NOTE TO USERS

The original manuscript received by UMI contains pages with indistinct print. Pages were microfilmed as received.

This reproduction is the best copy available

UMI
THE ROLE OF IMMIGRANT SERVING ORGANIZATIONS IN THE
CANADIAN WELFARE STATE: A CASE STUDY

by

B. Saddeiqa Holder

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements
for the Degree of Doctor of Education
Department of Adult Education, Counselling Psychology, and Community Development
University of Toronto

© B. Saddeiqa Holder 1998
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-35404-0
THE ROLE OF IMMIGRANT SERVING ORGANIZATIONS
IN THE CANADIAN WELFARE STATE: A CASE STUDY

by

B. Saddeiqa Holder

Doctor of Education
1998

Department of Adult Education, Counselling Psychology, and Community Development
University of Toronto

Drawing upon an interdisciplinary body of literature this thesis investigates the role of immigrant serving organizations in the Canadian welfare state. Comparative literature on the voluntary sector, international perspectives on settlement services for immigrants, and state/minority relations in Canada are reviewed to illuminate salient research questions. A case study was undertaken guided by the following research questions: what is it that the organizations do, including both their service and nonservice functions; what is the impact of the organization on clients and other stakeholder groups; what is the agency’s relationship with government, its primary funder; and lastly, what are the implications of the study for analyses of the welfare state?

The key findings reveal that, in their service dimension, the organizations proffer a type of safety net of cultural, kinship, and linguistic resources for immigrants; increase immigrants’ access to mainstream services; and through collective action, articulate needs and thereby extend the provisions of the welfare state to immigrants. In political terms the symbolic allocation of societal resources minority communities is realized. An examination of the agency’s relationship with government representatives indicates that, within the constraints imposed by government funding, variables such as ideological affinity and bureaucratic professionalism contribute to
positive relations. In so far as the welfare state is concerned, the mobilization by ethnoracial communities to extend welfare provisions highlights the role of social movements as agents of change in social policy.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER ONE

**INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM**

- Introduction to the Study ................................................................. -1-
- Background to the Problem ............................................................... -2-
- Statement of the Problem .................................................................... -3-
- Purpose of the Study ........................................................................... -6-
- Research Questions ............................................................................. -10-
- Importance of the Study ................................................................. -10-
- Definition of Terms .......................................................................... -12-
- Limitations of the Study ................................................................. -15-
- Structure of the Thesis ................................................................. -16-
  ENDNOTES ....................................................................................... -17-

## CHAPTER TWO

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

- Voluntary Organizations and the Welfare State ................................ -19-
- The Canadian Welfare State ............................................................ -32-
- Theory of Canadian Voluntary Welfare Organizations .................. -35-
- An Overview of State/Immigrant Minority Relations ....................... -38-
- Race and the Welfare State ............................................................. -50-
- Summary ........................................................................................ -59-
- Social Theory and Minority Rights .................................................. -57-
- Conclusion ....................................................................................... -66-
  ENDNOTES ....................................................................................... -69-

## CHAPTER THREE

**IMMIGRANT SERVING ORGANIZATIONS**

- International Perspectives ............................................................... -71-
- A Canadian Perspective .................................................................. -71-
- The State and Immigrant Serving Organizations: Resistance and/or Cooptation? -98-
- Conclusion ....................................................................................... -108-
  ENDNOTES ....................................................................................... -112-

## CHAPTER FOUR

**METHODOLOGY**

- Review of Purpose of the Study ....................................................... -114-
- Description of Methodology ............................................................ -116-
- Design of the Study .......................................................................... -119-
- Data collection .................................................................................. -120-
- Data analysis .................................................................................... -122-
  ENDNOTES ....................................................................................... -125-
## CHAPTER FIVE

**FINDINGS** .......................................................... -126-
- The Centre: An Overview ........................................... -126-
- Client Perceptions ............................................. -143-
- Links with the Local Community .............................. -147-
- Funding Relationships ........................................ -147-
- Mainstream Organizations .................................... -153-
- Issues of Culture and Ethnicity ............................... -156-
- Contentious Issues in the Immigrant Service Sector ..... -161-
- Conclusion: Integrating Data and Theory ................... -162-

## CHAPTER SIX

**CONCLUSION AND INTERPRETATION** .............................. -165-
- Summary of the Study ........................................... -165-
- Long Term Prospects for ISOs ................................. -170-
- Recommendations ................................................ -176-
- Conclusion .................................................... -179-
- ENDNOTES ................................................... -182-

## APPENDIX I .......................................................... -183-

## REFERENCES .......................................................... -189-
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM

Introduction to the Study

The social welfare objectives of the Canadian state are accomplished through a nexus of policies and programs delivered by three levels of government, a variety of voluntary organizations (also known as nonprofit organizations, or NGOs - nongovernmental organizations), and, of late, privately operated service deliverers. Community-based immigrant service organizations (ISOs) are key players in the arena of service delivery to recent immigrants. As will be seen their characteristic features are: governance by a voluntary board of directors, usually community representatives; reliance on governmental funding primarily; and delivery of programs and services to particular ethnoracial communities by nonprofessionals.

Roughly speaking, regarding the relationship between this subset of voluntary welfare organizations and the Canadian state (the principal funder of these organizations), it may be said that there are three central perspectives. The "good news" perspective perceives in such organizations the humanization of the bureaucratic state and the accomplishment of the pluralistic objectives of the liberal democracy. The more critical "bad news" view is apt to investigate ways in which such organizations (inadvertently) aid capital accumulation and/or race, class and gender stratification. Lastly, "the good news and the bad news" perspective acknowledges both an emancipatory as well as a regulatory potential to this sector - the "otoh/botoh" (on the one hand/but on the other hand) perspective.

This thesis inquires into the role of immigrant serving organizations1 in the Canadian welfare state by presenting a case study of one such service deliverer - an immigrant serving organization in Metropolitan Toronto. Although descriptive, the study marshalls evidence for an
assessment of the three competing perspectives noted above. The purpose of this descriptive
effort is to produce a relatively full account of the forces operative in this area. Therefore the
analysis herein attempts to link macro level factors such as the development of the Canadian
welfare state and state/minority community relations with micro level practices within an ISO.

Background to the Problem

During the 1970s a service delivery infrastructure of non-profit agencies was put into
place to provide so-called settlement services to recent immigrants. The establishment of ISOs
was coincident with significant changes at the symbolic level in ethnic relations in a Canada,
notably, the promulgation of a federal Multiculturalism policy in 1971. Since then profound
changes have been wrought in Canadian society as a result of immigration. An aging Canadian
population and declining birth rate have resulted in government policy to increase population
through relatively high immigration levels. The push/pull factor of economic disparity between
the industrial nations and the so-called Third World and the pressures of a rising world
population in 'underdeveloped regions' have also contributed to increasing human migration.

The rapid expansion of ethnoracial services is noteworthy. The Ontario Council of
Agencies Serving Immigrants is an advocacy body to which most incorporated (Ontario)
immigrant serving agencies belong. In 1978 its membership numbered 20. Today that number
has grown to over 140. Until recently, funding for this sector expanded considerably and these
agencies have come to play an important role in the delivery of social services. Nonetheless
immigrant serving organizations see themselves as significantly underfunded and subject to
inappropriate program criteria (especially at the federal level) despite the fact that they play an
essential role in anti-racist service delivery by providing culturally sensitive services and
advocacy on behalf of their communities (Beyenne, Butcher, Joe, & Richmond, 1996).
In addition to normative considerations of justice and equity, the availability of services to immigrants is a practical and relevant consideration given the nature of current immigration. Since about 1970 newcomers to Canada are largely: from non-English, non-French speaking backgrounds; racial minorities in Canada; and come from countries whose norms and traditions differ significantly from those in the Western world (see Table 1). Adequate and effective services can ease the transition that immigrants, refugees and their families must make. Research indicates that levels of utilization of services are low in relation to need, and further, immigrants through taxation, contribute more to the economy than they use in services (Reitz, n.d.).

Statement of the Problem

As Jones (1977) recognized, social services are not as full and as perfect and complete, and systematic as wished. They are scarce resources, valuable in increasing people’s life chances and as such are a site of contention. The distinction of services for immigrants from those included in general welfare and the establishment of a separately funded sector (around 1966/67) resulted from the federal government's decision to administer services to newcomers through Employment and Immigration Canada, rather than Health and Welfare Canada which was concerned with social welfare provision (Lanphier & Olumskyj, 1992). Today the relationship between the two sectors is an uneasy one.

Immigrant serving organizations want funding to deliver a wider range of services beyond those narrowly conceived of as settlement services, arguing that the so-called mainstream services are inaccessible because they are unable or unwilling to meet the needs of non-English speaking Ontarians (Beyene, Butcher, Joe, & Richmond, 1996, p.3); and racial minority groups are arguing for culturally based service delivery (Lewis, 1992). "Community delivery," as the issue was termed in the Lewis Report, reflects a pervasive theme in current debates about
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Caribbean &amp; Cuba</th>
<th>South America</th>
<th>Central America</th>
<th>United States</th>
<th>Asia</th>
<th>Middle East</th>
<th>Africa</th>
<th>Europe</th>
<th>United Kingdom</th>
<th>Area of Last Permanent Residence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 1

LANDED IMMIGRANTS TO ONTARIO BY AREA OF LAST PERMANENT RESIDENCE

Compiled by: Research and Data Group, Ontario Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation
Source: Citizenship and Immigration Canada
service delivery.

For example, Muslim psychologist Dr. Bruce Ally asserts that the time has come for Toronto's Muslim community to have its own Children's Aid. Citing the growing numbers of Muslims in Toronto, and the limited human resources available through the Children's Aid (i.e., few Muslim foster parents and Muslim front-line workers), Dr. Ally stated, "The Catholics have the Catholic Children's Aid and there's the Jewish Family and Child Service. We pay taxes too. It's time" (Memom. 1994:A8). In addition ethnoracial communities have felt themselves to be excluded from the planning and development of mainstream services.

In "A time for action: Access to health and social services for members of diverse cultural and racial groups." Doyle and Visano (1987) described the human service delivery system in Metropolitan Toronto system as comprised of two solitudes -- mainstream organizations and ethnoracial organizations. The study concluded that, although there was an awareness of barriers, limited efforts had been made by the "mainstream" services to undertake strategies to increase access by diverse groups. In contrast, the other solitude -- ethnoracial agencies -- were perceived by key informants as more responsive to the service needs of a variety of racial, linguistic, and cultural groups. Further, ethnoracial organizations were expected to provide an array of service responses which they did not pretend to offer.

Another view is taken by critics who voice concerns about universality and the cost of developing and maintaining an extensive "parallel" service delivery system. Some argue that the service needs of immigrants and racial minorities in Canadian society are best met through the adaptation of existing mainstream organizations to meet the needs of the non-English speaking population. They contend that separate institutions may result in a continued marginalization of immigrant groups (Christensen, 1993), and an avoidance by mainstream institutions of their
responsibility to respond to the diversity in Canadian society (Teram & White, 1993).

According to the Director of the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto's Multicultural and Race Relations Division of the Chief Administrators's Office, ISOs challenge the traditional approaches to service delivery which envisioned delivery of service based upon a geographical area. Recently arrived immigrant communities want to deliver service autonomously. At the same time, "the mainstream" has been encouraged to expand its services to immigrants and refugees. Hence a new set of conception of the roles, responsibilities, and relationships between government and levels of service providers is required (M. Nakamura, conference remarks, October 18, 1993). Recent cutbacks in spending, devolution to lower levels of administration and privatization of some services present further challenges for the sector.

Burnaby (1992) poses the question of why it is so difficult to coordinate settlement services. She concludes that the settlement of immigrants is a "marginalized social concept" (Burnaby, 1992, p. 134) and argues that a lack of public consensus and government leadership to put settlement at the forefront, combined with the English/French debate, preempts a far-reaching discussion. Consequently there is public uncertainty about the value of immigration; there are tensions between central and local perspectives and activities, low levels of funding, fragmentation of service delivery, and unhealthy competition among service deliverers. The essence of this critique was stated much earlier on in a work on services for immigrants in the United States where Jenkins (1981) concluded that society's view of multicultural minorities is reflected in its services to them.

Purpose of the Study

This study will inquire into the role of immigrant serving organizations (the dependent variable, so to speak) in the Canadian welfare state (the independent variable). This phrasing
accentuates the state and relations of dependence between the state and ISOs -- a warranted characterization of the subject, given the predominance of government funding for these organizations. However, as well as accomplishing state objectives, and being acted upon, the organizations are to some degree autonomous actors with their own motivations and aspirations. The limits and conditions of that autonomy should be revealed in the proposed study of the functions of a medium sized agency in Metropolitan Toronto.

A comprehensive look at this issue must link the discussion of ISOs to the general question of the role of voluntary organizations in the welfare state, thus identifying factors that impact ISOs and other voluntary organizations (e.g., dependence upon state funding, fiscal and accountability relationships, changing conceptions of the welfare state, etc.). Although the focus of the thesis remains immigration and settlement services (both responsibilities of the Federal Department of Citizenship and Immigration), the particular context of ISOs is illuminated by examining relations between the state and ethnic, linguistic and racial minority communities (e.g., multiculturalism, administrative measures that promote equity, the legacies of federal/provincial institutional arrangements, the effects of state actions upon minority communities and vice versa). Additionally, by sketching the evolution of immigration and settlement policy over time and by combining macro level policy description with a micro level examination of practices within organizations, ISOs are illuminated as both actors and policy beneficiaries.

Personal and Theoretical Approach to the Study

An Interdisciplinary Approach

My academic interest in this area is rooted in my extensive work in settlement services during the past fourteen years, mostly in community based service and advocacy organizations,
and for a brief period in government. Formative experiences included working for the Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants (OCASI) for many years in outreach and training. I became familiar with the range of ISOs, from small associations in northwestern Ontario to large multi-service agencies in Metropolitan Toronto. As a trainer I met settlement workers serving many different communities. Another influential experience occurred working in government when I had the opportunity to coordinate a funding program and work on a cabinet submission on settlement policy.

The impetus for this study was my conviction that ISOs are not merely service deliverers, sources of community support and advocates. Instead their existence represents the allocation of public goods and services to immigrant communities and as such, are part of the power base of immigrant communities. As will be seen, the academic literature on ISOs offers a less sanguine view. I also see the tale of ISOs and mainstream services as a tale about the limits of liberal democracy and its ability to respond to the needs of those considered outsiders. I am a reluctant advocate for ISOs, suspicious that their existence may undermine the goal of intergroup contact necessary for participatory democracy, yet I am cognizant of the role they play in extending the boundaries of prevailing conceptions of social welfare provision.

Framing the research question has entailed an interdisciplinary investigation into several literatures, notably, political science and sociological approaches to the voluntary sector in the welfare state, sociological and cultural studies approaches to race and ethnic relations, and public administration and policy studies of immigration and refugee policy.

This approach to the topic is rooted in my earlier training in political economy which favours certain categories of analysis, state, class, and dependence (Andrew, 1994), hence the Canadian state as the independent variable and immigrant serving organizations as the dependent
variable. However as Andrews points out, there are new areas demanding attention such as: relations between genders, and among race, ethnicity and socio-political identities; and analysis of culture and ideas; and an analysis of action. We should also add inequality in power and social relations between dominant and subordinate groups.

During the 1970s debates within Marxism took a poststructural turn, drawing attention away from determining social structures such as the economy, and focusing instead upon the relative autonomy of the state and the role of ideology in the reproduction of capitalism. With this emphasis on ideology (and later on, culture) and the way it operates, interest shifted to the individual as a feeling, thinking, acting subject capable of both reproducing and contesting hegemonic practices (for an overview of these developments from a metatheoretical perspective, see Cocks, 1989; Weiler, 1988). More functional strands of thinking accentuate the interrelatedness of social institutions, their mutual sustenance and stability of the overall system. Politically, the accenting of human agency allows for an understanding of change and resistance. This emphasis on lived experience was pivotal to the women's movement of the 1970s.

Feminism's understanding of the personal as political extended the boundaries of political inquiry into what had hitherto been considered the private sphere. Additionally, feminism identified how an understanding of gender relations is crucial to political economy issues such as the paid work-force, and the development of the union movement (Andrew, 1994). Further, feminist scholarship has responded to the challenge posed by minority groups (e.g., Lorde, 1984)—minority by virtue of their lack of social and political power—by examining the intersections of gender, race, class, and sexual preference and the resultant multiple social identities. Political economy by contrast stems from a tradition that privileges class as an analytical category, suspicious that other categories are manipulations, and products of false
consciousness.

An analysis of culture and ideas requires that political economy recognize a multiplicity of levels (and topics) of exposition. The final challenge Andrew perceives is that of incorporating the study of practice or action. Studies of micro level interventions, that is, by individual social actors, are as important as macro political economy concerns such as policy initiatives that regulate access to goods and services. According agency a place in political economy analyses allows for an understanding of how domination is reproduced (and contested) in, for example, direct service delivery and other micro level practices. The challenges Andrew has identified are played out in my attempt to integrate theory on the Canadian voluntary welfare state, writings on race and ethnic stratification, and studies of community organizations.

Research Questions

Given varied perspectives on the role of ISOs in the Canadian welfare state, this case study of an immigrant women's centre will ask the following questions: 1) what do ISOs do above and beyond service delivery; 2) what is the impact of the organization upon clients and mainstream society; 3) what is the agency’s relationship with government, its primary funder; and 4) what are the implications of the study for welfare state theory?

Importance of the Study

Implications for Policy and Practice

The changing ethnoracial composition of large Canadian urban centres and recent developments in federal settlement policy make ISOs a topical area of study. According to a senior official at Citizenship and Immigration Canada (C & I), the recent federal program review and the federal government's strategy document, "Into the 21st Century: A Strategy for Citizenship and Immigration," determined that there are more effective ways of delivering
services to immigrants than the current mechanism of federal purchase-of-service, ways that avoid duplication and overlap of services. Through a process termed "settlement renewal" the federal government will continue to play a role but will withdraw from providing/purchasing direct services. How these changes will be operationalized is not yet known. The federal government will continue to fund settlement services but will be seeking to establish "partnerships" in the provinces over the next two to three years. According to government officials there is a belief that local communities know what is expected of them and can respond more effectively than the federal government. Local priorities will determine spending. C & I will work with partners to ensure continuity and accountability for public funds (P. Gaulin, conference remarks, March 3, 1995).

Thus this case study is timely in illuminating the relative importance of questions about who provides the service and how the service is provided. Further, what are the implications for intersectoral planning given the experiences of collaboration between ISOs and generic/mainstream agencies with vastly different functions, domains, interests, and resources?

From a social welfare perspective there is much to be learned. Social programs attempt to achieve many objectives besides provision for needs (Musyzinski, 1992). In a recent comparative study of welfare states, Esping-Andersen asks whether welfare states enhance or diminish existing status or class differences. whether dualisms, individualism or broad social solidarity is fostered (Esping-Andersen, 1990). Orloff extends the question beyond such gender neutral categories to ask whether there is potential for the welfare state to alter gender relations, and proposes core criteria for making such an assessment (Orloff, 1993). The delivery of services to diverse communities is also about accommodating difference in a multicultural society, a key feature of contemporary societies. What is opened up therefore is the way ethnicity and race
operates in Canadian social welfare policies and institutions.

Definition of Terms

Settlement Services

Core concepts or terms germane to this discussion are the delineation between "settlement services" and "counselling services;" and between "mainstream" organizations and community based immigrant organizations.

Settlement services refer to those services provided to immigrants and refugees* upon their arrival to facilitate their reception and settlement in a new country.9 Official (i.e., governmental) definitions of settlement services are contested by ISOs. The essence of the debate concerns the precise delineation of settlement services. ISOs argue for an expanded understanding of the range of services required to facilitate settlement while governments (especially the federal government) categorize settlement services more narrowly. Most notably, neither the provincial nor the federal government funds ISOs to provide in-depth, or long term, or clinical counselling.

The following descriptions of government funding programs delineate what services are seen to be required by immigrants in the initial period following arrival in Canada. The Province of Ontario, through its Newcomer Settlement Program (NSP), replacing the Ontario Settlement and Integration Program (OSIP) as of April 1997, makes available operational funding to community based agencies for the provision of the following direct services: assessment, information and orientation, and general settlement assistance essential for early settlement. Indirect services such as training for settlement workers and volunteers, and enhancement of the of settlement service sector are also funded, as was language training until recently (May, 1997). Under the Progressive Conservative government funding for the settlement sector has
been radically decreased.

The federal government supports settlement services through the Immigrant Settlement and Adaptation Program (ISAP). Funding is available to provide direct services such as: reception; orientation; translation and interpretation; referral to community resources; para-professional counselling; general information and employment related services; other activities which will improve settlement services. The eligibility for receiving these services has changed over the years. At one time services were limited to newcomers who had been in the country for less than three years. This continues to be the ISAP priority currently, although landed immigrants who have been in the country for longer than three years are eligible. Canadian citizens and refugee claimants are ineligible for services.

According to a provincial civil servant (E. Allmen, personal communication, June 28, 1993), this distinction between initial settlement services for immigrants and refugees from those included in general welfare, rests on a differentiation between those services that are required as a result of immigration and the personal and family service needs that do not result from immigration -- as if immigration and other life events are disconnected. This dubious distinction is the subject of debate between government and community based service deliverers.

**Immigrant Serving Organizations**

"Immigrant serving agencies" is the term currently used by the Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants to refer its more than 140 member agencies who serve immigrants primarily. Previously the agencies were referred to as settlement agencies. The adoption of new terminology reflects the view of immigrant serving agencies that they are providing a wider range of service than those defined by government as settlement services. The term also refers to so-called mainstream service agencies who have a significant immigrant clientele. The terms
"immigrant serving organization" and "immigrant serving agency" will be used interchangeably within this document.

"Mainstream organization" is the term usually used to denote organizations that provide generic services based on need (such as shelter, health care, etc.), not on client characteristics such as race or ethnic origin. In contrast, for immigrant serving organizations, cultural, racial and/or linguistic factors determine the clientele (Allmen, 1990). Some question whether the mainstream is in fact mainstream, given the number of agencies that have implemented programs for ethnoracial communities.

As Beyenne et al. (1996) point out, the term "ethno-specific" is generally used to denote services or service organizations dedicated to serving members of a particular ethnic, linguistic or racial group. The term is complex since in many instances an organization may be serving a particular language group whose members originate from many different countries. For example, Mandarin speaking persons may come from Vietnam, Hong Kong, or the People's Republic of China. Instead the term "ethnoracial" will be used to refer to programs or services designed to meet the needs of groups on the basis of characteristics such as culture, race, or language.

**Immigrants**

In this discussion the word immigrant(s) will be used to denote both immigrants and refugees. Persons who have been granted refugees status by the Canadian state become permanent residents upon arrival in Canada and validation of identity papers. If that status is granted inland, they generally become permanent residents upon satisfaction of medical admissibility criteria and validation of identity papers.

The distinction between refugees and immigrant is often maintained to emphasize an essential difference between the two groups: that refugees emigrate by force of circumstances
and not by choice. In terms of entitlement to general social services, service needs, and availability of programs, there are differences between the two groups. Refugees are either government or privately sponsored (i.e., by individuals or voluntary associations) and may benefit from a number of programs for which immigrants are ineligible. These include, for example, government loans for travel to Canada, government loans to pay the $975 Right of Landing fee, and the Adjustment Assistance Program which provides income maintenance for government sponsored refugees for up to one year. In contrast, sponsored immigrants are entitled to greatly reduced social assistance benefits as a consequence of having a sponsor in Canada who is responsible for providing income support. Service needs of the two groups may also vary considerably.¹⁰

**Minority communities**

The term minority communities is used herein to denote immigrant or entry communities whose minority status is predicated upon their ethnic, racial and linguistic backgrounds and who possess limited access to social, economic, and political power, in contrast to the so-called Charter groups, the English and the French. Aboriginal or First Nations peoples are not entry groups and are excluded from this definition.

**Limitations of the Study**

The study's drawback is its single agency approach. Given the large number of organizations, the different types of agencies and the diversity amongst immigrant groups in Metropolitan Toronto a multiple case study might have captured this variability. Because the amount of data and variables generated by qualitative studies is large, a single rather than a multiple case study was undertaken. Similarly some aspects of a case study in a large urban centre may have limited relevance for communities where there are smaller populations of
immigrants.

As will be discussed in Chapter 4, case study researchers may seek to only to understand the particular, or they may wish to make wider extrapolations from the particular. I am interested in using this particular case to illuminate the nuances in relationships among key variables identified in the literature. Further, the study is instructive in describing the evolution of an agency which, over a twenty year period, has grappled with the dynamics of organizational growth, fluctuations in government programs and policies, and changing client needs. The agency selected for study serves two ethnoracial communities, Portuguese-speaking and Spanish-speaking women and their families. Thus some of the diversity in immigrant needs and in immigrant communities is captured.

Structure of the Thesis

The major themes in this study are addressed in Chapters Two and Three. Chapter Two provides an abbreviated review of: recent comparative literature on voluntary organizations and the welfare state and state/minority community relations in Canada. This condensed review serves to introduce the major conceptual frameworks and perspectives in the two fields of study. The last part of the chapter introduces a discussion of entitlement to rights and benefits from the perspective of social and political theory, a topic I will return to in the final chapter. Chapter 3 presents a summary of writings on immigrant serving organizations in an international perspective, followed by a consideration of the Canadian ISOs including a description of the making of Canadian immigration and settlement policy. Chapter Four describes the case study methodology utilized in the study, with findings presented in Chapter Five. Chapter Six offers conclusions and recommendations. Interview protocols are contained in Appendix I.
ENDNOTES

1. In Canada private service deliverers play a relatively small role in the delivery of social services to immigrants but are more active in language and employment training. For profit organizations are not discussed since this study is concerned with organizations whose goals include social change.

2. In contrast, in Britain, for example, responsibility for refugees is transferred to statutory agencies as soon as possible.

3. Christensen concurs that despite significant changes, many agencies continue to be ill equipped to do the effective outreach, and program planning, etc. that are required to transform agencies into truly multicultural organizations (Christensen. 1993).

4. Following a "riot" by black and white youth in Toronto in the summer of 1991, then Premier Bob Rae requested Stephen Lewis, a prominent social democrat and former ambassador to the United Nations, to consult with racial minority communities and report back to the Government.

5. This is especially true of insured services such as health where parallel and separate services are seen to promote fragmentation and to be in conflict with the principle of universal access. In a 1991 United Way discussion paper, "Family services to ethnocultural groups," the authors find that most ethnocultural services are not parallel services. They are instead "decentralized, community-based services with flexibility in their methods of provision" (Kerr & Lewis, 1991, p. 2).

6. As an example, Andrew describes a recent study of the political economy of passion: the tango, exoticism and decolonization. The author of the study examines the traditional concerns of political economy such as the material conditions of domination and class that produce a commodified exotic representation for Western consumption. In addition she investigates such themes as her own gendered, racialized participation in tango. The result is an investigation of material reality that incorporates symbolism, aesthetics and individual voice.

7. As she recognises, an understanding of the causes of women's oppression is necessary in order to specify what would be necessary to overcome male dominance. Despite a lack of agreement among feminist theorists she believes it to be nonetheless possible to identify processes and institutions relevant to gender relations that are influenced by state actions. These include the provision of welfare through families, the treatment of unpaid labour, access to paid work, and the capacity to form and maintain an autonomous household (Orloff, 1993).

8. For ease of expression the word immigrant(s) will be used to denote both immigrants and refugees. Persons who have been granted refugees status by the Canadian state become landed immigrants upon arrival in Canada; if that status is granted inland, they become landed immigrants upon satisfaction of medical admissibility and identification requirements. The distinction between refugees and immigrant is often maintained to emphasize an
essential difference between the two groups: that refugees emigrate by force of circumstances and not by choice.

9. The concept of settlement work originated with the settlement house movement in England in the late 19th century. Concerned with the impoverished conditions in English industrial cities, settlement houses were established in poor neighbourhoods by university trained workers. The workers who lived and worked with the poor were referred to as "settlers" (Galway, 1991).

10. For refugee claimants the situation is entirely different with regard to service needs and entitlement.
CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter is a lengthy one with three major sections providing an abbreviated look at:

a) theoretical literature on relations between the voluntary sector and the welfare state; b) state/minority relations in Canada; and c) entitlement to rights and benefits from the perspective of social and political philosophy. Chapter Three will examine various dimensions of community based immigrant service organizations, including their role in immigration and settlement policy making.

Voluntary Organizations and the Welfare State

The last decade has witnessed the growth of a significant body of literature on voluntary organizations and the welfare state resulting from the efforts of European governments at cost control, and in the United States, from neoliberal disenchantment with government intervention in social welfare. Five compilations on the voluntary sector in an international context and published in the period since 1990 (i.e., Anheier & Seibel, 1990; Evers & Svetlik, 1993; Gidron, Kramer, & Salamon, 1992; Kuhnle & Selle, 1992; McCarthy, Hodgkinson, Sumariwalla, & Assoc., 1992) were selected for review because of their introductory chapters which fall into the category of existence literature, i.e., identification of the reasons and conditions leading to the sector's existence (Campbell, 1993). The five chapters contain useful analyses on the prevailing terms, concepts and theories in the field and the international scope offers more fruitful insights into the Canadian context than writings that focus solely on the voluntary sector in the United States.

Figuring prominently in these five analyses are attempts to specify the nature of the relationship between the state and voluntary service organizations. The rise of the welfare state
has meant that consumption of services is separated from control of services; for example, as federal governments became the primary sponsor of social services, consumption was separated from financing, and agencies have become responsible to the service sponsor rather than the service consumer (Iglehart & Becerra, 1995; Ismael, 1988). Although it may be argued that clients or consumers have never really controlled services, financial accountability to state funders is seen to predominate over other forms of accountability such as the relevance or appropriateness of the services being delivered, or the legitimacy of the organization in claiming to speak or act in the interest of the clients it serves (Leat, 1990).

American authors Gidron, Kramer and Salamon (1992) write from the point of view of dispelling the myth of conflictual relations between public (government) and private (voluntary) activity. In contrast to earlier visions of voluntarism which were hostile to government, some contemporary proponents of voluntarism believe that an expansion of governmental responsibility for social services has buttressed the voluntary sector through increased reliance on these agencies to deliver services. Scandinavian authors such as Kuhnle & Selle (1992) assume a bifurcated social welfare structure, and concentrate their queries on the complexities of state/voluntary sector interactions. Evers (1993), an English scholar, moves beyond the two actor scenario -- state and voluntary sector -- to a formulation that situates voluntary sector activities within civil society, bounded by the state, the market and the informal sector. Evers's presentation attends to dynamics other than service provision which drive voluntary welfare agencies. In general then, according to Scott (1992), literature in this field has focused on the defining characteristics of the voluntary sector, who's in and who's out, and what does the sector do?
An American Perspective

The Gidron, Kramer, & Salamon chapter begins with a definition of terms, exploring the nuances of "nonprofit" and "third" sector. The first is found to be inaccurate since nonprofits may earn profits from investments, although these gains accrue to the organization and not to individual owners. They prefer to use third sector to refer to the range of organizations lying between the market and the state. Anheier and Seibel (1990) note a normative element in the use of the term "third sector:"

The "discovery" of a "third sector" occurred at a time when politicians and policymakers in most Western societies began to reconsider the division of labour between the public and the private sectors, and to examine ways of reducing state responsibilities. This intensified interest in the third sector was supported not only by conservative forces but also by others from across the political spectrum...The broad range of economic and social attributes which exit under the term "third sector" allow politicians to support those parts or aspects of the third sector which seem to support their own critique and interpretations of the "welfare state in crisis." (Anheier & Seibel, 1990, p. 8).

Gidron et al. distinguish three levels of analysis which are useful in discussions of this variegated sphere. The sectoral level encompasses organizations that are constitutionally separate from government, are not primarily commercial in nature, specify processes for self government, and fulfil a public purpose (p. 3). The field of service identifies the arena in which organizations are active, and is relevant in that the dynamics differ among different fields of service although the organizations are all members of the third sector. Third, at the level of the individual organization, characteristics at the sector and field-of-service level may not apply.

They comment upon the dominant paradigms which posit a conflict between the nonprofit sector and the state. In part this view is rooted in Western political traditions which fear the encroachment of the all-encompassing state upon the sphere of the individual. Within the Catholic tradition, an 1891 papal encyclical specified that community institutions such as the
family, neighbours and the church are to relied upon first (p. 5). In modern times neoconservative arguments buttress the role of mediating institutions such as voluntary organizations which contain the impact of the ever expanding state. On the Left, voluntary organizations are seen to be ineffective guarantors of public benefits which are more properly provided by the state. Meanwhile, economic theories explain the existence of nonprofit organizations in the failure of the market and state to provide public goods.

According to Gidron et al., the emphasis on conflictual relations between the two sectors ignores several important issues: a) the reality of the situation versus ideological constructs utilized to support particular policy options; b) a failure to investigate the various levels at which interactions occur, e.g., with various levels of government, in certain departments of government, with individual organizations, and within fields of service in the third sector, etc.; c) additionally, both sectors perform various functions vis-a-vis each other and it is feasible that each of these interactions possesses distinctive characteristics; d) financial support for services is distinct from delivery of service and the form of financial support may be more or less neutral upon the organizations' delivery of service; e) the role of the two sectors has been subject to change over time with periods of expansion and contraction influencing the nature of the interaction; and lastly, f) national traditions shape the connections between the two sectors (e.g. degree of decentralization of state functions, legal systems, church and state relations, etc.).

Gidron et al. are not unaware of the element of control in the interplay between government and the third sector; they are desirous, however, of underplaying the regularly held assumption that "he who pays the piper calls the tune" (p. 19). In stressing the cooperative elements of the interaction, they are emphasizing the fact that social welfare organizations receive the bulk of their funding from government, on a consensual basis. Because of the sector's
ability to deliver human services combined with its inability to secure financial resources, cooperation with government (through contracts for service, for example) have been a natural outcome. This means that governments are in fact providing service but not through public servants. Hence there is no "government failure" as characterized by economic theories (Campbell, 1993, p. 6). It should be noted that the schema makes no predictions about the level of welfare provision in each model.

While there is little doubt that these organizations have entered voluntarily into funding arrangements with government, the discussion by Gidron et al. lacks empirical support which would reveal the presence or absence of conflict and control and the truly consensual nature of these interactions.

A Scandinavian Perspective

In a recent collection of writings on government and voluntary organizations, Kuhnle and Selle (1992) provide a valuable overview of theoretical approaches to voluntary organizations and the welfare state. Their aim is to remedy the lacuna in welfare state theory that has largely failed to take into account the role of voluntary organizations. In bridging this gap, their point of departure is to argue that relationships between the sectors have arisen out of different political, social and cultural contexts which have received little investigation. Consequently misleading assumptions have arisen about the nature of the voluntary sector and its strength relative to government.

They explore the appropriateness of nomenclature such as "non-profit" (seen to be inaccurate since these organizations may earn profits from investments), "third sector" (seen to be a residual category after the market and the state) and "voluntary sector", opting for the latter term as the one that best conveys information about the sector in that these organizations are
formed through a voluntary association of persons.

Welfare State Theory.

Kuhnle and Selle review recent developments in welfare state theory and cite Baldwin's (1990) work in distinguishing between three major approaches, which vary according to the level of explanation. One set of writings situates explanations at a macro (systems) level, accounting for the welfare state in terms of levels of industrialization, political mobilization, modernization, etc., with an emphasis on similarities among nations. The second group of theories, also concerned with general processes, attributes social policy to a functional response to the problems of modern societies, and includes both Marxist and non-Marxist analyses. Both of these approaches stress the laws of motion of systems. Esping-Andersen (1990) has termed the first as "logic of industrialism" theories, and the second as "logic of capitalism" theories.

The third group are intermediate level analyses which emphasize social and political forces rather than economic structures and processes as determinants of social policy. Thus welfare policy is sought by those who stand to benefit and have the political power to influence policy making. Bonapartist interpretations emphasize elite strategies to maintain social control and the existing social order. Social interpretation theory regards social policy as the outcome of working class struggle (or the middle class in Britain according to Baldwin's analysis). Lastly, the state-centred approach views the state as an independent or autonomous actor.

Another intermediate level analysis proffered by the neoinstitutionalism school, prominent in public administration, stresses the role of public institutions as autonomous political actors capable of wielding significant influence over policy making.

Voluntary Organization Theory

According to Kuhnle and Selle, voluntary organization theory falls into two main
theoretical approaches - political theories and economic theories. Political theories of voluntary organizations tend to emphasize a conflictual relationship between the sectors wherein public services are characterized as rigid, hierarchical, etc. In Kuhnle and Selle's view, this characterization fails to take into account that the situation may vary depending upon which institutions or parts of government are being discussed (p. 23). For example expositions of the American situation posit that government is needed due to the financial shortcomings in the voluntary sector. Thus, contrary to "market failure" explanations, "the voluntary sector is far from derivative and secondary" (p. 23).

Another set of political explanations emphasize the study of organizational culture specific to different countries:

An important question is to what extent voluntary organizations get (or take, regain, or secure) ideological space in a government-dominated system and in market-dominated systems. From this approach follows the clear understanding that institutional inertia and historical contingencies have an impact on institutional choice. (p. 24).

Institutional factors identified by various authors include the legal system, political tradition, religious heterogeneity, the degree of centralization/decentralization of public welfare activities among levels of government, and the role of political parties and political processes.

Kuhnle and Selle find economic concepts of supply and demand to be inadequate in accounting for the size of the voluntary sector in a number of Scandinavian countries, so that although such theories are more explicit about voluntary organizations in the welfare arena, a more historical contextual analysis with political variables at the core is required. A similar criticism is levelled by Evers (1993) who comments upon a limited economistic understanding which conceives of social life as an arena where actors attempt to maximize their special advantages (Evers, p. 6).
Kuhnle and Selle's own typology for characterizing relations between government and voluntary organizations providing services is graphically depicted below:

**GOVERNMENT & VOLUNTARY ORGANIZATIONS: A RELATIONAL PERSPECTIVE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEPENDENCE (in terms of finances and control)</th>
<th>NEARNESS (in terms of communication and contact)</th>
<th>DISTANCE (e.g., France, Italy, Hungary?, Slovenia?)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTEGRATED DEPENDENCE (1) Germany, Netherlands, Norway</td>
<td>INTEGRATED AUTONOMY (3)</td>
<td>SEPARATE DEPENDENCE (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPARATE DEPENDENCE (2)</td>
<td>SEPARATE AUTONOMY (4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e.g., Spain)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The nearness/distance dimension identifies the scope, frequency, and ease of communication between the state and voluntary organizations. The degree of closeness may depend upon ideological affinity, physical proximity or other factors. The second dimension pertains to the independence of voluntary organizations. Control is a key element since most human service voluntary organizations are financed by the state. However, the authors stress that the degree of control may vary in market and in state-oriented societies, or it may vary by type of service delivery, or by organizational model.

According to Kuhnle and Selle, most authors implicitly assume a movement from the ideal of a minimal state (box 4) towards boxes 1 and 2 where organizations are strongly influenced and constrained by public policies. Box 3 represents the ideal of pluralism where groups are able to organize themselves to affect public policy without being affected by state actions. Their own investigations and that of others suggest however, that from the beginning
voluntary organizations have cooperated with government such that it is not possible to discern
the motif of visionary voluntary agency and reactionary public bureaucracy.

They conclude that it is difficult to predict the ideological and service space open to the
voluntary sector in different countries. Consensus concerning public responsibility for welfare,
and the ideological and economic strength of the non-public sector are important variables.

Summary

Kuhnle and Selle retain the emphasis by Gidron et al. on financial relationships as an
important variable in understanding government/voluntary organization relations while adding
the additional component of nearness/distance of communication and contact between the state
and voluntary organizations. In this way variability in interactions between government and
particular fields of service, or government and individual organizations is accounted for. Their
emphasis on the importance of socio-historical factors stands in contrast to ahistorical
economistic analyses.

A British Perspective

Turning to England, the portrayal of the voluntary sector as "gap-filling" is also prevalent
in British state centred welfare concepts according to Evers (1993). Additionally, proposals for
state centred welfare have underrated the care provided by the informal sector, notably women
within the family. However, more pluralistic conceptions have emerged featuring a role for
voluntary organizations and for-profits as providers of service with a regulator and purchaser of
service role played by the state (Evers, p. 10). Evident within this approach is the likelihood for a
conflation of democratic pluralist objectives and a push to extend the role of the market sector, as
has occurred in Britain (p. 11). Left critiques of welfare pluralism denigrate the variability
inherent in decentralization to smaller and local communities, in contrast to models dependent
upon formalized collective political participation and entitlements.

Evers assesses the debate to have been framed in ideological terms in an intentional way in order to secure political power for each side. He argues that:

Thereby this debate at least underrates the degree to which the respective transformations of the voluntary and informal sector - as parts of the welfare system - are due to often unintended socio economic and cultural changes like pluralization and individualization or to public discourses below the level of distinct political strategies...(p. 12).

In an environment of tremendous diversity in lifestyles, and variation in value systems, it is impossible to construct uniform services which meet everyone's needs resulting in the creation of alternative service delivery modes.

Evers presents four theses that contain the major theoretical components of the welfare mix concept. His first premise posits the existence of a public space in civil societies, inhabited by the "third sector," and typified by its lack of clear boundaries, and coexistence of diverse rationales and discourses. Public space is that sphere in modern societies, free of market relations, where uncoerced association, social and political interest representation, solidarity, and help and self-help ensue (p. 13).

Conceived of in triangular fashion, the state, the market and the informal sectors of family and community are the cornerstones which exert influence upon and are influenced by developments in the public space (the central area of the triangle). Voluntary agencies reside in that public space in that they reflect the values and convictions of their founders, for example, churches, minority groups, social movements, etc. Thus to focus solely upon the service aspect of these organizations is to reduce their various roles and dimensions. Evers concurs with Kuhnle and Selle that the influence of such organizations in the public space varies according to history and political traditions.
Each of the three cornerstones operates according to a dominant rationale. For state institutions, uniformity in rules and standards dominate; for the market, individualized commodity relations prevail; and in the informal sector, ties of personal obligation obtain. Organizations in the public space may be influenced by state goals, or by commercial values, or by communitarian tendencies. Hence the delineation between the public and private spaces is not clear cut.

Explaining the cooperation between voluntary agencies and government identified by Kuhnle and Selle, Evers' second thesis emphasizes the "intermediary" character of this "tension field" within the public space. By intermediary, Evers is referring to the balancing of interests among different parties in a complex system. For voluntary organizations there is a constant negotiation with the three rationales: between the instrumentalism of the market and the communalism of the public sphere; between the universalism and traditional programs of state institutions and the particularism and innovative strategies of local communities of interest within the public space; and between the informal world of family, neighbourhoods and communities and the relative formality of organizations.

His third thesis stipulates that these organizations are themselves "polyvalent and hybrid" in their intermeshing of tasks, roles and rationales (p. 21), for example: delivering services on a contractual basis, along with advocacy and community education; and relying on state provided resources as well as private fundraising, require a balancing act - a situation that is not altogether negative since it allows space for reforms and greater responsiveness.

Evers' final thesis concerns the search for more "synergistic welfare mixes" (p. 22) within organizations and between sectors. In effect this means providing a variety of legitimized options for the use of public services, maximizing the strengths and minimizing the weaknesses of
organizations and sectors. He concludes with a procedural lesson for policy making: that social policy making address not only state institutions but all of the actors/sectors.

In closing, Evers cautions that there is a danger to institutionalized cooperative and mixed solutions since the preservation of a social movement's political mobilization function may be more important than service delivery.

Summary

Evers' contribution enriches the discussion by accentuating voluntary organizations as actors that come into being as a result of the particular motivations of their founders. These organizations are constituted within a nexus of market, state, and informal sector forces which influence the organization's practices in indeterminate ways. In contrast, the formulation by Gidron et al. leaves little space for political and ideological considerations. While Kuhnle and Selle give more consideration to how physical and ideological proximity affect contact and communication between government, or parts of government, and voluntary organizations, they also stress a two actor system revealing their rootedness in a Scandinavian context. In contrast to Evers, neither Gidron et al. nor Kuhnle and Stelle pay much attention to the voluntary organization as a space of competing influences.

Influence of Legal and Constitutional Factors

In all of these collections, mention is made of an influential discussion by Helmut Anheier (1991) proposing an understanding of the voluntary sector in a comparative fashion, depending upon a country's legal and constitutional structures. Hodgkinson and McCarthy's (1992) introductory chapter to this volume of international writings introduces his argument regarding certain countries operating according to common law, where the nonprofit sector arises out of voluntarism and is fairly competitive. When social welfare entitlements are extended, the
tendency in such countries is not to enlarge government but to utilize nonprofits. A second group of countries operating under common law are the social democratic Scandinavian countries, where government provision predominates, with a weaker nonprofit sector, and less well developed notions of volunteering (p. 4).

In countries operating under civil or Roman law and where the corporatist dynamics of the Catholic church predominate, the role of nonprofit organizations in delivering service have been state sanctioned. Anheier's two other categories include the developing countries and Islamic countries. In the former there has been increasing growth in the nonprofit sector as a better means of providing services for the poor. In Islamic countries, citizens are required by their religion to contribute to the poor and thus philanthropy for the most part remains at the individual level, although governments have variously favoured and disfavoured an organized nonprofit sector (p. 5). The five approaches elucidated above highlight the limits of attempts to make generalizations about the nature of government/voluntary sector relations. The particular social welfare histories of countries, the dynamics within particular fields of service and at the level of individual organizations are key variables that impact the degree of dependence and control.

In accounting for the rapid development of the nonprofit sector, Hodgkinson and McCarthy emphasize government initiatives, nongovernmental resources, religious and ethical values, and degree of heterogeneity within a given society as contributing to the sector's growth. According to these authors, two recurring themes are the need to strengthen the managerial capacities and political viability of nonprofit activities and the need to augment nonprofit research for the purpose of policy-making.

**Summary**

The five approaches elucidated above highlight the limits of attempts to make
exerted by government as the primary funder. Evident in these discussions is the significance of macro variables such as social welfare policies, mezzo level service delivery issues, as well as micro level variables operating within agencies (especially ideology). The articles examined illustrate Van Til's analysis of ways of thinking about voluntary action (cited in Scott, 1992). For Van Til action models of the voluntary sector see independent citizen action as good and may reside in any institutional context, not just the third sector. The analysis offered by Gidron et al. is an action model. It concentrates on financing and provision of service, concluding that the predominance of government finances means that government is providing services but not through public servants. Thus a certain neutrality towards both government and the voluntary sector is apparent arising from the perceived reciprocal nature of the relationship - funding in exchange for service provision. In contrast earlier economicistic models reflected a view of the voluntary sector as derivative [from Van Til], a marginal economic or political construction playing no special role, resulting from government failure. Meanwhile according to Van Til sectoral models see a distinctive role for the voluntary sector in relation to other sectors - such as Evers' perception of NGOs as potentially democracy-enhancing.

The Canadian Welfare State

In light of the foregoing discussion emphasizing the importance of socio historical factors, an outline of the development of the Canadian welfare state is presented next, as a prior step to reviewing the state of the art of writings on the Canadian voluntary sector.

Introduction to the Canadian Welfare State

Underlying the modern liberal welfare state are three principles: that the state may intrude upon economic activity in order to maximize the collective good; that some of the basic needs of citizens will be met by society, including instances where private mechanisms fail; and that
formal equality and impersonal procedures permeate the operations of public institutions (Young, 1990, p. 69). The redistributive aspects of the welfare state are seen by liberals to be an accomplishment of democratic objectives; by conservatives as a failure in achieving an end to poverty because of the suppression of individual effort and the consequent dependency of the poor upon the state; and by Left critics as an aid to the preservation of the capitalist system. The Left critique interprets the rise of the welfare state as due to: a) the struggle of workers for better benefits; b) the desire to aid capital accumulation by socializing the costs of production (education, training, transportation infrastructure, etc.); and c) the requirement to legitimate the capitalist system in the eyes of citizens through the distribution of benefits.

Lightman’s (1991) analysis, and those of others, suggest that in Canada the welfare state was conceived more as an adjunct to economic development than as redistribution (p. 156). In part an economic interventionist role is in the long tradition of the federal government’s nation-building activities, as it has attempted to forge an east-west country in the face of overwhelming north-south geographical determinants (e.g., rivers and mountain ranges facilitate north south transportation and communication, coastal economies in Canada have more in common with their southern neighbours than with the rest of Canada, as have Prairie farmers with their American mid-Western counterparts).

In general the Canadian welfare state has been characterized as "liberal" (Esping-Andersen, 1990) or residual in nature, providing modestly for those with low incomes, employing strict criteria such as means testing to determine entitlement, and stigmatizing recipients. To briefly summarize the history of social service delivery systems, the tradition in Ontario has been one in which statutory social programs (i.e., mandated by government) were delivered by the public sector and nonstatutory social programs by the nonprofit voluntary sector,
with the exception of child protection services which have been delivered by Children's Aid Societies since 1893. At the beginning of this century, most social service delivery was initiated by voluntary religious or secular organizations bolstered in part by public funding. Government provision of welfare services expanded considerably as a result of the Great Depression and continued into the 1960s (Mishra, 1988). The growth of the welfare state during the 1960s and early 1970s followed a trajectory of government funding through program or project grants to foster community based social services and volunteer mobilization (Ismael, 1988). Spurred by government funding, community centres launched crisis intervention, advocacy, self-help, public education, and information and referral activities.

The retrenchment and decline of the Canadian welfare state began in the mid-1970s under the influence of monetarism, and has accelerated in recent years under sway of arguments about the fiscal capacity of the state and the reduction of structural deficits (i.e., the increasing costs of social programs) in the federal budget (Lightman, 1991). (For a more complete political economy analysis of the growth of state welfare in Canada, see Moscovitch & Albert, 1987.) Concurrent with neoliberalism has been the call for social policy reform in terms of remedying individual skills deficits (e.g., literacy) and/or individual dependency or pathology (e.g., substance addiction). Issues requiring government expenditure or intervention are out of fashion (Brodie, 1995). In Ontario, according to Mwarigha (1997), with the election of a conservative government, privatization strategies have included both the commercialization of service provision, and marketization, that is, competitive market type relationships in the nonprofit sector, such as narrowly defined purchase of service agreements, time limited contracts, and reliance on commercial activities such as fee-for-services and product sales.
Theory of Canadian Voluntary Welfare Organizations

Both of the authors below subscribe to frameworks derived from American literature. In his overview of writings on voluntary welfare organizations, Campbell (1993) characterizes the Canadian literature as consisting mainly of surveys, "how to [form a nonprofit board]" literature and limited statistical material. Campbell's discussion focuses upon Canadian definitions of charity, levels of charitable donations and volunteer labour. He identifies issues for the future including questions about: the efficiency of the nonprofit sector in meeting needs; the determinants of nonprofit dominance in certain sectors and its absence in others; the nonprofit sector as an instigator of social innovation; alternative funding for different services, that is, donations of funds and effort versus tax collection; the extent to which certain nonprofits may be self-justifying; the issue of unfair competition; and the third sector as a means of income redistribution.

According to Campbell, the demand for services has received considerable attention with little attention paid to questions of why charitable organizations are formed by people who are not beneficiaries, and what determines the scale of voluntary activities. There are also questions about the assumption of reducing government expenditures through the use of nonprofits since demands for funding are always increasing and never decreasing.

He found merit in the argument that in democratic societies, the overarching principle of equality before the law, and access to public goods and services may require the provision of additional services. Such services may be inappropriate to the general population, and may be experimental. In these circumstances non-profit provision plays an important role.

Written from a public administration perspective, Campbell obviously shares the concerns (e.g., efficiency, competition, financial incentives) of the earlier mentioned economistic
theories. Viewing nonprofit organizations as largely altruistic, philanthropic providers of service, he does not consider them as arenas for citizen participation, as advocates, and as proponents for social change.

In contrast, Phillips (1995) considers the distinct roles of the sector to be representation, citizen engagement, and service delivery with individual organizations engaging in each of these role to different degrees. As representatives of their constituencies, Phillips distinguishes between two kinds of knowledge provided by voluntary organizations - technical expertise about their constituency/services, and popular knowledge about the issues facing their constituency. She argues that citizen participation benefits individuals' sense of personal efficacy, and at a broader level buttresses social capital through enhanced mechanisms for civic cooperation and trust. As service deliverers, voluntary sector organizations utilize modes of service delivery different from those in use by government. An important consequence, she contends, is that an equitable distribution of standardized services and avoidance of duplication cannot be expected from the voluntary sector which serves particular populations and hence may be highly concentrated geographically. She argues that the current period of devolution of services in response to economic constraints and demands for more responsive and decentralized government, must be accomplished in tandem with redefining relationships between the two sectors and should not be viewed simply as the opportunity to offload costs.

Summary

The origins of the welfare state are seen to lie in: i) levels of economic development that allow for surplus resources to be allocated to social consumption (Esping-Andersen, 1990; Kuhnle & Selle, 1992); or ii) a functional response to problems in modern societies, including Marxist and non-Marxist variants of this argument (Esping-Andersen, 1990; Kuhnle & Selle, 1992); or iii) the
failure of a social service delivery system based on standardization and uniformity to respond to the multifarious needs of a plural and diverse society characterized by marked socio-economic and cultural changes (Evers. 1993; Hodgkinson & McCarthy, 1992). Further, legal and constitutional structures, reflecting degrees of absolutism and corporatism, influence both levels of service provision and the distribution of governmental and voluntary sector roles.

A major preoccupation in the literature has been that of the relationship between voluntary organizations and the welfare state. In this respect, several authors (Kuhnle & Selle, 1992; Gidron et al., 1992) challenge the view of a conflictual relationship between government and voluntary agencies. This may or may not be the case depending upon which parts of government and which of the fields of service is being discussed. Nonetheless the interactions between the welfare sector and its primary funder, government, are expressed in two primary variables - fiscal dependence and control, and communication and contact (e.g., ideological affinity, physical proximity).

In addition to their service delivery function, welfare organizations have other dimensions which reflect the values and convictions of their founders. for example, religious, or social reform values (Evers. 1993). Along with welfare organizations as constitutive of the interests of their founders, these organizations may be caught in a mesh of influences emanating from the state, the market and the informal sector of the family and community, affecting their tasks, roles and rationales (Evers. 1993).

A sketchy overview of the macro socio-historical factors leading to development of the Canadian welfare state and the general role of voluntary organizations in Canadian social welfare provision has been provided here. As a number of authors caution, however, the dynamics operating within particular service areas and particular organizations may not characterize the voluntary sector as a whole. What factors prevail in the field of immigrant services? Recalling Jenkins’ (1981)
assertion that a society's view of multicultural minorities is reflected in its services to them, the next section reviews writings that have attempted to specify the nature of state/immigrant relations in Canada.

An Overview of State/Immigrant Minority Relations

Assessments of the relationship between the Canadian state and minority immigrant communities are to be found in three major areas of social science literature: the sociology of ethnic and group relations; immigration and refugee policy; and multiculturalism policy. The first part of this section provides a broad overview highlighting dominant themes in this vast literature.

**Culture, Ethnicity and Race**

It is necessary to briefly clarify the usage of the terms "race," "ethnicity," and "culture". Critical writings have shown the category of race to be an erroneous social construct (since intragroup variations are as great as intergroup variations), that classifies people on the basis of ancestry and certain perceived physical characteristics (Fleras & Elliot, 1992:318). However:

> The illusory nature of race as a basis for identifying genetic difference does not deny its importance as a marker - although not a genetic one...The reality is that race is important as a sociological concept because of racism and that the use of skin colour as a marker for racial stratification is a (sociological) fact - although based on a biological myth. (Sumen, 1991, p. 18).

That is, we must recognize, "the social effects of 'race' despite its lack of a scientific basis" (Dei, 1996b, p. 255).

According to Kallen (1995), "The concept of ethnicity refers to any arbitrary classification of human populations based on the biological criterion of common ancestry in conjunction with cultural criteria such as language or religion" (Kallen, 1995, p. 20). Further, expressions of ethnicity occur in a specific historical context and their assertion is determined to
a large degree in response to the activities of the dominant groups. Ethnic communities are at times the basis for collective action -- advancing claims to entitlement, and resisting intrusion into autonomous realms (Adam, 1989) -- while also playing a role in fashioning social identities and in binding individuals together (Stasiulis, 1990). Symbolic ethnicity or voluntary self identification with the cultural heritage of one's ethnic group is based on the social psychological view that ethnic identification meets fundamental human need for communal roots and belongingness. However,

In this endeavour ethnicity can be manipulated. Ethnic symbols are used or created by elites to further their goals; situations are defined by the intellectual leaders of a group, and these portrayals and explanations then become a living reality for followers who, in turn perceive and interpret their individual life experiences in terms of the dominant values of their reference group. (Adam, 1989, p. 19).

An important aspect to contemporary understandings of ethnicity and race is the recognition that racial and ethnic formation are social processes that apply to both minority and majority groupings.

Culture, like ethnicity, refers to something "out there," that is, social; as well as something, "in here," that is, psychological. According to Sumen,

Culture may be described in terms of accumulation of knowledge among people constituting a social group, of 'conceptual' structures that determine the total reality of life within which people live and die, or of social institutions such as the family, the village and so on. In a broad sense, the term culture is applied to all features of an individual's environment, but generally refers to its non-material aspects that the person holds in common with other individuals forming a social group. (Sumen, 1991, p. 3).

From the point of view of the social critic, what connects the race, ethnicity and culture are:

constructs of collectivity and belongingness...postulated through notions of common origin or destiny...These involve mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion of individuals on the basis of categorizations of human subjects into those that
belong and those that cannot. (Anthias & Yuval-Davis, 1992, p. 2).

For critical theorists the preoccupation with culture and ethnicity are suspect in that:

...the new racism is expounded in theories of ethnic absolutism based on 'human nature.' This approach posits the existence of 'natural boundaries' between human populations (nations) rooted in immutable cultural differences.

...The language of this theory is race-free, but its covert agenda links together race/ethnicity/culture and nation, based on 'legitimate', 'natural' human instincts. ... The language of innocence in which the new racism is couched [is] free of any imputation of racial superiority/inferiority... (Kallen, 1995, p. 30).

What Kallen refers to as the new racism has also been referred to as racialism (Appiah, 1990, p. 4), or racialization. According to Hatcher and Troyna (1993), racialization, in Miles' words (1988, p. 246), refers to "any process or situation wherein the idea of 'race' is introduced to define and give meaning to some particular population, its characteristics and actions". In this case "race" refers not only to physiological differences, but includes as well geographical notions of ancestry along with cultural criteria such as nationality, language and religion. Processes in which immigrants are racialized are not uniform within or across nations but are instead conditioned by traditions of nationhood, the specific historical context in which immigration has taken place, the existing immigration regimes (policies and policymakers) and immigrant groups themselves (Joppke, 1996).

At a minimum, antiracism maintains that, "discrimination against visible minorities is embedded in institutions and systems, and their practices and cultures. It also emphasizes that discrimination and racism could be unintentional, that is, have no singular agent" (Harney, 1996, p. 42). In addition to a dismantling of barriers, antiracism advocates the opening up of institutions that exclude racial minority people from positions of power and decision-making.

In Canada, Dei (1996b) explores the meaning of critical antiracism in Euro-Canadian/American contexts. Understanding social interpretation as inescapably linked to the
position of the investigator, he asserts that antiracism has an academic and a political agenda and cannot be separated from praxis. Critical antiracism utilizes broader definitions of race than those dependent on skin colour as the only signifier of difference. Moving beyond a depoliticized celebration of diversity to fundamental power-sharing in communities, antiracism deals with questions of equity or justice, and representation, that is, a multiplicity of voices and perspectives as part of the mainstream. It also examines institutional practices in terms of their response to diversity and difference. The intersections of race, class, gender, sexuality, and other forms of social difference are recognized within a race-centred (emphasis in original) analysis.

In a recent Canadian college text on racism in the human services, James (1996) elaborates these premises of antiracism: society is stratified by the unequal distribution of power and resources; although recognized as a social construct, race is central to any analysis; racism is an ideology rooted in colonialism and oppression and permeates society; culture is dynamic and related to the distribution of power based on race, class, ethnicity, gender and so forth; ideologies that sustain racism are the problem, not cultural difference; the experiences of oppressed groups are central to any analysis; the actions of dominant groups towards minority groups shape daily life; society’s institutions must reflect the needs and aspirations of diverse groups; institutions and individuals operate according to a set of norms and are, therefore, not neutral; individual empowerment through social action is the key to change.

Given the differences within groupings and among groupings, James fails to acknowledge the lack of consensus on defining needs, and the consequent difficulty in designing programs and policies to meet highly diverse needs and aspirations. In underscoring the ideological component of racism, the social problems which exacerbate exclusionary beliefs and practices (e.g., unemployment, poverty, etc.) are ignored. Further, in the assertion that power is unequally
distributed by "race, ethnicity, class, gender, sexual orientation, abilities, and so on" [emphasis added] (James, 1996, p. 6), evident is the tendency to gloss over the importance of religion which, for Muslims for example, is a major feature of both their identity and exclusion (Modood, 1997). Additionally, this phrasing does not capture how these social differences interlock in specific and different ways. Lastly, there is an overwhelming emphasis on the oppression of minority groups and a lack of recognition of the strength and vibrancy of immigrant groups and forms of life attested to by cultural hybridity so evident in large cities. In short, the text is stronger on advocacy than on analysis.

In the American academic context the term multiculturalism has been adopted for what in Canada is known as antiracism. Distinctions have been made between conservative, liberal, left liberal and critical understandings of multiculturalism (McLaren, 1994). Left liberal versions of multiculturalism are said to emphasize cultural pluralism, or difference, in that racism is seen to be caused by a lack of cultural awareness on the part of the host community. Therefore racism is eradicated by policies and practices which encourage the acceptance of a multicultural society. According to McLaren, cultural pluralist analyses are deficient in their idealist (focus on static characteristics/conceptions of the traits and behaviours of particular groupings) and ahistorical analyses (inattention to the variations in form and content of racism through time). Intersections with class and gender are overlooked. This critique of essentialism seems ill-placed since there are few proponents of cultural pluralism who hold this position. Instead their stress is on the unities and continuities in cultural practices over time (Modood, 1997). It would perhaps be more accurate to say that cultural pluralism displays a certain colour-blindness which results in leaving intact oppressive systems and institutions.

According to McLaren, a critical multiculturalism understands representations of race,
class, and gender to be the results of larger social struggles over signs and meanings in particular historical contexts. A central task is the transformation of the social, cultural, and institutional relations in which meanings are generated.

In North America, in addition to antidiscrimination legislation, the two trends are obvious in efforts to combat the effects of racism. Since the 1960s, the major thrust has been to work within the system by monitoring inequality and promoting affirmative action measures. More recently, however, the promotion of separate development is apparent in arguments for same race adoptions, Black schools, etc.

As traditionally understood structural or institutional pluralism refers to an institutional infrastructure for the maintenance of ethnoracial distinctiveness - based on the social scientific notion that an enduring ethnic community infrastructure is required in order to ensure the viability of the ethnic group as an integrated entity (Magnet, 1989, in Kallen, 1995). However, within an antiracist interpretation, structural pluralism is equivalent to power sharing and questions of equity (G. Dei, personal communication, October 17, 1996) and the critique that separate institutions increase fragmentation rests upon the false assumption of a seamless and homogenous society, undivided by power and privilege.

Structural pluralism presents the same dilemma as does essentialism, that is, the assumption of a shared experience among members of a group.\(^{10}\) Further, empirical evidence raises concerns about accountability. A late 1970s (Breton, 1991) study suggests that there exists a distance between the leaders and the rank and file within ethnic communities. A more recent study of organizations serving immigrants (George & Michalski, n.d.) reports that consumers of services are underrepresented on boards of directors. An across the board implementation of separate institutions also raises the spectre of an unworkable institutional proliferation. Some
theorists (e.g., Young, 1990; Williams, 1997) have articulated the elements that would enable us to make the case for separate institutions for different groups. On the question of structural pluralism then, rather than asserting a priori support for the principle, a contextual approach which favours empirical evidence for separate institutions for particular groups is preferable. The issue of choice is of particular importance in the area of immigrant services where oftentimes is heard the story of immigrants who wish to avoid their own community organizations fearing a loss of privacy.

Overview of Social Science Literature

Sociological literature has examined social stratification (especially access to economic and political resources) and ethnicity, beginning with John Porter's (1965) seminal work, *The vertical mosaic*, and continuing to contemporary studies such as those by Breton, Isajiw, Kalbach, & Reitz (1990) and Li (1988). Subfields examine how ethnic and racial communities and agencies organize and reproduce themselves in reaction to dominant groups, or are organized as a result of the policies and practices of government and dominant social groups (see for example, Stasiulis, 1981, and Ng, 1988).

Anderson (1993) reviewing the "state of the art" in Canadian ethnic studies, examined the contributions of disciplines such as sociology and anthropology, demography, social psychology, linguistics, geography, political studies and economics, education, and the humanities. Anderson, who writes from a neo-Marxist perspective, finds the dominant sociological and anthropological approaches to have focused upon the survival of various minority ethnic groups in terms of endogenous features such as Breton's (1964) notion of "institutional completeness." He argues that many scholars appear to have missed the point that groups evolve as they do in response to dominant social control mechanisms (p. 18).
Similarly, analyses of assimilation or acculturation imply unidirectional or voluntaristic change as opposed to a conflict model emphasizing forced change and differential minority responses. With regard to ethnic stratification, with a few exceptions, he claims that research has been largely descriptive, in comparison to more sophisticated American analyses of a split labour market, or British studies of internal colonialism.

While Anderson may be correct about the relative underdevelopment of theory in relation to the Canadian context, the specific examples he cites may be poor illustrations. For example, Adam (1989) specifically refutes the applicability of the split labour market analysis to Canada. Similarly, unlike Britain and other European countries, entitlement to citizenship is not highly regulated.

In political studies and economics, the issue of Quebec, immigration, and multiculturalism policy have received most attention. Frideres (1997) has characterised the evolution of Canada’s federal multicultural policy as having had three, or perhaps four phases. The first, “compensatory” phase addressed the cultural and linguistic needs of immigrant which were seen to have hindered their integration into Canadian society. The second enrichment phase endeavoured to educate mainstream Canadians and immigrants about the contributions of diverse groups and to encourage an appreciation for cultural diversity. The third and current phase is aimed at the integration of immigrants into the institutional spheres of mainstream society.

Program priorities are to: eliminate racial discrimination; enhance economic opportunity through recognition for education and work experience; implement antiracist educational practices which eliminate stereotyping and promote positive images of all groups; encourage the participation of women in leadership positions; and work with the media to promote a national identity. According to Frideres a fourth stage is being discussed, which involves developing strong ethnic
communities to provide positive self esteem as well as fitting into Canadian institutional structures. Anderson cites a comment by the noted scholar, Jean Bumet, that critiques of multiculturalism have not included proposals for operationalizing crucial insights. However, as Frances Henry (Henry, 1995) has remarked, the confusions and connections between race, culture and ethnicity do not lead easily to policy implications.

In general, Anderson finds a dearth of critical political economy analyses examining ethnic stratification, labour market needs, exploitation of immigrants, dominant social control mechanisms and minority responses, and racist and discriminatory attitudes that may affect employment and social mobility (p. 19). In contrast to Anderson’s depiction, others have found the literature on the Canadian state and multicultural communities to have followed a variety of trajectories. Pal (1993) has identified three. First, there is the perspective of which Anderson and Frideres (1981) are an example, arguing that the state, through the multiculturalism policy organizes and mobilizes along ethnic instead of class lines, thus serving the interests of the dominant classes. Second, there is the perspective exemplified by Stasiulis (1982) and Ng (1988) that the state performs a social control function by restricting and structuring the alternatives of ethnic communities through: non-recurring project grants rather than core funding; depoliticization and constraining the activities of funded organizations; and bolstering factions of the community who have little popular support.

That influence is not total, however.

While powerful state institutions can enhance or inhibit the political goals of ethnic groups, the political organizing capacities of these groups largely determine their ability to attain influence in public affairs. (Stasiulis, 1982, p. v.).

A third view, articulated by Breton (1986), is more moderate, asserting that policies such as bilingualism and multiculturalism reflect deep forces within society, even while the policy
instruments that the government designs may depoliticize and constrain the activities of funded groups and organizations.

For Helly (1993), state promotion of cultural pluralism has as its intended effect compensation for those who experience unequal access to the goods and rewards of mainstream society. But no matter what the assessment of multiculturalism policies, the outcome is to politicize ethnicity by emphasizing:

[the] structuring role that cultural difference plays in the field of social and political relations, and gives to this difference the status of a sociological process. It officially recognizes the process of communalization and the ethnic institutions, and legitimizes and propagates the practices of the ethnic communities. As a result of State intervention, this policy also transforms existing societal relations by creating new ethnic political elites and legitimate lobby groups. (Helly. 1993. p.23).

**Critiques of Canadian Immigration Policy**

As will become evident in the next chapter, until the early 1970s, Canada's immigration policy contained provisions designed to restrict the entry of many racial groups. Explicitly racist criteria have been removed, however, immigration policy is still not seen to be neutral in its effects. Stasiulis, in a discussion which draws upon Australian, British and Canadian writing, summarizes present day critiques, especially with regard to women:

Immigration policy establishes the parameters for the 'legitimate' entry, settlement, and access to social services and paid work of immigrant women. Citizenship policies (in combination with social welfare policies) severely limit their access and entitlement to the fruits of liberal democratic, feminist and class struggles. (Stasiulis, 1990, p. 286).

In the case of Canada and social welfare entitlements Stasiulis is referring to Boyd's (1989) contention that some elderly immigrants may not receive Canada Pension Plan (CPP) benefits or Old Age Supplements (OAS) depending on country of origin. CPP benefits are based upon years in the paid work force. There is a 10 year residency requirement for OAS benefits.
However, an accord signed with European countries allows for those immigrants who were entitled to old age benefits in their home country to receive OAS after a one year residency period. Starting in 2001, all sponsored immigrants, European or not, will be subject to the 10 year residency requirement.

In Canada the only legal entitlements that distinguish citizens from noncitizens are the right to vote, official language rights, mobility rights including the right to not be expelled from the country, and the right to not be conscripted (Carens, 1994; Kymlicka, 1992). In recent times the Canadian government has held the position that immigration to Canada is a privilege not a right and that immigrants/noncitizens were not entitled to the same legal protection as Canadian citizens. However, in the case of *Singh vs the Minister of Employment and Immigration* (1985), the Supreme Court ruled that protections offered through the Charter of Rights and Freedoms apply to both citizens and noncitizens (Whitaker, 1991).

**Immigration and Racial Stratification of the Labour Force**

Das Gupta’s (1994) work exemplifies writings on ethnic stratification that link immigration policies to the needs of capitalist development. In her words, Canada has been a resource rich and labour poor country leading to the importation of labour. However, despite labour shortages, prior to 1967 this need was fulfilled very selectively. In Das Gupta’s reading, the removal of racial criteria arose from the needs of the post 1960s capitalist economy. More mechanized labour processes required skilled managerial, technical and clerical workers.

According to Das Gupta, workers from the "preferred countries" were less prone to immigration at this time, due to (unspecified) demographic changes. From the late 1970s to the present time, she sees Canada’s economic decline as resulting in restrictions on immigration, except for those with "essential skills" designated by government, and those bringing in capital for investment.
She notes that most immigrant women are unable to meet the criteria to be independent immigrants and must thus enter as sponsored immigrants.

In describing the immigration history of South Asians in Canada, she concludes:

...we see the state interfering in a very direct way with the capitalist production process. This was done by regulating the labour supply, specifically one which could be super-exploited and kept passive by the denial of political and legal rights [e.g., removal of the right to vote in 1907] rationalized by racist arguments. (Das Gupta, 1994, p. 62).

Contrary to Das Gupta's suggestion, the state did not always operate at the behest of the capitalist development process. Whitaker (1991) points out that during the building of the Canadian National Railway, business interests unsuccessfully pressed the Canadian government for less restrictive entry requirements for Chinese workers. Similarly Calliste (1993) in describing Black immigration from the Caribbean, emphasizes that, despite employer needs for manual and domestic workers, immigration officials were active in restricting the entry of Black immigrant labour. Hence there is evidence to suggest that racist dynamics rather than capitalist development may determine governmental action. Bovenkirk, Miles and Verbunt (1991) caution that historical specificity not be abandoned to universal notions regarding migration. Many migrations are rooted less in capital accumulation and more in the political process of nation-state formation and reproduction, although not to the exclusion of the demands of the accumulation process. (They cite the example of the expulsion of Ugandan Asians.) In the Canadian context, Asian refugees fleeing communist regimes were welcomed despite, for example, historical antagonisms against "Orientals."

Further, the current globalization of production calls upon the underpaid labour supply within the countries of the so-called Third World, making largely redundant the need for a low-cost labour force in the Euro-American economies (Ursal, 1992). Exceptions to this general
trend are the foreign domestic workers program and temporary migrant farmworkers program. Target immigration levels for 1997 identify as desirable investor class and skilled workers with skill sets that meet the perceived labour needs of the economic restructuring currently underway. In these selection criteria, a class rather than race bias is evident. The percentage of economic (independent) immigrants admitted has been increasing relative to family class (sponsored) immigrants and, in the independent class, highly skilled, educated immigrants will be favoured (Pereol, 1996: A1). Family class immigrants are predominantly racial minorities because they are sponsored by their families, themselves racial minorities in Canada. Highly literate, educated professionals are welcome, no matter what their country of origin. Of course, in their employment in Canada, many may encounter the so-called glass ceiling in organizations - a limit to mobility beyond certain levels within organizations and wage levels unequal to that of white counterparts (Li, 1988).

Race and the Welfare State

The study of race and racism(s) is a burgeoning field. A significant body of literature has focused upon the conceptual relationships between race, class, ethnicity, and gender (for a review of these discussions see: Anthias and Yuval-Davis, 1992; Stasiulis, 1990; and Williams, 1989), as well as the material manifestation of racial stratification (for example, Li, 1988). In addition, scholars have examined the presence of a White supremacist discourse in the Western world since at least medieval times (see for example: Goldberg, 1993; Said, 1979).

The neglect of race in discussions of social welfare policy has been notable. (Within the Marxist tradition, immigrants, race and the capitalist welfare state have been discussed in terms of a reserve army of labour that is called upon to supply cheap labour as required to enhance capital accumulation.) Williams (1989), writing of Britain, examined how race, class and gender
issues are (un)accounted for in the major frameworks analyzing the welfare state. Theoretical perspectives make little reference to race, and policy critiques fail to take into account the differential impact of policies and programs. According to Williams, racism against Blacks in the British welfare state has manifested itself in ideas of Black family pathology, in the exploitation of Black women as cheap labour in hospitals and home care, and in the linking of immigration controls to social costs of welfare.

There are attempts to remedy this lacuna. As defined by Williams, antiracist critiques view state policy as reflecting shifting relations between imperialism, capitalism, and patriarchy with the welfare state embodying societal racism. Manifestations of racism include the denial of access, second-class provisions, reproduction of racial divisions and maintenance of immigration controls. Williams acknowledges that "anti-racist" may be a misnomer for such an internationalist stance which includes an understanding of imperialism and the international division of labour. Nonetheless she asserts that such a perspective has links for welfare strategy in that eligibility for welfare provision is linked to nationality or length of residence (Williams, 1989, p. xvi). This definition of antiracism goes beyond the typical antiracist analyses that have as their starting point racism(s) and the interconnected levels—the interpersonal, the organizational/institutional and structural/societal—at which it operates. Williams' emphasis on the expression of racism in relation to the economic processes of contemporary capitalism retains the advantage of linking multiple categories and conditions. However, it is rooted in Britain's colonial history and manifestations of neocolonialism, and bears similarities to functionalist arguments which see sexism and racism as inherent in and necessary to the perpetuation of these systems. What then follows from this universalistic analysis is the necessity to mobilize against these "isms," thus superseding local struggles. All states do not possess the same history and
maybe guided by imperatives such as nation-building which in the Canadian context has resulted in relatively high immigration levels as well as national policies which, even if only in symbolic terms, subscribe to a vision of a multicultural society.

In a recent comparison of Germany and the United States, Faist (1995) connects both welfare and immigration policy regimes. He argues that ‘large’ (i.e., characterized by high levels of redistribution and labour market regulation) and ethnically homogeneous welfare states have tended towards fluctuating immigration policies and ‘indirect’ immigrant policies (i.e., no particular provisions for immigrants). Conversely, smaller and ethnically heterogeneous welfare states have been characterized by liberal immigration and direct immigrant policies. The prior argument is that large welfare states resulted from strong ethnically homogeneous labour movements and executive politics from above in fairly ethnically homogeneous societies. In the 1980s and 1990s welfare states with class as the dominant cleavage (e.g., Germany) are experiencing a transition to class-race cleavages and those states characterized by race-class cleavages (e.g., the United States) are witnessing a reinforcement of those cleavages. The retrenchment of the welfare state has thus reopened debates about the effects of immigration figuring a cosmopolitan liberal pro-immigration stance and an opposing national populist perspective. Interestingly, speaking of Europe, he contends that ethnic heterogeneity will be accompanied by a further diminution of the distributive and regulatory activities (in terms of the labour market) of welfare states. In Canada, a ‘small’ welfare state, direct immigrant policies, as they are termed by Faist, have fared comparatively well in the sense that immigration levels are still relatively high and federal expenditures for settlement services have been maintained.

Race and the Canadian welfare state

As previously stated, during the early to middle part of this century, Canada's immigration
policies were explicitly exclusionary. At the same time, however, according to Daenzer (1991), a study of Canadian welfare principles demonstrates that immigration status has not figured significantly in the entitlement to rights, protection and resources. Yet in the subsequent period of liberalized policies, Daenzer (1991), studying immigrant domestic workers in Canada, finds domestic workers policy in this period to be anomalous in that it developed in a pattern not consistent with other Canadian labour market and welfare policies. Daenzer's analysis meshes welfare values, the ideology of work (specifically domestic work), and race and gender relations. She suggests that a policy regression occurred from an earlier period to a later period, such that landed immigrant status for domestic workers came to be withheld as there was a corresponding change in the nationality of domestic workers.

In an earlier work Daenzer wrote:

The assumption that Canada offers mobility opportunities is not unfounded. Canada is morally committed to the idea of equality of opportunity, thought to be attainable through the structure of the welfare state. The settlement and adaptation of immigrants is a Canadian policy concern; federally funded services are provided to assist in the settlement and integration of some immigrants. But this commitment to the idea of equality exists in tension with the national economic organization which occurs with a capitalist framework [that rests upon a racially stratified labour force]. This results in the ideological belief in equality being tempered into a more modest promise of "less unequal." The existence of racial minority immigrants in Canada, then, can at best be less unequal than it would have been under a system not modified by the welfare state. Inequality, however, is still the dominant social context. (Daenzer, 1989: p. 56).

In the view of Henry and Tator (1994), the persistence of racial inequality despite notable efforts to address these inequities is attributable to an ideology of "democratic racism" which permits the coexistence of two conflicting sets of ideas, attitudes, and behaviours. One set values a democratic society and egalitarian notions of fairness, justice and equality. A second set contains negative feelings, thoughts or actions towards minority racial groups. Thus lack of support for policies such as affirmative action and other attempts to challenge racism by
changing the prevailing social, economic and political order are conceived as threats to liberal
notions of democracy and fair play. In effect the ideology of democratic racism reduces the
dissonance between egalitarian and nonegalitarian ideals.

Henry, Tator, Mathis, and Rees (1995), reviewing the small body of Canadian empirical
research, find the following manifestations of racism in the human services: lack of access to
appropriate programs and services, ethnocentric values and counselling practices, devaluing of
skills and credentials of minority practitioners, inadequate funding for ethnoracial community-
based agencies16, lack of minority representation in social agencies, and monocultural or ad hoc
multicultural models of service delivery. As will be seen in the next chapter, one might go further
than Henry, Tator, Mathis, and Rees to point out that the bifurcated service delivery structure, in
which orientation, language and skills training are provided by ISOs during the initial period of
resettlement, reifies the conception of immigrants as a labour market commodity.

In examining the organizational response to service delivery in an ethnoracially diverse
society Tator (1996) advocates the “ethno-cultural community-based model,” as a short term
solution. She describes a longer term approach put forward by Agard in which mainstream
organizations purchase services from ethnocultural community-based organizations. Earlier
modes of service delivery are characterised as monocultural assimilationist in their approach to
minority clients. Subsequently, in the add-on multicultural phase, front line workers from
minority communities were hired. Inherent in this approach was the understanding that racism
manifested itself only relationships between workers and minority clients. More recently within
the multicultural antiracist approach, mainstream organizations are being pushed to acknowledge
racism as a public phenomenon which requires systemic change in all areas of organizational life.
Mainstream organizations working collaboratively with ethnospecific agencies results in a more
integrated service delivery system ensuring needs are met, buttressing traditions of mutual help and voluntarism, and supporting the self-determination of communities.

The argument for separate ethnoracial institutions is premised on the necessity of community-based culturally appropriate practice. Whatever the content of indigenous practices, these have not been systematized into an accessible body of knowledge. Inquiring into the content of culturally sensitive practice, Agnew (1996) reports only that community based counsellors phrase interventions in the clients’ language, idioms and metaphors, and counsellors understand the clients’ cultural forms which, for example, may put the welfare of the family before the well-being of the individual. Agnew also notes that for some groups the use of appointments over a drop-in system is a formality which deters clients.

**Culturalization of Race**

Since the early 1980s theorists have argued that the major challenge facing anti-racist work is the culturalization of race which has replaced earlier conceptions of biological racism. In the realm of service delivery, Razack (1994) argues that the premise of cultural differences is used to account for oppression, resulting in the antidote of "cultural sensitivity." From the perspective of cultural differences, service deliverers receive training not about racism, but about the customs of clients. In this way covert racism is denied, and disguised by a progressive language of cultural pluralism, tolerance, and understanding. However, this view conceals a hidden norm; there are no workshops on WASP (white Anglo Saxon Protestant) culture; and it is the dominant groups who do the tolerating of minority cultures.

While Razack’s caution is well taken, immigrants’ ethnicity may explain their relationship to the welfare state in that the social welfare strategies (i.e., the ways in which people use forms of assistance to meet their needs) may vary among different groupings. Specifically, problem
identification, problem labelling, helping strategies for problem resolution and standards for knowing when a problem has been successfully resolved may be group specific (Green, 1982). In the context of the United States, Longres (1991) observes that the cultural model is most appropriate when working with recent refugees and immigrants but is less helpful when working with families and groups who have been residents for many generations and continue to experience minority status.

Mayadas and Elliott (1992) also distinguish between newcomer and indigenous minority groups. Indigenous minority groups suffer the effects of institutionalized discrimination, lack of accommodation and interpersonal prejudice while immigrants and refugees are adversely affected by all of these: in addition to the threat of discrimination, a country's nationalism and national policies may stigmatize and scapegoat the outsider, especially in times of economic recession. Newcomers are also seen as effecting a strain on cultural homogeneity and threatening societal norms. This fear and contempt for foreigners is termed xenophobia, "the self-centred egocentricity of human kind against people who are different" (Mayadas & Elliott, 1992, p. 48).

Scapegoating of newcomers is a recognizable phenomenon which bears highlighting; nonetheless, as Sivanandan writes, "racism ...cannot tell one black from another, a citizen from an immigrant, an immigrant from a refugee - and classes all Third World peoples as immigrants and refugees..." (Sivanandan, 1990, p. 160).

Summary

Most authors acknowledge Canada's attempt to build a multicultural society from a nation state that has deep currents of racism against many ethnoracial communities (e.g., aboriginal peoples, Chinese, Blacks, and Jews). Since the 1970s the Canadian state has developed bodies, special advisors, and programs to represent minority interests in response to community
prodding. However these developments have occurred within limits imposed by ideology and the priorities of government actors. Thus, for some there is a certain ambivalence to an interventionist welfare state which has been active in achieving/providing benefits for disenfranchised groups, and at the same time defines and limits the issues. The political tightrope is: whether assertions of ethnic identity result in progressive affirmations of diversity or whether they provide the grounds for discrimination and oppressive state policies; whether assertions of cultural uniqueness prevent minority groups from recognizing their similarities and cooperating to overcome them. The next part of this Chapter will consider entitlement to rights and benefits from the perspective of social and political philosophy.

Social Theory and Minority Rights

Immigration and Moral Theory

Questions of entry, settlement, and entitlements to rights have also been addressed in social and political theory. Whereas social science writings have documented the effects of discriminatory practices and raised political questions, social theory has concerned itself with ethically valid grounds for making judgements regarding entry, settlement and allocations to rights and benefits (see, for example, Waltzer, 1983). Foundational or first principles approaches (such as Rawls' seminal 1973 *Theory of Justice*) seek to establish the moral and theoretical justification of those rules. Others clarify principles of legitimacy that should govern a democratic state's provision of access to membership, but do not seek to establish the moral or theoretical justification for these principles. They locate their examination of these principles within generally accepted norms. The first approach has also been termed as "idealistic" (Carens, 1985) or "justification" (Baubock, 1995) theories, and the second, "realistic" (Carens, 1985), "contextual" (Carens, 1988), or "legitimation" (Baubock, 1995) theories. The review of Carens'
work below provides a glimpse of writings such as these.

Carens (1985) posits three major levels at which the moral analysis of social institutions and policies may take place. The first is the domain of universalistic moral theory which sets minimum standards for all social institutions, and applies to arguments about human rights and duties, including questions about international distributive justice. The second level pertains to minimum standards of treatment of members within a particular community however defined. In contradistinction to the first level, these values arise out a particular history or culture and are limited in their application beyond the members of the community. The third level considers the appropriate course of action where reasonable people within a community may disagree.

The right to immigrate raises first level questions and is reconciled in the following fashion by idealistic moral theory (Carens, 1994). Citizenship is usually assigned at birth, for the most part is not subject to change by individual will or effort, and has a major impact on one's life chances. Therefore limiting entry to a country results in the protection of a birth right privilege. In a just world, birth right privilege should not prevent the development of life chances. Further, freedom of movement within a state is permitted; why is that freedom not permissible across state borders?

Carens argues that idealistic moral theory presumes away the very conditions that present us with a problem. That is, in an ideal world, free of economic inequality, and where people's rights are respected, the desire to immigrate would be largely absent. But some would still want to immigrate, and some countries desiring to protect public order, or a distinctive way of life, may restrict immigration (for example, Japan). He concludes that a just world framework is unhelpful except for establishing an ideal or limiting case to guide action.

In its stead, he proposes a realistic moral theory that recognizes people not acting as they
should. In this way one starts from the world we inhabit. Recognizing people not acting as they should is both a strength and a weakness. It is a strength in that it is a better guide to action. It is a weakness because both factors that are morally unobjectionable and those that are subject to censure are accepted as constraints on action. For example, a plausible argument for the right to immigration may be made on the premise that people have the right to seek to improve their economic well-being; and an equally compelling argument may be made that nation-states in failing to transfer resources to needy countries, should permit migration. The latter is a case of people not acting as they should -- which a realistic moral theory takes into account.

The first task of a realistic moral theory is to articulate widely shared moral values in order to establish standards by which state may be judged. In order for the theory to be realistic, it cannot entertain views that are far from the norm: they must be feasible and up for debate. Does Carens' position on widely shared moral values open him up to the critique that proceeding according to convention will simply engender majoritarian rule? I think not. In an earlier paper he argues for minority positions in the hypothetical case of a Native band's right to restrict entry to non-Natives on the basis of cultural self-preservation.

Carens cites the example of open borders as a view that is not widely held. Clearly he also accepts what Kobayashi terms "the modernist interpretation of the nation" (Kobayashi, 1995, p. 70), that is, the legitimacy of the nation-state. Carens would likely argue that in the absence of world-wide moves to do away with the nation-state, it is a given with which we must contend.

Within the realist moral perspective, he enunciates a number of propositions: that the state has a right to restrict immigration; that refugees have moral claims that the state cannot ignore; that for the too long the burden of care for refugees has been carried unfairly by nearby receiving states; and that all states should share the cost, based upon ability to pay.17
In terms of immigration, he offers as a moral considerations the respect for family unity. Thus the definition of the family should adhere to minimum standards such as the right of minor children to live with their parents, and of spouses to live together. He acknowledges that cultural differences and who decides upon the definition of the family present a problem, but he offers no resolution. Presumably this is a level three question whose outcome is dependent upon democratic decision-making procedures.

In selecting immigrants, realistic moral theory adheres to prevailing conceptions of universal human rights and prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, religion, or ethnicity. He distinguishes between selection and admission criteria, finding that the selection of those who are linguistically and culturally compatible is morally defensible if such initiatives are not merely a pretext, and do not result in the systematic exclusion of certain peoples. The costs of resettlement are reduced, the labour market is more easily accessed, and there is some acculturation to the predominant "national identity" (emphasis added) (Adelman, 1995). In the case of Canada, initiatives such as preferential treatment for Commonwealth nations and French-speaking nations would include non-Whites. However the notion of cultural compatibility is tricky because it may well coincide with race.

Carens' discussion informs our understanding of the claims that may be legitimately made in terms of immigration policy. His realistic moral theory perspective possesses certain advantages, namely its attempt to contextualize justice and its pragmatic orientation. It is also based upon a national self-interested view, hinging upon a primarily economic rationale.

Adelman (1995) adds to the complexity of determining legitimate and illegitimate state responses by distinguishing among different types of migrant groups (i.e., temporary short-term migrants, refugees, fellow nationals, and those requiring temporary admission to access, for
example a state's health system). Thus one of the metaprinciples he asserts is that the principles of legitimacy vary with different groups of migrants. His three other metaprinciples contend that legitimacy varies with the type of obligation to be assumed by the host state, the burden of the obligation on the host state relative to other states, and the identity relationship of the migratory group to the host society. The last metaprinciple acknowledges that shared identity with populations at risk—in terms of such variables such as ethnicity, language, religion, and ideology—will influence the response of the host society. For each of these different groups of migrants, the minimum obligations involved vary. For example, refugees require physical protection and nonrefoulement and temporary migrants require human rights protection. Equal access to health, education and welfare and full membership in the host society are again dependent upon the category of migrant. Since Adelman does not mention permanent migrants, that is, immigrants, we must assume that he sees them as full members of the state whose adopted status does not entail differential treatment. Thus, for liberal theorists there are clearly limits and conditions to the extension of social rights and privileges of migrants.

**Citizenship and Minority Rights**

The question of entitlements to social welfare benefits has been also addressed within the parameters of broader conceptions of citizenship (i.e., not pertaining only to entry, settlement, and legal citizenship). Following the British scholar T.H. Marshall's 1965 definition, citizenship has commonly been understood in terms of its civil, political, and social dimensions. Civil rights pertain to equal application of the protections offered by law and political rights to the rights of suffrage and political representation. As understood by Marshall, social rights specify the need for a welfare state that extends benefits in order to prevent marginalization (especially of the British working class), and to enable participation in the national community.
In a recent overview, Kymlicka (1992, 1995) has identified strands of thinking in contemporary citizenship theory. He discerns two predominant themes within the literature. The first is evident in liberal, conservative, feminist, and critical discussions. It is the question of the relationship between the rights and the responsibilities—especially public participation—that accrue from citizenship. Social entitlements are seen on the one hand to be a prior requirement for full citizenship, and on the other hand, citizenship rights are seen to ensue from the fulfilment of civic responsibilities (i.e., earned).

The second notion that is relevant to the discussion herein concerns conceptions of citizenship in relation to pluralism in modern societies. Postmodernists ask whether it is intelligible to retain a universal conception of citizenship since cultures vary in their understanding of participation, public and private life, etc. (Yuval-Davis, 1991)—the precepts that underlie Western constructions of citizenship.

Yuval-Davis contends that two more critical aspects of citizenship rights arise when citizenship is understood more broadly as social rights. One such right is the issue of differential treatment or policies of positive action for particular groups. Versions of this approach have gained currency with liberal elements in Britain, Canada and the United States and have been translated into access to employment policies. However, the more problematic question remains: "the different cultural needs of different ethnicities" (Yuval-Davis, 1991, p. 64). Examples of different cultural needs range from the need for interpreters, or support for religious organizations, to support for minority groups to operate under their own customary and religious legal systems, such as one permitting polygamy. In Canada, apart from the Quebecois and Aboriginal peoples, the question of cultural pluralism has not loomed large thus far. For example, legal sanctions against practitioners of female circumcision were enacted without
fanfare.

As Rickard (1994) observes, from the point of view of liberalism, there are challenges (resolvable in his view) to the institutionalization of minority rights. There is the question of whether disadvantaged access to one's cultural community is something that is objectionable enough to warrant serious political redress, and if so, does an immigrant's disadvantaged access to her community have the same normative standing as an aborigine's? Immigrant protection appears symptomatic of the common tendency to adopt an overly precious and romanticized picture of ethnic identity. The idea of minority rights seems to license the outlandish prospect of radical socio-legal pluralism where different laws and institutions apply for different groups. And last, the idea of fundamental right to exceptional treatment seems to fly in the face of the deep liberal commitment to equality (Rickard, 1994. p. 144).

Critics also view the institutionalization of ethnic minority rights as divisive, destabilizing and inappropriate for social cohesion. Have immigrants not chosen to leave their home country to live elsewhere as minorities, and should they not therefore bear the consequences of that choice? And does the question of minority rights raise arguments for moral relativism?19

For Yuval-Davis (1991), feminist, postmodernist and antiracist analyses are not concerned with the development of a theory of minority rights. Rather they point to a concern with the state "as the focus of the intentionality of control", acknowledging that not all levels of the state, nor all states have the same degrees of control (p. 66). Second, notions like "society", "community", and the like should be subject to examination for "struggles over the construction of their boundaries" (p. 144). Further, the boundaries between the public and private domain should be inquired into as "a focus for struggles which determine gender divisions of labour as
well as ethnic patterns of cultural hegemony within the society" (p. 66).

Conceptual critiques, like Yuval-Davis', regarding prevailing notions of family, community, citizenship, and justice are insightful. Especially relevant are critiques of the notion of citizenship. Services for permanent residents are the responsibility of the federal Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada while the longer term integration (citizenship) programs are the mandate of the Secretary of State. Canadian citizens are not eligible for settlement services and settlement language programs, on the presumption of having integrated/adapted to the dominant Euro-Canadian culture and speaking sufficient English or French to secure services required from mainstream/generic services.

At the same time conceptual critiques in some ways side-step the normative question of what is to be done. One postmodernist thinker, Iris Young (1990), has continued to engage with the terms of liberal theories of justice. She posits that the accommodation of group differences is the very presupposition of equality (and hence citizenship). Oppressed groups have been excluded from the political process and institutionalized means are required to ensure their participation: secondly, many of these groups have distinctive needs necessitating group-differentiated policies. such as group-conscious policies for women, minority language rights for Hispanics in the United States, and land rights for American Indians.

Young carefully articulates the components of oppression—exploitation, marginalization, powerlessness, cultural imperialism, and violence—by which a social group would qualify for group representation in political institutions, in order to counter the fear of "an unworkable proliferation of group representations" (Young, 1990, p. 187).

Kymlicka finds Young's argument for group representation unhelpful because she conflates three different kinds of rights which he identifies as: special representation rights for
disadvantaged groups, multicultural rights for immigrant ethnic groups, and self-government rights for national minorities, all of which pose different challenges to governing. Special representation rights within the political process are distinguishable from multicultural rights which enable immigrants to express their cultural particularity without penalty. The first, such as special representation for gays and the poor, are assumed to be temporary in nature until the conditions leading to their oppression is eradicated. Multicultural rights on the other hand are required to be more permanently enshrined. Both of these types of rights are distinguishable from demands for self-government such as those expressed by the Quebecois and Aboriginal bands in Canada. The former two sets of rights accede to the authority of the larger community whilst the latter challenges that authority. Kymlicka asks further how we can determine if the secessionist rights of the Quebecois and Aboriginals should be extended to other oppressed cultural groups which lack features such as physical concentration and geographical boundaries. For example, is a linguistic community a political community?

Notwithstanding these distinctions, Young's argument and its implied proportionality of representation stands. She would sanction a particular oppressed group's right to secession. Further she envisions a localized political structure which would allow for jurisdictions as small as neighbourhood assemblies. What does fail to convince is how her politics of deliberation and openness to group difference will operate. Given the premise of a radical heterogeneity among persons, it must be asked who is to represent/speak for the different oppressed groups? Further it is not clear that all oppressed groups affirm the value of openness to difference.

Summary

The preceding section has illuminated issues in contemporary philosophy with regard to minority community rights. The ongoing dialogue between liberalism and its critics has focused
on conceptual as well as institutional critiques. In general conceptual critiques scrutinize the assumptions inherent in foundational definitions such as justice, community, citizenship, etc., seeking to identify that which is excluded. (These ideas will not be taken up herein. They have been presented to indicate the parameters of current debates in this area.) Institutional critiques address the ‘how to’ or implementation issues. For our purposes, the relationship between social welfare entitlements and citizenship is especially relevant. Young and others advocate differential treatment for oppressed groups as a precondition for equality. Do immigrant services constitute differential treatment, and what does the nature of those services imply about how immigrants are viewed?

Conclusion

One of the purposes of this case study is to portray the mesh of influences within which ISOs operate. Three distinct bodies of literature have been surveyed in this chapter. The first, existence literature on the voluntary sector, identifies the reasons and conditions leading to the sector’s existence and enumerates multiple determinants: at the macro level, a country’s legal/constitutional structure and the evolution of its social welfare policies; at the mezzo level, the dynamics within a particular service sector (in this case immigration and settlement policy); and at the micro level, interactions between individual organizations and their constituencies, including the organization’s founders, the community, clients and funders.

Much of this recent literature challenges the view of state funding as a form of social control and views the alleged loss of autonomy to be exaggerated. The relationship with government may in fact be one of mutual dependence; changes in agency structure are part of the natural growth of organizations, and part of the broader social trend towards public accountability in a period of fiscal restraint; and as suggested by Kramer’s (1981) study of
organizations serving the disabled, bureaucratic and professional agencies are leading initiators of new programs and active advocates.

The second body of literature—an overview of social science writings regarding the status of immigrants in Canadian society—reveals that, despite reforms to immigration policy and the enactment of a multicultural policy, some authors contend that barriers to social and economic advancement remain, amplified by racism and the inaction of the Canadian state. As will be seen in greater detail in the next chapter, some contend that government funding: depoliticizes issues by transforming political questions into social needs issues; distorts the mission of ISOs through government specifications on client eligibility and service approaches; transforms agency structures and staffing through accountability requirements; dilutes ISOs' advocacy efforts through extreme fiscal dependence on government funding; and gives precedence to accountability over accessibility, a primary feature of voluntary organizations. Generally, therefore, the relationship between government and ethnic communities is not one of partnership, given disparities in function, domain, interests and resources.

For other authors the otoh/botho perspective acknowledges the state's emancipatory as well as regulatory potential. The state has not been monolithic in its intentions and activities. In the past, racism and the requirements of capitalist accumulation have been mediated by state actors in distinct ways at different periods in history. Today immigration policy is being crafted to balance the requirements of a declining birth rate, a "high tech" economy, and a commitment to family reunification. The latter commitment reflects both the strength of a pro-immigration lobby as well as a pragmatic recognition that immigrants who have family supports will require fewer settlement services (Whitaker, 1991). There appears to have been some recognition of the benefits of immigration, settlement services and ISOs: an expanded labour force cannot be
maximised without expenditures on language training; immigrant serving organizations are a
good return on the dollar (in their recruitment and use of volunteers and comparatively low wage
levels), and the beneficial role they play in reducing the isolation of immigrants that may lead to
social fragmentation. However arguments such as these emphasize the economic benefits of
diversity and lead to weak reforms. Further, the emphasis on cultural politics, or difference
between immigrant groups and the dominant cultures is seen by some as a flight from class
analysis.

The third body of literature reviewed in this chapter is social theory. Racial and cultural
pluralism has resulted in a questioning of the precepts of liberal societies in terms of the rights of
those perceived as outsiders. In the Canadian context, the rights of immigrant minorities are
weighed in the context of a society that is also grappling with the claims of national minorities.
The preoccupation with citizenship based rights--what obligations are owed to each other in a
polity--is the legacy of the ongoing French/English/First Nations question. Hence there is
apprehension about whether the work of ISOs, in emphasizing the rights of immigrants, fosters
fragmentation rather than notions of civic duty, Canadian identity, and integration.
ENDNOTES

1. Of the 88 articles in these volumes, one article, on services to seniors in Montreal, addressed the Canadian situation.

2. For example, the third sector performs service functions, social functions, and representational functions. Government performs social, regulatory, and service functions. Conflict may exist in one area whilst cooperation may exist in another (p. 11).

3. As Esping-Andersen (1990) notes some of these approaches cannot account for the rise of social welfare policies so long after industrialization superseded earlier forms of social organization. Other theorists have posited that it is only possible to divert resources to welfare after a certain level of surplus has been produced.

4. Dirks' study of immigration policy making during the 1980s is an example of the application of this theoretical approach in the Canadian context.

5. As will be seen, Iglehart and Becerra's (1995) utilize a similar concept, the "deficit model of service delivery," to depict the need for ethnic agencies in situations where mainstream services are inadequate to the task.

6. The public space or civil society has in Keane's (1988) terms, "no natural innocence:" the Ku Klux Klan also inhabits this sphere.

7. Anheier's characterization of the Eastern European states would be of interest.

8. Not all communities are alike in this respect. Research by Breton et al. (1990) demonstrates that communities differ in their use of organizational structures to achieve change.


10. Advocating African-centred schools, Dei (1996a) proposes a curriculum centred around the recognition of differences, and where students and teachers do not all have to be Black.

11. The split or segmented labour market theory specifies the bifurcation of the economy into a primary and secondary sector characterized by differential wages, working conditions, stability, degree of unionization, and so on. Some argue, and others refute, that women and racial minorities are confined to the secondary labour market where benefits are reduced.

12. Community groups are positive about recent changes to the thrust of the activities of the federal multiculturalism program but are also critical of budget cuts and moves from program to project funding (Peries, 1997).

13. In 1996, the Independent Class (business immigrants and skilled workers) formed the largest proportion of immigrants to Ontario with 52.2%, up from 43.8% in 1995, and 42.3%
in 1994. Family Class immigrants decreased to 33.7% from 40.0% in 1995, and 46.3% in 1994.

14. In Canada sponsorship agreements specify that assisted relatives are the financial responsibility of the sponsoring relative for a period of ten years during which time, the assisted relative is supposedly barred from the receipt of social security (i.e., General Welfare Assistance, Family Benefits Assistance). Until recently the province of Ontario has been liberal in cases of sponsorship breakdown so that assisted relatives have had access to these benefits. In 1994, the benefits paid to assisted relatives have been reduced and the federal government has instituted a pilot cost recovery program using judicial means secured judgments against sponsors who have, in the eyes of government, defaulted upon their sponsorship agreement.

15. The concept of a racially stratified labour force refers to the segregation of the labour force in capitalist economies such that racial minorities are confined to limited job markets (Bolaria & Li, 1988).

16. Inadequate settlement service provision is due in part to the federal government’s presumption that other levels of government should be involved (Lanphier & Lukomskyj, 1994).

17. He considers problem of defining a refugee. There are those who find the definition to be too narrow, who would give weight to economic, environmental and social deprivation as grounds for refugee status. Others contend that this would open a floodgate, generating a backlash with the end result that less people will be permitted to come. Carens responds that the presence of large numbers underscores the legitimate needs that remain unmet. A realistic moral theory asks what are the consequences for the well-being of refugees?

18. These discussions have some bearing upon the topic of immigrant serving organizations in that ISOs inhabit that sphere of civil society where, some authors contend, civic virtues such as balancing interests, may be learned.

19. Mouffe (1994) counters that this extreme form of pluralism impedes the recognition that certain differences, or existing rights have been constructed on the very exclusion or subordination of others. Mouffe thus predicates her view of radical pluralism upon a common denominator "a `we', a collective identity that would articulate the demands found in the different struggles against subordination" (Mouffe, 1994, p. 4). Benhabib (1992) would argue that Young and Mouffe are subtly grounding both their politics and social criticism in a philosophy of universal civil rights as the basis or standard of appeal. This position allows us to understand (Mouffe does not use this example) cultural practices such as female circumcision as a practice of subordination which need not be defended under the guise of liberal pluralism.
CHAPTER THREE

IMMIGRANT SERVING ORGANIZATIONS

Chapter Two addressed predominant themes in discussions of the voluntary sector internationally and provided an overview of state/minority relations in Canada. With regard to the former, the prevalent theme in the theoretical literature is to challenge the traditional government/voluntary sector antinomy, underscoring instead the variability in this crucial relationship, depending upon the government department, field of service, and individual organization involved. In the latter part of Chapter Two an abbreviated review of state/minority community relations reveals that despite the adoption of multicultural policies and programs, discriminatory practices continue within the human services.

The literature surveyed in this chapter focuses upon the field of immigrant services, service delivery and other roles played by ISOs (or ethnic associations), and state/ISO relations. The first section presents findings from international writings on ISOs. The second section details the Canadian context by: a) surveying developments in immigration and settlement policy in the post-war period; b) reviewing the policy-making process in recent years; and c) summarizing writings on Canadian ISOs.

International Perspectives

A useful entry point to the field of immigrant services is provided by Cox's (1985) attempt to formalize a model (Fig. 1) for planning welfare services for immigrants. The model begins with an understanding of migration as a process consisting of four stages: pre-movement, transition, resettlement, and integration. At each stage there is a series of (independent) variables affecting outcome: the socio-economic-cultural-political background of the group and the nature of its migration; the nature of previous contact with the host society and consequent pre-arrival
attitudes, on both sides: the socio-economic-political context upon arrival; the prevailing host society attitudes; the nature of ethnic group development (i.e., informal or formal structures); and the economic status of the group.

These independent variables influence two dependent variables: the nature of social problems or needs that will be experienced by different immigrant populations; and the nature of welfare developments (that is, prevailing welfare philosophies and resources). Six levels of intervention are identified, the first two relating to pre-migration, and the remaining four to the integration stage: 1) immigration policies and practice; 2) reception/resettlement policies and practice; 3) community education; 4) equality of opportunity measures; 5) community development; and 6) provision of personal welfare services.

Cox's contribution lies in this delineation, from a planning perspective, of the major components of immigrant welfare. Country specific studies have investigated the phenomenon of immigrant and ethnic associations in countries with large institutionalized social welfare programs and professional social work bureaucracies. In a 1988, comparative study of five countries (Australia, Britain, Israel, the Netherlands, and the United States), researchers examined: a) whether benefits of the welfare state were available to immigrants, refugees, and temporary workers; b) if eligible, how were newcomers able to negotiate the system to obtain services; c) were ethnic associations, as “mutual support groups,” likely to become a conduit for the delivery of social services to immigrants and refugees; and d) were there linkages that existed, or that could be forged between ethnic associations, and the formal voluntary and public social service system (Jenkins, 1988).

Ethnic associations were distinguished from ethnic agencies. The former are defined as organizations whose key elements are a self defined ethnic group, the voluntary nature of the
association, and the goal of mutual benefit. On the basis of data gathered, Jenkins concluded that ethnic associations made important contributions in providing access to new immigrants and in helping point the way to "ethnic-sensitive" practice. How these organizations functioned depended upon: the nature of the new immigration, the ethnic characteristics of the group, the nature of ethnic associations, social welfare entitlements, and the social welfare system.

The ethnic agency was defined as an established social agency with a primary commitment to members of one or more ethnic groups, which operates service programs, employs professional staff, may or may not have a membership base, operates under a board of directors, may receive both public and voluntary funding and may be a single or multi-service agency. Ethnic agency operations were characterized by three variables: the incorporation of cultural components of the ethnic group; a consciousness of ethnic identity, and a policy of matching clients and service deliverers by ethnic group in all areas of operation.

A continuum of four different types of ethnic agencies, which I have graphically summarized below, was developed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnic Agencies</th>
<th>Ethic Assoc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. professionalised with trained social work staff</td>
<td>2. ethnic group based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. public funds</td>
<td>3. strong ethnic identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. government contracts</td>
<td>4. primarily cultural, social, and self-interest based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. access to traditional service systems</td>
<td>5. service component but not as extensive as in groups 1 and 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. minimal participation in service delivery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In general, patterns of service and referral differ because the needs of groups differ and because associations vary in the programs they offer. It was also possible to distinguish types of
service offered. Direct help was proffered in relation to education and job needs, as well as in family problems due to cultural conflict. Where extensive public social service programs existed, associations were more likely to occupy facilitator and advocate roles.

The country specific studies offer some insights into the varied roles of "ethnic associations" and state/voluntary welfare sector arrangements. In England, Cheetham (1988) notes that the general policy has been to transfer responsibility for refugees as soon as possible to normal statutory agencies. In other communities, representatives of some ethnic associations worry about being isolated into ghetto-like services. Thus the legitimation of ethnicity in politics, manifested in the establishment of separate ethnic associations, converges with racist and anti-immigrant sentiments, leaving services to be delivered by underresourced agencies. As a result there is some consensus between state providers and ethnic associations that integrated services should be the goal.

In her research Cheetham found some ethnic associations to be preoccupied with the politics of their countries of origin, while others located their organizations within the context of race and class dynamics in Britain. Cheetham asks whether the aspirations and methods of ethnic associations are far removed from those of mainstream social work. She concludes that the centrality of language and culture, and the retention of culture to help people accommodate and settle are consistent with social work's commitment to start where people are and to help them use their own resources and strengths.

In Israel, the role played by the central government means that ethnic associations are immigrant associations supported by a mix of public, semi-public and voluntary support. According to Korazim (1988):

...in sociological terms such organizations can be described as special structures between formal public bureaucracies and primary social networks which help to
absorb immigrants according to special socio-cultural characteristics. An immigrant association is thus simultaneously bureaucratized and non-bureaucratized, using different combinations of hired personnel and volunteers, primarily of its own ethnic origins. (p. 155)

As in other countries, associations vary from those that are well organized, and offer a broad spectrum of professional services, to the less organized offering hardly any services. The factors differentiating the associations appear to be: a) the size of the particular community; b) the proportion of recent arrivals; c) the level of public interest in the community as expressed in the level of public funding; d) whether migration was voluntary or involuntary; e) the level of ethnic cohesion or rivalries; f) the level of independent wealth; and g) the closeness of socio-cultural background of the immigrants to that of the host society.

Social services for immigrants were described as complex, uncoordinated and highly fragmented. As such, immigrant associations reported the need to coordinate services with other immigrant associations and other voluntary and public sector organizations.

Despite Israel’s commitment to Jewish immigrants, gaps exist at three levels. At the macro level there has been little coordination between absorption policies and services delivered by major ministries. At the mezzo level, there are service dilemmas about equity, in that wealthier, better organized communities are able to provide more for their own ethnic group. And last, at the micro level, immigrants are frequently shunted from office to office according to special needs, with no agency playing a case management or integrative role.

Korazim therefore identifies four key factors in developing a more rational model for social service delivery to immigrants: a) the level of commitment to the absorption of various groups of newcomers (as represented in the "melting pot," cultural pluralism, or ethnic identity models of assimilation); b) the levels of service delivery, whether national, regional, and neighbourhood/community based; c) the auspices of service delivery, that is, public, voluntary,
non-profit, private for profit, or a mix; and d) the organizational culture continuum ranging from formal organizations originating in the bureaucratic model of standardized service, to the informal world of the nuclear and extended families, and friends and neighbours. Immigrant serving associations are situated in the middle of the continuum attempting to integrate service and "ethnic" [sic] goals (e.g., face to face contact, positive and deep affect, permanent relationships, etc.).

In the Netherlands, nongovernmental rather than public sector agencies are the primary service providers and are fully funded by government. In the case of immigrant services, mainstream agencies, ecclesiastical or religiously based agencies, as well as ethnic associations are funded by government. However, according to the authors, "the number of measures that can be said to have a bearing on a kind of collective emancipation [in contrast to individual betterment] of the group through their own institutions is limited" (de Graaf, Penninx, & Stoove. 1988, p. 218).

Casey (1988), writing of Australia, describes a situation very much like that of Canada. Extensive government involvement in services means that privatization has not occurred on the same scale as it has in the United States. At the same time a strong voluntary tradition exists such that a large nongovernmental sector plays a role in service delivery in key areas. Like Canada, the early assumption of easy assimilation and adequacy of universal services proved erroneous and gradually monies have been made available for ethnic associations. Casey argues that governments have been reluctant to admit that non-English speaking communities are divided along political, religious and ethnic lines and a casual examination reveals that organizations sharing governmental ideology are the ones that obtain funding. Organizations that are engaged in politics internal to their own community are less likely to receive support.
As in the English context, Casey cautions that there is a danger that ethnic agencies serve to perpetuate the marginalization of non-English speaking immigrants. He contends that the major justification for the existence of ethnic associations should be the degree to which these agencies can address unemployment, employment in low paying jobs, and access to goods and services for non-English speaking immigrants.

On the basis of data gathered in the five countries, Jenkins concluded that ethnic associations made important contributions in providing access for new immigrants and in helping point the way to “ethnic-sensitive” practice seen to consist of: the incorporation of cultural components of the ethnic group; a consciousness of ethnic identity, and a policy of matching clients and service deliverers by ethnic group in all areas of operation. (In contrast, Matsuoka and Sorenson (1991), analyzing services in Metropolitan Toronto to refugees from the former Ethiopia, caution that the call for ethnically sensitive services rests on the questionable presumption of a single coherent ethnic community that is identifiable and can be served.)

The five nation study concluded that how these organizations functioned depended upon: the nature of the new immigration (voluntary or involuntary migration), the ethnic characteristics of the group (similarity of country of origin to host country), the nature of ethnic associations (ranging from informal associations to professionalised bureaucracies), social welfare entitlements (with absorption policies determining the level of commitment to services by the host society), and the social welfare system (levels of service delivery, whether national, regional, and neighbourhood/community based and auspices of service delivery, whether public, voluntary, non-profit, private for profit, or a mix). In those countries where governments have initiated programs, Korazim, in the case of Israel, questions how independent associations really are; and Casey, in Australia, wonders whether links with the bureaucracy have not stultified.
ethnic development and marginalized services. Thus recognition of a role for ethnic associations in official policy may inhibit their advocacy functions.

In a recently published textbook, *Social services and the ethnic community* (Inglehart & Becerra, 1995) the authors, examining the American context, and perceiving a schism between pre-existing service systems and ethnic service systems, investigate why communities want to deliver their own services, whether it is necessary, and how the two systems interact. They address questions such as the needs of communities, who has responded to these needs, the nature of those responses, and changes in the present day.

They conclude that the growth of ethnic organizations arose out of the need to provide services to individuals who could not receive services elsewhere. While the ethnic agency gains its legitimacy from the ethnic community, today its economic inputs (i.e., funding) are located outside the community, which may allow for environmental constraints upon the agency's autonomy (p. 151). Despite significant differences among agencies, what all ethnic agencies appear to share is an emphasis on ethnicity as the basis for service provision, and nonprofessionalisation. According to Inglehart and Becerra, ethnic sensitive practice consists of: an ideology of empowerment derived from an identification with the client and belief in the group; the goal of improving the group through work with individuals; a technology of education, information, and participation; and a structure that buffers clients from the bureaucracy (p. 276). At some point, however, needs may surpass the community's ability to respond, as for example in the case of the needs of the elderly. At this point mainstream services are required to provide ethnically sensitive practice. However ethnic agencies will continue to have a role to play in identifying and responding to community needs. Citing Kramer, Inglehart and Becerra write, "as the government seems to approach its limits of capacity and legitimacy,
the voluntary sector may be utilized more for the provision of services" (p. 278).

In discussing the continuing support for the "doctrine of ethnic group responsibility", the authors attribute this to a "deficit model of service delivery." that is, that mainstream responses are deficient and so minority communities must provide for themselves. Hence there is little confidence in partnership models. The authors acknowledge the issue of institutional separatism versus integration cursorily; whilst ethnic segregation is disparaged, ethnic agencies are sometimes viewed as a panacea.²

The authors enumerate a number of propositions about the ethnic agency and its practices: the agency is controlled, staffed by and provides services to a specific ethnic group; the agency appears to be a special type of voluntary, self-help, alternative, community-based service agency; the agency may fill a gap left by the mainstream social service delivery system, or may respond to cultural barriers that impede a group’s use of mainstream services; the agency is shaped by the larger social system; ethnicity is an integral part of the ideology and technology of the agency; the agency operationalizes the concept of empowerment; there is a tension between ethnicity and professionalism in the agency; the agency seeks to simplify the organization for the client; the agency attempts to protect its ideology and technology from bureaucratic intrusion; the agency and its community share a symbiotic relationship; the agency may not be reform oriented; the agency may augment rather than compete with mainstream services; there may be limitations in the service delivery practices; a tension seems to exist between the agency and mainstream social work practice (p. 194).

Summary

ISOs are recognized as uniquely suited to serving immigrants who have specialized needs and are not likely to use mainstream services. The core of the agencies' practice consists of
the incorporation of language and cultural elements thus reinforcing group identity. Agencies may also utilize education, information and participation strategies to enable their clients in their negotiations with the larger society. They also intervene on behalf of their clients in interactions with bureaucratic structures. Further ISOs perform more than a service provider role, representing as well access to goods, services, and power by minority communities. At the same time, the diversity and idiosyncrasies among these organizations result in uneven standards of service delivery and, it is argued, lead to social fragmentation instead of social cohesion through their emphases on narrow racial or cultural definitions of identity.

A Canadian Perspective

Chronology of Developments in Immigration Policy and Settlement Services in the Postwar Period

Before introducing the literature on the field of immigrant services in Canada, it is useful to provide an abbreviated survey of developments in Canadian immigration and settlement policy as a context. Since the 1970s the expansion of immigrant services and the growth of immigrant serving organizations has been fueled by federal government policy on immigration. The following is a synopsis of policy developments in the postwar period culled from descriptions by Hawkins (1988), the Economic Council of Canada (ECC) (1991), and Whitaker (1991).

1947
- Mackenzie King's policy statement on the aims of immigration developed to respond to the influx of displaced persons from Europe after World War II: immigration for population growth; immigration for economic development; immigration must be selective; immigration must be related to absorptive capacity; immigration to Canada is a privilege (not a fundamental human right) extended by Canada in correspondence with domestic policies; immigration must
not distort the character of the Canadian population, hence the continuation of restrictions on Asiatic immigration - only very close relatives of Canadian citizens eligible for admission (Hawkins, 1988, p. 92).

- Most preferred country status regardless of trade or skill level extended to France (1948) and other northern and western European countries - Belgium, Luxembourg, Norway, Denmark, Sweden and Switzerland (1950). Immigrants from other European countries with acceptable occupations could be sponsored by any legal resident of Canada.

1950
- Establishment of the federal Department of Citizenship and Immigration (with responsibility also for Indian affairs) to implement 1947 immigration policy.

1952
- Immigration Act established as legal framework for managing immigration.
- Provision of services (with costs shared between the federal and seven provincial and one territorial government limited to meeting basic welfare and medical needs resulting from accident or illness for one year after arrival "lest these should give immigrants a preferred status over Canadians." (Hawkins, 1988, p. 110).

1961
- Free textbooks for language training supplied by the Department of Citizenship and Immigration.
- Department of the Ontario Provincial Secretary and Citizenship created by merging the small office responsible for the provision of information, translation, group and community services for newcomers with a section of the Department of Education involved in English language training and citizenship instruction.
• Province active in recruitment of skilled immigrants in the United Kingdom and Europe as well as developing an extensive language training program.

1962
• Some racist regulations were relaxed as the need for highly skilled labour could not be met from traditional sources of immigrants (because of the economic recovery in Britain and other European countries). All immigrants could sponsor relatives except for Asian and African immigrants who were prohibited from sponsoring distant relatives.

1965
• Creation of the federal Department of Manpower and Immigration

1966/67
• Delineation of responsibilities for the Department of Manpower and Immigration primary concern for the individual worker - assisting with reception, family and employment counselling, costs of language training where necessary for employment, working with voluntary agencies that supplemented these services.

• Withdrawal of the federal Citizenship Branch from integration activities except for the provision of citizenship and citizenship language training classes in conjunction with the provinces and voluntary organizations; Department of the Secretary of State now concerned with social, political and cultural integration of immigrants.

1967
• The basis of the present immigration selection system was put into place in 1967 with the implementation of the point system of which the main principles were admission of people meeting the perceived needs of the Canadian labour market and economy (points allocated on the basis of education, skills and resources); and should be universally applicable, not discriminating on the basis of race, colour, or
religion (ECC, 1991, p. 14). The immigration policy applied to three groups - close family members and refugees (not subject to the point system) and independent immigrants (subject to the point system). Despite this liberalization the deck may have been stacked against poor immigrants from the so-called Third World (Whitaker, 1991, p. 19).

- An Immigration Appeal Board established. Refugees and visitors allowed to apply inland. Those not automatically granted immigrant status could appeal.

- Ontario Department of the Provincial Secretary and Citizenship announces funding for pilot citizenship development and information centres whose future would be subject to evaluation. Voluntary agencies had been urging the Department of the Provincial Secretary and Citizenship to provide services or subsidize the provision of services for immigrants. For example, in 1964 after a federally and provincially funded two year study, a recommendation was made to set up community information centres for immigrants using existing staff and buildings. The proposal was immediately rejected by a group of Ontario Ministers. Until the mid-sixties there was a prevailing notion that immigrants should fend for themselves as had their predecessors. When financial restrictions were loosen, funding remained limited to the development of language training programs and instructors (Hawkins, 1988, p. 209-210).

- Citizenship Branch becomes part of the Ontario Ministry of Community and Social Services. Hawkins asks how this degree of development became possible given the Ontario Cabinet's reluctance in most of the post war period to involve itself in more than the recruitment of skilled immigrants and language training.
1973
• A large backlog of appeals by persons whose inland applications had been refused resulted in a decision to grant them landed immigrant status during a two month Adjustment of Status Program. The necessity of implementing this program and the oil crisis later on that year led to a reconsideration of immigration and population policy.
• Federal Department of Manpower and Immigration initiated a study of settlement needs to gather data for the eventual implementation of a settlement policy (Amin, 1987). Lanphier and Lukomskyj (1994) emphasize this ‘philosophical’ [emphasis in original] change in responsibility for service delivery as government became actively involved in the resettlement process. They read this involvement as an attempt on the part of government to extend its power and influence which at the same time resulted in “the provision of services as a matter of right or entitlement: the status of ‘landed immigrant’ or ‘refugee’ is both necessary and sufficient to ensure eligibility for settlement services” (p. 342).
1974
• A federal Green Paper issued putting forward considerations on population size, growth, distribution and composition and review of principles governing admission and integration of immigrants from abroad.
1978
• A year of notable changes to the Immigration Act with the following policy and administration goals: to promote government established demographic goals, to enrich the cultural and social fabric of the country taking into account its federal and bilingual nature, facilitate family reunification, foster intergovernmental co-operation to assist the adaptation of immigrants to their new home, facilitate visits to Canada by foreigners, ensure non-discrimination among immigrants on grounds
of race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, and sex; fulfill international obligations to refugees; foster a viable economy and regional prosperity; maintain and the promote the health, safety and good order of Canadian society; and promote international order and justice by denying access to Canada by persons likely to engage in criminal activity. Whitaker notes that the act aimed for wider consultation with the provinces and the public. For example government was required to consult on desired immigration levels and to announce these in advance of implementation. Whitaker also notes the growing role of larger provinces - responsible for social services such as education, health and welfare - intrinsic to the absorption of immigrants. Ontario created a Ministry of Citizenship including a multicultural branch with a budget to promote settlement and integration of immigrants.

- Establishment of a refugee category which had existed in practice but not in legislation; previously refugees were admitted under Minister's permits;

provisions allowed for regulations that went beyond Canada's international obligations to the United Nations convention on refugees.

- Cullen Couture agreement signed between Ottawa and Quebec recognizing the concurrent jurisdiction of federal and provincial legislatures in immigration matters and attempts to harmonize the priorities of the Quebec and Canadian governments.

1979

- Implementation of the federal Immigrant Settlement and Adaptation Program (ISAP) of the Canada Employment and Immigration Commission (formerly Dept. of Manpower and Immigration), allowing for purchase of service agreements with
community agencies to provide settlement services.

1980

- Under Conservative government of Joe Clark, the resettlement of the "Boat People" used private sector voluntary associations as central actors in the process:

"...the entire movement was privatized and decentralized, with government playing a supportive role" (Whitaker, 1991, p. 22). Whitaker notes that while this Canadian action broke with traditional prejudice against Orientals, these people were fleeing communism. Latin Americans (Chileans in the 1970s; Salvadoreans and Nicaraguans in the 1980s) fleeing right wing governments allied with American government had not received the same treatment as had Hungarians and Czechs fleeing Communist regimes.

1985

- A special report to Parliament noted the drop in country's birth rate and linked immigration to compensation for declining domestic fertility rates as well as occupational skills required in the Canadian labour force. Hence immigration planning levels were increased.³

1994

- "Into the 21st century: A strategy for immigration and citizenship" emphasizes selection of immigrants according to their ability to contribute to economic and social development, thereby reducing the demand for integration services. The federal Department of Citizenship and Immigration is created, linking immigration and the acquisition of citizenship, demonstrating an obvious concern about shared values and national identity.

1995

- The federal government announces that Citizenship and Immigration Canada will withdraw from the direct administration and delivery of federal settlement programs. Instead the Department will work with public and private sector
partners to create new models for the delivery or settlement services.

**Immigration and Settlement Policy: The Policy-making Process**

**The Making of Immigration Policy**

Policy-making is a complex process whose determinants include such variables as changes in the global economy, public values, the ideological views of the governing political party, pressures exerted by the bureaucracy and other state institutions, and the degree of influence exerted by interest groups (Hess, 1993). The following section reviews recent academic writings relevant to policy-making in the areas of immigration, multiculturalism, and settlement policy. Hawkins stresses intergovernmental (federal and provincial) relations as key. Both Parkin et al. (1992), and Pal (1993) identify a tension between a nation building dynamic and pluralistic tendencies. Dirks (1995) accedes the importance of government concerns with the economy but emphasizes the bureaucratic dominance thesis as a significant factor in the development of immigration policy during the 1980s.

Hawkins’ (1988) seminal work on Canadian immigration policy making depicts the evolution of government policy and institutions. Hawkins’ work is a detailed account of the evolution of governmental policies and structures from the post war period to 1972 when her book was first published. In 1988 a second edition was published with single chapter covering the period 1972 to 1986. Hawkins writes from the perspective of managing immigration, detailing actors - senior civil servants and ministers - and policy and program changes, and including the role played by voluntary organizations. Her central thesis is that the narrow concept of immigration as a manpower policy was inadequate.

She situated immigration policy (and settlement service delivery) within Canadian federalism. With respect to immigration, Section 95 of the British North America Act (BNA Act)
of 1867 specified immigration (along with agriculture) to be a joint responsibility of the federal and provincial governments. Consequently bargaining and negotiating has been necessary to decide who pays for immigrant education and training, citizenship programs, medical services and welfare (Hawkins, 1972). Hawkins claims that the character of federal provincial negotiating relationships has prevented creative joint planning.

Other aspects of the BNA Act impinge on immigration policy and settlement service delivery. For example, education is a provincial responsibility and encompasses a wide scope of programs with ESL implications: education in schools, occupational training and re-training, citizenship education. With increased immigration levels, costs of English language training increased dramatically.

With regard to social security and welfare, federal, provincial and municipal governments share responsibility through a series of agreements first developed in the 1960s during the expansion of the welfare state. The key programs include the Canada Assistance Program (CAP) governing federal transfer payments to the provinces for social security, the Family Benefits Allowance Act and the General Welfare Act.

Hawkins is critical of the predominance of the federal government and absence of provincial involvement in this jurisdiction. Thus there was no joint collaboration or planning between the Department of the Secretary of State and the Department of Manpower and Immigration in crucial areas such as provincial involvement, language training, research, funding and role of the voluntary sector, resulting in a twilight zone in the planning and development of services.

The almost exclusive federal management of immigration led to weak or non-existent services for immigrants since many of the basic services required such as reception, information
and referral counselling, welfare, community services, and language training, all fall within the purview of the provinces who played little role in immigration. Instead, voluntary organizations (religious, ethnic, and secular) provided such services as best they could (Hawkins, 1988, p.185). Hawkins points out that “weak services must also be seen in the context of the cautious development of Canadian social services and system of social security during this period” (Hawkins, 1988, p. 194) and identified a need for a national policy and joint planning to put into place the requisite service infrastructure.

In paper prepared for a 1992 Conference on Immigration and Refugee Policy in Australia and Canada, Lanphier and Lukomskyj address settlement policy in both countries. They contend that, “political forces in the evolution of contemporary multicultural policy shape settlement services according to a [bureaucratic] construction of desired image of immigrant [cohort] profile” (emphasis in original) and secondly, that service deliverers, particularly non-governmental organizations, occupy intermediary positions of influence. The consequence of the first hypothesis is the lack of attention paid to the specific needs of client groups. The second hypothesis implies that the resettlement arena is one that is contested by service deliverers and to a lesser extent by clients. In a more recent account Lanphier and Lukomskyj (1994) summarize the broad principles underlying settlement policy, within a multicultural framework, thus:

- universal eligibility for services prior to and immediately after arrival in Canada;
- front-end loading with services primarily available in the first months and year(s) after arrival;
- respect for ethnocultural background while ensuring access to English/French language acquisition;
- economic adaptation predominant;
- and federal services to be complemented by the provincial, municipal, and voluntary sectors (p. 355).

In a paper comparing the making of immigration and refugee policy in Australia and
Canada (1992), the authors conclude that for both countries a dynamic tension exists between ‘nation building’ statism and a pluralistic social and political structure. Nation building statism is characterized by strong policy management by government elites according to an agenda which legitimizes state action and promotes national goals (such as strengthening the economy and infrastructure, and enhancing international status).

The pluralist social and political structure allows for competition between interest groups bringing societal pressures to bear upon the policy-making process. They argue that the statist dynamic has been most prominent in Canada although ‘pluralist intrusions’ have occurred in recent decades. Whitaker makes a similar point identifying the role of immigration in Canadian nation-building, concluding however that these attempts have had consistently indifferent results (Whitaker, 1991, p. 25). Before reaching this conclusion Parkin et al. examined five other hypotheses (none of the five hypotheses being mutually exclusive):

1) The responsible government thesis views the political process as one where political parties compete and are elected on the basis of electoral platforms (including an immigration policy) which are subsequently implemented by the winning party.

2) The bureaucratic dominance thesis posits that civil servants exercise undue influence upon the policy making process shaping policy according to particular value orientations. (They cite Abella's argument that bureaucrats were key in maintaining racially discriminatory policies in the past, and Whitaker's account of senior officials influencing refugee policy in 1970s and 1980s.)

3) The cosmopolitan elitism thesis suggests that post industrial societies are characterized by the hegemonic dominance of a new class whose cultural capital consists of values such as internationalism, universalism and liberalism. These values predominate amongst academics, teachers, journalists, human service professionals, and public servants who shape education and
mass communication.

4) According to the business dominance thesis, in capitalist societies, the maintenance of private capital accumulation is preeminent with immigration policies facilitating the interests of business through the provision of cheap labour and undermining of trade union power.

5) The populism thesis proposes that immigration and refugee policy is shaped by public opinion largely in the form of positions that have populist appeal, such as exclusionary regulations at times of high unemployment.

Parkin et al. argue that the responsible government and populism theses have the least explanatory power in that, in the case of the former, there has been more consensus than disagreement between political parties on the subject of immigration. (The article was written prior to the last federal election and the rise of the Reform Party.) In the case of the latter there is generally a weak relationship between public opinion and public policy.

For the authors the cosmopolitan elitism argument appears to be plausible in that government policies are more liberal than public opinion and business elites would espouse. Whether this is a decisive explanatory factor is uncertain. They conclude that there is not much evidence for the business dominance thesis in that business has tended to be less vocal than other sectors (e.g., labour) on this issue. As well the interests of the state include to a great degree not offending the interests of business.

The bureaucratic dominance perspective is discounted because of the strong influences on policy of prime ministers, ministers, the judiciary as well as external actors. This conclusion is contrary to Dirks' (1995) finding for the making of immigration policy during the 1980s. Parkin et al. note that the policy process of late has been vulnerable to mobilised interests; however in the case of Canada these are being mediated in a calculated fashion that strengthens the state's
legitimacy and preempts oppositional challenges.

In a study of Canadian immigration policy during the 1980s, Dirks (1995) argues that while economic factors have been a major determinant of immigration policy, social and political factors, as well as structural, organizational and bureaucratic considerations have had a considerable impact on the content and implementation of policy. Family reunification and humanitarian concerns with the plight of refugees are reflected in the high percentages and numbers of these classes in both forecasted levels and admissions to Canada. As well, whether the prime minister or minister responsible favours immigration can affect the setting of levels by the bureaucracy (p. 32).

Dirks finds that the elaborate consultation process with business and voluntary agencies that was put into place by government was utilized not to solicit input, but to disseminate information and legitimize programs and regulations. A lack of consensus among voluntary organizations and other constituencies has allowed government representatives to be selective about which suggestions and advice are taken (p. 42). His third major premise is that of a constant struggle between the "gatekeepers or controllers" factions (who emphasize restrictions on admissions) and the "facilitators" factions (who emphasize humanitarian interests) found in both elected officials and civil servants. He concludes on the basis of anecdotal evidence, that the views of the former are more pronounced in the field (p. 144).

On the subject of settlement services Dirks provides a cursory review of the development of government funded settlement services, noting that voluntary organizations have expressed confusion as to the jurisdictional responsibilities of the Department of the Secretary of State and the Canada Employment and Immigration Commission (CEIC). He relates that immigration officials believe the voluntary sector can provide settlement services more effectively and at less
cost than CEIC could itself (p. 102), and notes changes in priorities for settlement services corresponding with the intention to accept 250,000 immigrants and refugees. (These levels were not realized.)

Noting that social tranquillity in an ethnically diverse society is more likely when adjustment programs exist, he adds that these services have received very little attention in the media. However as Dirks himself has concluded, civil servants have played a greater part in influencing immigration policy than has public opinion. Therefore the views of government representatives are likely to be more influential in determining the scope of settlement programs.

My own experience in provincial government suggests that while government representatives (politicians, political staff, and civil servants) are unwilling to operate too far outside the norm of what is publicly popular, they exercise influence by framing the presentation of information and public policy options and through the selection of spokespersons and stakeholder groups to represent particular points of view. In general, civil servants are liberal with regard to spending programs since their prestige and influence is correlated with larger program expenditures.

**Federal policy-making and advocacy groups**

In a recently published historical study of the federal Department of the Secretary of State, Pal (1993) investigates the relationship between the state and NGOs in three areas funded by the Department: official languages policy, multiculturalism, and the women's program. In particular Pal investigated the effects of governmental funding for these advocacy organizations. He concludes that, from the mid-1960s, government support for these organizations was couched in terms of national unity, and consequently, citizenship, identity and participation, encouraging in turn a political discourse of collective rights and equality.⁸
Pal acknowledges that the policy process is complex and is very rarely singly determined. Nonetheless, he concludes that, as a result of state funding, effective constituencies of interest developed who argued for an expansion of programs in their area, and became contributors to the ongoing and fragmenting debates about Canadian identity. In regard to immigration, Whitaker similarly concludes:

The government tried to use non-governmental groups as a means of privatizing and legitimating its policies, but it learned that this could be a double-edged sword. By the late 1980s a permanent and highly respectable non-governmental pro-immigration lobby was well established. (Whitaker, 1991, p. 23)

In sum, these debates have been amplified as a result of state intervention. At the same time these particularistic politics have resulted in certain “nationalizing” tendencies: for example, the promulgation of national policies, the formation of national organizations within these constituencies, coalition building amongst NGOs with similar policy interests. Other impacts include the framing of Canadian political discourse in terms articulated by such constituencies: for example, the historical dimension of the French contribution to Canada emphasized by official language minority groups; and the equality seeking claims made by women and multicultural groups (Pal. 1993).

Summary

The foregoing analyses have reiterated the continued prominence of Canadian federalism and its unity and nation building concerns. At the same time, the funding of nongovernmental organizations in the 1970s resulted in the creation of significant policy communities that have attempted to exert policy influence with varying degrees of success. Not surprisingly, NGOs’ ability to influence policy would appear to be greatest when there is greater ideological affinity with preeminent sectors in the civil service.
A perspective on service delivery in the context of welfare state provision is found in Campfens (1990). Utilizing Kramer’s (1981) framework, he addresses the role of voluntary organizations in the welfare state. The influence of the British tradition upon anglophone Canada is cited; that is, NGOs perform a supplementary function to state delivered or state funded services, as well as providing an outlet for private philanthropy at the interpersonal level, and social reform at the socio-political level. According to Campfens, institutional and professional practice cannot respond readily to the needs of a changing population; therefore immigrant NGOs are in a better position, in the interim, to provide for unmet needs. Campfens elaborates upon the networking role required of these NGOs to facilitate the integration of newcomers and emphasizes the mutual accommodation that ensues. He stresses the importance of supporting group and organizational formations because they have significance for people as forms of social life, as well as being a means of securing access to the larger society. At the same time he acknowledges Breton’s (1981) findings that groups vary in their reliance upon community structures.

He sees the special contribution of NGOs as their flexibility in responding to a variety of issues, for example, the crisis resettlement of refugees, etc. Moreover, voluntary associations proffer a means for providing services in an informal setting, for humanizing the welfare state through the contact between NGOs and state agencies, and for reestablishing a sense of community (p. 166). This feature of immigrant organizations has been reiterated in a recent empirical study of Ghanaian refugees. Opoku-Dapaah (1993) finds that while refugees have attained some degree of economic adaptation, that is, the ability to participate in order to become self sufficient, their social adaptation has fared less well. Social adaptation denotes the degree to
which respondents have extended their social relationships to the wider society. He contends that their high level of dissatisfaction with life in Canada (in terms of economic aspirations) has resulted in Ghanaian refugees restricting their social ties to the Canadian Ghanaian community. Therefore, he recommends that migrant associations be recognized as effective partners in the resettlement of refugees because their informality and the personal involvement of refugees makes such organizations appropriate mechanisms for dealing with the social-cultural factors pertinent to the adaptation process (factors subsumed by the emphasis on economic adaptation by federal settlement policies). Additionally they are less expensive than mainstream community and federal agencies.

For Campfens, the competencies of ISOs are not unquestioned and, writing seven years ago, he perceived the future of NGOs in service delivery to be in question. Campfens himself advocates the partnership model whereby community development oriented services and more individualized services complement each other. The partnership model is preferred since it strengthens "mutual aid patterns and participation among consumers and constituencies of NGOs" (p. 169).9

Summary

From the foregoing writings, it may be concluded that the major functions of ISOs are seen to be those of: provision of services to individuals and communities in need (e.g., Iglehart & Becerra, 1995); advocacy and networking on behalf of marginalized groups (e.g., Beyenne, et al., n.d.); maintenance of ethnic identity through culturally and linguistically appropriate services (e.g., Jenkins, 1988); maintenance of forms of social life based on kinship, friendship and community (Opoku-Dapaah, 1993); and democratization and decentralization of the welfare state (Campfens, 1990).
In terms of the service delivery system, the following themes are evident: ISOs vary in resources, degree of bureaucratization, and service delivery capacity (e.g., Korazim, 1988); there are questions as to the respective roles of mainstream and ISOs and models of service delivery (e.g., Campfens, 1990); and there is the issue of whether ISOs foster ghettoization instead of service equity, institutional pluralism instead of integrated services, and reinforcement of ethnic boundaries instead of intergroup contact (e.g., Casey in Jenkins, 1988).

The State and Immigrant Serving Organizations: Resistance and/or Cooptation?

Immigrant Serving Agencies As Alternative Service Organizations

In their work on ethnic agencies in the United States, Iglehart and Becerra (1995) advance the proposition that an ethnic service agency be considered an Alternative Service Organization (ASO). For Powell (1986) ASOs are characterized as human service organizations, founded by local initiative as an alternative to established services found to be inadequate. ASOs offer alternatives to traditional programs, utilize different methods and provide services to different populations. Powell sees ASOs as an important element in the overall human service delivery system in that they fill service gaps, employ innovative service strategies and are advocates for social change.

Shragge (1990), writing in the context of Quebec, considers the growth of this sector from its origins in radical social movements to a stage where many have become an extension of state programs providing social and health service or support systems for private economic development (p. 137). His underlying assumption is that ASOs serve clients who are oppressed by the structures of patriarchal capitalism, while the state and the private sector are interested in maintaining the existing social order (p. 168). While immigrant serving organizations are not the focus of Shragge's study, the cases are instructive.
In a situation where the welfare state is being redefined, and where state services are being shifted to the community through the use of volunteers, community organizations and the family, Shragge concludes that ASOs are able to maintain their autonomy to act in opposition to state policy, and engage in community development strategies aimed at empowerment (p. 138).

Shragge's characterization of ASOs is overtly political. He contrasts the activities of ASOs with those agencies funded by government or private federations such as the United Way. The latter, he asserts, focus on service delivery on an individual basis whereas ASOs concentrate on programs that foster collective political action. A second feature of ASOs consists of their organizational forms as nonhierarchical and democratic as possible, allowing for staff and community participation in more than nominal ways. Thirdly, ASOs, especially in their inception, emphasize the hiring of community members rather than trained professionals.

From the literature, Shragge summarizes the phases of development of ASOs from an initial period when the organization is engaged in social change activities, to a transitional period when more attention is paid to organizational accountability. In the later state, traditional accountability procedures have been put into place, and more professional staff have been hired. An individual approach may replace more collective strategies such as public education, community development and group work. However, the organization retains its commitment to its original client group. This bureaucratization results from the power of funders to shape agency activities. (In the case of immigrant organizations, Korazim (1988), on the basis of Israeli data, suggests that these organizations are simultaneously bureaucratized and non-bureaucratized.)

The development of these ASOs was affected by Quebec government policy to develop community clinics with the result that many such clinics were later coopted or disappeared as a result of declining social movements which left them with little support. Following this period,
cutbacks in state spending entailed a thrust towards the use of community based services as an alternative to more expensive state programs. Now agencies have been pulled into partnership with government, and thus legitimized, while continuing to operate in a situation of underfunding and lack of long term fiscal stability. There are many parallels with the situation of immigrant service organizations in Ontario.

He argues that government and other funding sources operate to "destabilize" (p. 150) agencies by: providing funding on a short term basis, thus hindering long term planning; influencing programs through the provision of funding for social problems that are "in"; and appropriating large amounts of agency time for the administrative paper work required to procure short term project grants. As well, accountability procedures demand time be allocated for increased record keeping. Finally, groups may be required to change their structure to conform with the legal requirements of funders.

Despite ruptures to the monopoly of mainstream groups in procuring public funding, Anthias and Yuval-Davis (1992) identify another effect of state funding:

A grouping would have to emphasize its members' deprivation and marginality in order to claim funding. This then leads to ghettoization of 'needs groups.' It is in this way that minorities indirectly become defined and constructed by the state and their 'empowerment' can be of a very limited and specific nature. (Anthias & Yuval-Davis, 1992, p. 182)

The construction of minority communities is not entirely unidirectional as Anthias and Yuval-Davis claim, since communities chose a particular ethnic self-articulation as a result of internal as well as external dynamics. The provision of services to immigrants through ISOs also signifies a particular construction of immigrants as bearers of particular ethnic, linguistic or national characteristics in contradistinction to other social roles such as unemployed worker, etc.

Shragge concludes from his investigation of five agencies that the ability of these
organizations to maintain an oppositional stance is impressive. Maintaining agency autonomy depended upon the ASOs’ capacity to enlist support based upon its program successes, community support, or alliances with other service providers. Diversified funding was also helpful, as was the agency’s commitment to preserving its alternative viewpoint despite staff and board turnover.

At the same time the agencies examined by Shragge were described as in the transitional phase. Whether they will inevitably become more bureaucratized and professionalized depends on how their program approaches, and democratic processes differ from those of state agencies (p. 147). Despite a strong individual service orientation dictated by funding, the agencies utilize a client advocacy approach in an informal setting. A strong commitment to collective decision making was exhibited in the participative structures and democratic policies of the ASOs in question.

**Immigrant Women’s Organizations**

Ng (1988) offers an examination of an immigrant women’s employment agency providing job counselling and placement services for non-English speaking and Black women. She documents how the agency reproduced a labour market stratified by gender and ethnicity (p.13). By matching immigrant women to job openings based on their marketable skills, experience and the requirements of the employers, the agency was involved in the production of immigrant women as commodities. (At the same it may be argued that a job was a desired outcome for those women.) Accountability requirements (paperwork) led to a fragmentation of the work process among staff members and between the staff and board. (In a recent research study of a wide range of organizations providing services to immigrants, reactions to reporting requirements were described as mixed: reasonable for some, hectic for others and not
problematic at all for some. Individual counselling replaced group counselling sessions (the latter are seen to be an opportunity for reducing isolation and building political awareness among the women) as placement rates became the driving concern for the agency. Hence the initial advocacy impetus for the agency was blunted.

The state's role was one of attempting "to regulate and rationalize labour market demands through contracting out some of its functions to community groups with closer ties to the grassroots" (p. 19). Further through its incorporation and accountability requirements, agency staff were enmeshed in the administrative processes of the state. i.e., the activities of ruling (p. 89). Ng is clearly critical of the systemization, routinization, and standardization that is characteristic of bureaucratic functioning, which, from the point of view of government, enhances manageability of funds and programs. She cautions that community struggles not be limited to the provision of state funded community services but must be extended to include explicitly political and collective activities such as mass protests and building alliances.

In a recent publication examining African, Asian, and Caribbean community-based women's organizations and women's movements in Canada. Agnew (1996) finds support in Canada's multicultural policy for the provision of culturally sensitive services in languages other than English and French. In addition to this policy commitment and prohibitions against discrimination in the Charter of Rights, state agencies have allocated state resources for the funding of social services and advocacy work. At the same time, however, state funding has blunted the abilities of these organizations to be critical of state policies resulting in a "pragmatic, uncritical approach" (p. 171) that couches issues, not in terms of racial and gender discrimination, but in terms of equal opportunity and equal access.

As Agnew finds, the women in these organizations are diverse in terms of their
consciousness of feminism, and no doubt in their analysis of racism. It is not surprising then that their critiques are voiced in terms of the everyday realities of funding applications and client needs. It may be more accurate to locate this emphasis on equal opportunities as the legacy of the liberal/social democratic political strategies which dominated the new social movements such as the feminist and Afro-American political movements during the 1960s and 1970s (hooks, 1984; Gilroy, 1992). Alternatively as has been suggested by Joppke (1996), it may be that there is a tension between intellectuals’ critical interpretation of the immigrant experience and immigrants’ own interpretation:

The immigrant perspective contradicts the anticolonial perspective advocated by multiculturalism: immigration is voluntary, individual and in its factual attraction to the host society a powerful reaffirmation of the latter; anticolonialism, by contrast depicts the incorporation of new members as forced and collective, and it calls for a fundamental transformation of the host society’s structure and principles. To put it drastically, immigrants say “we are actors.” whereas the anticolonial perspective tells them “you are victims.” (Joppke, 1996, p. 454)

These two studies of immigrant women’s organizations suggest that, despite agency aims of working in the interests of immigrant women, there are limits to what may be accomplished through state funded community services.

**Class Formation**

Indra’s (1987) account of Southeast Asian (Vietnamese, Vietnamese Chinese, Lao and Khmer) refugee organizations illustrates Helly’s (1993) point about creating new elites. She argues that, as a consequence of the “demand” for community organizations and middlemen, certain elements within these ethnic communities possessing political resources (such as high socio-economic status) acquired prominence.

Given the various and multifaceted needs of refugees, certain questions needed to be answered: who would define and prioritize, for policy and program purposes, what were important
refugee needs; what would be the responsibility of government and voluntary settlement workers; and how would refugees' access to settlement services be determined?

Her overarching premise is that the answers to these questions about refugee needs and government and voluntary sector responsibilities involved a political struggle amongst refugees, government workers and voluntary agency settlement staff. As we might expect, the balance of power amongst these competing groups was highly skewed with refugees themselves possessing the least power to define their needs, given language barriers and unfamiliarity with Canadian bureaucratic processes.

Indra claims that in a sociological sense it was the classic case of the difficulties faced by a centralized, well-established bureaucracy required to adapt pre-existing programs to situations they were not initially designed for. (This does not explain why the same difficulties persist.)

Indra stresses that, through its need for bilingual workers and translators, CEIC affected the growth of Indochinese middlemen who were to become cultural brokers mediating governmental expectations and refugees' needs. The Department of the Secretary of State through its Multiculturalism Grants Program also provided funding for the formation of Indochinese associations as part of its operating philosophy to support ethnoracial organizations as part of the cultural pluralism promulgated in the Multiculturalism Act. Provincially funded voluntary settlement agencies also encouraged the formation of Indochinese organizations seeing them as a means of alleviating refugee alienation and culture shock and as a potential base of community based social services. Thus the understanding of “community” comes into question. Community may refer to a geographically defined locality, to professional activists representing marginalized groups, or to the voluntary sector organizations which represent and service them. Inherent in all of these conceptions is an “intimate, close and rooted image of the community”,
"the organic wholeness" of a "natural social unit", which ignores the variables of class, gender (Anthias & Yuval-Davis. 1992) and ethnicity (Matsuoka & Sorenson, 1991).

Despite ISO's greater understanding of and responsiveness to refugees (in contrast to the brokered and ethnocentric understandings of "mainstream government workers") in Indra's view:

...a primary ideological role of the immigrant settlement agency was to further legitimate particular government perspectives...the understanding gulf between government and non-government settlement workers was frequently so great that the latter's input had to be framed largely in terms of the former's worldview to be understood at all. Moreover...immigrant settlement agencies were almost entirely dependent on government financial support...which came with demands for accountability framed in governmental bureaucratic terms. (Indra, 1987, p.157)

Demands for increased funding legitimated government programs by reducing questions of programs' inadequacy to questions of money instead of program objectives.

Indra's secondary thesis focuses on the rise of middlemen, usually former immigrants, well-educated, bicultural and bilingual individuals who fill the roles of translators, interpreters and field workers. Indra describes the lack of Lao and Khmer individuals who could function as middlemen, in comparison with the Vietnamese community which had some immigration to Canada in the early seventies.

As a result Lao and Khmer refugee experience was subsumed under the Vietnamese refugee experience as framed by Vietnamese middlemen. Similarly, the Vietnamese Chinese experience was presented as synonymous with that of the Vietnamese. Vietnamese middlemen could undercommunicate certain problems because of lack of training about personal and familial issues, or to preserve the good name of the community, or may not have been privy to the personal problems of the Vietnamese Chinese, Khmer or Laotians.

Indra notes that, due to external influences, the creation of Vietnamese organizations took on the particular characteristics of a Canadian non-profit organization rather than a structure
more akin to Vietnamese cultural traditions. Dorais, Foster and Stockley (1994) also note that Canadian multiculturalism is sometimes criticized for blocking authentic forms of ‘ethnic’ agency, thereby encouraging, to some extent, the political marginalisation of immigrant organizations and individuals. The dominance in the organization of a Vietnamese middle class who interact well with governmental power brokers meant that demands presented were never confrontational and never threatened governmental definitions.

The question of funding community organizations and the creation of a group of people whom Indra has termed “middlemen” is addressed in a very interesting fashion by the British scholar, Paul Gilroy. Gilroy (1992) identifies in Britain the existence of a group of black people, a proto-middle class, dedicated to an antiracist project but whose remuneration originates from state institutions. In this group there are three tendencies in proposing antiracist solutions. One strand, rooted in social democratic interventions, is committed to questions of policy notably around equal opportunity, rather than questions of politics. A second group is emphatically culturalist, emphasizing ethnic particularity and arguing for cultural relativism. The third tendency has been to collapse race and class and seek solutions in class politics. According to Gilroy,

these diverse yet inter-dependent groupings share a statist conception of antiracism. In making the local state the main vehicle for advancing antiracist politics they have actively confused and confounded the black community’s capacity for autonomous self-organization. Here, we must make an assessment of the politics of funding community organizations and the dependency which that creates. (Gilroy, 1992, p. 60).

With regard to ISOs then, it must be asked whether ISOs have other aspirations which have been abandoned, and whether they have become merely managers of government services.

Anthias and Yuval-Davis (1992), in their work on Britain, have found that community representatives on the boards of voluntary organizations tend to be part of a network of activists,
already employed in similar organizations because there are practical problems in finding community representatives (for example, how to establish who would be representative and by what means could they be elected). In the Canadian context, Agnew (1996) writes, "agencies and organizations represent working-class women, but middle class women assume the organizational and administrative roles. They are the members of the boards, the spokeswomen, and the community workers and counsellors" (p. 110). Anthias and Yuval-Davis caution that perhaps it is best to speak of community advocates, or community-based service deliverers rather than representatives. In terms of the political process, Dei (1996c) adds that mere representation is insufficient; a voice of difference is necessary.

**Summary**

The studies examined above imply that state funding has made it possible to secure advantages for disenfranchised groups but not without costs. Conclusions about state/ISO relations vary: state policy has created an effective policy constituency and has legitimated lobby groups (e.g., Whitaker, 1991); state policies assume cohesion but not divisions within communities (e.g., Matsuoka & Sorenson, 1991); state policies have influenced class formation by creating new political elites (e.g., Indra, 1987); and state funding policies structure ISO service activities in unanticipated ways (e.g., Ng, 1988). There is the risk that the role of the voluntary board shifts from representing the populations the organization was established to serve to that of liaising with relevant bodies and multiple funders. In the process grant application, fundraising, and financial management skills become more highly valued than representativeness, notwithstanding the problem of determining who is representative. Further, the funding process may have narrowed agencies into service provision or specific kinds of service provision.
Most significantly perhaps, through the coalescence of broader social movements and state policies (e.g., multiculturalism), race and ethnicity have been reified as social markers of disenfranchisement—the status that permits access to public resources. As Sivanandan (1991) has argued, larger political struggles such as economic change have slipped into the background.

Conclusion

As demonstrated in Chapter Two, recent writings on voluntary organizations and the state question the supposition of antagonistic relations between the two sectors. Investigations into the sphere of state/minority relations in Canada suggest that ISOs are in part a policy community created and maintained by the state and occupying intermediary positions of influence. Hence the organizations must be understood as both actors and policy beneficiaries. In the resultant discourse of immigrant needs, little attention has been paid to resettlement and culturally specific social services as a form of community governance, and a structural component of a plural society. As Kanneh describes. "'Cultural pluralism' promotes a notion of separate but already equal co-existence - equal, that is, in terms of civil, legal and economic rights, but distinct in terms of familial, religious and social life" (Kanneh, 1995, p. 70). Thus diversity is tolerated in the 'private sphere' primarily. Where there is acceptance for publicly supported separate institutions, for example, ISOs and cultural associations, this support is premised upon the notion of sustaining minority cultures as places of socialization and retreat from a harsh, individualistic and competitive society. ISOs and ethnic associations are not regarded as places of equal opportunity or community self governance made necessary by relations of power and institutional racism.

Desai (1996) observes, "There is yet no vocal lobby in Canada espousing separatism as a solution to racism. The lobby is overwhelmingly for access and accommodation" (Desai, p. 250).
There is the danger that the emphasis by ISOs on their ability to provide culturally appropriate services may have resulted in technical and professional solutions to problems (e.g., cross cultural competencies, multicultural specialists) rather than political solutions which address the structural position of ethnoracial communities (Stubbs, 1993). Thus, in some respects the troublesome question of creating social policy on the basis of arbitrary definitions of community and culture is averted. Such policies and programs assume a commonality of interests among members that is likely nonexistent.

There has been an overwhelming emphasis on short term reception services with merely ad hoc programs in the “integration” stage and economic integration interpreted as rapid entry into the labour force predominates. Although much attention is paid to the need for culturally appropriate services, the absence of broader policy discussions suggests the implicit assumption that immigrants will adapt to the dominant social norms and utilize “mainstream” services; or that the issue will be taken up at local levels (e.g., the United Way of Greater Toronto now requires that every member agency develop and implement antiracism policies).

Clearly there are legitimate questions regarding the degree to which a government funded system can support professionally delivered services for each community, and whether such arrangements facilitate social integration or social segregation. Further the pressures caused by migration are not experienced to the same degree in all regions, raising questions about implementation where there are no ‘economies of scale.’ (This is especially true of Canada where larger urban centres receive the bulk of migration.) However, even limited initiatives such as those that ensure the availability of trained interpreters are discretionary. (For example, in Australia a multilingual telephone translation line has been established.)

What are we to make of the fact that the empirical support of research findings is
furnished for each of the positions (e.g., social control by the state versus the relative autonomy of NGOs) taken by the various authors? Is this the condition of post modern society characterized by paradox, uncertainty, suspense and difference as Leonard asks (1990)? Or are some arguments and analyses more convincing than others?

There are certainly differences in approach and emphases in the various bodies of literature that have been reviewed. Comparative analyses of the voluntary sector accentuate the role of social movements, social classes, and other extra parliamentary groups (such as voluntary organizations) in accounting for variations in social welfare provision between countries. Proponents of the social control thesis view things otherwise. In Ng’s (1988) depiction capitalist development produces immigrant women by drawing them to centres of industrial development away from their native livelihood. Further, classifying them as dependents has had specific consequences for their lives, for example, lack of access to language and job training which results in their participation in marginal and low paying jobs. In her account state and labour market processes are methodologically central (see p. 14), while Agnew’s account is much more of what has been characterised as a “history-from-below” approach (Benhabib. 1992).

In response to Leonard’s question above, yes, we live in complex times where monocausal explanations are inadequate. Social control and social reproduction theses tend to flatten out the contradictory nature of social phenomenon, projecting too total a vision of domination and oppression (Weiler, 1988). They may also undermine the pursuit of social change since the outcome is predetermined.

The case study presented herein reopens these issues by detailing the programs and services offered by an immigrant women’s organization, the values inherent in the programs, the constituencies affected by the programs, who the key decision-makers are and what the decision-
making processes are. whether the social problems to which programs are addressed changed over time. and finally. what the implications are for community organizations?
ENDNOTES

1. Hawkins (1987) has identified the same predicament in Canada.

2. In her 1988 study Jenkins noted the change in American ideology: from an earlier notion supporting desegregation in schools on the basis that education could not be separate and equal, to a position that equality can only be achieved from a base of being separate.

3. Planned immigration from 1947 to the present has been clearly driven by the varying economic imperatives of the country for labour and investment. However, in the view of the Economic Council, historical perspective gives little or no support to the view that immigration is needed for economic prosperity. In the 19th and early 20th century the fastest growth in per capita real incomes occurred at times of little or no immigration; later in the 20th century the opposite is true. Therefore there appears to be no long term correlation. The consistent link is between unemployment and immigration—immigrants are more numerous when times are prosperous than when they are not. In sum, the good and the bad times cause immigration to fluctuate not the other way around.

4. This statement is as true now as it was in 1972. The former NDP government of Ontario was pursuing an immigration agreement with Ottawa to resolve a variety of issues, including health costs for refugee claimants, medical inadmissibility criteria, English language training for immigrant children, etc.

5. Currently the federal government is key player in the provision of settlement language training, however the former NDP government of Ontario was pressing for greater fiscal involvement in language training in schools arguing that costs have risen as a result of federal policies including refugee determination procedures. The current Conservative government has indicated that it would like federal contributions to the legal aid for refugee and immigration cases.

6. With regard to immigrants, currently access issues are those related to language, and levels of benefits in the case of sponsorship breakdown.

7. Hawkins (1985) also noted the confusing separation of immigrant concerns within two federal departments; Anderson & Marr (1987) mention the "battery of services" provided by municipalities and voluntary organizations, in addition to provincial and federal governments.

8. This argument finds support elsewhere. For example, according to Dr. Irving Abella, a member of the Royal Commission on Bilingualism and Biculturalism, the Multiculturalism Act was conceived in part, as a means of persuading ethnoracial communities to buy into a bilingual vision of Canada (I. Abella, conference remarks, February 4, 1995).

9. Matsuoka and Sorenson (1991) and Teram and White (1994) in academic social work writings also advocate collaboration between mainstream and immigrant serving organizations at the same time as they enumerate the barriers to such collaboration.
10. On this issue George and Michalski's (1996) report, sponsored by Citizenship and Immigration Canada, did not distinguish between the responses from community-based organizations and larger or mainstream organizations providing services to immigrants.

11. See Cambridge A.X. & Feuchtwang, S. (1990) for an alternative view of labour migration which stresses the distinctiveness of national economies rather than the ideal needs of an economic structure. See also Forment (1996), for a discussion of migration due to second class status of groups within their own homeland.
CHAPTER FOUR

METHODOLOGY

Review of Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this descriptive study is an investigation into the role of immigrant serving organizations in the Canadian welfare state. A comparative review of theoretical and empirical literature on voluntary organizations in the welfare state reveals a preoccupation with: policy concerns such as the service delivery functions of voluntary organizations vis-a-vis state-provided services, and the consequences of state funding for these organizations. At the same time, a study of policy making and state/minority community relations in Canada reveals contradictory effects for both state and community. In synthesizing these two bodies of literature a fairly extensive picture of the range of influences in the immigrant service sector was attained.

In 1987 Indra commented that there were few detailed analyses of present day immigrant organizations, despite assertions that these organizations play an important role in the integration of immigrant groups. She also lamented the absence of any examinations of the political forces shaping immigrant communities. Since then Ng’s 1988 book, a case study of an immigrant women’s employment organization, was published. Ng uses a neo-Marxist framework to understand how the agency, in appearance an independent community organization, functioned as an extension of the coordinated activities of the state. While acknowledging the state to be an arena of contestation, Ng investigates how state funding serves to dissipate dissention and maintain class domination while meeting the practical need of immigrant women for jobs.

Agnew’s (1996) more recent review of immigrant women’s organizations is based upon interviews with community activists and service providers from Asia, Africa and the Caribbean. One of the strengths of her book is its acknowledgment of the diversity among activists, and
within communities and community-based organizations. She also acknowledges tensions such as: the middle class background of service providers in contrast to their working class clients; community workers who see their work as just a job while others see it as an expression of their political commitment; and racist behaviours towards residents exhibited by staff in shelters for immigrant women. As seen in the last chapter, Agnew contends that government funding blunts criticism and the espousal of radical or militant politics on the part of activists. (This is Agnew's conclusion; it is not evident whether or not she asked her informants to comment on her perception.) Her finding contradicts my own experience of attending meetings (as a governmental representative) where community representatives were quite outspoken in their criticism of governmental initiatives.

The findings of both of these authors represent the conventional wisdom of left critiques, as expressed in the phraseology, "in the final analysis x predominates", where one may substitute for x a number of alternatives including the state, capitalism, the ruling class, etc. This kind of thinking is worrisome for its implied disempowering fatalism, despite the evident liberatory intentions of the authors. Ng writes, "As I see it, the analyst's responsibility is to make visible the structural constraints within which groups have to operate" (Ng, 1988, p. 99). Perhaps Ng had greater expectations for the organization than members themselves had for the organization. As Agnew points out, some of the women working in these organizations see what they do as work, not as social change.

My perspective is to surface the "messiness" and resist easy conclusions about ISOs and the state. Thus in analysing the possibilities and limits to state support, close scrutiny is paid to liberal elements such as particular governmental actors and programs. In providing an account of the evolution of the welfare state and government policy on immigration and settlement I have
taken a "polity-centred" (Skocpol, 1995) approach which, counter to the conventional wisdom of governmental antipathy to immigrants, underscores, for example, the continuation of relatively high immigration levels.

Questions guiding the inquiry are: what are the core features of ISOs, what factors explain these core features, what role(s) do ISOs play in meeting community needs, and what dynamics propel changes in the organization? A single case study approach was utilized to explore these questions.

**Description of Methodology**

Methodological discussions occur at varying levels of abstraction: in philosophical terms, in ideological terms, and in methodological terms (Smith, 1981). Level I, the disciplinary point of view, is that constellation of conceptual, value, social and philosophical elements which defines the nature of the phenomenon, the purpose of the discipline's activities and its social and historical context. Level II, the paradigm level, directs the nature of scientific or investigative activities. It is at this level that debates take place over experimental/naturalistic inquiry, between objectivist and subjectivist epistemologies. At Level III strategies are operationalised and theories are developed as to how research should proceed, resulting in research models. Finally at Level IV, the methods or techniques for gathering evidence are prescribed. The preceding literature review, a Level I discussion, has revealed predominant themes. The next section briefly reviews Levels II to IV in relation to case study research.

**Case Study Research**

Case studies may be undertaken utilizing either quantitative or qualitative methods. Qualitative research is characterized by its use of words rather than numbers, allowing for highly contextualized studies which detail the natural setting where the research project is located, and
permits a holistic appraisal that attends to all features of the experience (Sherman & Webb, 1988). Judgements or appraisals aimed at enhancing understanding are made through descriptions of phenomena and reasoned interpretations of the significance of phenomena. There is often a concern for depicting the situation from the perspective of those being studied in an attempt to better understand the phenomenon. Critical qualitative researchers may question those understandings, offering alternative understandings.

Among those engaged in qualitative research there are those whose approach is deductive and those who favour a more inductive strategy. Yin advises the prudent use of theory to develop propositions for guiding the research strategy and speaks of generalization in terms of the ability of the case to enhance theory (Yin, 1989). In contrast, Stake (1994) emphasizes the use of case studies where interest is not in theory building but in the intrinsic and the particular, the case or object of study. Yin accentuates the discounting of alternative explanations as a means of establishing internal and external validity. For Stake, the issue is to reduce misinterpretation through redundancy in data gathering and procedural challenges to explanations.

Stake's constructivist approach underscores the reader's preexisting knowledge and individual reading of the case, and argues therefore that the researcher must provide grounds for validating observations and generalizations to try and ensure the transfer of knowledge. For Yin, the concern with validating observations stems from the need to satisfy "reliability" requirements, (i.e., that, following the same procedures, another researcher would replicate the findings).

Common to both are: the existence of subsections (Stake) or units (Yin) within cases; the use of conceptual structures (Stake) or theoretical propositions (Yin) as an aid to knowledge acquisition; and triangulation (Stake) or multiple sources of evidence (Yin), etc.

A case study approach was well-suited to this inquiry because the study focuses upon the
dynamics of one organization’s interactions with various constituencies. Hence it is a well bounded system (Merriam, 1988). A single in depth case study reveals these dynamics where a multiple case study would yield an overwhelming amount of data and number of variables since there are clearly many salient dimensions to the question of how ISOs operate, including variables generic to the sector and particular to the organization. Following Stake’s (1994) definition, this case study was undertaken for instrumental reasons (i.e., to further an understanding of ISOs and to explore the relevance of certain theoretical issues to a particular setting, in this case, an immigrant women’s centre) and is, therefore, closer to Yin’s approach to case study research.

Introduction to the Centre

The Centre is located in the central-west part of the City of Toronto, has been in existence since 1976, originating in the activities of a group of immigrant women who had been meeting to address their employment needs. The length of the agency’s existence makes it an appropriate research site in that the initial start-up problems common to new organizations have been overcome. It is a medium sized organization (10 full- and part- time, permanent and contract employees) which responds to both newcomer needs and those of immigrants beyond the initial settlement period. The Centre is typical of many ISOs in its core programs of initial settlement services (e.g., information and referral, language training, etc.) offered to Portuguese and Spanish speaking women. The Portuguese and the Spanish communities have resided in Toronto for different lengths of time with the Portuguese speaking community, unlike the Spanish speaking community, receiving little new immigration. Like other organizations committed to women, over the years the Centre has utilized the model of support groups as a preferred mode of service delivery because of its potential for consciousness raising. More atypical were its activities
during the 1980s which included innovative initiatives such as a collective management structure, a nontraditional employment training program for immigrant women and an unsuccessful dressmakers' cooperative.

The choice of the Centre as a field site was the result of three additional factors: I knew some of the current staff members, having worked in immigrant services in Toronto for some ten years and had worked with previous staff members during the 1980s. I anticipated therefore that entry problems would be lessened. The organization had also been described as one that supported research initiatives. Finally, I wanted to study an organization that provided services in a language I possessed some facility in, in this case Spanish.

Design of the Study

The key questions in the research design are summarized in Table 2.
TABLE 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key question</th>
<th>Variables to be investigated</th>
<th>Data sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 a) What are the core features of the Centre?</td>
<td>• organizational goals&lt;br&gt;• programs and services&lt;br&gt;• interactions with stakeholder groups&lt;br&gt;• client needs&lt;br&gt;• service approach&lt;br&gt;• community relations&lt;br&gt;• relationships with mainstream organizations</td>
<td>• interviews with current board (4) and staff members (5), past board (1) and staff members (1), funders (2), and mainstream service representatives (2)&lt;br&gt;• client feedback (five Portuguese speaking and five Spanish speaking)&lt;br&gt;• review of documents (e.g., mission statements, annual reports, needs assessments)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 b) What role does the Centre play in meeting community needs?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 a) What factors explain these core features?</td>
<td>• socio-historical factors&lt;br&gt;• state/minority community relations&lt;br&gt;• fiscal &amp; accountability relationships&lt;br&gt;• ideological &amp; physical proximity &amp; communication with funders&lt;br&gt;• responding to community needs&lt;br&gt;• adjusting to resource and other decisions made elsewhere&lt;br&gt;• developing alternative modes and strategies to achieve goals</td>
<td>• literature review&lt;br&gt;• board and staff member interviews&lt;br&gt;• review of documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 b) What processes of adjustment operate in the Centre?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data collection

In September 1995 I contacted the interim Executive Director (a maternity leave replacement) who agreed to forward a letter of request to the Board of Directors. A few days later, my request was approved and the data collection process began. Initially, I familiarized myself with the Centre by attending staff meetings to introduce myself and become acquainted with the range of programs being offered. Having become somewhat familiar to staff and
volunteers, I occupied myself by reviewing annual reports, and other documentation such as program evaluations, minutes of staff meetings, minutes of the Board of Directors meeting, etc. I attended the Annual General Meeting in November 1995 where I met some of the Board members I would interview. (See Appendix 1 for letters of introduction and interview guides.)

Both staff and Board members were approached first in a letter introducing myself, the purpose of the study, and outlining procedures for ensuring confidentiality. The five current staff members interviewed included the two Settlement Counsellors, the Direct Services Assistant/Welfare Worker, the Training Program Manager, and the Executive Director. Names of board members (four) were suggested by the Interim Executive Director, and included the outgoing President of the 1994/95 Board (Portuguese speaking), the incoming President of the 1995/96 Board (Portuguese speaking), a non-immigrant Board member, and a Spanish speaking Board member. The history and early dynamics of the Centre were related by a past Board member, and a former client/Board member/staff member.

Two funding representatives, one of federally funded English language training classes, and the other, a provincial project officer for a joint federal/provincial employment training program were interviewed (one in person and the other by telephone). I also attended an agency visit (a meeting with the settlement staff) by a representative of a major funding body. The mainstream or generic service providers contacted were an organization the Centre has worked with for over ten years and an educational institution with whom the Centre cosponsored a 28 week training program. One of these interviews was conducted in person and the other telephone. Notes were taken for telephone interviews. All face to face interviews were tape recorded and transcribed.

Interviewing clients proved challenging. Speaking only limited Spanish and no
Portuguese, I paid a part time staff member and former placement student to contact clients to explain the purpose of the study and to invite them to a focus group interview. Names of clients were provided by the settlement counsellors. TTC tokens and refreshments were provided for the women, and in the case of the Spanish speaking women, a small donation was made to their support group. Seven Spanish speaking women attended the focus group held at the library across the street from where the Centre is located. In the Spanish speaking group the women were interviewed by a volunteer from the Centre who had translated my questions. We decided that if the women had anything critical to say, they would be less likely to say it in the presence of a staff member, hence the choice of a volunteer. The focus group was tape recorded and translated later on. Since I speak some Spanish I was able to follow some of the discussion.

The Portuguese women were harder to reach. A group of twenty women were contacted by a Portuguese student who had completed her community work placement at the Centre during 1995/96. Eight promised to attend and two women were unsure. We estimated that five or six would come. Only two women attended. Again the questions were posed in Portuguese and tape recorded. Having no comprehension of Portuguese, I was fully dependent upon the translation of the tape. With the help of the settlement counsellor, and the 1996/97 placement student, a second focus group was arranged. Although two women attended, one had to leave because of a family emergency. To supplement the three interviews, I was given permission to use the evaluation data collected in questionnaire format by the Centre during September and October 1996.

Data Analysis

Several methods for qualitative data analysis are recommended in the literature. For example, Miles and Huberman (1984) outline a variety of techniques such as clustering, matrices, metaphors, splitting variables, factoring, triangulation, etc. Tesch (1990) offers detailed
steps in developing an organizing system for unstructured data, first by listing topics according to content, then clustering topics, then grouping them to establish categories as the basis for more interpretive codes. The data is then reexamined in light of these codes. Merriam (1988) describe Lincoln and Guba's (1985) approach, that is, to "unitize" the data by marking units of information which are then sorted in relation to each other.

The search for both specificity and generality entailed considering the data in its own right (the Centre as its own complex reality) and also in relation to theory and themes arising in the literature review. With regard to the latter, certain questions were central to the interview protocols, for example, client needs, relationships with funders and other community and mainstream organizations. After the document review and as the interviews proceeded, questions pertaining to the Centre's particular dynamics were added, for example, the issue of the different service needs of Portuguese and Spanish speaking clients, and the tensions around the level of services and workers for the two communities.

The first step in the data analysis involved reviewing documents such as minutes of meetings, evaluation reports and the like. Notes and photocopies were taken when the content was related to themes guiding the study. These documents also alerted to me to additional queries for the interviews and likely key informants. For example, it seemed appropriate to interview a representative from a mainstream organization that the Centre had been involved with for some time.

Because the interviews were semi-structured a fairly "straightforward" method seemed appropriate. Transcripts were first labelled or coded according to content, then cut up and sorted into file folders. Each unit of information was marked making it possible to identify the speaker and where the unit was excerpted from in the interview. The units of data within each folder were
then sorted in relation to each other. Where units of data applied to more than one theme, these were photocopied and placed in the appropriate folder. The units of data from the document analysis were also placed in the same folders. As will be seen in the next chapter, in triangulating the data I have utilized published literature, document analysis and interviews.
ENDNOTES

1. Federally funded ESL and skills training programs are generally multicultural rather than ethnospecific.
CHAPTER FIVE

FINDINGS

This chapter introduces findings from the data interwoven with a discussion of findings from the literature. Following a historical overview of the Centre, data is presented in terms of the Centre's relationships with its four major constituencies (clients, the 'community,' funders, and mainstream organizations). As seen in the literature review these categories represent crucial features of ISOs. Additional themes arising out of the data constitute the final part of the analysis. These latter themes were not suggested by the literature; they constitute the specificity of this case.

In presenting the data I have indicated the speaker's position in place of using names. For example, board member, settlement worker, etc.

The Centre: An Overview

The Centre is one of three service agencies in Metropolitan Toronto whose client base are primarily Portuguese speaking, and one of four organizations serving the Spanish speaking community (although there are Portuguese and Spanish speaking workers at multicultural agencies). 1996 was the Centre's twentieth year of operation. The chronology following provides highlights from the years 1974 to 1984-85 and was compiled by the Centre to commemorate its tenth anniversary.

1974

- A group of Brazilian, Black, Chinese and Spanish women met to discuss the creation of an employment counselling centre for immigrant women.
- A needs assessment was conducted at the same time that a drop-in centre to provide primarily labour-related counselling and information was established.

1976

- A split occurred at the Centre with the Portuguese and Spanish-speaking workers
forming an organization which became known as the Centre, a collectively run centre, offering counselling, advocacy, referrals, escort services and educational workshops.

- The Chinese, Italian and West Indian workers formed another organization under the sponsorship of another immigrant women's centre, later becoming an independent organization (still in existence).

1977-78
- The Centre initiated a research study into the skills-training needs of Portuguese and Spanish-speaking women in 1977, resulting in the creation of an agency which began operation in September 1978. The agency was established to provide training to improve the employment skills of the women thereby creating alternatives to cleaning and factory work.

1979-80
- A Mental Health Support Group was formed as a preventative measure to provide emotional support for isolated women after a review of social services in Metropolitan Toronto revealed the lack of services available for non-English speakers. The groups were run for 15 weeks, 3 times during the year and included an ESL component.
- The Centre provided staff support to a group of Portuguese women dressmakers who had begun to meet and work there.

1980-81
- Continuation of the Mental Health Group with discussion topics geared to the changing needs of the women along with ESL instruction.
- A grant secured under the Canada Community Development Project enabled a garment making cooperative enterprise to employ six Portuguese dressmakers along with a full-time business coordinator.
• A Clothing Drop Box was set up for clients and those in need to help them cope with the effects of economic recession.

• A volunteer led program for Spanish speaking children - Creative Expression through Dance - provided children with the opportunity to explore the creative arts and Hispanic culture.

• In conjunction with an immigrant women’s advocacy organization, the Centre sponsored a feasibility study into the creation of the first shelter in Canada designed around the needs of abused non-English speaking women.

1981-82
• As a result of increased demand for ESL instruction, ESL classes were established in addition to those associated with the support groups.

• A child-parent drop-in centre ran for 6 months at a library.

• A market analysis conducted for the garment cooperative resulted in a business plan for the cooperative. LEAP funding secured for 3 years.

• Start-up of a resource library on immigrant women.

1982-83
• The ESL classes were expanded and citizenship ESL classes were added.

• The garment cooperative became separately incorporated.

• The Centre is an active member of the Immigrant Women’s Shelter Advisory Task Force.

• A Canada Works summer project allows for the development of visual training materials developed for bilingual ESL classes.

1983-84
• In addition to again expanding the ESL class offerings, Citizenship classes were held, as well as a new program of ESL Employment Options for Immigrant Women.
A Canada Works project enabled the development of instructional software to be used in a computer literacy course for immigrant women, to be offered in conjunction with a large community centre in 1985.

A training program in electronic testing is offered in cosponsorship with a college to provide training to allow immigrant women to move into higher waged occupations.

A series of workshops on Nontraditional Occupations for Women are held.

Parenting workshops based upon slide/tape and written materials in Spanish and Portuguese were offered.

Women's support groups, including one for Spanish speaking seniors, are formed as an outgrowth of the Mental Health Groups.

1984-85

- The 'nontrad' training program offers tester and assembler programs.
- ESL computer literacy classes are held at a large community centre
- Work on the Immigrant Women's Shelter Advisory Task Force continues.
- ESL classes and women's groups continue.

The following record of the Centre's second decade was compiled from Annual Reports.

1985-86

Annual Report unavailable

1986-87

Programs consist of:

- 6 ESL classes
- Spanish speaking seniors group and the Portuguese women's group
- Counselling services
- Placement rate for 'nontrad' training program of 96% at wages that are 57% higher than the women's previous wages
• Participation in the Advocates for Community-Based Training & Education for Women (ACTEW), Coalition for a Just Refugee Immigration Policy, Hispanic Social Development Council (HSDC), Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants (OCASI), Ontario Immigrant Women's Network (OIWN), Portuguese Interagency Network (PIN), WWIW

1987-88
• Hiring of an Executive Director and move to a hierarchical structure

(The earliest memories of the current staff date back to 1987 when the senior Portuguese counsellor was first hired.)

1988/89
• Continuation of the Portuguese women's group and a group for Spanish speaking seniors

• Conducted a research study into the electronics industry resulting in the discontinuation of tester program

• Skills training program for social assistance recipients

• Language training classes

• Published a health manual for Spanish seniors

• Initiated a newsletter for Portuguese women

• Income tax clinic

• Member of the Charter Challenge Committee to obtain a ruling on federal language training eligibility criteria and its impact on immigrant women

• Participated in City of Toronto Community Reference Group, the Employment Standards Group of Parkdale Legal Clinic, OCASI.

1989/90
Annual Report unavailable

1990/91
• In conjunction with the United Way, a Volunteer Leadership Development
Program is offered for Spanish and Portuguese women

• A pre-apprenticeship bridging program (math and English upgrading)

• A multicultural women's group

• Spanish speaking seniors’ group

• Settlement counselling

• Language classes

• Income tax clinic

• Participation in ACTEW, Canadian Multilingual Literacy Centre, OCASI, OIWN, PIN, Portuguese Women's Coalition.

1991/92 Annual Report unavailable

1992/93

• Expansion of settlement services with funds made available to help clients secure social assistance

• Employment training programs reduced due to federal funding cuts

• A new short term preparation for employment workshop series offered

• ESL classes

• Income tax clinic

1993/94

• Two family violence support groups and the Spanish speaking Senior women's group

• ESL classes

• Co-sponsored, with a city college, a new Building Maintenance/Superintendent training program for immigrant men and women receiving unemployment insurance or social assistance

• Income tax clinic
• Participation in ACTEW, Barbra Schlifer Cultural Interpreter Program Advisory Committee (BSCIP), Community Health Board, ESL Coordinators Group, HSDC, Justice for Graciela, PIN, Ontario Association of Women's Centres.

1994/95

• Settlement counselling provided on a one-to-one basis, and through monthly information sessions
• Two family violence prevention workshops
• Support groups for assaulted women in Spanish and Portuguese
• Portuguese women's peer support group and Spanish- speaking Seniors’ Group
• Income tax clinic
• Employment training programs included the completion of the Building Maintenance/Superintendent training program for men and women, Computer Skills/Job Search for women cosponsored by the Toronto Board of Education, and the Home Day Care Provider training program for women on social assistance offered in conjunction with Canadian Mothercraft Society and the Metropolitan Toronto Separate School Board

• Participation in ACTEW, BSCIP, HCSD, International Women's Day Coalition, Latin American Coalition for the Eradication of Violence, OCASI, Ontario Association of Women's Centre's, Wallace Emerson Community Centre Advisory Committee, West End Interagency Network.

The Early Years

The Centre's activist orientation during its first ten years of operation years is evident. For example, from its inception in the mid-1970s, Paolo Freire's *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (1970) was identified as the educative strategy to be used in the Centre. Freire's literacy work with
Brazilian peasants utilized visual aids and political consciousness raising. This same perspective was utilized in curriculum materials developed by the Centre. The approach continued into the 1980s under the influence of three staff members who were studying Freire's work at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. Staff meeting minutes from the early years of the organization identify as a key criterion in Board, staff and volunteer selection the requirement that they be committed to the empowerment of women by helping them to recognize their strengths and taking steps to direct their own lives. The Centre operated as a collective between 1976 to 1988/89.

From 1980 onwards there has been regular participation in the International Women's Day March, bringing women who spoke little or no English to march under the Working Women banner at a time when there was comparatively little participation by immigrant women in the mainstream women's movement (Das Gupta, 1986). In the 1981/82 fiscal year the Centre was unionized which, according to that year's annual report, recognized "the principle that all workers have the right to organize themselves to negotiate their working conditions collectively and join with other groups of organized workers in the struggle for better conditions for all workers" (p. 2). Even today, few ISOs are unionized.

The Centre also provides services to male family members of their women clients. Still a majority of programming is directed towards women. To decrease barriers for their women clients attempts have been made to provide child care for as many group programs as possible. Similarly Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) tickets are provided. The Centre has also attempted to foster a sense of community among clients through the organization of annual social and recreational events aimed at families: since 1980, an Annual Dinner and Dance; since 1981, an annual Christmas Party; and since 1982, an annual picnic at Niagara Falls.
The Transitional Years

Evident in 1986/87 Annual Report is a shift to a shorter, more sophisticated visual presentation, and less of a focus on using the publication to present problems and issues faced by clients and struggles over government policies. Minutes of the Finance Committee note that the change was undertaken so that the Report would be more attractive to funders and foundations, presaging a concern with professionalism in the management of the Centre. (As well it would be easier to translate a shortened version into Spanish and Portuguese as per the United Way's direction, making the report accessible to the membership.)

1988/1989 was a watershed year for the Centre when the present Executive Director was hired in the transition from a collective to a "modified hierarchy." The new management structure was accompanied by staff changes and a significant 'changing of the guard.' According to a former staff member, the collective structure had grown unwieldy. At one point staff members had rotated job functions resulting in people being assigned to tasks they were not motivated to do (e.g., counsellors having to draw up budgets and funding applications).

As the number of employees grew, decision-making and staff meetings had become increasingly time consuming. Minutes of a staff meeting record a staff member's opinion that relationships among agency personnel were strained due to ideological differences between those who "have a Marxist ideology and some [who] just want to work in a capitalist society.” There were also feelings of isolation on the part of the staff located at the Immigrant Women Into Electronics (IWIE) Program physically located in Humber College, some distance from the Centre. Staff meeting minutes note that the training program staff felt that the Centre's Christmas Party was inappropriate for its clients, many of whom were not Christian. (Although the clientele for the settlement programs and support groups were Portuguese and Spanish speaking women,
the training programs were not limited to clients of any one ethnoracial group.)

The change in organizational structure and a streamlining of management processes resulted in funding increases from a number of the Centre's core funders.

**The Present**

**The role of the centre**

The Centre, as do most organizations, has enumerated a set of organizational goals which have not changed significantly from those articulated in 1976, with the exception that earlier organizational goals referred only to immigrant women and did not specify Portuguese and Spanish speaking women. According to the 1995/96 Annual Report the Centre's mission is to provide immigrant women with opportunities to improve the quality of their lives through self-development and community action. The objectives of the Centre are:

- to act as a resource for the immigrant women's community as a whole;
- to facilitate the participation of Portuguese and Spanish speaking women in the community through counselling, settlement and support services;
- to increase employment opportunities for immigrant women and particularly Portuguese and Spanish speaking women, through the provision of language and skills training programs;
- to advocate on behalf of immigrant women for changes in policies affecting their lives; and
- to work with community agencies and organizations to ensure that the current and future needs of immigrant women are met.

Concretely the Centre attempts to assist clients by: meeting basic needs (housing, income, food, clothing); reducing isolation, loneliness, fear; assisting them to become self sufficient and exit social assistance programs; building self confidence and esteem; supporting them in coping effectively with life and family difficulties and transitions; training them in English language
acquisition; and helping them to education, accreditation, and career planning assistance.

When asked about their perceptions of the role of the Centre and ISOs generally, the responses of staff and Board members were most often couched in terms of service delivery to newcomers:

settlement services - providing needed information/orientation to Canadian society

Settlement counselling sounds like a very specific thing, but there's this whole aspect, the human aspect. So it's very hard to say, "Okay you walk in here with your practical problems, your forms and your issues of work, and your issue of applying for a SIN [social insurance] number but everything else you just leave outside." It doesn't work like that and I think that's one of the things that government funding, or funders sometimes have a hard time to understand.

...support, counselling, advocacy, integration, and settlement...Unfortunately there is very little understanding of what these things mean to workers and agencies. For example, everyone should be given an orientation of how the Canadian government works. Adaptation and integration are different for immigrants and refugees. Government has a role to play. When people arrive at the airport they should be given an information package advising them to go to certain agencies that will be able to help them.

Other functions mentioned included client outcomes such as: the political representation of constituents - “representation of immigrant women's issues through advocacy and lobbying”; the provision of personal counselling services - “support for clients who and are now unemployed after years in the workforce: the Centre cannot provide jobs but they are able to provide emotional support”; “personal counselling to assist women with family crises and situations of abuse”; the provision of role models - “to give them [clients] the optimism also that we made it so they can make it too”; empowerment - “by listening to women, helping them make changes, and teaching them the skills to negotiate Canadian society, they develop their own voice”; and mediation - “You are in between the needy and the powerful (workers in welfare, housing, etc.) who can really provide the answer for the needs.”

For staff there is the opportunity for on the job training - “staff employed at the Centre in
training positions have acquired skills enabling them to get better jobs.” From Board members we hear about indirect outcomes:

• the orientation to and experience in decision making processes - “participation on the Board of the Centre provides the opportunity to learn ‘how to do business here in Canada...how things work’”

• development of political leadership skills - “community organizations give women, like [two Liberal Members of Parliament], a chance to learn skills and knowledge of the political processes that may allow them to integrate into the political arena”

• the opportunity for voluntarism - “the opportunity to help your community”

• a new area of work - after obtaining help from one of the counsellors. “I started volunteer work at the Centre and found it was quite important for me, because it was a place I could go and find people who spoke my language, and who understood my background as a refugee and as a woman. It was a very important step in my life in Canada. I continued to do some volunteer work and had the opportunity to do some training...I became very interested in the work...I took a position on the Board of Directors and finally with all my learning, I was able to secure a job as a counsellor at [another Centre]. I think the Centre was really important in helping me get a job in that area”

• the chance to pursue social change strategies such as community economic development - “working locally with issues that get you at the global issues of economic systems and exploitation of people and the earth...” and “that takes into account the work that women do.”

One role the Centre has been unable to realize is that of community development understood as the formation of groups of individuals/clients able to articulate community demands, especially in political terms. According to a non-Portuguese, non-Spanish speaking staff member:

We have not been successful at developing communities’ abilities to secure their own interests. They need help to build leadership. The Centre’s efforts in building leadership have been through individual counselling, group work especially in the Portuguese community, developmental support to the Seniors’s group and through role modelling when clients who have made gains take on leadership roles through committee work, facilitating groups, organizing events.

Board members reiterate:

We have been unable to politicize clients despite delivering needed services due to underfunding. The staff are busy, there is no time. We are responding not
initiating. Like many immigrant communities we don’t hold leadership meetings for clients, organize political events, or engage in active lobbying. We have been more successful in bringing some of them onto the Board. Although we work with women in groups, most of the work is individual work; efforts to form groups or link them with pre-existent groups have not been so successful.

Community development is a community that cares for itself. That doesn’t happen much. You just do your everyday service and go on...They [the Centre] do do a lot of networking but not a lot of community development.

These Board members clearly demarcate between themselves and clients as members of the community.

Community networking and advocacy efforts continue unabated especially in the areas of wife assault and employment training. In terms of programming, the provision of settlement services continue to constitute a major component of the work. In an evaluation of the settlement services program in 1994 staff identified difficulties such as: how to realize the empowerment of clients; the lack of services to refer clients (e.g., in-depth counselling) which affects the counsellors’ case load and necessitates training for counsellors if they are to continue seeing these clients; discriminatory attitudes in clients, workers, and mainstream society; the need for English language training for workers to enable them to do translations for clients and to write letters required by clients; and client needs for employment counselling.

When asked about unmet needs in 1996, staff and board identified economic issues as primary: jobs, community economic development, and recognition of qualifications. Related to the high level of unemployment, one board member spoke of the need for a drop-in centre for parents and children to reduce isolation (and, therefore, depression). As well, the composition of the area is changing as new immigrant groups with their own service needs move into the neighbourhood. For older immigrants, that is, the Portuguese, their needs are for information around service entitlements such as the Canada Pension Plan. Legal services in the language of
the clients were mentioned by both a Spanish speaking staff member and the Spanish speaking clients. The need for childcare spaces for women in the home daycare program (discussed below) was also mentioned.

Responding to the labour market needs of clients has remained a central focus based on the understanding that without jobs and earned income clients are without access to economic power and the consequent ability to affect personal and even political changes (given the association between low income and low levels of political participation in Canada). Regarding employment counselling, however, workers are sceptical:

One of the clients I remember very clearly. She said, 'You know I didn't speak English, so I took English classes. So when I finished with the English I knew English but I didn't have any formal training in any profession, or area.' So she went and got a certificate in hospitality. And she says, 'to do that I got an OSAP [Ontario Student Assistance Program] grant and loan. And then when I was finished that I was almost worse off than before because before I didn't have any English but I didn't have any debts. Here I was with English proficiency, with a certificate in my hand, unemployed, on welfare, and with a debt.'

In 1993/94 the Centre offered a training program for non-English speaking men and women in Building Maintenance/Superintendent Training in conjunction with a college. However, the concept for the program originated not with the Centre but from the local Canada Employment Centre which circulated a Request for Proposals inviting bids by organizations wishing to develop and offer the training program. Ten men and three women graduated. By undertaking to deliver a government initiated program the Centre expanded its target group to include men. A Board member presented her reasons for supporting the program: high levels of formal education and English skills were not required and if women lived and worked in the same building, they could be at home with their children. Cuts to the federal skills training budget meant that the program was discontinued.

However a joint federal provincial training initiative - Home Daycare for immigrant
women on social assistance - did proceed. The Coordinator of the program described reactions to the Home Daycare program from staff in other training programs:

People got into this stance of, ‘We’re not training women any more to be anything where they are going to be decently paid...The dollars for training women to do auto cad or computer drafting, that kind of stuff is drying up. It’s like let’s get women back into the kitchen and back into the homes and look after kids where they can’t make a decent living...They have to work long hours.’

Subsequently the funding for the Home Daycare program was cancelled. The Centre has been able to run the program again by replacing federal and provincial funding with a combination of private funding from foundations and municipal support for childcare. From the perspective of the Centre, the Home Daycare means that: the training period is shorter; women could operate as their own businesses and work for themselves or they could work as an employee of a home daycare provider; by providing childcare in their homes women with young children will be able to remain with their children while still earning an income, albeit a limited one; the program builds on skills and interests the women already have; high levels of English were not necessary if the women provided care to members of their own community; and research indicated that there was a demand for home daycare. Being less costly than technical training programs it was therefore possible to find replacement dollars for the federal and provincial training funds. Both of these training programs took into consideration the realities of the women’s lives, that is their level of fluency in English and their roles as mothers.

Summary

The history of the agency’s development reflects Shragge’s (1990) description of ASOs in Quebec to an uncanny degree. Offering alternatives to traditional programming, the Centre’s services focused on nontraditional initiatives for women such as the electronic tester program, the (unsuccessful) attempt to set up a dressmakers’ cooperative, and even the Home Daycare
program which includes business training to enable the women to operate as small businesses. Support groups encouraged personal empowerment for women as did participation in marches for the labour and women's movement. In their organizational form, as a collective, the Centre attempted to be as nonhierarchical and democratic as possible allowing for staff participation in decision making. The hiring of clients and community members as staff, and recruitment of Board members from the clients allowed for community participation. However, as Agnew (1996) noted, social class, more specifically class skills, are clearly operant in determining which community members and clients go on to become staff and Board members: for example, one respondent mentioned that during the 1980s three staff members were completing graduate degrees. At the present time most of the service delivery staff have college diplomas/university degrees. The 1995/96 Board members interviewed were all middle level white collar workers, three of them working in government and one in post secondary education. Middle class boards help secure funding and provide needed skills.

Shragge summarizes the phases of development of ASOs from an initial period when the organization is engaged in social change activities, to a transitional period when more attention is paid to organizational accountability. In the later state, traditional accountability procedures have been put into place, and more professional staff have been hired. This is partially evident at the Centre in that a vertical management structure was put into place; however staff qualifications have not changed. He posits that an individual approach may replace more collective strategies; however, the organization retains its commitment to its original client group. For Shragge this bureaucratization results from the power of funders to shape agency activities. In this case changes in the Centre's operation stem from external influences such as the requirements associated with securing funding, as well as internal factors such as divisions among staff, and
the need as a growing organization to streamline administrative procedures. There is no evidence of a decline in collective modes of service delivery; support groups continue to be a preferred way of working and the Centre provides support to at least two groups for which they have not received funding support.

Shragge concludes that ASOs are able to maintain their autonomy through successful programming, community support, building alliances, diversified funding, and a continued commitment to an alternative point of view. This agency clearly demonstrates these characteristics. Throughout its history to the present day this agency has embarked upon mostly successful training programs intended to foster the economic independence of women by avoiding the traditional low paying job ghettos (such as the ones described by Ng in her earlier study of an immigrant women’s employment centre). The Centre also initiated joint programming with community colleges many years before the recent emphasis by funders on service partnerships. The agency was a founder of, and has continued to be a key player in advocacy organizations and initiatives such as Women Working with Immigrant Women, as well as coalitions such as OCASI, Advocates for Community-Based Training & Education for Women, and earlier on, the Immigrant Women’s Shelter Advisory Task Force and the Charter Challenge on language training. Participation in ethnocracial networks such as the Hispanic Social Development Council and the Portuguese Interagency Network secures its ties to the these communities. Further the Centre has engaged in joint programming with other organizations to expand its services (for example, serving the African community by sharing a settlement worker with another agency) to other client groups. It has been able to obtain funding to replace dollars from government from nongovernmental sources such as foundations. Diversification of funding also circumscribes the control exerted by a single funder and their ability to exert political
influence.

Client Perceptions

That voluntary organizations meet community needs is a presupposition about the sector. How those needs are met by this ISO is described by clients below.

Feedback from Spanish speaking clients

The Spanish speaking clients who agreed to attend the focus groups were all participants in a support group that is sponsored by the Centre and receives staff assistance and meeting space but no financial assistance. Hence the six women spoke mostly about the group and only rarely of the other services they utilized at the Centre. Obtaining needed services such as housing (2), assistance with immigration matters (2), problems at work (1), and a son's disability were the reasons for first approaching the Centre:

When I came I did not start studying. The cultural shock harmed me a lot. I locked myself in my house. I didn’t want to go out. I would only go to see the lawyer and to immigration. But I went to the library to pick up tapes to learn English and the person that gave me the tapes told me about the English classes that the Centre had in the basement of the library and he told me about the other services of the Centre.

I saw the sign on the building. I had been in Canada for seven years at that time, but I had a problem and I came to look for help.

I came here two years ago because I needed help to apply for Ontario housing and I needed help in processing the immigration papers for my younger daughter. They are very good people, they gave me orientation. Then I started to volunteer with the women’s group.

After this initial assistance the overwhelming benefit of the Centre’s programs and services was that of meeting other women, of gaining the support and understanding of other women through the group and maintaining contact with each other over the telephone; “when you're not working it’s easy to get depressed”; “men go out with friends, women are always at home and cannot express their feelings of unhappiness”.
A preoccupation of the women is economics. Global and national restructuring has resulted in the absence of jobs and cuts to social assistance mean that making ends meet has become more difficult. Setting up a food bank or a community kitchen are ideas that are being explored by the group. They would also like the Centre to become more involved in job search programs, such as a job board and job placement program. Like the Ghanaian refugees described by Opoku-Dapaah, the economic disappointments experienced by these women contribute to their need for social supports from within their own community.

Intercessions by the settlement worker help the women in their contacts with mainstream services such as social assistance. Welfare workers are more attentive when the client is referred by the Centre and has an advocate:

The Social Services people respect the Centre very much. They are very polite. There is a difference in the service when the Centre is involved.

The women reported different experiences with their “workers.” One worker was described as very helpful, visiting at home and bringing an interpreter, while another was suspicious:

People in the Welfare office think we are lazy and don’t want to work, but there are no jobs. I keep them informed when I work and then when I am laid off I get in touch again and the social worker is helpful.

Encounters with the government-provided social assistance program are clearly difficult. It is difficult to access welfare workers without the assistance of a settlement worker, and once accessed the women do not know whether the worker will be supportive or hold stereotypical attitudes about immigrants.

Feedback from Portuguese speaking clients

Individual interviews with two Portuguese speaking women were not informative in terms of the goals of this study. The women spoke in greater detail of their abusive relationships
with their spouses attesting to the long term and profound impact of familial violence in their lives. (According to the Portuguese speaking settlement counsellor the majority of her cases are wife assault although women come first on the pretext of seeking settlement related services such as ESL.) Maria (a pseudonym), in Canada for six years, and married to an alcoholic husband, was depressed. She heard two of the Centre’s counsellors in an interview on Portuguese radio and took down the number. With the help of one of the counsellors her husband was able to get help from a doctor. However her marriage did not survive. Maria attended ESL classes as well as the women’s group for three years and still has the friends from the group. She quit the ESL classes in order to work. The Centre has also provided her with an escort to the welfare office, helped her obtain legal aid for the divorce, and assisted her in renewing her passport.

Ilda, also in Canada for six years, was in an abusive relationship and very depressed. A friend, also a volunteer at the Centre, recommended that she see a counsellor at the Centre. With the counsellor’s help she was able to find an apartment and moved out, eventually separating from her husband. She attends the support group for women and has volunteered with the Centre where she conducts orientation groups with newcomers. In both of these instances the Centre provided much needed support to the women to make changes in their lives, changes that were probably difficult to make in a new society and away from their traditional support structures.

To supplement these interviews the Centre provided access to the data below that come from an evaluation questionnaire administered by a placement student at the Centre. Not hearing the women’s responses makes it difficult to interpret what meaning they made of the statements. There may have also been a desire on the part of the women to portray the Centre in a positive light when interviewed by personnel associated with the Centre. The questionnaire asked 30 Portuguese speaking women to indicate which of the following statements applied to them:
I have been able to:

- build social networks and peer support (15)
- increase understanding of dynamics of family violence (14)
- develop problem solving skills (14)
- practice leadership skills (14)
- improve parenting knowledge and skills (11)
- obtain information and education on specific issues of need (9)
- develop greater understanding of Canadian society (14)

Thanks to the help of the Centre, I now...

- have my citizenship (5)
- participate in community and political events (7)
- am involved in Centre activities, volunteer program or committees (10).

Summary

In sum the Centre has ensured access to services for Spanish and Portuguese speaking women as well as decreasing the isolation of the women arising from lack of work opportunities and family circumstances. Wife assault is a large part of the agency’s work whether it be through support groups, advocacy, service coordination, or individual counselling. As well among the Portuguese clients are many older workers who are no longer able to work because of some type of disability. High unemployment and lack of English language skills compound their difficulties while training is a daunting prospect for those who have had few years of formal schooling.

Ongoing counselling for individuals experiencing stress as a result of unemployment is difficult to obtain due to the lack of Portuguese speaking (professional) counsellors meaning that “we are pressured to do even family counselling at times because there is no one to do it...And it is
better...to do something than nothing."

Links with the Local Community

Relationships with the broader Spanish and Portuguese speaking community, that is other than service deliverers, are largely nonexistent. However in the area of services, agency staff and occasionally Board members, participate in numerous advocacy, interagency, and networking bodies for the purposes of improving service delivery. There are community representatives on the Board, many of them middle class, with activist backgrounds in the service area. Outreach initiatives include community radio station and newspaper interviews which profile the organization. Small scale client surveys to determine level of client satisfaction with programs, and counting of clients (thereby meeting accountability requirements,) are more common than formal needs assessments and evaluations.

Funding Relationships

A primary focus of this study has been the extent to which ISOs have the leeway to pursue their own goals in the context of high levels of governmental funding. Some authors suggest that government funding has resulted in a skewing of the priorities of voluntary organizations such that governmentally defined needs rather than client-defined needs take precedence in service delivery (Shragge, 1990). This possibility was remarked upon by a Board member who wrote in 1982:

Now is the time for the Centre to start long term planning in policy, services and funding. Although the United Community Fund (UCF) is not the most progressive funding source it is a secure funding source which would probably enable the Centre to serve more immigrant women in Toronto. Will the UCF change the nature of our services? This and more questions can only be answered after long debate and discussions by ex-clients, staff and Board members.

Others have argued that extensive reporting requirements have influenced the work such
that Board members and administrative staff of the organization become part of the
dependencies of the organization (Ng, 1988). Certainly the funding officers interviewed
seemed very much concerned with an organization's ability to complete grant applications and
fulfil its financial reporting obligations in an efficient and timely fashion. In this respect the
Centre received high marks, largely due to the skills of the Executive Director. Board members
were unanimous in characterizing the agency's relationship with funders as excellent, meaning
that funding levels were perceived as adequate and relationships with funding officers were
cordial. The agency's status with funders is such that they have been consulted by funders prior to
new programs being established.

Funders like the Centre because it is well run (financially accountable with good quality
programs), has a twenty year history, and has been able to secure multiple sources of funding.
Nevertheless a Board member who has worked in immigrant services characterized the
relationship with funders as nonexistent in the sense that the preoccupation with accountability
precludes any real interest in the services and how the community is benefiting from the services.

This was not true for the two funding officers who were interviewed. The provincial
funding representative was described by a staff member as "wonderful", in that she was available
to clarify matters when needed to the point of coming to talk to trainees about why certain
information was being asked of them. In the case of a trainee who became ineligible for the
program sometime after the program started, the funding officer's response was, "Keep on
supporting her until you officially hear. She can stay in the program after that even though we
can't spend dollars [for childcare] on her."

However, on the occasion of an agency visit by a major federal funder I found the
perception of "bean counting" to be accurate. A respondent from one of the mainstream
organizations commented:

In this kind of thing [project] you have a project officer and depending on the individual project officer, that could be either a good experience or a horrible experience. Some are much more hands on than others and again that could be good or bad. If you've got someone who has an understanding of training and service delivery and is very client oriented, it can be something that adds to the program. If you've got someone who has a very bureaucratic focus, you can then spend all of your time explaining why you charged $8.75 for object X.

According to the Centre's Executive Director, government funding is in some respects more desirable than private funding from foundations, or agencies like the United Way, in that the funding process is open to influence. 1986 Fundraising Committee minutes describe the incident of a client of the Centre who had been interviewed by a newspaper journalist. The client spoke of being insulted by a Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) driver because of her lack of English language skills. Subsequent to the story appearing, an “upset” United Way funding representative contacted the Centre dismayed at the negative portrayal since the TTC was a large contributor to the United Way campaign.

Lobbying government can have an impact, and cutting funds cannot be done without some consideration of the political implications. In one case, as a result the agency's advocacy efforts, relations with a provincial funding officer deteriorated, but in general. “I don’t think it’s been a dilemma to knock the government while getting the money.”

The agency has cultivated relations with federal, municipal and provincial political representatives which has had its rewards. The provincial funding officer reported that the NDP Minister who represented the Centre's riding took a keen interest in the status of the Centre's project application. Further evidence that the funding process is pervious is demonstrated by the decision of the former provincial government, in the last months of its existence, to forego the usual funding allocation process of 45%, 45%, with a 10% holdback. Instead the approved
training projects were given 90% funding upfront with a 10% holdback.

Government funding officers see themselves as having the same goals as organizations, that is “to work together to serve clients” and “make the best use of the taxpayers’ dollar.” They also serve as conduits between front-line service providers and policy makers, and according to a funding officer, provide a needed “reality check” since policy makers “sometimes miss the point.” As a staff member observed. “At the staff level they are always friends. They end up usually agreeing [with us about program criteria]. Or they say that to keep their position comfortable.”

There is of course a distinction to be made between the policy makers and the funding officers who implement funding policies. In the words of a funding officer:

...our world is too complex not to have people interpret systems for us. So you need to make a contact on a human level so that you can interact with a certain amount of trust. Once that’s accomplished the other pieces begin to fall into place. I get what I need for my system. She gets what she needs for her system. The women get what they need for their systems... I don’t think it was a conscious effort but it is at some level a knowledge of how we interact as people.

And so corporate office maintains its separateness in order to be more analytical, more open to make decisions for dollars and impacts...I think that segregation is quite planned so that each of those areas can do what they need to do most effectively.

In an environment of decreasing funding and less staff resources, a federal funding officer of language programs admits that fledgling organizations who require developmental assistance suffer while the more experienced agencies benefit. According to a provincial funding officer, in the area of skills training for social assistance recipients (now defunct) both the provincial NDP and the federal Liberals had agreed to the funding of:

innovative new projects that could accomplish the task of reentering the labour force...And they made it as loose a criterion as possible so that agencies that might not have the wherewithal to apply for formal funding process would still be able to apply...
In the past, staff have attempted to circumvent accountability measures. A staff member recounts that ISAP purchase of service contracts entailed that specified services be provided to newcomers who had been in the country for three years or less, excluding refugee claimants. Yet up to 50% of the clients served by ISAP workers were refugee claimants who had been in the country for more than three years. Consequently, to maintain the funding for the two workers, ISAP eligible clients were recorded as extremely needy in terms of the services and counsellors’ time required. A current settlement counsellor remarked:

Realistically, because I do not think this is going to the Settlement Services unit in Ottawa, I can tell you the truth. In reality what I do...is very little in terms of settlement issues. I would see my position more as a social worker, counsellor rather than settlement issues...what I call brief solution focused counselling.

The Department of Citizenship and Immigration has not been unaware of these fabrications. A recent costly and unsuccessful attempt to computerize record keeping at the agency level was probably based on the Department’s suspicions that its funds were being used to support ineligible clients. However the rationale for the record keeping was allegedly to allow tracking of service needs and thereby service delivery planning.

Summary

As suggested by Gidron and Kramer (1992) and Kuhnle and Selle (1992) conflictual relations between government and voluntary organizations are not necessarily the order of the day. The data presented above suggests means by which the Centre has been able to negotiate the funding process in pursuit of its objectives. First, interpersonal relationships between agency and funding representative are cordial. While recognizing that individual relationships do not ameliorate restrictive policies, there is a practical benefit in illuminating how particular agents in particular situation act to resolve their situation. As scholars of immigration policy have pointed
out, there are significant liberal elements within the bureaucracy who have at times played a greater part in influencing immigration policy than has public opinion (Dirks, 1995; Parkin, Hardcastle, Simmons, & Suyama, 1992).

Secondly, successful funding relationships ensue when, first and foremost, financial accountability requirements are satisfied. The organization's history in delivering successful programming also enhances the funder's perception that program goals will be met. Also Kuhnle and Selle's (1992) observation that ideological affinity between the government of the day and the agency will enhance the relationship is borne out.

Notwithstanding critiques of the federal language training program (over eligibility, for example), funding levels for the LINC (Language Instruction for Newcomers to Canada) provided financial stability for some agencies by contributing to a portion of their administrative costs. As well, clients who came into agencies seeking language training would then be referred to settlement and training programs within the agency thus boosting program numbers.

In Ng's (1988) case study she noted the impact of funding on service delivery, observing the change from group to individual counselling, group work being a desired tool for building solidarity among clients. Ironically the ISAP program, as a cost saving measure, now contracts with agencies to provide information through group sessions. Of course information provision is not the same as consciousness raising groups.

Agnew's (1996, p.171) contention that community groups adopt a pragmatic and uncritical approach (i.e., they do not phrase their opposition in terms of race and gender bias) in order to keep their funding was specifically refuted by Board and staff members who cited a number of advocacy efforts they have been involved in from the Charter Challenge on Language Training for Immigrant Women, to coalition efforts, to individual lobbying with governmental
ministers. (Of course some may argue that denying/forgetting/ eliminating contradictions maybe people’s strategies of adaptation to structures of domination.) Agnew’s point is that these critiques are phrased in terms of program criteria, funding levels, etc. Or as Fraser (1989) would put it, an administrative vocabulary is the predominant one for pressing claims. Yet at the 1995 ISAP Conference settlement workers voiced their opposition to the imposition of the $975.00 Right of Landing Fee asserting that the policy was racist.

The terms in which oppositional claims are framed have very much to do with the understandings of those advancing the arguments. Evers (1993) has suggested that transformations in the voluntary sector may stem from socio-economic and cultural changes like pluralization and individualization or to public discourses below the level of distinct political strategies. Agnew has described the range of interpretations of feminism within community organizations. Why would their analyses of racism not vary as well? Further the debates concerning the links between gender, class and ethnicity exacerbate the issue. Is ethnicity independent of, prior to, reified by, or coincident with class and gender, if indeed these largely academic debates reach the community level?

Mainstream Organizations

The Centre's relationship with generic or ‘mainstream’ organizations, mainly relationships involving cosponsorship of programs, was considered successful by representatives of both sides. In the case of a Centre program jointly sponsored with a large community college, the reasons for collaboration were numerous. In short term projects it is difficult for the college to pull in full-time staff from their permanent positions and the hiring of part time staff is difficult because of the short time frame between approval and start up date. In the college's unionized environment, staff salaries for a faculty coordinator are relatively high and would not
be compensated for by the rates allowed in federal training contracts.

Hence a situation in which community based organizations administer a contract is beneficial to organizations like colleges. The agencies are less bureaucratized and hence more flexible in terms of turn around time for job postings and hirings, and salary levels are lower even in a unionized environment. Important also is the community agency's ability to reach immigrant clients and ensure a client focus for these students who often “get lost in the shuffle and for whom the environment needs to be modified to accommodate their needs.” Agency staff then become advocates for participants in the program. Thus in the words of a college representative, her organization’s collaboration with community based agencies is:

worth it in terms of the college’s mandate which is to serve the community, worth it in the sense that it expands the accessibility of the college to people who would not otherwise perhaps be able to take advantage of it, worthwhile in the sense that it's part of the economic development of the community it serves.

In financial terms, the college was able to provide the technical training on a cost recovery basis by costing out the program at the same *per diem* rate that government was usually charged for other adult skills training programs offered by the college.

Despite these advantages, not all community-based organizations are perceived as desirable partners. The college official feels that some agencies convey the attitude that, “You’re a big college, therefore you don’t understand our community, you don’t understand our clients...” However, for her, successful interorganizational collaboration means “...there has to be a basic assumption that your partner is sound, that the partner wants to do a good job and that you can communicate. And that there’s some degree of trust between the two partners.”

In this case the personalities of the Centre’s senior administrative staff as well as the capabilities of each organization meshed. The college official reports:
What I liked about the Centre’s approach was that they bring something unique to the table that we don't have. And a way of working and providing service that we don’t have. We bring to the table something that they don’t have and there seemed to be a good fit between us for this particular project.

Another instance in which mainstream organizations amended their practices to reduce barriers was recounted by a Board member. In assessing language skills for placement into a cosponsored training program, a community college utilized a process that was clearly intimidating for clients, so much so that many left without attempting the test. Others left halfway through the test and there were many complaints from clients. A staff person from the Centre discussed the situation with college staff resulting in modifications to the test. Clients were called back and invited to re-take the test.

In collaboration with a generic/mainstream family services provider, the Centre has been offering a seniors’ summer camp since 1984/85. The Centre translated outreach material, collected intake data, provided advice on the menu, and consultation on the camp's wellness educational program. Over time this generic/mainstream organization has been developing its capacity to work with diverse communities by staff training and the recruitment of staff with minority language skills or an understanding of the immigrant experience. A key learning for this generic/mainstream organization has been the assertion by the Centre's staff that “our clients are not homogeneous.” Similarly commonly held stereotypes have been disproven: “the Portuguese and Spanish speaking seniors may be Catholic but they don't want to say Grace.”

In sum these two programs demonstrate instances of successful collaboration where the Centre has been able to impact how services and programs are delivered in mainstream organizations. The Centre is an attractive partner to these organizations because of a) to its ability to access a hard-to-reach population and, b) the flexibility resulting from its relatively
nonbureaucraticized structure.

**Issues of Culture and Ethnicity**

As originally conceived the ethnic origins of the groups served by the Centre was not central to the study. However in a review of agency documents mentions of intergroup conflict occurred frequently during the mid to late 1980s.

**Relations between the Spanish and Portuguese speaking Communities**

Minutes of staff meetings from the middle years of the Centre indicated that, within the Centre, there was a perception among the Portuguese staff that the Centre was dominated by Spanish speaking staff and Board members, and consequently the Portuguese community was under served by the Centre. According to a staff person who later joined the Centre, the perception was shared by Portuguese service providers at other agencies. Decisions regarding what services were to be offered and the ethnicity of new employees were always closely scrutinized during those years (and still is today to a lesser extent). At the Board level it appeared to be more difficult to recruit Portuguese speaking members. The explanation offered by present day staff and Board members is that despite similarities between the two communities in terms of language and religion, the circumstances of the two groups’ migration and settlement were distinct and necessitated different service responses.

The majority of the Portuguese speaking community emigrated to Canada from the Portuguese mainland and the Azores during the 1960s-1970s. They were mostly working class people who entered the workforce immediately and encouraged their children to do so as well. Recent recessions have meant high unemployment and many people have sought the help of the Centre seeking assistance in securing unemployment insurance or social assistance or finding out about their entitlements under the Canadian Pension Plan, etc. Many of them did not learn
English since they tended to work in ethnically segregated sectors, in manual work such as construction, office cleaning, and garment making. In essence they may have lacked the class skills to participate on a Board of Directors.

In contrast, many Spanish speaking immigrants were refugees who were politically active, well educated in their countries of origin, who sought language training and skills training when in Canada and possessed the class skills to participate on the Board of Directors. According to the Portuguese counsellor the majority of her work with Portuguese speaking clients consisted of family counselling, including wife abuse cases. Many of the Spanish speaking clients are receiving "settlement services" such as information and orientation. Lack of job opportunities and the greater availability of language training classes mean that they are acquiring English language skills at an earlier stage in settlement than their Portuguese speaking counterparts.

An astute observation was offered by a past client and eventual Board member who noted that the service needs of the Portuguese community did not meet the criteria for settlement funding and it was therefore difficult to secure funding for services for that community. Consequently funding policies have to be blamed for the perception that the Portuguese speaking community was not being served equally.

Ethnic Segregation and Diversity

I almost think there is some legitimacy to the point of can you have...indefinite numbers of organizations existing forever? I think there is a time obviously in immigration levels, and stages communities go through when they enter the [Canadian] community but I don't know if forever and ever...

You know I'm thinking about the Italian community because that's where I'm from. And it's been a while now. Although it's just a generation. But there is still a need for Italian serving agencies. There are a lot of Italians and they don't speak English and they won't get the service they need culturally if it weren't for organizations like COSTI [a large multicultural ISO]. So that's the other side of the coin. It's not so simple to say, 'Okay for five years we'll have an agency that works with the African community and then after that well they'll all be integrated
by now and their needs are met. And now mainstream organizations can meet those needs.' That can’t happen. So I don’t know.

...I’m almost torn between communities wanting to retain their own identities and having a very segregated society... When I started working at here, everything became cultural. Everything I did became identified as a cultural issue. Because we’re so conscious of it because that’s the work that we do. And people in this business are so aware of their own culture. Because that’s what they’re busy doing too that I almost start to feel that there’s a negative side to being too insular as community. And that sometimes we almost promote that kind of... I want to be careful about what I’m saying here because I’m not trying to get into a melting pot and assimilation into the majority society and stuff like that. But I just wonder whether we do enough to kind of work towards more interaction with communities as opposed to more insular kind of activities.

This staff member’s (a first generation Canadian) suggestion of insularity was echoed by three Board members who remarked upon “a gap in the work of the Centre has been the lack of linkages with other communities.” As early as 1982, a Board member had alluded to a trend she perceived, that of decreasing the number of ethnic groups served by the Centre to only two Portuguese and Spanish speaking women.

Diversification of its staff through the implementation of employment equity policies, the employment of a counsellor to serve African clients, and the recent Building Maintenance training program for both men and women all witness the Centre’s attempts to expand its programs and services. (The rationale is not purely altruistic according to a Board member, who sees the expansion as part of a survival strategy at a time of cuts in government spending. The current funding environment has also been the impetus for the organization to start building political alliances and service relationships with organizations in the surrounding area.)

The Centre is working on an employment equity policy which will open up the hiring for staff positions for which neither the Spanish nor Portuguese language is required, for example, administrative positions. “The particular issue that becomes very difficult... is when men apply for positions, how do you determine if they qualify, if the person has the sensitivity that is required?”
In February of 1996, the Centre was faced with just such a problem; the two top contenders for a temporary administrative position were a racial minority immigrant man and a white Canadian born woman. The hiring committee felt both candidates were equally qualified and took the matter to a staff meeting for a final decision. The staff were conflicted, citing almost equally, apprehensions: that, stereotypically men are the ones who do math and finance and women do the “soft caring stuff”; but that immigrants have a harder time here; that immigrants bring an immigrant perspective; that the ideology of the Centre is a woman centred ideology that a man may not support; and that a man might dominate the meetings. In the end their allegiance went to the immigrant male although there was a general agreement that they did not like it too much and would have preferred an immigrant female.

**Conceptions of Ethnoracial Identity**

Are claims framed in terms of the cultural/linguistic needs of particular groups naive in their understanding of racism? Iglehart and Becerra (1995) conclude that, for service deliverers, ethnicity is an integral part of the ideology and technology of the agency. A senior staff member remarks:

> It’s all the subtle nuance about how a service is delivered...that makes it appropriate for that cultural group. Everything from where it’s located, to how it’s set up, how it’s delivered, how the counselling is delivered, whether you have appointments or not, what it feels like, the environment, all those things.

At the same time socio-economic inequality has not gone unnoticed. In the view of a long time Board member, state sponsored equity programs ignore ethnicity (as opposed to race or phenotype) as a marker of inequality. Portuguese women are assumed to be at the level of the general population. Yet Portuguese women’s socioeconomic status indicators are low. Similarly for Hispanic women, although there are more professionals in that community and better
education levels, they have not been able to secure jobs.

Critics might point out that, at times, the understanding of ethnic identity expressed by Board and staff alike appear to demonstrate a reliance upon a misconceived assumption of a common experience, even though as a staff member remarked, “the community is a vast number of people coming from all different places...” Yet as has been suggested elsewhere this “self-identification [as an ethnic person] proves a condition for agency” (Gates, 1990, p. 324).

Padolsky has remarked that:

Ethnicity, as defined and understood within Canadian contexts, seems to be functioning more as a conceptual catch phrase for such terms as ‘minority’ (visible or otherwise), ‘immigrant’ or ‘multicultural’ rather than in the more universal sense. (1990, p. 26)

That this usage has arisen is in part due to immigrant groups’ grounding of the notion of ethnicity in a reality that they “cannot not know” (Cornel West in Stephanson, 1988), that is, the immigrant experience of marginality, transition and loss (e.g., of culture and language):

we have the experience of what being an immigrant means, the difficulties we face...and we are very well aware of the needs of the clients we serve

we understand immigrants needs, language, culture, and marginal status.

This ethnically-based understanding of oneself and one’s community as Portuguese, or as immigrant is political not ontological. That is, these self assertions represent an attempt to recuperate something that is almost lost in the immigration to a new society (Benhabib, 1992).

The other part of the equation is, of course, the host society’s contribution to the ‘othering’ of immigrants. But ethnicity cannot be subsumed entirely by theories of racialization. Gilroy's account of Britain describes the existence of different strands of antiracist solutions, including a group that is emphatically culturalist. In Ontario, Harney (1996) has also alluded to tensions between multiculturalism or race relations specialists and more forceful proponents of antiracism
among minority civil servants.

Contentious Issues in The Immigrant Service Sector

Two issues, very topical in the sector in the current funding climate, were mentioned in the interviews. The first was the issue of efficiency and the related question of service outcomes. While the agencies are seen to be cost effective, in systemic terms there are those among the ISO community who hint at a lack of efficiency and coordination. A Board member was candid in her opinion that: the settlement services sector lacks coordination; there is duplication of services especially in the downtown area of the city; the lack of interest on the part of funders means that agencies are able to utilize funds for other than the intended purpose, thus public accountability suffers; and there is a general lack of knowledge about the effectiveness of settlement programs. In regard to duplication, a funding representative queried whether the relatively low registration in language training classes was attributable to the large number of providers in the geographical area. The absence of studies assessing effectiveness in meeting ethnoracial needs and assessments of service outcomes is reiterated by Reitz (n.d.) in a review prepared for the Multicultural Coalition for Access to Family Services (Toronto). In fairness it must be stated that follow-up with clients to assess outcomes is both difficult to do (i.e., it is often difficult to track down clients and it is costly).

The second topical issue concerned the role of mainstream service providers and was identified by a funding representative who spoke about language instruction and the conflict between expertise and access. Boards of education and colleges want more of a role in LINC instruction, not merely because of the dollars. Many of the program administrators were teachers and have had direct involvement with learners. They are concerned about expertise: assessment, teaching and curriculum standards. LINC assessment has been centralized because there was a
perception that not all of the deliverers were equally competent in assessing language skills. However, from the point of view of access, volunteer led community classes originated because students from some communities were unwilling to attend classes in school settings. These classes eventually grew into ISOs and there continues to be a need for community based ESL because the nuances in different cultures and traditions required different service responses.

Conclusion: Integrating Data and Theory

The data provides support for a number of Iglehart and Becerra’s propositions about the ethnic agency and its practices in the United States:

- the agency is controlled and staffed by and provides services to specific ethnic groups;
- the agency appears to be a special type of voluntary, self-help, alternative, community-based service agency;
- the agency fills a gap left by the mainstream social service delivery system, or may respond to cultural barriers that impede a group’s use of mainstream services;
- the agency may augment rather than compete with mainstream services;
- the agency, like other kinds of organizations, is shaped by the larger social system;
- ethnicity is an integral part of the ideology and technology of the agency;
- the agency attempts to operationalize the concept of empowerment;
- the agency seeks to simplify the organization for the client;
- the agency attempts to protect its ideology and technology from bureaucratic intrusion;
- there may be limitations in the service delivery practices (p. 194).

There was little or no evidence to support Iglehart and Becerra’s thesis that there is a tension between ethnicity and professionalism in the agency. Settlement counsellors were eager for training in order to meet the complex service needs of clients. Similarly their suggestion that the
agency and its community share a symbiotic relationship is imprecise in that the Centre appears to be closely tied to one segment of the community—other service deliverers—through its networking activities. As Anthias and Yuval-Davis (1992) found in Britain, Board members representing the community have been drawn from a network of activists and service providers already employed or involved in similar organizations.

The following additional features are suggested by this case study. The agency:

- embodies a commitment to the political functions of representation, leadership development and community development;
- views the economic marginalization of clients as a central focus of its work;
- is adaptive to community needs through embeddedness in immigrant service deliverer and advocacy networks;
- increases client access to multiple programs through cosponsorship of programs, and advocacy and brokerage with mainstream service providers;
- coordinates and integrates services to clients through assessment and referral mechanisms;
- is to some extent limited by its historical origins as service provider to the Portuguese and Spanish speaking communities primarily, although there have been recent external catalysts that are expanding the agency's constituency;
- is a resource dependent organization (on government funds and use of volunteers, placement students, etc. in the day to day running of the organization);
- is accountable to funders;
- is committed to efficient management processes;
- is perceived as cost effective and flexible.

Thus multiple processes of adjustment operate in the Centre. Community need, especially
the needs of Portuguese and Spanish speaking women has driven much of the Centre's programming. At the same time government funding priorities are the backbone of the organization's work, primarily the provision of settlement services including language training. Current reductions in government funding are the catalyst for investigations into interagency collaboration. The past influence of the United Way on agency publications was noted. However the Centre cannot be accused of abandoning its goals.

Alternative modes of commitment were evident in the Centre's earlier attempts to implement Freireian pedagogy and in the present day concerns of counsellors regarding client empowerment. The desire to engage in community development strategies, despite the inability to do so, provides evidence that dynamics other than service provision drive the agency.

Evers' (1993) definition of voluntary organizations as polyvalent and hybrid is a propos here. Intermeshing tasks, roles, and rationales are evident: the contract delivery of services (e.g., ISAP's purchase of service agreements), advocacy (e.g., the Charter Challenge), reliance upon state funding, and private fundraising, universalism (i.e., ESL classes open to all immigrants) and particularism (settlement counselling and support groups primarily for the Portuguese and Spanish speaking communities); the implementation of financial management processes; and communal activities.
CHAPTER SIX
CONCLUSION AND INTERPRETATION

Summary of the Study

The aim of this thesis has been an investigation into the role of immigrant serving organizations in the welfare state. According to community advocates, the growth of ISOs resulted from: mainstream institutions' inability to provide services in the languages of immigrants; lack of understanding in mainstream programs, policies and staff of the culture and life experiences of immigrants; immigrants' preference to receive social services from organizations and staff from their own communities; ISOs' ongoing advocacy to eliminate racism as a barrier to settlement; and the work of ISOs in pressuring government for increases in funding (Beyenne et al., 1996). Proponents also argue that ISOs have been continually underfunded, that the range of funded services is inadequate to meet the needs of immigrants, and that, given the unwillingness or inability of mainstream services to meet the service demands of immigrants, separate institutions are required to meet immigrant needs, and to actualize power sharing with minority communities.

International literature on voluntary organizations in the welfare state has been investigated revealing factors that impact upon one aspect of ISOs, their status as voluntary organizations that are largely government funded. A second body of literature on minority (immigrant) communities in Canada has been explored shedding light on that other defining characteristic of ISOs, service delivery to immigrants. Taken together these bodies of literature reveal a contradictory relationship with the state. State policies and funding enable at the same time that they constrain.

The immigration process and subsequent settlement of immigrants have been structured
by state intervention in different ways at different periods. Recent literature on the voluntary sector has identified a country's socio-historical circumstances as relevant. Strong nation building dynamics (Pal, 1993; Parkin, et. al., 1992), a federal/provincial structure, and constitutional allocation of powers to each of these levels of government (Hawkins, 1986) have been key features of the Canadian situation. The legacy of these institutional features has shaped present day jockeying between levels of government regarding responsibilities for immigrant services. In anglophone Canada in the past, British welfare state traditions have determined the greater presence of state funded/state delivered services with a supplementary role played by voluntary organizations (Campfens, 1990). State provided services were characterized by the application of universal criteria and standardized rules (Evers, 1993).

Socio-economic and cultural changes spurred the growth of the voluntary sector (Evers, 1993; Ismael, 1988; McCarthy & Hodgkinson, 1992) and the funding of community based advocacy and service organizations which originated during the 1960s has continued unabated despite fluctuating funding levels, policies and program criteria. During this period Canada's preoccupation with national identity shifted from that of a bilingual nation to a multicultural country, although much of the political debate still centres upon the two Charter groups. Nonetheless, from the mid-1960s government support for advocacy organizations has been couched in terms of national unity, and consequently, citizenship, identity, and participation, encouraging in turn a political discourse of collective rights and equality (Pal, 1993). Federal funding for official language minority associations and multicultural groups fared well relative to women's groups and First Nations peoples (Pal, 1993; Phillips, 1991), attesting to the preeminence of Canadian identity issues— in symbolic terms at least. Concurrently a notable policy constituency of immigrant and refugee aid organizations was created (Agnew, 1996;
Lanphier & Lukomskyj, 1992; Whitaker, 1991). However recent cost cutting measures have taken a toll: a 1996 Metropolitan Toronto community agency survey reveals immigrant and settlement services as being the hardest hit by funding reductions (City of Toronto Urban Development Services, Metro Community Services, Social Planning Council of Metropolitan Toronto, 1996).

Political studies of immigrant serving organizations in Canada have suggested that government funding has operated as a form of social control, creating elites within ethnic communities (Indra, 1987), blunting criticism by agencies (Agnew, 1996), influencing the terms in which needs are expressed, and reproducing a labour market stratified by gender and ethnicity (Ng, 1988). Social work writings concerned with service delivery questions recommend the provision of service through mainstream agencies’ use of ethnic matching (Matsuoka & Sorenson, 1991) or through collaboration between mainstream organizations and settlement agencies (Teram & White, 1994) because ISOs are by themselves unable to meet immigrant needs, given their chronic underfunding. Further, separate institutions may result in a continued marginalization of immigrant groups (Christensen, 1993). Taken together they paint a bleak picture of the possibilities of community involvement and control of services.

Research in different countries supports the thesis of variability in types of ISOs ranging from ethnic associations with minimal service delivery, to those that meet the designation of alternative service organizations whose defining characteristic is its deep commitment to social change, to highly professionalized service organizations dedicated to improvement of the group it serves, but who are less politically active.

A case study of an ISO was undertaken guided by the following questions: 1a) what are the core features of the organization and 1b) what is its role in meeting community needs; 2a)
what factors explain the core features and 2b) what processes of adjustment operate? In addition to a review of documents, past and present staff and Board members were interviewed as well as clients, funders and mainstream organizations involved in cosponsoring relationships.

The data reveal that key features of the Centre include: its underpinnings in both service provision and political representation; a commitment to the personal empowerment of clients; service accountability to and resource dependence upon funders, especially government; embeddedness in institutional relations with other ISOs (in the sense that participation in networks of agencies, for purposes such as lobbying, etc., is a goal in its own right); an allegiance to its historical origins as a service deliverer to Spanish and Portuguese women; adaptation to community needs within the limited degrees of freedom allowed by dependence upon external funding; and increasing client access to multiple programs through partnerships with mainstream service providers. In this case study the conceptualization of ISOs as alternative service organizations neatly captures the liberatory aspirations of the Centre, aspirations which rest upon the social or economic marginalization of immigrants and their experience of loss and transition.

A major preoccupation of the Centre is the agency's ability to address unemployment and employment in low paying jobs, thus a major service focus is the labour market and economic well-being of clients, beyond marginal levels. Services to abused women also figure prominently in the Centre's achievements. Hence, to generalize from the experience of the Centre, a central purpose of ISOs is that of meeting the needs of real people (as opposed to the abstract or bureaucratically defined concept of 'immigrant'), that is, the nonEnglish speaking, unemployed, and abused women, through the mechanism of support groups that promote kinship ties. (This thesis also finds support in Opoku-Dapaah's investigation into Ghanaian refugees.)

The effectiveness of the Centre's work is not known in the sense that government
accountability frequently emphasizes the number of services provided and these organizations lack the resources to carry out in depth evaluations. Although the Centre has attempted to gauge the quality of its programs, the longer term effectiveness of programs and services in terms of increasing individual client well-being or advancing group equity is unknown. Unintended outcomes such as the development of community leaders attest to Phillips' (1995) depiction of the voluntary sector as a forum for citizen engagement, which, at a broader level, builds social capital. However, while the Centre has been able to facilitate the development of leadership skills of particular individuals, it has been unable to engage in community or group development initiatives, largely due to the absence of a bounded geographic locale where clients live.

Multiple determinants of change operate within the agency - internal dynamics of growth, organizational goals, client needs, and accountability to funders. Kramer (1994) therefore suggests that the conventional antinomy between autonomy and accountability may be more artificial than real. In Chapter 1 I formulated the purpose of the study in terms of ISOs as the dependent variable and the Canadian state as the independent variable. Having conducted this study a reformulation is required. We might enumerate the presence of intervening variables such as the characteristics of the sector, organizational characteristics, or the characteristics of funding representatives as factors that influence the degree of conflict in government/ISO relationships.

One of the key organizational characteristics of the agency has been its advocacy function and its role as part of an influential policy constituency in Canada. This mobilization by ethnoracial communities to extend welfare provision highlights the role of social movements as agents of change in social policy. This role is now more curtailed than in previous times as we see governments intent on rolling back social welfare entitlements and equity policies.
Long Term Prospects for ISOs

The Impact of Economic Globalization

As Andrain (1985) points out, elements of voluntarism and determinism are at play in government decision making. Individual policy makers possess the ability to influence policy—but within limits. These limits may comprise cultural beliefs, i.e., ideologies, formal laws, informal customs. The ability to exercise power within the political system, the scope of public action that is permissible, and the state of the economy (especially tax revenues) operate to place limits upon public action. One of the fallouts of global restructuring has been the loss of Canada's manufacturing base and a consequent increase in unemployment, for both the native born and immigrants. Thus tax receipts are decreased at a time of increased demand for social insurance. The result has been the decision by federal and provincial governments to translate fiscal constraints into a redefinition of social entitlements and general reduction in social expenditures.

Thus there is a strongly pragmatic orientation to the approach taken herein. That is, notwithstanding how we want things to become, there are real parameters and a real historical context which limit the possibilities. In 1973, Habermas wrote of a legitimation crisis resulting from the inability of the state to respond to the numerous demands placed upon it. Richmond's (1991) updated appraisal is provided by Dorais, Foster, and Stockley (1994):

Policy-makers face a ‘no-win’ situation. There are too many conflicting interests to reconcile and too many structural contradictions in the global economic and social system to permit any policy a ‘rational’ or ‘optimal’ solution to pressing demographic, economic, political and humanitarian concerns. (p. 401).

The absence of a self evident solution, struggles between competing economic interests, and a lack of consensus has allowed government representatives to be selective about which suggestions and advice are taken (Dirks, 1995), resulting in state actions that promote economic goals such as strengthening the economy and infrastructure and enhancing international status.
Jimenez notes:

Ironically, the process of globalization, economic integration and economic restructuring give rise to an increasing movement of persons across international boundaries. “International labor migrant” is a more precise term to describe those who move in the complex web of a global economic system. Since the 1960s, economic migrants from developing countries to industrialized nations have quadrupled, reaching 940,000 per year. (Jimenez, 1997, p.1)

Public perception views high immigration levels as undesirable in these times. Government, aware of the need for population growth but desirous of decreasing public expenditures, has opted to pursue more skilled immigrants (and fewer family class immigrants) who will contribute to the economy and require few supportive services. In Jimenez’ (1997) view, worldwide, current immigration policies facilitate the exit and entrance of business owners, executives, administrators, and support technical labour (while limiting the movement of the poor), thereby advancing the interests of a global economic elite.

At the same time, presently the basic problems in immigrant settlement arise from high unemployment levels. In a study of 1991 census data, poverty amongst ethnoracial groups was correlated with higher than average unemployment levels within those groups, despite high educational levels (Ornstein, 1997). A report of the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto’s Commissioner of Community Services indicated that a survey of people on social assistance (excluding single parents) revealed: 68% were born outside Canada; 42% of this group had arrived after 1990; about one third had significant or occasional English language difficulties; 66% of all survey respondents had completed at least Gr. 12; 54% had some college/university; and 20% had Gr. 10 or less. More than one half of those with high school education, and 43% of those with higher education had studied outside Canada (Metro Chief Administrator’s Office, 1996).

Where previous generations of immigrants could be sure of employment and hence, some
degree of economic security and/or mobility, structural unemployment means that present day immigrants can be less sure of economic security. The potential for ghettoization is there despite the shift in emphasis in immigration policy to more educated and financially independent immigrants. Barriers to foreign-trained professionals and trades people, and gaps between labour market shortages and the skill sets of immigrants mean that problems in economic absorption will persist.

**Trends in Immigrant Service Delivery**

At the present time the lack of a clear mandate for community-based immigrant serving organizations is witnessed by the federal government's recent decision to devolve service delivery to local levels (e.g., provinces, municipalities, local planning committees), and to maintain current levels of funding but open up funding to broader public sectors institutions such as school boards and colleges. The proposed federal withdrawal from the current system purchase of service contracts for settlement service provision would leave the state playing a coordinating role by setting minimum standards for service provision. In theory, a pluralization of service provision would follow and ISOs would become one form of non profit service provider among others vying for government contracts. In the ensuing competition for funds, even the currently circumscribed political function of the agencies is likely to be curtailed. The benefit of devolution is of course flexibility, the ability to design programs that meet local needs. The drawbacks are the fiscal stress that occur when service demands exceed fixed funding levels, and intensified competition for dollars. In this competition there are clearly winners and losers among ISOs: winners have been able to maintain their organizations through strategies such as collaboration with other organizations.
Thus far the federal government has eschewed any role for the delivery of settlement services by for-profit enterprises. This probably reflects less of a commitment to ISOs as distinctive service providers and more of a recognition of the sector's cost efficiency.\textsuperscript{4} (Private for-profit enterprises have accessed governmental funding for employment training; for example, a now defunct federal/provincial training initiative for social assistance recipients program contracted with a for-profit organization in partnership with five ethnoracial community agencies.) Additionally, service accountability is increasingly measured in terms of the difficult to measure service outcomes and outputs rather than the even more difficult to measure equity outcomes.

Despite an improvement in mainstream service delivery (i.e., more mainstream organizations delivering culturally appropriate services) there has been no concurrent reduction in the demand for ethnoracially based service organizations. It is a positive sign that services to immigrants is no longer the concern of minority communities alone. The ISO sector cannot, on its own, provide equitable access to services, as well as addressing ethnic stratification and social inequalities. So-called mainstream services must assume some of this responsibility. Monitoring by funders and advocacy groups will continue to be necessary to assure appropriate decision-making structures, staff resources, and programs are in place.

In devising solutions to the current instability in the immigrant service sector (e.g., 36% cuts in the Province of Ontario's spending in the past two years and uncertainty regarding federal programs), Mwarigha (1997) of the Social Planning Council of Metropolitan Toronto proposes a type of triage approach in which settlement monies are dedicated for the initial and intermediate stages of settlement, that is: shelter, food, clothing, information and orientation, and other
essential services, language training, educational upgrading, and access to health, housing and legal systems. (He understands the “long term stage” to be various initiatives that facilitate the long term participation of individual immigrants in Canadian society.) His proposal rests upon a conception of ISOs as primarily service deliverers to individuals. Meanwhile, some time ago, Indra argued that:

> Were these organizations [ISOs] further institutionalized and more legitimated as means of social and cultural integration, they would also become a far more powerful political force in two senses at once; this would create a set of potent vehicles for the advocacy of ethnic minority concerns, while at the same time meaningfully integrating these groups into the fabric of Canadian political life. (Indra, 1987, p. 168)

For Indra, ISOs represented a mechanism for group empowerment.

While attractive in its emancipatory intent of power sharing, the notion of separate institutions is problematic. It is a political response which does not necessarily lead to adequate service responses. First, the assumptions of a homogeneous community have been done away with. Gender, class and in some instances clan and interethnic divisions exist among immigrant communities surface in struggles for control of service organizations. Second, the existence of multicultural ISOs provides a model which challenges the need for separate ethnospecific organizations. Third, the issue of how to provide counselling has been a long standing service issue. Many communities lack trained professional or paraprofessional staff. Thus far responses to this service issue have included the inadequate response of attempting to work through interpreters, and the training of immigrant workers to provide group counselling in areas such as wife and sexual assault. Fourth, how does the extreme insistence on cultural diversity and/or structural pluralism translate into participation in the political sphere of decision making and the
consequent ability to affect access to economic and political power? Fifth, all communities do not possess comparable resources: some will thrive and others will languish. And last, as this case study reveals, a shortcoming of the agency's work has been its limited ability to forge links with other communities, both immigrant and majority. (Recently more stringent funding polices have led to collaboration between the Centre and other agencies to offer joint programming.)

In terms of service provision the most powerful arguments for ISOs appear to be: that as Opoku-Dapaah has found, in the absence of integration in the economic sphere primarily, ISOs proffer a kind of safety net of cultural, kinship and linguistic resources; the ability of the agencies to band together and collectively articulate needs and thereby extend the provision of services to immigrants; and the brokerage/advocacy role played by settlement workers in increasing client access to mainstream services.

In political terms of course, the symbolic allocation of resources to minority communities is realized. But is there not an argument to be made for the importance of ISOs in more than symbolic terms? Writing in the area of democratic theory, Mansbridge (1996) adopting Nancy Fraser's term 'subaltern counterpublics,' advocates fostering such groups because of their importance to democracy in supplementing mainstream discourses and formal deliberations in government:

The goals of these counterpublics include understanding themselves better, forging bonds of solidarity, preserving memories of past injustices, interpreting and reinterpreting the means of those injustices, working out alternative conceptions of self, of community, of justice, and of universality, trying to make sense of both the privileges they wield and the oppressions they face, understanding the strategic configurations for and against their desired ends, deciding what alliances to make both emotionally and strategically, deliberating on ends and means, and deciding how to act, individually and collectively (Mansbridge, 1996, p. 58).
Recommendations

Further Research

A single case study is inadequate to the task of capturing the variety of forms of ISOs which range from associations using volunteers as unpaid staff, peer self-help groups, community-based grassroots associations and service agencies staffed by professionals. Thus surveys and multicase studies are required. Longitudinal studies of agencies would provide insights into organizational variables that influence an agency’s growth and effectiveness. The effects of the current period of flux—fiscal constraints and competition for funds—also warrants investigation.

How can we build on the strengths of the sector to enable it to compete with mainstream institutions? The Centre’s success with the use of support groups parallels the experience of Jewish Immigrant Aid Services and their use of support groups (Romberg, 1994). Therefore, the effectiveness of particular services, service models, and models of service coordination should also be highlighted through research.7

Hein’s (1991) caution that immigrants’ relationship to the welfare state not be subsumed within the larger field of race and ethnic relations, and that attention be paid to the conditions that lead to immigrants becoming ethnic minorities is well taken. For example, economic dislocation and marginality, in conjunction with the experience of transition and loss are conditions leading to some immigrant groups’ self-identification as an ethnic community. The nature of the group’s interactions with the host society is yet another variable.

Policy Implications

In the current climate of curtailed government spending on social welfare services
prescriptions for increased spending seem hopelessly naive. How can the demand for ethnically based services best be accommodated? The recommendations below have implications for broader public institutions such as universities and colleges, government, and ISOs.

From the instrumental perspective of obtaining the greatest impact from decreasing resources, Mwarigha’s (1997) proposition for the rationalization of funding to cover the initial stages of settlement has much to recommend it, since assistance with settlement in the language of the immigrant is obviously required. Further, the symbolic allocation of resources to minority communities is attained (leaving untouched the achievement of power in the political and economic spheres). From another point of view Mwarigha’s recommendation is less attractive. The triage approach leaves the agencies with “a constituency of the weakest”, that is, immigrants in the initial stages of settlement. If agencies are to engage in community fund raising, as is recommended below, these are the people with the least resources.

In Ontario, arguably the most innovative model of settlement services are offered by Jewish Immigrant Aid Services in Toronto. They have been able to supplement government funding with their own community funding to design programs that are holistic. Obviously all communities do not share the same socio-economic profile. If agencies want the flexibility to design programs that meet the needs of their particular communities they must pursue community funding. Activists have traditionally feared that this will ‘let the government off the hook’, leading eventually to reduced funding. If community development is an activity the agencies see as necessary, they will have to fund it themselves anyway since government has not been funding community development for some time.

Under the present Progressive Conservative government in Ontario, social services are
being moved "from state responsibility to personal and community responsibility" (Ontario Ministry of Community and Social Services, cited in Mwarigha, 1997). On the basis of empirical research, the argument could be made that for many immigrants who have left behind their familial and community connections, ISOs represent new, albeit artificial, forms of family and community support.

In-depth or longer term counselling must be addressed through programs that will: train paraprofessionals beyond basic level skills, recruit students from diverse communities into counselling programs, and fast track the accreditation of foreign trained counselling professionals. Initiatives such as these need to be championed, but ISOs are not likely proponents of initiatives like these that do not strengthen the agencies. In the present circumstances they generally lack the resources to engage with mainstream organizations in such change initiatives.

On the subject of strengthening agencies, this case study has revealed the not too surprising finding that through efficient management practices, such as meeting accountability requirements and effective agency administration and leadership, agencies are able to exert influence on funders and policy makers. Therefore a training school or initiative for smaller agencies and newer communities, akin to those of labour unions would not be amiss. The workshops and professional development activities that exist are short term and turnover in the profession is high. Professionalism in management practices is desirable because it signifies accountability to stakeholders. Professionalism in human service delivery is not as clear cut. Professionalization implies the specification of skills and models of practice derived from a body of knowledge and theory. The strength of the community based sector has been its ability to respond flexibly and to develop innovative programs (Kramer, 1981) in the absence of clearly
enumerated principles and codes of conduct. Critics of professionalization fear the imposition of yet another form of social control on clients. Settlement workers favour professionalization as recognition for the work they do and as a step towards addressing the issue of relatively low wages and wage disparities across the sector.

Finally, service coordination among ISOs and between ISOs and mainstream organizations should be addressed for many reasons, but most notably for the purpose of enhancing client access to services at a time of decreased service availability.

Conclusion

In the introductory chapter I alluded to an otoh/botoh perspective—a humorous but insightful turn of phrase. Otoh/botoh is a descriptive as well as a normative assertion of an intrinsic duality. Pels (1995), writing of simultaneity or duality in another context, seeks to supercede the barren opposition between functionalist and critical traditions:

I shall proceed from the hypothesis that the enabling and disabling dimensions...are interconnected in a much more immediate and constitutive sense than can be grasped from the dualistic oppositions in which both traditions hold each other prisoner. "Duality" does not mean that the productive and exploitative dimensions, "eufunctions" and dysfunctions, can simply be joined together by simple addition. It entails something like a generative or symbiotic coincidence of "light" and "dark" sides. These polarities appear to presume and precondition one another in a sense that falls out of range for one-dimensional "optimistic" or "pessimistic" approaches. (Pels, p.82)

The truth of otoh/botoh term resides in the endurance of a number of dichotomous ideas.

For example:

- the tendency towards drastic idealizations of the community
- the recognition that community activities are not always progressive and do not always serve the interests of all community members (Ng, Muller & Walker, 1990)
- the view that community representatives engage in conflict, competition and struggle which fulfil a positive and generative function

- in the final analysis the state performs a social control function

- state authority is seen as a pretext for dysfunctional domination

- governmental institutions and representatives operate according to a set of majority group norms and are, therefore, not neutral

- functionalists argue that bureaucratic management allows for institutionalized expertise, democratic control over knowledge and technology, and a collective ethos of disinterested public service (Pels, 1995)

- determinist arguments that the existence of welfare societies gives rise to needs, provides a particular means for satisfying those needs, and influences ways of thinking about those needs

- a suspicion that while community groups are funded to advocate and represent interests, advocates tend to become a threat to the extent that they speak on behalf of and in place of others. Their livelihood, power and prestige derive from those whom their services degrade into dependents. Thus enabling runs the risk of disabling.

- state responses to demands from below are not always unitary: state programs may be affected by interactions between state officials and pressures from clients, activists and academics (Fraser, 1989; Ng, Muller & Walker, 1990)

- state authority is a functional necessity allowing for a mediation of competing claims, legitimating some, disallowing others

- the state is inhabited by representatives of the wider population some of whom share the immigrant experience and interpretation of reality

- routinization of management processes do not allow for variability, and imposes a form of control over clients and their needs through reporting mechanisms

- a view of relationships as contradictory, ambiguous and conflictual, and power as something that is negotiated among unequally endowed parties, refuting simple theories of social control and interpretations that stress the top down nature of social welfare policies and passivity of recipients
• racialization or 'othering' involves the inclusion and exclusion of individuals

• public space has been brought under administrative control (Fraser, 1989).

• identity is predicated upon difference

• public space defined as a space for debate and discourse (Evers, 1993).

The challenge to the activist is to manage or balance these polarities with awareness, to be self-conscious, but not naive in their opposition.

From the otoh/botoh approach ensue modest and pragmatic conclusions, which nonetheless signal a practical engagement, the outcome of which is never guaranteed in advance. Hence for example, the conclusion that the field of immigration and multiculturalism is a field of unequal struggle between parties endowed with unequal resources: dominant group(s) and dominated groups of outsiders and newcomers. The dominant group opts for strategies of assimilation to which its interests are immediately linked; minority groups may choose more or less combative strategies in their efforts to level the playing field. Each acts in accordance with its perceived self interest and, in this instance, the resultant conflict has resulted in some progress and the promise of a fissure in the dominant social order.
ENDNOTES

1. Phillips (1995) notes the move towards government consultations and broader stakeholder meetings involving divergent and opposing groups with the supposed intent of mutual education (or with the intent of neutralizing opposition); however the result is the lack of a clear consistent message to policy makers.

2. At the same time the federal government has put dollars into the establishment of research centres on immigration and settlement in major cities across the country, and in Ontario they are expected to invest shortly in information and computer technology for all ISAP workers. These initiatives suggest a commitment to the sector.

3. Thus far the Ontario government has not expressed any desire to take over responsibility for settlement services—the preferred option of the federal government.

4. For example, in a recent study of service delivery to immigrants commissioned by Citizenship and Immigration Canada, no differentiation was made between immigrant serving and mainstream service deliverers. Instead distinctions between agencies were made on the basis of size, determined by the number of staff. If size is indeed a determining variable, it would still be possible to distinguish among large, medium and small immigrant serving organizations.

5. According to a Portuguese speaking counsellor, research conducted among service providers revealed one Portuguese speaking family counsellor among Portuguese service providers.

6. Mansbridge notes there are, of course, problems in that counterpublics include less than admirable groups such as the Kuklux Klan. Also counterpublics may speak only to the like minded detracting from the goal of an enlarged public conversation.

7. A potentially important provincially funded initiative to develop a standards framework for the sector is being carried out by two influential ISOs.

8. Dei (1996a) makes a similar argument with regard to funding for Afrocentric schools.

9. I am greatful to Professor Marilyn Laiken at OISE for this idea.
APPENDIX 1
Board member interview

1. Can you tell me about your involvement with the Centre? How did you become a part of the Board? What aspects of the agency's work have you been involved with?

2. As you know I am particularly interested in the Centre's relationship to clients, the community, funders and mainstream organizations. I'd like to ask you now about each of these groups.

   a) What does the Centre do for clients/why do they come here?
   Are there pressing needs the clients have that you are unable to provide for?

   b) What has been the nature of the agency's relationship with funders?

      Probes: • highpoints
              • lowpoints
              • points of contention

   c) What has been the nature of the agency's relationship with mainstream organizations in general?

   d) In particular, what has been the nature of the agency's relationship with ______ agencies?

      Probes: • highpoints
              • lowpoints
              • points of contention

   e) With respect to the larger Spanish and Portuguese community, not simply clients, what has been the agency's involvement?

      Probes: • community events
              • advocacy efforts
              • public education
              • board and staff recruitment

3. Lastly, can you tell me a little bit about your own background, your work etc.
Client interview

1. Can you tell me when you first came to the Centre?

2. Why did you come?

3. How did you know to come here?

4. Was the Centre able to help you with ________

or

Tell me about your experience in the program.

Probes: • isolation
        • has she made friends here
        • if she has been referred to a mainstream organization, what was that experience like?

5. Now I'd just like to know a little bit about you, how long have you been in Canada?
   Where did you come from?
   Where do you live?
Funder questionnaire

1. Can you tell me about your involvement with the Centre? What aspects of the agency's work have you been involved with?

2. As you know I am particularly interested in the Centre's relationship to clients, the community, funders and mainstream organizations. I'd like to ask you now about each of these groups.
   
a) What thoughts do you have about what the Centre does for clients/why do they come here?
   Are there pressing needs the clients have that you as a funder are unable to provide for?
   b) What has been the nature of the agency's relationship with you as a funder?

   Probes: • highpoints
   • lowpoints
   • points of contention

   c) To the best of your knowledge, hat has been the nature of the agency's relationship with mainstream organizations in general?
   e) With respect to the larger Spanish and Portuguese community, not simply clients, what is your perception of the agency's involvement?

   Probes: • community events
   • advocacy efforts
   • public education
   • board and staff recruitment
Mainstream interview

1. Can you tell me about your involvement with the Centre? What aspects of the agency's work have you been involved with?

2. In working together, are there pressing needs the clients have that you are unable to provide for?

3. One of the things I am interested in is the Centre's relationship with mainstream organizations.

   a) What has been the nature of your agency's relationship with the Centre?

   Probes: • highpoints
           • lowpoints
           • points of contention

   b) Do you have any knowledge of the agency's relationship with other mainstream organizations? If so, how would you characterize that relationship?

4. In working together have you had joint relationships with funders? If so, what has been the nature of the relationship?

   Probes: • highpoints
           • lowpoints
           • points of contention
Staff member interview

1. Can you tell me about your involvement with the Centre? How long have you been working here? What do you do?

2. As you know I am particularly interested in the Centre's relationship to clients, the community, funders and mainstream organizations. I'd like to ask you now about each of these groups.

   a) What does the Centre do for clients/why do they come here?
      Are there pressing needs the clients have that you are unable to provide for?

   b) Have you had any involvement with funders?
      What has been the nature of that relationship?

      Probes: • highpoints
               • lowpoints
               • points of contention

   c) What has been the nature of your/the agency's relationship with mainstream organizations in general?

   d) In particular, what has been the nature of your/the agency's relationship with __________ agencies?

      Probes: • highpoints
               • lowpoints
               • points of contention

   e) With respect to the larger Spanish and Portuguese community, not simply clients, what has been the agency's involvement?

      Probes: • community events
               • advocacy efforts
               • public education
               • board and staff recruitment

3. Lastly, can you tell me a little bit about your own background, training, previous work experience?
REFERENCES


Canadian Task Force on Mental Health Issues Affecting Immigrants and Refugees. (1988). After the door has been opened: Mental health issues affecting immigrants and refugees in Canada. Ottawa: Health and Welfare Canada


James, C. Introduction: Proposing an anti-racism framework for change. In C. James (Ed.), Perspectives on racism and the human services sector: A case for change (pp. 3-12). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.


