THE COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE CERTIFICATION PROCESSES OF FIVE PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATIONS

by

Elizabeth Speers

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education
Department of Adult Education, Community Development and Counselling Psychology
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

@ Copyright by Elizabeth Speers 1997
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-27771-2
The Comparative Analysis of the Certification Processes of Five Professional Associations
Doctor of Education, 1997
by Elizabeth Speers
Department of Adult Education, Community Development and Counselling Psychology
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

Abstract

Technological developments and innovations are changing the nature of work, traditional jobs are disappearing and new, more advanced forms of work requiring an expanded and growing knowledge base are emerging. More occupations are taking on the characteristics of “professions” particularly in terms of certifying and maintaining competency of their members. Professionals, whose knowledge and skills were acquired through formal education and technical training find their initial education is not longer sufficient. With the increasing demand for up-dating, up-grading and re-training, professional associations are playing a significant educational role by developing and implementing activities such as seminars and certification programs.

In this study, the certification processes used by five professional associations were analyzed. The objectives were to determine: the type of certifications process or processes used by the association; why association members participate in the process; if the understanding of the requirements to participate in and successfully complete the certification program by the association membership reflect the association’s requirements; whether the association leadership and members share the same understanding regarding how the certification program standards are set and who
participates in setting the standards; how accessible the certification program is perceived by the membership and the types of continuing education programs offered and the participation in the programs.

The research included examples of criterion-, curriculum-, and competency-based certification. The researcher found that: individuals participate in certification programs to develop new skills to strengthen their position or marketability, the documentation on how programs are developed, how standards are set and why certain courses are in a program is generally confidential to the association and generally members of the associations survey were unclear as to how the standards are set. The study was limited by the lack of association documentation and the inability to survey the membership or ask specific questions on the survey.

The research findings will be of interest to individuals and associations who have or would like to have an understanding of the use of certification and the implications of the process on members of the profession who participate in the program and employers who hire the certified profession.
Table of Contents

Abstract i

Table of Contents

Tables vi

Abbreviations viii

Chapter One

Introduction 1
Research Problem 5

Chapter Two

Literature Review on Professionalism, Professional Associations, Credentialing, Certification, Competence and Continuing Education 9

Introduction 9
Professionalism 10
Professional Associations 13
Credentialing 16
Accreditation 16
Licensing 18
Certification 19
Types of Certification 23
Competence 25
Evaluation of Competence 26
Obsolescence 28
Continuing Professional Education 31
Changing Needs 34
Summary 35

Chapter Three

Methodology 36
Selection of Associations 36
Criteria for Selection 37
The Approach 38
The Process 41
Ontario Society for Training and Development 43
Overview 43
Information Gathering 44
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>St. John Ambulance - Ontario Council</th>
<th>45</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Gathering</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Canadian Compensation Association</th>
<th>48</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Gathering</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators</th>
<th>50</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Gathering</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Canadian Payroll Association</th>
<th>52</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Gathering</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary</th>
<th>54</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Chapter Four Data from Interviews and Surveys 55

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ontario Society for Training and Development (OSTD)</th>
<th>55</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Certification Program</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in Certification Program</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification Program Requirements</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuing Education</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>St. John Ambulance</th>
<th>65</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Division Interview Data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification Process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in the Certification Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification Program Requirements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuing Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Division Survey Data</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification Process</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in Instructor/Instructor-Trainer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification Program</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification Program Requirements</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuing Education</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Interview and Survey Data</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Canadian Compensation Association (CCA)**

**Interview Data**
- Certification Process: 80
- Participation in Certification Program: 82
- Certification Program Requirements: 83
- Standards: 83
- Accessibility: 83
- Continuing Education: 84

**Survey Data**
- Introduction: 84
- Certification Process: 85
- Participation in Certification Program: 85
- Certification Program Requirements: 88
- Standards: 89
- Accessibility: 90
- Continuing Education: 91
- Summary of Interview and Survey Data: 92

**Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators (ICSA)**

**Interview Data**
- Certification Process: 94
- Participation in Certification Program: 95
- Certification Program Requirements: 96
- Standards: 96
- Accessibility: 96
- Continuing Education: 96

**Survey Data**
- Certification Process: 97
- Participation in Certification Program: 97
- Certification Program Requirements: 99
- Accessibility: 101
- Continuing Education: 102
- Summary of Interview and Survey Data: 102

**Canadian Payroll Association (CPA)**

**Interview Data**
- Certification Process: 104
- Participation in Certification Program: 105
- Certification Program Requirements: 105
- Standards: 105
- Accessibility: 106
### Summary of Chapter Four

- Certification Process
- Participation in Certification Program
- Certification Program Requirements
- Standards
- Accessibility to the Program
- Continuing Education
- Summary of Interview and Survey Data

### Chapter Five

#### Analysis

- Response Rate
- Certification Process
- Certification Program Participation
- Certification Program Requirements
- Standards
- Accessibility
- Continuing Education
- Summary

### Chapter Six

#### Conclusions

- Types of Certification Programs
- Certification Program Requirements
- Certification Program Participation
- Standards
- Accessibility
- Continuing Education
- Implications
- Limitations of the Study
- Summary
- Next Steps

### Appendixes

#### Appendix A
- Letter to Gather Association Information

#### Appendix B
- List of Professional Associations

#### Appendix C
- Professional Associations Contacted

#### Appendix D
- Follow-up Letter

#### Appendix E
- Consent Letter

#### Appendix F
- Interview Questions

#### Appendix G
- St. John Ambulance - Instructor Requirements

#### Appendix H
- St. John Ambulance - Pilot Survey
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I</td>
<td>St. John Ambulance - Main Survey</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix J</td>
<td>Canadian Compensation Association - Pilot Survey</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix K</td>
<td>Canadian Compensation Association - Main Survey</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix L</td>
<td>Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrator - Pilot/Main Survey</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix M</td>
<td>Canadian Payroll Association Letter</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix N</td>
<td>Canadian Payroll Association - Pilot Survey</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix O</td>
<td>Canadian Payroll Association - Main Survey</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References                                                  198
Tables

Table

4-1  Survey Results  70
4-2  Recertification of Instructors/Instructor-Trainers  71
4-3  Reasons Why Respondents participated in the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer Training of St. John Ambulance  73
4-4  Perceived Requirements for Admission to St. John Instructor/Instructor-Trainer Training Programs  74
4-5  Perceived Requirements to Successfully Complete the St. John Certification Program  76
4-6  Who sets the Standards for Instructor Certification and Who should be involved in Setting the Standards  77
4-7  Survey Results  84
4-7a  Reasons for Pursuing a CCP Designation  87
4-8  Requirements to Participate in the CCP Designation Program  88
4-9  Who is Involved in Setting program Standards for CCP Designation  89
4-10  Activities Respondents Participate in to Maintain Knowledge of Compensation Current  92
4-11  Survey Results  97
4-12  Reasons for Participation in the ICSA Designation Program  99
4-13  Mandatory Requirements to Earn ICSA Designation (ACIS)  101
4-14  Survey Results  106
4-15  Reasons for Pursuing a CPA Designation  108
4-16  Requirements to Participate in the CPA Designation Program  109
4-17  Mandatory Requirements to Earn a CPA Designation  109
4-18  Who is Involved in Setting Program Standards for CPA Design  110

5-1  Mandatory Recertification  119
5-2  Reasons for Participating in the Designation Program  123
| 5-3 | Requirements Respondents Felt were Needed to Participate in the Certification Program | 125 |
| 5-4 | Requirements that Respondents Felt Should/Need to be Mandatory in the Certification Programs | 127 |
| 5-5 | Who Sets Standards and Who should Set Standards for Certification Program | 129 |
| 5-6 | Accessibility of Certification Program | 132 |
| 5-7 | Responsibility of the Cost of the Courses for the Designation | 133 |
| 5-8 | Activities Participated in to Keep Knowledge in Field Current | 134 |
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACA</td>
<td>American Compensation Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACRSP</td>
<td>American Society of Registered Safety Professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACIS</td>
<td>Associate of the ICSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASAE</td>
<td>American Society of Association Executives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASAM</td>
<td>American Society of Association Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASTD</td>
<td>American Society of Training and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>Competency Analysis for Trainers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCA</td>
<td>Canadian Compensation Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCP</td>
<td>Canadian Compensation Professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHRP</td>
<td>Certified Human Resources Professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNA</td>
<td>Canadian Nurses Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPA</td>
<td>Canadian Payroll Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPR</td>
<td>Cardio Pulmonary Resuscitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRSP</td>
<td>Canadian Registered Safety Professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTPD</td>
<td>Certified Training Profession Designation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCIS</td>
<td>Fellow of the ICSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRPAO</td>
<td>Human Resources Professional Association of Ontario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICSA</td>
<td>Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISPI</td>
<td>International Society for Performance Improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NITDP</td>
<td>National Instructor Trainer Development Program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

viii
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OSTD</td>
<td>Ontario Society for Training and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTAB</td>
<td>Ontario Training and Adjustment Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTC</td>
<td>Ontario Training Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.A.</td>
<td>Payroll Administrator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S.</td>
<td>Payroll Supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.M.</td>
<td>Payroll Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDAP</td>
<td>Professional Development Accreditation Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEO</td>
<td>Professional Engineers of Ontario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMA</td>
<td>Professional Management Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMCP</td>
<td>Payroll Management Certificate Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCA</td>
<td>Training Competency Architecture</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter One
Introduction

Continuing education or life-long learning (OTAB, 1994) are two phrases used to describe developmental needs of workers and professionals in the 1990s. Many studies (Beck, 1992; Cummings et al, 1989) have illustrated that if we are to be competitive on an individual, company, provincial or national basis, we must have the requisite knowledge and skills. One source of continuing career development for professionals are professional associations. In the Province of Ontario, these associations are either publicly-regulated and compulsory or self-regulated and voluntary.

Publicly-regulated professions have governing bodies created by statute that control almost every aspect of the governance of the profession. In most publicly-regulated professions, the Government of Ontario determines the composition of the governing bodies which grant licences to practise the profession in Ontario. Professions in Ontario regulated under public statute include: Architects, Engineers and Lawyers.

There are two types of self-regulatory professions - self-regulatory and governed by private statutes and self-regulatory and not governed by any statute. Both types of voluntary professional association will be included in the study. The legal status of voluntary professional association has no effect on the outcomes of the study.

Self-regulatory professions, governed by private statutes, are typically controlled by bodies elected solely from the membership of the professional association. Self-regulatory professions are acknowledged by the Legislature through the passage of governing acts, which grant professional associations the right to control the use of a professional certified title. However,
associations are not granted statutory authority to license their membership. Once the certified title is recognized in the business community, the professional association has considerable control over who is employed in the profession. Included in this group of professional associations in Ontario are Accountants, Foresters, Human Resource Professionals and Engineering Technicians and Technologists. The Ontario Association of Certified Engineering Technicians and Technologists is, for example, recognized under the Ontario Government Act 1984 S.O. 1984 CPR14.

Voluntary self-regulated professional associations are often formed as a result of a group of individuals getting together to network on a particular area of knowledge. Over time, the networking extends to the organization of seminars, workshops and other activities to exchange ideas and develop new skills. In some situations, the association leadership begins to formalize the developmental activities and seeks legislation that recognizes the association as the representative of the specific professional group. Some volunteer professional associations, such as the Canadian Compensation Association, have identified standards for their profession and invested considerable resources to develop and administer a certification process for their membership. However, they have not sought legislation by the government for recognition as a self-regulating profession with the right to control the use of a certified title.

Why do volunteer professional associations resort to certification? The development and maintenance of a professional certification process can be expensive and time-consuming. Yet according to Barnhart (1994), the leadership of many professional associations believe that the development of a certification process:

1. serves as a quality enhancement mechanism,
2. serves as a continuation of the mission of the association to benefit both their members and
the profession,
3. gives the association control over the requirements for individuals who want to practise the profession and,
4. provides an opportunity for the association leadership to represent the group to business and government on issues related to the professional area.

For example, the Human Resources Professional Association (HRPAO) advertises that their members "who have earned the designation Certified Human Resources Professional (CHRP) have met specific academic and professional experience requirements, are bound by a code of ethics and are subject to discipline should they be in contravention of the code of ethics"1 The CHRP designation is a legislated designation which is recognized by the government of Ontario. Individuals must earn the designation by successfully completing the requirements of the association and must maintain current membership in the association in order to use the designation. Many industry advertisements for human resource staff state that a CHRP is a requirement for employment consideration. Members of the HRPAO are encouraged to support this requirement when advertising positions in Human Resources in their organizations. Recently, the HRPAO instituted a comprehensive provincial exam for their certification program (HRPAO, 1995) which is required after the academic component is completed. The comprehensive examination was developed to:

1. ensure consistent academic standards for the legally Certified Human Resource Professional designation,
2. increase confidence by the management community and,
3. increase confidence by the general public in the qualifications of the person who has

completed the certificate of Human Resource Management.

By promoting the use of the CHRP requirement in employer hiring practices, it appears that one of the objectives of the Association is to control who practises the profession and ensure growth of Association membership.

In the absence of a clear understanding of the competencies required by some professional workers, many business organizations have come to rely on specific certification processes to determine entry level qualifications of a candidate. Potential employers may assume that a professional association that has developed a professional certification program has done a good job of defining at least entry level competencies. Additionally, they assume that by granting the designation an association has ensured these competencies have been met by the individual holding the designation.

In 1989, the Task Force on Access to Professions and Trades in Ontario (Cummings et al, 1989) stated that the setting of standards for a professional group should be the responsibility of the association representing the professionals. However, the standards for a profession should reflect the professional needs as identified by a needs assessment. The authors were not concerned that credentialing was being carried out by volunteer professional associations. Their concern was the lack of information about how the standards were being set and how the association ensured the standards were being met. Voluntary professional associations are seen as exercising considerable authority in the credentialing process without external review of their methodologies. Under such circumstances, how can the public be assured that the credentials of a professional accurately convey to the employer or purchaser of the service that the certified individual has a specific skill or competency level?
The number of voluntary associations in the process of proposing, developing or thinking about a certification process for their membership seems to be increasing. Two examples of voluntary associations in Ontario in the process of defining a certification process are the Ontario Society for Training & Development and the Canadian Institute of Marketing. The Ontario Society of Training & Development (OSTD), one of the voluntary associations representing training and development in Ontario, has for a number of years had two voluntary professional development programs. For the past couple of years, the OSTD Board of Directors has been involved in the development of a certification process and is seeking Ontario government legislation to become the agency which:

- establishes and maintains standards of professional competence in the field of training and development,
- governs/censures its members with respect to competence, ethics and professional standards and,
- assesses current competence level against standards of professional competence.²

The Canadian Institute of Marketing, a professional organization representing marketing in Canada, has begun the process of organizing a voluntary professional designation program in Ontario by the commencement of sponsorship of courses at the University of Toronto. The objectives of the Institute are to:

- improve the practice of marketing in Canada by encouraging the adoption of international professional standards and qualification by practitioners, business and learning institutions,
- be a vehicle by which those engaged in the practice of marketing as a profession can

represent their views and interests to government and agencies in Canada and overseas and,

- be an internationally-recognized catalyst for the improvement of marketing skills to the benefit of members and their companies.

**Research Problem**

The research problem to be addressed explores the processes that some voluntary professional associations use to certify their membership and identifies the understanding the association membership and others have of the methodology used to define the certification process.

The questions posed were:

1. What are the certification processes professional associations use to certify their membership, why do they use the identified processes and how is the currency of the processes maintained?
2. Who in voluntary associations participates in certification and why?
3. How accessible are the certification programs perceived to be by the association membership?
4. What are the implications of the process for members and non-members of an association, and for employers and the public who seek the services of the certified individual? For example, what expectations about skill level of a certified individual can an employer assume?

The objectives of the in-depth study were to determine:

1. the type of certification process or processes used by the association,
2. why association members participate in the certification process and what the value of the designation is to them,

3. if the understanding of the requirements to participate in and successfully complete the certification program by the association membership reflect the association’s requirements,

4. whether the understanding the association leadership and members have is the same regarding how the certification program standards are set and who participates in setting the standards,

5. how accessible the certification program is perceived to be by the membership and,

6. the types of professional development education programs offered by the association and the participation of members in the programs.

This study is significant to the field of Adult Education. Increasingly, groups of professionals are feeling the need to group together, organize professional development activities and formally recognize this development by a designation in order to be competitive. Additionally, there is an increasing tendency by employers to require a job candidate to have either an association designation, a degree, or both before being considered. Yet what does the degree or designation guarantee? Do associations in the role of certification agents contribute to the life-long learning of adults and/or facilitate adult learning? Do the recertification programs and/or the professional development programs play a role in life-long learning? How accessible are these programs to the membership? Do associations play a role in monopolization of labour pools? What political issues arise for the associations and their membership?

I believe this study will contribute to an understanding of certification processes in relation to individual and association growth. Additionally, the study will document the issues involving voluntary credentialing organizations which effectively control entry into their fields of
expertise through the use of certification.

In addition to addressing the questions and objectives outlined above, the research will also identify some political issues related to access and control that are exerted by professional associations.

The thesis is developed as follows.

Chapter Two is a review of relevant literature and defines the terms: professionalism, professional associations, credentialing, certification, competence and continuing professional education. The goal of this chapter is to set the background for the research.

Chapter Three outlines the methodology used to carry out the research, including how and why the associations were selected for study. The researcher interviewed the key staff and/or volunteers of the association and surveyed a selection of the membership and/or participants in the certification program. Since each association had a different certification program based on differing standards, it was necessary to develop customized surveys for each association based on a standard format. The Ontario Society for Training and Development is in the process of developing a certification program and decided it did not want the researcher to survey its membership. As an alternative, it was agreed to carry out interviews of trainers, some of whom were members of the association.

Chapter Four provides an analysis of the data collected from each association. The interviews were analyzed and summarized based on the stated objectives under the topics: development, standards, recertification and professional development. The data from the surveys was analyzed based on the stated objectives under the topics: certification process, standards.
maintenance recertification and professional development.

Chapter Five is a comparative analysis of the five associations against the objectives and questions identified in Chapter One with reference to the information in the literature review.

Chapter Six offers a summary of the finding and issues. Reflection on the findings as well as suggestions for future research are discussed.
Chapter Two

Literature Review on Professionalism, Professional Associations, Credentialing, Certification, Competence and Continuing Professional Education

Introduction

What is a profession? Why are more and more occupational groups referring to themselves as professionals? What is competence and who defines it? How does one ensure the competence of a professional and how can competencies be linked to professional performance? What is the relationship between professionalism, professional associations, competence, professional education and certification?

Individuals working in areas such as management, training, and finance are constantly inundated with information on professional development opportunities by entrepreneurs, professional associations, educational institutions and others. Each piece of marketing information is directed at the need for the professionals to keep their skills current and to develop new skills. Every workshop, conference or training program is marketed as the solution to the professional's every need.

The research undertaken in this thesis is a comparative study of the process(es) used by professional associations to certify their membership. The questions addressed are documented in Chapter One.

The literature relevant to the study includes the areas of professionalism, professional associations, credentialing, certification, competence and continuing professional education.
Each of these topics will be reviewed with the objective of setting the stage for the analysis of the data gathered from the research.

Professionalism

Today, more and more occupations are referring to themselves as professionals. Professions are a group of occupations whose boundary is ill-defined (Eraut, 1994). Historically, only occupations such as medicine, theology, and law were looked upon as professions. Other occupations such as teaching or nursing were considered semi-professions. In the past, individuals in recognized professions:

- were looked up to,
- were generally of the well-to-do middle class,
- had specialized knowledge acquired through specialized education and training and,
- usually worked independently for a fee. (Webster’s New World Dictionary, 1957; ASAE, 1975)

What differentiates an occupation from a profession? What are the characteristics of a professional? McGuire³ quotes Starr's definition of a profession as an occupation that:

- regulates itself through systematic, required training and collegial discipline,
- has a base in technological specialized knowledge and,
- has a service rather than a profit orientation enshrined in its code of ethics.

---

According to Schein and Komner (1972) the definition of a professional is an evolving one that includes an individual who:

- is trained in a specialized body of knowledge and skills,  
- participates in a prolonged period of education and training,  
- makes decisions on behalf of a client,  
- has a service orientation,  
- demands autonomy of judgement in his/her own performance and,  
- permits only her/his colleagues to judge his/her performance if a client is not satisfied.

The definition of profession and professional include many overlapping elements, but no one definition in the relevant literature is accepted by all authors. Carr-Saunders (1966) defined a profession as an occupation based upon specialized intellectual study and training whose purpose is to supply skilled services or advice to others for a defined fee or salary. Houle (1980), after a number of attempts to define the term profession, suggested that instead the term professionalization ought to be used. He argued that a number of occupations are in the process of professionalization and that some groups are closer than others to their goal of becoming a profession. According to Greewood (1966), the true difference between a professional and a non-professional occupation is not a qualitative but a quantitative one. In his opinion non-professional occupations possess the attributes of a profession, but to a lesser degree. Occupations are distributed along a continuum. At one end of the continuum are the well defined recognized professions such as physicians and attorneys and at the other end are the least skilled occupations such as farm labourers. The question that arises is how do we differentiate between the two. Greenwood (1966) stated that a professional is required to master a series of unusually complicated operations that require lengthy training. Whereas, the non-professional may be required to master a high level of skill development, for example, as
with a tool and die maker or a diamond cutter, but the skill is not supported by a fund of knowledge that is organized into a body of theory. He believes that on the job training is adequate for the non-professional, but not the professional who requires formal education and orientation in the body of theory specific to the profession. The process of professionalization for an occupational group according to Carr-Saunders (1966) and Houle (1980), includes defining a code of ethics, a central mission and a body of knowledge that is unique to the occupation. Professionalization is a political process (Deschamps et al, 1979) in which governments grant exclusive jurisdiction to a specific organization to manage an occupational group.

Another difference between a professional and non-professional according to Greenwood (1966), is based on the customer or client serviced. For the non-professional the customer is always right. For the professional the client presents his/her issue or problem and the client generally accedes to professional judgement. The subordination of the client to professional authority invests the professional with a monopoly of judgement.

The older professions such as medicine have evolved, and their characteristics today are different from the past. For example, in today's changing social conditions, the continuing development of new knowledge and changing social values make it difficult to define a specific constant body of knowledge for any occupation or a central mission that is accepted by all members of the profession (Curry et al, 1993). For example, physicians in Ontario have had to adapt to the official acceptance of midwives and nurse practitioners and the role they play in the practice of medicine. No longer is it the sole right of physicians to deliver babies or to diagnose. Others have been trained and licensed to deliver in these services.

The process of professionalization for most groups includes the following steps (ASAM, 1975):
• self-identification as a group,
• creation of restricted membership associations,
• accreditation of instructional programs and,
• licensure or certification of practitioners.

Professional Associations

According to Vollmer et al (1966), professional life cannot be achieved in isolation. Professions only exist when there are bonds between the practitioners and these bonds are usually developed in the form of professional associations. The prerequisite of professionalism is the desire to associate and the ability to do so. Membership in a professional association gives the professional ready access to the social and professional contacts that are indispensable to professional growth (Meigh, 1966).

Professional associations have a long history in North American society. During the 1700s in the United States, local societies such as the American Scientific Society founded by Benjamin Franklin were organized. By 1840, it became obvious that national professional associations were required to meet the needs of the members. Many local societies expanded, some even becoming national in scope. The American Scientific Society was one of these and is still in existence today. Many national associations grew and became trustees of their particular bodies of knowledge, responsible for its dissemination and for the maintenance of high professional standards (ASAM, 1975).

There are distinct similarities between the medieval guilds and modern professional associations. Guilds (ASAM, 1975) developed out of co-operation, fellowship and mutual
interest by artisans. The craft-guilds protected the rights of artisans and craftsmen and set quality standards for work. They grew to become rigid instruments for maintaining social status and self-interest. To maintain control of their members, they set stringent entrance requirements and membership was restricted. The guilds promoted growth of new industries, improved processes and individual skills development. Membership in the guild provided not only employment for the artisan but skills development and rewards (Carnevale, 1991). However, the guild leadership set prices for the guild products, had absolute authority over the product and its price, suppressed individual initiative but often protected the rights and privileges of the individuals in the groups at the expense of the craft or profession itself (Carnevale, 1991).

Some examples of guilds include the Company of Barber Surgeons, where surgeons were trained under the apprenticeship model, and the Company of Grocers, where apothecaries apprenticed and qualified (Charlton, 1973 and Dubin, 1971).

The guilds began to be challenged by other associations. For example, the College of Physicians and Surgeons in Britain, founded in 1518, licensed only physicians and surgeons who were university-educated. Since the surgeons of the Company of Barber Surgeons were not university-trained, they were not considered qualified under the new model. Eventually, the College of Physicians and Surgeons won primary status and the only accepted surgeon was the university-trained one. Other examples of societies that developed into professional associations include the Pharmaceutical Society formed in 1848 and the Society of Gentlemen Practises in the Courts of Law and Equity formed in Britain in 1739 that later became the Law Society.

Professional associations have continued to develop and grow. In the 1990s, the number of
professionalizing groups or voluntary professional associations is increasing. In a continually changing work environment, organizations require employees who can adapt quickly to new technology. Individuals require skills that make them more employable. Organizations look for potential employees who already have the skills they believe are needed and individuals look for effective means to gain skills that are portable. Long-term employment with one employer has become the exception not the norm. The concept of portability of skills is a very popular one. The Department of Labour in the United States has a plan to set standards for all jobs and certify all workers who perform them (Gerber, 1995). According to Gerber (1995), employers will be assured of the skills and abilities of a certified individual and will only need to assess them on how well they fit into systems and culture of the company. Additionally the professional can be assured of an independent constituency when the employer asks the professional to perform a task that the latter considers unprofessional. For example, the Engineering Society has been known to blacklist employers who ask those who hold a PEng to carry out processes considered unprofessional. The concerns that arise in the development of the program are the costs of set up and maintenance. Gerber (1995) believes that the Federal government will need to continue to be involved long term in the process. Professional associations in their role of developing and maintaining certification processes for their membership may play a valuable role in this process (Barnhart, 1994).

How do voluntary professional associations get started? Initially, a group of individuals who work in a specific occupation form an association to protect and enhance the profession through one or all of the following (Schein and Komner, 1972):

- defining professional development activities for themselves,
- defining the boundaries of the association and setting entrance criteria for membership in the association and, ultimately, the profession,
• setting educational standards,
• defining career lines within the profession and other areas of jurisdiction,
• lobbying for various degrees of autonomy or self-government by setting up and legalizing licensing and/or certification procedures and,
• performing public relations activities on behalf of the profession.

Professional associations are formed as a result of a perceived need for a relevant group to occupy and defend its exclusive use of a particular area of knowledge (Schein and Komner, 1972). Professional associations on behalf of the profession strive to persuade the community to sanction its authority within certain spheres by conferring upon the profession a series of powers and privileges. The community approval can be formal or informal. The association often supports professional development activities for its members who require formal education in established educational institutions. The formal educational process may involve memorizing information and learning skills prior to an assessment process designed to measure the individual against a set of standards. The educational process is geared to producing autonomous specialists and usually leads to credentialing. Credentialing is a formal means of testing the capacity of individual practitioners to perform their duties in a competent manner. If at the end of the educational process, the individual is declared competent, a certificate of competence and/or a licence that tells the world he/she is competent to practise the designated profession is issued.

Credentialing

Credentialing can involve accreditation of a professional school, licensing of individuals to practise a profession or certifying that an individual has met specified standards.
Accreditation

Accreditation is a process whereby an agency or an association grants public recognition to a school, college, university or specialized study program that meets certain predetermined qualifications or standards (Websters, 1957). For example, the accreditation of medical schools is performed by the Committee on Accreditation of Canadian Medical Schools or by the Liaison Committee on Medical Education in the United States. The Ontario Regulations which provide descriptions of requirements, qualification and fees for registration are the Medicine Act, 1991 and the Regulated Health Professions Act, 1991. Upon successful completion of the accredited school program and successful completion of a set of qualifying examinations, the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario (the registering and regulating body for physicians in Ontario) issues a certificate that permits a physician to engage in independent, unsupervised medical practice in Ontario (Lum, 1994).

A similar accreditation process is in place for professional engineers. The Professional Engineers of Ontario (PEO) accredits the engineering programs at various universities. Graduates from accredited engineering programs are considered by the PEO to have met the minimum educational requirements of the association. After two years of practice and successful completion of an association examination, candidates are licensed to practise in Ontario and can legally add PEng after their name (PEO, 1994). Graduates of engineering programs of universities that are not accredited by the PEO are required to submit documentation on the program to the association for assessment. They may be asked to complete specific educational requirements at an accredited institution prior to sitting for the Ontario examination of the PEO. Accreditation is based on criteria (McGlothlin, 1960) such as admission standards, faculty qualifications and facilities. Only institutions or programs, not individuals, can be accredited (Bratton, 1984).
The accreditation process carried out by the professional association regulates the number, location, curriculum content and calibre of instruction in the schools. Additionally, the professional association can control admission to the profession by convincing the community that individuals can not wear a professional title unless it is conferred by an accredited professional school. Such comparable control is not found in non-professional groups.

Another principal function of professional schools accredited by professional associations is to screen individuals who are prospective individuals for entry into the profession. The admission of candidates to professional education may be judged on criteria other than academic qualifications (Greenwood, 1966). For example, potential candidates to Medical School may be given points toward admission if they have done volunteer work or part-time work in a hospital.

According to Fritz and Mills (1980), accreditation promotes and ensures the quality of the training and services provided by the accredited organization and enables the student or professional to join a program of recognized quality. The graduates of an accredited program are generally selected by employers over those who lack such experience.

**Licensing**

A licence to practise a profession is required where unqualified practice is thought to pose a potential risk to a consumer's life, health or safety (Cumming et al, 1989). In Ontario, professions regulated under public statutes, such as medicine, have governing bodies created to control every aspect of the governance of the profession, including veto and directive power. The government has a say in the composition of the governing bodies and these bodies are given the power to grant licences, which are entitlements to practise the profession in Ontario.
(Cumming et al, 1989). A licence is issued to an individual who has successfully completed the defined requirements for a profession. It is illegal for individuals to practice a profession that requires a licence unless they have been granted permission by the appropriate body or board. Generally, a licence to practise is granted for life. For example, nurses, on successful completion of their training and a licencing examination, are granted a licence to practice by the College of Nurses. The only requirement for maintenance of the licence is payment of an annual fee to the college. In other professions, an individual may be required to participate in ongoing professional education as well as to maintain an active membership in the association (ACRSP, 1994). The suspension or revocation of a licence to practice is a relatively rare occurrence. No examples of suspension or revocation of a licence were found or mentioned in the literature reviewed. However, association literature such as the Canadian Nurses Association documents do identify legal actions brought against specific individuals and the result of those actions. These actions often include suspension or revocation of a licence. The process to initiate this type of action is outlined in the association's policies and rules. For example, the Regulated Health Professions Act of 1991 (amended in 1993), Chapter 37, outlines the policies for Health Care Professionals in Ontario. The examples used above are Ontario based. However, similar examples exist in other provinces in Canada.

Certification

In professions where there is no perceived potential risk to a consumer's life, governments are not directly involved in setting standards. Licences to illustrate competence are not issued (Cumming et al, 1989). Professional standards may be set by professional associations representing these professions, and credentialing in the form of certification of members may be established. Certification is a formal (sometimes informal) evaluation process that:
• is usually developed by members of a profession,
• determines, validates and attests that individuals meet the technical competence and skill that are prescribed by the profession (Lapp, 1982),
• defines and measures standards of professional practice (Gilley et al, 1987) and,
• are designed to separate those individuals of a profession who are perceived to be competent from those who are not.

Why is it different from licencing? The certification process (Bratton, 1984) is:

• usually voluntary,
• controlled by bodies elected entirely from membership and,
• regulated through association bylaws which are not subject to government review or approval.

According to Bratton (1984), the voluntary professional association maintains the power to control who uses the certified titles. Individuals who are not certified can practise the profession but must not present themselves as certified. However, it is difficult for the volunteer professional association to monitor who has been certified and who uses a specific designation. Generally, it is not monitored and the buyer of the service is left to confirm the validity of the designation of an individual who presents it. For example, the Canadian Compensation Association has a certification program leading to a designation. Once an individual completes the program and gains the designation, there is no requirement for them to maintain themselves current or to maintain a membership in the Association. However, a purchaser of services of an individual who holds that designation can check with the Association to determine if the individual does have a designation and if he/she has maintained currency (CCA, 1994).
Some professional associations require attendance at continuing education events to maintain their certification, but none require any continuing demonstration of skills required for practice (Eraut, 1994), even where the appropriate application of skills in the work environment is required for client safety, such as in nursing (CNA, 1994 & CRSP, 1994).

Why would a voluntary professional association go to the expense and effort of developing and maintaining a certification process? According to Coscarelli (1984) and Barnhart, (1994) the benefits may include:

- enhanced prestige for the profession,
- improved public image of the profession,
- protection of the public from incompetent practitioners,
- protection of employers by providing them with a means of comparing potential applicants,
- increasing the standards for practice and,
- improved academic programs due to the defining of the body of knowledge of the profession.

Government groups tend to value input from the professions that are self-evaluating, and members of such groups can have an influence on government policies that affect the profession (Smith, 1993). For example, St. John Ambulance, recognized for its certification programs in First Aid, has been actively involved in providing input to the Workplace Health and Safety Agency process of defining standards for First Aid Training in Ontario (St. John Ambulance, 1994).

Why would a professional association not get involved in developing and maintaining a
voluntary certification process? Disadvantages for the association include (Houle, 1980) and Boothe (1984):

- dissension within the membership of the association, with some members withdrawing their membership as a result of process and content disagreements and concern about minimum standards versus quality standards,
- difficulty in identifying common core competencies on which to base the certification standards and,
- expenditure of resources and energy to develop and maintain a fair and acceptable certification process.

There are some professions that have requirements which include both licensing and certification. For example, to practise as a registered nurse in Ontario, an individual is required to have a licence which is issued by the College of Nurses upon successful completion of licensing examinations. In addition, the Canadian Nurses Association provides, as part of its ongoing voluntary professional development program, certification in areas of nursing specialities such as Critical Care or Paediatric Nursing (CNA, 1994). Why would an individual participate in a voluntary certification process after having obtained a license? The documentation on the program defines the certification process as "a valuable opportunity to demonstrate your commitment to, and expertise in, your nursing speciality area". Additionally, "becoming certified represents a significant step in your professional and personal development". A review of professional association literature reveals that many associations market their programs based on the ideals of professionalism, competence, prestige and self-improvement (HRPAO, 1994 & PMA, 1993). The American Nurses Association Certification

---

catalogue (1983) states that their certification processes:

- validate an individual's knowledge and practice based on predetermined standards,
- verify an individual's commitment to the very highest professional standards and,
- will bring the individual the respect of peers and the public.

Additionally, as the certification program becomes more widely acknowledged, some job advertisements are beginning to indicate that candidates with the certification will receive preference.

Standards required for certification by voluntary professional associations vary considerably among professions. They commonly include (Bratton, 1984):

- continued membership in a professional association,
- successful completion of an accredited program of study and,
- satisfactory performance on written and/or performance examination.

A professional association that installs and controls a certification process controls the professional standards of the profession. If an association (Coscarelli, 1984 and Harwood et al, 1993) manages to convince employers and individuals that its professional designation is a legitimate and an important aspect of a professional's resume, then the association will control access to employment. Controlling the access to the profession constitutes an effective means of ensuring the economic well-being of the association and in the eyes of the association's leadership the economic well-being of the profession (Laliberte, 1979) since collection of fees from training sessions and certification examinations as well as memberships (Boothe, 1984) are in association control.
How and by whom are the standards for certification set? Since professionals are expected to have the knowledge required for their profession, it is agreed (Bratton, 1984) that the primary responsibility for establishing and maintaining certification standards rests with members of the profession. Each association sets its own standards for certification. According to Barnhart (1994), there is no defined methodology for setting professional standards. Thus, what is included in professional standards may vary considerably from association to association. In some cases, for example, the Canadian Nurses Association (CNA, 1994) or the Ontario Society for Training and Development (TCA, 1995), competency standards for the profession are documented and published. Other professional associations, such as the Human Resources Professional Association, do not publish competency standards, but provide lists of courses (HRPAO, 1993) an individual must successfully complete in preparation for the association’s comprehensive examination.

**Types of Certification**

According to Barnhart (1994), the three types of certification are criterion-, curriculum- and competency-based.

Criterion-based certification requires candidates to meet a predetermined set of criteria. That is, they must hold an association membership, show a minimum number of years in the profession and hold a relevant licence. There is little or no attempt to objectively evaluate a candidate’s job knowledge or competency. Today, there are few such certification programs. However, the Institute for Chartered Secretaries and Administrators, which participated in this study, has a certification program that is an example of criterion-based certification.

Curriculum-based certification requires candidates to demonstrate a mastery of relevant
knowledge. The course requirements for certification are determined by the association but the
details of how the course requirements were determined are generally not made available to the
membership. If an individual would like to substitute a course for the required one, he or she
must apply to the association for an exemption prior to registration in the desired course. The
exemption is usually granted if a review of the course outline of the required course illustrates a
match with the course the individual wishes to take (OSTD, 1995). According to Barnhart
(1994), there is little or no attempt by the association to do a task analysis or define a common
body of knowledge on which the certification is based. After successful completion of the
required courses a candidate is often required to successfully complete an examination or a set
of examinations set by the association. Upon successful completion of the requirements a
certificate and a designation are issued. The curriculum-based program is quite common and
both the Human Resources Professional Association and the Canadian Compensation
Association offer this type of a program.

Competency-based certification requires candidates to prove their expertise, mastery or
capability within their profession. The professional education, examinations and experience
requirements are based in part on a set of tasks identified by a job analysis. This type of
analysis requires considerable time and effort among the players in the association and
consensus on the competencies and standards is often difficult to achieve. The candidate for
certification is required to show mastery of a common body of knowledge within his/her
profession. Competency-based examinations are designed to measure the mastery of the
knowledge that reflects job content. This type of certification is more common in professions
where safety is a factor, such as nursing (CNA, 1994), and is the methodology being used by
OSTD (1995) for the development of their certification program. Skill testing is usually
avoided except in cases where observation of the skills, for example, in first aid can be used as a
methodology of confirming that an individual can perform the identified skill.
What constitutes competency? In general, competent means "well qualified or capable". To be considered professionally competent, one needs to have demonstrated a set of defined competencies. According to a report of the American Society for Training and Development (1983) and Dubois (1993), a competency is a skill or focused grouping of skills or knowledge that facilitates performance of a role, such as negotiation skills. A job competency is an underlying characteristic of an employee (body of knowledge, skills and/or attitudes) which results in effective and/or superior performance on the job. For example, a competent doctor can diagnose, prescribe and treat patients to maintain and to promote health (Dubois, 1993). According to Esque and Gilbert (1995) competencies are behaviours that assist the performer to overcome known barriers to achieving performance standards. The literature has many variations on the definition of the term competency and on how it is used or tested. For example, The Canadian Nurses Association, in its literature for the Critical Care Nurses certification program (CNA, 1995), defines competency as "knowledge, abilities, skills, attitudes and judgement" expected of critical care nurses. The defined competencies are measured using a written test. The Ontario Society for Training and Development (OSTD) defines competency as an overall activity one must perform to demonstrate a job responsibility of a training practitioner (TCA, 1995). For example, one competency established for a trainer is "create and maintain a learner-centred environment". OSTD’s methodology for measuring the achievement of competencies has not been determined. Although the competencies have been expressed in behavioural terms the organization has experienced difficulty creating a suitable methodology to test the identified skills. However, according to the association literature,

successful completion of both a written test and a performance activity will be required to earn a designation.

Evaluation of Competence

How is competence determined or measured? According to Chalofsky (1983) and Carnevale (1991), competency should be measured by performance of a task rather than by written tests. However, passing an exam is the general method most organizations use to determine competence. Therefore, most certification processes involve the successful completion of a written examination to illustrate that an individual knows a specified body of knowledge. In the past, testing for competence was carried out by experienced practitioners who created tests or tested candidates in oral examinations (Shimberg, 1983). It was assumed that the experienced practitioner knew from experience what questions to ask during the testing to ensure that the candidate was competent. Little thought was given to the specific questions asked and the evaluation was highly subjective. To ensure more objectivity and consistency in testing, a move to standardized examinations based on defined objectives began to occur as early as the 1940s for professions such as medicine (Shimberg, 1983). The objective-oriented approach to evaluation resulted in educators reflecting about their intentions and clarifying formerly ambiguous generalities about educational outcomes. What was expected of the candidate was defined and then tested. Concerns over the objective-oriented approach to evaluation, according to Worthen et al. (1987) include:

- the approach measures the ability of the individual to achieve objectives rather than the ability to make explicit judgements of merit or worth,
- there are observed discrepancies between the objectives and performance levels of individuals,
• the objectives tend to neglect the context in which the evaluation takes place and,
• the approach tends to promote a linear, inflexible approach to evaluation.

Concern has been expressed about how testing reflects the needs of the profession. According to Jarvis (1983):

• examinations should test what has been studied and what they claim to test,
• testing should be relevant to professional practice,
• results should be replicable and,
• the process used for testing must separate those who can do from those who cannot in a valid reliable way.

Training and development professionals (TCA, 1995) suggest that a job analysis should be done to define the required competencies and that testing should reflect professional performance needs.

Using the criteria identified by Jarvis (1983), Harwood and Westgaard (1993) developed a certification process for Interior Designer certification that is based on performance and mastery of knowledge. The assessment process was tested and validated as part of the development of the certification program. Few professional associations have created public documents to illustrate the defined competency standards of their certification program or the methodology they use for testing.

When individuals representing a profession or occupation group design a certification process the following three questions need to be addressed (Shimberg et al, 1983):

29
• Is initial competence being measured adequately?
• Are standards being set at an unrealistically high level to restrict the supply of practitioners?
• Are members of minority groups being excluded by the methods used?

Yet does success on a competency-based, written certification examination reflect how the individual will perform on the job? According to Shimberg (1983), written testing only illustrates that the successful individual has the knowledge tested. The testing mechanism ought to reflect the performance requirements of the job if the examiner is to be convinced that the individual has the performance skills necessary to practise the profession.

Obsolescence

According to Dubin (1971 and 1990), obsolescence is the "discrepancy between a professional's body of knowledge, skills and abilities to perform the tasks at hand". Incompetence is exacerbated by obsolescence but may involve health and work environment issues as well (Willis & Dubin, 1990). Professional obsolescence exists in those professionals who lack of knowledge and skills in current techniques and new technologies that have been developed since the individual was educated. Additionally, some professionals allow themselves to settle into a narrow, specialized area of their profession and become obsolete in other areas. Why is obsolescence a concern? Individuals who become obsolescent tend to be affected with a complacency that prevents them from anticipating or participating in developments unfolding in their profession. The rate of growth and complexity of knowledge is increasing dramatically while the half-life of knowledge is decreasing. In 1971 the half life of an engineer's usefulness was estimated at seven and a half years based on their initial education (Dubin, 1971). There is continued rapid change in technology and innovation as well as global competition (Willis & Dubin, 1990). Professionals are finding that their knowledge and skill requirements are
changing even faster. Clients of professionals are more knowledgeable and more demanding in their requests for service. In the past, professionals were often individuals who worked for themselves. Today, many professionals work for organizations. For example, engineers are hired in large numbers by utilities such as Ontario Hydro, many physicians work for a salary in hospitals or clinics and corporate lawyers often work for governments or corporations. Obsolence is an issue that not only affects the professional and the client but also the organization for which the professional works. In the banking industry, the employer of the professional is dependent on continued competence of the professional banker to ensure the organization's profitability and survival (Curran, 1983). Errors or lack of knowledge on behalf of the professional make the employer less competitive.

What are some of the signs of obsolescence of a professional? According to Dubin7 the signs include:

- difficulty reading new technical papers,
- new tasks and assignments look too difficult to be practical and,
- contemporaries no longer seek the advice of the professional.

How can professionals and their associations deal with the issue of obsolescence? First, the professional must take on the responsibility for his/her own professional competence. He/she should have his/her own plan for continual learning (Barrett et al, 1971). However, some professionals do not develop and implement such a plan. In the role of policing their members, many professional associations have a peer review process in place. Complaints are reported by members of the profession or clients to the association review group. The complaints are dealt with using processes outlined in the organization's policies and procedures. The premise of the

---

concept of peer review is that the only body qualified to determine the competency of a professional is the specific professional body (Kidd, 1980). The essence of peer review is that the profession is actively reviewing the work done by its members and that there is a set of accepted standards shared by association members, including defined levels of performance. This concept is not always the reality. Additionally, it is difficult for association leadership to play the role of policing and professional support and not interchange the roles.

Periodically, the peer review process has been challenged by the public, public advocacy groups or governments because the process is sometimes seen as serving the professional and not the public interest (Kidd, 1980). If the peer review process as a concept becomes widely challenged, some groups believe it might be necessary to review and remove the right of a profession to govern itself. In addition, they advocate that there might be a need for external groups such as users of the service to have input in defining standards of professional performance. Failure on the part of any professional to ensure the competence of the association members provides a basis for challenging the right of the profession to govern itself (Swan, 1979).

How does a profession ensure continued competence of its members? Should there be a periodic mandatory re-examination of every member of the profession? What are the criteria for re-certification? What happens if individuals lose their licence to practise because they failed a re-certification or re-licencing examination and subsequently lose their livelihood? To deal with the sensitivity about recertification the American Board of Medical Specialists, when introducing a recertification program, decided to exempt those individuals who were certified. This process of accepting current professionals without requiring them to participate in the program is generally known as grandparenting. The decision to grandparent current members is usually a political one the helps facilitate the acceptance of the new procedures. All future
licencing candidates are required to participate in ongoing recertification (Shimberg, 1983).

Should continuing education be mandatory for candidates who have been declared incompetent by their peers? What about the costs of and access to education? The answers are not clear, but ultimately it is the individual who earns the licence or certification who can lose it. Individuals must deal with their own obsolescence if they want to continue to practise their profession.

Professional associations serve to protect the autonomy of the profession. Often they become both providers of education and dictators of who can practise (Stern, 1983 and Laliberte, 1979). What should be the role of the professional association? What are the ethical issues in the dual role? It is impossible to carry out both roles without a conflict of interest. Do you maintain the standards and revoke a licence or certificate of competence, or do you work with the individual to help him or her gain the skills and knowledge to become competent? In some professions such as banking, the professional and perhaps the bank will lose business if the professional is obsolete, whereas in other professions such as teaching or medicine, innocent people may suffer due to a practitioner’s incompetence. It is in such cases that the public often demands third party intervention in the “policing” role. For example, in Ontario, professions regulated under public statute are governed by bodies or councils, yet the government has a say in the composition of these bodies (Cumming et al, 1989). Government-appointed third parties sit on these boards and ensure there is an outside view of how the organization governs itself.

**Continuing Professional Education**

The issuance of a licence or a certificate signifies that the successful candidate has sufficient knowledge and skills to begin the practice of the profession (Jarvis, 1983). The initial educational preparation for entry into a profession requires individuals to learn massive
amounts of information in specific areas. To illustrate successful completion of the learning, the individual then must successfully complete a written examination. Upon commencement of professional practice, he/she invariably finds that the accelerating rate of technological and social change is continually altering the body of knowledge and skills that defines the requirements of professional practice. Obsolescence rapidly becomes an issue.

The historical image of the professional has been that of an individual who is strongly motivated by service and whose conduct is governed by the ethical and performance standards set by a voluntary association of colleagues (Jarvis, 1983). This image no longer predominates in the minds of the public. More and more, concern is being expressed about professionals who do not live up to the standards of their profession but who continue to practise. Many members of the public believe that professional associations are now primarily economically-motivated and do not always discipline their members. Where necessary, a greater reliance on formal administrative rules, government regulation and court imposed sanctions are options that some users of professional services have advocated ought to be applied in the case of obsolescence of a practitioner (McGuire, 1993).

How can educators of potential professionals and the individuals themselves deal with the issue of obsolescence? First, potential professionals need to understand that entry level education is the first step in a life-long process of learning and that continuing professional education is not a luxury, but a necessity (Houle, 1980). Life-long learning is a term frequently used to denote learning that takes place throughout one's life (OTAB, 1994). How does it relate to professional practice? Professional practice is in constant change. There is a need for new goals, new understanding and new skills for all professionals as a result of changing values and technologies. Generally, professionals, both as individuals and as groups, have little understanding of their roles and responsibilities as self-directed learners to ensure competence
Many professional educational programs teach students what to learn to prepare themselves to obtain their licence or certification. Professionals need to acquire much more than a store of knowledge in subjects related to professional practice: they need to be taught how to learn and relearn (Houle, 1980).

In order to be the master of a branch of knowledge, it is essential for a practitioner, after his/her initial education, to continue learning about recent developments in knowledge and the application of that knowledge to the occupational setting. To address this issue, some occupations require ongoing continuing education to maintain certification. For example, dental assistants are required to participate in ongoing continuing education classes during their career. Additionally, they are required to gain a specific number of continuing education credits yearly to maintain their certification (Jarvis, 1983).

According to Hohman (1980), participation in ongoing continuing education is not a guarantee of continuing competence. In many cases the requirement by professional associations for their membership to participate in continuing education is a response to concerns expressed by legislators or clients and/or a fear that if they do not do something, they will lose control of the standards of the profession. In making continuing education participation a requirement to maintain a licence or certification, a professional association has made continuing education an end in itself (Norcini & Shea, 1993).

If demanding that individuals participate in continuing education is not the way, then what is? There does not seem to be a definitive answer to this question. First, the initial education of a professional ought to develop individuals with a commitment to ongoing learning. According
to Houle (1980), individuals who are taught how to learn have been prepared for the future. Some professional schools have developed initial professional development programs that are designed around problem-based curricula as a means to help individuals learn how to learn. Problem-based curricula emphasize the learning process, including learning how to learn and adapting to and participating in change. Secondly, there are professionals who work in many areas of their profession such as teaching, researching and writing in their field of interest and working on professional committees. Houle (1980) maintains that these types of activities illustrate an ongoing commitment to learning. Continuing education needs to be viewed in the broad sense of all kinds of learning, as many activities illustrate learning and the adaptation of experience to learning. Thirdly, some professions, such as midwifery, insist that practitioners can only remain members of the profession provided they undertake a refresher course at specific intervals (Jarvis, 1993).

Barriers to the development and maintenance of ongoing assessment of professionals include the cost of producing and administering the assessment and the cost of lost employment hours necessitated in order to prepare and participate in the process. According to Eraut (1994), an additional barrier to individual development are higher education providers who tend to be creators and transmitters of knowledge but tend not to help individuals learn how to learn.

Changing Needs

Professional education and evaluation assumes that the professional works as an individual. A major flaw of the competency approach is the underlying assumption that performance is an individual affair (Nylon, 1990). Generally, initial professional education provides neither training nor experience in how to work as a team member, how to collaborate with clients in identifying needs and possible solutions and how to collaborate with other professionals on
complex projects (Schein & Kommer, 1972). Continuing education is generally done profession by profession with little or no communication across professions. Professional associations have not been accustomed to collaborating with one another (Hohman, 1980; Cunningham & McLaughlen, 1990). How can these groups link resources to deal with intra-professional problems which tend to reflect the reality of professional practice in today’s world? To address this concern, some educators of professionals have found answers in the use of learning processes such as problem-based learning. Schools that have adopted this methodology for learning have noticed that the process increases the breadth and the depth of commitment of the learner and that individual departments/groups lose control of curriculum, resulting in interschool co-operation and a more team-based approach to ongoing development.

Summary

The literature on professionalism, certification, competence and continuing professional education is very diverse and not easily accessible. Much of the conceptual and empirical work is discipline-specific and published in speciality journals (Willis & Dubin, 1990). Additionally, many of the current programs of professional development have been produced by professional organizational or regulatory agencies and are often published only in internal confidential reports. The extensive discussion of these topics in the literature illustrates the interest in the field of professions and their continued competence.

The tendency of professional associations to want to get involved in professionalization of their membership is growing. It is seen by many associations as an extension of their mandate to enhance the prestige of the profession and to generate standards for the profession. Credentialing of graduates of volunteer professional association certification programs usually involves certification. Of the three types of certification carried out, curriculum-based
certification is the one used by most associations. Competency-based certification is an area that is emerging. The details of the competencies required for certification and the definition of competency varies from association to association.

Individuals need to develop the ability to learn if they are to maintain currency of skills. Many associations claim that continuing professional education is a means to help members keep their knowledge and skills current. Thus, professional associations provide opportunities for their members to attend workshops, educational programs and other activities developed by the association or others. However, there is little consensus on how attendance at a workshop versus working on producing a newsletter for the professional association contributes to professional growth or the life-long learning capabilities of their members.
Chapter Three

Methodology

The goal of the research was to carry out a comparative study of volunteer professional associations with respect to their certification programs. Many volunteer professional associations have certification processes and each professional association defines certification differently. The study is a detailed examination of the certification programs of five volunteer professional associations. The leadership of each association was interviewed using a standard set of questions (Appendix A) and the membership was surveyed at random using association specific surveys. The analysis of the similarities and differences within associations and across associations with respect to the questions and objectives outlined in Chapter One was carried out. Issues related to sensitivities about the types of questions the researcher was permitted to ask and the availability of association documentation are outlined and the limitations they posed on the researcher are discussed.

Selection of Associations

A search of College and University calendars and professional magazines surfaced approximately eighty volunteer professional associations offering certification programs. A letter (Appendix B) was sent to the leadership in each of these associations requesting information on their certification process and outlining the research project. A list of the associations contacted for information is included in Appendix C.

Forty-two professional associations responded to the request for initial information. The data received was summarized in a database (Appendix D) in an attempt to standardize information for comparison and to facilitate the selection of the associations for further study.
Criteria for Selection

The goal of the study was to carry out a comparative study of three or four volunteer professional associations that had certification programs leading to a designation. In order to ensure that the research would cover as broad a base as possible, the researcher analyzed the initial data against the following criteria:

1. the number and types of delivery methodologies used by the certification program,
2. the methodologies for ongoing maintenance of the certification program,
3. the requirement or lack thereof for ongoing recertification,
4. the number of certification programs the association sponsors,
5. the level of development of the certification program such as number of years the program had been in place and,
6. the availability of the courses through various sources.

The initial investigation, in mid-1994, of volunteer professional associations’ certification programs determined that there was a considerable variation with respect to the above criteria. The following illustrates the variability found:

- the Ontario Society of Training and Development has informal professional development programs, but is in the process of developing a competency-based certification program leading to a designation,
- the Human Resource Professional Association of Ontario offers a full-blown certification program (curriculum-based) with defined courses of study available through colleges and universities as well as the Association and an Association-sponsored comprehensive
certification examination,

- the Canadian Compensation Association and Certified General Accountants Association of Canada run certification programs (curriculum-based) with courses and examinations that can be obtained only through the Association,
- the Association of Professional Placement Agencies and Consultants provides a curriculum-based certification program that can be accessed only through correspondence courses offered by the Association,
- the Canadian Payroll Association offers a curriculum-based certification program involving a combination of Association courses offered through correspondence and/or computer-based study and university/college courses,
- the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators offers a criterion-based Canadian certification program that has been developed outside of Canada,
- the Canadian Public Relations Society Inc. has a criterion-based certification program that requires work experience, self-preparation and a society formal examination and,
- the Association of Canadian Registered Safety Professionals offers a criterion-based certification program requiring work experience, peer examination and ongoing recertification based on a point system.

Although the literature indicated that criterion-based programs were being phased out, there are still a significant number in place.

**The Approach**

After review of the materials provided against the criteria, the following associations were targeted for follow up:
1. The Ontario Society for Training and Development,
2. The Canadian Direct Marketing Association.
3. St. John Ambulance,
4. The Canadian Society of Association Executives,
5. The Canadian Compensation Association,
6. The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators and,

The reasons these associations were targeted for further investigation are as follows:

- The Ontario Society for Training and Development has two professional development processes in place and is developing a certification program. The study of the proposed OSTD program would provide an opportunity to collect data and analyze issues related to initial program development.

- The Canadian Direct Marketing Association did not have a formal professional development program but was interested in creating a certification program. The concerns of the leadership included the amount of resources that would be involved in the development and maintenance of a program and the issues around the support of the membership. The involvement of this Association in the study would allow data to be gathered from the membership on their interests and concerns in initiating the development of a new program.

- St. John Ambulance has a number of curriculum-based and competency-based certification programs, many of which are safety-related. There is a requirement for recertification periodically for all their certification programs. The involvement of this Association in the study would provide data on a certification process that has a long history and includes recertification.
- The Canadian Society of Association Executives has a curriculum-based certification program, which they manage centrally. Participants write a comprehensive examination set by the Association.
- The Canadian Compensation Association is a Canadian section of an American Association. The curriculum-based certification process was developed in the United States and then Canadianized. The courses are only available through the Association. No membership in the Association is required to use the designation earned.
- The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators is a subset of a similar Institute initiated in Great Britain with many such groups around the world. Their certification processes are criterion-based. The standards are set by the parent Association with input from the Canadian group.
- The Canadian Payroll Association has three curriculum-based certification programs in place. The Association has developed one course for each program that relates to the payroll needs of industry. The participants in the program are required to take the Association course as well as defined university or college courses to earn the designation. The Association courses are available through correspondence, although one is also available through computer-based delivery. The Association members are industries not individuals.

Each of the targeted associations was approached in the following way:

1. a letter (Appendix E) was sent to the individual who provided the initial information to thank them and ask if their association would participate in the in-depth research study,
2. a follow-up phone call was made within a week or two to initiate contact, to confirm the interest of the association to participate in the study, to clarify any points and to arrange a meeting with an association representative and,
3. If interest was expressed, a meeting was held with the identified association staff person to clarify the scope of the study, to determine how the association might participate and to ensure that the association Board of Directors was both aware of and had agreed to the study.

The five associations that agreed to participate were The Ontario Society of Training and Development, St. John Ambulance - Ontario Council, The Canadian Compensation Association, The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada and The Canadian Payroll Association.

The following are the reasons for non participation of the associations who were targeted for followup:

- The Canadian Direct Marketing Association indicated that they lacked the resources to work with the researcher and,
- The Canadian Society of Association Executives had lost its education contact and was not prepared to work on the project until it hired a new one.

The Process

Once an agreement was obtained for participation in the study, interviews of the association leadership (including Manager of Training and/or Executive Director and key volunteers such as Vice President of Standards or Vice President of Education) were arranged and carried out. All interviews, except those conducted over the telephone, were audio-taped and transcribed. The initial meeting with the association's contact person was usually also the first interview. Other key staff or volunteers to be interviewed were identified by the
association's contact person and interviews were arranged. Each person interviewed was asked to sign a letter of consent (Appendix F). Not all participants in the interview process felt it was necessary to sign the letter of consent. Reasons for the refusal included: “I do not think it is necessary and I would prefer not to”.

The structure of the interview was very open, but a set of standard generic questions was developed and used in each interview (Appendix A) to ensure key basic information was gathered. Deviation from the questions was encouraged to allow the interviewee to talk freely about the association and its certification process. All questions were covered in each interview.

To obtain information from members of the association and/or participants in the certification process, a survey was designed based on the association's written documentation and the information from the interviews. The survey, designed to gather information to address the objectives of the study, was customized for each association to ensure that it reflected the uniqueness and concerns of the association. A draft survey was reviewed by the association's contact person and other association representatives based on the agreement the researcher had with each group. The distribution of the survey commenced when all parties were comfortable with its contents.

Each survey included questions to gather background information on respondents as well as information to address the objectives and questions identified in Chapter One.

In each case, the distribution of the survey was limited to Canada or Ontario depending upon the nature of the association structure. For example, St. John Ambulance has a national structure but the researcher was working with the Ontario Council and the survey was
distributed in Ontario only. Initially, the survey was sent to approximately thirty members of the association or participants in the certification program, in a package that contained stamped envelopes addressed to the researcher. This survey was intended to test the questions and ensure that the responses obtained would satisfy the objectives.

Approximately 30% of the pilot surveys were returned in each case. The exact information for each association is found in Chapter 4. Modifications were made to the pilot survey based on respondent input or to clarify the question if information gathered in the pilot did not reflect the expected response. The modifications were agreed to by the association contact.

The modified survey was sent to a random selection of association membership and/or participants in the certification program. The number of surveys distributed was based on the size of the membership and association input. The return rate was 30% or greater in each case. The data from the surveys was entered into a database (Q&A by Symantic\(^8\)) and analyzed using the database features. The statistical analysis was done in MSExcel. Data that was statistically analyzed was electronically transferred to MSExcel\(^9\) from Q&A to minimize data entry error.

A report including a summary of the interview and the survey data for each association was prepared and sent to the contact person of the organization for comment. Comments of the association representatives have been included in the thesis, if possible.

---


Ontario Society for Training and Development

Overview

The Ontario Society for Training and Development (OSTD) is a volunteer not-for-profit professional Association of approximately 1100 members dedicated to setting new standards for training and human resource development professionals in Ontario (OSTD, 1994). The OSTD was founded in 1946 and has been involved in establishing the standards of professional competence for Training and Development professionals. The two professional development programs that the OSTD had in place at the beginning of this study were the Human Resources Development (HRD) certificate program and the Professional Development Accreditation Program (PDAP). The HRD program, designed for individuals who are preparing for a career in the HRD field of training, was initiated in 1966 and is offered through educational institutions in Ontario. The PDAP was established in 1975 and was “designed to provide OSTD members with a means of planning and organizing their personal development in the Training and Development field10”. At the time of this study, the OSTD was in the process of developing a formalized certification program. The Association leadership identified in its literature that it was applying to the Legislative Assembly of Ontario (OSTD, 1994) to become a body with the authority to govern and to censure its members with respect to competence, ethics and professional standards, and to grant to duly qualified members the right to the exclusive use of the designation "Certified Training Development Professional (CTDP)".

---

Information Gathering

At the time the study began, the OSTD had just published the Training Competency Analysis (TCA) and the TCA Toolkit. The TCA defines standards of professional practice for Training and Development practitioners in five major competency categories. The TCA toolkit provides individuals with a methodology to analyze their current level of competency against each category in the TCA and to design a plan to close any identifiable gaps in their competencies. The certification program is seen as an extension of the OSTD’s PDAP. The proposed certification program will require:  

- successful completion of a written examination on the theories, concepts and practices of the profession,
- successful completion of a demonstration of a skill component, such as the design of a learning event or the delivery of a training or group facilitation session,
- making a commitment to continuous learning and self-development and,
- maintaining OSTD membership on an annual basis.

Interviews of the Managing Director and the Vice President of Standards and Certification were carried out. Permission to conduct a survey of the membership was not granted. At this stage of development of the designation program, the leadership of the Association felt that all communication about the proposed program should come only from the OSTD. They wanted to ensure consistency in the messages about the certification program. The researcher was given permission to interview training and development professionals on the topic. The following criteria were used to select candidates for interviews:

---

• individuals who had been in the field for more than 10 years (two of the four were members of OSTD),
• individuals who were just starting out and in the process of taking courses in training and development (2 individuals),
• an individual who had just completed an MEd and was working in the field, but who was a member of International Society for Performance Improvement and not OSTD and,
• an individual who was interested in getting into the field and who had reviewed the TCA.

St. John Ambulance - Ontario Council

Overview

The Order of St. John\textsuperscript{12} is the oldest charitable organization in the world and was founded in the 11th century when a group of Benedictine monks used an ancient monastery as a hospital for Christian pilgrims in Jerusalem. They were officially recognized by Pope Paschal II in 1113 and became known as the Order of the Hospital of St. John of Jerusalem. The organization is known around the world for its charitable work in communities. The St. John Ambulance national organization in Canada has local councils in each province. The Ontario Council with whom this study was carried out celebrated its first hundred years of service in 1995.

St. John has a number of certification programs including: Standard First Aid, Cardio-Pulmonary Resuscitation(CPR), Wilderness First Aid, Instructor and Instructor-Trainer.

Only the Instructor and the Instructor-Trainee certification programs (National Instructor Trainer Development Program - NITDP I or II) were analyzed in this study. To participate in the NITDP I program, an individual must have certification in Standard First Aid and CPR. Successfully, completion of the NITDP I program is required for consideration to participate in the NITDP II program. The details of the requirements to participate in the certification program are in Appendix G.

Instructors/Instruction-Trainers, who are certified by St. John, teach CPR and First Aid courses for St. John as volunteers or for other organizations such as colleges or corporations and are paid for their services. There are organizations such as the Ontario Provincial Police and the Military, who maintain a staff of certified Instructors/Instruction-Trainers to run First Aid and CPR programs. The Instructors must teach the programs as outlined by St. John but can add other organizational requirements that the employer needs.

In Ontario, there are other organizations such as the Royal Life Saving Society, the Canadian Red Cross and the Canadian Heart and Stroke Foundation who provide certification at the Instructor level. The Instructor certification program in each of these organizations is recognized by the other organizations. However, if an Instructor of St. John wants to teach for the Canadian Red Cross, it is usually necessary for the Instructor to requalify with the second organization. This ensures that the Instructor is familiar with the documentation and support materials of the second organization.

Information Gathering

The primary contact for St. John Ambulance-Ontario Council was the Director of Standards and Certification for Ontario. Interviews of approximately one hour were carried out with
three staff: the Director of Standards and Certification, the Co-ordinator of Program Support and the Operations Manager for the Metro Branch, and a volunteer who is a senior Instructor-Trainer. A survey to gather information from St. John Instructor/Instructor-Trainers was designed and reviewed by both the Director of Standards and Certification and the Co-ordinator of Program Support. The Co-ordinator of Program Support supplied address labels of Instructor/Instructor-Trainers from across Ontario that included new and senior Instructors and Instructor-Trainers.

Initially, twenty-eight surveys were mailed to test the survey questions (Appendix H). All questions in the survey were answered as expected and no comments or suggestions for improvement to the survey were made by the respondents. After discussion with the staff of St. John, it was agreed to ask (Appendix I) an additional question on accessibility to Instructor/Instructor-Trainer training on the main survey. The number of certified Instructor/Instructor-Trainers in Ontario that have current certification varies at any time because recertification is required every three years to maintain currency. Additionally, in 1995, a new program for First Aid was launched and all Instructor/Instructor-Trainers had to participate in an update session by a specified date or they would no longer hold current certification. It was estimated that there were 3500 current Instructor/Instructor-Trainers in the Ontario database. After discussion, it was agreed to send the survey to five hundred current Ontario Instructors/Instructor-Trainers. Again, the co-ordinator of Program Support supplied address labels of Instructors/Instructor-Trainers based on the same criteria used for the pilot. The data on return rates are found in Chapter 4.

Since all the questions on both surveys were the same except for the additional question on accessibility (#14), data from both the pilot and main survey were analyzed together.
Canadian Compensation Association

Overview

The Canadian Compensation Association (CCA) is a not-for-profit organization of more than 1,100 professionals engaged in the design, implementation and management of employee compensation and benefits programs in Canada. The CCA was established in 1985 and is governed by a Board of Directors elected from the membership of the Association. The CCA is one of five regional offices of the American Compensation Association (CCA, 1994).

The CCA offers a certification program in the area of compensation and benefits. The program consists of nine courses of study (five mandatory and four elective) with an examination after each course leading to a Certified Compensation Professional (CCP) designation. Courses are only available through the association and were developed by the American Compensation Association and Canadianized by Canadian subject matter experts. The body of knowledge covered by courses was validated by a research team from Rutgers University’s Institute of Management and Labour Relations (CCA, 1994). The report is not a public report and was not released to the researcher. No explanation was provided.

The design of the certification program allows individuals to participate in specific courses for their own development, take a course and not write the exam, write the exam at a proctor centre without taking the course, or take the whole program. Upon successful completion of the program, candidates receive a CCP with or without the requirement to become a member.

of the CCA.

To participate in the training program, an individual is required only to register and pay a fee to take the courses. There is no educational entry or association membership requirement.

**Information Gathering**

The primary contact for the Canadian Compensation Association was the Manager of Operations. Interviews of approximately one hour were carried out with the Manager of Operations, two volunteers on the Board (President and Vice President of Education) and an individual who has recently completed the CCP program. The survey to gather information from the membership and/or those participants in the CCP program was reviewed and agreed to by the Manager of Operations and the Vice President of Education prior to distribution.

The Manager of Operations provided address labels of association members and/or participants in the certification program. The candidates for the study were selected from the CCA database by CCA staff based on the following criteria: individuals who had earned the CCP designation and/or were in the process of completing the program; members of the association not taking the program and a cross section of candidates from across Canada. To test the survey, thirty pilot surveys (Appendix J) were mailed out with return stamped envelopes addressed to the researcher. One respondent suggested that the questions asking for feedback on objectives, testing and accessibility (questions # 11 to 18) be changed from a "yes/no" response to one that had a scale. The scale would allow respondents to select a score representing their answer (Appendix K). After discussion with the Managing Director of the CCA, this change was made for the main survey. The main survey was sent to 300 CCA members and/or participants in the CCP program using the same criteria for the
selection of candidates used for the pilot. Data on the return rates are in Chapter 4.

The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators

Overview

The Institute is an internationally recognized body of administrators and advisors in corporate matters. It was founded in Great Britain in 1891 to provide a professional qualification for Corporate Secretaries. The Institute has a world-wide membership of 45,000 full members plus 21,000 student members. In Canada there are approximately 1,300 members. The first Canadian Branch was established in 1920, and the Institute was incorporated federally in 1957. The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators (ICSA) is the only organization in Canada offering a professional designation for corporate secretaries and administrators. The professional designations are Associate (ACIS) and Fellow (FCIS). The candidate for the designation applies to ICSA and progresses through an accreditation program called Program 2000.

For admission as an Associate and/or as a Fellow, a candidate must:

- successfully complete Program 2000
- hold an appropriate position at the time of application
- for an ACIS: have at least three years relevant work experience
- for an FCIS: have at least eight years relevant work experience, three of which should be

---

at the senior level as a corporate secretary, assistant or deputy corporate secretary, or equivalent executive administrative position.

The ICSA Program 2000 requires a candidate to have an undergraduate degree from a university recognized by the Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada or a professional designation such as CMA, CGA, CA or LLB. Individuals who hold one of the above degrees may be required by the Institute to take courses in one of the following three streams: business administration, federal/provincial government and local/municipal government. The courses are available through the Institute at various locations throughout the country. The criteria used to analyze a candidate’s application were not available as a public document nor were they released to the researcher. If an individual holds a degree other than the ones identified by the Institute he/she may be required to complete courses in the three streams listed above plus two additional courses: management of information systems and organizational behaviour. All courses taken at a university or college must be pre-approved by the ICSA.

There is a special entry scheme for election to FCIS. Candidates for this scheme must have an approved academic qualification, practical experience of appropriate character and duration including a minimum of ten years experience in a position of senior administrative capacity, and a minimum age of 33. These candidates have three options that include to:

1. write Institute’s final examination on Corporate Procedures or,
2. attend a Professional Interview or,
3. prepare a thesis of 3,500 and 4,500 words on a subject relevant to the candidate’s experience.
Information Gathering

A discussion about the association and the professional program was carried out by telephone with the Executive Director. She indicated that the Institute standards were set by the United Kingdom group and that the role of the leadership in Canada was to develop a recognition of the designation in Canada. She noted that questions on who set standards would initiate discussion in the organization which the association leadership was not prepared to address. The standards are set internationally with input from Canada, but the Canadian group did not have control over the standards. Additionally, she indicated that the question on recertification was not appropriate and asked that it be removed from the survey.

Initially, 30 surveys (Appendix L) were distributed as a pilot to a random sample of association members using the membership list given to the researcher by the Executive Director of the Institute. No changes were made as a result of data collected during the pilot. Thus, the same survey was distributed to three hundred members of the Institute. Data on the return rates are in Chapter 4.

Canadian Payroll Association

Overview

The Canadian Payroll Association (CPA) is a national trade association whose mission is to provide payroll leadership through education and advocacy. The CPA, founded in 1978, represents the interests of over 3,000 member companies. In 1985, the CPA introduced the
Payroll Management Certificate Program (PMCP). The PMCP is a multilevel training program designed to increase the level of knowledge and professionalism in payroll administration and management.

The CPA Payroll Training program consists of three levels. One course in each level is offered through the Association and the other courses are available through Universities and Colleges. The Association course on Introduction to Payroll is offered through two options, correspondence for all courses and computer-based delivery. The computer-based delivery option for Intermediate Payroll and Payroll Management is scheduled for future development. All students in the program are subject to the same examination schedule. The "challenge option" allows students who believe they have sufficient experience in the course topics for a particular level to write the final examination for all CPA courses without submitting assignments. Challengers must obtain a grade of 60 percent or greater as compared to the 50 percent passing grade required in the correspondence or computer-based option (CPA, 1995).

Information Gathering

Based on my initial proposal to the association, a meeting was arranged with the Manager of Training and a Marketing Manager to discuss details of the steps involved in the research. During this meeting, the certificate program details were clarified, and it was identified that the members of the CPA were not individuals but companies. The candidates for the survey were defined as the students taking the payroll courses. The staff of the CPA stated that up to 10,000 students had participated in their courses in the last 10 years. It was decided to target students on the program during the past two years.
After these discussions, the Manager of Training took my proposal to a Board of Directors Meeting to get their permission to proceed with the survey. The Board agreed to allow the survey under the following conditions: the association staff would put address labels on the surveys as the association wanted to control access to their student database and a letter (Appendix M) from the association would be added to the survey to clarify the activity.

Initially, 30 surveys (Appendix M) were mailed out to test the instrument. Question 7, which asked for the number of courses completed toward a designation, was not answered with a number but a check mark. To ensure that the expected response was received, the question on the main survey (Appendix N) was changed to ask for the number of CPA and the number of college and university courses that had been completed. After discussion, the agreement was to send 500 surveys to students in the CPA certification program in the past two years. Data on the return rates are in Chapter 4.

**Summary**

Five professional associations agreed to participate in the study. The OSTD has just begun to create a competency-based certification program. They were agreeable to interviews of some of their membership but did not want a survey sent out. St. John Ambulance agreed to a study of their members who are Instructor or Instructor-Trainers. Their program is a combination of curriculum-based for the adult education portion and competency-based for the skills. The Canadian Compensation Program and the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators both run a program that was created in other countries and that has been modified to meet Canadian needs. The CCA program is curriculum-based whereas the ICSA program has moved recently from a criterion-based to a curriculum-based program. In the CPA association, the membership is companies not individuals. Representatives from
organizations have formed an association to meet their needs and one of the products is their certification program. Many individuals take only the three association specific courses and do not complete any of the certification programs.
Chapter Four
Data from Interviews and Surveys

Data on the certification program of five professional associations (OSTD, St. John Ambulance, CCA, ISCA and CPA) were gathered using interviews of key association staff and members as identified as well as surveys of association members or participants in the certification program. The questions used for the interviews are illustrated in Appendix F and the surveys, customized for each association, are in Appendixes H, I, J, K, L, M, N and O. The interviews and survey results were analyzed based on the questions and objectives in Chapter One under the headings: certification process, participation in the certification program, certification program requirements, standards, accessibility and continuing education. All associations were analyzed in the same way except the OSTD. OSTD is in the process of developing a certification program and only interviews were carried out. The development of the certification program was emphasized in the interviews and is included in the analysis.

Ontario Society for Training and Development (OSTD)

Interviews of the Managing Director, Vice-President of Standards and Accreditation and three individuals who are involved in training in business, education and a student of the Training and Development program at Ryerson were carried out.

Note 1: The percentages in Table 4-2 to 4-6, 4-7 to 4-10, 4-12 to 4-13, 4-15 to 4-18 and 5-1 to 5-8 do not add to 100 as participants were asked to respond to all items that applied to them.

Note 2: Not all participants answered all questions. The total respondents to a question appears in the table as total respondents.
The OSTD serves a very diverse population involved in providing training activities to a diverse clientele. The membership of OSTD tends to be entry level in the training profession and involved in the delivery of training in a wide variety of areas including: management training, technical training, software training, consulting on training needs, on-the-job training and management of training. The membership tends mainly to include individuals who are involved in the delivery of training. Senior level training professionals who tend to be involved in deciding how training will occur usually drop out of the OSTD and look to other professional organizations, such as the International Society for Performance Improvement, to meet their needs.

**Certification Program**

**Background**

OSTD initiated the development of a certification program leading to a designation because it is committed as a professional association to the professionalization of trainers. The association leadership believes that the creation of a certification program with documented competencies will:

- increase the credibility of trainers with employers and the government,
- help employers assess the capabilities of potential candidates for trainers when hiring and,
- provide employers with a means of evaluating and maximizing the use of their training staff.

The Association leadership believes that the training profession would become self-governing as a result of defining the standards of the profession. In order to maintain their designation individuals would be required to have current membership in OSTD. The need to retain a significant number of members is as important for OSTD as it is for any other
voluntary professional association. The funds needed to run the office, pay staff and develop professional programs come from the fees of the membership. According to the Vice-President of Standards and Certification, OSTD will need a mechanism such as a continuing education point system to ensure certified individuals keep up-to-date in the field. The proposed certification program has no proposed formal recertification process.

The leadership of OSTD acknowledged that once the business community accepted the validity of the certification program, access to some training jobs would be restricted as employers would require the designation. However, as the designation is not a licence to practise the profession, individuals without the designation will not be denied the right to work as trainers. Trainers, some of whom are members of OSTD, have expressed concern about the development of a certification process. They are worried that the certification program will result in the need for a licence to practise the training profession.

There was no push from the membership to create a certification process, as many members were concerned about the tremendous expenditure of resources and energy that would be needed to develop and maintain a certification program. One member of the OSTD Board was keenly interested in taking on the task of developing a certification program, and the Board agreed to begin the process if the financial resources could be obtained. Support was obtained from the Ontario Training and Adjustment Board and consultants were hired to do the work.

Why should OSTD and not some other training group develop a certification program for all trainers? OSTD is the oldest, largest and most broadly based training organization in Canada. As an organization, it has credibility with individuals, with other professional organizations and with the government. For example, when the Ontario Training and Adjustment Board (OTAB) was formed, OSTD was extensively consulted on how things should be shaped. OSTD has the organizational and financial support needed (membership of over 1000 and an office staff of three) to venture into this type of work. Other training associations such as the International Society for Performance Improvement - Toronto
Chapter and the Organizational Development Network - Toronto Chapter, tend to be specialized in nature, with smaller memberships and no permanent office staff.

Program Development

Very few people set out in their career to be a trainer. Many trainers are subject matter experts who end up training for a short period of time. However, the leadership of OSTD wanted training to be perceived as a profession that people aspire to as a career and not simply as a “stop-gap” on the career ladder. There are a number of universities offering degrees in Adult Education and a number of institutions have diploma programs in Training and Development. However, according to the Vice President of Standards and Accreditation\(^\text{15}\), there is no path and no university program leading to a degree in training and development. The development of a professional certification program would provide individuals and employers with the tools to help them develop in the areas of training and development and in the management of the training function.

To determine if there were certification programs available for trainers in other countries, a number of research activities were carried out. Initial surveys of the training field, internationally, showed that there were no professional competency standards\(^\text{16}\). The American Society for Training and Development (ASTD) had defined a Model for Excellence for trainers but has not developed a certification process. Under the sponsorship of the Ontario Training Corporation (OTC), OSTD commissioned a study that looked at the worldwide state of performance standards for trainers to ensure their efforts would not be redundant. They found nothing existed except the ASTD material, which was too detailed and which did not define competencies of trainers in behavioural terms.

---

\(^{15}\) Interview with Vice-President of Standards and Accreditation. (1994).

Research on best practices was initiated. The results indicated that organizations were aware of best practices such as needs assessment but found that people and organizations did not practise them. As there were so few examples of best practices in use to build on, OSTD began a process to develop them.

To initiate the OSTD's work on the certification program, a representative of the OSTD Board made an information presentation at the 1993 OSTD annual general meeting, held public forums and outreach efforts with OTC and solicited opinions from the training community on the topic. Generally, there was overwhelming support for the concept at the meeting. The main concern expressed about the development of a certification program was the objection to testing the knowledge of trainers rather than their performance. Trainers were "doers" and the testing of competency ought to permit the trainers to demonstrate their worth and qualifications.

To gain support in the training community for the development of a certification process, a number of presentations were made to the International Society for Performance Improvement (ISPI), Toronto Chapter and an article was published in News and Notes (a publication of the International Office of ISPI) in November/December 1993 on the topic. The feedback from the ISPI membership was split, with many ISPI members stating that there was no way OSTD should be the organization responsible for any certification for trainers.

To begin the development of the certification program, The Competency Analysis for Trainers (CAT) was reviewed. The CAT is a self-assessment tool, developed by OSTD in 1975 and updated in 1987, that was the basis for the Professional Development Assessment Program for trainers. The consultant group hired to develop the certification program used the CAT as the starting point. They prepared a proposal for the OSTD Board which was accepted, and then went on to produce the product. The output of the work of the consultant group was the Training Competency Architecture (TCA) that defined competencies and a toolkit that provided a methodology for self-assessment. The draft TCA was reviewed.
extensively using focus groups of representatives from large and small companies, trainers, organized labour, community groups and union representatives. No defined training/education program for learning the competencies was developed.

Program Maintenance

The Vice-President of Standards and Certification for OSTD stated in his interview with the researcher (1994) that there was a need to be ready to update the process yearly. His concern was that, in the past, the organization has been unable to review periodically programs such as the Human Resource Development Certificate (HRD) Program. The OSTD has decided that the program does not reflect the needs of the training community of the 1990s. As a result, OSTD is walking away from the HRD program (a curriculum-based program developed in 1966) with the introduction of certification. According to the Vice-President of Standards and Certification, the resources to carry out this type of update will require the contracting of someone to do the updating. The development of the TCA was expensive and ongoing maintenance will also be expensive. There is a need to ensure that the fee for the examination has a built-in component that goes directly to a fund for ongoing updating.

Introduction of the Certification Program

After the initial announcement of the availability of the Training Competency Architecture (TCA), there was a lot of interest that came mostly from organizations who saw the TCA as a management tool. Some colleges and universities staff responsible for courses in training have expressed an interest in the TCA. The competencies listed will be used as a basis for designing or updating their training and development course material. The Vice-President of Standards and Certification (interview, 1994) indicated that a great deal of interest has been expressed by other training associations in the United States as well as in other countries.

The Managing Director stated that OSTD is committed to the process of certification (interview, 1994). The OSTD leadership is looking for ways to get more of the membership
involved in the next steps of the process. From her point of view if a “member was not prepared to be part of the professional association that promotes a certification process, then perhaps OSTD is not the professional organization for them”\textsuperscript{17}

Recertification

There is no formal recertification process in the OSTD certification program. To be able to continue to use the designation once earned, the individual will have to maintain current membership in OSTD. The Vice-President of Standards and Certification indicated during his interview that there may be a need to create a formal continuing education program for individuals who are certified. However, in his opinion, this type of development will not occur sometime in the future.

Participation in Certification Program

The expectation of the leadership of OSTD is that the following groups of individuals will be interested in participation in the certification program:

- individuals who are new to the profession and who are looking for developmental opportunities,
- individuals who are looking to move into the field of training and who want credentials to prove their abilities with potential employers and
- individuals who have been in the field of training but who have no credentials and who want to round out their knowledge base.

\textsuperscript{17} Interview with Managing Director of Ontario Society for Training and Development. (1994).
Certification Program Requirements

The proposed process for certification based on the TCA is to include a comprehensive knowledge examination and a skills test, neither of which has yet been developed. As an organization, OSTD is not concerned about how the individual achieves the competencies defined in the TCA. They will be looking to others, such as colleges and universities to provide the training and to become acknowledged test centres. In addition to demonstrating the achievement of the competencies, individuals will be required to have two years of supervised practice before they can be certified. The process, including the experience component, is consistent with other professional associations such as Certified Management Accountants and Certified General Accountants Association. There will be no grandparenting of individuals who have been in the training field for years. The completion of both the knowledge and skill components will be required for certification.

Standards

OSTD has created a competency-based certification program and documented its development and requirements in the TCA. The competency categories required include:

- analyzing performance/training needs,
- designing training,
- instructing/facilitating,
- evaluating training and,
- coaching the application of training.

There was a significant amount of input from recognized training professionals in the development of the TCA. Using the toolkit, individuals can assess their own competencies and plan a professional development program to fill the gaps. Colleges, universities and other professional development institutions provide a basis on which to develop courses of study.
Accessibility

The OSTD will not be requiring individuals to participate in any specific training or education program. The only requirements for certification will be the successful completion of a knowledge examination which will be proctored through examination centres and of a performance requirement the details of which are yet to be determined. The leadership does not anticipate any accessibility issue with the certification program.

Continuing Education

The OSTD offers its membership ongoing workshops on current topics. The frequency of these varies and is based on demand. Various workshops are offered more than once. Additionally, the OSTD offers an annual two day Conference which is usually attended by four to five hundred members and non-members.

Summary

Although interested as an association in a professional certification program for its membership, the OSTD leadership did not take on the job until it was able to obtain the resources, both human and financial, to manage the task. Additionally, it had a champion on the Board who was prepared to see the process through. There is more that one professional association for trainers in the community. As was to be expected (Barnhart, 1994), the issue of why OSTD should take the leadership has arisen. However, as an organization it has pushed ahead, creating standards with input from the training community and publishing public documentation on these standards. At this time, OSTD is preparing to develop the assessment tools. The organization is aware of the cost in dollars and human resources to carry out the task but is continuing to move forward.
A membership survey was conducted by OSTD in the fall of 1995 to gather information on the future direction of the organization. The leadership used the survey as a means to gather information on the work done on certification. Eight out of ten members wanted OSTD to actively market the Certified Training Professional Designation and to take a more proactive leadership in the development of Training and Development standards and competencies.

Issues Related to the Introduction of the New Program

There are a number of issues about the certification that have been raised by the OSTD. First, there are a number of community-based organizations in the Toronto area that are very involved in training and are interested in a certification process to develop skills in their trainers. They do not have the resources to create one themselves and their leadership sees the OSTD program as valuable. However, they are concerned that their membership would have to become members of OSTD and pay additional fees to participate in the certification. Most individuals would not want to belong to two professional associations with its added cost. Secondly, training is often not a life-time position. Employers ask individuals who are subject matter experts to take on a training role for a specific period of time. If these individuals earned a designation, they would need to maintain membership in OSTD to continue to use the designation. Thirdly, potential candidates for the certification program, when interviewed, expressed concern about the qualifications of individuals who set standards for the profession.

The leadership of OSTD is aware of these issues and is looking for ways to deal with the first one. A possible solution may include the selling of the certification program to other training organizations and collecting a fee for generic testing on the training competencies. The Managing Director stated that OSTD needs to “partner with other training organizations if it is going to be successful in the introduction of the certification program”. In order to

---

support the introduction of the certification program, OSTD must maintain its membership; to do that it has to meet the needs both of its members and of the training community. Partnering with other associations may be the answer. Certification is a product, a marketing tool good for the consumer. As an organization, OSTD believes it can make money on certification and also service the training community.

St. John Ambulance

Ontario Division Interview Data

The Director of Standards and Certification, the Co-ordinator of Program Support, an Operations Manager for the Metro Branch and a senior Instructor-Trainer were interviewed using the questions in Appendix F. Although St. John Ambulance has a number of certification programs, the study was limited to those for Instructors and Instructor-Trainers.

Certification Process

To register and participate in an Instructor or Instructor-Trainer certification program, candidates are required to meet the criteria outlined in Appendix G. During the program, participants are required to:

- demonstrate a selection of CPR and First Aid skills to defined standards,
- successfully complete a written examination on knowledge related to adult education and,
- make a presentation that incorporates adult education principles.

After successful completion of the above and prior to receiving their certification, the Instructor or Instructor-Trainer must be monitored by another Instructor-Trainer using a
standard monitoring form when teaching his or her first course. Every three years, individuals must take a recertification course to maintain their designation.

Program Development

The bulk of the program development is done at the National Headquarters of St. John Ambulance, where minimum program standards are set for the Canadian Program. Each provincial council can add to these minimum standards based on local needs. Ontario, with the largest number of Instructors, tends to be more particular and less flexible in the requirements for Instructor/Instructor-Trainer training. The Director of Standards and Certification and the Co-ordinator of Program Support identified that there was no set procedure for the development of certification programs, and that updates were done when needed and when resources were available to do the work.

The history of the original development of the Instructor and Instructor-Trainer program was unknown to the staff members interviewed. Approximately four years ago, the Ontario Council gathered together a number of Instructor-Trainers who had perceived expertise in the areas of instructor training to update the Instructor program. In a one-day workshop, the Instructor-Trainers drafted an outline for a new Instructor course and filled in the details using materials they had brought with them. At the end of the day, the Director of Standards and Certification took the work that had been done and had it typed. After some review, the new materials were piloted in an Instructor course, updated and submitted to National Headquarters to be considered as the course for the country. The updated materials were adopted nationally.
Program Maintenance

The certification program is updated periodically based on need and resources, as previously discussed. Instructors are monitored at each course taught, and if issues arise, the Director of Standards and Certification for Ontario is responsible for dealing with any complaints about Instructors from students or the public. If a complaint is received, a review is carried out. If the outcome of the review is the removal of Instructor certification, the Instructor can make an appeal to a St. John appeal committee. If the appeal committee agrees to remove the Instructor's certification, the Instructor is sent a letter signed by the Executive Director of St. John Ambulance and the Director of Standards and Certification stating that their certification has been withdrawn. Some individuals require the Instructor certification for employment and this type of action may result in job loss. There is the possibility for appeal to the court system. The Director of Certification and Standards indicated that in five years, she has been involved in the removal of only one Instructor.

Recertification

Every three years, each Instructor and Instructor-Trainer is required to recertify by participation in a course and the successful completion of a written and skills examination. None of the interviewees knew why the frequency of recertification was every three years. As far as the staff of St. John were aware, no studies have been done in this area for First Aid. CPR skill-retention studies have illustrated that within six months of training, an individual’s skills deteriorate by 50%. Based on these studies, CPR recertification on basic skills has been set at once per year.

Participation in the Certification Program

Individuals who participate in the Instructor and Instructor-Trainer certification program include: individuals who do volunteer work for St. John Ambulance in their community
based programs such as the Brigade and individuals from businesses such as the police, mining, fire and medical where First Aid and CPR programs are required.

**Certification Program Requirements**

The prerequisites for participation in the Instructor certification program are a recommendation from a St. John Ambulance representative, a valid First Aid certificate and a current CPR certificate. The prerequisites for participation in the Instructor-Trainer certification program are a recommendation from a St. John Ambulance representative, a valid First Aid certificate, a current CPR certificate and a valid NIDTP Instructor certificate.

**Standards**

A St. John Ambulance medical committee and program committee at a national level set new skills standards with input from provincial staff and volunteers. The knowledge and skill requirements for the First Aid components are reviewed periodically by the National Medical Committee. Based on changing medical practice and feedback from members of St. John Ambulance, changes are made to the program. The CPR component of the program is reviewed by an international medical committee every five years. The changes proposed by that committee (based on changing medical practices and feedback from Instructors and Instructor-Trainers) are incorporated into the program. St. John Ambulance, along with other organizations who teach CPR, are required to adhere to the international standards. The standards for the Instructor and Instructor-Trainer components of the program (teaching using adult learning principles, coaching skills and communication skills) have been identified and documented by various education committees over the years. The most recent update to these standards was described under program development.
Courses for certification and recertification of Instructors and Instructor-Trainers are offered through the Provincial office. The program design requires the Instructor and Instructor-Trainers courses to be controlled centrally through the Toronto office and run only when demand is sufficient. The Program Co-ordinator and the Instructor-Trainer interviewed identified the ability of St. John to offer courses across the province where and when needed as an issue. Individuals requiring certification are often required to travel to larger centres such as Toronto and London and to incur significant costs to participate in the training sessions. In some cases, the training sessions are cancelled due to the lack of registered participants. Recertification courses for Instructors are not always available when their recertification is required. In many areas of Ontario there are few or no Instructors. This has been a concern of the leadership of St. John Ambulance but at this time they have not been able to address it.

Update training for Instructors/Instructor-Trainers on any standard changes is mandatory. When "First On The Scene" was introduced in 1995, all Instructors and Instructor-Trainers were required to take an update course on the new materials by a specific date. Provincial Council controls the updating process by ensuring that only those Instructors/Instructor-Trainers who have participated in the training by a specified date maintain their certification. St. John Ambulance Branches authorize all training courses and control the distribution of certificates for candidates who have completed St. John Ambulance courses. Thus, if an Instructor organizes and teaches a course without St. John's permission, the participants in a course would not receive certificates.

Ontario is divided into areas, each of which has a group of Instructors and Instructor-Trainers who provide training in courses such as Standard First Aid and CPR. The Metro Branch has an Instructor Development Committee that has developed a guide for new Instructors and has
organized professional development sessions for Metro Instructors. Instructors and Instructor-Trainers of the Metro Branch are required to participate in a minimum of one professional development session per year if they wish to be maintained on the Metro list as active Instructors. There are a large number of different programs run by St. John. Instructors can develop professionally by taking other skills courses such as Wilderness First Aid, which they can then teach.

**Ontario Division Survey Data**

**Introduction**

The data collected by survey of St. John Instructors and Instructor-Trainers was analyzed under the heading identified in the introduction to Chapter 4. Table 4-1 illustrates the rate of return of the surveys. The pilot survey tested the instrument to ensure the questions were answered and that the answers reflected the data the researcher had set out to collect. Question 14 was added to the main survey to collect data on the perceived accessibility of the program to the respondents. All other questions were the same both on the pilot and main surveys. The rate of return of 34% was considered good by St. John who have had difficulty getting responses from Instructors and Instructor-Trainers on their surveys.

**Table 4-1**

**Survey Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Number Distributed</th>
<th>Number Returned</th>
<th>Percentage Returned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pilot</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>33.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>528</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>34.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Certification Process

Recertification

Over 90% of respondents indicated that recertification is important because it ensures that:

- Instructors are teaching current skills and knowledge,
- standards of practice are maintained and,
- an opportunity is created for individuals to learn and share ideas (Table 4-2).

When reasons for recertification were analyzed against years of experience of Instructors, the overwhelming reason, regardless of years of experience of the respondents for mandatory recertification (greater than 89% for all age groups except ages 18 to 29), was to maintain standards. The same response was obtained when the data on recertification was analyzed against age.

Table 4-2
Recertification of Instructors/Instructor-Trainers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons why recertification is important</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ensure that Instructors/Instructor Trainers are teaching current skills and knowledge</td>
<td>96.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensures that certain standards of practice are maintained</td>
<td>93.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creates an opportunity for individuals to learn and share ideas with each other</td>
<td>92.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL Respondents = 173</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Participation in the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer Certification Program

Background of Respondents

Fifty-seven percent of the respondents were NIDTP Instructors and 35% were NIDTP Instructor-Trainers. Over 35% of the respondents had greater than 9 years experience as an Instructor and on the average they taught between 16 and 23 courses per year. Accessibility to training and recertification was an issue for 24% of the respondents but 88% felt confident to provide training after completion of their certification program.

Reasons for Participation

The main reason (Table 4-3) identified for participation in the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification program was to make a volunteer contribution to the community. The St. John Ambulance organization is based on volunteerism.

It has developed a Brigade system in which individuals are trained in First Aid and CPR. The Brigade members volunteer their time at community events and disasters to provide support and aid to those individuals in need. Generally, individuals volunteer to work in one of St. John’s programs and take the certification program (paid for by the Brigade) in order to be qualified for the volunteer program. The second most identified reason for participation in the certification program is that certification is required for employment (Table 4-3). There is a mandatory requirement for First Aid and CPR skills in a number of jobs such as mining, policing and firefighting. Many organizations prefer to have individuals on staff who can teach these requirements to their employees because they can tailor the training to the specific job or they can do training in “down-time” on the job.
Table 4-3
Reasons Why Respondents participated in the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer Training of St. John Ambulance

180 (100%) of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respondent wanted to make a volunteer contribution to his/her community including Brigade.</td>
<td>68.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification required for employment</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondent wanted to develop additional skills for future employment</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondent believed he/she could earn extra money from teaching.</td>
<td>35.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The third and fourth reasons identified (Table 4-3) were to develop additional skills for future employment and to earn extra money from teaching. The requirements for employment in a job such as firefighting include having current CPR and First Aid certification. Many potential candidates for these types of jobs feel that being certified to teach these qualifications gives them an extra qualification in a difficult job market. This reason was identified mainly by respondents in the age range of 19 to 39. Since the demand for certification at the First Aid and CPR level is high in many job categories, there are opportunities to teach for St. John Ambulance, the Community Colleges and private trainers who are involved in providing training in the marketplace. The availability of employment provides individuals with the opportunity to earn extra income. Respondents in the age range from 30 to 49 in particular noted this as a reason for certification. Other reasons identified...

---

19 Discussion with an Instructor-Trainer. (1994).
for participating in the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification include: enjoy teaching (11.7%) and the desire to keep skills current (5%).

Certification Program Requirements

Table 4-4
Prerequisites for Admission to St. John Instructor Training Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actual Prerequisites for Admission to the Instructor Program</th>
<th>Percentage of NIDTP Instructor Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A recommendation from a St. John Representative</td>
<td>43.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A valid First Aid certificate</td>
<td>93.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A current CPR certificate</td>
<td>84.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Perceived prerequisites to participate in Instructor the program</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A valid NIDTP Instructor certificate</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous teaching experience</td>
<td>12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A valid Health Care certificate</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 95</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An analysis of the requirements the respondents felt they required to participate in the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer training indicated that the documented requirements for participation are not clear. The prerequisites for the NIDTP Instructor program include a valid St. John Ambulance Standard or Advanced First Aid certificate issued within one year.
Table 4-4a
Prerequisites for Admission to St. John Instructor-Trainer Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actual Perquisites for Admission to the Instructor-Trainer Program</th>
<th>Percentage of NIDTP Instructor-Trainer Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A recommendation from a St. John Representative</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous teaching experience</td>
<td>51.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A valid First Aid certificate</td>
<td>72.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A current CPR certificate</td>
<td>72.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A valid NIDTP Instructor certificate</td>
<td>37.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived prerequisites to participate in Instructor the program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A valid Health Care certificate</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 35

of the course commencement, a current Level C CPR certificate issued within one year of course commencement and a recommendation of a St. John Ambulance representative indicating that the individual is capable of meeting course objectives and fulfilling the responsibilities of the position description. (See Appendix N). For the Instructor-Trainer
program, in addition to the Instructor program prerequisites, the candidate requires a current NIDTP Instructor certificate. The data in Table 4-4 indicates that only 43.2% of respondents thought a recommendation from a St. John Representative was required for participation in the Instructor program and 72.9% believed that a valid First Aid certificate or current CPR certificate was required for the Instructor-Trainer program.

As identified both of these requirements are mandatory. It would be expected that at least 90% of respondents would have identified these requirements as necessary, considering they are required to recertify every three years and must review the requirements and be tested on the requirements at that time.

Requirements for Successful Completion of Certification

To successfully complete the NIDTP Instructor or Instructor-Trainer program and receive certification, candidates must demonstrate some First Aid and CPR skills, participate in group work to the satisfaction of the Instructor-Trainer, do a presentation on an assigned topic using the principles of adult education discussed in the course and be successfully monitored by an Instructor-Trainer using the required monitoring procedure. Instructors are monitored on a First Aid and/or CPR course and Instructor-Trainers are monitored on an Instructor course.
Table 4-5
Requirements to Successfully Complete
the St. John NIDTP Instructor Certification Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actual Requirements</th>
<th>Percentage of NIDTP Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Be monitored by an Instructor-Trainer</td>
<td>94.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepare and deliver a presentation on a relevant topic to the satisfaction of the instructor</td>
<td>91.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Perceived Requirements</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate all the skills of First Aid and CPR</td>
<td>87.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate all the skills of the Health Care program</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS</strong></td>
<td><strong>96</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The need to demonstrate First Aid and CPR skills during the certification program was understood by the participants in the program (Table 4-5 and 4-5a). This is not surprising, as the participants are preparing to teach these skills and must come to the certification program prepared to demonstrate them (Appendix G). The question on the survey was not well-worded, as it implied that all CPR skills must be demonstrated and in fact only some are required. The pilot results did not show this and the problem may have resulted in the less than 100% confirmation of the requirement.
Table 4-5a
Requirements to Successfully Complete the St. John NIDTP Instructor-Trainer Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actual Requirements</th>
<th>Percentage of NIDTP Instructor-Trainers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Be monitored by an Instructor-Trainer</td>
<td>82.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepare and deliver a presentation on a relevant topic to the satisfaction of the Instructor</td>
<td>91.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceived Requirements</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate all the skills of First Aid and CPR</td>
<td>91.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate all the skills of the Health Care Program</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 32</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Standards

#### Table 4-6
Who sets the Standards for Instructor Certification and Who should be involved in Setting the Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Groups involved in setting standards (% of respondents)</th>
<th>Who should be involved in setting standards (% of respondents)</th>
<th>Difference A minus B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National volunteers of St. John Ambulance</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>57.5</td>
<td>(14.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial volunteers of St. John Ambulance</td>
<td>90.6</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>(5.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National staff of St. John Ambulance</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>50.3</td>
<td>(15.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial staff of St. John Ambulance</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>(5.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Instructors and Instructor-Trainers</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>71.9</td>
<td>(28.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL RESPONDENTS</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>153</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: All identified groups are involved and encouraged to be involved in setting standards for the programs.
Only 43.8% of respondents indicated that Individual Instructors and Instructor-Trainers of St. John Ambulance were involved in setting the Instructor standards. (Table 4-6). A few respondents indicated that others such as the Ministry of Health, Hydro and Workers Compensation should be involved. The answers illustrate that many respondents are not aware that national and local volunteers as well as Instructors and Instructor-Trainers are asked to provide input and feedback on standards and are actively participate on committees involved in periodically updating of standards. However, they indicated that there should be more involvement of the National Staff of St. John and Individual Instructors and Instructor-Trainers (Table 4-6).

**Accessibility**

**Location**

Accessibility to Instructor/Instructor-Trainer training is perceived as a problem by 24.4% of the respondents to the survey\(^2\). This confirms the concern the leadership of St. John Ambulance expressed during the interviews. The courses for the certification training are only run in areas that support the cost. Therefore, many candidates for the training must travel to larger centres and pay the cost in time, accommodation and travel.

**Cost of Certification**

The average cost reported by the respondents of the various instructor training courses varied considerably. Many respondents did not answer the question and stated they did not know the cost of the course as it had been covered by the employer or the Brigade. The average cost of the NITDP Instructor course was $328 with a standard deviation of $316. One of the contributing factors to this variability of the cost is the length of the courses. Some Instructors take courses from their employer (military, RCMP or Hydro) and the employer

\(^2\) Data from research survey. (1994).
may vary the length of course by adding additional material to suit their needs. St. John Ambulance sets the minimum standards (40 hours for the initial NITDP Instructor course).

**Continuing Education**

Of the 168 of 180 respondents who indicated that they were aware of the professional development activities of St. John, 60% identified that they participated in one or more of them and 61.7% indicated that some of the professional development activities were mandatory. Skills update was identified as mandatory by only 41.7% of the respondents. As skills update is always mandatory, the researcher expected this percentage to be closer to 100. When asked if professional development activities in their opinion ought to be mandatory, 62.5% indicated that they should not. They stated that Instructors were volunteers and did not have the time, and that the cost was too high.

**Summary of Interview and Survey data**

The St. John Ambulance Instructor and Instructor-Trainer certification program is competency- and curriculum-based. The survey data confirmed the leadership comments that individuals participate to a large extent in certification to be able to volunteer for programs such as the St. John Brigade. Others require the certification for their job or to make them more employable. The leadership of St. John Ambulance, during the interviews, indicated that Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification is a requirement for jobs in areas such as policing and mining. Recertification every three years is a requirement in order to continue to use the designation. The recertification is strongly supported by the respondents and the leadership that was interviewed. Both groups agreed that it was a means to ensure that standards of certification were maintained.

Many respondents are unclear about who sets the standards for certification and some are unclear about the requirements for successful completion of the program. The Director of Standards during her interview provided the researcher with a copy of information on the
standards and requirements for certification. The application forms for the two programs ask candidates to review and sign a document where the requirements and standards are outlined. Since there is still confusion among some of the respondents, the researcher wonders if the standards and requirements are being administered differently across the province.

Over 60% of respondents participate in some form of continuing education. These data confirmed the interview data that most continuing education events were well attended. However, since poorly subscribed programs are generally cancelled, this information needs further clarification to determine the scope of the participation in planned continuing education activities. Over 60% of respondents identified that continuing education should not be mandatory. However, the leadership told the researcher that mandatory activities would continue, as they felt they were necessary to maintain standards.

**Canadian Compensation Association (CCA)**

**Interview Data**

Interviews of the CCA Managing Director, the President, the Vice President of Education and a student of the certification process were carried out.

The Canadian Compensation Association is the Canadian Region of the American Compensation Association (ACA). The CCA has divided Canada into seven regions, each headed by a volunteer Vice-President who is encouraged to initiate and run Association-sponsored events that meet the needs of their local membership.

**Certification Process**

The certification process is a curriculum-based program. The program requires candidates to successfully complete nine examinations in curriculum areas they have defined. CCA offers courses in a two day format to prepare candidates for the half-day examination. There are no
exemptions granted and the courses are only available through the Association. There is no comprehensive examination. There is no recertification process and the CCA does not require continued membership in the Association by individuals who have been awarded a designation to use the designation.

The President of the CCA stated that she was interested in determining the value of certification to individual members. In her opinion, individuals who participate in the designation training have committed to do the work. On successful completion of the program, they have shown their ability to learn information and to pass examinations. It does not mean they have other skills, such as listening, that are required to implement the knowledge on the job. The President stated that some of the CCA executives are now concerned that if the certification becomes a requirement for a job there is some liability on behalf of the association if an individual does not perform to the employer's expectations.

Program Development

The CCA courses are available only through the association and are run in a 2.5 day format: two days of course work and a half-day exam. Many of the clients for the designation program hold higher-level positions in their organization and, due to time constraints, cannot commit to a 13-week program. The 2.5 day program services a market niche. The association chose to run the courses for the program themselves rather than to run them through other agencies such as universities in order to maintain control of the quality. Equivalencies are not recognized. The program is a revenue generator for the Association.

Certification is a totally volunteer process. Individuals who participate in the program need not be members of the Association, and they can use the designation without this membership. Members of the Association pay less per course than non members. There are appropriately 200 individuals with a CCP in Canada. The designation program is relatively new (1985), and the average age of participants appears to be 35 - 45.
Program Maintenance

The organization is committed to ongoing development and updating of their courses and program. The cost of course development is built into the course and membership fee. The CCA has budgeted in the 1994 fiscal year to spend $50,000 in course development.

The compensation subject matter experts used to develop course content are generally program faculty who are chosen from the certified membership based on an Association defined selection process. Individual members of the association are not involved directly in course development. Participants are asked to provide feedback at the end of the course. The student interviewed expressed concern that the feedback from the courses was going into a black hole and not being used as a mechanism for program change.

Recertification

A “currency” (recertification) program, administered by the American Compensation Association, helps individuals to remain current in the field. Participation in conferences, workshops, and volunteering in the organizations contributes to the points required for currency. In addition, individuals can provide the committee with a synopsis of the major projects they have been involved in and thus apply for currency recognition. To keep his/her designation current, an individual must submit an application every 3 years illustrating his/her professional activities. A mandatory requirement for recertification was not seen as necessary. It was felt that individuals who actively work in the field would remain competent, as their employers would require it.

Participation in Certification Program

The leadership of the CCA stated that participants in their program included individuals who:
• want to move into the area of compensation and/or benefits and who believed that having the certification would improve their opportunities,
• are moved by their company into the area of compensation and/or benefits or the company had required them to take the CCA program,
• want to make a career change and were taking the courses to improve their chances of a successful change and,
• need one or more courses to provide the background they required to carry out a new assignment in their work organization.

Certification Program Requirements

In order to earn the designation an individual must successfully complete nine examinations outlined by the association. In addition to the standard nine course certification program, two courses in the benefits area have been added to the options to meet the needs of the Canadian professional. A large number of Canadians are more heavily involved in benefits than compensation. Candidates wanting to earn a Canadian Compensation Professional designation (CCP) can apply to write only the examination for each area of study and can buy the student workbook used in class to use as a study guide. Upon completion of the course work, a candidate can arrange to write the examination at any proctoring centre.

Standards

The standards for the courses and the structure of the courses have been developed by the ACA using a team of training and subject matter experts and are based on an analysis that was not available to the public or the researcher. The ACA is a very large organization of approximately 60,000 members and a staff of 50 to 60. The staff includes specialists in education and training development. The material developed by the ACA is Canadianized (Canadian legislation) by CCA subject matter experts who are usually the Canadian faculty. The CCA has Canadianized the materials to address the differences in laws on Compensation and Benefits. There is no public document defining the required competencies. The CCA
publishes a course calendar which defines the compulsory and non-compulsory courses. Each course has only a brief description of the content.

Accessibility

The CCA is unable to offer courses leading to the CCP in all areas of Canada due to lack of participant numbers and has had to cancel some scheduled courses for the same reason. One reason for the lack of participation in certain areas of the country, identified by respondents, is the cost. Some CCP candidates must travel to more populated areas such as Toronto and Vancouver to participate in required courses. To address the problem of the lack of course accessibility, the CCA has taken a number of steps that include running in-house programs for large organizations who sponsor the courses for their employees and looking at development of alternate delivery modes of courses to meet needs of potential candidates at more acceptable cost. The development of an interactive video course for job evaluation is also underway.

Continuing Education

The CCA runs an annual conference covering topics of membership interest that have been solicited using surveys, focus groups and general feedback. The certification program courses are offered during the annual conference. Additionally, workshops and seminars are offered in local areas based on identified needs. The ACA Institute provides a case study educational program in the area of compensation and benefits. Individuals require a designation to attend. Developing a similar program in Canada would require a high level of commitment if it were to be run by volunteers.
Survey Data

Introduction

Table 4-7
Survey Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Number Distributed</th>
<th>Number Returned</th>
<th>Percentage Returned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pilot</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>34.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The CCA survey (Appendixes J and K) were mailed to individuals who had participated in the CCA certification program whether or not they were members of the CCA. Table 4-7 illustrates that the average return rate was 40%.

The following is a summary of the information in the database of the survey results of both the pilot and the main survey.

Certification Process

Recertification

The CCA has an ongoing program known as the Currency Program which is administered by the American Compensation Association. Individuals who have earned the CCP designation and who participate in workshops, conferences and other activities earn points that the ACA recognizes towards maintenance of currency of CCP designation. When the respondents were asked if recertification should be mandatory, 54% said no. The main reasons were that recertification was too expensive (2.4%) and unnecessary (7.3%). Most respondents did not
provide reasons. However, 4.8% indicated that the currency method was agreeable and no other recertification was required. Of the 46% of respondents who indicated that recertification should be mandatory, 11.3% thought that a periodic refresher course plus examination was needed.

**Participation in Certification Program**

**Background of Respondents**

Over 80% of the respondents were in the age range of 30 to 49. Sixty-six percent were CCA members and 30 percent were not members. Of the 40% of respondents who indicated that they hold a CCP, the average length of time required to complete the program was $3.1 \pm 1.6$ years and 19% indicated that they maintained currency. For those respondents who are completing their CPP, the average number of courses completed was $3.7 \pm 2.4$ years. Over 80% of respondents had greater than 6 years experience in compensation and benefits. Additionally, 89% had work experience in general human resources and 15% had experience in finance.

**Reasons for Participating**

The main reasons respondents indicated for pursuing the CCP designation included to:

- validate their knowledge of compensation and benefits practices,
- strengthen their position in the job market at the time and,
- strengthen their position in the job market in general.

Not all members of the CCA who responded to the survey had pursued a CCP designation. The two main reasons identified for not pursuing the designation were the lack of value of the designation to their job (36.4%) and the high cost of the program (22.7%).

93
Table 4-7a
Reasons for Pursuing a CCP Designation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>Total Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Validate knowledge of compensation and benefits practices</td>
<td>75.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen position in job market at the time</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen position in the job market</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain respect among colleagues and professional associates</td>
<td>34.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand career options</td>
<td>46.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Become a part of a network of compensation and benefits practitioners</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The designation was a requirement for the job</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 81</strong></td>
<td><strong>59.1</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the respondents who had taken the CCP designation, 31.7% were not members of the CCA. Membership in the CCA is not a requirement for pursuing or maintaining a CCP designation. The reasons indicated by respondents for not maintaining or having CCA membership included lack of relevance of the membership to their job (44.7%) and/or lack of employer support for membership (13.2%). Although only 6.2% of respondents indicated that the designation was a requirement for their job, over 30% saw the designation as a means to gain respect among professional associates. Additionally, over 40% indicated that earning a designation would expand their career options.
Certification Program Requirements

Of the 65 respondents to the question, over 90% (Table 4-8) indicated that they required support from their employer to pay fees for courses. They indicated that the cost per course was approximately $800. Since the program is generally only available in a 2.5 day format, it is not surprising over 75% of respondents required time from their job to participate in the courses. Although work experience in the field of compensation is not required as a prerequisite to the courses, 66% of the respondents assumed that work experience in the area of compensation was required.

Table 4-8
Prerequisites to Participate in the CCP Designation Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prerequisites</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My employer's support by paying my course fees</td>
<td>93.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permission from my employer to have time from my job to participate in the courses</td>
<td>76.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work experience in the field of compensation</td>
<td>66.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior training in the area of compensation and benefits</td>
<td>27.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A recommendation from my employer</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A university degree/college diploma in an appropriate field</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 65</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: None of the requirements indicated are required by the association.

The perceived requirements to earn a CCP designation once in the program were unclear to the respondents. Of 114 respondents, 37.7% indicated that the successful completion of a
A comprehensive examination was required for certification. Additionally, 57.0% indicated that a current CCA membership was required. Neither is a requirement of the CCA. As well, 47.4% of respondents indicated that it was necessary to participate in CCA-run courses when in fact one needs only to successfully complete course exams. The course material can be covered by self-study and the candidate can apply and write the examination at a proctored examination centre. Although membership in the CCA is not required at this time to use the CCP designation, the respondents were divided 50/50 in their opinion as to whether this requirement was appropriate.

Standards

Table 4-9
Who is Involved in Setting Program Standards for CCP Designation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Who</th>
<th>Who Respondent thinks is Involved (% of respondents)</th>
<th>Who Respondent thinks should be Involved (% of respondents)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer members of the CCA</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>63.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University/College experts in the field</td>
<td>56.8</td>
<td>80.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCA staff</td>
<td>55.9</td>
<td>52.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers of graduates of the CCA program</td>
<td>28.8</td>
<td>52.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL RESPONDENTS</td>
<td>118 respondents or 86.1 %</td>
<td>120 respondents or 87.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

the original designation program was designed in the United States based on an analysis of the requirements of the field and has been validated by a research study at Rutledge.
University\textsuperscript{21}. The material has been Canadianized by subject matter experts in Canada. Over 20\% of respondents identified that, in their opinion, there should be more input to the development of program standards from University/College experts in the field and from employers of the graduates of the program (Table 4-9). It would appear that the association has not sufficiently communicated the involvement of the academics in the setting of the professional standards.

The involvement of participants of the program and their employers is negligible, and the association leadership\textsuperscript{22} is aware of the fact that some of the membership would like to see a change.

**Accessibility**

**Location**

Of the 110 respondents to the question, accessibility to courses was perceived as an issue for 50\%. The main reason identified by 30.9\% of respondents was the lack of courses in many areas of the country, which results in the need to travel to other locations, pay the cost of travel and accommodation and take extra time off work to travel. Only 7.2\% of respondents indicated that the cost of the CCA courses was a factor in their perceived lack of accessibility. The CCA is trying to address this issue by marketing the concept of in-house programs. In these programs, larger organizations sponsor a course in their organization and often invite participants from other organizations to help defray the costs. Additionally, the availability of courses in other modes of delivery, such as interactive video, may help to alleviate the accessibility issue for some candidates.


\textsuperscript{22} Interview with Vice President of Education of CCA. (1994).
Program Costs

Forty-two percent of respondents indicated that the program costs should be paid by the employer of the participant and another 42% stated that the participant and the employer should be responsible for program costs. Only 16% of the respondents indicated that the cost of the training should be the sole responsibility of the participant. Some respondents qualified their response and noted that the cost of the program should be the responsibility of the participant or the employer depending on the employer policies. For example, if the participant was required to take the designation by the employer, then the employer should pay.

Since participants often have to travel to major centres to participate in the course they require, the cost per course varies considerably. The average cost identified for travel and accommodation was $943 with a standard deviation of $667.

Continuing Education

Of the 102 respondents answering this question, 86.3% identified participation in local workshops/seminars as the main methodology of keeping their skills current. Another 58.8% participated in the CCA annual conference. Other activities identified as professional development, in addition to the ones in Table 4-10, were participation on regional committees (7.8%) and attending other human resources conferences (4.9%).

Of the 120 respondents to the survey, 74.5% identified at least one activity that they participated in to keep their knowledge current. Keeping current is an important factor for the survey respondents.
Table 4-10
Activities Respondents Participate in to Maintain Knowledge of Compensation Current

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local workshops/seminars/focus groups</td>
<td>86.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCA annual conference.</td>
<td>58.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading compensation literature</td>
<td>28.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching or directing workshops.</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing and publishing articles in the field of compensation.</td>
<td>11.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 102</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Summary of Interview and Survey Data

The CCA runs and maintains a curriculum-based certification program. The original materials were produced by the American parent and have been Canadianized. The program is only offered through the association in a 2.5 day format and no exemptions are granted. Details of how the standards have been derived are not available in a document that is available to the public. The leadership of the CCA identified that the faculty was heavily involved in Canadianizing the materials and that volunteers of the parent organization and University experts were involved in creating the original materials. Many of the respondents were not aware of the involvement of academia in the program and felt there should be more. The respondents identified that there was no requirement to participate in the courses. However, some respondents identified that they felt that to successfully complete the required program examinations they needed to do the course work. Self-study or the
challenge option were was not sufficient to guarantee successful completion of the examinations. There may be concern over the lack of knowledge of the course content and the feeling that the course materials are not sufficient for self study. There are no recertification requirements to continue to use the designation after it is earned. However a currency program does exist and is administered through the US parent organization. The majority of respondents indicated that the ACA program was all that was needed to remain current. The leadership of the CCA supports the ACA currency program does not actively promote it.

The main reason identified by respondents and the CCA leadership for participating in the certification was to validate knowledge in the field of compensation. Accessibility was perceived as a problem for 50% of the participants, since courses are only offered in centres that have enough enrolment to make it cost-effective. The leadership of the CCA concurred with this fact and is trying to use alternate means of program delivery to make its program more accessible to interested parties.

During the interviews the CCA leadership indicated that there was a significant membership participation in continuing education events. They were encouraging local groups to provide workshops/seminars that meet local needs. The survey results illustrate that members more actively participate in local activities than in national conferences.

**Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators (ICSA)**

**Interview Data**

Telephone interviews were carried out with the Executive Director of the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada. The Executive Director works part-time for the ICSA. The office that coordinates the program is also involved in coordinating the work of other professional associations. Interviewing volunteers was not agreed to. The
Institute is an internationally-recognized body of administrators on corporate matters that was founded in Great Britain. World-wide, the Institute has a membership of 45,000 plus 21,000 students. There are approximately 1,300 members in Canada. The program is a criterion-based program and was developed in Great Britain. The Canadian group, as well as other subgroups around the world, has input to the standards to ensure the needs of each subgroup were addressed.

Certification Process

To obtain a professional designation (either Associate or Fellow) a candidate must apply to the ICSA and progress through the accreditation program known as Program 2000. Program 2000 requires a candidate to have a university degree recognized by the Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada or a professional designation such as a Certified Management Accountant (CMA) for entry to the program. Upon entry, a candidate may be required to complete other courses in areas, such as Business Administration, that are approved by the ICSA. Some courses such as Corporate Procedures are available through the Institute. The requirements for certification vary and candidates must submit information about their educational and work background for assessment by the Institute. If an individual does not hold a degree that is recognized, course requirements will be identified by the Institute. Exemptions may be granted based on proof of successful completion of approved university courses.

A potential Associate would require at least three years relevant work experience and must hold an appropriate position at the time of application. A candidate for the Fellow designation must have at least eight years relevant work experience, three of which should be at the senior level as a corporate secretary or equivalent.

Program Development

There was no identified standard process for ongoing development of the program. The parent of the organization is in the United Kingdom and it defines the need and when the program will be updated. Local volunteers have some input through their executive but the final decisions are made by the parent organization.

Program Maintenance

There is no ongoing standard process identified for maintenance of the program. Once the program standards are set, they are maintained. Updates are initiated and done by the parent organization in the United Kingdom with input from the other groups around the world.

Recertification

According to the Executive Director, recertification in her opinion was not appropriate for the designation. The researcher was asked not to include a question on recertification on the survey as the Executive Director did not want to have to deal with questions related to this topic from members of the organization.

Participation in Certification Program

The participants in the certification program are executives and administrators in the corporate environment who meet the program requirements. The Institute serves as a forum in which individuals network and participate in professional development activities. The long standing international reputation of the Institute and the recommendations of the Institute to colleagues has encouraged its continued growth.
Certification Program Requirements

The requirements to be considered for a designation include: current membership in the ICSA, active work in the appropriate field, a degree in business, law or other agreed to area, minimum of three years relevant work experience for an Associate or eight years for a Fellow and successful completion of courses that the association may require based on an analysis of the individual’s background.

Standards

The standards for the criterion-based program are set in Great Britain by the parent organization. The researcher was asked not to include questions on standards on the survey, as the Canadian membership had expressed interest in having more input to standards. A new certification program called ICSA Program 2000 had just been developed and the staff and volunteers were heavily involved in launching it. Questions on who sets the standards and who should be setting the standards would open discussions that the leadership was not prepared to address.

Accessibility

According to the Executive Director, accessibility to certification is not an issue. Course requirements are readily available through the Institute or colleges and universities.

Continuing Education

The Institute co-sponsors conferences for their membership and provides local workshops and seminars. Additionally, it publishes a magazine called the “Professional Administrator”. Members actively participate in the local conference or workshops and are encouraged to participate in programs in other countries when travelling.
Survey Data

The survey was mailed to a random sample of ICSA members selected by the researcher from the membership book for 1995/1996. Only members who lived in Canada were selected. The questions on the pilot and main survey were the same. The average return rate of the survey was 36.4%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Number Distributed</th>
<th>Number Returned</th>
<th>Percentage Returned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pilot</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Certification Process

Recertification

As discussed in the interview data section the researcher was requested not to ask a question on recertification.

Participation in Certification Program

Background of Respondents

All of the respondents were members of ICSA and the average length of membership was 20 ± 14 years. Fifty-three percent of respondents hold an ACIS designation and 35% hold a FCIS designation. Thirty-three percent of those who hold a FCIS did not have an ACIS. Only five of the respondents have or are participating in the Program 2000. Eighty-six
percent of members are over 40 years and 40% are over 60 years old. Sixty-six percent of the respondents had 10 years of experience in administration. The education level varies considerably with 40% holding no degree and 8% holding a Masters or Law degree.

Reasons for Participating

The main reasons that respondents participated in the designation program were to (Table 4-12):

- gain knowledge in the field,
- expand their career options and,
- to strengthen their position in the job market or in their current job.

Of the 79 respondents to this question, 34.1% and 31.6%, respectively, indicated that the designation helped them become a part of a network of professionals in their field and to gain respect from their colleagues. One individual noted that the international recognition of the designation was the main reason he/she participated in the program. Although only 5.2% of respondents stated the designation was a requirement for a job, the data indicates that the designation is a major factor in making the individuals more competitive in the job market.

Table 4-12
Reasons for Participating in the ICSA Designation Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gain knowledge in the field</td>
<td>77.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand career options</td>
<td>70.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen position in the job market</td>
<td>58.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen position in current job</td>
<td>48.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

105
Certification Program Requirements

The main requirements respondents stated they needed to participate in the program included:

- work experience in the corporate secretary or executive administration field (54.2%),
- holding a relevant position in the field at the time of application to the program (45.8%) and,
- employer's support in paying course fees (31.9%).

Based on the criterion for Program 2000, the researcher would have expected the percentages for items one and two above to be closer to 100%. However, since many of the respondents earned or received their accreditation many years ago, the criterion may have changed. There was no history of program availability over the 50 year period. As with the CCA program participants, the need for financial support to pay for university or Institute courses was identified by 31.9% of respondents. Other requirements included time from the job to participate in courses (15.2%) and employer recommendation (13.9%). Although an employer recommendation is not required, there is a need to prove that one holds a relevant position in the field at the time of application to the Institute.

Requirements to Successfully Complete ICSA Designation

Respondents indicated that the main requirements to earn an ICSA designation included (Table 4-13):

- successful completion of examinations in all identified courses,
- successful completion of a comprehensive ICSA examination,
- current membership in ICSA and,
- active work in an appropriate field.
Table 4-13
Mandatory Requirements to Earn ICSA Designation (ACIS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirements</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Successful completion of examinations in all identified courses*</td>
<td>72.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current membership in ICSA*</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active work in an appropriate field*</td>
<td>47.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful completion of a comprehensive ICSA examination.</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in ICSA run courses</td>
<td>38.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 80</strong></td>
<td><strong>67.7</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Association Requirements

While items one, three and four are required, the successful completion of a comprehensive examination is not one of the criteria for a designation. Many of the members of the Institute earned their designation in other countries many years ago. Some of the variability in the understanding of the requirements to earn a designation likely arises as a result of changes in the program over the years. Additionally, many respondents indicated that they received full or partial exemption from course work and may not be familiar with the detailed requirements.
Accessibility

Location

According to the Executive Director, accessibility was not an issue, as courses were available from the Institute or Universities. The researcher was asked not to include a question on accessibility on the survey as the Executive Director was not prepared to answer questions from Institute members on this topic.

Responsibility for Program Costs

Of the 84 respondents to this question, 51.1% identified that both the participants and the employer should be responsible for the cost of the designation program, and 38.1% identified that the cost should be the responsibility of the participant. Only 10.7% indicated that the cost was the responsibility of the participant’s employer in the program while others (8%) noted that payment of program costs would depend on individual circumstances, which included employer policy.

The question on the cost of the program was not phrased well. Many respondents indicated that they had been granted their designation without having to participate in courses, had been granted exemptions from courses or had been granted a FCIS without earning an ACIS. The variability of the responses did not allow for analysis of the data. This variability did not show up in the pilot survey.

Continuing Education

The main activities that respondents participated in to keep their knowledge current were local workshops/seminars (46.3%) and ICSA co-sponsored conferences (38.8%). It was interesting that 10.4 percent of respondents answered this question by indicating they were retired but are still members of the Institute. The network of professionals created by the
Institute appears to be of value to individuals even after retirement. Other activities respondents identified as professional development included reading ICSA articles (17.9%) and writing articles for publication (14.9%).

Summary of Interview and Survey Data

Although not a common type of certification program in the 1990s (Barnhart, 1994), the ICSA has just updated and reintroduced their criterion-based certification program. This type of program makes little or no attempt to objectively evaluate a candidate’s professional knowledge. Eligibility for certification is based on education, background, work experience and holding the appropriate position in an organization. In the new program the Institute will access the candidates’ qualifications and identify courses they require to be acceptable to be granted certification. Some of these courses are offered by the Institute.

The information gathered in the survey on requirements to participate in the designation program or to earn a designation varies considerably. This is not surprising as many respondents identified they had earned their designation many years ago and/or in other countries.

Due to the restriction of the questions the researcher was permitted to ask in the areas on recertification, standards and accessibility, there were significant gaps in the data that were gathered. These issues will be discussed in limitations of the study.

Canadian Payroll Association

Interview Data

A meeting with the Manager of Education and the Manager of Public Relations and Marketing was held to discuss the thesis research and the program run by the Canadian
Payroll Association (CPA). During the meeting, it was confirmed that the membership of the Association consisted of companies. The participants in the certification program are often employees of the company that sponsors the training with the Canadian Payroll Association. Nevertheless, individuals that do not work for member companies are still eligible to participate in the training, although at a higher cost.

After discussion, it was agreed the Manager of Education would get the permission of the Board of Directors for the study using a draft survey as an example. The Board gave permission for the use of the survey to a random selection of students in the program over the past two years. However, all correspondence to the students was to be sent by the Association with an Association letter attached (Appendix O). The researcher was not to have access to the Association’s database.

Certification Process

The certification process is a three-tiered designation program (Level 1 - Payroll Administrator, Level 2 - Payroll Supervisor and Level 3 - Payroll Manager). At each level, the participant in the program must complete an Association course which is payroll specific and successfully complete required university/college courses. Students can challenge the Association courses and write an examination instead of participating in the course. Courses through the Association are offered by correspondence and are now also being developed in a computer-based mode of delivery.

Program Development

The program is developed according to standards set by the association leadership. The leadership consists of members whose companies participated are members of the Association. The Association was developed to provide the professional development requirements of their staff member companies in the areas of payroll and tax requirements.
Program Maintenance

The legislation on payroll is continually changing. The Association must update its program to meet both the federal and provincial legislative requirements. The three courses offered by the Association are reviewed yearly to ensure data are correct. The other requirements are general programming offered through Universities and Colleges and the details are reviewed periodically by the Education group.

Recertification

The Manager of Education of the Association believes recertification is not applicable to the program. Once the designation is earned individuals keep current because they are working in the field and in order carry out their job they must use current practices.

Participation in Certification Program

Individuals who participate in these certification programs include those who:

- work for companies that sponsor the program and whom the company has designated as requiring the program,
- do not work for member companies but have a interest in the professional development opportunity,
- have worked in payroll areas for years and who want to formally demonstrate their knowledge by earning formal certification and,
- are looking to move into this area and believe that the designation will improve their opportunities.

Many individuals take only the association courses as they require them for their employment and do not complete the designation program.
Certification Program Requirements

To participate in Level 1 - Payroll Administrator there are no entry level requirements. An individual can register and take the association course. The prerequisites for the college/university courses depend on the requirements of the institution where the individual is taking the course. Level 2 - Payroll Supervisor requires the successful completion of the Association course for Payroll Administrator and Level 3 - Payroll Manager requires successful completion of the Association course for Payroll Supervisor.

Standards

The standards are set in the payroll courses to meet the business needs of the member companies and to meet the requirements of provincial and federal payroll legislation. The Association must keep all their members up to date on the changing payroll environment and the association courses must reflect the changes. The requirements for other courses are set and reviewed periodically by the education committee.

Accessibility

The leadership of the CPA stated that accessibility to the Association courses is not an issue. All Association courses are available through correspondence and additionally the Level one course is available as a computer based program. The other courses, required for certification, are available through local universities and colleges. The member organizations pay less for the programs through the Association than others.

Continuing Education

The Association offers professional development activities for their member companies in the form of an annual conference, workshops and seminars, articles from the legislative
bodies, as well as communications to member organizations. The Association leadership identified that there was a high degree of participation by members in continuing education activities. No data were available for review.

**Survey Data**

The average return rate was 29.8% (Table 4-14).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Number Distributed</th>
<th>Number Returned</th>
<th>Percentage Returned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pilot</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>530</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>29.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Certification Process**

**Recertification**

Only 37.4% of respondents indicated that recertification should be mandatory and approximately 30% of respondents identified that if individuals are working in the payroll field, they receive updates which they must review from the CPA and the government. This ensures their currency, and thus they do not need to recertify.
Participation in Certification

Background of Respondents

Sixty-seven percent of respondents work for Association member organizations and 64% are under the age of 40. Ninety-nine percent have payroll experience but 53% have worked in payroll less than 5 years. The education background varies considerably with greater than 50% hold only a high school diploma and less than 1% holding a Masters degree. In the group responding to the survey, 30% hold a P.A, 22% hold a P.S. and 13% hold a P.M.

Reasons for Participating

One hundred percent of respondents participated in the CPA designation program to gain knowledge of payroll practices. As well, over ninety percent of respondents indicated that participation would strengthen their position in their job and the job market and expand their career options (Table 4-15).

Certification Program Requirements

Respondents indicated that they needed work experience in payroll to participate in the program and that prior training in payroll would be helpful. Approximately 72% of respondents identified that they needed their employer's support in paying their course fees (Table 4-16). There are no specific requirements placed on the participants by the Association for participation in the program.
Table 4-15
Reasons for Pursuing a CPA Designation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gain knowledge of payroll practices.</td>
<td>94.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen position in my job.</td>
<td>95.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen position in the job market.</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand career options.</td>
<td>86.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain respect among colleagues and professional associates.</td>
<td>51.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Become a part of a network of compensation and benefits</td>
<td>46.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>practitioners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The designation was a requirement for the job</td>
<td>27.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 144</td>
<td>91.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4-16
Requirements to Participate in the CPA Designation Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirements</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My employer's support by paying my course fees</td>
<td>72.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work experience in the field of payroll</td>
<td>67.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior training in the area of payroll</td>
<td>41.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 148</td>
<td>93.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: None of the above are required by the Association.
The respondents identified that to earn a CPA designation, it should be mandatory to participate in CPA run courses and successfully complete exams in the identified courses. Over 60% indicated that there should be a mandatory comprehensive examination which does not exist at this time.

Table 4-17
Mandatory Requirements to Earn a CPA Designation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th>Percentage of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Successful completion of examinations in all identified courses</td>
<td>81.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in CPA run courses.</td>
<td>72.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful completion of a comprehensive CPA examination.</td>
<td>61.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current membership in CPA.</td>
<td>26.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS = 154</strong></td>
<td><strong>97.5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Standards

Approximately 25% of the respondents think there should be more involvement of university/college experts and employers of graduates in the development of standards for the certification program and less involvement of CPA staff and volunteer members of the CPA.
Table 4-18
Who is Involved in Setting Program Standards for CPA Designation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Who</th>
<th>Who Respondent thinks is Involved (%)</th>
<th>Who Respondent thinks should be involved (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer members of the CPA</td>
<td>46.8</td>
<td>39.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University/College experts in the field</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>76.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPA staff</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>75.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers of graduates of the CPA program</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>60.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL RESPONDENTS</strong></td>
<td>156 respondents or 98.7 %</td>
<td>150 respondents or 94.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Accessibility of the Program

Location

Of the 152 respondents to the question, 82.9% indicated that the courses required for the CPA designation program were accessible to them because the CPA courses are available through correspondence and the electives are available through local colleges or universities. The 17.1% of respondents who indicated that accessibility to courses was an issue noted that some courses were not available through their local college and that required information on courses was not available.
Responsibility for Cost

Of the 156 respondents to this question, over 50% of respondents indicated that both the employer and the participant in the program should be responsible for the costs and 38.5% indicated the employer of the participant should be. Only 20% identified that the participant should pay. This emphasis on the employer to pay is not surprising considering 72.3% of respondents felt they needed their employer to pay the fees for the courses of the designation program.

Continuing Education

Of the 98 respondents to this question, 80.7% participate in local workshops/seminars, 23.5% attend the annual conference and 38.8% read payroll articles to maintain their knowledge current. Working in the payroll field was identified by 16.3% of respondents as a means of maintaining currency.

Summary

The Payroll Association, a trade Association, has three levels in its designation program. The participants in the program include individuals who are not members of the Association group of companies. At each level there is an Association payroll course offered through correspondence or computer based delivery in the case of the Level One course. Additional university or college courses are required to earn a designation at each level.

The program is seen by the majority of respondents as a means to strengthen their position in their job and in the job market. Some respondents (27.8%) required the designation for employment. These facts were substantiated by the CPA leadership. There was some confusion by respondents over requirements for participation in the program. Over 60% indicated that a mandatory work experience was required. The documentation provided by the leadership and discussion with the researcher indicated this requirement had never
existed. Over 60% of the respondents indicated that a comprehensive examination should be mandatory. At this time the leadership was not considering this option.

Accessibility to the program is not seen as a problem by the leadership as CPA courses are available through correspondence. However, respondents identified concerns that the distance to colleges made it difficult to complete course requirements. Additionally concerns about the ability of the Association to return assignments on time were documented. The leadership of the Association confirmed that in the past it had markers who were slow at returning assignments. The cost of the program is an issue and over 70% of respondents indicated that their employer should be paying the fees for the courses. The CPA offers the Level One course through computer based training. However, a significant number of respondents indicated they had no access to a computer to do the course.

Participation in continuing education activities, including local workshop/seminars and a national conference are supported by the CPA and the membership who participated in the certification program.

Summary of Chapter Four

In Chapter Four, the data from the interviews and the surveys was documented and discussed. The following summarizes some of the key points of the five associations researched:

- all three types of certification programs (criterion-, curriculum- and competency-based) outlined by Barnhart (1994) were encountered,
- the key reasons individuals participate in certification programs involve developing skills for present or future jobs as well as to expand career options,
- a large percentage of respondents noted that they needed financial support from their employers to pay the fees of the programs,
associations see certification as a means of professionalizing their memberships and a continuation of their role of helping their memberships,

- professional development, including conferences and workshops, is a key component of the services that the associations offer their memberships on an ongoing basis and there is a high degree of participation by respondents in these programs,

- recertification is not a component of four of the five associations studied,

- the documentation of the information on which the programs were developed and is maintained was available only for OSTD, which has produced a public document of competencies,

- a significant number of respondents in four out of five situations were not clear on the requirements for certification,

- groups involved in setting standards for each certification program were not clear to some respondents, and approximately 25% of respondents indicated a need for more involvement of employers of graduates, graduates of the program or volunteers in the associations in the setting of certification standards and,

- the perceived accessibility to the certification programs was identified as an issue for respondents from two of the five associations.

There was a high degree of agreement between what the association leadership states with respect recertification, who participates in and why they participate in the certification programs, accessibility issues and participation in continuing education program. However, the respondents' understanding of who participates in setting the standards and what standards are mandatory for the certification program varies from that of the leadership. The setting of standards is a highly political issue. According to Gerber (1995) the difficult part is not setting professional standards but gaining consensus on the standards among the professionals, industry and educators. The researcher was unable to access documentation on this topics from the CCA, CPA and the ICSA leadership to illustrate how the standards were set. The OSTD in their TCA and St. John Ambulance in its Association documentation
document how their standards are set and who is involved in setting them.
Chapter Five

Analysis

A comparative analysis of the data of the five volunteer professional associations studied was carried out based on the objectives of the study under the headings of certification process, certification program participation, certification program requirements, standards, accessibility and continuing education. In the comparative analysis the similarities and differences will be noted and discussed.

Response Rate

Overall, the response rate (at least 30%) of respondents was higher than expected to unsolicited surveys. According to Tovar (1996)\textsuperscript{24}, the expected rate of return for this type of survey would be in the order of 15 to 20%.

Certification Process

Types of Certification Programs

All three types of certification programs (criterion-, curriculum- and competency-based) as stated by Barnhart (1994), were represented by the five associations of the study. The ICSA

Note 1: All values in tables are percent of respondents unless otherwise stated.
Note 2: The analysis of age and work experience against other data did not illustrate any correlation and is not included in this analysis.

\textsuperscript{24} Tovar, M. (1996). Presentation at the Toronto Chapter, International Society for Performance Improvement, Toronto, Ontario
Program 2000, updated recently, is criterion-based. If candidates for certification meet the criteria defined by the association, they are awarded the designation. This type of certification, although no longer common, does not attempt to evaluate job competencies in a particular field.

The CPA, CCA and in part the St. John programs are curriculum-based. Candidates of a curriculum-based program are required to demonstrate as part of the program a mastery of specific knowledge by successfully completing an examination or set of examinations. According to Barnhart (1994), there is little or no attempt in curriculum-based certification programs to define professional requirements using a systematic job analysis or analysis of the skills and/or knowledge required to practice the occupation. Both the CCA and the CPA publish a list of courses required of the candidates but neither association publishes information on how the courses were selected. No documentation on how courses were selected or how the content of each was chosen was made available to the researcher even though according to CCA documentation such information exists. This documentation was requested by but not released to the researcher.

The CCA controls the content of courses and examinations by providing required courses only through the Association and does not allow any exemptions. St. John Ambulance does the same. The CPA controls the content for the payroll courses of their program. The other designation requirements are available through various colleges or universities who control the content. The Association has identified courses that they will accept towards a certificate. Exemptions are allowed for the college/university courses. Granting of course exemptions involves the review of the requested course outline against the course outline of the Association accepted course by a designated Association representative. The reviewer looks for consistency of content and evaluation methodologies. An exemption is granted if there is a reasonable match between the two.
The researcher, during her tenure as a Registrar for a professional association, found that courses with the same title and general outline often covered different topics and had different evaluation methodologies. The outcomes or objectives of two courses with the same title are often very different. It is a very difficult job to determine if one course actually covers the same materials as another by reviewing the course outline. Candidates who successfully complete the certification programs of the CCA or the CPA identified that they believe they have the knowledge base required for their specific professional area.

The proposed OSTD program is competency-based. The TCA documents the competencies required for each of five identified areas such as analyzing performance/training needs and designing training as required learning for trainers. The competencies include learning objectives for both the knowledge and the skill component of the competency. The TCA is based on an analysis of requirements of an entry level training professional by members of the profession. The outcomes of the analysis were validated by a committee of training professionals who were identified in the public document. The certification program proposal has three requirements including: successful completion of an OSTD knowledge examination based on the TCA, successful illustration of a skill component to peers and a minimum of two years documented training experience. The details of the methodologies for testing were not available at the time of writing.

The St. John Ambulance skill section of the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer program is competency-based. The requirements for successful completion of the skills section are published in the student materials and include successful demonstration of First Aid and CPR skills to the documented standards as well as successful teaching to a group of students. The specific requirements for credit in First Aid and CPR have been developed by professional medical committees and are periodically updated by these committees.
Recertification

One method some associations use to control how individuals remain current is to require periodic recertification. Recertification is a topic that is often debated by the leadership of professional associations during their certification program development and is politically a very difficult topic to manage. Individuals often have very strong and opposing views on it. Is recertification necessary to ensure that the membership who have earned a designation remain current? Two of the associations in the study had recertification programs and only St. John Ambulance has a mandatory process that requires periodic retesting on knowledge and skills components. Both the leadership of St. John Ambulance and the membership surveyed fully supported the need for continued recertification of Instructors and Instructor-Trainers. Over 95% of St. John Ambulance respondents indicated that mandatory recertification was necessary to maintain standards.

The CCA has a voluntary recertification program based on acquiring points for participating in activities such as workshops. This program is administered by their sister organization, the ACA. There is no formal retesting of individuals. The leadership and individuals surveyed generally support this informal program as sufficient to meet their needs. However, when asked if mandatory recertification ought to be in place 46% of the respondents indicated yes. No details were added to the comments section of the survey to explain this response. The leadership of the Association was not supportive of this position. Some of the respondents compared the earning of the designation to the earning of a degree. They noted that there is no requirement to recertify a MBA so why would you recertify a designation?

The CPA does not have a recertification program and the leadership and 62% of the respondents indicated there was no need for such a program. Respondents noted that in order to continue to work in the payroll field individuals must keep current with the legislative changes and that the association provided appropriate documentation to keep individuals current.
The ICSA leadership in its interview stated that recertification was inappropriate for its designation program and refused to allow the researcher to ask the question on the survey. They were not prepared to have a discussion on the topic opened by a question of the survey.

The OSTD has no information in their documentation about any recertification program. The Vice-President of Standards and Certification stated during his interview that a program would have to be put in place but he was unclear as to what it would look like.

Table 5-1
Recertification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Association</th>
<th>Mandatory Recertification</th>
<th>No Mandatory Recertification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John Ambulance</td>
<td>96.1</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCA</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>54.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPA</td>
<td>38.6</td>
<td>62.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICSA*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* This question was not asked on the survey at the request of the ICSA leadership.

Certification Program Participation

Background of Respondents

The association population surveyed varied considerably by association. The original design of the research was to randomly select members of the association to receive a survey. The
following are some of the issues that arose in the researcher’s attempt to standardize the selection of who would receive the survey:

1. The CPA is a trade association and the membership consists of member organizations. The association maintains a database of individuals who had participated or are participating in the certification program. If an individual had not participated in the program in the past two years, the leadership could not guarantee the data in the database was correct. Therefore, it was agreed that the target group for the survey would be individuals who had participated in the program in the past two years. This selection affected the data collected around age and years of experience. Additionally, the current knowledge of practices and details of the designation program was current to the respondents.

2. The participants in the CCA program are not required to maintain membership in the CCA in order to use the designation earned. The population surveyed included members and non-members of the association who had earned or were earning the designation.

3. There is no survey of OSTD membership as the leadership wanted information about the certification program which was under development to come only from their office. Thus, feedback on the membership concerns, interests and knowledge of the process as developed was not obtained.

4. A survey was sent to a random sample of ICSA and St. John Ambulance membership as per the original design.

Reasons for Participating

The leadership of each association during the interviews identified that individuals participated in the certification programs to confirm their knowledge in the field, or to gain new knowledge in the field, or to gain new knowledge for career opportunities. Additionally, the leadership of St. John Ambulance noted that many of their program participants are volunteers and participate in the credentialing program in order to provide volunteer services to their communities. Each association was interested in obtaining the results from the
surveys to confirm their reading on the reasons for participation and to document other findings so they could use the information in program development.

For all associations analyzed (except St. John Ambulance), the main reason that respondents were participating in or have participated in a certification is to gain or validate knowledge in the field of certification. The second most frequently identified reason was either to strengthen their position in the current job or strengthen their position in the job market (Table 5-2). These facts confirmed the beliefs of the leadership of the associations.

Over 90% of the CPA respondents identified these two reasons for participating in the certification program. Additionally, 85% of CPA respondents indicated that the designation would expand their career options. The CPA program provides introductory courses at three levels in the area of payroll that are not available in the formal education system and are specific to the legislative requirements for handling payroll in an organization. The participation in the employer sponsored association, although not a key requirement for the job, is seen by participants as necessary.

For ICSA and CCA respondents, their designation was seen by a significant percentage as a tool to expand their career options. According to one of the interviewees of the CCA, many of the participants in the program are mid to senior manager staff with post secondary education who are looking to change careers or who are formally illustrating to their current employers the acquisition of knowledge by earning the designation. Over 50% of ICSA respondents identified that they had formal education credentials such as LLB or CGA. The designation, in addition to other formal credentials, is perceived as having benefits to career development by the candidates who network and obtain professional development opportunities at seminars and workshops (Table 5-2).

The main reason St. John Ambulance respondents identified for obtaining a designation was to make a volunteer contribution to their community (Table 5-2). This fact confirms the data
from the interviews and association documentation. However, 36.7% identified the designation as a means of strengthening their position in the job market since some employers such as the police and firefighting require the designation for employment. During the leadership interviews it was identified that these employers take the St. John Ambulance program and add to it to meet their own specific safety needs.

The leadership of the OSTD clearly stated that they saw their program as a means to increase the credibility of trainers with employers and the government, to help employers assess the capabilities of potential candidates for trainers when hiring and to provide employers with a means of evaluating and maximizing the use of their training staff. If these objectives are achieved then it could be deduced that potential candidates for the designation of the OSTD will see the designation as a means to develop their career options and strengthen their position in their job or the job market.

Although the certification programs leading to a designation have been developed by volunteer professional associations and there is no legal requirement to have a designation to practice the occupation, the designations are perceived by the participants in the programs as benchmarks used by employers in the selection of candidates for jobs. Additionally, the designation was identified as a means to expand career options. Volunteer professional associations whether they intend to or not are affecting the ability of an individual to enter a profession. They are setting a baseline for employers to use in the absence of other criteria or in conjunction with other criteria such as a degree to prescreen candidates for positions.

The President of the CCA\textsuperscript{25} expressed some concern that employers believe that the CCA designation indicates that an individual can perform on the job. In her opinion the CCP designation illustrates that an individual has demonstrated mastery of specific knowledge but does not illustrate an ability to apply the knowledge to the job. She was concerned about the liability the association might have if employers perceived that the CCA designation

\textsuperscript{25} Interview with President of CCA. (1994).
illustrated the transferability of knowledge to skills on the job. The CCA in granting the designation does not test the individuals' ability to transfer the knowledge component to skills on the job.

Table 5-2
Reasons for Participating in the Designation Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>CCA</th>
<th>CPA</th>
<th>ICSA</th>
<th>St. John</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gain knowledge in the field.</td>
<td>75.3</td>
<td>94.4</td>
<td>77.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Validate CCA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen my position in my job.</td>
<td>55.6</td>
<td>95.7</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen my position in the job market.</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain respect among my colleagues and professional associates.</td>
<td>34.6</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand my career options.</td>
<td>46.9</td>
<td>86.1</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Become part of a network of practitioners in the field.</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>46.5</td>
<td>34.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obtain a designation which was/is a requirement for my job.</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make a volunteer contribution to my community.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>52.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earn extra money teaching.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Whereas, the Vice President of the OSTD\textsuperscript{26} indicated that the competencies documented by the OSTD for trainers provide employers with a means to screen candidates for positions or to evaluate trainers. The program is designed to allow individuals to evaluate their own competency and thus, employers could use the same methodology (the toolkit of the TCA) with potential candidates or staff. In summary, some volunteer professional associations are moving to a certification program that can be used as a screening mechanism for employers and they define this concept as one of the purposes of their program.

Other certification programs analyzed, although not marketed as a requirement for employment in the field by the association, are seen as such by the participants in the programs.

**Certification Program Requirements**

Prerequisites to Participate in Programs.

The prerequisites to participate in the designation program and to successfully complete the program were discussed with the leadership of each association and are clearly documented in the literature of each association. However, the responses of those participating in the surveys did not always reflect the documentation of the association. At least 50% of all association respondents, except those of St. John Ambulance, identified work experience in the field of the specific designation as a requirement to participate in the designation program. The CCA, St. John, CPA Level One and OSTD programs are entry level programs to the profession and as such do not require work experience. The CPA has an entry level certification program which does not require work experience. The two additional levels of certification require the CPA previous level course for entry to the next level course.

\textsuperscript{26} Interview with Vice President of Standards and Certification, OSTD. (1994).
Only 45.8% of ICSA respondents indicated that one needed to hold a relevant position in the field to receive certification. This is an association requirement. Perhaps there is some confusion due to changing requirements over time and/or the location in which the respondents applied for designation, as many obtained their original designation in other countries a number of years ago. Only five respondents are participating in the newly launched certification program entitled "Program 2000". Other association respondents were not asked this question and none added it as a requirement under comments.

Table 5-3
Requirements Respondents Felt were Needed to Participate in the Certification Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirements</th>
<th>St. John*</th>
<th>CCA</th>
<th>CPA</th>
<th>ICSA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employer recommendation.</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>12.9</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work experience in the field of designation.</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>67.6</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permission from employer to have time from job.</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior training in the field of the designation.</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>41.9</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer support in paying course fees.</td>
<td>93.8</td>
<td>72.3</td>
<td>31.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hold a relevant position in field.</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*St. John Program has a defined set of requirements that are different from the other associations

** Not asked as it was not a requirement of the association.
Time off from the job to participate in CCA courses was required for 76.9% of respondents as their courses are only available in 2.5 day blocks through the association. This requirement is confirmed during the leadership interviews and it was recognized as a barrier to participation of some individuals. However the CCA leadership did not see it as a significant barrier. The requirement for time off from the job was not an issue for other associations analyzed as courses required are offered at varying times throughout the year and/or via varied modes that allowed participants to study based on their own schedules. The CPA leadership noted that they offered their courses by correspondences and their Level One course has a computer-based delivery methodology as well to help eliminate access issues. CPA respondents identified that they took courses by correspondence as it meant that they could do the course on their own time. Some identified that their employer required them to take the program on their own time. Some CPA respondents noted that although the computer-based methodology was a good idea they had no computer and thus could not use the program.

Over 40% of CPA respondents indicated that they required prior work experience in the field of the designation as a requirement to participate in the designation program. According to the leadership interviewed this is definitely not a requirement. Respondents added comments to this question indicating that the CPA course assumed some knowledge that without experience they would not have known.

When asked if employer support was required to pay course fees both CCA and CPA respondents overwhelmingly indicated yes (Table 5-3). As courses are expensive most candidates would obviously prefer that their employers pay. The percentage of ICSA respondents wanting employer financial support to pay program costs was approximately 30%. This is not surprising as generally courses and thus course fees are not required.

There is considerable variation in what respondents felt should be required for certification and what the association required. The ICSA requires employment in the field for
application to the designation program and only 47.5% of respondents felt this should be mandatory. No specific reasons were noted in the comments.

Forty-seven percent of CCA respondents, 72% of CPA respondents and 39% of ICSA respondents indicated that participation in association courses should or needed to be mandatory. Both the CCA and the CPA allow participants to write the examination for their courses and if they are successful they are awarded credit. The leadership of both associations stated that individuals should be able to illustrate the knowledge gained through experience and/or self-study without having to spend the time on a course. Over 95% of CPA respondents were aware of the challenge option but 72.1% identified that participation in the courses of the association should be mandatory. Only two respondents out of 158 identified that they had participated in this option. However, a number of participants in the survey from both associations identified in the comments section that in order to assure themselves success on the examination, they needed to take the courses. It would appear they were unclear about the requirements for successful completion of the examination or felt course materials needed to be supplemented by instructor experience. The ICSA response of 38.8% indicating that mandatory course participation was needed can not be explained with additional data.

Forty-five percent of ICSA respondents, 37.7% of CCA respondents and 62.2% of CPA respondents identified that a successful completion of a comprehensive examination needed to be or should be mandatory. At the time of the interviews the leadership of the CCA and the CPA had stated there was no need for such an examination and they saw no value in having candidates for designation complete an association comprehensive examination. The CCA has complete control over the courses and examinations of their program and the CPA has the same over their subject specific courses.
Table 5-4
Requirements that Respondents felt Should/Need to be Mandatory for Participation in the Designation Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirements</th>
<th>CCA (Should be mandatory)</th>
<th>CPA (Should be mandatory)</th>
<th>ICSA (Needed to be mandatory)</th>
<th>St. John*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participate in the courses of the association.</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>38.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complete association exams for identified courses.</td>
<td>86.0</td>
<td>81.9</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successfully completed a comprehensive exam.</td>
<td>37.7</td>
<td>61.1</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have current association membership.</td>
<td>57.0</td>
<td>26.6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have employment in an appropriate field.</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>47.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*This question was not asked of St. John Ambulance respondents

Membership in a professional association is usually a requirement to continue to use the designation. Continued membership assures the association of ongoing financial viability from fees and control over those using the designation if the association carried out its policing role. The OSTD leadership stated in their interviews that individuals earning the OSTD designation would be required to continue to maintain their membership. The CCA does not have a membership requirement to continue to use the CCP designation. The CCA leadership stated that as an association they decided not to make this mandatory but to provide programming that encouraged individuals to maintain their membership. Fifty-seven
percent of CCA respondents differed from their leadership and indicated that there should be a mandatory membership requirement. Only 26.6% of CPA respondents identified that membership should be mandatory. As the CPA is a trade association, the researcher can only assume that these respondents felt that individuals who participated in the designation program should be employees of the trade association members. Forty percent of ICSA respondents identified that there should not be a mandatory membership requirement to participate in the designation program. Further information would be required to explain this information.

Standards

Table 5-5

Who Sets Standards and Who Should Set Standards for Certification Program

NOTE: Data is the percentage difference between who respondent felt should be setting standards and who the respondents believed is setting the standards of certification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Association</th>
<th>CCA</th>
<th>CPA</th>
<th>St. John</th>
<th>ICSA*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volunteers of the Association.</td>
<td>(4.1)</td>
<td>(7.2)</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College/University experts in the field.</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>26.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional association staff.</td>
<td>(3.8)</td>
<td>(8.7)</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers of the graduates of the program.</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>26.8</td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*ICSA standards are set outside of the country with Canadian input. As a new program has just been launched. The researcher was asked not to ask this question because it would open an issue the association was not prepared to address at this time.
The understanding by association membership of who is setting certification standards and who they believe should be doing it often does not reflect the reality. In Chapter Four the researcher identified that respondents in general did not know who set the professional standards required to earn the association designation. One interviewee stated that who set the standards was not an issue if the designation was accepted by the marketplace and helped to facilitate employment. In her mind individuals were only concerned about who was setting the standards when a new program was being developed. The analysis of who was involved in setting the standards of certification versus who respondents thought should be involved (Table 5-5) reflects a significant difference in opinion. For the three associations analyzed, over 20% of respondents believe there should more input from college/university experts in the field of certification into setting the standards. Additionally, 24.1% of CCA and 27.1% of CPA respondents said that the employers of the graduates of the program should have input in the setting of certification standards. The St. John respondents would like to see more input from the volunteers of the association.

Accessibility

Location

Accessibility to the courses of the designation programs is perceived was identified as an issue by St. John Ambulance and CCA leadership. In both cases, the association controls the courses being offered and makes them available only in locations where the number of candidates will cover the cost of running the course. The survey identified that accessibility to courses of designation programs is perceived by respondents as a problem in all four associations. The location where courses were held was noted as the key reason for the lack of accessibility was noted by respondents.

27 Interview of Trainer for OSTD. (1994).
As expected, the ICSA respondents had the least difficulty with access to their program. Only individuals who have not meet specific criteria in the ICSA program have to take courses which are available through local colleges and the ICSA offices. Centres in various communities have been approved for examination purposes. Additionally, partial course exemptions were granted for 54.8% and full course exemptions were granted for 10.5% of ICSA respondents. The granting of course exemptions reduces the perceived lack of accessibility.

For St. John Ambulance Instructors, accessibility to training due to lack of courses in certain locations in Ontario was an issue for 24.4% of the Instructors (Table 5-6). Instructor courses are controlled through St. John Ambulance Provincial Office and participants are required to attend a course, demonstrate skills and recertify every three years by attendance at a course. Courses are generally not run in remote areas of the province because there are not enough participants to warrant the cost of sending an Instructor. Thus, candidates for certification must travel to larger centres and pay the cost of the course plus travel and accommodation. At this time St. John has no proposed solution to this problem.

CPA respondents (17.1%) had some issues with the accessibility of courses for the CPA program (Table 5-6) CPA courses are available through correspondence, an option that facilitates the access to programs. The CPA respondents identified issues that affected accessibility such as the lack of return of reviewed materials and feedback on assignments by the association. The elective courses are available through local colleges and universities. Again this option facilitates course availability except in the areas where a local college does not exist within a reasonable distance of where the candidate lives or where the courses of the local college are not accepted by the CPA.

Accessibility to courses is a problem for over 50% of CCA respondents. The courses are run only through the association. Candidates are not required to take a course prior to writing the examination for credit but approximately 50% of respondents identified that they felt the need to take the courses to be prepared to write the examination. The courses are offered in
locations across Canada where the number of candidates support the cost of setup and the instructors. The program is designed as a money maker for the association so it is not prepared to run at a loss. Respondents identified that in some provinces, such as PEI or Alberta, there are no courses offered or when courses were offered they were cancelled due to the lack of registration. Courses are generally run in Vancouver, Montreal and the Toronto area. The CCA has begun to address the accessibility of courses due to location by developing a home study program for a quantitative methods course and an interactive video course for job evaluation.

The staff and volunteers of OSTD who were interviewed believe that accessibility of courses to meet the competencies defined for the designation program will not be an issue for potential candidates. The design of the program requires individuals to assess their own competencies using the toolkit and to close any gaps by self-study or by taking courses offered by any educational institution or third party trainer. OSTD proposes to put no restriction on where individuals learn the required competencies. They plan to encourage local colleges and universities to be test centres for the knowledge examination and to minimize the potential lack of access to the certification examination. The proposed OSTD certification program leaves a lot of responsibility with the potential candidates to ensure they access the training that is likely to help them develop the required competencies for certification and to facilitate their successful completion of the certification knowledge and skills examinations.

Table 5-6
Accessibility of Certification Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Courses are Accessible</th>
<th>Courses are not Accessible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John Ambulance</td>
<td>75.6</td>
<td>24.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCA</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>50.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPA</td>
<td>82.9</td>
<td>17.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICSA</td>
<td>89.1</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

139
Responsibility for Cost of Certification Program

Cost of the program was also identified as an issue affecting accessibility. There was an overwhelming response, (Table 5-7) from the respondents of the CCA, CPA and the ICSA, that the responsibility to pay for the program courses ought to lie with the employer and/or the participant and the employer. Unfortunately, this question was not asked of the St. John Ambulance Instructors/Instructor-Trainers. Data gathered on the cost per course of the various programs was extremely variable and was not very useful. In the responses to the question on cost of the program, the St. John Ambulance respondents indicated that the training was often required by the employer or the Brigade of St. John Ambulance. Individuals were not aware of the cost as it was paid by the organization or group that required the individual to have the certification. It is interesting to note the emphasis on the employer to pay the cost of the voluntary certification program, especially when the designation is strongly identified as increasing career options of those holding the designation.

**Table 5-7**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Association</th>
<th>CCA</th>
<th>CPA</th>
<th>ICSA</th>
<th>St. John*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participant in the program</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>38.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer of the participant in the program</td>
<td>48.5</td>
<td>38.5</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both the participant and the employer of the participant in the program</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>51.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depends</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* This question was not asked of St. John Ambulance respondents as the designation.
Continuing Education

As outlined in Chapter Two, continuing education is defined in many ways and includes activities such as conferences, workshops and reading periodicals. During the interviews the leadership of each association identified that they sponsored or co-sponsored an annual conference as well as local seminars and workshops in their role of providing professional development opportunities for their membership. Each indicated that membership participation at the events was generally good. The survey data confirmed the interview data. Approximately, 60% of CCA and St. John, 38.8% of ICSA and 23.9% of CPA respondents participate in the association conference or co-sponsored conference (Table 5-8). Local workshops/or seminars are attended by over 80% of CCA and CPA respondents and 66.1%

Table 5-8
Activities Participated in to Keep Knowledge in Field Current

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>CCA</th>
<th>CPA</th>
<th>ICSA</th>
<th>St. John</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Association conference or co-sponsored conference</td>
<td>58.8</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>38.8</td>
<td>59.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local workshops/ seminars</td>
<td>86.3</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td>66.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach or direct workshops</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Write or publish articles in the field</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read articles from the association</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>38.8</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other professional meetings/ committees</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of St. John respondents. Less than 50% of ICSA respondents participate in workshops. The reading of articles in the professional field was identified by 28.4% of CCA and 38.8% of CPA respondents. This information confirms the data recorded earlier, under the topic recertification, that in order to remain current and work in the field, respondents identified that it was necessary to continually keep abreast of information on legislative changes which were provided in CCA and CPA documentation.

Summary

All three types of certification programs (criterion-, curriculum- and competency-based) identified by Barnhart (1994) were studied in this research. In all cases individuals participate in certification programs to gain or validate their professional knowledge, strengthen their position in their job or the job market and expand their career options. Only one association had published required competencies for the certification program and the association leadership indicated that they expected employers to use these competencies as a means to screen potential employees.

There was general agreement between the leadership interviewed and the data received on the surveys on requirements to participate in association programs and to be successful. However there are some differences and work experience was a significant one. Although not required by CPA and CCA for participation in the certification program over 60% of respondents in both cases felt they needed this experience to participate in the program. The reason stated by respondents was that the courses and examinations covered materials that required previous knowledge of subject matter that would be gained during work experience opportunities.

Respondents were unclear as to who set the professional standards but generally, they indicated that more input was needed from university/college experts in the field and from employers of the graduates of the programs.
Accessibility was perceived by a significant number of respondents in St. John Ambulance and CCA as a problem due to the lack of courses in specific locations. For participants in the CCA, St. John Ambulance and CPA programs the cost of the courses, including travel and accommodate, were also factors affecting accessibility.

Continuing education in addition to the certification program is offered by all associations and respondents indicated that they participated in these programs. The need for recertification was identified by respondents of St. John as essential. The other respondents felt no need or felt that the current program (CCA) was sufficient. When safety of the public is an issue, then continually updating skills is acceptable. Otherwise recertification in a formal sense with examinations was not a choice of the respondents.
Chapter 6
Conclusions

In a world where technological developments and innovations are changing the nature of work, traditional jobs are disappearing and new, more advanced forms of work, requiring an expanded and growing knowledge base are emerging, the need for continuous development of new skills is and will continue to be required. Learning is taking on a new meaning. Volunteer professional associations play a significant role in the potential learning of their members. They develop publications, seminars, conferences and workshops to bring to their membership the latest and greatest in the field. The development and maintenance of a professional certification process is part of the opportunities for learning provided by some associations.

Houle's concept (1980) of professionalizing is even more relevant in the 1990s. Individuals, who see themselves as an occupational group with a specialized body of knowledge, are continuing to form associations. The goals of these newly formed organizations include: regulating the occupation, creating a positive public image and grouping together to provide networking opportunities and some professional development opportunities. The research of this thesis focused on five volunteer professional associations that have created a certification program and are at various stages of implementation/management of their programs. The research problem to be addressed was to explore the processes that the five voluntary professional associations use to certify their membership and the understanding of the association membership and others of the methodology used to define the certification process. The objectives that were addressed and the questions that the researcher attempted to address are outlined in Chapter Three. The associations that participated in the study were:

- The Ontario Society for Training and Development who had just created and published a set of competencies that they planned to use as the basis for its certification program,
St. John Ambulance who have an Instructor and an Instructor-Trainer certification program that was updated in 1990,
- The Canadian Compensation Association whose ten year old program is based on its American parent organization program,
- The Institute for Chartered Secretaries and Administrators originally formed in Great Britain in 1891 whose program was recently updated and,
- The Canadian Payroll Association whose ten year old program is a mixture of association and college/university requirements.

Types of Certification Programs

All three types of certification programs as described by Barnhart (1994) were covered in this study. The ICSA program is criterion-based, the CCA and CPA are curriculum-based, St. John Ambulance is a mixture of curriculum- and competency-based and the OSTD is competency-based. Only the leadership of the OSTD and St. John Ambulance were able to describe why they had chosen a specific type of certification program. The OSTD program was recently designed and the leadership who were interviewed had been directly involved in the program development. Additionally, the development process had been documented, the outcomes were published and available to individuals who wished to purchase a copy. The leadership that was interviewed stated that as a training organization they suggested that the requirements for participants in training programs should be clearly defined and available to the trainees. In developing their own programs they believed they ought to practise what they were preaching. The St. John Ambulance program was updated in 1990 and the Director of Standards and Certification for Ontario had been directly involved in organizing the update to the Instructor and Instructor-Trainer program. A mixture of curriculum- and competency-based was chosen because those involved in the update decided that the Instructors and Instructor-Trainers required knowledge based on adult education (curriculum portion which was developed as a course with general course requirements) and an ability to
demonstrate specific CPR and First Aid skills (competency-based which was developed based on clearly defined measurable outcomes).

The research confirmed that the certification programs of the five volunteer professional associations studied were:

- developed and maintained by some members of the profession,
- advertised and perceived as defining and measuring standards of professional practice,
- advertised and perceived as a means to separate individuals who are perceived to be competent from those who are not,
- documented but the details are often in confidential association documents and,
- in three out of five associations, curriculum-based (standards tend to be defined in terms of courses required not job specific competencies).

The benefits that some associations studied believe they gain from developing, implementing and maintaining a certification program include:

- an improved public image\textsuperscript{15},
- improved academic programs due to the defining of the body of knowledge of the profession \textsuperscript{16},
- an increased confidence by the management community and the general public in the qualifications of a professional \textsuperscript{17} and,
- increased opportunity for self-governing of the profession\textsuperscript{18}.

\textsuperscript{15} Interview with Vice President, Standards and Certification, OSTD. (1994).
\textsuperscript{16} ibid. (1994).
\textsuperscript{17} HRPAO brochure. (1994). Toronto, Ontario: HRPAO.
\textsuperscript{18} Brochure on Certification, OSTD. (1994). Toronto, Ontario: OSTD.
Disadvantages and Difficulties

The disadvantages and difficulties for some of the associations studied in developing and maintaining a certification program include:

- identifying and developing core competencies\(^{19}\),
- the need for considerable resources, both financial and human, to develop the program and to maintain it\(^ {20}\),
- considerable resistance by professionals outside of the organization who were concerned that a specific organization was taking control of professional standards\(^ {21}\),
- determining methodologies to access skills of candidates and,
- determining how to ensure knowledge and skills remain current\(^ {22}\).

The OSTD leadership indicated that its only started the process to develop a certification program when it had the dollars and resources in place to begin the difficult task of identifying and developing core competencies. Additionally, the Vice President of Standards and Certification stated that there would be a significant cost to ongoing maintenance which would have to come from the fees of the program when implemented. The Managing Director of the CCA program, which is built on the work done in the United States by the ACA stated the organization must budget every year for ongoing development and this cost is planned into the cost of the courses. This process is also true for the CPA. Both St. John Ambulance and the ICSA update their programs when resources are available and the leadership support the project. However, the competency standards for CPR are updated

\(^{19}\) Interview, Managing Director, OSTD. (1994).
\(^{20}\) Interviews with Vice President of Standards and Certification, OSTD and Education Coordinator of the Marketing Association. (1994).
\(^{21}\) Interview with Vice President of Standards and Certification, OSTD. (1994).
\(^{22}\) Interviews with Managing Director, CCA and Vice President of Standards and Certification, OSTD. (1994).
internationally every five years and St. John Ambulance are required to make changes to their redesign as resources are not available to make major changes. The lack of resources for program maintenance and updating is a major issue for volunteer professional associations. When standards change, such as in the CPR changes for St. John, the response is usually to distribute an add on as resources are not available to update the program. Resourcing is also a factor when they are looking at alternative delivery strategies for programs.

Certification Program Requirements

Most volunteer associations require continued membership for an individual to continue to use the designation. This requirement ensures a source of continued revenue in the form of fees for the association and an audience for their other professional programs. The CCA was the only association studied that did not require continued membership. The lack of this requirement did not seem to have a negative effect on the growth of the CCA membership as this organization has experienced continued growth in the past few years. Their own surveys indicate this growth is due in part to the provision of education and professional development opportunities in a format that is not otherwise available to their membership. However, the lack of membership requirement would affect the ability of the Association to control how the designation is used.

In the case of both the CCA and CPA, individuals often take association courses but do not complete the designation. Discussions with the Managing Director of the CCA and the Manager of Education of the CPA indicated that there were a number of reasons why, including:

- individual courses offered by these associations are required to do a specific job in the areas of compensation or payroll and these courses are not available elsewhere,
- the courses are recognized in the industry as providing the knowledge and/or skills to deal with government requirements in the areas of compensation and payroll,
• individuals taking the courses often have jobs that require them to have the specific training in a specified professional area and,
• individuals may be only doing the job for a short period of time and do not want to spend the time and dollars on the designation.

The prerequisites for CCA and CPA program allow all candidates to challenge the need to take a course by applying to write the examination for credit. This process of challenging the system is in its infancy in the Ontario education system. Candidates for a college diploma can, under the Prior Learning Assessment process, either build a portfolio of their accomplishments for assessment by college faculty or write a challenge examination to gain credit for a course or courses towards a diploma. Although the challenge option is available to all CCA and CPA designation candidates, the majority of respondents of both Associations indicated that they needed to take the courses to ensure success on the examination. They were unsure of the requirements to be successful on an examination, felt the information provided by the association to prepare for the examination was insufficient and that the information provided during the program or from feedback on self-study assignments was a requirement for success.

Certification Program Participation

The key reasons that respondents from the CPA, CCA and ICSA associations analyzed participated in and or are participating in the volunteer professional association certification programs included:

• gain or validate knowledge in the professional field,
• strengthen position in a job or the job market and,
• expand career options.

This finding validates the reasons that associations develop and offer these courses. A review of the advertisements of a number of the volunteer professional associations found
that the professional development courses of the designation programs are advertised as a method to validate a professional's knowledge and skills, demonstrate commitment to and expertise in a professional area and help the professional gain the respect of their peers and the public. The proposed program of the OSTD is being developed to support the above reasons. Individuals participate in the St. John Ambulance program to gain the skills to provide volunteer services to their communities in addition to the above reasons.

**Standards**

Although the leadership of the associations studied was clear on who set the standards, there was considerable variability among those surveyed and their respective association as to who sets the standards and who they believed should be involved in setting the standards. One of the trainers who was interviewed in the study of the OSTD stated that individuals were not really concerned about the standards or who set them if the certification program was well recognized in the marketplace. In her opinion, the question of standards among potential participants in a program only arises if it is a new program. The concern at that point is will the new program provide the qualifications that will be recognized by the potential employers?

What are the requirements to earn a designation for current members of an association when a new certification program is introduced? Frequently, current association members are grandparented. That is to say, they are given the right to use the designation but have no requirements to meet. Grandparenting may be a political necessity to get the new program accepted by current Association members. The OSTD leadership indicated that no grandparenting when its program is launched. However, members of the OSTD who have completed the advanced level of the PDAP program will not be required to be tested on the knowledge component of the certification. They will however, be required to successfully complete the skills component to be awarded the designation when it is decided how the skills component will be tested. It will be interesting to see how the association implements the testing of the skills component. They may encounter the usual political issues, such as
lack of support of the process by long standing members that could affect the outcome of the implementation.

The researcher’s concern in the area of standards is their validity. If a group of professionals creates a program that becomes accepted in the marketplace, who validates and maintains the standards to reflect the professional needs? Will there be public documentation that clearly defines the how the standards were arrived at and how they will be tested and maintained current? Generally, there is minimal public documentation on the methods used to set the standards. The current leadership of an association is often unaware of how the original work was done. The researcher believes that the lack of knowledge surrounding the development, details and evaluation of standards can imply hidden agendas on behalf of the developers of the program of the association staff or the volunteer leadership.

Professional associations by their nature are run by staff and volunteers who periodically change. If the history of the development and maintenance of the program is not available, it becomes difficult for individuals to be aware of the details and to build on the history. Potential certification candidates work to earn a designation because it is recognized in the marketplace but they are unaware of the competencies required. How can individuals be confident that the knowledge gained during the certification program reflects the needs of the profession? If a maintenance program is not in place, the currency of the standards will eventually become an issue. Employers using the designation to screen potential candidates will assume they have base knowledge required for a current position and this knowledge may not be current. Eventually, the lack of currency of a program will reflect on an association and the demand for the designation will disappear. In the short term the individual taking the program will not be receiving value from the professional association.

The respondents of the CCA and the CPA indicated that they would prefer more input to the standards from University and College experts in the field. Why would they want these groups to have more input? It would appear to the researcher that the respondents had
confidence in such experts and were less confident in their association colleagues to set standards. This area would be an interesting one to pursue with further research.

Finally, over 61% of CPA respondents, 45% of ICSA and approximately 38% of CCA respondents indicated that there should be a comprehensive examination completed by candidates for the respective designations. None of these associations had this requirement in place. Generally, comprehensive examinations are put in place to confirm that candidates for designation have met a common standard such as in the case of the HRPAO. The associations have not responded by creating such an examination. The leadership of the CCA indicated that such an examination was not necessary since they had control of content, delivery and evaluation of all courses and do not allow exemptions. Whereas other associations such as the CPA and ICSA do allow exemptions and they credit college and university courses as meeting their need or being equivalent to their courses. At this time they are not responding to the membership need. Some associations, such as the HRPAO, publish a yearly document that outlines the course equivalents to their own in various colleges and universities. How does an association determine that a course meets their standards? How do they monitor the standards of the course? This is an area for further study.

Accessibility

When programs are tightly controlled by the association and only offered in specific locations, access to the program was identified as an issue by both the association leadership and the individuals surveyed. Cost of programming including fees, transportation, supplies are also factors affecting accessibility. Respondents to surveys overwhelmingly indicated the need for employer support to pay fees. Alternate delivery strategies such as correspondence or computer-based delivery can help to alleviate the access issue but participants need access to equipment or support to make these alternatives a viable option. The CCA and CPA have begun to develop and deliver programs by alternate means such as interactive video and
computer-based study. The question is why are there not more distance education strategies in place. Although individuals may be aware of distance education options, in the researcher's experience, most do not have the knowledge and/or the expertise to pursue them. To develop a multi-media delivery mechanism it would be necessary to document information in significant detail because you no longer have an instructor to complement the documentation. The cost and time to develop such programs is significantly higher than the traditional classroom based program. However, the delivery costs are significantly lower as there is no need for an instructor. Additionally, testing can be built into the system to minimize administration costs. The delivery of certification programs by distance education has the potential to reduce the cost of transportation and perhaps fees as the overall development and delivery cost of the associations should decrease. The researcher believes that there is potential growth if the association leadership decides to move in this direction.

Many of the individuals involved in the development of certification programs for associations do not have an education background. Individuals interviewed by the researcher, who had responsibility for the certification programs, were Manager of Marketing, Manager of Communication and Executive Directors. In the opinion of the researcher, if the associations are going to make significant use of alternate delivery strategies for their certification programs they will need to first gain some expertise in these areas.

**Continuing Education**

Continuing education has two components, recertification and other voluntary professional development activities such as conferences and seminars. All associations in the study sponsored or co-sponsored activities such as conferences, workshops, seminars and publications as a means to keep their membership up to date in the professional area. These activities were generally supported by those surveyed, with local seminars and workshops being the most popular. In all cases, the participation in these activities was voluntary. The availability of such activities depends on registration. Although the leadership of the
associations studied indicated that their events were well attended, it is difficult to determine the extent of such activity as the leadership of all associations studied clearly indicated that programs with low registration were cancelled. All events were designed to make money.

Recertification was required only by the St. John Ambulance programs. In addition to mandatory recertification, the association had other professional development activities that were generally voluntary. However, the Metro Branch of St. John Ambulance required yearly participation in a professional workshop, in addition to the recertification course, for individuals to maintain the right to work in the Metro Branch. The leadership of the Metro Branch stated that they felt a need for higher standards and since they had a significant number of instructors they could afford to more demanding. Variable standards for the same designation from the researcher's point of view is not acceptable. If standards are defined as appropriate to earn a designation and maintain currency, they should be consistent for all who earn or maintain a designation. What surprised the researcher was this did not seem to be an issue with the Instructors. Further research into the seeming acceptance of variable standards would be valuable.

Implications

In Chapter One of the thesis the researcher asked the question; Do volunteer professional associations play a role in the monopolization of labour pools? The participants in the study have indicated "yes". A significant number of respondents in each association see the designation from the certification programs as a required tool to enter the job market or expand their career options.

According to Barnhart (1994) the development of a certification process by a volunteer professional association gives the association control over the requirements for individuals who want to practise the profession. Certainly the research verifies this point. The Vice-President of Standards and Certification for OSTD, in his interview, stated that the competencies that OSTD has created will provide a means by which employers can assess
employees working as Trainers or screen potential candidates for training positions. OSTD, in their needs analysis prior to program development, identified a gap in the educational programs offered at Colleges/Universities in the area of training. According to the Vice President of Standards and Accreditation, no specific career path leading exists that leads to a degree or diploma in Training. To close this gap they defined standards for entry level training professionals and plan to encourage Colleges/Universities to develop their curriculum to support these standards.

In the majority of cases, the associations have created a curriculum-based program based on a set of courses a group of professionals of the association recognize as needed to practise the profession. Of the associations studied only St. John Ambulance had a set of public documents that illustrated the processes used to define what was included in their certification program. Curriculum-based programs tend not to be based on a job analysis of the profession but on a group of professionals’ understanding of their needs. If employers are using the designation as a screen to assess potential candidates for a job, the screen may not be as consistent as employers would like to think. The researcher, from personal experience as a registrar for a professional association that supported a curriculum-based program, was often asked to grant course exemptions. To grant an exemption from participation in a course not formally acknowledged by the association, a review of the course outline and assessment methods was required. Course outlines vary considerably. The outcomes achieved by participating in a course are far from explicit in most course outlines as the standards vary from institution to institution. An exemption was granted by the researcher, if approximately, 75% of the course outline was similar to the association accepted course outline.

Some professional associations, such as the HRPAO, who support a curriculum-based certification program that can be delivered through colleges and universities, became concerned that the various courses taken by potential designation candidates did not provide them with the same knowledge. For example, a course in Human Resources Administration in one institution might not have the same standards as that of another. The HRPAO introduced a comprehensive certification examination that was under its control to ensure
consistency of academic standards for all who are awarded the HRPAO designation. All candidates for the designation must take the comprehensive examination upon completion of the required courses. The HRPAO leadership believe the comprehensive examination ensures consistency of standards for all candidates who earn the designation. The questions that the researcher asked are:

- What is the basis for the comprehensive examination? and
- Is there consistency with the course materials that individuals are asked to study and on which they write examinations?

The researcher believes there needs to be a clearly defined set of objectives and competencies based on a job analysis to ensure ongoing consistency of courses of study and assessment mechanisms.

The CCA program gets around the problem of variability in course content by maintaining control over the courses and testing mechanisms. However, the same question arises. Is there a consistent basis for development of the courses of study and testing? If not is the outcome of the program, an individual holding a designation, an individual with knowledge that a potential employer can rely on?

Competence

Do volunteer professional associations ensure the competence of the individuals who earn a designation from their association? If competence means that an individual is well qualified and has demonstrated a set of defined competencies, then in three out of the five associations studied the answer is, the researcher is not sure. Only OSTD and St. John have public documents that define required competencies. Potential candidates, employers and the public have access to the standards of these programs and can assure themselves what standards the candidate has met. The CCA and the CPA curriculum-based programs do not have standards defined in this way. The CCA and CPA curriculum-based programs deal only with the
required knowledge and not the skills required for the profession. As the President of the CCA indicated in her interview, there is concern among some of the CCA executive that employers might believe that the individuals who have earned the designation have the skills to transfer the knowledge learned to the skills required for the job. She stated that individuals who had earned the designation illustrated only their ability to learn information and to pass tests. This is an important observation to make. Testing of skills to earn a designation is rarely done except in areas of technical skills, in part because we do not know how to test them.

The ISCA's criterion-based program awards a designation based on criteria such as years of experience and earning a degree. For potential employers of individuals with this designation there is no expectation that a clearly defined body of knowledge has been successfully mastered if they have an understanding of designation requirements.

According to Jarvis (1993) testing ought to be relevant to professional practice. Of the associations studied, only St. John's program requires candidates for the Instructor program to illustrate CPR and First Aid skills and demonstrate teaching of the skills prior to certification. They are testing transfer of skills and knowledge to its application on the job. There is liability on behalf of an Instructor of St. John Ambulance to ensure successful candidates of the programs can perform CPR and First Aid to the documented standards. Application of CPR or First Aid procedures incorrectly can result in further injury or death of a victim. If it can be demonstrated that an individual was incorrectly taught that the individual, the Instructor and St. John Ambulance can be sued.

OSTD's proposed certification program requires candidates for the designation to illustrate certain competencies. The details are unclear at the writing of the thesis. The difficulty in developing testing to illustrate performance based is not surprising considering how difficult it is to test skills in areas other than technical areas such as CPR.
Skills testing is avoided by most educational organizations when it comes to what is often referred to as soft skills. These usually include areas such as leadership skills and negotiation skills areas. How do you test that an individual has the skills to negotiate? It is much easier to measure that a individual has the knowledge about a negotiation process. In most education programs, the evaluation process stops at this point. Individuals are tested on their ability to apply the skills in an on the job situation where the evaluation includes the success or not of the outcome of the situation. The OSTD has developed behavioural objectives for its soft skills and is now determining how it will test these skills. Observation is a method that may be used but who will do it? What tools will be used to assess that the individual has mastered the skill? Further research into the testing of skills especially in the areas of the soft skills would be useful for professional associations and their membership if they entent to move into this area.

Obsolescence

Do volunteer professional associations provide a means by which they ensure that their membership who hold designations do not become obsolete? The five professional associations studied offer voluntary continuing education programs but generally provide no means of evaluation of the learning in these programs. Only St. John Ambulance requires recertification every three years by participation in a workshop in which candidates must illustrate their skills and knowledge. The codes of ethics of the associations state that individuals who hold designations will maintain their currency in the profession. Most associations have procedures to deal with complaints from the public if one of their profession is seen to be obsolete. However, these procedures are rarely if every used\textsuperscript{23} and no examples were found in the literature of volunteer professional associations. During the interview with the Director of Standards and Certification it was noted that in her five years with the association she had to remove the certification from one individual only. However,

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{23} Interviews with CCA Managing Director, Director of Standards at St. John Ambulance and Manager of Education, CPA. (1994 & 1995). 
\end{footnotesize}
examples were found in the literature of profession associations such as the Colleges of Nurses of Ontario that license individuals\textsuperscript{24}. Once a designation is earned the main requirement of the association for continued use of the designation requires ongoing membership as a means to control how the designation is used.

In the curriculum-based programs the candidates for certification are told what to learn. They are not taught how to assess their knowledge in an area and how to fill in the gap to meet required standards. A number of respondents to the surveys expressed concern about the need to take courses they had already successfully completed in the past to earn a designation or a degree. They indicated that the organizers of the certification programs ought to include a methodology in the certification process to allow candidates to assess their current knowledge, receive credit for it and take only the training needed to close the knowledge gap. Some associations such as the CPA and the CCA have included in their program an option of illustrating knowledge by successfully completing a challenge examination or examinations. Although candidates for certification in the CPA can choose the option of a challenge exam rather than take the course first, they indicated that taking the course is necessary. They were unsure of the requirements, based on the course outline provided by the association and were concerned they would not be successful unless they participated in the course.

The proposed program of the OSTD requires candidates to assess their own learning and develop a learning strategy based on the required competencies in the TCA to close their personal competency gap. Candidates can close the gap in many ways including reading of professional materials, going to workshops and attending conferences. When the candidates believe the gap is closed they can apply to write the knowledge examination. Additionally, candidates for OSTD certification will be required to successfully complete a skills

examination. The details of this are not available at the time of the writing of this thesis. The OSTD process has been designed to help candidates to learn how to learn and plan their own learning. However, it is a big step for individuals who have no previous experience in this type of learning. The OSTD program will be difficult for candidates who have always been told what they require. Many may choose to take courses that cover all the competency areas to ensure they can pass the examination. Perhaps there is an opportunity for the OSTD to teach individuals how to develop learning plans and participate in designing their own learning.

Limitations of the Study

There was little or no difficulty in finding associations that were interested in participating in the research. The original letter sent at random to a number of associations solicited interest from ten associations that expressed interest. When the researcher followed up with the leadership of the identified association, issues related to resources, authority, control and confidentiality arose. For example, the researcher initially pursued the Marketing Association, a recently formed volunteer association, to participate in the study as the contact expressed an interest in the research. The association does not have a certification program but sponsors a course in continuing education at the University of Toronto. At the time of the study they did not have the resources, financial or human to create a certification program. Since the association leadership believes there is a specialized body of knowledge associated with the area, the researcher thought it would be interesting to get data from a group that did not have a program but whose leadership was interested in creating one. The organization was unable to participate in the study due to a lack of resources.

Generally, volunteer associations are run by staff who report to a Volunteer Board. Staff have limited authority to commit to activities such as research into their programs without involving the Volunteer Board. However, they can act as a barrier to the Board. They assume the role of gatekeepers of the information restricting what the Board hears and what gets distributed to the membership. In the case of the CCA and St. John Ambulance, the staff
(Managing Director of CCA and Director of Standards and Certification) were very supportive of the study, reviewed the proposed survey in detail and requested the addition of questions or changes in questions to facilitate obtaining information. Additionally, they arranged for key volunteers to be involved in the interview process. The researcher believes that there is a significant opportunity for further research on the association programs as many association staff members expressed an interest in finding out more about the research with the hope of being able to use the output to help them develop their programs.

However, there were a number of areas in which the control and confidentiality issues prevented certain questions from being asked or certain documents from being made available. Examples of this included:

- The inability to get copies of reports or documents about the certification program from the association staff because such documentation was considered confidential,
- The request not to use certain documentation as references in the study,
- The refusal to allow the survey to be distributed to the membership if certain questions on the study such as ones related to certification standards were asked,
- The inability to survey membership as the association leadership wanted all communication to come directly from it.
- Access to databases of membership or participants in the program to ensure that the criteria for selection of individuals to receive the survey were adhered to,
- The lack of accessibility to association documentation on the development and/or maintenance of certification programs meant that the researcher had to rely on the information provided by the staff and or leadership volunteers and,
- Limited access to staff and volunteers to discuss the certification process.

Overall, the association contacts were very helpful and open to discussion of the topics under study. Rarely was the researcher asked not to deal with a topic. The inability to survey the OSTD membership and the lack of access to confidential reports were a real loss to the outcomes of the research. The reports would have provided an excellent background of
information to round out the research and the responses from professional groups whose leadership was developing a new process would have contributed to the understanding of where the membership is on the topic and the issues they felt strongly about. The researcher believes that control played a significant part in this case and that this control requirement was shared by only a few in the association. The inability to ask questions of the ICSA membership on standards and certification limited the value of the information gained from the survey. The data gathered from the CPA, CCA and St. John Ambulance participants was not limited only by the questions asked. The leadership of St. John Ambulance was pleased at the response, as similar efforts by it to gather data resulted in few surveys being returned.

Summary

In summary, volunteer professional associations studied have developed and manage certification programs that are seen by the participants in the programs as credentials required in the job market and are perceived to be used by employers to screen potential candidates for positions. Thus, the programs do restrict access to the job market and may control labour pools, if designations are ultimately seen as credentials for entry to employment in the specific professional field. The documentation on the standards and how they are developed and maintained is usually confidential to the association and very difficult, if not impossible, to obtain. In the opinion of the researcher this is an issue as potential candidates and employers of certified individuals have the same problem. As a potential candidate for certification or a potential employer of an individual, there is no means of clearly knowing the competencies that are part of the certification program. Candidates for certification are fearful of taking the Challenge Option. Potential employers base their acceptance of the designation on previous experience with individuals with the designation or on recommendations from others. The testing mechanisms usually consist of written tests of knowledge and do not test the individual’s ability to transfer the knowledge to the job. The exceptions in the study were the programs of St. John Ambulance where the skills are documented and tested and the proposed OSTD program where the competency document
includes performance criteria that will be the basis for the testing. As discussed earlier it is questionable whether associations should or would know how to test soft skills.

Do volunteer professional associations contribute to the life-long learning of members? The researcher believes the answer is “yes”. Associations usually include in their mission statements a mandate to provide continuing education, which usually includes providing literature, workshops and conferences on current topics of interest to their members. If the activities do not meet their members’ needs the membership will not maintain their relationship with the association. It is very much up to individuals to know how to choose the direction they believe they need to take to keep their knowledge and perhaps skills current and to participate in the many possible activities offered to meet their needs. For the associations studied there were no required continuing education programs except in the case of St. John Ambulance, where participation in programs to illustrate standards changes were mandatory. Most professionals were originally educated in an environment where the learning was defined by the authority and the ability to pick and choose individual requirements for development was not fostered. The opportunity to learn through volunteer professional association programming is available, but individuals must develop the ability to assess their needs and to chose activities to close the identified gaps they identify. Many professionals may not have developed this ability.

In the next decade, the movement of professionals, within the job market will necessitate the need for continued learning and perhaps additional credentialing. An individual who holds a designation from HRPAO may want to move to the speciality area of compensation or training. If that individual has earned a CHRP from the HRPAO, what competencies have been achieved? Can any be credited towards a CCP or CTDP? The researcher believes that a certification process, with clearly defined and measurable outcomes, would allow more freedom for potential candidates to move from one professional area to another without the duplication of effort on course work. Some respondents to the surveys were concerned that

25 Vice President of Standards and Certification, OSTD. (1994).
they could not illustrate prior learning and were being required to take courses when they already had the knowledge. Even when Challenge Options were available, they were unclear of expectations and took the course to increase their success on the examination.

The researcher believes that a process that documents requirements in the form of competencies would facilitate ongoing learning. Potential designation candidates would be aware of or be able to assess the competencies they have achieved and prepare a personal plan for development. Potential employers would be able to use the competencies as a standardized means to screen candidates for positions to help employees form individual development plans that when fulfilled, will ultimately be of value to both the individual and the employer. From the researcher’s point of view, there is a significant need to move to a competency-based format that clearly defines requirements based on competencies and tests to these requirements. Whether skills testing ought to be done on “soft” skills by volunteer professional associations is questionable in the researcher’s mind. More information is required on how this might be carried out and what the liabilities to the association would be if their designation indicated that the graduate had the skills as well as the knowledge. Candidates for certification and employers of certified candidates would have a fuller knowledge of what the designation signifies and the ability of the association to discipline their members (Barnhart, 1994) would be significantly increased.

Next Steps

From the researcher’s perspective there are a number of avenues open for further research including:

- the issues around the gatekeeping aspects of both staff and the volunteer leadership of professional associations,
- how testing of soft skills such as negotiation skills is or can be done,
• the question of whether volunteer professional associations ought to be in the business of testing skills and their transfer to the workplace,
• the issues around the lack of information on standards that individuals must meet to earn a designation,
• other options for the delivery of programs such as distance education,
• how does continuing education contribute to the professional growth and reduce obsolescence and,
• the maintenance of currentcy of certification programs.

As with most research studies more questions were raised than were answered. However, the outcomes of this study have provided some base information that can be built on.
APPENDIX A

Interview Questions based on Study Questions and Objectives in Chapter One.

1. What is the process used by your association for certification? Why do you use the identified process?
2. How do members of the association access the training for certification? Are there any issues (real or perceived) with respect to accessibility of training?
4. Who sets the standards for certification? How were or are the standards determined? How are the standards for and process of certification maintained current?
5. What types of continuing education programs such as conferences, workshop do you offer as an association? What kind of participation do you get in the programs? Are any of the programs mandatory?
6. How are the requirements to participate in and/or successfully complete certification in your organization communicated?
7. What are the implications of participation of a member in the certification program? Will their be more or better opportunity for employment? What are the implications for an employer hiring a graduate of the certification program of your association?
APPENDIX B

E. Speers, 81 Husband Dr., Weston, Ontario, M9L 1J8
416-506-6228

June 29, 1994

Executive Director

« 1»
« 2»

Dear Sir/Madam

I am a doctoral student at the University of Toronto, embarking on a research project for my thesis. The research will focus on a comparative study of the certification process used by professional associations.

The first step, of my research is to gather information from professional associations about their certification process. I am writing to ask you to provide me with information on your organization’s certification process, including who the candidates are, what the certification program recognizes, what is required of the candidate, what organizations endorse the certification and how certification is maintained. After reviewing the information provided, I will be selecting four associations for an in-depth study. The in-depth study will involve an analysis of the certification process, including how it was developed, the methodology used to certify the members and the membership’s understanding of the process. This will be accomplished through surveys and interviews.

If your association is selected as a potential candidate for further study, I will be in touch with you to solicit your support in the process of gathering additional information.

I appreciate your taking the time to read this letter and hope that you can provide me with the requested information. Please give me a call if you have any questions prior to releasing the information.

E. Speers
APPENDIX C

Professional Associations

Canadian Compensation Association
P.O. Box 294
Kleinburg, Ont
L0J 1C0

HRPAO
2 Bloor St. W., Suite 600
Toronto, Ontario
M4W 3E2

Purchasing Management Association of Canada
2 Carlton St., Suite 1414
Toronto, Ontario
M5B 1J3

The Institute of Canadian Bankers
199 Bay St., Suite 3000
Commerce Court W.
Toronto M5L 1G2

Certified General Accountants Association of Ontario
240 Eglinton Ave. E.
Toronto, Ontario
M4P 1K8

Association of Professional Placement Agencies & Consultants
National Head office
114 Richmond St. E., L-109
Toronto, Ontario
M5C 1P1
Canadian Direct Marketing Association
1 Concorde Gate, Suite 607
Don Mills, Ontario
M3N 3N6
Bonnie Wasser - 391-2362

Canadian Institute of Management
456 Danforth Ave
Toronto, Ontario
M4K 1P4

Insurance Institute of Canada
18 King St. E., 6th floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5C 1C4

Canadian Securities Institute
33 Yonge St. Suite 360
Toronto, Ontario
M5E 1G4

Real Estate Institute of Canada
2200 Lakeshore Blvd, W.
Toronto, Ontario
M8V 1A4

College of Nurses of Ontario
101 Davenport Rd.
Toronto, Ontario
M5R 2P1

Association of Professional Engineers of Ontario
1155 Yonge St.
Toronto, Ontario
M4T 2Y5
Institute of Certified Management Consultants
181 Bay St., BCE Place
Heritage Building
P.O. Box 835
Toronto, Ontario
M5J 2T3

Canadian Institute of Traffic and Transportation
145 Berkeley St
5th Floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5A 2X1

Canadian Institute of Chartered Business Valuators
277 Wellington St., W.
5th Floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5V 3H2

Arbitration and Mediation Institute of Ontario
234 Eglinton Ave., E.
Suite 602
Toronto, Ontario
M4P 1K5

Society of Professional Accountants
37 Cosentino Dr.
Scarborough, Ontario
M1P 3A3

The Canadian Public Relations Society
1 Yonge St. Suite 1801
Toronto, Ontario
M5E 1W7
Canadian Society of Customs Brokers
111 York St.
Ottawa, Ontario
K1N 5T4

Association of Administrative Assistants
Toronto Branch
P.O. Box 5107
Station A,
Toronto, Ontario
M5W 1N4

The Canadian Payroll Association
1867 Yonge St., Suite 801
Toronto, Ontario
M4S 1Y5

Credit Union Institute of Canada
275 Bank St., Suite 400
Ottawa, Ontario
K2P 2L6

OAMFT Commission
P.O. Box 50055
660 Eglinton Ave., E.
Toronto, Ontario
M4G 4G1

The Canadian Dietetic Association
480 University Ave., Suite 601
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 1V2

Ontario Association of Certified Engineering Technicians and Technologists
10 Four Seasons Place
Islington, Ontario
M9B 6H7
Association of Architectural Technologists of Ontario
150 Consumer’s Rd.
Suite 407
Willowdale, Ontario
M2J 1P9

Canadian Institute of Management
456 Danforth Ave
Toronto, Ontario
M4K 1P4

Canadian Public Personnel Management Association
Att: J. Fernandes
Ministry of Culture, Tourism and Recreation
Human Resources Branch
77 Bloor St., W
14th floor
Toronto, Ontario
M7A 2R9

Canadian Society of Association Executives
40 University Ave
Suite 1104
Toronto, ON
M5J 1T1

Association for Canadian Registered Safety Professionals
6519B Mississauga Rd.
Mississauga, ON
L5N 1A6

College of Physicians & Surgeons of Ontario
80 College St.
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2E2
College of Veterinarians of Ontario
340 Woodlawn W.
Guelph, Ontario
N1H 2X1

Association of Registered Interior Designers of Ontario
168 Bedford
Toronto, Ontario
M5R 2K9

Association of Professional Computer Consultants of Canada
2175 Sheppard Ave., E.
Toronto, Ontario
M2J 1W8

Association of Canadian Pension Management
1075 Bay St.
Toronto, Ontario
M5S 2B1

Association of Allied Health Professionals of Ontario
234 Eglinton Ave., E.
Toronto, Ontario
M4P 1E5

Law Society of Upper Canada
Osgoode Hall
130 Queen St., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M5H 2N5

Canadian Institute of Professional Business Consultants
55 Bloor St., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M4W 1A5
Canadian Institute of Travel Counsellor
3300 Bloor St., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M8X 2X2

Canadian Manufacturers’ Association
1 Yonge St.
Toronto, Ontario
M5E 1E5

Canadian Mental Health Association
970 Lawrence Ave., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M6A 1B8

Canadian Nuclear Association
144 Front St., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M5J 2L7

Alzheimers Society of Canada
1320 Yonge St.
Toronto, Ontario
M4T 1X2

Canadian Council of Professional Certification
1 Edenmills Dr.
Toronto, Ontario
M1E 1V6

Canadian Franchise Association
88 University Ave
Toronto, Ontario
M5J 1T6
Canadian Hotel Marketing & Sales Executives
25 George St.
Toronto, Ontario
M5A 4L8

Canadian Importers Association Inc.
210 Dundas St. W.
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2E8

Canadian Institute of Radiation Safety
555 Richmond St., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M5V 3B1

Canadian Institute of Certified Administrative Managers
1235 Bay St
Toronto, Ontario
M5R 3K4

Canadian Institute of Credit & Financial Management
5090 Explorer Dr.
Mississauga, Ontario
L4W 4T9

Canadian Diabetes Association
78 Bond St.
Toronto, Ontario
M5B 1X2

Ontario Association of Certified Engineering Technicians
and Technologists
10 FourSeasons Pl
Toronto, Ontario
M9B
American Society of Quality Control
P.O. Box 340
Sta A, Scarborough
Ontario
M1K 5C1

Association of Independent Consultants
2175 Sheppard Ave., E
Toronto, Ontario
M2J 1W

Association of Professional Training Organizations
950 Yonge St.
Toronto, Ontario
M4W 2J4

Association of Registered Interior Designers
of Ontario
717 Church St.
Toronto, Ontario
M4W 2M5

Association of the Chemical Profession of Ontario
789 Don Mills Rd.
Toronto, Ontario
M3C 1T5

Canadian Institute of Marketing
41 Capital Dr.
Nepean, Ottawa
K2G 0E7

Canadian Insurance Brokers Inc
1 Eglinton Ave. E.
Toronto, Ontario
M4P 1A1
Canadian Association of Women’s Executives & Entrepreneurs
595 Bay St.
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2C3

Canadian Association of Occupational Therapists
110 Eglinton Ave. W
Toronto, Ontario
M4R 2G9

Canadian Association of Tour Operators
611 Pinegrove
Oakville, Ontario
L6K 2C5

Ontario Association of Dispensing Opticians
2029 ¼ Avenue Rd.
Toronto, Ontario
M5M 4A4

Ontario Association of Medical Radiation Technologists
233 Colborne St
Bradford, Ontario
L3& 2R8

Ontario Association of Optometrist
290 Lawrence Ave., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M5M 1B3

Ontario Association of Professional Social Workers
410 Jarvis St.
Toronto, Ontario
M4Y 2G6
Ontario Association of Radiologists
86 Bloor St., W.
Toronto, Ontario
M5S 1M5

Ontario Society of Chiropodists
6519-B Mississauga Rd.
Streetsville, Ontario
L1N 1A6

Ontario Speakers Association
1 Babington Crt
Etobicoke, Ontario
M9A 1J7

American Management Association of Canada
100 University Ave
Toronto, Ontario
M5J 1V5

American Marketing Association
246 Sherborne St
Toronto, Ontario
M5A 2S1

Institute of Chartered Secretaries & Administrators
55 St. Clair Ave. W
Toronto, Ontario
M4V 2X7

Institute of Corporate Directors
100 University Ave.
Toronto, Ontario
M5J 1V5
Institute of Canadian Advertisers
30 Soudan Ave
Toronto, Ontario
M4S 1V6

Institute of Management Training
110 Bloor St. W
Toronto, Ontario
M5S 2W7

Institute for Computer Studies
155 Gordon Baker
North York, Ontario
M2H 3N5

Institute of Municipal Assessors of Ontario
109 Railside Rd
North York, Ontario
M3A 1B2

Canadian Association of Human Resource Systems Professionals
250 Consumers Rd.
North York, Ontario
M2J 4V6

Canadian Association of Interns and Residents
505 University Ave.
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2H2
APPENDIX D

Professional Associations Contacted

Note: Highlighted Associations are the ones that participated in the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Association</th>
<th>Certification Program</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Recertification Required</th>
<th>Exams</th>
<th>Membership Required</th>
<th>Work Experience Required</th>
<th>Age Requirement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Association of Chemical Professionals of Ontario</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y K and S</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Association of Optometrists</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. John Ambulance (Instructor)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y 18 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association of Canadian Registered Safety Professionals</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Society of Association Executives</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CSAE</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Society for Training and Development</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CTP</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Institute of Chartered Business Valuators</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CBV</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 2 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association</td>
<td>Certification Program</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Recertification Required</td>
<td>Exams</td>
<td>Membership Required</td>
<td>Work Experience Required</td>
<td>Age Requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. John Brigade</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y K and S</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y 16 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Canadian Public Relations Society Inc.</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>APR</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 5 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certified General Accountants Association of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CGA</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 2 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute of Canadian Bankers</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>FICB</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Compensation Association</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CCP</td>
<td>N (Currency)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute of Certified Management Consultants of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CMC</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Nurses Association</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Specialty areas eg: Critical Care</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Securities Institute</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>FCSI</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association</td>
<td>Certification Program</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Recertification Required</td>
<td>Exams</td>
<td>Membership Required</td>
<td>Work Experience Required</td>
<td>Age Requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Payroll Association</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>P.A., P.S., P.M.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association of Professional Placement Agencies and Consultants</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 2 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources Professional Association of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>C.H.R.P.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 3 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing Management Association of Canada</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>C.P.P.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 3 - 6 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Credit Union Institute of Canada</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>FCUIC &amp; ACUIC</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 2 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>ACIS &amp; FCIS</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 6 years for ACIS /10 years for FCIS</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Institute of Marketing</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>M.C. Inst. M or A.C. Inst. M.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 3 to 5 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association</td>
<td>Certification Program</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Recertification Required</td>
<td>Exams</td>
<td>Membership Required</td>
<td>Work Experience Required</td>
<td>Age Requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Institute of Canada</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>F.C.I./A.C.I.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y/N based on education</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arbitration and Mediation Institute of Ontario Inc</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Insurance Institute of Canada</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>A.I.I.C</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association of Administrative Assistants</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Q.A.A.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Real Estate Association</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>License through government</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 2 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Institute of Management</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>C.I.M. /F.CIM /P.Mgr</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 7 years for P.Mgr</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Institute of Certified Administrative Managers</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CAM/FCAM</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 5 years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Dietetic Association</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>University Accredited Program</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y 40 weeks</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association</td>
<td>Certification Program</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Recertification Required</td>
<td>Exams</td>
<td>Membership Required</td>
<td>Work Experience Required</td>
<td>Age Requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>University Accredited Program (MD)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>1 year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College of Nurses of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Accredited Program (RN or RPN)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>1200 hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Association for Marriage and Family Therapy</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>AAMFT</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>2 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Engineers of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>P.Eng</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>2 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Association of Certified Engineering Technicians and Technologies</td>
<td>Y (being changed)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association of Professional Computer Consultants</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Association of Women Executives and Entrepreneurs</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

184
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Association</th>
<th>Certification Program</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Recertification Required</th>
<th>Exams</th>
<th>Membership Required</th>
<th>Work Experience Required</th>
<th>Age Requirement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Ontario College of Certified Social Workers</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>C.S.W.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y Oral and Written</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Foundation of Employee Benefit Plans</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>CEBS</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute of Municipal Assessors of Ontario</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>M.I.M.A/A.I.M.A.</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y (M.I.M.A.)</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Association of Human Resource Systems Professionals</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Association of Occupational Therapists</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>O.T.©</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX E

Follow-up Letter

Elizabeth Speers
81 Husband Dr., Weston, Ontario, M9L 1J8
416-491-5050 x 4320

Date:
Addressee

Dear

Earlier this year, I wrote a letter to your organization requesting information on your certification program. This information was to provide the groundwork for my doctoral thesis at the University of Toronto. You replied to my request by providing me with considerable data, and you also expressed an interest in my study.

After reviewing the initial information you provided, I am now writing you to request that your organization participate in my study. I am interested in using your organization in my sample for two main reasons. First, it has a certification process that has been in place for some time, and second, the data that your membership could provide would be very useful in my comparative study.

Your participation would involve the following:

- interviews of approximately one hour with key association leadership who are involved in the educational role and
- a survey of membership using a survey produced by the researcher.

Feedback on the survey from the association leadership would be sought prior to its use with the membership.

All data collected would belong to the researcher, who would destroy it upon completion of the study. Further, association leadership would be asked to comment on the analysis of the data and their opinions would be included in the summary.

I will be calling you within the next week to confirm your association’s interest in this activity.

E. Speers
APPENDIX F

Consent Letter

Date:
Address:

Thank you for agreeing to provide me with information on the certification process of the XXXXXX Association. As a staff/volunteer member of the association, the information you have on the processes and procedures in your professional development programs will be very valuable to the outcome of my thesis. As explained earlier, my thesis is a comparative study on the processes professional associations use in the certification of their members. The objectives include a comparison of methods used for certification, a determination of the perception of members of the process of certification and a determination of why members participate in the certification process.

The interview will involve up to one hour of your time and will be structured around some very general questions which I will provide. If you have any questions or concerns, I would be pleased to address them prior to or during the interview, which will be taped. The taped data, which belongs to the researcher, will be stored in a locked cabinet. It will only be reviewed by my thesis supervisor and myself and will be destroyed at the end of the study. Once the analysis has been completed, I would be pleased to share it with you and to seek your feedback.

At any time, you can withdraw from participation in the interview by letting me know.

E. Speers
I agree to participate in the interview as described above and understand that I can withdraw from the process at any time.
INSTRUCTOR APPLICATION

Thank you for your inquiry regarding Instructor courses.

PREREQUISITES:

1. Will be 18 years of age or older.

2. Will have the ability to teach both theory and skills.

3. Must be in possession of a valid St. John Ambulance Standard or Advanced First Aid certificate issued within one year of the course commencement (for NITDP Phase I and First Aid Instructor courses).

4. Must be in possession of a valid Level C (Basic Rescuer) CPR certificate issued within one year of the course commencement (for NITDP Phase I and CPR Instructor courses).

5. Must outline qualifications to teach i.e.: nursing, teaching or health care background (for Health Promotion Instructor courses).

6. Must be recommended by a St. John Ambulance representative stating that the individual is capable of meeting the course objectives and fulfilling the responsibilities in the position description.

St. John Ambulance is committed to training highly motivated, skilled instructors with the qualities necessary for delivering a quality product. For this reason, an Instructor Position Description is enclosed for your serious consideration.

Please review, complete and return this entire document to Ontario Council or the Branch conducting the course, as applicable, at least 8 weeks before your preferred course date.

Precourse study is essential. It is our assumption that you will study the precourse material and arrive at the course with basic skills in hand. Further, you will be expected to be familiar with all the theory of provider courses. Included should be a working knowledge of appropriate Instructor Manuals.

If you have any questions, please contact your Regional Representative, Branch or Ontario Council.

November, 1994
INSTRUCTOR RECOMMENDATION

Please have the St. John Ambulance/Company representative complete these sections of the application.

St. John Ambulance/Company Representative:

As the St. John Ambulance/Company representative you are responsible to evaluate the candidate's suitability to become an Instructor, to review the requirements, and to confirm candidate eligibility. You will be held responsible for candidates you recommend for Instructor qualification.

To successfully complete the course, the candidate will:

1. perform the skills to the standards of St. John Ambulance, demonstrating the instructor's function as a role model;

2. evaluate the performance of the skills of another course participant, identify strengths and weaknesses, and facilitate correction;

3. demonstrate competence in the presentation of selected topics;

4. identify strengths and weaknesses of both content and overall presentation of another course participant's presentation and make appropriate recommendations for change;

5. demonstrate the use of principles of adult education throughout the course;

6. demonstrate the characteristics of an Instructor role model throughout the course;

7. be able to achieve a pass mark on the examination(s).
APPENDIX H

Pilot Survey of St. John Ambulance Instructors and Instructor Trainers

Same as Appendix I except questions 14a and 15 were not included on the pilot survey.
Instructor/Instructor-Trainer Survey by Elizabeth Speers

I am a doctoral student in Education at the University of Toronto. I am working on a thesis that involves a study of certification processes of various professional organizations. St. John Ambulance has agreed to participate. The attached survey has been designed to gather information about the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification process that you participated in to become an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer. All surveys are coded to maintain confidentiality and the information gathered will be reviewed only by the researcher and her thesis supervisor. At the end of the study all data will be destroyed. Only a summary of the information will be provided to St. John Ambulance administration.

1. What is your current status with St. John?
   - NITDP Instructor-Trainer
   - NITDP Instructor (First Aid & CPR)
   - CPR Instructor only
   - Health Care Instructor-Trainer
   - First Aid Instructor only
   - Health Care Instructor
   - Other (please specify)

2a. How long have you been an Instructor? Instructor-Trainer?
   - Less than a year
   - 2-3 years
   - 4-6 years
   - 7-9 years
   - More than 9 years

2b. Identify your age range.
   - 18 - 29
   - 30 - 39
   - 40 - 49
   - 50 - 59
   - 60 plus
   - 40 - 49

3. How many courses do you teach per year?
4. I am an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer because (identify all items that apply):

   a. I require the certification for employment. ___
   b. I want to develop additional skills for future employment. ___
   c. I can earn extra money from teaching. ___
   d. I want to make a volunteer contribution to my community. ___
   e. I am a member of the Brigade and want to instruct Brigade members. ___
   f. other (please specify) ________________________________

5. To participate in the St. John Instructor/Instructor-Trainer course I required (indicate all items that apply):

   a. a recommendation from a St. John representative ___  ___
   b. previous teaching experience ___  ___
   c. a valid First Aid certificate ___  ___
   d. a current CPR certificate ___  ___
   e. a valid Instructor certificate ___  ___
   f. a valid Health Care certificate ___  ___
   g. other (please specify) ________________________________

6. To successfully complete Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification, I was required to (indicate all items that apply):

   a. demonstrate all the skills of First Aid and CPR. ___  ___
   b. prepare and deliver a presentation on a relevant topic to the satisfaction of the instructor. ___  ___
   c. be monitored by an Instructor-Trainer. ___  ___
   d. demonstrate all the skills of Health Care program ___  ___
   e. other (please specify) ________________________________

7. After the instructor training, I was confident and prepared to train others?

   Yes ___  No ___

8. If the answer to question 7 is "YES", state why.

   ____________________________________________________________
9. If the answer to question 7 is "NO", state why.

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

10. What was the cost to certify as an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instructor</th>
<th>Instructor-Trainer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Fee for course</td>
<td>__________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Length of Course</td>
<td>__________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Required preparation time</td>
<td>__________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Other (please specify)</td>
<td>___________________________</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11. a. How frequently must you recertify? __________

b. How often do you feel you should certify as an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer? __________

c. Why? ____________________________________________

12. What is the cost to recertify?

| a. Fee for course | __________ |
| b. Length of course | __________ |
| c. Required preparation time | __________ |
| d. Other (please specify) | ___________________________ |

13. Recertification for an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer (indicate all items that apply):

a. ensures that they are teaching current skills and knowledge. _____

b. creates an opportunity for individuals to learn and share ideas with each other. _____

c. ensures that certain standards of practice are maintained. _____

d. does not create an opportunity for individuals to learn and share ideas with each other. _____

e. does not ensure that certain standards of practice are maintained. _____

f. other (please specify) ___________________________

14. a. Recertification as an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer needs to continue to be mandatory. Yes ___ No ___

b. Why? ____________________________________________________

14a. Are the Instructor/Instructor-Trainer courses (initial and recertification) accessible to you when required? Yes ___ No ___
15. If "No", state why?

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

16. Who is involved in setting the standards for Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification? (indicate all items that apply):

   a. national volunteers of St. John  
   b. national staff of St. John  
   c. provincial volunteers of St. John  
   d. provincial staff of St. John  
   e. individual Instructors/Instructor-Trainers  
   f. other (please specify)  

________________________________________________________________________

17. Who should be involved in setting the standards for Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification? (indicate all items that apply):

   a. national volunteers of St. John  
   b. national staff of St. John  
   c. provincial volunteers of St. John  
   d. provincial staff of St. John  
   e. individual Instructors/Instructor-Trainers  
   f. other (please specify)  

________________________________________________________________________

18. Do you have certification as an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer from:

   a. the Heart and Stroke Foundation of Ontario  
   b. the Canadian Red Cross Society  
   c. other (please specify)  

________________________________________________________________________

19. a. If you have certification as an Instructor/Instructor-Trainer with another organization do they have different standards for certification?  

   Yes ___ No ___  

   b. If the answer to a. is "YES", what are the differences?  

________________________________________________________________________  

________________________________________________________________________  

________________________________________________________________________
20. a. How would you suggest that the certification program for Instructors/Instructor-Trainers be improved?

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

b. How would you suggest that the recertification program for Instructors/Instructor-Trainers be improved?

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

21. What professional development activities does St. John offer you? (indicate all items that apply)

a. Annual conference
b. Workshops on topics related to teaching
c. Workshops on topics related to skill development
d. Other (please specify)

22. Do you participate in the professional development activities that you identified in question 21?

Yes ___ No ___

23. Are any of the professional development activities mandatory?

Yes ___ No ___

24. If your answer to question 23 is "YES", identify the activities.

________________________________________________________________________

25. If your answer to question 23 is "NO", are there any professional development activities that should be mandatory?

Yes ___ No ___

26. If your answer to question 25 is "YES", identify the activities that should be mandatory and why.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

194
27. If your answer to question 25 is "NO", state why.

_________________________________________________________________________

28. Do you participate in professional development activities offered by:

a. Heart and Stroke Foundation of Ontario?  
b. Canadian Red Cross Society?  
c. Other (please specify) ________________________________

29. What are the professional development activities noted in question 28?

a. Annual conference
b. Workshops on topics related to teaching
   ____________________
c. Workshops on topics related to skill development
   ____________________
d. Other (please specify) ________________________________

30. My overall satisfaction with St. John Instructor/Instructor-Trainer certification program is:

   1  2  3  4  5
   dissatisfied  satisfied

Comments

Thank you for your help. Your valuable input will ensure that my thesis is completed successfully. Please return in the enclosed self-addressed stamped envelope.
APPENDIX J

Pilot survey of the Canadian Compensation Association Members and Participants

Same as appendix K, except questions 12 to 18 required a yes/no answer and did not have a scale.
APPENDIX K

Survey of Canadian Compensation Association Members and Participants in the CCP Designation Program by Elizabeth Speers

I am a doctoral student in Education at the University of Toronto. I am working on a thesis that involves a study of certification processes of various professional organizations. The Canadian Compensation Association is fully co-operating in this activity. The attached survey has been designed to gather information about the professional certification process of the Canadian Compensation Association. All surveys are coded to maintain confidentiality and the information gathered will be reviewed only by the researcher and her thesis supervisor. All data will be destroyed at the end of the study. Only a summary of the information will be provided to the Canadian Compensation Association (CCA) administration.

1. Are you a member of the Canadian Compensation Association?   Yes __  No __

2. If the answer to question 1 is "Yes", how long have you been a member?

3. If the answer to question 1 is "No", is there a reason why you are not a member of the CCA.

If you hold a Certified Compensation Professional Designation (CCP), proceed to question 4.

If you are in the process of working on a Certified Compensation Professional Designation (CCP), proceed to question 9.

If you do not hold CCP and are not in the process of working on a CPP proceed to question 20.

4. How long have you held the CCP designation?

5. How long did it take to complete the certification program?

6. I participated in the CCA certification program to: (please identify all items that apply):

   a. validate my knowledge of compensation and benefits practices.  ___
   b. strengthen my position in my job at the time.  ___
   c. strengthen my position in the job market.  ___
   d. gain respect among my colleagues and professional associates.  ___
   e. expand my career options.  ___
   f. become a part of a network of compensation and benefits practitioners.  ___
   g. obtain the designation which was a requirement for my job.  ___
   h. other (please specify) ___________________________________________

197
7. To participate in the Certified Compensation Professional program I felt that I needed (please identify all the items that apply):

a. a recommendation from my employer. 

b. work experience in the field of compensation. 

c. a university degree/college diploma in an appropriate field 

d. permission from my employer to have time from my job to participate in the courses. 

e. prior training in the area of compensation and benefits. 

f. my employer's support by paying my course fees. 

g. other (please specify) ____________________________________________

8. Have you maintained your certification currency? 

Yes___ No___

Proceed to question 12

9. a. As a participant in the CCP designation program, how many courses have you successfully completed. 

b. As a participant in the CCP designation program, how many examinations have you successfully completed. 

10. I am participating in the CCA designation program to (please identify all items that apply):

a. validate my knowledge of compensation and benefits practices. 

b. strengthen my position in my job. 

c. strengthen my position in the job market. 

d. gain respect among my colleagues and professional associates 

e. expand my career options. 

f. become part of a network of compensation and benefits practitioners. 

g. meet the requirements for my current job. 

h. other (please specify) ____________________________________________

11. To participate in the Certified Compensation Professional program I felt that I needed (please identify all the items that apply):

a. a recommendation from my employer. 

b. work experience in the field of compensation. 

c. a university degree/college diploma in an appropriate field. 

d. permission from my employer to have time from my job to participate in the courses. 

e. prior training in the area of compensation and benefits. 

f. my employer's support by paying my course fees. 

g. other (please specify) ____________________________________________
12. The courses offered by the Canadian Compensation Association as part of the CCP designation program have clearly defined objectives that identify the requirements of the courses.  
   | always | never | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

13. When I participated in the Canadian Compensation Association (CCA) courses I received all the required pre-course information in time to prepare for the training sessions.  
   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

14. The instructors on the CCA courses were prepared to deliver the courses.  
   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

15. The schedule and locations of the CCA courses allowed me to fit my need for the courses with my personal schedule.  
   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

16. The tests used to assess my knowledge of the course material reflected the content of the course.  
   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

17. The instructors of the CCA courses were able to adapt to the needs of the participants during the course with respect to content.  
   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

18. The facilities used for training were appropriate.  
   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |

19. If any of your answers to questions 12 to 18 were "3 or 4", please state why.

   __________________________________________

   __________________________________________

   __________________________________________

   __________________________________________

   __________________________________________

   Proceed to question 21.

20. What is the reason that you are not pursuing a CCP designation?

   __________________________________________

   __________________________________________

   __________________________________________

199
The rest of the questions are to be completed by all participants.

21. What activities do you participate in to keep your knowledge of the compensation field current? (please identify all items that apply)

a. CCA annual conference
b. local workshops/seminars
c. teach or direct workshops
d. write and publish articles in the field
e. CCA focus groups
f. other (please specify)

22. Who do you think is involved in setting the standards for the courses and examinations in the certification process? (please identify all that apply)

a. volunteer members of the CCA
b. university/college experts in the field
c. CCA staff
d. employers of graduates of the program
e. others (please specify)

23. Who do you think should be involved in setting the standards for the courses and examinations in the CCP certification process? (please identify all that apply)

a. volunteer members of the CCA.
b. university/college experts in the field.
c. CCA staff.
d. employers of graduates of the program.
e. others (please specify)

24. Should there be a mandatory recertification process for individuals who earn a CCP designation? Yes ___ No ___

25. If your response to question 24 is "Yes", please identify what should be included in the process.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

26. If your response to question 24 is "No", please state why.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
27. To earn the CCP designation it should be mandatory to:
   a. participate in CCA run courses.
   b. successfully complete exams in all identified courses.
   c. successfully complete a comprehensive CCA examination.
   d. have a current membership in CCA.
   e. other (please specify) 

28. Courses required for CCP designation are readily available to me. Yes ___ No ___

29. If your answer to question 28 is "Yes", please state why.

30. If your answer to question 28 is "No", please state why.

31. What is the cost to participate in the certification process per course?
   a. Fee per course ________
   b. Length of course ________
   b. Required preparation time ________
   d. Accommodation ________
   e. Travel ________
   f. Other (please specify) 

32. The cost of the courses for certification should be the responsibility of:
   a. the participant. ___
   b. the employer of the participant. ___
   c. both the participant and their employer. ___
   d. Other (please specify) 

33. Do you think a current membership in CCA should be required to use the CCP designation? Yes ___ No ___

34. My work experience includes:
   a. Training and Development ___
   b. Marketing ___
   c. Finance ___
   d. Planning ___
   e. Sales ___
   f. General Human Resources ___
   g. Other (please specify) 

201
35. Identify your age range.
   a. 20 - 29 ___  b. 30 - 39 ___  c. 40 - 49 ___  d. 50 - 59 ___  e. 60 plus ___

36. Identify the number of years of work experience you have in the area of compensation/benefits:
   a. <1 year ___  b. 1 - 5 years ___  c. 6 - 10 years ___  d. >10 years ___

Comments:

Thank you for your help. Your valuable input will ensure that my thesis is completed successfully. Please return in the enclosed self-addressed stamped envelope.
APPENDIX L

Survey of The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada Membership and/or Participants in the ICSA Professional Program by Elizabeth Speers

I am a doctoral student in Education at the University of Toronto. I am working on a thesis that involves a study of certification processes of various professional organizations. The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada has agreed to participate. The attached survey has been designed to gather information about the professional program of the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada. All surveys are coded to maintain confidentiality and the information gathered will be reviewed only by the researcher and her thesis supervisor. All data will be destroyed at the end of the study. Only a summary of the information will be provided to The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada.

1. How long have you been a member of The Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators in Canada? _____ years

If you hold the professional designation "Associate" (ACIS) or "Fellow" (FCIS), proceed to question 2.

If you are in the process of working on your professional designation "Associate" (ACIS), proceed to question 5.

2. I hold the following designation ACIS ___ FCIS ___

3. a. How long have you held the ACIS? _____ years
   b. If you hold a FCIS, how long did you hold an ACIS before being granted the FCIS? _____ years

4. How long did it take to complete the ACIS/FCIS designation program? _____ years

5. Which ICSA program were you (or are you) a participant in?
   Program 2000 _____
   Previous Program _____

6. a. As a participant in the ICSA designation program, were you granted any course exemptions? Yes ___ No ___
   b. If "Yes", how many course exemptions were you /have you been granted? _____ courses
   c. How many courses have you successfully completed? _____ courses
7. I participated or am participating in the ICSA designation program to: (identify all items that apply):
   a. gain knowledge in the field. __
   b. strengthen my position in my job. __
   c. strengthen my position in the job market. __
   d. gain respect among my colleagues and professional associates. __
   e. expand my career options. __
   f. become a part of a network of corporate secretary and/or administrator practitioners. __
   g. obtain the designation which was/is a requirement for my job. __
   h. other (please specify) ____________________________

8. To participate in the ICSA Professional program, I felt I needed (identify all the items that apply):
   a. a recommendation from my employer. __
   b. work experience in the corporate secretary or executive administration field. __
   c. permission of my employer to have time from my job to participate in the required courses. __
   d. prior training as a corporate secretary or executive administrator. __
   e. my employer's support by paying my course fees. __
   f. hold a relevant position in the field at the time of application to the program. __
   g. other (please specify) ____________________________

9. On application to the ICSA program, what educational degree did you hold?
   ____________________________

10. What activities do you participate in to keep your knowledge of the field current (identify all items that apply)?
    a. ICSA co-sponsored conferences. __
    b. local workshops/seminars __
    c. teach or direct workshops __
    d. write and publish articles in the field __
    e. other (please specify) ____________________________
11. Courses offered by the ICSA as part of the designation program have clearly defined objectives that identify the requirements of the courses. 
always never 1 2 3 4

12. The schedule and location of ICSA courses and exams allowed me to fit my need for the courses with my personal schedule. 
always never 1 2 3 4

13. The tests used to assess my knowledge of the course material on the ICSA courses reflected the content of the course. 
always never 1 2 3 4

14. To the best of your knowledge to earn the ICSA designation (ACIS) it is mandatory to:
   a. participate in ICSA run courses. __
   b. successfully complete exams in all identified ICSA courses. __
   c. successfully complete a comprehensive ICSA examination. __
   d. have a current membership in ICSA. __
   e. have current employment in an appropriate field __
   f. other (please specify) ________________________________

15. Courses required for ICSA designation are readily available to me. Yes ___ No ___

16. If your answer to question 15 is "Yes", state why.

____________________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________________

17. If your answer to question 15 is "No", state why.

____________________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________________
18. What is the cost to participate in the certification process per course?
   a. Fee per course($)  ________  b. Length of course (days)____
   b. Required preparation time (days) ________  d. Accommodation ($)  ____
   e. Travel ($)  ________
   f. Other (Please specify)  ________________________________

19. The cost of the courses for the designation through ISCA should be
   the responsibility of:
   a. the participant.  ________________
   b. the employer of the participant.  ________________
   c. both the participant and their employer.  ________________
   d. Other (please specify)  ________________________________

20. My work experience includes positions as:
   a. Corporate Secretary  ____  b. Assistant Corporate Secretary  ____
   c. Deputy Corporate Secretary  ____  d. Executive Administrative Position  ____
   e. Other (please specify)  ________________________________

21. Identify your age range.
   a. 20 - 29  ____  b. 30 - 39  ____  c. 40 - 49  ____  d. 50 - 59  ____  e. 60 plus  ____

22. Identify the number of years of work experience you have in the area of administration:
   a. <1 year  ____  b. 1 - 5 years  ____  c. 6 - 10 years  ____  d. > 10 years  ____

   Comments:

Thank you for your help. Your valuable input will ensure that my thesis is completed successfully.
Please return in the enclosed self-addressed stamped envelope.
October 5, 1995.

Dear student/ former student,

Please find enclosed a survey from ELIZABETH SPEERS, a doctoral student in Education at the University of Toronto, who is currently working on a thesis that involves a study of certification processes of various professional organizations.

The Canadian Payroll Association has agreed to distribute this survey on behalf of Elizabeth. We feel that the results of the survey will enable us to make improvements to our Payroll Management Certificate Program based on student feedback. If you choose to complete the survey, please return it in the enclosed self-addressed envelope.

If you have any questions or concerns please contact me.

Yours truly,

Maureen Flaherty
Manager, Education.
APPENDIX N

Pilot Survey of participants in the Canadian Payroll Association Certificate Program

Same as Appendix O, except question 7 did not ask for the number of courses completed at college/university.
APPENDIX O

Survey of Participants in The Canadian Payroll Association Certificate Program by Elizabeth Speers

I am a doctoral student in Education at the University of Toronto. I am working on a thesis that involves a study of certification processes of various professional organizations. The Canadian Payroll Association is co-operating in this activity. The attached survey has been designed to gather information about the professional certification process of the Canadian Payroll Association. All surveys are coded to maintain confidentiality and the information gathered will be reviewed only by the researcher and her thesis supervisor. All data will be destroyed at the end of the study. Only a summary of the information will be provided to The Canadian Payroll Association (CPA).

1. Is the company you work for a member of the Canadian Payroll Association?  
   Yes ___ No ___

2. If the answer to question 1 is "Yes" how long have they been a member?  
   _______ years

If you have completed the Payroll Management Certificate Program (PMCP), proceed to question 3.

If you are in the process of taking courses in the Payroll Management Certificate Program (PMCP) proceed to question 5.

3. How long have you held the CPA designation?  
   P.A. ___ P.S. ___ P.M. ___

4. How long did it take to complete the certificate program (years)?  
   P.A. ___ P.S. ___ P.M. ___

5. I participated or am participating in the CPA certificate program to: (please identify all items that apply):

   a. gain knowledge of payroll practices.  
   b. strengthen my position in my job.  
   c. strengthen my position in the job market.  
   d. gain respect among my colleagues and professional associates.  
   e. expand my career options.  
   f. become a part of a network of payroll practitioners.  
   g. obtain the designation which was or is a requirement for my job.  
   h. other (please specify) ____________________________________________________

209
6. To participate in the program I felt that I needed (please identify all the items that apply):

a. a recommendation from my employer. __
b. work experience in the field of payroll. __
c. a university degree/college diploma in an appropriate field __
d. permission from my employer to have time from my job to participate in the courses. __
e. prior training in the area of payroll. __
f. my employer’s support by paying my course fees. __
g. other (please specify) ____________________________

7. As a participant in the CPA designation program how many courses have you successfully completed towards:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CPA</th>
<th>College/University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P.A.</td>
<td>__ courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S.</td>
<td>__ courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.M.</td>
<td>__ courses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. Are you aware that some of the CPA courses are available through

a. correspondence? Yes ___ No ___
b. computer-based delivery? Yes ___ No ___

9. If your response to question 8 is "Yes", have you taken CPA courses through

a. correspondence? Yes ___ No ___
b. computer-based delivery? Yes ___ No ___

10. If your response to question 9 was "Yes", please state why you selected the option.

____________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________

11. Are you aware of the Challenge Option? Yes ___ No ___

12. If your response to question 11 was "Yes", please state what is involved in this option.

____________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________

210
13. The courses offered by the Canadian Payroll Association as part of the CPA designation program have clearly defined objectives that identify the requirements of the courses.

14. When I participated in the Canadian Payroll Association (CPA) courses I received all the required pre-course information in time to prepare for the training sessions.

15. The CPA tests used to assess my knowledge of the CPA course material reflected the content of the course.

16. If any of your answers to questions 13 or 15 were "3 or 4", please state why.

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

17. What activities do you participate in to keep your knowledge of the payroll field current? (please identify all items that apply)

a. CPA annual conference ____________________________
b. local workshops/seminars ____________________________
c. teach or direct workshops ____________________________
d. write and publish articles in the field ____________________________
e. other (please specify) ____________________________

18. Who do you think is involved in setting the standards for the courses and examinations in the certification process? (please identify all that apply)

a. volunteer members of the CPA ____________________________
b. university/college experts in the field ____________________________
c. CPA staff ____________________________
d. employers of graduates of the program ____________________________
e. others (please specify) ____________________________
19. Who do you think should be involved in setting the standards for the courses and examinations in the CCP certification process? (please identify all that apply)

a. volunteer members of the CPA __
b. university/college experts in the field __
c. CPA staff __
d. employers of graduates of the program __
e. others (please specify) ____________________________

20. Should there be a mandatory recertification process for individuals who earn a CPA designation?
   Yes ___ No ___

21. If your response to question 20 is "Yes", please identify what should be included in the process.
   ______________________________________________________________
   ______________________________________________________________

22. If your response to question 20 is "No", please state why.
   ______________________________________________________________
   ______________________________________________________________

23. To earn the CPA designation, it should be mandatory to:

a. participate in CPA run courses. __
b. successfully complete exams in all identified courses. __
c. successfully complete a comprehensive CPA examination. __
d. have a current membership in CPA. __
e. other (please specify) ____________________________

24. Courses required for CPA designation are readily available to me. Yes ___ No ___

25. If your answer to question 24 is "Yes", please state why.
   ______________________________________________________________
   ______________________________________________________________

26. If your answer to question 24 is "No", please state why.
   ______________________________________________________________
   ______________________________________________________________
27. What is the cost to participate in the certification process per course?
   a. Fee per course ($) ______   b. Length of course (days) ______
   c. Required preparation time (days) ______   d. Accommodation ($) ______
   e. Travel ($) ______
   f. Other (please specify) ____________________________

28. The cost of the courses for certification should be the responsibility of:
   a. the participant. ______
   b. the employer of the participant. ______
   c. both the participant and their employer. ______
   d. Other (please specify) ____________________________

29. Do you think a current membership in CPA should be required to use the CPA designation? Yes ___ No ___

30. My work experience includes:
   a. Payroll ______    b. Accounting ______
   c. Information systems ______    d. General Human Resources ______
   e. Other (please specify) ____________________________

31. Identify highest level of education attained.
   a. High School Diploma ______    b. College Diploma ______
   c. Bachelor's Degree ______    d. Master's Degree ______
   e. Ph.D. ______    f. Other ______

32. Identify your age range.
   a. 20 - 29 ___    b. 30 - 39 ___    c. 40 - 49 ___    d. 50 - 59 ___    e. 60 plus ___

33. Identify the number of years of work experience you have in the area of compensation/benefits:
   a. <1 year ___    b. 1 - 5 years ___    c. 6 - 10 years ___    d. > 10 years ___

Comments:

Thank you for your help. Your valuable input will ensure that my thesis is completed successfully. Please return in the enclosed self-addressed stamped envelope.
References


**Blueprint for the Critical Care Nursing Certification Examination.** (1994). Ottawa, Canada: Canadian Nurses Association Testing Division.


**Canadian Nurses Association Certification Program, Critical Care Nursing, Application and Examination Information.** (1995). Ottawa, Canada: Canadian Nurses Association.


221


