NOTE TO USERS

This reproduction is the best copy available.

UMI
TEACHERS' EXPERIENCES IN MAKING MEANING OF THEIR EDUCATIONAL ORIENTATIONS: 
THE MODEL OF CARE-EMPOWERING EDUCATION

by

Nettie Campbell

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Ph.D.
Department of Curriculum, Teaching, and Learning
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the
University of Toronto

© Copyright by Nettie Campbell 2001
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.
TEACHERS' EXPERIENCES IN MAKING MEANING OF THEIR EDUCATIONAL ORIENTATIONS: THE MODEL OF CARE-EMPOWERING EDUCATION

Nettie Campbell, Doctor of Philosophy, 2001

Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning

University of Toronto

Abstract

The question addressed in this study is, "What process allows teachers to acquire educational orientations they consider more viable for their situation?" Their central concern was discovered to be teaching the children. Because I wanted to have the data tell their own story and valued the possibility of contributing toward formal theory, I applied Glaser's grounded theory methodology in this qualitative study. The participants were sixteen teachers and four administrators, all employed in the same school system in Ontario. Data were collected by survey-interviews; individual, focus, and telephone interviews; history lines; observations; and obtaining other artifacts. Data collection and analysis were guided by constant comparison to discover the social psychological and/or structural processes that allow teachers to acquire more appropriate orientations, given their central concern of teaching the children.

Care-empowering education is the process that allows teachers to achieve more viable orientations. The model of care-empowering education consists of three complex and interrelated processes: creating and maintaining voice, caring, and inspiritive awakening. The processes of creating and maintaining voice determine the social structure of who has voice in the children's education. The process of caring, adapted from Nel Noddings' theory, refers to affirming and encouraging competence.
in drawing the best out of others and oneself. The caring teacher gives voice to the children in their own education. The children learn how to be cared for, and learn how to care for self and others. The new teacher-children relationships are accepted or supported by other adults. The process of *inspiritive awakening* is a special property of caring. It involves teachers learning how to be cared for as well as learning how to care for self and others in the teaching situation.

The care-empowering model, which emerged from the data, suggests how teachers cope with teaching the children. Inspiritive awakening may have important implications for the education profession. Extending the model to formal theory involves its application to education and caring in various social contexts. Future research may extend the model into other areas such as *caring for the earth*. 
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A Ph.D. dissertation has the author's name on the spine: however, many people contribute energy and inspiration for beginning and completing the dissertation. I am therefore proud of, yet humbled by, the contributions of many people who helped me to see the world in myself as a researcher and author (as opposed to seeing myself in the world). In particular:

To the research participants: I wrote this dissertation alone, yet I felt your presence through the stories you had shared with me. My gratitude to you continues to emerge.

To Dr. John Davis: You are a supervisor-mentor par excellence. My experience indicates that others could learn from your model. You have been a true believer in my efforts to complete this dissertation. Your high standards, consistent encouragement, gentle guidance, and giving me space have allowed the report to materialize. Your contribution was large, wise, and wonderful. What a beautiful soul you are!

To Dr. Lynn Davie: You are a thesis-proposal coach par excellence. You have been a true believer in my efforts to write a proposal I could live with. Your high standards, consistent encouragement, gentle guidance, and giving me space helped to maintain my enthusiasm throughout the proposal-writing process. Your contribution was large, wise, and wonderful. I loved working with you!

To Dr. Merl Wahlstrom and Dr. Edmond O'Sullivan: Thank you both for joining the committee, and for seeing to it that the report was acceptable for all of us. I am appreciative of the difference you made.

To Dr. Nel Noddings: What a joy it has been to share so much between the lines. I believe in your choices, and feel I have come to know you as a wise and caring person. I am also grateful for your contribution as the external examiner. Your questions delighted
They stretched my understanding of what it means to be a researcher.

To Jane Dubrick: Your presence meant a great deal to me, particularly when I needed someone to laugh with, or to help articulate my thoughts and feelings, or to contribute insights about some of the ethical issues I was experiencing.

Dr. Howard Russell: Your timely coaching from an insider's perspective, and your encouraging me to provide similar coaching for other students helped to bring pleasant closure to the oral examination experience.

To my family: You have helped me to make deeper meaning of the real power of love. I shall be eternally grateful for your encouraging, inspiring, applauding, and ingeniously helping to make all thing possible—even when the universe seemed to be testing me. Only kindred spirits would take responsibility for so many details, making it possible for me to concentrate on my research and writing. I sing your praises!
DEDICATION

For teachers everywhere who seek to apply care-empowering education:

Individually,

you nudge the evolution of a more caring humanity.

Collectively,

you make an invaluable contribution toward creating a better world.

It is to you I dedicate this dissertation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .............................................................................................................................. ii

Acknowledgments ........................................................................................................... iv

Dedication .......................................................................................................................... vi

Table of Contents ............................................................................................................ vii

List of Tables ................................................................................................................... xi

List of Figures ................................................................................................................... xii

Chapter One: Purpose of the Study, and Definitions of the Central Process .......... 1
  Purpose of the Study ........................................................................................................ 1
  Rationale ........................................................................................................................ 1
  Intended Contribution ................................................................................................... 5
  Definition of the Central Process ................................................................................... 6
  Overview of the Dissertation Chapters ......................................................................... 7

Chapter Two: Guiding Theoretical Perspectives ......................................................... 9
  Introduction .................................................................................................................... 9
    Orientation of Caring ................................................................................................ 10
    Teaching With Heightened Awareness ................................................................ 11
    Encountering the Children ....................................................................................... 15
    Encountering Other Adults in the Children’s Education ......................................... 17
  Changing Teacher’s Orientations ............................................................................... 21
    Curriculum Horizons ............................................................................................... 21
    Phases of Becoming More Authentic ...................................................................... 23
    Spiritual Energy in Making Intentional Life-Changes ............................................. 27
    Guidance Under the Ethic of Care .......................................................................... 31
  Summary of Chapter Two ............................................................................................. 34

Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology, the Participants, and the Researcher ........................................................................................................ 36
  Introduction ................................................................................................................... 36
  Selecting the Design .................................................................................................... 36
  The Qualitative, Grounded Theory, Case Study Design ............................................ 37
Participants and the Site ................................................................. 39
Gaining Access and Data Collection ............................................ 41
  The modes of Collecting Data .................................................. 44
Stages of Collecting and Analyzing Data ...................................... 48
  Stage 1: Concept Forming ....................................................... 51
  Stage 2: Concept Developing .................................................. 52
  Stage 3: Modifying and Integrating the Central Concept .......... 55
  Stage 4: Writing the Report ..................................................... 57
My Own Adaption of the Stages .................................................. 58
Encountering the Participants ..................................................... 60
The Researcher ........................................................................... 63
Limitations of the Study ............................................................. 64
Summary of Chapter Three .......................................................... 65

Chapter Four: Care-Empowering Education: Contextual Definitions,
Phases, and Conditions ............................................................... 66
Introduction .................................................................................. 66
What are the Contextual Definitions of Care-Empowering Education? ................................................................. 67
  Awakening .............................................................................. 67
  Caring .................................................................................... 68
  Orientation ............................................................................. 68
  Voice ..................................................................................... 69
  Indicators of a Caring Orientation ........................................... 70
What Phases Affect the Process of Care-Empowering Education? ................................................................. 71
  The Conduit Phase ................................................................ 72
  The Struggling-and-Finding Phase .......................................... 74
What Conditions Inhibit or Block the Process of Care-Empowering Education? ................................................................. 75
  Educational Orientation ......................................................... 76
  Connections .......................................................................... 78
  Image/Expectations ............................................................... 81
Summary of Chapter Four ............................................................. 83

Chapter Five: Struggling Through the Storm: Whose Voice Is It Anyway? 84
Introduction .................................................................................. 84
What Attempts Do the Teachers make to Create Voice in the Children's Education? ................................................................. 85
  Moves Toward a More Caring Orientation ........................................ 86
  Teachers' Attempts to Move Toward More Caring Orientations ... 87
What Attempts Do the Teachers Make to Maintain Voice in the Children's Education? ................................................................. 92
  Sources and Substances of Voices .............................................................. 92
What Voice Patterns Are the Outcome of the Teacher's Attempts to Create and Maintain Voice in the Children's Education? ......................... 99
  The Caring Pattern: No Voice Left Out .................................................. 100
  The I'm-Out-of-Here Pattern: All Voices Left Out .............................. 102
  The Teacher-Directed Pattern: The Voices of the Children and Other Adults Inhibited or Blocked ........................................ 104
  The Other-Directed Pattern: The Voice of the Teacher Inhibited or Blocked ........................................................................ 105
Summary of Chapter Five ....................................................................... 112

Chapter Six: Finding a Guiding Star For Navigating By: Caring and Inspiritive Awakening ......................................................... 114
  Introduction ......................................................................................... 114
  What Are the Properties of Caring? ....................................................... 115
    Properties ............................................................................................. 117
    In Summary ......................................................................................... 128
  What Are Some of the Conditions that Facilitate Caring? ..................... 129
    Past Experiences .................................................................................. 129
    The Most Challenging Children ......................................................... 131
    The Educational Orientations of Other Adults .................................. 132
    In Summary ......................................................................................... 145
  What Are the General Outcomes of Caring? ......................................... 145
    Margaret’s Pathway ............................................................................ 146
    Melissa’s Pathway ................................................................................ 147
    Miriam’s Pathway ............................................................................... 148
    In Summary ......................................................................................... 150
  What is Inspiritive Awakening? ............................................................ 151
    Inspiritive Awakening and the Caring Teacher ................................ 154
Summary of Chapter Six ......................................................................... 157
LIST OF TABLES

Table I: Description of Teachers ................................................................. 40

Table II: Data Collection Sessions ............................................................. 43
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Care-Empowering Education ................................................................. 6
Figure 2: The Six C’s as Properties of Care-Empowering Education ................. 55
Figure 3: The Phases of Teachers’ Pathways ....................................................... 71
Figure 4: Creator-Mentor Voice Patterns ............................................................ 99
Figure 5: Inspiritive Awakening ........................................................................ 152
Figure 6: The Model of Care-Empowering Education ........................................ 162
Students, in the care of good teachers, learn that they are indeed the recipients of care, and they have an opportunity to learn more about appropriate forms of care... We should study the best performance... and try humbly to find out how... [to] develop the attitudes, dispositions, and skills to care effectively. We need to know in order to provide all our children with experiences likely to develop this capacity... At a time when it is difficult to maintain an optimal level of caring even in loving homes, schools simply must help young people to learn how to contribute to caring relations (Noddings, 1991: 165, 166, 167).

The Purpose of the Study

The question addressed in the present study is, "What process allows teachers to acquire educational orientations they consider more viable for their situations, given their central concern for teaching the children?" My present view of the educational orientations of teachers is captured in the above quotation by Noddings. Thus, I feel there is a need to find out what teachers' orientations are and what experiences led to teachers changing their orientations over time, as well as to provide support for perfecting their acquisitions.

Rationale

Teachers and humanity are currently in an era of deep and unprecedented change. Teachers\(^1\) will move through the change, rather than be knocked over by

\(^1\) Where no option seemed available, the following two literary privileges have been taken: "Student" and "child" are used interchangeably, a use echoing that of many of the teachers in this study of educational orientations. Also, male and female pronominal references have been used for "child" and "teacher" respectively. These privileges are necessary because more appropriate vocabulary in the English language has not yet been born.
it, if they see clearly the pathways upon which they travel, what their desired destination is, and what energy forces are in motion. To date, however, there seems to be more fog than clarity. The orientation which currently dominates education is characterized by "reductionist and fragmented ways of knowing, truncated conceptions and hence, impoverished experiences of reality... [thereby putting] the children and the future at risk" (Sloan, 1993: 2). While many students are left "without a sense of continuity and with a feeling that no one cares" (Noddings, 1992: 64), the reason teachers often cite for leaving their careers in teaching is their being unable to make a worthwhile difference for the children (Noddings, 1996). Yet, teachers are reported not seeing themselves as agents of moral and social change (Fullan, 1995), and not making conscious and continuous efforts to make their knowledge explicit and change it where appropriate (Drake, 1994; Erickson, 1989; Fullan, 1993; Sloan, 1993), so they have no "positive images of driving forces" for guiding their practices (Fullan, 1993: 13). Nevertheless, "values are being transmitted --by what a teacher says and does and what he or she doesn't say and do" (Drake, 1994: 5). It is suggested that some teachers may need to become aware of themselves as whole persons in learning with at least six learning capabilities: rational, metaphoric, emotional, relational, physical, spiritual, and to take this awareness back into the classroom (Griffin, 1994). It is also suggested that some teachers may be unwilling to do the hard work necessary for managing growth around their own edges where:

The teacher develops a compassion for the student's edgework that goes beyond simple caring into a mutual process of expanding capacity for becoming [more] human,.. being creatively alive, taking risks in relationships, and moving along a personal path of growth in our work --[all of which]
is extremely enlivening. It can be extremely exhausting, exhilarating, painful, and frightening (Kirkpatrick, 1993: 128).

Yet, teachers are overloaded with changes originating from other persons (Beck, 1995; Fullan, 1993; Erickson, 1986). Both their contexts of work and their definitions of problems in their practices have often been ignored (Lieberman, 1996) while teaching is often described as a technical set of skills so that little room remains for intervention and building craft skills (Lieberman, 1996). It is also generally assumed that once teacher certification is acquired, "the task of learning to teach has been completed" (Eisner, 1991: 116). As a condition of employment, for example, teachers are not required to elucidate their educational orientations or to share them with their colleagues (Erickson, 1986).

Teachers seem to bring their own personal meaning to curriculum, to decide what will be taught to students, and how students learn (Erickson, 1986; Fullan, 1993; Lieberman, 1996; Schubert, 1986; Simmit, 1993; Wideen & Pye, 1994). Yet, little is known about how teachers make their decisions or about teachers as persons (Clandinin, 1986; Erickson, 1989; Fullan, 1993; Schubert, 1996; Wideen & Pye, 1994). For instance, little is known about how their belief systems are changed (Pajares, 1992), and about the role students play in the teachers' process of educational change (Fullan, 1993; Pajares; 1992; Smylie, 1994). The conceptual and empirical connections between redesigned teacher work and improved student outcomes are unclear (Smylie, 1994). Thus, it comes as little surprise that there continues to be strong criticism of research into teacher development, curriculum reform, school improvement, and effective schools (Wideen & Pye, 1994). "Too many researchers do not grant sufficient credibility
to the theories and knowledge that teachers develop from experience" (Schubert, 1991: 212). Clark and Patterson (1986) reviewed the research into teacher thinking and concluded:

Research has... tended to focus on relatively discrete and isolated aspects of teachers' thought processes and actions, rather than the whole process of teaching... The literature provides us with little sense of how teacher planning, interaction, thinking and decision making, and implicit theories and beliefs have developed over time" (Clark & Patterson, 1986: 292).

An example is provided by Elliott's (1993) qualitative study of three individual teachers' experiences in changing their educational orientations to be more holistic. Her report provides little insight into the conditions which inhibit the teachers' changing their orientations, and suggests the data may have been forced to fit extant theories of educational orientations. Similarly, although Wideen and Pye's (1994) qualitative study focuses on the social interaction within a whole school where the teachers choose to replace basil readers with a whole language approach, at the closure of the study the teachers do not have complete holistic orientations, and they resist the suggestion that there is need for such a change. Moreover, little has been learned to date from the intensive and expensive quantitative approaches to research on how to improve education, yet the dominant approach to research continues to be quantitative (Clarke & Patterson, 1986; Gram, 1990; Pajares, 1992; Smylie, 1994). Glaser (1999, 1996, 1994a, 1994b, 1994c, 1992, 1987; & 1967 with Strauss) provides a grounded theory method for studying the central concern of the participants, and the social structural and psychological processes which they describe as making life more viable for them in their situation. This research method is also appropriate for studying areas where there is a dearth of available research as well as areas where a fresh
approach is required.

Our concern about moving through the current era of deep and unprecedented change will remain futile until we hear from teachers' own voices: What does it mean to be human? What kind of person, school, and society are teachers trying to create? With what attitude, skills, and sense of understanding do teachers respond to everyday concerns? The central concern identified by the teachers in their situation is teaching the children. Thus, as noted earlier, the purpose of this study is to discover the process that allows teachers to acquire more appropriate orientations for their situations, given their central concern of teaching the children.

**Intended Contribution**

My hope is to contextualize teaching as having a human face, and help to lift it to the place of honour which it deserves in our society. Another hope is that explaining and predicting the process of allowing teachers to acquire orientations will contribute to a better understanding of what we might continue to do and what we should do differently if we are to provide schools which are better places in which students learn and teachers teach. For example, knowing what teachers do, will provide a foundation for "work[ing] cooperatively with them toward perfecting the methods to which they are devoted and in which they reveal their talent" (Noddings, 1984: 197). Teachers need to identify areas they could influence and see the consequences of their encounters with the children and other adults in their education in day-to-day practices. Official policy makers need to identify areas they can influence and see the consequences of policy interventions in teacher-children relationships. Hopefully, the theory discovered from this study will be useful to other persons concerned with policy making and student learning.
as well as with the self-inquiry and well-being of teachers.

**Definition of the Central Process**

The existential heart of life:... draws our attention to our passions, attitudes, connections, concerns, and experienced responsibilities (Noddings: 1992: 47).

The teachers' experiences of acquiring orientations they consider more appropriate for their situations while teaching the children have been addressed through a process I have named "care-empowering education." Figure 1 below provides an illustration of the three embedding processes of care-empowering education: *creating and maintaining voice, caring, and inspiritieve awakening.*

**Figure 1: Care-Empowering Education**

Voice refers to the communication of energy in verbal and nonverbal messages. Creating and maintaining voice refers to the processes of forming and
continuing to have voice which determine the social structural patterns of who has voice in the children's education. There are voice patterns where no voice is left out, where all voices are left out, where the voice of teacher is left out, and where the voices of the children and other adults are left out. This can be seen, for example, in the caring voice pattern where no voice is left out in that the teacher has voice in the children's education, and she gives voice to the children in their own education, while the teacher-children relationships are accepted or supported by other adults in the children's education. Caring has a broader focus than academic subject matter, in that it refers to affirming and encouraging competence in drawing the best out of others and oneself. For instance, through dialoguing, the teacher coaches the child's cultivating more caring relationships. She does this based on the feedback she receives from what the child is thinking and feeling. Inspiritive awakening refers to the teacher making deeper meaning of moving along a pathway toward applying a more caring orientation into the children's education.

**Overview of the Chapters of the Dissertation**

In this dissertation, Chapter One focuses on the purpose and rationale for the qualitative, grounded theory study, which was to determine the process by which teachers acquire educational orientations they consider more appropriate in their situations, while teaching the children. The name I have given to their central process is *care-empowering education*. Introductory definitions are provided for that central process and its supporting processes of creating and maintaining voice, caring, and inspiritive awakening. The theoretical perspectives applied in the study are described in Chapter Two. Noddings' orientation of caring and various
theories of changing orientations are included. Glaser's (1999, 1996, 1994a, 1994b, 1994c, 1992, 1987, & 1967 with Strauss) qualitative, grounded theory methodology is described in Chapter Three. The description of the 20 participants, my encounters with them, and my experience as the researcher are also described in Chapter Three. The contextual definitions for the study, the phases affecting the teachers' movement along their pathways, and the conditions inhibiting or blocking their movement are the focus in Chapter Four. The least-caring processes, in which the teachers struggle through the storm when their caring for the children is inhibited or blocked, are described in detail in Chapter Five. At the end of that chapter, voice patterns are described which indicate who has voice in the children's education. The caring process, in which the teachers are described as finding a guiding star for navigating their pathways toward applying more caring orientations, is described in Chapter Six. Other sections of that chapter focus on the conditions which facilitate the teachers' caring for the children, the voice patterns which are the general outcomes of caring, and the process by which the teachers' make deeper meaning of learning to be cared for, and learning to care for their own selves as well as the selves of the children and other adults in their education. In Chapter Seven, the theory of care-empowering education is summarized and discussed, as are some of its implications for practice, formal theory, and future research.
CHAPTER TWO

THE GUIDING THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

We collect data in the field first. Then start analyzing it and generating theory. When the theory seems sufficiently grounded and developed, then we review the literature in the field and relate theory to it through integration of ideas (Glaser 1978: 31).

Introduction


For the sake of clarity in this chapter, Noddings' theory is divided into two subtopics, those of caring and changing orientations.
Orientation of Caring

Noddings provides a philosophy of the caring orientation that helps to explain teachers' caring. This theory has emerged in response to the dominant liberal orientation which Noddings says prescribes a narrow set of capacities for all students and neglects their learning to care:

... liberal education (discipline orientation defined as a set of traditional disciplines) is an outmoded and dangerous mode of education for today's young... Is it the stuff people really need to live intelligently, morally, and happily? Or... mere political maneuverings?... [It is] an ideology of control that forces all students to study a particular, narrowly described curriculum devoid of content they might really care about... The greatest burden of the schools, as a result, is trying to find some way to teach adequately intelligent students things that they do not want to learn (Noddings, 1992: xii, 42).

For example, competence in liberal education is determined by objectives focusing on what students will be able to do under given conditions, rather than on "what students will want to do" (1999a: 209). Through the orientation of care, on the other hand, "classroom talk would cease to become a charade around the edges of intellectual and spiritual questions and become more nearly a fully human dialogue... [with] each individual... then set free to explore his or her own mental and spiritual nature" (Noddings & Shore, 1998b: 97-97). Moreover, "At present, neither liberal arts departments nor schools of education pay much attention to connecting academic subjects with themes of care" (Noddings, 1995c: 679).

In the caring orientation, the fundamental reality of being human is relational. "To receive and to be received, to care and be cared-for: these are the basic realities of human being and its basic aims" (Noddings, 1984: 173). Thus, the focus is on facilitating the growth of "caring, competent, loving, and lovable
people... [which] demonstrates respect for the full range of human talents" (Noddings, 1995c: 676). The focus is also on "transforming the school, and eventually society" (Noddings: 1992: 25), since "all human beings... can be led to develop the skills and knowledge necessary to make positive contributions" (Noddings, 1995c: 676). In their required experiences and moral thought:

* The focus is on living together, as well as on creating, maintaining, and enhancing positive relationships.
* The person caring and the recipient of that caring are responsible for co-creating the relationship.
* Decision making takes into account who the persons in the relationship are, with whom they have relationships, and the context in which they are situated.
* One great good is not positioned as superior.
* Ends and means are not separated (Noddings, 1992).

**Teaching with heightened awareness.** In the orientation of caring provided by Noddings, the caring teacher has heightened awareness of opportunities for caring during each encounter with another person. Love, which is inseparable from caring, is "a force that can be the most powerful agent in the classroom, leave the most lasting impression, and touch lives most deeply" (Noddings & Shore, 1998d: 157) by creating a special bond between the teacher and the student. For the caring teacher, this bond extends to loving the subject matter as well as to teaching and learning. The rewards for both the teacher and the child are joy and excitement, such as when the teacher's caring helps to facilitate the child's growing and self-actualizing. Noddings describes the attitude of caring teachers: "When we see the other's reality as a possibility for us, we must act to eliminate the intolerable, to reduce the pain, to fill the need, to actualize the dream" (Noddings, 1984: 14).
In teaching with heightened-awareness, the teacher is guided by a self-monitoring cycle consisting of the non-linear phases of reception, reflection, assessment (regarding why the teacher and the student are doing certain things and the effect), revision, and further exploration. In focusing upon this cycle, however, "rationality as 'trained intelligence' is not the dominant and guiding aim of education, but that does not mean that it is not at all an aim to be valued. It means that rationality, while important and prized, must serve something higher" (Noddings, 1984: 172). Assessment, for example, is directed by the teacher's aim "to preserve and enhance caring in herself and in those with whom she comes in contact" (Noddings, 1984: 172). From this point of view:

While much of what goes on in caring is rational and carefully thought out, the basic relationship is not, and neither is the required awareness of relatedness... The caring relationship in which a child thrives... is fundamentally nonrational. However rational the decision making process, however rational the investigation of means-ends relations, the commitment that elicits the rational activity precedes it and gives it personal meaning" (Noddings, 1996a: 23).

The teacher's commitment emerges from her Will, "the dynamic or motivational mechanism at the centre of her self" (Noddings & Shore, 1898e: 59). Thus, in a very real sense, the teacher's Will is who she is. Her Will's "appearance as force -- directed toward understanding, feeling, expressing, creating-- sustains and promotes intuitive activity" (Noddings & Shore, 1998e: 59). It does this through the supportive effect of curiosity, excitement, and awe that accompany intuitive

---

activity⁴. For instance, her Will emerges in intuition as feeling and sensibility or insight when she feels what the child feels, when she is on fire with inspiration, and when she sees with breathtaking clarity (Noddings & Shore, 1998e: 58). For this to evolve, however, the teacher's Will must allow her intuition to make such contacts: "It must, in a sense, be more concerned with subject-to-subject relation than with subject-to-object contact" (Noddings & Shore, 1998e: 63). Thus, the intuitive mode of thinking is described by Noddings and Shore (1998e) as best understood in contrast to the rational mode of⁵ thinking, as well as through the turning points connecting the two modes.

In contrast to the teacher whose thinking remains in a rational mode, the caring teacher also uses her intuitive mode for experiencing a sense of we-ness or even of being acted upon. Thus, her intuitive mode allows her to have a self-monitoring cycle that is at the heart of teaching "with heightened awareness" (Noddings, 1984: 35) in that the things that matter deeply to her appear as responses to her quest for meaning (Noddings & Shore, 1998: 65-66). For manifesting the intuitive mode, the teacher removes herself from the rational mode through relaxing herself, quietly turning her attention to the reality of the child, and seeing what he sees and feeling what he feels. Incubating the whole of what she has received from the child's reality allows the teacher to become aware that something must be done to facilitate his growth and self-actualization. Then, she

⁴ Traditionally, we have conceived intuition as our capacity to connect and represent objects of reason. We have neglected its dynamic or motivational connections and its affective connections" (Noddings & shore, 1998e: 63).

⁵ The intuitive mode can be thought of as subjective-receptive, and the rational mode can be thought of as objective-analytical/abstraction.
becomes aware that she wants to facilitate his growth and self-actualization. Thus, the intuitive mode of thinking "is a precreative mode characterized by outer quietude and inner voices and images, by absorption and sensory concentration" (Noddings, 1984: 34).

During teaching with heightened awareness, a turning point occurs as the teacher's intuitive mode of thinking carries perceptual materials into her cognitive domain so that they may be thought about. Her intuitive mode also carries perceptual materials to her Will so that they will be thought about. Those materials are combined and transformed through the rational mode of thinking according to its own rules (Noddings & Shore, 1998e: 60). During this combining and transforming, the child's reality becomes data for the analysis and study. Abstract plans thus emerge for concrete and personal execution with the particular child, place, and circumstances. There are also back-and-forth turning points between executing her plans and assessing the child's growth and self-actualization. In this way, the teacher keeps her "objective thinking tied to a relational stake at the heart of caring" (Noddings, 1984: 36).

Another turning point during teaching with heightened awareness, which may occur at any time during the self-monitoring cycle, involves the teacher turning her attention in on herself. If this turning point occurs, she weighs what she finds there against what she has received from the child. Thus, she decides whether or not to proceed with her efforts to care for him. If she decides not to proceed, it is a temporary decision in that she keeps an eye toward potential opportunities for caring for the child in the future.

In any effort to apply her intuitive mode of thinking, however, three risks
are present. The teacher may fail to quiet her own inner chatter which is necessary for establishing her intuitive mode. She may misinterpret the intuitive cues. Other person(s) involved in the encounter may reject a perfectly sound insight (Noddings & Shore, 1998b).

Application of the self-monitoring cycle for teaching with heightened awareness is often exemplified in this study of educational orientations. For instance, the teacher often quiets her rational mode of thinking, and turns her awareness to the child's reality in order to see what he sees and feel what he feels. Often, her awareness ultimately turns to feelings, imaginations, and judgments which emerge in support of her efforts for facilitating the child's growth and self-actualization.

**Encountering the children.** In the orientation of caring, Noddings says the caring teacher wants, but never demands, that the child "turn freely to his own projects, pursue them vigorously, and share his accounts of them spontaneously" (Noddings, 1996a: 36). As she cares for the children, her hope is that they will learn to be cared for as well as learn to care for themselves and others. The caring teacher focuses on teaching caring for self (including spiritual growth), and caring for intimate others (including friends and family)\(^6\). In order to enhance present and future possibilities of caring, Noddings wishes for students to spend at least half of the school day thinking about and working on interdisciplinary issues arising out of the challenge of caring. During the remainder of the day, she wishes

\(^6\) Although Nel Noddings' theory includes themes and centres of caring for self, strangers, other living things, the human-made world, and ideas, the present study focuses primarily on the teachers' caring for themselves, the children, and other adults in their education.
for students to focus on separate disciplines.

A caring teacher must be prepared to respond to the needs of students as both learners of subject matter and young persons learning to live meaningful lives... It is never wasteful use of time to establish relations of care and trust. Everything else goes better when such relations are in place. If teachers, with great artistry, can relate social incidents to the subject matter at hand, the rewards are clearly enormous. But even if the subject matter must be set aside temporarily, the results in terms of emotional safety and social growth are worth the brief sacrifice (Noddings, 1999a: 219).

The teacher focuses on encounters that confirm, model, dialogue, and practise caring with the children. She confirms for the child that he is worthy of being cared for through affirming, encouraging, and lifting him up toward a more-caring image of self than is manifested in his present actions. Because the teacher models caring, the child is provided with opportunities for experiencing the feel and look of caring. The teacher talks with the child about what he thinks and feels as a basis for helping him to cultivate caring relationships. She also guides the child's practice in finding his own directions and reasons for caring through the social and academic subject matter of his own projects. In order to care in this way, "Teachers must know their students well enough to connect present interests with prior experience, and they must know the community and subject matter well enough to make connections to future experience" (Noddings, 1992: 72). In addition,

There are risks... in undertaking any unit of study that focuses on matters of controversy or deep existential concern, and teachers should anticipate such risks... I am arguing here that it is morally irresponsible to simply ignore existential questions and themes of care; we must attend to them. But it is equally irresponsible to approach these deep concerns without caution and careful preparation (Noddings, 1995c: 677).
The caring teacher therefore has the obligation to protect immature students by helping them to make wise decisions. However, "Some children do not seem to respond to the attention and concern that teachers give them. No matter what we do, these children remain aloof and inaccessible at best, hostile and violent at worst" (Noddings & Shore, 1998: 172). Teachers react in a variety of ways to these manifestations. For instance, they may acknowledge that social factors outside of the classroom are sometimes more powerful than social factors within it.

This study of educational orientations abounds with examples of Noddings' theory of encountering the children as opportunities for caring. This can be seen in the teacher's efforts to confirm for the child a more caring image of himself than is manifest in his present encounters with others.

**Encountering other adults in the children's education.** The caring orientation provided by Noddings includes the teacher encountering other adults in the children's education as opportunities for caring. For example, teachers reach out to circles of care in "work[ing] to create and gather resources, plan[ning] options for [their own] developmental growth, and allocat[ing] tasks so as to capitalize on their own individual strengths" (Noddings, 1992: 176). Each person who provides caring support for the teacher reaches out, in turn, to additional circles of caring for support. Thus:

> When we are asked whose job it is to teach children how to care, an appropriate initial response is, 'Everyone's.' Having accepted universal responsibility, we can then ask about the special contributions and limitations of various individuals and groups (Noddings, 1995c: 678).

Examples of some of the configurations of the caring circles include at least four
ways of sharing interdisciplinary units on themes of care:

* Teachers actually teaching together in teams...
* Teachers agreeing on a theme or a central focus of care, but they do what they can, when they can, in their own classrooms...
* Teachers who have to work alone... choose several themes and weave them into regular course material over an entire semester or year. The particular themes will depend on the interests and preparation of each teacher... as well as helping their students learn to care and demonstrating their own caring by sharing interests that go well beyond the demands of textbook pedagogy.
* Being prepared to respond spontaneously to events that occur in the school or neighborhood... [such as] respond[ing] to the needs of students who are suffering from the death of friends, conflicts between groups of students] (Noddings, 1995c: 677-678).

However:

In the moments of care, carers attend and feel their motive energy flowing toward the cared-for; the cared-for makes some form of response that completes\(^7\) the relation. But beyond this basic description of two consciousnesses meeting in a caring relation, what actual, concrete people do varies with the situation; further it varies across time and cultures, even across personalities and moods. This variance is indeed part of what it means to care (Noddings, 1996b: 161).

The amount of caring between the teacher and the other adults in the children's education depends upon a constellation of conditions which involves adults across the whole network of care. The teacher therefore monitors the effect of her caring, not only with students and their relationships with each other, but across the network (Noddings, 1996b). To do so, the teacher needs the courage to grasp both possibilities and happiness since:

In today's educational climate, teachers were urged unceasingly to control their students ...and... stick rigidly to an authoritatively recommended teaching plan... If teachers

\(^7\) I add italics for emphasis.
understood the company they were in as they adopt (or adapt to?) those methods, they might resist using them. Perhaps we are fortunate that so many students... refuse to accept pedagogical authority. There are worse things than cultural illiteracy (Noddings, 1993: 61).

The caring teacher therefore aims to use policies which are compatible with justice, by establishing conditions in which caring flourishes. For example, she "follow[s] up with caring implementation and with reflection guided by care to see whether the original policy has fulfilled its aims or has introduced new inequalities and harms" (Noddings, 1999b: 4). She examines everything proposed as a part of education in the light of possibilities for the children becoming more competent, caring, loving, and lovable. Thus, she passes judgment as to whether each proposal is to pass, be rejected, or postponed because of doubt.

Vulnerability is, however, a natural part of the teacher's caring. For example, she could perceive the needs of the children as incompatible with the desire of another adult in their education, in which case she may care for the children but fail to care for the other adult. Although the teacher encounters the other adult as positively as conditions allow, and tries to disagree without disconnecting, "sometimes conflict cannot be resolved, and must simply be lived" (Noddings, 1984: 55). At worst, coercion, conformity, exclusion, assimilation, and distrust by others can limit her efforts to care for the children.

Often a lack of autonomy frustrates and humiliates the teacher by preventing her from establishing relations of care and trust with the children. "Caregivers... are worn down by the lack of completion --burned out by the constant outflow of energy that is not replenished by the response of the cared-for. Teachers... suffer this dreadful loss of energy when their students do not respond"
There is also the risk that the teacher "will be overwhelmed by the responsibilities and duties of the task" (Noddings, 1984: 12).

If the other adult's caring for the teacher is dramatically diminished or destroyed, the teacher may experience frustration and non-affirmation, and may retreat to a more receptive circle of relationships. Alternately, the teacher could respond by turning her sympathy in on herself, withdrawing, acknowledging feeling weary, and then recognizing that the mood will pass.

Two patterns of teachers' relationship with other adults in the children's education are "dependent" and "genuine caring." In the latter pattern, which is also referred to as "the way of hope and beauty," the teacher is cared for by another genuinely caring adult. The dependent pattern has three dimensions. In one, the other adult is self-centered and does not want the teacher to have freedom and, thus, does not care for her. Yet, the other adult could demand that she act as if she is cared for. If the teacher does so, she becomes unauthentic. In time, this other adult might recognize the reversal, and respond by caring for the teacher. However, the strain of the initial deceit could prevent the teacher from trusting that the other adult actually cares. She could, therefore, ultimately choose to exit the relationship, if possible.

In the second dimension of the dependent pattern, where caring for the teacher is diminished, she continues to respond to the encounter as potentially caring, and thus maintains the ethical ideal. She assumes and reflectively transforms the motives of the other adult, and uses strong motivation and commitment to restrain her persistent doubts. This is usually a teacher who has a long history of being genuinely cared for.
The third dimension of the dependent pattern is similar to the second, except that the teacher receives support elsewhere.

Noddings' theory of encountering the other adults in the children's education is exemplified repeatedly in the experiences of the teachers in this study of educational orientations. This can be seen where the voices of other adults' facilitate, inhibit, or block the teacher's voice in the children's education, which helps to determine who creates and maintains voice in the children's education.

Changing Teachers' Orientations


Curriculum horizons. In describing changes in curriculum policy, William Schubert's (1986) theory includes the evolution of three horizons in particular, those of mechanistic, practical, and critical praxis. The traditional paradigm, which precedes the mechanistic paradigm, is directed toward discovering and living the good and virtuous life. A misinterpretation of Ralph Tyler's theory has strongly influenced the trend toward replacing the traditional perspective with the mechanistic paradigm. Tyler's rationale actually emphasizes "a broad notion of behavior (including how learners thought and felt),... attention to experiences in
and out of school, and... involving students in their own learning experiences" (Schubert, 1986: 173). This rationale, however, has been re-interpreted in a technical manual focusing on behaviors and on the structures of disciplines. In this "how to" manual, learning experiences were addressed from the perspective of purpose, learning objectives, organization of instruction, and quantitative evaluation.

The emergence of an alternative to the mechanistic paradigm has been influenced by Joseph Schwab's work on the practical paradigm. In his proposal "for a language of the practical, reference was made to a mode of inquiry that evoked world view or outlook" (Schubert, 1986: 180). There are three eclectic arts in his curriculum inquiry: "to match theoretic perspectives with problems," "to tailor, adapt, and combine theoretical perspectives to fit situations, and "to invent new solutions that fit situations" (Schubert, 1986: 176). Through these three eclectic arts, it is intended that insight be developed into the continuously changing dynamics among the common places of teachers, students, subject matter, and milieu (psychological, physical, social, and economic aspects). For facilitating this development, a fourth eclectic art suggests forming teams composed of school and outside personnel.

A more-recent alternative paradigm in curriculum inquiry leads to a loosely-connected body of theories which, for lack of a well-fitting name, William Schubert (1986) refers to as the "critical praxis paradigm." To describe the broad

---

3 Tom Roby, who was a graduate student of Schwab for years, and whose thesis was initially supervised by Schwab, said that Schwab interpreted curriculum-making as "teaching and learning about life and living... in which everyone teaches everyone else and themselves besides" (Roby, 1998: 8).
range of perspectives in this new paradigm, he borrows a list of commonalities from Kolhr (1980, cited in Schubert 1986: 180). These may be summarized as follows:

* Nature as Organic.
* Individuals create knowledge and culture.
* Experiential methods.
* Preconscious experience.
* Curriculum literature extended to include emancipation via phenomenology, radical psychoanalysis, existentialism, critical theory, and even Eastern thought.
* Emancipation via higher-levels of consciousness of the growing/becoming person.
* Means and ends as integral for emancipation via diversity and pluralism.
* Application of critical praxis to political and social reconstruction.
* New languages of discourse for greater "moral compassion and sensitive artistic imagination" (Schubert, 1986: 180).

In the study of educational orientations, examples abound of teachers' responses to these three paradigms presented by Schubert. The practical paradigm, for instance, can be seen in their efforts to respond to professional development sessions based on the system's new framework of inclusive education.

**Phases of becoming more authentic.** Stephen Brookfield (1990, 1989) provides a theory of the phases in becoming more authentic. This theory emerged in response to the need for social-personal change in the lives of adults, and is intended to help adults become free from incongruencies between their ways of encountering themselves, others, and their espoused worldviews. One aim of Brookfield's theory is to help adults elucidate assumptions embedded in their implicit theories for interpreting, structuring, and making sense of the world. A second aim is to help adults learn to respect the worldviews of others, and thus to
facilitate their enjoyment of reciprocity and full equality. The ideal learning environment therefore mirrors these two aims of the theory.

For facilitating their becoming more authentic, adults focus on their own ongoing, personal critical incidents as they progress through the following non-linear phases:

* One trigger event for change is a sense of longing that is affiliated with joy. The other trigger event for change is a sense of inner "discomfort and perplexity" (Brookfield, 1989: 26) which emerges from circumstances or from a stimulus such as something someone says, or from a more catastrophic event involving dramatically reordering of personal priorities and assumptions.

* The trigger event is assessed through self-examination, identification, and clarification of other concerns, and perhaps connection with others who have similar experiences. Emotional stirring may also be heightened through the assessment.

* New ways of responding to discrepancies between the way things really are and desired reality are explored through "new ways of doing things, new answers, new concepts, new ways of organizing one's world view" (Apps, 1985: cited in Brookfield, 1989: 26).

* Alternative perspectives are developed through selecting "those assumptions and experiences that seem most satisfactory and congruent with our relationships and living" (Brookfield, 1989: 27). The old assumptions and actions are often maintained and modified to be more congruent with the situation.

* "Transforming attitudes and assumptions,... or confirming, with a renewed sense of conviction, existing stances" (Brookfield, 1989: 28).

* The subsequent change is externally observable or internal.

"As people strive for clarification in self understanding, and as they try to change aspects of their lives, the opportunity to discuss these activities is enormously helpful" (Brookfield, 1998: 10). The learning coach or adult educator must, however, remain mindful that it is enormously difficult for students to
become aware of their own assumptions and, in so doing, their worlds may crumble. Any caring support that is provided must, therefore, ensure that the individual's self-esteem remains relatively intact. Guidelines are provided for the adult educator who is helping students become more authentic through the use of recollected critical incidents:

As a means of probing [adult] learners' assumptive worlds, the critical incident technique is rooted in the phenomenological research tradition and presumes that learners' general assumptions are embedded in, and can be inferred from, their specific descriptions of particular events, and that specific responses to critical incidents often have the generic embedded within them. The purpose is to enter another's frame of reference so that that person's structures of understanding and interpretive filters can be experienced and understood by the educator or peer, as closely as possible to the way they were experienced and understood by the learner. [Reflections on critical incidents provide an] incontrovertible source of data representing the learner's existential realities. [They] stand alone as primary data sources giving insights into learners' assumptive worlds in expressions that are indisputably the learner's own (Brookfield, 1990: 179-180).

As an adult educator, Brookfield first models the kind of interpersonal relations he is asking the students to participate in as they explore their own critical incidents toward becoming more authentic. He discloses his own stance and strives to exemplify the process of reflecting on critical incidents by asking the adult learners to analyze some of his own incidents in teaching and learning in order to discover the general assumptions embedded therein. The adult students are then provided with the following instructions:

Think back over the past year. During that time, what event made you as an educator feel a real 'high' of excitement, satisfaction, and fulfilment? A time when you said to yourself, 'This is what it is all about,' or 'This is what makes it all
worthwhile? Write a brief description of the event. Make sure you include the details...(Roles, functions, and job titles should be used here rather than names of individuals)... Keep your description under one page (Brookfield, 1990: 182).

Only after the student describes details of why the critical incident is personally significant, as well as when, where, and who is involved in what sequence of events, does the collaborative induction take place around general elements embedded in the particular descriptions. In groups of two or three adult students, descriptions are read and analyzed for assumptions about the good educational practices embedded within them. Here assumptions are thought of as intuitions, general beliefs, or commonsense ideas which underlie and inform teaching actions.

The analysis includes considering:

* What the person's choice of critical incident says about her or his value system.
* What assumptions are embedded in the actions taken in the incident. After hearing the colleague's/colleagues' insights, the author of the incident comments on the accuracy and validity of the insights, whether surprised, and if a subsequent change in opinion is experienced.
* If there are commonalities and differences in the assumptions identified, are they representative of conventional wisdom in this field of practice?
* If there are major differences, to what extent are they representative of divergent views in the field or the results of contextual variations?
* What do colleagues' questions regarding the incident indicate about their own values and sense of what is significant in the incident (Brookfield, 1990)?

For each learner, one successful or high event is written and analyzed, and then one negative or low event is written and analyzed. This provides a fuller picture of the student's assumptive world than if only one positive or negative event is included. An alternative form of this experience is for each student to have a turn as a learning observer during the activity. The learning experience
concludes with a debriefing session which focuses on the ease of the process with respect to its clarity of instructions, difficulty in disclosing personal experience, the ease of identifying a significant event, and problems in probing colleagues' assumptions underlying their teaching.

Examples of Brookfield's theory of the phases of becoming more authentic abound in the study of educational orientations. An instance is a system consultant supporting a classroom teacher in learning to teach reading and math, with the outcome that the teacher adds ideas to her own teaching repertoire.

**Spiritual energy in making intentional life-changes.** Christiane Northrup (1994a, 1994b, 1994c) provides a theory of spiritual energy in making conscious changes. Her theory emerges from the concern that we too often comply with external control, or even look outside of ourselves for guidance, and are therefore often out of touch with what we know and feel. To "begin to trust ourselves and our experience" (Northrup, 1994c: 23), we need to become more conscious of our own role in the feedback loop of the system, which would lead to greater attention being paid to such priorities as cooperation with one another and with nature. This is possible because:

Humans are made out of energy and sustained by energy. Our bodies are ever-changing, dynamic fields of energy, not static physical structures. They are a hologram in which every part contains information about the whole... We can view our bodies as manifestations of spiritual energy... Energy fields interact within an individual person. They also interact between one person and another, and between one person and the world in general (Northrup, 1994a: 25-26).

This expanded concept of the mind locates it in every cell of our bodies rather than limiting it to the brain or the intellect. The mind and soul permeate the entire
body, and our inner guidance comes first, not through intellectual understanding, but through our feelings and body. Since beliefs are encoded in the body, biofeedback involves feelings, thoughts, and memories of the muscle tissue as part of the body's wisdom:

When we search for inner guidance with the intellect only -- as though it existed outside of ourselves and our own deepest knowing-- we get stuck in the search, and our inner guidance is effectively silenced. The intellect works best in service to our intuition, our inner guidance, soul, God or higher power -- whichever term we choose for spiritual energy that animates life (Northrup, 1994a: 31).

While thoughts are just one part of the body's wisdom, a long-held and repeated thought becomes a belief, an energy force, and is embedded in the person's cells. Beliefs create the physical basis for individual lives and health. For example, "Conflicts live in the body's energy field until they are resolved --they are 'healing opportunities' simply waiting for... attention" (Northrup, 1994a: 42). The individual's beliefs, which come from both the intellect and from past experiences, are influenced by commonly-held beliefs of our society. However, many beliefs are completely unconscious, and are thus unavailable to the intellect, so that we respond to assumptions about reality that are embedded in past events associated with ourselves and our experiences. Changing one's reality, therefore, begins with changing what one believes is possible. "We can be open to learning from all of life, from our inner selves and from all that with which we are connected" (Northrup, 1994a: 49).

It is by inner guidance that the individual is directed toward what is both life-enhancing and life-fulfilling:

Inner guidance... informs everything... Human beings are
co-creators with spirit and nature. Behavior is based on respect for self. Respect for self results in respect for others. Difference is celebrated as a reflection of the creative spirit. There are many paths to fulfilment and joy. None are superior. Living in touch with our inner guidance involves feeling our way through life using *all* ourselves: mind, body, emotions, spirit. When I refer to this process, I mean the various ways we listen and use our inner guidance to make conscious changes in our lives, behavior, relationships with other, and health (Northrup, 1994c: 51, 52).

The most important factors are hope, self-esteem, and education.

"It feels good in our bodies to think about and dwell upon what we want and why. We get excited and are inspired automatically by these thoughts and feelings, which in turn keep us in touch with our inner knowing and spiritual energy. The result is enthusiasm and joy" (Northrup, 1994b: 60). Yet, although we have been taught to think rather than to feel that we should always be happy and upbeat, in reality, "sadness and pain are natural parts of life. They are also great teachers" (Northrup, 1994b: 54).

Nothing changes in the individuals' outer circumstances, however, until they learn to value their own lives and gifts as much as those of other persons. For example:

All of us receive messages from our bodies regularly about what serves our health and well-being and what doesn't. Our bodies know immediately when we are doing something or even thinking about something that doesn't support us fully... We need to pay attention to the subtle signals from our bodies about what feels good and what doesn't" (Northrup, 1994b: 63).

These signals can provide guidance for the individual's identifying and saying "no" to things that drain personal energy, and identifying and saying "yes" to things that replenish it. They also provide direction for being sustained by doing things one
enjoys. This releases and cleanses the body, mind, and spirit so that they are set free. What is fundamental here is that "insight about what to do in a given situation often comes only after we feel our emotions about it" (Northrup, 1994b: 55).

The first step in making contact with our inner guidance is:

... to name our current experience, allow ourselves to feel it fully, emotionally, spiritually, and physically... [so that] it can no longer influence us unconsciously... [Moreover,] naming something that has affected us adversely is part of freeing... emotional and physical energy that has been stuffed, stuck, denied, or ignored (Northrup, 1994c: 14,15).

Thus, when Northrup is caught up in a downward spiral of negative feeling, she knows she is out of touch with her inner guidance, and giving too much attention to what she does not want. She gets her energy flowing positively again through the following self-talk process:

1. I acknowledge what I am feeling without making any judgment about it. [Yet,] I avoid wallowing around in negative energy and prolonging it... But I definitely feel it fully...
2. I acknowledge that there is a reason why I am feeling the way I am.
3. I... identify what is causing my energy to flow negatively...
4. ... I then ask myself what I do want... What I want is usually the opposite of what I am experiencing the moment I'm feeling bad. Asking myself what I want shifts my focus back to positive thoughts and thus moves my energy toward my wants.
5. I then name what I want. Stating our wants is powerful because it defines them clearly, allowing our creative energy to flow toward them.... It helps draw what I want to my experience....
6. Finally, I affirm that I have the power within me, via my inner guidance and my power of intent, to get what I want (Northrup, 1994b: 64).

Northrup says this process helps her to feel her emotions fully as well as to use
them for guidance for what she wants:

This aligns my thoughts with my inner guidance, and it feels good. Inspiration about what to do generally follows... I don't try to figure out what to do about a certain situation until I've gone through the entire process of looking in the direction of what I want. The reason for this is that directed thought creates vibration, which then results in inspiration (Northrup, 1994b: 65).

Thus, "We need to know that the very essence of a life based on inner guidance is abundant delight and joy" (Northrup, 1994b: 66). We also need to know that, "We all have choices --and we all have inner guidance and spiritual help available that can help us move toward optimal health, joy, and fulfillment... As individuals do this work, society as a whole can become healthier" (Northrup, 1994c: 24, 18).

Examples of spiritual energy in making intentional change abound in this study. This can be seen in the teachers' energy getting stuck on their pathways and then their getting it flowing again through encountering differences in their inner and outer guidance, and through naming what they want and do not want.

Guidance of an ethic of care. Nel Noddings' (1996a, 1996b, 1995a, 1995b, 1992, 1991, 1984; & with Shore, 1998c, 1998d) theory of the caring orientation includes the teacher's growing under the guidance of an ethic of care which emerges from the natural sentiment the teacher feels for others, as well as from the sentiment associated with her longing to maintain, recapture, or enhance her most tender caring moments:

The reflective nature of joy that accompanies a realization of the responsive reception of caring: the sense of connectedness, of harmony --the combination of excitement and serenity-- the sense of being in tune that is characteristic of receptive joy. The occurrence of joy as a willing transformation of self under the
compelling magic of other subjectivities points to a receptive consciousness, one that is energized by engagement and enlightened by looking and listening (Noddings, 1984: 144).

Since both the natural and longing sentiments may be denied, the teacher's challenge may be to learn to acknowledge and accept her need for relatedness, and commit to establishing the ethical ideal which is attainable. Likewise, by committing to receptivity, her natural caring will occur more frequently, and the conflict she experiences may be reduced. When her ideal is constrained, her challenge is to learn to acknowledge her finitude with sadness and relief, and to confine and stem past flaws. She is also challenged to commit herself to an ethical ideal that may be attainable in future while remaining open to correction as well as to guidance from another adult who is genuinely caring. Through the latter support, the teacher's world may be stretched, her projects may be supported, and her ethical and self-image may be nurtured. Thus, the teacher's ethical ideal does not exist in isolation, but rather is constructed and sustained by others caring for her, by her memory of her own past successes in caring, and by a reservoir of her own general strength.

Continuing to pay attention to her own needs, fears, and desires allows the teacher to have a vision as the basis for appreciating the efforts of others who care for her and for her own caring for the plights of others:

The effort to care over time reveals weaknesses in both ourselves and those we care for. Astute carers see that, to meet the needs of a variety of cared-fors, they must increase their own skills... As teachers, we may have to learn new subject matter to maintain the growth of our best students, and we may have to change our methods entirely to work effectively with students.

---

9 I add italics for emphasis.
who have great difficulty learning. In a fundamental, essential way, caring implies a quest for competence (Noddings, 1996b: 162).

Thus, rather than blaming herself when caring fails, the teacher needs to keep in mind:

While love is by definition an absolute, its immediate perceivable effects are infrequently absolute. Likewise, if our intuitions about students and subject matter have proved to be, at least on the surface, incorrect, we should not abandon intuitive approaches... The most profound connection between the intuitive experience and the emotion and involvement of love... should be the motivation to evaluate critically cherished intuitive feelings and to strive to adjust classroom situations that are not working (Noddings & Shore, 1998d: 172-173).

Therefore, when love seems to fail, it actually provides "possibilities for future efforts, decisions, and intuitive insights" (Noddings & Shore, 1998d: 173). If love continues to fail, the teacher may just have to live with the failure, at least temporarily, but remain open to future opportunities for caring.

Traditional critical thinking is inadequate for the teacher's growing under the ethic of care because that thinking is often associated with winning arguments, implementing the disciplines, and gaining self-knowledge. Critical thinking may also be inadequate in that it is often applied to overcome the tendency to act on feeling, and thus results in coldness and meanness toward others. With intuition added to the teacher's critical thinking, receptivity is directed both outward and inward, thereby allowing the teacher's acceptance of herself as caring, as an interpersonal reasoner, and as identifying and accepting her emotional basis for actions. The hope is that:

As we understand ourselves better, we may increase our
motivation to understand others; similarly, as we engage in caring forms of interpersonal reasoning, we should gain a deeper understanding of ourselves. The two pursuits should be synergistic. A positive form of critical thinking would be directed at our own emotional lives and patterns of response, not at just our beliefs and arguments... Critical thinking guided by an ethic of care encourages us to stay in touch with our own feelings and accept our embodied condition... Our hope is that the identification and acceptance of our own emotional states should help us to set aside (not overcome them) and replace them, first with the tragic sense that we too are vulnerable to error and evil and second, with more positive feelings for those we encounter... As we understand the emotional roots of our behavior, we may learn when to abandon conventional critical thinking and engage in interpersonal reasoning... Interpersonal reasoning is concerned primarily with the relationship between participants in conversation or dialogue. It is characterized by an attitude of solicitude or care... It requires the engrossment or attention... of care. It asks the other, explicitly or implicitly, 'What are you going through?' (Noddings, 1995a: 195).

In this way, the teacher is awakening more deeply to her love in teaching children, and subsequently striving for further self-actualization. Thus, interest in the ethical ideal surpasses self-interest.

Examples of the teachers growing under the guidance of the ethic of care are replete in the study of educational orientations. This can be seen in the teachers' learning how to learn in the teaching situation, learning to be self directed, and learning to be cared for.

Summary of Chapter Two

Chapter Two focuses on the theoretical perspectives that guided the collection and analysis of data during this study of teachers' orientations. The
orientation of care provided by the teacher educator, Nel Noddings (and with Paul Shore) helped to explain the teachers' learning to care. Four extant theories helped to explain changes in the teachers' orientations: curriculum paradigms, provided by the teacher educator, William Schubert; phases of becoming more authentic, provided by the adult educator, Stephen Brookfield; spiritual energy in intentional change, by the physician, Christiane Northrup; and growing under the guidance of an ethic of care, by Nel Noddings (and with Paul Shore).
CHAPTER THREE
THE RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY,
THE PARTICIPANTS, AND THE RESEARCHER

Grounded theories have 'grab' and they are interesting. People remember them; they use them. To achieve this use, a theory must have fit and relevance, and it must work. A theory must be readily modifiable. Grounded theory meets these criteria (Glaser, 1978: 4).

**Introduction**

I began this study with the broad question, "What process allows teachers to acquire educational orientations they consider most viable for their situations?" This is a question that required cogent explanation of what was going on and how it could be accounted for. Thus, I found that I wanted to ground the explanation in the central concern described by the teachers themselves for their situations. Their central concern was discovered to be teaching the children.

**Selecting The Research Design**

In selecting the design of this study into teachers' educational orientations, I was guided by Merriam (1988):

The nature of the research design is determined by the nature of the research question, and the amount of control, the desired end product, and whether a bounded system such as a program, an event, a person, a process, an instruction or a social group... is identified as the focus of the investigation (Merriam, 1988: 9).

Given these criteria, the options for this study were either a case, historical, or experimental study (Merriam, 1988). Because the participants are a group of
teachers in one school system, and the desired report focuses on all of the
participants' experiences over time, the case study design was confirmed as
appropriate. It allowed me "to understand the particulars in depth, not because one
wants to know what is generally true to many" (Mirriam, 1988: 173). That the
qualitative, case study design is confirmed as appropriate can be seen in its use by
Elliott (1993) for inquiring into changes to the holistic orientations of three
individual teachers who added mythology to their practices. This design can also
be seen as appropriate in its use by Wideen and Pye (1994) for inquiring into
changes in the practices of teachers in one school where a core group decided to
replace basal readers by a whole language approach.

The Qualitative, Grounded Theory, Case Study Design

Early in the process of collecting and analyzing data, I discovered that a
qualitative, grounded theory design was a good match with the nature of this
research:

Grounded theory tells us what is going on, tells us how to
account for the participants' main concerns, and reveals access
variables that allow for incremental change. Grounded theory is what is, not what should, could, or ought to be... Qualitative
data are inexpensive to collect, very rich in meaning and observation... Grounded theory is being linked to qualitative
data and is seen as a qualitative method... Qualitative grounded
theory accounts for the global spread of its use (Glaser,
1999: 840, 842).

There were other ways in which grounded theory was appropriate: There was a
dearth of research into why teachers make the decisions that they do and who they
are as persons. Grounded theory was appropriate for uncovering peoples'
meanings, experiences, and interactions which are largely absent from published
research. It was also appropriate where there is need for a fresh approach to
studying an area of interest (Glaser, 1978; Glaser, 1992; Glaser & Strauss, 1967: Stern, 1994). Grounded theory seemed appropriate for honouring the complexity and dignity of the teachers' experiences in a situation where the school system's policy of holistic education was not stable (Glaser, 1978). Glaser's (1978) insistence, as cited above, that "grounded theories have 'grab' and they are interesting, people remember them, they use them" (Glaser, 1978: 4) also encouraged me to apply grounded theory. This design was also attractive to me personally because it is readily modifiable whenever new data present variations in properties and categories. Moreover, I was enthusiastic that "the grounded theorist has no idea what paradigm will emerge... Emergence is a [sic] eureka process... You will be excited with the emergent outcomes which will be replete with relevance, work and fit... and very original!" (Glaser, 1992: 82). My thinking was also influenced by Bryman and Burgess's statement (1994):

Grounded theory is widely cited as a prominent framework for the analysis of qualitative data and is frequently referred to as the approach employed when writers report the results of their research... [Yet] quite rarely do we find evidence in the contributions of the iterative interplay of data collection and analysis that lies at the heart of grounded theory... and rarely do we find clear indicators that theory is being developed (Bryman & Burgess, 1994: 220-221).

There are, however, currently two schools of thought on grounded theory: the Glaserian school, and Straussian school. Stern says that Glaser and Strauss are "two brilliant men who both do important work. But they go about it in different ways" (Stern, 1994: 220). The difference, according to Stern, is:

Strauss, as he examines the data, stops at each word to ask, 'What if?' Glaser keeps his attention focused on the data and asks, 'What do we have here?' Strauss brings to bear every
possible contingency that could relate to the data, whether it appears in the data or not. Glaser focuses his attention on the data to tell their own story (Stern, 1994: 220).

Stern adds:

To me, a strict Glaserian (student paying homage to a mentor), Strauss and Glaser present fundamentally different methods. Strauss' students produce good and important work,... but it, too, is fundamentally different. The product seems bound to a single set of circumstances and fails to hint at that conceptual leap that, in time, becomes formal theory (Stern, 1994: 221).

Because I felt the need to have the data tell their own story and valued the possibility of contributing toward formal theory, I decided to follow the Glaserian school of grounded theory. I had no external funding that could bias the decision, so I was free to choose the school of grounded theory that seemed most appropriate. I also decided to follow Stern's advice that the researcher report in detail the methodology applied, "so that readers might learn something" (Stern, 1994: 219).

Participants and Site

There were 20 participants in the study, sixteen teachers and four administrators, all employed by one Separate School System in Southern Ontario. The sixteen teachers taught in two elementary schools, each serving approximately 300 children. Two system-based and two-school based administrators provided backdrop information for the teachers' stories, such as policy trends in the system, and served as gatekeepers for access to data collection with the participant-teachers. I considered the sixteen teachers a manageable number, given the financial and time costs to myself for completing the study, including my
travelling more than two hours each way between my residence and the schools. The research site was selected because it was expected to cover a rich mix of teaching, interactions, programs, and structures (Bogden & Biklen, 1982). Moreover, this rich mix seemed to be characteristic of the past decade, since there was a system policy of inclusive education, followed by a policy of holistic education and, just prior to the first collection of data, the Ministry of Education and Training had mandated a curriculum of outcomes-based education.

The demographic description of the teachers is shown in Table I:

**Table I: Description of the Teachers**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years Taught</th>
<th># Schools Taught In</th>
<th>Years Taught In Present School</th>
<th># Grades Taught</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>MEd, MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Cert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>BEd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>MEd, ...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>MEd, ...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

10 It will be recalled that the decision to apply grounded theory was made after the site was chosen. The site, nevertheless, meets Glaser and Strauss's (1976) criteria such as covering wide ranges, continua, degrees, types, uniformities, variations, causes, conditions, consequences, probabilities of relationships, strategies, processes, and structural mechanisms.

11 Missing data indicates that the participant omitted it from the demographic sheet.
All of the teachers were Caucasian, and fourteen were female. Their teaching experience included four to 32 years, with only two having less than ten years experience. The number of schools they taught in ranged from two to seven, with eight of the teachers having taught in five or more schools. Their years in their present school varied from one to 21, with only three having taught at that school for three years or less. The number of grades the teachers taught throughout the years ranged from four to nine, with only two having taught fewer than five grades. Their education varied from Certification to MEd plus MA, with only two having no degree. This demographic description of the teachers indicates an appropriate mix of people, programs, and interactions for the study of educational orientations.

**Gaining Access and Data Collection**

My entry into the research site was smooth, and was initiated by two system-based administrators (with whom I was already acquainted) expressing interest in my research question, and suggesting their system as the site for the study. Before I began to collect data, however, one of the original administrators had been replaced through retirement. For the purposes of obtaining backdrop information for the teachers' experiences, and for developing a positive rapport and building trust, as well as facilitating their deep interest in gleaning useful insights from the research report that I would ultimately provide for the administrators, I interviewed both the new and the remaining administrators regarding their own thoughts and feelings concerning the policy changes during the past decade. One of the administrators also suggested that I observe a system-wide, "intensive
training session" for principals and teacher-representatives. After obtaining the support of the other administrator, I observed the session.

The administrators suggested three principals who might agree to the teachers in their schools participating in the study. I was not previously acquainted with these principals. I contacted each of them by telephone, briefly described the study, and offered to provide copy of a brief written description as well. For the purpose of establishing a positive rapport and beginning to build trust, I accommodated the first principal's request for a personal interview regarding the study. During the interview, I explained that teachers from two schools were required to participate, and that each principal would be invited to be interviewed (together or separately) regarding his or her thoughts and feelings about the influence of the recent framework changes on his or her school. The second principal declined the invitation to participate because the teachers in his school had recently made a major commitment beyond their teaching responsibilities. The first and third principals conferred with each other and with their teachers, and decided to participate in the study. Two teachers declined the invitation to participate, and the remaining nine teachers from one school and seven teachers from the other school became the participants in the study. During the first data-collection session, nine teachers volunteered to be participants in the in-depth study, and the selection of the actual, three key participants was made by the principals and teachers. Prior to the study, I was not acquainted with any of the teachers. The principals chose to be interviewed together mid-way through the study.

The selection and detailed description of the modes of collecting data are
the focus of a later section in this chapter; however, a description of the data-collection sessions with the teachers is shown in Table II:

Table II: Data Collection Sessions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Sessions</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Observer</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11/04/97</td>
<td>Survey-interview</td>
<td>7 (one setting)</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>90 min</td>
<td>Spiritual retreat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/04/97</td>
<td>Survey-interview</td>
<td>9 (one sitting)</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>90 min</td>
<td>Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/05/97</td>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>70 min</td>
<td>Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/05/97</td>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Class &amp; teacher</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>20 min</td>
<td>Classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06/02/98</td>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>2 (focus group)</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>1-4 hrs</td>
<td>Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06/02/98</td>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Class &amp; teacher</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>20 min</td>
<td>Classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06/02/98</td>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Class &amp; teacher</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>25 min</td>
<td>Classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06/02/98</td>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>2 (focus group)</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>90 min</td>
<td>Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>Follow-up</td>
<td>2 of 3</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>5-30 min</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>Follow-up</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Snail mail</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The collection of data extended beyond two-and-one-half years. This period was extended due to the teachers being unavailable for data collection for various periods including almost a year, because of their other commitments such as the teachers' protest, new mandated curriculum, and new computerized report cards for reporting to parents. With one exception, all interviews took place in the schools. The exception was a set of interviews held in a spiritual retreat building on the edge of a wooded nature trail. For the initial interview session with each teaching-staff, the respective principal was present. A principal who extended an invitation for me to observe a class of children and their teacher (who was not a key participant), was also present during that observation period. The face-to-face

---

\[12\] Another delay during the research process was due to my restricted use of the computer because of eye strain.
interviews were scheduled for 60 to 90 minutes but, upon the request of the teachers, one interview was extended to four hours. The number of teachers participating in a session ranged from one to nine. There was a total of nine follow-up interviews and one written response from two of the three participant-teachers (and a total of five follow-up interviews with the administrators). The length of the follow-up interviews ranged from five to 30 minutes. In addition, with the exception of the periods when the participants were unavailable for data collection, every two or three months throughout the duration of the study, I provided each of the four administrators with a brief oral or written report on the progress of the study, as well as an expression of my appreciation.

The Modes of Collecting Data

In grounded theory, constant comparison is "likely to be applied in the same study to any kind of qualitative information, including observations, interviews, documents, articles, books, and so forth" (Glaser, 1994: 184). Interviews, for example, are used to explore the perspectives of the participants "to find out from them those things we cannot directly observe... We cannot observe feelings, thoughts, and intentions... behaviors that took place at previous points in time,... and how people have organized their world and the meaning they attach to what goes on in the world" (Patton, 1980: 198). As cited earlier, the modes selected for collecting data in this study included survey-interviews; individual, focus group, and telephone interviews; drawing history/biography lines; observations; and acquiring other artifacts.

Mode 1: Survey-interview. The survey mode is convenient and easily administered (Merriam, 1988). The purpose of the survey-interview was directed
by three basic guiding questions for inquiring into what each teacher was thinking and feeling:

* How do you see your own current practices, and the current practices of the school and of the school system?
* How has your practice evolved over the years, and what were the learning experiences that led to those current practices?
* What future changes do you desire in your own practices, in the future practices of the school and of the school system? How may it be possible to work toward these changes, and who can help and how?

Other guiding questions were expected to emerge, and did so, as the study progressed. The purpose of the survey-interview was also guided by my desire to create positive rapport and build trust with the participants, and hopefully providing an experience for them that they would consider worthwhile. To open each of the survey-interview sessions, I used a short conversation about my own experience as a teacher and a researcher, as well as about the purpose, procedures, and duration of the study. A further description of this conversation is included in a later section of this chapter. For the purposes of the survey-interview, I then invited the teachers to give me, in person or by writing in the margin of the survey-interview sheets, suggestions for modifications for better accommodating their own experiences.

**Mode 2: Individual, focus group, and telephone interviews.** The teachers participated in the individual, focus group, and telephone interviews with their own interpretation of the purpose of the research which they had gleaned, for example, from their preceding experiences with the survey-interview. They also
arrived with their own agendas for describing changes and challenges in their practices (during the years) that allowed their teaching to be more appropriate for their situation.\(^\text{13}\)

During the face-to-face interviews, I often listened as the teachers followed through on their own agendas. Throughout these interviews, and particularly during the follow-up interviews, I chose appropriate interview questions as suggested by Patton (1980b), open-ended, semi-structured, and structured. I also chose appropriate types of questions as suggested by Patton (1980b), experience, opinion/value, feelings, knowledge, and sensory. In addition, (with the exception of "devil's advocate,") I chose the appropriate researcher-stances suggested by Strauss, Schatzman, Bucher, Sabahin (cited in Merriam, 1988), hypothetical, ideal position, and interpretive.

**Mode 3: History/biography lines.** During the first individual or focus-group interview with the key participants, I invited each teacher to draw a history or biography line of the key events/experiences in her practice over time. I provided two-by-three-foot sheets of paper, as well as pencils and coloured markers. This mode of collecting data was adapted from Bauer and Vannice (1992).

\(^{13}\) An example of a teacher arriving with her own interpretation of the research purpose and her own agenda can be seen in one teacher's enthusiasm and eagerness to share a story and a related note of appreciation which arrived that morning from a parent. Her positive energy led to my foregoing a planned centering experience for easing our way into the session. Another example can be seen in a teacher seeking me out after school to share the story of coming to the aid of an (anonymous) child. She greeted me, "Oh, there you are Nettie. There is something else I have been waiting to tell you." The story that followed was told with much passion for the child, and included an interweaving of the child's and the teacher's experiences. The story continues to touch me deeply as I write.
**Mode 4: Observations.** In each situation where I was present with the participants, I collected a systematic description of their events, interactions, artifacts, and then recorded the meaning associated with my observations. It may be recalled that I observed classes of children and teachers, and an intensive training session with principals and teacher-representatives. Other observations took place prior to, and following, formal interview sessions. The observations occasionally involved informal interviewing, and served as the basis for questions in formal follow-up interviews (Patton, 1980a). During the observations, I applied Patton's (1980a) guidelines of focusing on what people say, what they do, how they interact, the nature of the physical setting, and what does not happen in the participant’s experiences. Following Patton's (1980a) guidelines, I also focused on the physical environment, the social environment, activities and participant interactions, informal interactions and planned experiences, and habits of verbal expression.\(^{14}\)

**Mode 5: Acquiring other artifacts.** A variety of other artifacts were collected during interviews. For instance, a key participant provided me with a copy of a note from a parent which was relevant to several experiences she described for me. Other documents, such as school newsletters, a system framework booklet, and mission statement booklet were also collected. An artifact that I was offered, but politely declined, was a *five-inch, multi-coloured worm* from a bag of candy "treats" a teacher offered to a child, a colleague, and myself.

\(^{14}\) For example, although "child" was used by the participant-teachers more frequently than "kid" or "student," it was an unreliable indicator of the teacher’s educational orientation or change in orientation because the latter were often used as synonyms for "child."
I enjoyed the event, however.

**The Stages of Collecting and Analyzing Empirical Data**

Glaser (1992) says the grounded theorist "moves into an area of interest with no problem. He moves in with the abstract wonderment of what is going on that is an issue and how it is handled" (Glaser, 1992: 22). Therefore, in order to funnel the collection and analysis of data toward a core concept, Glaser (1978) directs the researcher to focus on the integration of concepts that flow into the end product of the basic social process (BSP). In this study of educational orientations, that process is discovered to be care-empowering education. Glaser says that the basic social process has stages, is variable in that not all persons go through the stages in the same manner, and is pervasive in that it captures a theoretical reflection and summarization "of the patterned, systematic uniformity flows of social life which people go through" (Glaser, 1978: 100). He also says that a basic social process involves change over time, and has a dominant psychological process\(^\text{15}\), or a dominant structural process\(^\text{16}\), or a mix of these processes (Glaser, 1978: 100-101). In this study, the basic social process is a mix of the structural process, creating and maintaining voice patterns together in relationships, and the psychological process, caring. Glaser says that the psychological process, such as becoming, highlighting, and health optimizing, refers to the participant's capacities and resources relevant to understanding behavior. It is usually needed to

\(^{15}\) Glaser usually refers to this as "the basic social psychological process" (BSPP). In this report, I often refer to it as to "the psychological process."

\(^{16}\) Glaser usually refers to this as the "basic social structural process" (BSSP). In this report, I often refer to it as "the structural process."
understand the focus of a structural process” (Glaser, 1978: 102). He also says that the structural process "refers to social structure in process—usually growth or deterioration—such as... centralization or decentralization, organizational growth" within which the psychological process processes (Glaser, 1978: 102).

Since the grounded theorist enters the field in search of the participants' central concern relevant to a particular area of interest, and with the hope of discovering the basic social process in the data, Glaser provides four, generic, guiding questions:18:

'What is this data a study of?' 'What category' or what property of what category does this incident indicate.[sic]'
'What is actually happening in the data?' and lastly 'What is the basic social psychological process or the social structural process that processes the main problem that makes life viable in the action scene?' (Glaser, 1992: 51).

These questions are answered through the process of constant comparison analysis by going "directly for categories, their properties and the theoretical codes" that

---

17 For the purposes of this study, I interpret the BSPP to be what is going on inside of the teacher relevant to teaching.

18 These questions point the analyst to "patterns among indicators which yield codes" (Glaser, 1978: 57).

19 Categories and properties emerge from the data, and explain the kind of behavior that is observed. "A category stands as a conceptual element of the theory. A property, in turn, is a conceptual aspect or element of the category" (Glaser & Strauss, 1967: 36).

20 A theoretical code is often a pictorial model, and is used to help lift the grounded theorist's thinking about the data from a descriptive to a theoretical level. An example of a theoretical model used in this study of educational orientations is a four-cell grid representing the voice patterns discovered from the data —Caring, I'm out of here, Teacher directed, Other directed.
connect them (Glaser, 1992: 45): The grounded theorist, "within the first days in the field already begins to generate codes, to emerge hypotheses and to integrate them. Thus, much of his complex analysis is done while collecting data... going back and forth between the data and concept as one generates theory" (Glaser, 1978: 36-37). Thus, data analysis and data presentation continue to be intimately linked so that they constantly adjust each other as the theory emerges throughout the study (Glaser, 1992: 74). "The balance then gradually changes until near the end when the research involves mostly analysis, with brief collection and coding for picking up loose ends" (Glaser & Strauss, 1967: 72-3). Ultimately:

... the well constructed grounded theory will meet its four most central criteria: fit, work, relevance, and modifiability. If a grounded theory is carefully induced from the substantive area its categories and their properties will fit the realities under study in the eyes of the subjects, practitioners and researchers in the area. If a grounded theory works it will explain the major variations in behavior in the area with respect to the processing of the main concerns of the subjects. If it fits and works the grounded theory has achieved relevance. The theory... should be readily modifiable when new data present variations in emergent properties and categories (Glaser, 1992: 15).

I progressed through the four stages of grounded theory research as each stage transformed over time into the next; yet, "early stages do remain in operation simultaneously throughout the analysis and each provides continuous development to its successive stage until the analysis is terminated" (Glaser, 1994: 185). These stages are (1) concept formation, forming emergent categories through collecting and comparing data on teachers' concerns and how the teachers responded to them: (2) concept development, linking together the concepts through category

---

21 Italics are my emphasis.
reducing, selective-literature data-sampling, and selective-theoretical data-sampling (from the teachers); (3) concept modification and integration, clarifying and delimiting the theory and the categories through theoretical coding and writing memos as the relationship of the psychological and structural processes were delineated; and (4) writing the report, using references from the literature and illustrations from the data to describe the theory. In the following discussion, the four stages are separated for clarity. Since each grounded theorist adapts the stages for getting at the core concept (Glaser, 1996: xvi), a description of my own bent is interwoven throughout the following description, and is included separately following the description of the stages.

**Stage 1: Concept forming**. Through coding and analyzing the data, a tentative theory emerged of the teachers' challenges, and how they responded to them. During open coding, I read the substance of the data line by line,

Theoretical coding is intended to help lift the grounded theorist's thinking about the data from the substantive level to the theoretical level. Examples of theoretical coding applied in this study are the pictorial model of caring-empowered education shown in Chapter One, and the pictorial model of the phases along the teachers' pathways shown in Chapter Two.

With the permission of the participants, each of their interviews was audio recorded, including telephone interviews. One of the interviews was lost because of a faulty audio tape. As soon as possible following each meeting with the participant(s), I audio recorded field notes describing my experience and related insights. I generally typed the interview transcripts and field notes within a week of the interview. I chose to take limited field notes during our sessions because I wanted to be fully present for the participants.

Three types of coding are applied in grounded theory, first, "open" coding of the substantive data; later, "selective" coding of data from extant literature and from (returning to) the participants; and finally, theoretical coding for the concept that integrates the theory.
identified and named incidents occurring in the teachers' experiences. This can be seen in, "Hearing the children when they are solving group problems, watching the interactions and ideas of the children develop," which was coded as *dialoguing care* because the children's thoughts and feelings are used by the teacher for coaching their learning to cultivate caring relationships (Iris, 11/04/97). Similarly, "excitement, mine matches the children's," was coded as *modelling care* because the children were provided with experiences in what it feels and looks like to be cared for (Iris 11/04/97). I gave names to some codes, such as "modelling" and "dialoguing." Other codes, such as "caring for the children" (Iris, 11/04/97) emerged from the teachers' own language.

Coding and constantly comparing the data in *categorizing* led to hypothesizing about the clustering of the coded data into categories. An example emerged while constantly comparing data on how the teachers cared for the children, when I saw a range in that some children presented greater challenges for the teachers' caring than others. I also saw that the degree of that challenge for the teachers was affected by the presence or absence of receiving support from other adults in the children's education.

**Stage 2: Concept Developing.** The emerging theory was expanded and densified in order to determine the teachers' central concern in their situation and how they coped with it. This expanding and densifying takes place through the processes of category-reducing, selective-literature data-sampling, and selective-theoretical data sampling from the participants. In *category-reducing*, comparing the categories allows their linkages to emerge, and umbrella categories to form. For example, some of the "voice" categories clustered together to form dimensions
of the "Other-directed" voice pattern in which the teacher's voice was inhibited or blocked by the voices of the children and other adults in their education. Examples of those dimensions are "Feeling at risk" of having a diminished voice in the children's education, and "Being someone else's image" due to mandates or directives giving the teacher only a token voice in the children's education. The various voice patterns were discovered to affect the teachers' movement along their pathways toward applying more caring orientations.

In selective-literature sampling, I compared data from the literature included in my research proposal with data from the emerging theory. I also identified other extant theories, and compared data from them with data from the emerging theory. For example, it was necessary to find out what other authors say about teachers' caring for children. I found Noddings' (1999a, 1999b, 1999c, 1996a, 1996b, 1996c, 1995a, 1995b, 1995c, 1994, 1993, 1992, 1991; & with Shore, 1998a, 1998b, 1998c, 1998d, 1998e) theory of the orientation of care a good fit with the emerging theory, and thus was data supportive of this study. Similarly, Schubert's (1989) work on curriculum horizons was a good fit with some of the trends of the times experienced by the teachers in the present study.

For selective-data sampling from participants, which was also referred to as "theoretical sampling" because the data were collected prior to the theory emerging, I collected additional data for validating or refuting the emerging theory by asking the participant-teachers, "Is this the way it is?" In this way, I verified that the teachers saw teaching children as their central challenge, and that it

---

25 The full name, given by a participant to this dimension, is "Being someone else's image of who I should be."
coexisted with a more appropriate orientation only in the presence of caring. The reader may recall that caring was made up of properties such as dialoguing and modelling.

The data from the teachers did not support my cherished notion of a linear progression from a dominant mechanistic to a dominant transformative orientation along the teachers' pathways. The data from the teachers also did not support the existence of the voice pattern, "Feeling divided," but instead, created a bifurcation so that the new pattern, "Feeling overwhelmed" emerged along with "Feeling divided." Thus, both of these patterns were included in the emerging theory. Ultimately, these two patterns and two other voice patterns were fitted together as four dimensions of the "Other-directed" voice pattern. The other voice patterns, such as "I'm out of here," and "Teacher directed" were supported by the data from the teachers. The reader may recall that there were four voice patterns.

In central-process emerging, the focus is on discovering the core category that is the basic social process (BSP). "Discovery of properties of a category and its relationship to all other categories over and over again is how we choose the core category. It is how it emerges" (Glaser, 1992: 81). This central category has "the primary function of integrating the theory and rendering it dense and saturated" (Glaser, 1978: 93). Care-empowering education is the name I have given to the central category that seems to emerge from this data in the study of educational orientations. I therefore reexamined how well the categories integrate all of the theory, and thus confirmed for myself that care-empowering is the basic social process because it seems to explain most of the variance in the teachers' acquiring more appropriate educational orientations for their situation, given their
central concern of teaching the children. As noted earlier, this process is a mix of
the structural process of creating and maintaining voice together in relationships,
and the psychological process of caring.

Stage 3: Modifying and integrating the central concept. The central
processes for clarifying and delineating the relationship between the structural
process and the psychological process are memo writing and theoretical coding.
Through these processes, my thinking about the data was raised from a descriptive
to a theoretical level. I began by applying Glaser's theoretical coding of "Six C's"
--an analytical scheme of cause, consequences, context, contingency, covariance,
and conditions-- which are illustrated in Figure 2 below.

Figure 2: The Six C's as Properties of Care-Empowering Education

---

Adapted from Glaser (1978: 74).

Covariance is a powerful idea that "includes connected variables without forcing
the idea of cause" (Glaser, 1978: 74).
In this study, the cause is teaching the children; the covariate is caring; and the consequence is the teacher creating and maintaining voice as well as giving voice to the children in their own education, while other adults accept or support the teacher-children relationships; and the contingent is that the child has high status. Given this basic theoretical coding, I continued to develop the relationship of the structural and psychological processes by other theoretical coding. For instance, in Figure 1, I used three interconnected circles for pictorially modelling the three processes of care-empowering education. Another instance, as in Figure 3, is using temporal lines for modelling the phases of the teachers' pathways — conduit, struggling-and-finding.

In memoing, I captured my emerging hunches, hypotheses, analytical schemes, and abstractions in memo writing throughout the study while they were still fresh in my mind. These memos, which include references to specific data, were often re-written at a higher level of abstraction. I labelled the memos "theoretical" [TM] or "methodological" [MM], for ready linkage with other memos, so that the emergent theory was continuously being enriched (Glaser,

---

28 A change is a cause in process. The cause is the independent variable, while the consequence is the dependent variable.

29 For example, I often wrote memos based on insights that emerged intuitively.

30 For instance, memos were written about patterns that seemed to be emerging from the data. Examples include “I can’t do it,” “Being someone else’s image,” and “Feeling at risk.” In later memos, I can’t do it was renamed “Teacher-directed voice pattern” because the teacher’s voice gives direction to the voices of the children and the other adults in their education. In another memo, both “Being someone else’s image” and “Feeling at risk” were described as dimensions of the “Other-directed voice pattern” in which the voices of the children and the other adults give direction to the teacher’s voice. In contrast to these patterns, another pattern was described where none of the voices is left out of the children’s education.
1978). Many of my methodological memos focus on the modes and stages of collecting and analyzing the data, and others focus on ethical issues. My theoretical memos focus on the theory being discovered in the data. For example, theoretical memos focus on Glaser's Six C's and on each of the above-cited pictorial models which helped to raise my thinking about the data from the descriptive level to the theoretical level.

**Stage 4: Writing the report.** For the grounded theory report, I described the basic social process of care-empowering education that was discovered from the data, and supported an integrated set of hypotheses by appropriate references to the literature and illustrations from the data. In doing so, I also focused on satisfying the grounded theory criteria of fit, work, relevance, and modifiability of the theory. The outline for writing the report emerged as I sorted the memos into chapters. For instance, the temporal pictorial-model of the teachers' pathways was sorted into a pile of memos for Chapter Four where it helped to provide an overview and introduction to the theory. For choosing an appropriate style for the written report, I was guided by Glaser's (1978) suggestion:

> By style we mean exactly what the author is doing when writing, not what he says he is doing. How he orders the piece, not how he says it is ordered... What he actually says, not what he said he will or did say. Other aspects of style to carefully watch are the construction techniques, theoretical codes, integration schemes, densification, scope, clarity, and source of data... Comparing diverse authors styles and properties of them is crucial to deciding what style to write in (Glaser, 1978: 32).

I also follow Glaser's (1978) advice to include in the report a discussion of how the theory developed in this study extends or broadens extant theories. In addition, I remain open to the possibility of filing memos for future study.
The constant comparison process continued as I wrote so that concepts continued to earn their way into the report. Glaser says that writing forces "the final touches of the integration that is not achieved through [memo] sorting" (Glaser, 1978: 119). Not only was this confirmed by my own experience, but the degree to which the theory continued to emerge throughout the period of both writing and editing amazed and delighted me. My experience verified Glaser's claim that "until the analyst is an accomplished writer, one half or more of his creativity occurs in rewriting his initial draft" (Glaser, 1992: 111).

**My own adaption of the stages.** Glaser (1996) says:

> [Grounded theorists] bend grounded theory methodology carefully to their emergent needs. In this shaping of grounded theory to work and fit, they show the experiential nature of doing it, and to the great extent that the researcher is a part of what he is producing. They show the use of their own introspection to ... [avoid forcing the data to fit]" so that the theory actually emerges from the data (Glaser, 1996: xii).

I adapted the stages in three ways that also complemented my own "personal recipe for pacing out the research so as to be consistent with... [my own] temperament and... energizing the project" Glaser's (1978: 19). Throughout the four stages, I took pride in continuously creating positive rapport and building trust with the participants; fairly early in the stages, I identified a tentative style for writing the hypotheses chapters of the research report; I also added researcher memos to the types suggested by Glaser (1978). Creating rapport and building trust with the participants can be seen in my enthusiasm about the first hints of theory that emerged from the data and wanting to share that enthusiasm to ensure that the teachers and school principals saw the value of their contributions to the
study. I felt that such sharing would likely help to maintain their interests in the study over time. I therefore compiled summary lists of the teachers' responses to the survey-interview items, which I shared, first with the teachers and then with the principals. Likewise, for example, I provided the administrators with a report on the progress of the research procedures every two or three months throughout the duration of the study. I also remained open to considering their invitations and to opportunities for inviting their involvement in the study, both of which are discussed in a later section of this report.

Glaser (1978) guides the grounded theorist to sort memos into chapters and then chapter sections for guiding the writing of the research report. He also suggests selecting an appropriate writing style based on studying existing grounded theory reports within and outside the researcher's own field of interest. It was, however, following the second round of interviews that I intuited similarities between some of the voice patterns emerging in my analysis and patterns in a grounded theory report I had read perhaps a decade ago. I was thus very curious, but remained sceptical, as I reread that report. The similarity of patterns was confirmed, and naturally led me to immediately read two other grounded theory reports. Together, these three reports\textsuperscript{11} allowed me to identify a tentative style for my future writing. For example, that tentative style seemed to allow reporting theory that is dense, and to include maximum contrasts with highly conceptual content. It also seemed to allow for locating literature references primarily in the guiding-perspectives chapter; and for using language that has

"grab" for the reader. Beyond the guidelines I gleaned from these existing reports, I was inspired to use questions rather than statement subtitles for the sections of each hypothesis chapters. This, I felt, helped me to capture the complexity of the theory that was emerging from the data, and would probably increase the grab of the report for readers. Once the tentative writing style was identified, I filed most subsequent memos by chapter.

Some of my memos did not fit neatly into Glaser's suggested methodological and theoretical memos. I therefore added a file for researcher memos (RM), which focused on my own learning and changing as a researcher.

Encountering the Participants

Since I wanted to create and maintain positive rapport with the teachers as well as the administrators, and to gain their trust, I therefore focused on being truthful, supportive, open, and flexible with them. This can be seen in my initial conversation with each of them when I cited two purposes for the inquiry. The first was the completion of the requirements for my degree. The second purpose was the production of a report that I hoped would be useful to the participants, and would make an important contribution to the larger educational community. Also for creating and maintaining positive rapport and building trust, at least three days prior to the first data collection session, I provided the participant(s) with a summary copy of the research purpose and procedures, the tentative interview questions, and the Consent Form. These copies were provided directly to

---

Glaser (1999) says grounded theory "bits" lend themselves to "instant grab" for the speaker as well as the listener (Glaser, 1999: 843-844).
administrators, and to the teachers via the principals. Some of my other efforts to create and maintain positive rapport and to build trust were recorded in my personal agenda for our session:

* Speaking in a manner that I felt the participants could relate to and, where appropriate, switching to their modes of speech.
* Making reference (during the initial meeting with the teachers) to my experience as teacher and as having inquired into changes in my own teaching practice over time.
* Pausing often to invite questions and comments.
* Thanking participant(s) for agreeing to participate in the study and inviting them to sign the consent form at our initial meeting.
* Describing, during our first session, my efforts to mask their identities by using pseudonyms and omitting the name of the school and the system in all reports.
* Explaining that the participants would have the opportunity to read and comment on the accuracy and needed changes in my written summary of their experiences before I shared the oral or written report with anyone else.
* Informing the participants that the written report would be the basis for some of my publications, presentations, and other contributions to the field of education.
* Saying, "This research is not an evaluation. There are no right or wrong answers to any of the questions. You are the expert in your own story, so I look forward to learning from you."
* Saying, "In telling my story, I disclose only what I would be comfortable hearing tomorrow morning. I invite you to do likewise. If you choose to share confidential information with me, please inform me that it is confidential.
* Describing two alternative centering experiences "for helping us to relax our ways into the research experience." (Pause.) Adding, "Whatever depth you achieve in the experience and in telling me about changes in your practice, is acceptable, since that depth is a personal matter." (Pause.) Leading the participants' preferred centering experience.
* Describing a change in my own teaching, and inviting the participants to enquire further into my experience at a later date.
* Saying, "Feel free to tell me at any time, how the study may be changed to better accommodate your own needs." (Field notes: 11/04/97.)

In preparation for each encounter with the participants, my routine included gathering together all of the required materials, then sitting quietly while visualizing myself interacting authentically with the participants. I also welcomed both the teachers and administrators taking reasonable responsibility for the research procedures. For instance, I accepted a teacher's invitation to return with her to the classroom to observe the children because, as she explained, "You will get a clearer picture of what I am describing by observing the children interacting with each other" (Margaret, 13/05/97). Another instance of the teachers taking reasonable responsibility of their own volition during a focus group interview occurred when one teacher described her interaction with a principal, and another teacher naturally followed up with her own description of her interaction with the same principal. Similar flow also applied during their descriptions of personal experiences in team teaching with the same children.

A reciprocal creation of positive rapport can be seen in each principal's decision to attend the first interview sessions with all consenting teachers from his or her respective school, my dissemination of a copy of the survey-interview to the principal as well as to each teacher at that session, and my subsequent invitation to the principals to collect the consent forms from the respective teachers. Other examples of our reciprocal efforts toward creating positive rapport were evident in the principals offering to provide my transportation from a central location in their city to and from their schools, treating me to a pleasant buffet lunch at a restaurant in that city, and choosing to be interviewed mid-way through the data-collection
procedure for which I provided the meeting place and snack.

The three key participants and the four administrators were invited to comment on the completeness, accuracy, and required modifications to my written interpretations of their individual experiences. After I confirmed the support of the principals, each teacher's summary was placed in a sealed envelope, addressed to her, and enclosed in an envelope mailed to the principal for dissemination. After I received the agreement of the administrator, his or her own summary report was mailed. Two of the three key participant-teachers and each of the four administrators provided positive feedback. The most significant modifications they requested dealt with both minor rewording and the tone of the comments. There were also follow-up interviews with two of the key participants and three administrators. One key participant provided written comments. For most of the interviews, I provided written guidelines at least three days in advance.

The Researcher

Prior to the first data collection session, I gave careful consideration to the best way of presenting myself to the participants. I had already decided to focus on creating positive rapport and on building trust. For instance, it was because of the rapport that had been created and the trust that had been built up with the teachers and administrators that I remained committed to completing the study with them, despite the key participant-teachers being unexpectedly unavailable for interviews for significant periods of time. One of those periods extended to eleven months. In addition, I decided to present myself as a learner and informed the participants that they were the experts in their own stories, and that I looked
forward to learning from them. On some occasions, this way of presenting myself allowed me to cite from my teaching experience and ask the participant, "Is/Was it like that for you?" Identifying myself as a learner also contributed to the natural flow of our encounters. For instance, when my expectations did not materialize, I naturally looked for something better to emerge, or I remained open to opportunities to learn something important.

Presenting myself as a learner was congruent with my own double quest for a theoretical perspective for thinking about and discussing education, and for greater competence and confidence as a qualitative researcher. Thus, I found myself enthusiastic about learning to be a grounded theorist and about the theory that was emerging from the data.

Limitations of the Study

One limitation of this study might be that thirteen of the sixteen participant-teachers were interviewed only once. For example, this has led to repeating some of the participants' experiences in different contexts in this report. A second limitation might relate to the choice of participants and school system. This can be seen in that all of the participant-teachers were teaching at the primary-elementary level and most of them were female. It is also relevant that the system was Catholic and had officially promoted three emergent educational frameworks during the past decade. A third limitation might be that the process of caring was limited to interpersonal relationships, whereas complete caring involves every aspect of one's life.
Summary of Chapter Three

In this chapter, I describe the qualitative, grounded theory, case study design and methodology that guided this inquiry into teachers' experiences in making meaning of their educational orientations in relation to their central concern for teaching the children. I introduce the sixteen participant-teachers, the four administrators, and the research site, a school system in southern Ontario. For collecting data, I discuss the use of survey-interviews, individual/group/telephone interviews, drawing history/biography lines, observations, and obtaining other artifacts. I also describe the non-linear phases involved in working with the data: concept forming, concept developing, concept modifying and integrating, and report writing. In addition, I discuss both my efforts to create a positive rapport and build trust with the participants, and my own learning experiences as a researcher.
CHAPTER FOUR

CARE-EMPOWERING EDUCATION: CONTEXTUAL DEFINITIONS, PHASES, AND CONDITIONS

Humans are made out of energy and sustained by energy... We can view our bodies as manifestations of spiritual energy... Energy fields interact within an individual person. They also interact between one person and another, and between one person and the world in general (Northrup, 1994a: 25, 26).

Introduction

In this study, teachers identify teaching children as their central challenge; the process through which they acquire a more viable orientation for coping with that challenge is discovered to be care-empowering education. They describe differing orientations in their situations, and responses to them by themselves, the children, and other adults such as principals and parents affecting who creates and maintains voice in the children's education. Some combinations of orientations facilitate the teachers teaching the children; other combinations inhibit or block their teaching. An example that helps teachers to have voice in the children's education would be that of a principal providing a workshop on a topic requested by the teachers. An example that inhibits or blocks the teachers having voice would be that of a parent criticizing teachers instead of working with them in support of their child's education. It was through contrasting the facilitative modes of creating and maintaining voice with the inhibiting and blocking modes that the process I have named "care-empowering education" was discovered. These modes are the focus of the remainder of this report.

In this chapter, the following three questions are addressed:
* What are the contextual definitions for care-empowering education?

* What phases affect the process of care-empowering education?

* What conditions inhibit or block the process of care-empowering education?

For the sake of clarity in addressing the two latter questions, reference is made to specific experiences of the teachers.

What Are the Contextual Definitions for Care-Empowering Education?

People develop a moral orientation of caring... through direct contact with those who need to be cared for... This is not a capacity that develops in isolated study. It requires sustained interpersonal contact (Noddings, 1996: 164).

Care-empowering education consists of the three supporting processes of creating and maintaining voice, caring, and inspirational awakening. The contextual definitions of these supporting processes and related terms are grouped under the headings of awakening, caring, orientation, voice, and indicators. For the sake of clarity in these definitions, some reference is made to the contrasting definitions where the teachers' creating and maintaining voice in the children's education is inhibited or blocked.

Awakening33

Awakening refers to the process of making meaning through experience which involves a fundamental awakening of the teacher's inner life, becoming

---

33 “Awakening” is supported by Nodding’s (1984: 35) orientation of caring, as opposed to conformity and obedience. It is also supported by Northrup (1994a, 1994b, 1994c) theory of a healthy person guided by inner wisdom.
more aware of who she is and her purpose in teaching children. In inspiritived awakening, the teacher learns how to learn; learns to be self-directed; learns to be cared for and to care for herself, the children, and other adults in their education; and connects deeply with sources of her self-actualization. Thus, through inspiritive awakening, she finds a guiding star for navigating her pathway toward applying a more caring orientation. Dispiritive awakening, which is the opposite to inspiritive awakening, refers to experiences where the teacher tends to turn inward with worry; her emotions get stuck; she discovers what she does not want in teaching the children, and she does not learn to be cared for nor does she learn to care for her self, the children, and other adults in their education. Thus, through dispiritive awakening, the teacher struggles with not moving along a pathway toward applying a more caring orientation. Spiritive awakening is similar to inspiritive awakening, except that it has more flow.

Caring

Caring refers to affirming and encouraging competence in drawing the best out of others and oneself. Through caring, the child becomes more loving and loveable. In contrast to caring, caring attempts refer to the teachers' unsuccessful efforts to facilitate the children learning to be cared for, and learning to care for themselves and others.

Orientation

An educational orientation is known by many names such as frame-of-reference and way-of-being. It refers to a more-or-less implicit map of reality. It

---

34 The words, “inspiritive,” dispiritive,” and “spiritive” are adapted from the nurse educator, Burkhardt (1994, 1989) who focuses on spiritual well-being.
consists of an attitude toward humanity, a mind set of an acceptable image of encounters in the classroom, school, and society, as well as the skills (and understanding) required for those encounters. It is, as one teacher said, "what I'm all about" (Margaret, 13/05/97). In the caring orientation, the focus is on human nature as relational, encounters as potential opportunities for caring, and understanding guided by inner wisdom as opposed to simply conforming. In contrast to the caring orientation, in the conduit orientation, the teachers serve as channels for the voices of other adults in the children's education. They also supervise and manage the children as receivers of the official curriculum, and have little awareness of their own limited voices in the children's education. Also in contrast to the caring orientation, the liberal education is similar to the conduit orientation except that the teachers struggle in attempting to care for the children, even under the pressures of a mandated academic curriculum, quantitative evaluations, and the restrictive directives and expectations of other adults such as some principals and parents in the children's education. Pathways are the routes along which the teachers' movements are facilitated, inhibited, or blocked toward imbedding more caring orientations into the children's education.

**Voice**

Voice refers to the communication of personal energies in verbal and nonverbal messages (Noddings, 1998a, 1996a, 1996b, 1984; Northrup, 1994a, 1994b, 1994c). Creating and maintaining voice refers to forming and maintaining communication patterns of voices in the children's education. When no voice is left out, the communication pattern includes the voices of the teacher, children, and other adults in their education. In contrast to creating and maintaining voice,
attempts to create and maintain voice refers to the teacher's unsuccessful efforts to form and maintain communication patterns with the children and other adults in their education.

The inner voice is known by many names such as the spiritual energy animating life, the Soul, Inner Guidance, God Within, the higher power, the Will.

Indicators of a Caring Orientation

Since acquiring more caring orientations is an heuristic concept, teachers with totally caring orientations do not exist, nor do teachers with totally noncaring orientations. Caring and least-caring orientations are considered to be located at the opposite ends of a continuum on which each teacher is positioned. One source of the impression of a caring orientation is seen through observing teachers' encounters with the children and other adults in their education. Another source of that impression comes from the teachers' descriptions of their own experiences while teaching the children. From these sources, a teacher who has a caring orientation can be identified by the following indices. When the children are not present, the teacher uses a tone of warmth and obvious pleasure in describing them as worthy of being cared for. She takes pride and pleasure in helping the children to discover their own reasons and directions for caring through experience in their own academic and social projects, as well as helping to cultivate caring relationships based on what the children are thinking and feeling through their encounters with others. The teacher with a caring orientation also takes pride and pleasure in providing the children with opportunities for seeing and feeling what it is like to be cared for, as well as in conveying to the children more caring images of their selves than they presently manifest.
Other indices were observed by myself or described by the teachers that could be considered exemplary of the teacher with a caring orientation. This teacher takes pride and pleasure in applying a non-linear, self-monitoring cycle directed from her own centre of motivation. This teacher also takes pride and pleasure in learning both to be cared for and to care for herself and the children, through caring circles formed with other adults. In contrast to the teacher with a caring orientation, another teacher may be limited in her efforts to apply a self-monitoring cycle directed from her own centre of motivation, as well as in her efforts to learn both to be cared for and to care for the children and the other adults in their education.

What Phases Affect the Process of Care-Empowering Education?

The occurrence of joy as a willing transformation of self under the compelling magic of other subjectivities points to a receptive consciousness, one that is energized by engagement and enlightened by looking and listening (Noddings, 1984: 144).

The teachers in this study describe two phases along their pathways toward applying more caring orientations, while teaching the children, the conduit phase

Figure 3: The Phases of the Teachers' Pathways
which is followed by the struggling-and-finding phase. A pictorial model of the phases is shown in Figure 3 (page 71). During the first phase, conduit, the teachers who are "travelling through the fog" where they serve as conduits for the voices of other adults (such as curriculum officials), supervise and manage the children as receivers of the official curriculum, and are largely unaware of having limited voices in the children's education. During the second phase, struggling and finding, there are times when the teachers are "struggling through the storm" along their pathways where their efforts to care for the children are inhibited or blocked. During the struggling-and-finding phase, there are also times when the teachers are "finding a guiding star for navigating" their pathways toward embedding more caring orientations into the children's education. The struggling-and-finding phase occurs for all teachers, but the conduit phase is by-passed if too many immediate changes lead them to try to create and maintain voice in teaching the children. The struggling-and-finding phase is a time when voice patterns are formed, and the tone is set for the teacher's relationships with the children and other adults in their education.

The Conduit Phase

During the conduit phase, at the beginning of their teaching careers, the teachers describe seeming to be happy in teaching the children, and things seeming to go well. Two conditions which contribute to the continuation of this phase are the teachers' preoccupation with managing and supervising the prescribed curriculum, and their assumption that children "are already learners." Isolation is also a contributing condition to the continuation of this phase in that the teachers spend the day almost exclusively in their own classrooms. Another contributing
condition is that parents have expectations for the children to do their homework and to be polite and mannerly. A related condition, which contributes to the continuation of this phase, is the teachers seeming to be happy and hoping things continue to go well. This can be seen in a teacher saying, "I didn't have to try new things" (Margaret, 13/05/97). Another teacher words the experience:

I was naive when I first went into the classroom. I taught all of the kids like robots. -academics, academics, academics. Covering curriculum, the first to the last page of the book or workbook... And never contemplating that some of those children have never seen a book. Every year, every child has to read those books... You go in and you think that are they already learners, curriculum receivers. And you're going to do this bang-up job (Miriam, 13/05/97).

Things seem to go smoothly:

Most children were receivers of curriculum. They fit into that role because they came from families who had expectations of them. Most kids came from good family structures. I spent all of my time preparing all of those beautiful-looking lessons. I had all of those little birds, pictures of birds on display. I changed my bulletin board every month (Miriam, 13/05/97).

Typically, the conduit phase ends when the teacher begins to awaken to the reality that things are not as they had seemed, and begins to struggle through the storm when her attempts to create and maintain voice in teaching the children are inhibited or blocked, or when she begins to find a guiding star for navigating her pathway through reaching for support or accepting support offered by another adult for helping her to create and maintain voice. This initial effort to find a guiding star emerges from past encounters with children and other adults in their education which left the teacher with little support and a limited repertoire for creating and maintaining voice in teaching the children.
**The Struggling-and-Finding Phase**

As cited above, the conduit phase is followed by the struggling-and-finding phase. Most of the processes described in this report occur during that phase which is briefly described here.

In the following two chapters, processes are described which occur during this phase. The inhibiting and blocking conditions described in a later section of this chapter give rise to the teachers' struggles. The processes of caring and inspirititive awakening, which are described in Chapter Six, influence the teachers caring for the children and foster the emergence of more caring orientations while they teach the children. The teachers describe the struggling-and-finding phase as a time when their relationships with the children and the other adults in their education led to the formation of voice patterns (described in Chapter Five), which the teachers have to live with, at least temporarily. The teachers describe the "finding" part of the struggling-and-finding phase as a time of encountering other adults around common interests in the children's education, as well as a time of trying out ideas and of compromising. Most of the processes occurred either during the struggling-and-finding phase or, by the closure of the study, the situations were set for them to occur. The amount of struggle experienced by the teachers during this phase is largely dependent upon the conditions which exist in the teaching situation. Some combinations of teacher, children, and other adults are more harmonious than others. Some teachers experience smoother pathways toward applying more caring orientations than do other teachers. However, each teacher's pathway is unique. Conditions which influence the teachers' movements along their pathways are discussed in the next section of this chapter.
What Conditions Inhibit or Block the Process of Care-Empowering Education?

Beliefs and memories are actually biological constructs in the body. The conscious part—the part that thinks it's in control—is what peaks above the surface. But it amounts to only 25 percent of the iceberg. The so-called 'subconscious' part—75 percent of it lies below the surface. Our personal histories are stored throughout our bodies, in muscles, in organs, and in other tissues. This information, like the submerged part of the iceberg, is not generally recognized by the part of the iceberg on the surface, our conscious intellect. Our cells contain our memory banks—even when the conscious mind is not aware of them and actually battles to deny them... Fortunately, our inner guidance is always available to remind us of our direction toward fulfillment. When we realign with our inner guidance and our feelings... and our feelings are offering us information, we are on the pathway to a life filled with growth and delight (Northrup, 1994a: 38, 48).

The smoothness or roughness of the teachers' pathways toward embedding more caring orientations while teaching the children is dependent upon their connections with the past as well as their acceptance of new situations, new ways of doing things, and new sources and substances\(^{35}\) of voices. They arrive at the struggling-and-finding phase with notions of teaching which are based on their past experiences. Teachers from the conduit phase, for instance, enter the struggling-and-finding phase with limited teaching repertoires. Their efforts to teach the children are often unsuccessful. Their connections to the children are interrelated with their connections to other adults in their education, such as principals and parents. Consequently, it is the voice of authority that often has the final say in the children's education. For teachers whose efforts to create and

---

\(^{35}\) The name of the category, "sources and substances," is adapted from Stein (1976).
maintain voice in teaching the children are blocked or inhibited, the experience can be frustrating. Their success in applying more caring orientations while teaching the children is largely dependent upon how they, the children, and other adults respond to the differing views about teaching, which are based in their educational orientations. The three general and interrelated conditions for embedding caring orientations, an educational orientation, connections, and an image/expectations of teaching, are separated for clarity in the following discussion.

**Educational Orientation**

An educational orientation is a more-or-less implicit map of reality which consists of an attitude, a mind set, skills, and understanding itself, each of which affects the teachers' movement along their pathways toward embedding more caring orientations into the children's education. An educational orientation conveys a past sense of self worth, of worth to the children, to other adults in their education, and to humanity. A response emerging from an educational orientation can be seen where the teacher uses a new curriculum only when feeling coerced into doing so (Sandy, 11/04/97). The teachers' interpretations of the official curriculum are coloured by their own educational orientations, such as in the priority of "covering the curriculum" (Olive, 11/04/97). Teachers' more-or-less implicit educational orientations are exemplified by the teacher who wants the children to experience success in their learning yet continues to attempt to fit a mandated program into teaching plans without modifying and tailoring it to the needs and interests of the children (Miriam, 11/04/97). Teachers' interpretations of teaching environments coloured by their educational orientations are seen where
the teacher assumes she is to remain independent of input from others such as when she is not open to hearing the ideas regarding how her teaching may be improved. This teacher does not welcome input from the principal, colleagues, or the children (Nancy, 11/02/97). The teachers' receptiveness, which emerges from their educational orientations, is often guided by their sense of the expectations of other adults in the children's education. This is illustrated by the teacher who understands that "teachers are expected to be independent," and therefore struggles alone in attempting to teach a new grade of students while using a new curriculum (Melissa, 13/05/97). On the other hand, the teachers' sense of self-worth, which emerges from their educational orientations, is exemplified by the teacher who knows she is "a good teacher," takes pride in coaching a mother who wants to help her child learn to read, and is enthusiastic about reciprocal support with her colleagues for caring for the children. Despite being overwhelmed by the persistent media reports stressing the lack-of-credibility of teachers, this teacher vows "not to let the children down" even though she is disheartened by those reports (Margaret, 6/02/98, 28/06/99, 22/11/99, 7/12/99).

An instance of the teachers' skills and understanding in everyday encounters with the children and other adults is provided by the teacher who seeks special education assistance for some of the children but becomes "frustrated by the lack of support available." Her skills and understanding are coloured by her educational orientation (Geraldine, 11/04/97). An instance of a teacher attempting to change her social connections with the other adults can be seen in a teacher telling an administrator that she should have voice in deciding if some of the children are to participate in a specific program (Miriam 13/05/97). Similarly,
when the same teacher attempts to change the perspectives of the administrator, her attempts arise from her educational orientation. She insists that she knows the children best, and that the program-in-question is a poor match with the language-arts levels of some of them (Miriam, 13/05/97).

Facilitated, inhibited, or blocked efforts to teach the children often emerge from and are addressed through the various educational orientations involved in the teachers' encounters.

**Connections**

Educational orientation is a connection to the teacher's past educational experiences which, in turn, affect her caring in her present situation. Other conditions affecting her present practices include her contract, her teaching unit, the curriculum, the school principal, and the children.

**The contracts.** The teachers described their formal contracts as obligations to the children, parents, and personnel with the school board. They describe parents as having legal and moral responsibility for the education of their children. They are aware that their contracts affect their encounters with the children and other adults in their education. Occasionally, contracts may have the effect of limiting teachers' impact upon the children's education. This can be seen in the experience of a teacher who goes "directly to the Director of Education" with her request to have "a terrible situation" addressed. Her request is ignored, and the outcome for her is blocking her caring for the children and necessitating that she continue to cope with an unchanged situation (Fran, 11/04/97). Likewise, the teacher who feels overwhelmed by the negative image of teachers which is portrayed by the media feels she just has to live with the letter of her teaching
contract (Melissa, 6/12/99). Part of the challenge to the teachers applying more caring orientations in teaching of children is their finding ways of encountering other adults in the educational hierarchy in ways that do not inhibit or block their own caring for the children.

The teaching unit. Since the fundamental unit in a school usually consists of the children and the teacher in an individual classroom, the teacher is often isolated from other teachers who also struggle to care for the children, and from other adults such as system consultants and workshop leaders who could provide instructional suggestions. Often, however, the teacher lacks specific types of support. For example, early in her teaching career, at a time when she did not know of available support for her teaching, one teacher struggled alone in the classroom because some children did not learn to read. This teacher worried that she did "not know very much." She said, "I am looking for something" (Margaret, 6/02/98). It therefore becomes necessary for teachers to find ways of connecting with other caring adults both within and outside the teaching unit, and to assess the effect of their search for assistance.

The curriculum. The teachers describe the impact of the official curriculum on the children, and illustrate how their dependence on that curriculum often inhibits or blocks their caring for the children. Often they become aware of a poor match between the curriculum and addressing the needs and interests of the children. This has been the experience of a teacher who was excited about beginning to teach her choice of grade. She soon became aware, however, of a poor match between the support provided by the official curriculum and the children's academic needs, which she did not know how to address. The
experience was disconcerting for her, and led her to question her ability to teach children at that grade level (Eva, 11/04/99). Another teacher was excited about using a curriculum which seemed to support the children's learning. In time, however, the pressure to conform to a new official curriculum caused this teacher tension and even led her to question her teaching ability (Sandy, 11/04/97). Such experiences pose a challenge for teachers to acquire more appropriate ways of coping with an official curriculum that misses the mark of addressing the immediate needs and interests of children.

**The school principal.** Directives and expectations from other adults in the children's education often filter through the voice of the school principal. Teachers describe the principal as a participant in assessing their practices, in decisions regarding their professional development, and in their assignments to and transfers from a particular grade or school. The principal, therefore, serves as a gatekeeper who may facilitate, inhibit, or block teachers' caring for children. This can be seen in the example of a principal who does not support a teacher's providing special education support for some of the children. The teacher is disheartened by the experience which, in turn, adversely affects the degree of her caring for the children (Melissa, 13/05/97). Part of the challenge for many teachers is to find ways of working with principals in order to facilitate caring for the children.

**The children.** The teachers describe their struggles to help some of the children learn. They describe three groups of students, those generally progressing very well, those generally in the middle range, and those generally progressing very slowly. The academic and social skills of children in the third group are
identified by teachers as presenting the greatest challenge to their caring. The trends of the times are often reflected in the challenges presented by this group. For example, an increased number of single-parent families appear to the teacher to be preoccupied with the struggle for financial survival. Teachers express the concern that some of the children arrive at school too tired or hungry to learn, while some children do not have unconditional love at home (Melissa, 13/05/97). Other children arrive at school from homes where there are no standards; some are not centered when they arrive at school, and some do physical harm to themselves and others (Miriam, 13/05/97).

An instance of a trend influencing the challenge to the teachers' efforts to care for the third group of children is the system's new policies of inclusive education and holistic education, both of which invite children and parents to become more involved in the children's education. Each of these policies is supported by an increase in personal and material support for such involvement. The later trend of financial cutbacks, however, has had the outcome of dramatically reducing personal and material support while, at the same time, maintaining the trend for parents to continue to have increasing voice in the children's education. Part of the challenge for the teachers' caring is finding ways of having voice in the children's education that also accommodate the trends of the times.

**Image/Expectations**

The images/expectations teachers have for teaching the children determine the extent to which they see their situations as acceptable or unacceptable. For example, one image is of isolation and dependence, while another image is of
connection, interdependence, and integrity.

**The image of isolation and dependence.** For teachers guided by the image of isolation and dependence, what could make teaching the children more self-actualizing for themselves as teachers remains a mystery. Their self-image filters out the need for personal and professional growth and, instead, leads to seeking quick and easy answers. It prevents them from learning both how to learn in their teaching situation and how to be directed from the dynamic or motivational centers of their selves. External circumstances often remain far more powerful than their own efforts to design their own realities. Until they are ready to open up to learning to be cared for, and learning to care for their selves, the children, and other adults in their education, they continue to bump into glass walls!

**The image of connection, interdependence, and integrity.** Teachers guided by the image of connection, interdependence, and integrity prioritize moving along pathways toward becoming "the best I can be." Theirs is an image of reaching out for opportunities for stretching their own worlds, supporting their own projects, and nurturing their own images toward becoming more caring. In so doing, they are reaching out for opportunities for stretching the worlds of the children, supporting their projects, and nurturing their own images toward becoming more caring. Although these teachers have the image of delighting in "being who I really am" and in growing and changing without boundaries, their image is also one of being humbled by the integral part others play in that growing and changing without boundaries. Their image radiates light and hope in their lives. Once the teacher has acquired this image, there is no turning back because the image seems to take on an intelligence of its own.
Summary of Chapter Four

In this study, teachers identify teaching children as their central challenge in their situation. The process through which they acquire an appropriate orientation for coping with that challenge is discovered to be care-empowering education. Contextual definitions are provided for the processes of care-empowering education, creating and maintaining voice, caring, and inspiritive awakening. Descriptions are provided of the two phases along the teachers' pathways toward applying more caring orientations, "conduit" and "struggling and finding." Not all teachers experience the conduit phase, but all experience the struggling-and-finding phase. The conduit phase is a time of supervising and managing the prescribed curriculum in an isolated classroom with students as curriculum receivers. These teachers serve as conduits for the voices of other adults such as curriculum officials. They are largely unaware of having little voice of their own in the children's education. The struggling-and-finding phase is a time when the teachers identify the processes of facilitating, inhibiting or blocking their travelling along pathways toward embedding more caring orientations into the children's education.
CHAPTER FIVE
STRUGGLING THROUGH THE STORM:
WHOSE VOICE IS IT ANYWAY?

Learning about human relations is one of the toughest tasks any of us faces (Noddings, 1992: 55).

Introduction

In this study of educational orientations, the participant-teachers identify their central challenge as teaching the children. They describe their struggles to accommodate the voices of other adults, such as those mandating official curricula and those of administrators. Often, the outcome is that the teachers struggle through the storm when some of the children do not learn academic content and some continue to demonstrate unacceptable social skills. Yet, teachers who resort to applying ideas from their own teaching repertoires are often disheartened when they observe that some of the children continue to experience limited success. The preceding chapter included descriptions of some of the conditions inhibiting or blocking teachers from acquiring more viable orientations. Particular emphasis was given to the teachers' educational orientations and connections both of which emerge from the past, as well as to their present images and expectations of acceptable teaching in their situation. Voice patterns are defined as the outcomes of the teachers' efforts to create and maintain voice in the education of the children. These patterns are formed on the basis of whether the teacher has voice in the children's education. They are, however, not permanent since the teachers tend to move back and forth among the various configurations of the patterns while seeking more appropriate ways to cope with the realities of their situation.
Three questions are addressed in this chapter:

* What attempts do the teachers make to create voice in the children's education?
* What attempts do the teachers make to maintain voice in the children's education?
* What voice patterns are the general outcomes of the teachers' attempts to create and maintain voice?

**What Attempts Do the Teachers Make to Create Voice in the Children's Education?**

[We need to] appreciate ourselves as an ever-changing energy system that is affected by, and also affects, the energy around it... Energy fields interact within an individual person. They also interact between one person and another, and between one person and the world in general... These interactions... are important for lifelong human growth and healthy development...

When we begin to appreciate ourselves as fields of energy with the ability to affect the quality of our experience, we will be getting in touch with our innate ability... *Hope, self-esteem, and education are the most important factors in creating health daily* (Northrup, 1994a: 26, 27).

For the teacher to create voice in teaching the children, it is often necessary to have the cooperation of the children and other adults in their education. Typically, the teachers' efforts to do what is expected elicit responses from other adults that range from total acceptance to total rejection. Thus, those adults' reactions may facilitate, inhibit, or block teachers from creating voice in educating their students. The teacher's first efforts to teach the children may place her on either a relatively smooth or rough pathway toward embedding a more caring orientation into the children's education. In the most extreme cases, cumulative
experiences on rough pathways lead the teachers to give up hope and exit or retreat from teaching. For the sake of clarity, some description of maintaining voice is included in the following description.

**Moves Toward a More Caring Orientation**

When teachers teach the children while taking particular care to address their needs and interests and to accommodate the voices of other adults (such as those embedded in the official curriculum), the teachers' efforts are usually successful. This can be seen in Margaret's experience around teaching math and reading. In creating voice with the children who arrive at school ready and eager to learn, progress is so smooth that she makes little mention of those experiences in our discussions. By the end of her first year of teaching, however, she says, "I am looking for something," and then reaches out for support for teaching the other children. Thus, during her second and third years of teaching, a consultant provides "a lot of support." For instance, she offers suggestions and possibilities for Margaret to try out with the children. Margaret reflects on their successes with the children, and is delighted to add the valuable ideas to her own teaching repertoire. Thus, she welcomes continuing support from the consultant.

Margaret's movement along her pathway toward applying a more caring orientation is so smooth that, for example, she recalls changing her focus from teaching to a balance of teaching and "how children learn," but is unable to recall for me the process through which the change emerged (Margaret, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98, 11/04/99, 28/06/99). These are experiences in inspiritive awakening for Margaret because she is learning how to learn in her teaching situation, how to be self-directed, how to be cared for, and how to experience self-
actualization while caring for the children. Progressing along her pathway toward embedding a more caring orientation is dependent on continuation of these conditions.

**Teachers' Attempts to Move Toward More Caring Orientations**

In contrast to the teacher's movement toward applying a more caring orientation, if the substance of the teacher's voice differs from that of other adults, their responses may be unsupportive of her efforts to teach the children. In some situations, the difference can be circumvented. This can be seen where Alice wants to continue her full-time assignment but is required to transfer to another school for a full-time position. Ultimately, an alternative is worked out where Alice chooses the option of remaining half time at her present school "because I like the staff and school" (Alice, 11/04/97). At the other extreme, if the difference in voices is great, the other adults' responses may resonate for the teacher as inhibiting or blocking her progress along her pathway toward applying a more caring orientation. An instance is provided by Melissa's experience when she is pleased to begin teaching children in special education. Hers is the first class of special education at the school, and she assumes the support of the principal until he informs her, "I do not want those children in my school." Reflecting on special education as new, and on the principal not yet appreciating its value for the children does not lesson her feeling of shock and fragmentation. Moreover, the encounter reinforces the unwelcome assumption that she will have to be independently responsible for her teaching. This is an experience in dispiritive awakening because Melissa is stressed, and she acknowledges great disappointment in that her relationships with the children are neither accepted nor
supported by the principal. Her movement along her pathway toward embedding a more caring orientation into the children's education is inhibited (Melissa, 13/05/97).

**Attempts with other adults.** No teacher readily accepts her voice being inhibited or blocked in teaching the children. In extreme instances, such as just described for Melissa, the teacher feels there is no option but to disassociate herself from adults whose voices differ significantly from her own. On the other hand, there are situations where teachers respond in other modes which range from speaking up on behalf of the children to ignoring the voice of other adults. The mode of their response, speaking up on behalf of the children, is illustrated in Miriam's agreement to be a partner in a project whereby a program is to be designed specifically for her use with the children. Originally, she is enthusiastic about the partnership, but soon discovers that some of the children have "neither the maturity nor the level of language arts skills required to work independently with the program." She, therefore, shares her concerns with the program designer, and suggests that those children would benefit more from devoting their time to improving their reading skills. She is disheartened when her suggestions fall on deaf ears (Miriam, 13/05/97, 6/02/98). Another mode of the teachers' response to differing voices is working harder, which is often referred to by the teachers as "trying to be everybody to everyone." For instance, Margaret speaks of the multitude of changes she is expected to make in her current teaching, such as introducing new curricula and computerized report cards, both of which require significant amounts of time. She says, "I have always worked hard, and harder in recent years," even to the point where there is little time for networking with her
colleagues, which is an experience she has enjoyed in the past because it has facilitated her growth as a teacher (Margaret, 6/02/98, 7/12/99). Another mode of teacher-response to differing voices is ignoring the voice of the other adults. This can be seen in Sandy's disregarding a directive to use a new curriculum because of feeling that it provides fewer opportunities for giving voice to the children in their own education. Sandy tells me about being determined to do what is best for the children, a conviction emerging from a deeply-held educational orientation. Even when pressured to conform, Sandy stands firm. As the pressure intensifies, however, there seems to be no choice but to succumb. The outcome is stress, and wondering about being capable of teaching the children (Sandy, 11/04/97).

Attempts with the children. Teachers sometimes experience dispiritive awakening during their attempts to teach some of the children such as when they discover limitations in their teaching repertoires. For instance, in Eva's early efforts to teach some of the children, guidance from the official curriculum brings little success. Subsequent use of ideas of her own lead to discovering a void in her teaching repertoire. The experience is disheartening for her. She tells me, "I questioned my ability to meet the needs of the children" (Eva, 11/04/97). Similarly, Miriam discovers a void in her repertoire for teaching the children, and subsequently wonders how she is to survive (Miriam, 13/05/97). As well, regardless of the teacher's attempts to teach the children, her efforts are often not completed in the growth and self-actualization of the children. This can be seen, for example, in Beth's comment that "some children will not let you get to know them," which leaves the teacher without direction for addressing their needs and interests (Beth, 11/04/97).
Maintaining the struggle. One condition that helps to maintain the teachers' struggle in attempting to teach the children is the continuation of differences in voices, which emerges from differences in their orientations. For instance, when some of the children continue not to learn to read despite Margaret's best attempts, she feels stressed and thinks that she does not know very much, both of which emerge from her educational orientation. Likewise, the lack of readily available support for her learning to teach emerges from the educational orientations of the people who could make that support available (Margaret, 6/02/98). Another condition that helps to maintain the teachers' struggle with dispiritive awakening is their past experiences. This condition is exemplified when Alice struggles with feeling worried and scared because she is responsible for introducing new parents of new children to the new curriculum and the new holistic framework she is expected to use. A related condition is that some teachers assume they are expected to be independently responsible for their own teaching. This can be seen when Miriam attempts to teach a child social skills but the principal responds with a hands-off directive which reinforces that assumption for Miriam. Struggling alone, and having to "look the other way" year after year because of differing voices causes continuing stress that exacerbates her poor health condition until her physician advises her to teach only half time in order to allow for a period of recovery. Some years later, when she is continuing to struggle alone in attempting to teach another child social skills, that same void emerges again in her teaching repertoire (Miriam, 13/05/97). Melissa's experience is even more extreme. During her first year as teacher of special education, the principal tells her he does not want those children in his school, and Melissa
therefore struggles alone. Still later, she continues to struggle alone in attempting to teach a new curriculum to a new grade of children with limited programming support, and hoping there will be "light at the end of the tunnel." She also struggles alone a few years later when a second principal does not support her teaching special education. Melissa's repeated experience in disspiritive awakening led her to feel it might be best to exit from teaching (Melissa, 13/05/97, 6/02/98).

The advantages, disadvantages, and outcomes of struggling. It is common for teachers to create voice but not be able to maintain it, which leaves them struggling with how it may be possible to teach the children. The advantages of their struggles are that they help to identify a variety of processes inhibiting and blocking their voices. Such experiences lead to redefining their own self-images and expectations, both of which may ultimately contribute toward their efforts to create new realities in their situations when the time is right. A disadvantage of struggling to create voice is that the teachers do not expect teaching to involve so much disspiritive awakening. For instance, some teachers struggle with other adults who are singularly difficult. They often struggle in attempting to teach the children without sufficient self-actualization for sustaining their own efforts to care for them. Another disadvantage is that benign voice patterns established with other adults often leave the teacher with a secondary voice in the classroom, rather than being able to communicate directly with the children. The struggle with secondary voices is often confounded by the teacher discovering a void in her teaching repertoire. So long as benign voice patterns and the voids continue, teachers are unable to move along their pathways toward embedding more caring orientations into the children's education.
What Attempts Do the Teachers Make to Maintain Voice in the Children's Education?

Teachers struggle through attempts to maintain voice in the children's education. Many sources and substances of voices are involved in their struggles. The voices of other adults, such as those embedded in the curricula, echo throughout the other substantive areas. For curriculum to be feasible, however, it must be appropriate to the development of the children, and adapted to the trends of the times. Yet, it is often in affiliation with the responsibility the teacher gives to the children that she acquires a more viable orientation for teaching them. For the sake of clarity, some description of creating voice is therefore included in this description of maintaining voice.

The Sources and Substances of Voices

The sources and substances of voices are interrelated in the children's education. The key sources identified by the teachers are the teacher, the children, the Provincial Ministry of Education and Training, school principals, teaching colleagues, administrators at the system level (such as consultants), parents, instructors in teacher education, authors of professional literature, and the public media. Other sources of voices I have observed include parent assistants, library technicians, and secretaries. The substances of the voices are the curriculum, directives and expectations; the teaching plan; the children's responsibilities; and the growth of the children. For voices to be feasible, the teachers ultimately describe them as needing to be a good match with facilitating the growth of the children. For instance, the child who needs more time to learn requires a different teaching plan and different responsibilities than the child who arrives at school.
ready and eager to learn. Without exception, the teachers in this study describe wanting, wherever possible, to apply the content of the other substantive areas such as the curriculum, directives, and expectations of the other adults for guiding their teaching.

The curriculum. The teachers describe differing voices about the curriculum echoing throughout the other substantive areas since the curriculum specifies what and how the children are to be taught. Other adults usually provide the curriculum and curriculum guidelines for the teacher's use, but when those adults have little or no affiliation with the day-to-day use of the curricula with the children, they are often described by the teachers as providing insufficient support for the teachers maintaining voice in teaching the children. This can be seen in Eva's struggle during her first year of teaching when the curriculum provided insufficient support for her helping the children to learn to read. She says, "I hated it" (Eva, 11/04/97). Another struggle has been introduced with the current outcomes-based curricula mandated by the Ministry of Education and Training. That curriculum consists of a continuous stream of end products for the teachers' professional development. As a result, the teachers are often left with little time for preparing to address the immediate and pressing needs of some of the children (Margaret, 13/05/99; Melissa, 13/05/97; Miriam, 13/05/97, 6/02/98). Without exception, however, the teachers in this study tell me they try to teach the children as best they can.

Directives and expectations. The teachers feel that the substance of directives and expectations that originate from other adults in the children's education often inhibit or infringe upon their efforts to teach the children, and,
sometimes indicate a lack of appreciation for their teaching efforts. Although early in some teachers' careers there is a general expectation that teachers are independently responsible for their own teaching, there is also little or no professional development support available at that time. Thus, teachers refer to this as a time when, "you are on your own." More recently, they refer to "trying to be everybody to everyone" in response to the plethora of outside directives and expectations they are expected to apply in teaching. For example, there is a directive to provide more group-learning experiences for the children "which can be difficult to manage with thirty children" (Terry, 11/04/99), and there are directives to use direct instruction and techniques for which "the time and needed resources are unavailable" (Miriam, 13/05/97). The teachers naturally try to accept more responsibilities for the children whose parents have little time for them for various reasons, yet some parents pressure teachers with unrealistic demands for taking responsibility for their children's actions. They telephone the school and attend meetings where they both criticize teachers' efforts to teach their children and state their expectations of holding the teachers increasingly accountable for what their children do and say. The teachers are sometimes left feeling they are expected to "raise your kid for you." And, "it hurts sometimes" when, for example, a teacher attempts for months to maintain voice in teaching a child, and neither the child nor the parents express appreciation, "Their parents don't even give you a Christmas card." Thus, the teacher feels taken-for-granted rather than appreciated (Melissa, 13/02/97, 21/11/99, 6/12/99).

While the teachers would welcome more support, they do not want to expend their energies on attempting to maintain voice where those teaching efforts
are unlikely to be completed in the responses of the children. If the other adults could arrive at compromises with the teachers with respect to their expectations, the teachers feel that they could more readily accept them while experiencing self-actualization in doing so.

**The teaching plan.** The teachers describe the unsettling experience of children often changing the intent of their teaching plans. For example, there are children who "are not motivated to learn" (Terry, 11/04/99), children who "have difficulty learning," (Geraldine, 11/04/97), who "won't let you get to know them" until mid-year which delays the possibility of carefully identifying their needs and interests (Beth, 11/04/97), children who neglect their homework, and children who do not have prerequisite academic and social skills for their grade level (Melissa, 13/05/97, 6/02/98). As cited above, teachers often struggle alone when their plans are unexpectedly changed by the children. For example, Margaret struggles alone during her first year when her own plans do not enable some of the children to read (Margaret, 6/02/98), and Miriam struggles alone when her teaching plans are disrupted by children interacting with others in ways that are socially unacceptable (13/05/97).

Over time, the teachers learn to provide more emergent and flexible plans based upon official and personal expectations. Margaret describes a typical experience, "You have your agenda, and they [the children] have their agenda. You have to take time to get to know what their strengths are, where to take them," and yet do "all of the other things that you have to do." She accepts the resulting tension as part of the normal struggle and rhythm of teaching (Margaret, 6/02/98). Melissa says, since "some children cannot be taught until they feel safe," there are
often changes in her teaching plan which emerge from the children's needs, and
that cannot be anticipated beforehand (Melissa, 13/05/97). I observe both
Melissa's and Margaret's plans and note that those teachers seem to drop
everything, when appropriate, in order to respond to the unexpected needs of the
children. For example, they use a variety of modes including confirming care and
modelling care. In confirming, the teacher reveals to the child a more caring
image of his self than is manifested in his present actions. In modelling, the
teacher creates caring relationships with the children so they have opportunities to
experience what it feels and looks like to be cared for. Where possible, these
teachers also guide their teaching plans by regular reciprocal caring encounters
with parents, consultants, and other adults in the children's education.

The child's responsibility. It is around the substance of the children's
responsibilities that the teachers often describe moving or not moving along their
pathways toward embedding more caring orientations into the education of the
children. Their early experiences often tend to focus on the children's
responsibilities as limited to learning academic content such as reading and math.
Typically, they tell me about the priority of covering the curriculum (Olive,
11/04/97) and struggling with questions such as, "Can I get all of them, 32 kids, to
read by the end of the year?" (Melissa, 13/05/97). The outcome is that the teacher
often feels she is letting the children down when they are not experiencing
academic success.

Ultimately, many teachers described placing academic content at the
existential heart\textsuperscript{36} of the child. For example, Fran says:

Teaching for relevancy: What I am teaching has far-reaching significance. Learning must be seen as worthwhile and connections between learning and life must be seen as a means of growth and happiness... and, [when things did not go well,] trying to process what happens when students make decisions which affect others in ways which are hurtful to themselves and others (Fran, 11/04/97).

Teaching for relevance, by focusing on who and what the child is trying to become, involves applying modes in which the teachers coach the children in learning to create caring relationships. These teachers typically delight in their caring being completed in the children's responses of growth and self-actualization. Yet, for teachers who experience insufficient opportunity for self-actualization through teaching the children, the outcome can be retreating or exiting from their careers in teaching.

**The growth of the children.** The teachers describe their voices as ultimately feasible when proving to facilitate the growth of the children. This can be seen in Margaret's telling me about learning to focus on how children learn:

You have to be sure that the children are learning what you are giving them... If kids don't see it when taught that way, stop teaching it that way because they don't understand that kind of concept. So, if you do everything you can, and nobody gets it, it is because it is not appropriate for their developmental levels (Margaret, 6/02/98).

A change of children's age-level often requires the teacher to adopt a different voice (Alice, 11/04/97). Moreover, the modes of teaching at a grade level the teacher is familiar with often may not be successfully adapted to another grade

\textsuperscript{36} Existential heart refers to who and what the child is trying to become which is also acceptable to the teacher.
level (Eva, 11/04/97). The modes of teaching that are successful with the children who arrive at school ready and eager to learn often do not provide enough support, unless adapted, for children who are not centered when they arrive at school (Miriam, 13/05/97).

The teachers describe trends of the times which cause them to struggle while attempting to maintain voices which are appropriate for facilitating the growth of the children. One trend is the limited professional development support available at the time when some teachers began their teaching careers. In its place, a new system policy invites children and parents to have more voice in the children's education; this is supported by additional personal and material resources for teaching. Thus, when the teachers struggle to facilitate the growth of the children, a later trend brings financial cutbacks accompanied by drastically reduced personal and material resources for teaching (Melissa, 6/02/98). Another trend of the times with which the teachers need to contend is the increasing number of single-parent families that are otherwise preoccupied so that their children arrive at school without acceptable standards and not yet ready for learning (Miriam, 13/05/97, 6/02/98). Another trend involves the teachers' energies being drained when they hear persistent media reports that diminish their credibility (Margaret, 22/11/99, 7/12/99).

Even the teachers who have learned appropriate modes for facilitating the growth of the children, which are sources of the teachers' self-actualization and sustenance for teaching, find their struggles starting all over again when new trends of the times threaten their connecting deeply with the children. Yet, insufficient caring in relationships and rapid change without opportunities for adequate sustenance for the teachers' caring for the children are likely to stretch
the teachers' efforts too thin.

What Voice Patterns Are the Outcome of the Teachers' Attempts
to Create and Maintain Voice in the Children's Education?

Caring involves two parties: the one-caring and the cared-for.
It is complete when it is fulfilled in both (Noddings, 1984: 68).

Voice patterns are the outcome of the teachers' efforts to create and
maintain voice in teaching the children. These patterns, in which the teachers'
educational orientations are embedded, are formed on the basis of who has voice.

As illustrated in Figure 4 below, some voice patterns are more viable than others
for the teachers' situation:

**Figure 4: Creator-Maintainer Voice Patterns**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Caring: No Voice Left Out</th>
<th>Teacher Directed: Voices of the Children and Other Adults Inhibited or Blocked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Directed:</strong> Voice of the Teacher Inhibited or Blocked</td>
<td><strong>I'm Out of Here</strong> All Voices Left Out</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No voice (teacher, children, other adults) is left out of the "Caring" pattern, yet all
voices are left out of the "I'm-out-of-here" pattern because the teacher exits or
retreats from her teaching career. The voices of the children and the other adults
are inhibited or blocked by the teacher's voice in the "Teacher-directed" pattern.
The teacher's voice is inhibited or blocked by the voices of children and other
adults in the "Other-directed" pattern. Unlike the other patterns, the Other-
directed pattern has four dimensions. For instance, there is the "Feeling at risk" dimension when the teacher feels at risk of having a diminished voice in teaching the children, and there is the "Being someone else's image" when the unwilling teacher conforms to someone else's image of whom she should be. There is also the "Feeling divided" dimension when the teacher feels torn between using the time available for addressing the needs and interests of the children or for attending to the plethora of outside initiatives. The fourth dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, "Feeling overwhelmed," occurs when the teacher is crushed by the persistent media reports intimating teachers' lack of credibility. The four voice patterns and their dimensions tend to be dynamic, so the teacher does not remain in one category. For instance, no teacher remains in the Teacher-directed voice pattern all of the time, and no teacher remains in one of the dimensions of the Other-directed voice pattern all of the time. Having her voice inhibited or blocked is often disheartening for the teacher, and the following discussion focuses on the responses of the teachers to the various voice patterns and dimensions.

**The Caring Pattern: No Voice Left Out**

Time is central to the caring voice pattern. Time is required for the teacher to move to a more caring orientation if she begins her career in an orientation in which she serves as a conduit for the voices of other adults, supervises and manages the children as curriculum-receivers, and has little awareness of having limited voice of her own in teaching the children. Over time, she learns to trust in creating and maintaining her own voice while teaching the children. The teachers describe trust, and creating and maintaining voice as emerging more readily when they create and maintain voice directly with the children rather than through
secondary voices. Such learning also takes time, during which the child is learning to be cared for, as well as learning to care for himself and others. As the teacher is learning to create and maintain voice in the children's education, she is also learning to be cared for, as well as learning to care for herself, the children, and other adults in their education. The process of caring is discussed in detail in Chapter Six.

An excellent illustration of the caring teacher's encounters with the children is provided by Margaret. Her experience has been cited here and there throughout the previous section of this chapter, and is described here briefly. Her experience is described in considerable detail in Chapter Six.

**The Caring Teacher**

At the end of her first year of teaching, Margaret seriously considers reaching out for support for creating and maintaining voice in teaching the children. During the next few years she reaches out and receives "a lot of caring support" from Gloria, a system consultant. With this and other adult support, Margaret becomes enthusiastic about being "a learner first and a teacher second." She also becomes enthusiastic about teaching children first, and subject matter second. Similarly, she savours experiences where her teaching efforts lead to the children's success in academic and social learning. Her flexible teaching plans are directed at addressing the specific needs and interests of each child. Often, she provides non-competitive, game-like, learning experiences for the children. I observe the children participating in one of these experiences. Then Margaret announces in a firm but caring tone, "It is time to go to French class," and the children gracefully and unhurriedly form double lines inside the classroom door as the quiet murmur of their voices continues. Margaret invites the children to proceed to French class, and they exit the classroom room in seemingly happy strides... Then, just as Margaret begins to show me entries in her plan book, she suddenly turns to the right, where Sally is seated at a countertop. Margaret immediately makes clear to Sally what is more acceptable in their relationship than

101
Sally's choosing to remain in the classroom. In doing so, Margaret speaks directly to Sally while honouring her by name in a firm but supportive tone, "All of the other children have gone to French class." Sally continues to colour as Margaret speaks, then stops colouring and looks directly at Margaret. She says in a tone of pride and confidence, "I am making something for the French teacher." Margaret responds in a way that guides Sally toward finding her own reasons and direction for caring. She appreciatively acknowledges Sally's project, pauses, and then reminds her that she can finish colouring "during the free time the French teacher provides at the end of the class." Thus, Margaret provides Sally with experience in what it feels and looks like to be cared for. Once reminded, Sally appears to have a clear sense of her own responsibility, and to act accordingly. She walks slowly toward Margaret with her colouring paper in hand. As she passes Margaret, Sally displays the paper in both hands above her head. Margaret nods affirmatively as Sally proceeds in what appears to be a happy stride toward the door, and then exits. In this encounter, Sally's response indicates that Margaret is helping her to cultivate caring relationships, based on Sally's own thoughts and feelings (Researcher's partial synopsis for Margaret: 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98, 22/11/99).

**The I'm-Out-Of-Here Pattern: All Voices Left Out**

The voice pattern, "I'm out of here," is the only pattern in which all of the voices in the education of the children are left out. The teacher gives up hope of creating and maintain a voice she can live with in teaching the children, and exits or retreats from her teaching career.

In this voice pattern, the teachers describe having fixed images of what is acceptable in their teaching situations. For example, they feel the teacher should have confidence that her teaching efforts will often be completed in the responses of the children. Melissa words her lack of confidence as "struggling alone" and "feeling scared," "fumbling through the [new] curriculum," and questioning, "Can I do this job well enough?" (Melissa, 13/05/97). Fran tells me, "I feel tremendous
malaise because my integrity clashes with my career goals" (Fran, 11/04/97).
Similarly, Eva describes questioning her own capability for teaching the children and adds, "I hated it, and got out" (Eva, 11/04/97). It may be recalled that some teachers, such as Melissa, have the expectation of being independently responsible for their own teaching (Melissa, 2/11/99). Another fixed image is the impossibility of experiencing sufficient self-actualization for sustaining teaching where conditions persistently inhibit and block teaching the children (Eva, 11/04/97, Fran, 11/04/98; Melissa, 13/05/98, 6/02/98). Depending upon the teacher's relationship with the children and other adults, the I'm-out-of-here pattern may continue for years. Yet, in their discussions with me, the teachers do not speak uncaringly of the other adults involved in the inhibiting or blocking experiences. In this study, three teachers experience the I'm-out-of-here voice pattern but, in time, move toward more caring voice patterns.

An illustration of the I'm-out-of-here teacher is provided by Melissa, and her experience is cited here. Her encounters with other caring adults in the children's education, are also described in Chapter Six.

**The I'm-Out-Of-Here Teacher**

During her first year of teaching, Melissa uses the official curriculum with a grade of children, and soon observes that some of them are not experiencing success in learning the academic subject matter such as reading. She subsequently tries out ideas from her own teaching repertoire, but is disheartened when some of the children continue not to experience success. Melissa assumes she is to be independently responsible for her teaching. She tells me that, in those days, "Everybody does!" During the following year, she continues to struggle alone in attempting to teach academic content to "special needs children." During the next year, a consultant provides her with some support in programming. Her face lights
up when tells me about the subsequent and "positive" supervision of her teaching, which leaves her feeling "capable and validated." During her fourth year, Melissa teaches a new grade of 30 children while continuing to struggle alone to become familiar with the new curriculum. She feels "scared," is "fumbling" her way through the new curriculum, and repeatedly asking herself, "Can I do this job well enough?" Yet, she is also hoping that her teaching will improve. By the end of the school year, however, Melissa is discouraged, and reflects, "It's not worth it." She gives up hope, and on resigning for the birth of a new baby, tells herself, "I'm out of here" while vowing "never to return"... Ultimately, however, Melissa returns to teaching and moves toward a more caring voice pattern (Partial synopsis of Melissa, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 10/02/98).

The Teacher-Directed Pattern:

The Voices of the Child and Other Adult Inhibited or Blocked

In the Teacher-directed pattern, teachers give direction to the voices of the children and the other adults in their education. This pattern originates with the teacher attempting to use the official curriculum, and the directives and expectations of other adults. She is taken by surprise when some of the children do not experience success, and is likewise taken by surprise when trying out ideas from her own limited teaching repertoire also leads to some of the children continuing to experience limited success. These experiences are disheartening for her. The outcome for the child and other adults is having their voices inhibited or blocked. The outcome for the teacher is to ultimately acknowledge a void in her teaching repertoire, and typically reflect "I should be able to do this" (Melissa, 13/05/97) and "I do not know very much" (Margaret, 6/02/98). Depending upon the teacher's relationship with the children and other adults, the Teacher-directed pattern may continue for years. Yet, the teachers in such situations do not speak
uncaringly about the children or other adults involved. From this voice pattern, the teacher, in time, moves to another voice pattern or dimension.

Miriam's experience provides an excellent illustration of the Teacher-directed voice pattern. Her experience, including encounters with other caring adults, is also described in Chapter Six.

The I-Can't-Do-It Teacher

Miriam has been teaching for several years and working alone with the children. Things seem to be going relatively well in guiding her teaching with the official academic curriculum. The exception is a child, Ralph, who interacts with Miriam and the other children in ways that are harmful to himself and others. For example, he throws books and swears. The academic curriculum provides no guidelines for Miriam's response to his unacceptable encounters. Trying out ideas from her own teaching repertoire is unsuccessful. She feels fragmented, given that Ralph's social skills are not only harmful to himself and others, but they often prevent her from teaching the prescribed curriculum. Ultimately, she speaks her own truth to herself, "I can't do it," and struggles with the question of how to survive. Something has to give since she cannot yet trust her own voice in the child's education. Ultimately, however, Miriam moves toward a more caring voice pattern (Partial synopsis for Miriam, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98).

The Other-Directed Pattern: The Voice of the Teacher Inhibited or Blocked

In the Other-directed voice pattern, the voices of the children and other adults give direction to the teacher's voice. In this pattern, there are four dimensions: "Feeling at risk," "Being someone else's image," "Feeling divided," and "Feeling overwhelmed." These dimensions are separated here because the effect of each on the teacher is completely different. In none of these dimensions do the teachers in this study speak uncaringly about the other adults involved in their encounters.

The Feeling-at-Risk Dimension
In the dimension, Feeling at risk, other adults introduce change in the children's education which causes discontinuity of the processes and situations that seem to support the teacher and the children well. The introduction of the change leaves the teacher feeling the risk of diminished opportunities for creating and maintaining voice in teaching the children. Often the change is introduced by a person in authority, and is totally unexpected by the teacher. For example, assignment to a new curriculum, a new age level, and a new holistic approach by the board leaves Alice feeling the risk of having a diminished voice in teaching the new children (Alice, 11/04/97). Similarly, a change introduced into the configuration of the age-grade Eva was happily teaching, leaves her feeling the risk of diminished opportunities for creating and maintaining a voice she can live with if she were to teach the same grade in the following year (Eva, 11/04/97).

Even the teacher who agrees that there is no option to closing the school where she has been teaching for many years, experiences an unwelcomed sense of discontinuity (Margaret, 6/02/98). The greater the magnitude of the discontinuity of the processes and conditions that seem to have been supporting the teacher and children well, the greater the amount of stress the teacher experiences. Depending upon the teacher's relationship with the other adults and the children, the Feeling-at-risk dimension may continue for years. However, from this dimension, the teacher may eventually move to another pattern or dimension.

Margaret's experience provides an excellent example of the Feeling-at-risk dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern. Her experience is described briefly here.

**The feeling-at-risk teacher.** After Margaret had taught at her first school
for eight years and was well-ensconced as a satellite teacher, the school's closure was announced. In response, Margaret felt at "double risk" of having to stop work on in-progress programs for the children, and of having no assurance that the staff at her new school will be enthusiastic about growing and changing. Thus, she felt at risk of having diminished opportunities for creating and maintaining voice in teaching the children, which was a disheartening experience for her. She appreciated the reason for the closure, the school building was old, but this acceptance made the experience no less stressful for her. Even the principal's saying, "I would love to work with you again" and extending an invitation for Margaret to teach at his new school, did not reduce her sense of feeling at risk...

Ultimately, however, Margaret moved toward the caring voice pattern.

(Researcher's partial synopsis for Margaret, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98, 22/11,99).

The Being-Someone-Else's-Image Dimension

In the Being-someone-else's-image dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, the other adult issues a hands-off mandate, directive, or strong expectation regarding the teacher's creating and maintaining voice in teaching some of the children. The communication from the other adult is in the voice of authority, often conveyed indirectly to the teacher, and is totally unexpected by her. If the teacher responds by attempting to talk about the matter with the other adult, dialogue does not emerge. This is Miriam's experience when she assumes "the principal always supports the teacher." She is therefore surprised to receive a hands-off directive from the principal regarding her attempt to teach social skills to a child. She responds by attempting, without success, to discuss the issue with the
principal. The directive is maintained, and Miriam is frustrated (Miriam, 13/05/97). In the Being-someone-else's-image dimension, at best, the teacher has a token voice in the education of the children. She experiences a sense of helplessness and hopelessness which is often articulated as "feeling smothered" (Miriam, 13/05/97) and "being someone else's image of who I should be" (Melissa, 13/05/97), as well as "questioning my ability to teach the children" (Sandy, 11/05/97). One teacher comments that the principal is a weak leader and is therefore readily influenced by the expectations of other adults without caring for the teacher (Miriam, 13/04/97).

Where the teacher maintains hope that the other adult will hold the position of authority for only a short period of time or where there is the expectation that a related policy will change in the near future, the Being-someone-else's-image dimension serves as a holding pattern of short-term stability. Depending upon the encounters among the teacher, other adults, and the children, this pattern may continue for years. From this dimension, the teacher moves to either another voice pattern or dimension.

Melissa's experience provides an excellent illustration of this dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern.

**The being-someone-else's-image teacher.** Melissa is a teacher of special education, and has settled into the responsibilities of "teaching children whose needs are not met in the regular classroom," and of creating and maintaining supportive relationships with the classroom teachers. She feels that her assistance is appreciated by the classroom teachers and principal. However, when she attempts to support a new teacher by offering to assist some of the children with learning to read, the offer is rejected. Melissa responds by telling the classroom teacher that the children are more likely to experience success in learning to read if
they are provided with special education assistance during their early years of school. Her words, nevertheless, continue to fall on deaf ears. This is at a time when the classroom teacher has the final say regarding children receiving such assistance. The new principal does not support Melissa's sense of special education teaching as "a calling," nor her practice of "identifying children with special needs at an early age and grade." Although Melissa feels fragmented by the experience, she also feels she has no alternative, and must live with the decision of the classroom teacher. Thus, she tells me she is "being someone else's image of who I should be," and that she is longing to "be who I really am"...

Ultimately, however, she moves toward a more caring orientation (Partial synopsis for Melissa, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98, 2/11/99).

**The Feeling-Divided Dimension**

In the Feeling-divided dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, the teacher faces the dilemma of wanting to support two voices that differ or that cannot realistically be accommodated in the time available. Often the divided loyalties emerge unexpectedly in the teacher's interaction with a child or as a result of a decision introduced by another adult. A sense of feeling divided is a part of the natural rhythm of teaching. For example, as cited earlier, Margaret routinely faces the challenge of finding time to get to know the children well enough to address the specific needs of each child, while at the same time, trying to do all of the other things she is required to do. The struggle to achieve an acceptable balance is "always there" (Margaret, 6/02/98). Similarly, Miriam says, "All teaching is a struggle" (Miriam, 13/05/97). In the Feeling-divided dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, however, there is an extraordinary intensity in feeling divided. There are, for example, a plethora of outside initiatives (such as emergent curriculum) by which the teacher is to be guided. These initiatives, however, often compete for the teacher's time, attention, and energy which she
feels would be better spent on addressing the immediate needs and interests of the children. For example, some of the children "have never known unconditional love" (Melissa, 13/05/97), and some interact in ways which "place themselves and others at risk" (Fran, 11/04/97). Moreover, the greater the pressure for the teacher to do more in less time, the greater the intensity of the teacher's feeling divided. This is a relatively new dimension, and is ongoing at the time of the closure of this study.

Miriam's experience provides an excellent example of the Feeling-divided dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern.

**The Feeling-divided teacher.** During her twenty years of teaching experience, Miriam has had "few smooth sailing times: "This," she tells me, "is the dichotomy that exists in teaching." Yet, her sense of feeling divided has been intensified dramatically during the past few years. When focusing primarily on the needs and interests of the children, she feels she is neglecting other responsibilities in their education. When focusing primarily on the other responsibilities, Miriam feels she is neglecting the children's needs and interests. The pendulum always swings too far in one direction or the other. She is happy when addressing the children's needs despite the increasing number of children who are not centered when they arrive at school, and who experience emotional instability. For instance, Miriam takes the time to give the children unconditional love, lets them know what is expected of them, and often telephones the parents at home. She usually remains after school to prepare plans and materials for the following day, and takes marking home for the evenings and weekends. Yet, at the same time, she is attempting to address the plethora of outside initiatives from other adults in the children's education. An example is the Ministry of Education and Training's continuous stream of end products, such as a new computerized report card and new curricula that require professional development for the teacher. Often, as well, Miriam finds it necessary to adapt them to accommodate the specific needs of the children. There are also instances when adequate
adaptation is not possible. Examples are the limited space on the new report cards where pertinent information is be recorded for the parents, and the constant testing to get marks. As the intensity of feeling frustrated and disheartened increases, so does Miriam's awareness of the decreasing time available for the evolutionary changes she would like to make in her teaching. With a tone of deep regret, she tells me, "It's almost like the children are second fiddle, the missing element." (Researcher's partial synopsis for Miriam, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98).

The Feeling-Overwhelmed Dimension

The Other-directed voice-pattern dimension, "Feeling overwhelmed," emerges in response to persistent media reports focusing on teachers' lack of credibility, and therefore, conveying a lack of appreciation for many teachers' hard work in creating and maintaining voice in teaching the children. Margaret struggles in listening to television reports concerning "how terrible teachers are... You have nothing to offer because you are a teacher." Not only does she feel overwhelmed by those reports, but she feels she had always worked hard, and even harder in recent years, "There are times when I just feel I can not do another thing" (Margaret, 22/11/99, 6/12/99). Miriam shudders when reading false media reports that are telling parents "everybody is happy; every child is a self-directed learner; there are all of those computers, and teachers are facilitators." This false image painted by the media leads some parents to have unrealistic expectations, given the impossible load she already struggles with in endeavouring to create and maintain voice in teaching the children. Rather than feeling appreciated and given credit for her efforts, she feels "arrows coming at me from all sides" (Miriam, 13/05/97, 6/02/98). This relatively new Feeling-overwhelmed dimension is continuing for the teachers at the closure of the study.

Melissa's experience provides an excellent illustration of the Feeling
overwhelmed dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern.

**The Feeling-overwhelmed teacher.** Melissa struggles with the media reports on teachers' lack of credibility. She says, "We're trying to do the best with what we have... You are trying to do the right things but no matter what you do..." She adds, "I have never felt this way before, affecting you as a person, not accepting our credibility at all. We've got 30 years experience or more, and I feel I've worked conscientiously all along." Melissa tells me that the negative media reports seem to contribute to decreasing the teachers' credibility with some parents who might otherwise work cooperatively with teachers. Instead, "during telephone conversations and at school meetings these parents tend to criticize teachers and insist on unrealistic expectations for their children." Sometimes Melissa is left feeling that the parents expect her to raise their child. Another instance of parents' lack of appreciation is provided by the new computerized report card mandated by the Ministry of Education and Training. The third page of the report is provided for comments by parents. Some of their comments on the first issue of the report card criticize the teachers' interaction with the children, and become part of the public record. During my first interview with Melissa, she says, "I love what I do. I am happy in my teaching." During later interviews, she says, "It used to be dings. At least you could recover from them. Now it's hits all of the time, and you don't recover from hits. Sometimes I wonder if I will be left standing." She adds, "Everyday there's something more. I can't do any more, I'm so buried now... I don't know how to dig myself out any more." In conclusion, Melissa says, "I don't need this... feeling overwhelmed!" (Researcher's partial synopsis for Melissa, (11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98/21/199, 6/12/99).

**Summary of Chapter Five**

There are many differing voices in the children's education. Voice refers to the communication of personal energies in verbal and nonverbal messages. Where the teacher's voice differs from that of the child, the teacher often tries out her own ideas, and often discovers a void in her repertoire. Where the voices of the teacher
and the other adults differ, the teacher is often left with a secondary voice for teaching the children. Having her voice inhibited or blocked in teaching the children can be a disheartening experience. The teachers in this study do not expect to experience so much dispiritive awakening.

Voice patterns are formed on the basis of who has voice in the children's education. In the "Caring" voice pattern, no voice (the teacher, children, adults) is left out of the children's education. The teacher creates and maintains voice in teaching the children and gives voice to the children in their own education. The teacher-children relationships are accepted or supported by other adults in their education. These is also the voice pattern, "I'm out of here," where all voices are left out of the children's education. As well, there is the "Teacher directed" pattern when the voices of the children and adults are left out. In the "Other-directed" pattern, the voice of the teacher is left out. The four voice patterns tend to be dynamic; the teacher does not remain in one category all of the time.
CHAPTER SIX

FINDING A GUIDING STAR FOR NAVIGATING BY:

CARING AND INSPIRITIVE AWAKENING

The most important thing children learn from us is how to interact with people and other living things... We show how to care in our relations with them (Noddings, 1996d: 163).

Introduction

In this study of educational orientations, the teachers describe their central concern as teaching the children, and care-empowering education is discovered to be the process by which they acquire more viable orientations for coping with that challenge. Teachers who initially seem happy teaching, in time, often find themselves struggling to create and maintain voice in the children's education. Typical expressions include "struggling with how to survive," "frustrating," "scared," "worried," "questioning my being a good teacher." They tell me that creating and maintaining voice in teaching the children, as described in the preceding chapter, is met when they care for the children, and learn to be cared for as well as learn to care for themselves and other adults in the children's education. Even teachers, whose educational orientations differ from those of other adults in the children's education as well as teachers with limited teaching repertoires, ultimately move toward acquiring more viable orientations when caring is applied. For example, when caring is applied to the Teacher-directed voice pattern where the children are not learning academic content or social skills, they seem to respond by completing the teacher's caring.

Through inspiritive awakening, which is a special property of caring, the
teacher learns to create and maintain voice in teaching the children and learns to
gives voice to the children in their own education, while the teacher-children
relationships are accepted or supported by other adults in the children's education.
Thus, the teacher tends to move along a pathway toward applying a more viable
orientation in the children's education. In this chapter, which focuses on the
teachers finding a guiding star for navigating their pathways while teaching the
children, four questions are addressed:

* What are the properties of caring?
* What are some of the conditions that facilitate caring?
* What are the general outcomes of caring?
* What is inspiritive awakening?

**What Are the Properties of Caring?**

Inclusion as practiced by the teacher is a vital gift... [which
enables her] to receive the student, to look at the subject
matter with him. Her commitment is to him, the cared-for, and
he is --through that commitment-- set free to pursue his
legitimate projects... The child wants to affirm competence in
his own world of experience;... [and] gradually assumes greater
responsibility for the tasks... [he and the teacher] undertake
... The student has his greatest effect on the relationship as
the one cared-for. If he perceives the teacher's caring and
responds to it, he is giving the teacher what she needs most to
continue to care... The student rewards his teacher with
responsiveness (Noddings, 1984a: 177-8, 181).

---

37 In this report, some teacher experiences are repeated in various contexts. Where
an example is cited from one participant's experience, the intention is not to discount
the experiences of the other participants, but to provide the reader with one of the most
explicit examples.
The teachers describe their caring for the children as involving more than helping them to learn academic content. At a minimum, caring refers to providing an environment where the child seems to learn that he is cared for. At a maximum, caring accounts for the child learning to be cared for, as well as learning to care for self and others. Thus, caring is mutually beneficial for the children and the teacher in that the children respond with growth and self-actualization which, in turn, nurtures the teacher's desire to continue to care. Caring is located at one hypothetical end of the teacher's pathway, and least caring is located at the other end. This can be seen in a child interacting in ways that are harmful to self and others, and the teacher caring for him by praising his small steps of progress toward acceptable social skills, whereas not praising his small steps of progress is seen as least caring. Likewise, adapting the prescribed reading curriculum to meet the needs and interests of the child is seen as caring, while applying a prescribed curriculum which does not address the reading needs and interests of the children is seen as least caring. The timing of the teacher's caring could also be crucial to the child's learning. For instance, the priority of the child's learning math is well timed for the child who arrives at school ready and eager to learn. Yet, for the child who arrives at school too tired and hungry to learn, the same priority would contribute little toward educating him.

Confirming and practicing are two properties of caring. Confirming refers to affirming for the child that happiness comes from being cared for, as well as from caring for self and others. In confirming, the teacher lovingly lifts the child up toward a more caring and achievable image of his self than is manifested in his present actions. On the other hand, least confirming, as in not acknowledging the
worth of the child himself, refers to minimally affirming for the child that
happiness comes from caring. Similarly, practicing refers to providing the child
with creative opportunities for finding his own reasons and direction for caring.
For example, the teacher coaches his apprenticeship and service in caring through
his own academic and social projects, and even helps him to stretch them. Least
practicing refers to providing the child with minimum opportunities for finding his
own reasons and directions for caring. In general, the teachers describe caring as a
set of encounters which have the effect of the child learning to be cared for, as
well as learning to care for self and others. In the following discussion of caring,
some focus on least caring is also included.

**Properties**

The teachers' describe five properties of caring which facilitate their
creating and maintaining voices in the children's education, and their moving along
pathways toward embedding caring orientations. The properties include
*confirming, modelling, dialoguing, practicing,* and *timing.* The core property,
confirming, echoes throughout the other properties of caring, and is essential if the
children are to learn that they are valued and trusted, and if they are to learn to
value and trust themselves and others. The process of caring often begins with
confirming, in which the teacher affirms for the child that happiness comes from
caring. As cited above, this involves lovingly lifting him up toward a more caring

---

38 In Noddings' (1984, 1992) theory, caring is more broadly defined in that it focuses
on caring for the self, intimate others, distant others, non-human living things,
person-made objects, and ideas. In this study of teachers' educational orientations, the
teachers focus primarily on interpersonal relations.

39 Four of the five properties of caring in this study are similar to those included in
self-image. Confirming, in combination with practicing, dialoguing, modelling, and timing, makes caring for the children easier. Modelling, in which the child has opportunities for seeing and feeling what it is like to be cared for, is an enrichment property of caring which also helps to develop the child's trust. Practicing and dialoguing are essential properties of caring, whereas timing is a more-general property. For example, it takes time for the children to learn to be cared for. Confirming, practicing, dialoguing, and modelling take place over time. Because of its general nature, the property of timing is embedded within the discussion of the other four properties of caring. Although these four properties of caring are interrelated, they are discussed here separately for clarity.

**Confirming.** The confirming property of caring is evident to both the teachers and myself. More than any other caring property, the teachers describe confirming as the source of building trust between the child and the teacher. Confirming involves affirming for the children that happiness comes from being cared for as well as caring for self and others. The timing property of caring is embedded in confirming as the teacher gets to know the child well enough to have a sense of who and what he is trying to become. She accepts him as he actually is and as having the power to nurture his own caring self, and she lovingly lifts him up through achievable steps toward a more caring image of himself than is manifested in his present actions. Thus, the teacher attributes the best possible motive to him. The confirming property of caring can be seen, not only in the in-progress relationship of the teacher and child, but also terminally and retrospectively. In-progress confirming is exemplified by Sandy: "Happy learning: My practice is worthwhile when my students enjoy and have fun
learning, which is when they choose what they want to learn and how, and I guide them in their learning" (Sandy, 11/04/99). Iris words the experiences of in-progress and terminal confirming:

Children wanting to learn: They need to learn to solve their own problems... Watching the interactions and ideas of the children develop... Children are working through a math problem... They commit themselves to independently solving it. You can see them calculating and thinking. Their eyes show their mental efforts... They get an answer and they are so excited... Excitement... mine matches theirs... The engagement in learning is what counts (Iris, 11/04/97).

Confirming, as appreciated retrospectively, is exemplified by Nancy:

I received a telephone call at my home from a student I taught in my second year of teaching. He called to tell me how positively I had affected his life. He is now 30 years old, and a lawyer in northern Canada. We shared. I cried tears of happiness. I felt validated because I motivated a young man to make his learning a journey of joy and satisfaction (Nancy, 11/04/97).

Confirming openly affirms for the child that he is worthy of being cared for even when no dialogue is involved. This can be seen in my observations of Melissa's interaction with Sid:

[In the midst of my interview with Melissa:] The door unexpectedly opens, and Sid enters with a teacher on each side. One of the teachers accompanying him describes the situation briefly, "He is late for his medication." Through a graceful rhythm everyone seems to emerge as fully present for Sid and his situation so that he is at the centre of attention. He looks directly at Melissa, and she looks directly at him. Words seem unnecessary... One of the other teachers continues to rest a few fingers gently on the Sid's shoulder. Melissa and Sid proceed in silence as Sid administers a test to determine his specific need for medication. Melissa responds by providing the medication, which Sid then self-administers. There is a pause as he looks directly at Melissa, and his nod seems to convey,
"Thank you, teacher." Melissa responds with a similar nod. Again, no words seem necessary for an appropriate closure to their meeting as an opportunity for caring. As Sid turns slowly to exit the room, one of the other teachers breaks the silence in a supportive tone, "Next time, Sid, leave your friends on the playground when it is time for your medication" (Field note for Melissa, 6/02/98).

In this illustration of confirming, everything else seems to stop in order to address Sid's situation. Melissa and the other two teachers seem to be fully present for him. The interaction between Melissa and Sid indicates that past experiences had allowed a substantial routine of mutual trust to build up as the basis for addressing this unexpected situation. Melissa and the other teachers do not demand or impose conditions on Sid but, rather, seem to facilitate nurturing his caring self-image. This is an instance of a teacher's confirming when no dialoguing is involved. Melissa beams as she tells me later, "I love what I do" (Melissa, 13/05/97), and "As a special education teacher, I am not bound by the curriculum. I am bound by the children" (Melissa, 2/11/99).

The above examples illustrate that confirming takes place over time, provides an opportunity for the children to experience happiness through caring, and is appropriate to the development of the child. The confirming property of caring is contrasted with least-confirming in which the self of the child is not acknowledged. This is exemplified by Beth's experience with Donald who is known to his previous teachers as a "trouble maker." Beth describes Donald as having a history of experiences so inappropriate for his development that he has generally experienced little success in learning. On the other hand, the confirming property of caring is illustrated when Beth becomes Donald's new teacher. She had recently learned to focus on the individual child, rather than only on
academics, and talks to me in a tone of pride about getting to know Donald's needs, accepting him as he is, and attributing the best possible motive to him:

... to realize that Donald had many talents... wanted to learn and be successful but he couldn't do it like everyone else. There have been lots of... individual chats with him to determine his academic and social needs and how he wants to succeed... So we created a program specifically for him (Beth, 11/04/97).

In reference to Donald's subsequent success, Beth describes "giving children the love of learning" as a source of her own self-actualization as a teacher. Confirming, unlike least confirming, is appropriate to the development of the child, and is beneficial for both the child and the teacher.

**Modelling.** The modelling property of caring is both reported by the teachers and observed by myself. This property and the timing property are already mirrored in the above examples of confirming. In modelling, the children are provided with opportunities for experiencing what it feels and looks like to be cared for. The teacher demonstrates pleasure in working with them, cooperatively establishes goals and flexible standards with them, and co-creates an environment with them in which it is safe for them to take learning risks, venturing out, trying again, and sharing their related emotions. The teacher also demonstrates that everyone has moral worth, and that she is a member of a support team. Terry words the experience:

Teaching children to read can be a struggle for some... in many regular reading lessons, nightly reading at home, library technician assistance, parent-volunteer assistance. And then they suddenly realize their success in Language Arts class, sometimes on their way to class... 'I can read that.' Excitement. Praise. 'We did it!' (Terry, 11/04/97).

In modelling, the teacher responds to the child as more sacred than the
administrative rules, addresses his needs as they emerge, as well as demonstrates consistently that she can be counted on. This can be seen in Melissa's experience. Her face lights up as she tells me:

We had a little girl who was going through a very difficult time with her single parent. And she is staying with an older cousin right now. I worked very hard with her. Easter time was a really difficult time for her... But the school got together, and somehow she had a nice Easter. She had some money, and some toys and whatever. Right? In her little journal she wrote, 'We don't have much money. But we had a lovely Easter. I didn't think it was going to be very good... The Angels help out. Thank you' (Melissa, 6/02/98).

Similarly, Carolyn tells me that she believes it is her authenticity with the children that helped a child gain the courage to disclose to Carolyn first about the ongoing experience of being placed at risk in the larger, non-school community. Subsequently, Carolyn and other members of the school support team provide additional care for this child after school for months (Carolyn, 11/04/97).

These examples indicate that modelling takes place over time, provides the children with experiences in what it feels and looks like to be cared for, and is appropriate to the development of the child. The modelling property of caring is contrasted with least-modelling in which the affective relationship is not acknowledged. An instance is Eva's experience during her first year of teaching when her teaching is guided by the official academic curriculum. She observed that some of the children were not experiencing success in their learning and, in her isolated classroom, she subsequently tries out ideas from her own limited repertoire. Some of the children continue not to experience success in their learning, and thus are not provided with a model of what it feels and looks like to be cared for (Eva, 11/04/97).
**Dialoguing.** The dialoguing property of caring is evident to both the teachers and myself. Modelling, confirming, and timing are mirrored in the dialoguing property of caring. Through dialoguing with the child about what he thinks and feels, the teacher guides him in cultivating caring relationships according to his maturity. She coaches his emergent attachments and connections around an open-ended search for common understanding, empathy, and appreciation for who and what he and the other person are each trying to become. The child is also provided with opportunities for sharing suggestions and possibilities as well as for disclosing successes, risks, and failures. Thus, the child is guided to take responsibility for making well-informed decisions and to form the habit of doing so. An instance of dialoguing is provided from my observation of Melissa and Tom:

Melissa provides Tom with a quiet place for completing his learning experiences because he is distracted by the busyness of the classroom. Each time we observe Tom in the room adjacent to the interview room, he appears to be working diligently. When dialoguing is involved, Melissa often praises Tom's choices in his learning experience. She tells me, within Tom's hearing distance, "He's so successful, and gets his work done, and he'll be stronger for that." As Tom is getting ready to leave for the day, Melissa is honest in disclosing that the paper she promised him is not yet ready, but "will be ready for you tomorrow." Then, as he is about to exit the room, Melissa invites each of us to have a treat which consists of multi-coloured, five-inch long, worm-like candy. Tom's eyes lit up as he received the treat (Researcher's partial synopsis for Melissa, 13/05/97).

Similarly, the teacher's valuing the dialoguing property over the outcomes of the encounter is seen in Margaret's wording of her experience:

With all of the outcomes-based learning and new curricula that are making the children more responsible for their own learning,
I send a little note and book home. I usually don't send it to the parent. I send it to the child. I say, 'Take this little book home. It is your job.' In Henry's case, it was a book he read in school, and he was taking it home to share with his family. The next day, he says 'My mom forgot where it was.' And I say, 'It was not your mom's responsibility. It was your job.' Like they need to be responsible for carrying communication back and forth... I say, 'What did you learn from this? What will you do with your book after you read it? (Pause.) [Nodding affirmatively,] put it in your knapsack?' (Margaret, 9/02/98).

An example of teacher-child dialoguing which emerges into a circle of dialoguing for the children is provided by Miriam:

I'm sitting around talking to them and getting their feelings and their sense of the topic... One student in the group, Robert, is a very difficult student to get along with, and yet, I would praise him... And the other students look at that, 'That's so good.' They see that he can't do it, but they see that I say, 'That's okay.' Then they say, 'See what he did here. That's so good.' And Robert's getting feedback. Now they see that he can do it. Those social connections are changing. It changes from the teacher being the praiser to the kids seeing that the other kid is capable too. So maybe they didn't have to read four books in that time, but they did learn the language skills that they needed (Miriam, 13/05/97).

The examples cited above indicate that the dialoguing property of caring takes place over time, involves the teacher inquiring into what the child thinks and feels as a basis for guiding him in cultivating caring relationships. Thus, the dialoguing property of caring is appropriate to the development of the child, and is beneficial for both the child and the teacher. This property may be contrasted with least dialoguing such as in becoming or remaining disconnected. For example, least dialoguing is seen in Alice's early teaching, when she is not open to feedback from the children which could indicate how her teaching might be improved (Alice, 11/04/97).
**Practicing.** The practicing property of caring is very evident. Dialoguing, modelling, confirming, and timing are mirrored in the practicing property of caring. In practicing, the teacher coaches the child in finding his own reasons and direction for caring, through trying out and even stretching his own academic and social projects affiliated with familiar, new, and different environments and resources. The child is also provided with creative opportunities for sharing his visions for his own projects, apprenticing in service and leadership, and seeing his own responses as encouraging or diminishing others' enthusiasm for helping to create pleasant learning environments. Geraldine says, "Assemblies provide opportunities for recognition of students' achievements, their coming together as a community, and their involvement in decisions and choices" (Geraldine, 11/04/97). Melissa provides an example of the principal arranging for the students and teachers to assemble in the gym each week where accomplishments are acknowledged and there is an introduction of the goals for the week (Melissa, 13/05/97). Likewise, I observe various students leading the opening rituals for the school day as a learning community. For example, over the school's intercom system, a child leads the morning prayer and provides announcements such as birthdays of the children. Another example of community service that I observe is a table display with a variety of non-perishable foods in the school corridor. Above the table is a banner inviting the donation of a different type of food item each week for several forthcoming weeks to be provided for people in need.

Another example of the practicing property of caring is described by Melissa, a special education teacher, who uses a "timeout chair" for Roy:

I tell him, 'Roy, you will sit there without falling off the chair or crawling underneath it.' I praise him, 'Aren't you sitting in
the timeout chair nicely,' or 'Congratulations...'. The timeout chair is turned into a positive. But it is amazing how he can be so out of control in the classroom; put him in the timeout chair, and he learns to change: He knows on the timeout chair, he has to be quiet, and he is. It's a think time. Every 45 seconds or so, I'll say, 'What are you thinking about?' Then processing the problem begins: Discuss, and the child verbalizes his action: 'Why was it inappropriate? What could you have done instead of throwing scissors? What can you do in the future if you start to feel angry? How do you think the class feels? What do you think is an appropriate consequence for your action?' And, if Roy does not choose an appropriate consequence, I move the discussion toward an appropriate consequence so he knows the consequences of throwing scissors in the future. In this case, I was thinking 'the safety of the other children came first'...

Sometimes the kid really didn't know what is appropriate here at school: 'My Mom lets me do it at home'--throwing scissors... snow balls, getting mad and throwing a tantrum. 'Well this is what you do at home, but this is not appropriate here. We don't accept that here'... And we can't go on assuming that they all know how to act appropriately (Melissa, 2/11/99).

An example of practicing for the entire class is provided by Margaret. In her introduction, she tells me with a tone of warmth and pride:

If you come into my room, you will find that some kids are just reading reams. They come in very bright and very eager. And you'll see that their planning is very different from the other kids who are becoming a little more independent. And then there are the kids at the bottom who need a lot of practice and drill. What I plan for them I try to make really fun, something they really want to do, and that they enjoy doing. Like, with the lowest group, I could give them an activity where they draw a picture and write the words because they need practice in, not just writing, but sounding out the words. Well, if I could make it more interesting or revolve it around Valentine's Day, they

---

40 In this school, "consequence" seems to be common terminology in adult-child communications affiliated with the special-needs children learning what is expected of them.
would do two sheets. They would do one, and say, 'Can I do another?' So they are getting the practice they need. We do our practicing intentionally. They need a little help in someone directing theirs (Field note for Margaret, 13/05/97).

I subsequently observe:

The children are involved in game-like experiences. Each child seems to be immersed in reading the story from his own sheet and subsequently choosing appropriate items from the cache, such as stickers of a variety of shapes, sizes, colours, and textures, which are located in the centre of the table. The instruction sheets differ from child to child, and each child appears to experience success. A few of the children receive minimum assistance from a child sitting next to them. Occasionally, a child's face lights up while gracefully retrieving an item from the central cache. Now and again, two children at the same table share reciprocal glances of delight or a few words of delight in response to their choices. Margaret moves quietly about the room. Like myself, she appears to be generally unnoticed by the children. Occasionally, she stops to observe a child or to ask a warm but direct question related to the child's instruction sheet and subsequent choices (Field note for Margaret, 13/05/97).

The illustrations cited above indicate that the practicing property of caring takes place over time as the teacher coaches the child's discovery of his own reasons and direction for caring through his own academic and social projects. The examples also indicate that practicing is appropriate for the development of the child, and is beneficial to both the children and the teacher. This property of caring may be contrasted with least-practicing such as in supervising and managing. This can be seen in Melissa's early experience when a new classroom teacher declines her invitation to identify and assist with teaching special-needs children. Those children are, therefore, not provided with creative opportunities through special education for finding their own reasons and directions for caring to
read (Melissa, 13/05/97).

In Summary

The five properties of caring that are described by the teachers are timing, confirming, modelling, dialoguing, and practicing. In embedding caring orientations, they describe these properties not only as present, but also as reciprocally beneficial for the teacher and the children. Thus, both the child and the teacher are transformed during caring.

Timing is a general property of caring, and is involved in applying each of the other four properties, when appropriate for the development of the child, through coaching his learning to be cared for, and learning to care for self and others. Confirming is a core property of caring, which involves providing opportunities for the child to learn that happiness comes from caring through gently lifting his self-image up to a more caring level than is manifested in his present actions. Confirming involves the children's learning that they are valued and trusted, learning to value and trust being cared for, and learning to care for self and others. In the modelling property of caring, the child is provided with creative opportunities for experiencing what it feels and looks like to be cared for. In dialoguing, the child's feelings and thinking are used by the teacher as a basis for guiding his cultivation of caring relationships. In practicing, she coaches the child for discovering his own reasons and directions for caring through his own projects. For each of the caring properties, an opposite least caring property is also discovered to exist in the teachers' experiences. Like the properties of caring, these of least caring are interrelated.
What Are Some of the Conditions that Facilitate Caring?

Interpersonal reasoning... is marked by attachment and connection, rather than by separation and abstraction... Several important features [include]: An attitude of solicitude or care, attention, flexibility, effort aimed at cultivating the relation, a search for an appropriate response (Noddings, 1996d: 158, 163).

The teachers describe their caring for the children as determined by their own educational orientations as well as by the orientations that seem to be embedded by the children and other adults in their education. Where children having voice in their own education is considered a priority, the teacher's efforts to care for them are likely to extend beyond searching for quick and easy answers. If applying the expectations of the other adults in the children's education is the priority, caring often becomes a low priority. The teacher's past experiences and the children's readiness and eagerness to learn are also described by the teachers as determinants of their caring for the children. Where the children are generally slow to learn or interact in ways harmful to themselves and others, the teacher's efforts for caring are most often challenged. The teacher's past experiences often help her acquire a teaching repertoire and become aware of the value of caring in the children's education. On the other hand, a lack of experience often leaves the teacher struggling to manifest caring. In the following discussion of conditions facilitating the teachers' caring for the children, some discussion of inhibiting their caring is also included.

Past Experience

The teachers describe how their own past experiences affect their efforts to care for the children. Some experiences allow the teachers to care for the children, and to move along pathways toward applying more caring orientations. Lacking
such experience, the teacher has a limited repertoire for caring for the children. For example, teachers in this study often talk about their assumption of being independently responsible for their own teaching. This can be seen in Miriam's experience where a student interacts in ways that placed himself and others at risk, for which the academic curriculum provides her with no guidance as to how to respond to the student. Trying out ideas from her own limited repertoire also proves unsuccessful. Miriam tells me, "I have no experience with that," so she is left struggling alone to cope with the situation. Another instance of past experience inhibiting a teacher from having a caring voice in the children's education is provided by Eva who struggles alone to teach children whose age is one for which she has no training. When they are not successful in learning, Eva questions her ability to teach children at this age, and hates it. This is in contrast with her later experience after having had opportunities to learn about how children learn, how to make school enjoyable for them, and how to incorporate a sense of community with them (Eva, 11/04/97). Similarly, following a six-month maternity leave, Dorothy discovers that she had previously been inhibited from caring deeply for the children. During her maternity leave, she had many experiences as "nurturer and care giver, and thus became sensitive to the child's whole being." She reflects, "It changes one's relationship with the students. One becomes more compassionate, and develops a greater sensitivity and concern towards the well-being of children" (Dorothy, 11/04/97).

The illustrations cited here indicate that past experience is a condition affecting the teacher's caring for the children.
The Most Challenging Child

The teachers describe how their relationships with the most challenging children often affect their caring for those children. They often describe three groups of children, those who generally arrive at school ready and eager to learn, those who are generally becoming more independent in their learning, and those who generally learn very, very slowly and/or whose social skills place themselves and others at risk. In caring, the teacher creates and maintains voice in the children's education, and is compassionate about giving voice to the children in their own education. Their efforts to do so are facilitated or inhibited by the responses of the children. They describe the children who present the greatest challenge as likely to be cared for if the teacher persists in caring for them or if there is an increase in the teacher's repertoire for caring for them. However, the more the teacher has to struggle with those children, the less likely it is that those children are cared for. Examples of inhibiting or blocking the teacher's caring efforts with those children were discussed above. It may be recalled that the teacher's persistence is exemplified by Miriam's sitting around talking with the children about their feelings and their sense of the topic. Although, Robert in particular, is very difficult to get along with, Miriam praises each of his small steps toward greater social and academic success. The other children see that he can't do some of the academic tasks, but that Miriam says, "That's okay." Those other children subsequently also accept and praise Robert's small steps of learning success, and as the social connections are changing the other children observe that Robert is capable too (Miriam, 13/05/97). This is an instance of the teacher's persistence in caring leading to transformation of the children's orientations toward
being more caring. Similarly, it may be recalled that teacher persistence in caring is noted in Beth's experience. "Troublemaker" is the name Donald acquired from his previous teachers. On the other hand, Beth, his new teacher, has many meetings with him, the school team, and his parents, and discovers that he is unable to learn by the same modes as the other children. A program is therefore created specifically for him, and Beth ultimately savours success in meeting his needs. Thus, she and Donald are transformed by the experience (Beth, 15/04/97).

The illustrations cited above indicate that the teacher's persistence in caring for the most challenging children and increasing her repertoire for doing so facilitate her movement along a pathway toward applying more caring orientations.

The Educational Orientations of Other Adults

As cited above, the teachers tell me their encounters with the children did not occur in isolation. They describe the educational orientations of other adults in the children's education as greatly affecting the degree of their caring for the children. How the relationships with the other adults develop also influences the teacher's awakening to how to create and maintain voice patterns in the children's education. In Chapter Five, it was established that a lack of caring support by the other adults contributes to inhibiting or blocking the teacher's voice in the children's education. Where other adults team with the teacher to form circles of care, the outcome is building trust and foundations for future support for her caring for the children. These caring circles include informal teams, the school principal, persons in formal education, and persons in the Ministry of Education and Training and system-based administrators. Although these circles of care are

---

11 The name for the concept, "circles of care," is adapted from Noddings (1992).
interrelated in the teachers' experiences, they are separated here for clarity. Some of the teachers' experiences cited here will be recalled from earlier descriptions.

**Informal circles.** The educational orientations of members of the teacher's informal caring circles can help to influence building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher's caring for the children. These members include individuals who team, as well as school-parent(s)-other-educator teams. Through applying the confirming property of caring, for instance, these other adults help to affirm for the teacher a more caring image of herself than is manifested in her present relationships with the children. This can be seen in Miriam telling me about receiving support from a special education teacher who provides suggestions for teaching a child who has unacceptable social skills, and about their subsequent team-teaching with other children (Miriam, 13/05/97). Nancy provides an illustration of broader informal circles of caring:

...peers, principal, and parents facilitate my opening myself to sharing and hearing ideas of other peers, educators, and the children regarding how to improve my teaching. I thus try to see the children in a holistic perspective, to give them choices in problem solving, and to ask, 'What do I want and need as a learner?.. And, because of the richness of my environment and my desire to improve, I am now never content (Nancy, 11/04/97).

Alice describes an even broader informal circle of caring after being assigned:

...a new grade, a new program, a new age group and a new holistic approach by the board. I was fearful at first. I needed to present the change to parents during meetings, class visits, home visits, and orientation. I also needed to get to know the new children and families coming into my room... There were visits from the consultant to help set up the room and to provide additional teaching and learning materials. I had to attend inservice to familiarize myself with the change. It was a chance for flexibility as well as a change of interest for me. The change was evolutionary through time, experience, and help from
professional reading, inservice, and the consultant. The response from the children and comments from the parents were positive and helpful. Over time, I learned to see my teaching as being loving but fun: I feel little children need to know I love them, and that builds up a trust and self-esteem; they respect kind, firm discipline (Alice, 11/04/97).

These examples indicate that the educational orientations of other adults in informal caring circles can influence the building of trust and foundations for future support for the teacher’s caring for the children. Through applying the confirming property of caring, for instance, the other adults affirm for the teacher a more caring self-image than is currently manifested in her encounters with the children.

**Circles with the school principal.** The educational orientations of school principals also influence building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher’s caring for the children. These caring circles include individual-teacher-principal teaming as well as teaming collectively through the school community. Over time and through embedding the modelling property of caring, for example, the principal provides opportunities for the teacher to experience what it feels and looks like to be cared for as she cares for the children. This can be seen in Beth's saying, "I was a teacher aide for five years, until the principal convinced me that I could make a good teacher." She subsequently earned both her teaching and specialist certifications (Beth, 11/04/97). Alice tells me that, although her teaching is reduced to half time:

I chose to stay half time at the school because I liked the school and staff. I could change to another school for full time but, on the other hand, I preferred the total support of this principal in his promotion that children and adults should and can make good choices (Alice, 11/04/97).
Miriam's face lights up when she contrasts the present principal's caring with the approaches of some laissez-faire principals in her past teaching experiences:

The new principal treats us like professionals. He trusts us. When he first came here, he came into my classroom and did his supervision, and it was (pause) just glowing (pause). He gets to know each person's strengths. He gets someone involved whose strengths are your weaknesses. I can say almost anything to him. I was reading a story to the children when he came in, and wanted to read a while... I said, 'Save the last chapter for me' (Miriam, 13/05/97).

Similarly, Melissa tells me with a tone of delight, about a principal facilitating her learning how to care for the children: "I learn about how children learn by working with him. He is a wonderful mentor! Also there are workshops about how children learn, where he talks about learning and follows through" (Melissa, 13/05/97). She also speaks appreciatively about a principal providing inservice sessions for all teachers in the school. For example, one inservice topic originates with the teachers expressing concern regarding realistic expectations of children. The outcome of the subsequent inservice provided by the principal is that "it is less stressful" because the teachers feel their encounters with the children will be supported by the principal "if there is an incident in the yard or in the class" (Melissa, 2/11/99).

I observe the principals applying the modelling property through helping to create safe environments in which teachers can take risks by venturing out, trying again, and sharing their related feelings. This can be seen in principals and teachers addressing each other by first names and seeming to be fully present for each other when discussing the children interacting in ways which are admirable, as well as in a principal responding supportively to teachers' concerns when the
children interacted in ways that are harmful to themselves and others, such as a teacher receiving the immediate support of the principal when a hyperactive child placed himself and others at risk. I also observe a professional development session for the teachers' "spiritual renewal" in an exclusive setting:

The session is located in a retreat building in a forest setting. The meeting room is large and has ample natural light from windows on three sides. Prior to the opening experience, a display table on one side of the room is covered with a white cloth and then books are spread across it, including Care of the Soul (1992), Soul Mates (1994) both by Thomas Moore, and Christian Meditation (1996) by Paul Harris. During the opening experience, we assemble in the semi-circle of "a sacred space" on another side of the room where the experiences include a period of silence, prayers, comments, and sacred readings lead by Dwight, the principal, and a few of the other teachers. Following the sacred participation, Dwight introduces the study of teachers' orientations as "an opportunity to reflect on your teaching." Following the research experience, everyone participates in the buffet lunch in a third side of the same room. There is lighthearted conversation, sharing of humour, and a sense of warm community in which Dwight seems to be an equal participant with the teachers (Field note for Dwight, 14/04/97).

Dorothy, Joan, and Olive say that holistic education is practised throughout the day in the school (Dorothy, 11/04/97; Joan, 11/04/97; Olive, 11/04/97).

Likewise, Geraldine tells me that, during assemblies, everyone in the school comes together as a community to acknowledge the children's achievements as well as to involve them in decisions and choices (Geraldine, 11/04/97). Similarly, Olive says, "Our school celebrations are beautiful and very holistic" (Olive, 11/04/99). An example of a celebration is provided by Margaret:

When a teacher leaves the school, usually there's a book made by all of the kids in the school. They play the music about being a friend and how 'We will miss you.' The teacher is sitting in the centre at the assembly. All of the children raise their hands,
bless that person at that stage of their life. And the book is presented. We do it whenever a teacher leaves. Sometimes the kids will say, ‘Are we going to bless So-and-so?’ (Margaret, 7/12/99).

I observe that the principals apply the modelling property of caring through demonstrating consistently that the principal can be counted on, and attributing the best caring motive to each teacher and child encountered. These principals seem to get to know and accept the teacher and children for who they are. The children appear to move about the building and classrooms with grace, and there is a constant hum of their voices in the classrooms, except when the teacher or an individual child is speaking. The principals address the children by first name, and provide quiet places for those who are distracted by the busyness in the classroom. For instance, in a quiet room by herself, a girl is diligently erasing lightly-circled words from a story she had copied, and then printing a replacement word in each space. I also observe children serving as leaders in the school community. For example:

The opening ritual for the school day, which is heard throughout the school over the intercom system, is led by a child. The ritual includes playing an audio tape of *O Canada*, guiding a communal prayer, and reading a variety of announcements such as children's birthdays and school events (Field note for Wanda, 8/02/98).

Individual children or children-as-partners select their own books from the library shelves, and take responsibly for signing out their books. Children read to each other as partners while waiting in the corridor for another group of children to exit the library. I observe Dwight, a principal, talking with a child in the school corridor:

As Dwight and I walk along the school corridor, we meet Peter
who is about the same physical height as Dwight. Their conversation begins when Dwight asks in a respectful tone, "What do you like about this school?" They maintain eye contact throughout the ensuing conversation. After a short pause, Peter tells Dwight politely, "The teachers in the school care for the students." Dwight nods affirmatively, pauses, then asks, "What do you not like about this school?" There is a short pause, and Peter responds with reference to the music in the corridors which he says is too loud in the area where the speakers are located, and he does not like one of the selections of music. Dwight expresses appreciation and, after a short silence, Peter proceeds in the direction he is walking when meeting us in the corridor. Dwight then explains that Peter is a relatively new student in the school (Field note for Dwight, 8/02/97).

Similarly, Wanda, a school principal, gives celebratory voice to a child's birthday in the school community:

Wanda talks with Susie about her birthday when they enter the principal's office. As they approach the credenza, Wanda stoops to eye level with Susie, and invites her to choose a birthday gift from a transparent container located on the credenza. The container is about eye level for Susie who looks in its direction. The two remain motionless during a short period of silence. Susie pulls at the hem of her skirt. In an invitational tone, Wanda caringly retrieves from the container a collection of items, such as brightly-colored stickers. She names each item while spreading them out on the top of the credenza. Susie politely takes one of the items. Wanda continues to look at Susie as she names Susie's chosen item, and then adds in a warm tone, "Happy Birthday." After a short silence, they leave the office together (Field note for Wanda, 8/02/98).

The physical environment in both schools seems well cared for and lived in ways that indicate respect for the uniqueness (rather than conformity) of the teachers and the children. The grounds, and the exterior and interior of both school buildings are clean, and the walls appear freshly painted. Healthy-looking trees grow on the grounds of both schools, and one school has large healthy plants
in the entrance where there is abundant natural light. The schools are tidy in that objects appear to be in their proper places when not in use. The children's art is displayed on the walls and tables in the corridors, libraries, secretary areas, and the principals' offices. In the latter locations, for example:

There are a few items of children's art on a table, a few items mounted on walls, and an outer bulletin-board frame of individual children's pictures. In response to my inquiry regarding whether the photos are of current students, Wanda affirms that they are, and added that the pictures are often used by the children as well as by herself. For instance, the children seem to enjoy pointing to their own pictures and to those of their relatives and friends. As well, the pictures often seem to facilitate Wanda's discussions with teachers and parents (Field note for Wanda, 13/05/97).

Some of the artifacts displayed throughout the school are created by individual children; others are created by groups of children, and some, such as a huge dreamcatcher, are created by all of the children in the school in a given year. The children's furniture varies from classroom to classroom, and consists of individual desks, community tables and chairs, wall counters, shelves, and benches. In some classrooms, the teachers' desks are located at the front of the rooms, and in other classrooms they are located elsewhere. Classroom doors often remain open while classes are in session. There are about fifteen computers in each school library; the library books are arranged neatly on the shelves, and the libraries are used by the teachers as well as the children.

In the many examples cited above, the educational orientations of the principals can help to influence building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher's caring for the children. Over time, for instance, principals can embed the modelling property of caring. They provide teachers with opportunities
to experience what it feels and looks like to be cared for as they care for the children. These circles of care include the principal teaming individually with the teacher as well as teaming collectively through the school community. In fact, the teachers in this study place so much emphasis on their caring circles with principals that I describe them here in considerable detail. Moreover, not only do I observe caring circles which include the two principals interviewed for this study, but those persons speak with me in tones of pride about their admiration and respect for the teachers' "being as involved as they can possibly be with the children and in the school community." They also emphasize their own foci on authentic dialogue, consistency, and boundaries, so that students know what to expect and, in turn, became leaders (Dwight and Wanda, 25/09/97).

Caring circles within formal education. The educational orientations of other adults in formal education can help influence building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher's caring for the children. These circles of care include instructors/presenters, participants, authors participating in courses, workshops, conferences, and other inservice activities. Over time and through applying the dialoguing property of caring, for instance, these other adults facilitate the cultivation of caring relationships between the teacher and the children based on what the teacher is feeling and thinking. This can be seen in Melissa's experience during an inservice conference where participants share their life stories and discuss the meaning of their individual stories. Her colleagues in the inservice experience affirm for her the importance of her contribution in providing the principal with feedback that he needs. They also affirm that she is qualified to provide that feedback because, "You know all of the children, work
with all of the teachers, are a special education teacher, and will have the additional specialization of leadership from this inservice session." Melissa, tells me, "I didn't recognize it before. You just go about and do your job. Once you recognize who you are and that your ideas are valued, then you can proceed with added confidence and enthusiasm." She adds, "I'm comfortable with that now, a confidence that the way things are is okay" (Melissa, 13/05/97).

Lillian's caring circles include both formal and informal teaming. She wants to give a complete and knowledgeable language arts program for the children and, therefore, enrolls in a reading specialist program. With one support team, Lillian says:

I select the course, attend class, try out ideas, return to class to discuss, and select follow-up courses. Keep building. Responses from the instructors and colleagues I meet during the process of these courses serve as affirmations for what I am trying to do in the school classroom (Lillian, 11/04/97).

With the second team, Lillian and another teacher in the school try out ideas with the children. Parents and volunteers also support what Lillian is trying to do. Whether in the classroom, on field trips, or at home with parents, Lillian values knowing that the students enjoy learning, and she experiences "excitement when their light bulbs go on" (Lillian, 11/04/97).

The examples cited above indicate that the educational orientations of persons in formal education circles of caring can help influence building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher's caring for the children. Through applying the dialoguing property of caring, for instance, these other adults help to cultivate caring relationships between the teacher and children based on what she is thinking and feeling over time.
Circles of care including persons from the Ministry of Education and Training and systems-based administration. The educational orientations of adults in the Ministry of Education and Training as well as in system-based administration can influence building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher's caring for the children. Over time and through applying the practicing property of caring, for example, they provide opportunities for the teacher to find her own reasons and directions for caring for the children. This can be seen in Margaret's appreciation of the requirement in the new curriculum for the children to take more responsibility for their own learning. She talks quietly with individual children who forget to bring their learning materials to school. She says, "It is your responsibility" (Margaret, 9/02/98). An earlier announcement by the Ministry of Education and Training states that a provincial framework of education is forthcoming and each school board will be expected to develop its own framework. A framework of holistic education is, therefore, developed at the system level, and related professional development sessions are provided for the teachers throughout the district. Olive tells me about being a teacher representative on the Holistic Education Committee for drafting the framework document. The committee is composed of a Superintendent, system-based consultants, principals, and teacher-representatives: Olive words the experience:

Through reading, reflection, discussion, and visiting other educators in their roles, I try to put less pressure on myself in regard to 'covering the curriculum,' and begin to focus more on the whole child and the real meaning of this. I become a true believer in holism through trying to help children make connections in their lives and learning. I come to an understanding of how all of the parts fit together very generally (Olive, 11/04/97).
Both Iris and Terry describe their daily experiences with the holistic framework, "The system promotes holistic education. It is up to the individual schools to interpret and practise this process" (Iris, 11/04/97; Terry, 11/05/97). Alice says, "Children are important human beings and they deserve an education" (Alice, 11/04/97). Similarly, Fran, who is teaching some of the older children, says, "Relevancy is central where learning must be seen by the children as worthwhile and connections between learning and lives must be seen by them as a means of their growth and happiness" (Fran, 11/04/97).

Many teachers focus on their connections with people from the Ministry and with system-based administrators who apply the practicing property of caring through supporting or stretching the individual teacher's own projects. Beth and Geraldine tell me they value the system's support for a professional development day for spiritual renewal (Beth, 11/04/97, Geraldine, 11/04/97). Similarly, Margaret says she values the system's providing professional development opportunities, as in:

...a family-of-schools day with common beginning and choice of activities and publisher's day, all combined. Our Board has always been at the forefront of new ideas. Like good ideas, not just jumping on the bandwagon. So if you want to learn, the opportunities are right there (Margaret, 11/04/97; 6/12/99).

The same teacher serves as a member of the system's Whole Language Committee, and bases her contributions on what is learned from encounters with the children and her colleagues. She notes:

We have lots of days when the Primary teachers and the Junior teachers can meet together. We have evening sessions. This [middle period in Margaret's career] is a great peak period of growth for everybody. An example might be math where we use problem solving as the focus, and wrap all of the strands
together. We try out all kinds of problem solving. We also talk about the problem of the week or a little problem every day that the kids can take home. We tie it all in with language. Problem solving is something that not only needs to be focused on, but it needs to be tied in with all of the other subject areas as well. So we do a lot of things around that, and as a result, we get better at problem solving... so that we are teaching children first, and academics second (Margaret, 6/02/98).

As well, I observe a circle of caring consisting of a family-of-schools professional-development session for principals and teacher-representatives:

In a relatively new, large, clean, well-lit meeting room there is an area with a round table and chairs for each school where the principal and two or more teacher representatives are seated as a focus group. There are a variety of individual, small-group, and whole-assembly experiences during the day. The participants seem to take the experiences seriously and, when appropriate, pose questions for the presenting System-Based consultants, and otherwise freely discuss applications of the suggested planning and other information and materials included in the session. For the inservice theme of authentic assessment, I observed the teachers viewing an excerpt of The Bells of St. Mary's starring Bing Crosby, followed by discussion comparing and contrasting the authentic and non-authentic assessment of the children's learning as portrayed in the video. In the concluding experience for the day, the principal and teacher representatives from each school design the follow-up professional development session for the teachers at their own school (Field note for Albert and Elizabeth, 17/10/96).

The system based administrators in this study tell me about their hopes for providing future support for the teachers' caring for the children.

The illustrations cited above indicate that the educational orientations of persons in the Ministry of Education and Training and in system-based administration facilitate building trust and foundations for future support for the teacher's caring for the children. Over time and through applying the practicing
property of caring, for instance, they provide opportunities for the teacher to find her own reasons and directions for caring for the children based on her own projects.

In Summary

The teachers state that caring for the children does not take place in isolation. They tell me caring is influenced by their own educational orientations as well as by those of the children and other adults in their education. Where the children having voice in their own education is considered a priority, the teacher's efforts to care for them are likely to go beyond searching for quick and easy answers. The teacher's past experience affects her caring for the children. Participating in caring circles with other adults in the children's education also affects her caring. In these circles, trust and foundations are built for future support for the teacher. These conditions facilitate the teacher's efforts to embed a more caring orientation into the children's education.

What Are the General Outcomes of Caring?

Our conscious intellect is not in control. Another part of us—our higher power, soul, or inner wisdom—is. The concept of "the self" needs to be expanded... We are "acted upon" by forces outside of our conscious control. We can be open to learn from all of life, from our inner selves and from that with which we are connected (Northrup, 1994a: 49).

The teachers describe caring as a powerful force of energy in reversing the least-caring voice patterns so that they can move along pathways toward applying more caring orientations in which they have voice and they give voice to the
children in their own education, while other adults accept or support the teacher-
children relationships. In the following discussion, the focus is on the general
outcomes of caring in the form of some of the voice patterns along the pathways of
the key participants in this study, Margaret, Melissa, Miriam.

Margaret's Pathway

Margaret has had a relatively smooth pathway because she does not
experience the I'm-out-of-here voice pattern nor the Being-someone-else's-image
dimension of the Other-directed pattern. The following description is limited to
some of her experiences in the Feeling-at-risk dimension of the Other-directed
pattern. In this dimension, other adults make a decision which leads the teacher to
feel at risk of having a diminished voice in the children's education.

After teaching at her first school for eight years, its closing is announced
which leaves Margaret feeling at double risk of having a diminished voice in the
children's education. She feels this way because she has to stop work on the
programs she is developing for the children, and because the new colleagues may
be less enthusiastic about growing and changing than the colleagues at her present
school. To her surprise, however, receiving and providing support facilitates her
settling smoothly into the new school where she continues her new responsibilities
as a satellite teacher. She reflects during our interview, "The move was the best
thing. I was ready and did not know it." Eight years later, when her second
school closes, Margaret's transfer to another school is, "...really easy. Everyone is
new. The parents are from different schools because ours is a new school being
created. Everyone at the new school is very welcoming and supportive, not just
colleagues; everyone is really accepting." Thus, through the second school
closing, Margaret does not experience feeling at risk of having a diminished voice
in the children's education. She has moved along her pathway toward embedding
a more caring orientation into the children's education (Researcher's partial
synopsis for Margaret, 11/04/97, 6/02/98, 28/06/99, 22/11/99).
Melissa's Pathway

Melissa's pathway has been relatively rough because she has experienced all of the voice patterns and dimensions. The following description is limited to some of her experiences in the I'm-out-of-here pattern as well as in the Being-someone-else's-image and Feeling-overwhelmed dimensions of the Other-directed pattern. The pattern, I'm-out-of-here, is described as ultimately leaving out all of the voices from the children's education. Because the teacher struggles alone while not feeling competent in caring for the children or because her words regarding needed support fall on deaf ears, she gives up hope of acquiring viable voice patterns in caring for the children, and exits or retreats from her career in teaching. In the Being-someone-else's-image dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, another adult issues a hands-off directive to her regarding her voice in the children's education, with the outcome that she has only a token voice. The Feeling-overwhelmed dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern is described in relation to the outcome of persistent media reports which emphasize teachers' lack of credibility.

At the end of her fourth year of teaching, Melissa gives up hope of acquiring a voice pattern she can live with in the children's education, says, "I'm out of here," and leaves her teaching career. Later, in supply teaching, she feels she can cope because there is not the typical stress associated with full-time teaching. Upon the invitation of a caring school principal, Melissa agrees to teach half-time until the end of the calendar year, and then decide if she will continue or resign. She returns to full-time teaching with that caring principal. Thus, she continues to learn to be cared for and to care for herself and others so that she moves along her pathway toward embedding a more caring orientation into the children's education.

In time, however, a new principal does not support her special education
efforts to care for the children. Thus, she becomes "someone else's image" of a special education teacher. Ultimately, she says for the second time, "I'm out of here," and takes a year off. Later, after teaching half-time for three years, "the leadership changes, and the new principal is very different and very supportive." She therefore returns to a full-time teaching career where, once again, she continues to learn to care. Thus, she moves along her pathway toward applying a more caring orientation.

More recently, Melissa feels overwhelmed by the persistent media reports concerning the lack of teachers' credibility which, in turn, seem to lead some parents to criticize teachers rather than to work with them toward caring for the children. This can be seen in some parents recording negative comments, such as "I don't like the way the teacher does this..." on the third page of the new computerized report cards mandated for reporting to parents. Subsequently, the principal, Melissa, and her colleagues respond by modifying that page to create "a very unique structure, a Gold Page. This is a great page! The children put on it what their goals are for the next term. The parents put on what their goals are for helping the child achieve these goals." Melissa subsequently reflects on the report card experience as a small step toward reversing the Feeling-overwhelmed dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, "I don't know why the Ministry didn't do this in the first place." In an earlier interview, Melissa had told me, "I love what I do;" more recently, however, she says, "I do not feel that way any more. I don't need this, feeling overwhelmed." Thus, this experience and the other two experiences cited above indicate that, once she enters a pathway toward a more caring orientation, there is no easy turning back because this orientation seems to take on an intelligence of its own for her (Researcher's partial synopsis for Melissa, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98, 2/11/99, 6/12/99).

**Miriam's Pathway**

Miriam's is a relatively rough pathway because she more-or-less

---

42 Miriam's experience in the I'm-out-of-here pattern is limited to a period when her teaching is reduced to part-time due to physical illness which has been exacerbated by her stressful teaching situation.
experiences all of the voice patterns and dimensions. The following description is limited to her experiences in the Teacher-directed voice pattern and the Feeling-divided dimension of the Other-directed pattern. In the Teacher-directed pattern, the teacher's voice gives direction to the voices of the children and other adults in ways that inhibit or block their voices. This pattern is particularly harmful to the children who arrive at school not yet ready and eager to learn. In the Feeling-divided dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern, the teacher faces the dilemma of wanting to support two voices which differ or voices which can not be accommodated in the time available.

Early in her teaching career, Miriam finds herself being someone else's image of who she feels she should be because the principal directed her not to attempt to teach social skills to one of the children. Some years later, she continues to be independent in her teaching but wonders how she is to survive when one of the children interacts in ways that are harmful to himself and others. Ultimately, she reaches out for caring support from the special education teacher. Miriam tries out that teacher's suggestions, such as providing achievable steps for the child's success, and she is delighted when her caring is completed in his growth and self-actualization. She says, (pause) "Beautiful!" (pause). The special education teacher subsequently becomes Miriam's partner in team teaching as well as her "confidant" and "friend." Thus, Mariam continues to learn to care and to be cared for and, therefore, moves along her pathway toward embedding a more caring orientation into the children's education.

She has experienced few smooth sailing times in teaching, but recently experiences the most profound sense of feeling divided. This is due to being responsible for an increasing number of high-needs children while, at the same time, also being responsible for addressing a plethora of outside initiatives. With a tone of deep regret, she tells me that, when change is so rapid, "Although the needs of some children are so great, it is often the children who are left out." This can be seen where Miriam "is expected" to pilot a supposed cutting-edge program
with the children. She assumes the person who designs the project for them takes into consideration the needs and interests of the specific children she is teaching. For instance, some of the children are more dependent on her direction due to their lower levels of social and/or language arts skills. Early in the piloting testing process, she feels at risk of having a diminished voice in the education of these children. For instance, she observes that, despite her coaching, the products that are beginning to emerge from those children are of obvious inferior quality to the products emerging from the other children. She worries that the inferior quality may ultimately lead to the most-dependent children feeling diminished. Something has to give! Yet, her attempts to discuss their plight with the person who has designed the pilot program fall on deaf ears. She is, however, expected to complete the pilot testing as originally planned. Miriam feels, nevertheless, that the more-dependent children would benefit most from using the piloting time to improve their reading and social skills. Thus, she and another teacher team-teach the pilot program with those children. In so doing, Miriam and the other teacher often work consistently for hours after the children have left for the day and even on Saturdays in order to prepare well for the learning experiences of those children. Miriam describes the pilot program experience as personally stressful and exhausting. Yet, she is pleased that all of the children, including the least-independent ones, ultimately seem proud of their products and that they seem to have enjoyed the additional one-to-one contact with her and the other teacher. She is also pleased that some of the students have improved their social skills. With the support of her colleague, Miriam is thus able to better cope with feeling divided between doing what she is directed to do and caring for the children, which allows her to move along her pathway toward applying a more caring orientation. However, during our interview, Miriam tells me, "Teaching has never been like that before. This is an impossible load... I'm not saying it is all like this," but there is little hope for the pace slowing down in the foreseeable future (Researcher's partial synopsis for Miriam, 11/04/97, 13/05/97, 6/02/98).

In Summary

Each teacher describes her pathway as unique, both smooth and rough, and
including voice patterns and dimensions that overlap and repeat. The teachers also describe other adults caring for them as a powerful energy force in reversing their least-caring voice patterns so they tend to move toward applying more caring orientations in which they both have voice and give voice to the children while other adults support and/or accept the teacher-children relationships. Even in the I'm-out-of-here voice pattern, caring by other adults may allow the teacher to return to a career in teaching children. In both the Teacher-directed voice pattern where the teacher's voice inhibits or blocks the voices of the children and other adults, and in the Other-directed voice pattern where the voices of the children and other adults inhibit or block the teacher's voice, caring support of other adults may allow the teacher to care for the children. Even in the new Feeling-divided dimension where the teacher feels torn by the mandates, directives, and expectations of others, as well as in the new Feeling-overwhelmed dimension where teachers' credibility is diminished by persistent media reports, caring for the children seems to be delayed until more caring support is provided for the teacher.

What is Inspiritive Awakening?

Our inner guidance system is mediated via our thoughts, emotions, dreams, and bodily feelings. Our bodies are designated to act as receiving and transmitting stations for energy and information. Living in touch with our inner guidance involves feeling our way through life using all of ourselves: mind, body, emotions, and spirit. When I refer to this process,... I mean the various ways we listen and use our inner guidance and make conscious changes in our lives, behavior, relationships with others and our health (Northrup, 1994b: 52).

Inspiritive awakening is a special property of caring which both facilitates and indicates embedding caring orientations into the education of children. It is a
special property of care-empowering education where the teacher creates and maintains voice in the children's education and gives voice to the children in their own education; where the teacher-children relationships are accepted or supported by other adults in their education. Thus, if the teacher has acquired voice, she has also gained support for acquiring it. As illustrated in Figure 5 below, in caring-

**Figure 5:** Inspiritive Awakening

![Diagram](image)

empowering education, inspiritive awakening occurs with such consistency that it is considered an indicator of care-empowering education. Through inspiritive awakening, the teacher learns how to learn in the teaching situation and how to trust in direction from the dynamic or motivational centre of her own self. This can be seen in the teacher becoming increasingly receptive to the reality of a
child's needs and interests, as well as in her trying out guidance from the official curriculum, ideas from her own repertoire, and suggestions and possibilities received from other caring adults. She progresses through the three phases of feeling: she must address the needs and interests of the child, she wants to address them, and she will do so. She subsequently plans how to care for the child, implements those plans based on ongoing feedback from the child, and ultimately reflects on which ideas to add to her own teaching repertoire and which ideas to maintain with respect to receiving and providing caring support by other adults in the future. Thus, through the process of inspiritive awakening, the teacher gradually acquires a non-linear, self-monitoring cycle of reception, reflection, assessment (of why she and others are encountering each other the way they are and the effect), revision, and further exploration. In applying this cycle, she connects deeply with the children and other caring adults in their education, as well as with teaching, learning, and subject matter. In turn, these deep connections become sources of her own self-actualization which help to sustain her caring.

In the opposite process to inspiritive awakening, dispiritive awakening, the teacher's self-monitoring is aborted, her emotions get stuck, and she turns inward with worry and experiences the residue from not being cared for. As well, she discovers what she does not want, such as being dependent on an official curriculum that provides limited support for the learning of some of the children. Over time, the teacher may discover that the way out of her dispiritive awakening is through inspiritive awakening. She may also discover that her own teaching repertoire is too limited to allow her to honour the children's voices in their own education. She may experience stress, and acknowledge, "I can't do it." A turning
point toward inspiritive awakening emerges when she becomes open to the caring support of other adults whose suggestions ultimately prove successful in helping her to teach the children.

A third form of awakening is spiritive. This process is similar to inspiritive awakening except that it has more flow in coping with change because the teacher has already found a guiding star for navigating her pathway. Spiritive awakening, however, is not permanent since it is disrupted now and again by changes affecting her teaching situation.

**Inspiritive Awakening and the Caring Teacher**

Margaret's experiences provide an excellent illustration of inspiritive awakening while finding a guiding star for navigating her pathway toward applying a more caring orientation. Her experiences also provide excellent illustrations of both dispiritive awakening and spiritive awakening. Her experience is summarized briefly here.

**Learning how to learn, to be self-directed, and to be cared for:** Initially, in her first year of teaching, things seemed to go well for Margaret. She tells me, "I don't really have to take risks or try new things." Later that year, however, she sees that some of the children are not learning to read and some are not learning to do math. She subsequently attempts to apply a self-monitoring cycle with her limited repertoire for teaching reading and math. Her attempts to care are not completed in the responses of growth and self-actualization by some of the children. She worries, "I don't know very much." Through these experiences in dispiritive awakening, however, Margaret names what she did not want, to be dependent on prescribed curricula which provide inadequate support for teaching the children. Thus, she begins to awaken to direction from the dynamic or motivational centre of her own self. She says, "I don't have anyone to help me. There isn't any support. I am isolated from people. I don't know how to work with
people." Her efforts to apply a self-monitoring cycle are therefore aborted, at least temporarily.

By the end of her first year of teaching, Margaret fortuitously meets Gloria, a consultant with the Board, and reaches out to her for caring support. Gloria responds by visiting her classroom as well as by providing suggestions for teaching math and reading. Margaret applies a self-monitoring cycle while trying out the suggestions and maintains some of them for her own teaching repertoire. Thus, she continues to awaken to direction from the dynamic or motivational center of her self. This first caring support opens the door for future insipiritive awakening while trying out Gloria's suggestions for teaching the children. Soon, Margaret accepts Gloria's invitation to meet with other people:

We start, and then Gloria brings professional books to the group, which provide invaluable inservice. Meeting a few people really makes a difference. It is the people around me and the people I meet who help me to grow. They talk with me, give me ideas, listen to the problems, help with solutions, and get me on the right track. And, of course, when you have someone you can work with, you get very excited, and you want to do more and more.

She continues:

If you want to be the best you can be, you have to go out and look for professional development, to be a learner first and a teacher second. Things start small, and they just grow. It's just evolving, when seeking out change. It is a gradual thing that evolves over time through all of my experiences with others, such as the children and parents, by taking courses, working on committees, and living in a satellite classroom. I'm helping others learn and I am learning from them too. We are all learners first and foremost, and teachers later.

**Caring for the children.** During the reading courses, "after about ten years in teaching," Margaret sees the completion of an evolutionary change in her
teaching, putting more emphasis on how children learn than on teaching. She says: "I think that helping children to learn is different from teaching them because it puts the emphasis on the child rather than on the teacher. The children have taught me so much about their own learning needs, styles and modes." This can be seen in the application of Margaret's self-monitoring cycle. She gets to know the children well enough to know their strengths and, thus, "where to take them" because, although the program is teaching them subject matter, it is important to focus on "exactly what they need and is relevant in their lives." To do this, she is "constantly assessing through paper and pencil, observation, talking with them, working with them" while planning based on their feedback so that they "get not just what I plan to teach that day, but what they need in order to move along." Moreover, what she plans for the children who are ready and eager to learn differs from what she plans for those who are becoming a little more independent in their learning; both of those plans differ from her plans for the children who need more direction with their learning. For the latter group of children in particular, she provides learning experiences that appeal to their interests. Being a teacher "is what I am all about, observing the children's progress and successes in learning." Margaret does not limit their learning to classroom experiences. For instance, she delights in guiding a mother who wants to help her son to learn to read. In doing so, Margaret's goal is for the boy to ultimately learn to love both to read and to learn. Similarly, she delights in experiences such as the children's participation in the Christmas Celebration for the whole school. She says:

The little guys in my classroom read and acted out the Christmas story as part of it. We planned it together. They were leading. They acted out little plays about how children should be nice to other children. They did some fun things. They got so excited. They felt they were contributing. The parents of the children all came. The lights were dimmed. There was music.

Margaret has never known of a school where "the little guys" have so many opportunities for participating in the school community.

156
**Self-actualizing.** Margaret's self-actualizing experiences are interwoven with her caring for the children as well as throughout her caring for herself and being cared for by other adults. This can be seen in her delight in being a learner first and a teacher second. It can also be seen in her teaching children first, and subject matter second. As well, it can be seen in her treasuring an unexpected note of appreciation received from a mother in celebration of her child's progress in learning to read under the coaching of both Margaret and his mother. These sources and substances of Margaret's self-actualization echo throughout her description of her personal experience during spiritive awakening:

It just seemed that everything has suddenly come together, and you know what you are doing, being able to share with colleagues, and you're learning more as you talk. You just feel right on top of everything. It's almost like you are at the height of what you can do. You also feel humble because, as you talk to people, you know there's still so much to learn, and so many other ways to do things, and you want to keep trying everything. When things work, you want to try more things, and not back off. It makes you want to quest and look for more things, and to share with more people (Researcher synopsis for Margaret, 13/05/97, 6/02/98, 28/06/99, 22/11/99, 7/12/99, 5/02/00).

**Summary of Chapter Six**

The central challenge for the teachers in this study was discovered to be teaching the children. In care-empowering education, the caring properties of timing, confirming, modelling, dialoguing, and practicing are present. Timing is a general property of caring which is involved in applying each of the other four properties when appropriate for facilitating the children's learning to be cared for, as well as learning to care for themselves and others. Confirming, the core
property of caring, provides opportunities for the child to acquire a more caring and achievable image of himself than is manifested in his present actions. The modelling property of caring provides opportunities for the children to experience what it feels and looks like to be cared for. Through dialoguing, the children are coached toward cultivating caring relationships with others. The practicing property of caring provides them with opportunities for finding their own reasons and directions for caring. For each of the caring properties, the opposite least caring property is discovered to exist in the teachers' experiences. Like the properties of caring, the properties of least caring are interrelated.

The teachers describe their amount of caring for the children as dependent upon their own educational orientations, as well as those of the children and other adults in their education. Thus, since the amount of the teachers' caring depends upon their encounters and others' responses, in one sense, the conditions of caring and the outcomes of caring can be seen as reciprocal.

There are many differing voices in the children's education. The outcome of these differences can be seen in the four voice patterns. In the "Caring pattern," the teacher creates and maintains caring voice in the children's education and she gives voice to the children in their own education, while the teacher-children relationships are accepted or supported by other adults. In the "I'm-out-of-here" voice pattern, the teacher gives up hope of creating and maintaining viable voice patterns in the children's education, and retreats or exits from a career in teaching children. In the "Teacher-directed" voice pattern, the teacher directs the voices of the children and other adults in their education in ways that inhibit or block their voices. In the "Other-directed" voice pattern, the teacher's voice is directed by the
voices of the children and other adults in ways that inhibit or block her voice. The patterns are not stable, and even overlap and repeat. With caring support from other adults, however, the teachers more-or-less move along pathways toward applying more caring orientations.

Inspiritive awakening is a special property of caring which both indicates and facilitates applying more caring orientations. It allows the teacher to create and maintain voice in the children's education and allows her to give voice to the children in their own education, while the teacher-children relationships are accepted or supported by other adults in their education.
CHAPTER SEVEN
SUMMARY, DISCUSSION, IMPLICATIONS

I want to suggest that caring is the very bedrock of all successful education and that contemporary schools can be revitalized in its light... Perhaps the most fundamental change required is to empower teachers as we want them to empower students (Noddings, 1992: 27, 178).

Introduction

This study is an inquiry into the process that allows teachers to acquire educational orientations they consider more viable for their situations, given their central concern for teaching the children. Care-empowering education is the name I have given to the process that allows the teacher to acquire more viable orientations. With these orientations, she creates and maintains voice in teaching the children and she gives voice to them in their own education, where other adults (such as colleagues and curriculum officials) accept or support the teacher-children relationships. Care-empowering education is an heuristic concept, so hypothetically, completely caring teaching would be located near one end of the teacher's pathway. At the other end of her pathway, least-caring teaching would be located where her efforts are limited to attempts to have voice in the children's education.

The two phases along the teachers' pathways toward acquiring more caring orientations are conduit and struggling-and-finding. The first phase occurs when teachers are "travelling through the fog" by serving as conduits for the voices of other adults, supervising and managing children as receivers of the official curriculum, while being generally unaware of having limited voices of their own in
the children's education. Time is required for them to gain trust in their own voices in teaching the children, to learn the kinds of encounters that engender caring, to get to know the children, to receive support from and provide support to other adults, and to build trust with the children and other adults. During the struggling-and-finding phase, there are times when the lack of support from other adults and the limited teaching repertoires of the teachers leave them "struggling through the storm" where their voices are inhibited or blocked. During the struggling-and-finding phase, there are also times when the teachers "find a guiding star" for navigating their pathways toward applying more caring orientations. The struggling-and-finding phase, which is the major focus of this study, is a time when voice patterns are formed with the children and other adults, and the tone is set for the teachers' relationships with them. This phase occurs for all teachers, but the conduit phase is by-passed if too many immediate changes lead them to attempt to create and maintain voice in the children's education.

The social structural and psychological processes, which facilitate teachers' movement along their pathways toward applying more caring orientations, are contrasted with the structural and psychological processes which inhibit or block movement along their pathways. Care-empowering education has wide application for teachers' creating and maintaining voice in children's education inasmuch as it is the process which allows them to find a location nearer the caring end of their pathways.

**Summary**

We are meeting the other in genuine encounters of caring and being cared for. There is commitment, and there is choice. The commitment is to the cared-fors and to our own continual
receptivity, and each choice tends to maintain, enhance, or diminish us as ones-caring (Noddings, 1984: 175).

Care-empowering education consists of three complex and interrelated processes: creating and maintaining voice, caring, and inspiritive awakening as illustrated in Figure 6 below. The processes of creating and maintaining voice

**Figure 6: The Model of Care-Empowering Education**

- **Creating and Maintaining Voice:**
  - Educational orientations from past
  - Connections from past
  - Self-image and expectations for current situation

- **Caring for Children:**
  - Timing
  - Confirming
  - Modelling
  - Disciplining
  - Practicing

- **Care-Empowering Education**

- **Inspiritive Awakening:**
  - Giving voice to children in their own education
  - Other adults accepting or supporting teacher-children relationships
  - In teaching situation, learning how to:
    - Learn
    - Be self-directed
    - Be cared for
    - Self-actualize
determine the social structure of who has voice in the children's education. The substance and use of the teacher's voice are determined by her own educational orientation and by the orientations of the children and other adults in their education. Their educational orientations and connections with each other emerge from past experiences whereas the image of acceptable voices in the children's education emerges from the current teaching situation. One teacher may take the time to get to know the children well, to give them voice in their own education, and to gain support or acceptance from other adults for the teacher-children relationships. This teacher more readily facilitates the children's learning to be cared for, and learning to care for themselves and others. In contrast to this teacher's relationships, another teacher who has acquired only a limited teaching repertoire, may not take the time to get to know the children and is likely to be affected by other adults in ways that inhibit or block her creating and maintaining voice in the children's education. Where the educational orientations of the teacher and the other adults do not differ, but the teacher does not give the child voice in his own education, he often does not learn to be cared for or learn to care for himself and others, or his learning progresses slowly.

Other adults in the children's education often provide mandates, directives, and expectations which inhibit or block the teacher from creating and maintaining voice in the children's education. The result is a voice pattern that is less, rather than more, caring. For the teacher to move along a pathway toward applying a caring orientation, she must acquire voice in the children's education.

The teacher who applies the process of caring gives the child voice in his own education, which is beneficial for both herself and the child since he seems to
learn to be cared for and appears to learn to care for himself and others, and the
teacher experiences self-actualization through caring. In facilitating the children's
learning to care at levels which are appropriate to their individual development, the
teacher applies the caring properties of timing, confirming, modelling, dialoguing,
and practicing. In teaching, these properties are interrelated. They are, however,
separated here for clarity. Timing is a general property of caring that is embedded
in applying the other four properties of caring. For instance, time is required for
the teacher to get to know the needs and interests of the child, as well as to address
those needs and interests through confirming, modelling, dialoguing, and
practicing with him. During confirming, the core property of caring, the teacher
lifts the child up toward a more caring and achievable image of himself than is
manifested in his present actions. Thus, as he is valued and trusted, the child
learns to value and trust himself and others. Through modelling, the teacher
provides a model for the child so he can feel and see what it is like to be cared for.
During dialoguing, the teacher discusses with the child what he is thinking and
feeling as the basis for coaching his cultivation of more caring relationships.
During practicing, the teacher coaches the child's own academic and social
projects as the basis for helping him to find his own direction and reasons for
caring. Thus, this teacher is moving along her pathway toward embedding a more
caring orientation into the children's education. On the other hand, in least-caring
teaching, the teacher has a limited teaching repertoire, often struggles alone in
attempting to care for the child, and does not honour his voice in his own
education. This teacher is not moving along her pathway toward applying a more
caring orientation.
The teachers learn to have caring voices in the children's education through the special property of caring which I have named inspiritive awakening. In this process, the teacher learns to create and maintain voice in the children's education, to give voice to the children in their own education, and to welcome the acceptance or support of other adults for the teacher-children relationships. The teacher learns how to learn in the teaching situation and learns how to be directed from the dynamic or motivational center of her self. She does so by becoming more receptive to the needs and interests of the children as she tries out with them ideas from the official curriculum and from her own teaching repertoire, as well as suggestions and possibilities from other adults. She reflects on their effectiveness, and maintains the successful ideas in her own teaching repertoire. She also reflects on her sources and substances of support from other adults and maintains the successful ideas for potential caring support in the future. Over time, she acquires a non-linear, self-monitoring cycle of reception, reflection, assessment, revision, and further exploration. This cycle allows the teacher to experience self-actualization through connecting deeply with the children, other adults, learning, teaching, and the subject matter. In contrast to this situation, if the teacher attempts to care for the child but her teaching repertoire is limited and/or the teacher-child relationship is not supported or accepted by other adults, she experiences dispiritive awakening when her self-monitoring cycle is aborted, at least tentatively. She turns inward with worry, and experiences the residue of not being cared for. Her emotions get stuck, and she learns what she does not want, such as being dependent on curricula that do not provide enough support for the learning of some of the children. In time, she discovers that the way out of
dispiritive awakening may be through inspiritive awakening. Teachers also experience spiritive awakening, which is similar to inspiritive awakening, except that there is more flow because they have already found a guiding star for navigating their pathways toward embedding a more caring orientation into the children's education. This process is disrupted now and again by changes in their teaching situation.

**Care-Empowering Education and the Voice Patterns**

On their pathways toward embedding more caring orientations into the children's education, the teachers experience four voice patterns: Caring, I'm out of here, Teacher directed, and Other directed. In the Caring voice pattern, the teacher, the child, and other adults all have voice in the children's education. The other three voice patterns are less-caring. Some teachers experience the I'm-out-of-here voice-pattern when they exit or retreat from the teaching career. The teachers also experience a Teacher-directed voice-pattern in which their limited teaching repertoires lead to inhibiting or blocking the voices of the children and other adults. In addition, the teachers experience an Other-directed voice-pattern in which their voices are inhibited or blocked by the voices of the children and other adults. In this pattern, there are four dimensions: Feeling at risk, Being someone else's image, Feeling divided, and Feeling overwhelmed. The Feeling-at-risk dimension is experienced when other adults make changes, such as introducing a new curriculum, which leaves the teacher feeling at risk of having a diminished voice in the children's education. The dimension, Being someone else's image of whom I should be, emerges from the situation in which the teacher is permitted only a token voice in the children's education which may emerge, for
example, from a principal's directive. In the Feeling-divided dimension, the teacher struggles to address conflicting needs or, encounters needs for which there is insufficient time, such as getting to know and address each child's specific needs and interests while trying to respond responsibly to a multitude of outside initiatives. Not only is there insufficient time to do so, but pressures continue to increase for her to do more in less time. In the Feeling-overwhelmed dimension, the teacher struggles to cope with media reports which persistently state that teachers lack credibility, and therefore have nothing to contribute.

Each teacher's pathway toward a more caring voice pattern is unique. This can be seen in that not every teacher experiences all of the patterns; they experience overlap of various patterns and dimensions, and they may occasionally loop backward along their pathways to repeat patterns or dimensions.

Discussion

Other theories are neither proven nor disproven, they are placed, extended, or broadened (Glaser, 1978: 38).

Perspectives, rather than a framework, have guided the collection and analysis of data from the 20 participants in this study of teachers' orientations. Four extant theories helped to explain the teachers' efforts to care for the children, and those teachers' experiences in acquiring more caring orientations. These theories, include the orientation of caring provided by the teacher educator, Nel Noddings singly, and with Paul Shore; the curriculum horizons provided by the teacher educator, William Schubert; the phases of becoming more authentic provided by the adult educator, Stephen Brookfield; spiritual energy in making conscious changes provided by the physician, Christiane Northrup; and growing
under the guidance of the ethic of care provided by Nel Noddings and Nel Noddings with Paul Shore.

**Caring For the Children**

Nel Noddings' broad theory of caring is made more integrated by this study. Her theory included four properties of caring: confirming, modelling, dialoguing, practicing. In this study, timing also is elevated to a general property of caring; for instance, timing of care is critical to teachers getting to know and address the needs and interests of the children, as well as to gaining their trust. The outcome patterns of interpersonal relationships in both the theory and in this study are described as caring or dependent. These patterns are broadened through the consistent inclusion of three voices, those of the teacher, the children, and other adults. The dimensions of the dependent pattern are broadened by this theory through the consistent inclusion of teachers' feelings, such as in Feeling at risk, and Feeling overwhelmed. The outcome patterns in the theory are also extended by the study to include Conduit and Teacher-directed.

**Changing Orientations**

William Schubert's theory of curriculum horizons, which includes those of mechanistic, practical, and critical praxis, more-or-less helped to explain the various mandates, directives, and expectations regarding frameworks the teachers coped with, albeit not in the same evolutionary order. This can be seen, for instance, in the teachers experiencing the practical paradigm prior to the mechanistic paradigm.

Stephen Brookfield's theory of the phases in becoming more authentic helped to explain the teachers learning to care for themselves through elucidating
and perhaps changing the assumptions embedded in their implicit theories for interpreting, structuring, and making sense of the world while also learning to respect the worldviews of others. This study narrows teachers' reflections on their own ongoing and past critical change incidents to focus primarily on ongoing incidents. Brookfield's theory is extended by this study through inclusion of critical change incidents which overlap as well as those which loop backwards to repeat past critical incidents. An example of overlapping is a teacher's Feeling at risk in one relationship while being Cared for in another, and an example of looping backward is a teacher's repeating incidents of the I'm-out-of-here voice pattern. In addition, the study extends the theory by including time periods involved in becoming more authentic. For instance, depending upon the evolution of a teacher's relationships with the children and other adults, years may be required for living her way through a particular critical incident such as the Being-someone-else's-image dimension of the Other-directed voice pattern.

Christiane Northrup's theory of spiritual energy in making intentional life changes helped to explain the teachers' becoming more attuned to and guided by their own inner guidance rather than by external control. This study narrows the theory through the inclusion of external forces that significantly diminish both the teachers' quiet time which is required for their intuitive thinking, and their freedom to say "yes" to things that replenish their energy and "no" to those that drain their energy. Examples of external forces are the mandates, directives, and expectations of other adults.

Nel Noddings' theory of growing under the guidance of the ethic of care helped to explain the teachers' self-actualization in affiliation with their natural
sentiment for caring for others, as well as the teachers' longing to maintain, recapture, or enhance their tender caring moments. This study extends the sources of self-actualization from connecting deeply with the children, learning, teaching, and subject matter to also include connecting deeply with other adults. This study also broadens the theory through a much greater focus on the teachers' experiences in creating caring circles with other adults.

Implications For Practice and Research

Grounded theory... [is] saying let us find out directly what is going on and how can we account for it. Let us see what the main concern of the participants in substantive areas is and how they resolve it. Let us generate the concepts of the theory. Then, research will help in the area under view (Glaser, 1999: 839-840).

There are important implications of the theory of care-empowering education for teachers, the education profession, and persons in academia. The four criteria which must be satisfied in grounded theory research are fit, relevance, working, and readily modifiable. In this study of teachers' orientations, the first three criteria are satisfied by the generation of theory systematically from the substantive world of teachers. The fourth criterion, readily modifiable, is satisfied in the emergent notions from additional data.

For Teachers

In the current era of both rapid and continuous unprecedented change when teachers are feeling overwhelmed, they openly acknowledge their need to be cared for and to learn to care for themselves. They may, therefore, try desperately to find the time to inquire into the applicability of the theory of care-empowering
education presented here for their own situations.

**Fit.** The theory of care-empowering education has to do with the day-to-day struggles and delights of teaching children. As they continue to face the new pressures and demands of teaching in today's schools, teachers may be comforted by the confirmation that time is required for them to learn to care for themselves, and to learn be cared for, as well as to acquire more caring orientations. For example, they may find legitimization for being more attentive to their own inspiritive awakening.

**Relevance.** Teachers need vocabulary which resonates readily for them in their own situations, and much of this report is couched in their own words which may legitimize their experiences as teachers, facilitate their inspiritive awakening and their creating and maintaining the caring voice pattern.

**Working.** The theory of care-empowering education suggests processes by which teachers can often cope successfully with their central challenge of teaching the children. For example, the teacher can reach out for caring support, try out subsequent suggestions with the children, and maintain in her own repertoire those suggestions which are successful. In this way, she learns to apply timing, confirming, modelling, dialoguing, and practicing in encountering the children.

**Readily modifiable.** The theory of care-empowering education is readily modifiable. Classroom teachers, for example, may compare and contrast their own experiences with the processes described in this report and identify other voice patterns in the future. Such an occurrence would be accepted in the context of the Glaserian school of grounded theory as potentially emergent. The new patterns
would not invalidate the theory of care-empowering education but, rather, would be comparatively analyzed for their fit and relevance and working. The theory of care-empowering education could thus be modified and enriched, but it would not be diminished.

For the Education Profession

The special property of caring, inspiritve awakening, may have important applications for many members of the education profession, such as persons concerned with policy making, student learning, curriculum development and application, as well as with the education and self-inquiry of teachers. The creation of learning circles could help teachers to find a way out of struggling to maintain voice in the children's education, by learning how to learn in the teaching situation, and learning how to be directed from the dynamic centres of themselves. Moreover, other adults may consider providing time, opportunities, and support both for teachers' circles of care and teachers' use of the five properties of caring. Each of these sources of support could place emphasis on identifying and savouring the sources and substances of each teacher's self-actualization, and perhaps even spiritve awakening.

For Extension to Formal Theory

The theory of care-empowering education was discovered in the substantive area of teachers' orientations to education, given the teachers' central concern of teaching the children. This theory may be applied to addressing concerns involving educating and caring in a variety of social contexts since relationships in care-empowering education are similar to those in any learning situation. This can
be seen in that the salient features are the teachers' entering into an ongoing educational situation, intending to care, and encountering various educational orientations. Thus, the theory of care-empowering education is easily transferrable to the salient features in universities, colleges, teaching hospitals, seminaries, well-being institutions, volunteer associations, and so forth.

For Future Research

Grounded theory tells us what is going on, tells us how to account for the participants' main concerns, and reveals access variables that allow for incremental change. Grounded theory is what is, not what should be, could be, or ought to be... There are fields --particularly business, health, education-- that require research on high-impact dependent variables that help them to understand and handle problems by imbuement... What works is needed. Grounded theory does this (Glaser, 1999: 840, 841).

The grounded theory study discussed in this report focuses on teachers' central concern of teaching the children, and acquiring a viable orientation for coping with that concern in their own situation. Some suggestions for extending applications of grounded theory and for potential areas of future research follow.

Applications of grounded theory. The Glaserian school of grounded theory offers exciting possibilities for future qualitative research into the evolution of a more caring humanity since it provides a design and methodology for inquiring into previously unresearched areas as well as into familiar situations where a new perspective in sought. The criteria which grounded theory research aims to meet provide the foundation for research which allows investigators to experience the excitement of getting at what is relevant and what works, and of making a meaningful and lasting contribution. In this study of teachers'
orientations, grounded theory research provides a fresh and exciting way of identifying the social structural and psychological processes for explaining what makes teaching viable for the teacher in this era of both rapid and unprecedented change, and for inquiring into situations where there is simultaneous change in these processes.

In grounded theory, there are generally two forms of memos written for the collection and analysis of data, theoretical memos and methodological memos. An example of a theoretical memo is one focusing on receptiveness seeming central to how teachers learn how to learn in their teaching situations. An example of a methodological memo is one focusing on creating rapport and building trust with the participants. In this study, I also used "researcher memos" focusing on my personal experiences, such as in learning as a researcher.

Data for this study were collected in some seemingly unique ways. In addition to the usual methods of collection, I used both face-to-face interviews and survey-interviews with each participant choosing to respond individually or individually as a member of a small focus group. I also used biography/history lines on which each key participant drew and synopsized critical changes in her teaching over time. In addition, I used audio-recorded telephone interviews to follow-up on the face-to-face interviews.

I presented the subtitles in the hypotheses chapters in the form of questions because I found that doing so helped to maintain my own focus on the complex theory that continued to emerge from the data. Moreover, my hope is that this form of presentation contributes to the 'grab' of the report for the reader, given that
Glaser (1978) says, "Grounded theories have 'grab' and they are interesting. People remember them; they use them" (Glaser, 1978: 4).

**Suggested research.** The claim derived from by the insights in this study is not developmental but, rather, one particular to the participants involved. Thus, generalizations from of this study have limited application to other settings. However, in future studies which apply Glaser's *grounded theory* methodology, the model of care-empowering education may be readily-modified should new data present variations in properties and categories.

Future researchers may want to consider items such as the following, which are important in the present study:

* Timing, confirming, modelling, dialoguing, practicing with the children.
* Past experiences.
* The most challenging children.
* Expectations and acceptable images of teaching.
* Informal circles of care with adults, circles of care with adults within formal education, circles of care with administrators.
* Learning how to learn in the teaching situation, learning how to be directed from the dynamic centre of self, learning how to self-actualize.
* Self-monitoring through reception, reflection, assessment, revision, further exploration.

Future researchers may wish to further consider in greater depth:

* Brookfield’s (1990, 1989) theory of becoming more authentic.
* Schubert’s (1986) critical praxis paradigm.

The teachers in the present study teach at the primary-elementary level in a Separate school system in southern Ontario. Future researchers may want to inquire into the experiences of other teachers such as those at the high school level
or teachers in public schools. Their research may provide helpful guidelines for the preservice and continuing education of teachers.

Noddings says, "The primary aim of every educational institution and every educational effort must be the maintenance of caring. Parents, police, social workers, teachers, preachers, neighbors, coaches, old siblings must all embrace this primary aim. All must accept responsibility" (Noddings, 1984: 172,173). Thus, future researchers may want to consider studying appropriate modes for disseminating the good news of care-empowering education to others who are ready to hear that news. The researchers may also consider inquiring into who benefits and how from that dissemination. That research may contribute guidelines for facilitating the general evolution of a more caring society.

Many dedicated individuals and groups are currently working hard and even sacrificing to help create a better humanity. But that is not enough! As Northrup (1994a) says,

When we search for guidance with the intellect only—as though it existed outside of ourselves and our own deepest knowing—we get stuck in the search, and our inner guidance is effectively silenced. The intellect works best in service of our intuition, our inner guidance, soul, God, or higher power—whatever term we choose for the spiritual energy that animates life (Northrup, 1994a: 31).

Thus, future researchers may want to consider studying how these individuals and groups can be helped to connect their own self-actualization with caring for others. Such research may contribute important guidelines for facilitating the evolution of a more caring humanity.

The focus of the present research was limited to academic and interpersonal
caring. Noddings' (1992, 1984) theory focuses on care of the self, intimate others, distant others, plants, animals, the earth, the human-made world, and ideas. Thus, future researchers may want to consider broadening each of the studies suggested above so as to include all of these aspects of the participants' lives. That research may provide valuable guidelines for facilitating the evolution of a more caring humanity.

The Last Words?

It is important that the researcher not myth-break, whistle-blow, structure-burst, finger-point, bubble burst, and so forth. Grounded theorists never should be crusaders, subversives, or underminers... Grounded theorists should engage in incremental changes slowly, if at all. In fact, before ever trying incremental change, the grounded theorist should analyze the functional requirement of maintaining the social fiction. Learning the categories involved will help to make the incremental change go smoothly. Furthermore, the functional requirements of the fiction might be more important to both the researcher and the participants than is the change (Glaser, 1999: 843).

Students, in the care of good teachers, learn that they are indeed the recipients of care, and they have an opportunity to learn more about appropriate forms of care... We should study the best performances... and try humbly to find out how they develop the attitudes, dispositions, and skills to care effectively. We need to know in order to provide all our children with experiences likely to develop this capacity (Noddings, 1991: 165, 167).

We all have choice --and we all have inner guidance and spiritual help available that can help us move toward optimal health, joy, and fulfilment... As individuals do this work, society as a whole can become healthier (Northrup, 1994a: 24, 18).
BIBLIOGRAPHY


