THOMAS JEFFERSON'S "ESSAY ON THE ANGLO-SAXON LANGUAGE" IN CONTEXT: A STUDY OF JEFFERSON'S ANALYTICAL METHOD

by

Raymond George Lacina

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of

Doctorate of Philosophy

Graduate Department of English

University of Toronto

© Copyright Raymond Lacina, 2001
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.
Abstract


Submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctorate of Philosophy

Year of Convocation: 2001

Raymond George Lacina

Graduate Department of English

University of Toronto

This dissertation shapes a context for Thomas Jefferson’s “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language,” in which he made radical propositions for the simplification of Old English grammar, in order to better understand the results of his analysis of the language. Central to the study is the concept of “utility,” an important element of Jefferson’s philosophy which is crucial to understanding his approach to scholarship. Jefferson preferred areas of study with clear utilitarian value, as his love of invention demonstrates, and so the dissertation first addresses how Old English met the criterion of utility. As a believer in the “Anglo-Saxon Myth” (which describes the Saxons as democrats fiercely committed to freedom), Jefferson saw in the Saxons an important example for the United States. He also believed the study of Old English would strengthen Modern English by elucidating the meanings of its words and promote neology by restoring the practice of forming new words by the combination of existing words and roots. Utility also affected the methods by which Jefferson analyzed the language: Jefferson borrowed from the techniques of natural classification, which had been designed to render knowledge of
nature more useful to the natural historian. Since his own purpose was to ease the acquisition of Old English, and so render it more useful, the selection, tabulation and comparison of traits, the methodology of Linnaeus, suited him well. Chapter 1 introduces the concept of utility as it applies to Jefferson’s scholarship, and explores the utility of history and education (both factors in his study of Old English). Possible influences on Jefferson’s linguistic theory are also examined, and his methods of scholarship explicated. Chapter 2 explores the importance of language – and particularly of English – to republican society. Returning to the subject of history, Chapter 3 describes the evolution of the Anglo-Saxon myth and its use in the American colonies, and Chapter 4 describes Jefferson’s own understanding of Anglo-Saxon history. Chapter 5 concludes the dissertation with a detailed discussion of the “Essay” itself, revealing how the context explored in previous chapters sheds light on Jefferson’s understanding of Old English and its place in his thought.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION: BUILDING A CONTEXT FOR THOMAS JEFFERSON’S “ESSAY ON THE ANGLO-SAXON LANGUAGE” ................................................................. 1
   Survey of Scholarship on the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” ......................................................... 16

CHAPTER 1: THE UTILITY OF PHILOSOPHY: HISTORY AND EDUCATION IN THE THOUGHT OF THOMAS JEFFERSON ......................................................... 24
   The Republic of the Wise: The Uses and Methods of Scholarship ................................................................. 25
   The Role of Education in the American Republic .................................................................................. 32
   The Study of Languages and History ..................................................................................................... 38
   The Past Cannot Bind Us ....................................................................................................................... 49
   The Uses of Language and Language Reform .......................................................................................... 55
   Jefferson and the Theory of Language .................................................................................................. 62
   The Comparison of Traits: Jefferson’s Analytic Methodology ............................................................... 77

   The Filiation of Languages and the Legacy of English ........................................................................... 94
   The Republic of Words: The Role of Language in Jefferson’s Nation ..................................................... 101
   Words and Silences of the Statesman: Jefferson’s Controlled Discourse .................................................. 111
   “The Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language”: Shaping a Context ............................................................. 120
   Correcting History: Jefferson’s Approach to Editing ............................................................................... 127

CHAPTER 3: NORMAN TYRANTS AND SAXON PATRIOTS ......................... 140
   English Origins of the Anglo-Saxon Myth ................................................................................................. 142
   Saxon Liberties in the New World .......................................................................................................... 158
   Anglo-Saxon Liberties: Tradition in Support of Change ........................................................................ 185

CHAPTER 4: THOMAS JEFFERSON AND THE LIBERTIES OF THE SAXONS 189
   History through Whig Eyes: Jefferson’s Sources on the Anglo-Saxons .................................................. 191
   Jefferson’s Saxons: The Republican Barbarians .................................................................................... 207
   Fortescue-Aland and the Utility of Old English ..................................................................................... 228

CHAPTER 5: JEFFERSON’S “ESSAY ON THE ANGLO-SAXON LANGUAGE” 235
   Jefferson’s Statement of Purpose: The Postscripts of 1822 and 1822 ................................................... 244
   “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar” .............................................................................................. 251
   The “Essay” for the University of Virginia .............................................................................................. 274
   Jeffersonian Linguistics: History, Natural History and the Study of Language ..................................... 305

WORKS CONSULTED .................................................................................................................................. 321
INTRODUCTION: BUILDING A CONTEXT FOR THOMAS JEFFERSON'S "ESSAY ON THE ANGLO-SAXON LANGUAGE"

In 1824, Thomas Jefferson wrote English radical Major John Cartwright what he admitted to be "a long and rambling letter", thanking him for a copy of his "valuable volume on the English Constitution", which he had read "with much pleasure and approbation" (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 51, 42). The letter to Cartwright offers a useful starting point for this study, because in it Jefferson raises many of the issues which form the basis of my argument. The subject of Cartwright's work, the English constitution, inspired Jefferson to expound upon its Anglo-Saxon origins. Jefferson was a believer in what historians have come to call the "Anglo-Saxon myth," and he outlines its key elements here, describing for Cartwright how the Saxons had brought with them to England the Germanic system of liberties, establishing themselves and their system on the island after driving "out the former inhabitants of England" and becoming "aborigines" to the modern English and their "lineal ancestors" (41-42). The free constitution of the Anglo-Saxons was "set at naught by Norman force", and English history has been the stage on which a struggle for the restoration of those rights has been played out (42-43). Jefferson saw the American Revolution as a manifestation of this struggle, though the
former colonists had a distinct advantage over the English; while the past of Saxon England may have inspired their struggle, they had no need to “search into musty records, to hunt up royal parchments, or to investigate the laws and institutions of a semi-barbarous ancestry” (44). What Jefferson sought and found in Anglo-Saxon England was not the details of their system of government, preserved in “musty records,” but rather a historical expression of the his own ideal of liberty.

Jefferson’s letter to Cartwright does more than outline his belief that English freedoms were rooted in the Anglo-Saxon past. Jefferson also explains the importance of that past to the present generation, and the way in which the language of the Saxons could offer the means of instilling the values of that people in young Americans through the powerful medium of public education. At the time of the writing of this letter, Jefferson had spent several years establishing the University of Virginia, which was only a single component in his broader plan for a system of public education. The basis of that system would have been the ward school: the wards were to be subdivisions of the counties, which, Jefferson wrote Cartwright, would “answer to the hundreds of your Saxon Alfred” (46). Jefferson concludes his letter by thanking Cartwright for his “good wishes” to the University, and touches upon some of the “novelties” which have been introduced into it:

Of that of the professorship of the principles of government, you express your approbation. They will be founded in the rights of man. That of agriculture, I am sure you will approve; and that also of the Anglo-Saxon. As the histories and laws left us in that type and dialect, must be the text-books of the reading of the learners, they will imbibe with the language free principles of government (51).

1 Jefferson is referring to Cartwright’s The English Constitution Produced and Illustrated (1823).
The "novelties" which Jefferson discusses here bring together in the University curriculum several areas of acute interest to Jefferson: political theory, history, and the study of language – particularly that of the Anglo-Saxons.1 Jefferson’s reasons for including Old English in the course of study are made explicit here: the Anglo-Saxons had established a system of liberties long lost in England, and the works they left to posterity, studied along with the language in which they were written, would instill their principles in their descendants in the Americas, who were re-enacting Saxon history by their emigration from their European homeland and their establishment of a free society in a new country. At the same time, Jefferson hints at his somewhat complex relationship with the past: while citizens would "imbibe the...free principles of government" from Anglo-Saxon texts, the principles of the new nation’s government would be "founded in the rights of man.” The Anglo-Saxon system, Jefferson wrote elsewhere, had also been founded on those same rights; however, Jefferson believed that as society progressed, its laws must keep pace with that advancement. Jefferson reserved for himself and those who would follow him the same right enjoyed by the Saxons, the right to build a society suited to their own needs.

In 1825 Jefferson wrote that the study of Old English “is a hobby which too often runs away with me” (Padover 856). However, the letter to Cartwright reveals that the subject was more than a mere “hobby”: the language of the Anglo-Saxons is there linked to their history, and the study of both to the proper education of the citizens of the United States. In fact, the subject was important enough to Jefferson that he not only dedicated

1 The mention of agriculture here is also evocative, given the pastoral ideal Jefferson often expressed of a nation based on simple farmers – the Anglo-Saxons were, after all, a “semi-barbarous” – a primitive –
time to learning the language and reading its texts, but he also conducted his own analysis of Old English grammar and wrote on the subject at two separate, yet critical junctures of his life. He first outlined his thoughts on the language in 1798, at a time when, as Secretary of State, he was struggling against the "monarchical" incursions of the Federalists, and again in the 1820's, when he was engaged in the founding of the University of Virginia. The "Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar," likely the final form of the essay written in 1798, and the "Essay" which he wrote for the University both go beyond mere introductions to the language: Jefferson rejected many of the assumptions of his mentors in the language (Elizabeth Elstob, George Hickes and Edward Thwaites, from whose grammars he learned Old English) and argued for a radically new approach to its grammar and to how its texts should be presented in published form. His goal in these operations was to simplify the language, primarily by insisting upon its nearness to Modern English and then using the grammar of the latter as a guide to Old English grammar, with the ultimate goal of facilitating its acquisition by the student.

Jefferson proved to be an enthusiastic surgeon, and the changes which he wreaks on the language – particularly his stripping away of the Old English inflectional system – are profound. Although he himself admitted that he is no more than a "tyro" in the language, Jefferson saw fit to reject the work of scholars whom he respected, and who had taught him the very language to which he was taking his scalpel ("Essay" 51). In the Notes on the State of Virginia Jefferson had insisted that "ignorance is preferable to error; and he is less remote from the truth who believes nothing, than he who believes what is wrong."

Yet, despite his admission of ignorance on the subject, Jefferson proposes a radically new approach to Old English.

It is the purpose of the present study to explore the "why" and "how" of Jefferson's analysis of Old English grammar — and, for Jefferson, the "why" was a key element in the "how" of his approach — in order to understand Jefferson's determination to simplify the language (and so render it accessible to a broader audience) and to clarify how he came to many of the conclusions he did. Jefferson once wrote that "nature has constituted utility to man, [as] the standard and test of virtue" (Bergh and Lipscomb 14142). Jefferson applied this same standard to science, showing greatest enthusiasm for fields of study which offered clear benefits to society. Utility also played a key role in his method of scholarship; Jefferson's study of natural history had exposed him to the methodology of classification, which was based upon the twin assumptions that the true order of nature might be incomprehensible to humanity, and yet that order must be imposed on the chaos of nature to aid scientists in the retention of knowledge and its communication within their community. The purpose of classification was utilitarian, and the traits selected for the ordering of nature were also those most readily apparent to a casual observer — again, those which would render the knowledge classified most useful to the scholar. The exploration of the "why" of Jefferson's scholarship in Old English must, then, reveal the utility of the subject to him, and it will be seen that Jefferson believed a knowledge of the language of the Anglo-Saxons would serve the citizen as a means of grasping the roots of the freedoms and even many of the laws enjoyed in the United States, as well as serve as a means of strengthening Modern English, the language of the new nation and an essential tool of statecraft. Utility will also explain his radical
simplification of the grammar; by applying the tools of natural science to language, Jefferson made egregious errors which, nevertheless, reflect the internal logic of his method. Finally, utility explains why Jefferson felt it so important to simplify Old English grammar. Despite his interest in the subject, he himself admitted, in his "Essay" that, if Old English was the heavily inflected language described by Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob, then "it's difficulties go beyond it's worth, and render a knowledge [sic] of it no longer a compensation for the time and labor it's acquisition will require" (67).¹ That Jefferson thought a knowledge of Old English important will be demonstrated below; by simplifying the language and so demonstrating that it is merely an antiquated form" of Modern English, he could ensure that the difficulty of its acquisition would not outweigh its utility and discourage students from its study.

An exploration of the utility of the language of the Saxons will reveal both the wide range of Jefferson's interests with which the study of Old English was connected and the fascinating interrelationships between seemingly disparate areas of his thought. The importance of education to Jefferson's republican ideal brings together many of these elements; the study of history and language both had important contributions to make to the education of the American citizen. However, history, politics and language had subtler connections: Jefferson saw echoes of the accomplishments of the United States in the experience of the Anglo-Saxons, and believed the former to be the true inheritors of the libertarian tradition of the latter; language provided proof of this relationship, since, as Jefferson put once it, "the filiation of languages" offered the "best proof" obtainable "of the filiation of nations" (Bergh and Lipscomb 861). In his "Essay," Jefferson argues that

¹ Jefferson habitually employs this spelling if "its," and so I will not mark future occurrences with [sic].
Old English is no more than the ancient form of Modern English, and the foundation of his analysis of the language is the analogy he draws between them. Language also had an essential role to play in a republican society, and so the language of the United States needed to be capable of bearing the responsibility of being the carrier of democracy, a task for which English was particularly well suited. However, Jefferson believed that in order to keep pace with the progress of society, English needed to be open to change, to both the forward-looking acceptance of "neologisms" and the return to its foundations in Old English, which would make clear the true meanings of English words and, by means of the Anglo-Saxon practice of building new words from a highly flexible system of roots, give Modern English a tool for ensuring its continual growth. How the linguistic theories to which Jefferson was exposed, particularly those of Locke, Condillac and the Ideologues, may have influenced his thinking on language will also be examined.

Because the "filiation" of Modern and Old English proved for Jefferson the "filiation" of the speakers of those languages, his somewhat complex relationship with the past and his beliefs about the Anglo-Saxons must be investigated as well. The present study will outline the history of the Anglo-Saxon myth in England and its use in the American colonies, shaping a context for Jefferson's own Anglo-Saxonism and exploring its sources, after which his own notes and comments on Anglo-Saxon history will be examined in detail. In his letter to Cartwright, Jefferson reveals some of the ambiguities of his relationship with Anglo-Saxon history; at the same time he places his own nation in the chronology of the English struggle for the restoration of Anglo-Saxon liberty, he declares its freedom from that past. He and the others who had helped establish the United States had no need to "search into musty records," to "investigate the laws and institutions of a
semi-barbarous ancestry”; rather, they had “appealed to those of nature, and found them engraved on our hearts” (Bergh and Lipscomb 1644).

The tendency of this progressive man, who declared the freedom of the present generation from the dead hand of the past, to appeal to history has been a subject of interest to many scholars. The most complete discussion of the uses to which Jefferson put English history and of the sources for his understanding of it is H. Trevor Colbourn’s unpublished dissertation for Johns Hopkins University, “The Saxon Heritage: Thomas Jefferson Looks at English History” (1953). Colbourn built upon the insights introduced in this dissertation in his 1958 article for William and Mary Quarterly, “Thomas Jefferson’s Use of the Past,” and incorporated them into his discussion of the role played by “Whig” history in the intellectual history of the American Revolution, The Lamp of Experience (1965). All three studies are invaluable resources for anyone interested in the uses made of English history by Jefferson and his contemporaries. In the article, which is essentially a refinement and abridgement of the dissertation, Colbourn places Jefferson’s historical perspective at the center of his thought:

His constant aim in politics was to avoid the political pitfalls into which England had evidently fallen, to establish a democracy which would not fall prey to petty ambition and political corruption, and to restore the ancient Saxon principles of polity. (69)

Colbourn concludes that Jefferson’s belief in Whig history made him a “strangely reactionary revolutionary” who “wanted change, but not innovation” and to “advance to the political perfection of an earlier age” (69). Phillips Russell draws a similar conclusion
in *Thomas Jefferson: Champion of the Free Mind*. After discussing Jefferson's comments on "ancient British liberties" and the sources of his ideas on them, Russell concludes that:

Jefferson can be understood only as an advocate of the continuation of ancient British liberties. He believed that the thread that began with King Alfred somehow must be picked up, restored and carried on. The English common law, introduced by the Saxons when they settled England, was the unwritten law which grew out of the customs and natural rights of the people.... He wanted to keep America free for a great experiment which should convince mankind that the basic principles which governed the Saxon tribes in their Germanic forests could be applied to a virgin continent (357).

While both Colbourn and Russell recognize the importance of history to Jefferson's political outlook, neither touches upon his seemingly contradictory insistence on freedom from the past — in fact, Colbourn, in suggesting that Jefferson "wanted change, but not innovation," seems to have overlooked Jefferson's own words to Cartwright, that the Revolution had presented the colonists "with an album on which [they] were free to write what [they] pleased" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1644). While cautious about innovation for innovation's sake, Jefferson certainly believed that each generation had the right to free itself from the legacy of the past. Russell, by demonstrating that an appeal to the Saxon past need not be an appeal to a restitution of all of their laws, comes nearer to reconciling this difficulty: his position is that Jefferson hoped to see the "basic principles" of Anglo-Saxon government restored in the United States, rather than their entire political system.

---

1 When referring to the historical perspective of the Whigs, Colbourn follows a convention of not capitalizing "whig," a convention followed here when citing from his work.
In his biography of Jefferson, *Thomas Jefferson and the New Nation*, Merrill D. Peterson points out that, while Jefferson's thought "became the quintessence of Enlightenment liberalism," it "had its roots in English law and government" and in the "tradition of the English constitution," which gave him and his fellow colonists "a concreteness to their claims of personal and political liberty, even a color of legality to the revolution itself" (56). In the light of this tradition, it often "seemed that the Americans, far from finding a new political paradise, were simply regaining the one that had been lost somewhere in the tumultuous English past"; it is this "recovery strain" which Peterson believes "is especially evident in the young Jefferson" (56). Peterson recognizes the apparent contradiction of Jefferson's historical perspective: on the one hand he invokes early English history in support of the rights being fought for in the Revolution and in the establishment of the young republic, and on the other hand, he advocates the freedom of the present generation from those past, and preaches the doctrine of progress. Peterson resolves this seeming contradiction by viewing these two historical perspectives through the context of an evolutionary development:

The progression of [Jefferson's] political thought before the Revolution has been described as a movement from history to theory. It was that, and at the same time a movement from the particularism, the local patois, of English law and government to the rationalism and universalism of the natural rights philosophy (57).

However, Peterson points out that Jefferson never wholly abandoned the Anglo-Saxon myth, and offers as proof Jefferson's "lifelong interest in the Anglo-Saxon language," which "expressed a linguistic passion," but which was "involved as well...with the roots of
law and government" (60). Peterson seems, however, to view this perpetuation of Jefferson’s belief in the myth as a regressive factor in his thought. Even after Jefferson’s appeal to nature in the Declaration of Independence, “the shadow of the English heritage hovered over Jefferson’s mind” (57). His “political imagination” was “partly clouded by old historical ideas,” and “had not yet caught up with the principles of reason” (57). This is loaded language, and Peterson clearly prefers to see Jefferson as a progressive, an American “apostle” of reason. David N. Mayer takes a similar approach to Jefferson’s historical perspective in The Constitutional Thought of Thomas Jefferson. Mayer, like Peterson, sees Jefferson’s use of Whig history as a stage in his developing constitutional theory. Although he touches upon the Saxons when mentioning Jefferson’s proposed ward system of local government, Mayer clearly sees the Anglo-Saxon myth as exerting its strongest influence early in Jefferson’s career. In the area of constitutional theory, with which Mayer’s work is concerned, this statement is a reasonably accurate assessment. I would argue, however, that although Jefferson did not again make as extensive reference to the Anglo-Saxons in a public paper as he did in the Summary View, they nevertheless continued to play an important role in his political imagination.

Joseph J. Ellis, in his 1996 character study of Jefferson, American Sphinx, calls the “Whig interpretation of history,” of which the Anglo-Saxon myth was a key element, “a crucial clue to Jefferson’s deepest intellectual instincts” (Ellis 37). According to Ellis, Whig history appealed to Jefferson because it “told a story that fitted perfectly with the way his mind worked”:

[Whig history’s] romantic endorsement of a pristine past, a long-lost time and place where men had lived together in perfect harmony without coercive laws or
predatory rulers, gave narrative shape to his fondest imaginings and to utopian expectations with deep roots in his personality. The Whig histories did not create his romantic expectations. They put into words the visionary prospects he already carried around in his mind and heart (Ellis 37).

In other words, the Anglo-Saxon myth allowed Jefferson to project his personal vision for the future back into history. Although this may well be true – Jefferson’s Anglo-Saxons at times seemed much like him and his fellows in the colonies – Ellis does not balance the importance of Whig history to Jefferson with the other side of his historical perspective, his belief that the living generation needed to break from the past, to form the society best suited to its needs in the present. This omission is not made by James R. Stoner, who, in his essay on the influence of the common law tradition on Jefferson’s thought, explores the legal inspiration of Jefferson’s appeals to Whig history. Stoner identifies the seeming discrepancy between Jefferson’s appeals to tradition (ancient English history and the common law) and his position as “the apostle of reason and natural rights in American political thought” (104). Stoner proposes that Jefferson “sought a perfect reconciliation between the opposing traditions,” a reconciliation sketched out in the Summary View of the Rights of British America (106). Jefferson insists upon the natural right of a people to emigrate from the country in which “chance, not choice” has placed them, and of establishing new societies elsewhere, a right also vindicated by English history, since the Anglo-Saxons exercised it when they left the continent and settled in Britain (106-107). However, according to Stoner, Jefferson “did not pretend that the ‘semi-barbarous’ Saxons had the benefit of the modern Enlightenment and thus a knowledge of the rights of man” (110). Stoner concludes that Jefferson employed the common law tradition, not as a
component of his political theory, but rather as "as source of laws and mores for a free people" (115).

Like Peterson and Stoner, Garret Ward Sheldon examines the place of Whig history in Jefferson's political thought, placing the notion of an "Ancient Constitution" on a par with "Lockean liberalism" as a source for Jefferson's "theoretical justifications for American independence" (25). That constitution, "embodied in the prefeudal Saxon tribes" of pre-Norman England, "was seen as a golden age of English liberty free from the decadent influences of monarchical authority and feudal tenure" (26). However, Jefferson, like the seventeenth century parliamentarians who inspired him, appealed to this Saxon golden age in an attempt to legitimize more than specific legal and political freedoms: it also "provided historical validity to liberalism by existing prior to the feudal monarchy," allowing progressive forces to beat "the traditionalists at their own game by situating their historical claim to liberty in a period antedating the monarchy" (27).

Reginald Horsman and Allen J. Frantzen approach Jefferson's interest in the Anglo-Saxons from a somewhat different perspective: both are concerned, not with the history of the American Revolution, but rather with the history of scholarship on the Anglo-Saxons and their language. Horsman's Race and Manifest Destiny: the Origins of American Racial Anglo-Saxonism traces the evolution of the relatively innocuous myth of Anglo-Saxon freedoms subscribed to by Jefferson into a system of racial beliefs which could be used to justify the spread of Anglo-American culture across the continent – in other words, to support the doctrine of Manifest Destiny. Horsman discusses Jefferson at length, clearly positioning him as the colonial figure most committed to the Anglo-Saxon myth. Horsman discusses Jefferson's sources and his own use of the Anglo-Saxons as a
model for the new republic to follow – as Horsman puts it, Jefferson "argued not for wholesale innovation but for a return to the principles of English government in the Anglo-Saxon period," and believed that "the Saxon government and way of life should become a model for the new America" (20-21). Examples of this include Jefferson's fight for the abolition of entail and primogeniture and for religious freedom, which he viewed as "a sweeping away of Norman tyranny," as well as Jefferson's proposed ward system, which was at least partly inspired by the Anglo-Saxon hundreds (22-23). While Horsman is right in stating that, despite the wide-spread acceptance of the Anglo-Saxon myth in the American colonies, "Jefferson was exceptional in the depth of his scholarly interest and belief in a free Anglo-Saxon past," his attribution to Jefferson of a desire to use the Saxons as a model for the new republic again ignores Jefferson's insistence on the freedom of the present generation from the past (23).

Alan Frantzen's study of approaches to the teaching of Old English, Desire for Origins: New Language, Old English and Teaching the Tradition, can serve as a segue between the discussion of scholarship on Jefferson and the Anglo-Saxon myth and that of studies of Jefferson's interest in the Old English language. Frantzen's purpose is to explore fresh approaches to pedagogy: Jefferson's Anglo-Saxonism provides him with a possible starting point for teachers and students to launch into their exploration of the language and the history of its scholarship. Jefferson's proposed plan for the Great Seal (Hengist and Horsa were to be pictured on one side, Moses leading the Israelites out of bondage on the other), which "encapsulates the makings of Manifest Destiny," can raise questions about "Anglo-Saxon language, literature and history" (16). "It is an exercise," Frantzen suggests, "that shows how the reception of an earlier culture – Jefferson's
understanding of Hengst and Horsa, and the student’s understanding of Jefferson – can lead to new ideas about one’s own” (17). Frantzen also touches upon Jefferson’s plans for the language of the Anglo-Saxons. After summarily discussing the importance of Anglo-Saxon history and law to Jefferson, he relates these interests to Jefferson’s Old English scholarship, which “linked law and education through Anglo-Saxon grammar,” and describes Jefferson’s attempts to simplify Old English orthography (205). Though his discussion of Jefferson’s Anglo-Saxonism is brief, it does identify the relationship between language and history which helps to elucidate Jefferson’s reasons for writing his “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language.” Frantzen also suggests that Jefferson seems to have followed many of his contemporaries in seeing a connection between language and national identity (205).

The present study will examine Jefferson’s disparate positions on history, and it will be seen that the Anglo-Saxon myth served Jefferson the revolutionary in a way different from that in which Saxon laws served Jefferson the lawyer and legal reformer; in the latter case, Saxon legal tradition was appealed to directly for precedents. In the former, Jefferson used the Saxon myth to ground his more radical agendas in the past, without insisting on blind imitation of tradition. Whether he felt those agendas needed such grounding is questionable, and it is more likely that Jefferson’s awareness of his own place in history had as much to do with his appeal to the past as did a need for historical precedent: what Jefferson saw in the Anglo-Saxons was a people who had succeeded at the same experiment in which he and his contemporaries were engaged. The Anglo-Saxons had left their native country and built a new society elsewhere, basing that society, not on tradition, but on natural right. Their system need not be exactly reproduced in the
United States in order for that nation to demonstrate its fulfillment of their legacy: the new nation need only determine for itself the best system of government to guarantee the liberty of its citizens. This perspective, in turn, may have colored his approach to the language of the Anglo-Saxons; the utility of Old English lay not in the language itself (not in purely linguistic concerns), but rather in its contribution to an understanding of the present, both in opening the way to the Anglo-Saxon texts which contained the foundation of the common law still practiced in Jefferson’s time, and in empowering Modern English by revealing the original meanings of its words and in restoring a powerful means of making additions to the language.

**Survey of Scholarship on the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language”**

Scholarship on Jefferson’s interest in the Anglo-Saxon language has been scantier than that touching upon his belief in the Anglo-Saxon myth. H. E. Shepherd made what appears to be the first published comment on Jefferson’s interest in Old English in his article “Thomas Jefferson as a Philologist,” published in 1882 in the American Journal of Philology. Shepherd indicates his own belief that his subject had long gone unnoticed when he writes that “no student of English [had] made a critical examination of the writings of Thomas Jefferson, with a view to ascertain their philological interest or importance” (211). He attempts to rectify the oversight by reminding readers of Jefferson’s role in founding the chair of Anglo-Saxon at the University of Virginia and of his written comments on neology and the language of the Anglo-Saxons. Although Shepherd makes no attempt at a critical study of Jefferson’s writings (and the article is too brief to sustain an in-depth discussion), he does note the similarities between Jefferson’s
ideas and those of more recent philologists (212-214). While Shepherd’s article may offer no profound insights into Jefferson’s essay, he does make a case for its interest to modern students of language. In 1893, J.B. Henneman discussed Jefferson’s interest in Old English along with that of Louis F. Klipstein in his article “Two Pioneers in the Historical Study of English.” Henneman makes some astute observations: he recognizes Jefferson’s indebtedness to Fortescue-Aland and blames the errors in Jefferson’s analysis of Old English upon his insistence that Old English, as the parent of Modern English, could not be an inflected language, since Modern English is not (xlv-xlvi). Henneman also recognizes the distinction between the “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar” and the rest of Jefferson’s “Essay,” suggesting that the former was written earlier than the latter, and was likely taken directly from notes made by Jefferson during his reading of Elizabeth Elstob’s grammar (xlvi). Another early introduction to the subject was made by C.R. Thompson in his article, “The Study of Anglo-Saxon in America.” Thompson’s comments on Jefferson are brief, adding little to Shepherd or Henneman’s discussions. He does link Jefferson’s interest in Old English to his role as a “leader of education reform” (242). He also recognizes Aland’s influence on Jefferson, and identifies Jefferson’s own “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” as “the first American Contribution to Anglo-Saxon scholarship” (241, 245).

The "Historical Review" component of this subtitle proves to be a key to Arnold’s work: his dissertation serves the primary purpose of demonstrating the uniqueness of Jefferson’s work on Old English within the context of what other scholars then and since have written on the subject, a task which he accomplishes by a massive gathering together of quotations. As a result of this approach, Arnold’s work is a wealth of information; it is filled with excerpts from scholars on the subject of Old English studies, and it brings together the complete texts of Jefferson’s letters touching upon the subject (14-95). He also includes a list of Anglo-Saxon works owned by Jefferson, which includes nearly every volume on language in his three libraries (96-104). These compilations of data are followed by a detailed outline of the “Essay,” and the dissertation concludes with an edition of Jefferson’s “Specimen” of his proposed method for publishing Old English texts, which had not been (and has yet to be) published in its entirety. Arnold’s work is exhaustive, and provides the student with a complete discussion of its subject. Arnold does not, however, analyze the data he has brought together, beyond asserting the uniqueness of Jefferson’s work; moreover, his transcription of the “Specimen” contains errors, as Hauer has pointed out (Hauer 890).

Albert C. Baugh’s essay, “Thomas Jefferson, Linguistic Liberal,” offers a useful starting place for the student interested in quickly grasping the essentials of Jefferson’s linguistic thought. Baugh begins by placing Jefferson’s work in its temporal and geographical context, revealing just how unique Jefferson was in the extent of his interest in language when compared to other Americans of his generation. Baugh also touches upon the primary sources of Jefferson’s Anglo-Saxonism, mentioning both Elstob’s grammar and Fortescue-Aland’s essay on the subject, the first of which taught Jefferson
the language, the second of which, as will be discussed below, probably helped persuade him of its utilitarian value (91-94). Baugh then summarizes the essential conclusions of Jefferson’s own “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language,” then relates these ideas to Jefferson’s reaction to 18th century movements toward standardizing English and reforming its orthography, with particular emphasis on the former (98-106). Interestingly, Baugh sees Jefferson’s neology – his commitment to the growth of language by lexical additions – as arising from his study of Old English, which led Jefferson to comprehend “the adequacy and flexibility of the Old English vocabulary” (100). Baugh also touches upon Jefferson’s conviction that usage should govern grammar, rather than the opposite (105-106). Its comprehensiveness makes Baugh’s essay an exceptionally useful introduction the subject, and although each aspect of Jefferson’s linguistic theory (if such it can be called) is touched upon only briefly, Baugh raises the most important relevant issues. Unfortunately, his discussion of the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” relies upon the version published in the Memorial Edition. This leads him to such errors as believing that the current “Essay” was a revision of the notes Jefferson had prepared for Herbert Croft in 1798 – his assumption here being that the “Essay” was actually a single document; however, the manuscript makes it abundantly clear that Jefferson actually preserved two separate essays on the subject, one of which may very well have been that sent to Croft. The “Essay” published in 1851 by the Trustees of the University of Virginia, and upon which all subsequent editions have been based, is an editorial construct which conflates the two essays, adding additional material from a letter to Herbert Croft and omitting the bulk of the “Specimen” from the Anglo-Saxon prose Genesis. Baugh’s insights on Jefferson’s Anglo-Saxonism may have been even more helpful had he
examined the originals. Baugh's article also deals exclusively with language: he makes no attempt to relate Jefferson's linguistic interests with other areas of his thought, omitting even his commitment to the Anglo-Saxon myth.

Stanley R. Hauer avoids both of these pitfalls in his essay on the subject, "Thomas Jefferson and the Anglo-Saxon Language." Hauer's essay provides the most comprehensive introduction to Jefferson's interest in Old English currently available. He describes Jefferson's education in the language, and does not omit the relevance of his belief in the Anglo-Saxon myth. His discussion of Jefferson's sources on the language of the Anglo-Saxons is exceptionally thorough, and by returning to the original manuscript Hauer is able to convincingly date its various components, largely by reference to the materials available to Jefferson at different periods in his life and an analysis of the evidence offered by his handwriting. Hauer's examination of sources also helps to elucidate some of the weaknesses of Jefferson's scholarship; Hauer points out, for instance, that Jefferson's library catalogues indicate he knew nothing of Anglo-Saxon poetry, the complexities of which may have led him away from some of his conclusions, and that it lacked representation of the research being done in Germany and Denmark by Jefferson's contemporaries (882). Hauer also demonstrates the utilitarian value Jefferson ascribed to a knowledge of Old English, citing as evidence his comments upon its close relationship to Modern English and its significance as the language of the oldest English laws (882-83).

Although Hauer's discussion of these subjects is quite comprehensive, Shepherd and Baugh had made similar observations. Where Hauer's article truly distinguishes itself is in its analysis of the "Essay." Hauer makes the connection between Jefferson's desire to
see Old English widely taught and the operations he performed upon the language — as Hauer puts it, “Jefferson realizes that radical simplification of Hickes’s grammatical categories is the only logical course for making Anglo-Saxon a common subject of popular study” (887). Hauer’s analysis of the manuscript is thorough, if not exhaustive, providing a useful summary of its components and pointing out the difficulties into which Jefferson’s desire for simplification led him (886-891). His discussion of the “Specimen” highlights some of the errors which inevitably result from Jefferson’s elimination of inflectional endings in Old English (890-91). Hauer concludes his essay with a brief reflection upon the fluctuating fortunes of Old English as a subject of study, and an exploration of how the “Essay” related to Jefferson’s other ideas on language (891-894).

One more discussion of Jefferson’s interest in language in general, and Old English in particular, must be mentioned here: Julie Tetel Andresen’s Linguistics in America 1769-1924: A Critical History. Andresen’s comments on Jefferson offer no really fresh insights; however, the study does help put Jefferson’s interest in language in perspective by investigating other Americans of the period who shared that interest, such as Franklin, Rush and Webster. Andresen’s primary goal is to demonstrate that American linguistics in the nineteenth century did not spring wholly from the import of European, particularly German, scholarship on the Indo-European languages. Rather, Andresen describes three “arcs of development” of linguistics in America, two of which could be traced to Jefferson’s time: the study of Native languages and the study of a distinctly American English (14). The student interested in a useful, if not exhaustive, introduction to the
linguistic interests of Jefferson and his contemporaries will find Andresen’s work invaluable.

While the present study does not take issue with most of the insights of these scholars, it goes beyond them in tracing the interconnections between Jefferson’s interest in Old English and other areas of his thought, and does so for a very specific reason: it will be argued that the utility of Old English, bound up as it was with the roles Jefferson imagined for both history and language in the young republic, not only inspired Jefferson’s interest in the language, but also influenced the methods he employed in his analysis of it. The errors made by Jefferson in his “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” were certainly, in part, a result of his status as a “tyro” in the language and of his limited exposure to the scholarship of his contemporaries in Germany. However, what has not been explored before is the role played in his analysis of Old English by his approach to scholarship, which, it will be argued, he derived from the practices of natural history and particularly from the system of classification created by Linnaeus. These methods, supported by Jefferson’s tendency to make scholarship serve the needs of society — even if doing so led him into error, or even the condoning of deception, as in the case of his support for Baxter’s “corrected” edition of Hume’s History of England — give his “Essay” a degree of internal logic, and shed light on how and why he drew the conclusions he did. Before turning to his analysis of the language, Jefferson had already determined the usefulness of Old English; what was left to be done was to render the language accessible to the student, and it was with that goal in mind that he went to work on Old English grammar and orthography. His goal was to allow students to attain a knowledge of the language “to a useful degree” in the “few weeks” which he had promised in his plan for the
University of Virginia would be “requisite for it’s attainment” (Cappon 2 565-66). As will be seen, the tools of classification served Jefferson well in attaining this goal: while modern scholars may shudder at his results, he did, to his own satisfaction, simplify Old English spelling and grammar and prove to prospective students that Old English became transparent – or at least translucent – if recognized as no more than an early form of Modern English.
CHAPTER 1: THE UTILITY OF PHILOSOPHY: HISTORY AND EDUCATION IN THE THOUGHT OF THOMAS JEFFERSON

In *The Philosophy of Thomas Jefferson*, Adrienne Koch devotes an entire chapter, albeit a brief one, to the role which Utilitarianism played in Jefferson’s moral philosophy. Koch calls Utilitarianism “the most hard-headed moral theory current in the Enlightenment” (40). The theory proposed that actions might be deemed “good” or “bad” in different societies based on the circumstances of those societies: actions which contribute to the needs of society are “good”, those which are detrimental are “bad” (41). As Jefferson wrote to Thomas Law in 1814, “nature has constituted utility to man, [as] the standard and test of virtue. Men living in different countries under different circumstances, different habits and regimens, may have different utilities” (Bergh and Lipscomb 14 142). I would argue, however, that the notion of utility had broader application than granting a certain flexibility to Jefferson’s moral philosophy; Jefferson used the standard of utility to define the “good”, not only of moral acts, but also of other fields of human endeavor. So Jefferson condemns the religious system of Moses for its empty ceremonies, which have “no effect towards producing the social utilities which constitute the essence of virtue”, a moral shortcoming addressed by Jesus, and at the same time praises Benjamin Franklin’s work in the sciences because “he always endeavored to
direct it to something useful in private life” (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 260, 13 176). Good science, like good behavior, was to be judged by the criterion of usefulness. As will be seen in Chapter 1, utility also influenced the methodology of Jefferson’s scholarship, including his analysis of the language of the Anglo-Saxons. But how exactly does the study of Old English meet that criterion? Why would Jefferson not only work to introduce its study into the curriculum of the University of Virginia, but also perform profound alterations on the grammar of the language in order to ease its acquisition by students? The utility of a knowledge of Old English lay for Jefferson, not necessarily in the language itself, but in the many points of intersection between its study and other areas of his thinking, particularly those bound up with statecraft, and so the present discussion will begin with an exploration of the different fields which Jefferson imagined would be furthered by a knowledge of Old English; the present chapter, will begin by exploring the important role which science had to play in Jefferson’s nationalism and the utility which he perceived in the study of history and of languages, and in education in general. The chapter will close with a discussion of Jefferson’s approach to the acquisition of knowledge, influenced as it was by natural history and the utility-based systems of classification employed in that field, systems he would later apply to his analysis of Old English grammar.

*The Republic of the Wise: the Uses and Methods of Scholarship*

To Thomas Jefferson, then, scholarship was not merely an ivory tower pursuit. Science was a means to the betterment of the human condition, and even the study of ancient languages could be made to serve a higher purpose than mere antiquarianism.
This is not to say that Jefferson insisted that all philosophy serve utilitarian ends; however, Jefferson’s own interests most often focused on subjects with clear practical applications, and he frequently expressed his disdain for “mere” theory. His fascination with new inventions certainly reflects this attitude. Jefferson eagerly collected new devices and employed them in his daily life, as any modern visitor to Monticello may see, and this fascination bled over from his private to his public life. As President, he proposed a system for dry-docking naval vessels, which he elaborated in a letter to Lewis M. Wiss (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 135-138). In 1807, he investigated Robert Fulton’s torpedoes, though he decided it would be too risky to rely for defense on “an engine not yet sufficiently tried.” In a letter to Fulton, he went on to suggest that torpedoes could usefully be attached to submarines, and a “corps of young men trained to this service” (Bergh and Lipscomb 11 327-28).

Given the importance of invention to Jefferson, inventors, scholars and scientists had in his view an important part to play in society. In a letter to Isaac McPherson, in which he evaluates Oliver Evan’s petition to patent a conveyor system, Jefferson wrote of his “wish to see new inventions encouraged, and old ones brought again to useful notice” (Bergh and Lipscomb 13 326). Although he concludes that Evans should not receive the patent, he takes great pains to emphasize his respect for the inventor, who is “a valuable citizen, of uncommon ingenuity and usefulness” (337). Another of these valuable citizens was David Rittenhouse, whose accomplishments are given as evidence of

---

1 Jefferson’s materialistic approach to knowledge will be discussed below.
2 Dumas Malone also discusses Jefferson’s correspondence during his Presidency on such subjects as kitchen fireplaces, a new type of corn sheller, a “butter refrigeratory,” and his own attempts to acquire a “refracting telescope, suited for both terrestrial and celestial objects” (Jefferson the President, First Term 180).
American genius in the *Notes on Virginia* (a fortiori because he was self-taught, as was Jefferson in many areas) (Peterson Portable 102). 1 Jefferson’s comments to Rittenhouse offer some insight into just how important a contribution “philosophy” had to make to society. For the past two years Rittenhouse had given his time to “civil government,” and, while Jefferson admits that he himself has accepted similar duties, he points out that “there is an order of geniuses above that obligation, and therefore exempted from it. Nobody can conceive that nature ever intended to throw away a Newton upon the occupations of a crown” (Boyd 2 202-203). While Jefferson does not deny the importance of government, he goes on to suggest to Rittenhouse that:

there are in your country many persons equal to the task of conducting government: but you should consider that the world has but one Ryttenhouse [sic], and that it never had one before.... Are those powers, then, which being intended for the erudition of the world, like air and light, the world’s common property, to be taken from their proper pursuit to do the commonplace drudgery of governing a single state, a work which may be executed by men of an ordinary stature, such as are always and every where to be found (203)?

Rittenhouse is discouraged from entering politics because his scientific gifts are so much more important, and not just to the United States, but to the world. Jefferson concludes his letter to Rittenhouse by invoking “the zeal of a true Whig in science” which “must excuse the hazarding of these free thoughts, which flow from a desire of promoting the

---

1 While most citations of Jefferson’s writings will be taken from the standard editions of Boyd and Bergh and Lipscomb, I have made use of Peterson’s edition of the *Notes on the State of Virginia* and Report of the Commissioners for the University of Virginia. Peterson’s work is comparable to Boyd’s (their editions of *A Summary View* are essentially identical), and so I have preferred it to the editions of Bergh and Lipscomb and Washington.
Jefferson was himself a "true Whig in science," and the primary goal of the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" was the dissemination of knowledge, both of Old English and of the materials available in that language.

The utility of science for Jefferson went beyond its service to any single nation. In Jefferson's view, science is advanced by an international brotherhood, united in its pursuit of knowledge despite any political rivalries which may divide the governments of individual scientists. He describes the loss of Rittenhouse the astronomer to politics as detrimental, not only to the United States, but to the world; his gifts, which are "intended for the erudition of the world" are "the world's common property" (Boyd 203). In a letter to John Hollins about the scandal caused by Jefferson's reception of seed from France in the highly charged atmosphere of the embargo of 1807-1809, Jefferson insisted upon the neutrality of science in times of war. Scientific societies, he says, "are always in peace, however their nations may be at war. Like the republic of letters, they form a great fraternity spreading over the whole earth, and their correspondence is never interrupted by any civilized nation" (Bergh and Lipscomb 12 253). Even Jefferson's Anglo-Saxonism involved a plea to this fraternity -- the "Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar" was sent to Sir Herbert Croft, an English scholar in 1798, and the postscript of the final draft of the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" makes a lengthy appeal for cooperation between the United States and England in recovering, distributing and studying Old English texts.

---

1 Robert K. Faulkner's discussion of science and liberty draws upon the influence of the philosophers of the Enlightenment upon Jefferson. Faulkner suggests that, for Jefferson, "enlightened liberty frees people to provide for their basic necessities...it liberates both the energy of the passions and the force of ingenuity" (43).

2 See Chapter 5, below.
At the same time he believed in the international mission of science, Jefferson's own work in the field of natural history carried overtly nationalistic overtones. His interest in paleontology offers a prime example of how his desire to exalt his country colored his research. In the *Notes on the State of Virginia* Jefferson attempts to re-shape European myths about America, with the notion of "pygmyism" in American species suggested by Buffon as his primary target. Jefferson invokes the example of the mammoth to refute Buffon's claims. The mammoth is, in fact, the first animal mentioned in his catalogue of Virginian fauna, and Jefferson immediately points out that, of all animals in America, it "must certainly have been the largest" (Peterson Portable 73). Not only was the mammoth large, but, according to native tradition it was also carnivorous, and still existed in the north of the country. Jefferson disputes the claims of Europeans that the bones of the mammoth were actually those of an extinct American elephant. He points out the differences between the elephant and the mammoth, and goes on to argue against the possibility of the extinction of species. So economical is the power of Nature, he insists, "that no instance can be produced of her having permitted any one race of her animals to become extinct; of her having formed any link in her great work so weak as to be broken" (86).¹ The American mammoth, living or dead (but, Jefferson suggests, probably still thriving), is or had been "the largest of all terrestrial beings. It should have sufficed to have rescued the earth it inhabited...from the imputation of impotence" (77).

In the 1790's Jefferson took up the cause of yet another species, when he delivered a paper to the American Philosophical Society on bones discovered by John Stuart in

---

¹ Pamela Regis points to this passage as evidence of Jefferson's belief in the Great Chain of Being - a concept central to Linnaeus, whose system of classification Jefferson endorsed (93, 13). See below for Jefferson's comments on Linnaeus.
Western Virginia in 1796. Jefferson insisted the great clawed animal was of "the family of lion, tiger, panther, etc., but as preeminent over the lion in size as the mammoth is over the elephant" (Peterson 577). Before presenting this paper, Jefferson came across Cuvier's account of a similar set of remains discovered in Paraguay, published in the *Monthly Magazine*, a more complete skeleton which had been identified as belonging to a giant member of the sloth family (Boyd 14 xxv).¹ Jefferson went ahead with his own paper, only mentioning Cuvier's article in a post-script, and for many years he insisted, not only that the bones discovered by Stuart belonged to a giant carnivore, but that the creature still existed in the wilds of America (Boyd 14, xxxi, Peterson 577-79). This brief portrait of Jefferson the paleontologist is revealing. Despite the fact that Jefferson often insisted that an admission of ignorance was better than accepting an unproven theory, his own convictions often colored his conclusions, even when the bulk of evidence was against him — a trait which he certainly evinced in his approach to Old English. In the case of his paleontology, it is not difficult to understand why he could not easily be dissuaded from the conclusions he drew from the remains of those long-clawed giants: that the largest carnivores in the world had appeared on the American continent certainly proved its vitality.

Clearly, then, Jefferson believed that science was an essential pursuit, and he worked to ensure its growth in the young United States. "I am for encouraging the progress of science in all its branches," he once wrote, "and not for raising a hue and cry

¹ Jefferson's position changed gradually after he had seen José Garriga's *Descripción del esqueletto de un quadrupedo muy corpulento y raro que se conserva en el real gabinete de l'histoire natural de Madrid*, published in Madrid in 1797. An account of this work and plates of the bones discovered appear in Boyd, vol. 14, xxvii-xxxiv, 41-42).
against the sacred name of philosophy” (Bergh and Lipscomb 1078). In the Notes on Virginia, he confessed that, because of the Revolution, it was impossible for him to assess the state of science in Great Britain. However, he was willing to hazard a guess:

The spirit in which she wages war is the only sample before our eyes, and that does not seem the legitimate offspring of either science or of civilization. The sun of her glory is fast descending to the horizon. Her philosophy has crossed the channel, her freedom the Atlantic, and herself seems passing to that awful dissolution, whose issue is not given human foresight to scan (Peterson Portable 103).

In England, the loss of science is linked to a loss of civilization, and the transfer of scientific endeavor to France is parallel to the emigration of freedom to America’s shores, and the result of these desertions is the “awful dissolution” of the nation.

In his public life, Jefferson took an active role in guarding the United States from a similar fate. When serving as President, Jefferson went so far as to extend the domain of government to encompass support for some branches of science. In his Sixth Annual Message to Congress, Jefferson insisted that the sciences were worthy beneficiaries of revenue surpluses, not because private institutions were incapable of supporting ordinary branches of education, but rather because “a public institution can alone supply those sciences which, though rarely called for, are yet necessary to complete the circle, all the parts of which contribute to the improvement of the country, and some of them to its preservation” (Bergh and Lipscomb 3423). When accepting the presidency of the Philosophical Society, he confessed that the only qualification he possessed for the post was “an ardent desire to see knowledge so disseminated through the mass of mankind that it may at last reach the extremes of society, beggars and kings” (Peterson 579-80). This
percolation of knowledge through every level of society was especially crucial in a republic, where the mass of people chose their leaders and lawmakers from amongst themselves. Jefferson was scarcely complacent about the democratic process, and he conceded that “a choice by the people themselves is not generally distinguished for it’s [sic] wisdom” (Boyd 1503). Knowledge offered the solution to the dilemma posed by giving power to a population which might not be capable of exercising it wisely, and so education became, in Jefferson’s scheme of government, the best means, not only of safeguarding the future of the sciences in the United States, but also, and perhaps more importantly, of creating a citizenry capable of self-government.

The Role of Education in the American Republic

Education played a central role in Jefferson’s republican system, and the Old English language was an element in the education he thought essential to the nation’s citizens. The basis of the republic must be its people, and so, Jefferson believed, the people must be adequately prepared to meet that responsibility. He asked in a letter to Samuel Kercheval, “where...is our republicanism to be found? Not in our Constitution certainly, but merely in the spirit of our people. That would oblige even a despot to govern us republicanly” (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 35). Elsewhere, he linked education with the agrarian society he thought most conducive to democracy:

I think our governments will remain virtuous for many centuries; as long as they are chiefly agricultural.... When they get piled upon one another in large cities, as in Europe, they will become corrupt as in Europe. Above all things I hope the

---

1 For a detailed discussion of Jefferson’s educational philosophy, and in particular his belief that “only instruction could complete a revolution,” see Hellenbrand (12).
education of the common people will be attended to; convinced that on their good sense we may rely with the most security for the preservation of a due degree of liberty. (Boyd 12 442)

If the people are to rule, they must be capable of doing so; with proper preparation, their "good sense" may be relied on to guard their own liberty. It is the role of education to cultivate their innate morality and instill them with the awareness of just how precious freedom was, and how quickly a republic could descend into tyranny; in order for their "good sense" to be trusted in, their education must be seen to. In the Report of the Commissioners for the University of Virginia, Jefferson summarized the key benefits of education:

Education generates habits of application, of order, and the love of virtue; and controls, by the force of habit, any innate obliquities in our moral organization. We should be far, too, from the discouraging persuasion that man is fixed, by the law of his nature, at a given point; that his improvement is a chimera, and the hope delusive of rendering ourselves wiser, happier, or better than our forefathers were. As well might it be urged that the wild and uncultivated tree...can never be made to yield better; yet we know that the grafting art implants a new tree on the savage stock, producing what is most estimable both in kind and degree. Education, in like manner, engrafts a new man on the native stock, and improves what in his nature was vicious and perverse into qualities of virtue and social worth (Peterson Portable 335).
Education is the key, not only to the success of any single political system, but also to the continued progress of humanity.¹ This notion of education improving upon nature reflects Jefferson’s somewhat ambiguous feelings about the character of humanity, reflected in a belief in an innate moral sense coupled with an acknowledgement that this sense revealed itself less in some individuals than in others, and some people might lack it completely. Where there was no innate sense for education to polish, it might “engraft” a sort of virtue onto the “native stock.”

Jefferson probably borrowed his belief in an innate moral sense from many sources, particularly, as Gilman Ostrander has argued, from his Scottish instructor at William and Mary College, William Small, and directly from the writings of Lord Kames, passages of which Jefferson copied into his commonplace books (172). However, he was realistic enough to recognize that, on an individual level, people could not always be trusted to listen to their better angels, and, in particular, those in power may be tempted into corruption at any time. In 1814 Jefferson wrote to Thomas Law in response to a treatise on “Instinctive Impulses” which Law had sent him. Accepting the premise that good acts give their performers happiness, Jefferson wonders why they should. Perhaps he suggests, because “nature hath implanted in our breasts a love of others, a sense of duty to them, a moral instinct” (Bergh and Lipscomb 141). In a phrase echoed elsewhere in his writings, he points out that “the Creator would indeed have been a bungling artist, had he

¹ In his linking of education with human progress and republicanism Jefferson echoed what was being written in France by the Marquis de Condorcet. See Elaine McAllister’s comparison of the two, “Condorcet and Jefferson on Education.” Condorcet also, like Jefferson, linked the progress of science with that of humanity; according to Charles Frankel, he set himself the task of determining, as he stated in The Progress of the Human Mind, “by what ties nature has indissolubly united the advancement of knowledge with the progress of liberty, virtue, and respect for the natural rights of man” (146). Jefferson made a similar connection when he related the setting of the “sun” of England’s “glory” with the loss of her philosophy to France and her freedom to the New World (Peterson Portable 103).
intended man for a social animal, without planting in him social dispositions” (143). He admits, though, that “it is true they are not planted in every man, because there is no rule without exceptions.” Where this innate moral instinct is lacking, “we endeavor to supply the defect by education, by appeals to reason and calculation” (143). In the passage already quoted from the Report of the Commissioners for the University of Virginia, Jefferson uses the engrafting metaphor he was so fond of: as a cultivated plant may be grafted to a savage one, resulting in a mingling of the best characteristics of both, so education can improve on the nature of the individual. Moreover, where that sense of virtue exists already, education may serve to strengthen it.

Not only might education supply the want of virtue in the individual, it could also guard society against the fall into tyranny which Jefferson so greatly feared. This is one reason given for general education in his Bill for the General Diffusion of Knowledge, which in 1786 he called “the most important bill in our whole code,” adding that “no other sure foundation can be devised for the preservation of freedom, and happiness” (Boyd 10244). The bill was written as part of the general revision of Virginia’s legal code in which Jefferson took part. Although it was never carried into full effect, Jefferson later included the bill in a listing of works with which he had best served his country (Padover 1289). The very first lines of the Bill state:

Whereas it appeareth that however certain forms of government are better calculated than others to protect individuals in the free exercise of their natural rights, and are at the same time themselves better guarded against degeneracy, yet experience hath shewn, that even under the best forms, those entrusted with power have, in time, and by slow operations, perverted it into tyranny; and it is believed
that the most effectual means of preventing this would be, to illuminate, as far as practicable, the minds of the people at large (Boyd 2 526).

Education, then, in addition to increasing the moral stock of the nation by nourishing the innate virtue of most people and instilling the moral sense in those who lack it, also provides citizens with the power to identify and prevent tyrannous impulses in their leaders. The fear that the American Revolution would careen into dictatorship, as it later would in France, was a real one for Jefferson. He was horrified when members of the Virginia House of Burgesses proposed a war-time dictatorship, with Patrick Henry standing as the most likely Caesar, and he later fought an exhausting battle with Hamilton and his “monarchical” Federalists. Though even the leaders of the Revolution, “men who were Samsons in field and Solomons in the council,” as he wrote in the famous Mazzei letter, might become “heretics” to the ideals of the first days of union, an educated public would serve as a corrective to the faults of their leaders, safe-guarding the republic (Bergh and Lipscomb 12 336). Education would also be necessary to cultivate worthy leaders. Jefferson often wrote of a “natural aristocracy” of gifted people who might be born into any level of society. If the education of the common person was ignored, those geniuses born without the means to pay their own way would be lost to history. Public happiness can be assured only if “those persons, whom nature hath endowed with genius and virtue, should be rendered by liberal education worthy to receive, and able to guard the sacred deposit of the rights and liberties of their fellow citizens” (Boyd 2 527). The call to public service must be made “without regard to wealth, birth or other accidental condition or circumstance [as in an aristocracy of wealth or nobility]” (527). However, in a society
where education is private only, the poor will be barred from its ennobling effects, and so genius must be "sought for and educated at the common expense of all" (527).

What this enlightening education was to consist of is particularly relevant to the present discussion: both history and languages would play important roles in Jefferson's scheme. History was to be one of the cornerstones of republican education. According to the Bill for the More General Diffusion of Knowledge, "the most effectual means" of preventing a slow descent into tyranny would be to "illuminate...the minds of the people at large, and more especially to give them knowledge of those facts, which history exhibiteth" (Boyd 2 526). This "experience of other ages and countries" would enable the people to "know ambition under all its shapes, and prompt them to exert their natural powers to defeat its purposes" (526-27). Though not unique, in 1779 this emphasis on history was far from common, and Jefferson, more than any of the other educational reformers of his day, had both the interest and the influence to introduce its study. Along with history, the ancient languages would be studied as well, to enable the student to truly understand the past through the medium of the languages of the peoples then living, including not only Greek and Latin, but also Anglo-Saxon. It should be remembered that the final version of the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" was designed for the use of the University of Virginia, and its primary goal was make the acquisition of Old English easier for the student, who could then apply the language to the study of the sources of his law, his language and his culture.
The Study of Languages and History

Jefferson’s own education began with the Reverend William Douglas, whom he later evaluated, using as his criterion a knowledge of the ancient languages, as “but a superficial Latinist, less instructed in Greek” (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 147). Though Douglas introduced him to the rudiments of the classical languages, Jefferson mastered these languages only after joining the school of another Reverend, James Maury, who was “a correct classical scholar” (147). The foundation of Jefferson’s learning was, as it would have been for others of his class, firmly rooted in Latin and Greek. “I thank on my knees, Him who directed my early education, for having put into my possession this rich source of delight,” he would write later in life, “and I would not exchange it for anything which I could have acquired, and have not since acquired” (147). After grammar school, Jefferson enrolled in the College of William and Mary, which had been founded in 1693 with the dual purpose of turning planters’ sons into ministers for the Church of England and converting the Natives. Though enrolled in a sectarian school, Jefferson quickly attached himself to the only non-clergyman on the William and Mary faculty, Dr. William Small. Small, a graduate of Aberdeen university, introduced Jefferson not only to science but probably to the common sense philosophy expounded by Lord Kames as well (Peterson 12, Ostrander 172). As a member of Small’s circle, which included life-long mentor George Wythe, Jefferson took control of his own education, finding in books the science and philosophy of Europe. It was Wythe who not only introduced him to law, but who also “extended his lines to the ancient world” (Peterson 15).

So, in the classical languages, Jefferson was trained early. However, in the field of history Jefferson was his own teacher, as was almost inevitable in pre-Revolutionary
colonial America. In 1760, when Jefferson entered the College of William and Mary, history had been introduced as a subject in only two colonial colleges. King’s College in New York, in 1754, had begun offering geography and history, placing them, in the published plan for study, among “‘Things useful for the Comfort, Convenience, and Elegance of life,’” and in 1756 the College of Philadelphia, under Franklin’s direction, offered first-year students an “‘Introduction to civil history,’” and introduced smatterings of ancient history throughout the course of study (Wiesen 58). At William and Mary, Jefferson was left to discover history on his own, a discovery which began in conjunction with his preparation for the legal profession. Jefferson began delving into Coke’s *Institutes of the Laws of England* in 1762 (Malone I 70). In Coke he would have been exposed to the common law tradition of an ancient English constitution, an important source of the Anglo-Saxon myth upon which was grounded so much of Jefferson’s historical perspective. Coke inspired him to pursue the history of English law before the Magna Carta, and his commonplace books are filled with notes on the subject from a range of authors (these notes are discussed in detail in Chapter 4). It was also during this time that Jefferson first purchased David Hume’s *History of England*, which he initially read with great enthusiasm, though, as I shall discuss below, he would later rage against the book’s “Tory” perspective on history (Wilson “Jefferson Vs. Hume” 49).

Throughout his life, Jefferson would place great emphasis on the study of history, and the acquisition of Greek and Latin as a means to that end. The study of Greek and Latin was a subject of some controversy in the young United States, but had nevertheless been an important part of education since colonial times. Certainly, the study of both languages played a role in the traditional classical curriculum of sectarian schools such as
Harvard, Yale and William and Mary (Wiesen 56). However, Greek and Roman authors were not read with the intent of studying classical history. Although English Puritans, influenced by Bacon, had begun introducing the study of history as a means of shaping prudent, effective leaders, the Puritans of the New World were less receptive to the idea; the Harvard curriculum of 1643, as described in New England’s First Fruits, limited the study of history to Saturday afternoons after 1:00 PM, and that only during the winter (Wiesen 55). Nevertheless, if the Harvard library is any indication, ancient history was studied by many Harvard students in their free time: from the mid-to-late eighteenth century the library purchased a number of histories written in the vernacular (55). These “short-cuts” to classical history probably provided most colonials of the revolutionary period with their knowledge of antiquity (55).

The increasing popularity of history was accompanied by a reaction against the study of Greek and Latin. Wiesen suggests that “the contrast between a rebellion against the ancient tongues and a rising interest in ancient history suggests that literate Americans were neglecting the heavily linguistic approach to antiquity fostered in schools and colleges and turning instead to the more immediate, direct, and “democratic” method of learning the lessons taught by the classical world through translations, popularizations and handbooks” (55-56). Benjamin Franklin, who had incorporated history in the plan of study for the College of Philadelphia, was also “the chief partisan of a specifically American approach to antiquity” (59). Franklin once compared the learning of ancient tongues to a Chapeau bras, a purely decorative hat carried by the genteel classes but never worn, lest it disorder their elaborately arranged and powdered hair (59-60). By freeing history from the encumbrances of the classical tongues which once had to be
mastered for its study, Franklin opened the way for a wider audience to benefit from its lessons (60-61). Benjamin Rush, himself educated in Latin and Greek, considered the study of these languages to be unrepentant, since "it is only by rendering knowledge universal, that a republican form of government can be preserved in our country. . . . It is likewise one of the greatest obstructions that has ever been thrown in the way of propagating useful knowledge" (61). Although the study of the languages of the Greek and Romans may have been a barrier to general education, the study of their histories was essential: "It is absolutely necessary that a boy should first be instructed in history and geography" (61). Then, once the student recognizes the value of texts written in classical languages, the study of Greek and Latin becomes both interesting and useful. "The classics," Rush complained, "are now read only for the sake of acquiring a knowledge of the construction of the languages in which they were written; but by the plan I have proposed, they would be read for the sake of the matter they contained" (61). The classics themselves are a source of knowledge, and the study of language only a means to attaining that knowledge. Later in life Rush disavowed the study of language for even this purpose, writing that "all [Greek and Roman books] that are good for anything are translated into modern languages," making the learning of Greek and Latin irrelevant; when he later rejected history's didactic powers completely, the study of the classics in any form became useless (62).

At first glance, one might think Jefferson would agree with his friend in this as in so many other things; after all, Jefferson preferred knowledge with clear utility, exactly the criterion which Rush is here using to condemn the study of language and, in the end, history. Jefferson even wrote in the Notes on Virginia, "I do not pretend that language is
science. It is only an instrument for the attainment of science” (Peterson Portable 197). However, language was, for Jefferson, an important instrument. Jefferson took a personal interest in the study of languages and thought their acquisition, and the reading of classical texts in the original, to be of continued importance, even when vernacular editions of classical authors became widely available. When Jefferson heard that the study of Greek and Latin was out of favor in Europe, he acknowledged that he did not know “what their manners and occupations may call for,” but insisted nevertheless that “it would be ill-judged” for Americans “to follow their example in this instance” (Peterson Portable 197). For the learning of history, Jefferson’s advice to Peter Carr and his own syllabus for the study of law insisted that the classical authors be read in their original (Boyd 8 407). Greek and Roman authors could also serve as models for eloquence, as Jefferson wrote to Joseph Priestly:

I think the Greeks and Romans have left us the present models which exist of fine composition, whether we examine them as works of reason, or of style and fancy; and to them we probably owe these characteristics of modern composition. I know of no composition of any other ancient people, which merits the least regard as a model for its matter or style (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 146).

Despite his insistence on their usefulness as models and examples, Jefferson’s own interest in Greek and Latin and the authors who wrote in them was not always strictly utilitarian. He wrote about points of Greek and Latin grammar, pronunciation and versification (see Foley 473–474), and, while admitting that “to read the Latin and Greek authors in their original, is a sublime luxury,” he suggested that “luxury in science [is] at least as justifiable
as in architecture, painting, gardening, or the other arts" (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 146-47).

Perhaps his definitive statement on the utility of learning Greek and Latin was made in a letter to John Brazier in 1819. “To whom are [the classical languages] useful?” Jefferson asks:

Certainly not to all men. There are conditions of life to which they must be forever estranged.... [However] To the moralist they are valuable, because they furnish ethical writings highly and justly esteemed: although in my own opinion, the moderns are far advanced beyond them in this line of science, the divine finds in the Greek language a translation of his primary code, of more importance to him than the original because better understood; and, in the same language, the newer code, with the doctrines of the earliest fathers.... The lawyer finds in the Latin language the system of civil law most conformable with the principles of justice of any which has ever yet been established among men, and from which much as been incorporated into our own. The physician as good a code of his art as has been given us to this day.... The statesman will find in these languages history, politics, mathematics, ethics, eloquence, love of country, to which he must add the sciences of his own day, for which of them should be unknown to him? And all the sciences must recur to the classical languages for the etymon, and sound understanding of their fundamental terms.... To sum the whole, it may truly be said that the classical languages are a solid basis for most, and an ornament to all the sciences (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 209-11).
Far from rejecting the study of Greek and Latin, Jefferson thus sees both languages as serving broad utilitarian purposes – he follows his statement that their study is not important “to all men” with a list of those who would benefit from it which embraces nearly every branch of science. Moreover, while admitting that to the merchant and the mechanic “the languages are but ornament and comfort,” he still sees this ornament as valuable (more than merely a *Chapeau bras*), and brags elsewhere that American farmers are the only ones who can read Homer (Padover 1088; Boyd 11 44).

One of the primary purposes for learning ancient languages in Jefferson’s opinion is the study of history, and that subject too held utilitarian value for him. A progressive in many areas, Jefferson insisted that each generation had the right to determine its own laws, even to write its own constitution. Nevertheless, he was himself a student of history, and for a young republic determined to do what, in Jefferson’s opinion, had not been successfully done before – create a nation ruled by the laws of nature and of reason – the examples of the past were, nevertheless, not to be ignored. In the Report of the Commissioners of the University of Virginia, the subject of history is “interwoven with Politics and Law” (Peterson Portable 338). In the *Notes on Virginia*, Jefferson describes the benefits which a study of history might offer the common citizen:

> History by apprising them of the past will enable them to judge of the future; it will avail them of the experience of other times and other nations; it will qualify them as judges of the actions and designs of men; it will enable them to know ambition under every disguise it may assume; and knowing it, to defeat its views (Peterson Portable 198).
Jefferson's educational system, as outlined in the Bill for the More General Diffusion of Knowledge, included the study of Greek and Roman history at the level of the “hundreds” schools (a term drawn from Anglo-Saxon sources) (Boyd 2528). As the entry point to the educational system, to be attended by every citizen, the hundreds schools were where “the principal foundations of future order” would be laid: those foundations were to be built upon the study of history (Peterson Portable 197). Even the books used to instruct students in language should also serve to “make them acquainted with Graecian, Roman, English and American history” (Padover 1049). At the most elementary level, then, the study of language is subordinate to the study of history; formal training in Greek and Latin are not introduced until grammar school. Unlike Franklin and Rush, Jefferson would not have history completely sundered from the languages in which the original historians wrote. For those destined by “the wealth of their parents or the adoption of the state” to higher degrees of education, the next several years would be given over to the learning of languages, because the young students’ “memory is then most susceptible...and the learning of languages being chiefly a work of memory, it seems precisely fitted to the powers of this period” (Peterson Portable 197). However, the attainment of language is still not separated from other pursuits. In addition to “providing tools for future operation,” the books used to teach Greek and Latin “may be such as will at the same time impress their minds with useful facts and good principles” (Peterson Portable 198).

Jefferson did not turn to the examples of history in order to discover models to be followed in his own time. He once wrote that “History, in general, only informs us what bad government is” (Bergh and Lipscomb 11 223). For example, while Jefferson may have respected Roman law, he was less enthusiastic about the history of the Roman
Republic. Jefferson's account in the *Notes on Virginia* of the 1776 move by the Virginia House of Burgesses to create a war-time dictator reveals the sort of model he thought Rome had provided his own colony. Jefferson was appalled that the delegates felt they had the right to surrender their power to a single representative, and asks: "In God's name, from whence have they derived this power?" He goes on to deny that the "ancient constitution" of England provided precedent. His fellow Virginians had, in fact:

been seduced in their judgement by the example of an ancient republic, whose constitution and circumstances were fundamentally different. They had sought this precedent in the history of Rome, where alone it was to be found, and where at length too it had proved fatal. They had taken it from a republic, rent by the most bitter factions and tumults, where the government was of a heavy-handed unfeeling aristocracy, over a people ferocious, and rendered desperate by poverty and wretchedness; tumults which could not be allayed under the most trying circumstances, but by the omnipotent hand of a single despot.... They misapplied this precedent to a people, mild in their dispositions, patient under their trial, united for the public liberty, and affectionate to their leaders (Peterson Portable 172).

For the Romans, the creation of a despot was probably the only means of restoring order, although the perpetuation of the dictatorship resulted from the influence of repeated "examples" rather than from need, and in the end "proved fatal" to Rome. However, Jefferson's view of the past included a belief in its otherness; the colonists were fundamentally different from their Roman antecedents, just as their government was different from that of Rome. So, while Roman law may have the "most conformable with
the principles of justice," it best applied to a people described here as "ferocious" and "desperate," quite different from the "mild," "patient" and "united" Colonists. Applying the example of an ancient republic was inappropriate in their very different circumstances.

The ancient democracy of Greece, like the Roman Republic, also offers a cautionary example to the new nation. When recounting the story of the formation of the Federal government in the Anas, Jefferson states that, in its earliest days, the union of the States had been created by the Articles of Confederation for the sole purpose of opposing Great Britain. Once this had been accomplished, "that bond was to expire of itself, and each State to become sovereign and independent in all things." Jefferson, however, advocate of the rights of the individual states though he was, was also a believer in their union, and only in the most extreme circumstances did he invoke the possibility of secession. Greece, the birthplace of democratic ideas, provided evidence of the dangers of too much autonomy among a confederation of democratic states. Were all the powers of government to devolve on the colonies at the close of the war, "these separate independencies, like the petty States of Greece, would be eternally at war with each other" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1 266-67).

Jefferson found it more difficult to sever all historical ties with England, and to the end of his life English history continued to be a very important element in his political thinking, as is witnessed by his ever more vociferous condemnations of David Hume’s History of England. In the same passage quoted in part above, that "history, in general, only informs us what bad government is," Jefferson qualifies this statement by suggesting that, "as we have employed some of the best materials of the British constitution in the construction of our own government, a knowledge of British history becomes useful to the
American politician” (Bergh and Lipscomb 11 223). In a letter to William Duane, which also contains an attack on Hume, he acknowledged that English history was, in fact, a part of that of the United States: “Our laws, language, religion, politics and manners are so deeply laid in English foundations, that we shall never cease to consider their history as part of ours, and to study ours in that as its origin” (Bergh and Lipscomb 12 405).

Exactly what could be gained from the history of the Anglo-Saxons will be discussed below. For now, suffice it to say that Jefferson did not believe his generation struggled for and won a restitution of the Anglo-Saxon system; rather, they fought to achieve what their ancestors had by building a free society founded on natural law. Though the Anglo-Saxon example may have come closer to his ideal than had those of Rome and Greece, it was not a model to be imitated.\(^1\) Rather, the legacy of the Anglo-Saxons offered the citizens of the new republic a source of inspiration and evidence that they could succeed in their experiment; the Saxons, like they themselves, had emigrated from their native country and established a new society, one based on natural right – as Charles A. Miller has put it, “the past served only to confirm, not to challenge, the lessons of nature”(5). As Greek and Latin served as the conduit for an understanding of the history of the ancients, so a knowledge of Old English would open the door to understanding the foundations of English history, and, as with Greek and Latin, the study of the language would also involve the study of its speakers, since, from Old English texts, students would “imbibe with the language their free principles of government” (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 51).

Jefferson’s desire to simplify the language of the Anglo-Saxons is, however, a crucial first

\(^1\) That is not to say that the Anglo-Saxons had not set precedents to which Jefferson appealed; he believed, after all, that they had given form to the common law upon which much of the legal system of the United
step in disseminating it; he himself admitted that, in the form given it by Hickes and Thwaites, "it's difficulties go beyond it's worth, and render a knolege [sic] of it no longer a compensation for the time and labor it's acquisition will require" ("Essay" 67).

Simplification serves the pedagogical purpose of easing the language's acquisition, but, more importantly, it serves as an encouragement to its study — and through it, the study of the history of the Anglo-Saxons. Jefferson saw no contradiction between a belief in the usefulness of history and his faith in the perpetual improvability of individuals and societies, a notion of progress expressed as well in his belief that each generation had a right to freedom from the weight of past generations.

In order to understand Jefferson's complex relationship with the past, the preceding discussion of the importance of history must be coupled with an exploration of the belief, first expressed when Jefferson was serving in France, that "the earth belongs in usufruct to the living" (Boyd 15 392).

**The Past Cannot Bind Us**

Although Jefferson freely drew examples, good and bad, from the past, he believed that an appeal to history held no more strength than an appeal to any other sort of example; precedent could not alone bind the current generation to a course of action.

Jefferson outlines this concept in some detail in a letter to James Madison, written from Paris in 1789, where he was surrounded by a people wrestling with issues perhaps even more complex than those he and his fellow colonists had faced in the days before their revolution (late in life Jefferson acknowledged the advantage offered the United States by

---

States continued to rely. See the discussion of the Bill to Proportion Crimes and Punishments for evidence of how he made use of Anglo-Saxon legal precedent.
beginning with “an album on which we were free to write what we pleased” (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 44)). The Parisians were struggling to establish in France the liberties that they had come to believe were their natural right. In the early stages of the struggle, Jefferson believed that France should settle for a constitution more like that of England than that of the United States, and suggested as much to friends such as Lafayette; a country, he believed, could not move from absolutism to complete freedom in a single step. By the time of his letter to Madison, Jefferson’s own position seems to have radicalized, and when, after a series of fumbles by the King and the aristocracy, the National Assembly abolished feudal rank privileges and produced the Declaration of the Rights of Man and Citizen, Jefferson approved, even where the French constitution differed from the forms of government he himself endorsed in such documents as the Draft Constitution for the State of Virginia. Jefferson’s letter to Madison, only one of two written during an illness that lasted from September 1 to 9, may have been inspired by his physician, Dr. Richard Gem, who was a firm believer in the ideas Jefferson proposed (Boyd 15 384-87). The proposition that generations, like individuals, had natural rights, and the mathematics by which these rights should be applied, are among Jefferson’s most radical ideas. The extremes of Parisian society probably increased the appeal of the idea to Jefferson, as did the extended discussion over the form which the French government was to take, in which Jefferson played a part (Peterson 379-385).

Jefferson himself was aware of how radical his ideas were; in the letter to Madison, he writes that “the question Whether [sic] one generation of men has the right to bind

1 That Jefferson recognized Gem’s role as a thinker in pre-Revolutionary France is shown by his belief that Gem influenced Condorcet’s *Declaration des droits, traduite de l’anglois, avec l’original a coté* (Boyd 15 386-87).
another, seems never to have been started on this or our side of the water” (Boyd 15 392). It was, nevertheless, “a question of such consequences as not only to merit decision, but place also, among the fundamental principles of every government” (392). Jefferson’s proposition: “I set out on this ground, which I suppose to be self evident, ‘that the earth belongs in usufruct to the living’: that the dead have neither powers nor rights over it” (392). For example, conventions which allow lands to change hands after the death of their occupant exist, but the inheritors take the land, “not by any natural right, but by a law of the society of which they are members, and to which they are subject” (393). By the same token, a member of one generation cannot oblige his successors to accept responsibility for his debts, “for if he could, he might, during his own life, eat up the usufruct of the lands for several generations to come” (393). In typical Jeffersonian fashion, an elaborate formula was worked out for exactly how long a debt may be contracted by one generation (19 years, as it turns out) (394). Although the example with which Jefferson elucidates this formula uses the kings of France, his own fiscal policies often reflected this fear of building the national debt and a commitment to retiring state debt as quickly as possible (Malone Jefferson the President. First Term 100-106).

So, just as the inheritance of land is a societal convention rather than a natural right, so the practice of requiring the inheritor to pay the debts of his ancestor is “municipal only, not moral.” However, “between society and society, or generation and generation, there is no municipal obligation, no umpire but the law of nature.” By natural law, “one generation is to another as one independent nation to another” (395).

---

1 Daniel Scott Smith has explored Jefferson’s “Demography of Generations” in depth; his discussion includes an examination of how Jefferson arrived at this figure and assesses Jefferson’s theory.
This separation between generations also prevents the living from creating an eternal form of government: "no society," Jefferson insists, "can make a perpetual constitution, or even a perpetual law. The earth belongs always to the living generation" (395-96). Laws and constitutions, like debts, must be "extinguished in their natural course with those who gave them being," that is, after 19 years (396). This is radical thinking from a lawyer trained in the common law, who had used the Anglo-Saxon example in his famous appeal to the King for colonial rights, and whose own nation had only recently drafted its constitution. As he closes his letter to Madison, Jefferson suggests introducing a limit of 19 years to the new copyright and patent laws, a change which could be made easily and so would serve two important purposes: first, it would familiarize lawmakers with the practice and so make its application elsewhere easier. It would also provide:

an instance the more of our taking reason for our guide, instead of English precedent, the habit of which fetters us with all the political heresies of a nation equally remarkable for it’s early excitement from some errors, and its long slumbering under others (397).

The point Jefferson makes here is an important one to the present study. Although he does not single out the Anglo-Saxon period in this passage – in fact, he may not mean to include it at all in his generalization of "English precedent" – he has elsewhere made reference to the "semi-barbarous ancestry" of the English (Bergh and Lipscomb 1644). In an 1800 letter to Joseph Priestly he goes so far as to describe the idea that the Americans must "recur to the annals of our ancestors for what is most perfect in government, in religion and in learning" as a "Gothic" trait, a comment clearly directed at the pro-English elements in the U.S. government (Bergh and Lipscomb 10148).
Jefferson's choice of words highlights the complexity of his position: while the "Gothic" freedoms of the Anglo-Saxons played an important role in his political imagination, slavishly following the examples of the past is described as a "Gothic" trait. "We might as well require a man to wear still the coat which fitted him when a boy," he wrote to Samuel Kercheval in 1816, nearly 27 years after his return from France, "as civilized society to remain ever under the regimen of their barbarous ancestors" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1541).

Clearly, as important as the Anglo-Saxons were to Jefferson's sense of national identity, he did not think the United States should be bound to their constitution or laws, should be committed to following the English example in all things. The key words here are "bound" and "committed": in the *Summary View of the Rights of British America*, Jefferson wrote that the English colonists in the New World "thought it proper to adopt that system of laws under which they had hitherto lived in the mother country" (Boyd 1122). So English law did form the foundation of the law of the United States, and Jefferson himself appealed to English precedent in such documents as the Bill for Proportioning Crimes and Punishments. However, the first English colonists in the Americas had chosen to submit to those laws; Jefferson, like many of his contemporaries, saw in the Anglo-Saxon example the right to adapt their laws to suit their environment, to reject what did not work, to add or create what was necessary to them.¹ Nor does Jefferson claim this right only for himself and his generation. In the letter to Kercheval just cited Jefferson summarizes many of his ideas on the organization of civil government, including his fear of "perpetual debt" and his belief that constitutions should be regularly changed. This includes the constitution drafted by the founders of the United States, and

¹ See Chapter 3.
just as Jefferson had spoken out against a blind following of the examples of history, he warns the successors of his own generation against an exaggerated esteem for him and his contemporaries:

Some men look at constitutions with sanctimonious reverence, and deem them like the ark of the covenant, too sacred to be touched. They ascribe to the men of the preceding age a wisdom more than human, and suppose what they did to be beyond amendment. I knew that age well; I belonged to it, and labored with it. It deserved well of its country. It was very like the present, but without the experience of the present; and forty years of experience in government is worth a century of book-reading; and this they would say themselves, were they to rise from the dead (40).

Jefferson, speaking as the representative of his own generation, points the way forward for those who follow it, calling for an imitation of the act of creation performed by him and his contemporaries, rather than for a blind following of the precedents they have established. Jefferson’s insistence that “each generation is independent of the one preceding, as that was of all which had gone before” establishes the radical act of creation occurring in the United States and France as precedents, not only for contemporary monarchies, but also for succeeding generations of those countries. This theory of the perpetual recreation of society is not, then, only a rationale for his own actions and those of his contemporaries; it is a natural, and therefore a universal right. “The Creator has made the earth for the living, not the dead” (Bergh and Lipscomb 1648). The past cannot bind the present, it can only instruct it; however, that is not to say, as we have seen, that the goal of instruction is unimportant. The study of the Anglo-Saxon language and society had a role
to play in Jefferson's republic, even if he did not think the practices of that people should be recurred to as a utopian example to be followed in the present.

**The Uses of Language and Language Reform**

For Jefferson, the utility of the study of languages went beyond their usefulness as a means of acquiring what had been created or recorded by ancient authors. Modern languages had their uses as well. French was useful as "the language of general intercourse among nations, and as a depository of human science" (Peterson Portable 341). Spanish was "highly interesting" as the language of much of the Americas and of many of the earliest histories of the New World (341). Italian "abounds with works of very superior order, valuable for their matter, and still more distinguished as models of the finest taste in style and composition" (341) The study of German was important for two reasons. Firstly, the German nation stood "in a line" with "the most learned nations in richness of erudition and advance in the sciences" (341). In addition, German was interesting for its relation to English, both branches of "the same original Gothic stock" (341). The Native languages, though not part of Jefferson's scheme of national education, were also an area of interest, largely because Jefferson hoped to find linguistic evidence of an Asian origin for the American aborigines, or, preferably, an American origin for the natives of Eastern Asia (Peterson Portable 142).

On the subject of the modern form of his own language, Jefferson expressed a distaste for the study of grammar, insisting in a letter to the grammarian John Waldo that "the scanty foundation, laid in at school, has carried me through a life of much hasty writing, more indebted for style to reading and memory, than to rules of grammar" (Bergh
and Lipscomb 13 339). He did discuss English prosody at length, arguing that English versification was based on accent rather than on syllabic length, as in Greek and Latin verse. Interestingly, Jefferson had originally supported the claim of syllabic length, and was only “converted” to the side of accent during the writing of the essay; in a sense, he had committed the same error he attributed to Old English grammarians by initially viewing English prosody through the lens of his classical training (Padover 832). As a young man Jefferson even endorsed the reading of novels in English. He wrote to Robert Skipwith in 1771 that “the entertainments of fiction are useful as well as pleasant,” despite what a “reverend sage” might say, who believes that “nothing can be useful but the learned lumber of Greek and Roman reading with which his head is stored” (Boyd 1 76). ¹ In fact, in his letter to Skipwith, Jefferson suggests that fiction may actually be more useful than history, since “of those recorded by historians few incidents have been attended with such circumstances as to excite in any high degree [the] sympathetic emotion of virtue” inspired by the travails of fictional characters (77).

As might be expected, however, Jefferson’s interest in Modern English focused on a more useful area of endeavor: Jefferson frequently addressed the issue of the reform of English, particularly in the areas of simplifying expression and expanding the breadth of the language by means of a “judicious spirit of neology” ((Bergh and Lipscomb 16 134). “Judicious” is a key word here, since Jefferson, here as elsewhere, was opposed to innovation for its own sake. When arguing against innovation in systems of natural

---

¹ It is intriguing to note that a novel (Charles Brackden Brown’s Wieland) appeared in 1798 (the same year Jefferson most likely wrote the “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar,” as well as the Kentucky Resolutions) which was very much concerned with the power of language and with the Saxon origins of its protagonist. Brown even sent a copy to Jefferson. See Looby, 145-158.
classification, he criticized developers of new systems for rejecting “the improvements of twenty centuries,” adding that they “co-operate with the neologists in rendering the science of one generation useless to the next by perpetual changes of its language” (Padover 1020). What is being criticized here is not the introduction of new words, but rather their unnecessary introduction, particularly when it will lead to confusion and potential miscommunication within the international fraternity of scientists – the primary purpose of classification systems, as will be discussed below, being to aid communication.

If neology is used as a means of enriching the language, then Jefferson’s attitude more closely suits his belief in progress. He wrote his confession of faith in neology to John Adams in 1820:

I am a friend to neology. It is the only way to give to a language copiousness and euphony. Without it we should still be held to the vocabulary of Alfred or of Ulphilas; and held to their state of science also: for I am sure they had no words which could have conveyed the ideas of Oxigen [sic], cotyledons, zoophytes, magnetism, electricity, hyaline, and thousands of others expressing ideas not then existing, nor of possible communication in the state of their language. What a language has the French become since the date of their revolution, by the free introduction of new words! The most copious and eloquent in the living world; and equal to the Greek, had not that been regularly modifiable almost ad infinitum (Cappon 2 567).

Although Jefferson’s statements to Dr. Manners on natural classification condemned the unnecessary coining of new scientific terms, it is clear that the ability to create new words was a powerful tool, and necessary to the expansion of science. French, enriched by
additions since the revolution, lacks only Greek’s modifiability to make it the equal of that classical language. Jefferson had been exposed to French neologism in depth when translating Destutt de Tracy’s Political Economy. In a letter to publisher Joseph Milligan, Jefferson suggests that “the horrors of Neologism, which startle the purist” gave him no alarm, because “where brevity, perspicuity, and even euphony can be promoted by the introduction of a new word, it is an improvement to the language” (Bergh and Lipscomb 14463).

In this capability for modification, Jefferson argued that English had the potential of matching and even surpassing Greek, despite the limitations of the “vocabulary of Alfred or of Ulphilas.” The language might be made much more flexible and powerful if English speakers were allowed to take advantage of the diversity of roots available to them, “which, native and adopted, are perhaps more numerous, and its idiomatric terminations more various than of the Greek” (Bergh and Lipscomb 13341). Jefferson’s neology goes beyond borrowing from other languages: he proposed an opening up of the language to new combinations drawn from roots, prefixes and suffices borrowed from Greek and Latin, coupled with a return to the Anglo-Saxon practice of creating new words by combining English roots.¹ When arguing for the richness of the Anglo-Saxon language in his “Essay,” Jefferson attributes that copiousness to “the latitude it allowed of combining primitive words so as to produce any modification of idea desired” (55). In this it was the equal of Greek, though the latter offered more proof of the ability because of “the actual books [the Greeks] have left us in the various branches of history, geography, religion, law, and poetry” (55). In an 1825 letter to Evelyn Denison, in which Jefferson

¹ See, for example, his letter to Waldo (Bergh and Lipscomb 13342-44).
outlines many of the key points he had made in his “Essay,” Jefferson again linked a greater understanding of Old English with the publication of “the present county dialects of England,” both of which would restore the roots of English words; along with these, he recommended “a judicious neology” and praised the “beautiful engraftments” borrowed from Latin and Greek (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 130-34). “A language cannot be too rich,” he concluded (134). Though he praised French for its copiousness, which stemmed in large part from an openness to neology in post-revolutionary France, he suggested that English “is founded on a broader base, native and adopted, and capable, with the like freedom of employing its materials, of becoming superior to that in copiousness and euphony” (Bergh and Lipscomb 13 345).

This openness to new words reflects not only a desire to strengthen his native tongue, but also a democratic approach to the evolution of language. In his letter to Waldo he expresses his approbation of the grammarian’s appeal to usage as the “arbiter of language,” accepting “that as giving law to grammar, and not grammar to usage” (Bergh and Lipscomb 13 339). To Adams he wrote that:

Dictionaries are but the depositories of words already legitimated by usage. Society is the workshop in which new ones are elaborated. When an individual uses a new word, if illformed it is rejected in society, if wellformed, adopted, and, after due time, laid up in the depository of dictionaries. And if, in this process of sound neologisation, our transatlantic brethren shall not choose to accompany us, we may furnish, after the Ionians, a second example of a colonial dialect improving on it’s primitive (Cappon 2 567).
It is the people, then, who determine the growth of a language. It almost seems that their innate moral sense is complemented by an innate philological sense, since their choice is not seen here as being arbitrary: if a word is “well formed,” it will survive society’s evaluation; if “ill formed,” it will be rejected. The end of this passage is reminiscent of the statement from Notes on Virginia already cited above, in which the “sun of [England’s] glory” is said to be setting, in large part because “her philosophy has crossed the channel, her freedom the Atlantic” (Peterson Portable 103). The anti-progressive sentiments on which England’s decline is blamed surface again here; should the parent of English speaking-nations resist the invigorating power of neologisms, then American English would surpass that of England. The comparison to Greece is especially telling when juxtaposed with Jefferson’s insistence that the mutability of English is comparable to that of Greek. Pursuing neology would offer the former colonies yet another opportunity to vindicate their break from Europe and demonstrate the strength of the new nation they had formed.

In addition to encouraging a liberal approach to the expansion of English, Jefferson endorsed a flexible approach to expression based on simplification. The rules of grammarians, he believed, should not be allowed too great an influence on a writer’s style. In his letter to Waldo, Jefferson wrote that “purists” threatened to “destroy all strength and beauty of style, by subjecting it to a rigorous compliance with their rules” (Bergh and Lipscomb 13 339). In a letter to Edward Everett, written in 1823, Jefferson expressed a similar sentiment:

[I am not] a friend to a scrupulous purism of style. I readily sacrifice the niceties of syntax to euphony and strength. It is by boldly neglecting the rigorisms of
grammar, that Tacitus has made himself the strongest writer in the world. The Hyperesthetics call him barbarous; but I should be sorry to exchange his barbarisms for their wire-drawn purisms. Some of his sentences are as strong as language can make them. Had he scrupulously filled up the whole of their syntax, they would have been merely common (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 414-415).

It is the ability to judiciously violate syntactical rules which gives Tacitus his strength; by merely writing correctly, he would be no more than "common." The choice of Tacitus, whose Germania laid the foundations for the Anglo-Saxon myth, is interesting, as is Jefferson’s defense against his alleged barbarism – Jefferson is conscious, after all, of his own descent from "semi-barbarous ancestors" (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 44). The example which Jefferson uses to support the point made in this passage is not from Tacitus’s Latin, but from his own English: he chooses a motto attributed to one of the regicides of Charles I, a phrase which Franklin had suggested for the national Seal, a suggestion of which Jefferson approved: "Rebellion to tyrants is obedience to God" (Kellsall 365). Jefferson presents a "corrected" version: "Rebellion against tyrants is obedience to God," and insists that the revised version "has lost all the strength and beauty of the antithesis" (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 415).

That Jefferson was consciously introducing stylistic reform into colonial discourse is evinced in the letter he wrote to George Wythe to accompany his Bill for Proportioning Crimes and Punishments: "In style I have aimed for accuracy, brevity and simplicity, preserving, however, the very words of the established law, wherever their meaning had been sanctioned by judicial decisions, or rendered technical by usage." Here Jefferson expresses the "judicious" approach to reform; while striving for brevity, he accepts the
need to retain expressions rendered necessary by that ultimate arbiter, usage. Despite these expressions, Jefferson was conscious of just how much his style broke with contemporary practice: “couched in the modern statutory language” the Bill “would have spread itself over many pages, and been unintelligible to those whom it most concerns.” Simplicity, then has the democratizing effect of making law accessible outside the community of lawyers. In an interesting parallel to Jefferson’s wish to restore the flexibility of the Anglo-Saxon root system to modern neologists, he claims that the reformed style he employs in the Bill is a similar restoration. In writing it, he “wished to exhibit a sample of reformation in the barbarous style into which modern statutes have degenerated from their ancient simplicity” (Padover 91).

**Jefferson and the Theory of Language**

So far, the discussion has focused on the practical uses to which the study of languages and history might be put and the means by which the English language might be rendered more useful through neology and stylistic reform. Jefferson’s efforts on behalf of expression in the modern form of the English language will be taken up again in the next chapter, which will discuss the power of language in the young republic: his interest in neology, stylistic reform and the invigorating power of a return to the flexibility and power of Old English are all closely bound up with the crucial importance of language to the day-to-day working of a democratic society and with more intangible associations of the English language with the spirit of democracy. However, for many of Jefferson’s contemporaries language served a far greater purpose than merely enabling the communication and transmission of ideas: for 18th century philosophers in England and
France, language had come to play a central role in human cognition. It remains to be explored whether or not Jefferson subscribed to a unified theory of language, and whether that theory might shed additional light on the importance of language to him. Jefferson was certainly exposed to the key figures in 18th and early 19th century language theory: he had read and been heavily influenced by Locke, and knew and corresponded with Etienne Bonnot de Condillac, Destutt de Tracy and Constantin François de Volney (Andresen 15). Furthermore, some of the interests outlined above – particularly his support for neology, reflect an awareness of the on-going debate between linguistic purists and liberals in Europe, particularly in France. However, the discussion of language in England and France went far beyond this debate, and as important as language was to Jefferson, the possible influence of European linguistic thought upon his own must be examined.

In *The Order of Things* (*Les Mots et les choses*), Michel Foucault discusses the central role that language played in the paradigm shift which took place in the 17th and 18th centuries – what he refers to as “the Classical age.” The “existence of language” in the Classical age “is both pre-eminent and unobtrusive” (78). It can be both these things because “words have been allotted the task and the power of ‘representing thought’” (78). In the 16th century the representational role of language had involved a complex of relationships between layers of signification: it was assumed that words pointed to the “signatures” of things – the marks left by God on His creation which enable the observer to discover the “invisible form of that which, from the depths of the world, made things visible” (26). These signatures, not the words, are the signs of the things – the words

---

1 For a brief yet cogent discussion of the role of neology in French Enlightenment linguistics, see Ulrich Ricken’s *Linguistics, Anthropology and Philosophy in the French Enlightenment*, Chapter 14.
serve only to represent that signature and to open a way for the human mind to approach what lay beneath it. The medicinal qualities of plants, for example, are encoded in their appearance:

There exists a sympathy between aconite and our eyes. This unexpected affinity would remain in obscurity if there were not some signature on the plant, some mark, some word, as it were, telling us that it is good for diseases of the eye. This sign is easily legible in its seeds: they are tiny dark globes set in white skinlike coverings whose appearance is much like that of eyelids covering an eye. (27)

In the 17th century, on the other hand, signs serve not as marks of the true form of things, but rather as the sole means by which the human mind may operate upon those things:

"language represents thought as thought represents itself" (78). Foucault goes so far as to suggest that "one might say that language in the classical era does not exist. But that it functions: its whole existence is located in its representative role...language has no other locus, no other value, than in representation" (79). As the sensationalist doctrine evolved throughout the 17th century, words became signs of ideas, taught to the mind by the senses, and eventually came to be seen as the tools by which the mind analyzes the impressions made upon it – the means by which cognition is made possible. Jefferson’s familiarity with the key shapers of this doctrine – John Locke and Etienne Bonnet de Condillac – raises the question of whether he himself subscribed to their philosophy. Was language so important to Jefferson because for him, as for Locke and Condillac, words were the fundamental tools of cognition? After a brief discussion of the sensationalist theory of language, Jefferson’s own writing on language will be examined in order to answer that question.
In England, John Locke broached the subject of words as signs in the *Essay Concerning Human Understanding*. For Locke, the purpose of language was to aid communication:

God having designed Man for a sociable Creature, made him not only with an inclination, and under a necessity to have fellowship with those of his own kind; but furnished him also with Language, which was to be the great Instrument, and common Tye of Society. (402)

Norman Kretzman has nicely summarized Locke’s point here: “Men require society and society requires communication” (335). “Man” is not the only being capable of articulation, but, having been designed as a sociable creature, he has been created with a capacity for language as an “Instrument” for communication. Unlike the articulations of animals, the sounds made by humans were made to be signs of ideas, so that humans “should be able to use these Sounds, as Signs of internal Conceptions; and to make them stand as marks for the Ideas within his own Mind, whereby they might be made known to others” (402). Words are therefore the “sensible Signs, whereby those invisible Ideas” of which a person’s “thoughts are made up of, might be made known to others”; they can also serve people in recording “their own Thoughts for the Assistance of their own Memory” (405).

While, as Harris and Taylor point out in their chapter on Locke in *Landmarks in Linguistic Thought I*, “Locke did not deny that we are innately equipped with the capacity to perform certain mental operations,” he did believe that “our ideas are derived from experience” (129). The signs which we employ to understand and describe our world are based upon the interplay between sensation and the operations of the human mind. The
senses generate "'simple sensations'" (e.g. the ideas of sweetness, of smoothness, of color) and the mind generates "'simple ideas of reflection'" by "experiencing the operations of our own mind" (e.g. the ideas of perception, will, desire, etc.) (128-129). By combining these simple ideas the mind can form complex ideas. These complex ideas might be "ideas of substances" such as gold, which is derived from the simple ideas of "'heaviness', 'yellowness', 'fusibility', 'malleableness', and fixity'," but which has a physical existence outside the mind. They might also be "mixed modes," ideas which exist only in the abstract, yet are still formed by the "multiple combination of simple ideas of both sensation and reflection" (129). In Locke's view, the words which are attached to both simple and complex ideas in order to enable communication are arbitrarily selected. "There is no general principle which determines the appropriate sign for any given idea"; communities are able to communicate by agreeing among themselves "to make a given word the sign of a given idea" (130). As Paul Guyer has pointed out, the arbitrariness of the sounds which were attached to ideas led Locke to attack the notion that systems of classifying the productions of nature reflected a determined number of "'substantial Forms...wherein all natural Things, that exist, are cast'," a notion popularized by the seventeenth century revival of Platonism (117). Jefferson would also insist, with Locke and Linnaeus, that systems of classification were essentially arbitrary. The need for linguistic communities to agree on meanings for words is also at the root of the problems of language, and Locke dedicates a chapter each to the subject of "The Imperfection of Words" and the "Abuse of Words," following these with suggested "Remedies of the Aforegoing Imperfections and Abuses" (Locke 475-524). Harris and Taylor summarize Locke's proposed remedy, definition, as follows:
As long as the name of a complex idea — either a mixed mode or an idea of substance — is defined in terms of the simple ideas from which that complex idea is composed, then the speaker who uses that name may be sure that hearers will interpret it as the sign of the same complex idea. For according to Locke there is little danger that names for simple ideas will be understood differently by different individuals. (134)

As Locke himself puts it, referring to a common category of mixed mode words, "Definition is the only way, whereby the precise Meaning of moral Words can be known" (Locke 517). Locke's position, then, is that language, although derived from innate operations of the mind in conjunction with sensory input, is also largely arbitrary. The actual words used to communicate are agreed upon by linguistic communities and unless carefully defined, can lead to the failure of language to achieve its primary purpose: communication. It might be added that the importance of deriving the true meaning of English words was one of the purposes Jefferson expressed for writing his "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language."

Etienne Bonnet de Condillac was the key interpreter of Locke in France, but he did more than digest Locke's ideas for a French audience: Condillac made significant additions to Locke's theory of language, placing words at the center, not only of communication, but also of cognition. For Locke language was a tool to serve memory and communication. Condillac and his successors among the Ideologues added a third use: for them language was a tool – in fact, the only tool – for the analysis of ideas. In Condillac's epistemology, "all the faculties of the mind are derived from the faculty of sensation"; in fact, "without the use of language man does not have voluntary control of
the faculty of reflection, nor indeed of the other faculties of the mind (Harris and Taylor 142). Locke had conceded that the mind possessed an innate ability to perform certain operations; Condillac, on the other hand, traces not only ideas, but also the faculties that operate upon those ideas to the senses.¹ Attention derives from “focusing on one component of a complex sensation to the exclusion of all others”; comparison is simply “attending to two sensations at the same time”; memory is comparing “a present sensation with an absent one” and judgement is born of the perception of “‘resemblances or differences between sensations’” (142). Condillac divides signs into the categories of accidental, natural and institutional or artificial. All of these originate in the natural reaction of humans to their environment: an accidental sign is created when “particular circumstances have connected with one of our ideas” and a natural sign arises from an immediate reaction to sensation, the “cries and gestural expressions which nature makes us produce” in reaction to environmental conditions (143). Initially, Condillac did attribute to one sign, the institutional, the same arbitrariness which Locke assigned to words; however, he would later come to deny that even artificial signs were arbitrary (143). While the use of words presupposes a convention which must needs be artificial, “this convention rests upon an analogy which limits its arbitrariness” (Crispini 145). The importance of analogy as the basis of language-building is at the root of Condillac’s notion of a well-made language. Condillac’s greatest addition to Locke was his belief that

¹ While comparing Condillac’s theories to those of Saussure, Julie Andresen sums up what may be the “crux of the distinction between the philosophies of the eighteenth and twentieth centuries” in a way which nicely expresses this same point: “the system that Saussure refers to is unconscious, while Condillac’s system is consciousness itself” (“Signs and Systems” 266). James H. Stam has called Condillac “the first thinker to give systematic consideration to ‘the psycholinguistic question’” or, more accurately, the “‘epistemolinguistic question’” of “the relationship between language...and an individual’s mental development” (77).
language is more than an aid to the communication of ideas; it is, in fact, the source of the human capacity for analysis. As Ellen McNiven Hine concisely puts it, “for Condillac, language is a method of analyzing the data of experience,” and, in fact, “all higher mental processes are dependent upon language” (21). While sensory experience is simultaneous, language is linear: in order to create linear sentences, we must disassemble sensory input, break it down into its components so that those basic elements might be expressed one-by-one (144). Human knowledge, therefore, derives completely from sensory experience, and a language is well-made to the extent that it remains true to nature, which even artificial signs can do if they are derived by the process of analogy (500). In the *Logic*, which Jefferson possessed, Condillac wrote that the “Author of our nature” did not expect us to grasp “the essences of beings”; rather, “He wishes only that we make judgements about the relations which things have to us, and the relations which they have among themselves when the knowledge of these latter relations can be of some utility to us” (Koch 193, Condillac 193). Reason is not an innate trait granted by the Creator, but rather is derived from the operations of the senses upon the human mind:

Hence this is what nature causes us to do: to observe relations and to confirm our judgements by fresh observations or to correct them by observing anew. And this all that we do and redo every time we acquire new knowledge. Such is the art of reasoning: it is simple just like nature which teaches us. (197)

Since reasoning is taught by nature, faulty reasoning results when nature’s lessons are forgotten, when, historically, “instead of observing the things we wanted to know, we preferred to invent them” (199). The result of this break from analogy is the decline in the ability to reason:
From one false supposition to the next, we went astray among a multitude of errors; and as these errors became prejudices we took them, for that reason, as principles: thus we went farther and farther astray. So we know how to reason only according to the bad habits which we had acquired. The art of misusing words was for us the art of reasoning: arbitrary, frivolous, ridiculous, and absurd, it had all the vices of the unregulated imagination. (199 italics mine)

“Everything will confirm,” Condillac confidently states, “that we think only with the aid of words. This is enough to make us understand that the art of reasoning began with languages” (211-213). As a result, “the cause of our errors [in reasoning] lies in the habit of judging according to words whose sense we have not determined” (213). Primitive languages were better made, because they were “extremely limited”: “it is not because they speak about many things with much confusion that languages are exact, but because they speak with clarity, even if it is about a small number of things” (229).

This does not mean that Condillac believed that languages should remain in their primitive state; however, in Condillac’s scheme of “neology” people would continue to create language “as they had commenced” (229). In other words, “they would have looked to analogy for new words only when a well-made analysis had in fact given them new ideas; and their languages would have been extended further while always remaining exact” (229). The practice of borrowing from other languages contributed to the degeneration of languages: as commerce “brought together peoples who exchanged...their opinions and their prejudices just as they exchanged the products of their soil and their industry,” the languages of these peoples “were mingled together and analogy could no longer guide the minds as to the meaning of words” (233). As a result of this confusion
“it appeared...that the art of reasoning was unknown” (233). On the other hand, “a language would be very superior if the people who make it cultivated the arts and sciences without borrowing anything from other peoples”:

for in this language analogy would perceptibly display the progress of knowledge, and one would not need to look elsewhere for its history. This would be a truly erudite language, and it would be the only one. But when they are jumbles of several languages which are foreign to each other, they confuse everything: analogy can no longer make the origin and generation of knowledge apparent in the different meanings of words: we can no longer introduce precision into our discourses. (241/243)

For Locke the solution to the problem of the misuse of language was definition; for Condillac it is a return to the foundations of language making, to building knowledge – and language – wholly upon the foundations of sensation and analysis. Even classification systems rely upon words, since only the abstractions words enable allow such divisions of nature (249). Although Jefferson makes no explicit reference to Condillac’s ideas of what constitutes a well-made language, Condillac’s insistence that languages were better made at their inception, when new words arose as a people’s knowledge increased, rather than from borrowings which render them “jumbles of several languages,” cannot but call to mind Jefferson’s own desire to return to Old English as a means (though certainly not the only means) of renovating Modern English. Too much cannot be made from this, since Jefferson was no enemy to borrowings; however, he also advocated a return to the flexibility of the Old English method for making new words as a way of increasing the capability of Modern English to adapt to the progress of science and society.
Destutt de Tracy and his fellow Ideologues were a loosely-knit group of philosophers and friends united in politics by their agreement with Condorcet’s views, and in philosophy by their association with Condillac’s thinking (Head 260). Jefferson worked to have Tracy’s writings published in the United States, going so far as to translate his Commentary and review of Montesquieu into English (Koch 59). In his Linguistics, Anthropology and Philosophy in the French Enlightenment, Ulrich Ricken suggests that “Condillac’s theory of language experienced its most immediate continuation” in Tracy’s work (208). However, just as Condillac was no mere transmitter of Locke, Tracy built upon Condillac’s theories by giving linguistic signs the task of preparing ideas for perception, which he viewed as a “sensate faculty” (208). According to Ricken, Tracy believed that:

Every idea that is to be communicated to others has to find entrance into thought by way of the senses and thus needs a form that can be perceived by the senses. The objectification of ideas is not, however, the precondition for communication alone, but also for the operation of cognitive processes themselves. If an idea is not combined with a material sign, then it is lost for any future thought. Destutt Tracy even took this notion so far as to assign in some cases a greater value to the cognitive, rather than the communicative, function of language. (208-209).

Tracy, then, has ranged even farther in advance of Locke’s thought than had Condillac. Locke had given language the primary purpose of communication; Condillac had given it a key role in cognition as well, placing it at the root of the analytical faculty; now Tracy grants this second role pre-eminence.
While there were obviously other thinkers on language who made significant contributions to this period, many of whom Jefferson may also have been familiar with, it is Locke and Tracy whom he knew best, and Condillac, with whose Logic he was familiar, who bridged the gap between the two, reworking Locke's theory into a form which Tracy could then make his own.¹ All three men shared a belief that language was an essential tool, unique to humanity, and with each the importance of language to human cognition increased. By Tracy's time, language had become more than a means of communication; he and Condillac had transformed it into the foundation of human cognition. This dissertation has argued that the study of language was important to Jefferson: did that importance stem at least in part from a belief in its role as a tool of analysis and a teacher of the ability to reason? Did his own materialist streak lead him to accept the advanced sign theories of Condillac and Tracy?

Jefferson certainly read Tracy and was a great admirer of the Ideologue. He corresponded with him, and made a serious effort to see his work on Political Economy published in the United States. As Adrienne Koch has put it, Jefferson "was proselytizer, translator, editor, sponsor for publication, and general representative in behalf of Tracy's

¹ The Scottish philosopher Dugald Stewart was also highly praised by Jefferson – the two men met in Paris, though Jefferson did not comment in writing on his friend's philosophy until 1820, when he wrote to Adams that the Scot was ""a great man, and among the most honest living"" (Koch 49). Although Stewart's positivism certainly paralleled Jefferson's own, his discussion of language in Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind does not find significant echoes in Jefferson. His discussion of language is, as he himself admits, little more than "a short summary" of Adam Smith's "leading positions," focusing primarily on the difference between ancient and modern languages. Unlike Condillac, Stewart assumes the latter to be better suited to "philosophical communication," though the former held an "advantage in poetry and oratory" (Stewart 3 50). Of greater interest are Stewart's comments on etymology, in which he explores the "affinity" of human languages and what they have to reveal about the "common descent of the different inhabitants of our globe" (3 65). While similar to Jefferson's ideas on the same subject, Stewart is not likely to have influenced him directly, since the Elements was first published in 1792, while Jefferson's first written comments on the affinity of languages occur in the Notes on the State of Virginia, written in 1781-82.
author’s rights” (56). Koch quite rightly points out that it would be inappropriate to “imply that Jefferson was not interested in the entire theoretical structure of ideologic thought”; however, in his thinking on language Jefferson seems never to have gone beyond Locke (64). He did link neology to the progress of the French language, as has been seen above, but Jefferson’s only statement of a theory of language does not go as far as had the French philosophers he admired. In 1825 he wrote a letter regarding a Cherokee Grammar sent him by the author; in this letter, Jefferson touches upon the underlying structure of language:  

> I thank you for the copy of your Cherokee Grammar, which I have gone over with attention and satisfaction. We generally learn languages for the benefit of reading the books written in them. But here our reward must be the addition made to the philosophy of language. In this point of view your analysis of the Cherokee adds valuable matter for reflection, and strengthens our desire to see more of these languages as scientifically elucidated. Their grammatical devices for the modification of their words by a syllable prefixed to, or inserted in the middle, or added to its end, and by other combination is so different from ours, prove that if man came from one stock, his languages did not. A late grammarian has said that all words were originally monosyllables. The Indian languages disprove this. I should conjecture that the Cherokees, for example, have formed their language not by single words, but by phrases. Thus the Cherokee has no name for father in the abstract, but only as combined with some one of his relations. A complex idea

---

1 Jefferson translated Tracy’s Commentary and Review of Montesquieu, but did not translate the Political Economy.

2 Unfortunately, the address (with the author’s name) is missing from the surviving copy of this letter.
being a fasciculus of simple ideas bundled together, it is rare that different
languages make up their bundles alike, and hence the difficulty of translating
from one language to another. European nations have so long had intercourse
with one another, as to have approximated their complex expressions much
towards one another. But I believe we shall find it impossible to translate our
language into any of the Indian, or any of theirs into ours. (Bergh and Lipscomb
16 107-108 emphasis mine).

Jefferson begins his comments with an allusion to the reason “we” normally study
languages: “for the benefit of reading the books written in them.” This is certainly the
reason which he most often gives for the learning of languages, particularly of the ancient
ones, through which moderns might grasp the strengths and failings of those who came
before them. Advanced thinkers on language such as Condillac and Tracy would likely
take issue with Jefferson’s statement in the Notes on Virginia: “I do not pretend that
language is science. It is only an instrument for the attainment of science” (Peterson
Portable 197).

That said, Jefferson does demonstrate an awareness of the philosophy of language.
His own attempts at comparative grammar typically went no further than the “filiation” of
nations demonstrated by the “filiation” of their languages, and later in this letter his
interest again returns to his own attempts to “arrange [Indian languages] into families”
based on their filiations (109). However from his study of the Native languages Jefferson
had to draw the conclusion “that if man came from one stock, his languages did not.”
When explaining why this must be the case Jefferson harkens back to Locke’s theory of
the origin of language: complex ideas are constructed from “simple ideas bundled
together." It is highly unlikely that different peoples will construct identical bundles, even though the simple ideas employed as building blocks may be the same. One result of this is the "difficulty of translating from one language to another," although long intermingling between European peoples has brought their languages closer together. This certainly elucidates Jefferson's beliefs about the filiation of languages and the filiation of nations: if the bundling of simple ideas into complex ones varies so much from people to people, similarities between languages must indicate similar environments, similar outlooks and either a direct descent of one people from another, or a long commerce between them.\footnote{It should be noted that this long commerce is not described by Jefferson as a negative, whereas Condillac blamed the degeneration of languages from such mingling.}

Despite his implied acceptance of Locke's theories, Jefferson goes on to make a statement which would seem to indicate that the science of language was still in its infancy: "I hope you will pursue your undertaking, and that others will follow your example with other of their languages. It will open a wide field for reflection on the grammatical organization of languages, their structure and character" (109). While Jefferson was likely aware of the advances in linguistic theory in France (he did, after all, know the key players, and owned copies of some of their works), he himself considered the key to understanding "the grammatical organization of languages" to be the continued collection of data – the gathering together of vocabularies and grammars. This preference for the gathering of evidence over theorizing is, as we shall see, typical of his approach to the acquisition of knowledge.
The Comparison of Traits: Jefferson's Analytic Methodology

Although Jefferson may not have embraced the linguistic theories of the Enlightenment as framed by his contemporaries in France, the methodology which he employed to acquire and analyze knowledge – including his analysis of the Anglo-Saxon language – clearly shows the influence of Enlightenment thought. This methodology, at the root of the development of systems of classification in the field of natural history, of which he was so fond, will provide perhaps the most useful insights into the operations he performed on Old English in his "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language." At the core of this approach is a belief that systems of classification are conventions agreed upon by individuals in order to enable communication – a formulation very close to Locke’s conclusions about the function and nature of language. Because of their relevance to his operations on Old English, Jefferson’s approach to scholarship and the classification systems which influenced him merit closer examination.

In the chapter on “Classifying” in The Order of Things, Foucault explores the epistemological shift in the realm of natural history which accompanied the changes in the understanding of the role of language during the Classical age; this shift, it will be seen, exerted a far greater influence on Jefferson than did the accompanying changes in linguistic theory. Whereas in the 16th century writing natural history entailed exactly what the name implies – a true gathering together of the history of the subject, mythological as well as “scientific” – in the 17th century the “facts” alone remain, “and the living being, in its anatomy, its form, its habits, its birth and death, appears as though stripped naked” (129). By the time of Linnaeus, the act of defining, of categorizing a living being centers less around the accumulation of all that is known about a plant or animal than upon a
careful selection of distinguishing traits which serve the primary purpose of enabling classification, of dividing the myriad production of nature into classes and genre. The table is the primary tool of this method because it allows the arrangement of creatures “according to their common features” (131). What “common features” one uses to construct this table may vary: the natural historian has to develop a system, based on the selection of “a finite and relatively limited group of characteristics, whose variations and constants may be studied in any individual entity that presents itself” (139). In other words, the natural historian determines the characteristics by which similarities and differences between living beings will be determined. This system “is arbitrary at its basis, since it deliberately ignores all differences and all identities not related to the selected structure” (140). While natural historians may still have believed a “natural method” of classification might some day be discovered, in its absence artificial, arbitrary systems would have to serve (140). In the realm of classification, the most popular such system was that employed by Linnaeus. The “epistemological base” upon which this system rested was the conviction that “a knowledge of empirical individuals can be acquired only from the continuous, ordered, and universal tabulation of all possible differences” (144). Knowledge, in other words, was the product of a process of tabulation and comparison.

These methods can be seen at work in Diderot’s *Encyclopédie*. Daniel Brewer, in his *The Discourse of Enlightenment in Eighteenth-Century France*, explores the work of Diderot, d’Alembert and the other encyclopedists in terms reminiscent not only of Foucault, but also of Jefferson’s approach to scholarship. Foucault described an approach to classification in which the natural historian, to impose order on nature, imposes order upon his subject by choosing certain characteristics for comparison and rejecting others in
an essentially arbitrary fashion. The encyclopedists similarly imposed order on their subject – which was the entire body of human knowledge – in order to not only organize it, but also to make it useful. D’Alembert and Diderot, according to Brewer, argue that:

all models...for ordering knowledge are inevitably arbitrary. Consequently, any model may be selected (or rejected) according to values and criteria that do not belong intrinsically to the model itself, but instead are fashioned by the practitioner of knowledge. (18-19)

Brewer sees this “empowering self-reflexivity” – the acceptance that the “practitioner” could “lay full claim to the powerful right” of choosing the “criterion according which knowledge will be represented” – as an effect of the encyclopedists’s “more experimental and experiential approach to knowledge,” the same approach to which Jefferson would pledge himself in the *Notes on the State of Virginia*. However, saying that the model chosen to represent knowledge is arbitrary does not mean that all such models were created equal: rather, that method was considered most effective which was most likely to render knowledge useful to the reader of the *Encyclopédie*. Hence, the alphabetical approach to the arrangement of articles is not the ideal one, according to D’Alembert. Rather, the *Encyclopédie* required “an ordering principle that ensures a more effective use of the knowledge [it] contains, a principle that also provides a protocol for reading” (17). The encyclopedists settled on a system which followed their notion of “an ideal interconnection between all articles”; namely, “the way they believed ideas are generated in the mind” (18). A similar utilitarian criterion is employed when the subjects of the articles are selected; as Brewer puts it:
the encyclopedists lay not claim to knowledge in and for itself, leaving that understanding to God and its pursuit to metaphysicians...because such knowledge is of little value to them. They desire only useful knowledge, relativized by being produced and ordered in relation to the human subject. (20-21).

For the encyclopedists – and it should be remembered that Jefferson, who contributed to the article on the United States in the Encyclopédie Méthodique, could be said to have been one of them – knowledge which is useful takes precedence over abstract theories, and the “practitioner of knowledge” had the right, even the responsibility, of imposing an order on knowledge which would render it most useful to others (Wilson “Jefferson’s Library” 678, Watts 321). Systems of classification represent a kind of order, and within them individual beings are organized by characteristics selected, again, by that same practitioner.

Jefferson’s own approach to the acquisition of knowledge is founded upon the same materialist basis as that of the encyclopedists, an approach which finds its roots in Bacon’s scientific method.¹ This, Adrienne Koch has argued, is the most significant contribution of the Ideologues to Jefferson’s thought: according to Tracy, “ideology” – the science of human cognition – was a branch of zoology; in other words, the faculties of the mind had a physical, not a spiritual, origin (Koch 67). When discussing Ideology in an 1824 letter to Augustus Woodward, Jefferson reiterates Tracy’s position, writing that zoology might be most effectively divided into two categories, “physical and moral,” the latter of which would include “ideology, ethics and mental science generally,” including

¹ Bacon, along with Locke and Newton, was a member of Jefferson’s “trinity of immortals” (Malone Jefferson the Virginian 101).
religion, all of which belong to "animal history" (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 19). For Tracy
Ideology was the sole safeguard against "hazy metaphysics," since it "approaches the mind
as natural history, for which observation is a better instrument than a priori
rationalizations" (Koch 68). Knowledge could only be obtained by adherence to a method
which could weed out "unfounded speculations and dogmas...from the field of
authoritative knowledge" (72). One aspect of this is the "slow but sure" method of
observation and inference leading to evidenced conclusions" (73). Where the Ideological
"method succeeds there will be knowledge, and where it fails, a careful methodologist
refrains from speculative judgement" (73). Jefferson too made frequent references to his
belief that only facts could be trusted, and the only truly trustworthy facts were those
received through the senses. Writing to John Adams in 1820 on the subject of the origin
of thought, Jefferson gives his reasons for subscribing to the materialist doctrine that the
Creator should certainly have been capable of "endowing matter with the mode of action
called thinking" (Cappon 2 568). He concludes a letter which has embraced not only this
subject, but also those of neology, the University of Virginia and the study of Anglo-
Saxon, with a declaration of his sensationalist beliefs:

Rejecting all organs of information therefore but my senses, I rid myself of the
Pyrrhonisms with which an indulgence in speculations hyperphysical and
antiphysical so uselessly occupy and disquiet the mind. A single sense may indeed
be sometimes deceived, but rarely: and never all our senses together, with their
faculty of reasoning. They evidence realities; and there are enough of these for all
the purposes of life, without plunging into the fathomless abyss of dreams and
phantasms. I am satisfied, and sufficiently occupied with the things which are,
without tormenting or troubling myself about those which may indeed be, but of
which I have no evidence. (569)

Though Jefferson respected the Ideologues, he confesses that Tracy does not always meet
his own utilitarian ideals; his empirical methodology did not always render his results
useful in a practical way, or prevent him from straying too far into theory for Jefferson’s
tastes. “His three 8vo. volumes on Ideology,” Jefferson wrote John Adams in 1816,
“which constitute the foundation of what he has since written, I have not entirely read;
because I am not fond of reading what is merely abstract, and unapplied immediately to
some useful science” (Cappon 2 491). Jefferson goes so far as to criticize Tracy’s
Political Economy in a letter to a potential publisher, writing that “it is a little unlucky that
it’s outset is of a metaphysical character,” a fact which he blames on Tracy’s desire to
connect the book to the larger body of his work on Ideology (Chinard Jefferson et les
Idéologues 111).

Abstract theorizing does not meet Jefferson’s standards of science because what
cannot be grasped by the senses can neither be proven nor usefully applied to the
betterment of society. In a letter to Pierre Jean Georges Cabanis, whose work on
anatomy he admired greatly, Jefferson mingled praise with a note of caution. After
thanking Cabanis for a book he had sent Jefferson on “the relations between the physical
and moral faculties of man,” Jefferson continued:

This has ever been a subject of great interest to the inquisitive mind, and it could
not have got into better hands for discussion than yours. That thought may be a
faculty of our material organization, has been believed in the gross; and though the
“modus operandi” of nature, in this, as in most other cases, can never be developed
and demonstrated to beings limited as we are, yet I feel confident you will have conducted us as far on the road as we can go, and have lodged us within reconnoitering distance of the citadel itself. (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 404).

Again, Jefferson expresses his awareness of the limits of human knowledge. Granting that Cabanis has brought science within “reconnoitering distance” of true knowledge of nature does reflect his belief in the possibility of progress; however, the “modus operandi” of nature “in most...cases” must remain beyond the bounds of human understanding.

Because nature has not yet yielded up the secrets of her inner workings (and is unlikely ever to do so completely), the science of classification cannot faithfully reflect the real divisions of nature. Acknowledging this fact, Jefferson, like many of his contemporaries, expressed a belief that these systems are subjective, created by natural historians, not to reflect “reality,” but to aid in memory and in communication – much the same role Locke had given language. Replying in 1814 to a request by Dr. John Manners to discuss the “comparative merits of the different methods of classification adopted by different writers on Natural History,” Jefferson writes that “Nature has, in truth, produced units only through all her works. Classes, orders, genera, species, are not of her work” (Bergh and Lipscomb 14 97). However, since the “infinitude” of individuals created by nature are “far beyond the capacity of our memory” to retain, natural historians must “distribute them into masses, throwing into each of these all the individuals which have a certain degree of resemblance” (98). Since nature has produced only individuals, in creating divisions among her works “we fix arbitrarily on such characteristic resemblances and differences as seem to us most prominent and invariable in the several subjects, and most likely to take a strong hold in our memories” (98). The system of Linnaeus receives
approbation, not because of its inherent strengths, but rather because the method of classification conceived by him “obtained the approbation of the learned of all nations. His system was accordingly adopted by all, and united all in a general language” (98). Its strengths, then, are summed up as follows:

It offered the three great desiderata: First, of aiding the memory to retain a knowledge of the productions of nature. Secondly, of rallying all to the same names for the same objects, so that they could communicate understandably on them. And thirdly, of enabling them, when a subject was first presented, to trace it by its character up to the conventional name by which it was agreed to be called.

(98-99)

Linnaeus’s system is useful as a tool for remembering and naming the “productions of nature” and for enabling communication between scientists. However, his system was hardly perfect, and in fact was “liable to the imperfection of bringing into the same group individuals which, though resembling in the characteristics adopted by the author for classification, yet have strong marks of dissimilitude in other respects” (99). In other words, natural beings might be classed together in Linnaeus’s artificial system which are actually quite different from each other. This, however, is an “objection” to which “every mode of classification must be liable, because the plan of creation is inscrutable to our limited faculties” (99). That other systems, such as those of Cuvier and Blumenbach, may or may not suffer from this fault to an equal degree is not important: only Linnaeus’s system unites “all nations under one language in Natural History” (99). Moreover, their systems, particularly Blumenbach’s, suffer the additional shortcoming of “giving too much into the province of anatomy,” and even Linnaeus’s “method was liable to this objection
so far as it required the aid of anatomical dissection” (100-101). Jefferson, on the other hand, would prefer that systems of classification be accessible to the average observer: “It would certainly be better,” Jefferson suggests, “to adopt as much as possible such exterior and visible characteristics as every traveller [sic] is competent to observe, to ascertain and to relate” (101).

Jefferson made direct use of these techniques of classification in the organization of his own library and in the various school curricula he devised (Miller 35). However, his application of them was not limited to these more obvious uses; in his approach to scholarship, Jefferson demonstrated the same methods which he identifies here as characteristic of classification. The exhaustive gathering of data and its arrangement into tables for comparison are both characteristics which were at the root of Jefferson’s scholarship, as was the sense that the elements selected and the system employed to analyze them were both, to some extent, arbitrary, determined by factors other than a desire to represent “reality.” At the same time, theories and abstractions were anathema to him – perhaps one reason why his interest in language never ventured into speculations as to its origins or its role in cognition. Real knowledge must be achieved through the patient accumulation of facts, and the admission of ignorance was better than error.

Jefferson demonstrated this cautious approach to acquiring new knowledge in his longstanding suspicion of medical science and its practitioners. Although an advocate of such medical advances as vaccination, Jefferson believed that, as often as not, nature could heal itself better without outside intervention. In 1807 he wrote to Dr. Casper Wistar that the wise physician, who has seen “the salutary efforts” of nature, “should rather trust to their action, than hazard... a greater derangement of the system, by conjectural experiments on
a machine so complicated and so unknown as the human body” (Bergh and Lipscomb 11245). An “adventurous physician,” on the other hand, “substitutes presumption for knowledge. From the scanty field of what is known, he launches into the boundless region of what is unknown” (245). In medicine, as elsewhere, he advocates “an abandonment of hypothesis for sober facts” (246).

Perhaps the best example of Jefferson’s own application of his approach to scholarship appears in his only published book, the Notes on the State of Virginia. Pamela Regis has written that “for Jefferson, quantification was a way to knowledge,” and the Notes on Virginia certainly supports this claim: the book relies almost exclusively on an overwhelming accumulation of data to accomplish its goal of describing Virginia and the New World to a European audience (92). Chapters contain detailed tables on a range of topics, including the relative sizes of Old and New World animals, the number and placement of North American Native tribes, state militia statistics and even the Virginia census from 1607-1782. There may be more to Jefferson’s use of tables than mere collection of data. Susan Manning suggests that, in an attempt to dispel prevailing myths about America, these apparently neutral lists are structured in such a way as to shape a new myth: “order is imposed on chaos, writing American greatness into prospective existence” (Manning 358). The means of ordering chaos is the collection and organization of large amounts of data; Buffon’s claims of New World impotence cannot bear up under the sheer weight of these tables, of all of this accumulated information. Moreover, Jefferson selects his data and arranges it in such a way that, table after table, either the Old and New Worlds are compared and the former found wanting, or the fertility of the New World is revealed by a weighty display of data. Two separate tables
covering several pages between them demonstrate that the Natives were more prolific than
Buffon had claimed by presenting the names and populations of tribes, while another table
compares animal species in America and Europe (revealing that not only are there more
species in America, but that the American species are larger) and a third lists details of the
many species of bird native to Virginia (Peterson Portable 136-137, 145-150, 82-85, 106-110).

By employing this method, Jefferson puts into practice a conviction that real
knowledge can only be achieved through a patient and thorough collection and
comparison of data. As he wrote in a marginal note in his own copy of the Notes on
Virginia: “A patient pursuit of facts, and cautious combination and comparison of them, is
the drudgery to which man is subjected by his Maker, if he wishes to attain sure
knowledge” (Peterson Portable 104). These facts, not the theories of philosophers, open
the doors to knowledge. In the field of medical science, Jefferson condemns the rashness
of the physician who employs a fashionable theory, “which lets him into all of nature’s
secrets at short hand” and who then proceeds to test that theory in “bold experiments on
the lives of his fellow creatures.” “Were I a physician,” Jefferson concludes, “I would
rather leave the transfer [of diseases from the table of the unknown to that of the known]
to the slow hand of accident” (Bergh and Lipscomb 11 245-47). It would be a grave error
to claim that this statement expressed a general distaste for the experimental method.
Rather, it highlights the dangers of trying to understand a complex world through the
arbiter of theory, rather than through the accumulation of facts. The Notes on Virginia
may be read as Jefferson’s demonstration of this approach: massive tables of data support
the statements of which he is sure, while Jefferson is willing to admit the imperfection of
his knowledge in those areas in which he is less certain. For example, when discussing the question of how petrified sea-shells, or "Schist," came to be found near the foot of a Virginian mountain, Jefferson outlines the prevailing theories, all of which he ultimately dismisses, admitting that the mystery is yet unsolved. "Ignorance is preferable to error," he concludes, "and he is less remote from the truth who believes nothing, than he who believes what is wrong" (Peterson Portable 60-63). Jefferson made a similar point late in his life, in an 1822 letter to George F. Hopkins, in which he declares that "I am myself an empiric in natural philosophy, suffering my faith to go no further than my facts" (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 394).

Jefferson employs the approach to scholarship which influenced his natural history in the Notes on Virginia – the collection and presentation of nearly overwhelming amounts of data – in other areas of endeavor as well. Jefferson’s Bill for Proportioning Crimes and Punishments as presented to George Wythe, reveals the detailed research which went into the crafting of the document. The copy Jefferson sent to Wythe is copiously annotated with legal precedents from Alfred to Coke. A glance at the text as it appears in the Papers of Thomas Jefferson instantly reveals the care with which Jefferson drew upon the sources of law to elucidate and support his own positions. Many pages are reminiscent of modern editions of Pope: the text of the bill consists of a narrow strip along the top of the page, sometimes no more than four lines, while the rest of the page is given to the notes Jefferson added to the original. Merrill D. Peterson published a plate of a page of the manuscript, in which the text of the Bill is written in loose, clear hand in the left column of the page, while the notes fill the right column in a smaller, tighter script, at one place invading the left column, the whole approaching a simple table in appearance
Each suggested punishment generates an extensive discussion of the position taken by other sources. For example, in the discussion of rape, the phrase “Whosoever shall be guilty of rape” is elucidated by citations from several sources, including volume and page numbers and lengthy quotations in Latin and Old English (Boyd 2497). Arson produces a similar discussion, in which Jefferson actually makes a word-for-word translation of his Old English text—elsewhere he repeats the Old English text with a revised orthography, employing the reformations he would latter recommend in the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” (499, 498). These notes, included for the eye of George Wythe, to whom Jefferson sent the Bill for review, reveal both the depth of the research that lay behind Jefferson’s work and his need to present in detail the fruits of that research in support of his positions.

The table, with its compilation and comparison of data employing criteria selected to serve the needs of the researcher, also influenced Jefferson’s approach to the written word, as is evinced not only by his operations upon the Anglo-Saxon language, but also, to an extent, by his approach to editing the works of others, to be discussed in Chapter 2. Utility is the key to Jefferson’s use of these techniques; the purpose of classifying data is to render it more useful to the reader. Why the study of history and language was useful enough to lead Jefferson to apply this method to Old English has been the subject of the bulk of the present chapter: history had lessons to teach the present generation, though it could not be followed blindly, and the ancient languages would enable the student to see history in a truer light by admitting access to the ancient authors in their original.

However, the study of language as “an instrument for the attainment of science,” or of history, was not the only way in which words were useful to Jefferson: the written and
spoken word both played key roles in the system of government which he struggled to establish and maintain in the United States (Peterson Portable 197). Jefferson was extremely sensitive to the power of words, and he demonstrated their importance not only in his vehement defense of free speech, but also in the extreme self-consciousness with which he himself wrote — a self-consciousness which implies much about the circumstances in which Jefferson recorded his thoughts on the language of the Anglo-Saxons. It will be the purpose of the next chapter to extend the discussion of the utility of language to these issues, and to explore as well the seemingly contradictory lack of respect which Jefferson demonstrated for the written word in his own approach to editing. The subjectivity of the table and the fluidity of the written word in Jefferson's scholarship both, as we shall see, played important roles in his approach to the language of the Anglo-Saxons.

The importance of the Anglo-Saxon dialect towards a perfect understanding of the English language seems not to have been duly estimated by those charged with the education of youth; and yet it is unquestionably the basis of our present tongue. (Jefferson “Essay” 55)

With these words Thomas Jefferson began the final draft of his “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon language,” and they have much to say about why the propagation of the study of Old English was so important to him. As we have seen, Jefferson’s scholarly interests were guided largely by utilitarianism: while he understood the value of sciences with no immediate practical application, he was himself far more interested in pursuits which could be put to use to improve the condition of humanity and in the service of his own nation – goals which, from his perspective, were scarcely mutually exclusive. So the benefits to be derived from the study of languages and history discussed in the previous chapter shed some light on the value Jefferson assigned to a knowledge of Old English. However, the importance of the ancient form of English also had much to do with the importance of Modern English to the United States. Thomas Jefferson lived in an age when the written word was often the agent of action: it was the only reliable means of
communicating information from city to city, state to state, nation to nation. Christopher Looby has gone so far as to argue that many Americans of the Revolutionary generation perceived the creation of the new nation as "a process enacted in language," and offers convincing evidence of their awareness of the importance of language to the founding of the United States (1). While the spoken word was important, and the focus of Looby's discussion, to Jefferson writing was especially crucial; by all accounts, he was an indifferent orator, and the strength of his public messages lay always in the same skill that helped win him the task of drafting the Declaration of Independence, "a peculiar felicity of expression" (Brodie 121). Looby points out that Jefferson had even referred to the creation of the United States in terms of writing – in the 1824, he wrote to Major John Cartwright that the American Revolution "presented us an album on which we were free to write what we please" (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 44). For Jefferson, language also played a key role in the governing of a republican nation; eloquence was the statesman's tool, and the newspapers and presses served almost as the cognitive faculty of the public, the means by which the citizens might debate openly and honestly, arriving in the end at the truth. Because of the central role to be played by language in the republic, Jefferson set high standards for utterance, demanding that the statesman should know when to give voice to his opinions and when to hold silent, and that the organs of discussion ensure the veracity of what is written. Jefferson himself wrote with profound self-consciousness, always aware that the audience of his utterances was far broader than the recipient of a letter or the audience of an address; not only those of his own generation, but also citizens

1 Looby explains the title of his work, Voicing America, as representative of his thesis that, while many authors have described the importance of print culture in early America, "there is a distinct countercurrent
of future generations would read his words. This was for Jefferson a double-edged blade; while comments made in private correspondence were often turned against him by his enemies, the knowledge that what he wrote would influence the version of history accepted by future generations offered him an opportunity to present them with the "correct" interpretation of the events of his time.

English was the medium of these communications, and for Jefferson it was a language particularly well-suited to democracy. Of course, one reason for its importance was its position as the language of the United States — that alone made it deserving of attention, as Jefferson’s insistence on the importance of neology and its role in elevating American English demonstrated. However, the fact that English was the language of the colonies also carried with it important political connotations; Jefferson, who believed that the “filiation” of languages offered proof of the “filiation” of peoples, implies as well that English is a carrier of democratic traditions and a link to the Anglo-Saxon and Germanic traditions of freedom. The importance of Modern English — the language of the republic — sheds light on the importance of Old English to Jefferson. Given the imperfection of

---

1 Lewis P. Simpson has described Jefferson as embodying “the transformation of the writer from an actor-relator…who acts in the old heroic style, but with a marked degree of self-consciousness writes and publishes an account of his acts, into the modern man of letters, who is…wholly self-conscious about writing as a historical act” (59). Simpson sees this self-consciousness as the result of Jefferson’s desire “to conform nature, man, and society to mind” (62). Jefferson “understood his function as a man of letters to be the making and carrying out of history” (59). While Simpson’s discussion goes beyond the scope of this thesis, his position does support mine: if writing is a means of “making and carrying out history,” then Jefferson’s desire to popularize the study of Old English in the service of Modern English may be seen as making the latter a more effective means of attaining that end. Larzer Ziff offers an intriguing perspective on the same issue, proposing that, for Jefferson, his biography and the history of the United States were so closely related that, when writing his autobiography, he passed over the first two years of his Presidency: “his ‘own history’ was not the account of his relation with family, friends, or lovers, but rather the account of his political and intellectual pursuits which either did not appear in the public record or which separated him from the course events took” (117). In essence, Jefferson’s personal history was that of the new nation.
language, a "knowledge [sic] of the Anglo-Saxon dialect," as Jefferson wrote in the postscript to the rough draft of his "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" offers the modern a profound understanding of the modern English," particularly "of the terms of the ancient laws" which were the carriers of Saxon tradition (50). Moreover, the revival of the study of Old English "would give a renovation to the powers of the English language, too much diminished by the neglect of it's ancient construction" (51). The study of Old English, then, would be made to serve, alongside a judicious neology, to make the English language a capable bearer of the democratic tradition and, by increasing its preciseness and power, an effective tool in the day-to-day functioning of the republic. The present chapter, then, will focus on these issues: the relationship between the English language and English liberties and the importance of language in a republican system will lay the groundwork for an examination of Jefferson's editorial techniques – of the lengths to which Jefferson would go to ensure the ideological "correctness" of a written text. The chapter will conclude with a brief examination of how the circumstances in which the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" was written reflects the influence of these concerns.

The Filiation of Languages and the Legacy of English

In addition to his interest in the flora and fauna of North America, Jefferson was fascinated by the Native inhabitants of the New World. Although Jefferson's record in regard to Native Americans was less than pristine from a modern perspective, he expressed a great respect for them, and hoped that the tribes would gradually accept the benefits of agriculture and integrate themselves into the American system (Peterson 773-774). His belief in the "improvability" of Native Americans stands in sharp contrast to his
doubts that freed slaves could be integrated into white society, as is highlighted in a much-quoted passage, which appears only in part in the Jefferson Memorial in Washington.

"Nothing is more certainly written in the book of fate, than that these people are to be free," are the lines which appear in the Memorial, but Jefferson continues: "nor is it less certain that the two races, equally free, cannot live in the same government. Nature, habit, opinion, have drawn indelible lines of distinction between them" (Bergh and Lipscomb 172-73). Freed slaves, unlike Natives, were not likely candidates for integration with white society, though Jefferson did not seem to doubt that they would be successful in their own, separate society.

One expression of Jefferson's interest in Natives was his study of their languages, a subject which was touched upon in the previous chapter. He described his extensive collection of Native words, which was lost in his move from Washington to Monticello in 1809, in a letter to Doctor Benjamin Barton not long after the loss. The letter also touches upon his reasons for undertaking the study:

I have now been thirty years availing myself of every possible opportunity of procuring Indian vocabularies to the same set of words.... I had collected about fifty, and had digested most of them in collateral columns, and meant to have printed them the last of my stay in Washington. But not having yet digested Captain Lewis' collection...I put it off till I should return home.... [Unfortunately, they were stolen and lost on their way to Virginia] I am the more concerned of this accident, as of the two hundred and fifty words of my vocabularies, and the one hundred and thirty words of the great Russian vocabularies of the languages of the other quarters of the globe, seventy-three were common to both, and would
have furnished materials for a comparison from which something might have resulted (Bergh and Lipscomb 12 312-13).

Jefferson's downfall was his desire to make his vocabulary of native languages as complete as possible – once again he demonstrated his need to gather almost overwhelming evidence before drawing a conclusion. By arranging his data in tables Jefferson reveals his reason for undertaking the study: Jefferson believed that the Native languages shared many words with each other, and with the languages of certain Asiatic tongues. His collection of words was far from random: for many years he had been providing "blank vocabularies" to friends who could fill them up with words with cognate words from the languages of different tribes.

The tabulating and comparison of these words, in the true fashion of the natural historian, would, Jefferson felt, demonstrate the "filiation" of Native languages with each other and with those of the Old World. As he wrote John Severin Vater in 1811, "I have long considered the filiation of languages as the best proof we can ever obtain of the filiation of nations" (Bergh and Lipscomb 13 61). Perhaps the most complete discussion of this concept occurs in the chapter on "Aborigines" in the Notes on Virginia. Writing about the possible origins of the aboriginal Americans, Jefferson mentions that, although the evidence of a land passage between America and Asia and physical similarities between the two peoples do offer support for a relationship between Native Americans and Asians, "a knowledge of their several languages would be the most certain evidence of their derivation which could be produced. In fact, it is the best proof of the affinity of nations which ever can be referred to" (Peterson Portable 143). Language provides the surest evidence of a connection between peoples: as was seen above, this is in part because of
the unlikelihood of two languages bundling simple ideas into identical complex ideas, a fact which suggests that cognates must surely derive from the descent of one people from another or from long intermingling between them.

Jefferson applied this principle of filiation to his own language as well as to those of the Natives:

How many ages have elapsed since the English, the Dutch, the Germans, the Swiss, the Norwegians, Danes and Swedes have separated from their common stock? Yet how many more must elapse before the proofs of their common origin, which exist in their several languages, will disappear? (Peterson Portable 143)

Just as the filiation of native languages with those of Asia demonstrated the relationship between the American aborigines and the tribes of Asia, the common ancestry of English and the languages of Northern Europe reveal the descent of the colonial speakers of the former from the nations of Northern Europe. The complex of ideas which Jefferson attached to the Northern nations will be discussed at length in Chapter 4. Suffice it to say here that the liberties of the Saxons were not unique to that people: they were the common heritage of the Northern nations, as both ancient writers such as Tacitus and the examples of modern history proved. While Jefferson never made sustained arguments for the superiority of a Germanic “race,” he certainly believed that the ancient German tribes had established a system more nearly founded on the natural liberty of humanity than any other, a system which was the cultural inheritance of their descendants in continental Europe, England and North America. The descent of the language of the United States from that of the Saxons offers additional proof of the “filiation” of the two peoples.
It is also worth noting that the filiation of the Native languages with those of Asia could also be made to serve the cause of defending the American continent from claims of its degeneracy. In the Notes on Virginia, Jefferson writes that, although his vocabulary of the languages of the Americas was still incomplete, and so his knowledge of Native languages was still "imperfect," he could draw an interesting conclusion from the limited evidence available to him. If the various dialects were arranged under the "radical ones to which they may be palpably traced," in other words, according to the distinct languages from which the dialects have descended, and if the same is done to the languages of the related Asian peoples, "there will be found probably twenty [radicals in America] to one in Asia." Whereas previous research had claimed an Asian origin of the Natives of the Americas, Jefferson uses this linguistic evidence to draw a quite different conclusion:

A separation into dialects may be the work of a few ages only, but for two dialects to recede from one another till they have lost all vestiges of their common origin, must require an immense course of time; perhaps not less than many people give to the age of the earth. A greater number of those radical changes having taken place among the red men of America, proves them of greater antiquity than those of Asia (Peterson Portable 143-144).

In the Notes on Virginia, Jefferson points to the evidence offered by the affinity of languages primarily as a means of learning the origins of the American aborigines, but, as was so often the case, this scholarly undertaking also helped "demonstrated the natural vitality of the American continent by suggesting that a race of people actually sprang from there, to people the very continent usually posited as the birthplace of humanity."
Jefferson's belief that the filiation of languages proved the affinity of peoples lends, as we have seen, a certain importance to the fact that the language of the colonies was English. That association was not, however, the only factor which made the improvement of the English language so important. English, the descendant of the language of the freedom-loving Anglo-Saxons, also played a role in imparting democratic ideals. In the letter to Cartwright mentioned in the Introduction, Jefferson stated explicitly that students of Old English would "imbibe with the language their free principles of government" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1651). In the Notes on Virginia, Jefferson links Modern English to the creation of a democratic spirit among the people, bringing together the learning of language with the acquisition of culture: when considering whether or not Europeans should be encouraged to migrate to America by various incentives, Jefferson suggests that immigration from Europe brings with it a crucial threat to republicanism. The government of the United States is unique, he suggests, being "a composition of the freest principles of the English constitution, with others derived from natural right and natural reason." The antithesis of these principles are "the maxims of absolute monarchy." Yet from where else will most immigrants come, but from the regimes of Europe? Such immigrants "will bring with them the principles of the governments they leave, imbibed in their early youth." Worse yet, those principles will not die with the generation which brought them:

These principles, with their language, they will transmit to their children. In proportion to their numbers, they will share with us the legislation. They will infuse into it their spirit, warp and bias its direction, and render it a heterogeneous, incoherent, distracted mess (Peterson Portable 124-125).
In reference to this comment, Harold Hellenbrand has observed that Jefferson seemed to think “that few people had either the heritage or nature to handle the responsibilities of republicanism to understand the spirit of its laws. The Anglo-Saxons and their British descendants, especially those who separated themselves in America, did” (116).

According to Jefferson, this tendency toward absolutism is transmitted with, if not by, language, and its greatest threat is the power of those so poisoned to shape, in another act of language, legislation. The resulting system of government, drawing as it will from these conflicting traditions, will be “incoherent.” The implication here is that, just as the study of Anglo-Saxon would instill democratic ideals in American students, the languages of immigrants from European monarchies would infect their children with the principles of despotism. Too much cannot be made from this argument – it can hardly be stated that Jefferson considered French, for example, to be a language of despotism, and at the time when Jefferson wrote the Notes on Virginia the enemies of the United States were English speaking – nevertheless, this connection of principle with language is evocative.

In his writings on the Anglo-Saxon language, including the “Essay,” Jefferson repeatedly insists that the language of Alfred is merely a dialect of English, “as much as those of Piers Plowman, Gower, Douglas, Chaucer, Spenser, Shakspeare, Milton” (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 130). By pointing out the “filiation” of Modern English with the language of the Anglo-Saxons, and then extending that affinity to the tribes of Germany written of by Tacitus, Jefferson identifies a national filiation, a common ancestry, which shares not only a common family of languages, but also a common tradition of freedom.

---

1 This discussion of the intermingling of political systems cannot but call to mind Condillac’s views on linguistic borrowings: as such mixing will render a government incoherent, so would borrowings weaken a language’s ability to serve as a tool of cognition (Logic 233).
The experiment of republicanism in United States can be seen as descending through this familial tree, just as Modern English descended, albeit not unchanged, from a Germanic root. However, language had a greater role to play in the American republic than providing this sense of continuity, of tradition, to the new nation: language, both spoken and written, was a means to power for the statesman and a tool for the empowerment of the citizen. Because of this importance, Jefferson believed that citizens enjoyed the right to free speech, but insisted as well that they employ that right responsibly.

**The Republic of Words: The Role of Language in Jefferson's Nation**

In 1785 Jefferson wrote a letter to John Banister Jr. discussing the advantages and disadvantages of an American seeking education in Europe. While Jefferson acknowledges there are some advantages offered by a European education, he warns that the young man returning from a long sojourn in Europe to his native land will, among other things, come “speaking and writing his native tongue as a foreigner, and therefore unqualified to obtain those distinctions which eloquence of the pen and tongue ensures in a free country” (Boyd 8 637). Although Jefferson does not explicitly link English with the republican spirit here, eloquence in the language is important because it is the language of a “free country.” Given the power to be derived from the spoken and written word in such an environment, fluency in English is a prerequisite to effective citizenship in a republican state. Jefferson again links culture with language in this letter, warning that an American youth in Europe will lose, not only in not acquiring his native language, but also “in his knowledge, in his morals, in his health, in his habits, and in his happiness” (637).
When Jefferson cautioned that a young American educated abroad might be unable to "obtain those distinctions which eloquence of the pen and tongue ensures in a free country," he emphasized just how important eloquence in speaking and writing were to the citizen of a republic and so how crucial was a mastery of the language of that republic – in the case of the United States, English. When, in the Autobiography, he describes three of his fellows in the house of Burgesses, he emphasizes their powers of expression. The three he discusses are George Mason, George Wythe and James Madison, though Wythe is mentioned only briefly (Jefferson directs the reader to his letter to John Saunderson for more details on his mentor's life (Bergh and Lipscomb 161)). Nearly half of his description of Mason is given over to a discussion of his oratory: "His elocution was neither flowing nor smooth; but his language was strong, his manner most impressive, and strengthened by a dash of biting cynicism, when provocation made it seasonable" (Bergh and Lipscomb 160). Madison's more polished declamatory power is described as well, and its relationship to his political success is stated explicitly:

Never wandering from his subject into vain declamation, but pursuing it closely, in language pure, classical and copious, soothing always the feelings of his adversaries by civilities and softness of expression, he rose to the eminent station which he held in the great National Convention of 1787; and in that of Virginia which followed, he sustained the new constitution in all its parts, bearing off the palm against the logic of George Mason, and the fervid declamation of Mr. Henry.... Of the powers and polish of his pen, and of the wisdom of his administration in the highest office of the nation, I need say nothing. They have spoken, and will forever speak for themselves (61-62).
Although this passage follows a list of other qualities possessed by Madison, it is his eloquence which is described in the same sentence as his rise to power, the implication being that this contributed to his success. This talent also proved a weapon in the service of the constitution, defeating even Henry’s oratory. The connection between eloquence (now in the written form of the language) and statecraft is made again when the “power and polish of his pen” are mentioned with “the wisdom of his administration in the highest office of the nation,” both of which, it should be noticed, Jefferson assumes to be so widely known that he “need say nothing” about them.¹

The power of the spoken and written word in the service of statecraft, when combined with the need for free inquiry into the sciences and the diffusion of knowledge already discussed, make freedom of speech an essential element of Jefferson’s republican ideal. In a nation where the spoken and written word empowered both the statesman and the citizen, who stood to benefit from education and the advancement of science, the imposition of restrictions on expression was antithetical to republicanism. One of the greatest arenas of free speech in Jeffersonian thought was a responsible press, and the importance he attributed to it serves as another example of the key role which language had to play in a democratic society. In the turbulent days of Jefferson’s tenure as Secretary of State, during his almost constant struggle with Hamilton and his “monarchical” party, Jefferson kept careful notes of events, which he cobbled together with copies of his own

¹ Another indication of the importance of eloquence to Jefferson is his praise of the oratorical skill of Native Americans: of the speech of Logan, included in the Notes on the State of Virginia, Jefferson writes “I may challenge the whole orations of Demosthenes and Cicero, and of many more eminent orator, if Europe has furnishes more eminent, to produce a single passage, superior to the speech of Logan” (Peterson Portable 99). See S1 vol. to date. heehan’s discussion of Jefferson’s “Noble Savage” in “Paradise and the Noble Savage in Jeffersonian Thought,” particularly 355-54.
letters to Washington and copies of some primary documents. This "diary," the *Anas*, will be discussed in greater detail below, but it is useful here to mention Jefferson's defense of Philip Freneau, whose newspaper was the primary organ of the Republican party. Washington, in a private meeting, complained of Freneau's attacks on him personally and his government; he went so far as to suggest that Jefferson remove the writer from the post of translating clerk in his office. Whether or not Jefferson refused Washington's request outright is not clearly stated in the *Anas*; however, he makes it clear in this political diary that he "will not do it":

His paper has saved our Constitution, which was galloping fast into monarchy, and has been checked by no one means so powerfully as by that paper. It is well and universally known, that it has been that paper which has checked the career of the monocrats; and the President...has not with his usual good sense and *sang froid*, looked on the efforts and effects of this free press, and seen that, though some bad things have passed through it to the public, yet the good have preponderated immensely (Bergh and Lipscomb 1353).

Freneau's newspaper, which, in Jefferson's view, was sound in its politics, had saved the constitution from the Federalists. In this, it shares the power of the statesman, Madison, to help shape a republic with the power of words. Washington's condemnation of Freneau was an aberration, and Jefferson criticizes the President, albeit gently, for not overlooking what bad has passed through the press in recognition of its usefulness.

Freneau's paper serves the intended purposes of the press: to disseminate knowledge so that an informed public will be capable of defending itself from the encroachments of autocracy and, as Jefferson wrote in a 1792 letter to Washington, to
serve as a critic of the government. "No government ought to be without censors,"
Jefferson wrote in Freneau's defense, "and where the press is free, no one ever will"
(Boyd 24 357). A confederation of "distinct" states, Jefferson wrote to Destutt de Tracy
in 1811, organized under an elective legislature and executive, "and enlightened by a free
press, can never be so fascinated by the arts of one man, as to submit voluntarily to his
usurpation" (Bergh and Lipscomb 13 19). Elsewhere, he outlined the importance of a free
press in a democracy even more explicitly. When writing to Edward Carrington about the
"tumults" in America, meaning primarily Shay's Rebellion, Jefferson insisted that the best
way to avoid such "irregular interpositions of the people" is to keep them fully informed of
their affairs, and the public press is the best means of accomplishing that task (Boyd 11
49). Since public opinion is the basis of elective government, Jefferson wrote, "the very
first object should be to keep that right" (49). He goes on to state in no uncertain terms
the importance of the press: "Were it left to me to decide whether we should have a
government without newspapers, or newspapers without a government, I should not
hesitate a moment to prefer the latter" (49). If education is responsible for shaping the
republican spirit and a critical ability to recognize threats to common rule, the press serves
the complementary role of keeping the Homer-reading farmers abreast of current events
and the performance of their representatives. This educational role, coupled with the
press' position as critic of the government, give the press a function in society close to the
role of cognition in the individual: as Jefferson wrote Washington, public debates, the
"fair operation of attack and defense" between a virtuous press and the government, will
help the people arrive at the truth of the issues under discussion (Boyd 24 357). In that
1792 defense of Freneau, Jefferson added that "nature has given to man no other means
of sifting out the truth either in religion, law, or politics” (357). These two concerns come together again in an 1816 letter to Charles Yancey, in which Jefferson writes: “Where the press is free, and every man able to read, all is safe” (Bergh and Lipscomb 14 384).

Given the importance of a free press as a forum for the public mind to arrive at the truth, it should not be surprising that Jefferson’s support for free expression was qualified by an insistence that the press accept the responsibility which comes with its crucial position in a republican society. He often insisted that in order to play a constructive role in society, the press must be honest – a condition which it all too often failed to meet.

Jefferson first complained of a lack of honesty in the press while in Paris, where he received news of his own country from the presses of Europe and England. The English press was, in his view, consistently inaccurate and inflammatory – in a 1787 letter to St. John de Crèvecoeur Jefferson blamed them for “robbing” the Americans of the invention of the single-piece wheel and passing credit on to the English (Boyd 11 43). In an earlier letter to George Wythe, he described how European papers served to convince Continentals that the image of the United States received through British papers was somewhat distorted. Jefferson’s handling of the subject reveals his acute sensitivity to the reports of the press:

The European papers have announced that the assembly of Virginia were occupied on the revisal of their Code of laws. This, with some other similar intelligence, has contributed much to convince the people of Europe, that what the English papers are constantly publishing of our anarchy, is false; as they are sensible that such a work is that of a people only who are in perfect tranquility (Boyd 10 244).
These European papers, in fact, did more than correct the erroneous notions propagated by the English press: they also served as a medium for the spread of the ideas on which Jefferson hoped the new nation's society would be built:

Our act for freedom of religion is extremely applauded. The Ambassadors and ministers of the several nations of Europe resident at this court have asked of me copies of it to send to their sovereigns, and it is inserted at full length in several books now in the press; among others, in the new Encyclopedie. I think it will produce considerable good even in these countries where ignorance, superstition, poverty and oppression of body and mind in every form, are so firmly settled on the mass of the people, that their redemption from them can never be hoped. If the almighty had begotten a thousand sons, instead of one, they would not have sufficed for this task (244).

That the Bill for Religious Freedom was his own creation, although it was passed into law in an amended form, Jefferson does not mention here (of course, Wythe was aware of that fact already). Its acceptance vindicates the young government of the United States of the charges of the British press of "anarchy" in their nation's former colony. The first triumph stated in this passage, then, is that of one set of newspapers — the European, which are honest — over another — the British, which are dishonest. The "similar intelligence" which has contributed to correcting the European view of events is subordinated to the power of the papers, and the focus shifts back to the presses after only a few sentences. The European presses are also the means by which the ideas of the American Revolution will be disseminated: the Bill for Religious Freedom (which is itself a document, and so is representative of the power of language), which will be presented to Europe through its
various published forms, "will produce considerable good" in countries so benighted that true redemption may be hopeless - even under the ministrations of a thousand sons of the Almighty.

The dishonesty evinced by the British press in this instance was not without parallel in the United States, and later in his career Jefferson became increasingly disenchanted with the press at home, largely because of the number of attacks made on him through that organ. Because of its tremendous importance, when the press was dishonest it rendered itself worse than irrelevant; it threatened the very system which guarded its rights. During his second term as President, Jefferson wrote to John Norvell in response to a query as to how a newspaper should be run "so as to be most useful" (Bergh and Lipscomb 11224). After touching upon the importance of the study of history to the young republic, Jefferson launches into a discussion of those most powerful distributors of information, the newspapers. Jefferson suggests that a newspaper can only be made useful "by restraining it to true facts and sound principles only." Unfortunately, such is not the reality of the situation in the United States, and Jefferson goes so far as to say that an honest paper "would find few subscribers." He then continues on the theme of the veracity of the press, and the dangers of its untruthfulness:

Nothing can now be believed which is seen in a newspaper. Truth itself becomes suspicious by being put into that polluted vehicle. The real extent of this state of misinformation is known only to those who are in situations to confront facts within their knowledge with the lies of the day. I really look with commiseration over the great body of my fellow citizens, who, reading newspapers, live and die in the belief, that they have known something of what has been passing in the world
in their time; whereas the accounts they have read in newspapers are just as true a
history of any other period of the world as of the present, except that the real
names of the day are affixed to their fables.... I will add, that a man who never
looks into a newspaper is better informed than he who reads them; inasmuch as he
who knows nothing is nearer to truth than he whose mind is filled with falsehoods
and errors. He who reads nothing will still learn the great facts, and the details are
all false (224-25).

These are strong words indeed, though perhaps understandable, given the things which the
newspapers so often had to say about Jefferson. Nor are they surprising coming from the
man who insisted that ignorance is better than error in the sciences — here, ignorance is
better than the misinformation disseminated by the presses. The dangers of the falsehoods
in the press are that even those truths published are suspect, so that, in the end, only those
already cognizant of the facts can judge truth or untruth. In other words, a small elite
possess the knowledge, and the press's primary function of disseminating information to
the real decision makers — the people — is rendered impotent. Worse yet, the people are
not only ignorant, they are unaware of their ignorance. The contrast between the last line
in this citation and Jefferson's earlier position that he would prefer "newspapers without a
government" to "a government without newspapers" is stark. Although, in the abstract,
Jefferson would probably still support his earlier statement, the actuality of the press has
rendered the institution worse than irrelevant; the newspapers not only fail in their primary
purpose of qualifying the people for government, but by misinforming the public they also
render themselves dangerous. Now the citizen who abstains from reading will probably be
better informed than he who does not, because what is written is untrue.
A few years before his letter to Norvell, Jefferson, in his Second Inaugural Address, mingled his despair at the failure of the press to always fulfill its role in society with his hopes that its abuses might be addressed by the natural corrective of public opinion:

During the course of administration, and in order to disturb it, the artillery of the press has been leveled against us, charged with whatsoever its licentiousness could devise or dare. These abuses of an institution so important to freedom and science, are deeply to be regretted, inasmuch as they tend to lessen its usefulness, and to sap its safety; they might, indeed, have been corrected by the wholesome punishments reserved and provided by the laws of the several States against falsehood and defamation; but public duties more urgent press on the time of public servants, and the offenders have therefore been left to find their punishment in the public indignation.

Nor is it uninteresting to the world, that an experiment should be fairly and fully made, whether freedom of discussion, unaided by power, is not sufficient for the propagation and protection of truth—whether a government, conducting itself in the true spirit of its constitution, with zeal and purity, and doing no act which it would be unwilling the whole world should witness, can be written down by falsehood and defamation. The experiment has been tried; you have witnessed the scene; our fellow citizens...saw the latent source from which these outrages proceeded...and when the constitution called on them to the decision by suffrage, they pronounced their verdict.... No inference is here intended, that the laws, provided by the state against false and defamatory publications, should not be
enforced;...but the experiment is noted, to prove that...the press, confined to truth, needs no other legal restraint; the public judgment will correct false reasonings and opinions, on full hearing of all parties . . . (Bergh and Lipscomb 380-83).

Jefferson expresses here a clear frustration with abuse of “an institution so important to freedom and science,” and a willingness to employ the “wholesome punishments,” the “salutary coercions of law” established against defamation. These laws are connected to health in both phrases cited here, Jefferson describing their effects almost in medicinal terms; when the institution is weakened (its usefulness sapped), these correctives might be expected to heal it. But, if the analogy may be stretched a bit further, Jefferson still prefers, as in bodily health, to let nature heal itself as public debate, ensured by the freedom of discussion, will ultimately arrive at the truth. Again the newspapers, carriers of language, carry also the cognitive ability of the public mind.

*Words and Silences of the Statesman: Jefferson’s Controlled Discourse*

The role to be played by the press in Jeffersonian democracy demonstrates the importance of language to the functioning of a free society. It is also of interest to note Jefferson’s awareness of how the American “experiment” may itself be viewed as a message, a text, which is not “uninteresting to the world.” Jefferson anticipated scrutiny not only of his country, but also of he himself; this awareness of how both his contemporaries and future generations would dissect his words likely contributed to the great emphasis which he placed upon the control of one’s utterances, of how one’s words might be used once committed to paper. As a result, he wrote with extreme self-
consciousness, aware of the tremendous power of any text he might create to both aid and harm him. As has been mentioned, Jefferson's talent for a "felicity of expression" in writing garnered him the right to draft the Declaration of Independence, and many of his early accomplishments were based upon the drafting of documents, such as his contribution to the revisal of the Virginia legal code. Throughout his life, as we shall see, he continued to put his own ideas on paper and — at times — to correct the words of others whose ideas differed from his own. However, by the time he advised his grandson in 1808 to "establish with yourself the habit of silence, especially on politics," Jefferson had suffered the consequences of having words meant for private consumption released to the public at large, and of having those words turned against him (Bergh and Lipscomb 12 196-202). Perhaps the best known example of this is the letter he wrote to Philip Mazzei in 1796, which touched upon Jefferson's concerns for the direction the United States Government was taking. One of the dangers he saw was the rise of "an Anglican monarchical aristocratical party" which threatened "to draw over us the substance, as they have already done the forms, of the British government" (Bergh and Lipscomb 9 336). Even more inflammatory than this was Jefferson's reference to the heroes of the Revolution who had apostasized to these "heresies": "men who were Samsons in the field and Solomons in the council, but who have had their heads shorn by the harlot England" (336). The story of how this letter became public is bound up in language: Mazzei translated the political parts of the letter into Italian for publication in a Florentine newspaper. From there it was picked up by a French paper from which the American press translated it back into English for publication in May 1797. Jefferson was put in the difficult position of either denying the letter, which he could not do, since he had written
it, or of defending it, which, again, would have been difficult. The highly condensed rhetoric which was clearly inflammatory, and the letter had been edited and altered in the translation (for example, "forms," meaning the pageantry of the British government, had been rendered "form," implying monarchy). As he would in other scandals in which the press later embroiled him, Jefferson chose keep his silence, and suffered accusations of treason and of slandering George Washington without defending himself (Peterson 571-572).

Among other things, the publication of the Mazzei letter did serious damage to his relationship with Washington. This damage was exacerbated by the actions of Henry Lee, whom Jefferson accused in a letter to Washington of carrying scraps of Jefferson’s table conversation to Washington with the intent of “sow[ing] tares” between them. Perhaps the final blow to the relationship between the two men was a letter written to Washington by Peter Carr, under the pseudonym of “John Langhorne,” possibly in the hope that Washington’s response might provide material for the Republican propaganda machine in Virginia. Carr’s authorship was revealed to Washington by a Federalist “snooper” in the Charlottesville post office (Peterson 573-574). Not only was the truth of the letter carried to Washington by a third-party, but also a third-party’s actions (Carr’s) were blamed on Jefferson. In the case of Mazzei’s letter and of Lee’s tale-carrying, the essence of what was attributed to him was true, if distorted; it was the mere act of putting his thoughts into words which opened Jefferson up to the consequences which followed. In the case of Carr’s letter, incautious speech was still at the root of the problem, even though that speech was not Jefferson’s. That Jefferson would come to recommend reticence on political matters, then, comes as no surprise.
Again and again Jefferson would demonstrate his fear that by giving his thoughts the relative permanence of written form he was putting himself at risk. When he sent Dr. Benjamin Rush an “Estimate of the Merit of the Doctrines of Jesus,” he was clearly sensitive to his religious views being made public – after all, he had long been accused of atheism, and any straying from orthodoxy might be read as confirmation that he had abandoned religion. “In confiding it to you,” he wrote Rush “I know it will not be exposed to the malignant perversions of those who make every word from me a text for new misrepresentations and calumnies” (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 380). Jefferson goes on to generalize from his fear of his own ideas being made public to suggest that “it behooves every man who values liberty of conscience for himself, to resist invasions of it in the case of others,” and even to avoid “betraying the common right of independent opinion, by answering questions of faith” (381). Jefferson makes this request for the recipient of the letter to remain silent, to keep his words private, in many letters: for example, he closes a letter to John Taylor little more than a year after the American publication of the Mazzei letter with the postscript: “It is hardly necessary to caution you to let nothing of mine get before the public; a single sentence got hold of by the Porcupines, will suffice to abuse and persecute me in their papers for months” (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 47). Revealed here is the self-consciousness with which Jefferson was writing in this period (the letter was written in June 1798, within a month of the drafting of the first part of the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language”). That so much might be made of “a single sentence” of his is not much of an exaggeration, when one considers the damage done by a mistranslation in the Mazzei letter. That Jefferson now feels the need to add such postscripts adds to the
impression that he is writing each word knowing that it may find its way before the public eye.

Despite his fears, Jefferson continued to put his ideas on paper, and for essentially the same reason he feared writing: by recording his thoughts he could ensure that they would be carried to a wider audience, in the hopes that he might better understood, his actions vindicated, his version of republicanism propagated. To Samuel Kercheval, in 1816, he offered some explanation of why he had felt the need to place his opinions before his contemporaries while serving in civil government. Although Jefferson now reveals his opinions to Kercheval “for [Jefferson’s] own satisfaction only, and not to be quoted before the public,” when he had served in government, things had been somewhat different: “while in public service . . . I thought the public entitled to frankness, and intimately to know whom they employed” (Bergh and Lipscomb 1532). Jefferson then proceeds to express some of his most radical ideas to Kercheval, including a number of “amendments” to the system of government, including recommendations for general suffrage, a popularly elected executive and judiciary and periodical amending of the constitution (32-39). He also makes his case for the independence of succeeding generations from those preceding (42-43). At the same time he encourages use of his ideas, he closes the letter with another request for privacy, asking that Kercheval, should he choose not to make use of his suggestions, keep them secret “as the effusions of withered age and useless time” (44).

Looking back on his public career, Jefferson credits himself with the intent of being completely frank with the citizens of the United States so that they might better know the man who served them. However, during those turbulent years of service he admitted an equally valid, if somewhat less altruistic purpose to making his thoughts public and to
quietly recording his version of events. During the long conflict with Hamilton which plagued his years as Secretary of State, Jefferson wrote to George Washington to put forth his understanding of the "internal dissentions" within the administration. Jefferson tells Washington that, although he would rather keep the details of his conflict with Hamilton out of the press, he does not surrender the right to appeal to the people directly if necessary:

If my own justification, or the interests of the republic shall require it, I reserve to myself the right of then appealing to my country, subscribing my name to whatever I write, and using with freedom and truth the facts and names necessary to place the cause in it's just form before that tribunal. To a thorough disregard of the honors and emoluments of office, I join as great a value for the esteem of my countrymen; and conscious of having merited it by an integrity which cannot be reproached, and by an enthusiastic devotion to their rights and liberty, I will not suffer my retirement to be clouded by the slanders of a man whose history, from the moment at which history can stoop to notice him, is a tissue of machinations against the liberty of the country which has...heaped it's honors on his head (Boyd 24358).

The greatest fear expressed in this passage is the marring of Jefferson's public image, and it was the desire to protect that by putting his own version of events before the public which moved him to write, not only to Washington, but to the public as well. His conditions for appealing to the public are not completely altruistic; while the "public interest" is included, his first condition for speaking out is his "own justification." The means by which Jefferson might speak out in his own defense were constrained by his
antipathy for the newspapers, and the controversies and debates between public figures, who more often than not hid behind pseudonyms when writing, which filled their pages. When denying that he had used Freneau's paper as an organ for his own ideas, he swore "in the presence of heaven" that he had never hidden behind pennames or proxies in the newspapers: "I never did by myself or any other, directly or indirectly, write, dictate or procure any one sentence or sentiment to be inserted in his, or any other gazette, to which my name was not affixed or that of my office" (Boyd 24 356). In 1800 Jefferson again wrote with some pride that he had never in his life "directly or indirectly, written one sentence for a newspaper" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1 435).1

So Jefferson meticulously recorded his views in private, primarily in his voluminous correspondence, conscious of the fact that his letters would someday be published; in a sense, Jefferson avoided contemporary controversies, choosing instead to focus on writing the history through which those controversies would be viewed by later generations.2 Toward the end of his life, he admitted as much in a letter to Martin van Buren:

Although I decline all newspaper controversy, yet when falsehoods have been advanced, within the knowledge of no one so much as myself, I have sometimes deposited a contradiction in the hands of a friend, which, if worth preservation,

---

1 So strong was his disapproval of these controversies, Jefferson found it necessary to record in the Anas Abigail Adams' admission that John Adams - with whom he was then entering a long period of alienation - had been the author of the "Davila" papers (Bergh and Lipscomb 1 435).
2 Jefferson was not alone in writing his correspondence with a broad audience in mind: in the long correspondence with John Adams which marked the reconciliation of the two men, Adams often expressed his desire that he be truly understood by posterity - an end he clearly hoped would be served by the lectors of their correspondence. See, for example, Blake, 7-9.
may, when I am no more, nor those whom I might offend, throw light on history, and recall that into the path of truth (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 68).

There are echoes here of Jefferson’s 1808 letter to Thomas Jefferson Randolph, in which he cautioned his young relation against entering into arguments with or contradicting others; Jefferson withholds speaking his views until doing so is unlikely to offend (Bergh and Lipscomb 12 196-202). But he also states explicitly that he hopes to correct history, calling it back “into the path of truth.” This statement comes at the end of a lengthy letter in which Jefferson is doing exactly that by recounting his version of the events surrounding the disaster of the Mazzei letter, attempting in particular to explain what he had meant by his reference to “men who were Samsons in the Field, and Solomons in the council” (62). “History may distort truth,” he wrote to William Johnson not long before the letter to van Buren. It would be the letters of those who lived that history that will set these distortions right: “the opening scenes of our present government [will not] be seen in their true aspect, until the letters of the day, now held in private hoards, shall be broken up and laid open to public view” (Bergh and Lipscomb 15 442). Jefferson is clearly aware that he is not only writing for history, he is writing history.

Nor were his letters the only repository of his version of this history. During his time as Secretary of State, and, less completely, up until 1806, Jefferson made notes of the events in which he was involved, including summaries of private conversations. In 1818, twelve years after the last entry, Jefferson gave these notes a “calm revisal” (removing things which were “incorrect, or doubtful, or merely personal or private”) and bound

---

1 Jefferson concludes a list of rules for self-government in society with a warning against “entering into dispute or argument with another,” warning that he “never saw an instance of one of two disputants
them, together with copies of some original documents. The *Anas*, in which he had recorded the defense of Freneau already discussed, begins with Jefferson’s explanation of his reasons for its creation: these “loose scraps,” Jefferson writes, will offer “testimony against the only history of that period, which pretends to have been compiled from authentic and unpublished documents” (Bergh and Lipscomb 1265-66). That history, Justice John Marshall’s *Life of Washington*, was based on papers in Washington’s collection, which included the “suspicions and certainties, rumors and realities, fact and falsehoods” of many of their contemporaries. Were that history to be relied upon by future generations, they would suppose the republican party (who were in truth endeavoring to keep the government within the line of the Constitution, and prevent its being monarchised in practice) were a mere set of grumblers, and disorganisers (Padover 1205).¹ Jefferson’s *Anas*, then, would re-fight his battles on the field of history, and posthumously at that, since Jefferson never made an attempt to pull these scraps together into his own history of the early days of American republic. Jefferson knew perfectly well that he would be an object of scrutiny to future historians; when he wrote, then, he did so with a sense, not only how his words might affect his own generation, but of their impact on the future as well.

¹ Bergh and Lipscomb have for some reason chosen to excise this passage from his edition, so I have here cited Padover’s *Complete Jefferson*.

convincing the other by argument. I have seen many, on their getting warm, becoming rude, and shooting one another” (199).
"The Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language": Shaping a Context

The "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language," too, should be viewed in the context, not only of what it says, but also of what Jefferson may have intended it to accomplish. If his private correspondence and personal diaries were expected to bear far greater responsibilities than merely conveying his thoughts to his correspondent or aiding his own memory, then the fact that he felt compelled to put his ideas about Old English on paper reveals the importance of the subject to him in a way that his other comments on history and language cannot. In the light of this understanding, the context in which he wrote the two parts of the "Essay" – the "Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar," most likely written in 1798, and the essay written to accompany the "Specimen" in the 1820's – can be expected to illuminate why he may have seen fit to write on the subject. Jefferson explicitly connected the later installment to the greatest project of his twilight years, the creation of the University of Virginia. In that context, its purpose seems clear: Old English was, as we have seen, important for many reasons – it was the language in which the oldest English laws were recorded and the foundation of Modern English, the language of the young republic. Old English also served as a link to an Anglo-Saxon and from thence to a Gothic tradition of liberty, the full meaning of which will be discussed in Chapters 3 and 4. Putting on paper his case for the study of Old English and the means of making its attainment easy to students at that juncture is quite understandable: the University offered him the best opportunity to enshrine his ideals and impart them to future generations, and knowledge of Old English – taught as Jefferson intended it to be taught – furthered that cause.
However, Jefferson wrote the first "installment" of the "Essay" under somewhat different circumstances, at a time in his life in which its usefulness is not immediately apparent. The "Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar" was probably drafted during the summer of 1798, while Jefferson was on hiatus in Monticello from the Vice Presidency (Hauer 889). Jefferson was embroiled in controversy that year, which began with Congress awaiting word from envoys who had been sent to the Directorate in France to discuss terms that might prevent the United States from becoming directly involved in the conflict between that nation and England. At home, the American "Whigs" and "Tories" were divided by the war in Europe: the "Tory" Federalists were for allying with England, and expressed a fear that France might at any time invade the Americas. The "Whig" Republicans, with whom Jefferson identified himself, preferred neutrality, and as a result were labeled "Jacobins" by the Federalists. Jefferson suspected Adams and the Federalists of monarchical leanings, and many of the entries he made to the Anas during this time present the possibility of an American monarchy as a real threat. Jefferson was seen by the Federalists as a pro-French philosopher, and his attacks on the founding fathers in his letter to Mazzei had not been forgotten. Accusations of Jacobinism became even more strident after the XYZ affair: dispatches from the U.S. mission to France revealed that agents of the French crown had, among other demands, insisted on a sizable loan from the United States in exchange for peace. When Adams informed Congress of the failure of the mission, the Republicans suspected the administration of attempting to push the United

---

1 The dating of the various components of the manuscript is discussed further in Chapter 5, below.
2 See, for example, his discussion of a "convention of the States" held at Annapolis, at which, according to Jefferson, the supporters of monarchy strove to obstruct the efforts of republicans in hopes that "nothing being done, and all things going from bad to worse, a kingly government might be usurped, and submitted to by the people, as better than anarchy and wars" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1 269).
States toward an alliance with England and demanded the publication of the dispatches. The Federalists obliged, and the conduct of Talleyrand, the French agent, shocked even the Republicans; their demand for publication had backfired. This fed the anti-Jacobin hysteria, and Jefferson’s efforts to excuse France’s behavior made him, again, a target of the Federalist presses (Peterson 593-597).¹ This hysteria gave the war party the momentum it needed to pass the Alien and Sedition Laws. Jefferson, who was already under fire for allegedly sending his friend, Dr. Logan, on a surreptitious mission to France, was thought by some Republicans to be the target of the Sedition Act, which made it a federal crime “for anyone to enter into conspiracy impeding the operations of the federal government or to publish ‘any false, scandalous and malicious writing’ against the government” (Peterson 606). The Act led to immediate arrests, and Jefferson delayed his return to Monticello for several months in order “to stave off still more violent measures” (Peterson 607).

Jefferson turned to the Philosophical Society for refuge during this period. He wrote to his daughter Martha: “I have changed my circle here according to my wish, abandoning the rich…and associating entirely with the class of science,” (Peterson 599). Among his companions was Benjamin Rush, whose thoughts on language and history have already been discussed. After his return to Monticello on July 7th, Jefferson made his notes for Herbert Croft; the “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar,” as Hauer has argued, is likely the final version of that document (886). In this context, the essay almost

¹ Lawrence S. Kaplan describes the result of “Jefferson’s years of cooperation with France” as no less, by 1798, than “the destruction of most of the hopes he had nourished for himself and for his country,” at least in regards to France (77). Kaplan’s discussion of why Jefferson remained so loyal to France, despite the turmoil in that country, is illuminating, focusing primarily upon the sources through which Jefferson received his information on events in that country (77-81).
seems another means of escaping the political chaos of Philadelphia. But, given the nature of the chaos, the “Essay” is an interesting response. To begin with, Jefferson had repeatedly come under fire as a pro-French Jacobin. In the “Observations” he turns to the language of the Anglo-Saxons, the shared ancestors of many Americans and the British. Moreover, the “Observations,” like the rest of the “Essay,” insists that Old English is no more than an older dialect of Modern English. He makes this point first by suggesting that the pronunciation of the Anglo-Saxon characters was likely passed down “by tradition” (69). Jefferson then lays out his plan for reforming Anglo-Saxon orthography in published editions and makes his case for a simplified system of declensions. With these simplifications in place, Jefferson predicts that a reader would experience “little more difficulty in understanding an Anglo-Saxon writer than Burns’ Poems” (75).

After completing this simplification of the language of his ancestors, Jefferson then sent a copy to an English etymologist. It is almost as if Jefferson, accused of Jacobinism, insisted on his neutrality by turning to the language of the enemy of France. More probable is the possibility that, in sending the “Observations” to Croft, Jefferson was making an appeal to the international fraternity of scientists – an appeal he later made explicit in the postscript to the final draft of the “Essay” prepared for the University of Virginia. This appeal was not only a written one, but was concerned with language, with all the meanings that subject may have had for Jefferson. While the Sedition Act was placing constraints on free expression (a threat Jefferson was about to respond to by writing the “Kentucky Resolutions”), and while Jefferson himself was the recipient of heated attacks in the Federalist Press, he turned to the subject of language. Moreover,
Jefferson exercised his will over language through his “reforms,” and he chose a language that was integrally related to his political philosophy.

Jefferson’s “Essay” does not, however, reach out only to England and its Anglo-Saxon past. While English writers were interested in the subject of language, it was in post-Revolutionary France that language was being discussed with increasing urgency. While the French government worked to disseminate the langue nationale, questions were being raised about lexical ambiguity and neology by the turmoil of the revolution itself (Ricken 191). Regarding the first issue, the possibility “that one and the same expression could have diametrically opposed meanings, depending on the social and political standpoint of those using the word” drove home an awareness that new meanings continued to accrue to old words, and that those meanings were not necessarily the work of accident (Ricken 191). While neology had been debated in France since the publication in 1726 of an anti-neological dictionary, during and in the years following the Revolution “intense neological activity [was] evident in the great number of words created for newly coined concepts, and this activity was enhanced by an awareness that a linguistic renewal was under way” (191-92). Urbain Domegue and Louis-Sébastien Mercier were important contributors to this movement, as were the Ideologues. 1791 saw the foundation of Domegue’s “Société des Amateurs de la Langue Française,” with the goal of creating a dictionary which would “give the ‘first free people’ a language that was worthy of its new political existence” (194). At the charter meeting, Domegue linked language with freedom by making it France’s task to provide “to all nations the example of the regeneration of languages,” as America had given France “the example of the regeneration of laws” (195). The science of “lexicology” would provide the dictionary makers with,
among other things, both “sound etymology” and “the treasury of a wise neology” (195). Both of these concerns – the restoration of the original meanings of words by tracing them back to their origins and the enrichment of language through new additions – played a role in Jefferson’s own work in language, including the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language.” Mercier was also concerned with neology, and in three more years would publish his Néologie, and Le Nouveau Paris, which was published in 1798, contains several chapters which comment upon “new words or word usages” (199).

In 1795, French law made general grammar a required subject in the newly founded “Ecoles centrales,” which served as the primary audience of Destutt de Tracy’s Éléments d’Idéologie (207-208). While Jefferson may not have delved deeply into the Éléments d’Idéologie, publication of which did not, at any rate, begin until 1801, he was familiar with the work of Condillac, whose ideas served as the foundation of Tracy’s, and whose La Logique had appeared in 1780. The work, which, as has been mentioned, Jefferson owned, was very much concerned with the role which language had to play in the faculty of reason. While Jefferson may not have accepted all of Condillac’s conclusions, the Logique does explore the concept of a well-made language, based, not on blind innovation, but on a return to the root of language, analysis, and to the organic evolution of language; new words would spring up from among a people with the ideas they express, so that “the progress of the sciences” may be seen in “the formation of language” (277). Although Jefferson was not so threatened by linguistic borrowing as Condillac, one of the benefits he would claim for the study of Old English is, as we have seen, the strengthening of Modern English by returning to its ancient form, both to restore
the original meanings of English words and to revive the practice of coining new words by the combination of roots.

In turning to the language of the Anglo-Saxons in 1798, then, Jefferson embarked on a subject which drew upon the two traditions which had the greatest influence on his thinking, those of England and France, nations which, at that time, were embroiled in a struggle which had carved great divisions into the young American government of which Jefferson was a part. That Jefferson’s flight into scholarship reflected a desire to escape these troubles is very likely; however, his choice of subject at this time, in approximately the same period in which he was, among other things, writing the Kentucky Resolutions against the Alien and Sedition Acts, is evocative. At a time when he feared the American revolution was straying from its ideals, Jefferson conducted an analysis of the ancient form of English, which, in its intended goal of enriching the language of his nation, paralleled the concerns of participants in the younger French Revolution. Nevertheless, he did not write an essay on neology – he turned to the origins of his language, to the tongue spoken by the ancestors who had, he believed, been as jealous of their freedom as Jefferson and his Republicans were of theirs. Old English was also the language of Jefferson’s legal training, and so offered a link to the ancient English constitution and to the common law that was its modern embodiment. The study of language and the methods of scholarship employed by Jefferson forge links with the French thinkers from whom he inherited many of his most radical ideas, but the language he studied was that of his English ancestors, and that choice of subject was hardly accidental, given the relevance of the myth of a freedom-loving Anglo-Saxon race to his political thinking. When, in 1798, Jefferson retreated into the study of Old English, one of his goals at some level may have been to
bring together France, which he loved, and England, with which he shared both a history and a culture, even if he could only do so in the realm of scholarship. At a time when he was writing with extreme self-consciousness— as his request to John Taylor not to let “a single sentence” get before the “Porcupines” demonstrates— he put his thoughts on paper, knowing full well that doing so might bring them to a far broader audience than a single British scholar.

**Correcting History: Jefferson's Approach to Editing**

For Jefferson, the power of the written word transcended his own time; it became a tool for both influencing the events of the nation and ensuring that his perspectives on those events would outlive him. Jefferson does not, however, seem to have been consciously producing propaganda— he was determined, rather, to see the “truth” disseminated. His desire to control the interpretation of events went beyond what he himself wrote: at times Jefferson turned to reshaping the texts of others in order to ensure their correctness, a tendency that certainly contributes to an understanding of how he could wreak such radical changes on the language of the Saxons, almost completely abandoning the wisdom of those very scholars who had taught him Old English. As a system of classification was subjective, built from elements selected with utility, not “reality” as the primary guide, so too texts could be adapted and altered in order to reflect Jefferson’s own truth— the truth which was most likely to preserve the liberties gained in the revolution. Perhaps the best example of this is his long-standing enmity for David Hume’s *History of England*, and the methods he endorsed to repair the damage that work had done with its Tory perspective on history. This conflict also highlights again the
profound power of the written word in Jefferson’s thinking— the power, in the case of Hume’s work, to mislead the innocent. Much has been written about Jefferson’s opinions on Hume, particularly since some of those opinions arguably undermine the strength of his position on free speech. As Douglas L. Wilson puts it, “it has appeared all the more unseemly that the great champion of freedom and education should protest so loudly about the dangers of reading a book” (Wilson “Jefferson Vs. Hume” 50).

And protest he did, in increasingly virulent terms with the passage of time. Jefferson’s initial reaction to Hume’s History, as we have seen, was a positive one. As late as 1787 he recommended the early volumes of Hume to Peter Carr; Wilson suggests that the clashes with Hamilton, an open admirer of Hume, during the 1790’s may have contributed to the souring of Jefferson’s opinion of the History, although he did still include Hume in recommended reading lists. In the letter to Norvell, discussed above, in which he so caustically discussed the dishonesty of the press, Jefferson also took aim at Hume. Jefferson wrote to Norvell that British history should be studied by their countrymen; he warns, however, that Hume’s work, despite its elegance, “seems intended to disguise and discredit the good principles of the government” (Bergh and Lipscomb 11223). “This single book,” he wrote to John Adams in 1816, ”has done more to sap the free principles of the English constitution than the largest standing army of which their patriots have been so jealous” (Cappon 2 498). What most bothered Jefferson about Hume was his “Tory” attitude toward the relationship between the rights of the crown and those of the people, especially his contradiction of the Whig belief that popular rights had their roots in the ancient constitution of the Anglo-Saxons. Jefferson blames Hume’s distortions on his method of writing: he had begun his History with the Stuarts and had
served, in Jefferson's view, as an apologist for them. "He spared nothing, therefore,"
Jefferson once wrote in a lengthy discussion of Hume, "to wash them white, and to
palliate their misgovernment. For this purpose he suppressed truths, advanced
falsehoods, forged authorities and falsified records" (Washington 7 412). The defense of
the Stuarts, however, was the least of his offenses: after having attained "fortune and fame
by this work," Hume continued his history, moving further back in time with each
successive volume, but in each "maintain[ing] the thesis of the first, that 'it was the people
who encroached on the sovereign, not the sovereign who usurped on the rights of the
people'" (418). Finally, he turned to the Anglo-Saxon period, "to make of the whole a
complete history of England, on the principles on which he had advocated that of the
Stuarts" (418). What Hume said of this period we learn only by Jefferson's insistence on
its opposite view, that the Anglo-Saxon government had exhibited "the genuine form and
political principles of the people constituting the nation, and founded in the rights of man,"
while that of the Norman usurpers was "built on conquest and physical force, not at all
affecting moral rights, nor even assented to by the free will of the vanquished" (418).

Jefferson was concerned about Hume's History, then, because it undermined one
of the foundations of his own political thinking, that the United States, in pursuing a
republican form of government, paralleled what the Anglo-Saxons had done when they
emigrated from Germany and established in their new home a society based on the natural
"rights of man." More dangerous even than this position, though, was the power of
Hume's writing: in his letter to Norvell Jefferson warned that Hume's History was so well
made, that it had the power to "instil [sic] its errors and heresies insensibly into the minds
of unwary readers" (Bergh and Lipscomb 11 223). To Adams, as to Norvell, Jefferson
attributed the power of Hume’s book to the author’s “fascinating style,” and to William Duane Jefferson wrote that “everyone knows that the judicious matter and charms of style have rendered Hume’s History the manual of every student” (Cappon 2 498, Bergh and Lipscomb 12 405). The power which Jefferson attributed to Hume’s eloquence is remarkable:

So bewitching was his style and manner, that his readers were unwilling to doubt anything, swallowed everything, and all England became tories by the magic of his art. His pen revolutionized the public sentiment of that country more completely than the standing armies could ever have done, which were so much dreaded and deprecated by the patriots of that day (Washington 7 412).

Hume’s writing is magical, capable of bewitching the unprepared, transforming them into Tories. Such is the power of language, and it is, apparently, the power of Hume to persuade which earned him Jefferson’s long-standing enmity – others expressed Tory positions on English history, but none received such sustained criticism from Jefferson as did Hume.

When, during his second term as president, Jefferson acquired John Baxter’s A New and Impartial History of England, he found a book he could advocate as an alternative to Hume, and with that advocacy came some of his most heated attacks on Hume’s work (Wilson 59-69). In Baxter’s history, Jefferson saw a corrective for the “poison” of Hume’s:

Baxter has performed a good operation on it. He has taken the text of Hume as his ground work, abridging it by the omission of some details of little interest, and wherever he has found him endeavoring to mislead, by either the suppression of a
truth, or by giving it a false coloring, he has changed the text to what it should be, so that we may properly call it Hume’s history republicanized (Bergh and Lipscomb 11 223-24).

Although Baxter’s “operations” on Hume as described here may be enough to unsettle most scholars, it is in part what is not said that is so disturbing. Baxter had abridged Hume and incorporated his own opinions in order to change the ideological focus of the text from an “incorrect” Tory view to a “correct” Whig (or Republican) view. That he had “changed the text to what it should be” where Hume either suppressed or distorted truth is somewhat ominous, but the extent and method of his alterations are not made clear in this letter. When Jefferson wrote to William Carey in order to persuade him to publish Baxter’s book, Baxter’s editorial style, and Jefferson’s approval of it, is surprisingly frank:

[Baxter] gives you text of Hume, purely and verbally, till he comes to some misrepresentation or omission, some sophism or sarcasm, meant to pervert the truth; he then alters the text silently, makes it what truth and candor say it should be, and resumes the original text again, as soon as it becomes innocent, without having warned you of your rescue from misguidance. and [sic] these corrections are so cautiously introduced that your are rarely sensible of the momentary change of your guide. you [sic] go on reading true history as if Hume himself has given it (Sowerby 1 177).

Baxter is praised here for deceiving the reader; his history truly is “Hume’s republicanised,” in that, to the casual reader, Baxter’s words and Hume’s might be indistinguishable. Even the most sympathetic reader cannot easily overlook the fact that
Jefferson had vilified Hume for scholarly practices which are comparable to Baxter’s operations. Hume had “suppressed truths, advanced falsehoods, forged authorities and falsified records,” while Baxter “alters the text silently,” leading the reader to believe that his words are Hume’s. Both scholars deceive: Baxter stands above Hume only because his deceptions reveal the “truth” as Jefferson saw it.

In Jefferson’s defense, Dumas Malone has pointed out that scholarly notions of plagiarism were quite different in Jefferson’s day (Malone Sage of Monticello 206-207). It may very well be that Jefferson’s intentions were innocent enough: Hume had distorted history, and Baxter had restored it to its correct form. Leonard W. Levy, however, offers a harsher interpretation of Jefferson’s endorsement of Baxter, suggesting that the incident shows “his willingness to be a party to intellectual deception. In the case of Hume, he feared that truth would not best error in a fair encounter and therefore needed a slight advantage” (Levi 144-145). This may, as Wilson points out, be unfair. Jefferson had clearly expressed his belief that Hume’s elegant style was capable of overwhelming the inexperienced or uninformed – so that an encounter with Hume’s text was not a “fair” one from the outset. Arthur Bestor, referring to Jefferson’s promotion of Baxter’s “sorry combination of plagiarism, expurgation, and clandestine emendation” as “embarrassing,” adds in his defense that “expurgation has, by long usage, become almost respectable in preparing books for the young,” and that Baxter made his own political biases clear on the title page (18-19). In the same letter cited above, Jefferson redeems himself somewhat,

---

1 Levy also sees Jefferson working through “indirection, finesse, and subtlety” in his recommendations of required texts for the University of Virginia, texts which included Baxter’s history (147). Levy’s study offers some interesting insights, but needs to be read critically; it does not, as he freely admits, offer a balanced view (his presentation, Levy claims, “balances the conventional one” (ix)).
revealing that, even for him, Baxter’s text was not an ideal solution: he suggests that the best means of opposing Hume would be to publish an edition of his *History of England* that would contain the criticisms and opposing views of other historians (“Antidotes of it’s disguises, it’s misrepresentations, it’s concealments, it’s sophisms, and ironies”) in “collateral columns” and notes (Sowerby 1 177). This suggestion better fits Jefferson’s philosophy of letting truth fend for itself, and implies that his support for Baxter was a stop-gap to protect the unwary until a more complete answer might be made.

Still, Jefferson’s support for Baxter does indicate that he was not above tampering with a text in order to bring it into line with his version of truth. Bestor points out that Jefferson’s belief that books and manuscripts should be useful “occasionally...led him into practices at which a bibliophile would shudder,” such as dismantling a sixteenth century book, trimming its margins, interleaving it with pages from a later Latin translation of the same work, and rebinding the whole into a series of smaller volumes “for easier study and handling (5-6). Perhaps the best example of Jefferson’s willingness to physically re-arrange texts to suit his purposes, and a fascinating indication of his own editorial technique, is his personal edition of the Gospels, “The Life and Morals of Jesus of Nazareth Extracted textually from the Gospels in Greek, Latin, French and English.” The “Life and Morals” differs from the earlier “Philosophy of Jesus” in its depth and in its use of parallel columns (a sort of table) to present the text of the Gospels in Greek, Latin, French and English. Although the dating of the “Life and Morals” is problematic because of its highly private nature, it was most likely created sometime after 1819, about the same time that Jefferson was deeply involved in the founding of the University of Virginia and in his reworking of the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” (Church 26). Susan Bryan’s
discussion of Jefferson’s “scissor edit” of the Gospels demonstrates the deliberateness with which Jefferson reshaped them, transforming Jesus into “a subversive who was just as skeptical of his culture’s sacred texts as Jefferson was of the Gospels” (Bryan 21). Also similar to Jefferson is the new Jesus’s use of eloquence and rhetoric to “argue his followers into an empirical sort of righteousness,” leading them to a morality based, not on divine revelation, but rather on social utility (21). Jefferson’s message is reflected in his method. By fragmenting the gospels with his scissors and then re-assembling them, Jefferson graphically shows that any printed text, even one considered sacred, should not be unconditionally accepted in its entirety. Instead, each element must be evaluated individually (21). Bryan points out that this technique comes very close to “the hermeneutic method of testing pieces of the text against the whole, or rather, against the posited horizon of meaning” (21). By clipping out everything that he did not believe consistent with Jesus’s original teachings, Jefferson resembles modern scholars who attempt to restore authorial intention to “faulty” editions of items of the canon (21-22). Jefferson’s edition of the Gospels reconstructs authorial intention by giving primacy to the spoken over the written word, so that the words of Jesus are disencumbered of “extraneous additions and interpretations” (22). That this extraneous material is part of the text he is editing did not seem to bother Jefferson any more than had Baxter’s operations on Hume. In both cases, truth is revealed only through these alterations, even though the changes involved concealing parts of the original. Truth is not what a text says, but rather it is what it should say.

Jefferson’s editorial techniques are reminiscent of his approach to natural history. It will be remembered that Jefferson believed that systems of classification, such as that
designed by Linnaeus, were constructed upon the basis of the comparison of subjectively selected traits, and were to be judged by their usefulness as a means of communication between scientists and as an aid to memory. While nature created only individuals, the human seeker must arrange those individuals into tables in order to come to some understanding of them. Jefferson’s edit of the Gospels, and Baxter’s operations on Hume, which he endorsed, both involve analyzing texts by criteria drawn, not from their internal structure, but rather from the understanding of the editor. Baxter held Hume’s work up against the Whig interpretation of history, and where there was a discrepancy between the two, he excised text from the original in order to substitute a “corrected” text. In his own analysis of the Gospels, Jefferson first established the criteria by which the text might be deemed true or untrue – the words of Jesus or a later insertion. In a letter to John Adams, Jefferson mentions an earlier version of his scissor-edit, after first describing the need for such drastic operations on the text of the Gospels. “In extracting the pure principles which he taught,” Jefferson writes, “we should have to strip off the artificial vestments in which they have been muffled by priests” (a passage similar to Jefferson’s insistence, discussed elsewhere, that priests had been responsible for inserting Christianity into the laws of Alfred) (Cappon 2384). Those “trappings” include the spiritual beliefs of:

- the Platonists and Plotinists, the Stagyrites and Gamalielites, the Eclectics the Gnostics and Scholastics, their essences and emanations, their Logos and Demiurgos Aeons and Daemons male and female, with a long train of Etc. Etc. Etc. or,
- shall I say at once, of Nonsense. (384)

The result would be a volume limited to “the simple evangelists,” and even from them “the very words only of Jesus” must be selected. In his own efforts, Jefferson cut “verse by
verse out of the printed book” and brought together “the matter which is evidently his, and which is as easily distinguishable as diamonds in a dunghill” (384). The “dung” left behind are those doctrines incorporated into Jesus’s teachings by the “Platonising successors” of the Apostles (384). In brief, Jefferson brought to the text his own materialist doctrine, and, by comparing each passage of the Gospels to the tenets of that materialism, determined which belonged and which were erroneous. In the final version of the “Life and Morals of Jesus,” Jefferson went so far as to present “four identically expurgated versions of the text in parallel columns of Greek, Latin, French and English,” in effect arranging the Gospels into a table in which the passages he has selected through a process of comparison might be analyzed through further comparison of versions (Bryan 20). Jefferson even tabulates his data, as would any natural historian worth his salt, adding to his scissor-edit a table of the texts used in his gospel and the order of their arrangement (Church 33). This, too, was his preferred method of dealing with Hume: publish Hume’s history and the opposing views of “correct” historians in columns, and let the reader arrive at the truth, again, through the process of comparison. As will be seen, Jefferson also employed this method of tabulation and comparison in the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language,” a fact which, when joined with the subjectivism which he believed was an inevitable element of classification, does much to explain how he could propose such radical alterations to Old English grammar.

The discussion of this chapter has focused on the power of speech, of eloquence and of writing to Jefferson. To say that the written word has power does not imply,

---

1 A page from Jefferson’s *Life and Morals of Jesus of Nazareth* can be seen in the published edition of the work, edited by F. Forrester Church (32).
however, that it is inviolable: if a written text was not true, or did not fit Jefferson’s understanding of the truth, it could be altered, edited and re-arranged until it came into line with that understanding. The impact of these observations on the reading of the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” is twofold: firstly, Jefferson’s willingness to “correct” texts helps shed light on the spirit with which he may have approached his subject; although it would be going too far to claim that he intentionally distorted Old English grammar in order to render it more accessible, he certainly was not afraid to reject the conclusions of scholars such as Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob and make radical changes to the language; their texts, and that of Old English itself, were certainly not inviolable to Jefferson. Secondly, the central role played by language in Jefferson’s republic illuminates the importance of the subject of the “Essay,” revealing the utility which earned Old English the right to Jefferson’s scholarly interest. Language, as imperfect as Locke thought it to be, is the basis of speech and of writing, and Jefferson, perhaps because of his reading of Locke, was conscious of how ambiguous language could be: Jefferson’s own legal background would have made this point clear to him as well, even if the Essay Concerning Human Understanding had not. In his Autobiography, Jefferson recounted the 1777 debate over the Virginia Code. The question was whether the code should be revised, or rewritten utterly. According to the opinion Jefferson attributes to himself, Wythe and Mason, rewriting the code posed a number of problems, not least of which was the danger that, once “reduced to a text” its meaning would be potentially ambiguous: every word of that text, from the imperfection of human language, and its incompetence to express distinctly every shade of idea, would become a subject of
question and chicanery, until settled by repeated adjudications (Bergh and Lipscomb 163).

Language, here, is actually a source of confusion—and this in the case of a sincere attempt to reduce a code which is known and understood to words. In the realm of litigation, each word might be expected to bear intense scrutiny, as this lawyer or that tried to make a case, whether sincerely or insincerely, based upon the text of the law. The meanings of those words would only finally be decided after years of opinions—opinions which already existed for the old code. What these opinions offer the text of the law, a knowledge of Anglo-Saxon might offer all the texts of the English-speaking world. The very first line of the published form of Jefferson’s essay is: “The importance of the Anglo-Saxon dialect toward a perfect understanding of the English language seems not to have been duly estimated by those charged with the education of youth” (55). This has direct bearing on the study of law, of course, since much of the code adopted from English common law drew from Anglo-Saxon sources. But the importance of clarity in language, as Locke and Condillac both point out, goes far beyond legal issues. For Locke language is the sole means of communication, while for Condillac clear language is crucial to clear thought. Given the importance of speech and writing to Jefferson’s republic, and the role which language must needs play in the pursuit of knowledge, particularly in the sciences, a “perfect understanding” of English has an impact far broader than mere philological curiosity. An understanding of Old English would improve Modern English, firstly by aiding the process of definition by illuminating the original meaning of words, and secondly by making Modern English a more “well-made” language. By restoring the Old English roots and the Anglo-Saxon practice of combining them to form new words,
Modern English would come to rival the Greek, as neology had allowed the French language to do (Cappon 2 567).

English is also important in and of itself—not only as a vehicle for debate and discussion in republican society. English had closer ties to freedom than the fact that it happened to be the language of the United States: as the modern form of Old English, the language of the Anglo-Saxons and their Germanic forbears, the English language itself partakes of the democratic spirit. The study of Old English, then, offers more than a means towards making Modern English a more useful language; it also illuminates, strengthens and maintains the links between the ancient Germans of Tacitus, the freedom-loving Anglo-Saxons of Whig history and the citizens of Jefferson's own republic. No exploration of the importance of Old English to Jefferson can ignore these powerful political associations which the language of the Anglo-Saxons held for him. Nor can his intended audience for the "Essay" be fully understood without examining the currency of the Anglo-Saxon myth among the colonists and the use to which it was put by thinkers who saw themselves as Englishmen, yet were preparing the way for independence from the mother country. The following chapter will first trace the growth of the Anglo-Saxon myth in England, with emphasis on scholars and writers whose works had a direct influence on Jefferson and his contemporaries, and then will look at how it was made use of in the colonies. This discussion will be followed, in Chapter 4, by an examination of Jefferson's own notions of the ancestors whose language he meant to see revived among the people of the new nation.
CHAPTER 3: NORMAN TYRANTS AND SAXON PATRIOTS

In the years preceding the American Revolution the colonists wove together many ideological strands to make their case, initially for the maintenance of freedoms to which they had become accustomed, particularly the freedom from paying taxes to the British Parliament, and later for complete independence from the mother country. Lockean liberalism and Classical Republicanism both played important roles, as did an appeal to the original freedoms of England’s “Ancient Constitution.” It was the arguments invoking the rights of the Ancient Constitution which often evoked images of liberty-loving Anglo-Saxons, bringing their republican institutions with them from the European forests depicted in Tacitus’s *Germania*. Jefferson’s own version of the Anglo-Saxon myth resurfaced again and again in his political writings, and was central to his belief in the utility of learning Old English, and in the importance of simplifying its grammar in order to render the language more accessible to students. As was seen in Chapter 1, the study of history had an important role to play in Jefferson’s republic, and it was best learned from the words of those who lived it, making the study of even dead languages useful. In the realm of language, the study of Old English could increase the communicative powers of Modern English; in the realm of history, Old English would open for students a window
on the Anglo-Saxon society which Jefferson believed had so much in common with his
own. For this reason, what Jefferson believed about the Anglo-Saxons must be examined.
The history of the Anglo-Saxon myth which informed Jefferson’s historical perspective
will be explored in the present chapter, a study which will also serve as an introduction to
Jefferson’s sources on the subject, since he was familiar with most of the writers
discussed. It will be seen that he was not alone in his beliefs about the Saxons; in fact, his
vision of the Saxons was largely conventional when viewed in the context of both English
and colonial discourse; he accepted the Whig version of history and used the example of
the Anglo-Saxons to support the rights which most concerned him, particularly those of
emigrants and property holders – uses paralleled in the work of many of his American
contemporaries.

Before moving on to an overview of the uses to which the Saxon period was put
by Jefferson’s contemporaries in the American colonies, an outline of the English origins
of the Anglo-Saxon myth is necessary, since the colonists drew upon English sources as
they adapted the myth to their own needs. This discussion will demonstrate the
remarkable flexibility of the Anglo-Saxon myth. Its evolution was integrally tied to the
origins of Anglo-Saxon scholarship and the study of the Old English language, and yet
from the outset that scholarship reflected the political and social agendas of the scholars
engaged in it. The roots of this revival of interest in the pre-Norman period, and the
language in which many of its texts had been written, lay in the English Reformation, while
the development of the Whig version of history was worked out in the struggles between
monarch and Parliament from the 16th century up through the time of the Glorious
Revolution. The history which supported the claims of the English church and later of
Parliament served the colonists in their own demands for their rights, such as that of representation in bodies empowered to levee taxes and that of holding their property alodially, despite English claims that colonial lands were held of the Crown. The following discussion will touch upon the key figures in the development of the Anglo-Saxon myth, focusing primarily on writers whose works appeared in colonial American libraries and so contributed to the propagation of the myth in the colonies. The second part of this chapter will turn to the uses made of the Anglo-Saxon myth in colonial discourse, exploring not only works written in the colonies, but also those English authors republished in American in the years before the American Revolution.

**English Origins of the Anglo-Saxon Myth**

The English antiquarianism which opened up the Anglo-Saxon period to scholars began with the collection of books, perhaps most notably by John Leland, who combed the monastic libraries, culling some books for the Royal Libraries and cataloging those left behind (McKisack 3-5). His area of interest was not, however, Anglo-Saxon England: he was most concerned with the antiquities of Roman Britain (Frantzen 42). Contemporaries such as John Bale and John Foxe were among the first to turn to the Anglo-Saxon period: in their efforts to legitimize the restructuring of the English church they searched pre-Conquest documents for proof that a pristine Christianity had been practiced in England before the Roman Catholic Church had begun its attack on the souls and property of the English (38-39). However, it is Matthew Parker who is often credited with initiating serious research into Anglo-Saxon England (Horsman 10). Made the first Anglican Archbishop of Canterbury by Elizabeth the First, Parker was given the task of justifying
the settlement of the church during her reign and setting the Church of England on a “solid historical base” (Levy, F.J. 117). With the aid of his secretary, John Joscelyn, Parker produced a number of editions and collections of Anglo-Saxon texts, and provided printer John Day with Anglo-Saxon type for their publication (Adams Old English Scholarship 18). Interestingly, Parker employed some of the same editing techniques which Jefferson would later commend in Baxter’s “corrected” edition of Hume. Parker went so far as to “complete” defective manuscripts, making insertions in a hand which imitated the original text – inspired in part by a belief that many manuscripts had been altered by Norman priests after the Conquest (McKisack 34-35, Frantzen 45-46). Parker also reviewed the work of other scholars, including Bale, Foxe and William Lambarde, record keeper of the Tower of London. Lambarde’s Archaionomia is of particular interest: it was in Jefferson’s library, and Lambarde presented the Old English original and his Latin translation in parallel columns, a format Jefferson would often use himself in presenting texts with translations, including his “Specimen” of the Anglo-Saxon prose Genesis (Hauer 895).

Although these early scholars had little direct bearing on Jefferson’s reception of Anglo-Saxon history, they were largely responsible for reopening the Anglo-Saxon period to writers interested in mining the past in the service of the polemics of the present. However, the concerns of these authors were not without parallel in Jefferson’s work. As Bale, Foxe and Parker wished to cleanse the Anglo-Saxon period of the influence of the Roman Church in order to bring its religious system in line with their own, so Jefferson would insist that Christianity had been no part of the common law – had, in fact, been interpolated by priests, a belief reminiscent of Parker’s theory that the Norman priests had
altered Anglo-Saxon religious texts (Bergh and Lipscomb 14 90-91). He even cites Lambarde’s and Wilkin’s collection of laws in support of this claim (Chinard Commonplace Book 354). However, these scholars had little direct bearing on the shaping of the Anglo-Saxon myth at the center of Jefferson’s Saxonism: it would fall to the members of the Society of Antiquaries to initiate serious research on Old English manuscripts, and their works formed the foundation upon which later writers, including Jefferson, built their version of Saxon history. The Society was founded in 1572 under the patronage of Sir Robert Cotton (Adams 42). While Parker, Bale and Foxe had been religious partisans, the Society of Antiquaries consisted primarily of lawyers, trained at the Inns of Court, whose interests went far beyond the history of the English church (McKisack 160). Sir Robert Cotton, John Selden and Sir Henry Spelman, all members of the Society, along with scholars such as William Camden and Richard Verstegen, began to give form to the image of a freedom loving, valiant Anglo-Saxon nation.

Again, however, the scholarship of these men was not wholly disinterested; in fact, the impetus for much of their early work on Anglo-Saxon sources was a desire to counter the Tudor use of an Arthurian past, which legitimized the Welsh dynasty’s claim to the throne, with a version of history more favorable to the Stuarts: the antiquaries traced the origins of English institutions to the Anglo-Saxons and their German forbears rather than to Brutus of Troy and his descendant Arthur (Hill 60). The same work used to solidify Elizabeth’s claim to the throne was made to serve quite a different purpose in the battles over royal prerogative which preceded the English Civil War — a fact which contributed to the demise of the Society under James I (Butterfield 37). It was at this time that the

---

1 Jefferson cites a passage from Parker in the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language.”
The liberties of the Saxons became a central component of historiography of their period. The crux of the debate was the right of Parliament to oppose what it viewed to be royal infringements on their authority; Parliamentarians needed to prove that Parliament, and particularly the House of Commons, had always played a role in governing the nation and even in electing the King, while the Royalists wished to demonstrate that Parliament had been first summoned by the Crown, and so could be dissolved by the King if he saw fit to do so. The nature of the Norman Conquest generated heated debate as well. Had William come as a conqueror and, if so, was he responsible for establishing English law based on Norman precedents? If so, then the King’s prerogative predated Parliament’s, and the power to make and change law rested with the monarch.

The proponents of the pro-Crown version of events were not numerous, and would not later find a sizable audience among the American colonists. They included the Rev. Dr. Blackwood, whose *Apologia pro Regibus* (1581) claimed that William’s power after the Conquest was absolute, and suggested that the English were to the Normans what the American natives were to their Spanish conquerors; Nicholas Ferrar, who suggested that conquest by the Normans “had had a valuable disciplinary effect upon the dissolute Anglo-Saxons,” and Francis Bacon who wrote that William had brought the “ancient laws” to England (Hill 61-62).¹ The Parliamentarians spilled far more ink than the Royalists arguing the other side of this issue. The great jurist, Sir Edward Coke, was

---

¹ Pocock suggests the argument for the Crown’s authority based upon William’s was less widely made than Hill believes (*Ancient Constitution* 54). In response, Hill wonders “why…the Parliamentarians [found] it necessary to regularly and consistently attack a view which nobody held” (Hill 62). Since the opposite argument was made so often, I am inclined to accept Hill’s view that this argument was used among Royalists, if perhaps “at a rather low level of argument” (Hill 63).
one of those who insisted that the English common law not only pre-dated the Conquest, but had in fact existed since time immemorial. Coke, whose works on the common law were the starting point in the education of colonial lawyers, including Jefferson, did not believe that that law originated with the Anglo-Saxons, and unlike such writers as Verstegen and Camden, he does include Brutus of Troy in the lists of the ancient codifiers of English law (Pocock Ancient Constitution 40). However, William was no more its source than the Saxons: Coke believed that English common law had descended from the most ancient times, since long before written records of it had been made, continually refined by custom and added to by the decisions of judges. William was no law-bringer; rather, he swore to observe these ancient laws, and went so far as to gather them into a compilation he called the “laws of King Edward.” William’s successors continued the restoration of this law of King Edward in increasingly purer form, until the process culminated in John’s Magna Carta (Pocock 44, Butterfield 47-55). Along with the common law, the institution of Parliament could be traced back to pre-Norman times, as could the attendance of the Commons, which had begun among the Anglo-Saxons (Hill 65). “There were Parliaments unto which the Knights and Burgesses were summoned both before and in the reign of the Conqueror,” Coke wrote in the Preface to the Ninth Reports (Pocock Ancient Constitution 40). He supported many of his claims with a source much used by those of like mind, both in Coke’s time and after, The Mirrour of Justices, which had been transcribed by the Society of Antiquaries and widely circulated in manuscript (Hill 66). Although it presents itself as an account of the laws of King Alfred, the evidence of its thirteenth-century origins were so obvious that even Coke eventually
had to admit that the text had been worked on at that late date (Vann 265). The \textit{Mirrour} explicitly placed the origin of the monarchy with the people: after God had delivered England to the Anglo-Saxons, they “chose themselves an [sic] king to Raign [sic] over them,” and made him swear to uphold the law (\textit{Mirrour} 3). ¹ Coke was even less critical about the equally spurious \textit{Modus Tenendi Parliamentum}, from which he drew material on pre-Norman parliamentary procedures and which offered, by its mere existence, proof that Parliament went back at least as far as the time of Edward the Confessor (\textit{Modus} 1). John Selden and Henry Spelman were apparently less credible than Coke, at least in this regard; they both identified the work as being of more recent vintage than the eleventh century origin it claimed for itself (Vann 266).

Coke’s contribution to the Anglo-Saxon myth was his tracing of the ancient constitution back to pre-Norman times; however, he placed its origins in a period long before the coming of the Saxons to England, and believed that William had wrought no substantive changes in English law. It would be Coke’s contemporary, the antiquarian Sir Henry Spelman, who would “discover” that the Normans had brought more than their language with them across the Channel: they also brought to England the feudal code in its most oppressive form. J.G.A. Pockock credits Spelman with the “discovery” of feudalism in England, and Jefferson would later commonplace him when conducting his own inquiry into feudal history. ¹ Spelman was himself steeped in the common law tradition which was at the heart of Coke’s thinking, and its influence remained with him throughout his career as a scholar; however, when he initiated a thorough study of the terms used in both the

\footnote{This passage's description of the \textit{adventus Saxorum} calls to mind Jefferson’s proposed seal for the United States; the \textit{Mirrour} claims that God had “brought down low” the tyrannical British nobility and “delivered the Realm to the most humble and simple of all the countries adjoyning[sic]” (\textit{Mirrour} 3).}
legal and the ecclesiastical realms, many of which had become obsolete by his time, Spelman took a fresh, uniquely critical, approach to common law (Pocock Ancient Constitution 94). In preparing the Archaeologus, a massive historical dictionary, Spelman followed his belief in the Germanic origins of the English language to continental sources on history and law. In his discussion of the term “Feudum,” he outlines his version of the history of feudalism: Spelman traced the origins of the feudal system to Germanic peoples, going so far as to accept that Tacitus’s comites were probably the ancestors of the vassals. However, in the time of the Saxons feuds “were no more than for life”: it was the Normans who introduced the tyranny of hereditary tenure, based on the French practice (Kliger 127-28). This innovation, and perhaps more importantly the feudal notion that all lands were held of the Crown, would prove of great importance to American colonists arguing for their rights as property holders. However, according to Spelman, the true foundation of English law came, not from the French practices of the Normans, but from “’the prime and most potent’” Germans (Kliger 129). Spelman’s conclusion that William had brought a fully evolved feudalism into England would maintain its hold over opposition writers for many years to come.

John Selden, Spelman’s fellow in the Society of Antiquaries and another whose writings would later appear in colonial libraries, including Jefferson’s, is closer to Coke in his belief that the laws of England suffered no radical changes after the Norman invasion; history was, for Selden, a continuum, “in which the only change was likely to be degeneration” (Colbourn Lamp 159, 214, 216, 218-20, Vann 267). 2 Other scholars whose

---

1 See Chapter 4 below.
2 The references from Colbourn support the appearance of this work in colonial libraries. The same convention will be followed below.
work would later fuel the Whig view of history included William Camden, who, like his contemporaries in the Society of Antiquaries, insisted on a Germanic, rather than a Trojan, origin for the English people—indeed, in his Britannia he discusses the continental origins of the German invaders of England at some length in passages commonplacened by Jefferson (Camden 175-181). Richard Verstegan’s Restitution of Decayed Intelligence would prove an even more valuable source for the Saxonists who would follow him. Verstegan, who dedicated his work to James I, the descendant “of our ancient English-Saxon kings,” begins the Restitution with the statement that “Englishmen are descended of German race” and dedicates an entire chapter to proving this point and to demonstrating “how honorable it is for Englishmen to be descended from the Germans” (Verstegan 1, 25-54). For his description of the Germans as a courageous and principled, if warlike, people, Verstegan draws upon such Classical writers as Aristotle, Tacitus, Julian and Caesar (whose criticisms of the German race he refers to as “a bad reporte [sic] at his enimyes [sic] hand”) (46). He concludes that the English nation, “doubtless from [the Germans] descended,” need not seek elsewhere for their origins, “beeing [sic] from no where able to deryue [sic] it more cleer, [sic] nor no way more honorable” (54). In Verstegan the Saxons are recognizably those same noble ancestors whose history would provide such fertile materials for the Whigs of England and colonists such as Jefferson, and he would be widely cited in their works.

The struggle between Charles I and his Parliament would generate further permutations of the Anglo-Saxon myth as the opponents debated which faction held

1 It is interesting to note, given Jefferson’s concerns about European immigration, that Verstegan also insists upon the racial purity of the English and the Germans, and goes so far as to point out that “their
ultimate authority. One important work inspired by this struggle, which would make its way into colonial libraries, including Jefferson’s, was Nathaniel Bacon’s *Historical and Political Discourse of the Laws and Government of England*, which Samuel Kliger has described as “a landmark in the growth and development of the Gothic tradition in England” (Colbourn Lamp 215, 218, 220, 222, Kliger 141). Bacon’s work echoed many of John Selden’s ideas; in fact, many readers claimed Bacon used Selden’s materials for his book, and the 1760 edition is explicitly attributed to “the manuscript notes of John Selden” (Vann 267, Bacon 1). Bacon describes the Anglo-Saxons as “a free people, governed by Laws, and those made not after the manner of the Gauls (as Caesar noteth) by the great men, but by the people” (Bacon 9). Although the Saxons were not perfect — Bacon acknowledges that many writers have said they were “no better than highway-men both by Sea and Land” — their government was an ideal one (10). The king served by suffrage of his people, and his election was “qualified under a stipulation or covenant, wherein both Prince and People were mutually bound each to other...and the Prince to the people [was] to be no other than the influence of the Law” (30). Not only was their king’s power constrained by the law, but the Saxon people also participated directly in their government by means of the “mickelmote,” or “Wittagenmote,” the ancestor of Parliament, which was attended by both “Lords and Freemen” who debated on issues and voted “by noise” (56, 37). Bacon concludes that “the Saxon Commonwealth was a building of greatest strength downward even to the foundation,” and by its merits “the

language” had never mixed “with any forrain toung [sic],” the dangers of which would later be described by Condillac (43).

1 Jefferson purchased Bacon’s *Historicall Discourse of the Uniformity of the Government in England* for both his second and third libraries, and Adams was an admirer of Bacon’s work (Colbourn Lamp 86, 218, 220).
Saxona became somewhat like the Jews, distinct from all other people...and their Government, above all other, likest unto that of Christ’s Kingdom” (70). The comparison to the Jews cannot but call to mind Jefferson’s proposal for the Great Seal of the United States; one side would depict Hengest and Horsa emerging from the sea, the other Moses leading the Jews out of bondage. In Bacon’s version of events, the Normans also served a divine purpose, having been sent by God as a “scourge unto Harold”; far from being a conqueror, William, who held a legitimate claim to the throne, was accepted by the Saxon nobility, including Harold, and submitted to the Saxon laws of kingship (70-71). This version of events granted Bacon and his fellows the right to claim from Charles what the Saxons had claimed from their kings.

During the Interregnum, such arguments were seen by radicals such as the Levellers as replacing one form of tyranny – that of the King – with another – that of Parliament. Rather than making both the servants of the law, many in Parliament insisted on sovereignty for their own body, placing themselves as far above the law as the king had been before them (Kliger 258). Although the Levellers might originally have agreed with the principal that ancient liberties had existed in the constitution of the Saxons, as their thought developed they drew sharper lines dividing their present from that past. While their historical perspective seems to have exerted little direct influence on the American colonists, they deserve mention here because their ambiguity about the past at times comes quite close to Jefferson’s own, with an important difference: while the Levellers eventually turned away from historical precedent to base their claims on natural right, Jefferson continued to the end of his life to appeal to both the liberties of the Saxons and the rights

---

1 John Adams described Jefferson’s proposal to his wife in 1776. See Familiar Letters of John Adams and
of man according to Nature’s law. Like Jefferson, the Levellers perceived the Norman invasion as a radical break in English history. John Lilburne, who had initially accepted Coke’s depiction of the Magna Carta as an embodiment of Anglo-Saxon liberties, later came to reject this position, and to agree with fellow Levellers Walwyn and Overton that the Magna Carta contained no more than a remnant of the ancient rights of the people (Hill 76). Writing in prison in 1646, and probably embittered by his own experiences with the courts, Lilburne broke from Coke and the common law tradition: “The greatest mischiefe of all and the oppressing bondage of England ever since the Norman yoke” was that he must be tried by the common law (76). This is a startling statement from a man who had once been a devotee of Coke, but Lilburne no longer believed that the common law as it was enforced in England had its roots in the immemorial past, as the passage which follows this statement demonstrates: “the tedious, unknowne, and impossible-to-be-understood common law practices in Westminster Hall came in by the will of a Tyrant, namely William the Conqueror” (76).

According to Lilburne, the common law, which had been for Coke the immemorial wisdom of the English people, refined over generations but never significantly changed, is not only “tedious” and impossible to understand, but was in fact introduced by William, as an element in the “Norman yoke” of tyranny which he imposed upon the Saxon people. At his trial, Lilburne went so far as to tell the judges that they were “no more than Norman intruders” (77). Lilburne is no longer arguing from a purely legal perspective,

---

1 According to Richard T. Vann, Coke’s initial influence on Leveller thought was quite significant — Lilburne went so far as to have a portrait of himself made, pleading at the bar with Coke’s Second Institutes in his hand, and Richard Overton was reading the Institutes at the time of his first arrest (265).
since the law has become a tool of oppression: the rights which he claims must be derived instead from nature. However, appeals to pre-Norman common law were not utterly superceded, and many Levellers took a position with which Jefferson would have sympathized when they suggested that the ancient common law had, in fact, been the law of nature (Hill 78). Lilburne even proposed that legal issues be resolved before the hundred courts, thus abolishing the innovations introduced into Westminster by the Normans (Hill 81). While Jefferson never went so far as the Levellers in his rejection of the common law, which he believed did represent the system of the Saxons, he would have agreed with them that tradition alone did not determine right. For him, the law of the Saxons was just where it coincided with natural law (as in the Saxon practice of holding lands allodially), and it was “set at naught” by the Norman invasion, which substituted force for natural right (Bergh and Lipscomb 1643).

The controversies of the mid-17th century also produced a number of works which would later carry Whig history, and with it the Anglo-Saxon myth, into the colonies. In 1648, when it was still possible to hope that the Long Parliament might dissolve and the king issue writs for a new election, Sir Robert Filmer began publishing tracts against the absolute power of the Parliament – against, in fact, the whole notion of a mixed monarchy, in which the king’s power was limited by that of the Lords and the Commons (Pocock Ancient Constitution 151). By carefully examining the writ of summons which called Parliament to session, Filmer attempted to demonstrate that the role of the Commons had been to give consent to Parliament’s rulings, and that of the Lords to give council. The right of making law lay only with the king: Parliament is not, then, a legislative body at all (Pocock Ancient Constitution 151). In fact, there had been a time when the Commons
had not even been present at council: according to Filmer, they had first been summoned by Henry I, and since a king had created the Commons, there was no barrier to another king dismantling the House (Pocock _Ancient Constitution_ 153). While the original publication of Filmer’s work failed to accomplish its desired ends, his ideas would resurface during the debate over the exclusion of the Duke of York from the throne, which began in 1679 (Robbins 28). Filmer’s works were republished (and, in the case of the _Patriarcha_, published for the first time), and among those who responded to Filmer at that time are many of those writers whose works would bring the Anglo-Saxon myth into the libraries of colonial America, including Algernon Sidney, William Petyt, James Tyrrell and John, Lord Somers (28).¹

Of these men, only Sidney did not live to take up his pen again after the Glorious Revolution or in response to the 1710 impeachment of Henry Sacheverell for proclaiming theories of divine-right (Robbins 73, 78). Sidney’s major work, which Jefferson owned, was _Discourses Concerning Government_ (Colbourn _Lamp_ 217, Robbins 42). Though Sidney’s comments were essentially forward-looking — he was a believer “in the necessity for constant change in government” — he did demonstrate what Caroline Robbins calls a “nostalgia for the medieval world in which master and man, land-lord and tenant, formed a Gothic balance” (45). Sidney’s execution in 1683 would make him a martyr for future revolutionaries, and his _Discourses_ “was more of a Bible” to the American revolutionaries “than any of the other works of his century” (Robbins 46). Although William Petyt’s _The

¹ Citations of where these authors appear in colonial libraries are as follows: Algernon Sidney (Colbourn _Lamp_ 11, 16, 201, 203, 205-8, 210, 212, 213, 215-27, 220); James Tyrrell (10, 200, 201, 202, 211, 213, 218, 220); John, Lord Somers (212, 218, 221). Because Somers’ work was republished in the colonies, he will be discussed in the second part of this chapter.
Ancient Right of the Commons in England Asserted was written before the republication of Filmer’s work, it was not published until 1680, and was seen as at that time as an attempt to counter Filmer’s arguments. In fact, Petyt was writing in response to William Dugdale, who had delved into what documentary evidence was available to argue in his The Baronage of England that the Commons had not formed a part of Parliament until the reign of Henry III (Adams 69). Petyt’s angry response to Dugsdale’s work, which would be widely read in the colonies, argued that the Commons had been “an essential and constituent part” of Parliament since the time of the Britons (Colbourn 16, 209, 210, 159, 210, 217, 219, 221, Petyt 3). He provides evidence from such sources as Spelman, Camden and Coke to demonstrate that the Saxons had “made Laws and managed the great affairs of the King and Kingdom” in their “Wittena Gemots” (Petyt 7).

James Tyrell, a friend of Locke’s, also responded to this republication of Filmer’s works, and continued writing until long after the Glorious Revolution. In the Biblioteca Politica: or an Enquiry into the Ancient Constitution of the Ancient Government, first published shortly after the Revolution, Tyrell explores the roles of Parliament and King, and the issue of where ultimate sovereignty resides, and in the process presents the Anglo-Saxon myth in the form in which it would be most widely accepted in the American colonies, with one important difference. The Biblioteca is in the form of a long dialogue between a Tory, Meanwell, and a Whig, Freeman, and the history of the Anglo-Saxons plays an important role in their debate. Meanwell follows the Royalists of the Civil War era in building his case for the power of the kings upon the right of conquest. However, William is not the only Conqueror in Meanwell’s version of events: the Saxons themselves, whose kings were as absolute as William, had ruled by the same right (Tyrrell
351). In order to answer this claim, Freeman offers an outline of Saxon history: the Saxons had been a “free People” who had created their king to serve them, and only by “the Consent and Voluntary Submission of the People” had the first monarch received his title (349). The people continued their influence through Parliament, which operated in “Conjunct Authority” with the king (350). From Tacitus Tyrell offers evidence that this balance of power was the legacy of the Saxons’ Germanic heritage: like all “Nations of the Gothick Original,” the Anglo-Saxons had never submitted to an absolute monarchy (356). Freeman goes on to trace Anglo-Saxon liberties through the Heptarchy to Alfred and Edward the Confessor, whose laws were no more than a compilation of the laws made by the Great Council of the kingdom (362-63). On the subject of the Normans, Tyrrell’s version of events breaks from that of Jefferson and others in the colonies: in Tyrrell, the Normans were not oppressors, but rather another Germanic people who helped to perfect the English system of limited monarchy when they introduced the House of Lords (371). The “Ancient Constitution” of England had therefore been instituted by ancestors which included both peoples (371).

It was this view which, according to Christopher Hill, came to dominate historical thinking after 1660, and which came to be referred to as the “Whig interpretation of history.” An essential element of this version of events was the belief that the Saxons had enjoyed the liberties defended by the common law and the ancient constitution, but those same liberties survived the arrival of the Normans and continued to survive thereafter, thanks to the struggles of the English, until the present day (Hill 87-90). There were still dissenters to the notion that English liberties descended from the practices of the Anglo-Saxons. Sir Matthew Hale, Chief Justice of the King’s Bench under Charles II, considered
it a “Moral Impossibility” to give “any satisfactory…Conjecture, touching the Original of [English] laws” (Hale 57). Dr. Robert Brady believed, among other things, that the Normans had introduced a new kind of law to England with feudal tenures. In his Introduction to Old English History, one part of which is dedicated to refuting Petyt and which Jefferson and others in the colonies owned, Brady insists that William “Governed the Nation as a Conqueror” evidence of which is offered by “his bringing in a New Law, and imposing it upon the people” (Sowerby 3 129, Colbourn Lamp 213, Brady Introduction 13-14). Brady also denied the immemorial nature of the Commons in Parliament, and proposed the 49th year of Henry III’s reign for the date of their first sitting (Brady Introduction “The Introduction”). He would argue both positions again in his Complete History of England, where he states in the epistle that “all the Liberties and Priviledges [sic] the People can pretend to, were the Grants and Concessions of the Kings of this Nation” (Brady History “To the Reader”). Thomas Hobbes also offered up a version of history at variance with the Whig view. “The knights of shires and burgesses were never called to Parliament,” Hobbes wrote in Behemoth, “…till the beginning of the reign of Edward I, or the latter end of the reign of Henry III” (Hobbes 99). Moreover, no sharp distinction could be drawn between the Saxon and Norman methods of calling Parliament, since both “descended from the Germans” and so “had the same customs in this particular” (98). Brady and Hobbes both offered what Jefferson would have termed the “Tory” version of history; predictably, they made little impact upon Americans seeking justification for rebellion. The Whigs and their authors, on the other hand, would be read widely, and many of the colonists would come to see themselves as continuing the long struggle to retain the liberties of the ancient constitution.
Saxon Liberties in the New World

In England, Whig history and the Anglo-Saxon myth so central to it were most often mined to support the rights of Parliament, particularly of the House of Commons; when conflict arose between Great Britain and her colonies in America, the colonists invoked that same myth, now adapted to suit their own needs. While general appeals to the liberties of the Saxons were popular in the colonies, the Americans also found specific elements of the Anglo-Saxon myth ideally suited to their own claims against Great Britain. Colonists saw in the Anglo-Saxon migration from Germany to England a parallel to their own status as Englishmen resettled in the New World. The representational nature of Saxon government was also an issue for Americans, but only so far as it supported their own claims that Parliament had no right to levy taxes on a people not represented in its body. Others pointed to the Anglo-Saxon system of government a model for their own, or insisted on the property rights which were an essential component of that system. Although many of the authors already discussed appeared in colonial libraries, the following discussion will begin with an exploration of works published in England which were particularly suited to the colonial environment, most of which were republished within the Colonies in the years before the Revolution, a clear indication that the colonists themselves were conscious of their relevance. The discussion will then turn to colonial writers who appealed to the history of the Anglo-Saxons in the years preceding the American Revolution, and to one significant figure – John Wilson – who continued to draw parallels between the Americans and the Saxons long after the establishment of the new republic. It will be seen that Thomas Jefferson’s beliefs about Saxon history would have stirred little controversy among his contemporaries; when making a case for the
importance of studying the language of the Anglo-Saxons, he could at least expect his 
lectors to grasp the relevance of the Anglo-Saxon example to their own efforts to build a new society in America.

A number of scholars have touched upon the subject of the influence of historical ideas on the ideology of the American Revolution. Bernard Bailyn’s investigation of the pamphlet literature of the period explores the evolution in thought that turned dissenting Englishmen who happened to live in the colonies into revolutionary Americans, and touches upon the importance of the Whig historical tradition (Bailyn Ideological Origins 41-42). Gordon S. Wood devotes the first chapter of The Creation of the American Republic to the “Whig Science of Politics” and discusses the appeals to the heritage of the English Constitution which were such an important part of Whig politics (Wood 3-45).¹

H. Trevor Colbourn’s The Lamp of Experience is the most complete exploration of the influence of historical thinking in the colonies. He recognizes the effect on the colonists of “True Whig” writers, who often drew upon the “golden age of their Saxon ancestors” to support their positions (185-186). At the same time, however, Colbourn recognizes that the Americans read even these authors selectively, and in doing so reached conclusions unique to the colonial context:

The American achievement was one of adaptation and translation. They used whig [sic] history, they used whig arguments, but their borrowing fed ideas and led to decisions appropriate only to the colonial circumstances. Had the Founding

¹ Robert E. Shalhope’s review on the scholarship of republicanism in colonial America (“Republicanism and Early American Historiography”) provides a useful overview of the discussion of other factors, particularly socio-economic ones, which worked with ideology to move the colonies toward rebellion.
Fathers remained totally true to the English whig historical tradition they would never have produced a revolution—their counterparts in England did not (189).

This description of the colonists in general applies as well to their most scholarly Saxonist, Thomas Jefferson. Though Jefferson may have made a deeper study of the language of the Anglo-Saxons than any of his contemporaries in the colonies, his use of Saxon history paralleled that of other colonial writers in most areas.¹ This is not particularly surprising; the broad outlines of the Anglo-Saxon myth were widely accepted in the colonies, as the passing references to Saxon liberties made in many pamphlets and sermons indicates.

Colbourn suggests that one reason for this interest in Saxon history was the importance of land titles in colonial America and, indeed, we shall see that the Anglo-Saxon practice of holding lands alodially was important to several of the writers to be discussed below, as well as to Jefferson himself. Most colonists first encountered a version of the myth in the common law tradition they found, not only in Coke, but also in the works of other legal scholars, particularly in those of John Vaughan and William Blackstone. Vaughan stated outright that Saxon law was a part of the common law, and Blackstone not only agreed, but went so far as to urge lawyers to investigate the history of British and Germanic law in Caesar and Tacitus (25). Blackstone blames the introduction of the feudal code into England on the Normans, and traces the first collection of the common law to Alfred, describing the similar compilations of Kings Edgar and Edward the Confessor as “no more than a new edition, or fresh promulgation of Alfred’s code...which our ancestors struggled so hardly to maintain under the first princes of the

¹ Or even than many in Europe, as Malcom Heartwell Arnold has demonstrated in his survey of the “Status of the Study of Old English in the World of Letters in 1798” (Arnold 71-119).
Norman line,” and which later princes promised to “keep and restore” (Blackstone 2 40-41, 1 43-45). Colonists also turned to Tacitus, available in Thomas Gordon’s English translation, for the evidence of what that Germanic law had been, as well as to writers of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, including many of those already discussed, who demonstrated the applicability of the Anglo-Saxon myth to contemporary problems.

French historian Paul de Rapin’s History of England held a place in many colonial libraries and undoubtedly contributed to the spread of Whig history in America (Colbourn Lamp 10, 11, 12, 15, 16, 158, 200, 201, 203-209, 212-16, 218-20). It was available in an English translation, a copy of which Jefferson would have encountered in his father Peter’s library (158). Rapin concludes the fifth book of his history with a “Dissertation on the Government, Laws, Manners, Customs and Language of the Anglo-Saxons,” in which he expresses a version of Saxon history well-suited to the colonial environment. Rapin begins by establishing both the age of Anglo-Saxon laws, and their continued survival in England:

Whoever has any knowledge of the government of this kingdom, will easily be convinced, by what I shall relate on this head, that the customs now used by the English, are, for the greater part, those which the Anglo-Saxons brought from the northern countries, and lastly from Germany (Rapin 174).

Rapin, like Jefferson, attributed the foundations of English law to the system which the Anglo-Saxons brought with them during their migration, firmly stating that up to “the conquest of the Normans, there was not in England a single law, but the substance of it might be found among the Germans” (175). One of the characteristics the Saxons brought with them from Germany was a highly decentralized form of government not unlike the
federal system later implemented in the United States. When Hengist was first called to the aid of the Britons, he and his followers left behind them in Germany a kingless society divided into twelve provinces, each of which was led by a governor who was "established by the general assembly of the nation," the "Witten-Gemot" (175). Internally, these twelve provinces were further divided into towns and boroughs, each with its own governor. In wartime, a single governor was selected by the assembly, to "command the army" and to "[p]reside over the civil affairs of the commonwealth," but this leader never took the title of king (175). Although Hengist and the leaders of the kingdoms of the Heptarchy had assumed the title of "king," they continued to share authority with their individual Witten-Gemots, and over the seven kingdoms was established another assembly, designed to administer to "those affairs which were common to the whole nation of the Anglo-Saxons" (175). Rapin admits to uncertainty when discussing the particulars of the great council of the Saxons; he accepts the role of the nobles in the Witten-gemot, but remains non-committal about the presence of the commons at this council, explaining that "all the ancient monuments" which would offer evidence of their status had "been buried in the ruins of the monasteries, either before or after the Norman conquest" (Rapin 184-85). Whether joined by the commons or not, the Witten-gemot had been a powerful force, without which the king could not pass laws or lay taxes – in fact, although the king’s prerogatives may have included the declaration of war, that power had been limited by his reliance upon his council for tax revenue (Rapin 185-87). Although Rapin did not go so far as to claim that the monarchy was elective, he did grant the Witten-Gemot the right to "[a]ssume an absolute authority" in "extraordinary
occasions.” If kings deviated from custom in naming their successors, “they took care to have their choice confirmed by the general assembly” (Rapin 189). 1

James Burgh, another author popular in the colonies, attributed to the Saxons a fear of centralized authority which resulted in a system much like that which Rapin describes in the homeland of the Saxons before their exodus:

For the general government of the country, the antient Saxons [our ancestors] ordained 12 noblemen chosen from among others for their worthinesse and sufficiency. These in the time of peace, rode their several circuits, to see justice, and good customs observed, and...at appointed times, met together to consult and give order in publick affairs; but ever in time of war one of these twelve was chosen to be king, and to remain so only as the war lasted (Burgh 104).

Burgh takes the Saxon’s control over their king a step further than Rapin had: they not only had the right to influence his decisions, but they had originally elected to him to office. The change from this elective government and the establishment of noble titles Burgh blames on Charlemagne, who not only made the Saxon king Wittekind’s position permanent, thus introducing monarchy among the Saxons, but who also converted him to Christianity – a juxtaposition of “evils” likely to appeal to Jefferson’s sensibilities (104-105). Although Burgh’s version of events (which he attributes to Verstegan), does not

1 Colbourn, in his Doctoral dissertation, “The Saxon Heritage: Thomas Jefferson Looks at English History” (72-73), attributes to Rapin a vision of a Saxon government which enjoyed an elective monarchy. In the “Dissertation,” however, which Colbourn does not cite, Rapin does qualify this position as discussed here.

2 Burgh’s presence in colonial libraries is discussed in Colbourn, Lamp of Experience (165, 153, 205, 207, 211, 214, 216, 218, 221).
perfectly match Rapin's, Burgh demonstrates his familiarity with Rapin by citing him as a source on a law enacted in 1444 to limit the tenure in office of sherrifs (Burgh 104-105).  

While the authors discussed to this point likely had their effect on the historical perspective of the colonists, colonial publishers frequently reprinted previously published works which could be read as supporting the American cause, whatever the original circumstances of their writing, a clear indication that the Americans themselves saw their relevance to the situation in the colonies. Henry Care presents Whig history in its purest form, though, like Burgh, he makes only passing reference to the Saxons, without going into great depth about their customs and laws. His English Liberties was readily available from England, and editions were published in Boston in 1721 and in Providence in 1774 (Colbourn Lamp of Experience 19). Care concerned himself with the limitations of royal power: he insisted that kingship was derived from the law, and not the law from the king (Care 1-2). King John, in granting the Magna Carta, was not therefore conceding anything of his power; rather, he was restoring "the suffrages of the people, who claimed them as their rights and privileges, and as their birthright" (Care 6). These rights and privileges were rooted in the system devised by the Saxons, who "very wisely contrived their government, and made excellent provisions for their liberties, and to preserve the people from oppression" (Care 8). These liberties included the "Witenage Mote" and trial by jury (Care 87, 212). Care maintained the unbroken descent of English law by insisting that William was no conqueror and had been admitted to the crown "by compact," taking "an oath to observe the laws and customs" of the English (Care 8). However, the

---

1 The passage quoted by Burgh can be found in Verstegan's Restitution of Decayed Intelligence, 62-63.
usurpation of English liberties that eventually led to the war with John began with William and continued with his successors (Care 8).

John, Lord Somers, an English Whig who had played a role in bringing William and Mary to the throne, drew upon Saxon history to do more than merely limit royal prerogative: he appealed to tradition in order to justify the right of a nation to replace its monarch when just rule gave way to despotism and tyranny. While making his argument, he also touched upon a subject which would play a key role in colonial use of the Anglo-Saxon myth, including Jefferson’s own: the rights of colonists to adapt their laws to suit their new environment. Somers’ *Judgement of Whole Kingdoms* could be found in many colonial libraries, and editions were published in Newport and Philadelphia (Colbourn *Lamp of Experience* 30). Somers argues from the *Mirrour of Justices* that the English kings were created by the Saxons to put a stop to the “continual Wars that attended the Reigning of so many Kings in so narrow a Compass of Land,” and that they had sworn an oath to guard the rights of the people; the monarchy was based on this social compact (18-19). Of even greater interest to colonists may have been Somers discussion of the history of the Saxon system: the Angles and the Saxons, who had been “the most powerful and valiant People of Germany,” had brought their form of government, with its “Councils and Magistrates,” from their native country. However, they did not feel themselves bound to maintaining that government in its original form:

As soon as the *Saxons* came into this Country, they had their *Micklegemots*, which were general Assemblies of the Noble and Free-Men, who had in themselves the Power of the Nation: [the variety of forms taken by this institution over time] does evidently testify that they ordered all Things according to their own Pleasure;
which being the utmost Act of Liberty, it remained inviolable under all the
foregoing Changes.... And, we may be sure, those of the Norman Race can have
no more Power, since they came in by the same Way, and swore to govern by the
same Laws (Somers 46).

Somers expresses here not only the nobility of the institution of the Micklegemot, but also
the privilege enjoyed by the Saxons to change that institution to better suit their present
needs – again emphasizing the right of the expatriated to change even the most beneficent
of systems. The continuation of the law under the Normans meant for Somers the same
thing it had meant for his predecessors; by accepting the law of the Saxons, the Norman
kings committed themselves and their successors to upholding the freedoms embodied by
it.

William Penn’s Argumentum ad Hominem and The Genuine Principles of the
Ancient Saxon, or English Constitution, published under the pseudonym “Demophilus,”
also appeared in the colonies in the years leading up to the revolution; both works were
particularly well-suited to the needs of American polemicists. Although Penn died nearly
sixty years before the American Revolution, his treatise reappeared to contribute to
colonial discourse, first in London, then in Philadelphia in 1775. The publisher’s preface
gives as the reason for republishing Penn’s work a desire to sway those who were
“somewhat at a loss what step to take in [these] times of public difficulty” out of a
“modest deference toward those in authority, or for fear of acting inconsistent with their
religious profession” (Penn 3). In fact, Penn’s essay is almost ideally suited to the
publisher’s purposes. Not only is Penn useful as a figure likely to appeal to conscientious
objectors to armed resistance to England, but he also addressed essentially the same issues
at stake in the colonies in the years prior to the American Revolution, drawing very near at
times to Jefferson’s comments on the rights of colonies in the Summary View. The three
most important “Rights and Privileges” which Penn considered to be “the Birth-right of
Englishmen” were, in his own words:

I. An ownership, and undisturbed possession: That what they have, is rightly
theirs, and nobody’s else.

II. A voting of every law that is made, whereby that ownership or propriety may
be maintained.

III. An influence upon, and a real share in that judicatory power that must apply
every such law, which is the ancient, necessary and laudable use of juries: (5-6).

The importance of property rights and of the right to representation in the body making
laws for the colonies were both, as we shall see, of crucial importance to American
writers, including Jefferson. Penn places the origin of the rights of property in Great
Britain with the British, but insists that “the Saxons brought no alteration” to the rights of
property (6). The Saxons also enjoyed the right to participation in legislative bodies: they
“were a free people, governed by laws, of which they themselves were the makers” (6).

Drawing from Tacitus and the Mirror of Justice, Penn describes the “Micklemote,” citing
the latter to give a particularly “Quakerish” twist to the institution: “the Grand Assembly
of the kingdom in the Saxon time, was to confer of the government of God’s people, how
they might be kept from sin, in quiet, and have right done them, according to the customs
and laws” (6-7). As the passage cited above makes clear, one of the rights guaranteed the
German people by their Micklemote was that of voting on laws which preserved their
ownership of property.
Penn insists that the Saxons “lost nothing [of these rights] by transporting themselves” to England: “They brought this LIBERTY along with them, and it was not likely they should lose it, by transporting themselves into a country where they also found it [among the British]” (9). However, Penn suggests that the Saxons may have learned the right to set limits on “Judicatory Power” from the British, since he could find no evidence that it existed in Germany (11). Penn makes use of this fact to emphasize the right of emigrants, not only to keep the liberties they had enjoyed in their native country, but to improve upon such laws as they found defective in their native code. After stating that he would not “enter the lists” on the issue of from where the Saxons derived this right, he does go on to suggest that:

we find it early among the Saxons in this country, and if they, a FREE PEOPLE in their own country, settling themselves here as a new planted colony, did supply what was defective in their own government, or add some new freedom to themselves, AS ALL PLANTERS ARE WONT TO DO, which are those first and corner stones, THER POSTERITY, with all care and skill are to build upon, that itself will serve my turn to prove it fundamental (11).

That the Saxon “colonists” introduced a right not enjoyed in their homeland does not, Penn insists, make that right any less fundamental. While Penn is mining history for the sources of English liberties, he here makes a point Jefferson made even more forcefully later: no group must be bound by tradition, since every people has the right to adapt its laws to its circumstances. Penn closes his discussion of this third right with a reference to the Saxon kings who guarded it, including Alfred, who had put judges to death for abusing
their power, and even William, who "chose rather to rely upon the PEOPLE's Consent, than his own power, to obtain the kingdom" (10-11).

One of the most complete outlines of the Saxon "constitution," and the one which comes closest to Jefferson's own use of the Anglo-Saxon myth, was the anonymously published Historical Essay on the English Constitution. The Historical Essay, which has been attributed to Obadiah Hulme, was first published in 1771 in response to the conflict between England and her colonies (Robbins 363). The relevance of the Essay to the colonists' struggles with England is most clearly illustrated by "Demophilus," whose The Genuine Principles of the Ancient Saxon, or English Constitution, published in Philadelphia in 1776, consisted primarily of excerpts from the Historical Essay. Demophilus' volume could also boast the first publication of the Declaration of Independence. By juxtaposing the American colonies' declaration of their intent to reclaim their own lost liberties with an essay that places the origin of those rights with the Saxons, the author explicitly brings together past and present, linking the traditions of Great Britain with the cause of a group of rebels who had just declared their independence from that nation. For Demophilus, this relationship is more than an illustration, more than a rhetorical device. He explains that he has published his essay for the benefit of those who would soon be meeting in Philadelphia to outline a constitution for the new confederation of colonies; he is recommending that the delegates make use of the example of the Saxons when forming the new government. This is the most explicit attempt to introduce the government of the Anglo-Saxons as an example to be followed, going even

---

1 Interestingly, although Jefferson commonplaced the Historical Essay, he did so only briefly, and did not excerpt many of the passages used here by Demophilus. See Chapter 4, below.
further than Jefferson’s attempts to introduce elements of Saxon practice into the Virginia constitution. According to the Essay, the Saxons had accomplished what the new American confederacy now hoped to accomplish: they had built a system “‘founded...on the common rights of mankind.’” The “‘first principle of their constitution’” was an elective form of government, in which the people delegated their power to “‘such men as they could best confide in.’” Furthermore, the Saxons were wise enough to understand and guard against “‘the degenerating principles of mankind’,” which might lead initially honest men into corruption when they felt their power, by electing their representatives annually (5).

The author of the Historical Essay describes the Saxon government in Germany as a highly decentralized collection of tribes, a system which, according to the Essay, was introduced, largely intact, into England. Local government began at the level of the tithing, each of which had its own legislative body and court of law, all elected by “‘every man who paid his shot and bore his lot’” (10-11). These tithings were grouped together for mutual defense into “wapentakes,” which were themselves organized into shires, each of which had a superior court, a parliament and an elected “‘chief officer’” (11-12). Above the level of the shire, Saxon England was originally divided into the seven kingdoms of the Heptarchy, each led by a king and a Wittenagemote. One of the kings was selected to stand as a “‘generalissimo’” over the rest, and he was served by an appointed council, the ancestor of the House of Lords. When Alfred united the seven kingdoms, he not only retained this council, but he also formalized its role as a separate branch of parliament (14). Demophilus concludes of this Saxon government that “in their own country, and for many years after they settled in England, they maintained that
natural, wise and equal government, which had deservedly obtained the admiration of every civilized age and country" (16). However, the Saxons also offered a cautionary example of the dangers of consolidation: the wisdom of the system of Alfred proved, in the long run, a factor in its own undoing, as it concentrated power into the hands of the few and then lulled the people “into a political stupor” which allowed them to succumb to a conspiracy between William and Rome (17, 28-31). This conspiracy was aided by the Anglo-Saxon clergy, who had “grafted” themselves onto the body of Parliament by playing upon their influence with the people (24-25). In his desire to make clear that the clergy had originally had no part in the Saxon council Demophilus is again very much like Jefferson, who not only fought for the separation of church and state but who also, as will be seen in Chapter 4, took great pains to prove that Christianity had not been part of the Anglo-Saxon common law.

After excerpting this detailed description of the Saxon government from the Historical Essay, Demophilus outlines the lessons it had to offer for the colonies. They should, he recommends, take the opportunity offered by the upcoming convention to create a system modeled on “the old Saxon form of government,” the best that “human wisdom, improved by experience, has left them to copy” (17). This form was elective, and based on the township – much like Jefferson’s “wards” or “hundreds.” Demophilus, quoting the Historical Essay, writes that the Saxons,

by dividing the country into small parts, as our tithings were, the character of every man, that was fit to bear an office, was well known amongst his neighbours. And therefore, when the choice of an officer to preside over them was their object of election, the concurrent sentiments of an uninfluenced majority, of a multitude of
people, would naturally fall upon those men only, who were most eminent for their wisdom and justice (22-23).

Again, these ideas are close to those Jefferson would espouse. The size of these small communities enabled them to select the best leaders from amongst themselves, those whose "wisdom and justice," rather than their station of birth, qualified them for leadership. With the addition of an educational system to prepare them for their roles, this sounds very much like Jefferson's belief that a "natural aristocracy" could be culled from the people of his hundreds, leaders capable of protecting the rights of their neighbors. In fact, according to Demophilus the colonists had already begun re-instituting some of these Saxon practices by forming the Conference of Committees, which brought together the representatives of smaller states who were put into office by frequent elections (4-5).

Most colonial writers who made use of the Anglo-Saxon myth to support their claims against England did not develop such detailed comparisons between the colonists and the Saxons. As had their counterparts in England, American pamphleteers typically wrote in response to specific events, and employed the history of the Saxons to address those circumstances. The long-standing controversy over Parliament's right to tax the American colonies, aggravated by such duties as that imposed by the Stamp Act, inspired many colonists to take up the pen, drawing upon the Whig version of Anglo-Saxon history to assert their rights as property holders to representation in any body authorized to tax them. Richard Bland, in his Inquiry into the Rights of the British Colonies, much admired by Jefferson, draws upon Saxon history for the origin of the rights which the colonies hoped to re-establish (Malone I 134). Bland used Saxon history to demonstrate the fallaciousness of "virtual representation," the theory that Parliament represented all the
English, whether an individual voted for a member or not. Those who put forward this
time theory pointed out that there were populous districts in England which, like the American
colonies, did not elect members to Parliament. How, then, could the colonists complain
about taxation without representation, when they, like these boroughs of England, were
represented “virtually” in Parliament? Bland insists that such an assertion is “not only
paradoxical, but contrary to the fundamental Principles of the English Constitution”
(Blind 6). To support this claim, Bland traces the rights of the English people to their
origins, to determine what those rights were “at the Establishment of the Government”
(7). The Saxons had brought with them from Germany the original of the English
Constitution, altered only as their “Situation and Circumstances” might demand, and the
Wittinagemot, which every Freeholder had a right to attend (7). After the practice of
sending representatives to stand for the Freeholders was introduced, each land owner held
the right to vote in elections (8). There was no “virtual representation” in the time of the
Saxons – each Freeholder attended Parliament either in person or by voting for a
representative.

Bland was not the only colonial writer to draw upon Saxon history to argue that
Parliament had no right to impose taxes on citizens who were not represented in that
body. Maurice Moore’s 1765 pamphlet, The Justice and Policy of Taxing the American
Colonies in Great-Britain Considered, begins with an appeal to Saxon history. Moore
admits that the exact role of the Commons in the Saxon “Wittingham Mote” had been “a
subject of great dispute,” but he cites Spelman, among others, to support the claim that
they were certainly called “whenever the exigencies of the state made a tax necessary”
(Moore 3). William was the first usurper of this right: not only had he “erected a new
court or parliament, of which the commons were no part,” he also “changed the Allodial
tenure of the Saxons into the Feudal” (3). When, “a few reigns after the conquest,”
Parliament was reestablished, “the representatives of the people laid claim to their antient
and equitable right of taxing themselves” (3–4). The colonists, then, would not be the first
to struggle for a reclamation of the old Saxon right of representation in bodies empowered
to levy taxes. The anonymous author of the Monitor’s Letters, published with the
Farmer’s Letters in Williamsburg in 1796, derives the right of representation in legislatures
from the “old common law of the land, the constitution, the immemorial inheritance of
every Englishman,” a right which could be traced back to “the woods of Germany” (93).
A Letter to the Right Honourable the Earl of Hillsborough on the Present Situation of
Affairs in America, published anonymously in London and reprinted in Boston in 1769,
takes a similar tack, and its republication in the colonies demonstrates the appeal of this
line of reasoning. The author of the Letter expresses his dismay when, after the repeal of
the Stamp Act, a “second attempt to raise a revenue from them by parliamentary
authority” by laying duties on certain goods imported into the colonies revived the
colonists’ “distrust and jealously of [English] designs on their freedom” (18). For the
author, this action had violated more than the charters drawn up for the colonies:
“Taxation and representation are connected by an unabrogable law of nature: a law coæval
with the existence of property” (19). This natural law had been established in England, on
the foundation of actual representation, by the Saxons, who, after their conquest of the
island, had divided the conquered lands among themselves, “and every freeman who by
this division became a freeholder; was then a member of their Witten Gemott or
parliament” (19). When it later became impractical for each individual to attend
personally, the practice of electing representatives was introduced, and "every freeholder however small his freehold, had then a right to vote for representatives for the county in which he was resident" (19). This right was not lost until the time of Henry VI, who limited the vote to freeholders whose lands produced an annual profit of more than forty shillings.

John Dickinson was also inspired by the issue of taxation to appeal to ancient English history. Dickinson's historical perspective was derived from many of the same authors read by contemporaries such as Jefferson, including Spelman, Blackstone, Coke, Rapin, Molesworth, Bolingbroke, Macaulay and Tacitus (Colbourn "Dickinson" 274-280). Dickinson employed these resources in response to the Stamp Act, and, although his argument did not center on Saxon history, he laid the groundwork necessary to making such an appeal valid. After first invoking the historic privilege enjoyed by the English of taxing themselves, a privilege ensured by their ancient constitution, Dickinson portrayed the citizens of colonial America as essentially English; he could then go on to describe "colonial rights in increasingly the same way his favorite English historians described their Saxon constitution" (Colbourn "Dickinson" 287-88). He came closest to invoking the Anglo-Saxon myth in response to the Townshend Acts, which, after the repeal of the Stamp Act, attempted to draw revenue by imposing import duties on the colonies. In his Essay on the Constitutional Power of Great-Britain Over the Colonies in America, Dickinson traced the freedoms enjoyed under the English government back to the ancient Germans, whom he declared to be "'the Fathers of Englishmen'" who had come from Germany to England bearing with them "the first principles of the constitution" (Dickinson 66). Despite his insistence that the Englishmen of America had a claim to the ancient
liberties brought by the ancestors of the English out of Germany, he did not, in the end, support a separation from Great Britain as a means of obtaining those liberties, a fact which H. Trevor Colbourn has suggested may have been a result of his historical awareness: “if George III was another James II, Dickinson had no overwhelming ambition to become another beheaded Duke of Monmouth” (“Dickinson” 292). Two elements of Dickinson’s historical sense did have their parallels in Jefferson’s thought: first, the belief that the Americans were, at the root, English, and so could view the legacy of the Saxons as their own, and, second, the tracing of that tradition of liberty back to Germany.

Joseph Galloway, who, like Dickinson balked at full independence from Britain, addressed the issue of taxation in *A Candid Examination of the Mutual Claims of Great Britain and the Colonies*. Writing ten years after Richard Bland, Galloway suggested that the wisest course for Great Britain would be to grant the colonists “the right of assenting to, and dissenting from, such bills as shall be proposed to regulate their conduct” (Galloway 383). These rights were based on property, and were established in the time of the Saxons, among whom “the proprietors of land, gave their personal attendance in the legislative council, and shared the power of making their laws” (378). After the unification of the seven kingdoms of the heptarchy, this system became unwieldy; nevertheless, the Saxons preserved “this important principle, upon which all their rights and freedom depended” by granting land-holders the right to elect representatives to the Wittena-Gemot (378-79). For Galloway the foundation of Anglo-Saxon liberties was their right to representation in legislative bodies, exactly that right which he believed to be at the center of the struggle between the colonies and England.
While the issue of taxation generated a strong response from colonial writers, many Americans made a more general appeal to the liberties enjoyed in pre-Norman times in order to demonstrate that the colonial call for liberty was in the best tradition of the English themselves. One indication of how widely accepted was the belief in Anglo-Saxon liberty is the fact that James Otis could make passing reference to the fact that “liberty was better understood and more fully enjoyed...before the coming in of the first Norman tyrants than ever after” without taking time to support the claim (Otis Rights 441). Dan Foster’s A Short Essay on Civil Government, published in 1775, went into somewhat greater detail when arguing for the historic right of a people to chose its own kings. Foster traces this right from the kings of Israel to the Persians and, in a bit of a leap, to the ancient Britons (17-23). Although the Saxons were the bringers of “tyrannic and despotic power,” and forced the freedom-loving Britons to flee to Wales to maintain their liberty, the Germanic forbears of the invaders were sometimes governed by a mixed democracy, in which the power of the chieftains “depended entirely on the community, or people” (23-24). “As for liberty,” Foster goes on to write, “no people were ever so jealous of it, or ever defended it so long, and so successfully as the Germans” (24). When Roman arms drove liberty “out of the best part of the world,” it found refuge across the Rhine, “in the fastness of wood,” where “poverty, innocence, frugality and modesty” guarded her (24). James Lockwood, who, like Foster, declaimed on liberty from the pulpit, also traced its history through the ages. Lockwood begins a 1759 Election sermon by outlining the history of freedom in Rome and tracing the origins of civil government back to God, then turns to the direct source of the form of government found in the colonies – England. Although Lockwood states that the current form of government (the mixed monarchy)
had "obtain'd in England from the earliest Times," he traces it to the Northern Nations, who established free states on the ruins of Rome, but later degenerated into despotism (11). Only in England were these Germanic liberties, brought to the island by the Saxons, "preserv'd, secur'd and improv'd" (11). This Germanic freedom was enjoyed under the Heptarchy, temporarily usurped by William the Conqueror, and then finally restored by William the Second, who "solemnly promised to restore the ancient Government and Laws" (11).

The figure of Alfred appears in works published and written in the colonies as well, in which he represents an ideal king, defender and establisher of the liberties of his people and founder of important English institutions. Bolingbroke's The Freeholder's Political Catechism, published in Boston in 1757, credits Alfred with the statement that "the English nation was as free as the thoughts of man," and placed him among the monarchs "most indulgent to the liberties of the people" (Catechism 10). In his Master's dissertation for the College of Philadelphia, published in 1766, Stephen Watts credits "the Great Alfred, of glorious and immortal memory" with the founding of the British navy (Watts 49-50). The anonymous Letter to the People of Pennsylvania, published in 1760 as a contribution to the controversy over the independence of the judiciary from the influence of the Crown, invokes Alfred as the "wise founder of the English government" (263). Before Alfred, judicial responsibilities were combined with military authority in the persons of the nobility. The Lords, as "creatures and dependents" of the Crown, necessarily "paid a devoted obedience to the directions of their superiors" in their deliberations. Alfred, the "great father of public virtue," set about remedying this situation:
A generous compassion for the distressed state of the nation induced him to alter the constitution wherever he found it inconsistent with the welfare and happiness of his people. The security of property, without which private felicity is a mere chimera, engrossed his chief attention. He was the author of the excellent institution of trials by jurors, that solid pillar of English liberty. He altered the former dependent state of justice by appointing and commissioning [sic] judges as independent of the crown.... He did not, perhaps, like our modern politicians, see no advantage in an impartial administration of justice, but well knew from late experience that justice must be a stranger to the land whose form of government could not ensure safety to the liberties and properties of the people (Letter 263). For the author of the Letter, Alfred is directly linked to those liberties of which Britain’s colonies in North America were most jealous, including the property rights which were of such concern to Jefferson. Not only was the Saxon king the originator of an independent judiciary and trial by jury, but he is also depicted as a defender of the rights associated with property, such as the right, at the core of so many colonial pamphlets, of representation in Parliament. And, like Demophilus and Jefferson, the author makes explicit the relationship between the Anglo-Saxon example and the present crisis by comparing Alfred to “modern politicians,” who “see no advantage in an impartial administration of justice.”

As widely accepted as the Anglo-Saxon myth may have been in pre-Revolutionary America, there were those who took a different view of English history. William Knox, who, like Galloway, balked at independence from England, provided a rare example of what Jefferson might have called the “Tory” historical view in colonial discourse. Knox
suggests that the origins of parliament lie “hid indeed in the obscurity of antiquity” (Knox 26). The only thing historians could be sure of was that, before the period of written history, “the great men of the realm, who held their lands in capite from the crown, together with the king, composed the supreme legislature” (26). While Knox freely admits that the consent of Parliament had always been necessary for the passage of laws, this body was not composed of the representatives of the people, except in the same sense that the House of Lords might be seen to be representing their interests (26). Even when these tenants became so numerous that they were forced to elect representatives from amongst themselves, the body so chosen represented only the tenants – it could not be claimed that they had been selected by “the people of England” (26). In the end, Knox returns to the concept of virtual representation: the subjects of Great Britain cannot be said to be subject to laws made without their consent, because those laws are made by “the King, Lords and Commons [who] are their representatives,” to whom the English have delegated their right of choice (28).

Some authors traced those liberties to a time even before the coming of the Saxons to England. Jonathan Mayhew, writing more than a decade before the Stamp Act controversy, drew heavily on English Whig writers (to the extent that he was accused of plagiarism by his Anglican opponents) for his “Discourse Concerning Unlimited Submission” (Bailyn Pamphlets 208). In a footnote on the power of Parliament to oppose the Crown, Mayhew discourses at length about the English constitution, which “is originally and essentially free” (241). Mayhew places the origin of this freedom with the original British inhabitants of England, whom Caesar and Tacitus characterized as “extremely jealous of their liberties” (241). Mayhew goes on to describe the British in
terms reminiscent of what other writers had to say about the Saxons, so much so that it almost seems that Mayhew has confounded the two. British kings held their thrones "by grant of Parliament," and the Crown's rights and prerogatives were limited and clearly defined: in fact, the King swore an oath at his coronation that he would "exercise only such a power as the constitution gives him" (241). Other American writers turned to the pre-Saxon past as well, representing the Britons in terms reminiscent of the Anglo-Saxon myth. Daniel Fowle, in his Appendix to the Late Total Eclipse of Liberty, cites Mayhew on the historic liberties of the Britons (Fowle 15). While Benjamin Trumbull follows standard Whig practice by depicting the history of England as a long struggle against tyranny, his history begins, not with the Saxons, but rather with the contest between the British and the Roman invaders: "How warm and bloody were the struggles of the ancient Britons for these privileges when Julius Caesar made his descent [sic] upon the British Island? — And afterwards, with the Saxons, Danes and Normans" (Trumbull 14)? In a long footnote on the same subject, Trumbull describes this struggle in greater detail: to begin with, the Britons "were, at times, intolerably oppressed and most barbarously treated by the Romans" and for hundreds of years "disputed their liberties with them" (14). Not long after the Romans finally abandoned Britain, a new oppressor arrived: the Saxons. Trumbull's Saxons are quite different from those most commonly found in Whiggish depictions of English history. After conquering the island, the Anglo-Saxons "reduced the Britons to a state of servitude, and employed them in all manner of

---

1 It should be noted here that Jefferson commonplace Simon Pelloutier's Histoire des Celtes, in which that author argues that the Celts — including the ancient Britons — had in fact been, like the Saxons, a Germanic people. See Chapter 4, below.

2 A struggle which, according to Jefferson, ensured that Latin made only slight inroads on the British tongue. See Chapter 5, below.
drudgery; particularly in cultivating those very lands, for their foreign masters, of which they had been the Proprietors” (15). When Trumbull complains of the introduction of “foreigners” into “civil rule” under Edward the Confessor, it seems that the Saxons have now become the threatened defenders of England, but they are still not mentioned as such by name (16). In fact, only one Saxon is explicitly referred to as a defender of liberty: Trumbull credits Alfred the Great with the introduction of the jury system, and describes him as “so vigilant…against the least infringement of this noble institution, that he hanged one of his judges for sentencing a man to death without the assent of the twelve jurors” (19).

All of the colonial writers discussed so far were spurred to writing by the conflict between Britain and her colonies in the years preceding the Revolutionary War. James Wilson, who was one of the first Justices of the Supreme Court of the United States and who had played a role in the deliberations over the Constitution and in securing its ratification in Pennsylvania, deserves mention here because he employed the Anglo-Saxon myth as a starting point for an examination of the institutions established by the Constitution in the young nation: like Jefferson, Wilson perceived in the Anglo-Saxon example a relevance which went beyond its rhetorical usefulness in the polemics of revolution. In his lectures on law, delivered during his tenure as the first law professor at the College of Philadelphia, Wilson expressed the hope that he might, as Robert McCloskey has put it, “lay the foundation for an American system of law” based on his own principles (28). While Wilson worked to influence the legal system emerging in the new country, he was nevertheless steeped in the Whig traditions of the English legal world. He followed Coke in his belief that “England has been constantly governed by the
same customs by which it is governed at present” (Wilson 335). While he does not posit a Saxon origin for the common law, accepting rather that “it is extremely difficult...to trace the common law of England to the era of its commencement,” he accepts Bacon’s verdict on the government of the Saxons (discussed above) and finds in it parallels for many of the institutions established by the Constitution (335-337, 347-48). So the common law practiced in the United States “bears, in its principles...a stronger and fairer resemblance to the common law as it was improved under the Saxon, than to that law, as it was disfigured under the Norman government” (348). In other words, the Americans, not the English, are the true inheritors of the Anglo-Saxon system. Before the Conquest feuds did not exist among the Saxons, and, as in the United States, “lands were the absolute proprieties of the owners; they could be devised and transferred at pleasure” (351, 352).

In his lecture on the legislative department as established in both the U.S. and the Pennsylvanian constitutions, Wilson points out that the Saxons could be called “freemen” because they were born free “from all laws of compulsion, except those which were made by their voluntary consent,” a fact which he immediately compares to the preambles of both the United States and the Pennsylvania constitutions, which state explicitly the role of the American freemen in their making: “‘We, the people...ordain and establish this constitution’” (401). As one would expect, Congress is compared to the “wittenagemote,” which “was holden sacred,” and the members of which “were under the publick [sic] faith, both in going and coming” (420). In his lecture on the Executive Department, Wilson compares the President to the Saxon kings, whose “title rested upon the good opinion of the freemen” and who “were elected to their kingly office” (437). To elucidate “the juridical institutions of the United States and of Pennsylvania,” Wilson
again takes "a historical view" of English judicial establishments, "especially those which were formed under the government of the Saxons" (448). Wilson describes the system of hundreds and tythings, which deliberated upon law suits, defence, and "matters of still greater consequence," while above these local assemblies was "the greater assembly" of the wittenagemote (449-50). Alfred is credited with reshaping the court system and, among other things, guaranteeing the right of appeal and, of course, guarding the institution of trial by jury among the Saxons, as "this was a privilege belonging to all the Germans" (470, 512). Wilson is willing to admit that "the Saxons borrowed more from the Britons," who had retained much of the Roman legal system, "than the Britons borrowed from the Saxons"; nevertheless, these institutions seem to have reached their highest level in the Saxon period (517-518). Even the lecture on "Sheriffs and Coroners" points out that the Anglo-Saxons, like "all the other nations of Gothick and German origin," had elected sheriffs with extensive powers (550). In these several lectures, Wilson is writing about institutions which have already been established; his appeals to history are not made to claim ancient rights or even to propose reforms in contemporary practices. Rather, his identification of points of similarity between the Anglo-Saxon and American systems seems rather to be a sign of the success of the American experiment; the system of liberties which had reached its high-water mark before the Norman Conquest had been restored, not among the English descendants of the Saxons, but rather among their successors in the New World.
Anglo-Saxon Liberties: Tradition in Support of Change

The use of Anglo-Saxon history in England began in the realm of ecclesiastical reform, steadily growing until it became part and parcel of political debate over such sweeping issues as royal prerogative and the origins of the common law and Parliament. Its use as a means of legitimizing a variety of positions fits exactly the definition of a tradition given by J.G.A. Pocock:

A tradition, in its simplest form, may be thought of as an indefinite series of repetitions of an action, which on each occasion is performed on the assumption that it has been performed before; its performance is authorised — though the nature of the authorisation may vary widely — by the knowledge, or the assumption, of previous performance (Politics 237).

What is fascinating about the use of the Anglo-Saxon tradition by radicals and reformers in England and America is that it was appealed to for authorization of change, rather than for preservation of the status quo. Pocock explores this use of tradition as well, suggesting that, when drawn upon by radicals, history must give way to myth, "an image of the past owing to the creative imagination and heavily endowed with charismatic authority" (249). As a result, an Anglo-Saxon past from which few documentary sources survived is transformed into a reflection of what the reformer is working to establish in the present: Anglo-Saxon history becomes the Anglo-Saxon myth. For Archbishop Parker and his colleagues, the Anglo-Saxon past revealed a pre-Catholic Christianity which conformed very closely to the form the Church of England was taking in their time. For those attempting to strengthen Parliament and support the inviolability of the common law, the Anglo-Saxons became the Germans of Tacitus, a freedom-loving people who
enjoyed liberty, a monarch constrained by law, and annual parliaments attended by the commons. For those seeking the most radical changes, the Anglo-Saxon liberties could be contrasted to the feudal oppression introduced into England by those usurpers, the Normans.

The power of the Anglo-Saxon myth to invoke ancient English liberties and its supreme adaptability made it a highly useful rhetorical tool in the hands of Americans in conflict with Great Britain. By deriving the rights of the colonists from English origins, the myth enabled even conservatives like Dickinson to resist the dictates of Parliament, and, when the time came to break ties with both Parliament and Crown, the myth provided ample evidence of the people’s right to self-government, including the right to reject an unjust monarch. It should be noted that the use of the myth in the colonies was more homogenous than it had been in England, a homogeneity which likely resulted from the lack of an opposing view; only a handful of writers took the “Tory” view of Anglo-Saxon history even in England, and most of those in the colonies who, like John Adams, did not accept the Anglo-Saxon myth in its entirety were nevertheless on the same side of the issues at stake as those who did; as a result, no pamphlet war debating the particulars of Saxon history developed.¹ So when, in the Summary View of the Rights of British America, Jefferson invokes the example of the Saxons, among colonial readers he was speaking largely to the converted, drawing upon a motif he could expect to be understood by his audience, and which was likely to help him earn their sympathies. As we turn in the

---

¹ Adams preferred to turn to more recent English history to support his arguments. He confessed that “the Saxon constitution is involved in much obscurity”, in large part because of the political uses to which it was put: “the monarchical and democratic factions in England, by their opposite endeavors to make the Saxon constitutions swear for their respective systems, have much increased the difficulty of
next chapter to Jefferson’s perspective on Anglo-Saxon history it will be seen that the
elements of the myth emphasized in the colonies and by him both reflected the unusual
position in which the colonists found themselves: they were English citizens who did not
live in England, and as such were uncertain as to just how English tradition should apply
to them. As colonists, they found the Anglo-Saxon emigration to England of particular
interest, and largely agreed that the Saxons had enjoyed a right to adapt their laws to the
new circumstances in which they found themselves. Jefferson, in the Summary View,
would make much the same argument. The colonists were also concerned with the rights
of property and of representation in governing bodies, and Jefferson turned to the Anglo-
Saxons to demonstrate the right of colonists to make their own laws, as well as for an
example of how lands had been held before the oppressive system of feudalism had been
introduced into England. Writers published in the colonies also found in the Whig version
of Anglo-Saxon history a model for the government of a confederation of states; while
Jefferson’s own federalism drew upon many sources, his outline for local government and
his design for an American education system were both inspired, at least in part, by the
hundreds of Anglo-Saxon England. Finally, what most of the writers examined shared
with Jefferson was a sense of their own place in a Gothic tradition of liberty, stretching
back to the forests of ancient Germany and the tribes described by Caesar and Tacitus.
Despite the many similarities between Jefferson’s notions about Anglo-Saxon history and
those expressed by other contributors to colonial discourse, the broad range of his
interests and, as importantly, the many points of intersection between those interests led
determining...what that constitution, in many important particulars, was”” (cited in Colbourn Lamp of
Experience 93).
him to go beyond his contemporaries in linking the history of the Anglo-Saxons to the study of their language.
CHAPTER 4: THOMAS JEFFERSON AND THE LIBERTIES OF THE SAXONS

Thomas Jefferson’s life-long belief in the Anglo-Saxon myth has been explored by many scholars, and their contributions have been discussed above in the Introduction. In the previous chapter, the evolution of that myth and the uses to which it was put in the American colonies revealed that, while Jefferson’s contemporaries certainly accepted the Whig version of history, for the most part they made it serve very specific purposes: by most authors, the freedom of the Saxons might be invoked against taxation without representation or as a reminder of the traditional rights of the English, as much the inheritance of those who had emigrated to the New World as of those who still resided in Great Britain. Aside from Jefferson, only “Demophilus” made an extended comparison of Anglo-Saxon society with the circumstances prevailing in the colonies at the time of the Revolution, while James Wilson made most frequent reference to the Saxons when describing the institutions of the young United States. For Jefferson, the Anglo-Saxon myth played a key role in his sense, not only of history and law, but of the foundations upon which his own culture was built. Jefferson was also very much aware of his own position in history – not only as an individual whose actions would be evaluated by future generations, but also as the inheritor of a great tradition of liberty; insisting on his right to
a selective use of that past did not, for Jefferson, indicate an utter rejection of the example of his forbears. Jefferson’s beliefs about the Saxons are of particular interest in the context of a discussion of his scholarship in Old English because they both explain the importance of the language to him and shed light upon some of the assumptions with which he approached his analysis of it. In Chapter 2 the importance of language – and particularly of English – to the exercise of democracy in Jefferson’s thought was examined. Jefferson’s commitment to neology was bound up with the re-discovery of the Anglo-Saxon foundations of Modern English. His belief that Old and Modern English were fundamentally the same language, and that by drawing upon Old English he might revitalize Modern English, creating a dialect which might surpass that of the mother country, parallels his belief that the Saxons themselves offered valuable lessons to him and his fellows, and that his nation’s attempt to create a free society was the ultimate flowering of the Anglo-Saxon experience. Perhaps the strongest link between the historical perspective to be discussed here and the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” is Jefferson’s belief that the “filiation” of languages offers proof of the “filiation” of nations: the parallels which Jefferson drew between the history of the Anglo-Saxons and that of his own country derive in large part from his belief that he and his contemporaries had inherited what was best in the Anglo-Saxons, and the nearness of the two peoples and their connection to the wider Germanic world is proven by the similarities between Old and Modern English and by their common Germanic origin. Language serves to link past with present and to give students direct access to history through original documents; at the same time, history helps to elucidate how learning a dead language merits the time devoted to it – the utility, in other words, of studying the Old English language.
History through Whig Eyes: Jefferson's Sources on the Anglo-Saxons

In his unpublished dissertation for Johns Hopkins University, "The Saxon Heritage: Thomas Jefferson Looks at English History," H. Trevor Colbourn summarizes Jefferson's reading of history, turning to the catalogue of Jefferson's library and the notebooks in which he transcribed passages from his reading, edited by Gilbert Chinard and published as the Commonplace Book of Thomas Jefferson, for evidence of which works contributed to his historical vision. Colbourn does not, however, thoroughly examine the entries Jefferson made in the Commonplace Book; instead, he outlines what Jefferson would have found in his reading by touching upon the key arguments made by the writers he read, only occasionally referring to the excerpts made by Jefferson for support of his discussion. While Colbourn's insights have made a valuable contribution to the present discussion, the focus here will be less on whom Jefferson read than on a careful review of Jefferson's notes, which have much to say about the reasons for which he read and the information which he found relevant to his own situation. This examination of the Commonplace Book will be followed by a careful reading of Jefferson's own comments on the Anglo-Saxons.

Before delving into Jefferson's notebooks, works which he read but did not commonplace should be discussed briefly. While the mere possession of a particular book offers little evidence of how that work influenced his thinking, his reading of many of the key contributors to the Anglo-Saxon myth undoubtedly had its effect on his own acceptance of that myth. For example, although Jefferson's study of law is usually cited as the point at which he was first introduced to the Whig version of history, he would have read it first in Rapin (Colbourn Lamp 158). Although he left no record of Rapin's
influence upon his ideas, other than his praise for the author, the fact that what may have been Jefferson’s first exposure to English history was a Whig text may explain the adult Jefferson’s essentially uncritical acceptance of the Anglo-Saxon myth. Colbourn also identifies Tacitus as an early influence: Jefferson probably would have read the Roman under the tutelage of his Latin teacher, William Douglass, and he would later praise Thomas Gordon’s translation, adorned as it was with “extremely moralistic discourses” describing Tacitus as a proper Whig (Colbourn *Saxon Heritage* 67, 68). Those “Political Discourses upon that Author,” the subtitle of Gordon’s work, actually have very little to do with Tacitus and quite a bit to do with contemporary politics – they truly are “moralistic,” and offer little commentary on the author translated. In his discourses, Gordon comments on such subjects as “the present state of the English Tongue” (complaining that the writing of his time “comes too close to talking”), warns against a people’s surrendering of its rights to a dictator, and discusses the “Wisdom and safety of ruling by standing laws, to Prince and People” (Gordon IV. 4 181, 221-225, 230). Other discourses likely to have been of interest to Jefferson explored freedom of speech, the difficulties faced by a “worthy man” serving a “bad prince” and the importance of improving the character of the people of a nation through education and wise government (IV 318-321, V 30-32, 165-171, 212-219). The people are not naturally rebellious, Gordon argues, unless poorly governed, and when they are oppressed it is in fact the tyrant who is the true rebel (V 179-212). Gordon even insists upon freedom of religion and of the “fatal and ungodly consequences of allowing force” to be employed in matters

---

1 In an 1825 letter to George Washington Lewis, Jefferson recommended Rapin, saying that “there is as yet no general history so faithful” as his (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 124-28).
of conscience (V 237). That Gordon saw fit to attach these statements of liberal ideology to his translations of Tacitus certainly implies that he perceived a relationship between the two, and Jefferson would undoubtedly have traced the foundations of many of these freedoms to what was best in the Anglo-Saxons and the Germanic forbears described in the *Germania*.

Other writers whom Jefferson read include Henry Care, Nathaniel Bacon and Robert Brady, already discussed above. William Atwood, contributor to the Filmerian controversy of the previous century, reaffirmed the position of the Saxon king as a servant of the people, and claimed that before the Normans the kingship was not necessarily hereditary (Colbourn *Saxon Heritage* 82). His discussion includes a list of Saxon kings who had been enthroned or removed from power by the English people in support of his claim that all of the Saxon monarchies were originally elective (Atwood 36-37). Robert Atkyns’s *Power, Jurisdiction and Privilege of Parliament; and the Antiquity of the House of Commons Asserted* blames the notion that the Saxons were ruled by the nobility before as they were after the Norman Conquest on, among other things, the mis-translation of Saxon words such as “thane,” which Norman writers rendered “Barons” when, in fact, it represented every Saxon gentleman (Atkyns 30). Atkyns also argues that the Saxon Freeholders elected many of their political officers, and that the participation of the Commons in Parliament was “as Antient as the Nation it self [sic]” (30, 34). Gilbert Stuart’s *An Historical Dissertation Concerning the Antiquity of the English Constitution* depicted the Saxons as simple farmers and hunters, free of vice and of standing armies, the great bogeyman of the Whigs (Colbourn *Saxon Heritage* 90-91). Stuart also claimed that
the Saxons had virtually exterminated the Britons, in support of the derivation of the English political systems solely from “the ancient German order” (Peardon 131).

What Jefferson took from these writers is difficult to ascertain; at the very least, each would have offered support for the Whig interpretation of England’s Anglo-Saxon past. It is easier to determine Jefferson’s reception of the works from which he took copious notes, transcribing, translating and commenting upon them in his notebooks. Although Jefferson’s commonplace books served him in his studies as a student of the law, if Gilbert Chinard’s dating of the entries is correct (and he argues his dates persuasively), he continued to add to his notebooks long after entering his legal practice – in fact, the final entries, from Robinson’s Reports of cases argued and determined in the High Court of Admiralty, must have been made after that work’s publication in 1800, though the bulk of the entries, numbered by Chinard and referred to by him as “articles,” were probably made when Jefferson was a young man (11-14). Although the early entries are primarily citations from legal reports and from Coke’s Institutes, it is worthwhile noting that when Jefferson broadened his reading beyond these strictly legal matters, it was to the field of history that he turned – though history still bound up with the subject of law. Gilbert Chinard marks Jefferson’s commonplacing of Lord Kames’s Historical Law Tracts as the point at which his interests began to embrace “more general questions” (16). In Kames Jefferson began to explore an area of legal history which was bound up with the property laws he would work to reform when revising the Virginia code: the role played by feudalism in English history and law. Kames’s discussion of feudalism amounts to little more than a definition, though it does demonstrate how the transfer of property given a vassal by his lord in exchange for service would have been “inconsistent with the nature of
the covenant,” since the feudal contract granted the vassal only the “usufruct” (a term Jefferson would later apply in his theory of generations) of the land (120-21).

After several lengthy extracts from Kames on other areas of the law, Jefferson returned to the topic of feudalism, turning to Sir John Dalrymple’s *Essay towards a General History of Feudal Property in Great Britain*. Dalrymple gives historical grounding to Kames’s discussion of property rights, particularly Kames’s insistence that “entails are... subversive of industry and commerce,” a “snare to the thoughtless proprietor” and “a perpetual source of discontent” (117). In Dalrymple’s scheme of things, among the Saxons there had been both allodial and feudal lands, the latter “parcelled out among the chieftains” by their prince, who had led them in their conquest of England (135). In this, Dalrymple points out, the Saxons were like “the other northern nations” (135). Although feuds were known among the Saxons, some of the conquered were allowed to keep their lands “on the antient footing,” and those Saxons not in the service of a chieftain could occupy vacant lands “on that same footing” (136). Moreover, not only were many lands held allodially among the Saxons, but feudal land grants were never hereditary, preventing the passing on of large parcels from one generation to the next (136). William the Norman, however, emerged from a land where the “greater power of the prince had rivetted [sic] the feudal duties on the crown vassals” and where the rights of rear-vassals had had greater time to “ripen” (136). When William came to England, he carried this matured form of feudalism with him, and did away with the distinction between feudal and allodial lands (136). So, though the rudiments of feudalism were in place in Saxon England, William completed the system after the conquest, so after him all lands would be held from the crown. Moreover, he established descent by primogeniture, which Jefferson
opposed in Virginia; according to Dalrymple, under the laws of Edward the Confessor land had passed to all children equally, though at “a lower period in Saxon times” the grantee could stipulate in the charter that the lands descend to a single son, not necessarily the eldest (151). This equal division of property among sons practiced by the Saxons Dalrymple calls a “law of nature, and of the world,” and it was abandoned for no better reason that feudal services could not easily be performed by more than one heir (150).

Dalrymple’s Saxons share many traits with Jefferson’s. Their property laws were those same ones which Jefferson fought to establish in Virginia – laws which would prevent the accumulation of too much wealth (and the power derived from it) by a handful of individuals, ensuring that with each generation large holdings would grow smaller as sons took their equal shares at the death of their fathers. This system followed the law of nature (while, as Kames had pointed out, feudal practices had been in opposition to it); the Saxons, by implication, lived more closely according to that law than did the generations of English after William’s conquest. After these notes on feudalism, Jefferson copied several more passages from Dalrymple, concerned primarily with laws of descent. He next turned to Matthew Hale’s *History of the Common Law of England* (articles 585-588).

Interestingly, Jefferson passed over passages in Hale supporting the common law’s ancient pedigree – passages in which the author admits to the difficulty of determining its true origin due to the lack of “any clear and certain Monuments of the original Foundation of the English Kingdom or State” (Hale 59). Two of the three passages he copied from Hale discuss the legal definition of the phrase “time within memory,” while the third again turns to rules of descent (62-164). His omission of Hale’s comments on the difficulty of learning the origins of the common law is particularly evocative when Jefferson, after a
series of excerpts from Croke’s **English King’s Bench Reports tempore Elizabeth** on legal matters (many of which also deal with such property issues as inheritance, leasing and rents), turns to the subject of ancient governments and early European history, including extracts from authors attempting to identify the continental homeland of the Anglo-Saxons. From Kames’s **Natural Religion** Jefferson copied a brief passage stating that the Lacedemonian constitution had guaranteed the right to “lawfully take what by address he could make himself master of without force or violence” (167). This is followed by an excerpt from Ferdinand Warner’s **History of Ireland** which places a similar right among the ancient Irish (167-168).

Then begins a long series of passages focusing on the history of Germanic peoples, beginning with a paraphrase of Simon Pelloutier, from his **Histoire des Celtes**, in which Pelloutier attempts to prove that the Celts of history were a Germanic people; the Celts and Germans, along with the Persians, were the descendants of the Hyperboreans, one of two peoples which made up the Scythian nation, with which “Pelloutier supposes Europe to have been inhabited,” the other people being the Sarmatians of Eastern Europe and parts of Asia (168). After summarizing Pelloutier’s case for the Celtic origin of the Gauls, Jefferson presents that author’s evidence that Germany had been inhabited by the Celts, which he calls “more conclusive” than the former argument (169). Since Britain had also been “peopled from Gaul, or Gaul from Britain,” the British peoples conquered by the Saxons shared their Germanic heritage (170). Other peoples descended from the Scythian stock included the Greeks, the Egyptians and the “Phenicians [sic],” the ancient inhabitants of Italy, who were Gauls, and the Tuscans and Romans, who were Celts (172-74). This Celtic heritage is again linked to the Germans with linguistic evidence, by which
Pelloutier "proves the modern German descended from the Celtic by a number of instances" which, however, Jefferson points out "are evidently from the Teutonic language" (177). This statement follows a passage in which Pelloutier "proposes to prove the similitude of the languages of the several people whom he supposes to have been Celtic," which linguistically connects the Britons, Gothini, Gauls, Scordisi, Galatians and, of course, the Germans (176-77). The Galatians earn these Celtic/Germanic peoples a place in the Bible as the auditors of St. Paul's epistle (177). That Jefferson suggests a Teutonic origin of the German/Celtic connection need not be seen as a complete rejection of Pelloutier's positions: Jefferson may simply be suggesting for the Teutonic languages the status of parent tongue given by the author to the Celtic tongues.

Jefferson reads Pelloutier critically; for example, the author's claim that the Tuscans were Celts Jefferson states was made "on very slight grounds," and Pelloutier's efforts to give the Greek and Latin languages a common parent in the Celtic evokes a somewhat lengthy note: "this shews the ardor of the author to establish his system, for it is not possible to admit two languages so dissimilar as the Latin and Greek to be immediately derived from a common root, and that on the sole authority of 40 or 50 analogous words" (174-175). Elsewhere, he argues with Pelloutier's dating of the migration of the Scythians to Greece, pointing out that it "must have been very numerous, or much earlier than above supposed," since the two generations of the author's dating would not have "sufficed to enable them to raise and to spare from the defence of the country at home such an armament as was sent to the Trojan war" (172). However, another notation made by Jefferson shows how Pelloutier helped the young lawyer and budding revolutionary establish his own political system. After paraphrasing Pelloutier's discussion of the
colonies established by the Pelasgians, including in the Greek isles, Jefferson comments: “neither the Egyptians nor Phenicians [sic] ever pretended any right of dominion over the Greeks, their colonists” (172). The link Jefferson is making between the circumstances of the American colonies and the ancient colonies of Greece is clear, and he would himself make a similar comparison between the Saxons who emigrated to England and the English settlers of North America in his *Summary View of the Rights of British America.*

Abraham Stanyan’s *Grecian history down to the death of Philip of Macedon* provided Jefferson with additional examples from Classical history of the relationship between nations and their colonies, examples which evince again the tendency of the latter towards autonomy (181-185).

After copying a brief series of passages on the history of the slave trade, Jefferson turned to the development of feudalism in England, drawing from Spelman’s *De Terminis Juridicis* and *Glossarium Archaiologicum,* from William Somner’s *A Treatise of Gavelkind* and from Montesquieu’s *L’esprit des lois* (his first notations from this work). Jefferson for the most part summarizes, rather than extracts from these authors. Whereas previously Jefferson commonplaced one work at a time, in his discussion of feudalism he works together passages from each of his authors, sometimes setting one against the other to support the position which Jefferson himself would later express in his own writings. Of greatest concern to Jefferson is the debate over whether or not feudalism existed among the Saxons – his own opinion being forecast by the summary of Spelman with which he begins his exploration of the subject: the section is introduced by a reference to Spelman’s conclusion that “the feudal law was introduced into England at and shortly after the Conquest,” followed by notes on the etymology of the terms “fee” (“from the Saxon
feo...fee, rewards, salary...) and "allodial" (from "All, English, all and hode...[denoting] lands possessed totally") (186). After presenting evidence from Dalrymple, Montesquieu and Spelman that the Saxons had held land allodially, he turns to Spelman for evidence of the origin of feudalism, which that author attributes to the Germanic peoples generally, though only "some traces" of it were "thought to be found" among the Anglo-Saxons (188). After thus qualifying Spelman's suggestions that feuds had existed among the Saxons, Jefferson, in mid-entry, draws from Somner's Treatise evidence that allodial lands clearly existed among the Saxons and, in opposition to Dalrymple, that even "Tain-land" had been held allodially (189).

Article 740 begins with yet another statement of Somner's agreement with those who held, as Jefferson did, that "feudal tenures were introduced by the Conqueror" (190). Whereas Jefferson had earlier inserted Somner into an entry which had begun with Spelman, he now cites additional authors to support Somner's position—and his own. First Caesar and Tacitus are brought in to prove that even in ancient times "the Germans...had no fixed property in lands," evidence that, if feudalism "prevailed at all among our Northern ancestors, before their irruption into the Southern countries, it must have been in a very infantine state" (190). That Jefferson sees himself and his fellows as descendants of these Germans is clear in this passage, since he refers to them as "our Northern ancestors." Jefferson next turns to Blackstone for additional support for the belief that feudal policy "seems not to have been received in England, at least not universally and as a part of the national constitution, till the reign of William the Norman" (191). Though Blackstone places greater emphasis on the role played by Norman barons, rather than by William, in the spread of feudal tenures, he nevertheless places the onus for
their introduction upon the Normans. "Our ancestors," Jefferson summarizes, later took advantage of Henry I's pretensions to the crown to procure "a restitution of the antient Saxon laws" (192). Jefferson concludes this abridgement of Blackstone with a passage of pure Whig history:

*This shews* [Jefferson began] that English liberties are not infringements [sic] merely of the king's prerogative, extorted from our princes by taking advantage of their weakness; but a restoration of that antient constitution, of which our ancestors had been defrauded by the art and finesse of the Norman Lawyers, rather than deprived by the force of Norman arms. (192-193)

After a series of entries on the origin of legal fees, drawn from sources such as Coke and Bracton, Jefferson begins an exploration of federalism. He first describes two federal states, the Dutch Union of Utrecht and the Helvetic Body of Switzerland, both of which, one might note, are descendants of the same "Northern ancestors" as the Anglo-Saxons. This link is more than implied by the paths down which Jefferson's interests led him: from his discussion of the Helvetic Body, he turns to authors such as William Temple, Daniel Langhorn, Paul Henry Mallet, Abraham Stanyan and Camden for evidence of the European homeland of the Saxons — most likely, Camden suggests, to have been Cimbric Chersonesus (the latter part of which Jefferson would suggest, though with a slightly different spelling, as a name for one of the Western Territories of his own nation) (206-211, Boyd 6 604). Two brief excerpts on purely legal matters follow, after which Jefferson turns to Molesworth's *Account of Denmark as it was in the Year 1692*. He begins article 754 with Molesworth's remark: "All Europe was beholden to the Northern nations for introducing or restoring a constitution of government far excelling all others
that we know in the world" (212). In the passage excerpted by Jefferson, Molesworth goes on to attribute the origin parliaments and an elective monarchy to those nations, and the practice of deposing rulers found to be "cruel, vitious [sic], tyrannical, covetous, or wasteful" (212-213). Jefferson follows this with a list of English kings elected by the people, beginning in the year 640 with Ercombert and continuing up to the "election" of George III, who, like George I and George II, had succeeded to the exclusions of the more immediate descendants of James I (214-217). It is worth noting that, in this context, "William the Norman" is included, having "excluded Edgar Atheling" (215). Though placing William in this list of kings who came to their throne from outside the line of succession seems out of character, this rather terse and ambiguous reference to William is preceded by a longer passage on Harold, who succeeded Edward "by universal consent," and it is after mentioning Harold, not William, that Jefferson concludes that "from these instances it appears that the crown of England was neither hereditary nor testamentary," though both of these factors "gave weight in the election of a successor" (215). Jefferson then turned to Thomas Salmon's Modern History, or Present State of all Nations for details on government of three Northern nations, Sweden, Denmark and Poland (217-229). In his attempt to explore the possible forms to be taken by a federal government, he seems to have taken Molesworth at his word and looked for it among the Northern peoples of whom the Anglo-Saxons were an off-shoot.

Jefferson then, in a series of entries which according to Chinard were made between 1774-1776, returns to the history of feudalism, drawing primarily from Francis Stoughton Sullivan's Historical Treatise on the Feudal Laws and the Constitution and
Laws of England (14). Though the passages on allodial lands add little new information to Jefferson’s earlier notes, aside from a reference to Tacitus’s Germans, whose comites sometimes received properties in exchange for their services, Jefferson does include a lengthy passage on the Germanic invasions of Rome (230-31, 236-239). One cause which Sullivan gives for these invasions is the “notion of particular independence among the Germans,” which allowed soldiers not in the service of the king to mount their own expeditions (236). Sullivan also credits William the Conqueror with bringing the feudal code into England in the “state of maturity” it had attained on the continent (251). The “progress of Descents,” including the evolution of primogeniture, is also excerpted from Sullivan, though, as Jefferson points out, he “does not differ materially from Dalrymple” on the subject (Jefferson goes so far as to point out that Sullivan’s “account is less ingenious and less perspicuous” than Dalrymple’s) (255).

In the months preceding the Revolution, Jefferson’s notes turned to materials which would point the way to the form which a possible American federation might take, including, in particular, extensive notes from Montesquieu’s Espirit des Lois (257-296). While of great interest to those looking for the sources of Jefferson’s constitutional thought, these passages have little bearing on the present discussion. They are followed by three brief excerpts from An Historical Essay on the English Constitution, the source which Demophilus mined so heavily for his pamphlet. Jefferson’s transcriptions from the Historical Essay deal exclusively with the power of parliament in the time of the Saxons,

---

1 Chinard attributes entries 550-882 to this period. Based on his examination of Jefferson’s handwriting, Douglas L. Wilson argues that some of these entries may have been made in the 1760’s, and some after Jefferson had left the Continental Congress in 1776 (“Jefferson’s Early Notebooks” 445-448). However, according to his dating the articles discussed above did likely fall within the period of 1774-1776.
clearly reflecting Jefferson’s interest in working out the best form for the young government of the United States. The first article compares the Saxon Wittenagemot to the Roman Senate, the Historical Essay noting that, while the membership of the Senate changed only rarely, the Saxon parliament was “annually moveable, and entirely subject to the elective power of the people” (296-97). Moreover, the actions of the “executive authority” (the king) were “confined within a certain sphere of action, prescribed by the law, so that it could not operate to the injury of any individual,” and the bounds of that sphere of action were “controllable [sic] by the parliament” (297). The second article copied by Jefferson suggests that the number of men who can meet together “to inform and be informed by argument and debate” has been limited by “the natural powers of hearing and speech” (297). The final article states that when the parliament offered the crown to William, they had declared that “parliaments ought to be held frequently,” a declaration which was followed shortly thereafter by an act by which “kings were obliged to call and dissolve [sic] parliaments once in three years at least” (297). While this may sound like a surrendering of authority to the Crown, according to the Historical Essay it was rather an attempt to usurp power from the people by “restraining” their elective power “by acts of parliament,” granting the legislature and later the king the right of determining “how often the people should exercise their elective rights” (297). When it was later enacted that membership in parliament be limited to those possessing estates of sufficient size, the “wise men of England” who had made up the Wittenagemot of the Saxons surrendered power to “the rich men of England” (298).

Jefferson returns to the history of the Anglo-Saxons with a series of extracts from Fortescue’s De Laudibus legum Angliae. Much of what Jefferson discovered in Fortescue
would later find its way into his own correspondence, including the passages on Christianity and the common law which he would later copy and send to Dr. Thomas Cooper. Jefferson first notes that J. Fortescue Aland, in his preface to his ancestor's work, traced the origin of the common law to Alfred, whose codex brought together the substance of the separate systems practiced before the Heptarchy (346-348). From Fortescue and others (including Hale and Blackstone, with whom Jefferson disagrees) is also taken a lengthy discussion exonerating the Saxons from including Christianity in the common law, the passages later sent to Cooper and discussed below. Sandwiched between these historical excerpts are two notes on linguistic issues, one a discussion of the etymology of "Gabbelle," and the other of the Saxon "Ye," which according to Aland is a corruption of the Saxon "th" (349). The mingling of history, law and language, typical of Jefferson, is particularly interesting here in notes taken from Aland, who, according to Jefferson, "possessed more Saxon learning than all the judges and writers" he had cited in his notes on the common law, since Aland's ideas on the study of Old English, to be discussed shortly, closely paralleled, and probably influenced, Jefferson's own (355).

Jefferson's selection of texts, discussed by Colbourn in his dissertation, certainly has much to say about what the young lawyer was exposed to by his reading. What he chose to copy into his commonplace books has, I believe, far more to reveal about how he read, with what issues he was concerned, and with what prejudices he approached his reading. That, in the case of the Anglo-Saxons, Jefferson was a prejudiced reader is made clear by the way in which his own notes take issue with writers who do not agree with his own view of events – to the extent that one writer is in places played against another, as when he used Somner to correct Spelman's position that feuds had existed among the
Saxons. The elements of the Anglo-Saxon myth with which he most concerned himself are unsurprising, given his circumstances: firstly, the Saxons Jefferson chose to believe in had not surrendered themselves to a rigorous feudal code. As a result, the landholding practices with which Jefferson was so concerned in Virginia had not taken hold among them: they held their lands alodially, not as grants from their king, and those lands did not automatically pass to the eldest son, thus aiding the gathering and holding of tremendous wealth (and so power) in the hands of the few. Somewhat surprising though is the extent to which Jefferson seems to have already formed his commitment to the Anglo-Saxon myth, and the extent to which he tied it and, it would seem, the republican tradition to continental, Gothic roots. This last is evinced by the substantial notes he took from Celtic history, after first seeing it proven that the Celts had been Germanic, as well as by his determined search for the continental homeland of the Saxons. Jefferson’s interests were also unusual in his intermixing of language, history and law – all of these legacies of the Anglo-Saxons, and all of them worthy of study by the statesman. Of all the authors commonplased by Jefferson, Fortescue Aland comes closest to him in this mixing of interests, and Aland’s defense of the study of Old English, made in his Preface to The Difference between an Absolute and Limited Monarchy shares much with Jefferson’s own comments on the importance of Anglo-Saxon studies. Aland will be examined at the conclusion of the present chapter; first, the use to which Jefferson put the fruits of his reading in his own writing will be discussed. For now, let it suffice to say that Jefferson’s historical entries in his commonplace books demonstrate that he approached his reading as he approached his natural history and, as we shall see, his linguistics: Jefferson frequently read his historical authors not as an aid to the forming of opinions, but to find support for
opinions already held, and in the years prior to the Revolution to gather evidence for a
case against the Crown and for the new nation which he and his contemporaries were
readying for the break from England.

*Jefferson's Saxons: the Republican Barbarians*

Apart from an examination of Jefferson's reading, his thoughts on the Anglo-
Saxons must be culled primarily from his personal writings, since, unlike friends and
enemies such as Adams, Madison and Hamilton, he was not inclined to assume the role of
essayist. Nevertheless, his references to the Saxons in letters and in public documents
such as the *Summary View of the Rights of British America* were frequent enough that it
is possible to reconstruct Jefferson's view of Saxon history with a reasonable degree of
accuracy. As will be seen, that vision closely followed the interpretation of the most
radical English Whigs; in other words, not only did Jefferson believe that the Saxons had
enjoyed freedoms similar to those sought by the colonists, but also that those freedoms
had been lost to William the Conqueror. English history thereafter centered on the
continued struggles of the people of England to regain their Saxon liberties from a Crown
dedicated only to guarding and extending its prerogative.

Aside from the notes entered into his *Commonplace Book*, Jefferson's first written
comments on Anglo-Saxon history were in *A Summary View of the Rights of British
America*, the 1774 set of resolutions designed to lay colonial complaints before George
III.1 Julian Boyd, while confessing the weaknesses of Jefferson's argument in the

---

1 Jefferson originally wrote the set of resolutions later published as the *Summary View* for presentation to
the Virginia House of Burgesses in Williamsburg, to which Jefferson had been elected a representative for
Albemarle county. Jefferson fell ill during his journey, and so sent the resolutions ahead to Williamsburg,
Summary View, insisted upon its power “as an utterance of sentiments Americans increasingly wished to hear expressed,” despite the fact that parts of the document were probably in advance of public opinion (Boyd “Jefferson’s Expression” 551, 554). While Jefferson’s use of Anglo-Saxon history in the Summary View reflected a fairly conventional interpretation of Whig history, the detailed parallel he drew between the rights of the Anglo-Saxons as emigrants from Germany, and those of the ancestors of the Colonists, who had immigrated to American from Great Britain, had not, as was seen in the last chapter, been widely made in print. Demophilus would make a similar point in 1776, after independence had already been declared, but only Benjamin Franklin had employed anything like this theme before 1774. Franklin’s “An Edict by the King of Prussia” was first published in the English paper, The Public Advertiser, in 1773. In this satirical letter, the King of Prussia insists upon his rights over the people of England, who, from the time of the “first German Settlements made in the Island of Britain,” had remained German subjects, enjoying German protection (Franklin 415). Franklin’s “Edict” is satire, and draws its examples from the rhetoric which had been employed by the Crown against the American colonists, rather than from Whig historians.

Jefferson’s adaptation of the Anglo-Saxon myth, though perhaps not as pleasing from a literary perspective as Franklin’s, shapes a national history which positions the colonists as inheritors of a long tradition of resistance: their opposition to England represented the assumption of that heritage, and what at first glance may seem radical is actually extremely conservative. As one scholar has put it, while Franklin “got more out
of the Anglo-Saxon myth, Jefferson’s references to Saxon history had greatly enhanced his evocation of America’s own founding “by establishing the image of a pioneering ancestral people settling a new country more than a thousand years before Jamestown” (Hedges 172). Unlike Franklin, Jefferson draws this parallel in absolute seriousness, with no hint of satire. The purposes of the address which Jefferson suggests Congress put before George III were to include reminding the king that the ancestors of the colonists, “before their emigration to America, were the free inhabitants of the British dominion in Europe.” In that state they had:

- possessed a right, which nature has given to all men, of departing from the country in which chance, not choice has placed them, of going in quest of new habitations, and of there establishing new societies, under such laws and regulations as to them shall seem most likely to promote public happiness (Boyd 1 121).

Jefferson is not here insisting that the Americans had a claim on the same rights enjoyed by British citizens at home – an argument taken up by many of those who, for example, insisted on their right to representation in any legislative body empowered with the levying of taxes upon them. Rather, he is insisting on a natural right to establish new societies based on laws suitable to the condition of the place and people. Although the Summary View was written long before Jefferson began preaching the doctrine of the present generation’s freedom from the past, he here says nothing which really contradicts his later theory. Jefferson is appealing less to a return to the Saxon system of government, than to the natural rights which that society had embraced. Not only should Congress remind the king of the conditions under which the English had emigrated to the Americas, but also that:
their Saxon ancestors had under this universal law, in like manner, left their native wilds and woods in the North of Europe, had possessed themselves of the island of Britain then less charged with inhabitants, and had established there that system of laws which has so long been the glory and protection of that country. Nor was ever any claim of superiority or dependance asserted over them by that mother country from which they had migrated: and were such a claim made it is believed his majesty’s subjects in Great Britain have too firm a feeling of the rights derived to them from their ancestors to bow down the sovereignty of their state before such visionary pretensions. And it is thought that no circumstance has occurred to distinguish materially the British from the Saxon emigration (121-122).

Jefferson almost seems to have Franklin’s “Edict” in mind here, and is certainly making a similar point, though in a more straightforward fashion. The Saxons are not evoked in order to appeal to their “ancient constitution”; rather, Jefferson appeals to the rights they exercised in framing that constitution, the rights, as H. Trevor Colbourn expresses it, “of expatriated man” (Colbourn Lamp of Experience 158). America, a land also “less charged with inhabitants” than the mother country, had also been conquered by individuals, not by the Crown, and those individuals had borne the expense of their migration; although England had from time to time aided the new colonies, these aids had come only recently, after they had “become valuable to Great Britain for her commercial purposes”: similar aid had been offered to allied states, without any assumption of English sovereignty (122).

However, the English emigrants to America differed from the Anglo-Saxons in one important respect:
[they] thought proper to adopt that system of laws under which they had hitherto lived in the mother country, and to continue their union with her by submitting themselves to the same common sovereign, who was thereby made the central link connecting the several parts of the empire thus newly multiplied (122-23).

Other writers have pointed out that the Anglo-Saxons brought their system of government with them from Germany; arguably this assumption is essential to the Anglo-Saxon myth, which draws so heavily from Tacitus's description of the Germanic tribes. However, no one claimed that the Saxons had maintained political ties to Germany, and this is perhaps the weakest point of Jefferson's comparison: that the settlers in America had submitted to English sovereignty distinguished them from the Saxons and undermined their claim to independence. However, the central argument of Summary View is not for independence from England: as the full title suggests, it is an appeal to the king to support the rights of his subjects in America. In this passage, then, Jefferson depicts those earlier settlers as making use of their right to self-determination to choose to remain under their old system (they "thought it proper" to do so), and to accept the sovereignty, not of England, but of the King. This sets the stage for Jefferson's appeal to George III for intervention in a conflict between the colonies and Parliament, the latter having no right to claim authority over the former.

Although Jefferson has not in the Summary View made any appeals to the "ancient constitution" to support his case against Parliament, he does appeal to Anglo-Saxon law when taking up the issue of property, specifically the manner in which lands were held in the colonies. Disputing the notion that landed Americans held their property from the King, Jefferson turned again to history to make his case, revealing in the process the fruit
of the research evinced by his commonplace books. “The introduction of the Feudal
tenures into the Kingdom of England, though ancient, is well enough understood to set
this matter in a proper light,” Jefferson began, then launched into his version of the history
of feudalism in England:

In the earlier ages of the Saxon settlement feudal holdings were certainly
altogether unknown, and very few, if any, had been introduced at the time of the
Norman conquest. Our Saxon ancestors held their lands, as they did their
personal property, in absolute dominion, disencumbered with any superior,
answering nearly to the nature of those possessions which the Feudalists term
Allodial. William the Norman first introduced that system generally. The land
which had belonged to those who fell in the Battle of Hastings, and in the
subsequent insurrections of his reign, formed a considerable proportion of the
lands of the whole kingdom. These he granted out, subject to feudal duties, as did
he also those of a great number of his new subjects, who, by persuasions or threats
were induced to surrender them for that purpose (132).

While Spelman, one of Jefferson’s sources for feudal law, pointed out that the precursors
of feudalism existed in Anglo-Saxon England, Jefferson’s Saxons suffered from no such
oppressions before William’s conquest. The “persuasion or threats” employed to coerce
his subjects into surrendering their lands seems to foreshadow Jefferson’s later description
of the Normans’ seizure of power as being “built on conquest and physical force, not at all
affecting moral rights, nor even assented to by the free will of the vanquished”
(Washington 7 413).
This lack of consent to the laws of the conquerors is further emphasized by the encroachment of feudal power into those lands still held alodial by the Saxons:

These [Saxon lands] therefore by express laws, enacted to render uniform the system of military defence, were made liable to the same military duties as if they had been feuds: and the Norman lawyers soon found means to saddle them also with all the other feudal burthens (132).

In Jefferson's version of history, these lands, though treated as Feuds in many ways, had still "not been surrendered to the King"; they "were not derived from his grant, and therefore they were not holden of him" (132). The application of the principle that "all lands in England were held either mediately or immediately of the crown" to the lands of these freeholders had served "the purposes of illustration" only, and had been "borrowed from those holdings which were truly feudal" (132-33). In England, "feudal holdings were therefore but exceptions out of the Saxon laws of possession.... These therefore still form the basis or groundwork of the Common law, to prevail wheresoever the exceptions have not taken place" (133). The feudal holding of land was, therefore, the exception rather than the rule in England; only those lands actually granted by William and those whose Saxon owners swore feudal service to him could be said to be held by the Crown.

Lands in America, then, must be held in absolute possession, despite the fact that a cunning Crown had persuaded the first settlers otherwise:

America was not conquered by William the Norman nor were it's lands surrendered to him or any of his successors. Possessions there are undoubtedly of the Allodial nature. Our ancestors however, who migrated hither, were laborers not lawyers. The fictitious principle that all lands belong originally to the king,
they were early persuaded to believe real, and accordingly took grants of their own lands from the crown (133).

Only the Crown’s habit of granting land “for small sums and on reasonable rents” had made this practice tolerable (133). Recent changes in this policy, however, impelled Jefferson, on behalf of the colonies, “to declare, that [the King] has no right to grant lands of himself,” that their lands, like those of their Saxon ancestors, were wholly theirs (133).

Jefferson’s use of Anglo-Saxon history in the Summary View of the Rights of British America reflects in many ways the standard positions of Whig history: the Saxons enjoyed freedoms which were taken from them by the Norman invaders, and English history could be seen as a sustained struggle to recover that ancient liberty. Among those freedoms was that of holding land in absolute right, a theme Jefferson would return to not long after drafting this document. Most interesting in the Summary View, though, is the parallel Jefferson drew between the Saxon colonization of England and the English colonization of the Americas. Both the Saxons and the British Americans had reserved to themselves the right of building a society suited to their needs. The Saxons, then, were not simply the inheritors of an ancient German constitution (though Jefferson does elsewhere link them and their language to the wider “Gothic” world), but also were engaged in the same process in which Jefferson would soon be engaged, that of building a society based on natural right.

That Jefferson did not think that the Americans should struggle to discover and adopt the Anglo-Saxon way of life in its entirety is evinced not only here, at the beginning of his career, but also in his 1824 letter to John Cartwright, to be discussed shortly. However, at both ends of his life Jefferson did express his respect for the Anglo-Saxon
legal codes, which he acknowledged to be the foundation of English law, and the ancient English "constitution," embodied by the common law. When Jefferson was playing a legislative role in the Virginia House of Delegates in 1776-1779, in what Dumas Malone referred to as "his most creative period as a statesman during the American Revolution," he introduced a number of proposals aimed at reforming the Virginia code (I 247). In the Notes on the State of Virginia, written not long after this period, Jefferson indicated the importance of those early days of independence for the legislator. Discussing the legal guarantee of freedom of religion, he insisted that:

- the time for fixing every essential right on a legal basis is while our rulers are honest, and ourselves united. At the conclusion of this war we shall be going down hill. It will not then be necessary to resort every moment to the people for support. They will be forgotten, therefore, and their rights disregarded (Peterson Portable 213).

At this crucial time, Jefferson often turned to Anglo-Saxon precedent as a source for the code he was helping to shape for Virginia. The heavily annotated copy of his Bill for Proportioning Crimes and Punishments which he sent to George Wythe, discussed in Chapter 1, reveals the influence upon the work of Anglo-Saxon laws which, as he wrote to Wythe, are "the sources of the Common Law" (Padover 91). This is a break from his mentor Coke, who established the origins of the common law in time immemorial; Jefferson attributes it to a specific epoch of history and a single society, that of the Saxons. When citing Saxon law, Jefferson quotes his source in the original language, "for [his] own satisfaction," appending translations in Latin and/or English. Although Jefferson does not here reform Anglo-Saxon orthography along the lines he would later propose, his
literal Modern English translations call to mind the specimen of the Gospels in which he demonstrated how Anglo-Saxon texts should be printed. One example of this is the punishment for intentional disfigurement, which Jefferson proposed should be the maiming of the criminal. He cites the laws of “Aethelstan and Canute” in their original Old English: “‘gif se myntere ful wurþe, slea man þa hand of, þe he þaet ful mid worhte, & sette uppon þa mynet smiþan’” (Boyd 2 498). He then renders them again “in English characters and words”: “if the Minter foul [criminal] wert, slay the hand off, that he the foul [crime] with wrought, and set upon the mint-smithery” (498). Jefferson already demonstrates his belief that Old English is no more than a dialect of modern English; his translation renders the Old English words into their nearest Modern English equivalents. This leads him into an error he would make again in the “Specimen”: he confused “wurþe,” from “weorþan,” “to become,” with “wesan,” “to be,” so that wurþe is translated “werte,” rather than “became.” Although this error is at least partly a result of his relatively shallow knowledge of the language, it also seems a sign of his tendency to trivialize the differences between Old and Modern English. He evinces the same tendency when translating the Anglo-Saxon punishment for felony: “’Hus brec & bærnet, & open þyþ, & æberemorþ, & hlafordswice, æfter woruld læga is botleas’,” is rendered “word for word” as “house break and burnt, and open theft, and manifest murther, and lord-treachery, afterworld’s law is bootless” (499). Jefferson has at times substituted Modern English words in this passage, demonstrating that he was aware that many Old English words had no direct modern parallels (“æberemorth” he changes to “manifest murder,” “hlaford swice” he translates to “lord-treachery”). However, when there seems to be a clear modern equivalent, Jefferson opts for a direct supplementation of the Modern English word for the Old English one, so
that “after woruld laga” (“according to the law of the world”) he renders as “afterworld’s law,” drastically changing the meaning, and confusing the sense of the passage.

Jefferson also proposed in this period a Bill to Abolish Entails. While the Bill itself, aimed at enabling land owners to “convey their lands in fee simple” to their inheritors, makes no direct reference to the Anglo-Saxons, Jefferson made this connection in a letter to Edmund Pendleton, written before Jefferson introduced his bill into the Virginia legislature. Pendleton had opposed Jefferson’s draft constitution for Virginia on the grounds that he had done away with “quit-rents,” formerly paid to the Crown, which could be used, among other things, for the establishment and support of the military (Colbourn Saxon Heritage 161-62). The underlying assumption of this system had been that the colonists held their lands from the Crown, and in making his case for alodial possession Jefferson restates the position he had taken in the Summary View, that the Americans, like their Saxon forbears, held their land by absolute right. Jefferson admits to never considering the effect that the “acts of assembly or acceptance of grants” from the Crown “may have converted lands which were alodial into feuds”; however, he adds that “this matter is now become a mere speculative point; and we have it in our power to make it what it ought to be for the public good” (Boyd 1 491-92). In Jefferson’s opinion, what the status of property “ought to be” was what it had been among the Saxons, and, as we have seen, he had copied into his commonplace book copious evidence of its alodial nature in pre-Norman England. Had not the feudal system, he asks Pendleton, “made an engine of immense oppression?” On the other hand:

Are we not the better for what we have hitherto abolished of the feudal system?

Has not every restitution of the antient Saxon laws had happy effects? Is it not
better now that we return at once into that happy system of our ancestors, the
wisest and most perfect ever devised by the wit of man, as it stood before the 8th
century? (Boyd 1 492)

While it must be remembered that Jefferson is writing here in the context of land tenures
(he nowhere indicates a belief that the Saxon system, in its entirety, should be put in force
in Virginia), Jefferson clearly sees Saxon law as a system worthy of selective emulation,
and certainly of respect.

Also of great concern to Jefferson at this time and later was the subject of religious
freedom. As a result, in part, of his outspoken advocacy of this right Jefferson was often
accused of atheism, the charges being supported by statements such as this one from the
Notes on Virginia:

it does me no injury for my neighbour to say there are twenty gods, or no god....

Constraint may make him worse by making him a hypocrite, but it will never make
him a truer man.... Reason and free inquiry are the only effectual agents against
error” (Peterson Portable 210-211).

Central to Jefferson's notions of freedom of conscience was the complete separation of
church and state, supported by statutory freedom of religion. During his time in the
Virginia House of Delegates he framed his Bill for Establishing Religious Freedom, though
it was not enacted until several years later (Malone I 276). It is interesting, then, that he
took so strong a stance against the belief that Christianity was part of the common law of
England, a point which clearly concerned him as he read and commonplaced Fortescue
and others, and which he argued again in 1814 in a letter to Dr. Thomas Cooper, in which
he included excerpts from his notebooks. From these sources he traces the notion to
Prisot and points out that, from the perspective of history, the conflation of Christianity with the common law was impossible to support:

...we know that the common law is that system which was introduced by the Saxons on their settlement in England [another indication that Jefferson believed in its Germanic origin], and altered from time to time by proper legislative authority from that time to the date of the Magna Charta.... This settlement took place about the middle of the fifth century. But Christianity was not introduced till the seventh century; the conversion of the first Christian king of the Heptarchy having taken place about the year 598, and that of the last about 686. Here, then, was a space of two hundred years, during which the common law was in existence, and Christianity no part of it (Bergh and Lipscomb 14 90-91).

Fortescue Aland had claimed that the Saxon kings had included the ten commandments in their laws, but Jefferson argues that the inclusion of these and a few other chapters from Exodus actually supports his own point, since “adoption of a part proves rather a rejection of the rest, as municipal law” (92-93). Jefferson includes in the letter another entry from his commonplace book, in which he cites Howard’s Coutumes Anglo-Normandes, in which the author “notices the falsification of the laws of Alfred, by prefixing to them four chapters of the Jewish law,” in what Howard calls “a hors d’œuvre of some pious copyist (93). Textual evidence in the laws themselves reveals the fraud:

This awkward monkish fabrication makes the preface to Alfred’s genuine laws stand in the body of the work, and the very words of Alfred himself prove the fraud; for he declares, in that preface, that he has collected these laws from those
of Ina, of Offa, Aethelbert and his ancestors, saying nothing of any of them being taken from the Scriptures (93).

Once again demonstrating his tendency to prove his points with overwhelming evidence, Jefferson goes on to cite specific instances in which Alfred’s laws contradict Exodus, and concludes by again blaming this fraud on the “alliance of Church and State in England” (96).

In a letter Jefferson had sent Cooper only a month earlier, and to which this one was a follow-up, excising Christianity from the laws of Alfred is especially important, given the importance of those laws to English history:

[The] digest of Alfred of the laws of the Heptarchy into a single code, common to the whole kingdom, by him first reduced into one, was probably the birth of what is called the common law. He has been styled, “Magnus Juris Anglicani Conditor;” and his code, the Dom-Dec, or doom-book. That which was afterwards under Edward the Confessor, was but a restoration of Alfred’s, with some intervening alterations. And this was the code which the English so often, under the Norman princes, petitioned to have restored to them (Washington 6 291-92).

The code of Alfred, digested from the laws of the Saxon kingdoms, and presumably brought with them from Germany, is described in the same terms as others have described the “ancient constitution”: it is the source of English liberty, and the focal point of the struggle between the people and their princes throughout history, a struggle which culminated in the conflict between Great Britain and her colonies in America. Jefferson here again posits an Anglo-Saxon origin for the common law. He was also consistent throughout his life in insisting that Christianity had formed no part of the original code: he
made the notes cited in the letter to Cooper while a student at law, so was clearly concerned even then with the issue, and he made the same point again, not only in his 1814 letters to Cooper, but also to Major John Cartwright in 1824. Separating the two served the practical purpose of strengthening his own case for statutory protection of religious freedom; however, it also removed the onus of instituting a state religion from his idealized Saxon forbears.

Jefferson continued to hold these ideas about the Saxon origin of the English common law throughout his life. In 1824 Jefferson wrote to John Cartwright, who had sent him a work on that subject; in this letter, Jefferson expressed his strong support for Cartwright’s positions. In doing so, he reiterated much of what he had written nearly fifty years earlier in the Summary View. Cartwright’s volume, he wrote, “has deduced the Constitution of the English nation from its rightful root, the Anglo-Saxon.” Cartwright’s derivation of the constitution from the Anglo-Saxons:

seems to be made on legitimate principles. Having driven out the former inhabitants of that part of the island called England [much in the same way in which Jefferson’s generation were continuing the work of driving out the Natives], they became aborigines as to you, and your lineal ancestors. They doubtless had a constitution; and although they have not left it in a written formula, to the precise text of which you may always appeal, yet they have left fragments of their history and laws, from which it may be inferred with considerable certainty. Whatever their history and laws show to have been practiced with approbation, we may presume was permitted by their constitution; whatever was not so practiced, was not permitted. And although this constitution was violated and set at naught by
Norman force, yet force cannot change right. A perpetual claim was kept up by the nation, by their perpetual demand of a restoration of their Saxon laws; which shows they were never relinquished by the will of the nation (Bergh and Lipscomb 1642-43).

Jefferson offers no “proof” of the existence of a Saxon constitution; he simply asserts that the Saxons “doubtless” had one. As for what form that constitution had taken, he could not argue that it had survived in written form (others had pointed to the scarcity of documentation as a source of difficulty in ascertaining the Saxon constitution); instead, he suggests that written documentation is unnecessary, since the form of the Saxon constitution might be deduced from their surviving laws. Not only does Jefferson place the origins of the constitution in historical times, but he also seems to think of it in terms of modern constitutions, as a contract, although not necessarily given form as a document, which encapsulates the form of government agreed upon by a people and which may still be discovered in the laws still retained by the present generation. Jefferson makes an argument not dissimilar to this when discussing the pronunciation of Old English, the language of the Anglo-Saxons, which he believes may best be determined through analogy to Modern English, the language in its present form.

Jefferson goes on to reiterate the outline of English history which he learned from the Whigs, depicting it as a series of “pullings and haulings for these ancient rights, between the nation and its kings,” concluding in “the final reconquest of [these] rights from the Stuarts” (43). This struggle was not over, however, and the long shadows of its chief antagonists – the Saxons from whom these rights had sprung and the Normans who first usurped them – still fell over English politics: “It has ever appeared to me,” Jefferson
wrote Cartwright, "that the difference between the Whig and the Tory of England is, that
the Whig deduces his rights from the Anglo-Saxon source, and the Tory from the Norman
(43–44). This is a highly evocative comment; Jefferson is explicit here in identifying
himself with his Anglo-Saxon ancestors, as well as in depicting his opponents as the
descendants of the Norman usurpers of Saxon liberty. Jefferson does not ignore an
opportunity to take a shot at David Hume, of the latter camp, who wrote that the principle
"that the people are the origin of all just power" was "belied by all history and
experience" (44). "And where else" asks Jefferson, "will this degenerate son of science,
this traitor to his fellow men, find the origin of just powers, if not in the majority of
society? Will it be in the minority? Or in an individual of that minority" (44)? By
implication, Jefferson is describing Anglo-Saxon society as based on the will of the
majority. While he never in his own writing expressed interest in the exact form of the
Saxon government, this statement and others already discussed show that he clearly
believed that it had reflected the wishes and needs of the people who submitted to it.
Nevertheless, despite his praise for the Saxon constitution, Jefferson does not suggest that
it should be reestablished in its entirety in the United States; in fact, the Americans were
fortunate in that they "had no occasion to search into musty records, to hunt up royal
parchments, or to investigate the laws and institution of a semi-barbarous ancestry" (44).
They turned instead to the true source of all laws, and Jefferson concludes: "We appealed
to those of nature, and found them engraved on our hearts" (44). While praising his
Saxon ancestors, Jefferson still prefers to rely on the laws of nature as the ultimate guide
to how a society should be structured; in this, however, he remained true to the legacy of
the Saxons, whose own laws were closer to nature than the feudal practices of the
Normans. That Jefferson himself saw no contradiction in his twin appeals to Anglo-Saxon history and to natural law is made clear when, later in this same letter which has been so concerned with the past, he launches into his argument that “the Creator has made the earth for the living, not the dead,” emphasizing the need for the present generation to rely on itself, rather than on laws excavated from “musty records” and “royal parchments” (44).

Jefferson was also in 1824 still very much concerned with exonerating the Saxons from any mingling of church and state in their government. To Cartwright he wrote:

I was glad to find in your book a formal contradiction…[of the claim] that Christianity is a part of the common law. The proof of the contrary, which you have adduced, is incontestible; to wit, that the common law existed while the Anglo-Saxons were yet pagans, at a time when they had never yet heard the name of Christ pronounced, or knew that such a character had ever existed (48).

Although himself an advocate for the right of a people to refine, create or even abandon laws as their society evolved, Jefferson implies here that the common law had retained its original form throughout Anglo-Saxon history; instead of conceding that Christianity might have entered the laws after the conversion of the Anglo-Saxons, he again blames the traditional assumption that Christianity was a component of the common law on linguistic confusion: the jurists Finch and Prisot had mistranslated the phrase “ancien scripture” from a case cited in a fifteenth century law book as “holy scripture” (49). Moreover, Anglo-Saxon priests had “interpolated into the text of Alfred’s laws, the 20th, 21st, 22nd and 23rd chapters of Exodus, and the 15th of the Acts of the Apostles, from the 23d to the
29th verses" (50-51). Condemning among the Saxon priests what he fought against in his own time, Jefferson exclaims: "What a conspiracy this, between Church and State" (51)!

In an 1825 letter to George Washington Lewis of the University of Virginia, Jefferson strove to refute Hume's "Tory" version of English history, and in doing so presented again his own Whig perspective. The Saxon conquest of England, according to Jefferson, exhibited "the genuine form and political principles of the people constituting the nation," and was "founded in the rights of man," while the Norman Conquest had been "built on conquest and physical force, not at all affecting moral rights, nor even assented to by the free will of the vanquished" (Washington 7 413). Describing the Conquest and its aftermath, Jefferson wrote:

The battle of Hastings, indeed, was lost, but the natural rights of the nation were not staked on the event of a single battle. Their will to recover the Saxon constitution continued unabated, and was at the bottom of all the unsuccessful insurrections which succeeded in subsequent times. The victors and vanquished continued in a state of living hostility.... The government of a nation may be usurped by the forcible intrusion of an individual into the throne. But to conquer its will, so as to rest the right on that, the only legitimate basis, requires long acquiescence and cessation of all opposition. The whig historians of England, therefore, have always gone back to the Saxon period for the true principles of their constitution, while the tories and Hume...date it from the Norman Conquest, and hence conclude that the continual claim by the nation of the good old Saxon laws, and the struggles to recover them, were "encroachments of the people on the crown, and not usurpations of the crown on the people" (Washington 7 413-14).
In this late attack on Hume, Jefferson proposes that, while both the Saxons and Normans were conquerors of England, the former established themselves on a very different footing from the latter. Saxon rule represented the "genuine form and political principles" of the English people, and their system was "founded in the rights of man." The Normans, on the other hand, were mere usurpers, who seized power by force but could not with force establish the authority to rule enjoyed by the Saxons. From the time William took the throne to the time Jefferson and his contemporaries seceded from the British Empire, the English had fought to re-establish the "natural rights" they had enjoyed under the Saxons.

Jefferson's vision of Anglo-Saxon history, though drawn from his reading, especially of Whig authors, also clearly reflects the ideals he wished to see realized in the American republic. His revision of the Virginia legal codes was inspired, at least in part, by Saxon practices, and he projected his desire to see Church and State completely separated back onto Alfred and the founders of the common law. When naming the proposed new territories to the west, he included the name of a possible Saxon homeland. The "ward republics," which Garrett Ward Sheldon and Richard K. Matthews give a central position in Jefferson's proposed structure for an ideal republic, may have been inspired by the townships of New England and the Greek polis, but Jefferson also related them to Alfred's hundreds (Sheldon 61-62, 84-88, Matthews 81-87). When calling on George III to intervene with Parliament on behalf of his subjects in British America, Jefferson compared the situation of the colonists with that of the Anglo-Saxons who left Germany to settle England. Late in life, when Jefferson was channeling his energies into creating the University of Virginia, he included the language of the Saxons in the curriculum. While the Anglo-Saxon myth may have been only one of many sources from
which Jefferson drew his political and philosophical systems (assuming he worked from a clearly defined system), the importance of his belief that the Saxon society had given form to many of his ideals cannot be denied.

Around the year 1800, Jefferson took it upon himself to answer the question of whether his country was “the better for [his] having lived” (Padover 1288). Writing before his two terms as President and before the founding of the University of Virginia, Jefferson drew mainly upon the contributions he had made to his own commonwealth of Virginia, though the Declaration of Independence did find its way onto his list. Most of the remaining accomplishments were those which have been discussed here: Jefferson included the “demolition of the church establishment,” “putting an end to entails,” an act “changing the course of descents,” another “establishing the natural right of man to expatriate himself, at will” and the act for “apportioning crimes and punishments” (Padover 1288-89). He also included the not-yet-enacted act “for the more general diffusion of knowledge,” in which he proposed his ward system and in which the language of the Anglo-Saxons played a role (Padover 1289). The only other items on the list are the bill which put an end to the importation of slaves, his work as a young man to make the Rivenna river navigable and the introduction of the cultivation of olives and upland rice, which he sent home from Europe while serving as the American minister to France. The fact that Jefferson invoked the Saxon heritage of England in the majority of these instances certainly demonstrates how relevant he thought their history it to be to the formation of a new society in the United States.
Fortescue-Aland and the Utility of Old English

Before examining Jefferson’s “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language,” in which he brings to the scholarship of Old English the cumulative weight of belief and method discussed to this point in this thesis, one source of influence which has never been thoroughly discussed by other scholars must be explored. Although no study of the contents of a person’s library can be expected to provide conclusive evidence of his ideas, Jefferson’s bringing together of the Anglo-Saxon language and the political philosophy embodied in the Anglo-Saxon myth does echo a work he read early in his career. Although Colbourn made reference to Jefferson’s reading of Sir John Fortescue, he overlooked an addition to Fortescue’s work which appeared in the edition owned by Jefferson (Colbourn “The Saxon Heritage” 83).\(^1\) Stanley Hauer, however, has pointed out that the preface to the 1719 edition of The Difference between an Absolute and Limited Monarchy, written by Fortescue’s descendant, Sir John Fortescue-Aland, did seem to exert an strong influence on Jefferson’s thinking (Hauer 879-80). Parallels may readily be found between Jefferson’s comments on the language of the Anglo-Saxons and Aland’s preface. What Hauer did not explore were the political overtones of Aland’s preface.

Aland’s primary interest was English law, the antiquity of which was “not very difficult to make out”: the laws of England were “as ancient as the Laws of most Countries in the World” (Aland xiii). The antiquity of the law was crucial to Aland, not only because “the Laws themselves gain Strength and Authority” from their antiquity, but also because admitting that the law might have “an uncertain Original” could tempt the

---

\(^1\) Colbourn’s reference is to De Laudibus Legum Angliae, commonplace by Jefferson. Although he includes The Difference between an Absolute and Limited Monarchy, the work which contains Aland’s preface, in his list of historical books owned by Jefferson, it is not discussed in the body of his thesis.
“Champions of Absolute Monarchy” to “fix their Original from William the First” (Aland xv). Aland’s fear was one shared by many of the writers discussed above: if William is credited with establishing the Law, based on the right of Conquest, then contemporary monarchs would have every right to change it at their pleasure. Therefore, England’s law must be ancient, and, in fact, Aland traces it back to the source of all law, Nature.

Nevertheless, the customs of Britain’s first inhabitants were “barbarous,” and even the Romans had “made no sensible Alteration among them” (Aland xvii). The great change to this state was brought by the Saxons, in whose time “we find a very great Alteration, a new Language introduced, never before heard of, and Volumes of Laws both Ecclesiastical and Civil” (Aland xvii). This comment lays the groundwork for Aland’s case for the study of the Anglo-Saxon language. Law and language are linked together here – the Saxons brought a system hardy enough to succeed where the Roman system had not, a system with roots in the laws of ancient Germany, the “common Mother of most Laws in the Western parts of Europe” (Aland xxx-xxxii). This system included a parliament attended by the Commons, as documents available only in Saxon proved (Aland lxviii). With this pedigreed code the Anglo-Saxons brought the English language in its earliest form. When, under Æthelbert, the laws were put into written form, they were published in English (Aland xvii). Alfred, first king of the Heptarchy, collected the laws of all the Saxon kingdoms, including Æthelbert’s, into a codex which came to be referred to as the “Common Law of England; because those Laws were now first of all made Common, to the whole English Nation” (Aland xix). When the Normans came, they retained this law, only changing “the Names of Things” (xxvi). This is significant, because
Aland, like Jefferson and unlike Coke, places the origin of the common law, not in time immemorial, but in the time of the Saxons. Aland wrote that:

the Stream of the Laws of Edward the Confessor, flowing from a Saxon Fountain, and containing the Substance of our present Laws and Liberties, sometimes running freely, sometimes, weakly, and sometimes stopped in its Course; but at last, breaking thro’ all Obstructions, hath mixed and incorporated it self, with the great Charter of our English Liberties [the Magna Carta], whose true Source the Saxon Laws are, and are still in being, and still the Fountain of the Common Law” (xxviii).

This flowing of English rights from a Saxon source is pure Whig history, and as has been seen Jefferson favored this interpretation himself; it is one reason he, like Aland, thought the language of the Anglo-Saxons worthy of study.

Aland makes the case for learning Old English in terms very like those used later by Jefferson. After establishing the link between the common law and the Codex of Alfred, Aland states that “he that will look into the Saxon Laws, and read them in their native Tongue, will find as clearly as can be, the Foundation and principal Materials of this noble Building” (xxv). The proof offered for the Saxon origin of William I’s laws is linguistic, since “many Expressions and Words” found therein, “and most of the Terms...are mere Saxon, and derived from that Language, but put into Norman French” (xxvii). In fact, it would be impossible to understand the Norman code perfectly “unless [one] has some Knowledge of the Saxon Language” (xxvii). Sir John Fortescue’s work, to which Aland’s essay is the preface, derived some of its authority from its language, which participated “very much of the Nature of the Saxon Tongue,” and in its diction and
inflections is sometimes "purely Saxon" (xxxvii). Aland himself took great care to retain these Saxon idioms in his edition of Fortescue's work, not only to make it the more correct, but also "for the Encouragement of such young Gentlemen, as may think it worth their while to look into that language" (xlii).

According to Aland, people in many professions might benefit from a knowledge of Saxon. Philologists must know the Saxon language to understand modern English, since it is "the Mother of the English Tongue" (xlii). It would also aid the philologist in "Etymologies," apparently one of the cornerstones of civilization, since, according to Aland, "there is no Nation that has had the least Taste of Learning, but what have dealt in Etymologies" (xlii). In the case of Saxon, seeking the etymology of Modern English words from that source is particularly beneficial since words in that language "express the Nature of the Thing," as had the names which Adam gave the flora and fauna of Paradise (xliii, lxxvi). That the language of the Saxons should be a natural one would be particularly pleasing to Jefferson, who believed that their government reflected natural law as well.1 Because of this preciseness in the language, Aland, in a passage which calls to mind Condillac's description of primitive languages in the Logic, speculated that Saxon commoners "understood more than the common People now" and "were less expos'd to Mistake; because the Words of their Mother Tongue were more comprehensive and scientifical, and less liable to give them wrong Ideas" (xliv). In terms very close to those later used by Jefferson, Aland compared Saxon with Greek, determining that there had been no real need to borrow from the latter language to better express concepts; rather,

1 In the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" Jefferson argues against assigning gender to nouns in Old English based on the unnaturalness of the practice — words, as inanimate objects, can have no gender. See Chapter 5.
borrowings had resulted from a sense of “Delicacy,” since the Greek words “seem’d to have a better Sound” (xliv). Because of the introduction of Greek, however, terms once understood “by every Saxon Yeoman” are now known only to “the learn’d” (xlv). Saxon, then, was not only the language of science, but was also the language in which science could be grasped by everyone, both characteristics which seem custom-tailored to impress Thomas Jefferson. Less likely to appeal to Jefferson’s sensibilities was Aland’s suggestion that the “Divine” would benefit from a knowledge of the language. Saxon would enable the divine “to study the Antiquities of the best constituted Church in the World, the Church of England” (lxviii). Through those antiquities the divine would be able “to demonstrate, that the Faith, Worship, and Discipline of our holy Church, is in great Measure the same with that of the primitive Saxons, and that she is reform’d only from the Corruptions of the Church of Rome” (lxviii).

More agreeable to Jefferson would have been Aland’s description of the uses to which Lawyers could put a knowledge of Anglo-Saxon. The “Elements and Foundations” of English law were laid in the Saxon language, “and for want of it the very Terms of our Law are sometimes mistaken” (xlxi). Many legal terms, though “disguised in a Norman Dress” were, in fact, derived from “a Saxon Original” (xlxi). Aland takes time to convince those who continue to write in legal French, a practice which serves “only as a Mark of [English] Subjection to the Normans” (Aland liii). Freeing English law from the linguistic bonds of the language of the Conqueror seems almost a way of throwing off the Norman yoke itself. In addition to its importance in understanding legal terms, the Anglo-Saxon language would also open the “Body of Laws” made under the Saxon kings, as well as ancient legal documents like charters, foundations of churches and the boundaries of
counties (lv, lxiv). Aland provides a number of examples of errors which resulted from an imperfect understanding of Saxon by such luminaries as Coke, and points out the errors which had crept into dictionaries of Law as a result of ignorance of the language (lvii-lxviii).

Aland closes his defense of Anglo-Saxon with a list of sources for the study of the language, which includes Hickes’ grammar and the *Thesaurus Linguarum Veterum Septentrionalium*, Benson’s dictionary, Gibson’s edition of the *Saxon Chronicle*, Spelman’s edition of the psalms and Thwaite’s *Heptateuchus*. Jefferson, at one time or another, owned all of these books. The only sources mentioned by Aland which did not find their way into Jefferson’s library were Somner’s dictionary and Mareschall’s edition of the Gospels (Hauer 894-95). Whether Aland’s list influenced Jefferson’s buying is impossible to say, though Jefferson does, in the letter to Croft which accompanied the “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar,” suggest that Aland’s suggestions did indeed influence his study of Old English (Padover 856). Aland’s apology for the study of Anglo-Saxon, and the nationalism with which he imbues the language, certainly have echoes in Jefferson, and bring together the political and linguistic, the Anglo-Saxon myth of Germanic freedom with the language spoken by that free people; however, Jefferson differed from Aland in his expressed desire to return to Old English in order to strengthen Modern English, and in his unique approach to the language of the Anglo-Saxons, which was influenced not only by his preconceptions about the language and his desire to simplify it, but also by the methodology of natural history. It is this mingling of language and politics which brings together the several strains of thought which have been explored
in the present study; how exactly these elements are reflected in Jefferson’s Old English scholarship will be the subject of the final chapter of this thesis.
CHAPTER 5: JEFFERSON’S “ESSAY ON THE ANGLO-SAXON LANGUAGE”

The “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” now in print is, in many ways, an editorial construct. The manuscript was first published in 1851 by the University of Virginia, edited by Schele de Vere, who held the post Jefferson had instituted, the professorship of Anglo-Saxon (Hauer 884). This text served as the source of the “Essay” as it appeared in the 1903 Memorial Edition of Jefferson’s writings and in Saul Padover’s The Complete Jefferson (884). Not only does de Vere’s text contain typographical errors and mis-readings of Anglo-Saxon characters, it also takes liberties with the manuscript (884). Although de Vere worked from the final draft (the manuscript contains both a rough and a final draft), he incorporates the section entitled by Jefferson “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar” into the body of the “Essay”, giving Jefferson’s title but no other indication that it was a separate work (885). The “Observations” is likely an earlier document, and it repeats and even contradicts some of what appears in the essay itself. De Vere also inserted a portion of a letter Jefferson wrote to Herbert Croft at the beginning of the “Essay,” to serve as an introduction, and omitted one of two postscripts to the “Essay” (885). Finally, the “Specimen”, which illustrates Jefferson’s ideas about how Anglo-Saxon texts should be published, is drastically truncated (885). Due to the
problems with the published versions of the text, the following discussion will rely on the manuscript itself. Jefferson’s orthography has been standardized, and for reference I have consecutively numbered the pages in the manuscript, ignoring internal divisions. For purposes of this discussion, the published version will be referred to as the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language,” and the manuscript will be divided into the “Essay,” the “Observations,” and the “Specimen.”¹

As was discussed in the Introduction, scholarship on Jefferson’s interest in Old English has been scant. H.E. Shepherd and Malcom Heartwell Arnold were the first to devote any great space to the subject, but Shepherd’s article did little more than introduce the topic and Arnold’s unpublished dissertation, while exhaustive in its presentation of data, seems intended more to prove the point suggested in its title – that Jefferson was an “American Pioneer in the Study of Old English” – than to explore the place of the “Essay” in his thought and the methodology by which he may have arrived at his conclusions.² While admitting that “as a linguist in the modern acceptation of the term [Jefferson] appears biased and misleading,” particularly in his attempts to obscure the inflectional nature of Old English, Arnold concludes that he was “far ahead of his day and time” (116-17). Although Arnold worked from Jefferson’s manuscript, he seemed still to be heavily influenced by the published version of the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language”: his discussion makes no comparison of the rough and final copies, nor does he draw a distinction between the “Observations” and the later “Essay,” which are clearly separate

¹ It should also be noted here that several pages are out of order in the manuscript. I have retained the original pagination, so that reference might be made to the manuscript. From pages 56-65, the order of pages in the manuscript is: 56, 63, 64, 59, 60, 61, 62, 57, 58, 65.
² Shepherd’s article is “Thomas Jefferson as a Philologist” and Arnold’s dissertation is entitled “Thomas Jefferson: An American Pioneer in the Study of Old English.”
works. Finally, he discusses only the 1825 postscript, which appears in the published version and includes references to Bosworth’s Anglo-Saxon grammar, disregarding the discussion of Henshall in the 1822 postscript, which was not published. Arnold seems to have concentrated on the unpublished “Specimen” when working with Jefferson’s manuscript (his dissertation in fact includes a complete transcription of the “Specimen”).

In his essay “Thomas Jefferson, Linguistic Liberal,” Albert C. Baugh discusses the “Essay” as it relates to Jefferson’s interest in language reform. Baugh points out the uniqueness of Jefferson’s interest in Old English in the colonial context, identifies Jefferson’s indebtedness to Fortescue-Aland, and astutely suggests that many of Jefferson’s misconceptions about Old English arose from his desire to “see in the older language only those features which correspond to characteristics in the language of his own day”; in other words, from his insistence that Old English and Modern English were essentially the same language (90, 92-94, 97). However, as was pointed out in the Introduction, Baugh relies on the version of the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” published in the Memorial Edition of Jefferson’s writings. As a result, he identifies the published work as a “revision and amplification” of the notes Jefferson had sent to Herbert Croft (97). While true to an extent, this assumption ignores the fact that the “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar” is clearly a separate document, and, Hauer argues, of an earlier date. As will be seen, the “Observations” offers valuable evidence about how Jefferson arrived at his conclusions about Old English, evidence which, if viewed as part of the same document as the later “Essay,” produces apparent contradictions, since the “Essay” further refines some of the propositions made in the “Observations.” Stanley Hauer’s overview of Jefferson’s interest in Old English, “Thomas
Jefferson and the Anglo-Saxon Language," corrects many of the errors of the other scholars who have taken on the subject. Hauer makes good use of the manuscript to date its various components (see below), and he explores how Jefferson’s interest in Old English reflected his political thinking, particularly as regards the Anglo-Saxon myth (880-881). His evaluation of Jefferson’s work is exceptionally astute, as is his analysis of the “Essay” itself, both of which have been discussed in detail in the Introduction. Hauer does not, strangely enough, discuss the 1822 postscript or Henshall’s work, though he does discuss the 1825 postscript (888). Though the present study does not take issue with Hauer’s work, by examining more tangential relationships between Jefferson’s Anglo-Saxonism and his other areas of thought the “why” and “how” of the “Essay” are elucidated more clearly: the utility Jefferson perceived in related fields of endeavor, such as the study of history and language and the importance of English to the American republic, answers the “why” of Jefferson’s desire to see the language simplified and so made more accessible. And, as shall be seen, the examination of Jefferson’s approach to scholarship, even in the apparently unrelated field of Natural History, will clarify the analytical technique which led Jefferson into many of his errors, a task Hauer does not attempt.

Jefferson most probably wrote the manuscript in two “installments,” a supposition supported by internal evidence. In an 1822 postscript to the rough copy of the essay, Jefferson describes the evolution of his interest in the language of the Anglo-Saxons. He first “became thoroughly sensible of the importance of a knowledge of the Anglo-Saxon dialect” in the course of his “early studies” (50). His first grammar of the language was Elizabeth Elstob’s *Rudiments of Grammar for the English-Saxon Tongue*, which he calls
"a defective abstract" of Hickes's in the rough draft, a phrase he drops in his clean copy, where he lets stand a statement that its "principal merit...is that it is written in English" (Hauer 881; Jefferson 48, 60). According to Jefferson's 1822 note, even at that early stage he was considering ways to "facilitate" the study of the language, and he committed "some first thoughts" on the subject on the blank leaves of Elstob's book (50). He first organized these thoughts and put them on paper in response to a letter from Herbert Croft, who had sent Jefferson a copy of his own work, A Letter from Germany to the Princess Royal of England (Padover 856). Croft's work compares the German and English languages, and it includes a "folding table" which demonstrates "the striking connexion [sic] between all the languages of this part of Europe" by comparing passages in each—a method in line with Jefferson's own approach to scholarship (Croft 79). Jefferson writes that in his reply to Croft he "went further into the subject than [he] had done before, and particularly as to a reformation of the Anglo-Saxon orthography, simplification of its grammar and the recovery of its pronunciation" (50). In the letter which accompanied these observations, Jefferson describes his introduction to the language:

I was led to set a due value on the study of the Northern languages, and especially of our Anglo-Saxon, while I was a student of the law, by being obliged to recur to that source for explanation of a multitude of law-terms. A preface to Fortescue on Monarchies, written by Fortescue Aland...develops the advantages to be derived to the English student generally, and particularly the student of law, from an

---

1 Sarah H. Collins has written an interesting study on the contribution of Elizabeth and her brother William to the "Saxon Revival." The article reveals much about the financial and social vicissitudes faced by scholars of that period, revealed by Elizabeth's repeated attempts to publish an edition of Ælfric's Catholic Homilies.
acquaintance with the Anglo-Saxon; and mentions the books to which the learner may have recourse for acquiring the language. I accordingly devoted some time to its study, but my busy life has not permitted me to indulge in a pursuit to which I felt great attraction. While engaged in it, however, some ideas occurred for facilitating the study by simplifying its grammar, by reducing the infinite diversities of its unfixed orthography to single and settled forms, indicating at the same time the pronunciation of the word by its correspondence with the characters and powers of the English alphabet (Padover 856).

In addition to explicitly acknowledging his debt to Aland, Jefferson expresses, as he would again in his 1822 postscript, his interest in “facilitating the study” of Old English. In addition, he outlines the areas he would address to accomplish this. These include the simplification of Old English grammar and the reform of its orthography, the second of which would in turn lead to the recovery of the original pronunciation of the language. These elements—a desire to make Old English more accessible, and the specific issues to be addressed in doing so—are reflected in both the notes Jefferson drew together for Croft and in those which he later developed for the University of Virginia. Stanley Hauer suggests that the section of the manuscript to which Jefferson gave the title “Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar” is the document which accompanied his answer to Croft, referred to in the 1822 postscript (Hauer 885). As Hauer points out, the “Observations” are in an earlier hand than the rest of the manuscript (886). Its placement in the manuscript would also suggest that it was a separate document, added to what Jefferson wrote in the 1820’s: the “Observations” was inserted between the clean copy of the essay
prepared for the University and the Specimen. Moreover, nothing like the "Observations" is included in the rough draft, which Jefferson followed closely in preparing the final draft. The fact that no rough draft of the "Observations" has survived may offer additional evidence of its earlier composition. All of this gives credence to Hauer's suggestion that the "Observations" as it appears in the manuscript represents a final version of what was sent to Croft, which, according to Jefferson's own chronology, represented his first attempt to put his thoughts on Old English on paper and the last until he prepared the "Essay" for the use of the University (886).

Jefferson returned to his subject twenty years later, when the "Essay" was written. In the 1822 postscript, and in another dated January 1825, he links the project to his efforts on behalf of the University of Virginia. In 1825 he wrote:

In the year 1818 by authority of the legislature of Virginia, a plan for the establishment of an University was prepared and proposed to them. In that plan the Anglo-Saxon language was comprehended as a part of the circle of instruction to be given to the students; and the preceding pages were then committed to writing for the use of the University (65).

The University of Virginia offered Jefferson an opportunity to see implemented the ideas he had first considered when reading Elstob's grammar. The manuscript contains two drafts of the "Essay" which he prepared for the University. The first, with which the manuscript begins, is titled "A Specimen." The specimen referred to actually appears at the end of the draft, and consists of the first twelve chapters of the Old English prose Genesis, taken from the Heptateuch of Edward Thwaites. The "Specimen" is followed by a revision of the essay. This clean copy includes a title page, in a hand other than
Jefferson's (perhaps de Vere's, or someone else's involved with the editing and publication of the manuscript), on which is written "An Essay (or Introductory Lecture) towards facilitating instruction in the Anglo-Saxon and Modern dialects of the English Language" (54). The most significant change to the "Essay" is the addition of an introduction, which makes a case for the "purity" of the Old English language and its position as the antecedent of Modern English. The "Essay" proper is followed by a postscript dated 1825, the "Observations," and a revised version of the "Specimen," which more closely matches the format which he proposes in the "Essay" than did the rough draft.

One of the recurring "themes" of the various components of the manuscript is Jefferson's insistence on simplification of Old English by "disembarrassing" it of the Latin structures imposed upon it by grammarians such as Hickes. Jefferson draws a sharp distinction between "Gothic" languages and those of southern Europe, particularly Latin and Greek. Rosemond Tuve's article, "Ancients, Moderns, and Saxons," contains a useful discussion of the trend among early Saxonists, including Elizabeth Elstob, to draw a connection between the simplicity of the language of the Anglo-Saxons with the simplicity of their society, a tendency which she refers to as "linguistic primitivism" (180). These appeals to the "primitive" nature of the English language were made in the context of calls for reform – Dr. Johnson had, for example, bemoaned the departure of English "from its

---

1 Shaun F.D. Hughes would agree that Hickes's "traditional Latin-based approach" proved problematic to him (121). Among the errors made by Hickes was lumping nouns and adjectives together into a single class – suitable for Latin, but inconsistent with the adjectival system of Germanic languages, with its distinction between strong and weak declensions (122). Hickes also failed to come to terms with the presence of strong verbs in Old English, labeling them "irregular" (122). Although Jefferson was correct in recognizing that Hickes erred in his insistence on fitting Old English to a Latinate mold, by replacing Latin with Modern English as a basis for analysis led him into far more grievous errors, as will be seen.
original Teutonic character’ toward ‘a Gallick structure and phraseology, from which it ought to be our endeavor to recall it’” (180). Elizabeth Elstob prefaced her grammar with a lengthy apology for the study of Old English, in which she defends the language against its critics, particularly Swift, whose Proposal for Correcting, Improving and Ascertaining the English Tongue is mentioned by name (e.g. Elstob xi). Those seeking to reform Modern English should, according to Elstob, seek assistance from Old English:

...in denying that Assistance toward adjusting the Propriety of words, which can only be had from the Knowledge of the Original, and likewise in depriving us of the Benefit of many useful and significant Words, which might be revived and recalled, to the Increase and Ornament of our Language, which wou’d [sic] be the more beautiful, as being more genuine and natural, by confessing a Saxon Original for their native Stock, or an Affinity with those Branches of the other Northern Tongues, which own the same Original (x, emphasis mine).

Jefferson, like Elstob, appealed for a return to Old English in order to increase the powers of Modern English, and also insisted on the “naturalness” of Old English, particularly when compared with Latin and Greek. Although he does not explicitly draw a relationship between the virtues of the Anglo-Saxons and the virtues of their language, Elstob’s comments on the subject may be usefully borne in mind during the following analysis of Jefferson’s writings on Old English. Elstob spends much of the “Preface” defending Old English against the charge that it, like the other Northern languages, consisted “of nothing but Monosyllables” (xi). After first demonstrating that they do not, in fact, “wholly or mostly consist of Monosyllables,” she admits that the language of the Saxons did contain “many Primitive Words of One Syllable” (xi). This, however, should be judged “rather...a
Virtue than a Vice," since it arose from the "Simplicity and Plainness" of the language" (xi). As Tuve points out, for Elstob "language is beautiful in so much as it is strong, genuine and natural" (184). These virtues reflected those of the Saxons themselves, and Elstob, after insisting, as would Jefferson, that the Anglo-Saxon monosyllables lent themselves to compounding in a manner "scarce inferior to the Greek itself," states that any "Hardness" in the consonants of those monosyllabic words was only so much "as was necessary to afford strength" (xi). "The worst that can be said on this occasion of our Forefathers," she concludes, "is that they spoke as they fought, like Men" (xi). The simplicity and the strength of the Gothic languages, for Elstob, was a reflection of the primitive virtue and strength of Tacitus's Germanic tribes.

**Jefferson's Statement of Purpose: the Postscripts of 1822 and 1822**

The two postscripts, that of 1822 and that of 1825, are of interest not only for the evidence they give of the writing of the document. They also reveal a great deal about Jefferson’s reasons for writing the "Essay," and how he viewed his own ideas in the broader context of the work of other scholars with similar interests. Jefferson himself wrote in the 1825 postscript that he "pretend[ed] not to be an Anglo-Saxon scholar," and that, despite his interest in the subject, his life had been "too busy in pursuits of another character" to allow him to gain "much proficiency in this" (65). He was eager, then, to support his theories by reference to the opinions of others. In both 1822 and 1825, he selected scholars whose works he had just recently read. In the 1822 postscript, which does not appear in the published version of the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language," Jefferson discusses Samuel Henshall’s *The Saxon and English Languages Reciprocally*
Illustrating Each Other. Although Henshall’s work was published in 1798, Jefferson first saw it advertised in 1821, and ordered what he proclaimed was “probably the first copy which had come to the U.S.” (50). Jefferson was pleased to discover that “some of [his] ideas were confirmed by their coincidences with Mr. Henshall’s” (50).

Jefferson excerpts passages from Henshall to support his own position on Old English orthography: Henshall, like Jefferson, had noticed that “‘the same Saxon word is frequently spelt in a different manner even in a few lines’” (50). Henshall also commented on the errors of grammarians suffering from too much influence from Latin and Greek: “‘Latin writers, by adopting the distinctions of Greek and Latin grammarians, have confounded our language and destroyed its simplicity’” (51). Like Jefferson, Henshall identifies this tendency to latinize Old English grammar in Hickes, whose classical learning was thus “‘misemployed’” (51). However, in Jefferson’s eyes Henshall goes too far in his criticisms of Hickes and other prominent scholars, including Wilkins, Edward Wheelock and Bede, “men to whose labours we owe what we possess in print of Anglo-Saxon literature” (51). Jefferson himself takes great care to disagree gently with Hickes, and he points out that Henshall is, like him, “a mere tyro in Anglo-Saxon learning” as compared to such scholars as Hickes and Bede (52).¹ These criticisms aside, Henshall does promote the presentation of Anglo-Saxon texts in Roman character, and presents his examples in a way strikingly similar to Jefferson’s own presentation of his “Specimen.” (see, for example, Henshall 5-11, in which a text is presented on one page in two columns, the first in Anglo-Saxon characters, the second Hickes’s Latin translation, and on the opposing

¹ Henshall admits in the introduction to his work that he had relied “little on his own knowledge,” but insists nevertheless that he is “confident in the errors of his opponents” (Henshall 1).
Jefferson also expresses approval for Henshall’s proposal that an Old English lexicon be developed “on the principle of Scapula, with English notes and illustrations” (52). The proposed lexicon, together with new editions of Old English works following Jefferson’s plan and a simplified grammar, “explaining the analogies” of Old English and Modern English, would “give a renovation to the powers of the English language, too much diminished by the neglect of its ancient [form], and remove for the student all the difficulties” of returning to “the sources of the English language.” This last, Jefferson concludes, is “the principle object of what is herein proposed”: the study of Old English will serve the purpose of strengthening Modern English, a goal particularly important given the links Jefferson drew between English and democracy, and the power of language in a free society (52). 1 The writer of this new grammar, however, must meet high standards:

He should be well read in all the ancient English writers, Piers Ploughman, Chaucer, Owen, Douglas, Spencer [sic], etc., well acquainted with the provincial dialects of England and Scotland, preferably divested of Greek and Latin, and free from the whimsical affection of forming the syllables and letters of our words in order to deduce them from sources so foreign to the form and origin of the language (52).

Jefferson would have been the first to admit that he himself did not meet these standards. Still, by describing the ideal, Jefferson sheds light on the approach he himself took in both “Essay” and the “Observations.” He hoped to divest Old English of the scaffolding of

---

1 See Chapter 2, above.
Greek and Latin grammar, and present it in such a way that it would be as comprehensible to moderns as the writers mentioned in this passage.

The postscript which Jefferson added to the end of his final draft in 1825 reflects many of the same concerns; it is, however, more than a simple revision of his earlier notes. Even more than in the 1822 postscript, Jefferson here relates his interest in the Anglo-Saxon language to education. "From an early period of my studies," he writes, "I have been sensible of the importance of making it a part of the regular education of our youth" (65). While he admits to not being a true scholar of the language, he has "applied [himself] to the study of it with some degree of attention" (65). His studies led him to a conclusion which is at the heart of his approach to Old English:

The leading idea which very soon impressed itself on my mind, and which has continued to prevail through the whole of my observations on the language, was, that it was nothing more than the old English of a period of some ages earlier than that of Piers Ploughman, and under this view my cultivation of it has been continued (65).

Jefferson goes on to reiterate the point he had made in the "Essay" proper, that Hickes and scholars like him had been "employed in a very unfortunate direction, in endeavor to give [Old English] the complicated structure of the Greek and Latin languages (65). As he did in his first postscript, Jefferson now turns for corroboration to a work he had just recently received; instead of Henshall, Jefferson discusses Joseph Bosworth's *Elements of Anglo-Saxon Grammar*. Like Henshall's work, Bosworth's failed to please Jefferson completely:
Mr. Bosworth’s is indeed a treasure of that venerable learning. It proves the assiduity with which he has cultivated it. The profound knowledge in it which he has attained, and that he has advanced far beyond all former grammarians in the science of its structure. Yet, I own, I was disappointed on finding that in proportion as he has advanced on, and beyond, the footsteps of his predecessors, he has the more embarrassed the language with rules and distinctions in imitation of the grammars of Greek and Latin, has led it still further from its genuine type of old English (66).

Jefferson is utterly himself here, prefacing criticism with flattery (as he had done in the *Notes on Virginia* when questioning Buffon’s conclusions about American fauna). What had raised Jefferson’s expectations for Bosworth’s work was the scholar’s recognition of an issue that formed the foundation of Jefferson’s case for simplifying the presentation of Old English grammar. Bosworth had written of “‘the total disregard of the Anglo-Saxons of any settled rules of orthography,’” including “‘their confounding the letters, using them indifferently for each other…and the variety of ways of writing the same word by different Anglo-Saxon authors’” (66). Jefferson summarizes the examples of unsettled orthography, some of which he himself has made use of in his “Essay” and in the “Observations,” and then quotes Bosworth’s explanation for such irregularities:

> It must be evident that learning was not so common in the Saxon era as at the present time. Our ancestors, having few opportunities of literary acquirements, could not have determined upon fixed rules for orthography, any more than illiterate persons in the present day…. Hence arose the differences observable in spelling the same words in Saxon (66).
In addition to supporting Jefferson’s claim that illiteracy was largely responsible for Anglo-Saxon spelling practices, Bosworth also perceived the descent of Modern English from the Old English language: “‘those changes in Saxon, which are denominated dialects, appear in reality only to be the alterations observed in the progress of language, as it flowed from the Saxon…till it settled in the form of the present English’” (66). Bosworth not only agrees with Jefferson in tracing Modern English to its roots in Old English: he also makes the same error which Jefferson does in his “Essay,” disregarding the possibility that some of the “irregularities” in Old English spellings might have resulted from regional variations in pronunciation. Jefferson reports how Bosworth supports his claim that Old and Modern English are the same language by presenting versions of the Paternoster from the year 890 through the year 1611, and concludes that they offered sufficient proof of the “gradual changes of the language from the Anglo-Saxon form, to that of the present English” (66). The only “dialects,” then, which Jefferson acknowledges are Anglo-Saxon and English, dialects “of the same language, separated by lines of time instead of space” (66). This is a point Jefferson has made already in this postscript, and one that surfaces again and again in the manuscript: Old English and Modern English are the same language. As a result, the first can be understood by reference to the second, and the second can be enriched by an understanding of the first.1

---

1 Jefferson found additional support for Modern English’s debt to Old English in Horne Tooke: in the Report to the Commissioners for the University of Virginia he points to Tooke as a source of “obvious proofs” of the fact that while Old English “gives the radix of the mass of our language,” while Greek and Latin “explain its innovations only” (Peterson Portable 341-42). Tooke’s Diversions of Purley, the first volume of which Jefferson owned, is filled with somewhat fanciful etymologies, such as the descent of “by” from “by6,” the imperative of “beon” (Sowerby V 132, Tooke I 402). Jefferson does not seem to have been influenced Tooke’s concept of abbreviation, which, for example, explained inflectional endings as abbreviations of whole words joined to the ends of other words (I 352). Hans Aarsleff summarizes Tooke’s thought and discusses his influence in The Study of Language in England, 1780-1860.
Jefferson concludes the 1825 postscript with a final appeal to the need for a simplification of Old English grammar based, in part, on reformation of its orthography. He complains that Bosworth, "in conformity with preceding authorities," has introduced genders, cases and declensions based on the final vowel of nouns, and formed verbs into parts based on the "collocation of letters," leading to "such an infinitude of minute rules and observances, as are beyond the power of any human memory to retain" (67). In a highly telling passage, Jefferson warns that:

If indeed this be the true genius of the Anglo-Saxon language, then its difficulties go beyond it's worth, and render a knowledge of it no longer a compensation for the time and labor it's acquisition will require: and in that case, I would recommend it's abandonment in our University, as an unattainable and unprofitable pursuit. But if, as I believe, we may consider it as merely an antiquated form of our present language, if we may throw aside the learned difficulties which mask it's real character, liberate it from these foreign shackles...then I am persuaded it's acquisition will require little time or labor, and will richly repay us by the intimate insight it will give us into the genuine structure, powers and meanings of the language we now read and speak (67-68).

This statement reveals much about the factors motivating Jefferson's operations on Old English. He felt certain that knowledge of the language of their Anglo-Saxon forbears was a useful acquisition for the citizens of the American republic, who not only spoke English, the language of freedom, but for whom the use of language was an essential element in their political system, ruled as they were by the voice of the people, who in turn were informed by a free press. Its acquisition would certainly accomplish more than
allowing moderns to "read Shakespeare and Milton with a superior degree of intelligence and delight" (68). Jefferson's insistence that there was really little difference between Old and Modern English, that apparent differences could be explained away by the poor spelling of an illiterate people, takes on new force given his admission here that, if grammarians such as Hickes, Thwaites, Elstob and Bosworth were right, and Old English was an inflected language, complete with such "embarrassments" as cases, genders and declensions, then learning it would take more time than this very time-conscious man could condone. The documents which make up Jefferson's manuscript, and which would later be published as the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language," demonstrate this drive to simplify, to fulfill his stated intent of freeing Old English from the "foreign shackles" in which these grammarians have bound it, an expression which cannot but call to mind the long laboring of the Saxons under the Normans, and the struggle of Jefferson's own generation against England.

"Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar"

Although the section of the manuscript entitled by Jefferson "Observations on Anglo-Saxon Grammar" was actually inserted after the essay proper, it would seem to be an earlier composition, and so will be dealt with first here. It covers the three topics which Jefferson claimed to have addressed in his reply to Herbert Croft: "reformation of anglo-Saxon orthography, simplification of its grammar and the recovery of its pronunciation," although not necessarily in that order (50). The "Observations" employs only sources available to Jefferson in his second library, which fact, coupled with the penmanship, which is, according to Hauer, an earlier hand, is evidence of its early
composition (Hauer 886). At seven pages, the "Observations" is far shorter than the "Essay" and the "Specimen." It begins with a section on pronunciation, in which Jefferson also introduces the subject of orthography and adds a brief "specimen" which presents in columns the form in which Jefferson wished Old English texts to be edited. This is followed by a section on Old English declensions, and the "Observations" concludes with Jefferson's case for the strong relationship between the Old and Modern English "dialects."

The section on pronunciation begins with a general introduction to the means by which a spoken language is represented in writing. "Different nations use different alphabets for expressing the sounds of their languages," Jefferson notes; however, "nations which use the same alphabet assign very different powers to the same characters" (69). For modern languages grammars are available which impart the pronunciation of a given character in an unfamiliar language by relating it to the same sound in the reader's native tongue. Such materials are widely available for "living languages," and had undoubtedly been available for "languages now considered dead," such as Greek and Latin, as well. Unfortunately, these ancient records have long since been lost, and so the linguist must turn to other sources to recover the original pronunciation of those dead languages:

These evidences being lost, we resort to the countries in which these languages were once spoken, and where they have been insensibly altered to what is now spoken there; and we presume that, the same alphabetical characters being still preserved there, the powers assigned to them are those handed down by tradition, with some changes no doubt, but yet tolerably correct in the main (69).
The way to recover the pronunciation of ancient Greek and Latin, then, is to refer to contemporary pronunciation in Italy and Greece, where "the pronunciation of the Greek and Roman characters... is nearer probably to that of the ancient Greeks and Romans than the sounds assigned to the same characters by any other nation" (69). However, the use of the qualifier "probably" is worth noting. While the oral practice of Greece and Italy may be used to help determine the pronunciation of the Classical languages, Jefferson makes no claim for the certainty of this method; both languages have undoubtedly changed from their ancient form, yet, lacking better evidence of their original pronunciation, the scholar must fall back on contemporary practice in Greece and Italy. This argument is significant, since it lays the foundation for Jefferson's approach to resolving the difficulties of learning the Old English language.

What is true of Greek and Latin, Jefferson suggests, must be true of the ancestor of Modern English, which "is also become a dead language" (69). Although the Saxon alphabet has been preserved, there remain no "written evidences of the powers assigned to its different characters" (69). A work which would make these clear would not likely have arisen among the Anglo-Saxons, since "the expressions of the sounds of their language by alphabetical characters had not been long and generally enough practiced to settle an uniform power in each letter or combination of letters" (69). In other words, the Saxons themselves could not have clearly assigned a specific power to each of the characters in the alphabet they had adopted. Jefferson concludes that in order to recover the pronunciation of their language the modern reader must:

resort to the pronunciation of corresponding words in Modern English. For as the Anglo-Saxon was insensibly changed into the present English Language, it is
probable the English have the pronunciation, as well as the word, by tradition.

Indeed I consider the actual pronunciation of a word by the English as better evidence of its pronunciation by their Anglo-Saxon ancestors than the multiform representation of it by letters which they have left us (69-70).

Jefferson is, in essence, calling on scholars to disregard the evidence preserved in Anglo-Saxon records, and to rely instead on the assumption of a near correlation between Modern English and Old English pronunciation.

This passage warrants careful examination, because it lays the foundation for the operations which Jefferson would perform upon Old English. Returning to Jefferson’s approach to natural history, it should be remembered, first, that Jefferson rejected abstract theorizing, “speculations hyperphysical and antiphysical” which “so uselessly occupy and disquiet the mind,” preferring instead to rely on the materialist approach of relying only on the evidence of his own senses, employed through a careful accumulation and comparison of data (Cappon 2 568). This acceptance that all knowledge must be derived from the senses resulted for Jefferson in a belief that humanity’s knowledge of nature is bound by the limitations imposed by those senses. Since nature has not revealed its secrets, the scholar must select perceptible characteristics by which natural phenomenon might be classified, analyzed and remembered. It is exactly because nature is unknowable that the scientist is allowed – is, in fact, forced – to make ultimately arbitrary decisions to impose order on the complexities of the natural world. Jefferson has here made exactly that claim for Old English pronunciation. Because of the illiteracy of the Saxons and the chaos of letters with which they spelled their words, the original pronunciation of their language is ultimately unknowable, at least from the evidence offered by surviving Anglo-Saxon
documents. Old English, like nature, refuses to yield up its secrets; to impose order, to arrive at a pronunciation which would allow the researcher an easier approach to Anglo-Saxon texts, a choice must be made as to how best to achieve that goal. For Jefferson, the best solution is to use Modern English as the guide by which the pronunciation of Old English might be determined — determined, not rediscovered. Jefferson offers additional support for the validity of his method by insisting that the present form of the language must have descended from the older form, and so probably retained much of the original pronunciation; however, his right to establish the modern as the criterion by which the ancient form of the English language might be studied is derived as well from uncertainty. Though a reasoned choice, it is also arbitrary.

Applying the standard of Modern English pronunciation, Jefferson suggests possible pronunciations for Anglo-Saxon characters. “C” he suggests “was probably sounded as ‘k’ [quotation marks mine],” since the Old English word “cynric” is clearly related to the Modern English words “kine” and “kingric.” “Ci” must be “ch,” since “cieste” became “chest” in Modern English, while “eo” was used to represent a variety of sounds, such as “y” in the Old English “eow” and “eower,” in Modern English “you” and “your.” “e” in “threo” (three) and seofon (seven) and “o” in “feower” (four). “Ea” could be “a” or “o,” as in “anfeald” (onefold) and “thryfeald” (threelfold). The Old English character “Sc” could represent “y” (yclept) or “a” (adown, along, aside, etc.). “Io,” as in “sioc,” “siolc” and “siolfor” had been pronounced “i” (“sick,” “silk,” “silver”). “Sc” was the same as Modern English “sh,” as “bisceop” became “bishop,” “Iuweisc” became “Jewish” and “scomlease” became “shameless.” The Anglo-Saxon character “J” Jefferson relates to the “y” sound in modern English, rendering an Old English word for “house,”
“hipe,” as the Modern English “hive,” which is actually descended from the Old English “hyf” (Hall 200). Interestingly, many of Jefferson’s conclusions do reflect the pronunciations generally agreed on by later scholars. “C” is believed to have been pronounced “k” before back vowels and “y,” and “ch” before front vowels” (Mitchell and Robinson 15; Sweet 3-4). However, his insistence upon applying modern pronunciation did lead him into errors, particularly in the case of the diphthongs, in which both vowel sounds are believed to have been pronounced (Mitchell and Robinson 14-15; Sweet 2). By relating the Anglo-Saxon “hipe” to the Modern English “hive,” Jefferson makes his most serious error, by modern standards: the grammars of Mitchell and Robinson and Sweet limit the “v” sound of Modern English to the Old English “f,” which was voiced between vowels or other voiced letters (Mitchell and Robinson 15).

Jefferson now proceeds to outline a plan for publishing Anglo-Saxon texts, based on this belief that “the dissimilitude between Saxon and English is more in appearance than reality” (71). He uses for his text Ælfred’s Old English version of Orosius, and arranges it in four columns, according to the following plan:

1. The original Anglo-Saxon characters and spelling.
2. The same text in Anglo-Saxon characters, but with Modern English orthography.
3. The text in Roman characters and reformed orthography.
4. A literal Modern English translation, employing “indulgences of grammar, or of obsolete, or provincial terms” to remain as true as possible to the original (70).

This “mini-specimen” will be discussed below, after Jefferson’s analysis of Old English declensions has been dealt with. Based on this comparative presentation of the Old English text, Jefferson concludes that the difference between Old English and English “consists chiefly in the difference of character and orthography”; “suppress” those differences and the Old English will reveal itself to be “not a different language, but the same in an earlier stage of its progression” (71-72). This theory, stated here in an essay which probably dates from 1798, is the same as the one Jefferson would propose in his 1825 postscript. It is of particular importance because Jefferson believed that his ideas about Old English orthography had applications beyond the lexical.

The second section of the “Observations” deals with the declensions of Old English nouns. “One of the simplifications of the Anglo-Saxon which would result from a reformation of its orthography,” Jefferson begins, “would be a reduction in the number of the declensions of nouns heretofore assigned to it” (72). He is not unaware of the varied terminations of Old English words; however, he explains these away by suggesting that “the Anglo-Saxons seem to have thought some vowel final necessary to give sound to the preceding consonant” (72). Since the problems with orthography extended to Old English vowels and diphthongs, one is led to the conclusion that the Anglo-Saxons “used all vowels indiscriminately for this purpose” (72). Jefferson demonstrates his point with a

---

1 Francis Grose’s Provincial Glossary, owned by Jefferson, supported Jefferson’s belief that the origin of many provincial words was the language of the Saxons, “grown obsolete from disuse” (Grose iii).
table of Old English words with orthographic variations in the vowels. Modern scholars would agree with him that many of these variations did not reflect the workings of a declension. The variants of man (man, mon), milk (meolc, meoloc, meoluc, milc), michle (micel, mucel, mycel, mycle, myccle) and pepper (peoper, peppor, pipor) are reflections of an unfixed orthography. However, in his first example, two of the variants of “son” which he lists (suna, sune, sunu) are caused by inflection: “sunu” is the nominative and accusative singular form, and “suna” the genitive and dative singular, and nominative, accusative and genitive plural (Mitchell and Robinson 30). “Meal,” he complains was spelt by the Anglo-Saxons “mela,” “mele” and “melu,” the final vowel serving no purpose but to give “sound to the preceding consonant.” However, these terminations again reflect inflection: “melu” is the nominative singular form of the word, “mele” the dative singular, and “mela” the genitive plural.

Jefferson does not ignore these inflections out of simple ignorance, since his sources (Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob) all arrange Old English nouns into declensions. His views of these changes is, however, colored by his firmly held belief that all variations in Old English orthography reflect a disregard for spelling among the Anglo-Saxons of epidemic proportions. These various spellings must “represent the same sound and probably that still retained by the English,” since it is easier to accept that “an unlettered people used various modes of spelling the same word, then that they had so many different words to express the same thing” (72). As far as attributing the variations to inflections, he argues against a heavily inflected Old English by drawing an analogy to the silent final “e” of Modern English, which he calls “a relique of the Anglo-Saxon practice of ending a
word with a final vowel.” This Modern English “relique” does not mark an inflection, and so Jefferson concludes that:

A difference of orthography…and still less a mere difference of final vowel is not sufficient to characterize a different declension of nouns. I should deem an unequivocal change in the sound necessary to constitute an inflection, and a difference in the inflections necessary to form a class of nouns into a different declension (72-73).

Jefferson’s argument does have a certain logic to it. There were certainly variations in Old English spelling which did not cause the noun to inflect (such as the medial vowel in “man” and “mon”), or terminal vowels now recognized as inflectional (such as variations of the nominative singular of menigu, such as “mengeo,” “mengo,” “menio” or “mengu,” and of its dative singular, “manigeo” and “mænige”) (75, Hall 233, Mitchell and Robinson 318-19). This fact, combined with the modern example of a meaningless final “e,” led Jefferson to question whether the terminal vowels of Old English words signified inflections. However, Jefferson is also here continuing to apply his own scholarly method – drawn from the practices of natural historians – to the study of Old English. After first, as we have seen, arguing the impossibility of recovering the original pronunciation of Old English, and so granting to the researcher the right to more or less arbitrarily settle upon a system for analysis of the language, Jefferson here proceeds to the next step in the classification process: he makes a case for the selection of traits which will serve him in his study of Old English, and the tool he will use to derive his declensions will be the table. In the passage discussed just above Jefferson eliminates the trait used by his predecessors to mark declensions by arguing that the final vowel served no inflectional purpose – it served
only to give sound to the final consonant. The remaining traits which he will use in his
own table of comparison will then be the stem of the words and suffixes terminating in a
consonant – “s” or “um.”

Armed with these points of comparison, Jefferson takes on the declensions
proposed by Edward Thwaites, whose Grammatica Anglo-Saxonica was essentially an
abridgement of the Anglo-Saxon part of George Hickes’s Institutiones Grammaticae
Anglo-Saxonicae et Moeso-Gothicae, with the exception that Thwaites added a seventh
inflection to Hickes’s six. The table used by Jefferson to arrive at his own declensions is
printed on the next two pages, and appears on page 73 of the manuscript. It should be
noted that Jefferson arranged his cases according to the terminations of words – as a
result, the singular and plural inflections of some of the cases are intermixed according to
that final consonant. To make the following analysis easier to follow, I have substituted
Roman characters for the Anglo-Saxon ones used by Jefferson, though below I will retain
the original alphabets. The substitutions are as follows:

\[ p = w \]
\[ r = s \]
\[ b = d \]
\[ y = y \]
\[ t = t \]
\[ \delta = \text{th} \]
\[ \eta = r \]
1st declension, being Thwaite’s 5th and 6th

|-------|------|------|------|------|------|------|-------|------|

2nd declension, comprehending Thwaite’s 3rd and 4th

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td>andyitu</td>
<td>Gen.</td>
<td>worta</td>
<td>Sing.</td>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td>worte</td>
<td>Nom.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td>andyitu-a-o</td>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td>worte</td>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nom.</td>
<td>andyites</td>
<td>Gen.</td>
<td>worts</td>
<td>Plur.</td>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td>wortum</td>
<td>Abl.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Plur.] Dat.</td>
<td>andyitum</td>
<td>Plur.</td>
<td>wortum</td>
<td>Abl.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3rd declension, comprehending Thwaite's 1st and 7th

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>smith</td>
<td></td>
<td>fre-o-oh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abl.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sing.</td>
<td>Gen.</td>
<td>smithes</td>
<td>Nom.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plur.</td>
<td>Nom.</td>
<td>smithes</td>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td>freo = fres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smiths</td>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smithas</td>
<td>Sing.</td>
<td>Gen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td></td>
<td>smithum</td>
<td>Plur.</td>
<td>Dat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abl.</td>
<td></td>
<td>-smithum</td>
<td></td>
<td>Abl.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4th declension, being Thwaite's 2nd

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Sing.</th>
<th>Nom.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>witeya = witey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abl.</td>
<td>witeyan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plur.</td>
<td>Nom.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>witeyen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen.</td>
<td>witeyena</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td>witeyum</td>
<td>witeyum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abl.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Jefferson has performed an intriguing operation on Thwaites’s declensions. Taking as a given that a mere change in terminal vowel was no indication of inflection – was, in fact, no more than “unsettled orthography,” Jefferson has arranged the cases in Thwaites according to terminations which marked “an unequivocal change in the sound” (73). These boil down to “s” or “es” and “um.” Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob all order their cases: nominative, genitive, dative, accusative, vocative and ablative. Hickes and Elstob further order them by placing singulars in one column and plurals in another, while Thwaites, perhaps in an attempt to save space, presents the declensions in a linear fashion, each paragraph beginning with singulars and concluding with plurals (Hickes 11-12, Elstob 10-12, Thwaites 3-4). Jefferson has placed the cases into columns, each representing a single declension from Thwaites, a format which allows him to compare two of Thwaites’s at a time, as a first step toward conflating them. The order of the cases varies according to the terminal letter or letters, rather than being arranged in a standard order. All cases ending in a vowel or a consonant other than those marking inflections (“s” or “um”) have been grouped together, so that a single bracket might reduce their complications by dropping the terminal vowel completely. As a result, there is no regular order to the cases, and even singulars and plurals are mixed together. Using the techniques of natural history, the identification and comparison of traits (here “s” or “um”), Jefferson does, somewhat surprisingly, manage to impose order on this apparent chaos; following this table is his analysis, summarizing the four declensions he has here developed:

The 1st declension has no inflection, but for the Dat. & Abl. plurals, which end in um.

the 2nd inflects its Gen. Sing. in r (s) and Abl. Plur. in um.

the 4th preserving its radical from in the Nom. & Voc. Sing. inflects all its other cases in en (74).

Before evaluating Jefferson's handiwork here, it will be useful to begin by placing the materials with which he was working into context. Shaun Hughes has examined the declensions of Elstob, which are also those of Hickes and Thwaites, and translated them into modern terminology as follows (the declension numbers in brackets are mine):


As Hughes points out, this arrangement was "unsatisfactory," if for no other reason than that it leaves a mass of residual nouns to be classed as "irregular" (126). It is quite different from the modern practice of dividing nouns into two general categories, "Strong" and "Weak," and within those classing them by gender and phonetic variation (e.g. the Strong Masculine declension, which is further divided into three declensions: nouns primarily ending in a consonant, nouns ending in "e" and nouns ending in "e" with a short first syllable) (Sweet 9-11). Hughes would agree with Jefferson that the main influence which led Hickes to devise this scheme was the method used to describe Latin in grammars of that language (121).

The system which Jefferson devised is clearly flawed, particularly in its insistence on disregarding the power of terminal vowels to inflect. Nevertheless, Jefferson's system
does have the merit of attempting to describe Old English based on an analysis of the language itself, with no “plan” other than that which provided the fatal flaw – the ignoring of single vowel inflections. And, whether by merit of the analysis or simply by sheer luck, Jefferson’s four inflections do in some places reflect the declensions used by modern scholars. To demonstrate this, it would first be helpful to describe Jefferson’s declensions in terms of Hughes’s analysis of the system used by Elstob and her predecessors:

1st declension: feminine ð-stems (Thwaites’s 5th) and masculine and feminine u-stems (Thwaites’s 6th).

2nd declension: neuter a-stems with a short preceding syllable (Thwaites’s 3rd) and neuter a-stems with a long preceding syllable (Thwaites’s 4th).

3rd declension: masculine a-stems (Thwaites’s 1st) and masculine and feminine a-stems ending in “h” (Thwaites’s 7th).

4th declension: masculine weak nouns (Thwaites’s 2nd).

Jefferson’s declensions are interesting in that, while he denied that Old English nouns were characterized by distinctions of gender, his declensions draw together many nouns of the same gender: the first declension is predominantly feminine and the last two masculine (and would have included no feminine nouns if Jefferson had followed Hickes instead of Thwaites and omitted the latter’s seventh declension). Jefferson’s second declension contains only neuter nouns. Jefferson has also recognized that a difference exists between strong and weak declensions; he leaves Thwaites’s 2nd declension to stand on its own. Although the words in this declension are masculine weak nouns, the inflections of the other genders in the weak form are essentially the same (they differ only in the singular nominative and accusative). Although the end product is still flawed, and is based on an
analytical method which is, to say the least, idiosyncratic, Jefferson has, in ignoring the example of Latin, come remarkably near the declensions formulated by better qualified scholars, declensions still in use today.

Turning now to the brief "specimen" which Jefferson incorporated into the "Observations," it is interesting to note that his efforts to reform Anglo-Saxon orthography did not include the implementation of his case system. The four-fold system which Jefferson uses to present his text, an excerpt from Orosius, is well-suited to demonstrating his theory of the close relationship between Old English and Modern English; even his selection of text emphasizes his point, since, by design or accident, it includes many Old English words which have been retained in Modern English.¹ Each column of the table represents a stage in the reformation process: in the first column is the original Old English text in Anglo-Saxon characters; in the second is a "reformed" text, still in Anglo-Saxon characters but adapted to more closely resemble Modern English spellings; in the third is the same in Roman character, and in the fourth is a literal translation in Modern English. Jefferson was careful to make use of the same portion of the selection across the rows, so that the reader might easily trace each word's progression to Modern English. The table is reproduced on the next page.

¹ Jefferson's source for this excerpt was Orosius, the Anglo-Saxon Version, from the Historian Orosius, edited by Daines Barrington and published in 1773 (Hauer 895).
he (Other) was with the first men in the land, nor had be tho more than twenty cattle, and twenty sheep, & twenty swine. & that little that he *eared, he eared mith horsen, ac hir gavel tha the Fins him yeldeth. that gavel beeth in deer fells. & in fowl-feathers & whales bone, & in them shipropum tha beeth of whales hide ywrought, & of seals: ay-while[every one]yields by his birth[state] the birth[thestate]liest shall yield fifteen martins's fells, & fie raindeer, & an bear's fell, and ten hampers of feathers, & bear's kirtle or otter's, and twain shipropes, either is sixty ells long other is of whale’s hide wrought, other of seals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>he pae mid-hzem</td>
<td>he pae mid-hzem</td>
<td>he(Other) was mid them</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fyrit-tum manum on hem</td>
<td>fyrit-tum manum on hem</td>
<td>first-um manum in them</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lande. *napde he</td>
<td>lande. napde he</td>
<td>land, nhaved he</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>heal ma bone tren-</td>
<td>jo ma ben tren-</td>
<td>tho ma than twenty-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tyng hynyepa. l</td>
<td>tyng hynyepa. l</td>
<td>tynty hryther, &amp; twenty-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trentyng treapa. l</td>
<td>trentyng treapa. l</td>
<td>tynty sheep, &amp; twenty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tytyng jynna. l</td>
<td>tytyng jynna. l</td>
<td>swine. &amp; that little</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jast lyche</td>
<td>jast lyche</td>
<td>that he eared, he eared</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jast he epete. he</td>
<td>jast he epit. he</td>
<td>mith horsen, ac hir</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>epite</td>
<td>epite</td>
<td>gavel tha the Fins</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mid hopran. ac hyna</td>
<td>mid hopran. ac hyn</td>
<td>him yeldeth. that gavel beeth in deer fells.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gavel he Finnap</td>
<td>gavel he Finnap</td>
<td>&amp; in fowl-feathers &amp; whales</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| hum gielao hast gao- | hum gielao hast gao-         | bone, & in them shipropum tha beeth of whales hide ywrought, & of seals: ay-
| pol-bi os on beona    | pol-bi os on beona           | while[every one]yields by his birth[state] the birth[thestate]liest shall yield |
| pelum. l on Fugela    | pelum. l on Fugela           | fifteen martins's fells, & fie raindeer, & an bear's fell, and ten |
| fe-trpum. l phaler    | fe-trpum. l phaler           | hampers of feathers, & bear's kirtle ot otteren, & twain shipropes, either is sixty ells long other is of whale’s hide wrought, other of seals. |
| bone. l on hem        | bone. l on hem               |  |  |
| rp-sapum he boE of    | rp-sapum he boE of           |  |  |
| hpaleor hyde geopoth  | hpaleor hyde geopoth         |  |  |
| 4 of pholer: AEGh\-| 4 of pholer: AEGh\-        |  |  |
| picle glyt be hyn ge-| picle glyt be hyn ge-         |  |  |
| -bpum. re              | -bpum. re                    |  |  |
| bynder-               | bynder-                      |  |  |
| ta rcal gylbon        | ta rcal gylbon               |  |  |
| rynynge meanfer     | rynynge meanfer              |  |  |
| fell. l fif hynan. l  | fell. l fif hynan. l         |  |  |
| an beman fell. l      | an beman fell. l             |  |  |
| tyS jynna. l          | tyS jynna. l                 |  |  |
| ambna feona. l        | ambna feona. l               |  |  |
| be-penne kynted orE| be-penne kynted orE          |  |  |
| yteneence. l trpenn-  | yteneence. l trpenn-          |  |  |
| repnapar.             | repnapar.                    |  |  |
| xypen             | xypen                        |  |  |
| ry yxtng elne long.  | ry yxtng elne long.          |  |  |
| open ry or hpaleor   | open ry or hpaleor           |  |  |
| hyde geopoth.        | hyde geopoth.                |  |  |
| open or pholer.      | open or pholer.              |  |  |
| * ne-hafde            | * ne-hafde                   | contracted                    |
| contracted            | contracted                   | * ploughed                    |
| * ploughed             | * ploughed                   |                                |
Despite the points Jefferson makes in the “Observations” about the Anglo-Saxon disregard for orthography and despite his suggested reduction in declensions, this table was designed with neither issue in mind. The specimen is presented with the purpose of making the Old English accessible to a modern reader, and demonstrating the affinity between Old and Modern English – Jefferson’s stated purpose for all of the operations which he performed on Old English. He accomplished this on the Old English side of the table by rearranging the Anglo-Saxon characters, adding and subtracting letters as necessary to impose a modern spelling. This often involves the introduction of letters which are not pronounced in Modern English, and had Jefferson’s intent been a simple “reform” of the spelling these would have seriously hampered the attempt by removing the word even farther from its pronunciation. So “Ƿƿƿƿƿnbsp;” (swyn), which concludes with one of the terminal vowels which, according to Jefferson, were used “to give sound to the preceding consonant,” is changed to “ƿƿƿƿƿnbsp;” (swine), which is no more than the modern word spelled in Anglo-Saxon characters. “ƿ,” which, in its modern form of “y,” is closer to the sound of the word (though not in the original, which was probably pronounced like the “tu” in French or, elsewhere, “ruse”) is changed for “i,” and one terminal vowel is simply changed for another (Mitchell and Robinson 14). In the case of “ƿƿƿƿƿnbsp;” (sioles), the diphthong is simply exchanged for that used in the modern spelling, rendering the word as “ƿƿƿƿƿnbsp;” (seals). Similarly, “ϳϳϳϳnbsp;” (gyld) is changed to “ϮϮϮϮnbsp;” (yield), giving the “ϳ” its modern power, and inserting the diphthong “ie” in its place in the original spelling. “ƿƿƿƿƿnbsp;” (hwales) becomes “ƿƿƿƿƿnbsp;” (whales), actually removing the word further from its pronunciation in Old English and retaining an “h” which is not pronounced in Modern English. This operation seems particularly jarring where the original spelling is closer to
the modern pronunciation than the "reformed" spelling. While reversing the order of the final letters in "phæna" (fethra) may more closely reflect the word's modern pronunciation, adding an extra vowel and making it "phæna" (feathera) does nothing but impose the modern spelling -- while, interestingly enough, retaining the final vowel which, in Jefferson's declensions, served absolutely no inflectional purpose. Elsewhere, the new spelling reflects both modern pronunciation and orthography, as in the case of "ræcaul" (sceal), which becomes "rhall" (shall), "tægen" (twagen), which becomes "train" (twain), or "fip" (fif), which is "five" (five).

In the table's modern English column, Jefferson attempts to assert the language's parentage by resurrecting archaic words, e.g. "gavel," for "tribute," which is clearly descended from the Old English "gafol" (gafol). "Eared," from the Old English "erebe" (erede), merits a marginal note, explaining the original meaning "plough." "Æghwilc" (Æghwilc), after being adapted to modern orthography and Roman characters as "aywhilc," is given as "ayewhilc" in the translation column, followed by the translation "every one" in brackets. Brackets are also used to give a non-literal meaning to "birth" ("bypcum" in the original), and "birthest" ("byperta") as "state" and "stateliest," allowing him to retain the original Old English word in a case where the modern equivalent would distort the meaning of the passage. In another instance, Jefferson's own irregular spelling implies an etymology which actually obscures the relationship between Old and Modern English: "hpaney" (hranes), the Old English word for "reindeer," is first "reformed" to "painey" (raines), then is represented in Roman characters as "rains." The final literal translation is "raindeer," and while this is a correct translation, the progression
Jefferson has represented seems to imply that “hpane” might be the parent of “rain,” and that this word bears some relationship to “raindeer.”

Clearly Jefferson has designed this specimen with a very specific purpose in mind, one which he admits to in the “Observations.” By “represent[ing] the sounds [of Old English] in English character and orthography,” he means to demonstrate that Old English is “not a different language, but the same in an earlier stage of its progression” (72). However, his claim that “removing the obstructions of character and false spelling” gives “habitual and true, instead of uncouth and false sounds to words” is certainly open to question (72). “Habitual,” yes, at least for the modern reader: by imposing modern spellings on many of the Old English words Jefferson makes these words recognizable. As to giving it a “true” sound, his tendency to retain all the irregularities and inconsistencies of modern spelling practices at times creates an even greater gulf between the characters on the page and the pronunciation of the word. Jefferson’s goal is to make the language accessible to modern readers, “facilitating” the study of Modern English “in its mother state” and revealing the “delicacies and beauties in it unfelt but by the few who have had the courage, through piles of rubbish, to seek a radical acquaintance with it” (72). Jefferson wants the Modern English speaker to discover the roots of his language in its Old English origins. Elsewhere Jefferson has stated that a return to Old English would strengthen Modern English; here, however, he is concerned only with demonstrating the parentage of his language, its descent from that of the freedom-loving Anglo-Saxons. This goal even supersedes comprehension in Jefferson’s scheme; it should be noted that even the final column of Jefferson’s “edition” is virtually incomprehensible, since no attempt has been made to re-order the words following modern syntactical practices. The
“reformed” orthography is enough to make Jefferson’s point, to demonstrate the parentage of Modern English. The word Jefferson uses for the operation he is performing on his Old English text is telling: he writes that, to reveal the descent of Modern from Old English, one need only “suppress” the difference in character and orthography between the two (72). This is not the verb one would choose to describe the work of a scholar massaging the two languages in an attempt to understand their underlying similarities and differences. “Suppress” implies instead an act of will and even of obfuscation; in order to prove the parentage of Modern English, very real differences may be ignored, even hidden. Given Jefferson’s approach to the editing of “incorrect” texts, his word choice here is particularly interesting.

Jefferson concludes the “Observations” with a final restatement of his case for “reforming” Old English orthography. After presenting his proposition for reducing the declensions from seven to four, he admits that some might think this reformation “a bold proposition amounting to a change in the language” (74). However, this is not the case at all:

What constitutes a language is a system of articulated sounds, to each of which an idea is attached. The artificial representation of these sounds on paper is a distinct thing. Surely there were languages before the invention of letters; and there are now languages never yet expressed in letters. To express the sounds of a language perfectly, every letter of its alphabet should have but a single power, and those letters only should be used whose powers successively pronounced would produce the sound required. The Italian orthography is more nearly on this state than any other (with which I am acquainted); the French and English farthest from it.
Would a reformation of the orthography of the latter languages change them? ...if the English word *cough* were spelt *cof*, would that change this word? And how much more reasonable is it to reform the orthography of an illiterate people, among whom the use of letters was so rare that no particular mode of spelling had yet been settled, no uniform power given to their letters, every one being left free to express the words of the language by such combinations of letters as seemed to him to come near their sound (74).

This passage restates Jefferson's case for performing the operations he has upon Old English. Since the representation of the spoken word in letters is an operation which is distinct from the word's role as the sign of an idea, a change in spelling is no change in meaning; orthography needs only represent the sound of the spoken word. Among an "illiterate" people, new to the use of writing, this purpose is not accomplished and, as a result, a range of written characters might be used to express each sound, as exemplified by the twenty ways of spelling "many," an example, drawn from Hickes, which Jefferson uses again and again in the manuscript (75). Since there is no system inherent in Anglo-Saxon spellings (just as the works of nature are not systematically arranged into classes, orders, genera and species) the modern scholar is fully within his rights to impose order on the chaos of the orthography of those "illiterate people." One cannot help but think of Jefferson's attitude towards other primitive systems - for example, his desire to see the Natives exchange their "primitive" lifestyle for one based on agriculture and education.¹

So, ignoring the spellings of words such as "many" in the source documents and replacing

¹ Malone discusses Jefferson's wish to lead the Natives "to the paths of peace and the blessings of agricultural society" in Jefferson the President: First Term, 1801-1805, 273-75. Malone astutely
them with “many” cannot be said to change the original language, since the sound represented, and hence the word, is still the same. This “correction in type is no more than every reader is obliged to make in his mind as he reads along,” since human organs cannot be expected “to pronounce all the letters which their bungling spellers have huddled together” (75). The reader of an Old English text must therefore reduce the many spellings of words such as many to a “single and simple sound” (75). Jefferson concludes:

This...is what I would wish to have done to the reader’s hand, in order to facilitate and encourage his undertaking. For remove the obstacles of uncouth spelling and unfamiliar character, and there could be little more difficulty in understanding an Anglo-Saxon writer, than Burn’s [sic] poems. So as to the form of the character of their Alphabet, that may be changed without affecting the language. It is not very long since the forms of the English and French characters were changed from the black letter to the Roman, yet the languages were not affected. We may truly say that the Anglo-Saxon language would still be the same, were it written in the characters now used in English, and its orthography conformed to that of the English; and certainly the acquisition of it to the English student would be greatly facilitated by such an operation (75).

Utility is the ultimate criterion by which any pursuit must be judged: the usefulness of Old English lay not in obscure linguistic theories about the language, but rather in the lessons to be learned from texts written in the language and in the strengthening of Modern English, the language of the young republic. When the antiquarian’s interest in the ancient

recognizes the Jefferson’s desire to see the Natives educated coincided with his desire to procure their lands – an agricultural tribe needing less land for its survival than one depending on hunting.
form of English is put in the balance against making the language accessible to the modern reader, the latter bears the greater weight.

The “Essay” for the University of Virginia

If Hauer’s dating is accurate, as it would seem to be, Jefferson wrote the “Observations” in 1798, at a time when he was fully engaged in his role as Vice President and was embroiled in what he saw as a struggle against the “monarchical” party represented by Adams and the Federalists. That Jefferson took the time to write such a detailed response to a letter from a foreign correspondent at the same time that he was covertly organizing a response to the Alien and Sedition Acts shows, if nothing else, how engaging he found the subject and its importance to him. However, at that time he was in no position to see his propositions implemented. When, in the 1820’s, he returned to the subject of Old English, his personal situation had changed dramatically. Retired from the Presidency for thirteen years, Jefferson had not retired from public life, and the public project which most engaged him at this time was the creation of the University of Virginia. As he wrote in both the 1822 and the 1825 postscripts, the plan for the University included the study of the Anglo-Saxon language, and so Jefferson again took up his pen to make his case for facilitating its acquisition (50, 65).

While the final draft of the “Essay” bears no title in Jefferson’s hand, the rough draft is titled “A Specimen,” referring to the twelve chapters of the Anglo-Saxon prose Genesis which are included in both the rough and the clean copies of the “Essay.” The rough draft begins with an introduction to the “Specimen,” and refers to the remainder of
the essay as an explanation of the theory behind the form in which he has presented his text:

In [explanation] of the reasons which render it desirable that the Anglo-Saxon writings still extant either in print or MS. should be edited in a different form, some preliminary observations are necessary. These shall respect 1. the alphabet, 2. orthography, 3. pronunciation, 4. grammar (1).

From here, the rough draft launches into a discussion of the various alphabets which have been used to represent the language of the Anglo-Saxons in writing. The centrality of the “Specimen” to the rough draft offers additional evidence of a late date of composition, since Jefferson did not own a copy of Thwaites's Heptateuchus until the time of his third library (gathered between the sale of his second library to the Library of Congress in 1815 and Jefferson's death in 1825), and supports Jefferson's own report that the document was prepared in connection with the newly-established University of Virginia (Hauer 885).

Although the final draft still includes the “Specimen,” Jefferson makes significant changes in the introduction to the “Essay,” including removing all reference to the “Specimen.” Instead the “Essay” begins with an apology for the study of Old English. The first sentence brings together many of the themes Jefferson played upon in the “Observations”:

The importance of the Anglo-Saxon dialect towards a perfect understanding of the English language seems not to have been duly estimated by those charged with the education of youth; and yet it is unquestionably the basis of our present tongue (55).
Jefferson begins the "Essay" by placing the study of an ancient language in the context of its present application of enriching the modern's understanding of English. Just how important this was in Jefferson's understanding of American society was the subject of Chapter Two: English, the language of the Anglo-Saxons, demonstrates the "filiation" of the American people with a Germanic tradition of freedom. Moreover, language was both the vehicle and the tool of statecraft, and eloquence in English was an important skill for anyone who aspired to a leadership role in the young republic, even for Jefferson, who may have lacked in oratory talent, but whose ability with the pen earned him the right to draft the Declaration of Independence. Because of this usefulness, the language of the Anglo-Saxons deserves attention from the present generation, particularly in the "education of youth." "It was a full-formed language," he continues, "its frame and construction, its declensions of nouns and verbs, and its syntax were peculiar to the Northern languages, and fundamentally different from those of the South" (55). Read after a close examination of the "Observations," this passage clearly foreshadows the core of the argument of the "Essay": that Old English is "fundamentally different" from Southern languages, which presumably include Latin and Greek, prepares the reader for the assertion that Latin grammar cannot serve as the model for Anglo-Saxon grammar. Given that Jefferson's historical researches also discovered the purest form of liberty among the Northern nations, this distinction likely had greater than linguistic meaning for him. That Old English was a "full-formed language" also speaks of its copiousness and its powers of expression, which Jefferson in this essay and elsewhere argues rival those of Greek.¹

¹ See the discussion of "neology" in Chapter 1.
Next Jefferson gives a brief history of Old English. He dates its predominance in England from the sixth century to the time of Henry III in the thirteenth, drawing no distinction between Old and Middle English – yet another indication that he did not recognize the inflectional nature of Old English. During that time it “was spoken pure and unmixed with any other” (55). This insistence on the “purity” of Old English is intriguing; it may reflect again Jefferson’s desire to distance the language from Latin and Greek, though it is also evocative of the independence of the Anglo-Saxon people as depicted in Whig histories, as well as of Condillac’s suggestion that primitive languages were better made because they were characterized by clarity (Logique 229). Jefferson now builds a historical case for this linguistic purity:

[A]lthough the Romans had been in possession of that country for nearly five centuries from the time of Julius Cæsar, yet it was a military possession chiefly, by their soldiery alone and with dispositions intermutually jealous and unamicable. They seem to have aimed at no lasting settlements there and to have had little familiar mixture with the native Britons. In this state of connection there would probably be little incorporation of the Roman into the native language, and on their subsequent evacuation of the island, its traces would be lost altogether (55).

This passage is reminiscent of Jefferson’s comparison of the Norman and Saxon occupations of England – that of the former being described in terms similar to those used of the Romans here: in his 1825 letter to George Washington Lewis, discussed above, the Norman Conquest was “built on conquest and physical force, not at all affecting moral rights, nor even assented to by the free will of the vanquished,” and so “the victors and vanquished continued in a state of living hostility” (Washington 7 418). As the Normans
could not utterly crush the Saxons' desire for freedom, so the Roman conquest could not cause the vanquished to surrender the purity of their language.

Even if the Roman invasion of the island had not been "unamicable," any "innovations" from Latin which might have crept into the language of the Britons (who were, according to passages Jefferson copied into his commonplace book from Pelloutier, a Germanic people) "would have been carried with the Natives themselves when driven into Wales by the invasion and entire occupation of the rest of the Southern portion of the island by the Anglo-Saxons" (55). Latin, then, could not have infiltrated Old English through the conduit of the original inhabitants of Great Britain. A double purity is involved here: that of the language of the Britons and that of Old English. The unadulterated language of the Anglo-Saxon invaders then "became that of the country," and it continued to resist violation by the language of Rome:

[S]o little attention was paid among [the Anglo-Saxons] to the Latin, that it was known to a few individuals only, as a matter of science, and without any chance of transfusion into the vulgar language. We may safely repeat the affirmation therefore that the pure Anglo-Saxon constitutes at this day the basis of our language (55).

Latin and Old English have nothing to do with each other, and, so eager was Jefferson to keep the two distinct, he even took it upon himself to demonstrate that Latin had made no impact on the language of the Britons. It almost seems that he included these natives in his discussion only because they presented an opportunity to deny that Rome's occupancy of the island had left lasting remains in the language. It is also interesting to note that this detailed historical argument for the purity of Old English does not appear in the rough
draft; Jefferson seems to have decided that he needed to make his case for the purity of Old English and the direct descent of Modern English from it even stronger, and understandably, since it is the foundation of his insistence that the Latinate trappings in which Hickes had dressed the language might be removed. Jefferson concludes his introduction with a final appeal to the purity and power of the language of the Anglo-Saxons, one which would fit in well with the desire he expressed elsewhere to strengthen modern English by drawing upon its Anglo-Saxon roots:

That it was sufficiently copious for the purposes of society in the existing condition of arts and manners, reason alone would satisfy us from the necessity of the case. Its copiousness too was much favored by the latitude it allowed of combining primitive words so as to produce any modification of idea desired. In this characteristic it was equal to the Greek.... And although, since the Norman conquest it has received vast additions and embellishments from the Latin, Greek, French and Italian languages, these are but engraftments on its idiomatic stem. Its original structure and syntax remain [the same, and can be but imperfectly understood by the mere Latin scholar] (55).2

This appeal goes beyond merely setting the stage for disencumbering Anglo-Saxon studies of the scaffolding of Latin grammars. Jefferson is making a sustained defense of the

---

1 This may resolve a seeming contradiction in Jefferson's position: in the 1820 letter to Adams, in which Jefferson makes his case for neology, he insists that without borrowings "we should still be held to the vocabulary of Alfred or of Ulphilus; and held to their state of science also" (Cappon 2 567). His remark to Adams need not be read as a criticism of the language of "Alfred or of Ulphilus"; rather, as the point is made here, that language was perfectly suited for that time. This again reflects Jefferson's complex relationship with the past; he admired past civilizations and draw examples from them, but he also believed in the continued progress of human society.

2 The end of this line does not appear in the manuscript – page 55 ends at "syntax remain." I have completed the line from the published version of the "Essay" (Padover 856). There would appear to be a page missing between pages 55 and 56.
ancient form of English. In doing so, he again enters into the subject of the reform of Modern English: the words taken from Greek and Latin are not native to English, and Old English could supply any want felt by their absence. For the "mere Latin scholar" who turns to Old English with only his knowledge of the Roman language, its true structure and syntax, unchanged in their essentials by these borrowings, will remain elusive. The result, presumably, is the work of Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob. Old English therefore merits study as an independent subject, by scholars capable of coming to it without such Classical prejudices. "Hence," Jefferson concludes, "the necessity of making the Anglo-Saxon a regular branch of academic education" (56). Jefferson praises the scholars who "cultivated" its study, including Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob, saying that their names "deserve to be ever remembered with gratitude" for the Anglo-Saxon works which they edited and published, and so assured of preservation; however, despite their efforts, the study of Old English had been "too much neglected" for the last century (56). Jefferson proceeds to outline the major headings of his "Essay," as he did in the rough draft, but now the purpose is not to introduce a "Specimen," but rather to expound "the reason of this neglect, and its remedy" (56). This is an important difference between the two drafts: by the time of writing of the second the "Specimen" seems to have receded in importance for Jefferson, though he still did include it in the final draft. Much like the Observations," the "Essay" proposes the simplification of Old English grammar and the modernizing of its orthography in published editions of Anglo-Saxon works. The structure of the "Essay" builds the case for this proposition gradually, introducing a section on the Anglo-Saxon alphabet not present in the "Observations" or in the rough draft of the "Essay," moving
from that to the issue of orthography, then to pronunciation, and concluding with a section on grammar.

Jefferson establishes the pedagogical relevance of his subject, and the importance of the change he means to propose, from the outset. The Anglo-Saxon alphabet, in its earliest form, was a mixture of Roman and Saxon letters, and the mixture of the latter with the former gave "an aspect to the whole rugged, uncouth and appalling to an eye accustomed to the roundness and symmetry of the Roman character" (56). This is strong language, and the preference for the Roman script is a bit surprising, given the lengths to which Jefferson has gone to insist that the language of that people had little impact on Old English. However, the "Essay" is moving now from a defense of Old English studies to the subject of making the language accessible. This "appalling" alphabet:

is a first discouragement to the English student. Next, the task of learning a new alphabet, and the time and application necessary to render it easy and familiar to the reader, often decides the doubting learner against an enterprise so apparently irksome (56).

Jefferson makes no attempt to claim the scholarly high ground; he is openly attacking the "black letter," not on historical grounds, but for the unabashedly ahistorical goal of opening the language up to a broader audience — utility, once again, takes precedence over scholarship.

The brief history of the alphabets used among the Anglo-Saxons which follows offers further support for the abandonment of the black letter. The period to which the term "Anglo-Saxon" is to be applied is defined as beginning in the seventh century and ending in the thirteenth. In the rough draft, Jefferson writes that the date of the first
introduction of the black letter could not be accurately ascertained (1). The final draft is more exact: “the black letter seems to have been introduced by William the Conqueror, whose laws are written in Norman French, and in that letter” (56). How Jefferson arrived at this assumption is difficult to say, but its usefulness to his purpose is clear: attributing the introduction of the black letter to William resolves some of the difficulties of proposing that the script be replaced by the Roman. If the black letter was introduced by an invader, particularly one who had trampled on the rights of the conquered as had William, then it has no claim to being particularly “Saxon”; therefore substituting one foreign script for another cannot be said to represent a change to the original language. Nor could it be said that William had brought a change to the original Anglo-Saxon language:

The expression of the same sounds, by a different character did not change these sounds, nor the language which they constituted, did not make the language of Alfred a different one from that of Piers Ploughman, of Chaucer, Douglas, Spenser [sic], and Shakespeare (56).

Nor had the “second revolution,” which “substituted the Roman for the English black letter” effected a real change, making Chaucer’s language different from “that of Pope and Bolingbroke” (56). Since such substitutions had taken place in the past, and since the black letter was not even native to the Anglo-Saxons:

why should not this Roman character, with which we are all familiar, be substituted now for the Anglo-Saxon by printing the former works already edited in the latter type? And also the manuscripts still inedited? This may be done letter for letter,
and would remove entirely the first discouraging obstacle to the general study of Anglo-Saxon (56).

Jefferson's argument here should be familiar by now: as he did when making a case for orthographic reform, he places the script used to represent Old English words in the same light in which the natural historian must view systems of classification. Nature has not revealed its underlying system, and so the scientist must impose system upon the chaos of its creations; similarly, the Anglo-Saxons were an unlettered people and the black letter simply another system imposed upon their language by William. The scholar is perfectly within his rights to impose a new system upon the language. As in classification, the criterion by which these systems must be judged is utility, and when the "appalling" black letter is compared to the familiar Roman script, it is clearly found wanting. The section on the Anglo-Saxon alphabet ends with a return to its beginning: there the black letter was described as a "discouragement" to study. That language is echoed here, only now in the context of proposing a solution. The need to make Anglo-Saxon texts accessible to modern students more than justifies reprinting Old English texts in modern, Roman, characters.

The "Alphabet" section of the "Essay" has established that the so-called Anglo-Saxon characters had in fact been introduced by the Normans. That writing was rare among the Saxons forms the basis of the following section on "Orthography," which begins with a discussion of the illiteracy of the Anglo-Saxons:

In the period during which the Anglo-Saxon alphabet was in use, reading and writing were rare arts. The highest dignitaries of the church subscribed their
marks, not knowing how to write their names. Alfred himself was taught to read
in his 36th year only, or as some editions of Asser say in his 39th (56).

For evidence of widespread illiteracy among the Anglo-Saxons, Jefferson cites a well-
known passage from Alfred’s Preface to the Pastoral of Gregory:

swa clean hi was othfallen on Agnelkin that s Bittefew weron behinon Humber the
hiro thenung cuthon understandan on English, oth furthan errand-y-write of Latin
on English areckon. And I ween that not many beyondan Humber nay aren. Swa
few hiro weron that I furthan ane onlepne nay may y-thinkan be-Suthan Thames
tha tha I to rie fang (56).

This text reveals one of the key differences between the “Essay” and the earlier
“Observations.” In the latter Jefferson used Anglo-Saxon characters when discussing Old
English, substituting the Roman only in the four-column presentation of Orosius, the
purpose of which was to trace the similarities between Old and Modern English. In the
“Essay” the Roman characters are used exclusively, even before the case for simplification
has been completely made. Jefferson has also altered the spelling of many words in order
to bring them nearer to a modern English equivalent (“areccean” in Parker becomes
“areckon,” “ge6encean” is “y-thinkan” and “ærendgewrit,” “to translate,” becomes
“errand-y-write,” and so loses all meaning) (Parker 41).1 The passage in reformed Old
English is followed by a literal translation of the same, this time, however, not Jefferson’s.

That Archbishop Parker’s version of this passage ignores Modern English grammar as
much as Jefferson’s own translation of Genesis certainly helps elucidate why Jefferson did

1 The black letter used by Parker has been modernized here. Parker’s text is identical to the Early English
Text Society’s version of the work, edited by Sweet (1-2).
not feel constrained to produce a polished, correct Modern English rendition. Parker’s translation of Alfred is cited by Jefferson as follows:

[S]o clean it was fallen amongst the English nation that very few were on this side Humber which their service could understand in English, or else furthermore an epistle from Latin into English to declare, and I wean that not many beyond Humber were not. So few of them were that I also one only may not remember by South Thamise when I to reign undertook (56).

In Parker’s edition of this text, his translation and the original are presented as an interlinear gloss on the original, with each Old English word printed beneath its Modern English equivalent (Parker 41).\(^1\) Jefferson, in his text, cites the original and the translation separately; in this form, Parker’s version is still comprehensible, but in the last half the reader must rearrange the words into a meaningful order. The problem with such a literal translation, presented as Jefferson presents it here, is that it disregards the significant differences between Old and Modern English syntax: as an inflected language, Old English relied far less on word order than does Modern English. This is one of the key weaknesses of Jefferson’s system of simplification: by “disembarrassing” Old English of most of its inflections and rendering it into such literal translations as this, an edition may aid the reader in recognizing the descent of Modern from Old English, but as a result of garbled word order, the meaning of the original may be lost. This is particularly the case with Old English poetry, with which Jefferson was not familiar — had he been, he may have revised his position on Old English inflections.

\(^1\) Parker’s edition of the Preface appears in *Alfredi Regis Res Gestae*, published in 1574, which Jefferson purchased for his third library in 1821 (Hauer 885).
The “benighted state” of Anglo-Saxon literacy is once again blamed for the irregular orthography undeniably evinced by surviving Old English works. So few could read and write that the writer had “no examples of orthography to recur to,” even thought “them unimportant” (56). Each writer “had for his guide, his own ideas only of the powers of the letters, unpracticed and indistinct as they might be” (56?-63). The confused orthography did not result from each writer spelling words as he pronounced them, or at least not from that alone. Although the writer “brought together...those letters which he supposed must enter into the composition of the sound he meant to express,” he “was not...particular in arranging them in the order in which the sounds composing the word followed each other” (63). The examples Jefferson draws upon to support his claim of such gross negligence among Anglo-Saxon scribes demonstrate the source of this misconception. “Birds,” he explains, was spelt “brides”; “grass,” “gaers,” “yrun,” “ynnan”; “cart,” “craet” and “fresh,” “fersh” (63). Jefferson assumes here that the pronunciation of Old English had been retained in modern English, a case he made in the “Observations,” but has not made yet in the “Essay.” The spelling “brides” must, then, be an indication of scribal carelessness, since it does not reflect the pronunciation of the word in Modern English.

Jefferson also complains, as he had in the “Observations,” that the Anglo-Saxons “seemed to suppose...that a final vowel was necessary to give sound to the consonant preceding it, and they used for that purpose any vowel indifferently” (63). This is one of the few additions to this section which Jefferson made when revising the “Essay” – it is omitted in the rough draft, and Jefferson may have realized that its inclusion was needed for his proposed revision of the declensions of Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob. Vowels, he
adds, were not only employed with abandon in the terminal position, but, in fact, they were “used indiscriminately also for every vowel sound” (63). Jefferson supports his claim with a table comparing various spellings of common suffixes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suffix Type</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comparative</td>
<td>in ar, er, ir, or, ur, yr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superlative</td>
<td>in ast, est, ist, ost, ust, yst</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participle Present</td>
<td>in and, end, ind, ond, und, ynd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participle Past</td>
<td>in ad, ed, id, od, ud, yd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To these Jefferson added “other examples”: “betweox, betwix, betwox, betwux, betwyx, for betwixt,” which appeared in the rough draft, and “egland, igland, ygland, for island” which he added in the final, as if he feared this point needed even more support (63). Nor does he miss an opportunity to demonstrate the descent of Modern from Old English, pointing out that the final silent “e” and the “promiscuous use of vowels” to mark the same sound (as in “bulwark, assert, stir, work, lurk, myrtle”) are the “remains” in English of this promiscuity in Old English (63).

After re-hashng Hickes’s example of the twenty spellings of “many,” Jefferson returns to Alfred’s translation of the Pastoral of Gregory, showing by the comparison of different “editions” of the text already discussed how the same word might be spelled in a variety of ways. Variant readings are interlined in the text, as in the following excerpt:

Swa clean hio wæs othfeallenu on Anglekynne thætte swithe feawe wæron

Heo othfeallen Angelcynne that swithe feawe wæron

fewawa

feawa

behionan Humbre the hiora thenunga cuthen understandan on Englisc
The variations demonstrated here, the result of "unsettled orthography," present another problem to scholars and students alike: the array of spellings used for any given word "renders it necessary to swell the volume of the dictionaries by giving to each word as many places...as there are different modes of spelling it" (63). If these variants are omitted for the sake of a more compact volume, "the difficulty of finding the words increases on the student" (63). The logical course, according to Jefferson, is clear:

Since then it is apparent that the Anglo-Saxon writers had established no particular standard of orthography, but each followed arbitrarily his own mode of combining the letters, we are surely at liberty equally to adopt any mode which, establishing uniformity, may be more consonant with the power of the letters, and with the orthography of the present dialect, as established by usage. The latter attention has the advantage of exhibiting more evidently the legitimate parentage of the two dialects (64).

Jefferson is quite comfortable with the notion of imposing order on Anglo-Saxon texts after all, if the largely illiterate Saxons paid little attention to spelling, why should moderns hesitate to correct their errors? He has made essentially the same case here that he made in the "Observations," and once again he demonstrates his indebtedness to the methods of natural history. Anglo-Saxon spelling practices were arbitrary, and it so it becomes the duty of the scholar to impose order on the chaos of their orthography, after first

---

1 It should be recalled here that "usage" was the standard Jefferson elsewhere applied to the acceptance of new words into English. See Chapter 1.
determining which traits would best serve as guides to classification – here as inflectional markers for the division of words in cases. Modern scholars would agree with him that the Anglo-Saxons did not follow fixed standards of orthography, though they might take issue with the implications of "arbitrary" here; although no rules may have been followed, their spelling often reflected, at least in part, dialectical variations in pronunciation (Mitchell and Robinson 11). They would also accept the proposition of normalizing Old English orthography, at least in textbooks – as is done in Sweet's Anglo-Saxon Primer, which adapts texts to conform with the Early West Saxon dialect, and in A Guide to Old English by Mitchell and Robinson, which normalizes the first few texts in the book, easing students gradually into the originals (Davis, Introduction to Sweet vi, Mitchell and Robinson viii). The difficulty with Jefferson's suggestion is that, as is demonstrated in the next section of the "Essay," "Pronunciation," determining what exactly were the "power of the letters" poses a real problem. Jefferson's desire to modernize and simplify leads him to side-step the issue of the original pronunciation of Old English completely.

Jefferson enters into his discussion on pronunciation in terms reminiscent of the "Observations": "To determine what that [pronunciation] was among the Anglo-Saxon our means are as defective as to determine the long agitated question: What was the original pronunciation of the Greek and Latin languages" (64)? As he suggested in his earlier essay, the "presumption" is that in the "countries occupied by those languages," Greece and Italy, "their pronunciation has been handed down by tradition," or at least "more nearly than it can be known to other countries" (64). It would be impossible to point to a specific time when Latin became Italian, or ancient Greek modern Greek: "they have been gradually worn down to their present forms by time, and changes of modes and
circumstances” (64). The language of the Anglo-Saxons, Jefferson suggests, is no different; it has, as have all the languages of Europe, “undergone a gradual metamorphosis,” some, like the language now known as Old English, but known to Jefferson as “Anglo-Saxon,” “in name as well as in form” (64). So, as the pronunciation of Greek and Latin is best sought in modern Italy and Greece, the original pronunciation of Old English can best be found:

in those counties of Great Britain which were occupied earliest, longest and latest by the Saxon immigrants, the pronunciation of their language has been handed down more nearly than elsewhere, and should be searched for in the provincial dialects of those counties (64).

That Jefferson may have made some attempt to seek out Saxon words among the provincial dialects of England is suggested by his purchase of Francis Grose’s Provincial Glossary (Sowerby 5 132). Although this may have been the ideal approach to recovering the pronunciation of Old English, it is not the approach which Jefferson proposes. Since the time of the Saxons the dialects of those counties of England which they inhabited have “divaricated,” making it “difficult to decide among them which is the most genuine” (64).

Rather than seek some way to resolve these difficulties, Jefferson chooses to bypass them completely, again exercising the scholar’s right to impose order on chaos by establishing a system selected in a somewhat arbitrary fashion: “we may as well take the pronunciation now in general use as the legitimate standard,” since aiming at the “probable pronunciation” of the Anglo-Saxon characters is no more than a “forlorn hope...for were we to regard the powers of the letters only, no human organ could articulate their uncouth jumble” (64). “We will suppose therefore,” he concludes, “the power of the letters to
have been generally the same in Anglo-Saxon as now in English, and to produce the same sounds we will combine them, as nearly as can be, with the present English orthography" (64). Admittedly, "this is indeed a most irregular and equivocal standard," but conforming to it will serve to:

bring the two dialects nearer together in sound and semblance, and
facilitate the transition from the one to the other more auspiciously than a rigorous adherence to any uniform system of orthography which speculation might suggest (64).

Yet again the goal of bringing the "dialects" of Old and Modern English nearer to each other is stated explicitly, as is the ultimate purpose, to allow the speaker of the latter to read texts in the former with little trouble. Jefferson's skepticism about "any uniform system...speculation might suggest" is reminiscent of his criticism of those who gave abstract theories precedence over practical experience. That some standard needed to be applied he concedes, but the "speculation" of scholars was not to be relied on to determine the original system used by the Anglo-Saxons themselves. Whether or not imposing modern spelling was preferable to such "speculation" was of secondary concern: if the ultimate goal is to ease the student's task, the use of modern orthography as the standard is the best means of achieving that goal. Utility once again serves as the deciding factor.

Before moving on to the subject of grammar, Jefferson adds one final table to further prove his point that the Anglo-Saxons assigned multiple pronunciations to each of their letters. As in his earlier examples, Jefferson arrives at the pronunciation of the various Old English words by examining their modern equivalents. The letter "c," therefore, could be pronounced:
as g  fic, fig
as j  ceole, jowl
as k  tacn for token, bacen baked, cind kind
as se  cedar, cedar
as ch  cheak, cheek (59).

This table does identify many variant pronunciations accepted by modern scholars, though they would explain these variations, not in terms merely of "unsettled orthography," but rather as a reflection of the effect of neighboring letters on the original; for example, "c" was indeed probably pronounced "k" when preceding the vowels "a," "o," "u," and "y," and "ch" before "e" and "i" (Mitchell and Robinson 15). In his table Jefferson also notes that "P" and "V" often exchanged pronunciations, a fact accepted by modern scholars, who believe that these letters were allophones, their pronunciation depending, again, on their position in the word (Mitchell and Robinson 15). His discussion of the letter "g" is also reasonably accurate; he identifies the guttural pronunciation (gandra (Old English)/gander (Modern English)) and the "y" sound it often expressed (gear (Old English)/year (Modern English), burigen (Old English)/bury (Modern English), geoc (Old English)/yoke (Modern English)) (Sweet 3–4). However, his method leads him astray elsewhere; he suggests that "g" could be pronounced as "c" (meaning "k"), as demonstrated by the pair gamel (Old English)/camel (Modern English) and as "ge" (meaning "i") as in angel (Old English/Modern English), or that "y" was pronounced at times as "ou," as in ynce (Old English)/ounce (Modern English).

Jefferson introduces his discussion of Anglo-Saxon grammar, again, in terms of simplification: "some observations on Anglo-Saxon grammar may show how much easier
that also may be rendered to the English student” (60). After praising George Hickes as the “father of this branch of modern learning” and “the great Restorer of the Anglo-Saxon dialect from the oblivion into which it was falling,” he launches into his case against Dr. Hickes’s approach to Old English grammar (60). Scholars in Hickes’s time were too much prejudiced in favor of Greek and Latin, and those languages “were considered as the standards of perfection” (60). The result of establishing the Classical languages as a standard was that other languages were forced into “a conformity with these models” (60). This effort is particularly misguided in the case of English, since “nothing can be more radically unlike than the frames of the ancient languages, Southern and Northern, of the Greek and Latin languages from those of the Gothic family” (60). English is classed among the latter, and so is related to the languages of Germanic Europe – as the Anglo-Saxons were themselves related to the Northern peoples, their system of government to the admirable systems which evolved among the Gothic nations. Hickes, though he can be praised for advancing his subject “far upon the right road,” diminished the usefulness of his work by using Latin grammars as his model, a conclusion with which modern scholars such as Hughes would agree. Had he “viewed the Anglo-Saxon in its conformity with English only,” his efforts would have been far more fruitful (60).

As in the “Observations,” Jefferson’s discussion of grammar in the “Essay” focuses on the noun, though, unlike in the earlier essay, he does touch briefly upon the verb. He considers the noun “under its accidents of genders, cases and numbers” (60). Perhaps the most interesting portion of this discussion is that on genders, in which Jefferson makes a case for the “unnaturalness” of grammatical gender. He begins by defining the term “gender” as he understands it:
The word gender is in nature, synonymous with Sex. To all the subjects of the animal kingdom nature has given Sex, and that is two-fold only, male or female, masculine or feminine. Vegetable and mineral subjects have no distinction of sex, consequently are of no gender. Words, like other inanimate things, have no sex, are of no gender (60).

Gender for Jefferson originates in the natural world, and so it must be examined in light of what any observer might see in nature. Gender, in nature, is sex, and so is limited to masculine and feminine subjects. Vegetables, minerals and other inanimate objects, then, have no gender, since they cannot be classed as male or female. Words, inanimate objects themselves, can therefore have no true gender. Jefferson is aware, however, of the use of grammatical gender in Greek and Latin and “the modern [languages] of the same family,” as indicated by the varied terminations of their adjectives to indicate “animal sex,” which are then matched to “the nouns or names of animal subjects,” so that “the two real genders, which nature has established, are distinguished in their languages” (60).

However, Latin and Greek go beyond reflecting natural gender in their languages:

But, not stopping here, they have, by usage, thrown a number of unsexual subjects into the sexual classes, leaving the residuary mass to a 3rd class, which grammarians call Neutral, that is to say, of no gender or sex: and some Latin grammarians have so lost sight of the real and natural genders as to ascribe to that language 7. genders...than which nothing can be more arbitrary, and nothing more useless (60-61).

By attributing gender to subjects which have no sex in nature, and classifying “the residuary mass” of words as neuter, these languages create a distinction between the word
and the natural object for which it is a symbol; by adding an additional five genders, the scholars of Latin render this aspect of those languages even "more arbitrary" and "useless." They have broken away from the simplicity which Condillac assigned to primitive languages, and in so doing have become unclear.

Old and Modern English are another story altogether. Those languages are "based on principles totally different from those of the Greek and Latin and constructed on laws peculiar and idiomatic" to themselves (61). Since the final vowels of Old English serve no purpose but to give sound to the final consonant, it can be said that the adjectives of that language, like those of Modern English, "have no changes of termination on account of gender, number or case" (61). Each adjective can be used with any noun, "whether it be the name of a thing having a sex or not," with no changes in termination (61). Under these circumstances, "to ascribe gender to nouns...would be to embarrass the learner with unmeaning and useless distinctions" (61). Although some words may imply gender, such as "priest" and "priestess," it is the subject to which the word attaches that has sex, while "the word designating it, like other inanimate things, has no sex, no gender" (61). So removed is Latin from nature that "the thing may be of one gender and the word designating it...another" (61). This "ascription of gender" is "artificial and arbitrary, and in English and Anglo-Saxon absolutely useless" (61). Lowthe (Jefferson's spelling), "among the most correct of our English grammarians," is cited in support of the conclusion that "in the Nouns of the English language, there is no other distinction of gender but that of Nature" (61).

To further support his assertion, Jefferson points out that the dictionaries of languages which "ascribe gender" to their nouns and adjectives

---

1 Jefferson owned Robert Lowth's English Grammar (Andresen 27).
“indicate the gender of every noun”; the fact that Old English and Modern English
dictionaries do not do so offers “a proof of the general sense that gender makes no part of
the character of the noun” (61). With this final bit of “proof,” Jefferson declares that “we
may safely therefore dismiss the learning of genders from our language, whether in its
ancient or modern form” (61). Jefferson’s insistence on the “naturalness” of Old English
is thought-provoking, given his belief that the Anglo-Saxon political system had been
based on natural law. Coupled with the case he makes early in the “Essay” for the purity
of the language, it seems clear that Jefferson felt a need to ensure that the language of the
Saxons reflected the strengths of their society—much as Elstob had done.

The law of cases in Old and Modern English is also different from that of the
Classical languages. Like gender, cases can be found in nature, “according to the
difference of accident they announce” (61). As expressions of natural phenomena, they
are essential to all languages, and Jefferson insists that Greek has an ablative case, though
“its ablative is indeed always like its dative” (61). In Modern English and, by analogy,
Old English, the cases are distinguished by the use of prepositions and, occasionally, by
changes of termination. However, “these cases are not so general or difficult as to require,
or to be capable of a distribution into declensions” (62). Old English, by means of its
affinity with Modern English, should therefore be disencumbered of the declensions of
Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob. Unlike the “Observations,” the “Essay” contains no tables

1 Jefferson refers to the Port-Royal Grammar (Grammaire Générale et Raisonnée, 1660) to support his
position on the Greek ablative (“Essay” 61). While the work’s pedagogical intent would likely have
appealed to Jefferson, Arnauld and Lancelot’s desire to “penetrate the reasons behind” human speech—in
other words, their desire to create a theory of the underlying structure of language—would have been too
speculative for his tastes (Tsiapera and Wheeler 124). The Port-Royal’s position on grammatical gender—
that it was often assigned to inanimate nouns in a “capricious fashion” also mirrors Jefferson’s position
(Percival 381). Robin Lakoff nicely summarizes the linguistic theory underlying the Port-Royal Grammar,
finding in it similarities to transformational grammar (Lakoff 348-373).
detailing Jefferson's method for reducing the declensions and, in fact, he now avoids enumerating cases at all, instead describing the characteristics of Old English nouns under three headings:

1. The datives and ablatives plural of all nouns end in um.

2. Of the other cases, some nouns inflect their Genitive singular only, and some their Nominative, accusative and Vocative plural also in s, as in English.

3. Others, preserving the primitive form in their Nominative and Vocative singular, inflect all the other cases and numbers in en (62).

While retaining the essential elements of the four cases of the "Observations," Jefferson groups the distinguishing feature of the first three cases under his second point. That he still refers to "other cases," as well as the essential similarity between this discussion in the "Essay" and the "Observations," would seem to indicate that he had not abandoned his earlier conclusions. One explanation of the brevity of the discussion here might be Jefferson's intended audience. The "Observations," it will be remembered, were addressed to Herbert Croft, a scholar of Old English. While the 1825 postscript purports that the "Essay" was written for the use of the Professor of Anglo-Saxon at the University, it does seem, as the editorial title given the final draft implies, that it was intended as an introduction to Old English for students, or at least as an outline of how the language might be presented to students. This may also have influenced his decision to omit the use of the Anglo-Saxon script in the "Essay." This document, even more than the "Observations," was designed to convince the reader that Old English can be made accessible, and to emphasize the similarities between Old and Modern English in order to achieve that goal. By omitting a detailed analysis of the case system, as well as by using
Roman characters throughout, Jefferson may have been trying to reduce the difficulty of his own arguments as he proposed reducing the difficulties of learning Old English.

The discussion of nouns closes with an argument against the existence of a dual in Old English. The point of dispute is Hickes’s belief that Old English contained a dual number, based on the pronouns "wit" and "yit," which are understood by modern scholars as well as meaning "we two" and "you two" (Mitchell and Robinson 19). Jefferson suggests that Hickes’s reliance on the Classical languages has betrayed him again, and that the existence of a dual in Greek, “distinctly formed by actual changes of termination and inflection,” deceived him into seeing the same in Old English (62). Even the Greek did not “uniformly use their dual for its appropriate purpose,” sometimes expressing the number “2” as a plural, and other times as a dual (62). What undermines Hickes’s proposition that Old English has a dual is the fact that it appears in only these two pronouns, rather than "running through the whole vocabulary of nouns and verbs, as in Greek” (62). “Is it worth while,” Jefferson asks, “to embarrass grammar with an extra distinction for two or three, or half a dozen words?” (62). His answer to this question is predictable enough, and provides the conclusion for his discussion of number in Old English: “We may surely say then that neither the Anglo-Saxon nor English have a dual number” (62). Not only does this statement conclude his discussion of the dual in Old English, but by referring to Modern English it also emphasizes again the similarities between the two “dialects.”

Jefferson turns now to the Old English verb, though he does not enter into the subject in any great detail. His concern is only to further “disembarrass” the language. On the subject of “moods,” he complains of the inclusion of optative and potential moods in
Latin: both, he accepts, exist in Greek, where they are “distinguished from the others by actual differences of termination” (61). In Latin, however, these moods demonstrate no “differences of termination or inflection,” and have therefore been abandoned by “later and sounder grammarians” (62). “We may,” Jefferson concludes, “in like manner, disemarrass our Anglo-Saxon from the Optatives and Potentials of Dr. Hickes” (57).

What adds a note of irony to this discussion is Jefferson’s acceptance of the vocative case in Old English, which, in Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob, is identical to the nominative, except for the addition of “Eala þū” or “Eala þē” (Hickes 11-12, Thwaites 3-4, Elstob 10-12).

Jefferson also disputes Hickes’s attribution of supines and gerunds to Old English, “accidents certainly peculiar to Latin verbs only” (57). According to Hickes, “lufian” (to love) was the infinitive form, and “to lufian” the supine. That the omission of the preposition “to” could mark the infinitive is unlikely, since “we have ever considered it as the essential sign of the mood” in Modern English. In support of this opinion, Jefferson compares four verses from the Gospels, written in Latin, Old English and Greek. In each case, the Latin supine or gerund is mirrored in the Greek by the infinitive, and in Old English with the noun prefaced by “to.” Since no scholar would claim that the Greek employed supines and gerunds in the examples, Jefferson asks:

Why then should to for-spillan, to healan, to a-drivan, to sellen, or, to destroy, to heal, to cure, to drive, to give, be necessarily supines or gerunds? The fact is only that the Latins express by these inflections, peculiar to themselves, what other languages do by their infinitives (57).
Hence, Old English can be further "disembarrassed," and the supines and gerunds of Hickes replaced by the infinitive.

Jefferson's discussion of Old English grammar closes with a final appeal for the simplification which would result from the implementation of his propositions:

From these aberrations, into which our great Anglo-Saxon leader Dr. Hickes has been seduced by too much regard to the structure of the Greek and Latin languages and too little to their radical difference from that of the Gothic family, we have to recall our footsteps into the right way, and we shall find our path rendered smoother, plainer and more direct to the object of profiting of the light which each dialect throws on the other (58).

Hickes's grammar imposed "cumbersome scaffolding, erected by too much learning,"

"obscuring, instead of enlightening" the structure of Old English (58). "Having removed" this scaffolding, Jefferson now proceeds to introduce the "Specimen," in which he demonstrates the advantages of his propositions and presents a form in which might be edited republications of published Old English works and editions of writings still in manuscript form. This "Specimen" omits the Anglo-Saxon character from its presentation; it consists of three columns, in which the closest thing to the Old English original replaces Anglo-Saxon characters with the Roman alphabet, already introducing the first of his proposed reforms. Another column presents the same text, in the Roman alphabet, "spelt with a combined regard to the power of the letters, to English orthography, and English pronunciation" (58). The literal translation, placed in a fourth column in the "Observations," is now interlined with this reformed text, so that each Modern English word appears under its Old English root, "without regard to the change
of acceptation it has undergone in time...leaving to the ingenuity of the reader to trace the history of the change” (58). In order to demonstrate the affinity between the two languages, Jefferson has “considered as English” not only archaic words which appear in early English writers, glossaries and dictionaries, but also those derived from “the Provincial dialects also, and in common parlance of unlettered people, who have preserved more of the ancient language than those whose style has been polished by education” (58). He admits to disregarding grammar as well, offering for justification the fact that his “principal object” is to “manifest the identity of the two languages” (58). Nevertheless, certain grammatical differences must be conceded, and Jefferson warns that “the ordo verborum of the Anglo-Saxon is not exactly the same as English”: “they used much oftener the noun without the article” and “they frequently used their oblique case without a preposition prefixed, the English very rarely” (58). This is an important piece of information, since one of the first things to strike the reader of the “Specimen” is the fact that the literal translation is often very difficult to understand – as Parker’s gloss of Alfred had been when Jefferson separated the Old English and Modern English versions. Regardless of these differences, Jefferson confidently concludes that “the Anglo-Saxon writings in this familiar form are evidently nothing but old English” (58).

Although the “Specimen” follows the “Essay” in the manuscript, it will be discussed here, so that it might be compared with the format Jefferson has just outlined. The “Specimen” offers few fresh insights into Jefferson’s operations on Old English. Like the brief “edition” of Orosius in the “Observations,” the “Specimen” demonstrates both the strengths and weaknesses of Jefferson’s approach to the language. While, as Hauer points out, Jefferson “shows a sound understanding of the Anglo-Saxon text,” his
rejection of Old English inflections and his desire to demonstrate the nearness of Old and Modern English lead him into a number of errors (890). He again confuses “weorðan” with “wesan,” and so mistranslates, for example, “God cwoth tha, y-werth liht” in Genesis 1.2, rendering the phrase “God quoth then were light” (77). Because he did not recognize inflections in Old English, “thaera watera gegaderunga,” “the gathering of waters,” he translates as “the water gathering,” and “faeder her-pera,” in an error pointed out by Hauer, becomes “father harper,” instead of the correct translation, “father of harpers” (78,77, Hauer 890). More interesting than these errors, which are somewhat predictable, is the fact that neither the rough nor the final draft of the “Specimen” follows Jefferson’s recommended layout for the presentation of Old English texts, but what he omits is telling: the rough draft of the “Specimen” includes only the normalized Old English text and the translation, while in the final draft Jefferson has added the original, but in Roman characters – the black letter is omitted entirely from both versions. Moreover, in the final draft the original appears, not before his own rendition, but after – placing emphasis on the normalized version. Once again the circumstances of the writing of the “Essay” might shed light on these omissions: when taking up the subject of Old English in the 1820’s, Jefferson was concerned primarily with rendering the language easily comprehensible to the student. Jefferson is clearly concerned, not with a historical analysis of the original text, but with massaging that text, exposing its nearness to Modern English and making its meaning more transparent to a modern reader.

The “Essay” proper ends with an exhortation to both American and English scholars for cooperation in their investigation of the language of their shared ancestors, the Anglo-Saxons. Jefferson took this “conclusion” from the 1822 postscript, and its
inclusion in the body of the final draft of the “Essay” says much about why its study was so important to him. Jefferson begins by suggesting that the printed editions of Anglo-Saxon writings available in America “furnish a fit occasion for this country to make some return to the older nations for the science for which we are indebted them,” presumably through new editions following Jefferson’s recommendations (58). “An honourable part” in this task will, Jefferson hopes, eventually be played by the University of Virginia, “for which, at an hour of life too late for any thing elaborate, I hazard these imperfect hints, for consideration chiefly on a subject on which I pretend not to be profound. The “learned men” of Britain, for their part, must bear the responsibility for putting into print as-yet unpublished manuscripts “which exist in the libraries of Great Britain only” (65). The passage which follows carries echoes of the sorts of ringing phrases for which Jefferson’s writings are so well known. Referring to those learned men of Britain, Jefferson writes:

Their means of science are great. They have done much and much is yet expected from them. Nor will they disappoint us. Our means are as yet small, but the widow’s mite was piously given, and kindly accepted. How much would contribute to the happiness of these two nations a brotherly emulation in doing good to each other, rather than the mutual vituperations so unwisely and unjustifiably sometimes indulged in by both…. No two people on earth can so much help or hurt each other. Let us then yoke ourselves jointly to the same car of mutual happiness, and vie in common efforts to do each other all the good we can, to reflect on each other the lights of mutual science particularly, and the kind affection of kindred blood (65).
This passage brings to mind Jefferson’s belief in the international “brotherhood” of scholars. When the United States were at war with Great Britain, one of the criticisms he leveled at the parent country is that “her philosophy has crossed the channel, her freedom the Atlantic, and herself seems passing to that awful dissolution, whose issue is not given human foresight to scan” (Peterson Portable 103). In a 1781 address to John Baptist de Coigne, a representative of a Native American tribe, Jefferson describes the beginning of the conflict with Great Britain as “a family quarrel between us and the English, who were then our brothers” (Bergh and Lipscomb 16 373). Jefferson appeals now for a restoration of that relationship, threatened by “mutual vituperations” indulged in by men “on both sides of the water, who think themselves of a superior order of understanding, and some of whom are truly of an elevation far above the ordinary stature of the human mind” (65). Although this appeal to the “kind affection of kindred blood” seems at first out of place in an essay dedicated to the grammar of a dead language, the language under discussion itself forms a link between the English speaking United States and Great Britain. In taking up the subject of the language of his Anglo-Saxon ancestors, it is not surprising if an aging Jefferson takes advantage of the opportunity to call for the restoration of familial relations between Great Britain and her former colonies. He concludes this passage, and the “Essay,” with a final summation of the complementary roles both nations might play in this particular science:

Be it our task, in the case under consideration, to reform and republish, in forms more advantageous, what we already possess, and theirs to add to the common stock the inedited [sic]treasures which have been too long buried in their depositories (65).
Jeffersonian Linguistics: History, Natural History and the Study of Language

It would be overstating the case to claim that Jefferson's interest in Old English was the Rosetta Stone of his political or personal philosophy, or that these essays under consideration reveal radically new insights into his thinking. However, it seems clear that for Jefferson the study of Old English was more than the task of the antiquarian; it was important to him, and he not only wrote on the subject at two very different points in his life, but also considered it deeply enough to propose substantial changes to the editing of Anglo-Saxon writings. The purpose of exploring so many different areas of Jefferson's thought in the first part of this dissertation was to reveal how the manuscript published as the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" both intersected with and sprang from some of those interests and beliefs. It is more than a curiosity, to be cited with his invention of a new kind of moldboard for plows or his comments on the giant sloth as signs of the breadth of his interests, and, in the case of the latter, of the errors into which his status as scientific amateur occasionally led him. Jefferson's reasons for pursuing the language of the Anglo-Saxons is bound up with issues of critical importance to him; namely, the role played by history and language in a democratic society, and the way in which the two were interrelated, so that the "filiation" of Old English and Modern English might prove a tie between the two societies – that of the Anglo-Saxons and that of the United States – both of which were built upon the natural rights of man. Moreover, the "Essay" offers valuable insight into Jefferson the scholar, demonstrating his reliance on the methods of natural science. Jefferson's errors arose not only from his self-admitted status as a "tyro" in Old
English; they were the result as well of the methodology Jefferson employed in his analysis of the language.

Thomas Jefferson has been included in the literary canon largely by default; although he was capable of producing eloquent, skillful prose, he was not, nor did he pretend to be, a literary figure in the traditional sense. That said, for scholars specialized in the study of language and literature Jefferson holds a largely unique position in the canon: he was a scholar who held political power, and he was a statesman for whom language played a key role in statecraft. Jefferson and many others of his generation believed themselves to be in a position to see the ideals of the Enlightenment realized in a living society; moreover, as Christopher Looby has pointed out, many of them viewed “the self-creation of the new nation as a process enacted in language” — spoken into being by the will of the people, proclaimed in writing by the Declaration of Independence and established in more or less final form by the Constitution (1). Jefferson is of particular interest because he was a scholar who reluctantly accepted the role of politician; although he thrived on the esteem and respect of his countrymen, he frequently expressed his desire to retire to domestic life.¹ He was not a politician interested in philosophy, but a would-be-scholar drawn into statesmanship by force of circumstances, and so scholarship for him assumed a central role in his political thinking. The examples of history were alive for

¹ For example, he wrote his daughter Martha in 1792 that his memories of their times together left him “always impressed with the desire of being at home once more, and of exchanging labour, envy, and malice, for ease, domestic occupation, and domestic love and society”; in another letter, he anticipates his last year as Secretary of State will be “the longest of my life, and the last of such hateful labours,” and promises that in the next year they “will sow [their] cabbages together” (Boyd 12 4-8, 326) The following year he insisted to Madison that he had “fully and faithfully paid” his “debt of service” to his fellow citizens, and should be allowed to leave public service: “The motion of my blood no longer keeps time with the tumult of the world. It leads me to seek for happiness in the lap and love of my family” (Bergh and Lipscomb 9 117, 119).
him, the power of language more than rhetorical.

One result of Jefferson's role as a philosopher/statesman was that his approach to scholarship paradoxically mingled internationalism with nationalism. His lifelong dabbling in natural history reflected both of these traits: he corresponded with scholars around the world and conducted his own researches within the context of work being done elsewhere, particularly in France and England. At the same time, his research was frequently explicitly nationalistic, as when he defended America against Buffon in the Notes on Virginia, or when he misidentified the bones of a giant tree sloth, claiming they belonged to a giant lion-like cat which still possibly roamed the western half of the continent. The "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" reflects both of these tendencies. The conclusion of the final draft of the "Essay," as has been seen, states explicitly that the study of Anglo-Saxon offered the United States and Britain an opportunity to establish ties of "brotherly emulation" and heal the wounds of their long-standing feud. Even this point, however, carries hints of nationalism; Jefferson hopes that the University of Virginia might play an important role in the revivification of Anglo-Saxon studies, a role equal to that of Great Britain: while the scholars of the mother country published manuscripts, those of the United States would republish them in the form in which they would ultimately be studied. The subject of the language of the Anglo-Saxons, and Jefferson's operations on it, also reflect national interests, as will be discussed shortly.

The key, however, to Jefferson's interest in "philosophy" is its perceived utilitarian value: he consistently demonstrated his preference for scholarship with clear practical application, as he demonstrated by his life-long interest in invention and his efforts to disseminate new technologies and techniques and his own work on such inventions as a
new form of moldboard for plows (Malone III 214-217). In his private letters he did occasionally take up less concrete subjects, such as Greek grammar or English prosody, but he produced nothing on these subjects like the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language." The difference between the study of the Classical languages or English literature and that of Old English is that the latter formed an important link to what Jefferson saw as the roots of not only his language, but also of his society, of the common law which still formed a significant element in the legal codes of the various states, and of the liberty he meant to see established in the young republic. That is not to say he saw no value in the study of the Latin and Greek—he certainly did, and he not only believed that the writings of Greek and, more especially, Roman authors had important lessons to teach, but also thought they should be read in their original languages, rather than in translation. It may be he never wrote an essay on the Classical languages or the importance of learning them because in his time their study still formed a fundamental element of education. Old English, on the other hand, was the subject of antiquarians only, however important a role the Anglo-Saxon myth might have played in political discourse.

The study of Old English served for Jefferson the purpose of linking the present with the past, for lawyers, certainly, but also for the average citizen, who would "imbibe with the language their free principles of government" (Bergh and Lipscomb 1651). Jefferson believed the study of the history of ancient peoples offered valuable examples for moderns, although often examples of what should not be done. One lesson of particular importance to the United States was the means by which past republics, like the Roman, had degenerated into tyranny. Jefferson's notions about Anglo-Saxons are particularly relevant, then, because he believed that they offered the best example of a people who had
done what the United States were attempting to do: though Jefferson never proposed blind emulation of any historical government, he saw parallels between the Saxons and the citizens of the United States. The Saxons had exercised their right to expatriate themselves from their homeland by removing themselves to Great Britain and there establishing a government based on natural right, keeping only the parts of their former government which they judged useful and just. As importantly, the Anglo-Saxon society had not rotted from within like Rome, but rather had fallen to a conquering tyrant – but never truly fallen, English history being the long playing-out of the struggle of their descendants to restore the liberties established by the Saxons. These were scarcely original ideas: as has been demonstrated, Jefferson’s beliefs were shared by many of his contemporaries in England and America, so when Jefferson made appeals to the Anglo-Saxon past in the *Summary View*, he could expect his arguments to carry weight with other colonials and with segments of the population of Great Britain. Jefferson, however, set himself apart from his contemporaries in the United States by studying the language of the Anglo-Saxons and in working to have it generally known among educated citizens.

There was more to the utilitarian value of Old English than a simple appeal to history. At times Jefferson implied that learning a specific language a person learned also a way of life, political and social, particularly when he expressed concern that immigrants from the despotic nations of Europe would teach their children the principles of tyranny and submission with their languages. Moreover, similarities in language provided the strongest evidence of the “affinity of nations,” as he wrote in the *Notes on Virginia*, where he also indicated the common origins of English and the Germanic languages of Europe (Peterson Portable 149). Though Jefferson’s scattered comments on this subject do not
go so far as to paint a cohesive philosophy of language (his own linguistic theory seems never to advance beyond Locke, despite his exposure to the key thinkers of the French Enlightenment), these connections are evocative, particularly when one remembers his insistence in the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" on the fundamental differences between the languages of Northern and Southern Europe and the fundamental relationship between Old and Modern English. On the surface, he is simply trying to prove that the grammar of Modern English, rather than that of Latin and Greek, should serve as a model for Old English grammar. Considering, however, his warning that speakers of the modern-day descendants of those Southern languages would teach tyranny with their language and his belief that the affinity of languages offered "the best proof of the affinity of nations which ever can be referred to," the distinction he draws between languages may reflect a fundamental difference between the societies which speak those languages (Peterson Portable 143). By insisting on the "affinity" of Modern and Old English, he is surely insisting upon the affinity between the freedom-loving citizens of the English speaking nations and the Anglo-Saxons and between the Saxons and the Gothic nations of Europe, which had offered the world a system of government "far excelling all others that we know of in the World," as Jefferson had noted from Molesworth (Molesworth 27). Moreover, the study of Old English would contribute to freeing Modern English from the influence of the Classical languages; Jefferson's discussion of neology, in the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" and in private letters, often made a case for the "copiousness" of Old English, which equaled the Greek in its ability to make new words by means of compounds ("Essay" 55). Again, the importance of history to Jefferson likely plays a role in this desire to place Old English on an equal footing with Greek; the
experiments in self-government conducted by the Greeks and Romans had been deeply flawed, whereas that of the Anglo-Saxons had succeeded until the coming of the Normans, and had continued afterwards to live on in the form of popular struggle against tyranny. Moreover, the Anglo-Saxons had created a society based on natural right; like their society, their language was a natural one, free of such “embarrassments” as grammatical genders distinct from those in nature, unlike those ancient languages of the South, Greek and Latin. What better language, then, than an English rejuvenated by a return to its source for the nation which, in Jefferson’s thinking, would succeed in a way which no other had, in part by recreating the experiment of the Anglo-Saxons.

Language itself held particular importance to Jefferson, and so the utility of what he set out to accomplish with the rejuvenation of Modern by a return to Old English must also be seen as more than simply providing a suitable language for a nation which had set for itself such lofty goals as had the young United States. Jefferson lived in a time when national and international politics relied on the written word; neighboring cities, let alone other states or countries situated across the oceans, obtained all information of what passed through the medium of writing, and the only means of transmitting and implementing policy was, again, writing. For Jefferson, who purportedly earned the right to draft the Declaration of Independence because of his reputation for a “felicity” of style, demonstrated extreme sensitivity to the power of the written word. Nor could he ignore the importance of the spoken word, as he demonstrated in his *Autobiography* when he assessed contemporaries in the Virginia House of Delegates in large part by their eloquence. However, it was the written word with which he most concerned himself, both when defending the rights of newspapers to print what they would and when insisting that
they be held accountable for the veracity of what they published. Throughout his life Jefferson was acutely aware of what was put into print about him and his policies. He feared Hume, and accepted Baxter’s operations on his work, because of that historian’s power to “enchant” his readers, turning good Whigs into Tories with the power of his words. Not only his public, but his private messages, particularly his correspondence, were written with a self-conscious awareness of the power of his words and their permanence: he knew full well that they might be mined by his contemporaries for statements which might be used against him, and knew as well that the private papers of the statesmen of his day would furnish the materials for the histories of future generations. In addition to keeping copies of his own private letters, he carefully recorded his long conflict with Hamilton in what has since come to be known as the Anas, as if his words could re-fight and win his battles with the Federalist leader on the field of history. To a man so intensely aware of the power of language in a political system founded upon popular will and popular opinion, the desire to strengthen the English language through neology and a return to the flexibility and power of Old English must have played an important role in his desire to see Old English studied by the future leaders of the nation. Jefferson’s reading of Locke, who had suggested that definition was the only means of overcoming the imperfection and abuse of words, would also have lent importance to deriving a clearer understanding of the meanings of words still in popular use from their original meaning – a goal Jefferson stated explicitly in his “Essay.” The fact that he took the time to put his case for simplifying Old English orthography and grammar on paper is indicative in itself of the importance of the subject to him. By putting into writing what he thought to be the best means of establishing the general study of the language, he could
preserve his vision, and when writing for the University of Virginia at a time when the his influence on the institution offered him an opportunity to direct the path of scholarship there, he could even make his vision reality by taking up his pen and putting his thoughts on paper. Even the timing of the “Observations” is interesting: Jefferson undertook his first attempt at sketching out his thoughts on Old English grammar and orthography in response to an English scholar at a time when he stood accused in the press of pro-French bias and Jacobinism, and at a time when the Alien and Sedition Acts had placed the issue of free speech at the forefront of public debate. Although it is impossible to say if these circumstances influenced Jefferson’s decision to go “further into the subject” of Old English than he had before, the confluence of these events is intriguing (“Essay” 50). At a time when he genuinely feared that the “monarchists” might succeed in derailing the progress of the republic, he poured his energies into an analysis of the language of the freedom-loving Anglo-Saxons.

Having passed the test of utility, Old English must be made accessible to the English-speaking student; Jefferson’s attempts to make the language more readily attainable, the operations which he performed upon Old English in order to simplify it, both reflect and elucidate the method with which he approached scholarship in other fields. To begin with, Jefferson’s writings, not only on “philosophy,” but also on legal matters, demonstrate a tendency to build a case with overwhelming evidence. In the margin of his personal copy of the Notes on Virginia Jefferson wrote that “a patient pursuit of facts, and cautious combination and comparison of them, is the drudgery to which man is subjected by his Maker, if he wishes to attain sure knowledge,” a point he demonstrate in the body of that work by producing table after table of information on
North America (Peterson *Portable 104*). In the "Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language" he evinced a similar tendency to build an argument on overwhelming examples; in fact, most of the changes he made when revising the rough draft of the "Essay" were the addition of further examples to support his case. However, Jefferson did not always live up to the ideal he stated in the *Notes on Virginia*: when he felt strongly about a subject, he could, at the very least, be somewhat credible in his interpretation of facts. So he suggested that the mammoth and the giant sloth-turned-lion still survived in the far West in order to prove the vitality of life on the North American continent. When approaching a written text, this probably innocent credibility gave way to a perfect willingness to alter that text to render it more "correct." In his own scissor-edit of the Gospels he excised, deleted and re-arranged until a portrait of a Jesus he could follow had emerged, though he of course never made any attempt to pass his edition off as the original. When it came to David Hume's "Tory" history of England, however, he not only supported, but recommended the publication in the United States Baxter's history, which surreptitiously "corrected" Hume's Toryism by inserting some passages and removing others, with no indication that such operations had been performed. While important — and perhaps because of that importance — the written word was not sacrosanct to Jefferson.

This would be even more true of a dead language such as Old English. His willingness to stray from the strictest standards of scholarship would in that case be supplemented by his belief that the present generation had a right to make what use of the past it might, and to reject what was no longer of use. As a modern turning to the subject of an ancient language, Jefferson admitted that its acquisition was only useful so long as it was easy; otherwise, "its difficulties [would] go beyond its worth, and render a knowledge
of it no longer a compensation for the time and labor its acquisition [would] require”: the purpose of the “Essay” was to render the acquisition of Old English easier by drawing parallels between it and Modern English (“Essay” 67). Why Jefferson made the errors he did in the “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language” has been explained variously: Baugh blames the errors at least in part on the “formative period which Old English studies were still in” in Jefferson’s time, while Hauer points to Jefferson’s lack of exposure to Old English verse (which is largely incomprehensible to a reader ignorant of the Old English case system) and to the “pathfinding researches being conducted in Germany and Denmark by his contemporaries” (Baugh 91, Hauer 881-82). Certainly these elements contributed to Jefferson’s difficulties with the language, particularly his lack of knowledge, not only of German scholarship, but of the German language, which would perhaps have offered a better analogy to Old English than did Modern English. However, although Jefferson’s ignorance of much of the work of his contemporaries in Europe on Old English contributed to his over-simplification of Old English grammar, more than ignorance lay behind the operations he performed on the language. Jefferson wanted Old English to be taught in the universities of the United States, and yet he himself admitted that, in the form it was presented by grammarians like Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob, the effort involved would be too great to justify the time spent in acquiring a knowledge of it. It cannot be claimed that Jefferson was intentionally deceitful in his “simplifications” of Old English, but his desire to believe that Old English could be understood by applying the rules of Modern English orthography and grammar, and so could be learned easily by a native speaker of that language, may have colored his perceptions. He certainly felt no great compunction against altering the orthography of the Anglo-Saxons, and went so far as to
argue that a modern scholar would know better than an illiterate people like the Saxons how their own language should be spelt. Since the evidence from which a scholar might be expected to deduce the rules of Old English (the remaining writings in that language) was so clearly flawed, the modern might just as well apply familiar rules to the ancient language to render it more comprehensible. Ease of acquisition weighs more heavily than adherence to the evidence offered by the language itself, and theories based on the latter Jefferson dismisses as "speculation." In the "Essay" in particular, Jefferson prefaces and concludes his suggestions for reform by insisting on how those reformations would help the student.

Jefferson's interest in natural history supplies the final element needed to understand the operations which he performed on Old English. Certainly the subordinating of the text to the ends to which it might be put, particularly in the case of a dead language, made it easier for Jefferson to wreak the radical changes he did upon Old English. However, his method of analysis is not without precedent in the realm of scholarship, though it doubtlessly did not reflect the techniques of linguists such as Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob. Jefferson's comments about classification systems, and his use of the tools of classification, particularly the table, provide the key to his analysis of Old English pronunciation, orthography and grammar. The "'modus operandi' of nature," Jefferson wrote, "can never be developed and demonstrated to beings limited as we are" (Bergh and Lipscomb 10 404). However, the scholar relies upon the systemization of his subject as an aid to analysis and to communication with other scholars, and to enable "the memory to retain a knowledge of the productions of nature" (Bergh and Lipscomb 14 98). Since nature's system is unknowable, the natural historian must impose a system of
classification upon it, arbitrarily identifying the traits by which the productions of nature might be categorized by means of tabulation and comparison. When turning to Old English, Jefferson applied much the same method in his analysis of the language. He begins by arguing that the pronunciation and orthography of Old English are unknowable – the Saxons were an illiterate people, who, when they began writing, imposed no regular system of spelling on their language. Old English, like nature, cannot be expected to reveal its true system – in the case of the language the system by which its pronunciation and spelling might be understood. Jefferson’s materialist prejudices would have encouraged him to reject any systems based on mere theory. Instead, he chooses the system most likely to aid the scholar, and the student, in acquiring enough competency in Old English to enjoy the benefits offered by a knowledge of the language – he uses Modern English as the standard for establishing both the pronunciation and spelling of Old English words. When turning to the case system, the complexity of which in the latinized grammars of Hickes, Thwaites and Elstob is a discouragement to the student, Jefferson uses the conclusions he has drawn about Old English orthography to identify the traits by which words might be classified: since the final vowel served no inflectional purpose, only consonantal endings (-s and -um) could have served as case markers. Jefferson produces a table in which Thwaites’s declensions are arranged according to these traits, and drastically reduces the number of cases, creating an Old English which was no more an inflected language than is Modern English. A method which had proved a useful tool in the classification of flora and fauna led Jefferson to radically distort Old English in an attempt to simplify it, to ease its acquisition by the average student.
Clearly, in Jefferson's opinion, the study of language and a knowledge of history formed essential elements in the education of the citizens of a republic. Jefferson's successful attempt to have a professorship in Anglo-Saxon established at the University of Virginia, and the two essays which make up the manuscript he collected and kept, though never finally presented, for the use of the University would seem to indicate that Old English shared that importance; as I have argued here, it did so because its study opened a door to the history of a free people and empowered students in their own language, Modern English. That Jefferson's approach to his subject may have been more astute than the errors he made might lead one to believe might be demonstrated by the similarities between the purpose behind his approach and the work of a more recent scholar. In *Desire for Origins*, Allen J. Frantzen examines how Old English is taught, and how it could be taught more effectively in a post-modern context. Frantzen's thesis, as stated in the preface to his book, was that the study of language origins, including Anglo-Saxon, has always been motivated by "engagement with political controversy" (xiii). The failure of scholarship on the Anglo-Saxons and their language to "retain a place in the mainstream of modern intellectual and political life" can be blamed in large part by the disengagement of the subject from politics, which has given way to "an attempt to justify the study linguistic origins for their own sake" (xiii). Frantzen's work addresses this issue, attempting to revivify Anglo-Saxon studies by suggesting pedagogical approaches which might render the subject more relevant to students. In an admittedly less sophisticated way, Thomas Jefferson was grappling with the same problems as Frantzen, and came to the some of the same conclusions. An Anglo-Saxon scholarship concerned only with linguistic matters, with issues once called "philological," would have seemed, to him, a
waste of the student’s time. Even learning the language would be such a waste if its pedagogy could not be simplified and its relevance made clear. In the essays, postscripts and “specimens” which make up the manuscript published as “Essay on the Anglo-Saxon Language,” Jefferson attempts to address these issues. He takes a practical approach to the study of the language, expressing less concern with the minutiae of grammatical construction than with comprehensibility to the average student. In his efforts to simplify, he inevitably obscured his subject, since Old English was a different language from Modern English, with a structure much closer to that of German than that of the language Jefferson intended to be the guide to its study. In his effort to justify the study of the language, however, he was more successful; by insisting that its study would teach lessons useful to the citizens of a democracy, invigorate Modern English and enable students to access the early sources of their culture, Jefferson built a context for the study of Old English which rendered it relevant to his society. Jefferson would probably have agreed with Frantzen’s statement that “Anglo-Saxon studies are a way to recall what our cultural memory has begun to forget, and a way to recover connections that have been weakened” (xvi). Although Jefferson’s own thinking may not have crystallized to the point where he could have put this thought in similar words, he clearly believed that learning a language would open doors to the origins of his culture and inspire students to an emulation of its ideals, to preserve, rather than to recall, the liberties he believed he and his contemporaries had re-established in the young nation. This dissertation has been an attempt to perform a similar operation on Jefferson, to recover the connections which led him to an interest in Old English and reveal the political aspects of his own approach to the subject, and how it reflected his beliefs about the purposes of education, the uses of history, the utility and
methods of scholarship, and the ways in which language can have an impact upon the workings of society.
Works Consulted


[Fowle, Daniel]. An Appendix to the late Total Eclipse of Liberty. Boston, 1756.


[Skillman, Isaac]. An Oration upon the Beauties of Liberty. Boston, 1773.


Care, Henry. English Liberties, or the Free-born Subject’s Inheritance. Providence, 1774.


Glass, Sandra A. “The Saxonists’ Influence on Seventeenth-Century English Literature.”


Molesworth, Robert. An Account of Denmark, as it was in the Year 1692. 4th ed. London, 1738.

Moore, Maurice. The Justice and Policy of Taxing the American Colonies in Great-Britain Considered. Wilmington, N.C., 1765.


*The Farmer’s and Monitor’s Letters to the Inhabitants of the British Colonies.* Williamsburgh, 1769.


Trumbull, Benjamin. *A Discourse, Delivered at the Anniversary Meeting of the Freemen of the Town of New Haven*. New Haven, 1773.


INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

ProQuest Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600

UMI®
Improved decision making and management of uncertainty when using Iwao's sequential sampling plan in insect pest management

by

Paul Vaclav Lomic

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Graduate Department of Forestry
University of Toronto

© Copyright by Paul Vaclav Lomic 2001
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-58608-1
Improved decision making and management of uncertainty when using Iwao's sequential sampling plan in insect pest management

Paul Vaclav Lomic
Doctor of Philosophy, Year of Graduation 2001
Graduate Department of Forestry
University of Toronto

Abstract

This thesis improves the decision making and management of uncertainty when using Iwao's sequential sampling plan in insect pest management. The objectives of the thesis were addressed in two interrelated parts. First, an approach was developed to select a mean-variance relationship for use in Iwao's sequential sampling plan. Using Monte Carlo simulation, four mean-variance relationships were evaluated on their ability to predict the true variance of the pest population at the decision threshold, a critical component of Iwao's sequential sampling plan. Factors such as the position of the decision threshold along the mean-variance relationship and the number of data points used to estimate the mean and variance played a role in the selection of the relationship. The results of the simulation found that generally that Iwao's mean-variance relationship estimated by \( m = \alpha + \beta m \), provided the best prediction of the true variance at the decision threshold. Second, uncertainty in the decision threshold was incorporated into Iwao's sequential sampling plan using Monte Carlo simulation. The effect of uncertainty in the decision threshold was to dramatically reduce the accuracy of the sequential sampling plans when compared to sequential sampling plans where the decision threshold was treated as if it was known with certainty. Methods of mitigating the reduced accuracy are discussed. The approaches developed in this thesis provide the pest manager with valuable tools and approaches to improve pest management when using Iwao's sequential sampling plan.
Acknowledgments

This thesis couldn't have been written without the support, help and guidance of my committee. I am particularly indebted to my supervisors Drs. J. Régnière and S.M. Smith whose kindness, generosity and expertise made all the difference. The choice of supervisors is probably the most important decision one can make in grad school, and I am lucky to have made the right one. I am most thankful for all of the help over the years from Dr. R.J. O’Hara Hines, it is hard to think of how my graduate studies would have ended up without her wisdom. I am completely in awe of Dr. M. Evans’ mathematical brilliance, his kindness and patience. Dr. D.L. Martell has been an inspiration and has brought out the best in me, his support and encouragement have been essential. Had it not been for the programming assistance of Vincent Bergeron and Rémi St-Amant, I might still be coding now, many thanks.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................. (ii)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................. (iii)

TABLE OF CONTENTS ............................................................................................... (iv)

LIST OF TABLES .......................................................................................................... (v)

LIST OF FIGURES ....................................................................................................... (vi)

LIST OF APPENDICES ............................................................................................... (vii)

CHAPTER 1: General Introduction ............................................................................. 1

CHAPTER 2: Selection of a mean-variance relationship for use in Iwao’s sequential sampling plan

   Introduction ............................................................................................................. 23
   Methods .................................................................................................................. 27
   Results .................................................................................................................... 32
   Discussion .............................................................................................................. 39

CHAPTER 3: The effect of uncertainty in the decision threshold on Iwao’s sequential sampling plan

   Introduction ............................................................................................................. 49
   Methods .................................................................................................................. 52
   Results .................................................................................................................... 56
   Discussion .............................................................................................................. 61

CHAPTER 4: General Discussion ................................................................................. 68

REFERENCES .............................................................................................................. 71

APPENDIX A .............................................................................................................. 89

APPENDIX B .............................................................................................................. 107
List of Tables

2.1 Hypothetical parameters used for Monte Carlo simulations to determine which mean-variance relationship provided the best prediction of the true variance at the decision threshold.................................................................28

2.2 Parameters from the literature used to determine which mean-variance relationship provided the best prediction of the true variance at the decision threshold........................................................................................................29

2.3 The ability of the four mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance at the decision threshold for Cases 1-9, Table 2.2.................................................................38

3.1 Parameters from the literature used in the Monte Carlo simulation to determine the effect of uncertainty in the decision threshold on Iwao’s sequential sampling plan.................................................................53

3.2 Hypothetical parameters used to determine the effect of various parameters on the uncertainty of the decision threshold.................................................................55
List of Figures

1.0 The effect of uncertainty on $m_1$ and $m_2$ in Wald’s sequential sampling plan............7

2.0 Several mean-variance relationships based on the Taylor power law
and Iwao’s mean-variance relationship estimated from the same data....................24

2.1 The effect of varying the decision threshold on the ability of
four mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance.........................33

2.2 The effect of the number of data points used to estimate the
mean and variance on the ability of four mean-variance relationship
to predict the true variance.............................................................................34

2.3 The effect of the number of data points used to estimate the
mean-variance relationship on the ability of four mean-variance
relationships to predict the true variance......................................................35

2.4 The effect of the negative binomial $k$ on the ability of four mean-
variance relationships to predict the true variance........................................36

3.1 The relationship between insect density and damage for the jack
pine budworm..................................................................................................50

3.2 The effects of uncertainty of the decision threshold in Iwao’s
sequential sampling plan for Case 1 and 2, Table 3.1....................................57

3.3 The effects of uncertainty of the decision threshold in Iwao’s
sequential sampling plan for Case 3 and 4, Table 3.1....................................58

3.4 The effect of increasing uncertainty in the decision threshold
on Iwao’s sequential sampling plan...............................................................59

3.5 The effect of various factors on the uncertainty of the decision threshold........60

3.6 The cause of the flattening of the Operating Characteristic curve when the
decision threshold is not known with certainty................................................62

3.7 A hypothetical Operating Characteristic curve that
indicates the uncertainty about the decision ....................................................66
List of Appendices

APPENDIX A: This program evaluates the ability of four mean-variance relationships to estimate the true variance at the decision threshold ................................................................. 87

APPENDIX B: This program calculates the expected Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves for Iwao’s sequential sampling plan incorporating uncertainty in both the decision threshold and the variance predicted at the decision threshold from a mean-variance relationship ......................................................... 105
CHAPTER 1

General Introduction

*Insects as pests in forest and agriculture systems*

Insects are major pests in agricultural and forestry systems causing wide spread damage. The impact of insect pests can be divided into two categories primary and secondary (Coulson and Witter 1984). Primary loss deals with damage caused by the insect directly to the plant, animal or product of interest. Secondary loss encompasses the impact by the insect on values other than the direct damage to the plant, animal or product of interest.

Primary losses due to insect pests are substantial and varied. In Canadian forests alone, the average annual reduction in wood volume from insects between 1982-1987 was million m$^3$ or 32.2 % of the annual harvest (Hall and Moody 1994). The spruce budworm, *Choristoneura fumiferana* (Clemens), itself was responsible for a reduction of 44 million m$^3$/year of timber in Canada from 1977 to 1981 (Sterner and Davidson 1982). The white pine weevil, *Pissodes strobi* (Peck), reduces the value of white pine (*Pinus strobus* Linnaeus) lumber by 25% and jack pine (*Pinus banksiana* Lambert) lumber by 13% (Davidson 1991, Brace 1971).

Secondary losses and impacts can be serious and are often difficult to quantify in economic terms and include the following categories: ecological, property values and product sales. A prime example of an insect that has serious ecological impact is the hemlock woolly adelgid (*Adelges tsugae* Annand). Defoliation by the adelgid can cause substantial tree mortality in hemlock stands containing eastern hemlock *Tsuga canadensis* (Linnaeus) Carr and Carolina hemlock, *Tsuga caroliniana* Engelmann and this places threatened and endangered species that depend on hemlock stands at risk (Rhea 1995). Similarly, attempts to control insect
pests with insecticides often cause mortality to non-target populations. An example here is the bacterial insecticide, *Bacillus thuringiensis* Berliner, which is composed of 30 subspecies and is used in the control of pests such as the spruce budworm (*Choristoneura fumiferana* (Clemens)), jack pine budworm (*Choristoneura pinus* Freeman) and gypsy moth (*Lymantria dispar* Linnaeus) (van Frankenhuyzen 1995, Volney 1994, Appel and Schultz 1994). There are as many as 200 species of Lepidoptera for which the subspecies *kurstaki* of *B. thuringiensis* is toxic (van Frankenhuyzen 1995). When *B. thuringiensis* is used to control gypsy moth, Wagner et al. (1996) found the pesticide could dramatically reduce nontarget species. Their study showed that 11 nontarget species were adversely impacted by a single application of *B. thuringiensis*. Moreover, simply monitoring insect pests can impact non-target insects. Pheromone traps used to monitor lepidopteran pests have been found to contain beneficial hymenopterans such as bumble bees and honey bees which are important pollinators (Meagher and Mitchell 1999). Several studies have evaluated which types of traps are the least likely to attract non-target insects (Mitchell et al. 1989, Hamilton et al. 1971).

Another type of secondary impact is the effect that insect pests have on property values. A study in Winnipeg, Canada, where Dutch Elm disease is a serious problem, found that the presence of trees on residential lots influenced the property values of those lots (Westwood 1991). The presence of trees increased the value of properties in an Oklahoma City subdivision by more than 20% (Petit et al. 1995). This change in value is different from primary loss because it is the value of the land and not the trees or lumber that is being considered.

The impacts of pest are also very important when calculating the value of land used for timber production where the value of the land is directly related to the net revenue that the land can generate. Specifically, the soil expectation value is the present value of the bare land that
incorporates the future net revenues from the timber production on the land (Klemperer 1996).

The soil expectation value is based on the idea that one buys the land and not the trees. Insect pests reduce the soil expectation value in two ways. First, pests reduce the value of the lumber reducing the revenue that the land can generate. Second, pests increase the management costs of the land thus reducing the net revenue of the land.

Finally, secondary effects can include product sales. For example, defoliation by the hemlock woolly adelgid has reduced sales of ornamental hemlock trees. This is particularly important in areas such as Tennessee and North Carolina, where hemlock stock is a $34 million dollar industry (Rhea 1995). This reduction in economic value is different from primary loss where damage must occur to the tree before it is included in the valuation. Here healthy trees are worth less because of their susceptibility to a forest pest.

The pest manager has a number of tools and intervention strategies to combat the substantial damage caused by insect pests including: conventional chemical insecticides, bacterial insecticides such as *B. thuringiensis*, insect viruses, classical biological control, management of the natural enemies of the insect pest, fungal pathogens, protozoa, nematodes, neurotoxic insecticides, insect growth regulators, natural antifeedants, pheromones, semiochemicals and silvicultural interventions such as salvage logging (Armstrong and Ives 1995). Intervention using these strategies requires knowledge of the pest status either as a measure of density or intensity. Density estimates quantify insect numbers per sample unit while intensity estimates involve presence-absence estimates or estimates on the proportion of sample units infested (Brewer et al. 1994, Southwood 1978). There are a number of ways pest managers can assess pest status including: hazard ratings, remote sensing, fixed-size and sequential sampling plans (McCullough et al. 1995, Joria and Ahearn 1991, Nealis and Lysyk
It is sequential sampling and, more specifically Iwao's (1975) sequential sampling plan, that is the focus of this thesis.

**Sequential sampling in insect pest management**

Sequential sampling plans are an efficient insect sampling strategy because they minimize the number of samples required to achieve a desired sampling objective. The sampling objective can be to classify the population into categories such as 'intervention needed' and "intervention not needed" or to achieve a particular precision of the mean pest density (Hutchinson 1994, Binns and Nyrop 1992). Sequential sampling plans achieve low sample sizes by taking the minimum number of samples required to reach a decision (Siegmund 1985). Samples are taken one at a time, evaluated and another sample is taken only if more information is needed to meet the sampling objective (Wetherill 1966). The time saved by sequential sampling, as compared to conventional fixed size sampling plans of equivalent accuracy, can be substantial, often over 50% (Luna et al. 1983, Foster et al. 1982, Bellinger et al. 1981, Cannola et al. 1957, Waters 1955, Ives 1954).

There are many types of sequential sampling plans used in insect pest management (Schmaedick and Nyrop 1995, Legg et al. 1994, Nyrop et al. 1989, Bechinski and Stoltz 1985, Pedigo and van Schaik 1984, Fowler 1983, Iwao 1975, Green 1970, Kuno 1969, Waters 1955). Wald's (1947) sequential probability ratio test was the first sequential sampling plan to be used in insect pest management. Iwao's sequential sampling plan was proposed as an alternative to Wald's to overcome some of its limitations (Iwao 1975). A number of later plans have been based on or modified from Iwao's (1975) sequential sampling plan, highlighting the applicability of the research in this thesis.
Wald's Sequential Probability Ratio Test (SPRT) is one of the most common sequential sampling plans in insect pest management. Wald's plan is a test of \( m_1 \), the null hypothesis, versus \( m_2 \), the alternative hypothesis. Pest densities below \( m_1 \) are considered low and densities above \( m_2 \) are considered high (Waters 1955). Wetherill (1966) gives one of the best explanations of the test, which is briefly summarized here. The test uses a likelihood ratio: 

\[
L = \frac{p(\text{observed results} \mid m_2)}{p(\text{observed results} \mid m_1)}.
\]

Sampling continues while \( A < L < B \). The values of \( A \) and \( B \) are set so that the desired type I and type II errors are not exceeded. When \( L < A \), the null hypothesis is accepted and the pest population is classified as low. When \( L > B \), the alternative hypothesis is accepted and the population is classified as high.

Wald's SPRT requires knowledge of the distribution of the insects on the sample unit. The theory on which distribution to use under which situations has been well developed (Zar 1996, Sokal and Rohlf 1995, Southwood 1978). The equations of commonly used distributions in insect pest management (normal, poisson, binomial, negative binomial) are available from a variety of sources (Binns 1994, Fowler and Lynch 1987, Waters 1955). The most widely used distribution in Wald's SPRT is the negative binomial.

The equations for Wald's SPRT where the distribution of the insect on the sample unit follows a negative binomial distribution were derived by Oakland (1950). The equations for the boundaries are:

\[
lb = sn - h_1
\]

and

\[
ub = sn + h_2
\]

where the slope and intercepts are defined as
\[
q2 = \frac{\log q_2}{q_1}, \quad h_1 = \frac{\log (1-a)}{\log \frac{p_1q_1}{p_1q_2}}, \quad h_2 = \frac{1-\beta}{\log \frac{p_2q_1}{p_1q_2}}
\]

using

\[
p_1 = \frac{m_1}{k}, \quad q_1 = 1 + p_1, \quad p_2 = \frac{m_2}{k} \quad \text{and} \quad q_2 = 1 + p_2.
\]

The components of the equations are defined as: \(lb\) is the lower bound of the sequential sampling plan, \(ub\) is the upper bound of the sequential sampling plan, \(k\) is the dispersion parameter from the negative binomial distribution, \(n\) is the number of samples taken, \(m_1\) is the pest density below which intervention is not needed (null hypothesis), \(m_2\) is the pest density above which intervention is needed (alternative hypothesis), \(\alpha\) is the type I error, \(\beta\) is the type II error.

The value of \(m_1\) and \(m_2\) are related to the uncertainty of the decision threshold, the greater the uncertainty the further one would expect to find these boundaries. Figure 1.0 is a schematic diagram of the range of uncertainty in the relationship between insect density and damage and how the uncertainty effects the values of \(m_1\) and \(m_2\) when the thresholds are determined by inverse interpolation from the damage threshold. The problem in the literature is that this uncertainty in the decision threshold is not explicitly calculated when deriving \(m_1\) and \(m_2\). Rather the pest manager uses a more subjective approach (Carter et al. 1994, Harcourt 1967).

The main limitation of Wald’s sequential sampling plan is the assumption that insects must follow a prescribed distribution (normal, poisson, negative binomial or binomial). This assumption causes problems when the distribution is assumed to be negative binomial. In many
Figure 1.0. The solid lines represent the uncertainty in the relationship between insect density and damage where DT is the damage threshold. The range of uncertainty is used as a basis for $m_1$ and $m_2$ in Wald's sequential sampling plan. Based on Mumford and Knight 1997.
cases the negative binomial parameter $k$ varies with the mean (Mackey and Hoy 1978, Morris 1954, Anscombe 1948). Several authors have also had difficulty finding a common $k$ that is necessary to create a sequential sampling plan based on the negative binomial distribution (Régnière and Sanders 1983, Silvester and Cox 1961). Given the importance of the common $k$, several studies have done a sensitivity analysis to determine the effect of a variable $k$ (Binns 1994, Hubbard and Allen 1991, Warren and Chen 1986). Warren and Chen (1986) found that the consequences of misspecifying $k$ were potentially quite minor, in fact, small underestimates resulted in lower classification errors, with only a slight increase in sample size. Hubbard and Allen (1991) found similar results. However, Binns (1994) suggests that the average sample size can become quite large if $k$ is significantly underestimated and as a consequence the assumption of a common $k$ may be problematic. As a solution, Binns (1994) suggested one of two approaches. First, if the data can be described by Taylor’s Power Law (Taylor 1961), then a sequential sampling plan can be developed where $k$ is a function of the mean and the four parameters of the SPRT $(m_1, m_2, \alpha, \beta)$ can be adjusted until a suitable sampling plan is found. Binns does warn however, that this may not be possible. The second alternative suggested by Binns (1994) is to use a binomial sampling plan with an increased tally threshold that in many cases is robust to variations in $k$ (Binns and Bostonian 1990).

Iwao’s (1975) sequential sampling plan is based on a confidence interval around a single decision threshold. Sampling is stopped when the cumulative number of insects crosses the boundary defined by the confidence interval. When the cumulative insect count crosses the upper bound of the confidence interval the population is classified as high, when it crosses the lower bound, the population is classified as low. The confidence interval is based on a mean-variance relationship.
Iwao's (1975) sequential sampling boundaries are:

\[ l_b = t * n - z \sqrt{n[s^2(t)]} \]

and

\[ u_b = t * n + z \sqrt{n[s^2(t)]} \]

where \( l_b \) is the lower boundary of the sequential sampling plan, \( u_b \) is the upper boundary, \( t \) is the decision threshold, \( z \) is the value of the standard normal deviate, \( n \) is the number of samples taken, and \( s^2(t) \) is the variance at the decision threshold based on a mean-variance relationship.

The restrictive limitation of Wald's SPRT requiring that the insects on the sample unit conform to a specific mathematical distribution is what Iwao's sequential sampling plan tries to address. It overcomes the need for a particular distribution of insect counts on the sample unit by relying on the relationship between the mean and variance of the insect counts.

The two most common mean-variance relationships used in Iwao's sequential sampling plans are Taylor's power law (Taylor 1961) and Iwao's mean-variance relationship (Iwao and Kuno 1968) regression of mean crowding on mean density (Chandler and Allsopp 1995, Cho et al. 1995, Binns 1994).

Taylor's (1961) power law is given by:

\[ s^2 = am^b \]

where \( s^2 \) is the variance, \( m \) is the mean and \( a \) and \( b \) are parameters obtained most commonly by fitting the relationship \( \log s^2 = \log a + b \log m \). For the sake of completeness, it is important to note that the equation above was used by Bliss (1941) to characterize the relationship between the mean and variance of Japanese beetle larvae.
Iwao's mean-variance relationship is given by (Iwao and Kuno 1968):

\[ s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2 \]

where \( s^2 \) is the variance, \( m \) is the mean and \( \alpha \) and \( \beta \) are parameters of the relationship. The parameters \( \alpha \) and \( \beta \) are obtained from the regression of mean crowding on mean density

\[ m = \alpha + \beta m \] (Iwao 1968). This is commonly referred to as the \( m - m \) regression. Mean crowding was defined by Llyod (1967) as the mean number of other individuals per sample unit per individual using the equation:

\[ m = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{Q} x_j^2}{\sum_{j=1}^{Q} x_j} - 1 \]

where \( x_j \) is the number of insects in the \( j \)th sample unit and \( Q \) is the number of sample units.

Though, mean crowding is usually calculated using \( m = m + \frac{s^2}{m} - 1 \), (Lloyd 1967). Again, for the sake of completeness, it is important to note that Iwao's mean variance relationship is similar to Bartlett's (1936) mean-variance relationship. Also, Iwao's original sampling plan used Iwao's mean-variance relationship and the use of Taylor's power law in Iwao's sequential sampling plan began as early as Ekbo (1985).

Given that Iwao's Sequential Sampling Plan was designed as an alternative to Wald's SPRT, the natural question is, how do these two sampling plans compare? Binns (1994) compared Wald's SPRT based on the normal distribution to Iwao's sequential sampling plan using Monte Carlo simulation, where the pest population was simulated using a negative
binomial distribution. The power of the two tests was controlled and the effect on sample size was examined. The study found that, when no maximum sample size was imposed on either plan, Iwao’s sequential sampling plan had much higher sample sizes that Wald’s plan even though the power of the two tests was equivalent. However, when a maximum sample size of 100 samples was imposed, the sample sizes of the two tests were roughly equivalent. Binns’ (1994) study is a bit of a false comparison. Iwao’s plan was not intended as a substitute for Wald’s SPRT using the normal distribution, it was intended as a substitute for Wald’s SPRT for the negative binomial where a common $k$ could not be assumed. The comparison of the later scenario with Iwao’s sequential sampling plan would have answered the question whether Iwao’s plan fulfilled its promise of overcoming the shortcomings of Wald’s SPRT. Moreover, it is problematic that Binns (1994) simulated data using the negative binomial distribution when clearly Wald’s SPRT was created using equations that assumed a normal distribution.

Kuno’s (1969) sequential sampling plan estimates the mean of a pest population to a desired level of precision rather than classifying the population into broad categories. Sampling plans where samples are taken sequentially until the mean is known to the desired degree of precision are often called sequential estimation plans or fixed-precision sequential sampling plans (Naranjo and Flint 1995). The basis for the sequential sampling plan is the mean-variance relationship ($m' - m$) used in Iwao’ sequential sampling plan. The boundaries are defined by:

$$T_n = \frac{\alpha + 1}{D_o - \frac{\beta - 1}{n}}$$

where $T_n$ is the cumulative number of insect counts, $D_o$ is the precision of the plan, $\alpha$ is the intercept from the $m' - m$ regression and $\beta$ = the slope from the $m' - m$ regression.
Green's (1970) sequential sampling plan is the same as Kuno's plan except that the mean-variance relationship used in the plan is based on Taylor's Power Law, $s^2=am^b$ (Taylor 1961).

The boundaries for Green's plan are defined as follows:

$$\log(T_n) = \frac{\log[(D^2/a)]}{b-2} + \left[ \frac{b-1}{b-2} \cdot \log(n) \right]$$

where $T_n$ is the cumulative number of insects, $D$ is the precision of the plan, $a$ and $b$ are the intercept and slope, respectively, from the Taylor Power Law and $n$ is the number of samples.

Fowler's (1983) sequential sampling plan improves on Wald's sequential sampling plan. The equations used to define the boundaries of the Wald's SPRT are approximate because of the overshooting of the decision boundary that results when a decision is made (Wald 1947). Wald's equations compensate for their approximate nature by being quite conservative, the actual type I and type II errors are lower than specified by the user, and as a consequence there is an increase in the average number of samples required before a decision can be reached (Wald 1947). Fowler (1983) proposed a method using Monte Carlo simulation to correct this. The approach involves altering the type I and II errors specified in the sequential sampling plan until the actual errors equal desired error rates.

Nyrop's (Nyrop et al. 1989) binomial sequential sampling plan is based on a confidence interval around a decision threshold, again using a mean-variance relationship. The decision threshold is expressed in terms of whether the sample unit is infested or not. The sample unit could be considered infested if it contains at least $n$ insects. The key advantage of binomial sampling plans is that not all of the pests on the sample unit have to be counted. For any give
sample unit, counting only continues until it is determined whether the sample unit is infested or not (Binns 1994). Nyrop’s plan is basically the conversion of Iwao’s sequential sampling plan based on density to a plan based on the binomial distribution (Brewer et al. 1994).

Legg’s (Legg et al. 1994) sequential sampling plan is also a modification of Iwao’s sequential sampling plan to a case of the binomial distribution. The additional modification by Legg et al. (1994) is that the decision boundaries are generated by computer simulation.

The time-sequential sampling plan (Pedigo and van Schaik 1984) is a modification of Wald’s SPRT which incorporates the additional variable of time. Insect pest populations vary over time and consequently the issues of both when to sample and when to make a treatment decision are very important (Pedigo and Zeiss 1996). Time-sequential sampling addresses these issues by classifying the population with respect to its growth and determining when a damaging infestation is likely to occur (Pedigo and van Schaik 1984).

Cascaded sequential sampling (Schmaedick and Nyrop 1995) addresses the issue of variable development in insect populations over time and the impact that this has on the decision to treat a particular population. Time-sequential sampling and cascaded sequential sampling address the same issue but in different ways. Cascaded sequential sampling is a modification of Wald’s SPRT that uses different decision thresholds based on the development of the insect predicted by a degree-day model. Cascaded sequential sampling also includes Fowler’s modifications to Wald’s SPRT. Cascaded sequential sampling expresses the decision thresholds at each sampling time directly in terms of the density of the insects (e.g. 5 insects per branch) (Schmaedick and Nyrop 1995), while time-sequential sampling (Pedigo and van Schaik 1984) uses a decision threshold that is weighted by a factor related to the time of sampling.
Sequential sampling of prey/predator ratios (Nyrop 1988) addresses the fact that insect pests are often preyed upon by other predatory insects. If the abundance of predators is high the insect pest may be controlled naturally and intervention with an insecticide may be unnecessary. If the insect pest density is very high relative to the predators, then intervention may be warranted. Nyrop (1988) developed a sequential procedure that classifies a population with respect to a critical prey/predator ratio, where Iwao’s (1975) sequential sampling plan was modified.

*Evaluation of Sequential Sampling Plans*

Sequential sampling plans are evaluated based on their accuracy and the number of samples required to reach a decision. Operating Characteristic (OC) and Average Sample Number (ASN) curves are used to evaluate sequential sampling plans (Nyrop and Binns 1991). The OC curve describes the probability of making a no intervention decision (i.e. crossing the lower decision boundary) as a function of the true mean pest density. The steeper the slope of the OC curve the higher the classification accuracy of the plan (i.e. the smaller the type I and type II error rates) (Binns 1994). The ASN curve indicates the expected number of samples required to reach a decision as a function of the mean pest density.

The general equation for the OC curve was developed by Wald (1947) as:

\[
L(m) = \frac{\left(\frac{1-\beta}{\alpha}\right)^h - 1}{\left(\frac{1-\beta}{\alpha}\right)^h - \left(\frac{\beta}{1-\alpha}\right)^h}.
\]
Oakland (1950) developed the specific adaptation for the negative binomial distribution.

\[
m = \frac{1 - \left( \frac{q_1}{q_2} \right)^h}{\left( \frac{p_2 q_1}{p_1 q_2} \right)^h - 1}
\]

and \( d = mk \).

The components of the above equations are: \( p_1, p_2, q_1 \) and \( q_2 \) are as defined previously, \( d \) is pest density and \( k \) is the shape parameter of the negative binomial.

The type I and type II errors are \( \alpha \) and \( \beta \) respectively and \( m \) is the mean pest density; \( h \) is a dummy variable \([-\infty, \infty]\). To calculate a value of the OC curve, first choose a value for the dummy variable \( h \), then calculate the value of \( m \) and then subsequently calculate \( L(m) \) (Oakland 1950). There is a direct relationship between the OC curve and the type I and type II error rates. The type I error rate is \( 1 - L(m) \) while the Type II error rate is \( L(m) \).

Oakland’s (1950) formula for the ASN curve for the negative binomial SPRT is:

\[
E(n) = \frac{h_2 + (h_1 - h_2) L(m)}{kp - s}
\]

where \( h_1 \) is the level below which intervention is not required, \( h_2 \) - the level above which intervention is required, \( L(m) \) is the probability of making a no treat decision, \( k = \) the common \( k \) of the negative binomial distribution and \( s \) is the slope where defined previously.

For lwao’s sequential sampling, the OC and ASN curve equations have not been developed. Consequently, they must be approximated by Monte Carlo simulation. Monte Carlo simulation tests a given sampling plan a large number of times (5000 for example) over a range of means, and then calculates average OC and ASN values for each pest density. During each of the 5000 Monte Carlo tests of the sampling plan, the parameters of the plan are of course the same.
The OC and ASN curves are not only used to evaluate a particular sequential sampling plan, but also to compare different sequential sampling plans. The most common method of comparison is to plot the curves from the different sampling plans on the same graph (Meilke et al. 1998, Binns 1994, Brewer et al. 1994, Nyrop and Binns 1991).

Uncertainty in Insect Pest Management

Insect pest management (IPM) can be best thought of in terms of its goals: reduction of pest density (not necessarily including elimination of the pest), improving grower profits and protection of the environment (Pedigo and Higley 1996). There are many strategies available and factors to consider when attempting to achieve the above goals. Similarly, there are at least as many sources of uncertainty in IPM as there are strategies and factors to consider, because the manner in which the different components of IPM interact is often difficult to predict. In the next section, the sources of uncertainty in IPM and approaches for dealing with the uncertainty will be discussed.

At its core, IPM involves making a decision on whether or not to intervene to modify a pest density, often based on imprecise information. Decisions of this type have an uncertainty associated with them that can be quantified in terms of the type I and type II errors. The type I error is the treatment of a pest population when no treatment is required and the type II error is failure to treat when intervention is justified (Waters 1955). Sequential sampling plans such as Wald's allow specification of the probability of a type I and type II error that the user does not wish to exceed. Conventionally, for Wald's sequential probability ratio test, the Type I and II errors are set to equivalent values such as 0.05 or 0.1 (Ng et al. 1983, Nilakhe et al. 1982, Shepard 1973, Shepherd and Brown 1971, Harcourt 1966). However, the consequences of one
type of error may be more serious than another and in those circumstances users specify a
different value for the Type I or Type II error (Stark 1952).

A key part of IPM is the evaluation of the pest status (e.g. density) through sampling. The uncertainty about the true value of the pest density of the population is a factor that must be addressed by the pest manager. One of the most common methods of addressing this type of uncertainty is to create a sampling plan where the mean is known to a predetermined level of precision (Newton 1994, Shepherd et al. 1984, Poston et al. 1983). Nealis and Lysyk (1988) created a fixed-size sampling plan for the overwintering stage of the jack pine budworm, *Choristoneura pinus* Freeman, where the manager can choose from several levels of precision and expressions of density. Another method of dealing with population uncertainty, is to assign different population states, a probability of occurrence, and calculate an expected value which will form the basis for a decision (Auld and Tisdell 1987).

Uncertainty in the development of insects over time is a major problem for pest managers. Factors such as weather and microclimate can affect this rate of development (Dent 1997, Lysyk and Nealis 1988). To schedule sampling and intervention strategies, it is essential to know if the insect stage of interest is present. For example, spraying a pest population based on a calendar date can be ineffective because the susceptible stage of the insect may not have appeared (Green 1972). In the case of forest operations where spraying and sampling may occur in remote locations, sending a crew out when the insects are not at the correct stage can be quite expensive. One of the most common ways to estimate the development of insects is to use a degree-day model in which the development of the insect present in the field is a function of temperature (Dent 1997). These models have been developed for pests such as the jack pine

The effect of multiple pests on a single host is an important source of uncertainty in insect pest management (Hutchins et al. 1988). This source of uncertainty is addressed by creating thresholds that focus on one type of damage caused by the different insects (Hutchins et al. 1988, Cartwright et al. 1987, Kirby and Slosser 1984). For example, Hutchins et al. (1988) created an economic injury level for soybean leaf-mass consumption by various species of insects.

Uncertainty about the effectiveness of the pesticide can also have an impact on pest management (Plant 1986). One of the methods of overcoming this type of uncertainty is the creation of more realistic laboratory bioassays to predict field efficacy (Robertson and Worner 1990). A particularly attractive approach is population toxicology that looks at the effect of the pesticide on a population of insects rather than the conventional approach of a single insect as a the experimental unit (Ahmadi 1983).

A serious source of uncertainty in insect pest management is the future dynamics of the pest populations. For example, both jack pine budworm, *Choristoneura pinus* Freeman and forest tent caterpillar, *Malacosoma disstria* Hbn. egg masses are a poor predictor of future defoliation (Meating 1986, Nyrop et al. 1979). This uncertainty is overcome by incorporating factors that influence the survival of the insects into the predictive models. In the case of the jack pine budworm, the pollen cones of the jack pine tree have a dramatic effect on the survival of budworm emerging in the spring (Nealis et al. 1997). In the case of the forest tent caterpillar age of the outbreak and parasite density influence the survival of the insect (Shepherd and Brown 1971, Cannola et al. 1957).
Statistical distribution of insects on sampling units

Insects are most often aggregated or clumped in their distribution (Pilson and Rausher 1995, Southwood 1978). The distribution of insects is firmly rooted in their biology as the following examples illustrate.

Third-instar larvae of the jack pine budworm are not randomly distributed throughout the tree, but rather are found in the pollen cones of jack pine. Pollen cones are the preferred food source when the overwintering budworm emerge in the spring (Bazter and Jennings 1980, Foltz et al. 1972). Similarly, aphids, such as the green peach aphid (*Myzus persicae* (Sulzer)) or rose-grass aphid (*Metopolophium dirodum* (Walker)), which feed on the fluids of the host plant are located on the leaf blades (Hollingsworth and Gatsonis 1990, Johnson and Bishop 1987) because this is where the simplest access to the phloem and largest area occurs (Mabbett 1983). Finally, female red sunflower seed weevils (*Smicronyx fulvus* LeConte) oviposit between the pericarp and the kernel of the sunflower (Peng and Brewer 1994) and thus, egg distribution is driven by the requirements of the subsequent larval stages (Peng and Brewer 1994).

The aggregated distributions of insects on sample units can be described by the negative binomial distribution. The negative binomial is one of the most widely used distributions to characterize aggregated populations (Sokal and Rohlf 1995). The probability of a sample unit containing \( x \) insects is given by (Krebs 1989):

\[
P_x = \left[ \frac{\Gamma(k+x)}{x!\Gamma(k)} \right] \left( \frac{\mu}{\mu + k} \right)^x \left( \frac{k}{k + \mu} \right)^* \]


where \( x \) is the number of insects, \( \mu \) is the mean, \( k \) is an index of aggregation, and \( \Gamma \) is the gamma function.

Pielou (1977) gives an excellent description of how the negative binomial distribution can arise in entomology where the insects are found in groups or clusters. Her description that uses generalized distributions is briefly summarized here. Essentially, when the number of insects per cluster follows a lognormal distribution and the number of clusters per sample unit follows a Poisson distribution the generalized distribution is the negative binomial. The probability generating function (pgf) for the generalized distribution for the number individuals per sample unit is

\[
H(z) = G(g(z))
\]

where \( g(z) \) is the pgf for the number insects per cluster and \( G(z) \) is the pgf for the number of clusters per sample unit. The pgf for the Poission distribution is

\[
G(z) = e^{\lambda(z-1)}
\]

and the pgf for the lognormal distribution is

\[
g(z) = \frac{\ln(1-\alpha z)}{\ln(1-\alpha)}.
\]

So we now have

\[
H(z) = G(g(z)) = \exp\left\{ \lambda \left[ \frac{\ln(1-\alpha z)}{\ln(1-\alpha)} - 1 \right] \right\}
\]

and with the appropriate identities this can be simplified to

\[
H(z) = (Q-Pz)^k
\]

the probability generating function for the negative binomial distribution.
The distribution of various insect species are well described by the negative binomial distribution including: beetles which infest maize, *Prostephanus truncatus* (Horn) and *Sitophilus zemais* Motschulsky; the red sunflower seed weevil, *Smicroynx fulvus* Leconte; gypsy moth, *Lymantria dispar* (L.); the Russian wheat aphid, *Diuraphis noxia* (Mordvilko); the froghopper *Eoscarta carnifex* (F.), planthoppers *Nilapavata lugens* Stal and *Sogatella furicifera* Horvath; the bollworm, *Heliothis zea* (Bodie); woodborers, *Monochamus oregonesis* LeConte, *M. maculosus* Haldeman, *M. notatus* Drury; the hairy chinch bug, *Blissus leucopterus hirtus* Montandon; and lygus bugs, *Lygus hesperus* Knight (Meilke et al. 1998, Chandler and Allsopp 1995, Peng and Brewer 1994, Carter et al. 1994, Butts and Schaalje 1994, Shepard et al. 1986, Liu and McEwen 1979, Allen et al. 1972, Sevacherain and Stern 1972, Safranyik and Raske 1970). The negative binomial distribution was used to generate the insect populations in the Monte Carlo simulations within this thesis because of the wide applicability of the negative binomial distribution to characterize insect populations.

**Objectives**

The objectives of this thesis are to improve decision making and management of uncertainty when using Iwao’s sequential sampling plan in insect pest management. Chapter 2 focuses on selecting the appropriate mean-variance relationship for use in Iwao’s sequential sampling plan. Different mean-variance relationships based on Taylor’s power law and Iwao’s mean-variance relationship are evaluated on their ability to predict the true variance at the decision threshold. Chapter 3 focuses on incorporating uncertainty into the decision threshold. There are two main sources of uncertainty for the decision threshold. The first source is uncertainty due to the relationship between insect density and damage. The second source is
uncertainty in the damage threshold. Both of these sources are incorporated when the OC and
ASN curves are compiled to include uncertainty about the decision threshold. The final chapter
links chapters two and three and provides specific recommendations for the pest manager.
CHAPTER 2

Selection of a mean-variance relationship for use in Iwao's sequential sampling plan

Introduction

The two most common mean-variance relationships used in Iwao's sequential sampling plan are Taylor's power law (Taylor 1961) estimated by $\log s^2 = \log \alpha + \beta \log m$ and Iwao's (Iwao and Kuno 1968) mean-variance relationship where the parameters are estimated by $m = \alpha + \beta m$ (Binns 1994). Within insect pest management it is standard practice to rely on the value of the $r^2$ of the mean-variance relationship when deciding which relationship to use (Meikle et al. 1998, Coffelt and Schultz 1994, Palumbo et al. 1991, Walker et al. 1984). This approach is problematic. Kvalseth (1985) points out that comparing different models using the $r^2$ is only valid if: 1) the Y (i.e. dependent) variables are the same, 2) the data are on the same scale (i.e. no transformations) and 3) the number of parameters of the models are the same. The consequences of violating these conditions are that two models which are functionally identical can have substantially different $r^2$ values, vice versa or the models can have both different functional relationships and different $r^2$ values (Scott and Wild 1991).

When comparing $\log s^2 = \log \alpha + \beta \log m$ and $m = \alpha + \beta m$ using the $r^2$ the first two conditions of Kvalseth (1985) are violated. First, $\log s^2$ and $m$ are different dependent variables. Second, $\log s^2$ is on the log scale while $m$ is on the original scale. Figure 2.0 shows the mean-variance relationships for four insects, based on the Taylor power law and Iwao’s mean-variance relationship. For each insect, the same data were used to calculate both relationships. Mean-variance relationships with very different $r^2$ values had functional relationships that were
Figure 2.0. Mean-variance relationships using the Taylor power law and Iwao's mean variance relationship:
(a) cereal aphids (Boeve and Weiss 1998); (b) Liromyza species (Zehnder and Trumble 1985); (c) Empoasca fabae (adult stage), (Walgenbach et al. 1985); (d) Campylomma verbasci (Thistlewood 1989). The Taylor power law was estimated using $\log(s^2) = \log(a) + b \log(m)$ and Iwao's mean-variance relationship was estimated using $m^* - m$. 
virtually identical (Figs. 2.0 a, b and c). In contrast, even though the $r^2$ value was similar for a mean-variance relationship, the functional relationship was very different (Fig. 2.0 d). Despite constant warnings in the literature about the problems and precautions necessary when using the $r^2$ to assess the goodness of fit for different relationships, the practice seems to continue (Scott and Wild 1991, Kvalseth 1985).

The key parameter used to create the decision boundaries in Iwao's sequential sampling plan is the variance that is predicted at the decision threshold. Consequently, the mean-variance relationship that best predicts the variance at the threshold should be used in the sampling plan. This chapter of the thesis will provide an approach for evaluating which mean-variance relationship best predicts the variance at the decision threshold, and consequently, which mean-variance relationship should be used in the sampling plan.

There are two methods of calculating the parameters for Taylor's power law and two methods for calculating the parameters for Iwao's mean-variance relationship. The parameters for Taylor's power law are most commonly obtained by fitting the following linear regression:

$$\log s^2 = \log a + b \log m$$  \hspace{1cm} (Model 1)

where $s^2$ is the variance, $m$ is the mean, and $a$ and $b$ are the parameters of the relationship. These parameters can also be obtained by fitting the following relationship using nonlinear regression:

$$s^2 = am^b$$  \hspace{1cm} (Model 2)

where $s^2$, $m$, $a$ and $b$ are as previously defined.

Parameters $\alpha$ and $\beta$ for Iwao's mean-variance relationship can be derived by fitting:

$$m = \alpha + \beta m$$  \hspace{1cm} (Model 3)
or by estimating directly by fitting:

\[ s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2. \]  \hspace{1cm} (Model 4)

A six step approach was used: 1) the true variance was calculated, 2) mean-variance data were simulated, 3) parameters for the mean-variance relationships were estimated, 4) the variances predicted at the decision threshold were calculated using the estimated parameters, 5) steps 2-4 were repeated 1000 times, and, 6) finally, the predicted variances were compared to the known variance for each of the mean-variance relationships.
Methods

Monte Carlo simulation was used to evaluate the ability of four mean-variance relationships to predict the variance at the decision threshold. The parameters for the simulations come from two sources: examples from the literature and hypothetical values. It is not always possible to find examples in the literature where one parameter varies systematically while the others are held constant. Furthermore, it is difficult to find examples where the values of the parameters adequately cover the whole range of possibilities. Consequently, simulations with hypothetical parameters become an essential part of the experimental process. In these experiments, parameters were varied one at a time, holding others constant. The parameters were varied included: 1) the number of data points used to estimate the mean and variance; 2) the number of data points used to estimate the mean-variance relationship; 3) the range of means; 4) the value of the negative binomial $k$ used to generate the insect samples; and 5) the position of the decision threshold along the range of means in the mean-variance relationship. The parameters used in the simulations are found in Table 2.1 for the hypothetical parameters and in Table 2.2 for parameters from the literature.

Calculation of the known variance for the insect populations assumed a negative binomial distribution with a specified mean and $k$. The known variance was calculated as $s^2 = m + m^2/k$, the variance of the negative binomial distribution, where $m$ is the mean, $s^2$ is the variance, and $k$ is the shape parameter of the negative binomial distribution.

Data were generated over the typical range of densities for each particular insect (e.g. 0 - 20 insects/branch). The data were simulated from a negative binomial distribution with either a common $k$ or where $k$ was dependent on the mean. For a given range of densities, a number of
Table 2.1. Parameters used for simulations to determine which mean-variance relationship provides the best prediction of the true variance at the decision threshold. Each simulation experiment consisted of 1000 Monte Carlo iterations. The decision thresholds were varied along the range of means at evenly spaced intervals. For each range of means, five decision thresholds equally spaced along the range of densities were tested.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range of means</th>
<th>( n ) (used to estimate means and variances)</th>
<th>( N ) (used to estimate mean-variance relationship)</th>
<th>Negative binomial ( k )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.5 - 8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-50</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>80</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2.2. Parameters from the literature used for simulations to determine which mean-variance relationship provided the best prediction of the true variance at the decision threshold: \( T \) = decision threshold, \( n \) = number of data points used to estimate the mean and variance and \( N \) = number of data points used to estimate the mean variance-relationship. All parameters come from the references provided. In some cases it was necessary to digitize data and perform additional analysis. In cases where parameters were lacking and additional calculations could not yield the required parameters, hypothetical parameters were assumed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Range of means</th>
<th>( T )</th>
<th>( n )</th>
<th>( N )</th>
<th>Negative binomial ( k )</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0-20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>Badenhausser and Lein 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0-20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>Butts and Schaalje 1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0-20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>( k=1.92+0.234m )</td>
<td>Harcourt 1967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0-16</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>Shaw et al. 1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0-16</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>Allen et al. 1972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0-16</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>( k=-0.012\text{mean}^2+0.234\text{mean}+0.1 )</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0-40</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>Harcourt 1967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0-5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5.56</td>
<td>Shaw et al. 1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0-35</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>Allen et al. 1972</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
mean pest density values were selected at random. For each mean density, a sample was
generated and resulting sample mean and variance were calculated.

The parameters of the Taylor power law described by \( \log s^2 = \log \alpha + b \log m \) were estimated
using ordinary least-squares linear regression. The parameters of the Taylor power law described
by \( s^2 = a m^b \) were estimated by nonlinear regression using Powell’s (1965) algorithm. The
parameters of Iwao’s mean-variance relationship described by \( s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2 \) were
estimated by least squares multiple regression with no intercept. Finally, the parameters of
Iwao’s mean-variance relationship derived from the regression of mean crowding on mean
density \( m = \alpha + \beta m \) were estimated using ordinary least-squares linear regression.

The variance predicted at the decision threshold using the Taylor power law was
calculated using \( s^2 = a \rho^b \). For Iwao’s mean-variance relationship, the predicted variance was
calculated using \( s^2 = (\alpha + 1)t + (\beta - 1)t^2 \).

The ability of a mean-variance relationship to predict the known variance was assessed
by:

\[
\text{Relative Error} = \frac{1}{1000} \sum_{i=1}^{1000} \left( \left| \text{predicted variance} - \text{known variance} \right| / \text{known variance} \right).
\]

The mean-variance relationship with the smallest relative error is the preferred model.

The use of 1000 Monte Carlo iterations to estimate the relative error was appropriate for
three reasons. First, 1000 iterations is within the common range of 100 - 10 000 iterations used
in simulations to estimate parameters of sequential sampling plans (Clark and Perry 1994, Binns
Fowler 1983). Second, the objective of this chapter was to evaluate the relative performance of
the mean-variance relationships rather than the specific value of the relative error, this objective
was met using 1000 Monte Carlo iterations. Finally, the experiments in this chapter were repeated five to ten times as an informal test using simulations of 1000 Monte Carlo iterations and the conclusions drawn from the results were consistent.

The results of the Monte Carlo simulations based on hypothetical parameters (Table 2.1) were compared to the results of parameters from the literature (Table 2.2) in terms of whether both sets of parameters resulted in selection of the same mean-variance relationship. The purpose of this step was to assess whether the simulations done on the hypothetical parameters (Table 2.1) could be used to select the mean-variance relationship without doing additional simulations. The comparisons were made where the hypothetical parameters were as close as possible to the parameters from the literature. Where possible, the results of the Monte Carlo simulations for parameters from the literature (Table 2.2) were compared to the mean-variance relationships that were (or would have been) selected using the conventional method (i.e. $r^2$) in the applicable papers.

The Monte Carlo simulations were run using a program written in C for this purpose. The program is found in Appendix A. The variable definitions and algorithms used in the random number generators are based on Binns (1994). The subroutines to calculate the parameters of Iwao’s mean-variance relationship based on the least-squares multiple regression with no intercept and Taylor’s power law based on nonlinear regression were written by J. Régnière.
Results

The position of the decision threshold relative to the range of means had an impact on the ability of the different mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance (Fig. 2.1). Although within the low range of means (0-5), models 1 and 3 provided nearly equivalent results, their ability to predict variance was unaffected by the threshold value (Fig. 2.1 a). With a wider range of means, however, model 3 outperformed all others (Fig. 2.1 b).

The sample size (n) used to estimate the means and variances affected the ability of the models to predict the true variance (Fig. 2.2), although, the influence of n was small, with little variation in the relative error. Model 3 generally outperformed the others, except when the thresholds were near the upper range of values and the range was narrow (Fig. 2.2 b). Small numbers of data points (N) used to estimate the mean-variance relationship (<20) tended to increase the relative error considerably (Fig. 2.3). Beyond that point, however, the relative error associated with the various mean-variance models remained nearly constant. Once again, Model 3 tended to outperform other models except when the threshold was near the upper end of the narrow range of means (Fig. 2.3 b). The amount of aggregation (k) had an impact on relative error only with the lowest values (k<1). Beyond that, model 3 outperformed other models consistently, except when the threshold was near the upper end of the narrower range of means (Fig. 2.4 b). It is of interest to note, that when the range of means was small (<0-5), variation in the values of the relative error was larger than when range of means was large (0-50) (Figs. 2.1-2.4). This can be seen by the fact that the curves are smoother for simulations were the range of means is 0-50.

In summary, Iwao's mean-variance relationship estimated by \( m = \alpha + \beta m \), model 3, generally provided the best prediction of the true variance (Figs. 2.1-2.4). This was particularly
Figure 2.1. Effect of varying the decision threshold on the ability of four mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance. The following factors were held constant: number of data points to estimate the mean and variance (100), number of data points to estimate the model (100), negative binomial $k$ (2). Model 1 is $\log s^2 = \log a + \log bm$, Model 2 is $s^2 = am^b$, Model 3 is $m = \alpha + \beta m$ and Model 4 is $s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2$. a) range of means, 0-5 and b) range of means, 0-50.
Figure 2.2 The effect of the number of data points to estimate the mean and variance on the ability of the mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance. The following factors were held constant: number of data points to estimate the mean-variance relationship (100), negative binomial $k$ (2), and the range of the means and thresholds indicated above. Model 1 is $\log s^2 = \log \alpha + \log \mu m$, Model 2 is $s^2 = \alpha m^b$, Model 3 is $m = \alpha + \beta m$ and Model 4 is $s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2$. 
Figure 2.3. Effect of varying the number of data points used to estimate the mean-variance relationship on the ability of four mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance. The following factors were held constant, number of data points to estimate the mean and variance (100), negative binomial \( k \) (2), and the range of the means and thresholds indicated above. Model 1 is \( s^2 = \log a + \log m \), Model 2 is \( s^2 = am^b \), Model 3 is \( m = \alpha + \beta m \) and Model 4 is \( s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2 \).
Figure 2.4 The effect of the negative binomial \( k \) on the ability of the mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance. The following factors were held constant: number of data points to estimate the mean-variance relationship (100), the number of data points in the mean-variance relationship (100), and the range of the means and thresholds indicated above. Model 1 is \( s^2 = \log a + b \log m \), Model 2 is \( s^2 = a m^b \), Model 3 is \( m = \alpha + \beta m \) and Model 4 is \( s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2 \).
evident for: decision thresholds at the lower end of the range of means, when there were few data points used to estimate the mean and variance, and when there were few data points used to estimate the mean-variance relationship.

The results of the Monte Carlo simulations based on parameters from the literature (Table 2.2) are summarized in Table 2.3. Of the nine cases from the literature, five agree with the results from the Monte Carlo simulation results based on hypothetical parameters found in Table 2.1.

The results of the Monte Carlo simulations for parameters from the literature (Table 2.2) were compared to the mean-variance relationships that were (or would have been) selected using the conventional method (i.e. \( R^2 \)) in the applicable papers. In two of four cases where such a comparison was possible, the results of the Monte Carlo simulation agreed with the selection of the mean-variance relationship by the conventional method (Table 2.3).
Table 2.3. Ability of the four mean-variance relationships to predict the true variance at the decision threshold for nine cases from the literature (Table 2.2). For each case and model the relative error is reported, as is agreement with the simulations based on hypothetical parameters (Table 2.2) and whether Monte Carlo simulations agree with the mean-variance selected conventionally.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Agreement</th>
<th>Model selected conventionally</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>110.76</td>
<td>218.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>144.80</td>
<td>221.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>28.94</td>
<td>129.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>159.89</td>
<td>1330.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>206.31</td>
<td>416.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>263.85</td>
<td>833.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>63.14</td>
<td>51.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>119.97</td>
<td>372.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>33.52</td>
<td>109.64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Model 1 - $\log s^2 = \log a + b \log m$

Model 2 - $s^2 = am^b$

Model 3 - $m = \alpha + \beta m$

Model 4 - $s^2 = (\alpha + 1)m + (\beta - 1)m^2$
Discussion


The beginning of the debate with respect to the parameters of the Taylor power law seems to stem from the statement by Taylor (1961) in his original paper that \( b \) \((s^2=am^b)\) is a “...true population statistic, ‘an index of aggregation’ describing an intrinsic property of the organism concerned...”. Even the strongest advocates currently supporting the law have backed away from the original statement, by suggesting that the power law was never intended to be species-specific (Taylor et al. 1998). They have further acknowledged that factors such as environment and phenology play a large role in the value of the parameters of the power law (Taylor et al. 1980). The debate now currently ranges from, the Taylor power law is merely a “convenient family of curves” (Routledge and Swartz 1992), to the spatial parameter of the Taylor power law has biological and sampling meaning subject to sources of variation (Taylor et al. 1988). These sources of variation are generally agreed to include time of sampling, number of samples, sampling method, location, phenology of the insect, and spatial scale (Perry 1997, Clark and Perry 1994, Yamamura 1990, Sawyer 1989). For example, Sawyer (1989) using simulation experiments found that Taylor’s \( b \) varied with the size of the sample unit. Also, Taylor et al. (1998) found that Taylor’s \( b \) for the western flow thrip, *Frankliniella occidentalis*
(Pergande) varied with the location of the samples taken (i.e. within the canopy of the cucumber crop or above the canopy).

The debate surrounding the parameters of Iwao's mean-variance relationship is centered on their stability, meaning and method of calculation. The parameters of Iwao's mean-variance relationship include $\alpha$, which is a measure of the organism's aggregation, and $\beta$, which is a measure of how the organism uses its habitat (Southwood 1978). Some authors concerned about the stability of Iwao's parameters suggest that very small errors in $\alpha$ may have very serious consequences on the prediction of the variance (Ito and Kitching 1986). This effect is due to the relatively small range of the $\alpha$ values when compared to range of mean values (Ito and Kitching 1986). The method used to calculate $\alpha$ and $\beta$ in the $m-m$ regression is of concern for some authors because the calculation of both $m$ and $m$ utilizes the same data, perhaps problematic when $m$ and $m$ are used in regression (Ito and Kitching 1986). The parameters of Iwao's relationship have some of the same problems as Taylor's power law when it comes to the factors that affect them. Iwao's parameters, as the parameters of the Taylor power law, are affected by sampling method and time of sampling (Perry 1997, Gutierrez et al. 1980, Byerly et al. 1978).

It is difficult to draw a conclusion from this debate other than for some insects, Taylor's power law seems to provide a better fit and for other insects, Iwao's $m-m$ regression seems to provide a better fit, although some evidence suggests that Taylor's power law provides a better fit for more insects (Routledge and Swartz 1992, Taylor et al. 1978). Many supporters of the Taylor power law take the intellectually awkward position and advocate that because the Taylor power law provides the "best" fit most of the time, it ought to be used all of the time (Perry and Woiwod 1992, Routledge and Swartz 1992). However, if Taylor's power law does provide a
better fit for more insects, this still does not convincingly argue that for the exclusive use of the relationship (Routledge and Swartz 1992). Obviously it is important to test several relationships and use the “best” one.

The concept of choosing the “best” mean-variance relationship is also a source of controversy because the criteria for choosing a mean-variance relationship are uncertain (Perry and Woiwod 1992, Routledge and Swartz 1991, Taylor et al. 1978). Taylor et al. (1978) used two methods to assess the ability of Taylor’s and Iwao’s equations (models 1 and 4) to capture the mean-variance relationship. The first method determines the maximum likelihood estimates for the parameters in the models and then uses the residual mean squares to compare the models. The second method fits the models as generalized linear models with a gamma error distribution and then uses the mean deviances to compare the models. The second method has been criticized because gamma errors assume that the variance is proportional to \( \text{mean}^2 \), which would increase the likelihood that the Taylor power law would have the better fit (Routledge and Swartz 1992).

Perry and Woiwod (1992) assessed the fit of Taylor’s and Iwao’s mean-variance relationships using a variation of the method by Taylor et al. (1978). Perry and Woiwod (1992) used the logarithm of the ratio of the mean deviance (that was a result of fitting a general linear model with a gamma error) of the model in question divided by mean deviance of a generalized mean-variance model they developed. They referred to this measure of fit as “an informal guide to the comparative fit...” of the mean-variance relationships, not a convincingly robust approach. This approach also has the disadvantage of using the gamma error that was described previously.

The approach of Routledge and Swartz (1991) for assessing the fit of the mean-variance relationships was to focus on the objective of the relationships, in other words, the prediction of variance. To this end, they calculated the sum of squares of the difference between the actual
variance of data points in the mean-variance relationship and the predicted variance and then create a ratio between the sum of squares of the predictability of the Taylor power law over the predictability of Iwao's mean-variance relationship. This approach has been criticized because it may confer an advantage to Iwao's mean-variance relationship because the least squares regression used to estimate Iwao's mean-variance relationship minimizes a component of the ratio they created (Perry and Woiwod 1992, Routledge and Swartz 1991).

It is standard practice in insect pest management to rely heavily on the value of the $r^2$ of the mean-variance relationship to decide which relationship is most appropriate (Meikle et al. 1998, Coffelt and Schultz 1994, Palumbo et al. 1991, Walker et al. 1984). As outlined in the introduction, this approach is particularly perilous.

The approach to evaluating the mean-variance relationships used in my thesis was based on the ability of the relationship to predict the variance at the decision threshold. Mathematically, the approach used in this chapter is similar to that of Routledge and Swartz (1991) with three important differences. First, Routledge and Swartz (1991) compare the predicted variance at a particular mean (which is calculated from samples collected) to the actual variance at that mean calculated from the collected samples. The approach used in this chapter was to compare the known variance to the appropriate predicted variance. Second, the approach by Routledge and Swartz (1991) compares the predicted variance of each point along the mean-variance relationship to the actual variance along that mean-variance relationship. The approach used here focused exclusively on comparing the predicted variance at the threshold to the known variance at the threshold. Third, they square the difference between the actual and predicted variance, as opposed to taking the absolute value as was done here.
One approach for evaluating the mean-variance relationships is to analyze them exclusively from a theoretical perspective and choose the relationship that is the closest to the variance of the negative binomial distribution. The theoretical approach is very important and needs to be incorporated. Kvalseth argues in his 1985 paper and I would agree, that when selecting a model there should be justification from both a theoretical and empirical perspective. And that is exactly what this thesis does when selecting a mean-variance relationship. The variance that is used as the test, is the theoretical variance based on the negative binomial. I discuss in the thesis the reasons for using the negative binomial distribution. The empirical data and the sample variances calculated from it are then compared to the theoretical values. When one has the actual variances from the biological system on hand, it seems sensible to see if the actual variances agree with the theoretical ones. What the thesis does is perform this check in a rigorous manner.

Based on the Monte Carlo simulations of the hypothetical parameters (Table 2.1), the Iwao's mean-variance relationship estimated by $m - m$ generally provided the best prediction of the true variance at the decision threshold. This result is consistent with the literature to the extent that there is some evidence that suggests Iwao's mean-variance is a more appropriate model (Routledge and Swartz 1992, Routledge and Swartz 1991). However, factors such as the number of points used to estimate the mean and variance, the range of the means in the mean-variance relationship, and the position of the decision threshold along the mean-variance relationship play a role in the ability of the mean-variance relationship to predict the true variance at the decision threshold.

The location of the decision threshold along the range of means had an impact on the relative errors when estimating the variance at the decision threshold (Fig. 2.1). This result is
consistent with the literature for both Taylor’s power law and Iwao’s mean-variance relationship. Various authors have found that the fit of the Taylor power law is quite poor at lower densities, where the variance is underestimated (Leps 1993, Routledge and Swartz 1991). McArdle et al. (1990) found the bias in Taylor’s power law was largest at mean densities between 0 and 20, which they quite correctly point out, is a very common range for means in ecological studies. Perry and Woiwod (1992) found that there was a “systematic” lack of fit with Iwao’s mean-variance relationship. In particular, they found that Iwao’s mean-variance relationship overestimated the variance at the extremes of the relationship and underestimated the variance in the middle of the range. Because the ability of the models to predict the variance is highly dependent on the position of the decision threshold, the model used should be chosen on its ability to perform at the desired threshold. Especially, given that the key parameter of Iwao’s sequential sampling plan is the variance at the decision threshold.

The relative errors varied with the number of points used to estimate the mean and variance and the number of points used to estimate the mean-variance relationship (Figs. 2.2 - 2.3). This is consistent with the results of previous studies. Downing (1986) found that \( b \) (consequently the predicted variance) varied considerably with the number of data points used to estimate the mean, variance and the mean-variance relationship. For example, the number of data points used in estimating of \( b \) for *Papillia japonicum* and *Pyrausta nubilalis* had a dramatic effect on their value even though samples were taken at the same sites and dates (Downing 1986). Other authors have also found that the number of data points used in estimation substantially impacted the predicted variance (Taylor et al. 1998, Leps 1993, Taylor et al. 1988)

The range of means used in the mean-variance relationship in some cases had an impact, although minor, on the models’ ability to predict the true variance. This result is also consistent
with previous work. When considering the parameters of the Taylor power law using Monte Carlo simulation, Downing (1986) found that estimates of $b$ (and consequently the variance) varied with the range of means in the mean variance relationship. The range of means also has an impact on the parameters of Iwao's mean-variance relationship. Gutierrez et al. (1980) evaluated the distribution of *Acythosiphon kondoi* over time and found different parameters for Iwao's mean-variance relationship. Taylor (1984) reanalyzed the results of Gutierrez et al. (1980) using the Taylor power law and found that the only difference was the ranges in the mean at different times. Taylor (1984) concluded that the difference in the parameters of Iwao's relationship found by Gutierrez et al. (1980) was due to the difference in the range of the means and not a change in the distribution of the insect over time.

The relative error varied more when the range of the means was small, 0-5 (Fig. 2.4). These results are again consistent with previous findings in the literature. Using Monte Carlo simulation Downing (1986) found that the range of Taylor's $b$ is largest when the range of means is small. Furthermore, he showed that extreme values of $b$ were common at small ranges of the mean in the mean-variance relationship. Taylor et al. (1988) recognized the impact of a small range of means and suggested that the range of means be as large as possible when estimating the parameters of Taylor's power law. A narrow range of means can also lead to "alarming results" when estimating Iwao's mean-variance relationship (Taylor 1984).

When the factors that have been shown here and in the literature to have an effect on the predicted variance are kept constant (i.e. the number of data points used to estimate the mean and variance, number of data points used to estimate the mean-variance relationship, position of the decision threshold, range of means) and the negative binomial $k$ is varied, the order of best fit for the relationships is also fairly constant. Clearly, when those factors that are known to have an
factor are not varied one would expect the ability of the different mean-variance relationship to be fairly consistent in their ability to predict the variance.

Factors such as the range of means and the number of data points used to estimate the mean, variance, and mean-variance relationship have an effect on the predicted variance. Downing (1986) warns that bias in Taylor's $b$ (and consequently the variance) is "a major technical problem... comparisons of $b$ should only be made where identical levels of replication are used and equivalent ranges of $M$ [the mean] are examined." Based on the work in this thesis and previous work cited above, this caveat is just as valid for Iwao's mean-variance relationship.

Of the nine cases from the literature, five agree with the results from the Monte Carlo simulation results based on the hypothetical parameters in Table 2.2. These results indicate that it is necessary to perform simulations on a case by case basis. The mean-variance relationships selected based on Monte Carlo simulation (parameters from the literature) were compared to the relationships that were (or would have been) selected using the conventional method (i.e. $r^2$). In two of four cases where such a comparison was possible, the results of the Monte Carlo simulation agreed with the selection of the mean-variance relationship based on the $r^2$. These results further support that the conventional method is not adequate to select a mean-variance relationship for use in Iwao's sequential sampling plan and selection of a mean-variance relationship by Monte Carlo simulation as outlined in this thesis is necessary.

When selecting a mean-variance relationship for Iwao's sequential sampling plan, the approach recommended here would be to choose the model that can best predict the variance at the decision threshold. The ability of the mean-variance relationship to meet this goal should be evaluated using Monte Carlo simulation as conducted here with the same parameters that will be used in the plan.
Methods for selection of the mean-variance relationship – a guide for the pest manager

1. The pest manager must first ensure that they are using the correct sample unit for the insect pest. Recommendations for the characteristics of an appropriate sample unit are given in Morris (1955) and Southwood (1978) and are: 1) all sample units should have an equal chance of selection, 2) the sample unit should be stable, 3) the proportion of the pest population living on the sample unit should be constant (for the appropriate developmental stage), 4) it should be possible to convert the sample unit to the number insects per unit area, 5) the sample unit should be small enough to be manageable, and 6) the unit should be clearly identifiable in the field. The methods for achieving the above are also given Morris (1955) and Southwood (1978).

2. The pest manager must ensure they are sampling the pest at the correct time of year (Southwood 1978). To this end the manager must be familiar with the biology and ecology of the insect. Often degree-day models can help insure that the manager is achieving this goal (Rodriguez and Miller 1999, Goldson et al. 1998, Dent 1977).

3. The pest manager must also know the decision threshold for the pest, the methods for determining this threshold are discussed in Weinzierl et al. 1987 and Coffelt and Schultz 1993.

4. Once the sample unit and time of sampling have been identified the manager can proceed to sample the insects over representative fields/forest stands from which sample means and variances will be calculated. It is recommended that no less than 20 fields/stands be sampled. The next step is to determine the statistical distribution of the insects on the sample unit. Potential distributions (normal poisson, negative binomial etc.) can be tested using the $\chi^2$ test,
additionally, the $U$ or $T$ tests can be used for the negative binomial distribution (Sokal and Rolf 1995, Southwood 1978). Once the appropriate statistical distribution has been identified, the variance of the distribution is obtainable from any standard statistical text, and the 'true' variance at the decision threshold can be calculated.

5. The manager now has all of the information needed to run the Monte Carlo simulation: the decision threshold, true variance at the decision threshold, the distribution of the insects in the sample unit, the number of stands sampled, the number of samples per stand and the range for insect densities. This information can then be entered into the program in Appendix A and the mean-variance relationship with the lowest relative error is the mean-variance relationship that should be used in Iwao's sequential sampling plan. The program in Appendix A is designed for use when the distribution of the insects on the sample unit is negative binomial, the most common distribution for insects, however, the program can be altered appropriately for insects that follow other distributions.
CHAPTER 3

The effect of uncertainty in the decision threshold on Iwao’s sequential sampling plan

Introduction

Iwao’s sequential sampling plan has three components: 1) decision threshold, 2) predicted variance at the decision threshold and 3) desired accuracy. However, the decision threshold in most cases is not known with certainty. This uncertainty should be considered when developing a sequential sampling plan, so that realistic Operating Characteristic (OC) and Average Sample Number (ASN) curves can be obtained to assess the performance of the plan. The focus of chapter 3 is to incorporate uncertainty in the decision threshold when evaluating the sequential sampling plan using OC and ASN curves.

There are two main sources of uncertainty in the decision threshold. The first is the relationship between insect density (X) and subsequent damage (Y), which is often derived from regression analysis such as illustrated in Figure 3.1. Such a relationship is an approximation, the certainty of which is related to goodness of fit.

The second source of uncertainty is the damage threshold itself. This is the level of insect damage that is considered unacceptable. The usual method of determining the decision threshold is to use inverse prediction (Zar 1996). Inverse prediction is solving for the X value in linear regression \( Y = b_0 + b_1X \) given \( Y, b_0 \) and \( b_1 \). The damage threshold is usually treated as a point estimate known with certainty. In fact it is often a parameter determined from data and has uncertainty associated with it. Uncertainty about the damage threshold should therefore be incorporated into the estimate of the uncertainty of the decision threshold.
Figure 3.1. The relationship between the density of fourth instar jack pine budworm and subsequent defoliation, $\tilde{Y}_i = 8.347 + 0.990 X_i$, ($r=0.76$, df=68, $p<0.01$). Data from Nealis et al. 1997.
Previous work has attempted to look at the problem of uncertainty in decision thresholds in the sequential sampling of insect pests. Nyrop and Binns (1992) addressed the issue while developing a binomial sampling plan based on Wald's equations. They did this by converting a decision threshold based on density to a threshold based on the proportion of sample units infested. The number of insects that constitute an infested sample unit is often called the tally threshold (Binns and Bostonian 1990). The threshold based on the proportion of sample units infested is determined by modeling the relationship between the mean pest density and the proportion of sample units infested. Once the relationship between density and the proportion of sample units infested has been derived, then the decision threshold based on density is substituted into the model and the decision threshold based on the proportion of infested units is obtained. It is to this relationship that uncertainty was added. Note that in this case the decision threshold based on density is still considered to be known with certainty, it was only the interpolated value (proportion of sample units infested) that was considered to have uncertainty associated with it. The objective of chapter 3 is to incorporate the uncertainty of the decision threshold into Iwao's sequential sampling plan using Monte Carlo simulation.

There are no equations for the OC and ASN curves for Iwao's sequential sampling plans. They must be derived by Monte Carlo simulation. This approach tests a given sampling plan a large number of times and then constructs the resulting OC and ASN curves. In this chapter, Monte Carlo simulation was used to incorporate the uncertainty of the decision threshold into the construction of these curves.
**Methods**

Rather than testing a plan repeatedly with the same decision threshold value, a new threshold was generated at each run of the Monte Carlo simulation. Throughout this chapter, experiments were based on 5000 Monte Carlo runs. The resulting OC and ASN curves were then compiled.

Decision thresholds were generated using a six-step process.

1. A relationship between insect density ($X$) and insect damage ($Y$) was taken from the literature (Table 3.1),

$$ Y = b_o + b_1 X + \varepsilon $$

where $\varepsilon \in N(0, MSE)$ is assumed ($MSE$ is the Mean Squared Error from the original regression analysis).

2. A fixed number of $X$ values were calculated over the range of the insect densities suggested by the literature.

3. Corresponding $Y$ values (i.e. to each $X$) were generated with equation in step 1 assigning a random value to $\varepsilon$.

4. The new $Y$ values were regressed on the generated $X$ values and new values $b'_o$ and $b'_1$ were estimated by ordinary least square regression.

5. Uncertainty in the damage threshold $Y_{th}$ was incorporated by randomly generating thresholds from a normal distribution with a given mean and standard deviation (parameters were taken from the literature).

6. A decision threshold ($X_{th}$) was then calculated from $b'_o$, $b'_1$ and damage threshold $Y_{th}$

$$ X_{th} = \frac{Y_{th} - b'_o}{b'_1}.$$
Table 3.1. Parameters from the literature used in Monte Carlo simulations to calculate the Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves for Iwao’s sequential sampling plan incorporating uncertainty in the decision threshold.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Damage threshold</th>
<th>Standard deviation of the damage threshold</th>
<th>Decision threshold</th>
<th>$\sqrt{MSE}$</th>
<th>$k$</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.18 scars/100 pods$^2$</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>3 insects/10 sweeps</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Weinzierl et al. 1987$^3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.18 scars/100 pods</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>3 insects/10 sweeps</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>25% defoliation$^4$</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>4.8 egg masses</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Coffelt and Schultz 1993$^5$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>25% defoliation</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>4.8 egg masses</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^1$Equations and parameters were taken directly from the literature or calculated from digitized data from the literature. Where parameters were lacking and additional calculations could not yield the required parameters, parameter values were assumed.

$^2$ damage = 0.29*insect + 0.30, N=45

$^3$ western spotted cucumber beetle, *Diabrotica undecimpunctata undecimpunctata* Mannerheim

$^4$ damage = 7.7*insect - 11.8, N=24

$^5$ orangestriped oakworm, *Anisota senatoria* (J.E. Smith)
The effect of increasing uncertainty in the decision threshold on the Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves was investigated using a hypothetical example. The relationship between damage and density was modeled by \( Y = 100X \), \( N=20 \), with a range of 0-1 for insect density and a decision threshold of 0.5. Three levels of uncertainty were modeled for both the standard deviation (SD = \( \sqrt{MSE} \)) of the regression error and SD of damage threshold (\( Y_{th} \)), the levels were 10, 20 and 30.

To examine the effect of the position of the damage threshold along the range of densities in the insect damage v. insect density regression, holding all other factors constant, the damage threshold was varied from 10 to 90% of the density range (Table 3.2). To examine the effect of the regression error, the SD of the regression error was increased from 5-50, holding all factors constant (Table 3.2). Finally, to examine the effect of the number data points in the regression, \( N \) was varied from 5 – 50 holding all other factors constant.

The Monte Carlo simulations were done using a computer program written in C for this purpose. The program uses some of the algorithms and variable definitions found in Binns (1994).
Table 3.2. A hypothetical example used to determine the effect of various parameters on the uncertainty of the decision threshold from the regression of insect damage on insect density. The range of insect damage (Y) was 0-100 and the range of insect density (X) was 0-1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Range of effect</th>
<th>Decision threshold</th>
<th>$\sqrt{MSE}$</th>
<th>N (density v. damage regression)$^1$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Damage threshold</td>
<td>10 - 90%</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\sqrt{MSE}$</td>
<td>5 - 50</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N (density v. damage</td>
<td>5 - 50</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>regression)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^1$The relationship between insect density and subsequent damage was assumed to be $Y = 100X$. 

Results

Uncertainty in the decision threshold reduced the accuracy of the sequential sampling plan when compared to a sequential sampling plan where the decision threshold was considered certain. This was illustrated by a flattening of the OC curve (Figs. 3.2 a, b and 3.3 a, b). Increasing uncertainty in the decision threshold resulted in an OC curve that became increasingly flatter (Fig. 3.4 a). There is was corresponding decrease in the average number of samples needed to reach a decision near the threshold, but an increase in the number of samples needed near the tails of the ASN curve (Figs. 3.2 c, d and 3.3 c, d). As uncertainty in the decision threshold increased, the ASN curve became flatter (3.4 b). Also, when the insect distribution was highly clumped ($k=1$) more samples were required to reach a decision than when the insects were less aggregated ($k=8$) (Fig. 3.2 c and d).

As the position of the damage threshold along the density range moved away from the mid point, the uncertainty in the decision threshold increased, by a factor of two (Fig. 3.5 a). As the regression error ($\sqrt{MSE}$) increased, the uncertainty of the decision threshold increased proportionately by a factor of 10 (Fig. 3.5 b). In contrast, the uncertainty in the decision threshold decreased by a factor of five as the sample number increased from 5 to 50 (Fig. 3.5 c).
Figure 3.2. Effects of uncertainty in the decision threshold on the Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves for the western spotted cucumber beetle, *Diabrotica undecimtntata undecimtntata* Mannerheim, Weinzierl et al. 1987. --- uncertainty in decision threshold while; — decision threshold is known with certainty.
Figure 3.3. Effects of uncertainty in the decision threshold on the Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curve for the orangestriped oakworm, *Anisota senatoria* (J.E. Smith), Coffelt and Schultz 1993. --- uncertainty in decision threshold; — the decision threshold is known with certainty.
Figure 3.4. Effect of increasing uncertainty in the decision threshold on the Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves. As uncertainty in the decision threshold increases the Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves become flatter.
Figure 3.5. Effect of various factors on the uncertainty of the decision threshold: a) effect of the position of the damage threshold, b) effect of the magnitude of the regression error expressed as $\sqrt{MSE}$ and, c) effect of the number of the data points used to estimate the relationship between insect density and insect damage. The dependent variable in all cases is the standard deviation of the decision threshold.
Discussion

Uncertainty in the decision threshold decreased the classification accuracy of the sampling plans. There was also an accompanying decrease in the average number of samples needed to reach a decision near the threshold with an increase in samples needed when density was further away from the threshold. As uncertainty in the decision threshold increased, the effects on the OC and ASN curves also become more pronounced (Fig. 3.5). The implication for pest managers is that as uncertainty in the decision threshold increases, there is a proportional decrease in classification accuracy.

Intuitively, the less certain the boundaries used to make a decision, the more likely a classification error becomes. Mathematically, the flattening of the OC curve is a result of averaging several curves based on different decision thresholds. OC curves have lower classification values when the decision threshold is from the left tail of the distribution than if it comes from further right in the distribution. The averaging of the “high” and “low” values results in intermediate values, which flattens the OC curve (Fig. 3.6). The same effect is seen for decision thresholds at the right tail of the distribution, with the curves responsible for the “high” and “low” values being reversed. A similar explanation accounts for the shape of the ASN curve when there is uncertainty in the decision threshold.

In the literature cases there is a clear effect of the negative binomial $k$ (Table 3.1). In a highly aggregated population ($k=1$), the OC curve is flatter than in a less aggregated population ($k=8$). The more a population is aggregated, the higher the variability of counts in a sample, and the less accuracy one can achieve with a given sampling plan. Also, when a negative binomial $k$ of 1 is used, the average number of samples needed to reach a decision is higher than when a $k$ of
Figure 3.6. Averaging these two Operating Characteristic curves results in a flatter curve.
8 is used. Thus, the more clumped a population, the more samples required to reach a decision with a particular sampling plan.

The position of the decision threshold along the regression had a two-fold effect on variability of the threshold (Fig. 3.5 a). As can be seen from the equation below, the uncertainty of the damage threshold (by extension the decision threshold) is smallest at the mean \((\bar{X})\) and increases in both directions (Zar 1996)

\[
s_{\hat{r}} = \sqrt{MSE \left[ \frac{1}{n} + \frac{(X_i - \bar{X})}{\sum x^2} \right]}
\]

There was a direct proportionality between the regression error (\(MSE\)) in the damage density regression and uncertainty in the decision threshold (Fig. 3.5 b). The poorer the relationship, the less certain one can be about the value of the decision threshold. The uncertainty of the decision threshold was also inversely proportional to sample size (number of points in the damage-density regression) (Fig. 3.5 c). Increasing the number of data points in the regression improved the estimate of the parameters of the regression and decreased the variability of the decision threshold.

Nyrop and Binns (1991) incorporated the uncertainty of the predicted variance in Iwao's sequential sampling plan by varying the variance at the decision threshold for each run of the Monte Carlo simulation. They assumed that the distribution about the \(y\) values in the regression \(\log s^2 = \log a + b \log m\) was normally distributed. However, they then took the antilog of \(\log s^2\) to determine the predicted variance on the original scale resulting in a highly skewed distribution of \(s^2\) values that may not be an accurate description of the distribution of the predicted variance.
Uncertainty in the decision threshold was indirectly incorporated into Wald’s binomial sequential sampling plan by Nyrop and Binns (1992), who modeled uncertainty in the proportion of samples with more than \( x \) insects (\( \delta \)). The value of \( \delta \) was determined from a relationship between insect density and the proportion of samples with more than \( x \) insects, and a constant threshold based on density. Uncertainty in the decision threshold per se is not considered. Nyrop and Binns (1992) assumed that \( \delta \) was normally distributed and generated 11 OC and ASN curves using values of \( \delta \) spaced equally along its range. Then, based on a weighted average, using the standard normal distribution, the overall expected OC and ASN curves were compiled.

Nyrop and Binns (1992) differ in several ways from the work in this thesis. Our approach was to use a large number (5000) of randomly generated decision thresholds from which to compile the final OC and ASN curves. Nyrop and Binns (1992) used Wald’s sequential sampling plan while the work here is based on Iwao’s sequential sampling plan. Moreover, the Wald plan used by Nyrop and Binns (1992) is a binomial plan, while Iwao’s plan used here is based on density and not intensity.

The work of Nyrop and Binns (1992) was based on previous work by Binns and Bostanian (1990 a b, 1988) who provided a method to increase the robustness of Wald’s binomial sequential sampling plan. Essentially, these papers argued that by increasing the sample size the classification accuracy of the Wald’s binomial plan could be increased. Specifically, by increasing the tally threshold one could create a sequential sampling plan that was more robust. This effect was largest when the insects sampled followed a negative binomial distribution and the \( k \) was not constant.
It is important that the pest manager consider uncertainty in the decision threshold when using Iwao’s sequential sampling plan. Such uncertainty in the decision threshold has the effect of reducing the accuracy of the sequential sampling. Two approaches can be used to mitigate the reduction in accuracy due to an uncertain decision threshold. One is to increase the sample size in an attempt to increase classification accuracy, while the other is to decrease uncertainty around the decision threshold by improving the relationship between pest density and subsequent damage. The conventional approach used in the sequential sampling of insect populations is the former. It is widely advocated that one should manipulate the parameters of the sequential sampling plan until satisfactory OC and ASN curves are obtained (Carter et al. 1994, Binns 1994, Brewer et al. 1994, Nyrop and Binns 1991). The problem with this approach is that raising the sample size to increase classification accuracy involves increasing the resources required to determine if the pest population is just slightly above the decision threshold or just slightly below. This level of accuracy may be out of proportion with the precision of the threshold itself. It is clear that increasing sample sizes to improve classification accuracy (create a steeper OC curve) makes little sense for parts of the curve that are in the area of uncertainty about the decision threshold (Fig 3.7).

We suggest that it would be more useful to focus on the information used to create the decision threshold rather than on increasing sample size. This approach directly addresses the problem of the decision threshold. Reducing this uncertainty leads to more accurate classification of the insect population. It can be achieved by improving the accuracy of the data used in the regression of pest damage on pest density (either by increasing the number of sample
Figure 3.7. A hypothetical Operating Characteristic curve indicating uncertainty (dotted region) about the decision threshold.
units used to calculate the pest density and subsequent damage, or by increasing the number of points along the damage-density regression).

Although this may seem to be an expensive solution, improving the quality of the data on which the decision threshold is based, is the most practical approach in the long run. The decision threshold in most cases is only defined once. The resulting sequential sampling plan may be used in hundreds of field/stands each year for many years. An approach advocating increased sample size in each sampling plan means that the sample size must be increased in each of the hundreds of sites each year. Over several years, this is clearly an extremely expensive option. The option advocated here puts resources into decreasing the uncertainty of the decision threshold, and this will save costs in the long term.
CHAPTER 4

General Discussion

The objectives set out at the beginning of this thesis were to improve the decision making and management of uncertainty when using Iwao’s sequential sampling plan. The objectives were addressed in two interrelated parts of the thesis.

In the first part of the thesis, the specific objective was to develop an approach for selecting a mean-variance relationship for use in Iwao’s sequential sampling plan. One of the critical components of Iwao’s sequential sampling plan is the variance of the pest at the decision threshold that is determined from a mean-variance relationship. This is a key area that needs research because the conventional approach in insect pest management (i.e. \( r^2 \)) (Meikle et al. 1998, Coffelt and Schultz 1994, Palumbo et al. 1991, Walker et al. 1984) is incorrect (Scott and Wild 1991, Kvalseth 1985). Choosing the wrong mean-variance relationship in a sequential sampling plan can result in poor and misleading plan performance.

The approach developed here is based on Monte Carlo simulation to evaluate the ability of the mean-variance relationship to predict the true variance at the threshold. Selection of a mean-variance relationship for Iwao’s sequential sampling plan can now be accomplished in terms of the specific requirements of the plan. By improving the selection of the components that are required in Iwao’s sequential sampling plan, the decision-making resulting from the plan is improved. A role in the selection of the mean-variance relationship was dependent factors such as the position of the decision threshold and the number of data points used to estimate the mean and variance. Given the influence of these factors it is suggested that the Monte Carlo simulation be done for each pest system. The results of the simulation show that in general,
Iwao's mean-variance regression based on $m = \alpha + \beta m$, will best predict the true variance at the decision threshold.

The first and second parts of this thesis are linked by the mean-variance relationship. The mean-variance relationship selected by using the approach in Chapter 2 should be used when modeling the uncertainty of the decision threshold as described in Chapter 3.

The objective of the second part of the thesis was to incorporate uncertainty into the decision threshold using Iwao's sequential sampling plan. Given the importance of uncertainty in decision making (Chacko 1991, Gardenfors and Salin 1988, Jones 1977, Lindley 1971), the quantification of the effects of uncertainty in the decision threshold is a significant addition to the literature. The many sequential sampling plans based on Iwao's (1975) traditional sequential sampling plan described in the introduction underscores the broad applicability of this thesis (Legg et al. 1994, Nyrop et al. 1989, Nyrop 1988). By quantifying the effects of uncertainty due to the decision threshold the pest manager is able to accurately assess the performance of sequential sampling plans and consequently make better management decisions.

Research from this thesis provides practical recommendations for the pest manager, both in terms of selecting the mean-variance relationship and uncertainty of the decision threshold. First, the mean-variance relationship should be selected on the basis of its ability to predict the true variance at the decision threshold. The selection should be based on Monte Carlo simulation as outlined in this thesis where the true variance is compared to predicted variance. The mean-variance with the smallest relative error at the decision threshold should be chosen. The parameters of the Monte Carlo simulation should reflect the conditions under which the plan will be used.
Second, it is important that the pest manager consider uncertainty in the decision threshold when using Iwao's sequential sampling plan. Uncertainty in the decision threshold reduces the accuracy of the sequential sampling plan as evidenced by the flattening of the Operating Characteristic curve. If pest managers are concerned about the effects of an uncertain decision threshold, they should focus on improving the quality of data on which the threshold is based rather than increasing the sample size. The quality of the data can be improved by increasing the number of sample units used to calculate the pest density and subsequent damage, and/or by increasing the number of points along the regression. Using the approaches outlined in this thesis, will improve decision making for pest managers when using Iwao's sequential sampling plan.
References


Banerjee, B. 1976. Variance to mean ratio and the spatial distribution of animals. *Experientia*


Carter, J.L., F.W. Ravlin, and S.J. Fleischer. 1994. Sequential egg mass sampling plans for gypsy moth (Lepidoptera: Lymantriidae) management in urban and suburban habitats. *Journal*


Leps, J. 1993. Taylor’s power law and the measurement of variation in the size of populations in space and time. *Oikos* 68: 349-357.


Mumford, J.D. and J.D. Knight. 1997. Injury, damage and threshold concepts. In Methods in
ecological and agricultural entomology. D.R. Dent and M.P. Walton Eds. CAB


Nealis, V.G. and T.J. Lysyk. 1988. Sampling overwintering jack pine budworm, *Choristoneura pinus pinus* Free. (Lepidoptera: Tortricidae), and two of its parasitoids (Hymenoptera).

*The Canadian Entomologist* 120: 1101-1111.


1-6.


611.


APPENDIX A

UPPORTEDktealuend the ability of four mean-variance relationship to estimate the true variance at the decision threshold.

The true variance for this program is based on the TPL and values of a and b assumed to the the true parameters. A companion program assumes that the true variance is based on Iwao’s mean variance relationship.

The four mean variance relationship evaluated are:

Taylor power law: log(variance)= loga + blog(mean)

Taylor power law: variance=a*mean^b

Iwao linear : mean_crowding = mean*b+a

Iwao polynomial : variance = (a+1)*mean+(b-1)*mean^2

The mean-variance relationships are evaluated in terms of ‘absolute error’ and ‘relative error’

Absolute error is the sums of squares of the predicted_variance - known_variance
Relative error is the sums of squares of the (predicted_variance - known_variance)/known_variance

*******************************************************************************/

#include <stdlib.h>
#include <stdio.h>

#include <math.h>
#include <conio.h>
#include <ctype.h>
#include <time.h>

#define RNUM 1000

void seedrnmn(void);
int ngb(float mean,float k);
extern void _stdcall POWELL(double *x, double *y, int n, double *a, double *b, double *r2);

extern int matrRegress(double *x, double *y, double *b, double *b0, double *cov, double *rsq, int nfac, int n, int zero);

void main()
{
    // variables for nonlinear and polynomial regression
    double x[100], y[100], xx[200];
    double a=2, b=2;
    double r2;
    double cov[4];
    double p[2];
    double b0;
    int i, j, n;
    int zero_intercept;

    // variables for linear regression - TPL and mc-m
    float mmin, mmx, minc, antia, t, knownvar;
    float k, kv;
    char file[12];

    // variable to allow program to pause until
    // input by user causes program to close
    char buffer[12];

    // sums of squares - of the different predicted variances
    float sstpl, ssiwao, sspowell, sspol;

    int rowm, colm, count, q;
    int datapt, mvnum, ic;

    float sx2r;
    float bsxb2r;
    float xy;
    float xsum;
    float ysum;
float xmean,ymean,at,bt;

// variables for the relationship between density and k
float kslope,kint;

// variables for iwaq regression
float ymeani,xmeani,xsumi,ysumi,sx2ri,ai,bi,xyi,bsxb2ri;

// variables for merge
float apowell,bpowell,apol,bpol;

// variables for the relative error
float rsstpl,rsiwaq,rsspow,rssp;

FILE *inparms,*afile;

// arrays for calculation of the mean-variance parameters
float *d,
   *dx,
   *dy,
   *means,
   *m,
   *sx2,
   *bsxb2,
   *var,
   *mc;

int **data;

// arrays for predicted variance
float *pvtpl,
   *pviwaq,
   *pvpowell,
   *pvpol;

float *diftpi,
   *diftwaq,
   *dipowell,
   *dipol;
// variables for the relative error arrays

float *reltpl,
    *reliwao,
    *relpowell,
    *re1pol;

if ((pvtpl=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pvtpl allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((pviwao=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pviwao allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((pvpowell=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pvpowell allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((pvpol=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pvpol allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

// variables for the difference between the known var and the
// predicted variance

if ((difipl=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("difipl allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((difiwao=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("difiwao allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((difpowell=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("difpowell allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((difpol=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("difpol allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
printf("dipol allocation failed\n");
exit(1);
}

// dynamically assigned relative error arrays

if (relpol=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
  printf("relpol allocation failed\n");
  exit(1);
}

if (relpoweIl=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
  printf("relpoweIl allocation failed\n");
  exit(1);
}

if (relpoweIl=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
  printf("relpoweIl allocation failed\n");
  exit(1);
}

if (relpol=(float *)malloc((RNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
  printf("relpol allocation failed\n");
  exit(1);
}

xmean = 0;
ymeans = 0;
sx2rs = 0;
sxb2rs = 0;

xyrs = 0;
atrs = 0;
trs = 0;

ymeans = 0;
xmean = 0;
apowells = 0;
bpowells = 0;
apols = 0;
bpols = 0;

tplrs = 0;
ssiwao = 0;
sspoweIl = 0;
sspols = 0;

rsstplrs = 0;
rssiwao = 0;
rsspoweIl = 0;
rsspols = 0;
knownvarrs = 0;
/* 
code to create an output file *
*/

seedmn();

/***************************************************************************/
/*
obtain necessary data
**************************************************************************/ 
/* read inputs from a file */

if (inpars=fopen("k_hilow.txt","r")) == NULL) exit(1);

fscanf(inpars,"%f",&t); // reads the threshold 't'

fscanf(inpars,"%s",file); // reads file name

// fscanf(inpars,"%f",&atpl); // reads Taylor power law 'a'
// fscanf(inpars,"%f",&btpl); // reads Taylor power law 'b'
// fscanf(inpars,"%f",&aiwao); // reads Iwao 'a' from m*-m regression
// fscanf(inpars,"%f",&biwao); // reads Iwao 'b' from m*-m regression

fscanf(inpars,"%f",&mmin); // reads minimum for range of means

fscanf(inpars,"%f",&mmax); // reads maximum for range of means

fscanf(inpars,"%f",&k); // reads k

fscanf(inpars,"%i",&datapt); // reads number of points used to estimate the mean and variance

fscanf(inpars,"%i",&mvnum); // reads number of points along the m-v relationship

fclose(inpars);

// dynamically assigned arrays

if ((d=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pvtpl allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((lx=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pvtpl allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if ((y=(float *)malloc(sizeof(float))!=(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((means=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((m=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((sx2=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((sxb2=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((var=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if ((mc=(float *)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Float allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

// dynamically set the data array

if ((data=(int **)malloc((mvnum+1)*sizeof(int *)))==(NULL) {
    printf("Data allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

for(ic=0;ic<mvnum;++ic) {
    if ((data[ic]=(int *)malloc(sizeof(int)))==(NULL) {
        printf("Data allocation failed\n");
        exit(1);
    }
}
/************ initialize variables *************/
rowm=0;
colm=0;
n=0;

/**************************** calculate the increment in means from the minimum mean to the maximum mean *****************************/
minc=(mmax-mmin)/(mvnum-1);

/**************************** caculation of the known variance *****************************/
knownvar=t+(t*t)/k;

for (q=0;q<=RNUM;q=q+1) // begining for predicted variance loop
{

// printf("rep #: %i \n",q);

    xmean = 0;
ymean = 0;
sx2r=0;
bsxb2r=0;
xy=0;
at=0;
bt=0;
xsum=0;
ysum=0;

    ymeani=0;
for (rowm = 0; rowm < mvnum; rowm = rowm + 1)
{
    means[rowm] = 0;
    m[rowm] = 0;
    sx2[rowm] = 0;
    var[rowm] = 0;
    lx[rowm] = 0;
    ly[rowm] = 0;
    rnc[rowm] = 0;
}

calculate the means for which the mean variance relationship will be calculated
******************************************************************************
for (rowm = 0; rowm < mvnum; rowm = rowm + 1)
{
    d[rowm] = (float) rand() / 32767 * mmax;
}

generate random data that conform to a specified mean variance relationship (TPL)
interms of the parameters 'a' and 'b'
and write them to a mantrix

each value generated represents the number of insects in a sample unit
******************************************************************************
for (rowm = 0; rowm < mvnum; rowm = rowm + 1)
{
    for (colm = 0; colm < datapt; colm = colm + 1)
    {
        data[rowm][colm] = agb(d[rowm], k);
    }
}

// print("*************\n");
/*****************************
write the generated data to the screen
*****************************

//for (rowm=0;rowm<mvnum;rowm=rowm+1)
//  {
//     for(colm=0;colm<datapt;colm=colm+1)
//       {
//           printf("%d",data[rowm][colm]);
//       }
//     printf("\n");
//  }
//  printf("**************\n");

/****************************
calculate the MEAN for each row in the array data[], each row has 20 values,
each value represents the number of insects in a sample unit
***************************/

for (rowm = 0; rowm<mvnum ; rowm=rowm+1)
{ 
   for (colm = 0 ; colm<datapt ; colm=colm+1)
   { 
      means[rowm]=means[rowm]+data[rowm][colm];
   }
   means[rowm] = means[rowm]/datapt;
}

/****************************
calculate the VARIANCE for each row in the array data[], each row has 20 values,
each value represents the number of insects in a sample unit
***************************/

for (rowm = 0; rowm<mvnum ; rowm=rowm+1)
{ 
   for (colm = 0 ; colm<datapt ; colm=colm+1)
   { 
      m[rowm]=m[rowm]+data[rowm][colm];
      sx2[rowm]=sx2[rowm]+ pow(data[rowm][colm], 2);
   }
}
bsxb2[rowm] = pow(m[rowm], 2);
}

for (rowm=0; rowm<mvnum; rowm=rowm+1)
{
    var[rowm] = (sx2[rowm] - (bsxb2[rowm]/datapt))/(datapt-1);
}

******************************************************************************
calculation of mean crowding vector for each row based
on the calculated mean and variance
*******************************************************************************/

for (rowm=0; rowm<mvnum; rowm=rowm+1)
{
    if(means[rowm]==0)
    {
        mc[rowm]=0;
    }
    else
    {
        mc[rowm]=means[rowm]+(var[rowm]/means[rowm]-1);
    }
}

******************************************************************************
print the mean, variance and mean crowding values to the screen
*******************************************************************************/

//for (rowm=0; rowm<mvnum; rowm=rowm+1)
//    {
//        printf("%i mean=% .2f variance= % .2f MC= % .2f\n",rowm+1,means[rowm],var[rowm],mc[rowm]);
//    }
//    printf("********************\n");
log the mean and variance values to perform linear regression based on taylor power law, to eventually obtain a and b

for (rowm=0;rowm<mvnum;rowm=rowm+1) {
    if (means[rowm]==0) {
        lx[rowm]=0;
        ly[rowm]=0;
    } else {
        lx[rowm]=log10(means[rowm]);
        ly[rowm]=log10(var[rowm]);
    }
}

perform preliminary - calculations for the linear regression - TPL

the regression is log(variance) = constant + log(mean)

objective of regression is to obtain the TLP parameters 'a' and 'b'

for (count = 0 ; count<mvnum ; count=count+1) {
    xmean=xmean+lx[count];
    ymean=ymean+ly[count];
    sx2r=sx2r+pow(lx[count],2);
}

xsum=xmean;
ysum=ymean;
xmean=xmean/mvnum;
ymean=ymean/mvnum;

bsxb2r= pow(xsum,2);

for (count = 0 ; count<mvnum ; count=count+1) {
    xy=xy+(lx[count]*ly[count]);
}

calculation of the intercept 'b' - TPL

bt = (mvnum*xy -xsum*ysum)/(mvnum*sx2r-bsxb2r);

calculation of the intercept 'a' - TPL

at = ymean - bt*xmean;
antia = pow(10,at);

preliminary calculation for regression - IWAO

this regression is:

mean crowding = constant + mean

the objective of the regression is to obtain the
IWAO mean variance parameters 'a' and 'b'

for (count = 0 ; count<mvnum ; count=count+1)
{
    xmeani=xmeani+means[count];
ymeani=ymeani+mc[count];
sx2ri=sx2ri+pow(means[count],2);

}

xsumi=xmeani;
ysumi=ymeani;
xmeani=xmeani/mvnum;
ymeani=ymeani/mvnum;
bsxb2ri = pow(xsumi,2);

for (count = 0 ; count<mvnum ; count=count+1)
{
    xyi=xyi+(means[count]*mc[count]);

}
calculation of the intercept 'b'

bi = (mvnum*xyi -xsumi*ysumi)/(mvnum*sx2ri-bsxb2ri);

calculation of the intercept 'a'

ai = ymeani - bi*xmeani;

print the slope 'b' and intercept 'a' for TPL and IWAO

println("TPL - linear: a is %.2f and b is %.2fn",antia, bt);
println("IWAO - linear: a is %.2f and b is %.2fn",ai, bi);

println("mean ");

calculating the variables for the mean and variance
input in to J code
println("mean ");
for (rown=0;rown<mvnum;rown=rown+1) {
    x[rown]= means[rown];
    y[rown]= var[rown];
}

// setting n to 8 so that the algorithm knows how many
// pairs of data are in the arrays

n = mvnum;

// Non-linear regression first.
a = antia;
b = bt;
POWELL(x, y, n, &a, &b, &r2);
apowell = a;
bpowell = b;
println("TPL - non-linear: a=%%.2f, b=%%.2f, R2=%%f", apowell, bpowell, r2);

j = 0;
for(i = 0; i < n; ++i) {
    xx[i++] = x[i];  // x term
    xx[i++] = x[i]*x[i];  // x^2 term
}
The polynomial fit, no intercept
zero_intercept=1;
matrRegress(x, y, p, &b0, cov, &r2, 2, n,zero_intercept);
a=p[0];
b=p[1];
apol=a;
bpol=b;

 //= printf("Tiao - polynomial: a=%.2f b=%.2f R2=%f\n",apol,bpol,r2);

 Polynomial fit, with intercept (not part of your set of models, Paul
 //= zero_intercept=0;
 //= matrRegress(x, y, p, &b0, cov, &r2, 2, n,zero_intercept);
 //= a=p[0];
 //= b=p[1];
 //= printf("Tiao, intercept: b0=\%.2f a=\%.2f b=\%.2f R2=\%.2f\n",b0,a,b,r2);

 //= printf("***************\n");

="/**************************
calculation of predicted variance TPL
**************************/

pv tpl[q]=antia*pow(t, bt);

="/**************************
calculation of predicted variance IWAO
**************************/

pviwao[q]=(ai+1)*t+(bi-1)*pow(t,2);

="/**************************
calculation of predicted variance TPL - POWELL
**************************/

pv powell[q]=apowell*pow(t, bpowell);

="/**************************
calculation of predicted variance IWAO - Polynomial
**************************/

pv pol[q]=apol*t+bpol*pow(t,2);

="/printf("***************\n");

} // end of loop for determining predicted variances
/***************
calculate difference between the known variance
and the predicted variance (and then square) - TPL,
Iwao, Powell, Polynomial
***************

for (q=0; q<=RNUM; q=q+1)
{
    diftpl[q]=pow((pvtpl[q]-knownvar),2);
    difiwao[q]=pow((pviwao[q]-knownvar),2);
    difpowell[q]=pow((pvpowell[q]-knownvar),2);
    difpol[q]=pow((pvpol[q]-knownvar),2);
}

/***************
calculate the relative error
***************

for (q=0; q<=RNUM; q=q+1)
{
    reltpl[q]=fabs(pvtpl[q]-knownvar)/knownvar;
    reliwao[q]=fabs(pviwao[q]-knownvar)/knownvar;
    repowell[q]=fabs(pvpowell[q]-knownvar)/knownvar;
    relpol[q]=fabs(pvpol[q]-knownvar)/knownvar;
}

/***************
sums of squares - ABSOLUTE ERROR
***************

for (q=0; q<=RNUM; q=q+1)
{
    sstpl=sstpl+diftpl[q];
    ssiwao=ssiwao+difiwao[q];
    sspowell=sspowell+difpowell[q];
    ssopol=ssopol+difpol[q];
}

/***************
sums of squares - RELATIVE ERROR
***************

for (q=0; q<=RNUM; q=q+1)
{
    rsstpl=rss tpl+rel tpl[q];
    rssiwao=rssiwao+reliwao[q];
    rsspow=rsspowell+relpowell[q];
    rsspol=rsspol+relpol[q];
}
/***************
printing of the results - known var, pred, known-pred - TPL, IWAO, Powell, Polynomial
***************

printf("the decision threshold = %.2f\n",t);
printf("known variance of the decision threshold = %.2f\n",knownvar);
printf("\n");
printf("minimum for the mean = %.2f\n",mmin);
printf("maximum for the mean = %.2f\n",mmax);
printf("\n");
printf("known variance and simulations based on constant k = %.2f\n",k);
printf("\n");
printf("data pts to estimate the mean = %i\ndata pts in mv rel = %i\n",datapt,mvnum);

/***************
print the sum of difference calculated above
***************

printf("\n");
printf("***************\n");
printf(" Model      ABSOLUTE ERROR          RELATIVE ERROR\n");
printf("\n");
printf(" TPL linear     %.2f            %.2f\n",sstpl,rsstpl);
printf(" TPL non linear %.2f            %.2f\n",sspowell,rspow);
printf(" IWAO linear   %.2f            %.2f\n",ssiwao,rssiwao);
printf(" IWAO poly     %.2f            %.2f\n",spol,rspol);

printf("***************\n");

FILE *afile;
afile=fopen(file,"w");
if (afile == NULL)
{
    printf("error to open file\n");
    getch();
    // return 1;
}

fprintf(afile,"the decision threshold = %.2f\n",t);
fprintf(afile,"known variance of the decision threshold = %.2f\n",knownvar);
fprintf(afile,"\n");
fprintf(afile,"minimum for the mean = %.2f\n",mmin);
fprintf(afile,"maximum for the mean = %.2f\n",mmax);
fprintf(afile,"\n");
fprintf(afile,"known variance and simulations based on constant k = %.2f\n",k);
fprintf(afile,"\n");
fprintf(afile,"\n");
fprintf(afile,"data pts to estimate the mean = %i

data pts in mv rel= %i
",datap,mvnum);

fprintf(afile,"n");

fprintf(afile,"***************
");

fprintf(afile," Model ERROR
");

fprintf(afile,"n");

fprintf(afile," TPL linear %.2f
TPL non linear %.2f
IWAQ linear %.2f
IWAQ poly %.2f
");

fclose(afile);

printf(" Press Return to End\n");
gets(buffer);

return;

} // end of main

/***************************************************************************/

int ngb(float mean,float k)
{
  int x;
  float px,ppx,pxsum=0,r;
  r=(float)rand()/RAND_MAX;
  x=0;
  px=1/pow((1+mean/k),k);
  ppx=mean/(mean+k);
  pxsum=px;
  if (r>px)
  {
    do{
      x++;
      px=((k+x-1)/x)*ppx*px;
      pxsum=pxsum+px;
    } while (x <= 200 && r > pxsum);
  }
  return (x);
}

void seedrnn(void)
{
  srand((unsigned)time(NULL));
}
APPENDIX B

This program calculates the expected Operating Characteristic and Average Sample Number curves for Iwao's sequential sampling plan incorporating uncertainty in the decision threshold.

*******************************************************************************

#include <stdio.h>  // other #includes to be added
#include <stdlib.h>
#include <conio.h>
#include <ctype.h>
#include <math.h>
#include <time.h>

#define ELNUM 50

int main(void);
void seedrnn(void);
int ngb(float mean,float k);

float no@oat(float mean,float sd);

int main(void)
{
    float m,maxm,minm,increment,vart,d,
         seq1,ter1,totcnt,sum,slu,sll,xbar,seqoc,
         avgsmp,z,cum,t,teroc,oc,k,tsydam;

    int priorn,nmax,j,end,count,element;
    long mci,i;

    char file[12];

    // ***
    int ipv,mcipv;

    // gets program to pause before ending
    char buffer[12];

    // *** start *********** variables uncertain threshold
// variables for the input file
float mmin,mmax,slope,intercept,stdev,ydam;

// variables for preliminary calculations
float minct;

// counter variables
int rowm,colm,q,dnum;

// variables for the regression
float sx2r,bsxb2r,xy,xsum,ysum,xmean,ymean,at,bt,tt;

// *** end variable uncertain threshold *********

/* definition of arrays */

float *mc,
    *asncf,
    *seqcf,
    *tercf,
    *occf,
    *pv,
    *th,
    *x,
    *yran,
    *ypred;

/* explanation of arrays*/

/*

asncf[] - holds the values of the final ASN curve
seqcf[] - holds the values of the final Sequential OC curve
tercf[] - holds the values of the final Terminal OC curve
occf[] - holds the values of the final OC curve
*/
code to create an output file
*/
FILE *afile,*inparms,*inparmsb,*afileb;

******************************************************************************
obtain necessary data
******************************************************************************

/ * read inputs from a file */
if ( inparms=fopen("wa3.txt","r")==NULL) exit(1);

fscanf(inparms,"%s",file); // reads file name
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&k);    // reads negative binomial k
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&z);   // reads z = 1.645
fscanf(inparms,"%i",&pricorn); // reads prior number of samples taken
fscanf(inparms,"%i",&nmax);     // reads maximum sample size
fscanf(inparms,"%i",&mci);    // reads number of MCI
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&minm); // reads minimum for means simulated
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&maxm); // reads maximum for means simulated
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&t);     // decision threshold
fscanf(inparms,"%i",&mcipv); // number of mc iterations
fclose(inparms);

if( inparmsb=fopen("in.txt","r")==NULL) exit(1);

fscanf(inparms,"%s",file);       // file name
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&slope);    // slope of damage v. density regression
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&intercept); // intercept of damage v. density regression
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&stdev);     // standard deviation of damage v. density regression
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&mmin);      // minimum for range of means
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&mmax);      // maximum for range of means
fscanf(inparms,"%f",&ydam);      // damage threshold
fscanf(inparms,"%f", &sdydam); // sd of damage threshold
fscanf(inparms,"%i", &dnum);  // N in den-dam regression

close(inparmsb);

/****************************************************************************
pre-simulation calculations
****************************************************************************/

if (occf=(float *)malloc((ELNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("occf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if (tercf=(float *)malloc((ELNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("tercf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if (seqcf=(float *)malloc((ELNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("seqcf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if (asncf=(float *)malloc((ELNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("asncf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if (mc=(float *)malloc((ELNUM+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("mc allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if (pv=(float *)malloc((mcipv+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("pv allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

// arrays for vn

if (th=(float *)malloc((mcipv+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("mc allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

// set arrays dynamically - threshold uncertainty

if (x=(float *)malloc((dnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("asncf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}
if (ypred=(float *)malloc((dnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("asncf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

if (yran=(float *)malloc((dnum+1)*sizeof(float)))==NULL) {
    printf("asncf allocation failed\n");
    exit(1);
}

/* ------------------------------------------

presimulation calculations

******************************************/

/*@ calculate the size of the increments between the minimum and maximum means to be simulated *
*/
increment=0;
increment=(maxm-minm)/ELNUM;       // formula for increment size
printf("increment= %.3f\n",increment);

/*----------------------------------------------------------------------

initialize the arrays

**************************************************************************/

for (ipv=0;ipv<=mcipv;ipv=ipv+1) {
    asncf[element]=0;
    seqcf[element]=0;
    tercf[element]=0;
    occf[element]=0;
}

/*----------------------------------------------------------------------

simulations

**************************************************************************/

/* initialize the random number generator*/
seedrn();

// ******************************************************
// START - threshold generation - START
// ******************************************************

// initialize variables

tt=0;
xmean=0;
ymean=0;
sx2r=0;
bsxb2r=0;
xy=0;
at=0;
bv=0;
xsum=0;
ysum=0;

rowm=0;
colm=0;
count=0;
q=0;

// initialize arrays

for (rowm=0; rowm<dnum; rowm=rowm+1)
{
    x[rowm]=0;
ypred[rowm]=0;
yran[rowm]=0;
}

/****************************
calculate the increment in meansrom the minimum mean to the maximum mean
***************************/

minct=(mmmax-mmmin)/(dnum-1);

/****************************
calculate the 'X' values of the
damage vs density relationship
***************************/

for (rowm=0; rowm<dnum; rowm=rowm+1)
{
    x[rowm]=mmmin+rowm*minct;
}
/***************
calculate the predicted 'Y' values of the
damage vs density relationship
***************/*

for (rowm=0;rowm<dnum;rowm=rowm+1)
{
    ypred[rowm]=slope*x[rowm]+intercept;
}

for (ipv=0;ipv<mcipv;ipv=ipv+1) // MCI loop for pred. var.
{

    // reset values to zero
    for (rowm=0;rowm<dnum;rowm=rowm+1)
    {
        yran[rowm]=0;
    }

    tt=0;
    at=0;
    ht=0;
    xmean=0;
    ymean=0;
    sx2r=0;
    xy=0;
    xsum=0;
    ysum=0;

    // generate random data for the 'Y' values

    for (rowm=0;rowm<dnum;rowm=rowm+1)
    {
        yran[rowm]=nor(ypred[rowm],stdev);
    }

/*********************/
perform preliminary - calculations for the linear regression
*********************/

for (count = 0 ; count<dnum ; count=count+1)
{
    xmean=xmean+x[count];
    ymean=ymean+yran[count];
    sx2r=sx2r+pow(x[count],2);
}

xsum=xmean;
ysum=ymean;
xmean=xmean/dnum;
ymean=ymean/dnum;

bsxb2r= pow(xsum,2);

for (count = 0 ; count<dnum ; count=count+1) 
{
    xy=xy+(x[count]*yran[count]);
}

.fullName="calculation of the intercept 'b' - TPL
.fullName="****************/

bt = (dnum*xy -xsum*ysum)/(dnum*sx2r-bsxb2r);

.fullName="calculation of the intercept 'a' - TPL
.fullName="**********/

at= ymean - bt*xmean;

.fullName="calculation of the threshold
.fullName="******************/

tt=(nor(ydam,sdydam)-at)/bt;

th[ipv]=tt; // *************** check counter
printf("%.2f\n",th[ipv]);
afileb=fopen("thres.out","w");
if(afileb==NULL)
{
    printf("error to open thres.out\n");
    getch();
    return 1;
}

for (ipv=0;ipv<mcipv;ipv=ipv+1) // MCI loop for pred. var.
{
    fprintf(afileb,"%.2f\n",th[ipv]);
}

fclose(afileb);

// ***********************************************
// END - threshold generation - END
// ***********************************************

//loop over means (element0 is the index throughout)
for(element=0;element<=ELNUM;++element)
{
    m=minm+element*increment; // mean value

    // set counters to zero
    seql = 0;
    terl = 0;
    totcnt = 0;

    // Monte Carlo loop
    for (i=0;i<mc1; i++)
    {
        t=th[i];
        vart=t+(t*)/k;
        sum = 0;
        end = 0;
        // loop to sample population 'priorn' times before using stop lines
        for (j=0;j<priorn;j++)
        {
            sum += ngb(m,k);
        }
count=prim;

if (prim==0) {

    sum += ngb(m,k);
    count=count+1;
}

cum=t*count;

// compare samples to stop lines
do {
    d=z*sqrt(count*vart);
    slu=cum+d;
    sll=cum-d;

    if (sum>slu || sum<sll) // is Tn between the thresholds?
        { 
            end=1;
            totcnt = totcnt + count;
            if (sum<sll) {
                seql = seql + 1;
            }
        }
    else if (count>=nmax)
        { 
            end=1;
            xbar = sum/count;
            totcnt = totcnt + count;
            if (xbar<t) {
                terl = terl + 1;
            }
        }
    else { // take another sample, and test again
        rand_el=rand()*scale;
        sum += ngb(m,k);
        count=count+1;
        cum=t*count;
    }
} while (end==0);

// the boundary or the maximum sample size has
// has been reached or one of the boundaries has
// been crossed. The program starts the next
// Monte Carlo iteration at the same mean and
// threshold. ***Monte Carlo for loop***
/***********************compute OC and ASN values*********************** /
seqoc = seql/(float)mci;
teroc = terl/(float)mci;
oc = seqoc+teroc;
avgsmp = totcnt/(float)mci;

printf("****n");

/********************write results to screen and arrays********************/
asnccf[element]=avgsmp;
seqccf[element]=seqoc;
terccf[element]=teroc;
occif[element]=oc;
mc[element]=m;
printf("%.2flt%.3flt%.3flt%.3flt%.3f\n",m,seqoc,teroc,oc,avgsmp);

}    // element loop.

/* simulation ends*/
afiel=fopen("woc.out","w");
if( afiel == NULL)
{
   printf("error to open woc.out\n");
   getch();
   return 1;
}

{
for(element=0;element<=ELNUM;element++)
{
   fprintf(afiel,"%8.3f %8.3f %8.3f\n",mc[element],occif[element],asnccf[element]);
}
}
fclose(afiel);
printf("Press RETURN to end\n");
gets(buffer);

return(0);

}    // } deleted sample loop

}    // main
int ngb(float mean, float k)
{
    int x;
    float px, ppx, pxsum = 0, r;
    r = (float)rand() / RAND_MAX;
    x = 0;
    px = 1 / pow((1 + mean / k), k);
    ppx = mean / (mean + k);
    pxsum = px;
    if (r > px)
    {
        do{
            x++;
            px = ((k + x - 1) / x) * ppx * px;
            pxsum = pxsum + px;
        } while (x <= 200 && r > pxsum);
    }
    return (x);
}

void seedrn(v)
{
    srand((unsigned)time(NULL));
}

/**************************************************************************/
sub routine to calculate the random data
that have a normal distribution
with a specified mean and standard deviation
***************************************************************************/

float nor(float mean, float sd)
{
    float r1, r2, y, xmn1, ya, yb;
    r1 = (float)rand() / RAND_MAX;
    if (r1 < 0)
    {
        r1 = 0.000000001;
    }
    if (r1 > 1.0)
    {
        r1 = 0.9999999999;
    }
    r2 = (float)rand() / RAND_MAX;
    ya = sqrt(-2 * log(r1));
    yb = cos(6.283 * r2);
    y = ya * yb;
    xmn1 = mean + y * sd;
    return (xmn1);
}
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

ProQuest Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600
Seeking Flexibility:  

by

Carl Drouin

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Department of Geography
University of Toronto

© Copyright by Carl Drouin 2001
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.
Seeking Flexibility:  
The Rise of New Forms of Work in  
Large Canadian Urban Areas (1971-1996)  
Carl Drouin  
Doctor of Philosophy  
Department of Geography  
University of Toronto  

ABSTRACT  
This thesis is concerned with the recent rise of flexibility within Canadian labour markets. The analyses of trends towards a greater use of atypical forms of working arrangements seek to highlight both the extent of that transformation and the factors influencing it. In adopting a combination of theoretical approaches, it is argued that the rise of flexible working practices in the workplace is best conceptualised when features of the demand side and supply side are considered in combination at the local scale. Such an approach is tested through two empirical studies. The first case study of part-time employment in Montréal investigates the processes that, from a supply side perspective, are producing flexible tendencies in labour practices. It is notably found that levels and growth of part-time employment are influenced by pre-existing concrete structures of urban labour markets such as the industrial and occupational structures of cities and their socio-cultural context. Second, through a case study of Toronto firms, the role of demand side factors is documented by exploring the actions and perceptions of life insurers in terms of labour flexibility. This case study found that recent expansion of flexible work practices in the life insurance business is the result of corporate strategies developed in the face of growing competition, and of employers’ willingness to adapt to certain needs of flexibility on the part of their employees.  

KEY WORDS  
Flexibility, local labour markets, Canada, restructuring, post-Fordism
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Going through the process of doctoral studies and completing my thesis was only made possible with the help and support of a number of people whose contribution I wish to acknowledge. First, I would like to thank Larry Bourne, the thesis supervisor, for his careful reading of earlier drafts, for his feedback and especially for the strong support he has demonstrated in the late stages of completing this Ph.D. Gunter Gad also deserves special thanks for his supervising work, availability and kindness. To the other members of my thesis committee: Sue Ruddick, Robert Lewis, Meric Gertler and Damaris Rose thank you for your comments and suggestions throughout the different writing stages.

I am grateful to members of the life insurance industry interviewed for a part of this research. The time they took for answering my questions and the information they provided me with was most valuable. Thank you also to Richard Shearmur and William Coffey for providing me with special tabulations of data that were essential for this study. Most of the financial support for this project came from the Government of Québec’s FCAR fund. The Ontario Graduate Scholarship Program and the School of Graduate Studies at the University of Toronto provided complementary means of funding. I am grateful to each of these organisations for their help.

Thanks to my friends and graduate school colleagues Joe Leibovitz, Kieran Donoghue, Joe Leydon, Ricardo Gomez, Damian Dupuy, Willie Jenkins and Mark Pfeifer. I surely learned as much from you in 615 and over beers on Friday afternoons as I did in any classroom. Many of you have reviewed my written work and guided me with the use of statistical methods (thanks Ricardo!). This assistance was very much appreciated. Des remerciements particuliers à Marc Despatie, qui dès mon arrivée a su
être un ami fiable. Je te suis particulièrement reconnaissant des efforts que tu as déployés pour corriger mes textes en anglais. I would also like to thank Laine Ruus of the data library. Her dedicated work and constant assistance were essential for the completion of this study.

De toutes les personnes qui m’ont assisté au cours de mes études supérieures, Nadine, ma compagne, ma blonde, mon amour, tu es celle qui mérite le plus ma reconnaissance et mes remerciements. À défaut de m’être intégré à la société torontoise, j’ai pu, grâce à ta présence, m’en accommoder. Je te remercie plus particulièrement pour ta patience, ta compréhension, ton courage, et bien entendu, ton amour.

Finalement, je souhaite remercier ma mère. Maman, les mots me manquent pour te remercier de ce que tu m’as donné et appris. Avant toute chose, tu as su me donner la liberté et la confiance nécessaires à mon accomplissement. C’est cette liberté et cette confiance qui m’ont non seulement permis d’écrire cette thèse, mais bien avant, ce sont elles qui sont à la source de mon désir de découvrir.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgments .................................................................................................................................. iii
Table of Contents ................................................................................................................................. v
List of Figures .......................................................................................................................................... vii
List of Tables ........................................................................................................................................ viii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 1
1.0 RESEARCH CONTEXT ..................................................................................................................... 1
1.1 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES ............................................................................................................... 5
1.2 BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE ................................................................................................. 6
1.3 STRUCTURE OF THE DISSERTATION ............................................................................................. 12

CHAPTER TWO: THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES ON RESTRUCTURING AND THE RISE OF FLEXIBLE WORK .................................................................................................................... 16
2.1 THE POST-FORDIST DEBATE ........................................................................................................ 18
  2.1.1 Regulation Theory and Restructuring .................................................................................. 18
  2.1.2 Seeking Flexibility .................................................................................................................... 29
2.2 UNDERSTANDING THE RISE OF PART-TIME WORK ................................................................... 37
2.3 SELF-EMPLOYMENT: ALTERNATIVES TO UNEMPLOYMENT, JOB SEGREGATION AND OPPORTUNITIES ................................................................................................................................. 43
2.4 CONCEPTUAL LINKAGES BETWEEN THE DEMAND FOR, AND THE SUPPLY OF, FLEXIBLE WORKERS: A SEGMENTATION APPROACH TO LOCAL LABOUR MARKETS ........................................................................... 49

CHAPTER THREE: NEW FORMS OF WORK IN CANADA’S AFTER-FORDISM: THE CONTEXT OF CHANGE FOR LABOUR .................................................................................................................... 58
3.1 SOCIAL AND DEMOGRAPHIC TRENDS: CHANGING THE WORKFORCE COMPOSITION .......... 58
3.2 CANADA’S ECONOMIC RESTRUCTURING AND POLICY RESPONSES ...................................... 68
  3.2.1 An Economic System in Transition ....................................................................................... 69
  3.2.2 Policy Changes .......................................................................................................................... 80
3.3 SUMMARY ........................................................................................................................................ 90

CHAPTER FOUR: THE DEVELOPMENT OF FLEXIBLE WORK IN CANADA (1971-1996) ......................................................................................................................................................... 91
4.1 THE RISE OF ATYPICAL FORMS OF WORK IN CANADA SINCE THE EARLY 1970S .............. 92
4.2 THE FLEXIBILISATION OF URBAN LABOUR MARKETS ................................................................. 111
  4.2.1 Self-Employment in Metropolitan Areas .............................................................................. 117
  4.2.2 Part-Time Work in Metropolitan Areas .............................................................................. 126
4.3 THE UNEVEN DEVELOPMENT OF AFTER-FORDIST LOCAL LABOUR MARKETS .................. 131

v
CHAPTER FIVE: NEW ECONOMY? NEW FLEXIBLE WORKERS? THE CASE OF PART-TIME WORK IN MONTRÉAL ........................................... 140

5.1 Montréal’s Changing Position ................................................................................................................. 141
5.2 Male and Female Part-Timers: Converging Experiences ............................................................................. 145
5.3 Changing Characteristics of Part-Time Workers in Montréal (1971-1996) ................................................. 154
5.4 Discussion: Factors Influencing the Development of Part-Time Work in Montréal .............................. 161
  5.4.1 Montréal’s Historically Lower Levels of Part-Time Work ................................................................. 163
  5.4.2 Montréal’s Faster Growth of Female Part-Time Work ............................................................................. 171

CHAPTER SIX: WORK PRACTICES IN THE TORONTO LIFE INSURANCE INDUSTRY: THE EMPLOYERS’ PERSPECTIVE ON FLEXIBILITY ..... 181

6.0 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 181
6.1 Profile of the Canadian Life Insurance Industry ......................................................................................... 183
6.2 The Entrenchment of Cost-Efficient Employment Practices in the Industry ............................................. 191
6.3 The Causes of Accelerating Labour Flexibility ......................................................................................... 199
6.4. A Bright Side to Flexibility ....................................................................................................................... 209
6.5 Challenges for the Future of Flexible Labour Markets ............................................................................... 216

CHAPTER SEVEN: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS .......................................................... 222

7.0 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 222
7.1 Summary of Research Findings ................................................................................................................ 224
  7.1.1 Approaching Local Labour Market Change ......................................................................................... 224
  7.1.2 Identifying Factors Responsible For the Flexibilisation of Urban Labour Markets ......................... 226
  7.1.3 The Role of Pre-Existing Concrete Structures ...................................................................................... 229
  7.1.4 Between the Competitive Environment and the Needs of Workers ..................................................... 231
7.2 The New Social Order of After-Fordism in Canada ..................................................................................... 232
  7.2.1 Women and Men’s Changing Work Environments .................................................................................. 234
  7.2.2 The Changing Place of Women at Home ................................................................................................. 239
7.3 Conclusion: Some Implications of Canada’s ‘Defensive’ Flexibility ....................................................... 243

LIST OF REFERENCES ........................................................................................................................... 248
APPENDIX A ............................................................................................................................................. 271
APPENDIX B ............................................................................................................................................. 276
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Post-Fordist Industrial Relations ................................................................. 34

Figure 3.1: Unemployment Rates in Canada, 1946-1999 ............................................. 71
Figure 3.2: Real Per Capita GDP and Real Average Family Income in Canada, 1967-1994 ...... 77
Figure 3.3: Evolution of the Employment/Population Ratio* in Canada, 1976-1999 ............. 83
Figure 3.4: Actual B/U Ratio (1976-1997) and Calculated Program Changes
Component (1990-1997) .............................................................................................. 88

Figure 4.1: Growth of Part-Time Employment in Canada (1976-1999) ......................... 95
Figure 4.2: Changes in the Distribution of Usual Weekly Work Hours, Employees
25 Years of Age and Older by Gender ........................................................................... 98
Figure 4.3: Percentage of Labour Force Involved in Paid and Unpaid Overtime Work
by Occupation (Canada, 1997) ..................................................................................... 100
Figure 4.4: Change in Share of Employment* Among Largest Ten CMAs (1971-1996) ........ 116
Figure 4.5: Ranking of Employment by Classes of Workers in Largest Ten CMAs, 1996 .... 119
Figure 4.6: Employment Growth Rates for Largest Ten CMAs, by Classes of Workers
and by Periods (1971-1996) ...................................................................................... 121
Figure 4.7: Ranking of Part-Time Work by Gender in Largest Ten CMAs, 1971 and 1996 .... 127
Figure 4.8: Growth Rates of Part-Time Work in Top Ten CMAs by Periods (1971-1996) .... 129
Figure 4.9: Movement Towards a Service Employment Structure .................................. 133

Figure 5.1: Participation Rates by Gender, Canada (1970-1999) .................................... 147
Figure 5.2: Selected Occupations as a Share of Experienced Labour Force in Montréal,
Toronto and Vancouver CMAs, 1971 .......................................................................... 165
Figure 5.3: Share of Employment by Industrial Sectors in Montréal CMA (1996) .......... 166
Figure 5.4: Women’s Participation Rate for Selected CMAs, 1971-1996 ....................... 168
Figure 5.5: Development of Part-Time Employment in Montréal and Other Large CMAs,
1971-1996 .................................................................................................................. 172
Figure 5.6: Decennial Growth Rates of Employment by Industry in the Montréal CMA
(1971-1996) .............................................................................................................. 174
Figure 5.7: Fast and Slow Growing Sectors in Montréal (1981-1996) ......................... 177
Figure 5.8: White, Grey and Blue Collar Employment Growth Rates in Canada’s Largest
Ten CMAs (1971-1996) ............................................................................................. 178

Figure 6.1: Growth of GDP in Selected Industries, Canada (1961-1998) ....................... 186
Figure 6.2: Employment Growth in Canadian Financial Services and Other Selected
Sectors, 1986-1996 .................................................................................................... 187
Figure 6.3: Life and Health Insurance Personnel in Canada (1970-1997) ...................... 188
Figure 6.4: Provincial Distribution of Employees in the Life and Health Insurance Industry,
Canada (1997) ........................................................................................................... 189
Figure 6.5: Composition of Premium Income of Life and Health Insurers, Canada (1970-1997). 201
Figure 6.6: Potential for Job Mobility in the Toronto Financial Industry ...................... 220

Figure 7.1: The Changing Gender Structure of Employment ............................................ 237
LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Changes in the Sectoral Structure of Employment in Canada, 1971-1996 ......................................................... 75
Table 3.2: Change in the Beneficiary/Employed Ratio by Province (1989-1997) ................................................................. 89

Table 4.1: Percentage of Flextime by Gender, 1991 and 1995 .................................................................................. 104
Table 4.2: Growth of Self-Employment by Category (1980-1996) ........................................................................... 108
Table 4.3: Percentages of Self-Employment by Gender (1971-1996) ........................................................................ 109
Table 4.4: Employed Labour Force for the Ten Largest CMAs in Canada (1971-1996) .............................................. 114

Table 5.1: Principal Occupations of Women and Men in Canada, 1996 ................................................................. 149
Table 5.2: Full-Time Employment in Canada, 1976-1999 .................................................................................. 152
Table 5.3: Log-Linear Model of Odds of Working Part-Time in Montréal CMA (1971-1996) – Part I ... 156
Table 5.4: Log-Linear Model of Odds of Working Part-Time in Montréal CMA (1971-1996) – Part II .. 159
Table 5.5: Log-Linear Model of Odds of Working Part-Time in Montréal CMA (1971-1996) – Part III. 160
Table 5.6: Part-Time Employment in Québec in 1976 and 1995, According to Sex and Reasons for Working Part-Time............................................................... 169
Table 5.7: Employment in Selected Manufacturing Industries in Montréal and Toronto CMAs (1971-1991) .................................................................................. 175

Table 6.1: Canada’s Ten Largest Life Insurance Firms and their Share of the Industry (1997) ............... 184
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Research Context

Industrialised nations have experienced a series of important economic upturns and downturns, and relatively little economic stability, over the past two decades. The short periods of time separating the recession of the early 1980s, that of the early 1990s and the Asian crisis of 1995-96, best illustrate this volatile reality, and contrast sharply with the relative economic stability of the earlier post-World War II period. Across a wide array of social science disciplines, researchers have raised a number of questions regarding the reasons behind these conditions and their implications for economic development and for society writ large.

For instance, much has been said about the emergence of a new political economic system. Concepts such as competitiveness (Drache and Gertler, 1991, Schoenberger, 1994), economic globalisation (Hirst and Thompson, 1996, Kiely, 1998, Ohmae, 1991) and flexible production (Piore and Sabel, 1984, Pollard and Storper, 1996), which are said to have *restructured* the way in which the modern economy operates, lie at the heart of these debates. In geography, many different perspectives have been brought to bear on the topic of the emergence of this new political economic system.
Economic geographers especially have contributed to the study of the development of industrial districts and to flexible production, one of their key characteristics (see for example Amin, 1999, Amin and Robins, 1990, Cooke, 1997, Gertler, 1992, Scott, 1988, Storper, 1997a). Social and urban geographers have, for their part, focused on the effects of restructuring on people’s lives and, in particular, on different segments of the working population (see Hanson and Pratt, 1995, McDowell, 1997, Massey 1984/1995, Villeneuve and Rose, 1995). A third group of geographers has approached the recent economic change from an entirely different theoretical perspective, looking mainly at the shift from a manufacturing-based economy to a service-based one (see Beyers and Lindahl, 1999, Christopherson, 1989, Coffey, 1996, 2000, Daniels, 1985). While the overarching theories have mostly been set in the context of the economic development of the United States, of the United Kingdom, or of other European countries; many of the debates have been carried on in the Canadian context as well (for a complete review of recent “Canadian economic geographical research”, see Barnes et al., 2000).

In building on these research efforts to document the restructuring process, the current dissertation examines an aspect of the structural transformation of labour markets in Canada from the beginning of the 1970s to the mid-1990s. In particular, I emphasise the changing ways in which a growing portion of the employed population is participating in this newly-structured labour market as flexible workers.

Flexible Labour

As part of the on-going discussion regarding restructuring, considerable attention has already been directed to the growth of so-called ‘flexible labour’ (Carnoy et al., 1997, Filion and Rutherford, 2000, Gregory, 1998). Two types of labour flexibility are
commonly identified in the scholarly literature (see Gertler, 1988, Holmes, 1997). The first is functional flexibility, a strategy that enables employers to use the same workers to execute a variety of tasks. This type of flexibility is often achieved in conjunction with the implementation of new technology. The second form, called numerical flexibility, is an ensemble of labour practices that provides employers with the possibility to reduce or expand their workforces according to variations in their production needs. This thesis is essentially concerned with the latter type, although some reference will be made to the former as well. Generally speaking, numerically flexible working arrangements include part-time work, sub-contracting and temporary employment, but, in some cases, researchers have extended their analyses to include workers who perform overtime work, flextime, telecommuting, and shift work.

Implicit in this definition of flexible work are two important assumptions: firstly, there is a temporal implication, as these practices are assumed flexible in comparison to more rigid work arrangements of an earlier period. Flexible work, therefore, is a feature of an emerging production system that is distinct from the one in place from the years following the Second World War to the early 1970s. Secondly, there exists a conceptual bias in the duality between flexibility and rigidity, as both essentially refer to the conditions of the labour market from the perspective of firms. A demand-driven definition views labour flexibility as something that employers request of their workforce in order to gain some benefits. These benefits, are, for instance, the productivity gains

---

1 Definitions of flexibility and labour flexibility may vary from one theoretical perspective to another. More detail regarding these definitions is provided in the second chapter.

2 The terms “demand” and “supply” may induce some confusion in the context of labour markets. For instance, depending on the point of view (employers / workers), the demand conditions may consist of either the economic environment of employers (i.e. the conditions affecting the demand for workers) or, conversely, the broad social and economic conditions of workers (i.e. the conditions affecting the demand for work). In the present research, employment is conceived as a commodity for employers. Therefore, the demand side of labour refers to the ‘production’ environment of employers, while the supply side of labour describes workers’ conditions in the labour market.
engendered by the use of specialised sub-contractors or the savings (in pay and benefits) related to utilising temporary or part-time workers to adjust to production needs. In contrast, the rigidity of the typical working arrangement, permanent full-time work, is conceptualised in terms of the limitations associated with such a practice. Namely, it forces employers to guarantee long term income and employment security.

In the mass media and other research, another definition of labour flexibility has often been employed. It associates the term flexibility with the ways in which workers adapt their working life to suit their personal needs. In essence, working practices such as part-time work, self-employment, job sharing, flextime, and shift work are seen as offering the advantage of balancing work and domestic life, and as representing a flexible alternative to ‘regular’ work.

One problem with the existence of these two opposite conceptions of flexible employment is that they sometimes co-exist in the real world, while conceptual constructions seem to highlight only one of the two perspectives. For instance, in the popular literature, self-employment is depicted as an option for workers to make better use of their human capital and sometimes benefit from certain scheduling freedom. Conversely, academic research has shown that firms tend to employ a growing number of sub-contractors, sometimes small self-employed firms, partly in order to better adapt to an irregular demand for products and services. Obviously, in these two cases, the meanings of the term ‘labour flexibility’ are different, but both translate into the same phenomenon: self-employment.

As a consequence, and notwithstanding the question of which of the firms or the workers benefit from flexibility, this study considers the term ‘flexible labour’ to be a
collection of employment relationships that deviate from what was perceived as typical employment during the post-war period. These working patterns are most commonly referred to as ‘atypical’, ‘new’, or ‘non-standard’, in order to mark their distinctiveness from the more traditional and typical full-time and permanent employment of the former period.

1.1 Research Objectives

Recognising the existence of these two perspectives on the rise of new forms of work, this research focuses on the development of labour market flexibility as an outcome of processes affecting both the demand for, and the supply of, labour. The analysis of recent labour market restructuring in Canada provides an opportunity to empirically investigate the role of social and economic forces at various scales in developing or intensifying certain labour practices.

Furthermore, I place this investigation in the context of local labour markets to account for qualitative as well as quantitative differences in the ‘flexibilisation’ of labour in different urban places. These general research objectives give rise to the following specific objectives and related research questions:

1. To document the extent of the shift from ‘standard’ labour practices to more flexible forms of work in Canada, and among its largest urban labour markets. To what extent has the growth of different forms of flexible employment been felt in Canada in the aggregate, as well as among its ten largest Census Metropolitan Areas (CMAs hereafter)?

2. Based on a case study of part-time employment in Montréal, to study the processes that, from a supply side perspective, are producing flexible tendencies in labour
practices. Has the socio-economic composition (age, gender, occupation, etc.) of part-time workers changed in the past twenty-five years? How might this be related to pre-existing structures in Montréal’s economy and in society?

3. To investigate the role of demand side factors by documenting the actions and perceptions of life insurers in terms of labour flexibility, through a case study of Toronto firms. To what extent have labour practices become more flexible in recent years? What are the perceived forces behind this transformation?

In addition, I situate the research within a historical perspective, by identifying the significance of the transformation and the characteristics that set it apart from the previous era. I argue that one must not only focus on the employers’ strategies and requirements to interpret shifts in labour practices, but that the broader context of change within specific urban labour markets also has to be considered. From that perspective, the increase of flexible forms of work can, on one hand, be linked to the economic transition that includes the intensification of international trade and the reorganisation of production. On the other hand, this process may be seen as a reflection of the changing composition and needs of the labour force and of the ever-changing position of social groups within local labour markets.

1.2 Background and Rationale

Having introduced the general context and the broad objectives of the study, I shall now turn to a more detailed presentation of the rationale behind this dissertation.
**Why Labour Flexibility in Canada?**

Compared with those of the golden era of capitalism which lasted from the end of the Second World War to around the mid-1970s, today's paid workers are far less likely to be involved in full-time permanent work. Evidence indicates that the proportion of workers who have been engaged in other, often contingent, forms of work arrangements has increased in most developed states, especially over the past thirty years (Delsen, 1995, OECD, 1997, Zeytinoglu, 1999). The importance of debating trends of labour flexibilisation can be demonstrated at three analytical levels:

This study is motivated, in the first instance, by the need to verify whether the trends toward labour flexibilisation observed elsewhere can also be observed in Canada. In recent years, many national labour markets have experienced major structural changes. Much of the literature on flexible production and labour flexibility assumes that the emergence of right-leaning political ideology, and its supporting economic system (often termed neo-liberalism), has played a role in this specific development within the labour market. From a Canadian point of view, one problem with such interpretations is that a large share of these studies are based on the British or American experiences. Yet, until the 1990s at least, there is no clear evidence that Canada had undergone the kind of political economic shift that would have been accompanied by a significant expansion of flexible forms of employment, such as that observed in those two countries (Jenson, 1989a).

Second, as discussed above, while academic circles have primarily portrayed labour flexibility as detrimental to labour, it is clear (especially in the mass media) that

---

3 Neo-Liberalism is also referred to as 'Neo-Conservatism' and 'Liberal Productivism'.

flexible working arrangements may also be viewed as a benefit. Forms of flexible employment, such as part-time and flextime, may also be beneficial to employees as they provide certain freedoms for balancing paid work and personal life. For employers, the decision to provide flexible working arrangements is not always driven by cost-saving considerations, but can more simply reflect their desire to accommodate employees, even when conditions of labour demand may be more suitable to traditional (and rigid) patterns of labour utilisation. Under such circumstances, flexible employment illustrates the progress made by labour rather than a more passive reaction to the changing needs of employers.

Third, beyond these methodological and theoretical considerations, the study of labour market flexibility raises important issues for society in general, most particularly with regard to the distribution of wealth. In many cases, changes in working patterns reflect the declining position of segments of the labour market (e.g. youth, immigrants, and women) in terms of participation rates, unemployment and income; and, may, therefore, have important implications for the ability of those groups to function in society. With the rise of a political economic ideology that gives prominence to the development of more competitive and more efficient firms, there is a sense that such competitiveness and efficiency are being achieved with the ‘help’ of labour. Under most scenarios, labour flexibility represents a way for companies to limit labour input and, thus, to reduce costs. This is especially the case for numerical flexibility. As more and more workers are engaged in such work practices their work period is being reduced or increased on a daily, weekly, monthly, yearly basis, and even throughout the course of their entire ‘worklife’.
The consequences for income distribution and for approaches to work management are important given the growing size of the contingent labour force. As Bennett Harrison (1994) rightly points out, such massive shifts in labour practices will strengthen existing trends towards the polarisation of income (MacLachlan and Sawada, 1997, Morissette et al., 1993) and the development of an “hourglass society”. While Canada has made considerable gains since the 1950s in terms of the (re)distribution of wealth, issues regarding the level of inequities among groups (including groups of workers) and among places will become increasingly important social concerns, especially if the trends toward labour flexibility continue to evolve as they recently have been.

*Why Consider Supply Side Factors?*

Given the bias towards a demand side point of view in analysis of the overall process of flexibilisation, the intention to also consider labour supply side factors offers a second motivation for the present dissertation. Discussed at length in the literature, is the role of new economic conditions which have given rise to the demand for more flexible workers through processes of industrial and institutional restructuring. In general, the extensive emphasis on the concept of flexibility in explaining the shift in labour practices among enterprises (see for example Aglietta, 1976/1997, Atkinson and Meager, 1986) seems to have diverted our attention away from other possible explanations for the growth of new forms of work. Although this explanation has its merits, it fails to consider the active role of workers whose attributes, needs and aspirations also change over time, with the result that the nature of labour market supply is in constant mutation. Therefore, in addition to economic shifts, the changing demographic and social structures of
industrialised societies are creating new conditions that affect the way labour practices evolve.

One particular aspect that has generally been overlooked in theories of labour change until recently is the role of gender. While feminist research has clearly demonstrated the need to incorporate existing sexual divisions of labour into analyses of labour market transformations, these have yet to become an integral part of most approaches. For instance, the fact that most new jobs are created in female-dominated service industries (e.g. retail and business services) is often neglected as analyses largely focus on private sector (Reimer, 1994, 1999) male-dominated manufacturing industries. Therefore, as argued by several scholars (Christopherson, 1989, McDowell, 1991, 1997, Pratt, 1990), outside of research adopting a feminist or gender perspectives, gender issues have been regarded as outcomes of economic restructuring, in spite of their integral role within this process. To overcome this drawback of restructuring theories, this study draws on feminist research to acknowledge the ways in which groups of men and women have experienced labour market transformation differently. Not only does this study imply that descriptions of labour market restructuring can only be fully understood through a careful description of women's and men's varied work experiences, but it also recognises that changing labour and domestic relations have helped shape the recent transformation of work.

Why Urban Labour Markets?

Comparative studies on the growth of flexible forms of employment have primarily used national-level aggregate data which only consider large and heterogeneous groups of workers. Differences that could be attributed to the specificity of intra-national
environments and markets are generally ignored. There are arguments, however, for proposing that differences do matter at the level of local labour markets and that these differences are the product of locally constructed processes (Theodore and Peck, 1999), or at least of the intersection of global, national, and local forces (Bourne, 1996).

First, couched within the broad research agenda involved in investigating the respective roles of supply and demand that underpin labour flexibilisation is the role of factors operating at the local scale in this process. In this thesis, the local scale is broadly defined as an urban labour market, and more precisely, refers to the metropolitan economy of the largest cities in Canada. Thus, I employ the concept of Census Metropolitan Areas (CMAs) to define these localities. It is the contention of this thesis that localities influence the direction and intensity of trends toward flexibility through the characteristics that define them. These characteristics include the social and political institutions that have a say in the social and economic development, such as local and provincial governments, unions, and social groups defending the rights of specific segments of the labour market. As well, they include the attributes of local workforces. In this regard, the age structure (Ledent, 1999), education level (McCall, 2000), industrial and occupational structures, dominant social divisions of labour, and cultural practices of a given place, all have an impact on the specific development of the labour market. While not all of these characteristics can possibly be accounted for in detail throughout this study, they must be given a significant place in the conceptual construction of labour flexibilisation.

Secondly, large urban agglomerations continue to play a greater role in the restructuring of employment than smaller labour markets. In an “archipelago-like” economy (Veltz, 1999), in which growth tends to concentrate in only certain locations,
the economic and social diversity of large urban agglomerations provides the spatial context for the development of 'polarised' labour markets. In cities of international level, this is evident primarily through the parallel development of high-and-low-order service occupations. Arguably, similar processes of fragmentation also occur within national and regional centres in order to compete with other metropolitan economies of the same size range, so that the national or continental set of urban places is developing into a more polarised system.

1.3 Structure of the Dissertation

This study is divided into seven chapters. Chapter Two introduces a conceptual framework that lies at the intersection of three theoretical perspectives employed for the study of economic restructuring. These three approaches are critically analysed in succession. Firstly, the concept of post-Fordism and the associated notion of flexibility are presented. It is argued that a post-Fordist reading of economic restructuring is particularly useful for conceptualising the generalised economic transition that has occurred during the past three decades. However, in most post-Fordist research, labour flexibility is theorised primarily as an outcome of changing demand side circumstances, and thus, fails to document the supply side conditions, which also play a role in the flexibilisation of labour. I claim that this bias limits the theory's ability to account for variation within a national economic system. Thus, in the second section of this chapter, I examine the role of supply side forces in the changing nature of labour markets. Finally, the importance of considering the conditions under which supply and demand factors intersect locally in the labour markets is discussed. As proposed by Peck (1996), I demonstrate that labour restructuring, and especially differences between places, are best understood within a framework that allows the researcher to simultaneously consider
both the supply of, and demand for, labour, as well as the manner in which they interact in a local labour market.

Based on the theoretical assumptions of the preceding chapter, Chapter Three goes on to describe and enumerate elements of the Canadian context which might have favoured the expansion of flexible employment. The chapter begins with a review of major demographic and social trends over the last thirty years or so. The second part of the chapter outlines the transformation of Canadian society from a political economic perspective and specifically discusses some of the public policy changes relating to labour.

Chapter Four directly relates to the first specific objective of the study (see p. 5). It portrays the recent evolution in the nature of work arrangements in Canada. Here, I document the rise of new forms of work at the national scale from the early 1970s, a date which is argued to be a threshold for economic restructuring, through to the mid-1990s. The second section of this chapter focuses on the evolution of two specific forms of labour flexibility, part-time employment and self-employment, to document the process of labour restructuring within Canada’s ten largest metropolitan areas. Some of the possible factors that might explain differences in the development of labour flexibility between urban labour markets are considered at the end of the chapter.

Chapters Five and Six provide empirical analyses to evaluate the conceptual framework proposed in Chapter Three. Chapter Five is presented as a response to strictly demand-driven analyses of labour market change. Though issues relating to the changing political economic circumstances of firms are not ignored, the emphasis is placed on the evolving composition of the flexible workforce through a detailed case study. In
particular, based on published and unpublished census data, the chapter is centred around the empirical investigation of the changing characteristics of part-time workers in the Montréal CMA from 1971 to 1996. Following a brief introduction reviewing the recent economic history of Montréal, I explore the relationship between gender and part-time employment. I then present a series of log-linear models showing the odds of working part-time according to the socio-economic characteristics of workers at different times. In the last section, attention is directed to the particular features of Montreal’s part-time labour market. Here, I argue that the crucial sets of factors and circumstances that influence labour market restructuring are partly constructed at the local scale where actors and processes interact to create distinct outcomes.

In Chapter Six, the focus turns to demand side issues. Based on a case study of the life insurance industry in Toronto, the chapter investigates employers’ point-of-views regarding labour restructuring using semi-structured interviews. This investigation offers the two-fold advantage of documenting restructuring in both a service industry as well as in a sector where competitive pressures have been very prominent in recent years. The development of some of the most common forms of flexible employment is examined in the first section of the chapter. I then argue that corporate restructuring of the industry, mainly comprised of consolidation and demutualisation, has caused an acceleration of labour flexibilisation. The case study also provides evidence that much of the flexibility witnessed in the life insurance industry has been made available by the employer as a direct response to employees’ needs. This dynamic is also investigated.

The two case studies provide a rare occasion to use quantitative and qualitative methodologies in combination rather than to view them as opposing approaches (Eyles, 1988). The quantitative dimensions obtained from the description and analyses of
statistical information on labour flexibility (and flexibilisation) enables to draw a profile of the localities and workers that are under investigation. This method not only serves to make new hypotheses and to construct an informed interview schedule, but also to situate the results of qualitative research in a broader perspective rather than to conclude on the generality of a limited set of interviews. In turn, the informal interviews offer complementary information and insights that cannot be seized by quantitative methods. In particular, by documenting individual experiences of "insiders", the interviews provide opportunities to explore the individuality of attitudes, responses and behaviours of employers regarding issues of labour utilisation (Johnston, 1987). The objective is, therefore, not only to measure the extent of change, but more importantly to understand how people involved in the milieux are affecting and affected by the process.

Finally, Chapter Seven has three main components. It starts with a summary and review of the principal research findings of this dissertation. This is followed by a discussion of what I have labelled "the new social order of post-Fordism". The last section discusses the broad implications that the particular forms taken by labour flexibilisation in Canada have for research and public policy.
CHAPTER TWO

THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES ON RESTRUCTURING AND THE RISE OF FLEXIBLE WORK

As presented in the introduction, it appears that two sets of factors can be associated with the transformation of working arrangements. One set considers the changing demand for labour and draws on concepts from political economy to interpret the rising prevalence of atypical forms of work. The second set of factors places emphasis on demographic and social structures to highlight changes in the supply of labour. As a result, despite a relative degree of consensus regarding trends in work arrangements, existing accounts of the rise of labour flexibility have approached this issue from either a supply or a demand perspective, with all the conceptual and methodological limitations that this implies.

To overcome some of these deficiencies, this chapter examines the theme of labour restructuring using a combination of approaches. First, it draws on the literature on post-Fordism to highlight the economic changes that have occurred in western industrialised countries since the early 1970s. Second, it recognises that the post-Fordist emphasis on firms' need to achieve flexibility distorts the functioning of labour market
Chapter 2: Theoretical Perspectives

Restructuring in that it portrays flexible workers as a docile workforce deprived of any other alternatives. Consequently, the approach chosen also considers other factors which, through their interaction with firms' behaviour, are integral parts of the process of labour restructuring rather than incidental to it. Based on extensive work which has documented the recent evolution of part-time work and self-employment, this study takes into account the socio-economic position of workers involved in new forms of work.

The use of the two approaches together serves to establish a conceptual link between what firms are trying to accomplish through labour restructuring and the types of flexible forms of employment workers willingly or unwillingly choose. In recognising that this relationship between supply and demand may take various forms depending on the socio-economic composition of the local workforce, and on political economic circumstances at various spatial levels, it is also acknowledged that the extent of labour flexibilisation may vary in space. Ultimately, some local labour markets may have the potential to become more flexible given this relationship and their pre-existing structure.

To explore this possibility, the research is designed around two case studies. The structure of this chapter anticipates these case studies. In section 2.1, the concepts of post-Fordism and flexibility are reviewed in order to provide an understanding of the discourse which portrays the recent growth of atypical forms of work primarily as a direct and inevitable consequence of economic forces. Chapter Six follows such an approach by presenting flexible labour practices from the point of view of employers. Sections 2.2 and 2.3 are presented as a response to this approach by analysing labour market shifts with respect to the changing socio-economic characteristics of the workforce and the local environment in which they develop. In particular, the second section examines the literature on part-time work because Chapter Five is developed around this specific
working arrangement. The final section of this chapter brings together the elements of demand and supply conditions to build a more nuanced understanding of labour market dynamics. Drawing on the recent work of Jamie Peck (1996), it is argued that such an approach will help to consider the uniqueness of local labour markets in different Canadian urban agglomerations.

2.1 The Post-Fordist Debate

In the social sciences, much of the recent discussion concerning labour restructuring revolves around the concept of post-Fordism. In particular, the rise of flexible employment is perceived as an outcome of firms’ changing behaviour during the post-Fordist era. This section briefly introduces the concept of post-Fordism which helps in understanding some of the conditions which have encouraged firms to restructure. The second part focuses on the notion of flexibility, a central concept within the post-Fordist literature. Despite some weaknesses, I believe that the tools offered by theories of post-Fordism are useful for understanding the growth of new forms of employment in Canada over the last twenty-five years.

2.1.1 Regulation Theory and Restructuring

There is a strong sense that times are changing; that new social, economic, and sometimes geographic conditions have been emerging from what is often characterised as a transition of capitalism. However, despite a relative consensus about the fact that the form of capitalism has been substantially altered since the early 1970s, social scientists view and conceptualise this transformation in a wide variety of ways. Indeed, scholars use a whole host of terms such as “post-industrial”, “post-modern” (Harvey, 1989), “post-Fordist” (Aglietta, 1976/1997, Amin, 1994), “service economy” (Daniels, 1991),
“information age” (Castells, 1993), “disorganised capitalism” (Lash and Urry, 1987) to mark the break or the shift between the earlier post-war period and the current times. In addition, commentators are also pointing to the ‘globalisation’ or ‘internationalisation’ of markets, to the ‘new world economic order’ (Drache and Gertler, 1991, Lipietz, 1997) and to the changes that these new conditions ‘inevitably’ engender in the structure and behaviour of firms and institutions. The variety of language used to describe the new age reflects the heterogeneity and the diversity of positions regarding an understanding of the current period and its link with the past in capitalist societies.

Among the most widely debated issues within the post-Fordist literature are those concerning the continuity of capitalism versus its ‘natural’ tendency to transform itself in times of ‘crisis’. Some argue that while economies are always evolving, the form of capitalism today still exhibits many of its past characteristics, and thus the transformation of society is only a reflection of capitalism’s ability to adapt quickly to changing conditions (Clarke, 1990, Lovering, 1990, Pollert, 1991). In other words, capitalism stays the same in essence, but the society around it changes. Other scholars place an emphasis on these latter changes as they attempt to demonstrate that the period extending from the 1970s to today is one which marks a break with the previous era, whose essential characteristics are eroding and disappearing. In addition, notwithstanding this first controversy, some claim that the period in which we live consists of an open age in which one hegemonic model of development has yet to be established (Lipietz, 1989, 1997), while others argue that a new regime of accumulation has come forth to sustain an emerging paradigm (Harvey, 1989, Storper and Scott, 1989).

Other more specific discussions concern the ways these shifts and/or continuities are expressed through the structure of industrial society writ large. Particular attention
has been paid to the emergence of global/world cities (Andrew et al., 1999, Friedmann, 1986, 1995, Knox and Taylor, 1995, Sassen, 1994), the way capitalist enterprises respond to changing competition by re-organising their production process (among several others: Amin and Thrift, 1992, Lipietz, 1986, Lovering, 1989), and the shift in the nature and role of different forms of governance (see for example Hirst and Thompson, 1996).

Post-Fordism, as a period succeeding Fordism, represents one of the approaches to understanding the restructuring of late twentieth century capitalism. But as Amin (1994) suggests, combining the arguments of the proponents and opponents of the theory of post-Fordism helps to conceptualise post-Fordism as a *debate*. As such, post-Fordism appears to be built from its own theoretical findings as well as from the critiques of others within or outside the same ‘school of thought’. As a result, among those accepting the concept of post-Fordism, there is a plurality of approaches.

Among these approaches, regulation theory has certainly been one of the most influential approaches. In particular, based on the work of Aglietta (1976/1997), the regulationists’ analysis of the passage from a Fordist to a post-Fordist society has dominated the Post-Fordist literature on economic restructuring (Amin, 1994, Vallas, 1999). Other than being particularly useful for introducing the economic context in which new forms of employment have ‘emerged’, regulation theory is the approach which attributes the strongest consideration to non-economic forces, including social changes, among the leading post-Fordist theories (see for example Filion, 1998, Noël, 1987, Peck, 1996). Notably, this school’s attention to changing gender relations has been noted elsewhere (McDowell, 1991). In short, the conceptual tools developed by regulationists help to conceive the advent of a ‘societal’ crisis by showing the organisational and
technical limitations of the Fordist mode of development. The key concepts sustaining this theory, and its reading of the recent history, are presented below.

**The Concepts of the Regulation School**

The regulation school was originally interested in developing a framework to theorise about the inherent tendency of capitalism to shift from one form to another in response to recurrent crises of accumulation (Amin, 1994). Apart from identifying the historical periods of crisis and those of relative economic stability, the school also has focused on explaining how contradictory forces in capitalism would create such crises and on suggesting how capitalism would work to solve them. From this angle the history of capitalism may look repetitive, but regulationists make it clear that crises exhibit different characteristics and emanate as a result of different confrontations over time. Thus, capitalism is not cyclical “even though it may correspond to certain identifiable tendencies” (Lipietz, 1987: 15).

In order to articulate the passage from a period of crisis to one of sustainable economic development, and the reverse, the regulation school draws on a series of concepts. Among these, the *model (or mode) of development, regime of accumulation, model of working organisation* and *mode of regulation*, are the most prominent (Grahl and Teague, 2000). Separately taken, a regime of accumulation describes an ensemble of regularities in the combined evolution of production and consumption which assure a general and relatively coherent progression of the accumulation process (e.g. Fordism); a model of working organisation, often called a technological paradigm, refers to the principles that govern the forms and the division of labour in the leading industries (e.g. Taylorisation); while a mode of regulation is one or a set of mechanisms that allow the
temporary regulation of the internal contradictions of capitalism (e.g. the welfare state). Therefore, the term ‘regulation’ does not refer to rules in the sense of the law, but more broadly to a collection of measures, concrete (e.g. labour laws) or implied (e.g. sexual division of labour), that permits a certain stability of the capitalist system. As Lipietz (1989: 17) mentions, the three main components of the theory are tightly linked:

Thus the regime of accumulation appears as a macroeconomic result of the operation of the mode of regulation, which itself rests on a model of working organisation. (my translation)

Combined, at the national level these components take the form of a model of development (e.g. national Fordisms), which varies from place to place depending on the nature and the interaction among the three.

In short, these concepts help to consider how Fordism came about as the dominant form of capitalism in the 1950s and 1960s. First, Fordism rested on Taylorism and mechanisation, therefore, enabling mass production. It meant the existence of a strict division of labour in which workers performing standardised tasks were kept away from managing decisions in the production process. Second, accumulation was supported by gains of productivity that originated from the strict organisation of work and the use of mechanised technology. Part of the accumulation (profits) was reinvested in financial investments to permit the constant development of production, while another part was consecrated to wage increases (and generally better capital-labour relations) in order to support mass consumption. Finally, a system of social, economic and political rules supported the relative stability of this regime. Although the means varied from country to country, this system included measures that guaranteed a close monitoring between

---

4 Technological paradigm is also referred to as an industrial paradigm or labour process.
productivity growth and wage increases, a certain level of protectionism within the national market, and the institution of a Keynesian welfare state to extend consuming capabilities to all classes.

*The Crisis of Fordism*

The conceptual tools first developed by the French regulation school also serve to investigate the apparent breakdown of Fordism around the late 1960s. In particular, the theory documents the organisational and technical limitations of the Fordist model of development which threatened the regime of accumulation and, therefore, provides explanations for the relative instability of the economy ever-since (Amin, 1994).

A number of analysts have broadly portrayed the crisis as follows\(^5\): A sequence of national and international events jeopardised the fragile state of equilibrium of Fordism. By the late 1960s and early 1970s a demand side issue relating to the levelling out of national consumer markets forced firms to look for market expansion in other countries. This situation also induced an internationalisation of the production process in which Fordist countries sought economies by outsourcing part of their production to non-Fordist socialist and newly industrialised countries. As for national markets, demand for the domestic production was 'artificially' maintained through welfare programs and wage policy.

In addition, a supply side problem, characterised by falling profitability rates, appeared by the end of the 1970s. There were several ingredients to this problem. First, according to Fordist theory, the revolt of non-specialised workers against the alienation of their work engendered a slowing down of productivity. Second, the profit-squeeze was

---

also the result of price increases of primary commodities, especially that of oil. Third, the costs of labour increased because of the above mentioned regulations that permitted the regular growth of wages, as well as because of the increasing welfare portion in incomes. In other words, the equilibrium between gains of productivity and wage increases was broken through attempts to sustain mass consumption.

During the 1970s, the responses put in place to face these problems had contradictory and unwanted effects. While consumption was increased, the resulting economic benefits were increasingly felt outside the national markets because Fordist nations transferred some of their activities to Third World countries in order to re-establish their levels of profit and open new markets. By doing so, they affected the commercial trade balance of their own countries and aggravated problems of unemployment. In that regard, the crisis is caused not only by internal and external forces, but is also best understood in terms of the tight interaction between supply side and demand side factors (Leborgne and Lipietz, 1991).

As uncertainty within the economy kept growing, the investments continued to diminish and unemployment rates climbed to peaks unprecedented in the Fordist era. National Fordisms were in crisis and the principles of the Fordist compromise were threatened. Thereafter, a neo-liberal rhetoric established itself in many northern countries as the only viable solution to the problem of profitability. The discourse is relatively simple: since support for demand has not solved the supply side crisis, firms need to be de-regulated to compete with external markets and eliminate the obstacles to higher rates of profitability:

Profits were low because workers were too strong, a product of the fact that the rules of the game were too 'inflexible'. Policies of 'liberal
flexibility' were put in place by the governments of the United Kingdom and the United States, eventually followed by most OECD countries. This repudiation of the long-standing social compromise attained different degrees and was drawn on different fronts: from the rules governing wage rises to the breadth and depth of social security, from the liberalization of employment laws to the proliferation of insecure jobs. (Lipietz, 1997: 4)

Indeed, profits were restored in the late 1970s, but the negative effects were major. In many countries, massive unemployment, wage reductions and progressive dismantlement of the welfare state all combined to slow down consumption in the following decade.

*The After-Fordisms of the Regulation School*

According to some regulationists, the crisis of Fordism has generated a variety of national experiences seeking 'ways out of the crisis'. Indeed, if some regulationists suggest the end of the crisis and the emergence of new model(s) of development (see for example Esser and Hirsch, 1994), most supporters of regulation theory hesitate to conceptualise the present era as one that has solved the problems of the former and that can produce sustainable development (Aglietta, 1998, Boyer, 1996, Jessop, 1994, Lipietz, 1995, Tickell and Peck, 1995).

In contrast, the theoreticians of the flexible-specialisation approach generally claim that post-Fordism is a period distinct from that of Fordism, and that it offers solutions for sustaining a regime of accumulation that rest on technological innovations and the reorganisation of the production process (see Hirst and Zeitlin, 1991, Piore and Sabel, 1984, Sabel, 1997). Filion (1998: 1104) has labelled this approach the "productivist" (or supply-side) perspective. In their book, *The Second Industrial Divide*, Piore and Sabel (1984) explain that flexible-specialisation and mass production constitute the only two major forms of production. In most of the history of capitalism, these two
forms have coexisted, except in times where one became dominant (e.g. an industrial divide). Based on the study of a few industrial districts, flexible-specialisation is said to be the emerging paradigm, the second industrial divide. To (over)s summarise the argument, flexible-specialisation is a system of production which combines the specialisation of small vertically disintegrated firms with the use of a flexible labour force and/or flexible technology. This approach has been widely criticised, however, notably for its dualistic structure, for its extensive use of the concept of flexibility, and for the weakness of its empirical evidence (Gertler, 1988, Pollard, 1995, Sayer, 1990).

The regulationists do not reject completely the results of the flexible-specialisation approach. Ironically, it is the more ‘flexible’ approach to the crisis that allows regulation theory to recognise that industrial districts and flexible practices are a salient part of the restructuring process inherent in post-Fordism. According to regulationists, however, far from being universal, flexible-specialisation is only one of the competing modes of production which characterise the post-Fordist age (see Leborgne and Lipietz, 1991). Keeping in mind the concepts proposed by the regulation school, two other points in the flexible-specialisation analysis tend to reinforce the belief that post-Fordism does not exhibit the attributes of a sustainable and hegemonic model of development. First, the flexible-specialisation approach fails to explain how the modes of production typifying new industrial districts can sustain long-term capital accumulation across all sectors of the economy, and how it can be applied at a larger spatial scale (Gertler, 1988). Second, by focusing almost exclusively on the emerging technological paradigm in these specific places, the approach lacks integration within a more general social project which binds political, social and economic development together (societal paradigm). Thus, regulation theory claims that post-Fordism does not constitute a
development model (Elam, 1994, Lipietz, 1989). Instead, regulationists suggest that post-Fordism is an open era in which different paradigms are fighting to become hegemonic. This is why regulationists also think that the period following Fordism is better captured through the concept of several after-Fordisms (après-Fordismes) than with the singular concept of post-Fordism which has been used to suggest a clearer break with the former period.

Until the mid-1980s, liberal-productivism has been the model that was favoured to replace Fordism (especially in the U.S. and in the U.K.). However, as Elam (1994) and Lipietz (1989) argue, this model has proven to be inefficient in regulating the economy and in giving satisfaction to a large proportion of citizens. Furthermore, Peck and Tickell (1994) add that it is premature to argue that neo-liberalism constitutes a new regime of accumulation. Basing their argument on regulationist theory, they maintain that for a new regime to come forth, it must comprise the structural coupling of a system of accumulation and of a social mode of regulation. In particular, they try to demonstrate that no social mode of regulation has emerged as a new institutional fix and therefore one cannot speak of a regime of accumulation. Peck and Tickell (1994) rightly point out that, far from providing the basis for a new regulatory framework, neo-liberalism is both an outcome of the crisis and part of it. As well, the ‘success stories’ of some regions represent fragile experiences illustrating the geographies of crisis. Even though they recognise the fact that privileged regions have benefited from the development of a good business environment (e.g. Silicon Valley, U.K. sunbelt, Third Italy), they claim that overall this strategy undermines local economies and increases their dependency upon supra-local forces. Nonetheless, if the experience of neo-liberalism (Thatcherism and Reaganism in particular) can be criticised, with good reason, for not providing long-term
economic and social progress to all classes of society, the growth of its influence in the ongoing political and economic discourse cannot be ignored. Indeed, the persistence of neo-liberalism and its prominent position within the political sphere of several developed countries, should raise questions about its capacity to reproduce itself over a long period of time, despite the numerous pitfalls it engenders for a large portion of society.

It is clear that none of the existing after-Fordist strategies can claim to constitute a stable model of development as they now stand. Although Lipietz (1995: 41) considers the strategies of Germany, Japan and Sweden more desirable, he also mentions that this kind of economic development should be altered:

Although these countries proved that economic liberalism could be improved on, at both the social and the environmental level, in no way can they (especially not Japan) serve as a model of ‘sustainable development.’

To get out of this crisis, regulationists argue that new rules must be set for the economy, a new paradigm which proposes new forms for the organisation of work must be created, as well as new compromises and modes of regulation (Carnoy and Castells, 1997, Lipietz, 1989). While the various after-Fordist experiences may serve as guidelines, the problem appears at the national and international levels, such that internal modes of regulation can only solve parts of the crisis. Different parts of the solutions are already in place, struggling to become hegemonic, and serve as new development models with their own regimes of accumulation.

To summarise, in Canada and elsewhere in developed countries, the shift from Fordism to some still undefined form of post-Fordism has had important social and economic consequences. Within the logic of regulation theory, the events that took place over the last twenty-five years or so (maybe more recently in Canada) must be
understood as interdependent: the increased internationalisation of the markets which contributed to the particular form of firm restructuring and to the decline of manufacturing employment in western industrialised states directly affected the level of unemployment in these countries and thus increased social spending by governments. But as unemployment increased, national consumption also declined and forced firms to make further restructuring with the support of governments. Therefore, a major argument of this approach is that firms and social institutions are being significantly transformed mainly to address the economic problems caused by the breakdown of Fordism. In particular, post-Fordist theorists explain this series of changes by reference to the willingness of firms to achieve 'flexibility'. This concept and its relation to labour flexibility are reviewed in the following section.

2.1.2 Seeking Flexibility

Many writers from a range of disciplines have argued that in the shift from Fordist models of development to after-Fordist ones, companies and institutions are using a variety of ‘new’ strategies which are assumed to be more flexible in contrast to the rigid methods of production of Fordism (Hirst and Zeitlin, 1989, Piore and Sabel, 1984, Sabel and Zeitlin, 1997). Thus, as Gilbert et al. (1992: 2) suggest:

[d]ominant interpretations of the contemporary profusion of divisions and changes in the labour markets and the organisation of work are now almost all discussed in terms of this conceptual triumvirate [Fordism, post-Fordism, flexibility].

Since competing conceptions of post-Fordism exist, it follows that there is also a variety of positions on the concept of flexibility. Of these approaches, three seem of greater significance (Gilbert, et al., 1992): flexible-specialisation, the flexible firm model, and regulation theory.
The flexible-specialisation model emphasises the transformation of the processes of production (i.e. industrial relations, industrial technology and capital-labour relations). As mentioned earlier, the so-called flexible-specialisation model is based on the belief that only two forms of production have co-existed since the emergence of industrial capitalism (Piore and Sabel, 1984). These two types of industrial production are mass production and craft production. Although the two have 'always' co-existed, it is believed that one form has come to dominate the other at various points in history. The passage from one state to another is referred to as an industrial divide. From the immediate post-World War II years roughly to the end of the 1960s, mass production supported by assembly-line technology and semi-skilled labour was said to be the dominant form of production. Since the 1970s, however, a new form of craft production, labelled flexible-specialisation, came forth in response to market fragmentation in consumer demands and international competition. According to early work utilising the flexible-specialisation approach (Scott, 1988, Storper and Scott, 1990), the recent transformation of production processes was only made possible by the development of new flexible technologies and the more flexible use of labour, which enabled firms to adapt to new economic realities (for more recent discussions see Pollard and Storper, 1996, Sabel, 1997, Storper, 1997a). Firms' particular strategies are identified: 1) individualisation of employment relations, 2) an increase of internal flexibility through functional flexibility (multi-skilling), and 3) enhancement of external flexibility through flexible work arrangements (part-time work, temporary work, subcontracting). Within this specific framework, flexibility and new forms of work are, therefore, essentially an outcome of the desire of firms to be more competitive.
The second main approach which uses the concept of flexibility extensively to interpret recent economic change is the *flexible firm model* developed by Atkinson (1985). The focus of this model is relatively narrow as it exclusively concentrates on changing employment practices in some industries. The notion of the flexible firm rests on the belief that enterprises now re-organise their labour force to achieve three types of flexibility (Atkinson and Meager, 1986, Institute of Manpower Studies, 1986). First, companies try to acquire ‘functional’ flexibility which means that they expect their workers to execute diversified activities to help them provide a variety of products and/or services. Second, in order to adapt to variations in demand, firms also seek ‘numerical’ flexibility whereby they can augment or reduce the size of their labour force using a combination of employment strategies such as part-time work, sub-contracting and overtime. Finally, to facilitate the first two types of flexibility, enterprises search for greater ‘financial and pay’ flexibility. This includes the possibility for businesses to renegotiate wages and contracts with their employees, and it also points to the deregulation of national economies to increase firms’ economic freedom. This model’s interpretation of the growth of flexible employment is, therefore, not limited to competition and market factors. However, despite making references to the role of social divisions of labour in implementing the different types of flexibility, the model does not provide evidence of how the different characteristics of labour supply could influence the distinct development of local labour markets (notably through flexibilisation). Although this conceptual division of types of labour flexibility has certainly been broadly influential, the flexible firm approach has generally been abandoned since the early 1990s.
Finally, based on the principles previously outlined, the Marxist-inspired *regulation school* views flexibility at various levels within society and, thus, appears much more holistic in comparison with the two other approaches. For regulationists, the transformation of production techniques, of the state and of consumption patterns, all reflect a *search* for greater flexibility. With respect to production methods, regulation theory specifically claims that flexibility primarily relies on a distinct ‘technological paradigm’ based on advanced robotics and computer controlled machines (Scharf, 1990). In turn, capital-labour relations are altered through a redefinition of workforce characteristics (Boyer, 1987a, 1987b). On the one hand, post-Fordist workers are expected to be versatile and thus perform a variety of tasks within the firm. In addition, the rigid labour contracts of the Fordist era are gradually being replaced to provide employers with more flexibility in the ways they utilise their labour force. In practical terms, this change has been expressed through the recent increase of part-time work and other forms of non-standard employment (Carnoy, Castells and Benner, 1997). In several parts of the world, wage flexibility has also been achieved because of the decline of unions and the weakening of labour contracts. This allows enterprises to pay their employees on the basis of individual productivity and reduce the employers’ contribution to the cost of social benefits.

More than any other approach to flexibility, regulation theory remains, however, careful about generalising these trends across nations and regions. This characteristic is observed in the analysis of differences in labour flexibility and, therefore, is useful for investigating this topic within a specific national labour market. Looking specifically at the labour process of the different after-Fordisms, Leborgne and Lipietz (1991) insist that there is more than one option to choose from. Based on differences in the forms of
capital-labour relations (industrial relations), wage relations and industrial organisations (inter-firm links), they distinguish two types of possible models of development that also correspond to emerging social blocs: defensive flexibility and offensive flexibility. In general, the characteristics of defensive flexibility are associated with trends in the policies and practices of neo-liberal countries such as Great Britain and the United States. Defensive flexibility is based on a short-term perspective of development of business to the detriment of the community’s wider and longer terms objectives of social development. In contrast, offensive flexibility is concerned with the use of flexible production techniques as long as they are not detrimental to the longer term perspective of development of the entire community. This more progressive type of flexibility is generally related to the industrial development of Japan, Germany and Sweden. By recognising diversity in the way flexibility is implemented at the national level, the role of institutional factors is also acknowledged. For instance, comparing labour flexibility in Japan, Germany and the U.S., Christopherson (1998) found that investment policies and practices have an impact on the extent and the shape that labour flexibility takes in various countries. This, in turn, contributes to the persistence of differences.

In the end, post-Fordist capital-labour relations are much more varied than those of the Fordist era, where the preponderance of Taylorist practices revealed the hegemony of the development model. As synthesised by Figure 2.1, the evolution of industrial relations may be defined by the combination of trends in the “external labour market” and the “internal labour market” (Leborgne et Lipietz, 1992, Lipietz, 1995). On the vertical axis, the external labour market corresponds to the links between firms and workers (and potential workers). It includes issues relating to working arrangements, and wage and hiring regulations. In the transition from a post-Fordist economy, the U.S., for example,
has gradually eroded the rigidities (e.g. lifetime employment) of the internal labour market by replacing those practices with more flexible labour relations (e.g. non-permanent employment). On the horizontal axis, the internal labour market coincides with the forms of working organisation prevailing within the work process. It mainly concerns issues regarding the level of involvement of workers (and unions) within the production process. In its after-Fordist experience, the American internal labour market has remained close to Taylorist practices in which workers' involvement is negotiated individually or at the team level and where a strict hierarchical system predominates over co-operation. This is contrary, for example, to the Japanese form of organisation (Naruse, 1991, Tomaney, 1994), where workers' knowledge is given considerable place in the production process; or to the Swedish case (Lipietz, 1997), where labour negotiations more commonly occur at a wider scale (e.g. industry and/or national) and where the roles of governments and unions are more directly felt.

**Figure 2.1: Post-Fordist Industrial Relations**

Therefore, depending on the mix in the intensity of these two aspects, different nations as well as regions or economic sectors exhibit different models of capital-labour relations. The combination of flexibility in the external labour market and negotiated involvement, as proposed by the flexible-specialisation model, appears largely incompatible. While it may be possible to implement such system within a restricted number of industries and/or regions, in the rest of the economy, it remains an unlikely combination because of the absence of common purposes between firms and their employees. In other words, it seems difficult to expect workers to be collectively involved in the production process and at the same time require of them a level of flexibility which primarily serves the firm to the detriment of their labour conditions.

Not surprisingly, flexibility has been the target of extensive criticism. Some critics, for example, have raised concerns regarding "the pervasiveness, significance, distinctiveness, and success of the flexible model." (Gertler, 1992: 259 also see; Gertler, 1988, Lovering, 1990, Pollert, 1991). More recent critics have suggested the concept of 'social risk' to convey the idea that flexible work is generally not flexible from the employee point of view (Allen and Henry, 1997, Reimer, 1998). In addition, others point out that the empirical evidence is thin and based only on a few examples, concerning particular places and relatively few sectors of the economy (Vallas, 1999). While the arguments of these critics usually rest on solid ground, whether they condemn the entire theory of post-Fordism or just the concept of flexibility, most of them still acknowledge the recent trends towards greater flexibility in several aspects of industrial society. It seems clear that society is changing and that whether the ways that firms organise their production is a cause or a consequence or both simultaneously, the search for flexibility makes up a significant part of this transformation.
Indeed, the post-Fordist debate has produced several points of agreement when it comes to identifying the peculiarities of the current shift. The general increase in the proportion and number of new forms of work (i.e. part-time, home working, sub-contracting, etc.) is one aspect that seems to emerge from the analysis of flexibility (Lee, 1996, Lovering, 1990, Mingione, 1994, Pollard, 1995). For instance, Gertler (1992: 260) distinguishes between six points of consensus which tend to acknowledge the “pursuit of, or search for greater flexibility” in recent firm practices and more broadly in institutionalised economic policies:

Recent times have seen an intensification of firms’ desires to adopt certain practices in the productive sphere of the economy. These include: (i) a more flexible use of workers and machines, (ii) more flexible inter-firm relations, (iii) more flexible relations with the market [...], (iv) a reduction in the amount of unrealized capital tied up in inventories, (v) changes to social institutions to foster flexible employment relations, and (iv) the breaking down of previous barriers to the mobility of capital between sectors and between places.

Of these six elements, at least two (i and v) directly concern the transformation of employment practices and hence highlight the high degree of agreement with respect to the rise of atypical forms of working arrangements. Most (if not all) industrialised nations seem to have experienced an increase in labour flexibility in recent years (for up-to-date discussion and data see Carnoy et Castells, 1997, Delsen, 1995, Gottlieb et al., 1998, Zeytinoglu, 1999).

One aspect that has often been ignored, however, is the geographic variation within countries in the extent and rise of this phenomenon. When the growth of atypical employment is explored, mostly from a sociological or economic perspective, research has primarily focused on the national scale. As a result, intra-national (and certainly inter/intra-urban) variations in labour flexibility remain one of the least investigated
issues in the literature on economic restructuring. This drawback will be addressed in Chapter Four, but before doing so, it is important to further investigate the factors to include in such an inquiry.

2.2 Understanding the Rise of Part-time Work

The previous section has described how the changing nature of working patterns has been interpreted as part of a broader process of economic restructuring by the various flexibility approaches. As well, it was established that this recent course towards more flexible employment hardly constitutes a point of disagreement in discussions about post-Fordism. Moreover, this is probably so because it is in this area of employment where changes are more easily felt and can be observed in practice. This section provides a first example of the partial limitations of such an approach by examining research which has described and analysed the growth of part-time employment within industrialised countries. In particular, I highlight the existence of a literature outside of that on flexibility models, which attempts to explain cross-national differences in the incidence and rise of non-standard work.

If most industrialised countries have experienced a rise in part-time employment, major variations may still be observed at the international scale. In general, differences are observed in the share of part-timers among the total labour force, in the growth of part-time work and in the proportion of women involved in this type of work (OECD, 1998b, Québec, 1998, van Doorne-Huiskes et al., 1995, Warme et al., 1992). As summarised in the post-Fordist literature, much of this transformation of work is associated with the desire of firms to become more competitive in an increasingly fragmented market. For example, it is argued that by employing part-time workers,
employers where state policy allow them to do so may reduce elements of non-wage labour costs (social security, pension contributions, etc.) as well as direct wages. Therefore, firms tend to rely increasingly on this type of work arrangement. However, one of the main arguments of the current thesis is that firms are not the sole drivers of the transformation in the balance of the different working arrangements and that other factors need to be investigated in parallel to the demand side factors highlighted by the post-Fordist debate.

Other researchers have acknowledged this specific need and sought to determine various sets of factors which help in interpreting the growth of part-time employment and analysing cross-national disparities (Gornick and Jacobs, 1996, Pfau-Effinger, 1994, Thurman and Trah, 1990, Warme et al., 1992). Using the case of part-time work, this section reviews some of the findings of this research and, therefore, provides examples of how spatial differences between levels and development of flexible employment may be interpreted.

Firstly, relatively few studies have discussed the importance of the shift from an industrial-based economy to a service-based one in order to explain labour market restructuring. Instead, research on labour flexibility has largely concentrated on manufacturing industries (Christopherson, 1989, Coffey and Bailly, 1991). The scant attention paid to service industries is rather bizarre since employment in this sector has been expanding more rapidly than in others. In Canada, as mentioned earlier, 88% of the 5.7 million new jobs created from 1971 to 1996 were in the service sector. In addition, because of constant fluctuations in demand, there are indications that services, particularly labour intensive ones, are more suitable than manufacturing industries to the use of numerical flexibility (Robinson, 1993). Surveys conducted throughout western
Chapter 2: Theoretical Perspectives

Industrial countries generally show that the use of part-timers varies by industrial sector and that, as a result, geographical differences could be interpreted with respect to the industrial mix of various places (Christopherson, 1989, Penn, 1992, Robinson, 1993, Walsh, 1990).

Other analyses point to the role of governments in facilitating the development of employment flexibility. In analyses that borrow some elements of the regulation approach, a common interpretation is that a mix of cultural practices, social regulations and government economic policies tends to be reflected in the levels of flexible work detected at national levels (Gornick and Jacobs, 1996, Haughton and Peck, 1996, Thurman and Trah, 1990). This approach acknowledges that while macro-economic factors may influence institutional and business behaviours, the ways in which each country responds to these pressures reflect their own cultural, institutional and political background (Green et al., 1993). Hence, specific national labour and social policies are likely to produce cross-national variations in the manner in which flexible work arrangements evolve. In a comparative study between Finland and West Germany, Pfau-Effinger (1994) demonstrates the effect of cultural factors in influencing levels of part-time employment. In investigating the gap in the proportion of women working part-time in these two countries, the author found that the evolution of the "traditional cultural norms and values of family form" were influential determinants of the ways that women's positions have evolved in the labour market. The author explains that the high proportion of West German female workers working part-time (30%) is supported by a set of practices, behaviours and values that give priority to women's reproductive role and, therefore, limits their access to full-time work. On the contrary, in Finland, women's much lower percentage of part-time work (10%) is partly a result of a fundamentally
different gender contract. Finnish women are more fully integrated into the labour market because of the social acceptance of the dual-earner family model based on full-time work by both members of a couple.

Government policies both reflect and help shape the different expectations of the population, so policies may be different even when they produce similar results. For example, in the Netherlands and Denmark, which have some of the highest proportion of part-timers among industrialised states, governments have promoted part-time work as a method to facilitate the entrance of young and female workers into the labour force (Drewes Nielsen, 1991, Siim, 1993). In contrast, in Britain the growth of part-time work has been associated with the neo-liberal policies of the Thatcher government. It provided strong support for enterprises seeking labour flexibility (Gregory, 1998), and acknowledged the ‘responsibilities’ of women in the reproduction sphere (Lewis, 1993, McDowell, 1991), while reducing National Insurance contributions (Hakim, 1989, Rice, 1990). In addition, the weakness of some British social regulations such as child care policies reinforces the likelihood of women seeking part-time employment compared with full-time work (Bowlby, 1990, Pinch and Storey, 1992). In other words, the promotion of part-time work may be perceived as a social measure to help ‘disadvantaged’ groups to gradually enter the workforce, or, alternatively, it can be used as a means of supplying a flexible (and often cheap) workforce to firms.

Finally, since women’s share of part-time work is disproportionately higher than that of men, the strong increase in women’s participation in the labour force has frequently been identified as one possible cause of the expansion of part-time workers in recent years (Dex and Perry, 1984, Duffy and Pupo, 1992, Humphries and Rubery, 1988, Hakim, 1996, Thurman and Trah, 1990, Warme et al., 1992). The argument of these
studies usually rests on a panoply of research which has clearly demonstrated the impact of the sexual division of reproductive labour on women’s rate of part-time employment. With the exceptions of factors related to the work history or qualifications of women, the presence of children (Perry, 1990), life cycles (Miller, 1993, Perry, 1988), and marital status (Elias, 1988) are some of the circumstances most commonly cited to interpret the relationship between female employment and part-time work. The combined growth of activity rates and part-time employment for female workers leads McDowell (1991: 409) to question the gains made by women over the past two decades: “Rather, what the 1970s and 1980s restructuring has achieved is ‘the sharing out’ of employment between larger numbers of women”(emphasis added).

Considering the clear link between these two trends it seems obvious that a thorough analysis of part-time employment and its evolution needs to consider the gender division of labour as well as differences between other labour market segments. Furthermore, such an analysis would reveal the importance of considering simultaneously the demand for, and the supply of, part-timers. For example, if employers create a demand for female part-time workers, there are also indications that some women would ‘voluntarily’ opt for part-time employment to ease the burden of coping with professional and domestic responsibilities (Pinch and Storey, 1992, Silver and Goldscheider, 1994). The interactions between the demand and supply sides are complex and illustrate the necessity of exploring the reasons which foster such divisions of labour markets.

While most approaches to labour restructuring have focused on one or another aspect (i.e. firms’ behaviour, government policies, feminisation of the workforce or others) to explain the growth of part-time workers in various places, it is evident that a combination of factors and processes would better explain this phenomenon and produce
a more comprehensive understanding of spatial differences. In summary, while the focus of the post-Fordist approaches on the changing political economy of individual nations may be useful in interpreting the rise of part-time jobs from an employer's perspective, shifts in the structure of the economy, and different institutional and political environments should also be acknowledged simultaneously and be incorporated more systematically in discussions regarding the transformation of labour markets.

In some instances, research within and outside of the flexibility debate has accounted for this complex interplay between the above factors. Gender studies have, for example, often placed the social composition of workforces at the forefront of discussions regarding labour restructuring and argued for their active role in modifying work patterns (see Duffy and Pupo, 1992, Walby and Bagguley, 1989, Walsh, 1999). Despite the prime objective of documenting labour processes for a specific segment of the workforce (as opposed to promoting the use of a theoretical approach to the understanding of labour restructuring as a whole), such research is a good example of the importance of considering supply side factors in the process of restructuring.

Perhaps more importantly, there is a need to recognise that the increase in part-time work is being pursued by both employers and employees. From that perspective, the diversity of interpretations might also reflect labour market segmentation within groups of part-time workers along the lines of age, gender and other socio-economic features. Not only would urban-level studies of new forms of employment bring an enhanced perspective to changing labour markets, but they might also shed some light on this heterogeneity. Chapter Five, which looks at the changing characteristics of part-time workers in Montréal, offers such an approach.
2.3 Self-Employment: Alternatives to Unemployment, Job Segregation and Opportunities

The case of self-employment is outlined as a second example supporting the need to include supply side factors in the study of labour restructuring. According to several labour market analysts, the expansion of self-employment and sub-contracting arrangements is also a direct consequence of economic restructuring in general and especially of firms' drive towards flexibility. The flexible-firm model, for example, specifies that among the strategies used to increase numerical flexibility, firms raise their reliance on external labour as they gradually reduce the size of their 'core'/full-time workforce through the use of short-term contracts (IMS, 1986). As in the case of part-timers, the model suggests that firms gain from the use of these other 'peripheral' workers by eliminating non-wage costs and by ensuring that the labour input is in tune with demand (Harrison and Kelley, 1993, Storper and Scott, 1990). By so doing, firms achieve both numerical and pay flexibility. Moreover, it is believed that such a practice guarantees a certain level of productivity since sub-contractors or self-employees are responsible for managing their workforce and must deliver goods/services within a predetermined time frame and at a given cost. Finally, the use of sub-contractors may be a relatively cheap solution to meet short term needs of specialised workers, since both the costs relating to the longer term retention of workers and training costs are avoided. The consequences of these strategies are two-fold. On one hand, the reduction of the workforce with large firms may foster an increase in unemployment rates. In turn, as Harvey (1989:152) explains, self-employment, which may take various forms, becomes a 'solution' to the unemployment problem:

Organized sub-contracting, for example, opens up opportunities for small business formation, and in some instances permits older systems of domestic, artisanal, familial (patriarchal), and paternalistic ('god-father',
‘guv’nor’ or even mafia-like) labour systems to revive and flourish as centrepieces rather than appendages of the production system.

As in the case of part-time employment, most writers who emphasise this approach to labour market transformation are not blind to other elements that may contribute to the rise of new forms of employment. But their strong dependence on the concept of flexibility tends to diminish the relative weight assigned to other influences (Vallas, 1999).

At odds with deterministic and restricted interpretations of the rise of entrepreneurship, other writers have identified multiple origins for this specific labour market trend, and thus, have left room for more diverse explanations for the rise of self-employment. More precisely, entrepreneurs would emerge in response to different pressures and incentives, and rather than being a homogeneous category, the self-employed exhibit many different socio-economic characteristics (Bögenhold and Staber, 1991, Wilson and Adams, 1994).

One prominent focus in research on entrepreneurship in industrialised countries is the role of immigrants and ethnic communities in fostering self-employment. This has formed a major research topic in the United States, especially among sociologists and geographers (Borjas, 1990, Maxim, 1992, Portes, 1995, Waldinger et al, 1990, Yuengert, 1995). The general argument is that due to a lack of possibilities to enter the wage economy, the unwillingness of some employers and jurisdictions to accept skills certification, the lack of local experience and outright discrimination, and because of strong community-based networks, entrepreneurship serves as a vehicle for the social and economic advancement of ethnic groups and especially for immigrants. This argument
has been widely used in the Canadian context (Langlois and Razin, 1997, Preston and Cox, 1999, Razin, 1990, Texeira, 1998, Walton-Roberts and Hiebert, 1997).

However, such research also increasingly acknowledges that immigrants and ethnic groups do not constitute monolithic categories. Recent studies have demonstrated that not all ethnic communities exhibit the same entrepreneurial enthusiasm (Hiebert, 1999, Reitz, 1998), and that spatial differences may be observed according to the spatial distribution of different ethnic groups and immigrants (Razin, 1989, Razin and Langlois, 1996). Razin (1992: 279), for example, underlines the role of “the social foundations of entrepreneurship”, which he defines by the presence of “entrepreneurial culture and a diversity of organisations, resources and information networks.” As well, the availability of local opportunities (Razin, 1992, Wong and Ng, 1998) and certain metropolitan characteristics (Langlois and Razin, 1997) are also recognised as factors producing a variety in ethnic business formation. This type of analysis does not contradict the economic restructuring approaches, but, as socio-cultural factors are taken into consideration, it refines our understanding of the process that encourages the growth of self-employment. Hence, contrary to one-dimensional approaches to self-employment, this viewpoint opens up to geographical variations as it appreciates the influence of both supply side and demand side factors.

Another common analysis of the recent growth in self-employment highlights the growing attention that governments have paid to the development of small businesses. The extent to which government policies for small business represent a political response to employers’ need for flexibility remains a matter open for discussion, but for national and regional (provinces, states) governments as well as local administrations, supporting small business entrepreneurship has become a ‘promising’ way to deal with
unemployment problems (Alba-Ramirez, 1994, Mayes and Moir, 1989, Wilson and Adams, 1994). An indicator of this entrepreneurial ideology is the emergence of a considerable number of public and private counsellors whose precise role is to encourage the development of entrepreneurs (Allen and Truman, 1993). Not only is self-employment viewed by policy makers as an alternative for the jobless, but it also creates more employers (Alba-Ramirez, 1994).

Despite this perception, however, and the neo-liberal discourse with which it is associated, the reality of small business formation is often different from the expectations set by governments and the self-employed (Wilson and Adams, 1994). In particular, the average income of the self-employed in Canada is significantly lower than that of full-time wage workers and the number of bankruptcies has been rising rapidly, especially in the last decade. In contrast to the entrepreneurial ‘success stories’ widely advertised in the literature on finance, this trend tends to indicate the existence of different categories of entrepreneurs who emerge for diverse reasons.

While self-employment represents a way for some immigrant or ethnic groups to integrate into the labour market or achieve professional mobility, other groups whose position in the economic sphere is also fragile may adopt a similar strategy. Indeed, because self-employment programs are often targeted to the unemployed (Wilson and Adams, 1994) it is most likely that a portion of future entrepreneurs will emerge from specific groups who have limited opportunities in the ‘regular’ labour market. In the case of women, it appears that their share of total self-employment in industrial countries has increased over the past two decades (Allen and Truman, 1993). The reasons for women becoming entrepreneurs are diverse. For many women, self-employment offers possibilities to more flexibly arrange their schedule in order to combine family and
professional responsibilities (Baines and Wheelock, 2000). In some instances, as in the case of child care providers, self-employment and child rearing overlap in time and space. This employment opportunity is popular with women with young children, many of whom set up their own child care establishment (Connelly, 1992). While female entrepreneurs are mostly found in the service sector and in traditional female occupations, self-employment also represents an entry into traditionally male-dominated jobs (Allen and Truman, 1993; Hakim, 1996).

Nevertheless, the experiences of women entrepreneurs should not be reduced to a simple reaction against problems of integration within the labour market. In some cases, women’s decisions to set up a business may reflect more positive aspects which have been mostly associated with male entrepreneurs. Specifically, the skills, training, education, experience and leadership of some women, mixed with their desire to meet new professional challenges, may drive them to become entrepreneurs. Therefore, starting up a business not only represents an alternative to unemployment or else a way to escape social divisions of labour, but in some instances men and women willingly decide to become entrepreneurs because it provides them with new opportunities, challenges and lifestyles (Statistics Canada, 1996b).

As for other forms of employment, it appears that the recent growth of self-employment can be related to various factors. Contrary to the argument outlined by post-Fordist approaches, the rise of entrepreneurship in industrialised countries should not be interpreted exclusively as a consequence of firms’ attempts to achieve labour flexibility. Undoubtedly, businesses (especially large ones) have to face new economic conditions which, in some cases, will lead to greater reliance on external labour. This in turn creates a demand for small sub-contracting enterprises. By diminishing their internal workforce,
firms also provide a certain number of potential future entrepreneurs. Thus, businesses affect both the level of supply and demand of entrepreneurs when shifting from an internal to an external labour force. However, many problems arise from such an analysis.

One assertion, often implied, is that those being laid-off by large firms are the same workers who later become self-employed as an alternative to unemployment. Popular ideology presupposes that most laid-off workers could find work if they became entrepreneurs, and perhaps, this is exactly what governments assisting self-employment are attempting to promote. Yet, the dynamics of labour markets seem quite different and much more complex. Factors other than a firm’s mere pursuit of flexibility could explain the rise of self-employment. Some reasons for the rise of entrepreneurship independent of efforts by firms to achieve labour flexibility include corporate and public-sector downsizing (not always driven by a need for flexibility), the growth of unemployment, a smaller and weaker welfare state, government policies assisting small businesses and individual initiative in response to all of the above, and other socio-cultural pressures.

As a result, for some people self-employment is an attractive alternative to regular wage work as it may offer more flexibility (not the type pursued by firms) on both a professional and personal basis. Self-employment provides an occasion to own a business, or a possibility of coping better with the combination of family and professional lives. In contrast, for others, self-employment may appear as a solution to limited work opportunities or as a way to escape traditional divisions of labour. Most likely however, the decision to become an entrepreneur is located at the intersection of these various factors which reflect a variety of contextual changes that produces the demand for and supply of entrepreneurs.
2.4 Conceptual Linkages Between the Demand for, and the Supply of, Flexible Workers: A Segmentation Approach to Local Labour Markets

Thus far, this chapter has attempted to show that, despite their essential contribution, when taken separately, the two sets of approaches to labour market analyses have been incapable of forging a nuanced understanding of recent trends in working arrangements. On the one hand, the focus of post-Fordist approaches on the concept of flexibility has been useful in interpreting the rise of non-standard work from the employers' perspective who respond to new economic imperatives. Clearly, however, the lack of attention to shifts in the sectoral structure of the economy, spatially different institutional and political environments, as well as the demographic nature of local labour, inhibits the ability of this theoretical framework to account for the non-market side of labour markets. On the other hand, research which concentrates on these other circumstances has been essential for the interpretation of geographical differences, especially at the international level. However, these approaches have been largely blind to the broader picture of labour market transition as they mostly ignore macro-economic forces which influence the development of labour markets. Consequently, they have failed to view the transformation of local labour markets as part of the general transformation entailing the combined effects of economic, social and institutional processes operating locally and at other scales.

To date, very few studies have attempted to combine the elements of the two groups of approaches. However, recent theoretical discussions on how to analyse the transformation of labour markets, and in particular their differences between places, can be used as guidelines for the empirical work undertaken in this research. Academic research has begun to employ such an approach by combining the theoretical framework of regulation theory with that of segmentation theory, a prominent approach to labour
market analysis (see Haughton and Peck, 1996, Peck, 1996). This work has been particularly useful in supporting the argument that labour market transformations are not only the result of pure economic forces, but also respond to changes in the social configuration of places at the local level. This approach is conceptually linked to the argument by Massey (1984/1995) that geographical variations are perpetuated by firms which seek to exploit local labour market qualities. More broadly, the work of Cox and Mair (1988, 1991, Cox, 1997) has been useful for defining the role of the local actors in orienting metropolitan economic development and in particular in forging locally different strategies from post-Fordist restructuring. In the same way that these authors demonstrated that places are associated with distinct economic sectors, functions and strategies of development, it is possible to imagine that local labour markets exhibit variations in their potential to achieve labour flexibility and that, as a result, they would be exploited in different ways.

In particular, the argument set out by Jamie Peck (1996) regarding the social regulation of local labour markets serves to establish the complex reality of labour markets as constructed entities built from the interactions of various social, economic and regulatory processes. The origin of this work, which is used as a theoretical backbone to this dissertation, is described below.

Peck’s framework rests on the inadequacy of neo-classical interpretations of labour as strictly a commodity in the economic sense. The author effectively attacks this conceptualisation of labour by highlighting its deficiencies in terms of the social side of the functioning of labour markets. In areas concerning the entrance of workers in the labour market, two elements are brought to our attention. First, unlike a regular commodity, labour is not integrated into the labour market according to the strict needs of
demand, but instead is also determined by the nature of the supply itself, which, in turn, is
defined by the socio-economic status of workers and local conditions. As Peck illustrates
(1996: 26):

[...] the supply of workers leaving school is not simply a function of the
number of available jobs, but instead the results from intersecting social,
demographic, educational, and economic decisions.

Second, the allocation of labour within the market is not strictly a case of skills
and labour quality, but is also determined by the constructed social position of various
groups of workers in society. As such, the contingent condition of workers is often a
reflection of their socio-economic features (especially age, gender, ethnicity and
immigrant status) and the ways these characteristics are institutionally used to sustain a
division between core and peripheral job markets.

Discussing issues of labour reproduction, Peck further notes the inherent social
construction of labour markets. Not only does the process of social reproduction support
capital accumulation, but ``accepted social practices contribute to determining and
reinforcing existing social divisions, particularly the gender division of labour.

Adding to this social regulation approach, Peck also builds on a theoretical model
of three generations of segmentation theory. In simple terms, segmentation theory
conceives the labour market as a series of sub-markets functioning individually according
to distinct norms and rules. Thus, contrary to orthodox economists who argue that all sub-
markets are derived from a “competitive model”, segmentation theorists emphasise that
labour markets are:

[...] social constructs, incorporating within them various rules and forms of
organisation which both condition their mode of operation and also
structure to some extent the actors themselves and determine their behaviour. (Castro, Méhaut, and Rubery, 1992, quoted in Peck, 1996: 47).

Peck explains that the first two generations of models provided a dualistic approach in which the internal labour markets are divided into primary and secondary sectors. A first generation, based on the work of Doeringer and Piore (1971), viewed this separation essentially as an outcome of technological imperatives and industrial structures. For its part, the second generation provided a less technologically deterministic interpretation by arguing that:

[...] capitalist firms sought to [consciously] segment their labor forces in the face of declining skills levels through the development of extended hierarchies and exploitation of racial and gender differences. (Peck, 1996: 53)

Of particular importance for an understanding of labour market dynamics, and in opposition to neo-classical theories, the dualistic models stressed the role of internal labour markets in partly determining the development of labour segments. In simpler words, it was acknowledged that firms’ interventions in hiring and promoting practices are not strictly a result of “extramarket inequalities”, but are also influenced by the ascribed features of workers. Such an approach offers a critical perspective on an understanding of labour market flexibility and particularly on the rise of new forms of work:

The notion of the internal labor market highlights alternatives to wage-clearing mechanism. Adjustment mechanisms such as production subcontracting, changing hiring standards, and job redesign might also be used. By their very existence, these alternatives undermine the orthodox view that the wage mechanism constitutes the primary source of adjustment. (Peck, 1996: 56)
A third generation of segmentation theory has done much in terms of locating causal factors and processes of segmentation within appropriately broader institutional and social contexts. An important aspect was the conception that labour market segmentation was produced at different levels. Segmentation occurs not only between core and peripheral sectors, but as well through the existence of divisions within firms. In addition, the tendencies towards segmentation are seen as the result of three interrelated "causal bases": conditions of labour demand, conditions of labour supply, and the forces of regulation. The first category emphasises the production imperatives that structure labour demand, the second refers to the processes of labour reproduction and the related features of labour supply, and the third highlights the role of regulatory institutions (particularly the state) in adjusting the interaction between the first two. Each of the three spheres are influenced by specific sets of factors which show how social divisions within the workforce is constructed, perpetuated and sometimes changed through these complex interactions.

In an attempt to build a fourth-generation segmentation theory, Peck addresses the issue of geographic contingency which was largely ignored in earlier approaches. The author takes on the task of formulating a theory for local labour markets studies. The need to look more specifically at the local level and the variability of labour markets over space represents a logical outcome given the prior reasoning of segmentation theory (Peck, 1996: 86):

If labour market structures, norms and practices are conditioned by the (uneven) social contexts in which they are embedded, then the functioning of labour market processes will vary across space.
This specific approach suggests the need to draw on two main concepts which emphasise the spatially variable nature of labour markets at the local scale. First, local labour markets are 'conjunctural' in the sense that they are subject to the intersecting effects of the afore-mentioned causal social processes (conditions of demand, conditions of supply, forces of regulation). Not only will the nature and structure of these three social processes vary in space, but so will the interaction between them. While general tendencies are not ignored, their intersection with the uniqueness of places contributes to producing different outcomes. For instance, referring to the work of Massey, Peck (1996: 93) contends that:

[... ] the same general process [e.g. economic restructuring] can produce different effects in different places, depending on the contingent interactions with preexisting concrete structures [e.g. industrial structure] and coexisting abstract processes [e.g. social division of labour].

The result is that local labour markets are conceptualised as social constructions where, for example, the general processes of the segmentation of labour and the gender division of reproductive labour are locally constituted through the availability of day care centres, intra-firm systems of production and welfare measures.

Second, with a particular focus on institutions, it is argued that labour markets are locally regulated. To support this argument, Peck pays particular attention to the uneven development of national labour markets drawing on the theoretical foundations of regulation theory. The author maintains that labour market regulation matters in three ways for the geography of labour. Firstly, regulation is needed to limit the impact of existing spatially uneven socio-economic development. Secondly, labour market regulation tends, intentionally or incidentally, to generate uneven development through national policies. Thirdly, the presence of regulation at the local level creates interactions
with existing local labour market characteristics and influences the distinctive development of labour markets. Therefore, not only does labour regulation vary over space, as regulation theory has demonstrated at the international level, but the effects of these regulations are spatially uneven.

The approach proposed by Peck illustrates that labour markets are complex entities that cannot be interpreted by simple causal relationships, but that a variety of processes interact to produce locally distinct outcomes. Not that the processes themselves are necessarily local, but how they intersect at the local level is more or less unique. In his theoretical research, the Peck has chosen to focus particularly on the role of social and political regulation, which proves to be helpful for understanding the broader context in which labour markets function. Perhaps most importantly here, Peck also demonstrates that places matter, as localities exhibit prior characteristics that affect their evolution.

In summary, as presented by Peck, the concepts of segmentation and regulation theory are useful for the interpretation of labour market changes and can be of assistance in the present analysis of the rise of labour market flexibility in several ways:

- Contrary to most post-Fordist models of restructuring, the social side of labour is systematically considered. Consequently, changes in the social ‘environment’ inside and outside the workplace (production vs. reproduction) must be seen as autonomous processes. From that standpoint, segmentation emerges from a mix of social construction and human capital factors. As well, the pre-existing social composition of workforces can facilitate or impair processes of labour restructuring.
• By signalling that labour segmentation can be perceived within firms as well as between sectors, the theory allows the researcher to explore intra-firm differences in working arrangements through segmentation.

• Despite a strong tendency towards a focus on state regulation (which is not empirically investigated in this research) the theoretical links between demand and supply are presented. This enables the researcher to investigate labour market changes by considering how both spheres adapt to each other. Thus, the rise of labour market flexibility can only be analysed by an understanding of how the positions of workers and employers are changing over time.

• More than any other approach to date, this fourth-generation segmentation theory offers the possibility of interpreting labour market differences across localities in the same national system. It proposes that the intersection of social, economic and regulatory processes working at various spatial scales take different forms in local environments. In that sense, the pre-existing features of labour forces and the economic bases of local places play a role in the development of particular labour market forms, including flexibility.

From this perspective, detailed and careful analyses of urban labour markets are needed. Not only should such inquiries document the changing aspects of international and national economies, but they should also describe the political context and the distinct characteristics of the workforce being investigated. However, Peck is silent about the ways to investigate such processes as he does not provide the researcher with a methodological framework or with examples of empirical research conducted at the local scale.
In order to fill this empirical gap in local labour markets theory, this thesis is an attempt at developing such methods. Keeping in mind that the complexity of local labour markets cannot entirely be revealed by empirical analysis, the following chapters shed light on some of the transformations in employment practices in specific places within the Canadian labour market.
CHAPTER THREE

NEW FORMS OF WORK IN CANADA’S AFTER-FORDISM: THE CONTEXT OF CHANGE FOR LABOUR

Following the argument made in the previous chapter regarding the need to document changes in demand and supply conditions of labour markets, this chapter reviews the most dominant economic and social transformations that have characterised Canadian society over the past three decades and have come to influence the structure of its labour market. First, Canadian labour market changes must be interpreted with reference to broader changes in its society. Therefore, in section 3.1, I review the most important social and demographic trends that have occurred in the last three decades. Second, to better understand what makes the contemporary Canadian economy different in contrast to the previous period, the characteristics of the economic and political shifts felt since the 1970s are described and analysed. Together, the review of key social, demographic, political and economic changes helps to define the context in which flexible employment may or may not develop, and why.

3.1 Social and Demographic Trends: Changing the Workforce Composition

In this section, I wish to review some of the major social and demographic trends in Canada that have affected the ways in which workers take part in the labour market.
Although I acknowledge that workers are influenced by overarching processes of economic and social transformations, rather than reacting passively to the needs and wills of employers, workers are seen as active agents in the process of labour flexibilisation.

Work is a social process. As the demographic structure of a society is modified, so is its relationship to labour. For example, as the number of single-parent families grows, more adults are likely forced to seek financial security through paid employment. Likewise, the changing nature of social values may affect the structure of labour markets. For instance, the declining number of children per family may have led to the increase of two-earner families in Canada or vice-versa. This may in part be explained by cultural factors that have encouraged members of society to increase their consumption. Other circumstances, such as the emancipation of women or the erosion of the welfare state, and rising costs of living may also have played a role in the growth of dual-income families. The explanation for this phenomenon is, therefore, by no means one-dimensional. Notwithstanding the exact causes, increases the proportion of people looking for work, diversifies the nature of labour composition, and, as a result, modifies traditional attitudes towards work (Rose and Villeneuve, 1998). Demographic and social shifts, therefore, have obvious implications for the structure of labour markets, whose changing nature cannot solely be interpreted according to economic conditions.

A Changing Age Structure

One of the most crucial demographic statistics for understanding the composition of today's labour force is the fertility rate. Lower fertility rates, for example, mean an ageing labour force. The power of these older workers may be disproportionately large in comparison with younger, less numerous, generations. It may also have an impact on
traditional gender roles, since parents (especially women) may have to spend less time, or at least a shorter period of time, raising children. Over the past thirty years, the decline in the number of births per Canadian woman is impressive. Between 1965 and 1985, the total fertility rate dropped from 3.1 to 1.7 births per woman (-45%) and has remained relatively low ever since (Statistics Canada, 1999a). It dropped under the 2.1 replacement threshold in 1972. This is not to say that the annual total of births has declined (it declined initially and since then has remained relatively stable), but that the average number of children per family has dropped sharply. Further, the number of families with three to five children declined while the number of families with zero or one child rose dramatically. While the baby boomers are still in their reproductive period, the population of Canada will continue to grow (i.e. the number of births will surpass the number of deaths) for some time. However, as the population ages, lower fertility rates will continue, so that around 2015, the Canadian population is likely to begin to decline, unless immigration is maintained at high levels to compensate.

At present, the direct impacts of these low fertility rates on labour are seen in the changing age structure of the Canadian labour force. After some improvements in the 1960s and 1970s, the relative influence of young workers has tended to decline since 1981 (Betcherman and Morissette, 1994, Morissette, 1997). As a direct consequence of demographic trends, the proportion of workers aged 15-24 grew until the mid-1970s to a high of 27%, before falling to a low of 15.9% in 1996. Associated with this decline, youth have experienced a decrease in relative hourly wages, have become more likely to work part-time (including involuntary part-time) and have had difficulty accessing well-paid jobs. While it could be argued that smaller cohorts of workers leads to a scarcity of

---

6 Total fertility rate: Sums of childrearing of a population of women for a given period.
labour and, in turn, to better bargaining position, the diminishing proportion of young workers in the entire labour force has had the reverse effect. In fact, because of the presence of large and older cohorts (i.e. baby boomers), the Canadian labour market is not characterised by an insufficiency of workers. In general, it seems that the smaller number and share of young workers has weakened their position in the labour market and increased the gap between generations. In a system predominantly based on seniority, it appears unlikely that such a gap will be reduced in the short term.

Labour market contrasts between generations also have an impact on the gender structure of labour markets. For example, while within older groups of workers the traditional gender division of labour is still very persistent, for younger groups gender differences by industries, occupations and income have declined or disappeared (Drouin, 1998). Given the powerful position of older generations of workers, 'their system' of gender relations is most likely to persist over that of a younger, more equitable, one, at least for the time being.

Overall, there are indications that fertility rates have consequential impacts on the functioning of labour markets. By modifying the age composition of the workforce, fertility rates tend to influence the relative power position of various age groups of workers. In turn, the weaker position of young workers noted above might incite them to adopt different strategies to enter the workforce or develop alternatives to employment (e.g. longer schooling). As a result, work experience of youth may often be characterised by flexible forms of employment.
Immigration

A second demographic trend influencing the organisation and composition of Canadian labour markets is international immigration. Throughout its history, Canada has been a country of immigrants. While the composition of the immigrant population changed over time, percentages of immigrants among the total Canadian population have remained consistently high. Until the Second World War, immigration was comprised largely of people of British and Irish descent. Americans made up the second largest number of immigrants to Canada, while Ukrainians were particularly numerous in the West. After the war, immigration from Great Britain still remained significant, but immigrants arrived increasingly from other parts of Europe. Populations from Italy, Portugal and later Poland, Germany, and Hungary then became dominant groups of immigrants. Starting in the 1970s, Canadian immigration became even more diversified. The proportion of British immigrants kept on decreasing while other European groups increased their presence in Canada. In addition, Asian population groups also started to enter Canada in substantial numbers. Arrivals from Asia intensified in the 1980s and 1990s. Groups from Africa and the Caribbean have also become an important aspect of Canadian immigration, contributing even more to its diversification. If, in the early years, immigrants settled in rural as well urban areas, today, a very high proportion choose urban settings, in particular the largest agglomerations (Bourne, 1996, Hiebert, 2000, Ledent, 1999).

The process of immigration may have several impacts on the development of labour markets. Immigration itself has often been used as a mechanism to stimulate economic development, and to fill gaps in the labour force, especially in periods of low unemployment (Hiebert, 2000, Veugelers and Klassen, 1994). Often, immigration
policies were aimed at attracting a foreign workforce that would 1) move to areas where workers were needed, 2) have skills underdeveloped by the Canadian-born, and/or 3) accept difficult working conditions (mining, railway, lumber) or jobs that Canadians would not take (e.g. domestic service). But as Beaujot (1991: 103) explains, such policies did not always meet their objectives:

When agriculturists were sought to settle the West, many in fact became unskilled labourers in Canada's early industrial development. When specialized skills were sought to fuel the urban-industrial expansion of the post-war era, many sponsored immigrants arrived as unskilled labourers.

Nevertheless, in comparison with the native-born population, immigrants tended to have socio-economic characteristics and skills which added to the productive capacity of the Canadian economy. Foreign-born populations, at least in recent years, generally had higher levels of education, were on average younger, and relied less on the welfare system. These features can be especially rejuvenating for an ageing workforce. However, more recently, immigration policies have facilitated the entry of more varied groups of immigrants. In addition to business immigrants and highly skilled workers who are selected based on a 'point system', Canada has, under the family reunification and refugee rules, accepted the arrival of people whose skills are not a criteria of admission.

As suggested by Simmons (1994) and by Mercer (1995) these policies may be seen as supporting a 'globalising' and polarising economy. On the one hand, the innovative and entrepreneurial characteristics of immigrants are sought through the promotion of business and investor immigration (Simmons, 1994, Wong, 1993). On the other hand, an unskilled labour force can be particularly useful to support staple production in a period of high international demand or to cater the needs for low-end service work in areas such as domestic work and accommodation (Preston and Giles,
Together, the arrival of the two different groups of immigrants also contributes to maintaining wages at low levels, which renders firms more competitive.

Again, the case of immigration patterns provides a good illustration of the approach needed to obtain a better understanding of recent labour market dynamics. In this context, as discussed in Chapter Two, the rise of self-employment can be presented as an outcome of the interaction between economic, social and institutional events. Immigrants may choose to become entrepreneurs because of their personal experience and aspirations. Yet, since many firms feel the need for sub-contracting out part of their activities as a way to save on labour costs, the restructured economy offers the context for the expansion of self-employment. In turn, this strategy tends to create a labour market in which opportunities for full-time permanent work are reduced, pushing even more people (immigrants and non-immigrants) towards self-employment (Globe & Mail, October 9, 2000). Finally, fine-tuning between the demand for workers and the supply of workers is facilitated by governments which put in place policies and programs that facilitate the entry of immigrants who respond to the needs of particular industries as well as to their own economic development strategy.

From this perspective, it can also be argued that the social and economic features of immigrants may have had an important role in either encouraging or discouraging the flexibilisation of the labour market. For instance, some groups of immigrants (e.g. Koreans, Chinese, Jewish) have been known to have higher than average entrepreneurial skills (Reitz, 1998). If, in a specific place, the numbers of immigrants from these groups increase, self-employment may be expected to rise. In itself, the flexibilisation of this specific local labour market is not simply related to macro-economic trends, but is also
explained by socio-cultural factors linked to the supply of labour in a given local labour market and the distinction between specific immigrant groups (Preston and Giles, 1997).

Families and Households

In the past three decades, living arrangements have undergone major modifications in Canadian society. In response to a variety of cultural, economic and social factors, traditional husband-wife families have declined rapidly as a percentage, and have been replaced by other types of family and non-family households, most of them smaller (Murdie and Teixeira, 2000). Consequently, the number of households has grown substantially faster than the population. It also means that a growing number of (smaller) units must become financially responsible for their ‘survival’. These varied forms of living arrangements have important implications for both at the individual level and at the household level. In particular, (paid) work and domestic responsibilities, and aspirations of individuals vary according to their family status. A review of the latest trends in family and household structures helps us to understand the possible repercussions on the supply of labour.

Another notable change in living arrangements has been the growth of dual-earner families. In the last thirty years, the proportion of husband-wife families with both spouses working has almost doubled (Chawla, 1992, Rose, 1996, Rose and Villeneuve, 1998). Higher rates of divorce, fewer children, older average age at marriage (or union), evolving cultural perceptions and changing social relations between men and women, are some of the factors that relate to the fact that women wish and/or need to be part of the workforce more than they did thirty years ago. In 1971, the participation rate of married

---

7 See Miron (1994) for a detailed account of changes in family and household forms from 1941 to 1986 in Canada.
women (including common-law) was 36%. Since then, this figure has reached 69%, with the result that dual-earner families are now the norm (Statistics Canada, 1999b). Clearly, the decline in the number of children per family has been a significant factor in this transition of women’s role within the family unit. Working couples are much less likely to have children than families where the husband is the sole earner (Beaujot, 1991). This is particularly true for younger couples.

Secondly, the number and proportion of persons in common-law unions has increased considerably over the past three decades. Since marriage is also negatively associated with the propensity of women to be in the workforce, this trend suggests that cohabitation is another factor that has facilitated the increase in women’s participation rate. The fact that common-law couples are less likely to have children also contributes to this increase. Not only are marriage and children related negatively with women’s workforce participation but, when women are part of the labour force, they increase the chance of work interruption and of part-time work.

Thirdly, since the 1960s, the growth of single parenthood has constituted one of the most critical changes in family organisation. Between 1991 and 1996 alone, the rate of growth of lone-parent families was four times larger than that of husband-wife families (common-law included) (Statistics Canada, 1997a). About 83% of lone-parent families have a woman as the head of the family. Obviously, for single-parents the circumstances of childrearing are particularly difficult, since they are single-income earner and caregiver by default. Not only must they secure stable earnings, but they must also raise children without support from a spouse. Yet, because of family responsibilities and the fact that they tend to have less education, single-parents, especially women, often have difficulties finding full-time work.
Each of the above trends in living arrangements points to the growing involvement of women in paid work and changes in domestic relations. For the structure of the labour market, this tendency towards the feminisation of work implies a diversification of labour supply. Not only are women entering the workforce in greater numbers, but they do so with a wide variety of needs and goals. Depending on their living arrangement and on the presence and number of children, women will have longer or shorter work periods and will tend to work more or fewer hours per week. Yet, adding to the complexity of the process of feminisation, the labour force participation of women with children has grown faster than that of women without children (Rose and Villeneuve, 1998).

Overall, this review of some recent demographic and social trends in Canadian society points towards a new structure of employment in which the status of segments of the workforce is different than what it was before the 1970s. Changes in the proportional and absolute representation of some social groups, and new social norms, affect the traditional place of social groups in society and, by extension, modify their attitude towards work. For instance, as more women and immigrants join the labour market, new attitudes to paid employment are surfacing. Among other things, typical work arrangements may not correspond with the needs and aspirations of these social groups. In addition, the labour market may not be offering them the type of opportunities that they are seeking. In short, alterations in the social structure of the workforce may have led to changes in the type of employment people seek, and in particular, resulted in an expansion of flexible employment.
3.2 Canada’s Economic Restructuring and Policy Responses

For the purpose of this research, an important assumption is made with respect to the changing nature of the economy and the social relationships that regulate it. Based on the concepts of the regulation school previously outlined, it is assumed that the study period (1970-1996) is an era of political and economic restructuring for all industrialised nations. Fordism, the earlier political economic system, which supported growth after the Second World War, entered a period of transition during the 1970s. Since then, capitalist economies have been testing a series of alternative models of development (after-Fordist models), in the hope of finding a sustainable solution to the ongoing process of restructuring.

Canada’s recent history must be understood with reference to a combination of factors that originate from this apparently hegemonic context, from Canada’s internal condition prior to this transformation, and from the varied ways in which Canadian firms and people have been responding to these ongoing changes. In this section, a description and analysis of the post-war economic transition of Canada are presented. The consequences of this transformation for labour will be highlighted. It is argued here that it is through the understanding of Canadian Fordism that Canada’s after-Fordism can best be conceptualised, and its effects on labour markets best interpreted. As it has been argued in Chapter Two, the concept of after-Fordism helps us to theorise the contrast between today’s society and economy and those of the preceding era. Therefore, it constitutes a major conceptual tool in understanding the origin of the current labour market transition, as it offers the possibility to review this transition in conjunction with major political economic changes and the broader societal shifts presented in the first section.
3.2.1 An Economic System in Transition

*Permeable Fordism*

Canadian Fordism shares a number of characteristics with other Fordist models and in particular with that of the United States. The post-war period was associated with a series of measures that enabled the rapid growth of a Canadian middle class. The formation of the welfare state and the growing unionisation of manufacturing and public sectors workers were among the most important actions that ensured the constant growth of consumption. By extension, this system also meant long-term job security for most paid workers. Improved (Taylorist) methods of production and investments in infrastructure made sure that productivity would be followed by an increasing demand for consumption goods. In short, the hegemonic (and international) model of Fordism was about maintaining a relative equilibrium between mass production and mass consumption.

In Canada, the type of development model that dominated the 1945-1973 period, can be typified by its economic dependency on the U.S., hence, the term ‘permeable Fordism’ coined by Jenson, (1989a) to illustrate the extent of economic openness of the Canadian economy. Similarly, Watkins (1997) talks about the persistence of ‘dependent industrialisation’ to depict the close trading links between the two countries.

During that period, although Canada’s social development policies were explicitly aimed at improving living conditions and reinforcing its system of redistribution, the means for achieving these objectives were mostly based on furthering continental economic links. Despite the absence of comprehensive free trade agreements, Canada and the U.S. could work within the limits of international agreements such as Bretton Woods
and GATT negotiations to facilitate flows of goods and capital. For Canada, there were basically three dimensions to these trade relations: 1) exports to the U.S. of natural resources to supply American-based production, 2) imports of American goods to take advantage of a growing consumer market (Barnes, 1996), and 3) imports of U.S. capital to Canada to support technological development and productivity improvements in the resource-extracting industry and in branch plants (Clement and Williams, 1997). Exports of some manufactured goods could be added to these three categories, as they rose considerably during the Fordist era with the signing of the Canada-U.S. Auto-Pact in 1965 (see Gertler, 1999, Holmes, 1996, 2000)

In general, labour benefited from the dominant economic relations of Fordism, but labour relations also tended to reflect the permeable nature of the Canadian model of Fordism. By the mid-1960s, Canada’s unemployment was at its lowest since the immediate after-war period (Figure 3.1), and social security had been strengthened considerably as a result of the expansion of social policies and of private support for fringe benefits. Governments, as direct employers and through nationalised industries, contributed greatly to such improvements. Although gains were unequal across social groups, occupations and industries, levels of unionisation jumped from 16.3% among the non-agricultural workforce in 1940 to 33.6 in 1971 (Rutherford, 1996). For the most part, this was due to the involvement of large American unions in Canadian-based firms which represented around 70% of unionised workers (Jenson and Mahon, 1993a). As Jenson and Mahon (1993a: 74) explain, not surprisingly, the influence of American unions was reflected in the type of labour contracts in place in Canada:

[...] collective-bargaining practices in many respect resembled the American pattern – highly decentralized and focused on securing wage increases in accordance with productivity rises, while posing a limited,
and highly bureaucratic challenge to capital’s prerogatives in the workplace via complex grievance procedures.

**Figure 3.1: Unemployment Rates in Canada, 1946-1999**

![Unemployment Rates Graph]


However, despite these seemingly similar labour relations, the Canadian federal government did more than its counterpart in the U.S. to reduce social and spatial inequalities within Canada. Whereas the wage gap between the unionised auto-workers and the rest of the manufacturing industry was roughly 40% in the U.S., it was ‘only’ 20% in Canada (Rutherford, 1996).

The biggest problem for Canadian workers in being so closely associated with American unions (and more generally, being part of the American industrial system of production), was the limited ability of Canadian institutions to defend their interests when they differed from those of American workers or when economic conditions were
divergent in the two countries. Obviously, in times of economic slowdown in the U.S., permeability placed Canadian unionised workers in a relatively weak bargaining situation. During most of the Fordist period, public policies worked to sustain the permeability of the Canadian economy mainly through perpetuating its reliance on staple products as well as on foreign (U.S.) capital.

The Side Effects of Permeable Fordism

As theorised by regulationists, in the second half of the 1960s, the fragile balance between gains in productivity and growing consumption started to dissolve. For reasons discussed in the preceding chapter, increases in productivity were declining, while labour costs and fixed capital costs were rising (see Glyn et al., 1990). Under these circumstances, the profitability of enterprises was falling. In many countries, including Canada, the resulting reactions to these conditions on the part of firms, governments, and labour contributed to forging a period of economic and, to some extent, social crisis.

One of the main difficulties directly linked to permeable Fordism was the dependency of Canada’s manufacturing system on U.S. investments. When American productivity started to fall in the late 1960s (see Harvey, 1989), so did investments in Canada’s branch plants and resource-based industry. As a result, technological research and development were reduced and rates of manufacturing job creation fell. Secondly, after 1973, the oil crisis directly affected the stability of the resource industry and consequently produced a rapid increase in inflation (Wolfe, 1984). national policies, such as wage controls and anti-inflation regulations proved to be unsuccessful in solving these problems because of the openness of the Canadian economy (especially with the U.S.). In fact, during most of the 1970s, economic growth was slow, unemployment rose and so
did inflation (Filion, 1996, Watkins, 1997). Despite this situation, governments remained blind to the problem and kept on increasing their social expenditures, and thus accumulating larger deficits.

This period of economic crisis was coupled with labour struggles. The inability of governments to effectively respond to corporate needs for improved productivity and for greater economic stability meant that workers were going to be used as a way to maintain profitability in a greater proportion than before. From the late 1960s to the mid-1970s, workers in Canada reacted with an unprecedented wave of strikes (Heron, 1996) that reflected the crisis of Fordist labour relations. For workers, the strikes produced favourable regulatory changes in labour policies both in the private and public sectors. But these gains marked the end of almost three decades of progress in Canadian labour relations. Starting in the late 1970s, it became increasingly clear that Canada was moving towards a development model characterised by an even greater continental integration than during the Fordist era (Jenson and Mahon, 1993a).

After-Fordism

Although the 1980s were marked by moments of significant growth, major economic indicators showed the beginning of typically Canadian after-Fordism. This period from the economic recession of 1982 to the latest in 1990-92 resulted in the loss of thousands of well-paid manufacturing jobs and, by the end of the latter recession, of tertiary jobs as well. Parallel to these job losses, government revenues declined while social costs and debt servicing costs increased. This produced levels of federal deficits ranging from 26 to 41 billion dollars.
During this same period, the signing of the Free Trade Agreement (FTA) with the U.S. in 1989 again consolidated Canada’s open economy. The agreement aimed to diversify the Canadian economy by gaining access to the U.S. market. More so, the impact of the FTA would allow the strengthening of its industrial sectors, the development of its technology and a gradual move away from the primary sector (Britton, 1998). However, the impacts of the liberalisation of trade seem to have been uneven from region to region, from sector to sector and from firm to firm. While in some cases, it has permitted the expansion of large national corporations (e.g. Bombardier, Northern Telecom), it sometimes acted to the detriment of the national labour market (Drache and Gertler, 1991). In other cases, the elimination of trade barriers increased the competitive pressures on American branch plants that led to job losses in Canada’s manufacturing heartland (MacLachlan, 1996).

Other structural shifts within the economy also marked the past quarter of the century and tend to confirm the transition to a new economy. First, building on a constant trend, labour supply was increasingly characterised by the presence of women. Relating to changes mentioned above regarding family and household forms, the participation rate of women in Canada rose from 44% in 1975 to 59% in 1999. Combined with the decline in the men’s labour force participation rate, this has enabled a closing of one aspect of the gender gap. This is particularly the case for women without children, who have a participation rate of 63% compared with a rate of 73% for men (1994 data from Statistics Canada, 1994).

Secondly, the feminisation of the workforce corresponded with persistent sectoral changes in employment, typified by the rapid growth of service employment, while the number of goods-producing jobs (primary, manufacturing and construction) stabilised
(Coffey, 1996, Coffey and Bataïni, 1998, Simmons and McCann, 2000). In Canada, of the 5.7 million new jobs created between 1971 and 1996, 5 million (88%) were in the service sector, thus, growing at a pace over three times faster than goods-producing employment (see Table 3.1). The growth of services should be seen as an inherent part of the modern economy based on consumption. As more goods are produced, the services required to market, administer and distribute them are expanded and become part of the overall process of ‘production’. This structural shift in employment may also help us to understand the growing heterogeneity of work arrangements as different segments of the service sector increasingly tend to be composed either of ‘good jobs’ or of ‘bad jobs’ (Noyelle and Stanback, 1984), some of which are fostered by the development of international/global cities (Sassen, 1994) and of a new international division of labour (Clark, 1996, Lipietz, 1997, Storper, 1997b).

Table 3.1: Changes in the Sectoral Structure of Employment in Canada, 1971-1996

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Goods-producing '000</th>
<th></th>
<th>Services '000</th>
<th></th>
<th>Total '000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>2,966</td>
<td>(34.4)</td>
<td>5,661</td>
<td>(65.6)</td>
<td>8,627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>3,801</td>
<td>(31.7)</td>
<td>8,205</td>
<td>(68.3)</td>
<td>12,005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>3,886</td>
<td>(27.3)</td>
<td>10,335</td>
<td>(72.2)</td>
<td>14,220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>3,665</td>
<td>(25.6)</td>
<td>10,653</td>
<td>(74.4)</td>
<td>14,318</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Thirdly, the economies of all industrialised nations have gradually shifted away from their domestic markets to competition at an international scale. This has had considerable implications for labour. Given the already open character of the Canadian economy, the recent step towards ‘globalisation’ may not appear as steep as it is for many other nations. Still, the neo-liberal rhetoric supporting the expansion of external markets
and the dissolution of trade barriers has far more important implications for the structure of national economies and for their economic sovereignty. The corporate attempt to facilitate trade in goods, services and capital between countries indicates a significant turn from a society where wealth is redistributed by the state, to a society that rests increasingly on ‘natural’ market forces to maintain some level of social and economic balance. The pressures coming from the corporate world raise questions regarding the ability of national governments to control their own economy and, as noted by Drache and Gertler (1991: 3), the extent to which they can sustain social and economic policies:

Where existing programs are perceived as barriers to business, they have to be modified so as not to impede the trade in goods and services. If present standards stand in the way of harmonization and competitiveness, new standards have to be imposed, even if it means overturning existing national programs.

The consequences of this increasingly borderless economy have been particularly oppressive for labour or at least for some groups of workers. Firms typically require deregulation of labour markets as they push for ways to increase their competitiveness. In key sectors of the Canadian economy such as manufacturing and resource-extraction, the long-term job security of a predominantly male working force is particularly endangered by the pressures of globalisation (Drache and Glasbeek, 1992). Apart from the adoption of new labour-saving technology and direct cut-backs in the number of workers, their job security, relatively high wages and rigid labour contracts are some of the aspects that employers seek to modify in order to reduce labour costs. In addition, as trade agreements and corporate concentration have facilitated the mobility of capital, many enterprises now have more freedom to move production to wherever conditions are more profitable. This effectively diminishes the bargaining power of workers, except for groups of workers whose specific skills are needed.
As a direct consequence of this transition, starting in the early 1980s, family incomes have been on the decline compared with economic growth (see Figure 3.2). Even in the growing service sector the position of workers is being affected by the growing mobility of capital. For instance, large financial corporations (banks, insurance companies) seeking to become more competitive at the international scale, have been merging. In many cases, this has resulted in the relocation of head offices and the dismissal of numbers of employees when services are merged. More than in other sectors, it also makes intuitive sense to think that services may be a sector where labour flexibility can be highly desirable for firms because of the wide variability in demand at various periods in some services.

Figure 3.2: Real Per Capita GDP and Real Average Family Income in Canada, 1967-1994


As a combined result of these trends, the capacity of workers, including organised workers, to influence their working conditions became increasingly constrained during
that period. After two to three decades of consistent gains, labour movements throughout North America began to wear down. Sub-contracting arrangements, privatisation and back-to-work legislation were becoming common place (Phillips, 1997). Attacks on labour came both from employers who were faced with stagnant productivity, decreasing profitability and increasing global competition, and from governments which worked at deregulating labour markets in an attempt to solve the broader problems of the economy. For Jenson and Mahon (1993a: 81), these strategies have to be seen as...

[...] part of a broader package including the consolidation of a continental mode of regulation that would incorporate the Canadian economy into the regime of polarized growth that has already taken place in the United States.

For these authors, the Free Trade Agreement has to be understood in this context of North American post-Fordism (see also Mahon, 1991). As a direct consequence of these strategies, private sector unions were faced with massive layoffs within the manufacturing workforce and, more often than not, forced into a defensive position with respect to their demands (Rutherford, 1998). In the public sector as well, attacks were made on the earlier gains made by labour (see Tanguay, 1993).

More recently, in the 1990s, one could refer to the entrenchment of after-Fordism, to borrow Pierre Filion’s term (Filion, 1996). Starting in the last period of recession, 1990-92, firms intensified their restructuring process, aiming both at increasing their productivity (e.g. research and development, professional training) and at reducing production costs (e.g. layoffs and workforce relocation, flexible work arrangements, and the reduction of other operating costs). In terms of trade relations, Canada’s economy has further increased its continental dependence with the signing of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), which added Mexico to the free trade zone, and with the
acceleration of freer trade initiatives with other parts of the world under the GATT and the WTO (Gertler and Schoenberger, 1992). Although the effects of trade liberalisation have not all been negative, it has caused uncertainty, deepened unevenness between industrial sectors and regions (Britton, 1998), weakened East-West national links (Richardson, 1998, Villeneuve, 1997), and emphasised the role of continental integration in the discourse of political economic development. The combined actions of the private and public sectors, therefore, generated massive layoffs in manufacturing and services, many of them directly related to the use of sub-contracting arrangements or temporary workers. It also caused the relocation of production outside national boundaries, and the acquisitions or mergers of certain firms. As such, economic changes in western countries, and the related ideological shift, have produced much instability.

The following section attempts to demonstrate how Canadian public administrations have intentionally or unintentionally facilitated this economic transition. Moving away from their role in supporting employment during Fordism, after-Fordist governments have adopted strategies similar to those of the private sector by cutting back on their workforce and restructuring the ways they produce services. Moreover, it has become common place to re-regulate Fordist policies to eliminate or modify those policies which employers perceived as detrimental to economic competitiveness. For the sake of eliminating national and sub-national deficits, governments throughout developed countries have been elected on their promises to improve the management of social programs (Stanford, 1995).
3.2.2 Policy Changes

During the days of Fordism, the state played a crucial role in the progressive development of labour markets. In an era of economic growth marked by gains in productivity and profitability, governments became the promoters and regulators of 'full employment', income protection and redistribution, and other social security measures. This policy regime came to be known as the 'Keynesian welfare state'. In Canada, Unemployment Insurance (1942), Family Allowances (1945), Canada Assistance Plan (1966), Old Age Pensions (1952), Canada and Québec Pension Plans (1966), and a progressive tax system were among the most important programs introduced to limit income inequalities among individuals, families and age groups.

For some authors the scope and impacts of this social reform in Canada were relatively limited when compared with those in many other western countries. It has been demonstrated, for example, that Canadian social expenditures were lower than standards established in most European nations (Banting, 1987, O’Connor, 1989), and that social policies did not considerably change patterns of inequality (Gillepsie, 1980). Nonetheless, the creation of welfare programs marked a significant advancement in the support available to vulnerable groups in Canada. While social measures did little to decrease income inequalities, they proved to be efficient in stopping the trend towards greater polarisation until the early 1990’s (Banting, 1987, Bourne, 1993).

Moreover, Canadian labour achieved clear progress in the post-war era including a noticeable increase in its real wage through the 1970s. In 1944, the federal government recognised the right of labour to be represented by unions, following similar regulations
in the U.S. (Wagner Act). In short, Canada’s first regulation of collective bargaining contained four major features (Drache and Glasbeek, 1992):

1) It obligated employers to acknowledge the existence of democratically chosen unions and to recognise their role as the bargaining representative of unionised workers.

2) Employers were required to negotiate in good faith with the unions.

3) In case of an impasse, employers had the right to lock out employees, and employees had the right to strike.

4) Any agreement reached between the employers and unions was to be legally enforceable.

In the meantime, the size of the public labour force, including crown corporations, grew rapidly in association with the increased role of governments in service provision, and in elaborating and improving a system of social redistribution. Clearly, governments then became more than just creators and enforcers of social and economic regulations, and have since occupied a major economic position as Canada’s most important employer. The expansion of public administration also signified another important step for organised labour. In this important part of the economy, unionisation rates are higher, although organised labour became the norm later than in the private sector. It is not until the 1960s that, as part of Québec’s Quiet Revolution, levels of unionisation in Québec climbed to cover the majority of public employees. Soon after, the rest of Canada’s public sector labour groups obtained similar rights, so that in just a few years (1967-1974), their unionisation rate grew from 37% to almost 68% (Drache and Glasbeek, 1992). Because women were better represented in public services than in the primary and secondary sectors, this wave of unionisation in the public sector also marked an important step towards equalisation of labour rights across gender lines.
Despite some notable drawbacks in the construction of the welfare state, by the end of the 1970s the Canadian population and more particularly its workforce, lived and worked under considerably better conditions in comparison with the situation prior to 1944. As a direct outcome of workers' recently earned bargaining power, working conditions improved, the working week had been reduced and real wages increased. In addition, as mentioned earlier, the establishment of a range of social programs reduced income disparities between classes and regions.

*The 1980s and 1990s*

As described in the section on economic changes, the recession of the early 1980s caused much uncertainty in the Canadian labour market. Higher rates of unemployment (refer to Figure 3.1, p. 69), extended periods of lower employment-to-population ratios (Figure 3.3), slower growth in rates of real wages (Canada, 1996, Drache, 1991), and the growing presence of less stable forms of employment combined to produce greater inequality and to increase the proportion of population living below the poverty line (Banting, 1987).

In an increasingly open economy, however, the ability of governments to respond to these social pressures appeared more limited than before. Banting (1987) illustrates the awkward position of governments in the midst of two contradictory dynamics. On one hand, as particular individuals, groups, economic sectors and regions increasingly bore the consequences of economic transition, governments came under pressure to accentuate their redistributive role. Yet, slower growth and increasing expenditures on existing programs severely constrained governments ability to develop new social measures. On

---

Examples of these drawbacks are noted by Drache and Glasbeek (1992) who claim that labour relations and policies in Canada were weaker than in many European countries, in part because of the resource-based economy.
the other hand, the requirements of a burgeoning international economy encouraged states to place emphasis on the development of flexible labour markets and deregulation. Under the influence of these two forces, the strengthening of Keynesian policies appeared unlikely. In contrast, the rise of a neo-liberal rhetoric pointed to the de-structuring of social programs.

**Figure 3.3:** Evolution of the Employment/Population Ratio* in Canada, 1976-1999

*The employment/population ratio measures the percentage of the population of 15 years and over employed at a given time.

For Canada, the 1980 decade was characterised by seemingly paradoxical events. In that decade, Canada’s most important recession since the Great Depression initiated one of its most intense periods of growth ever. This period of growth was coupled by profound changes in the Canadian social system. In a nutshell, the changing discourse of politicians and an unprecedented series of transformations of social programs indicated the definitive end of the Fordist age and the weakening of Keynesian policies. For Gow
and Simard (1999: 75) the restructuring of Canadian public administration was
illustrative of that period:

[...] the Progressive-Conservative government headed by Brian Mulroney
(from 1984 to 1993) tried to set a new course for the Canadian public
administration. Their top priorities in this regard were to increase
efficiency and responsiveness of the bureaucracy, as well as to reduce its
size, while scaling down the scope of government in society.”

During the first six years of the Mulroney government, social spending in Canada
as a percentage of GDP was slashed by more than 12% (Drache and Gertler, 1991: 18). In
concert with budgetary restrictions, the government introduced cutbacks in all major
federal social programs except the old age pension, and reduced social transfers to
provinces. In addition, the rapid rise of taxes on consumption (GST) directly
affected low-income families.

Yet according to Jane Jenson (1989a: 77), by the end of the decade, neo-liberal
ideology and policies were still not profoundly imprinted in Canadian society and this
marked an important distinction compared with other western democracies:

“[...] the ideological offensive against the state responsibility for income
redistribution and protection which shaped the politics of much of Western
Europe and the U.S.A., has not appeared in Canada.”

For Jenson, despite cutbacks in governments social expenditures, Canada did not
witness the same kind of systematic and widespread attacks against labour and social
movements that characterised most Western European countries in the 1980s. Moreover,
evidence of the rise of right-wing parties and of clear partisan realignment were not
experienced in Canada (see also Banting, 1987). Instead of an unequivocal disavowal of
the welfare state, attitudes towards social issues tended to reflect a mix of collectivist and
individualist values. The reform of social programs mirrored this position as programs such as health care continued to receive strong public and popular support, while others such as unemployment insurance were under more direct attack. The result is that the 1980s were marked by a shift in the position and the discourse of the state regarding its role in social policy and economic development, but, policy wise, this liberal-productivist view did not materialise to the same extent as it did in other countries.

The view that governments should no longer be solely responsible for maintaining social cohesion and relative equality by stabilising market forces became more forceful. Instead, the state would increase support to business in the hope that it will fuel the economy and that benefits will 'naturally' trickle down to the levels of workers and communities. Through measures such as direct grants, and research and development programs, governments can be expected to create a favourable business context that would render Canadian-based firms (domestic or foreign) more competitive and attract even more economic investments. Public funds in support of a strong welfare state then came in direct competition with funds for sustaining a competitive open economy. While state intervention and popular support for a neo-liberal social and economic system remained weaker than in other parts of the world, the 1980s signalled the shift toward more market-oriented economic policies, a trend which would accelerate in the following decade in response to greater international pressures and domestic change.

A number of institutional reports came forth in support of a profound "re-thinking and re-formulation of Canada's welfare state" in the 1990s (Canada, 1993, 1994a, 1994b, 1996, 1997, CCSD, 1992, 1993, Richards, 1998). Building on the neo-liberal rhetoric on the previous decade, changes in economic and social policies increasingly reflected the drive to develop a society of 'winners'. From now on, the success of the nation would be
strictly measured in terms of economic performance. In this world of 'winners', competitiveness and efficiency are key concepts that preceded notions of social cohesion. Echoing a 1994 survey, the Policy Research Committee revealed that the values of decision-makers were considerably different than those of the general public (Canada, 1996). Significantly for the development of public policies, decision-makers conferred their lowest scores to “redistributive wealth” (43%), “social equality” (53%), “equality among all regions” (53%), and “collective rights” (55%), while their highest ratings were given to “competitiveness” (85%), “integrity” (82%), and “minimal government” (77%).

On this last point, it is worthwhile noting that the proportion of employment in the public sector dropped from 1/5 to 1/6 of the total from 1976 to 1996, with net jobs losses of 121,000 in the last four years alone (CCSD, 1997).

Affected by a second recession in ten years, the conditions of the Canadian economy in the early 1990s were surely a critical factor in the materialisation of this position in economic development. Notably, the increase of unemployment rates and the decline of the proportion of people taking part in the labour market was at least comparable to figures of the earlier recession.

Two of the most important series of measures taken to reduce government overhead and social expenditures concerned health care and social services and unemployment insurance. First, in 1990-91, the federal government imposed a budget freeze on its per capita payment to provinces for health care and post-secondary education (CCSD, 1992). This meant that until 1994-95 transfers would not take into account the level of economic growth (GDP), but only population growth. Second, a series of legislative and administrative measures considerably changed the face of the
Unemployment Insurance (UI or EI) program (Canada, 1998). In 1990, the government introduced a first series of modifications that tightened benefit eligibility requirements:

1. The minimum period people had to work to be eligible went from 10 to 14 weeks to 10 to 20 weeks,
2. The maximum period of time that unemployed could claim benefits was reduced,
3. Penalties increased for those who voluntarily quit their jobs.

In 1993, another reform completely excluded voluntary quitters. In 1994, the number of weeks of work required to be eligible increased from 10 to 12 weeks in high-unemployment-rate regions and the number of insurable weeks was reduced by 8 weeks on average. In 1996, the maximum insurable weeks was cut from 50 to 45 in high-unemployment-rate regions and eligibility requirements were increased for new entrants and re-entrians to the labour force. On the other side, eligibility rules were adapted to benefit a larger proportion of part-time workers. As a result of these numerous policy reforms, the proportion of the unemployed covered by what is now called Employment Insurance, that is the beneficiary/unemployed ratio, dropped from 83% in 1990 to 42% in 1997.9

As illustrated on Figure 3.4, at least 48% of the drop can be attributed to policy reforms although this decline can also be explained in part by changes in the composition of the workforce.10 In other words, approximately half of the unemployed not covered by the program would have been covered had no policy changes been made in the 1990s.

---

9 The beneficiary/unemployed ratio (B/U ratio) compares the number of regular EI beneficiaries to the number of unemployed as estimated by Statistics Canada.
10 The overall decline is attributed to policy changes (48%), labour force changes (43%) and change in the ratio of beneficiaries with earnings to unemployment (9%). Since for the third category it is impossible to say if the decline is due to changes in the workforce composition or policy changes, it is assumed that 48% is a minimum in the first category.
Figure 3.4: Actual B/U Ratio (1976-1997) and Calculated Program Changes Component (1990-1997)

As indicated in Table 3.2, the total percentage point decline in unemployment coverage were relatively more important in the Atlantic provinces and Québec between 1989 and 1997. But the percentage of this change explained by policy changes was highest in the four western provinces. Obviously, if such a strategy has made the Canadian labour market more competitive vis-à-vis the U.S. market, it also implies an important reduction of most workers' bargaining position. Reduced federal support for unemployment benefits implies a greater dependency of the unemployed on provincial welfare programs. For example, Québec has calculated that more than 30,000 new welfare recipients in their province became welfare-dependent because they were pushed out of the UI programs. As a result, each individual province has introduced cut-backs in their social welfare programs and tried to substitute welfare policies with job creation programs (National Council of Welfare, 1997). The latter have largely produced negligible results to date.
### Table 3.2: Change in the Beneficiary/Employed Ratio by Province (1989-1997)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Nfld.</th>
<th>PEI</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>NB</th>
<th>Qué</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percentage points</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B/U in 1989</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B/U in 1997</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-1989 change</td>
<td>-.97</td>
<td>-.46</td>
<td>-.50</td>
<td>-.45</td>
<td>-.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proportion of the decline explained by:</strong></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour market changes</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program changes</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change in beneficiaries with earnings to unemployment ratio</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ont</th>
<th>Man</th>
<th>Sask</th>
<th>Alta</th>
<th>BC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percentage points</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B/U in 1989</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.68</td>
<td>.68</td>
<td>.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B/U in 1997</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>.32</td>
<td>.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-1989 change</td>
<td>-.29</td>
<td>-.33</td>
<td>-.32</td>
<td>-.36</td>
<td>-.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proportion of the decline explained by:</strong></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour market changes</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program changes</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change in beneficiaries with earnings to unemployment ratio</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Thus, contrary to what Jenson (1989a) had witnessed ten years ago, it seems that governments in Canada now advocate the same general neo-liberal strategies off development as do many of their Western counterparts. From the federal Liberals to Ontario’s Tories, most, if not all, provinces have elected governments on the basis of their promises to manage social expenditures more efficiently, to eliminate their deficits... and, as a result, to make Canada (or individual provinces) a more competitive environment. Obviously, the erosion of the welfare state that Jenson had identified in the 1980s has taken a more significant turn in the nineties.
3.3 Summary

The prime objective of this chapter was to describe the transformation of labour markets that has occurred in Canada in recent years. Following the introduction of theoretical constructs that was presented in Chapter Two, the history of Canada since the Second World War was divided into two periods. However, it remains difficult to specify a date at which the first period gave way to the second. Instead, the shift from one to the other seems better defined by a relatively long period of transition during which some changes have been more abrupt than others. For instance, while the demographic transformation of Canada was clearly fixed by the end of the 1970s, it would seem that political and economic behaviours had not yet been modified significantly. Political-economic responses to elements of crisis took place gradually, initially taking the form of neo-liberal discourses, and later translating into profound policy reform.

Notwithstanding the precise timing of these events, I argue in this thesis that such changes have had deep impacts on the labour market. Together, the above demographic, social, political and economic trends have not only modified the general structure of the Canadian labour market, they have engendered a situation in which a growing proportion of workers are employed in a non-traditional fashion.\textsuperscript{11} In Canada, as in most other industrialised countries, the transformation of work arrangements has taken several forms which include multi-job holding, part-time work, flexible work schedules, temporary work and self-employment. Some of these trends are reviewed in the next chapter.

\textsuperscript{11} From the early 1980s to 1999, unemployment rates in Canada have hardly been lower than 8% with peaks well above 10%. More importantly perhaps, the proportion of the population in employment has remained at low levels for most of that period.
CHAPTER FOUR

THE DEVELOPMENT OF FLEXIBLE WORK
IN CANADA (1971-1996)

Together, the two previous chapters have served to highlight the general context underlying the transformation of employment in Canada. The current chapter portrays the specific outcomes of that transition by providing a description of the trends and patterns in flexible employment between 1971 and 1996. The analysis is divided into three main sections. Through a review of statistical reports, the first section presents the recent development of a selected number of 'new' forms of work in Canada. Measuring the extent to which the phenomenon of labour flexibilisation is occurring within the Canadian labour market, however, simply provides a benchmark from which to start the analysis for smaller geographical units. In that sense, what is peculiar about Canadian labour market trends is emphasised rather than assumed to have followed patterns described and analysed elsewhere in the literature. Moreover, describing the nature of changes for several forms of work reveals the immense complexity and diversity of processes of labour restructuring. By extension, the contrast between the diversified character of contemporary labour practices and the typical (more homogeneous) Fordist working arrangement, is also shown. Finally, following arguments made in Chapters Two
and Three, the description of these trends is an opportunity to emphasise the need to consider, simultaneously, demand side and supply side factors in the analysis of labour flexibilisation.

The second section is more focused on the geography of these changes. Using data from the Canadian censuses of 1971, 1981, 1991 and 1996, levels of self-employment and part-time work are described and analysed for Canada’s ten largest urban agglomerations (i.e. CMAs) since the early 1970s. A comparison between the specific trends and patterns in new forms of work for these ten places sheds light on the spatial continuity or discontinuity of this phenomenon in urban Canada (or at the very least among the upper level of the urban system). As such, this comparison illustrates the specificity of the ways in which local labour markets are experiencing this transition and constitutes an essential preface to the two case studies presented later.

Thirdly, to reflect on the place of geography in the present study, the concluding section discusses the impacts of labour flexibilisation on the uneven development of local labour markets within a national system of cities. This discussion, in turn, provides an occasion to situate labour flexibilisation within the broader process of economic restructuring. As such, it ultimately raises issues regarding the production of spatial unevenness and its relationship with the changing labour process. Since many questions remain unanswered at this point, this section provides a bridge for the following two analytical chapters.

4.1 The Rise of Atypical Forms of Work in Canada Since the Early 1970s

Recently, I undertook the exercise of reviewing the work experiences of friends. They are men and women in their late twenties to early thirties with different training
background, skills and ambitions. Yet, one thing they seem to have in common is their employment mobility. Since entering the labour market, they have gone from one job to another so that by the age of thirty it would not be unusual to have worked for more than ten different employers. While these situations are certainly related to the business cycle and the lingering recession, as well as to the life-cycle, or reflect preferences and the desire to improve their labour market position, I argue that these conditions are also a reflection of changing opportunities in the type of employment available. Those situations appear to be radically different from those experienced by earlier generations. For instance, several of them, who are now high school or college teachers, have gone from contract to contract for the past ten years. In some cases, they have had to move to other regions of the country in order to find these opportunities. Still, despite their university education, their accumulated experience and geographic mobility, they are generally unable to find stable and satisfying employment. Other friends, in computer sciences, for instance, have had better luck finding well remunerated jobs in desirable places. However, to achieve professional advancement, they admit having to change employer or to start their own business like many others in today’s labour market.

Although the above situation is highly anecdotal, as well as place and age specific, it certainly reflects the general feeling that today’s labour market is quite different from the one in which our parents worked. Indeed, looking back at the earlier post-war period, the employment structure of that time appears less complex than today. In Canada, during this golden era of capitalism, workers benefited from the rapid expansion of primary and secondary sectors, due in large part to technological innovations and to an open continental economy (Norcliffe, 1994, Rutherford, 1996). There was also an explicit system of social relations that kept many women out of the
labour force or confined them to traditional occupations (nursing, teaching, etc.) which reflected their domestic roles. Under these circumstances, forms of employment that deviated from the typical “full-time, permanent, Monday-to-Friday, day job performed outside of the home for a single employer” (Lipsett and Reesor, 1997) were relatively uncommon. In the 1990s, however, the picture of employment seems much more diversified. Either in terms of weekly hours worked, duration of employment or employee-employer relationship, it is difficult to find common aspects. The emergence of these ‘new’ forms of work reflect the relatively unstable situation the majority of my friends have experienced.

As a starting point for studying labour market changes, this section reviews the general evolution of the employment structure in Canada with a particular emphasis on working arrangements. Making the assumption that new forms of work are often more flexible for the employer than for the employee, this section examines the trend to labour flexibilisation in Canada since the early 1970s. Specifically, it surveys major trends for five forms of employment said to be more flexible. These are: 1) part-time work, 2) overtime work, 3) non-permanent work, 4) flextime schedules, and 5) self-employment. However, due to severe problems in the availability and comparability of data, long-term trends could not be clearly established for all cases.

**Part-Time Employment**

The level of part-time employment has grown rapidly in Canada over the last two to three decades. Part-time work constitutes the most important fraction of non-standard employment in 1995, accounting for approximately 60% (Betcherman and Chaykowski,
The proportion of workers fifteen years and over who work on a part-time basis has increased from 10.6% in 1975 to 18.1% in 2000 (Langlois, 1993, Statistics Canada, 2000a). Significantly, for the same period, this expansion was approximately five times greater than the growth in full-time employment (Figure 4.1). It is important to note, however, that the number of part-time workers is not equal to the number of part-time jobs, since some full-time workers combine more than one part-time job. Therefore, most official statistics compiled through the Labour Force Survey tend to under-estimate the rise of part-time jobs. In a survey by Statistics Canada which distinguished between part-time workers and part-time work, the number of part-time jobs was shown to have increased by 120% between 1975 and 1993 (Pold, 1994).

Figure 4.1: Growth of Part-Time Employment in Canada (1976-1999)

12 Except when otherwise stated, in the current study and according to Statistics Canada's most widely used definition, part-time workers are defined as "those who usually work less than thirty hours per week at their main or only job" (Statistics Canada, 1992). Therefore, this definition is based on the number of hours worked in a 'normal' week, notwithstanding other employment characteristics such as length of employment, seasonality and multiple jobs holding.
Regional differences were also observed with part-time work increasing more rapidly in Alberta and British Columbia than in the rest of the country (Statistics Canada, 1996a). In 1996, the incidence of part-time work was also highest in the four western provinces (i.e. the Prairies and B.C.). The recent rise of part-time work may partly be explained by the rapid growth of service employment especially in Alberta and British Columbia (Coffey, 1994, Michalak and Fairbairn, 1993). Analyses of data for consumer-oriented industries confirm this trend, with 87% of total part-time jobs being located in services (Pold, 1994).

An investigation of the sex and age composition of part-time workers also sheds light on the specific characteristics of part-time workers and the reasons for the changing structure of labour markets. Among the most significant trends, statistics show that in 1996 52.4% of young workers (15-24) were engaged in part-time work compared to 19.4% in 1975 (Statistics Canada, 1996a, Betcherman and Morissette, 1994). This could reflect the tendency of employers to gradually replace full-time permanent workers with a younger and more flexible part-time workforce. At the same time, an increasing proportion of young part-timers are still in school. The 25-44 age group is the group with the smallest percentage of workers involved in part-time work (19.7%). Nevertheless, its share of part-time workers has grown the fastest, from 30.1% in 1975 to 39.8% in 1996. This seems to indicate a profound shift since the strongest increase in part-time employment is occurring within the age group where full-time work is most prevalent.

In Canada, as in most other developed states, regardless of age, occupation or industrial sector, women remain more likely than men to be employed part-time (OECD, 1998). While the general participation rate of Canadian women increased steadily over the past thirty years, the proportion of women occupying part-time employment grew
from 20% to 36% between 1975 and 1996 (Langlois, 1993, Statistics Canada, 1996a). In comparison, the involvement of male workers in part-time work rose from 5.1% to 16.5% during the same period. Consequently, women’s share of all part-time employment in Canada is now around 65%. A common sense interpretation of this contrast leads one to argue that the predominance of women in specific sectors and occupations is associated with their tendency to work part-time. However, data usually do not support this assertion for the Canadian case or elsewhere (see for example Hanson and Pratt, 1995). In fact, while it may be true to say that women concentrate in sectors where part-time employment is growing, especially in services, their overall tendency toward part-time employment is greater than men’s in almost all sectors. For instance, in a declining male-dominated sector such as manufacturing, women are five times more likely than men to work on a part-time basis (Statistics Canada, 1997b).

Thus, it is clear that interpretations of the growth of part-time work in Canada must not simply consider the changing industrial structure of the economy or the changing needs of employers. Instead, a thorough analysis should simultaneously account for prevailing economic conditions and the specific needs and constraints of selected groups of workers (McDowell, 1997). Analyses of the changing life experience of people according to their gender and age would appear to be particularly insightful.

*Overtime Work*

Considering the trends in part-time employment, one might reasonably expect the average hours worked per week to have decreased. In recent years, however, no significant reduction has been recorded in the length of the average workweek (Statistics Canada, 1997b). This is due to the fact that, in addition to people working fewer hours,
the distribution of work hours is now characterised by a greater share of people working more than the standard 35 to 40 hours per week. Stated differently, there has been a polarisation of working time in the Canadian labour market.

Between 1976 and 1995, the proportion of people working more than 40 hours increased from 19% to 22% (Morissette and Sunter, 1994, Statistics Canada, 1997b), a change that particularly affected the male labour force in which one in every four workers worked more than 40 hours in 1995 (see Figure 4.2).

**Figure 4.2:** Changes in the Distribution of Usual Weekly Work Hours, Employees 25 Years of Age and Older by Gender

![Bar chart showing changes in weekly work hours from 1976 to 1995 by gender.]


This trend has implications for the proportion of people who worked more than the number of hours they were scheduled to work. These are overtime workers. Data on overtime are sparse and rarely provide a basis for long term comparison. Nonetheless, an examination of overtime workers’ characteristics might reveal reasons for the growth of this particular work arrangement. First, according to the 1997 Labour Force Survey
(Statistics Canada, 1997b), 18.6% of all employees worked overtime in a given week.\textsuperscript{13} Approximately 45% received compensation in terms of pay or in some other form (e.g. time off), but the majority (57%) were considered as unpaid overtime workers since they received no additional compensation.\textsuperscript{14} In 1997, 21.4% of male employees worked overtime compared with 15.4% of female employees. Differences between paid and unpaid overtime tend to be more important in women’s case, where the share of unpaid overtime workers is almost twice that of paid overtime workers. This gender difference is almost eliminated among young workers who are much less likely to be working overtime than employees over 25 years of age. In other words, not only is the incidence of overtime higher for men over 25, but this group is also more likely to receive compensation for it (Betcherman and Low, 1997).

Such trends might be associated with a series of factors not necessarily related to patterns of demand for labour but rather to other circumstances that relate to the social circumstances of workers. For instance, the over-representation of youth in temporary employment (Drolet and Morissette, 1997), and their growing proportion in post-secondary education, do not predispose them to invest in overtime work. Likewise, women’s often fragile position in the labour market, and their disproportionate share of domestic responsibilities, might play a similar role in limiting their propensity to work overtime.

Analysis by occupation also gives additional weight to interpretations of overtime work based on models of flexibility which argue for a polarisation of working weeks that reflects firms’ changing practices. As Deborah Sunter points out:

\textsuperscript{13} Self-employed are excluded.
\textsuperscript{14} The total of paid and unpaid overtime exceeds 100% because some workers worked under both conditions in the reference week.
[...] this trend could reflect an employer strategy in which they invest in a highly skilled group of workers who will work long hours, then fill in with lesser-skilled part-time workers with less benefits and lower hiring costs. (Toronto Star, March 11, 1997).

Data from Statistics Canada (1997b) support this position. Overtime is far more widespread in high-end white collar occupations than in pink collar occupations (see Figure 4.3). Since pink collar occupations tend to include a large proportion of young and especially female workers, age and gender differences in the proportion of people working more than 41 hours per week could also be interpreted with reference to the occupational division of labour.

Figure 4.3: Percentage of Labour Force Involved in Paid and Unpaid Overtime Work by Occupation (Canada, 1997)

As demonstrated by Rose and Villemaire (1997) in the case of a newsprint mill, the restructuring of the production process may in itself cultivate this polarising structure of working hours. The case study indeed showed that deep cutbacks in the workforce and functional reorganisation of the production have forced the company to rely heavily on the few properly trained and skilled workers in the mills. As the authors found, this practice is being encouraged both by demand and supply conditions. On the one hand, overtime is widely used in times of demand fluctuations because “administrative costs and (in Canada) the structure of payroll taxes make overtime cheaper than keeping on a larger number of workers working a normal workweek.” On the other hand, the fact that overtime workers came to expect the supplementary income, plus the anticipation that they might be laid-off or moved to a lower-paying job made it more to accept (and maybe look for) overtime work.

Non-Permanent Employment

Another growing trend in work arrangement is that of non-permanent employment. People increasingly move from one employer to another where they have temporary arrangements, instead of working with the same employer throughout their working life. According to Schellenberg and Clark (1996), there are two types of non-permanent workers. The first type is based on a fixed-term contract in which there is termination date agreed to by the ‘employee’ and the employer. Seasonal workers, day-workers and sub-contracted consultants fall into this category. Workers employed through temporary help agencies constitute the second type of non-permanent workers. In this situation, the agency acts as an intermediary between firms seeking temporary help and workers employed by the agency. Usually, such workers do not engage in an employee-employer relationship with firms and are paid directly by the agency.
Research reports on non-permanent employment in Canada have generally not covered each of these work arrangements, with the consequence that the numbers of temporary workers have been under-estimated. In particular, surveys by Statistics Canada exclude the self-employed, who make up 15% of the temporary workforce according to British evidence (Casey, 1988). Based on this estimate, there were close to 1.5 million non-permanent workers in Canada in 1995 (derived from Lipsett and Reesor, 1997). This total represented approximately 13.6% of the workforce. Not including the self-employed, the share of non-permanent employees grew from 8% in 1989 to 11.6% in 1995. In 1995, half of non-permanent workers reported a non-seasonal temporary, limited term or contract job, with others being on-call or casual (33%), seasonal (14%) or with a temporary help agency (2%). The number of people employed by temporary-help agencies grew at a rate of 322% from 1971 to 1991 (Hamdani, 1997, Schellenberg and Clark, 1996). This contrasts with the overall growth rate of employment which was 68% for the same period.

Female represent the majority of the temporary workforce (52.1%), a share 4% higher than their share of total employment. In contrast, men have a lower probability of being employed on a non-permanent basis. Youths' share of non-permanent work is twice their share of all employees, with the result that one in three temporary workers is aged between 15 and 24. Once more, these data, originating from the 1995 Survey on Work Arrangements (Lipsett and Reesor, 1997), tend to illustrate the non-standard position of particular demographic groups in the labour market. For reasons discussed before, women and youths often have characteristics that lead them to participate in the labour market in a different ways than older men do. Yet, it must also be acknowledged that many temporary workers, all demographic groups included, fall into the category of
‘contingent’ workers, in the sense that they do not freely choose this work situation and would rather have a permanent job. Indeed, 1989 data for Canada indicated that 65% of non-permanent workers would prefer to work on a permanent basis (Schellenberg and Clark, 1996).

For those involuntary temporary workers, the industrial sector in which they work, and the occupation they occupy are more likely to determine their contingent position. Aggregated data by occupation, however, do not provide support for such an assertion. Blue collar workers are only slightly more likely to have a non-permanent job than white collar workers. In addition, specific employment relationships are closely associated with these occupations. For example, teaching occupations are characterised by high rates of temporary, term or contract arrangements, sales, food and accommodation by on-call or casual jobs, and forestry and logging by seasonal work.

_Flextime Schedules_

Flextime work is a work arrangement where employees are free to manage their working time around core hours during the day. Typically, workers have to work a definite number of hours per week and must be present at work each day between specific hours. Outside of these core hours and given that employees respect the number of hours they are expected to work in the week, workers can decide when to start and end their workday (Akyeampong, 1993). The use of flextime schedules is relatively recent and for that reason data and research on the subject are rare. Several aspects of this new form of employment are unique compared with other flexible types of work. For example, it does not involve less pay (as in the case of part-time work) or fewer social
benefits (as in the case of self-employment) and therefore, appears truly flexible from the employee perspective.

The only evidence available to examine trends in flextime within the Canadian workforce comes from 1991 and 1995 Surveys of Work Arrangements (SWA). In between these two dates, flextime increased 31%, as indicated in Table 4.1. Although this increase must be interpreted with caution since there was a change in the wording of the question between the two surveys (see Lipsett and Reesor, 1997:17), the scale of the increase still points towards an augmentation of the use of this working arrangement.

**Table 4.1: Percentage of Flextime by Gender, 1991 and 1995**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1995</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>24.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both sexes</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>23.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Contrary to other flexible work arrangements which often reflect the contingent situation of some workers, it seems that workers involved in flextime are better positioned in the labour market. Notably, those who work on a flextime schedule tend to be full-time workers. Workers with a university degree represent 32.2% of the flextime workers while their share of the total labour force is only 17.9%. In contrast, all other groups with lower levels of education are under-represented in this type of work arrangement. Finally, permanent workers are more likely than temporary workers to have a flextime schedule (Lipsett and Reesor, 1997). Again, as in the case of overtime work, this trend could be interpreted with respect to a ‘core-periphery’ model of labour markets. According, to this interpretation, ‘core’ workers, those who are more educated and who occupy a more stable position in the workforce, tend to benefit more from this flexible
form of work than do 'peripheral' workers. Under restructuring strategies, employers often tend to rely heavily on core workers, which would partly explain why flextime workers have a relatively high average of hours worked per week (42 hours).

Another supply side argument may also come from the significant differences in flextime among industrial sectors. According to the 1995 SWA, 25% of those working in service-producing industries had flextime compared to 20% in goods-producing ones. The predictable nature of the demand for certain services probably explains why employers in that sector are more likely to offer this type of arrangement to their employees. However, notable differences can be observed within these broad categories. Public administration, finance, insurance and real estate, and transportation, communication and other utilities, are the sectors where flextime rates are the highest. A priori, there is no common denominator that would explain why the use of flextime is more popular in these sectors than in others. Although a tendency exists for manufacturing industries to have a smaller share of flextime employment, all sectors are experiencing a rapid expansion of this new form of work.

Other statistics tend to indicate that there is also a demand for such types of work (Lipsett and Reesor, 1997). For example, data on family arrangements reveal that the presence and age of children and marital status have an impact on the incidence of flextime. Both for men and women, the presence of a spouse or children increases the likelihood of holding a job with a flexible schedule. In addition, single-earner families are less likely than dual-earner families to be involved in flextime work. This would suggest that workers are voluntarily seeking such forms of work arrangements in order to improve their ability to manage domestic and professional responsibilities. However, according to this interpretation, one would expect women to have higher levels of
participation than men in flextime schedule because of the traditional division of domestic labour. Yet, for most marital status or family status categories, men have higher percentages of workers on a flextime schedule. Another intriguing aspect is that for lone-parent families, where the need for flexibility would seem to be quite obvious, the incidence of flextime is at its lowest. Obviously, workers’ decisions to participate in flextime programs are influenced by other factors, and research on the topic should, therefore, account for other variables such as gender, occupation, earnings and age.

Self-Employment

The expansion of self-employment, especially the growth of small businesses, has also been a major component of the transformation of labour markets in Canada. In 2000, 2.5 million workers were self-employed, representing 17.0% of all workers, compared to 800 thousand, or 9.3% of the workforce, in 1971 (Statistics Canada, 1996b, 2000b). Between 1989 and 1996, three quarters of total employment growth was attributable to an increase in self-employment (Statistics Canada, 1997c). Again, part of this transformation can be associated with economic restructuring strategies that have changed the nature of work available. But, as argued in a previous section, other elements, which define the demand for self-employment, must be looked at to more fully understand this tendency.

In both the public and private sectors, the use of sub-contracting has accelerated in recent years. The replacement of existing employer-employee relations with contractor-contracted ones has had major implications for the supply of work: traditional in-house, full-time, permanent jobs are declining while the demand for contract workers is increasing. In many cases, this involves a transfer of workers from the public sector to the private sector, which is often detrimental to labour in terms of earnings and fringe
benefits (CCSD, 1997). Yet, the link between the growth of out-sourcing practices and that of self-employment is not straightforward. When firms and governments are downsizing, there is no guarantee that laid-off workers will later be hired as self-employed workers or as employees of a sub-contracted private firm. Instead, what happens is that more workers are pushed into a situation of unemployment and forced to look at options outside the typical labour market. One of these options might be to start up a small business.

Whether the choice to become self-employed is completely free or the result of confining circumstances is often hard to assess. In fact, while only a small share of self-employed (12%) chose this situation because there was “no other work available”, the characteristics of these workers often suggest that they would be better off if they had a paid job (Statistics Canada, 1997c). In many cases, the short term nature of self-employment also tends to indicate that it represents a temporary solution to unemployment.

Contrary to the contemporary public discourse which emphasises the positive aspects of entrepreneurship, statistical analyses show that, in practice, the experience of the self-employed is diverse and often insecure (see Globe and Mail, June 14, 1999). Despite a longer working week than paid workers, the self-employed tend to earn less (Statistics Canada, 1990, 1996b, 1997c). On average, the self-employed earned $30,800 in 1995, compared to $33,700 for paid workers. Furthermore, when the data distinguish between employers and own account self-employed, two clearly contrasting groups emerge where employers ($41,000) earn 79% more than own account workers ($22,900).\textsuperscript{15} Since own account self-employed are responsible for 90% of the recent

\textsuperscript{15} Own account self-employed are those who are working alone (or without paid help).
increase in self-employment (see Table 4.2), this would suggest that these new jobs are largely low wage and sometimes little more than disguised unemployment. This, one suspects, means that many of the new self-employed are ‘involuntary’, which in turn would give weight to a supply side interpretation of the rise of self-employment whereby firms dictate labour market dynamics. In fact, statistics recently released show the decline of own account self-employed in face of a better economy (Globe and Mail, October 9, 2000).

Table 4.2: Growth of Self-Employment by Category (1980-1996)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Absolute Growth ('000)</th>
<th>Share of Growth (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>Own account</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980-1989</td>
<td>227.8</td>
<td>119.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989-1996</td>
<td>46.1</td>
<td>411.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Nevertheless, from a supply side perspective, increases in the incidence of self-employment can be examined with respect to changes in occupational and/or industrial structures. In other words, if occupations and industries where the share of self-employment tends to be above average are on the rise, so would the overall share of self-employment. However, an analysis by Statistics Canada (1997c) indicates that the share of occupations and industries with high rates of self-employment have remained stable between 1989 and 1996. As a result, over 90% of the growth in self-employment was related to an increase across most industries and occupations. This would further suggest that either all sectors of the economy are undergoing profound labour restructuring or that workers themselves are willingly changing the ways in which they participate in the labour market. Most likely, such labour market adjustments are produced through the interaction between the two processes.
For instance, when gender is considered, shifts in the proportion of self-employment provide an indication that workers are in the midst of a gender role realignment while responding to labour market pressures. Although men still represent two in every three Canadian entrepreneurs, their share of self-employment has declined considerably over the past three decades while women’s share has tripled (see Table 4.3). Until the 1990s, women’s portion of self-employment had increased considerably in both the ‘employer’ and the ‘own account’ categories, but in the first half of the 1990s, all of the gains came from the growth of own account businesses. Clearly, self-employment now represents an avenue by which women can access the job market. However, this experience seems to be increasingly contingent since most of the new self-employed are ‘own account’.

Table 4.3: Percentages of Self-Employment by Gender (1971-1996)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Self-Employment</th>
<th>Employers</th>
<th>Own Account</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>87.9</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>75.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>81.3</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>62.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>44.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>65.6</td>
<td>34.4</td>
<td>31.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Statistics Canada (1996b) The Self-Employed. p. 51

Income data also show that self-employment may not be a panacea for women, despite the fact that it provides an alternative entry to the labour market. Not only are there significant variations between women and men entrepreneurs, but in addition the income of the self-employed seems to vary greatly by gender. In 1993, self-employed females had average annual earnings of $18,400 compared with $25,900 for women doing regular paid work and $33,400 for male entrepreneurs. Among women
entrepreneurs, female employers ($27,000) earned twice as much as own-account workers ($13,900). Among the reasons identified for these differences, one is that women entrepreneurs tend to work part-time in greater proportion than men (Cohen, 1996). Analyses of new patterns of work have often studied part-time work and self-employment separately. Interestingly, however, the two are intrinsically linked since entrepreneurs are often part-time workers. Specifically, one in five entrepreneurs work less than thirty hours a week and, therefore, are statistically considered part-time workers (Pold, 1994).

Analyses of the industrial profile of entrepreneurs indicate that self-employed women, like other female workers, tend to concentrate in the service sector. However, since 1976, women entrepreneurs seem to have improved their position in the industrial hierarchy through occupational diversification. For example, in 1994, 24% of the self-employed in non-agricultural industries were employed in ‘business services’, and ‘health and social services’, an increase of 18% since 1976 (Cohen, 1996). Similarly, women entrepreneurs are now much less concentrated in the occupational category of ‘other services’ which includes low-paid personal and household services (down 16% from 51% to 35%). For men, similar data are not available, although one study found that 45% of female and male own account workers in Canada were concentrated in the agricultural sector (Green, et al., 1996). Since men form two thirds of the agricultural workforce, it might be expected that their share of self-employment in other industries (mainly services) is smaller than that of women. Finally, a study by Cohen (1996) also reports that rates of self-employment are likely to increase with age both for women and men. However, data also show that the rise of self-employment by age has been more pronounced for men than for women. This may indicate the increasing precariousness of
men’s position in the labour market (see Bruegel, 2000, The Economist, September 1996, McDowell, 2000) or else a greater ease than women in exploiting their skills.

In summary, the description of major trends in flexible working arrangements confirms the need to give consideration to both supply-driven and demand-driven factors. However, given the geographical objectives of the present study, questions may also be raised regarding the ways in which these two sets of factors operate over space to produce different outcomes and trends. The next section is a step in this direction as it outlines the geographical variations within the country, and especially within its urban system, in levels of and trends in labour flexibilisation.

4.2 The Flexibilisation of Urban Labour Markets

The previous section highlighted the major trend to labour flexibilisation in the Canadian economy. Here, the focus specifically turns to those same changes at the inter-metropolitan level. In particular, this section describes the rise in the share of two specific groups of workers, the part-timers and the self-employed, among Canada’s ten largest Census Metropolitan Areas (CMAs). Various sources of data, all originating from the Canadian Censuses, are used for the description of these trends. Although this choice implies certain limitations, the Census is to my knowledge the only source of publicly available data that permits an investigation of these forms of working arrangements from 1971 to 1996, at the CMA level and by gender.\(^\text{16}\) In making this shift of scale, it is, however, useful to identify the links between the two.

---

\(^{16}\) Limitations with the use of Census data are notably found in the fact that these punctual data may reflect the cycle nature of the labour market (i.e. periods of economic recession and growth).
Defining Urban Areas

Cities are at the centre of the social and economic activities of nations. In Canada, despite the fact that urban areas only represent about 4% of the total territory, in 1996, they held nearly 78% of the population. In economic terms, it could be argued that this dominance vis-à-vis rural places is even stronger since their share of employment is greater than their demographic share.

Several other reasons militate in favour of an urban focus for the study of labour restructuring. First, existing work on labour restructuring tends not to document changes in primary industries, but instead focuses on manufacturing industries and to a lesser extent the service sector. Therefore, because of the concentration of service and manufacturing industries in urban locations, discussions of the changing nature of employment are more likely to be effectively addressed in an urban context. Second, as Veltz argues (1999), cities, especially large ones, are more than just places where economic activities concentrate, they are a “natural ecosystem” for the new economy. These cities are sites of a large array of commercial and non-commercial activities that facilitate economic development. In turn, the exclusive presence of larger corporations is said to result in greater labour market polarisation between high-end service occupations and lower-end activities that cater for the elite workers (McDowell and Court, 1994, Sassen-Koob, 1984, Smith and Feagin, 1987).

17 A notable exception in Canada is the work documenting economic restructuring in the BC forest industry. See for example Barnes, Hayter and Grass (1990), Barnes and Hayter (1992), Barnes and Hayter (1997), Barnes, Hayter and Hay (1999).
For analytical purposes, this system of urban places in Canada has usually been
defined as a group of urban agglomerations of 10,000 inhabitants or more (see for
example Bourne and Olvet, 1995, Coffey, 1996, Bunting and Filion, 2000). The core of
this urban system is formed by a set of twenty-five metropolitan regions with populations
over 100,000 as defined by Statistics Canada through the concept of Census Metropolitan
Areas (CMAs). Among other criteria, CMAs are defined as labour sheds, based on daily
labour movements between municipalities (Census Subdivisions) tied to a continuous
urbanised core. In this way, CMAs are supposed to be a statistical construction of
functionally integrated (local) labour markets. Thus, the concept of CMA represents a
logical choice for the present study of Canadian urban labour markets. Specifically, the
ten largest CMAs have been selected for comparing levels of flexible employment. The
ten CMAs selected constitute a substantial sample representing over 51% of the Canadian
population and 81% of those twenty-five CMAs. Because they comprise a larger share of
employment relative to their demographic base and also exhibit many characteristics that
are likely to facilitate the development of flexible forms of work, analysis of the rise of
part-time work and self-employment within these CMAs seems appropriate.18

Basic Employment Trends in the Top Ten CMAs

Appendix A includes a table showing basic employment and flexible employment
figures for the ten largest CMAs for the census years 1971, 1981, 1991 and 1996. These
data are the basis of the description of flexible employment trends and patterns that
follow in this section. Before examining these data, it is useful to review the figures on

18 In particular, Bourne and Flowers (1999) indicate that 85.1% of the immigrant population lives in cities
of 100 000 and over. There is also extensive evidence showing the relative concentration of services in
metropolitan environments (Coffey, 1994, 1996).
the employed labour force which enable the researcher to situate each metropolitan area within the upper level of the urban system.

Three major observations should be made from an examination of Table 4.4 below. First, the use of the ten largest CMAs does not provide an even geographic coverage of Canadian labour markets. Five of the ten provinces are absent from this dataset (NF, NS, NB, PEI, SK). In addition, six of the CMAs are located within Canada’s traditional heartland. While this situation certainly reflects the uneven spatial distribution of the Canadian labour force, one should not over-generalise the results presented in this section as they ignore the reality of smaller urban labour markets which may function differently (Barnes et al., 2000, Bourne, 2000).

Table 4.4: Employed Labour Force for the Ten Largest CMAs in Canada (1971-1996)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>167,425 (9)</td>
<td>337,190 (6)</td>
<td>406,015 (6)</td>
<td>441,580 (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>206,080 (6)</td>
<td>359,090 (5)</td>
<td>434,155 (5)</td>
<td>434,020 (6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>200,470 (7)</td>
<td>263,050 (8)</td>
<td>293,850 (9)</td>
<td>294,230 (9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>122,940 (10)</td>
<td>142,815 (10)</td>
<td>193,615 (10)</td>
<td>190,405 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>1,007,295 (2)</td>
<td>1,304,600 (2)</td>
<td>1,514,420 (2)</td>
<td>1,502,380 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>248,570 (4)</td>
<td>360,055 (4)</td>
<td>502,910 (4)</td>
<td>502,075 (4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>168,740 (8)</td>
<td>250,445 (9)</td>
<td>316,405 (8)</td>
<td>315,045 (8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>1,177,555 (1)</td>
<td>1,612,535 (1)</td>
<td>2,042,960 (1)</td>
<td>2,061,610 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>440,245 (3)</td>
<td>646,435 (3)</td>
<td>814,125 (3)</td>
<td>908,325 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>229,635 (5)</td>
<td>293,435 (7)</td>
<td>326,155 (7)</td>
<td>324,740 (7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Numbers in parentheses indicate the rank of CMA in the urban system for a given year.


Second, substantial differences obviously exist in the size of labour markets studied here. Based on the 1996 data, Toronto’s employed labour force, the largest in the
country, is more than ten times larger than London’s. In fact, among the ten CMAs, three groups of CMAs might be distinguished. The large metropolitan labour markets of Toronto, Montréal and Vancouver occupy the upper level of the hierarchy. A secondary set of places includes Ottawa, Calgary and Edmonton, as medium size metropolitan areas. The third group includes the remaining smaller CMAs of Winnipeg, Québec, Hamilton and London. Obviously, this diversity in sizes has implications for the structure of labour markets. Although urban economies are highly diversified at this level of the hierarchy, CMAs exhibit different levels of sectoral concentration according to their position within the urban system. For example, while the ten largest CMAs contain 51.7% of all employment in Canada, the three largest CMAs alone account for approximately half of the employment in high-order services (based on 1991 figures from Coffey, 1994).

Third, the relative position of some CMAs has changed over time. Although the overall ranking of cities has remained relatively stable, a notable exception is Calgary, which is now Canada’s fifth largest labour market, up from the ninth position in 1971. Hamilton and Winnipeg are the only two metropolitan areas which have experienced a decline in their ranking. Apart from changes in the position of the top ten CMAs, more substantial differences in each city’s individual gains are mirrored in the size of their labour force. One of the most notable differences is observed between the growth of the two largest urban regions. In 1971, Montréal and Toronto had an employed labour force of roughly similar size. Twenty-five years later, Toronto’s labour market is approximately 25% larger than Montréal’s. Figure 4.4 shows more detailed variations in the ability to create employment by indicating, for each decade, how much the position of individual CMAs has changed within the group of ten metropolitan areas. In particular,
this figure indicates that Montréal and Winnipeg have lost the most substantial shares of employment within the set of ten CMAs while Vancouver, Ottawa-Hull, Calgary and Edmonton have seen their relative shares increase markedly.

These different trajectories have not, however, been regular over time. In particular, cities with a relatively important secondary industrial sector (Toronto, Montréal, Winnipeg, Hamilton and London) experienced considerable decline during the 1970s and/or the 1980s. In contrast, metropolitan regions with a smaller dependency on manufacturing (Ottawa-Hull, Calgary, Edmonton and Québec), saw their share of employment rise during these same two decades. In the first half of the 1990s, geographical shifts in employment among the top ten cities are much less perceptible, indicating that the movement towards an economy of services might have slowed down. Vancouver and Calgary are the only two CMAs to have increased their share of employment in that period.

Figure 4.4: Change in Share of Employment* Among Largest Ten CMAs (1971-1996)

---

19 See Coffey, 1996, appendix 7 for location quotients by industrial sectors.
4.2.1 Self-Employment in Metropolitan Areas

Based on the data reviewed above for the national urban system level, there is no doubt that the increase in the proportion of self-employment is a salient feature of the ongoing process of economic restructuring. In most cases, the rise of self-employment has been associated with job increases. However, because labour markets operate primarily at the local level, chances are that the overall trend to a proportional increase of entrepreneurs will take various forms in different metropolitan labour markets. This section is the first of two examples that support such an assertion.

Defining Self-Employment

Before summarising the description of trends and patterns in self-employment, it is useful to clarify some of the terms used in this section as they are different than those used for the analysis of aggregate trends. An entrepreneur, from a business perspective, is someone who owns an enterprise irrespective of the number of persons being employed by the company. In statistical reports, these business owners are often called the “self-employed”. One classification of Statistics Canada (class of workers – direct) permits a distinction between three groups of workers who:

[...] (i) worked mainly for someone else for wages, salaries, commissions or payments “in kind”, (ii) worked without pay in a family farm, business or professional practice owned or operated by a related household member, (iii) worked mainly for themselves, with or without paid help. (Statistics Canada, 1992: 54)

The third class of workers defines the self-employed as the term is used in the present dissertation. The first category, usually called “paid workers or wage and salary workers” serves to contrast the growth of self-employment with a more typical working arrangement. However, since business owners can receive wages and salaries from the
company they own, the term “paid workers” may bring confusion. This is why I generally prefer to use the term “employee” to describe workers who receive wages and salaries from employers other than themselves. The second category, “unpaid family workers”, is ignored in this study because of various methodological considerations, as well as because of the indirect contribution of this class of workers to the economy.\(^{20}\)

In the course of the current study, the category of self-employed is further divided into the “incorporated self-employed” and the “unincorporated self-employed”. These two categories distinguish between businesses “formed into a legal corporation, having a legal entity under federal or provincial law,” and those which have “no separate legal entity, but may be a partnership, family business or owner-operated business” (Statistics Canada, 1992: 59). For lack of better comparable data, this categorisation is used as an indicator of the size of businesses, where incorporated businesses are thought to be larger and more stable than those in the other group.

*Self-Employment in 1996*

Figure 4.5 presents a summary of levels of self-employment and employees in 1996 for the ten CMAs. An interesting geographic pattern emerges from this set of charts. In general, it seems that cities in central Canada (Québec and Ontario) tend to have labour markets composed of higher proportions of employees than in the western CMAs. The cases of Calgary, Vancouver and Edmonton, in the West, speak for themselves. Yet, some other cases clearly do not follow this tendency. For instance, the large metropolitan area of Toronto exhibits a high proportion of self-employment for both the incorporated and unincorporated categories, while the western city of Winnipeg relies proportionally

\(^{20}\) Numbers of “unpaid family workers” are limited and comparisons over time are restrained.
more on the traditional employee-employer relationship. The contrast is especially clear between employees and the self-employed in incorporated business.

**Figure 4.5: Ranking of Employment by Classes of Workers in Largest Ten CMAs, 1996**

These results could possibly be related to trends reviewed in Figure 4.4 (see p. 116) regarding employment growth. Indeed, when comparing the two figures it can be seen that cities which have experienced the highest employment growth over the last twenty-five years are the same ones that are characterised by high proportions of self-employment. The relationship is clearer in the case of the incorporated self-employed, most likely because the stable nature of this work arrangement is a good reflection of long-term employment trends. In that specific case, the top three cities, Calgary,
Vancouver and Edmonton, are also those which recorded the largest net growth of employment between 1971 and 1996. By extension, links can also be made to the sectoral nature of these local labour markets, as economies relying on services have tended to produce a higher proportion of self-employment (Cohen, 1996). Given the relationship between entrepreneurship and immigration, the presence of large numbers of business class immigrants in Canada’s largest agglomerations, especially Toronto and Vancouver (Wong, 1995), can also affect levels of self-employment in the urban system.

**Contrasts in the Development of Self-Employment**

Based on the objectives set in this research, what is important to learn about self-employment is not so much the existence of differences between places, but more specifically how these differences have evolved in light of the process of economic restructuring. In other words, given that the trend towards an increase in self-employment has been established, the focus should turn to the specific trajectories of individual labour markets during the period of intense economic restructuring that is assumed to have started in the early 1970s. Are some metropolitan economies developing into more flexible places than others? Or, are these trends happening at a regular pace throughout the urban system? How are these trends related to the growth of typical working arrangements? Ultimately, an understanding of how these differences are produced will provide a clearer understanding of local labour market processes.

Figure 4.6 introduces trends and patterns with respect to differences in the growth of self-employment for the selected ten CMAs since 1971. To standardise the comparison
Figure 4.6: Employment Growth Rates for Largest Ten CMAs, by Classes of Workers and by Periods (1971-1996)

between the different periods, decennial growth rates are used in this figure.\textsuperscript{21} In particular, this method allows a direct comparison of periods of different length. First, when contrasted with the two groups of self-employment over the entire twenty-five year period the relative decline of wage labour is obvious. In terms of geographical variations, the agglomerations of Ottawa-Hull and Calgary appear as the fastest growing localities in the country. To a lesser extent Edmonton has also grown rapidly over that same span of time.

In contrast, Hamilton, Montréal and Winnipeg have had more difficulties in creating employment growth. Except for Québec City, which had an exceptional increase of unincorporated self-employed, the performance of CMAs in terms of the growth of self-employment is usually related to their performance in the other class of workers. Thus, as noted previously, the most dynamic local economies are characterised by a more rapid increase of both non-typical working arrangements and of typical employee-employer relationships.

Breaking down this twenty-five year period into decades, it becomes easier to relate changes in the structure of local labour markets to the specific phases of after-Fordism in Canada as they were presented in Chapter Three. Indeed, while the Canadian economy was showing signs of slowing down in the 1970s (notably through the rise of unemployment rates), many sectors were still producing a fair number of Fordist jobs (i.e. employee-employer relationship). In the meantime, however, the national labour market was becoming more diversified as self-employment began to grow. At this point, it is probable that such growth had little to do with strategies of economic restructuring aimed

\textsuperscript{21} Decennial growth rate \( = (W_{t2}/W_{t1})^{(t_{2}/t_{1})} - 1 \). Where \( W \) is equal to the number of workers in a given working arrangement, for a given CMA at a starting time \( (t_{1}) \) and an ending time \( (t_{2}) \), and where \( n \) is equal to the number of decades between those two times \( (t_{2}-t_{1}) \).
at the reduction of labour costs. Instead, the category of businesses developing at the time (incorporated businesses) suggests that a solid Canadian entrepreneurial basis was starting to emerge, maybe around the expanding public administration of large urban centres. This seems to be the case of Edmonton and Ottawa-Hull, where the growth of the share of high-order office activities within the local economy has been significant (Coffey, 1996).\textsuperscript{22} Despite not being a provincial capital, Calgary registered the largest increase of government and social services during the 1970s.\textsuperscript{23} In combination with a strong performance in business services, this can be linked to a strong increase in self-employment. Likewise, in Québec City the growth of unincorporated self-employment could be linked to the growing percentage of people working in the accommodation sector and in consumer services in general.\textsuperscript{24} On the other hand, the more traditional manufacturing-based economies of Montréal, Hamilton and London had more difficulties in producing employment growth.

In the following decade, job growth continued to slow down, despite the economic boom of the mid-1980s. In fact, at the end of the decade it became clear that in the face of a declining secondary sector, new jobs were increasingly created through self-employment. For self-employment, this period seems to be one of transition during which a shift from incorporated self-employment to unincorporated self-employment is observed (see also Lin, Yates and Picot, 1998). A logical interpretation would suggest that people were beginning to use self-employment as an alternative to unemployment. Yet, such change was primarily happening in the Prairies, whereas metropolitan areas of

\textsuperscript{22} High-order office activities include the “FIRE”, “Business Services” and “Other Business Services” sectors.

\textsuperscript{23} Government and social services include the “Education”, “Health” and “Public administration” sectors.

\textsuperscript{24} Changes in the employment share of industrial sectors from 1971 to 1996 were calculated using data provided by William Coffey and Richard Shearmur. The classification is based on Coffey (1996).
Canada’s old industrial core still had stronger or equivalent growth of incorporated entrepreneurs. The difference between these two regions is partially explained by their distinct economic performance in the 1980s. On the one hand, the urban economies of the West (Calgary, Edmonton and Winnipeg) saw their growth in high-order services slow down or decline, partly because of the relative decline of resource prices. As a result, their reliance on unincorporated self-employment is a reflection of this slower growth and of their sectoral economic basis. On the other hand, agglomerations where the growth of incorporated businesses continued to be stronger than unincorporated ones, posted better performances in those same high-order service sectors and in their overall performance. This was notably the case for Québec City, Montréal, Ottawa-Hull and Toronto.

In the last phase (1991-96), which Filion (1996) labelled the entrenchment of after-Fordism, the differential in growth rates between employees and the self-employed further increased. Moreover, in all metropolitan areas, the rise of unincorporated self-employment was stronger than incorporated self-employment, thus illustrating the fragile nature of this form of growth. Clearly, this shift in the structure of local labour markets has favoured some CMAs more than others. It could be argued that it is the quality rather than the quantity of job growth that should be investigated. But in this period of transition, places that were able to provide new and more flexible forms of work, such as unincorporated self-employment, are also those which performed best in the production of more traditional and stable jobs such as wage work. Indeed, between 1991 and 1996, Calgary and Vancouver, the two CMAs which recorded the highest increase in unincorporated self-employment, were the only two places to post an augmentation in the

---

25 Based on growth rates calculated using data provided by William Coffey and Richard Shearmur.
total number of employees. In contrast, Montréal and Hamilton ranked among the lowest for these two classes of workers.

In summary, an examination of the recent history of self-employment among Canada’s largest CMAs shows that shifts in the structure of the Canadian labour market were not experienced evenly across time nor space. Contrary to what discourses about after-Fordism (especially the crisis) would lead one to believe, local labour markets did not rapidly jump from a status of stability, characterised by growth of employee-employer relationship, to an extreme situation of instability, characterised by unincorporated self-employment. Instead, there seems to have been a slow transition in the situation during which the wage work sector gradually gave room to incorporated self-employment and later on to unincorporated self-employment. Taking this example, it could be argued, to some extent, that post-Fordism, as it has been described elsewhere (Lipietz, 1987, 1997), had not really taken place in Canada until the late 1980s. It is rather in the first half of the 1990s that the structure of growth of different classes of workers seems to indicate that certain employment shifts have corresponded to the expected features of post-Fordism.

In addition, some places have gone through this transformation more rapidly than others and now seem to exhibit some characteristics that would define them as flexible labour markets. To interpret these differences, I have made reference to the sectoral nature of the different CMAs, especially to the dichotomy between the older manufacturing urban economies of central Canada and newer service (and old resource-based) economies of the West. Still, a more detailed examination of the particularities of these local labour markets should provide additional insights regarding the reasons for these differences and the interplay between influential factors.
4.2.2 Part-Time Work in Metropolitan Areas

The rise of part-time employment probably illustrates best the shift from a typical and mostly steady employment situation of the Fordist years to the increasingly contingent position of numbers of workers in the post-Fordist era. This transition is represented, for example, by the gradual replacement of full-time manufacturing jobs held mostly by men with part-time service jobs in the accommodation and food service industry. This is not to say that manufacturing workers are, or were always, full-time and that service occupations are necessarily more precarious. But data for any recent times clearly show the likelihood that employment in the tertiary sector will be part-time (Pold, 1994). Therefore, similar to some of the hypotheses introduced in discussions about self-employment, the economic structure of local places may have an influence on the development of part-time work. In addition, as suggested before, other factors relating to the social and demographic configuration of local labour markets, and of specific policies affecting labour practices directly or indirectly, are likely to produce spatial differences in levels of part-time employment and the ways in which these levels evolve.

Part-Time Employment in 1996

For reasons evoked earlier, the analysis of part-time employment can hardly be done without distinguishing between the work experience of females and that of males. Thus, the following analyses of patterns in part-time work consider the two groups of workers separately.

Figure 4.7 presents the level of involvement of workers in part-time work in 1971 and 1996 for the selected CMAs. Note the gendered difference in the percentages of people who work fewer than thirty hours. In 1971, the share of part-time work among
male workers was three to four times smaller than for female workers. In 1996, the ratio had dropped to two to one. As seen in the distribution of values for the individual graphs, for women and men, the ten labour markets have tended to become more similar in terms of part-time employment.

**Figure 4.7: Ranking of Part-Time Work by Gender in Largest Ten CMAs, 1971 and 1996**

Note: s values indicate the standard deviation

Other than these few observations, geographical patterns are difficult to discern. In general, the ranking of CMAs in part-time work does not differ extensively between women and men. However, the exceptions of Hamilton and Ottawa-Hull are interesting
as they might reflect the existence of contrasting sexual divisions of labour. In Hamilton, as a result of its strong specialisation in ‘heavy’ manufacturing, men are more likely than in other places to work full-time. At the same time, women’s roles in such an economy have been constructed as peripheral so that their level of part-time work is higher than elsewhere. In contrast, Ottawa-Hull is an environment where equal access to employment has been advocated for a long time in part because of the strong presence of government administrations. In particular, the economic reliance of the region on public administration favoured the entrance of women into full-time employment and improved their earnings (Rose, 1999). The consistently low proportion of part-time employment in the Montréal CMA is also an interesting feature and will be analysed in detail in Chapter Five.

A priori, data on changes in levels of part-time work, presented on Figure 4.8, contradict this last statement regarding the role of public administration in facilitating the entry of women into full-time work. Based on the graph for the period of 1971 to 1996, part-time work has increased more rapidly in places where public administration represents an important portion of the local economy (Ottawa-Hull, Québec and Edmonton). Yet, despite the fact that these cities still very much rely on public administration, they are also those which have suffered the largest declines in this degree of specialisation.26 Clearly, the rise of part-time work is associated with the relative decrease in the weight of public sector employment within Canadian capitals.

---

26 Data from Coffey (1994: 44) show that Ottawa-Hull, Québec and Edmonton have registered significant declines in the public administration sector, as measured by changes in location quotients between 1971 and 1991. Data obtained from the same author indicate the persistence of this trend into the 1990s.
Figure 4.8: Growth Rates of Part-Time Work in Top Ten CMAs by Periods (1971-1996)

The growth of part-time work slowed down in the 1980s. Like many other trends, this trend is difficult to interpret because of the wide economic fluctuations that characterised that decade. It may be that this slower growth is a reflection of a lower number of jobs created in 1990 (the census reference year) as the country was entering an economic recession. Alternatively, if the impacts of the recession had not been felt yet, it could mean that there were fewer part-time workers because a more rapid growth of full-time employment. The only two CMAs where the growth rate was higher for females than for males were Québec and Montréal. This could indicate that in these two local labour markets higher rates of unemployment were making it more difficult for women to find full-time jobs.

In the 1990s, however, the increase in part-time employment seems to be linked to a more general restructuring of labour markets, both socially and economically. From a social perspective, gender roles (at home and in the workplace) have been redefined significantly over the last two decades with the consequence that the so-called ‘gender gap’ has contracted in many ways. For instance, not only has most of the new full-time employment been taken by women, but as shown in the graph for the 1991-96 period, male part-time work is now growing considerably faster than that of females in all ten locations.\(^{27}\) In comparison to the 1970s, when differences were not as clear, this denotes that women now have more diverse employment opportunities (i.e. they have greater access to full-time work) and that male workers increasingly face a situation in which they have to opt for part-time work. In addition, the course towards de-industrialisation may have facilitated women’s access to full-time work, while increasing men’s reliance on part-time jobs. In particular, the process of feminisation of labour markets is

\(^{27}\) Between 1976 and 1999, women have taken 62% of the new full-time jobs (Statistics Canada, 2000, Cansim, matrix: 3472).
amplified, both quantitatively and qualitatively, as more opportunities are being created in the service economy, where women often dominate. For sure, within that service economy there are widely diverse circumstances that are not always favourable to women, but, in general, it is widely acknowledged that service activities tend to attract larger proportions of women than other sectors (Nelson and Robinson, 1999).

For each of the three decades represented on the graph it is hazardous to interpret geographical differences. When looking at the charts for the 1971-96 period and the 1991-96 period, it could be said that agglomerations that rank well in job creation have seen their share of part-time work increase more rapidly than others. This can be seen through the examples of Calgary, Edmonton and Ottawa-Hull between 1971 and 1996, and for Calgary, Vancouver and Ottawa-Hull in the 1991-96 period. Their performance in high-order office sectors would particularly be a good indicator of trends in part-time work. But, once more, one needs to be careful in interpreting those tendencies. In particular, differences in the recent work trajectories of males and females tell us different stories. In fact, while service-oriented agglomerations seem to have encouraged women’s participation in full-time employment, these same localities are also those where part-time work is increasing most rapidly both for men and women. Not only do such trends suggest that gender positions are being reworked differently depending on location, but that an uneven process of labour flexibilisation is taking place at the same time. To what extent these two processes are intertwined requires more investigation.

4.3 The Uneven Development of After-Fordist Local Labour Markets

Overall, one idea dominates this review of trends and patterns in self-employment and part-time work among Canada’s largest CMAs. The capability of local labour
markets to produce growth in flexible forms of work is associated with their broader economic well-being. More specifically, a contrast between those more dynamic CMAs that produce growth in high-order services and those economically less vigorous CMAs with an important manufacturing base is observed. The idea that such spatial dichotomy within the urban system is a product of the new economic era is not new. But, in the context of the present research, what is important to conceptualise is how these differences are being produced and where labour flexibilisation fits into that process. Furthermore, it is essential to discern the particularities which encourage local labour markets to evolve in distinctive fashions.

The Role of the Service Economy

Esser and Hirsch (1994) have provided some indicators of how the division between older industrial regions and emerging service regions may have been modified under post-Fordism. In essence, the German example used by the authors is informative for the Canadian case. Among a series of elements which characterises the new economic era, Esser and Hirsch (1994: 77) talk about “a strengthened industrialisation of the service sector” through the adoption of new organisational and innovation techniques. In this race to develop the thriving service sector, in particular those activities relating to the global economy (information technology, tourism, financial services), it is argued that places do not have the same tools nor do they necessarily adopt the same economic development strategies (see Simmons and McCann, 2000). The larger CMAs of Toronto, Montréal and Ottawa might, for instance, be in better position to develop their high technology sectors (Gertler, 1991). In contrast, the older industrial economies appear as more rigid urban agglomerations where social changes such as the implementation of training programs are harder to achieve. In addition, even in those metropolitan areas
where an upper-end service economy is expanding, there are many indications that such development is paralleled by the growth of a contingent service economy.

Rather than being a definitive and pre-determined feature of the service economy, the uneven spatial organisation of labour markets is both politically and socially regulated. In itself, this movement towards the service economy is inevitable as productivity increases so that fewer workers are required to manufacture goods (see Figure 4.9). However, to a degree nations make deliberate choices regarding the type of service economy to develop, which, despite some common tendencies, affect the mix of employment, patterns of work and the spatial organisation of this new service economy. In Canada, some argue that the tendency has been to adopt a low-wage, low-skill personal services model that contrasts with the Scandinavian model based on high-wage, high-skill welfare occupations (Myles, 1991).

**Figure 4.9: Movement Towards a Service Employment Structure**

In broad terms, this low-wage, low-skill model is supported by social regulation through segmentation of the workforce. Women, ethnic minorities and, increasingly, youth (Betcherman and Morissette, 1994) are the main socio-demographic divisions around which businesses structure the lower end of the workforce. These divisions are regulated in two ways. First, a social construction of the productive and reproductive roles of people in our society exists based on social divisions. For instance, the fact that female workers are expected to perform certain occupations is based on their constructed
characteristics, such as their presumed skills (Brewer, 2000, Lovering, 1994). Second, institutions tend to sustain such practices, for example, through union policies which discriminate between workers based on age or through social policies (e.g. childcare), which assume different gender roles. In both cases, the type of service economy developing in Canada has reinforced this type of regulatory framework and thus promotes the existence of marked cleavages between groups of workers.

For labour markets, the maintenance of a service economy largely based on the low-wage model has meant that the workforce is increasingly becoming polarised. Not only is there a division between the declining position of manufacturing workers (excluding those in high-tech sectors) and those of the quickly growing service economy, but also between those workers involved in high-order service occupations and industries, and those who are confined to a growing sector of lower-end services. To the extent that places are not equally positioned to take part in the service economy, this has had spatial consequences for the organisation of labour markets in the urban national system. On the one hand, agglomerations with traditionally strong secondary industries have had more difficulties in adapting to those changes. This has been the case of Hamilton, Montréal, London and Winnipeg. Those cities which systematically ranked at the top for the place of manufacturing activities within their economy have experienced the slowest employment growth of the group of ten CMAs analysed here. On the other hand, the fastest growing urban agglomerations of Calgary, Edmonton and Vancouver have been characterised by the relative importance of tertiary activities and particularly by a sustained growth of those sectors within the local economy. However, as supported by the data in this chapter, much of the employment performance of the latter locations is
polarised between typical working arrangements and the newer, flexible, and more vulnerable, forms of work.

*The Role of the State*

In many ways, the gradual restructuring of the Canadian welfare state has also contributed to this distinction between ‘winning’ and ‘losing’ spaces. Within this process is the decline of transfer payments to weaker regions of the country, as well as a shift of responsibility from the federal government to provinces and downward to municipalities or urban regional governments (Klein and Lévesque, 1998). As argued by Filion (1996), both the economically weak regions of the country and the traditionally strong industrial regions have felt the disadvantages of this transformation. The opening of consumer markets has also played a role in this new tendency. When markets were better protected, a substantial part of the sums invested by governments in disadvantaged regions returned to stronger manufacturing regions through consumption of goods produced in those same places. Contrary to that logic, with tendencies towards continental and hemispheric integration, a larger share of public transfers is now being spent on products manufactured outside of these Canadian industrial regions. As the production of manufacturing places declines, so do government revenues and, therefore, their ability to redistribute wealth.

The downloading of fiscal responsibilities and a new international competitive environment have the potential to create greater economic spatial unevenness as well as to encourage the emergence of competing strategies between regions and localities. In particular, because the State concentrates its efforts on a limited number of economically strong places, it is the spatially even social and economic development of Fordism, in
place in the 1960s and 1970s (Brodie, 1997), that is being questioned under Canada’s after-Fordism. Regions, with large urban areas as their core, are not being supported exclusively under principles of social equality but rather based increasingly on their capacity to be(come) globally competitive. Given the new open economy, such support increasingly comes from transnational corporations. In contrast, the role of governments in local economic development is being restricted to indirect support (i.e. non-financial) in accordance with free trade agreements. Instead, federal, provincial and local governments are concentrating their efforts on building a “good business environment” and on promoting regions in order to attract investors. As Janine Brodie (1997: 256) puts it:

[...] this means reducing fiscal regulatory burdens on industry and lowering expectations about the role of the state, particularly in social welfare, employment, labour standards, and regional development.

In this period of restructuring, labour is also facing other pressures which involve issues of re-skilling and technological change (see Albo, 1993), as well as a re-definition of employment policies such as unemployment, training and mobility programs, a downward pressure on wages, and the weakening of unions (Lipsig-Mummé, 1993). This general transition in the labour process has been described in detail by Jessop (1993, 1994) who refers to the shift from a Keynesian welfare state to a Schumpeterian workfare state. In short, it is argued that while the former state system encourages widespread social progress, the latter rests on the promotion of corporate competitiveness.

Clearly, the data presented in this chapter illustrate that this general transformation of local labour markets also involves a shift in working arrangements. The overall pattern that emerges is one where the typical employee-employer working
arrangement gradually gives way to other, more numerically-flexible forms of work. As the growth of atypical and of traditional jobs seem to be positively associated, these trends also correspond to the development of a dualist or two-tier labour market at the local level described by several authors (see for example Jenson and Mahon, 1993a, Myles, 1991, Rutherford, 1996). What is particularly interesting here, is that such labour polarisation seems to be occurring at various spatial scales (Filion, 1996). Among regions and among urban agglomerations there seems to be a tendency for manufacturing-base economies to grow more slowly than service-oriented labour markets. At the urban scale, the parallel growth of flexible and typical employment also seems to supports the dualism thesis.

The Role of the Local

Thus, given the type of service economy emerging and its complex political and social regulation, the numerical flexibilisation of labour markets has not taken place equally across space. In this sense, the transition in labour practices tends to contribute, in parallel with other parts of the restructuring process, to the uneven spatial development of agglomerations within the same urban system. However, concluding that flexible labour markets are associated exclusively with these two processes would be incorrect. In as much as the type of service economy in Canada has promoted polarised labour markets at various scales and associated political and social behaviours contribute to its persistence, the specific manner in which labour markets evolve is complex. Again this type of flexibility is authorised by political and social conditions which operate globally, nationally, within regions and at the urban level. Yet, as argued in the Chapter Three, it is the way in which various factors interact locally that is especially crucial for the differentiated evolution of flexibility in local labour markets.
For instance, to grasp how Montréal’s labour market has developed a particular form of flexible employment, more than vague references to urban size, to the decline of manufacturing, or to the changing political economy of the province and the country, need to be done. Some industrial shifts occurring in Montréal might indeed suggest that the decline of the secondary sector is leading to a relative reduction of both typical and non-typical employment. But, on the other hand, the rise of various high-tech sectors (aeronautical, bio-pharmaceutical, computer animation) may lead to the exact opposite interpretation.

Therefore, to understand how differences in the evolution of labour flexibility happen, it becomes essential to thoroughly document the circumstances under which a specific labour market develops. Chapter Three made two crucial arguments in that direction:

1- That the analysis of labour market flexibility needs to be executed by giving simultaneous consideration to supply side and demand side conditions. On the supply side, this requires a close look at the changing characteristics of the workforce, including the ways in which divisions within the workforce are being regulated. For instance, the emergence of a new demographic structure, changes in human capital features, the repositioning of the state and the redefinition of gender roles, all have to be seen as factors at the core of new work practices and its associated labour market flexibility. On the demand side, the much examined issues of new political economic circumstances also have to be acknowledged. In particular, references to the new age of global competition have to be made in association with the shift towards a service economy, to the changing role of the state and the redistribution of social (including domestic) and economic responsibilities.
2- Such changing conditions should be interpreted in a local setting. Inspired by the work on social regulation of local labour markets (Peck, 1996), it should also be acknowledged that the interaction between economic, social and institutional processes matters most at the local scale. As argued earlier, these processes do not need to be local (e.g. global competition, state restructuring), but they are treated locally. In other words, the pre-existence of different economic structures (industrial/occupational), of different social environments (gender relations), and of different political intervention in both the social (family policy) and economic (labour law) spheres, ensure that local responses to global restructuring pressures will vary.

This approach enables the researcher to view changes in working arrangements as a complex set of interactions between processes that operate at various geographic scales, but take a distinct turn at the local level. In trying to understand more specifically such dynamics, the following chapters present two detailed case studies which examine certain aspects of flexibilisation in Canada. Together, the place-specific case studies will attempt to provide more indication of how changes in supply side and demand side conditions at the local scale have contributed to shaping distinct patterns of flexibilisation within Canadian urban labour markets.
CHAPTER FIVE

NEW ECONOMY? NEW FLEXIBLE WORKERS?
THE CASE OF PART-TIME WORK IN MONTRÉAL

To investigate the relationship between the characteristics of labour supply and the transformation of labour practices, this chapter examines part-time employment and part-time workers in Montréal’s urban labour market. Montréal is an interesting case-study of recent labour market changes because it constitutes one of Canada’s clearest and most documented examples of ‘de-industrialisation’. In addition, the transformation of Montréal’s economy in recent years has occurred in parallel with its relative decline within the Canadian urban hierarchy. From being the economic centre of the Canadian economy, Montréal has since lost much of its demographic and financial strength to Toronto. Montréal is now re-positioned as the dominant metropolitan area of the province of Québec, although it still retains a number of important pan-Canadian functions.

Furthermore, as it was briefly showed in the previous chapter, proportions of part-time employment in the Montréal CMA have tended to be lower than in other large Canadian agglomerations (see pp. 126-128). Combined with other features of the Montréal economy, such as higher unemployment rates and lower labour force participation rates, it provides an intriguing and interesting context for addressing the
flexibilisation of labour markets. From a theoretical perspective, the case study is also an opportunity to investigate the relationships between labour flexibility and the local environment especially through the characteristics of the labour supply. In the way that has been theorised in Chapter Two, exploring the socio-economic structure of the CMA and the changing characteristics of its part-time workers might provide clues for understanding the specificities of the development of Montréal’s part-time labour market.

This chapter has four major components. An introductory section briefly explores the structural transformation of economic activity in the Montréal CMA. Given the attention that academic work has given to gender in the analysis of part-time employment, the second section investigates the close association between these two variables in the context of restructuring. This provides a clear example of the role of workers’ characteristics for the development of flexibility. Expanding on this topic, section three presents an empirical analysis of the links between socio-demographic features of Montréal’s workforce and the propensity to be employed part-time. In the fourth section, I focus on the role of locality in the specific trends affecting Montréal’s part-time labour market. In particular, I attempt to conceptualise how the distinctive structure of part-time work in Montréal came to be and how it might relate to the factors mentioned above.

5.1 Montréal’s Changing Position

To provide some historical perspective on Montréal, this section briefly reviews the changing place of Montréal within the Canadian economy. In terms of economic structure, that is, the organisation of its economy by industrial sector, the development of Montréal in the past thirty years has followed trends similar to those observed in other
large metropolitan areas of North America (Coffey and Polèse, 1999a, 1999b, Lamonde and Martineau, 1992). However, job creation rates and, as a result, the shift to a service economy, have lagged behind those in other cities.

 Mostly because of geographic comparative advantages, Montréal was the economic centre of Canada throughout most of its history, including the pre-Confederation era. From being the fur trade capital during the French period (1642-1760), Montréal became, under the British crown, “the commercial, financial, and industrial metropolis of Canada” (Higgins, 1986: 31). During the 19th century, Montréal continued to be the centre of gravity of the Canadian economy as well as its most populous city (Lewis, 2000). This was due in part to the development of the Lachine Canal and, later, an extensive rail network of which it was the pivotal node. But as the population and economic activity of the continent increasingly moved west, Montréal’s importance gradually decreased in favour of the more centrally located Toronto. Though Montréal maintained its position as the most populous Canadian city until the early 1970’s, the first half of the 20th century was clearly marked by a gradual transfer of economic power from Montréal to Toronto (Gad and Holdsworth, 1984).

 Many factors have contributed to the relatively rapid reversal of primacy and to the general relative decline of Montréal’s economy. Among others, Coffey and Polèse (1993) have cited the exile of the anglophone elite, the structural weaknesses of Montréal’s economy and the loss of much of the western Canadian hinterland to Toronto as factors explaining this development (see also Germain and Rose, 2000). The completion of the St. Lawrence Seaway (1959), the decentralisation of activities to other regions in Québec (Polèse and Roy, 1999) and the pro-French language laws, restraining both international immigration and internal migration from the rest of the country, have
also been referred to as causes of the decline of Montréal. However, it is important to mention that in the period following the Second World War, Montréal was nonetheless growing rapidly, although Toronto was growing faster. As Higgins (1986: 11) notes:

Of all the metropolitan centres on the North American continent, only the “sunbelt” cities of Atlanta, Dallas and Houston, together with Washington D.C. and Toronto, were growing faster.

Although it has often been portrayed as an abrupt decline, Montréal’s loss of status in the 1970s seems more like a continuation of trends that had started much earlier (Germain and Rose, 2000). The seeming paradox is that Montréal peaked at the same time as the signs of its weaknesses appeared. On the one hand, Montréal still projected the image of an international city (attracting, for example, the 1967 World’s Fair and, later, the Olympic Games) and that of the centre of economic activity in Canada. Montréal was also at the centre of the *Quiet Revolution*, which marked an important shift in Québec’s economic, social and cultural development. Not only was the Quiet Revolution the point of departure of Québec significant and progressive political, institutional and social reforms that led to the rapid modernisation of the province (especially Montréal), but it also symbolised the emergence of Québec’s nationalism (Linteau *et al.*, 1986). For Montréal, this shift was consequential, as it meant becoming the economic capital of French Canada as opposed to that of Canada.

On the other hand, many factors were at the same time contributing to Montréal’s relative decline within the Canadian urban system. First, while Montréal still held a favourable position within the Canadian industrial system, the predominantly labour-intensive manufacturing sector (e.g. textiles, clothing) appeared weaker and more fragile than the heavy industrial complex of Southern Ontario (Manzagol, 1998). Second,
recognising the economic and demographic movement westward, financial institutions increasingly established themselves in, or moved to, Toronto. Third, no longer did Montréal hold a disproportionate share of the national and provincial retail industry, as commercial activities strengthened in other regions of Canada and Québec.

In short, contrary to common discussions about Montréal, which identified the 1970’s as the starting date of its decline, Toronto was already established as the metropolis of English Canada well before that time. The primary zone of economic influence of the now francophone-led Montréal establishment had been reduced to the province of Québec. In addition, Montréal’s relatively slow population growth and the ageing demographic structure of the ensuing decades (Ledent, 1999), hampered its economic development. The gradual transfer of power from Montréal to Toronto was, therefore, the result of a unique set of circumstances which included economic, demographic, political and cultural forces that operated at various scales.

In the early 1970s, Montréal’s economy was thus already in a rather fragile state to confront the period of economic restructuring that was to affect all industrial nations in the following decades. Since then, its consistently higher than average unemployment rate, in comparison to other North American cities, has been noted as the principal indicator of Montréal’s relatively ‘poor’ economic performance. Among other things, Montréal’s manufacturing sector lost approximately ten percentage points of its share of the employment in the metropolitan economy between 1971 and 1996. Most of this decline came in the 1980s, when the manufacturing workforce was reduced by 14% (for a more detailed analysis, see section 5.4.1). Also, compared with other metropolitan economies, Montréal posted lower job growth in most economic sectors (Coffey et Polèse, 1999b). Despite growth in many categories of services, Montréal has remained
one of the least ‘tertiarised’ economies among major cities on the continent. Therefore, given the lack of growth in new service jobs, the trend towards de-industrialisation of the workforce did not translate into a new service economy to the same extent as it did in other Canadian and American labour markets. As a result, the economy of Montréal was still marked by a fairly high level of manufacturing activity in 1996, but its manufacturing workforce was affected by much higher levels unemployment rates.

As I argue in section 5.4, this economic development trajectory has had an impact on trends in part-time employment and particularly on the differences between various urban labour markets. This is not to say that the industrial structure of places is solely responsible for the gradual shift in work practices, but it can certainly limit or facilitate their transformation. As theorised earlier, the production of labour flexibility must also be understood in terms of the characteristics of the flexible workers. In the next section, the association between gender and part-time work is considered in order to illustrate how aspatial factors (in combination with local factors such as those mentioned above) also contribute to forging labour flexibility.

5.2 Male and Female Part-Timers: Converging Experiences

Studies and statistical accounts of part-time employment usually give a prominent place to differences between men and women in their respective experiences of employment. However, gender has been largely neglected in post-Fordist research on labour restructuring, despite its inherent role within the transition from Fordism to post-Fordism (Christopherson, 1989, Massey, 1984/1995, McDowell, 1991, Reimer, 1994). In

---

28 The term de-industrialisation may suggest that the production of goods has decreased in the ‘industrialised’ world. But given that more goods are being produced than ever before, it is more accurate to talk of the de-industrialisation of the workforce.

29 Based on the 1996 PUMF file, 22.5% of the unemployed in Montréal had been working in manufacturing, whereas this industry represented 17.6% of all employed workers.
this section, I argue that it is essential to consider the role of gender in order to understand the dynamics of job restructuring and, in particular, the emergence of flexible work in urban areas. Considering gender as a factor in the transformation of labour practices provides a strong case for the inclusion of socio-demographic features into the analysis of labour markets. In addition, it provides an occasion to explore other features of the workforce and their relationship to the growth of part-time jobs in a given labour market.

However, while gender studies provide a good example of the necessity of considering the differences among social groups in the labour market and their link to restructuring processes, they are often guilty of ignoring the ‘other’ gender: males. Given this deficiency, and contrary to most work from a gender or a feminist perspective (the work of McDowell, 1991, 1997, 2000 is a notable exception), I wish to stress that the changing situation of both men and women in the labour market at the aggregate level is in itself a feature of post-Fordism.

Women and Work

Women’s participation in the paid labour force of developed countries has without a doubt increased significantly in the last three decades (OECD, 1998b). In Canada, for example, the proportion of women (15 years of age and over) who were in the labour force rose from 38.3% in 1970 to 58.9% in 1999. In contrast, men’s participation in the labour force fell by over five percentage points (77.8% to 72.5%) over the same period (Statistics Canada, 1994, Cansim: matrix 3472). Therefore, as indicated on Figure 5.1, the gap between men’s and women’s participation rates was reduced by 26 percentage points in just over two decades. One of the most dramatic trends among
women has been the growth in the number of employed women with children. Between 1981 and 1994 the employment rate of women with children aged less than 16 increased from 50% to 63%, compared to a four percentage points growth for women without children.

**Figure 5.1:** Participation Rates by Gender, Canada (1970-1999)

![Graph showing participation rates by gender, Canada (1970-1999).](image)


Behind this seeming convergence towards gender equity in labour market participation, many scholars have highlighted the continuing unequal features of the gender division of labour. In particular, women are highly concentrated in specific industries and occupations that pay less than ‘men’s jobs’ (Statistics Canada, 1995, 1998b). Even when women occupy positions in sectors where men predominate, they still tend to earn less than their male counterparts of similar experience and education for similar work (Coish and Hale, 1994, Drolet, 1999, Hutton, 1994).
These trends appear paradoxical in the sense that they show that women are increasingly present in the paid workforce, but persistent gender-based occupational segregation and wage differentials indicate that women's position in the labour market is still fragile. Moreover, women's substantial share of the part-time labour market (69% in 1994) and the small number of women entrepreneurs also contribute to the perception that women have a precarious position in the labour market.\textsuperscript{30} Self-employed women are also less likely than men to employ paid labour and 33% work part-time compared to 10% for men. Obviously, these two characteristics of the female labour force (i.e. flexible employment and occupational and wage segregation) are interrelated and contribute to explaining the recent work experiences of women (Boreham \textit{et al.}, 1996, Brewer, 2000). In particular, occupational segregation and the relative concentration of women in the service sector have been linked to their high rate of part-time employment.

\textit{Occupational Segregation and the Wage Gap}

Today women can be found in every occupation. There are still, however, striking tendencies for men and women to concentrate in distinct occupations (Hanson and Pratt, 1995, Hatt, 1997). According to Statistics Canada (1995), in 1994 70% of all working women were employed in either teaching, nursing and related health occupations, clerical positions, or sales and service occupations. More remarkably perhaps, 32% of Canadian working women were concentrated in the top ten occupations, compared with 20% for men (Table 5.1).

\textsuperscript{30} In 1996, only 1 in 8 entrepreneurs were female (Lin, Yates and Picot, 1999).
Table 5.1: Principal Occupations of Women and Men in Canada, 1996

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Number of workers (‘000)</th>
<th>% of total in labour force</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Retail salespersons</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Secretaries</td>
<td>312</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Cashiers</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Nurses</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Accounting clerks</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Elementary teachers</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Food servers</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. General office clerks</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Babysitters</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Receptionists</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total of top ten occupations</strong></td>
<td>2,117</td>
<td>32.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Men</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Truck drivers</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Retail salespersons</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Janitors</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Retail trade managers</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Farmers</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Sales representatives, wholesale trade</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Motor vehicle mechanics</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Material handlers</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Carpenters</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Construction trade helpers</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total of top ten occupations</strong></td>
<td>1,574</td>
<td>20.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Since many of the female-dominated occupations have grown at a rapid pace over the last two decades, this clear division of labour has certainly helped women to enter the workforce in greater numbers (Globe and Mail, April 20, 1998). In addition, this trend has been part of the more general growth of service employment, a sector where women tend to concentrate and which accounted for approximately three-quarters of the new jobs in Canada in the past two decades (Coffey, 1994, Statistics Canada, 1999b). However, while this occupational and sectoral segregation appears to have been beneficial for women as it has increased their labour force participation, it has also been associated with women’s high rates of involvement in part-time work. Indeed, not only is the number of jobs in the service sector increasing faster than in any other sector, but this is also where
non-standard work is growing the most rapidly (Krahn, 1995, Tam, 1997). In this context, and despite the rapid feminisation of the workforce over the last twenty years, women’s positions and experiences in the labour market remain quite different from those of men.

A further consequence of this segregation and of part-time employment is the wage differential between male and female workers. Despite the narrowing of the difference between women and men in terms of labour force activity, it is well documented that gender differences in earnings are still substantial (Coish and Hale, 1994, Drolet, 1999, Gunderson, 1998, Hutton, 1994). Using a decomposition model, a study by Drolet (1999) reveals that in 1997 the female-male ratio for the average hourly wage of full-year and full-time Canadian workers was 84% to 89% after accounting for differences in wage determining characteristics. In other words, women in Canada earned 11% to 16% less than men on an hourly basis. Because women are more likely to work part-time and for only part of the year, this gap would have been larger had the author used annual earnings.

An important finding of the Drolet study is that despite controlling for a large set of productivity factors, roughly 50% to 75% of the remaining wage gap could not be explained.\(^{31}\) Of all the influencing factors, work experience was the most consequential, explaining 12% of the gap. In short, only a relatively small portion of the difference in wages between genders can be attributed to factors such as men’s higher level of education or unionisation rates. The rest of the gap “is due to unmeasured factors, one of which may be systemic [sex] discrimination” (Coish and Hale, 1994: 40).

\(^{31}\) Productivity factors include human capital differences (i.e. years of work experience, years of education, field of study) and demographics (i.e. age, marital status).
To summarise, the experience of working women over the last three decades is generally characterised by a high level of concentration in female-dominated occupations, especially in the service sector. On average, women also earn significantly less than men. In addition, the increase of female participation in the labour force seems misleading when one considers the relative importance of part-time employment (both for self-employed and wage workers). These conditions are markedly different from those experienced by their male counterparts and, contrary to a superficial reading of statistics showing the growth of female participation in the labour force, this information suggests that the process of feminisation has not been a panacea for working women. However, statistical analyses of employment often report average figures which mask part of the reality of women in the labour market (Hakim, 1996). In particular, this method has tended to disguise the heterogeneity of work experience within the female labour force.

Rising Heterogeneity of Experience

The above trends are described in common feminist literature on employment, as they highlight the negative sides of feminisation and, especially, the growth of part-time work. However this focus on part-time work ignores the fact that in Canada female full-time employment has increased three times faster than male full-time employment between 1976 and 1999 (see Table 5.2). More recently, full-time job growth has been twice as strong for women (3.0%) as it has been for men (1.8%) during the first nine months of 1999 (Statistics Canada, 1999c). Also, while the proportion of full-time women entrepreneurs has remained relatively unchanged since 1976, the ratio of full-time self-employed males has declined by 5% (Cohen, 1996). Of course, any analysis of labour market shifts in Canada must consider the growth of part-time work among
women. Nevertheless, such an analysis should also take into consideration groups of women who have captured the lion’s share of the growth of full-time work in the last two decades, as women have taken up 72% of the new full-time jobs created since 1975 (Statistics Canada, 1994).

Table 5.2: Full-Time Employment in Canada, 1976-1999

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Women</th>
<th></th>
<th>Men</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total employment '000s</td>
<td>Full-time '000s</td>
<td>Relative growth of full-time 1976 = 100%</td>
<td>Total employment '000s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>3,631</td>
<td>2,769</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>6,146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>5,119</td>
<td>3,692</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>6,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>6,117</td>
<td>4,332</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>7,346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>6,665</td>
<td>4,797</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>7,866</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Another aspect of women’s recent professional experiences that is often overlooked is the growing proportion of women who enter male-dominated occupations. In the UK, for example, there are indications that while the male-female ratios of female-dominated and gender-integrated occupations remain roughly the same, male-dominated occupations are increasingly being feminised (McDowell and Court, 1994). According to Hakim (1996), women who work full-time are also increasingly likely to be employed in occupations traditionally defined ‘for men’. Mixed occupations also now tend to represent a larger share of total employment, signifying the integration of both genders into occupations that had been traditionally dominated by males. Although statistical reports on Canada do not provide the same type of information, other data show that Canadian women are increasingly entering jobs traditionally defined as ‘men’s jobs’ (Hughes, 1995). For example, between 1982 and 1993, women increased their share of total employment in each occupational category but one (manufacturing: -0.2%). The highest increase was in the managerial-administrative category, up by thirteen percentage points from 29.2% to 42.2% (Statistics Canada, 1994). Similarly, women made up 32%
of all doctors and dentists in 1994, up more than five percentage points from the previous year and fourteen percentage points since 1982 (Statistics Canada, 1994, 1995).

This tendency of some labour markets to become more gender-integrated is due in large measure to women's changing position in society, including human capital considerations, and to policies of positive discrimination. In fact, since the difference between the educational attainment of women and that of men has narrowed considerably in the past twenty years and since female students now account for the majority of full-time university students in Canada (Statistics Canada, 1995), women have come to reduce and sometimes eliminate some of the important barriers which have contributed to gender segregation. As a direct consequence of decreasing occupational segregation, the earning gap between men and women has closed considerably in recent years (Nelson and Robinson, 1999, Statistics Canada, 1994).

In contrast with traditional descriptions of the process of feminisation, analyses employing data on specific trends in women's work tend to demonstrate that working women have made considerable progress in recent years. But how can such opposite perceptions about the recent evolution of women in the labour force have been developed simultaneously? This might be explained by the fact that rather than simply being a homogeneous group of workers, working women have come to form a more diverse group among which aspirations, reasons for entering the labour market and qualifications for employment vary. More specifically, it seems that the female labour force is highly, and increasingly, polarised along occupational and industrial lines (Hakim, 1996, Humphries and Rubery, 1992).
Thus, as this section on gender demonstrated, accounting for labour force characteristics is useful for analysing labour market changes. But, this discussion also shows the complexity involved in such analytical process. Not only is the association between gender and employment affected by other factors, but these links are also being modified over time (and most likely in space). In order, to further the discussion on the role of supply side factors for labour flexibility, I turn, in the following section, to a concrete exploration of these links through an analysis of Montréal’s part-time labour market.

5.3 Changing Characteristics of Part-Time Workers in Montréal (1971-1996)

The analyses in this section are based on the 1% individual file of the 1971 Census’ Public Use Sample Tape (PUST) and the 3% individual file of the 1991 and 1996 Censuses’ Public Use Microdata Files (PUMF) from Statistics Canada. This data source was chosen for three main reasons: First, the individual file is a set of data that contains a very wide array of social, demographic and economic variables which can be related to particular individuals living in a given CMA. One’s given labour market experience can, therefore, be associated with that same person’s social and demographic features. Second, the considerable sample size (e.g. over 90,000 cases in 1991 and 1996) increases the analytical possibilities. Third, direct time comparisons over the study period are possible for many variables using the existing file categories or through reclassification of the data. I use these data to explore the association between part-time employment and a number of socio-economic features through a series of saturated log-linear models. Langlois and Razin (1989) previously employed a similar method to explore relationships among groups of self-employed people in Canada. In particular, this method allows one to estimate the probability of a binary event occurring (e.g. working
part-time). In a logistic model, coefficients are attributed to independent variables (e.g. socio-economic features) based on ‘likelihood’ of the event occurring. It is therefore, a useful method for assessing the relative weight of selected independent variables on a dependent variable. The primary objective here is to identify changes in the characteristics of part-time workers between 1971 and 1996. I discuss my interpretations of how these changing patterns are related to social, economic and cultural transformations in the final section.

Gender and Family Related Variables

A first series of associations looks at the socio-demographic structure of part-time workers (Table 5.3). Not surprisingly, the association by gender shows that women are still more likely than men to take on part-time employment, although there has been a slight decrease in the difference between 1971 and 1996. Traditional explanations of the relationship between women’s work and part-time work suggest that family responsibilities restrict women from taking on full-time employment in greater numbers. Research has clearly demonstrated that the presence, number and age of children are factors contributing to a reduction in the amount of paid work accomplished by women. Likewise, the presence of a spouse tends to limit women’s participation in full-time employment. However, the table also shows that gender differences in that area decreased throughout the period under observation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selected two-way interactions</th>
<th>Estimates (I)</th>
<th>1971</th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1996</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>.94</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td>-1.06</td>
<td>-94</td>
<td>-84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Children (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td>-2.74</td>
<td>.23</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 child</td>
<td></td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>-38</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 children</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>.00*</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 children or more</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of Children (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No children present</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>.22</td>
<td>-.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 1 child 6yrs or less</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>-.04*</td>
<td>-.01*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 1 child 6-14yrs</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>-.05*</td>
<td>.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 1 child 15yrs +</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>-.14</td>
<td>.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Selected three-way interactions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female / Married</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>1.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female / Single</td>
<td>-2.85</td>
<td>-2.16</td>
<td>-1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female / Others</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>-.62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Estimates present the probability of working part-time in a saturated log-linear model.
(1) All parameters are significant at level 0.05 except when specified by an asterisk (*).
(2) Variable is reported only for women.

In Table 5.3, the model linking part-time employment and the number of children in 1971 clearly supports this interpretation. The absence of children is negatively related to part-time work while the propensity to work part-time increases in relation to the number of children. However, 1991 figures seem to indicate that the number of children is no longer a factor influencing significantly women’s propensity to work on a part-time basis. In fact, not only do parameter values in individual categories not follow the expected patterns, but the low weight of the different parameters indicates a generally weak linkage between the two variables.

Other associations between family-related statistics and part-time employment also point in the direction of weaker relationships. For instance, 1991 and 1996 data on
the presence of children, which also provide an indication of the children’s age, show that there is no clear association between female part-time employment in Montréal and the presence of young children at home. Not only are the factors low for both years, but the absence of children at home is negatively correlated with part-time employment in 1996. These figures are consistent with recent findings that have highlighted the rapid increase of labour force participation rates among Canadian mothers (Logan and Béliveau, 1995, Rose, 1999), and that led Nelson and Robinson (1999: 246) to claim that: “[t]he presence of dependent children of any age no longer acts as a major inhibiting agent preventing labour-force participation by mothers.”

In the case of the role of the family status variables, for all three years married women (including those in common-law relationships) are more likely to work part-time than single women. This supports the argument that the presence of a male spouse is negatively related to the propensity of women to engage in full-time employment. The intensity of this relationship has, however, declined during the twenty-five years covered by the study. These trends seem to suggest that couples still tend to value the labour force activity of men more than that of the female spouse (Preston et al., 2000), especially when men’s earnings are higher than that of their female spouse (Bernier et al., 1996, Hanson and Pratt, 1995).

Findings in this first series of models do not clearly indicate the persistence of links between the domestic and parental responsibilities of women and their attachment to part-time work. Instead, the results suggest that the impact of factors traditionally related to the stronger propensity of women to work part-time is either fading or has disappeared.
Age and School Attendance

Part-time employment rose within the Montréal labour market during the period under study, despite trends which suggest a diminution of the role of reproductive factors. Moreover, women have maintained their dominance in part-time employment even though their share of part-time employment is decreasing. Therefore, while the argument that women have tended to concentrate in part-time employment because of domestic and family responsibilities is certainly valid based on 1971 data, such logic cannot be used to interpret the general increase of part-time work in recent years. Other factors seem to be becoming more important in explaining who works part-time.

Age seems to provide some indication that other factors are gaining in importance in accounting for part-time involvement (Table 5.4). The estimated parameters indicate that age is strongly related to 'work intensity'. Younger workers are much more likely to have a part-time jobs than workers in the 25-44 age group. Rose (1996) has reported that young adults tend to remain in casual employment situations longer than before, as their situation as flexible workers now tends to persist until they are in their mid-thirties. Contrary to the gap between genders, differences among age groups have widened considerably.

This interpretation is reinforced when a three-way model is built from gender, age and part-time work. The direction of associations (positive/negative values) clearly indicates the continuing pattern of dominance of the 25 to 44 age group in full-time employment. On the other hand, male-female differentials seem to have declined considerably over time, as indicated by the smaller values for 1991 and 1996.
Table 5.4: Log-Linear Model of Odds of Working Part-Time in Montréal CMA (1971-1996) – Part II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selected two-way interactions</th>
<th>Estimates (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-19</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-24</td>
<td>.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-44</td>
<td>-2.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-64</td>
<td>.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Attendance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not in school</td>
<td>-2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attending full-time</td>
<td>1.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attending part-time</td>
<td>.23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selected three-way interactions</th>
<th>Estimates (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sex * Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female/ 15-19</td>
<td>-2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female/ 20-24</td>
<td>-1.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female/ 25-44</td>
<td>3.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female/ 45-64</td>
<td>-.01*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Estimates present the probability of working part-time in a saturated log-linear model.

(1) All parameters are significant at level 0.05 except when specified by an asterisk (*).

The school attendance model might be related to these findings by age group, since being a full-time student has increased the propensity of working part-time (Statistics Canada, 1995). Many factors may explain this growing relationship between part-time employment and school attendance. First, there has been in recent decades a substantial increase in the number and proportion of students in post-secondary education, especially in the case of young females. For many of those individuals, paid employment is essential for participating in the higher education system. Second, the duration of the educational training has increased. Third, the combination of economic issues, including the rapid increase of tuition fees in Canadian universities, and the relative decline of real family incomes has forced many students into the part-time labour force.
Industry and Occupation

The characteristics of workers by occupation and industry also provide valuable insights into the analysis of trends in part-time employment (Table 5.5). In 1971, male-dominated managerial, primary and manufacturing occupations seemed fairly isolated from the phenomenon of part-time work (especially managerial occupations). Similar patterns are observed in 1991 and 1996, with the difference that clerical, sales and service occupations are even more strongly associated with part-time work. Also, manufacturing workers have become much more likely to be involved in part-time employment. By industry, there is a strong increase in the propensity of service workers to work part-time.

Table 5.5: Log-Linear Model of Odds of Working Part-Time in Montréal CMA (1971-1996) – Part III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selected two-way interactions</th>
<th>1971</th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1996 (2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Occupation (1971 classification)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial</td>
<td>-1.71</td>
<td>-1.93</td>
<td>-1.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>.31</td>
<td>-1.16</td>
<td>-.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical, sales &amp; services</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>3.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>-.11*</td>
<td>-.34</td>
<td>-.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>-.77</td>
<td>-1.37</td>
<td>-1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Industry (1970 SIC)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>.38*</td>
<td>-.43</td>
<td>-.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>-2.15</td>
<td>-1.27</td>
<td>-1.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>-.02*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.I.R.E.</td>
<td>.03*</td>
<td>-.74</td>
<td>-.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>2.41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Estimates present the probability of working part-time in a saturated log-linear model.
All parameters are significant at level 0.05 except when specified by an asterisk (*).
(2) 1996 occupational and industrial categories are not strictly comparable to the other two years. Occupations are based on 1990 SOC, industries on 1980 SIC.

Some of these trends have been noted elsewhere. In particular, it has often been mentioned that the tertiarisation of the economy leads to higher levels and proportions of non-standard employment (Mingione, 1991, Reimer, 1999). For instance, Jackson (1997:
19) argues that overall differences between the quality of jobs in the goods-producing sector and in the private services sector have contributed to a more polarised labour market:

All things being equal, the shift of the workforce away from industry and/or the public sector into the highly polarized world of private services will tend to increase labour market polarization and inequality.

However, other trends highlighted by this last model have been largely ignored. This is the case of the growing fragmentation of the manufacturing sector: not only has manufacturing employment experienced a quantitative decline in its share of total employment, but this trend has also been accompanied by a qualitative shift, given the increasingly contingent nature of employment in this sector. Post-Fordist scholars have tended to outline this phenomenon through discussions about out-sourcing and the related issue of vertical disintegration (Holmes, 1986, Scott, 1991), but the largely ignored trend toward an increasing proportion of part-time workers in manufacturing industries is bringing a new dimension to labour restructuring.

The above analysis indicates that increases in part-time employment do not simply result from a shifting economic context, but that the changing positions and aspirations of workers also play a role. However, this examination does not provide a direct indication of how these trends might be different in Montréal than from those in other labour markets. The section below discusses this particular issue.

5.4 Discussion: Factors Influencing the Development of Part-Time Work in Montréal

The above series of saturated log-linear models reveals that the likelihood of working part-time seems to be increasingly associated with the age of workers and
industrial/occupational factors. In particular, young workers and service workers were more prone to participate in part-time work in 1996 than in 1971. In light of the other associations that indicated the declining impact of factors linked to a gender division of reproductive work, there are strong signs that the increase in part-time work is being generated through a series of changing processes operating at various scales.

In addition to this transformation in the composition of its workforce, Montréal’s part-time labour market is characterised by two distinct conditions:

1) *The proportion of persons working part-time in Montréal has been low in comparison with the nine other major CMAs in Canada.* In 1971, the Montréal labour market had the lowest share of part-time employment of the ten largest CMAs, both for male and female workers. Montréal had one of the lowest percentages of part-time employment among the large CMAs in 1996 (refer to Figure 4.7, p. 127).

2) *Part-time work among females has been increasing during the entire twenty-five year period, contrary to the situation in other large agglomerations, where the growth only started in the 1990s, after a twenty year decrease in percentage terms* (refer to Figure 5.5, p. 172).

As I have argued throughout this dissertation, these differences among places are the result of a mixture of factors that interact locally. In other words, labour markets function at the local level despite the fact that they are under the influence of factors and circumstances beyond this geographic scale. Consequently, local labour markets are distinct and do not necessarily all move in the same direction or at the same pace. To support my argument that local processes matter in the development of flexible employment, the following discussion attempts to conceptualise how the two distinct features of Montréal’s part-time labour market may have arisen.
5.4.1 Montréal’s Historically Lower Levels of Part-Time Work

This section is based on the following postulate: levels of part-time employment have been lower in Montréal than in other large Canadian CMAs because of two factors: (a) the continuation of the dominance of manufacturing activities, which favours full-time (male) employment, and (b) the persistence of a socio-cultural model which has limited the participation of women in paid employment.

The Role of the Manufacturing Economy

Throughout the study period, levels of part-time employment have been lower in Montréal than in other major CMAs. Its industrial structure, most especially the relative importance of its manufacturing sector, seems to be partly responsible for this situation. It has been widely documented that manufacturing employment is less likely to be part-time (see Robinson, 1993). This was the case in the 1970s (Canada, 1983) and it still is today (Schellenberg, 1997, Veltmeyer and Sacouman, 1998). In this regard, Montréal’s industrial structure has been an obstacle to its flexibilisation.

Many reasons may account for the sectoral difference in the use of part-time labour. First, there are cost considerations. Compared to goods-producing sectors, service industries wages represent a larger proportion of the overall operating costs of a firm. Thus, the ability to match fluctuations in demand through modifications to working hours becomes a more efficient way of saving in the service sector than in the manufacturing sector (Kahn, 1999, Robinson, 1993). Labour costs are also lower because part-time workers earn less on an hourly basis. In Canada, over half of the workers who earn less than $7.50 per hour are part-time workers. These low-paid workers represent 43% of all
part-time workers (Schellenberg, 1997). Moreover, part-time workers are provided with few fringe benefits in comparison to full-time workers.

Second, part of the difference between sectors may be explained by different attitudes toward employees’ need for flexibility (see section 6.4). For instance, it has been argued that the close association between service sector growth and feminisation has led employers to provide more flexibility in the scheduling of their substantial female workforce (Walsh, 1990). Stated differently, some service industries have become accustomed to the specific circumstances of their female labour force (i.e. juggling jobs and family responsibilities) given their high numbers in this sector.

Third, and similar to what is happening in the goods-producing industries, technological innovations could be fostering the utilisation of part-time workers. That would especially be the case in clerical occupations where the use of information technology has produced rapid gains in productivity and allowed workers to be replaced by computers (Pollard, 1995, Robinson, 1993, Roessner et al., 1985, Wood, 1991).

Finally, the low levels of unionisation in major sub-sectors of the service sector (e.g. food and accommodation, FIRE) make it easier for employers to maintain a permanent part-time workforce, whereas it has been more difficult in the better protected manufacturing sector (Meltz and Verma, 1995). Gallagher (1999: 70) even contends that unions have been reluctant to defend the rights of part-time workers: “[…] unions expressed more opposition toward part-time employment rather than interest in organizing part-time workers.” In addition, non-unionised part-time workers are not well positioned to defend their rights on issues such as those discussed above relating to wages and fringe benefits.
Before the most recent restructuring period, Montréal was one of North America's centres for the production of goods. In 1971, one in three jobs were in that sector, including 27% directly in manufacturing. The transportation and communication sectors were also relatively strong in comparison to those in other large metropolitan economies. Thus, Montréal had a much larger concentration of employment in transportation and communication industries than most other cities in Canada (Coffey and Polèse, 1999b) and even in North America (Lamonde and Martineau, 1992). When taking part in the labour market, Montréal women were also more likely than those elsewhere to have a full-time job. The presence of a strong garment industry, employing mainly an immigrant female labour force, and especially the substantial place occupied by the public and parapublic sectors, both contributed to this trend (Germain and Rose, 2000, Rose and Villeneuve, 1994, 1998).

In terms of occupation, Montréal also had a structure that did not encourage the presence of part-time employment, especially among women (Figure 5.2). In comparison to Toronto and Vancouver, the female labour force of Montréal exhibited lower shares of

**Figure 5.2:** Selected Occupations as a Share of Experienced Labour Force in Montréal, Toronto and Vancouver CMAs, 1971
employment in occupations known for their use of part-time workers. This was especially true of clerical, sales and services occupations, jobs which have the largest percentage point differences between full-time and part-time employment (Schellenberg, 1997: 13).

Despite the period of economic restructuring that provoked a steep decline in manufacturing activities (see below), Montréal maintained its relative position as a manufacturing centre throughout the 1980s and 1990s. In 1996, the group of 252,000 employees in the manufacturing sector was the largest in a group of fifteen major industrial divisions (see Figure 5.3). Retailing was second with 70,000 fewer employees. Montréal’s manufacturing sector is among the largest in North America: with 18% of its employed labour force in manufacturing, Montréal ranks fifth among a group of thirteen comparable North American cities and first among Canada’s top eight regional economies on this index (Coffey and Polèse, 1999b).

Figure 5.3: Share of Employment by Industrial Sectors in Montréal CMA (1996)

Source: Special Census tabulation from Statistics Canada, table provided by William Coffey
As a result, Montréal has had relatively smaller employment numbers in sectors where the presence of part-time employment is greater. In comparison to Toronto, the percentage of employment in producer services appears small. While this sector represents 20% of all jobs in Toronto, only 15% of the workers in Montréal are part of it. Again, most of that difference (4%) is compensated through Montréal’s stronger public service sector.

*A Conservative Set of Socio-Cultural Values*

In addition to its particular, and in some ways peculiar, industrial structure, the presence of a set of socio-cultural values specific to the province of Québec has limited the supply of (female) part-time workers in Montréal. Lower levels of part-time employment must, in part, be understood through the combination of these two local conditions.

Montréal’s labour market has been marked by a socio-cultural value system largely built around the duality between the male breadwinner and the female reproductive role. Whereas this typically Fordist model started to erode in other parts of the country in the 1960s, I argue that households in the province of Québec were late to respond to this transition. The result is that female labour force participation rates were lower in Québec in the 1970s and have remained lower despite a substantial increase in the past two decades (Québec, 1998). It was only by 1986 that over half of the female population was part of the labour force in Québec, while the same threshold was surpassed five years earlier in Canada as a whole (Québec, 1990). Evidence of this difference is clearly observable for metropolitan economies as well (Figure 5.4).
Figure 5.4: Women’s Participation Rate for Selected CMAs, 1971-1996

The log-linear model for 1971 presented in Table 5.3 (see p. 156) illustrated the influence of the social context on the ways in which working females approached the labour market. Women limited their labour force activity to a greater extent than in other Canadian CMAs largely because of family related responsibilities. The number of children and marital status were then clearly associated with women’s part-time involvement in the workforce, as indicated by the model. At the time, social policies did not offer much alternatives to women, given the scarcity of daycare services and the absence of programs for maternity leaves (Dolment and Barthe, 1973). This, of course, combined with the fact that families were larger and that there was a dominant and rigid patriarchal culture in which women were defined as solely responsible for family and domestic tasks. Surveys of the reasons for working part-time provide a good indication of
women's attitudes towards paid and unpaid work in the 1970s. As illustrated in Table 5.6, in 1976, more than one out of five Québec women opted for part-time work because of family responsibilities. This ratio had dropped to less than one in ten by 1995. Moreover, while 40% of female part-timers chose this option in 1976 because they did not wish to work full-time, twenty years later, only a quarter provided a similar reason. As supported by the data, the incapacity of finding full-time employment explains all of the shift in women's reasons for working part-time.

Table 5.6: Part-Time Employment in Québec in 1976 and 1995, According to Sex and Reasons for Working Part-Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domestic and personal obligations</th>
<th>Goes to school</th>
<th>Could not find full-time work</th>
<th>Did not want full-time work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>26,900</td>
<td>31,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of 1976</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>21.6</td>
<td>59.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>25,700</td>
<td>66,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of 1995</td>
<td>&lt; 1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>44.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Calculated from Québec (1998) L'évolution de l'emploi atypique au Québec, p. 32.

The smaller proportion of young workers in post-secondary schools also contributed to the particularity of the socio-cultural value system that affected Montréal's labour market. Still in the midst of profound societal transformation, Québec's university and college system was underdeveloped in the 1970s in comparison to that of other provinces. This may have contributed to Montréal's lower part-time employment rates, although there are no precise data to verify this hypothesis.

The argument about the lateness of the labour force feminisation in Québec, does not deny the existence of feminist forces in the province in the early 1970s and earlier on. There is indeed no doubt that the gradual development of feminism in Québec has helped women to forge a greater place in the labour market (see Dumont, 1992). However, I believe that this trend reveals the long standing influence that traditional social and
cultural forces have until very recently had on the place of women in Québec’s labour market. Among the conservative forces that limited women’s participation in the labour force, the role of Catholicism has certainly been the most consequential. Not only has the Church’s opinion about women’s domestic role had an impact on their own ideologies with respect to their position in the labour market, but it also influenced the ideologies of their spouses and political leaders. In comparison to other provinces, where the influence of similar forces have been more limited, this would have contributed to the slower and more restrained feminisation of the workforce.

Although such point of view of gender roles has mostly disappeared from Québec’s dominant (French-Canadian) socio-cultural beliefs, I argue that the impact of this earlier situation are partly reflected in data on employment for the three previous decades. Such impact has gradually eroded as newer generations took place in the labour market. Again, this is not to deny the development of progressive feminist ideologies, but rather to highlight the transitional nature of the change that has taken place in Québec’s society. In other words, despite some important (and abrupt) measures that were put in place for the development of a truly modern and progressive society, the persistence of conservative ideologies for a large and ageing portion of society limited the speed of that revolution. In that respect, it is also important to acknowledge that some aspects of the modernisation process may take several years, if not generations, to be fully implemented. This is notably the case of the education reform (i.e. 1964 Parent report) whose benefit for women took decades to be felt as a culture of higher education was slowly being passed from generations to generations.

While I do not pretend to offer an exhaustive list of all factors and interactions in caused in the specific development of part-time employment (e.g. the age structure has
been ignored), together, the distinct economic and socio-cultural processes described above have interacted (and reinforced each other) at the local level to produce lower levels of part-time employment in the Montréal labour market. In short, the presence of a strong manufacturing sector has provided full-time employment for mostly for males, while opportunities in newer service industries were proportionately smaller. This, in turn, reduced the possibility of part-time employment for women wishing to gradually enter the workforce. Coupled with the presence of a relatively traditional gender division of labour, circumstances for the emancipation of Québec women were difficult. This is not to pretend that more general processes of tertiarisation or social liberalisation did not affect the evolution of the labour market in Montréal, but rather to affirm that its pre-existing economic structure and socio-cultural context provoked end results that are distinctive and unique to Montréal.

5.4.2 Montréal’s Faster Growth of Female Part–Time Work

What seems paradoxical in the recent development of Montréal’s labour market is that despite having had lower proportions of part–time workers than other major CMAs throughout the past twenty-five years, there has also been a constant growth of this type of work arrangement. In the case of male workers, this situation is no different than elsewhere and mirrors the relative decline of males in the labour market. However, in the case of women, this increase in part-time employment runs counter to what has been observed in other large CMAs, especially from 1971 to 1991 (see Figure 5.5). I argue

32 In 1996, 66% of the manufacturing workforce in Montréal was male. This is lower than for Canada as a whole (71%), but certainly compares to Toronto, Winnipeg and Vancouver where male manufacturing employment also represent less than 70% (Statistics Canada, 1996a).

33 The trend for the “9 other CMAs” showed on Figure 5.5 also seems to contradict data from the Labour Force Survey about the growth of female part-time work in Canada as a whole (see Statistics Canada, 1995). This apparent discrepancy between the two sources is not related to differences in the definition of part-time work as both sources define part-time workers as “those who usually work less than 30 hours per week at their main or only job.” (see Statistics Canada, 1992, 1999d).
that the increase in the proportion of female part-time work in Montréal is related to Montréal’s particular type of transition to a service economy and to general economic difficulties in that city during the post-Fordist era.

**Figure 5.5: Development of Part-Time Employment in Montréal and Other Large CMAs, 1971-1996**

![Graph showing part-time employment as a percentage of the employed labour force for Montreal and 9 other CMAs from 1971 to 1996.](image)

*The employed labour force includes unemployed that have had a job in the census year or the year prior to the census.*


**The Tertiarisation of Montréal’s Workforce**

The development of Montréal’s economy in recent years has provided more opportunities for the growth of part-time work than in other CMAs (especially outside Québec). Not only have higher unemployment rates forced an increasing number of workers into part-time employment, but Montréal’s transition to a service economy has been characterised by the growth of low-end and often contingent service sector jobs.

While this transition is not different than elsewhere in the Canadian urban system, the
development of Montréal’s labour market appears more fragile given its slower growth in higher-end occupations.

A first point to be made about Montréal’s inability to create full-time employment growth is in relation to its process of de-industrialisation. Many of the sectors traditionally providing male full-time employment have recorded declining or slow growth rates in the past twenty-five years, as shown in Figure 5.6. In close association with job losses, manufacturing, public utilities, transportation and communication, as well as construction and the primary sector, have all experienced net employment losses between 1991 and 1996. As a reflection of new economic conditions, the decline of manufacturing employment is almost identical to that observed in Toronto and certainly better than the decline recorded in Hamilton. Thus, as Coffey and Polèse (1999a, 1999b) claim, it cannot serve to characterise Montréal as a structurally distinct economy. However, while this thesis may hold true when large industrial sectors are considered, an intra-sectoral analysis of manufacturing provides a more subtle interpretation of the economic position and transformation of Montréal.

Contrary to Ontario, the province of Québec, and especially Montréal, have not been able to develop strong automobile, steel and petrochemical industries and their associated industrial complexes (Manzagol, 1998). This is partly a consequence of federal economic policies which set the bases of the Auto Pact (1965) and delimited territories for the distribution of refined oil (the Borden line, 1961-1973). For Lamonde and Martineau (1992), the impact of the Auto Pact alone explains more than half of the
Figure 5.6: Decennial Growth Rates of Employment by Industry in the Montréal CMA (1971-1996)

Source: Special tabulation from Statistics Canada, table provided by William Coffey and Richard Shearmur
difference in unemployment between Ontario and Québec and is, by far, the factor with the most weight. Even though those specific industries came under attack in the post-Fordist period, they permitted a more solid development of economic activities than the textile and clothing industries.\footnote{34}

Table 5.7 illustrates how the difference between the industrial mixes of Montréal and Toronto had an impact on job creation between 1971 and 1991. While the ‘steel industries’ added 13,000 jobs to Toronto’s economy, that same number of jobs was lost in the clothing industry in Montréal.\footnote{35} The entire loss came in the 1980s, when the clothing industry directly suffered from the elimination of protective barriers and from the 1982-83 recession. The traditionally strong sub-sector of transportation and communication was also adversely affected in the restructuring period, despite some absolute gains in employment (Coffey and Polèse, 1999b). More precisely, Montréal’s share of this industry among Canada’s top ten CMA’s dropped from 29% in 1971 to 23% in 1996. Meanwhile, Toronto’s share increased from 26% to 28%.\footnote{36} The decline of railroads as a mode of commercial transportation and the doubtful decision to construct Mirabel airport (1975) contributed to the decline.

\textbf{Table 5.7: Employment in Selected Manufacturing Industries in Montréal and Toronto CMAs (1971-1991)}

\begin{tabular}{|l|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
& \textbf{Montréal (‘000)} & & & \textbf{Toronto (‘000)} & & \\
\hline
Clothing, textile and related & 65 & 70 & 52 & 26 & 33 & 22 \\
Primary metals & 9 & 10 & 7 & 8 & 8 & 9 \\
Metal fabricating & 20 & 24 & 17 & 32 & 41 & 29 \\
Machinery & 8 & 13 & 9 & 21 & 24 & 21 \\
Transportation equipment & 17 & 27 & 24 & 25 & 31 & 40 \\
Chemicals and chemical products & 16 & 18 & 19 & 19 & 24 & 25 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Source: Brodeur and Galameau (1994) \textit{Three Large Urban Areas in Transition}, p. 40

\footnote{34} These mechanised industries have greater value added and higher productivity. They also tend to create well remunerated and stable jobs.

\footnote{35} Includes ‘primary metals’, ‘metal fabricating’, ‘machinery’ and ‘transportation equipment’.

\footnote{36} Calculated from Census data provided by William Coffey and Richard Shearmur.
Meanwhile, the decline in the goods-producing sector was counterbalanced by an expansion of the tertiary sector. The service sector has consistently been among the fastest growing economic sectors over the past three decades (refer to Figure 5.6, p. 174). However, the tertiarisation of Montréal’s economy has been occurring at a slower pace than in other agglomerations in North America. For instance, of the eight largest labour markets in Canada, Montréal ranked eighth in employment growth in the finance (FIRE) and business services sectors during the 1970s. In the following decades, Montréal’s performance improved in comparison to that of the other CMAs, but employment growth was no more than ‘average’. This further contributed to the difficulty in creating full-time employment faced by Montréal and may in part help explain the considerable expansion of part-time jobs.

In addition, the types of service jobs created in Montréal have tended to be at the lower end of the occupational hierarchy. A number of circumstances that reflect the shrinking of Montréal’s heartland can be identified as causes of this sectoral development and of its generally slower employment growth (Rose, 1996). Among the most consequential aspects of that specific evolution, Coffey and Polèse (1999a, 1999b) mention the decline of Montréal in the “command and control metropolitan function.” Between 1981 and 1996, the employment share of that function in Montréal’s economy dropped from 7.7% to 7.4%. This proportion is much weaker than in Toronto (11.3%) and less than the average of the top eight Canadian metropolitan economies (9%), and reflects the tendency of head offices to increasingly concentrate in the Toronto area (Gad,

---

37 Metropolitan functions are defined as groups of economic functions which characterise large urban labour markets. The command and control functions include “accounting, management consulting, and finance, insurance and real estate.” (see Coffey and Polèse, 1999a, 1999b).
1995, Todd, 1995). It also reflects a general movement towards agglomerations in the West, notably Calgary and Vancouver.

As indicated in Figure 5.7, consumer services have expanded rapidly in Montréal. The sub-sectors of restaurants (24,005), childcare (22,420) and miscellaneous services (21,020) saw the greatest absolute gains of employment in the period between 1981 and 1996 (Coffey and Polèse, 1999a). These jobs have the particularity of being dominated by a female workforce, apart from being characterised by high levels of part-time employment. Based on the data set used for this table, this particular trend is not significantly different than what is found in Toronto and Vancouver (Coffey and Polèse, 1999a). However, it still indicates the development of labour market conditions that would account for the strong increase of female part-time work in the Montréal labour market.

**Figure 5.7: Fast and Slow Growing Sectors in Montréal (1981-1996)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Employment losses</th>
<th>Employment gains</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hosiery &amp; clothing</td>
<td>-14,975</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railway transportation</td>
<td>-12,040</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various merchandise stores</td>
<td>-8,405</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metal production</td>
<td>-5,260</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoes &amp; leather</td>
<td>-3,952</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papers</td>
<td>-3,565</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum &amp; coal products</td>
<td>-3,299</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metal transformation</td>
<td>-3,085</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxis &amp; other transportation</td>
<td>-3,075</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture</td>
<td>-2,605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurants</td>
<td>24,005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childcare</td>
<td>22,420</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. services</td>
<td>21,020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer services</td>
<td>17,065</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. health services</td>
<td>13,735</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food stores</td>
<td>10,880</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal services</td>
<td>10,285</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food wholesaling</td>
<td>9,850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security and investigation services</td>
<td>9,415</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobacconists &amp; others</td>
<td>8,595</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Coffey and Polèse (1999b) *La restructuration de l'économie montréalaise.*
Finally, aside from differences by industries and occupations, the development of Montréal’s labour market generally seems to have been handicapped by a slow growth of employment. As indicated on Figure 5.8, the Montréal CMA has ranked eighth out of the top ten CMAs in Canada for employment growth in each of the three occupational categories.

**Figure 5.8:** White, Grey and Blue Collar Employment Growth Rates in Canada’s Largest Ten CMAs (1971-1996)

Clearly, this context of slower economic development in comparison to other metropolitan economies has played a role in the flexibilisation of Montréal’s labour market. While elsewhere, stronger economic growth may have provided women with greater opportunities to join the full-time labour force, in Montréal, the more limited number of new jobs seems to have constrained women to achieve participation rates gains through part-time work.
Concluding Comments

Given that the complexity of processes in play in the development of the labour market, it is important to acknowledge that other factors may also be linked to Montréal's more rapid rise of female part-time work. For instance, given that women between 45 and 64 years of age are more likely to work part-time than those aged between 25 and 44, the slightly older age structure of Montréal (and that of the province of Québec) could have had an impact on the rise of part-time work in that CMA. Moreover, the development of progressive ideologies may also lead to an increase of part-time employment. Again, this may seem paradoxical in light of the comments made regarding the role of persisting conservatism in maintaining low levels of part-time work in Montréal. But as the contrasting examples of Denmark (Drewes Nielsen, 1991) and Britain (Gregory, 1998) show, seemingly opposing strategies of development (i.e. social and economic support for the feminisation of the workforce, limited child care system) may produce similar results (i.e. rapid increase of part-time work). In this regards, increases in part-time employment may not uniquely symbolise the decline of women in the workforce, but in some instances their gains. In other words, rapid growth of part-time work in Montréal can also be the results of changes in institutional and business behaviours to recognise that women may want to participate in the workforce differently than men. Compare to most other Canadian jurisdictions, the recent development of stronger family policies in Québec for the support of parental and family leaves and childcare services has to be seen in such context.

The preceding case study meets two of the main theoretical objectives of this thesis. First, it demonstrates the need to consider a mix of supply side and demand side factors in order to capture how labour market shifts might be operating. Second, it makes
the point that these two sets of factors work at the local scale to produce results that are distinct between among urban labour markets.

In particular, despite widespread trends towards a tertiarisation and feminisation of the workforce, the Montréal labour market has *locally* responded to these generalised processes to produce levels and trends of labour flexibilisation distinctive from those observed in other large CMAs. The data analysis presented in section 5.3 was clear about the role of these two processes in the recent development of part-time employment. However, it did not introduce direct evidence of their role in the creation of locally distinct patterns. The conceptual discussion that followed has attempted to respond to that deficiency by documenting the role played by Montréal’s industrial structure and the socio-cultural conditions present within that city.

Firstly, elements pertaining to the extent and evolution of manufacturing activities, as well as the limited quantitative (i.e. numbers of jobs) and qualitative (i.e. types of jobs) development of tertiary activities, have induced trends in part-time work that are different than those observed in other large CMAs. Secondly, by reflecting social norms different than those in place outside Québec, the socio-cultural fabric of Montréal has had an influence on the particular development of gendered labour markets. Overall, the logic applied for this case study does not deny the role of demand side forces, nor that of processes operating at wider geographic scales, it just asserts that these interact locally with supply driven processes.
CHAPTER SIX

WORK PRACTICES IN THE TORONTO LIFE INSURANCE INDUSTRY:
THE EMPLOYERS' PERSPECTIVE ON FLEXIBILITY

6.0 Introduction

As a complement to the discussion of the emergence of new forms of working arrangements, this chapter examines recent changes in the labour practices of a specific industry. Compared to the focus on a given work arrangement, as in the first case study, the industry focus enables me to explore how firms are using different types of flexibility in combination or in complement to fulfil a variety of needs. In addition, it also permits me to analyse the various components and options offered by labour flexibility to workers in the industry. This sectoral case study deals with the Canadian life insurance business, with a focus on Toronto-based firms. While the first case study has demonstrated the importance of considering the changing characteristics of local workforces in the process of labour flexibilisation, the present discussion shifts its attention to changing demand side conditions.

Three major considerations influenced the choice of this industry for a case study. First, from a practical point of view, the life insurance industry of Toronto offered a
relatively large population of firms given the concentration of Canadian financial businesses in the Toronto area. Second, the nature of services rendered by this industry has made it subject to profound changes both in its structure and manner of doing business. As a result, it provides an interesting example of an industry which has been compelled to change in the face of rapidly growing national and international competition. At the same time, the industry finds itself acting as an agent that has further propagated the process of global restructuring and its related impacts on the social and economic structure of cities (Clark, 1996, Friedmann, 1986, Sassen, 1994). Third, and related to the previous reason, the life insurance industry provides an occasion to explore labour practices in the service sector, a sector whose restructuring processes have been relatively neglected in comparison to those of the manufacturing sector (Christopherson, 1989, 1998, Wood, 1991). Since there is evidence that contingent jobs are more prevalent in the service sector than in manufacturing (Herzenberg et al., 1998), it seems appropriate to investigate a portion of this sector. Moreover, as discussed later in this chapter, the financial services sector is increasingly integrated in terms of functions and corporate practices. Therefore, although the share of employment in life and health insurance within that sector is small (8%), trends in this industry have implications for the larger financial sector.

This chapter argues that the appearance of new forms of work in the life insurance industry is both the result of a new competitive environment in the financial services sector and also an acknowledgement on the part of the employers that their employees require a certain level of flexibility in balancing work and personal life. The following section provides a short description of the Canadian life insurance industry along with discussions about data collection issues. Subsequently, three sections present an analysis
of the development of specific forms of working arrangements, with a focus on the circumstances that might have provoked these increases. Sections 6.2 and 6.3 highlight demand-driven forces, while section 6.4 places emphasis on the role of supply factors. Finally, I discuss some possible implications of these trends for labour practices.

6.1 Profile of the Canadian Life Insurance Industry

As of 1997, there were 148 operating life insurance companies in Canada including national and foreign fraternal benefit societies (Office of the Superintendent of Financial Institutions, 1997). Only 45% of these firms were considered Canadian, but they controlled 94% of the nearly 380 billion dollars assets of the industry. Moreover, these Canadian firms generated over 86% of the net income of life insurance businesses. However, any figures regarding the nationality of companies need to be interpreted with caution, because they are more a reflection of a firm’s legal status rather than of ultimate control. For instance, *NN Life Insurance Company of Canada* is listed as a Canadian company given that it is incorporated in Canada. Yet, the ultimate owner of the company is *ING Canada Holdings Ltd.*, a Dutch company.

The Canadian life insurance industry is also a heterogeneous industry. Apart from the division between foreign and Canadian companies, differences between fraternal societies and regular insurance companies are considerable. Together, the 27 fraternal societies operating in Canada controlled only 1.8% of the assets of the Canadian life insurance business despite accounting for 18% of the number of firms. Alone, *The Independent Order of Foresters*, Canada’s tenth largest insurance company (as measured

38 The Canadian Life and Health Insurance Association listed 169 operating Life companies for 1998 (see CLHIA, 1998).
39 Fraternal benefit societies are organisations providing life coverage to their members. This membership is often, but not exclusively, based on religious, ethnic or vocational background.
by assets), generated 87% of the profits of all fraternal societies operating in Canada. Another example of the extent of concentration in the life insurance industry is seen in the dominance of only a few companies over most of the life insurance business. Table 6.1 shows that 88% of the assets of the business were under the control of only ten large companies in 1997. This left a mere 12% of assets to the remaining 138 insurance companies conducting life operations. After 1997, the operations became even more concentrated given the acquisitions of London Life by Great-West Life and of the Canadian operations of Metropolitan Life by Mutual Life. Even within this restricted list of ten firms important size differences are visible. The merged businesses of Great-West and London are more than 17 times larger than The Independent Order of Foresters.

Table 6.1: Canada’s Ten Largest Life Insurance Firms and their Share of the Industry (1997)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company Name</th>
<th>Total Assets (thousands of dollars)</th>
<th>Net Premiums Insurance (thousands of dollars)</th>
<th>Net Premiums Annuities (thousands of dollars)</th>
<th>Investment Income (thousands of dollars)</th>
<th>Net Income (thousands of dollars)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Sun Life Ass. Co. of Canada</td>
<td>80,677,280</td>
<td>4,451,019</td>
<td>2,337,394</td>
<td>3,834,058</td>
<td>510,941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Manufacturers Life Insur. Co.</td>
<td>77,540,948</td>
<td>4,580,655</td>
<td>1,065,873</td>
<td>3,923,275</td>
<td>743,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Great-West Life Ass. Co.</td>
<td>74,230,065</td>
<td>4,120,452</td>
<td>466,141</td>
<td>2,183,683</td>
<td>246,499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Canada Life Ass. Co.</td>
<td>39,639,348</td>
<td>1,906,632</td>
<td>1,374,847</td>
<td>1,842,159</td>
<td>265,691</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. London Life Insur. Co.</td>
<td>26,590,115</td>
<td>3,771,610</td>
<td>404,228</td>
<td>1,530,389</td>
<td>118,145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Mutual Life Ass. Co. of Canada</td>
<td>26,267,972</td>
<td>1,537,899</td>
<td>491,873</td>
<td>1,655,520</td>
<td>157,319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Standard Life Ass. Co. (Scot)</td>
<td>12,084,202</td>
<td>225,650</td>
<td>925,892</td>
<td>983,445</td>
<td>82,053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Independent Order of Foresters</td>
<td>5,876,782</td>
<td>282,253</td>
<td>46,490</td>
<td>435,802</td>
<td>55,385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top 10 sub-total</td>
<td>405,974,922</td>
<td>28,126,489</td>
<td>8,482,446</td>
<td>20,122,248</td>
<td>2,827,882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All other operating firms in Canada</td>
<td>49,856,740</td>
<td>5,836,879</td>
<td>1,162,661</td>
<td>2,782,811</td>
<td>489,512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share of top ten</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The Relative Importance of Life Insurance in the Canadian Economy

In comparison to other countries, the place of life insurance within the Canadian economy has been relatively weak. For instance, Canada ranks 20th out of 29 countries in
premiums per capita, and 21st in the share of premiums of GDP (OECD, 1998a). By contrast, the life insurance sector of its main competitor, the United States, is much more intensive as it ranks ninth and tenth respectively. As a result of this situation, but also mostly because of its small population base, Canada’s market share of life insurance business in the OECD is less than 1 percent. Moreover, this share has declined rapidly in the last decade from 2.35% in 1990 to 0.98% in 1997. The OECD market is dominated by the United States (31%) and Japan (25%), who still control the majority of premium values despite a decrease of 8% during the 1990s.

It is difficult to assess the specific contribution of the life insurance industry to the national economy because of data limitations. The available data only allow me to compare the development of the whole insurance sector to that of other sectors. In comparison to the economy as a whole, growth has been slower in insurance as indicated in Figure 6.1. In particular, the insurance industry experienced an absence of growth during most of the 1960s and 1970s, a period characterised by profound restructuring of assets management. Even though it caught up with the pace of growth of other sectors in the following decades, the long term performance of insurers lags behind the rest of the Canadian economy. However, in relation to the financial, insurance and real estate sectors as a whole, long term growth is comparable, especially since the rapid increases of the late 1970s and early 1980s.
Figure 6.1: Growth of GDP in Selected Industries, Canada (1961-1998)

Source: Cansim, Matrix 4677 (series: 153001, 153262, 153268)

Employment

The life and health insurance industry in Canada directly employed over 60,000 full-time persons at the end of 1997 (CLHIA, 1997). In addition, 43,900 independent agents were licensed to sell products from life and/or health companies operating in Canada. From 47,500 in 1970, the number of direct workers grew to a peak of about 65,000 in 1989, but decreased by 5,000 employees in the 1990s. More specifically, since 1986, employment in life and health insurance has slowly declined. As shown in Figure 6.2, this is not necessarily typical of other financial services, which have seen a rapid increase of employment in the late 1980s, followed by a relatively strong decrease between 1991 and 1996.

---

40 Those agents who are not employed exclusively in the life and health insurance business.
The size of the entire financial sector is of interest and of importance for the present discussion. The financial industry employed approximately 788,000 workers in 1996, which represented 5.5% of the labour force across all industries. This compares to the primary industries combined (5.6%) or to construction industries (5.7%), but is significantly smaller than the share of workers in manufacturing (14.2%) or retail activities (12.4%). Within the finance and insurance industries, deposit-accepting intermediary industries (banks, co-operative banking and trust companies) constituted the largest provider of jobs (288,000). Insurance industries ranked third in this category with 136,000 workers. The insurance industry, as with other financial industries, is considerably more important for female workers as opposed to male workers as women make up over 60% of those employed in insurance. As a result, financial services constitute one of the most crucial sectors for female employment in Canada after the

The "Financial Industry" includes Finance and insurance industries (division K) and Real estate operator and insurance agent industries (division L), based on 1980 SIC.
health and social services sectors, which possess an even larger share of female employees.

Another important aspect of the employment structure of life and health insurers is related to the division between head office on the one hand and branch and exclusive agents on the other (see Figure 6.3). The core of employment consists of head office jobs (33,200), followed by agents (17,500). In particular, jobs in this industry increasingly tend to be concentrated in head offices, which now account for more than half of the total industry’s workforce. Another 29% of the employees are those agents working exclusively for one insurer in branch offices.

Figure 6.3: Life and Health Insurance Personnel in Canada (1970-1997)

This specific division of labour is particularly relevant here as it also implies a spatial division of labour: head office employment is concentrated in large urban centres, branch employment in smaller regional centres, and agents spread throughout the entire country. As a result, the spatial distribution of employment in the industry is both a
function of the degree of concentration in the geography of high-level financial services (Coffey, 2000, Gad and Matthew, 2000) and of the demographic hierarchy within the urban system (McCann and Simmons, 2000).

**Figure 6.4:** Provincial Distribution of Employees in the Life and Health Insurance Industry, Canada (1997)

As shown in Figure 6.4, the majority (58%) of jobs in this industry are located in Ontario, where most financial head offices are found (Gad, 1991, Todd, 1995). Québec is a distant second with over 12,000 jobs that account for 20% of employment in the sector. Together, British Columbia and the Prairies hold 17%, while the four Atlantic provinces capture only 4% of the total workforce. Mainly because of the national role of Toronto, Ontario's dominance in the sector is even more noticeable when only head office jobs are considered. Ontario holds three quarters of all of the head office employment of the
Canadian life and health insurance business. In contrast, agents are distributed more evenly as they follow patterns of population distribution.

Methods of Data Collection

The analysis presented here is based on a series of 16 extensive interviews conducted between March and May 1999. In total, 13 firms were investigated. In some cases, more than one company official was interviewed, as part of a separate interview or with more than one respondent at the same time. The list of interview subjects includes senior vice-presidents, directors of human resources, managers, and human resources specialists. All interviews were conducted in person, except for one, which was administered by telephone. The interviews were based on an interview schedule (see Appendix B), which was loosely structured to allow me to follow-up on interesting leads. In general, the meetings ranged in length from 45 to 90 minutes.

To preserve confidentiality, the names of firms and interviewees are not disclosed. However, a good idea of the representativeness of the sample may be discerned by relating it to the Canadian life insurance industry and to business being specifically conducted in the Greater Toronto Area and in Canada. The 13 companies interviewed represent 40% of the 32 operating life insurance firms in Toronto with fifty employees or more (Toronto Board of Trade, 1999). In particular, the surveyed firms employed over 11,500 persons in the GTA and nearly 24,000 workers across Canada, excluding sales agents. Together, these 13 companies controlled over 295 billion dollars in assets, which represented 73% of the entire life insurance business in 1997.

---

42 Standard Industrial Classification (SIC): 6311
6.2 The Entrenchment of Cost-Efficient Employment Practices in the Industry

Changes in the corporate structure of life insurance seem to have led inevitably to a redefinition of employment practices. While some of these forces started to appear more than two decades ago, it seems that the pace of change has accelerated since the early 1990s. Consequently, shifts in labour practices have also quickened. In a report submitted to the Task Force on the Future of the Canadian Financial Services Sector, The Conference Board of Canada (1998: 6) clearly establishes the inevitability of the shift from an "old" to a "new employment contract":

At the macro level, the old employment contract is no longer practical or feasible. Employers can not guarantee employment for life, and individuals must accept the responsibility for their own careers.

During an interview, an employment specialist quoted a senior executive of one of Canada’s largest life insurers, who bluntly expressed the same opinion: “It’s not going to be a nice company to work for anymore.”

Not only is long-term employment security being questioned, but for those workers who remain in the industry, chances are that they are going to be employed in a new way. With a particular focus on outsourcing, temporary employment, and overtime work, this section describes some of the practices that appear particularly flexible and profitable to employers.

Sub-Contracting/Outsourcing

Among the clearest patterns observed in the transformation of employment in the life insurance industry is the rapid growth of outsourcing or sub-contracting. This trend corresponds to tendencies observed elsewhere, in manufacturing (see for example Hayter,
1997, Holmes, 1986, 1996, Kumar and Holmes, 1997, Norcliffe and Bates, 1997) and to a lesser extent in services (Daniels, 1991, Sinden, 1996, Ursell, 1998, Wood, 1991). This process of vertical disintegration, however, has not been uniform throughout the industry and, thus, has played a role in the varying reproduction of divisions of labour. Most common among the types of functions outsourced are those which relate to information technology (IT), mailing, and cleaning. These functions are entirely contracted-out or only in part. Less widespread is the outsourcing of functions associated with the day-to-day operations of life insurance companies such as the processing of claims.

Outsourcing allows a company to reduce direct and indirect operating costs. It is used when firms believe that the same level of work can be achieved by a second company at a lower aggregate cost. Such practices, therefore, offer obvious labour management advantages. In many cases, outsourcing provides all three types of labour flexibility: numerical, functional, and pay flexibility. For instance, pay flexibility is achieved when employers dissociate themselves from complicated and expensive employee benefits. Functional flexibility is realised when specific tasks are outsourced to companies that can handle them more efficiently. This is often the case for short-term technology functions, such as the year 2000 programming (Y2K bug). Costs related to training are avoided. Finally, numerical flexibility is obtained because the length of contracts between the two parties closely fits the requirements of outsourcing companies.

There are drawbacks to the transition from in-house to outside production. Among the most important issues is the question of retaining control: control over the quality of services, and over technological development and choices. Yet, despite these disadvantages, the rapid increase in outsourcing suggests that the trade-off is generally positive from the life insurance companies' perspective. There are indications that most of
the benefits are of a financial nature, thus giving weight to the argument that such practices are an outcome of competitive pressures (Stanback et al., 1981). When asked about the recent changes promoting the use of sub-contracting, one of the interviewees was particularly clear about the trade-offs and the circumstances related to the increased utilisation of such practices:

Ten years ago we wouldn’t have considered that [sub-contracting]. First of all the attention to cost. It’s the economy of scale. A number of years ago, we, as a company, refused to give up control. So, we would do a service because it was something that we could control. [...] And slowly, because of competition and because of what is going on in the market place, severe competition and the emphasis on cost efficiency, it’s become obvious that if you use a third party or contract a service you are able to save money, you’re able to save more, if you do it the right way.... The economy has forced the issue of getting things in an economical way, and if you want to do things in an economical way, you gotta look at the possibility of giving up a little bit of control. And that’s the trade-off!

Outsourcing rarely seems to benefit in-house employees. This type of practice is a clear example of labour flexibility being driven first and foremost by employers. Those whose jobs are being contracted out may lose their employment. There are many cases, where the life insurance company employee would be hired by the firm providing the outsourced services, but working conditions (pay, benefits, schedule) would not necessarily be transferred (Gammon, 1998). This is particularly the case in ‘low-level’ functions such as cleaning, where exploitative labour relations sustain the cost-efficiency of sub-contracting practices (Rees and Fielder, 1994).

Yet, to take advantage of highly sought skills, other types of functions, mainly technological ones, are also being externalised, but in this case to an ‘elite’ labour market (Lovering, 1990). In this sense, sub-contracting practices are reinforcing patterns of
labour divisions and, perhaps, of labour market polarisation (Baines and Wheelock, 2000).

Temporary Employment

Temporary working arrangements are on the rise in the life insurance business. All of the companies surveyed have registered a considerable increase in temporary employment within their organisation since the early 1970s. Again, as in the case of subcontracting, the growth of this specific form of work has accelerated in the last decade. By and large, in the life insurance business, temporary employees are used for 'semi-skilled' clerical functions, but not for professional or technical tasks. However, there is no indication that life insurers are calling on highly qualified temporary workers as suggested by Peck and Theodore (1998). Typically, temporary workers in the life insurance industry come from two distinct sources. The short-term temporary needs are filled by specialised 'temp agencies', who recruit the required workers for the company. Temporary workers who are employed for a longer period of time are usually directly hired through the human resources department. Although the two types of temporary workers are usually given different assignments, the use of such workers remains primarily driven by cost-efficiency.

At first glance, the reasons given for employing temporary workers do not point in the direction of newly competitive conditions in the industry. Rather, very short term and concrete needs are usually identified as the motivation for employing temporary workers:

My secretary is sick. I phone up the temp agency and say I need somebody in tomorrow [...] or my secretary leaves, I phone up the temp agency and say I need someone in until I fill the job.
Yet, when more questions are asked regarding the use of temporary workers, the answers reveal that responses to these short-term needs have evolved over time. A new financial logic seems to have inspired the increased utilisation of such practices.

Question: But these things happened 20 years ago, secretaries got sick. How did employers deal with the situation then? Did they hire temps?

Answer: No, at the time (probably) we would have asked another staff member to fill the gap on a temporary basis. [...] Today, given the workload of all of our employees, there isn’t really anyone available to do the work of others.

Question: What does it say about the workload of workers 20 years ago?

Answer: Well, it might mean that we didn’t manage our workforce efficiently. We were paying people to do work for an entire year, when maybe we needed them only for part of the year. Now, when we have extensive workload or special projects, we hire a contract person who’d typically be on the staff, but would be moving from x crew to y crew. [...] It’s a way of hiring someone and not committing until you know if you have the head count to support that person.

In fact, whether one talks about temporary employment, part-time work or any other form of numerical flexibility, a shift in labour management is apparent. Companies have moved from managing work needs based on yearly peak periods to setting the number of permanent/full-time employees based on average day-to-day needs. More precisely, this means that organisations will now hire extra staff during periods of high demand, whereas in the past, their level of full-time employment would have been determined by these specific periods of high demand. This transition has produced the expected costs-saving effects as it has reduced the amounts of both salaries and benefits paid.
Interestingly, while processes of corporate restructuring such as mergers and demutualisation are contributing to the establishment of labour flexibility as a common practice in the industry, they are also promoting the use of temporary employment in the short run. For instance, one executive argues that the hiring of temporary workers has been made more prevalent by the increasingly common process of merging two companies into one:

The number of temporary employees has increased over the most recent past. Especially with respect to what we’ve been through: a merger, [...] in the planning of going through that merger you have to be able to accommodate the short term need of getting the work done while in the same time insisting that you get the synergies that you’re trying to get by putting the two organisations to begin with. And so, you have a dramatic need to be able to hire people to do work on a short term basis, but you know you won’t need going forward. So, we’ve hired a pile, a pile, of temporary people.

In the end, temporary employment also represents a clear case of numerical as well as financial flexibility for life insurers. In contrast to the rigid practices of earlier periods, which were constructed primarily around permanent and full-time work, the use of temporary workers is enabling life insurers to be more competitive.

Overtime Work

Two major trends have been observed in the use of overtime work. First, paid overtime (which is not accessible to managerial and senior staff) tends to be increasingly discouraged. Except in cases involving special projects (the case of demutualisation was mentioned several times), employers are growing increasingly cautious of paid overtime. In part, this is because, in their view, overtime work tends to be consumed when made available to employees. In some cases, managers feel that workers come to expect overtime work and the supplementary source of income that it provides, whereas it
should be used only on an irregular basis. They further argue that such practices are unproductive by nature, since most work could be performed during the regular hours of employment. And therefore, in light of current attempts to increase competitiveness within the sector, the use of paid overtime appears to be an inefficient strategy. An employment specialist describes the recent trend to avoid overtime work:

What we’re trying to do within the company, is to get away from overtime pay and encourage employees to take flextime instead. It’s cheaper for the company.

In other cases, however, interviewees stated that there was so much work to be done during certain periods, that there was no way that all of it could be accomplished within the normal working schedule. Yet, again, they admitted that their organisations were trying to restrict the amount of paid overtime by using alternative means of compensation.

Second, the amount of unpaid overtime work appears to be increasing, especially at the upper end of the functional hierarchy. This is a trend that has been noted in other economic sectors and elsewhere in industrialised economies (OECD, 1998b). Labour legislation does not require employers to compensate managerial workers for overtime work. Thus, regulation is partly responsible for the widespread use of unpaid overtime of labour in certain functions. However, more than simply being supported by a regulatory framework, this practice is also driven by a corporate culture in which overtime work is something that is expected at the management and senior levels. Notwithstanding their position in the company, all interviewees confirmed the existence of such expectations and had noticed a recent increase in the number of “unpaid”, “unrecognised” and
“unrecorded” hours of work. An interesting comment on the reasons affecting this increase came from a director who considered technology to be one of the driving forces:

Because of technology, partly, people are more ‘on’ and for longer period of time, i.e. because you can hook on somewhere or from home. [...] I kind of think that the tensions to work certainly have expanded dramatically because it [work] is much easier to access. We can find you wherever you go now [chuckles].

These trends tend to support arguments of research cited earlier in the thesis regarding the advent of working hour polarisation based on the occupations of workers. In other words, while companies are trying to reduce costs related to the payment of overtime work at the lower level of the occupational hierarchy (mainly clerical), upper level workers face increasing amounts of unpaid work in excess of 40 hours per week.

Overtime work does provide clear flexibility to the employer, although the company representatives interviewed generally did not perceived it as a flexible working arrangement in the popular sense. This work arrangement allows the use of in-firm staff to execute extra work on an as-required basis. However, given the pressures in the industry to reduce labour expenses, the use of paid overtime no longer is perceived as a suitable solution. Instead, paid overtime is being replaced by other forms of compensation for the regular staff and by unpaid overtime work among management. Thus, this strategy contributes to an increase of both numerical and financial flexibility.

In summary, these findings echo changes that have been widely described in other economic sectors, especially in manufacturing, in that there is strong evidence that employee-employer relationships have changed considerably over the past three decades.

---

43 It is interesting to note that most people interviewed, at first, viewed flexibility as an arrangement that allows workers to flexibly arrange their schedule to respond to needs outside the workplace. This, I suggest, is reflective of a ‘popular’ definition of flexibility commonly portrayed in the mass media.
in the life insurance industry. In particular, the informants interviewed felt that the way the industry uses labour has been modified in abrupt ways in the last decade:

I would say that labour practices have definitely changed over the last 30 years, and probably (relatively), I was going to say, that the change is much more dramatic over the last 5 to 8 years as opposed to the last 25 years.

This acceleration of trends is particularly interesting. More specifically, it would suggest that the long-debated issue of post-Fordist labour restructuring in manufacturing during the 1970s and 1980s has only become significant in the financial services sector in recent years. Alternatively, it could mean that Canada has been slower to react to change in comparison to the (much better documented) American and British cases.

6.3 The Causes of Accelerating Labour Flexibility

The labour conditions described above in the life insurance industry appear to be largely driven by economic forces. A market culture of competitiveness seems deeply rooted in the corporate practices of this specific industry. To a certain extent, the willingness to be more competitive (and profitable) has not changed. But despite the fact that enterprises have always sought profits, there is something that makes today’s competitive context more intense than that observed in earlier the Fordist period. More precisely, it is not so much the changing balance in labour practices that constitutes an interesting phenomenon, but rather the fact that the trend towards flexibility has accelerated so much in a very short period of time. In this section, I present the main contention of this chapter, namely that the growth of these new forms of work in the Canadian life insurance business has intensified as a result of the broader corporate restructuring of this particular industry.
In recent years, the life insurance industry has undergone a series of transformations in accord with the general restructuring of financial services. Two of these changes seem to be of particular significance to the industry and for the present discussions about labour restructuring: 1) the wave of mergers and acquisitions; and 2) demutualisation.

*Mergers and Acquisitions*

In the 1970s, insurance companies entered a period of abrupt change in the way they operate their businesses. Mostly, these changes were caused by inflation and higher interest rates, which forced policyholders to seek better investments than the long-term plans that they possessed with life insurance (Huggins and Land, 1992). Not only did these new economic conditions force the industry to revise its investment strategies, but it also compelled them to expand their lines of products so that they, like other financial institutions, could offer competitive investment products to their policyholders. In particular, the shift from offering life insurance products to annuity products has been drastic in the 1970s (Task Force on the Future of the Canadian Financial Services Sector, 1998). As a result, approximately half of the premium income of Canadian life insurers now comes from asset management, while life insurance premiums, which accounted for over 60% of the income in 1970, now account for less than 30% (see Figure 6.5).

Therefore, life insurance companies have grown increasingly similar to deposit-taking institutions (i.e. banks, trust companies, credit unions, and ‘caisses populaires’) over the past twenty years. Traditionally, the financial sector has been divided into four types of businesses: banks, trust companies, insurance companies, and securities dealers.
Not only are the separations between these industries becoming blurred, but mutual fund companies have emerged as a major new player over the past decade.

**Figure 6.5: Composition of Premium Income of Life and Health Insurers, Canada (1970-1997)**

![Composition of Premium Income of Life and Health Insurers, Canada (1970-1997)](image)


In the face of this growing competition from within the financial services sector, mergers and acquisitions have come forth as a rapid solution for achieving product diversification and expansion. Such corporate practices have been commonplace in the financial service industry for some time. However, the intensity of these practices seems to have increased during certain economic periods. Both in terms of numbers and value, in Canada, this movement towards a greater concentration has occurred in the 1990s in the entire business of finance and the life insurance industry has played an important role within the overall process (Canada, House of Commons, 1998). Indeed, the control of life insurance premiums by the ten largest Canadian firms jumped from 60% in 1993 (Financial Post, January 27, 1995) to 79% in 1997 (see Table 6.1).
As Tickell (2000: 159) contends for the case of banks, the recent willingness of financial institutions to merge has been built upon the rhetoric of ‘globalisation’:

The banks argued that the globalisation of finance was proceeding so rapidly that they had no choice but to merge: “the relative small size of Canada’s banks puts them at a disadvantage... in global terms” (from Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

Other corporate strategies have included the expansion of the line of products and strategic alliances. In some cases, life insurers maintain total control over their own brand of services and compete for traditional life insurance services within the industry, as well as for new products with other financial companies outside the life business. In other cases, services are offered through complementary companies or subsidiaries.

In addition to the convergence of functions among the main players of the financial services sector, the increased competition for national and external markets is another main force contributing to the industry’s desire to consolidate. The specific strategies of consolidation in the life insurance business involve a series of movements within the industry that do not always reflect a homogeneous approach to becoming more competitive. Some very large global financial institutions are already starting to appear in the Canadian market (e.g. ING, AXA). These multinationals are striving to diversify both functionally and geographically. Other players are focusing on specific continental markets. Finally, a larger number of niche players are attempting to capitalise on either their geographical or functional strengths or in some cases both. For Canada’s life insurance business, the result has been a series of business exchanges around which specific companies try to define their future orientation.
While no Canadian-based life insurer seems to belong to the category of global financial institution, recently there have been some clear moves among them to become continental leaders in their field. In the last five years, a number of very large transactions have occurred in the Canadian life insurance industry.

One of the events that seems to have triggered this wave of mergers and acquisitions has been the failure, in August 1995, of Confederation Life Insurance Co., Canada's fourth largest insurer and valued at over 19 billion of assets at the time (McQueen, 1996). Following the failure, Maritime Life took over the company's individual life insurance accounts, Manulife bought its group life and health policies, and Sun Life acquired the British operations of the defunct Confederation Life. Since this time, two other major transactions have significantly changed the face of life insurance in Canada. First, in 1997, Great-West Lifeco Inc. acquired London Life. Not only did the move propel Great-West into the rank of sixth largest life insurer in North America (and largest in Canada), but it also prevented the Royal Bank from taking control of a large Canadian life insurer. Second, Mutual Life of Canada bought the Canadian operations of Metropolitan Life in March 1998. Third, in Spring 1999, Maritime Life Assurance Co. acquired Aetna Life Insurance of Canada.

The interviews have clearly established that this recent wave of mergers and acquisitions has affected the management of life insurance, including its labour practices. Not unlike the argument promoted by banks, companies feel that they have to fight harder than ever before to maintain their position in a relatively tight market. As one senior manager explains:

The life insurance, in Canada, is a very mature market, and so, the only way to get some more businesses is to take it out somewhere else. It's not
huge, it’s not a growth market. So, the competitive pressures are very much there.

This reaction was not uncommon during the interviews and reflects a feeling that has been felt elsewhere. As the outcomes of an American survey showed, 84.2% of insurance companies felt that the marketplace for their services was “highly competitive” (Lindahl and Beyers, 1999). The result is that competitiveness (and, thus, the ability to survive) is achieved through a “Lean and Mean” approach to the production of services. Clearly, strategies of labour flexibilisation are part of this approach. An anecdote provided by one informant was particularly illustrative of the competitive environment within the industry:

Ten years ago, I used to sit down and talk to my counterparts [VP, HR] with the other large life insurance companies in the country. There were twelve of us who met. Today, we’re four! [...] Because of competition and because of your ability to survive or not (and it depends on some of the things that we’ve been talking about concerning labour flexibility), you have to be able to respond. And if you don’t, you become one of the eight.

In short, from a relatively secure and protected situation within a national market that does not provide growth prospects, Canadian life insurers are gradually moving towards an economic environment where, for them, the future appears brighter. However, whatever the choice of corporate strategy (e.g. alliance, mergers, specialisation), this process heightens the level of competitiveness in all areas of financial services. Not only does it involve being able to quickly respond to the competition with efficient labour practices, but in many cases, it also requires the ability to raise financial resources. The demutualisation of life insurers is a response to the latter requirement.
Demutualisation

Demutualisation is the process by which mutual companies (owned by policyholders) become publicly traded companies in the stock market. Before the recent wave of demutualisation, there were only three major life insurers in Canada which were owned by stockholders: Great-West Life, London Life (now a subsidiary of Great-West), and Crown Life. Other companies had mutualised in the early 1960s in order to protect themselves from American take-overs. Now, in light of the increased competition, concerns regarding foreign ownership have given way to the ability of gaining easier stock access to capital. Following federal regulations that allowed demutualisation, but required large firms to be widely held (Financial Post, April 16, 1999), five large life insurers have engaged in this process. So far, Mutual Life (now called Clarica Life Insurance Co.), Manulife Financial Corp., Canada Life and Industrial-Alliance have entered the stock market. Sun Life of Canada and will follow by the end of the year 2000.

The decision of several large life insurance companies to become publicly traded has had important implications for the way of doing business and provoked inevitable impacts on labour management. Although demutualisation is just an extension of the process of mergers and acquisitions, people interviewed directly associated some components of labour force restructuring with this specific corporate transformation. Since the primary objective of demutualisation is an increase in liquidity for market expansion, the five demutualising companies need a priori to show their economic efficiency. This level of efficiency determines the level of the initial public offering (IPO) of market shares and, therefore, the amount of capital that can be raised. In this sense, the ability of insurance firms to manage their workforce efficiently is a direct indicator of
their economic performance and health. A labour consultant for one of the future stock companies summarises some of the steps that are being taken in this particular direction:

Just given the nature of the industry: there has been a lot of consolidation, we’re going public. So, it really forced us to look internally, to see where we need to cut down, where we’re inefficient, where there’s been a lot of repetition.

In a similar fashion, not long ago, Canada Life announced that job losses could precede demutualisation (Globe & Mail, April 21, 1999). The company’s chief executive officer maintained that “the company expects its strategy to become more sharply focused, resulting in an increased policy holder and shareholder value.” Although the job cuts did not occur, this shows that firms are more concerned with labour productivity and that they are willing to use labour reduction to increase share value. The case of Royal & Sun Alliance in the U.K. illustrated this point in September 1999, when the company slashed hundreds of jobs to please shareholders (Financial Post, September 6, 1999). Banks, which are the financial sector’s leaders, are clearly leading this trend in Canada. Despite posting record profits in the 1990s, both the Royal Bank (Globe & Mail, November 20, 1999) and the Bank of Montreal (Globe & Mail, November 24, 1999) announced massive reductions of their workforces. This situation recalls the profound restructuring of the British banking industry where thousands of jobs were lost and flexibilised in the early 1990s (Sinden, 1996). It also reminds us of the implications of an open financial market, in which the strategic actions of international competitors have effects on the behaviours of national firms.

According to Boyer (2000a, 2000b), the privileging of shareholder value is the corner stone of this “finance-led growth regime”. As firms must increase their internal rate of return to attract important investors, they place a premium on managers who are
forced to revise their management techniques to increase productivity. Reviewing labour relations through flexible employment is one of the most common and cost efficient strategies that has been favoured. The effects of such a system are perverse, since workers, who might be affected by flexible practices, themselves also seek (good) investments!

Evidently then, the corporate structure of mutual life insurers is seen as an obstacle to change and flexibility. In particular, mutual firms are described as paternalistic organisations in which employee-employer relationships are established for life. This 'cultural’ feature is further associated with the inability of firms to adapt to change in an effective manner. Therefore, in the face of growing competition and the need to react quickly to the competition, this particular corporate structure appears inefficient.

In short, although other factors also come into play, as will be argued in the next section, the flexibility strategies depicted above are in many cases just an extension of job cuts in that they are aimed at getting more for less: more sub-contracting at lower cost, more temporary work at lower cost, and more overtime work at no cost (Sinden, 1996). Clearly, the processes of mergers and acquisitions and demutualisation have a direct impact on the supply of numerically and/or functionally flexible jobs. And these strategies are well integrated into the general process of restructuring. Just as product diversification needs to be achieved through mergers and acquisitions, so are these alliances made easier by demutualisation, which, in turn, will be as successful as companies are efficient.
More importantly perhaps, the trend to the adoption of these specific labour practices also reflects the short-term vision of the financial services industry. Both numerically and functionally flexible jobs have the ability of eliminating some long-term costs while increasing job productivity, at least in the short run. One of the most evocative comments made during the series of interviews came from an executive who, in response to a question regarding the short-term objectives of companies, described the needs to produce quick results. In many ways, his view summarises very well the direction that the life insurance business is taking, both in its general management process and in its use of labour:

My personal response, as an individual, but also as an executive with this company is, although we don’t lose sight of what the long term objectives are, it gets to be a ‘what have you done for me lately syndrome’. [...] If there is a CEO or senior executive who can’t deliver the results, short term, then, they’re not going to be around very long. So, as a result of that, a lot of companies, ourselves included, are very short-sighted and pay a lot of attention to means that generate quick returns.

The two processes described above are no different than the ones occurring elsewhere in the world of finance (Johnson, 1998). They are simply symptomatic of the perceived need to respond to increased competition. Not all insurance companies may focus on global or international markets. Strategic considerations have to be made according to the size, experience, financial strengths and expertise of individual companies. Nevertheless, the behaviour of those national and international firms which attempt to grow inevitably has an impact on the market in which other more passive players operate. In this sense, questions have to be raised regarding specific strategies that life insurers are adopting with respect to the use of labour.
6.4. A Bright Side to Flexibility

In the above sections, employment trends were particularly linked to changes in the structure of the life insurance industry. All of the factors mentioned related in some ways to the need of the industry to become more competitive. In this sense, the process is essentially demand-driven, as employers do not propose alternatives to flexible working arrangements, but rather impose this transition from rigid employment practices to new, more flexible (and cost-effective) employee-employer relationships.

Yet, in all of the conducted interviews, the respondents also perceived flexibility as a benefit provided to accommodate employees’ needs. Sometimes this type of response reflected a narrow (and fashionable) definition of the concept of flexibility. It could also be argued that, as the firms’ representatives, respondents were likely to present and defend a position which reflected favourably on their company. However, because of the variety in the occupations of people interviewed (e.g. middle management, workplace specialist), many were in a position to represent their company’s workforce, rather than to speak uniquely for their employers. The interviews, therefore, reflected a combination of the corporate and the employee experiences and opinions on flexibility in the workplace. In both cases, labour flexibility was presented and discussed in terms of the benefits that it represents for workers. In this sense, it definitely reflected the supply-driven side of flexibility. This section analyses trends in working arrangements that are flexible from the perspective of the life insurance workers. I argue that rather than being simply linked to changing economic circumstances, this form of labour flexibility is also driven by shifts in the broader social construction of work and gender.
Changing Perceptions of Women's Roles

Despite attempts to eliminate all types of discrimination, there is no doubt that society as a whole expects different social groups, divided along lines of gender, age, ethnicity and the like, to perform different roles and to behave differently in society. These expectations may be referred to as the social construction of roles. As Nelson and Robinson (1999: 39) explain, these roles “are comprised of duties and responsibilities as well as rights and privileges associated with the occupancy of a status.” Arguably, in no case has such construction been more clearly instituted than in the different work expectations that society has of males and females at home and in the workplace. In particular, the industrial revolution established a work model in which ‘productive’ and ‘reproductive’ activities would be separated by gender (Kahn, 1999). The spatial division of such activities has re-enforced this separation (Bowlby, 1990). Therefore, throughout most of the industrial period, women’s roles have been defined in relation to their expected position within the household while their participation in the paid workforce was largely limited to occupations that reflected these roles (e.g. teaching, nursing).

Employers, like other members of society, have increasingly tended to recognise this gender division of labour (McDowell, 1997). For instance, Hanson and Pratt (1995) have shown that employers associate specific skills with either groups of males or females, and therefore, with distinct gender-oriented abilities and “inherent aptitudes” to perform different jobs. Walsh (1990) has noted similar perceptions within the service sector in particular and Kahn (1999) has clearly demonstrated it the case of health care services. Moreover, employers are more sensitive to women’s family circumstances than to those of men. As a result, not only do the constructed abilities of males and females influence the creation of gender-specific occupations, but the perceived roles of the two
groups outside the workplace are determining factors in the construction of their skill levels, efficiency, and availability to perform work (see Horrell et al., 1990, Jenson, 1989b).

Brewer (2000) has pushed this analysis further in arguing that work practices are constructed according to gender in the same way that gendered occupational divisions are created. On one hand, employers expect different working patterns from men and women and are, therefore, more or less willing to offer specific types of working arrangements according to this social construction. On the other hand, employees as well construct their own position in the professional and domestic spheres and, as a result, will seek types of working arrangements that respond to this construction.

Such constructions regarding the place of male and female workers have impacted employee-employer relationships in the life insurance business. However, given that perceptions regarding gender roles have changed over time, so have the outcomes of these social constructions. Since the beginning of the Fordist era, I suggest that there have been three phases during which life insurers perceived the social roles of women differently and, as a result, responded with distinctive practices.

Until the 1960s, although employers recognised the role of women within specific occupations (mainly clerical), this professional role was clearly conceived as secondary to their domestic and family responsibilities. Thus, as a senior vice-president explains, the traditionally conservative industry of life insurance reflected this position in their labour practices:

[...] back in the middle of the 60s, which isn’t all that long ago, if a female became a married female on the job, that person had to leave the organisation.
Gradually, however, perceptions regarding the place of women in the labour markets were modified. Throughout the following two decades, the rights of married women and mothers to pursue professional careers became accepted despite the persistence of explicit segregation (and discrimination). In addition, market circumstances worked in the favour of the introduction and retention of women in the workforce. In the early 1970s, competition to attract and to retain workers was fierce. The ability to grant long-term job security, therefore, became crucial to attracting a competent workforce. Soon after legislation mandated that certain groups of workers (especially women) would not face discrimination. Nevertheless, social expectations regarding the roles of women at home were maintained with the consequence that female workers were mostly expected to perform two jobs, one at work and another at home. In general, this reality for working women was not taken into consideration by life insurers and, as a manager noted, women were expected to deal with this combination of responsibilities on their own:

Back in the 70s, even through the 80s, problems with children, day-care. The employee was expected to take a vacation day. There really wasn’t a whole lot of ability to be flexible.

In the 1990s, the construction of gender roles was once again altered and some of the rise in flexible employment can be understood in these terms. Life insurance companies are now more open to accommodating female employees in their dual responsibilities. More specifically, companies usually offer a series of alternative working arrangements, which include flextime, a reduced workweek, part-time work, and time-sharing. Similar to their competitors in the banking industry (Canadian Bankers Association, 1994), life insurance companies have usually introduced formal policies and procedures for the establishment of flexible work practices. In addition, when unexpected
events require workers to leave the workplace for a short period of time, organisations try to adjust to the situation by employing temporary workers. Similar to the previous period, the reasons for this change in practices are both found in the industry’s genuine desire to recognise the needs of its workers and to adapt to a tighter labour market. In particular, offering alternatives to the 40 hour, 9 to 5 work-week, has become an argument to retain female workers. One informant described the recent period as being one which, therefore, favours access to flexibility:

We noticed over the course of the last year, [...] that it’s more difficult for us to recruit because competition is stiffer, because of the high-tech requirement. So, we have had to change the manner in which we recruit and the processes that we have in place to accommodate people out in the market place. ‘Cause if we don’t respond to that, then they won’t come and work with us, nor would they stay with us.

This gradual transformation in the behaviour of life insurers regarding their female workforce surely reflects a better understanding on the part of employers of workers’ life circumstances, but in the meantime, it also mirrors the relative rigidity with which domestic gender roles are established. At all three stages of this transformation, it was implied that women were responsible for domestic and family related work and the types of working arrangements in each period simply recognised this situation (although in different ways). Moreover, the construction of men’s roles in society has remained the same. In practice, such flexibility has tended to be available only to the female workforce and, given the gendered division of labour in the industry, mostly to employees outside the executive, managerial and professional functions.
Chapter 6: Work Practices in Life Insurance

Flexibility as a Gain for Employees?

As described above, in the context of the financial services sector, several types of working arrangements may be categorised as flexible for the employee. Part-time work, flextime and other variations seem to be the most common forms. The interviews have suggested that these particular forms of work are often put in place to respond to the needs of the labour force (or at least in a combination with more demand-driven needs). Because of the nature of the life insurance business, in particular the necessity to service clients on an on-going irregular (but unpredictable) basis, such practices do not seem to correspond to labour input requirements of employers, at least, not in the way part-time work benefits employers in the restaurant industry for instance.

Many industries run on part-time people, like the fast-food industry. But we don’t! Because we need people here, every-day, and we need them to attend meetings, we need them to get on the mainframe system and we need them to answer the phone with customers.

When insurance companies allow their employees to work part-time, they lose out in the immediate organisation of their business. Therefore, the recorded increase in these specific working arrangements is not exclusively associated with the economic factors mentioned earlier. Contrary to what has been found or implied elsewhere (Kahn, 1999, Pinch and Storey, 1992, Sinden, 1996), labour cost reductions do not always seem to be a dominant factor in providing a type of flexibility for the workforce. If this was the case, the level of such flexible working arrangements should increase during recessionary periods. However, while the level of access to flexibility varies over time, in the life insurance business employers feel that they have to make greater use of alternative work arrangements in periods of economic growth when the labour market becomes stiffer.
In many ways, these findings contradict those of certain feminist researchers who have proposed that labour restructuring was achieved by *taking advantage of* women as a flexible workforce (Pinch and Storey, 1992, Walby, 1989, Walby and Bagguley, 1989). This is not to say that gender has not played an important role in the move from a Fordist to a post-Fordist society. In fact, at the aggregate level, women have probably been affected by restructuring, as well as within the financial sector, where some forms of flexibility (demand side) have led to their casualisation. However, I argue that such a conceptualisation of flexibility as a strictly negative feature is an inadequate and narrow representation of the post-Fordist reality. First, as McDowell (1991) has explained, traditional feminist literature has focused on women rather than gender, thus ignoring that some groups of male workers are also losing in the restructuring process. Second, as the above example tends to demonstrate, the post-Fordist age also coincides with a transformation of some gender values, which is allowing women to pursue more effectively their dual roles although still subject to constraints.

In particular, interpretations of the supply-driven type of flexibility described in this section have to originate from a gradual transformation of the attitude of employers regarding employee needs. While the changing competitive environment clearly influences the intensity of the trends, they have not been the sole driving force in increasing certain types of flexible work practices in certain industries. Perceptions and behaviours are certainly being restructured, and they themselves are becoming forces of economic restructuring.

Still, the life insurance industry is not yet at a stage where it feels the need to provide more complete flexibility for its employees. The use of some new forms of arrangements, such as job sharing and telecommuting, remains marginal despite the
important media attention they have received. Human resources managers and other
decision makers are open to these new ideas, but remain fairly cautious regarding the
scale at which such practices should be implemented. At this point in time, employers fail
to see short-term benefits in the utilisation of these types of working arrangements. For
instance, in the case of telecommuting, even if many of the job descriptions in this
business appear to fit the prerequisite for a successful experience, workers and employers
are hesitant to try out this form of arrangement (see Bryant, 2000 for discussion of
telecommuting and gender). One informant explained the factors that are restricting the
financial services sectors' ability or willingness to expand such practices:

From the employer's perspective, there aren't many people who have the
discipline of being able to work at home and being focused and staying on track, [...] there's also the problem of sharing information: you need files, you need to talk about the departments, you need to go to meetings [...] that's very hard to do from a remote location

Therefore, the tensions within organisations to provide attractive working
conditions, while managing labour more efficiently, are very much present. In both cases,
these contradictory forces may produce certain types of labour flexibility.

6.5 Challenges for the Future of Flexible Labour Markets

The analysis presented in this chapter has offered important insights into the
transformation of work practices in a given industry. However, one needs to be careful
not to extend the interpretations and conclusions presented here beyond the limits of this
single case study. This chapter needs to be viewed as another step in the analysis of a
complex labour market structure in which industry-specific and place-specific labour
markets operate in distinctive fashions. Nevertheless, we should not lose sight of the fact
that these distinct outcomes are part of a more general process of post-Fordist
restructuring. To paraphrase Peck (1996: 14-15), generalised processes (e.g. economic restructuring) tend to yield different concrete effects (e.g. use of sub-contractors) in different industries (e.g. life insurance) and places (e.g. Toronto), but generalised processes they remain. The results emanating from this case study raise questions regarding the place of the life insurance industry and its practices within a wider scale of analysis. As a conclusion to the chapter, I raise issues regarding the possible consequences that the shifts in labour practices highlighted above might have for the Canadian economy and, more particularly, for the structure of its labour market.

*The Economy in General*

Since the traditional sub-sectors of the financial services industry are converging in terms of corporate practices, it is likely that the recent experience of the life insurance industry is a good reflection of trends in working arrangements throughout the whole financial sector. In fact, a senior vice-president had definite opinions regarding this issue:

In the financial sector [..], generally speaking, we’re all responding in the same way. [...] It’s pretty much understood that once someone responds in a creative way, very quickly the others pick up on it.

Similar to manufacturing and the public sector, the financial services industry has been a strong provider of typical forms of employment (full-time/permanent jobs). Given the increasing importance of this sector on the national scale, a significant transformation of labour practices could have important implications for the structure of the national labour market. In particular, the trends towards labour flexibility may contribute to further income polarisation in Canadian society. Current discussions in the public sphere regarding the future of financial services should therefore assess the possible impacts of
labour restructuring as presented in this chapter and advocate strategies that would serve the needs of both the industry and its workers.

The Gender Division of Labour

The two types of flexibility that were highlighted in this chapter certainly have had, and will continue to have, an impact on the structure of labour markets. For instance, it is likely that increases in supply-driven flexibility could lead to a more balanced distribution of male and female workers across occupations in financial services. The argument here is that as women gain access to flexible working arrangements, it will be easier for them to cope with their professional careers and they will potentially be better able to enter higher-end occupations. In addition, as it becomes more socially acceptable for men to engage in flexible work arrangements, a more equal sharing of domestic and family responsibilities may occur. Some evidence of those trends was recently documented by Preston et al. (2000) in a study of the Canadian paper mill industry.

At the other end of the spectrum, however, there might be concerns that demand side flexibility will lead to a deepening of gender differences within the industry. Financial services represent a significant pool of well-paid full-time employment for women. If, as in the case of the British retail banking (Sinden, 1996), labour restructuring leads to fewer of these types of jobs (through jobs cuts or flexibilisation), it may, as a result, translate into employment casualisation for a group of women that has avoided such problems in the past. A failure to implement flexibilisation strategies corresponding to employee needs across all occupations could reinforce the production of gender divisions in which a female-dominated clerical workforce becomes flexibilised,
casualised and marginalised, while a male-dominated managerial workforce continues to benefit from such restructuring.

Perhaps the solution needs to come from a synchronisation of the two types of flexibilisation processes. In other words, as life insurers move away from what they consider a very rigid system of labour management to one that provides workers with some level of flexibility, they have an opportunity to achieve some of the savings that they seek in order to become more competitive.

The Geography of Financial Services

Spatially, the Canadian financial services sector is strongly concentrated in the Toronto area. While this structure is certainly beneficial both for the industry and the region that houses the services, the impacts of a major transformation of the sector will also be proportionally more important to Toronto than elsewhere in Canada. The gradual continentalisation of financial services could either lead to Toronto strengthening its position as a North American financial pole or conversely to a decline in its relative share of employment in the face of growing competition.

With 165,000 jobs, the GTA is currently, after New York and San Francisco, North America’s third largest employment centre in financial services. But employment in this industry is highly volatile (Canada, House of Common, 1998). Based on a functional classification of financial services jobs, The Boston Consulting Group argues that 55% of those jobs (traded) could be located elsewhere in the short term (Figure 6.6). Jobs such as bank headquarters and corporate banking functions are considered relatively well anchored, assuming that Canadian control is maintained in this area. However, the
less specialised back office and life and health insurance functions are considered more mobile and could be established in any office complex in North America.

**Figure 6.6: Potential for Job Mobility in the Toronto Financial Industry**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial services jobs</th>
<th>Traded (55%)</th>
<th>Non-traded (45%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Well anchored (67%)</td>
<td>Mobile (33%)</td>
<td>Well anchored (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Potentially mobile (40%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In addition, another 40% of the ‘non-traded’ jobs are judged ‘potentially mobile’. These include Internet and telephone retail sales and processing centres that would also be likely to migrate given technological innovations that allow certain job functions to be undertaken at a distance from the headquarters of financial institutions. In total, nearly three quarters of all of the jobs in the financial services business in Toronto are considered potentially mobile.

For the authors of the report, only improvements to the competitive conditions of the Canadian financial sector are likely to secure these jobs:

These jobs will stay in Canada if the financial sector is sufficiently competitive so that it would be efficient to locate those jobs here. [...] To attract and keep them requires a framework that allows financial institutions to be competitive. (Canada, House of Commons, 1998: 5)

As this case study has demonstrated, the use of flexibility may well be a route to becoming more competitive. However, labour strategies that would emphasise labour
flexibility beyond the requirements of the labour force could also have unwanted consequences. First, levels of productivity could decline if pressures on the workforce keep increasing. Also, in local economies, increasing levels of flexible employment could affect the structure of income distributions. Chances are that international cities, such as Toronto, have more to lose from flexibilisation than smaller places, because of the expectation that they would be able to compete at a larger spatial scale (Andrew et al., 1999). However, more research is needed to understand the possible impacts of such restructuring, including research on the spatial redistribution of employment in the globalising financial services industry.
CHAPTER SEVEN

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

7.0 Introduction

This study has examined factors related to the recent growth of labour flexibility in Canada. In analysing the on-going transformation of large urban labour markets, the chief goal has been to document the combined influence of factors that modify employers’ labour practices (demand side) and those that may alter employees’ attitudes and inclination towards work (supply side). It has been argued, by doing so, that differences among local labour markets’ experiences with flexibilisation will be better understood. Although the issue of labour flexibilisation has been studied quite intensively in recent years, researchers have generally failed to use such an integrated approach. Furthermore, attempts to conceptualise spatial differences below the national scale, especially at the scale of local markets, have been notably scarce.

This absence of a geographical perspective is not surprising given the prevalence of economic and sociologically-based theory and research pertaining to issues of restructuring. However, the work of geographers has demonstrated that ‘places matter’ and that locality-specific factors contribute to the particular forms of socio-economic development. Although most of the existing scholarship has relied upon international
comparisons and isolated case studies, it has provided a framework for investigating differences at finer scales. Thus, this thesis is an extension of the work of geographers who have sought to conceptualise how the effects of restructuring are felt differently from place to place and how the particularities of these places themselves play a role in creating distinctiveness.

This has been done through an examination of the labour flexibilisation process in three different ways. In Chapter Four, the first part of the analysis has sought to highlight differences in levels and trends of labour flexibility in Canada's major urban labour markets. Secondly, the study of changes in the part-time labour market of Montréal, in Chapter Five, facilitated the examination of links between flexibility and the local characteristics of this labour market. Finally, Chapter Six has discussed how, in a given industry and place, factors relating to the new economic environment and workers' changing needs interacted to produce an increase in flexible employment.

In addition to presenting the main research findings derived from these three investigations, this chapter contextualises the relevance of the principal observations based on the theoretical framework used for the study. With an emphasis on gender relations, the second section provides a broader perspective for understanding the process of restructuring as it proposes a particular conception pertaining to the social context of post-Fordism. To conclude, I address some of the implications of the rise of flexible forms of work in Canada.
7.1 Summary of Research Findings

7.1.1 Approaching Local Labour Market Change

To begin with, I have argued that the theoretical perspective based on the concept of post-Fordism allows scholars to understand an essential part of the dynamic nature of labour restructuring as it describes the political economic circumstances which have stimulated the search for flexibility among firms. In addition, a focus on regulation theory enables one to analyse social changes which have occurred in parallel with this economic transformation. But despite the utility of the concepts of post-Fordism, I have recognised that the close relationship between flexibility and restructuring is often an inadequate construction of reality in as much as the active role of workers is usually ignored. Moreover, because of its focus on globally changing economic conditions, the post-Fordist debate pays little attention to the local configuration of labour markets and, therefore, to differences in their pre-defined potential to become more (or less) flexible. These weaknesses were outlined in the second chapter with relation to scholarly discussions about part-time work and self-employment whose analyses of flexible employment have given greater consideration to the supply conditions of labour markets.

To overcome these problems, I have suggested the need to combine elements of the two approaches within a framework that resembles Jamie Peck’s construction of local labour markets (Peck, 1996). The main contribution of Peck’s work comes from his emphasis on the role that local workforces and other local agents play in forging more pervasive processes of labour restructuring. Although the approach used in the current study is different from a methodological point of view, Peck’s social regulation approach has provided a framework in which differences between local labour market
flexibility could be investigated and discussed by considering the combined effects of the conditions of labour demand and supply.

Building on such a conceptual approach to labour markets, I documented the combination of socio-demographic circumstances and political economic restructuring that has brought substantial structural effects to the Canadian labour market. The role of changing demographics, including the age structure, patterns of immigration and family structure were acknowledged in order to provide examples of the links between supply side factors and working arrangements. On the side of demand factors, it was shown that a transition in Canada’s political economic system has given rise to economic circumstances and policies that affect labour practices. In particular, it was demonstrated that the Canadian experience of after-Fordism has been characterised by a larger degree of economic openness and by political discourse and actions that promote concepts of efficiency and competitiveness. These objectives have often been achieved to the detriment of workers, notably through efforts leading to the intensification of flexible labour practices, although other means have also been employed.

The challenge has not only been to understand how these shifts have induced a transformation of work practices, but also to conceptualise the relationships that exist between what workers want and what employers are trying to accomplish. A review of research related to labour flexibility has revealed the inability of most scholars to simultaneously account for these two sets of factors. As a result, such analyses appear unable to fully explain this structural change in modern economies, or to account for particular regional variations.
7.1.2 Identifying Factors Responsible For the Flexibilisation of Urban Labour Markets.

This thesis has explored the changing characteristics of local labour markets in accordance with the framework described above. It has also addressed an empirical shortfall of Peck’s approach by providing concrete examples of the roles of supply and demand factors in the specific evolution of work practices at the local level. However, this thesis does not pretend to have covered all of the relevant factors that play a role in the evolution of labour flexibility. Notably, the role of the wider institutional framework (including consideration to family, economic, labour and tax policies) was largely ignored, illustrating the difficulty of accounting for such qualitative factors. As a result of this methodological gap, the current dissertation is limited in its comparative analysis because it could not document the impact of potentially different local and regional policy approaches on the development of labour flexibility. Instead, the analytical chapters must be seen as essays supporting the usefulness of the proposed framework for further investigations of labour market changes.

Apart from demonstrating the diversity of labour flexibility and its significance, the description of the main trends of labour flexibilisation in Canada demonstrated the adequacy of the theoretical framework proposed in this study. In particular, the analysis led me to argue that the most compelling interpretation of the growth of flexible work is most likely to be a balance of the job preferences of workers, the economic requirements of firms, and industrial and occupational shifts. For instance, the empirical evidence showing an increase in the polarisation of hours worked can be interpreted in light of

44 Including the difficulties of comparing institutional factors between urban labour markets, as well as problems relating to the time it would require to investigate the perceptions and actions of institutions at the local level regarding issues of flexibility.
employers' flexibility strategies, but obviously, the extent to which these strategies may be implemented is limited by the characteristics of the labour supply, including elements of the external labour market and of the internal labour market. Similarly, analyses of flextime would lead one to believe that while flextime offers an opportunity to combine paid employment and domestic work more flexibly, not all groups of workers are given access to this form of work arrangement. It is true that workers with heavier domestic responsibilities tend on average to have a higher proportion of flextime schedules, but in most cases these would be 'core' workers. Therefore, rather than being solely driven by changes in industrial strategies and in the industrial structure, flextime is primarily a response to individual demands for flexibility while being largely limited to specific groups of workers.

Additional evidence of the usefulness of the approach was provided at the level of metropolitan areas. The study of the evolution of self-employment and of part-time work among the ten largest CMAs in Canada has shown that labour market flexibilisation had not been experienced evenly across space and time. Explanations for this spatial unevenness was partly found in the characteristics of local labour markets.

In the case of self-employment, reference was essentially made to the role of distinctive industrial structures in the formation of flexible labour markets. Just as Peck has theorised, the “pre-existing concrete structures” of places influence the quantitative and qualitative extent of labour flexibilisation. Both the vitality of the local economy as well as tendencies to increase shares of high-order service activities tend to be related to the expansion of self-employment. However, differences in the timing and in the quality of self-employment (incorporated / unincorporated) have also been observed. The gradual shift in the structure of employment from an employee-based relationship, to
incorporated self-employment (generally with employees), and to unincorporated self-employment (generally without paid help), is a particularly good illustration of the casualisation of labour markets. Interestingly, the trends show that those labour markets posting the largest growth in numbers of employees have also recorded the largest increases in unincorporated self-employed workers. The flexibilisation of these urban labour markets, therefore, seems to be marked by a certain polarisation in working arrangements.

Nonetheless, the analyses of trends in self-employment remain incomplete, and this, in turn, raises an important issue regarding the methodological limitations of the approach chosen in the present study. Seldom does data, at least data which is publicly available at the level of metropolitan areas, provide detailed information about the composition of sub-groups of workers. In this regard, questions pertaining to gender, age, and equally importantly, race and ethnicity, are difficult to assess. Thus, based on special tabulations and/or qualitative methods, further research should investigate the relationship between self-employment, labour market development and socio-demographic and ethnic characteristics. The recent work of Hiebert (1999) is a refreshing step in that direction.

Similar trends were highlighted through the description of the development of part-time employment. Notably, the role of industrial structure was found to affect the growth of part-time jobs, as rapidly 'tertiarising' centres had higher growth rates than

---

45 PUMF files do provide such information, but the limited number of cases restricts the analytical possibilities.
other CMAs. Acceleration of the trend towards part-time employment also supports the assertion that Canada entered a new employment era in the 1990s.

The introduction of gender as an influencing factor brings an additional dimension to analyses of employment trends. The intersection of gender and industries helps to conceptualise how the changing structure of labour markets has had different consequences for the working lives of males and females in various locations. In the earliest phase of restructuring, the rising participation rates of women resulted in faster growth compared to men in part-time work. However, as manufacturing activities have given way to services, increases in male as opposed to female part-time employment have become more evident.

These differences between places and groups of workers, I argue, are reflective of the polarised ‘nature’ of the new economy. Supported by political and social regulations, the Canadian labour market appears to have become increasingly split into ‘bad service jobs’ and ‘good service jobs.’ This has also had polarising effects within the urban system given the industrial structures of different CMAs.

7.1.3 The Role of Pre-Existing Concrete Structures

Through an analysis of the changing composition of part-time workers in Montréal, empirical support was provided for the growing importance of a number of factors that are influencing the general propensity to work part-time. Generally speaking, variables traditionally related to women’s high participation rate in part-time employment, such as age and presence of children, have become less important over time. By contrast, the age of workers, their occupation and the industry they are employed in have become more closely associated with one’s involvement in part-time
work. Women enduring high rates of involvement in part-time work is, therefore, not simply a result of their gender status, but increasingly associated with other factors. Regardless of gender, a young worker employed in a clerical, sales, or service occupation is increasingly likely to be employed part-time. In a similar respect, being a male worker in the manufacturing industry does not provide the same degree of isolation from part-time employment as it did in 1970.

The analyses in Chapter Five were also particularly useful for illustrating how differences in labour flexibility may be produced, and reproduced, locally. First, it was argued that Montréal’s much lower than average proportion of part-time employment is in part due to its industrial structure and to its dominant socio-cultural value system of inherited gender divisions of labour. I claimed that in comparison to other large Canadian CMAs, Montréal has maintained an industrial and occupational structure that partly favours full-time employment. In the meantime, the slower erosion of the Fordist model of the division of labour in the province of Québec has limited, and indeed impeded, the entry of women in the workforce, while reducing their numbers in part-time employment.

Second, I have proposed that the faster growth rates of female part-time employment in Montréal should be linked to the industrial transformation of this metropolitan area’s economy and its generally weaker economic performance measured against other comparable North American economies. Montréal’s process of de-industrialisation has been characterised by extensive losses of full-time manufacturing employment, which have been replaced by low-end part-time service jobs. The retreat of the garment industry, for instance, has affected women in Montréal more than elsewhere in Canada. This difference from other CMAs is also explained by Montréal’s difficulty in creating higher-end service employment and the recent decline of employment in
government services. Above all, Montréal's much lower than average employment growth in almost all industrial sectors seems to have affected its ability to create full-time jobs.

7.1.4 Between the Competitive Environment and the Needs of Workers

The empirical portion of this thesis was completed with the study of labour flexibility in the life insurance industry of Toronto. The case study was helpful for demonstrating that increases in labour flexibility stem both from employers' and employees' changing circumstances, and that the demand for and supply of flexible labour it produces do not necessarily complement each other.

First, the impact of competition on changing labour practices has been clearly established. From the employers' viewpoint, practices such as sub-contracting and temporary employment offer direct financial incentives that increase the cost efficiency of life insurers. Other work arrangements, such as part-time and overtime work, are also sought mainly for their numerical flexibility. In this way, life insurers are provided with some of the savings that make them more profitable and competitive. It has also been argued that this transformation of work practices has to be placed within the context of intense corporate restructuring in the North American financial industry. Therefore, the acceleration of trends in the 1990s towards an increase in flexible work has been directly associated with the common corporate strategies that invoke mergers and acquisitions and the demutualisation of life insurance companies.

As the selected case studies demonstrate, workers have contributed to changing the employee-employer relationship as well. Life insurance companies might have been more inclined than other industries to respond to their (female) employees' need for
flexibility given the sexual division of labour that exists within this industry. Socially, employers, as well as the rest of the population, have accepted and understood that women are an integral part of the labour market. The need for flexibility that working women often possess are better accommodated in today's working environment, at least in this industry. As a consequence, the range of working arrangements accessible to life insurance workers is now much more diverse and flexible compared to what it was two decades ago. This is not to say that employers neglect the potential financial benefit of employee-driven flexibility. But, as the reluctance vis-à-vis the implementation of telecommuting shows, progressive forms of flexibility are not provided to employees if the costs are deemed to high for employers.

This case study provides a good example of how labour markets are socially regulated. The change in the perceptions of the place of women in the labour market came about both as an outcome of the pressures to adapt to their dual roles and from the expectation (in our society) that women also have domestic and family responsibilities. Despite the absence of explicit economic benefits for firms, these social pressures have forced them to provide a type of labour flexibility which, at least in the short run, is essentially to the benefit of their employees.

7.2 The New Social Order of After-Fordism in Canada

The increased flexibilisation apparent within local labour markets in Canada has emerged through a series of processes operating at various geographical scales. Some of these processes have been explicitly addressed in this study, while others have not been examined in detail due to methodological considerations and resource constraints. The argument pertaining to the role of local characteristics in accounting for differences in
levels and trends in flexible employment was not presented as being in opposition to the role of more generalised processes. Thus, for instance, it was argued that the increasing emergence of part-time positions, as well as the changing composition of part-time workers in Montréal, are being produced and reproduced by a combination of socio-demographic and economic transformations that are inherent in the nature of post-Fordism in Canada (i.e. the Canadian after-Fordism). At the same time, these same trends are also being influenced by the local characteristics of Montréal’s labour market.

Among these processes, gender relations and changes in gender relations are one of the factors that has been most often cited as influencing the recent development of labour markets. To this point, the study has not attempted to introduce a detailed explanation of how gender variables might intervene to produce an increase in labour flexibility. To fill this gap and to provide a sense of how social regulation has a generalised impact on labour markets, this section will attempt to conceptualise how after-Fordist gender relations are linked to the emergence of new forms of work.

Two general processes are principally at work here. First, there has been a gradual transformation of the structure of the Canadian labour market through a sectoral shift and a redefinition of gender positions within the productive sphere. Second, the labour market has also been marked by a transition in the attitudes of gender groups regarding domestic and family responsibilities. I claim that while such a transition could have led to a more equitable distribution of wealth in society, instead, the prerequisites of the hegemonic post-Fordist economy are leading to the casualisation of a larger proportion of workers, notably through the increase of flexible employment. Compared to the Fordist period, the divisions between groups of workers observed today are not strictly observable between dominant social divisions such as gender, but are also increasingly found along other
segments of the labour force. The end result for the structure of labour markets is that differences are also deepening among groups of women and men.

7.2.1 Women and Men's Changing Work Environments

Although post-Fordist research often does not discuss gender divisions explicitly, it often implies that the 'core' workforce is still essentially made up of skilled men, while the 'periphery' is composed of less skilled women (Christopherson, 1989, McDowell and Court, 1994, Walby, 1989). In particular, regulationists conceptualise post-Fordism as a time period that has involved a combination of technologically-based employment requiring highly skilled (male) workers and lower grade (female-dominated) service workers (Aglietta, 1976/1997). Because of the differential nature of work in the core and in the periphery and because of the gender construction of skills (Jenson, 1989b), many interpretations have linked the rise of new forms of employment to the massive introduction of women into the labour market. Not only do those explanations implying that women constitute a 'secondary' or 'Peripheral' labour market appear simplistic in light of the emerging divisions among women, they also ignore the evolving gender relations which affect both men and women's employment.

First, in the workplace, women seem to have become more polarised in terms of income and labour market conditions (Kuhn, 1995), while men appear to be losing through the restructuring of the economy and in particular have felt severe repercussions from the loss of manufacturing employment. As Linda McDowell (1991: 411) mentions:

[แร]ther than men benefiting from the gender segregation of the labour market, they are losing from restructuring strategies that are defining increasing numbers of new jobs as jobs for 'women'.
As manufacturing jobs have declined or became more flexible, the position of many Canadian men in the labour market has become increasingly precarious. As pointed out earlier, males' participation rates have declined, while those of women have increased. Levels of unemployment are also typically higher among men than women. In addition, male workers are increasingly likely to work part-time, and often involuntarily (Noreau, 2000). This is not surprising because, given the construction of professional and domestic gender roles, it is still very unlikely that men would voluntarily opt for part-time employment. As Hakim (1996: 204) argues, contrary to what is generally implied in feminist research, this reflects the fact that men have (more) limited choices in their lives (than women):

Women [...] are forced into low-paid part-time jobs or forced into marriage instead of financial independence. [...] the implication is that men have real choices and more choices to make. This is the lie. Most men have little choice in how to spend their lives, being forced into the full-time continuous life-long employment career whether they like it or not.

The wage gap between genders is also decreasing because as women enter high rank occupations in greater numbers, men are increasingly confronted with low-paid employment. In addition, since women are mostly maintaining their position in female-dominated occupations and acquiring educational and professional qualifications at a larger proportion than men, it is very unlikely that these trends will reverse soon. These tendencies of the Canadian labour market roughly correspond to findings in other OECD countries (see The Economist, September 28th 1996).

47 Women increased or maintained their share of employment in most female-dominated occupations (social sciences/religion, teaching, nursing sales and service) except in clerical occupations (Statistics Canada, 1995).
Chapter 7: Summary and Conclusions

It would also be misleading, however, to contend that men are the only losers as the employment base of the economy shifts to services. Particularly, this trend can be understood through theories of flexibility that argue that labour flexibility takes various forms at different levels within firms. On one hand, firms rely on a decreasing share of 'core' workers in upper-level occupations. The functional flexibility of these highly qualified and skilled workers is exploited in order to reduce employment costs at this level and increase productivity. As discussed in the case of life insurance companies, this need for functional flexibility often translates into numerical flexibility as highly ranked employees are expected to perform overtime work. On the other hand, numerical flexibility (including part-time work) is clearly more prominent at lower occupational levels where services are widespread. Since service occupations constitute most of the new jobs, it can be deduced that this trend also serves to create an increase in numerically flexible jobs. In short, while flexibilisation tends to reduce the share of workers in upper occupational levels, employment in general and flexible employment in particular are on the increase among lower-end service occupations.

Given the existing gender division of labour, the impacts of flexibilisation upon groups of men and women are somewhat different. Partly because of the need to re-equilibrate gender inequities, women are rapidly increasing their presence at higher ends of the occupational hierarchy. Among lower-level groups of occupations, women gain access more easily to flexible and non-flexible jobs that are generally in sectors where they have dominated for a long time. In contrast, men have more difficulty in accessing the traditionally male dominated professional and managerial positions. For instance, in 1982, men held 70.7% of managerial and administrative jobs compared with 56.9%

48 Women's share of managerial and professional occupations has increased considerably over the past two decades (Statistics Canada, 1995, 1999b).
1994 (Statistics Canada, 1995). In addition, the decline of manufacturing industries is not providing them with much needed new opportunities. When those opportunities are present they are increasingly of the flexible type.

Therefore, and despite the fact that female full-time employment has grown much faster than men’s (refer to Table 5.2, p. 152), the parallel growth of service activities has provided an expanding source of flexible jobs. In part-time employment, a majority of these jobs are still held by women, but this share is gradually decreasing. As schematised in Figure 7.1, for both men and women, this has lead to a heterogeneity of work experience within their gender group. This is not to say that the structure of the labour market is becoming more equitable. In fact, given the precarious nature of many of the flexible jobs described in this thesis, it would seem that today’s labour market is more fragmented (if not polarised) than before. Therefore, apart from workplace separation between genders, it looks as though other factors are contributing to a greater fragmentation of the workplace among gender groups.

**Figure 7.1: The Changing Gender Structure of Employment**
Such trends toward an 'heterogeneisation' of society are also perceptible at the level of households as Rose and Villeneuve have suggested (Villeneuve and Rose, 1995, Rose and Villeneuve, 1998). In particular, while the preponderance of two-earner couples in the Canadian society has helped to reduce aspects of the gender gap, it has, in the meantime, created higher income disparities between higher-end professional households and other types of households.

Among those labour divisions that have become more significant in Canada’s after-Fordism, that based on age is of particular importance here. As shown, in the log-linear model of age and part-time employment, younger age groups are more likely to work part-time, while the 25 to 44 age groups are increasingly likely to work full-time. However, because of the relatively large size of this latter cohort, their labour practices have a disproportionate impact upon the overall structure of the labour market. The consequences are that the number of flexible workers remains high while differences between male and female workers are still perceptible at the national aggregate level.

For their part, younger cohorts of workers do not mirror the typical working conditions within the labour market, but they seem to provide a leading influence in the direction that the market has taken. In other words, the very large share of young workers engaged in flexible employment is surely associated with the rapid increase of this form of work. In the meantime, the fact that this generation is much less marked by gender differences in working experience has had an influence on the factors related to part-time employment. As the data on school attendance illustrates, these trends may reflect the tendency of people to stay in school for a longer period of time. In fact, according to a recent survey among young workers, school attendance is now the most common reason for not wanting to take a full-time job (Logan, 1994).
Therefore, not only has the after-Fordist transformation of the Canadian economy had negative impacts on women but also on a large number of men. In this context of increasingly precarious of employment both for groups of men and women, theoretical constructs which divide the labour market strictly along the lines of gender seem inappropriate (Reher, 1994). Instead of a division of labour characterised by a flexible and unskilled (or desklilled) female labour force and a core male labour force, the after-Fordist labour market appears to be marked by an increasing heterogeneity of employment among both female and male workers. In particular, the situation of many men is becoming similar to that of the ‘traditional’ working woman, while in contrast, a growing number of women have working experiences that are more typically those associated with male workers. These trends seem to have been fostered at the same time by a transformation of the economic structure and sustained through the growing casualisation of younger groups of workers.

7.2.2 The Changing Place of Women at Home

In addition to significant changes in gender relations in the workplace, the after-Fordist years have also witnessed a series of social transformations at home. These changes are interconnected with the evolving experiences of groups of men and women in the labour market. As women have gradually taken up paid employment, a convergence of situations is occurring in the workplace. Yet because their role as family caretakers remains important, gender inequity paradoxically seems to be persistent. It has been argued that the combination of domestic and full-time professional employment, represents an enormous task for married women, especially those with children. As a result, one of the most common interpretations of women choosing to work part-time is that these individuals constitute a distinct segment of the labour force due to their
reproductive role (see for example Pinch and Storey, 1992, Silver and Goldsheider, 1994). To support the argument that women take up part-time jobs to reduce their overall workload, authors generally highlight the uneven division of family and domestic responsibilities (Hanson and Pratt, 1995, Rose, 1999). A survey from Statistics Canada (1994: 48), provides evidence for such an assertion:

Domestic work activities such as cooking, cleaning and laundry make up the largest component of the total unpaid work time of women employed outside the home. In 1992, employed women with spouse and children spent around 2.5 hours per day on these activities. This was about an hour more per day than men with spouses devoted to these tasks. [... In addition,] employed women with spouse and at least one child less than age 5 spent 2.2 hours per day on primary child care activities, while mothers with older children spent only 0.7 hours per day on primary child care. For both groups, however, the amount of time women devoted to child care was roughly double the total for men with spouses and children.

I argue that while this explanation surely reflects the difficulty that working women face in coping with this socially-imposed dual role, it tends to ignore other aspects of the changing society and economy.

First, as discussed in Chapter Three, changes in the structure and composition of families and households have redefined the relations between gender, domestic work, and paid work. Namely, the rapid decline of fertility rates in Canada has reduced the burden felt by families in general and among mothers in particular. In addition, the increasing percentage of women who are single, separated or divorced (Statistics Canada, 1995), is substantially changing the context of domestic responsibilities. More specifically, since the size of families is considerably lower than before and since women are less likely to be financially supported by a spouse, their professional and domestic 'obligations' have become different than those of the majority of women in the previous generation. Second, the changes noted before in the gender structure of the labour market go hand in hand
with employers’ perceptions of the female labour force. Employers’ perceptions that female workers are “less readily available, less motivated and less productive” than men seem to be eroding (Coré, 1994). Third, as Hakim (1996: 51) highlights, trends in domestic work have shown that the male portion has been increasing while the share performed by women has gradually declined (for Canada, see Le Bourdais and Sauriol, 1998):

From the 1970s onwards, [...] data for a dozen of industrial societies [...] produces contrasting trends among men and women: total hours of employment decline among men and rise among women while total hours of domestic work (broadly defined) rise for men and decline for women.

Since the gender division of domestic work was found to be related to the female spouse’s income (Bernier et al., 1996, Marshall, 1993), it can be argued that the gradual shrinking of income disparities between genders is also leading to more equitable gender relations at home.

And fourth, although women still constitute a very large majority of part-time workers, a growing number of them do so because they are unable to find full-time employment (Hatt, 1997, Noreau, 2000, Tam, 1997, Warmer et al., 1992). More specifically, in 1993, at the height of the ‘job’ recession, more than 510,000 women took part-time jobs due to their inability to obtain full-time work (Statistics Canada, 1995). More importantly perhaps, and illustrating a rapid change in the labour market and in women’s aspirations, this number represented 34% of all female part-time workers, up from 11% in 1975 and from 20% in 1989 (Statistics Canada, 1994). Therefore, one in every three female part-timers would opt for full-time employment if she could obtain such a work opportunity. While this might be a reflection of after-Fordist economic necessity and the recession of the early 1990s, the development of new gender relations
in the home and changing expectations about gender roles surely also account for the growing desire of women to enter the labour market on a full-time basis. To describe this particular phenomenon, Walby (1989) has referred to new forms of patriarchal practices in the home and in the workplace, while the concept of “modern division of labour” has been used by Hakim (1996) to conceptualise the emergence of a new gender contract.

It appears that Canadian after-Fordism has been marked by significant social and economic changes which are affecting, while also being affected by, gender relations. This context of change has important implications for interpreting the expansion of new forms of employment. It means, for example, that whether one is investigating the rise of part-time employment or other non-typical forms of employment, the diversity of experience and motivations must be explored within gender groups. It also suggests that after-Fordist labour restructuring must be viewed not only as a result of economic determinants, but in terms of the ways in which groups of men and women construct their positions at work and at home, and the actions which correspond to this social construction, are also shaping the restructuring of society.

The combined analysis of socio-cultural (evolving gender roles, age-based segmentation) and economic transformations (tertiarisation, a new competitive environment) shows that the rise of new forms of employment is a multi-causal process in which factors interact one with another. These processes find their origins not only in factors that relate to new conditions in the demand of workers, but, reflecting the social nature of labour markets, they are also stimulated by supply conditions.

This thesis has also suggested that those factors that are reshaping the labour market of most industrial societies do not take effect and interact in the same ways from
place to place. Instead, differences in the evolution, extent and forms of flexible employment are observable from one urban labour market to another. Therefore, labour markets should be conceived of as sets of components of places (with a particular set of people, policies and economic structure) which influence the form and development of 'local labour markets'.

7.3 Conclusion: Some Implications of Canada’s ‘Defensive’ Flexibility

Finally, notwithstanding the dynamic that produces labour flexibility, it is important not to lose sight of the implications of the labour trends described in this dissertation as these highlight the importance of investigating issues of economic restructuring. In particular the type of “defensive flexibility” largely advocated in Canada, and found in the case study of the life insurance industry, is likely to generate some unintended and unwanted effects in the economy and society.

As the case of the life insurance industry demonstrated, despite the gains in flexibility experienced by employees, Canadian firms that have turned to labour flexibility strategies have done so in order to adapt to the constraints of competition (Statistics Canada, 1998c). For the most part, practices such as temporary employment, part-time work and outsourcing have been employed with a relatively short-term view of the benefits that are assessed in financial terms. According to Leborgne and Lipietz (1991), these strategies can be qualified as ‘defensive’ in contrast with more ‘progressive’ flexibility practices based on the collective and sustainable development of a community.

The consequences of such a model of flexibilisation are numerous. Firstly, for labour, flexibility is often accompanied by a de-structuring of labour contracts and,
particularly of employment (and income) security. Overall, the responses of the Canadian labour movement (Swartz, 1993, Holmes and Kumar, 1993) and governments (Jenson and Mahon, 1993b) have been timid, as they have mostly complied with the corporate discourse of competitiveness and efficiency. The problem, as Myles explains (1991: 359), is that the job insecurity that arises from the type of flexibility sought by employers is likely to act as a brake to economic development in the long run:

Insecure workers threatened by job loss or a shift from high- to low-paid work will naturally (and correctly) resist innovation and further development of the productive forces. In contrast, workers confronted with an egalitarian wage distribution, active labour market policies, and security of employment will welcome and promote structural change.

This contention is supported by a comparative study of labour relations in the steel and paper industries of Canada and Sweden (Smith et al., 1997). In Canada, workers were found to be more reluctant to change, and to accept geographic mobility, as a result of the lack of employment and income security.

Secondly, one of the most crucial problems related to the growth of new forms of employment is that a growing share of the workforce does not fit into the system of social assistance. National and provincial social security systems are based on the dominant pattern of full-time permanent employment (Bieback, 1993). This is the case with Canadian unemployment coverage. The government's system of coverage increasingly leaves out atypical workers based on its criteria for duration of work, as was demonstrated in Chapter Three. In Canada, policymakers have been slow to react to the new reality of labour markets, although some measures are gradually being introduced to cover some groups of non-standard workers. For female and younger workers, the relative absence of adequate policy alternatives has greater implications given the higher
participation of these cohorts in flexible work arrangements. Therefore, failure to include flexible workers in the social protection system leads to the establishment of a dual standard of equity based upon social segmentation.

Thirdly, not only are unemployment programs not designed to support this non-traditional workforce, but workers are not contributing sufficiently to funding the social system because of their working arrangements. Hakim (1989) demonstrated the perverse effects of such a selective structure in the U.K., as she found that the combined impact of flexible labour practices and restrictive national insurance provoked an increase in the black market. In the long run, this situation hinders the ability of governments to finance their social programs and may lead to cost-cutting measures. For government policymakers, the question of regulating flexible employment is a complex issue that must be addressed in conjunction with the simultaneous goals of accounting for the productivity of labour markets (Hogan and Ragan, 1995) as well as the social protection of all workers.

Fourthly, the rise of flexibility also raises a number of human resources concerns in the workplace. For instance, firms may be concerned with the difficulty of supervising work being done outside the official workplace (Bryant, 2000). This includes the increased difficulty of controlling for the quality and quantity of work achieved. It may also require management and other employees to be more adaptable to the schedules of flexible workers (e.g. when setting a meeting).

In contrast, the positive effects of flexible employment are felt when a more progressive model of flexibility is applied. From an employer perspective, beside cost reduction considerations, flexible work arrangements could help to reduce turnover and
absenteeism (Harrick, et al., 1986). For flexible workers advantages can be numerous as long as they choose such arrangements (Gottlieb et al., 1998). In particular, work-family conflicts are limited by working arrangements that reduce the number of hours worked (e.g. part-time, compressed workweek). In addition, employees’ attitudes towards their job and organisation are more likely to be positive if they have access to flexible employment that suits their needs. The effects of flexible work practices are, however, not exclusive to the employer or the employee. When employees are satisfied with their working arrangements, there are reasons to believe that productivity will increase given their satisfaction.

Overall, the main challenge in the utilisation of labour flexibility is that, to realise the potential benefits for economic development, flexibility must be achieved in a way that reduces the gap between employers’ flexibility and employees’ flexibility. In a system that contributes to the balance between these two, there is a greater likelihood that the positive consequences will be more easily achieved. The rapid increase of involuntary part-time workers (and probably of other atypical workers), unfortunately, does not suggest that Canada is moving in this direction. If strategies that impose defensive flexibility are to continue, it is more likely that the negative effects of flexibility will prevail over the more desirable impacts. In particular, the casualisation of work that is being accomplished through flexibility leads to an increasingly complex fragmentation of the workforce. Rather than dominant divisions along gender and ethnic lines, it seems that an intersection of factors, where age and industrial variables play a greater role, is the basis of this fragmented labour market. Responses to these harmful trends for economic and social development in the long-run must come from above, where governments have
the responsibility to legislate both in favour of employment security and for protecting
the rights of those who freely opt to take flexible jobs.
LIST OF REFERENCES


[ ] (1993) *Charting the Economic Course in a World of Change*. Document issued by the honourable Don Mazankowski, Minister of Finance (Ottawa), 34 pages.

[ ] (1994a) *Social Security in Canada*. Background Facts, Human Resources Development Canada (Ottawa), 44 pages.


[ ] (1997) *Canada 2005: Global Challenges and Opportunities*. Document prepared by the sub-committee on Global Challenges and Opportunities (Ottawa), two volumes. Available at http://policyresearch.schoolnet.ca.


Canadian Life and Health Insurance Facts. Canadian Life and Health Insurance Association Inc. (Toronto), 41 pages.


(1999b) "La restructuration de l'économie montréalaise: Positionnement et comparaisons avec d'autres métropoles." Report presented to the Ministère de la Métropole and to Développement Économique Canada, 144 pages.


______ (September 6, 1999) Britain’s Royal & Sun Cutting Jobs. London office.


References


------ (April 21, 1999) *Canada Life Could Start Cutting Businesses this Fall.* By John Partridge.

------ (June 14, 1999) *The Lure of Being your Own Boss.* By Bruce Little.


------ (October 9, 2000) * Drops in Ranks of Self-Employed Reason for Cheers.* By Bruce Little.


______ (1998a) Data selected from Catalogue No. 93F0022XDB96008. In the Nation Series. Available at Statistics Canada Web site.


______ (1999b) Labour Force Historical Review. (Cat. 71F0004XCB).


______ (2000b) CANSIM, matrix: D980211.


APPENDIX A

Flexible Employment as a Percentage of Workforce Category

1996

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees</th>
<th>unincorporated</th>
<th>incorporated</th>
<th>part-time workers</th>
<th>full-time workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>males</td>
<td>self-employed</td>
<td>self-employed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>83.80%</td>
<td>8.22%</td>
<td>7.86%</td>
<td>15.54%</td>
<td>93.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>85.02%</td>
<td>7.83%</td>
<td>6.99%</td>
<td>16.94%</td>
<td>93.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>86.94%</td>
<td>8.52%</td>
<td>4.37%</td>
<td>16.89%</td>
<td>92.63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>85.21%</td>
<td>9.94%</td>
<td>4.61%</td>
<td>19.75%</td>
<td>92.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>86.12%</td>
<td>7.96%</td>
<td>5.75%</td>
<td>16.21%</td>
<td>95.12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>86.64%</td>
<td>8.55%</td>
<td>4.65%</td>
<td>18.12%</td>
<td>92.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>89.08%</td>
<td>6.45%</td>
<td>4.33%</td>
<td>17.40%</td>
<td>95.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>83.98%</td>
<td>9.60%</td>
<td>6.20%</td>
<td>16.41%</td>
<td>93.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>82.02%</td>
<td>10.25%</td>
<td>7.56%</td>
<td>17.63%</td>
<td>92.56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>87.54%</td>
<td>8.09%</td>
<td>4.27%</td>
<td>17.24%</td>
<td>93.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees</th>
<th>unincorporated</th>
<th>incorporated</th>
<th>part-time workers</th>
<th>full-time workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>females</td>
<td>self-employed</td>
<td>self-employed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>89.55%</td>
<td>6.50%</td>
<td>3.48%</td>
<td>35.97%</td>
<td>74.52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>90.41%</td>
<td>5.97%</td>
<td>3.07%</td>
<td>39.30%</td>
<td>72.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>92.42%</td>
<td>5.44%</td>
<td>1.67%</td>
<td>39.90%</td>
<td>71.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>91.70%</td>
<td>6.09%</td>
<td>1.66%</td>
<td>39.54%</td>
<td>73.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>92.87%</td>
<td>4.69%</td>
<td>2.01%</td>
<td>31.77%</td>
<td>80.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>91.44%</td>
<td>6.54%</td>
<td>1.63%</td>
<td>31.70%</td>
<td>79.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>93.97%</td>
<td>4.15%</td>
<td>1.61%</td>
<td>35.70%</td>
<td>77.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>91.36%</td>
<td>5.78%</td>
<td>2.36%</td>
<td>30.51%</td>
<td>81.36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>89.23%</td>
<td>7.11%</td>
<td>3.07%</td>
<td>36.31%</td>
<td>75.22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>92.40%</td>
<td>5.57%</td>
<td>1.74%</td>
<td>37.40%</td>
<td>73.38%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

--------------------------- 100% ---------------------------
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees(^a)</th>
<th>unincorporated self-employed(^a)</th>
<th>incorporated self-employed(^a)</th>
<th>part-time workers(^a)</th>
<th>full-time workers(^a)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>87.90%</td>
<td>6.21%</td>
<td>5.79%</td>
<td>12.77%</td>
<td>98.43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>88.48%</td>
<td>5.81%</td>
<td>5.57%</td>
<td>13.20%</td>
<td>98.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>90.89%</td>
<td>5.49%</td>
<td>3.54%</td>
<td>14.03%</td>
<td>99.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>89.42%</td>
<td>6.83%</td>
<td>3.65%</td>
<td>15.83%</td>
<td>97.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>88.58%</td>
<td>5.88%</td>
<td>5.18%</td>
<td>12.83%</td>
<td>100.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>90.13%</td>
<td>5.94%</td>
<td>3.51%</td>
<td>13.98%</td>
<td>96.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>90.83%</td>
<td>5.41%</td>
<td>3.66%</td>
<td>14.09%</td>
<td>96.99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>87.74%</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
<td>5.23%</td>
<td>12.67%</td>
<td>99.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>86.08%</td>
<td>7.82%</td>
<td>6.02%</td>
<td>14.55%</td>
<td>98.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>90.50%</td>
<td>5.98%</td>
<td>3.16%</td>
<td>14.81%</td>
<td>98.56%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees(^a)</th>
<th>unincorporated self-employed(^a)</th>
<th>incorporated self-employed(^a)</th>
<th>part-time workers(^a)</th>
<th>full-time workers(^a)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>93.92%</td>
<td>3.59%</td>
<td>2.25%</td>
<td>32.56%</td>
<td>82.43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>93.84%</td>
<td>3.56%</td>
<td>2.17%</td>
<td>34.45%</td>
<td>80.89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>95.23%</td>
<td>3.13%</td>
<td>1.32%</td>
<td>37.35%</td>
<td>76.98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>94.72%</td>
<td>3.69%</td>
<td>1.28%</td>
<td>36.17%</td>
<td>77.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>94.94%</td>
<td>3.01%</td>
<td>1.64%</td>
<td>28.74%</td>
<td>86.55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>94.55%</td>
<td>3.81%</td>
<td>1.23%</td>
<td>28.23%</td>
<td>83.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>95.90%</td>
<td>2.60%</td>
<td>1.18%</td>
<td>32.68%</td>
<td>80.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>94.22%</td>
<td>3.62%</td>
<td>1.89%</td>
<td>26.79%</td>
<td>87.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>92.92%</td>
<td>4.44%</td>
<td>2.35%</td>
<td>33.65%</td>
<td>81.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>95.18%</td>
<td>3.22%</td>
<td>1.19%</td>
<td>35.08%</td>
<td>79.91%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### MALES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees(^b)</th>
<th>unincorporated self-employed(^c)</th>
<th>incorporated self-employed(^b)</th>
<th>part-time workers(^d)</th>
<th>full-time workers(^d)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>89.80%</td>
<td>4.61%</td>
<td>5.56%</td>
<td>9.88%</td>
<td>96.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>89.36%</td>
<td>4.61%</td>
<td>5.96%</td>
<td>10.20%</td>
<td>97.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>91.40%</td>
<td>5.16%</td>
<td>3.33%</td>
<td>10.94%</td>
<td>96.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>89.94%</td>
<td>6.59%</td>
<td>3.32%</td>
<td>13.71%</td>
<td>95.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>90.75%</td>
<td>5.48%</td>
<td>3.68%</td>
<td>10.48%</td>
<td>99.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>92.22%</td>
<td>5.19%</td>
<td>2.48%</td>
<td>12.70%</td>
<td>96.52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>92.11%</td>
<td>5.14%</td>
<td>2.65%</td>
<td>12.29%</td>
<td>100.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>89.58%</td>
<td>6.20%</td>
<td>4.15%</td>
<td>11.05%</td>
<td>95.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>88.32%</td>
<td>6.19%</td>
<td>5.44%</td>
<td>12.85%</td>
<td>95.68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>91.26%</td>
<td>5.24%</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>12.17%</td>
<td>97.14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---------- 100% ----------

### FEMALES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees(^b)</th>
<th>unincorporated self-employed(^c)</th>
<th>incorporated self-employed(^b)</th>
<th>part-time workers(^d)</th>
<th>full-time workers(^d)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>96.47%</td>
<td>2.01%</td>
<td>1.36%</td>
<td>32.42%</td>
<td>80.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>96.36%</td>
<td>1.58%</td>
<td>1.75%</td>
<td>33.75%</td>
<td>80.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>96.19%</td>
<td>2.46%</td>
<td>0.85%</td>
<td>41.10%</td>
<td>73.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>95.43%</td>
<td>2.63%</td>
<td>1.20%</td>
<td>37.87%</td>
<td>76.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>96.75%</td>
<td>2.00%</td>
<td>0.91%</td>
<td>27.80%</td>
<td>88.09%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>96.46%</td>
<td>2.17%</td>
<td>1.02%</td>
<td>29.71%</td>
<td>82.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>96.97%</td>
<td>1.90%</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
<td>29.70%</td>
<td>87.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>96.24%</td>
<td>2.41%</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
<td>28.20%</td>
<td>83.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>95.12%</td>
<td>2.80%</td>
<td>1.80%</td>
<td>37.00%</td>
<td>76.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>96.64%</td>
<td>1.96%</td>
<td>1.07%</td>
<td>36.59%</td>
<td>78.97%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---------- 100% ----------
## 1971

### MALES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMA</th>
<th>employees</th>
<th>unincorporated self-employed</th>
<th>incorporated self-employed</th>
<th>part-time workers</th>
<th>full-time workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>91.57%</td>
<td>5.30%</td>
<td>3.13%</td>
<td>8.41%</td>
<td>104.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>90.92%</td>
<td>5.68%</td>
<td>3.40%</td>
<td>9.56%</td>
<td>103.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>93.13%</td>
<td>5.21%</td>
<td>1.66%</td>
<td>8.63%</td>
<td>103.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>90.98%</td>
<td>7.51%</td>
<td>1.51%</td>
<td>10.54%</td>
<td>101.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>91.42%</td>
<td>5.91%</td>
<td>2.67%</td>
<td>6.89%</td>
<td>114.58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>93.88%</td>
<td>4.54%</td>
<td>1.57%</td>
<td>8.59%</td>
<td>105.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>96.71%</td>
<td>1.05%</td>
<td>2.24%</td>
<td>7.68%</td>
<td>114.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>91.80%</td>
<td>5.90%</td>
<td>2.30%</td>
<td>8.12%</td>
<td>104.12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>89.54%</td>
<td>6.96%</td>
<td>3.50%</td>
<td>11.62%</td>
<td>104.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>92.68%</td>
<td>5.15%</td>
<td>2.17%</td>
<td>9.69%</td>
<td>104.47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 1 Ratios for employees and self-employed are calculated as percentage of “all classes of workers”. Ratios for part-time and full-time are calculated as a percentage of the “employed labour force”. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FEMALES</th>
<th>employees</th>
<th>unincorporated self-employed</th>
<th>incorporated self-employed</th>
<th>part-time workers</th>
<th>full-time workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>97.47%</td>
<td>2.00%</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
<td>38.88%</td>
<td>94.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>97.58%</td>
<td>1.76%</td>
<td>0.66%</td>
<td>36.11%</td>
<td>94.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>97.09%</td>
<td>2.33%</td>
<td>0.58%</td>
<td>41.39%</td>
<td>91.84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>97.55%</td>
<td>2.04%</td>
<td>0.41%</td>
<td>36.34%</td>
<td>94.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montréal</td>
<td>97.30%</td>
<td>2.13%</td>
<td>0.57%</td>
<td>23.81%</td>
<td>111.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa-Hull</td>
<td>97.95%</td>
<td>1.67%</td>
<td>0.38%</td>
<td>28.78%</td>
<td>100.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Québec</td>
<td>99.09%</td>
<td>0.43%</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
<td>24.29%</td>
<td>108.27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>97.57%</td>
<td>1.91%</td>
<td>0.52%</td>
<td>28.57%</td>
<td>98.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>96.45%</td>
<td>2.73%</td>
<td>0.82%</td>
<td>39.36%</td>
<td>94.12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>97.84%</td>
<td>1.68%</td>
<td>0.47%</td>
<td>36.31%</td>
<td>95.68%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 2 Since the 'employed labour force' excludes a considerable number of workers who were not part of the labour force at the time of the survey, but who worked during the census year, it is possible that percentages exceed 100%. |

| b Statistics Canada, Estimates from the Public Sample Tapes (PUS T), 1981. |
| d Statistics Canada, Basic Summary Tables, 1981. |
| e Statistics Canada, Custom Tabulation from the 1971 Census of Population. |
APPENDIX B

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE FOR LIFE INSURERS

PART A: DEFINITIONS & TRENDS

- What do you understand the term labour flexibility to mean and how does it apply to your company?

- In terms of flexibility, do you believe that labour practices have changed significantly within your company over the past 30 years or so? How so / Why not?

- Have changes accelerated more recently? If so explain.

- Are changes happening at a constant pace or during specific periods? For example, during periods of economic growth are labour practices more likely or less likely to be restructured?

- Do you think that those trends are specific to your company or industry? How does it compare?

- Could you say if individually the following forms of work have been increasing over the past 30 years in proportion of the total workforce of your company?
  a) Contracting out / outsourcing?
  b) Temporary work?
  c) Part-time work?
  d) Flextime scheduling?
  e) Overtime work?

- Do you see any other types of work arrangements that could be labelled as flexible employment and that are being used by your company? (e.g. job sharing, telecommuting, compressed workweek)

PART B: EXPLANATIONS AND MOTIVATIONS

- In general terms, what would you say are the main reasons for adopting new labour strategies in the Life Insurance industry? (competition vs. needs of workforce)

- Who do you think benefits from labour flexibility?

- Are flexible working arrangements used in the same way throughout the occupational hierarchy of your company? For example, is the extent of overtime work (paid or unpaid) the same for clerical and managerial workforce?
- Do you feel that occupation, age or gender have something to do with labour flexibility? (For instance, are the needs of specific segments of your labour force an important factor for implementing labour flexibility?)

- How do the needs of your workforce interact with the those of the company? Do they complete each other perfectly?

**PART C: THE FUTURE OF LABOUR FLEXIBILITY**

- Do you expect that the structure of the Life Insurance will be (or will continue to be) modified in the near future? (e.g. demutualisation)

- (In some cases) How is your on-going process of demutualisation likely to affect labour?

- Do you foresee an increase of mergers, takeovers or strategic alliances in the short term?

- If so, how are these changes likely to affect labour?

- In general? (job demand, occupational structure, job stability, geographic concentration, etc.)

- For labour flexibility in particular?
Company Profile

Company name:__________________________________________________________

Location of head office:____________________________________________________

Line of Insurance:________________________________________________________

Total number of employees:_________  Employees in Toronto:_________

Ownership type:__________________________________________________________

Parent Co.:______________________________________________________________

Ultimate parent Co.:_______________________________________________________

Name of person interviewed:_________________________  Date:_____________

Occupation/title:________________________________________________________

Address:________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

Tel.:_____________________________  Fax:_______________________________

E-mail:____________________________

Comments:________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

ProQuest Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600

UMI
The Effects of Guided Imagery Exercises on Perceived Academic Self-Efficacy

by

Wayne Henry Schlapkohl

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of doctor of philosophy
Department of Human Development and Applied Psychology
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

©Copyright by Wayne Henry Schlapkohl, 2001
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-58611-1
ABSTRACT

The Effects of Guided Imagery Exercises on Perceived Academic Self-Efficacy

Author: Wayne Henry Schlapkohl

Department: Department of Human Development and Applied Psychology, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

Degree: Doctor of Philosophy

Date of Convocation: 2001

In this study, the effects of guided imagery exercises on self-identified low achieving postsecondary students' perceived academic self-efficacy (PASE) were examined, as well as its effects on study skills and anxiety. Also examined was whether participants with high imagery ability (i.e., ability to have vivid, controllable imagery) would be better able to enhance PASE through imagery and relaxation exercises than low imagery ability participants.

One hundred and four participants were randomly assigned by class to an imagery, a relaxation, or a comparison group. Participants in all groups identified self-limiting academic beliefs and discussed study skills. Relaxation and imagery participants were
taught and encouraged to use diaphragmatic breathing, autosuggestion, and relaxing imagery. Imagery participants also imagined successfully coping with academic situations in which they presently had doubts, whereas relaxation participants also engaged in a muscle relaxation exercise.

Weekly, participants estimated their PASE using an adaptation of Bandura, Adams, and Beyer's (1977) procedure. At pre- and posttreatment, participants completed the Learning and Study Strategies Inventory (LASSI) (Weinstein, Schulte, & Palmer, 1987) and the State-Trait Anxiety Inventory (Spielberger, Gorsuch, & Lushene, 1968). Imagery ability was assessed through the Questionnaire on Imagery Control (Lane, 1976).

Imagery participants had significantly larger increases in PASE magnitude than comparison participants \( (p < .001) \) and higher pretreatment-corrected posttreatment PASE strength than relaxation participants \( (p = .009) \). The comparison group had significantly lower pretreatment-corrected posttreatment PASE strength than the combined relaxation and imagery groups \( (p < .001) \). Imagery participants had significantly lower pretreatment-corrected posttreatment anxiety \( (p = .004) \) than comparison participants. The treatment groups did not significantly differ on study skill use. Finally, more high imagery ability participants enhanced PASE magnitude than low ability participants \( (p = .042) \). However, ability groups did not significantly differ on PASE strength.

Considering the imagery participants' success in enhancing PASE and lowering anxiety, guided imagery may have considerable promise as an academic tool. The importance of imagery ability received less support.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This thesis would not have reached completion had it not been for the below mentioned people. I wish to thank committee members, Dr. Jeanne Watson and Dr. John Ross, for their guidance. A special thanks goes to my supervisor, Dr. Barry Schneider, for both his astute suggestions and his patience for when I let life get in the way of the thesis. A special thank you must also go out to Laurie Borzel, my partner and wife, who put off some of her goals to let me return to school in a later stage in my life. In the distraction department, a big thank you goes out to the folks at Runners’ Choice (“May the wind always be at your back”) who took my mind off this study and took me to my first marathon.
Table of Contents

List of Tables .................................................................................................................. ix
List of Appendices ........................................................................................................... xii

Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1

Enhancing Academic Performance by

Enhancing Perceived Academic Self-Efficacy .............................................................. 1

PASE and Academic Success .......................................................................................... 2

Cognitive Processes ........................................................................................................ 6
  Cognitive Skill Usage .................................................................................................... 6
  Goal Setting .................................................................................................................. 8

Motivational Processes .................................................................................................. 9

Affective Processes .......................................................................................................... 9

Enhancing PASE Through Imagery .............................................................................. 11

A Very Brief Historical Outline ..................................................................................... 11

The Structure of Imagery ............................................................................................... 15

Imagery's Similarity to Performance Experiences ......................................................... 15

Imagery's Similarity to Nonenactive Experiences .......................................................... 17

Relevant Research .......................................................................................................... 19

Imagery Enhancing Interpersonal Skills PSE ............................................................... 21
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Imagery Protecting PSE from Negative Experiences</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparing Imagery to Verbal Persuasion</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studying Imagery's Mediating Factors</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery not Affecting PSE</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Effects of Guided Imagery on PASE</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery and Relaxation: Can They be Separated?</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selecting the Students who will Benefit from Imagery</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying the Postsecondary Students Most in Need</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypotheses</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background Questionnaire</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Learning and Study Strategies Inventory (LASSI)</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire on Imagery Control (QIC)</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task Specific Self-Efficacy Scale (TSSE)</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raven's Standard Progressive Matrices (SPM)</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The State-Trait Anxiety Inventory - State Scale (STAI)</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Imagery and Relaxation Diaries ........................................ 64

Vocabulary Subtest of the

Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale-Revised (WAIS-R) ............. 65

Procedures .............................................................. 66

Outline of the Five Treatment Sessions .............................. 66

  Session #1 ............................................................ 66
  Session #2 ............................................................ 68
  Sessions #3, #4, and #5 ........................................... 70

Integrity Checks ....................................................... 72

Results ........................................................................ 76

  Comparison of Pretreatment Scores ................................ 76

  The Effects of the Treatments on TSSE Strength and LASSI Factors .... 77

  The Effects of the Treatments on TSSE Magnitude .............. 81

  The Effects of Imagery Ability on TSSE ............................ 82

Subsidiary Analyses ..................................................... 84

  Counsellor Effects ..................................................... 84

  Effects of the Sex of the Participants ............................. 87

  Imagery Diaries ....................................................... 90

  The Effects of the Treatments on State Anxiety ................. 92

Alternative Analyses ................................................... 93
Summary of Findings .............................................................................. 94
Discussion ................................................................................................. 96
The Effects of Imagery Exercises on PASE ............................................. 96
The Effects of Relaxation Exercises on PASE .......................................... 97
The Effects of Imagery and Relaxation Exercises on Study Skills .......... 99
The Effects of Imagery Ability on PASE .................................................. 102
The Effects of Guided Imagery on Generalized Anxiety ......................... 104
Threats to Research Validity ................................................................. 105
  Issues in Statistical Conclusion Validity ............................................... 105
  Issues in Construct Validity ............................................................... 107
  Issues in Internal Validity ................................................................. 107
  Issues in External Validity ................................................................. 108
How this Study Informs Practice ............................................................ 108
Conclusions ............................................................................................. 109
References .............................................................................................. 111
Appendices ............................................................................................. 130
List of Tables

Table No.

1. Comparison of Participants who Completed the Program with Drop-Outs ........ 53
2. Internal Consistency Reliabilities for the LASSI Factor and Scale Scores (alphas) 59
3. Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups: Session #1 ............ 67
4. The Description and Rationale of the Programs given to Participants ............ 69
5. Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups: Session #2 .......... 71
6. Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups: Session #3 .......... 74
7. Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups: Sessions # 4 & 5 .. 75
8. Mean Task Specific Self-Efficacy Strength Scores by Treatment Group .......... 79
9. Mean Learning and Studies Strategies Inventory--Effort-Related Factor Scores by Treatment Group .................................................. 79
10. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Goal Orientation Factor Scores by Treatment Group ............................................. 80
11. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Cognitive Activities Factor Scores by Treatment Group .......................................... 80
12. Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Treatment Group ............................................ 83
13. Task Specific Self-Efficacy Strength Scores by Imagery Ability ................. 84
14. Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Imagery Ability ................................................................. 84
15. Mean Task Specific Self-Efficacy Strength Scores by Counsellor ............. 85
16. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Effort-Related Activities Factor Scores by Counsellor .................................................. 86
17. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Goal Orientation Factor Scores by Counsellor ...................................................... 86
18. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Cognitive Activities Factor Scores by Counsellor ...................................................... 87
19. Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Counsellor ...................................................... 87
20. Mean Task Specific Self-Efficacy Strength Scores by Sex .................... 88
21. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Effort-Related Activities Factor Scores by Sex ....................................................... 89
22. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Goal Orientation Factor Scores by Sex .............................................................. 89
23. Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory--Cognitive Activities Factor Scores by Sex .............................................................. 90
24. Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Sex .............................................................. 90
25. Mean Imagery Experience Ratings by Treatment Group ........................................ 92
26. Mean State Anxiety Scores by Treatment Group .................................................. 93
27. When using a cutoff of TSSE ≤ 10Percentage of Participants who Achieved TSSE Magnitude by Treatment Group .................................................. 200
28. Mean Scores and Univariate F-tests for the LASSI and TSSE scale ..................... 202
29. Mean Study Skills Scores by Treatment Group .................................................... 203
30. Univariate F-tests for the LASSI and TSSE scale gain scores .......................... 205
List of Appendices

Appendix

A. Background Questionnaire ........................................... 131
B. Questionnaire on Imagery Control .................................. 134
C. Task Specific Self-Efficacy Scale .................................. 145
D. Imagery and Relaxation Diaries ..................................... 147
E. Summaries of the Project given to the Different Treatment Groups ... 158
F. Descriptions and Rationales Given to the Different Treatment Groups ... 162
G. Informed Consent Forms ............................................. 173
H. Description of the Imagery and Relaxation Exercises ............... 175
I. Integrity Checks for the Study ....................................... 187
J. Alternative Analysis for PASE Magnitude ........................... 199
K. The Effects of the Treatments on Individual LASSI Scales and TSSE Strength ... 201
L. Analyses using Gain Scores ........................................ 204
M. The Request for Volunteers .......................................... 207
Enhancing Academic Performance by Enhancing Perceived Academic Self-Efficacy

Nonintellectual factors such as anxiety, fear of failure, and motivation play important roles in academic success and failure. In fact, some of these factors have been shown to be better predictors of success than intellectual factors, especially with students who are known to have academic difficulties. For instance, Larose and Roy (1991) found that fear of failure, not being aware of the importance of effort for success, and examination anxiety were better predictors of high risk college students' school success than previous marks. Sanchez-Herrero and Sanchez (1992) found that anxiety levels were better predictors of achievement in junior high students learning a second language than general intelligence or verbal aptitude. Similarly, several studies have found motivation to be an important predictor of academic success (e.g., Sharpley & Pain, 1987; Uguroglu & Walberg, 1988). Sharpley and Pain, for example, found that motivation was a better predictor of success in a graduate level counsellor training course than were the students' previous grades.

This study considers a particular type of nonintellectual hindrance to academic success: students' perceived academic self-efficacy. Perceived self-efficacy (PSE) is defined here as people's beliefs that they can successfully perform specific behaviours (Bandura & Adams, 1977). This introduction begins with the examination of the effects
of PSE on academic achievement followed by consideration of reasons why the judicious use of imagery may enhance perceived academic self-efficacy (PASE).

**PASE and Academic Success**

Albert Bandura in 1977 first suggested that PSE may have predictive value. He proposed that changes in PSE may explain why behaviour change can follow from very diverse treatment approaches. In other words, Bandura believed that the important change that occurs in successful therapies is that people leave therapy believing they can do things they did not believe they could do before therapy.

Bandura and Adams (1977) and Bandura, Adams, and Beyer (1977) demonstrated that PSE was enhanced by a number of successful forms of therapy for phobics. Furthermore, the level of PSE established during the course of the interventions predicted the degree of success in overcoming fearful and avoidant behaviour. These two studies examined the effectiveness of treatments on snake phobias. In one of these studies (Bandura & Adams), the researchers examined the effects of systematic desensitization on PSE. This was not only the first study to examine the effects of imagery on PSE, but the data from this study supported the belief that PSE was a better predictor of future behaviour than anxiety and past behaviour in phobics, a result that had a great deal of theoretical significance.

Systematic desensitization is a technique in which phobic clients vividly imagine the phobic stimulus while being in a relaxed state. Wolpe popularized this technique in his 1958 book *Psychotherapy by Reciprocal Inhibition*. He explained the technique's
effectiveness by its ability to reduce anxiety. Wolpe believed that what caused the avoidant behaviour in phobics was the anxiety people experienced when thinking of the feared stimuli. According to this theory, the imagery would extinguish the avoidant behaviour because it reduced anxiety.

This theory has a great deal of a priori appeal. Unfortunately, reciprocal inhibition did not adequately explain differences in behaviour found in the outcome studies. For instance, as early as 1967 researchers such as Agras studied participants who had been trained to remain relaxed while imagining feared stimuli. Although all participants were equally relaxed during desensitization, these participants showed significant differences in their ability to approach what they feared. The clients' anxiety levels were not effective predictors of behaviour. Presumably, if anxiety caused avoidant behaviour, it would also predict avoidant behaviour.

There are two ways of interpreting these data. One way is to suggest that because most human behaviour is influenced by many factors, the researcher needed only to identify additional causal factors that would distinguish those participants able to achieve maximal performance and those who did not. An obvious example of this may be that phobic behaviour is extinguished through systematic desensitization in relaxed, motivated participants. However, if motivation is a distinguishing causal factor, one might question why participants need high motivation to approach a stimulus that does not cause them any anxiety. The alternative interpretation is that systematic desensitization influences
higher order variables that cause both anxiety and approach behaviour. In this case, it is anxiety that is epiphenomenal.

Bandura and Adams' (1977) work with ophidiophobes suggested that the higher order variable of cognitions was a better predictor of avoidant behaviour in phobics than was anxiety. They found that desensitization not only reduced arousal, it also enhanced the participants' PSE, but it did not do so uniformly. Some participants' PSE levels were higher and stronger than those of other participants who had been desensitized to the same low level of arousal when confronted with the phobic stimuli. The higher the level of PSE, the greater the reduction in avoidance behaviour. Bandura and Adams' cognitive explanation of change fit the avoidance data better than Wolpe's behavioural explanation. Bandura and Adams had presented fairly convincing data to suggest that anxiety was not the causal factor in avoidance behaviour. They also reported a small pilot project investigating the change of PSE at several points during and after treatment. By using participant modelling, in which participants engaged in handling snakes as part of the treatment, the researchers found that PSE was a more powerful predictor of later behaviour than was behaviour during the treatment. Although these data do not constitute a direct test of causation, they did provide support for the belief that PSE was a more likely explanation for avoidance behaviour than two well-accepted explanations: anxiety and lack of exposure.

Almost as soon as the term PSE was coined, researchers began studying the PSE of students (e.g., Brown & Inouye, 1978). The results of these studies were very
promising. In some, but not all, of the studies, PSE was the most important source of variation in academic measures. For instance, in a study of nonintellectual factors, Ferrari, Parker, and Ware (1992) studied 319 postsecondary students. Their study examined the effects of the students' locus of control, Meyers-Briggs type, and PSE on academic performance. The researchers discovered that of these variables only PSE significantly affected academic performance. Shell, Murphy, and Bruning (1989) studied the predictive utility of skill, PSE, and outcome expectancies for reading and writing tasks. Multiple regression analyses showed that only PSE and outcome expectancies predicted reading achievement, with PSE being the stronger predictor. Only PSE accounted for a significant proportion of the variance in writing achievement. Schunk's (1989) review of the literature concluded that studies of different academic endeavors have found significant and positive correlations between posttreatment PSE and skill ($r = 0.27 - 0.84$). Furthermore, PSE remained a significant predictor when the effects of other influences on academic achievement were partialled out. Thus, the research indicates that students' beliefs that they can successfully perform academic tasks correlate with their academic performance. Bandura (1989) suggests that these beliefs affect academic behaviour both directly and indirectly through cognitive, motivational, and affective processes.
Cognitive Processes

PASE affects cognitive processes in two major ways: by increasing the use of certain cognitive skills and by facilitating the formation of goals based on the positive interpretation of one's previous behaviour.

Cognitive skill usage. Collins (1982, cited in Bandura, 1993) examined the effects of PASE on cognitive skill usage by studying children at three levels of mathematical ability: low, medium, and high. Within each of these ability levels, she found children who had low and high PASE. All the children were given difficult mathematical problems to solve. At each level of ability, children who believed strongly in their capabilities were quicker to discard faulty strategies. They chose to rework more of the problems they failed and did so more accurately than did children of equal ability who had low PASE. Finally, positive attitudes toward mathematics were better predicted by PASE than by actual ability. Bandura (1989) suggests that the reason why believing in one's abilities encourages effective skill usage can be found in the type of mental imagery high PASE encourages. In other words, students' PASE influences the types of anticipatory scenarios that run through their minds:

Those who have a high sense of efficacy visualize success scenarios that provide positive guides for performance. Those who judge themselves as ineffectual are more inclined to visualize failure scenarios that undermine performance by dwelling on how things will go wrong (Bandura, 1989, p.1176).
When people visualize themselves successfully completing academic work, they are also quite effortlessly reminding themselves of the steps needed to perform the task well. Such imagery creates a positive feedback loop that amplifies the original effects where high PASE fosters imagery of effective actions, and imagery of efficacious action strengthens PASE (Bandura, 1989).

There is also tentative evidence that PASE influences the metacognitive processes students use consciously in their studies. In a study conducted with 173 students in grade seven and eight science and English classes, Pintrich and DeGroot (1990) found that higher levels of PASE and belief in the intrinsic value of the subject matter were correlated with higher scores in their Cognitive Strategy Scale and Self Regulation Scale. The Cognitive Strategy Scale used by Pintrich and DeGroot included items on such study strategies as memorizing new terms, paraphrasing new ideas, and outlining textbook chapters. The Self-Regulation Scale was a combination of metacognitive strategies and self-regulation items. Metacognitive strategies items included such approaches as planning, skimming, and comprehension monitoring. The self-regulation components included items on persistence when studies were perceived to be uninteresting, self-testing, and use of practice exercises. The only weakness with this study was the design’s inability to determine the path of causality. It was impossible to tell whether being interested in the topics they were studying or believing that they had the ability to perform these academic activities caused the students to work smarter as well as work harder.
**Goal setting.** Students who believe they can perform well choose more challenging goals than those who do not believe they can perform well (Bandura, 1989, 1991, 1993). It seems this is not a direct effect. Rather, PASE affects goal setting by affecting the interpretation given to past performance. The higher the PASE, the more likely students are to perceive their past performances favorably and the less likely they are to attribute their initial failures to perform necessary behaviours as the result of the lack of ability (Bandura, 1993).

Zimmerman, Bandura, and Martin-Pons (1992) found that students' PASE correlated significantly with their grade goals and with their final grades in social studies. PASE and student goals accounted for 31% of the variance in the students’ academic course attainment. Interestingly, the direct path of influence between students’ prior grades and final grades was not significant, suggesting that self-regulatory factors not only mediated the influence of prior achievement, but also contributed independently to the students' academic attainment.

Related to goal setting is risk taking. Low PASE is related to low risk taking. If people doubt that they have the ability to do a new behaviour, they are less likely to attempt the behaviour. Unfortunately, academics, especially postsecondary academics, are risky business. The risks involved in academia are most likely to be assumed if people have the PASE to believe that they will be able to complete their program, and they have the outcome expectancies that their program will lead to a career.
Motivational Processes

If people do not believe they have the ability to perform certain behaviours, they are not as likely to persist in their attempts to perform these behaviours when faced with difficulties. Dale Schunk's work with low achieving children (1981, 1983) demonstrated that enhanced PASE increases persistence. Schunk's 1981 study has been described as the initial PASE research involving cognitive skill learning. Low achieving children received cognitive modelling or didactic instruction on long division. Regardless of treatment, higher PASE was associated with progressively greater division skill. A path analysis showed that PASE increased performance both directly and by increasing persistence.

Wood and Bandura's (1993) work with organizations and Lent, Brown, and Larking's (1984) study of undergraduates also demonstrated that enhanced PSE increases persistence. The study by Lent et al., also highlighted another way that PASE increases motivation. The higher the students' PASE, the more enjoyment they received from their studies.

Affective Processes

PASE directly affects the degree of physiological arousal and subjective distress students experience. Bandura (1993) explains that people only feel threatened if they believe their perceived coping capabilities are not sufficient to meet the potentially aversive aspects of the environment. In two studies, Bandura and his colleagues created different levels of PSE in participants with phobias about spiders (Bandura, Taylor, Williams, Mefford, & Barchas, 1985) or snakes (Bandura, Reese, & Adams, 1982) by
treated them with modelling or enactive treatments. Low levels of PSE were accompanied by high levels of subjective distress, autonomic arousal, and plasma catecholamine secretion. Meece, Wigfield, and Eccles (1990) found that academic failures evoked anxiety only if PASE was weakened. More important, it was the students' beliefs in their capabilities, not their anxiety levels, which best predicted their subsequent academic attainments. PASE predicted behaviour when anxiety was partialled out. Bandura asserted that these finding had "... important implications for how to alleviate scholastic anxiety. It is best reduced not by anxiety palliatives but by building a strong sense of efficacy" (Bandura, 1993, pp. 133-134).

In conclusion, there is converging evidence indicating that enhancing PASE will encourage cognitive and metacognitive skill usage, encourage the selection of challenging academic goals, increase academic motivation (e.g., persistence and enjoyment), and decrease anxiety. Thus, techniques that enhance PASE would be useful for counsellors, teachers, and students. Research on how best to enhance PASE is not only important but may be more worthwhile to individuals involved in academia than research on managing stress or enhancing low academic motivation because PASE may be a strong causal factor in these hindrances to academic success.
Enhancing PASE Through Imagery

Very little research has been conducted to assess how best to enhance PASE. However, there are three reasons to suggest that guided imagery exercises may be a good way to enhance PASE. First, imagery has a very long and successful history of clinical application and is presently extremely popular. Second, the way imagery experiences are structured, it is reasonable to believe they would be persuasive. For instance, they have the flexibility of nonenactive treatments while still being an isomorph of enactive experiences. The third and strongest reason to suggest that guided imagery exercises may be a good way to enhance PASE is that researchers have found that imagery has enhanced PSE in nonacademic areas.

Imagery is simply our imaginings. Perhaps because of its name, people often think of imagery as what they "see" in their mind's eye, but imagery can involve any sensory or perceptual experience (e.g., imagined tastes, imagined emotions, etc.) Throughout this thesis, imagery will be defined as quasi-sensory or quasi-perceptual experiences of which people are self-consciously aware. These experiences exist for them in the absence of those stimulus conditions that are known to produce their genuine sensory or perceptual counterparts (Richardson, 1983).

A Very Brief Historical Outline

Imagery is in a unique position compared to other clinical techniques. Every culture of every historical period has used imagery to some extent to help people cope with the difficulties of living (Achterberg, 1985). In fact, writers such as Jeanne
Achterberg (1985) and Samuels and Samuels (1975) remind us that even prehistorically imagery was used to cope with psychological difficulties. Achterberg provides examples of how shamans in tribal communities often spoke of using the mental images that they and their "clients" had. These images would be used to help the shamans and clients understand the clients' difficulties and help them overcome these difficulties. There is archaeological evidence to suggest that these shamanic techniques are at least 20,000 years old and imagery continues to be used by modern shamans such as healers in the Navaho nation (Achterberg, 1985).

When healers in the Western World started to write down their medical knowledge, they, too, wrote about imagery. For instance, the ancient Greek healer, Asclepius, used patients' hypnagogic images to assist him in the diagnoses of their illnesses. After Asclepius' death, more than 200 temples were eventually erected throughout the area of Greece, Italy, and Turkey to honour him and the practice of medicine which he fostered. The priests in these "Asclepia" (as these temples were called) also used hypnagogic images for diagnoses. They called it "dream therapy." Later, when the practitioners were Christian, the technique was renamed "incubation sleep." Many people found that studying these images gave them insights into their difficulties (Achterberg, 1985).

Modern psychotherapy is usually thought of as starting in the 1890s. It was during this time that Sigmund Freud published his paper, "On the Origins of Psycho-Analysis," and Freud and Bruer published Studies on Hysteria (both of which were published in
1895). Of course, there were psychotherapists before Freud. When Freud began his clinical work, perhaps the best known and most respected psychotherapist was Pierre Janet (1859-1947) (Corsini, 1989). Janet was perhaps the first modern therapist to strongly advocate for the use of imagery. He discovered that it was helpful to have hysterical patients replace one image with another because these clients often spoke of being fixated on particular images. In 1898, he published a book on this topic called *Nervoses et Idees Fixes* (Sheikh & Jordan, 1983).

In the early 1900s, writers in Europe, such as Carl Jung, continued to study and advocate for the use of imagery in psychotherapy. They kept the study of imagery alive in Europe while it was quickly disappearing in North America (Sheikh & Jordan, 1983).

As the popularity of behaviourism spread across North America in the early 1900s, work on all internal events was seen as imprecise and unscientific. John B. Watson labeled arguments in favor of the significance of imagery as "bunk" (Sheik, 1983). As a counselling technique, behaviourally oriented therapists saw imagery as irrelevant. This had such a profound effect on the study and use of imagery that between the years of 1920 and 1960 not a single book was published on the topic of imagery (Sheikh & Jordan, 1983).

The clinical study of imagery started to reemerge as people outside of the field of clinical psychology started publishing on imagery (Holt, 1964; Sheikh & Jordan, 1983). For instance, Wilder Penfield began evoking vivid mental images in patients by electrically stimulating brain tissue (Penfield, 1963). In the 1950s, D.O. Hebb's sensory
deprived research participants unexpectedly experienced spontaneous, uncontrollable mental imagery (Hebb, 1961). At approximately the same time, humanistic psychology started importing imagery techniques from Europe (e.g., psychosynthesis) and the Far East (e.g., Zen sitting meditations) (Sheikh & Jordan, 1983). In the early to mid-sixties, these studies and movements led to calls by both clinical and experimental psychologists to rediscover internal events. Holt, in his 1964 article entitled "Imagery: The return of the ostracized," called to both experimental and clinical psychologists to reexamine these areas. He wrote, ". . . come on in - the water's fine" (p. 263).

Therapists and researchers interested in imagery continue to this day to criticize North America's behaviourist past. Nonetheless, behavioural therapists also played a role in bringing imagery back. Joseph Wolpe spoke of systematic desensitization back in 1958. This was six years before Holt's call to "come on in." The effectiveness of systematic desensitization not only encouraged people to reexamine imagery, it also profoundly affected the field of psychotherapy. Wolpe's claim that 90% of his patients were either cured or markedly improved in a matter of months, when psychoanalysts were taking many years to treat the same patients, led to profound changes in the way psychologists think of psychotherapy (Wilson, 1989). Thus, imagery played a part in one of the biggest breakthroughs in modern applied psychology.

---

1 Wolpe was not the first person to use systematic desensitization. References to it go back as far as 1922. People associated with a technique or a discovery are seldom the first to run across it. Rather they are the people who are best able to prove its worth and advocate for its acceptance. As Timothy Ferris wrote in Coming of Age in the Milky Way (1988), there is more to science than precedence.
During the 1980s and 1990s, imagery has developed into an extremely popular topic. The psycINFO database, PsycLIT, which is an index to psychological journal articles, lists 10,293 journal entries under imagery (December, 2000; database abstracted articles from 1967 to 2000). Many universities offer courses in the clinical use of imagery. Finally, imagery is used in extremely diverse areas of psychology. For instance, it is used in behavioural medicine for pain relief (Reeb & Bush, 1996), transpersonal psychology to help people live in the moment and transcend themselves (Gawain, 1979), and physiological psychology to study localization of brain functions (Penfield, 1963).

In summary, imagery has a history that goes back 20,000 years, probably a longer history than any other clinical tool. It has been part of some of the greatest breakthroughs in psychology, such as systematic desensitization, and it has been used to help people with very diverse psychological and physical problems. There are historical reasons for suggesting that imagery may influence PSE.

The Structure of Imagery

Imagery's Similarity to Performance Experiences

Imagery is one of the two ways in which humans can symbolically represent (external or mental) events. Linguistic representation is the other form. To think in words has a different effect on people than does thinking in images. More to the point, the way we symbolically represent events may have differing effects on our PSE. Imagery is an isomorph of an actual experience. Participants engaging in imagery see, hear, and feel themselves perform the desired behaviour. Similarly, the structure of imagery (e.g.,
receiving a flood of information in one quasi-sensory experience) is almost identical to the structure of the actual sensory experiences. In these ways, imagery of the desired behaviour is very similar to a performance experience, which is the most powerful of all forms of information affecting PSE. Conversely, language, especially English, does not look, sound, smell, or kinaesthetically feel like the perceptual experiences it is attempting to describe (with the exception of a few onomatopoeias). These differences make it impossible for the content of language to resemble sensory experiences. Theorists believe these differences may make imagery more persuasive than verbal affirmations. For instance, while Bandura believes imagery can enhance PSE (Bandura, 1989), he believes affirmations often cannot enhance it:

It should be noted that the sociocognitive benefits of a sense of personal efficacy do not arise simply from the incantation of capability. Saying something should not be confused with believing it to be so. Simply saying that one is capable is not necessarily self-convincing, especially when it contradicts preexisting firm beliefs (Bandura, 1989, p. 1179).

Because people engaging in imagery are able to experience themselves engaging in the desired behaviour, they can receive a somewhat realistic view of how successful their behaviours will be. Thus, they also learn how they can best alter their behaviour to meet their goals. The first client with whom I used imagery to enhance PSE very clearly displayed this tendency to use it to learn how to alter his behaviour to maximize performance. This person asked to imagine reading his texts without becoming physiologically aroused and having intrusive thoughts such as, "Oh my God, I don't
understand this; I don't have the intelligence to make it," etc. He stated that during the imagery exercise some of his negative thoughts and fears started to emerge. He was also able to recognize some of his own self-defeating behaviours that encouraged these intrusive thoughts and emotions. Without any prompting on my part, he chose to change his imagery. He imagined himself slowing down his rate of reading and taking more notes in the margins of his text. Through his imagery, he was able to develop strategies that allowed him to be more effective.

Imagery's Similarity to Nonenactive Experiences

Unlike modelling or performance experiences, people doing imagery exercises are encouraged to daily imagine themselves engaging in the sought after behaviours (Hughes, 1990). The frequency of these images alone can make picturing success habitual and natural.

Related to repetitiveness is control. When people's doubts are highest, they cannot be assured that they will see a positive role model. Likewise, doubts often occur because of the lack of personal mastery experiences. This lack of control, especially in modelling, can be a serious hindrance to enhancing PSE. To better explore this, one should think of PSE as having three components: magnitude, strength, and generalizability.

PSE magnitude is the level of the behaviour that people believe they can successfully perform. For instance, some people may believe they could do well in an undergraduate program but doubt that they would be able to do well within a graduate program.

---

2 Some of the details of this client have been altered for the sake of anonymity.
program. Thus, one way PASE can be enhanced is by increasing how high or how far students believe they can progress in academia.

PSE strength refers to the people's degree of certainty. It is the difference between people somewhat believing that they may be able to complete an honours thesis and believing with great certainty that completing an honours thesis would be well within their abilities. An important aspect of PSE strength is the resiliency of the belief in the face of negative experiences. Thus, a second way PASE can be enhanced is by increasing how certain students are that they can progress to a specific level academically and increasing how resilient this belief is to negative experiences like a poor grade on an exam or not understanding an assignment.

PSE generalizability refers to the extent to which a change in one specific type of PSE belief could be generalized to changes in other types of PSE. For instance, students may be helped to believe that they will be able to learn the course material in an English class. It may be of interest to know whether this belief will lead to (generalize to) their believing that they have the ability to learn the course material in any humanities course.

Persuasion (like verbal affirmations, encouragement, imagery, etc.), in general, is placed with vicarious experiences as being significantly less resilient than mastery experiences because it lacks an enactive component (Bandura, Adams, & Beyer, 1977; Schunk, 1989). Thus, although such nonenactive treatments are typically effective in increasing the magnitude of PSE (Bandura & Adams, 1977), they are believed to be less effective in increasing the strength. Using imagery as a form of persuasion, though, may
be an exception to this. Because it is so similar to actually doing the event it may enhance PSE strength while continuing to give the user enough flexibility to reach maximum levels of PSE magnitude.

**Relevant Research**

Although there is very little information on the effects of imagery on PSE in academic settings (seemingly there is only one previous study, Covalt, 1996), this topic has been studied in other areas, especially sports psychology (Woolfolk, Murphy, Gottesfeld, & Aitken, 1985; Feltz & Riessinger, 1990; Ellis, Maughan-Pritchett, & Ruddell, 1993; Martin & Hall, 1995; McKenzie & Howe, 1997) with some work having been done in health psychology (Gregerson, Roberts, & Amiri, 1996), interpersonal skills (Kazdin, 1979), phobias (Bandura & Adams, 1977), and addictions (Kominars, 1997).

In this section, I will summarize those seven studies (with the exception of Bandura and Adams' [1977] study which has been discussed at the beginning of this literature review [p. 4]), that are the best examples of research on the effects of imagery on PSE (Bandura & Adams, 1977; Kazdin, 1979; Feltz & Riessinger, 1990; Ellis et al., 1993; Martin & Hall, 1995; Covalt, 1996; Gregerson et al., 1996). These seven studies are very diverse. Some researchers asked participants to imagine concrete behaviours (Martin & Hall, 1995); others asked participants to imagine symbols of strengths and problems (Covalt, 1996). Some researchers asked their participants about their imagery experiences (Ellis et al., 1993); others did not (Kazdin, 1979). However, what they all had in common was that all used research designs that allowed the researcher to separate the effects of
imagery on PSE from other variables. In the best studies (e.g., Feltz & Riessinger, 1990), this was accomplished through two means. Many studies involved a performance component (e.g., doing math quizzes or putting golf balls), and the best studies ensured that PSE was measured after the imagery but before the performance experiences, thus the researchers could state PSE did not change because the participants gained direct information from their performances. The second element of the best studies was that the researchers limited the number of independent variables. (Kazdin, 1979; Feltz & Riessinger, 1990; and Gregerson et al., 1996 are all excellent examples of this). The more independent variables the more difficult it became to conclude that it was the imagery and not some other component enhancing PSE. In fact, there are many other excellent research studies that clearly show that interventions that include imagery as one component positively affect PSE (e.g., Neck & Manz, 1996; Reeb & Bush, 1996; Kominar, 1997; Garza & Feltz, 1998). However, the above researchers clearly stated that they could not discern what particular part of the intervention was most effective or could stand alone.

When reviewing these seven studies, three points become apparent. First, and most obviously, is the paucity of research on the effects of guided imagery on PASE and the need for that research. A second consideration that becomes apparent is that in almost half of the reviewed studies (Feltz and Riessinger, 1990; Ellis et al., 1993; Gregerson et al., 1996), the imagery intervention was brief or given only once. There is a need not only for more research on the effects of guided imagery on PASE, but, as I argue in my
discussion of the Feltz and Riessinger study, future research on the ability of guided imagery to enhance PASE should include a more intensive imagery intervention. Imagery takes time to master, improves through repetition, and may be more effective in changing entrenched beliefs if used repetitively. The third consideration is that there is a need for a study on the effects of guided imagery on PASE because past research on nonacademic areas has been predominantly positive. Of the seven best studies, the majority (viz., five studies) did find guided imagery enhanced PSE. In one study that did not have positive results (Covalt, 1996), the author suggested methodological reasons for the lack of significance. The second study that did not have positive results (Martin & Hall, 1995) is more disconcerting. This study was well designed, and the imagery was not a "one-shot" intervention that did not have time to be effective. In this study, the imagery group had increased performance, and yet PSE was not enhanced. In summary, in the review of the literature I will show that even though guided imagery has been shown to be effective in enhancing PSE in nonacademic areas there is a paucity of research on the effects of guided imagery on PASE and a similar paucity of research that uses guided imagery in a more intensive manner.

Imagery Enhancing Interpersonal Skills PSE

Two years after Bandura published his work on ophidiophobes, Alan Kazdin from Pennsylvania State University published a study on the effects of imagery elaboration on assertive behaviour and PSE. Kazdin's (1979) participants were 77 adults solicited from newspaper and television advertisements and posters offering free assertion training.
After completing a screening process to ensure that they were very unassertive, they were randomly placed in one of four groups. The first group was a covert modelling group. Participants in this group were asked to imagine standardized assertive scenes exactly as the therapists suggested them without making any changes. Each of the 35 scenes was imagined twice. Participants were asked to imagine a person engaging in assertive behaviour who was of similar age and the same sex as the participant. The second group was the elaboration group. These participants were given the same scenes to imagine. However, the second time the participants imagined the scene they were encouraged to elaborate on them. They could change the scene in any way as long as the model engaged in an assertive response. These elaborations were tape recorded, transcribed, and read to the third group. The third group was added to control for the effects of the content of the elaborations in the previous group. The participants in this group, the yoked group, were read the elaborations and were asked to imagine them. The fourth group, the scene control group was added to control for the process of elaboration. They were to imagine a scene where assertiveness would be called for, and they were encouraged to elaborate on the scene, but were not asked to imagine an assertive response by the model.

Kazdin (1979) measured assertiveness through both role play and paper and pencil formats. The paper and pencil formats included the Conflict Resolution Inventory (McFall & Lillesand, 1971), the Wolpe-Lazarus Scale (Wolpe & Lazarus, 1966), and a global self-rating of assertion.
To measure PSE magnitude, participants were asked whether they believed they could respond assertively to several situations. The participants rated their PSE strength on a Likert scale for those items on which they believed they had PSE magnitude. This rating, which is very similar to Bandura's original procedure for measuring PSE (Bandura & Adams, 1977; Bandura et al., 1977), has been used in the vast majority of studies on the effects of imagery on PSE. This method of measuring PSE will simply be called "Bandura's technique" in the remainder of this thesis.

Those groups that imagined models being assertive were more assertive after treatment than the control group. As for differences between imagery groups, those participants who elaborated on their imagery were significantly more assertive than the yoked and covert modelling groups according to the role plays and one of the paper and pencil tests. The elaboration and covert modelling groups were both significantly higher in PSE magnitude than the control group. In terms of PSE strength, after treatment, the elaboration group was significantly stronger than the yoked and control groups. The covert modelling group was not significantly different from other groups.

Changes in PSE magnitude and strength were significantly correlated with changes on both role-play and the paper and pencil assertiveness tests. Finally, after treatment the covert modelling and elaboration groups' PSE scores were similar to the scores of a sample of individuals who considered themselves to be very assertive. In contrast, both the yoked and scene control groups were lower in PSE than this validation sample. Thus, imagery did enhance PSE to levels similar to those who considered
themselves to be assertive. The fact that the covert modelling group lost some ground in PSE strength is not overly concerning. As long as the imagery is permissive, there are significant changes in PSE strength.

The strength of this study was its design. Five different groups were used to ensure that the independent variables were precisely operationalized, and by explicitly defining three different research questions, Kazdin had fewer a posteri analyses and, thus, fewer problems with statistical validity.

**Imagery Protecting PSE from Negative Experiences**

Feltz and Riessinger (1990) randomly assigned university undergraduates \( N = 120 \) to one of three experimental conditions: mastery imagery plus feedback, feedback alone, or a no-treatment control condition. The study was set up in such a way that all but the control participants very frequently received negative feedback on their performance. To counter this, the mastery imagery participants received fairly brief mastery imagery experiences.

When contacted, participants were told they would be performing two related tasks that measured strength. They were informed that the study examined the relationship between the two tasks and that the participants would be scheduled in pairs to make the test somewhat competitive. In reality, the participants always "competed" against a confederate.

Feltz and Riessinger initially wanted all participants to start with similar PSE to reduce the problem of preexisting PSE influencing athletic performance and to avoid the
problem of ceiling effects. Thus, through the following method, they attempted to bring all participants PSE down to the same low level. When the participants arrived, the confederates acted as if they were completing a background questionnaire. The participants always competed against a same sex confederate. Both participants and confederates began by filling out a PSE scale based on Bandura's technique. The confederates then took off their sweat-suits. The confederates had very athletic builds. The participants and confederates were asked if they had any injuries that might hinder their performance or any previous experiences which might help their performance. The confederates commented that they ran track and lifted weights to increase leg strength. The confederates and participants then did the first task, the cybex machine.

Regardless of performance, the confederates were always told that they lifted 225 ft. lbs., at which time the researcher would state that this was "the best (performance) the experimenter had seen any subject perform in this experiment" (p. 136). Again, regardless of actual performance, the participants were told that they had lifted 150 ft. lbs. which was "... O.K., but the subject should 'really try' on the second trial" (p. 136). The participants were told that they had lifted 150 ft. lbs. on the second trial as well. PSE was again assessed and the manipulation was considered successful as participants across all groups had lower PSE after this experience. The participants were then assigned to experimental groups. One third of the participants were given imagery instruction. The other participants were told to rest for five minutes. After this, the PSE test was given a third time.
Perhaps what is most interesting about this study is the extreme brevity of the imagery training. As alluded to above, imagery training is often done daily for weeks or months (e.g., Kendall, Hrycaiko, Martin, & Kendall, 1990). Hughes (1990) stated that for effective imagery use, the imagery should be done several times a day until the visualization is clear and fluid. Conversely, the imagery exposure in Feltz and Riessinger's experiment consisted of listening to a 5 minute audiotape of mastery-producing images and then mentally practising the technique without the tape for two trials. In the pilot of this study, the trials lasted approximately 1 minute each. No mention of the time of trials was given for the actual study.

All the participants were next asked to engage in a phantom-chair competition. In the phantom-chair exercise, the participants were requested to sit against a wall with their feet shoulder-width apart and a thigh's length from the wall. Thus, it looks as if the participants were sitting in an invisible (or phantom) chair. The participants' backs were supported by the wall, but their legs and posteriors were not supported. Only their upper leg strength stopped them from sagging to the floor. It takes considerable leg strength to maintain this position. In the imagery and feedback alone conditions, regardless of how long the participants were able to endure this position, they were always told that the "other subject" had beaten their time by 10 seconds (control participants received no feedback). Participants who had received the imagery treatment were guided through in vivo imagery by listening to their tape through headphones during the competition. After
the second trail, participants completed a final PSE questionnaire and were debriefed. Thus, PSE was assessed five times during the study.

The results of this study were very promising. PSE was measured three ways: PSE magnitude, PSE strength, and how well they thought they would perform against the competitor (comparative PSE). Those in the imagery group increased on all three levels of PSE after imagery exposure. Furthermore, their PSE levels were significantly higher than the control and feedback groups for all three types of PSE. However, their PSE levels and comparative PSE were lower after the second phantom-chair exercise compared to assessments made after the first phantom-chair exercise.

Feltz and Riessinger (1990) contend that their results should be interpreted conservatively. They argue that, although those participants who had received imagery training had significantly stronger PSE, most of the significant mean differences between groups were smaller than their respective standard deviations. When making this interpretation, it is unfortunate that Feltz and Riessinger do not consider the brevity of their intervention more seriously. Less than 10 minutes of imagery significantly increased all measured types of PSE. That such a short intervention should have any effect is impressive. Feltz and Riessinger may have hoped to have found an immediate remedy to the negative effects of detrimental cognitions. However, many writers, most notably Albert Ellis, have commented that although cognitive change is possible, it only occurs after considerable effort (Ellis, 1980).
Comparing Imagery to Verbal Persuasion

Ellis et al., (1993), in a complex study, compared the effects of positive and negative imagery and stable and ambiguous verbal persuasion on PSE, outcome judgements, persistence, and performance in a video game. PSE magnitude and strength were measured by Bandura's technique. This study had the unexpected outcome that verbal persuasion was more effective than imagery, although this may have been because the participants had difficulty doing the imagery. Nonetheless, they did conclude that imagery enhanced PSE. The participants were 90 inpatient adolescents diagnosed with major depression. They ranged in age from 13 to 17 years. Participation in this study occurred in the first week of the participants' hospitalization. In addition to recreation therapy, participants attended school and cognitive-behavioural therapy groups.

Participants were asked to play Super Mario Brothers for 5 minutes prior to the study to help them become familiar with the game. The researcher then entered the room and administered one of three imagery scenarios (success, failure, or no imagery). In the failure imagery condition, participants were guided through the process of imagining a loss in attempting to save their final man. In the imagery of a successful experience, the participants imagined a forward movement of the last man into the final and highest kingdom. Members of the no imagery group completed a leisure interest survey at that time.
Following the guided imagery session or completion of the survey, participants played the game again, this time under one of the three verbal persuasion conditions: internal/stable persuasion, ambiguous persuasion, or no persuasion. In the internal/stable group, the researcher made statements that the participants were successful because of their skills and abilities. These statements included, "You have great reaction time," "you are really skillful," and, "you have great reflexes" (p. 91). In the ambiguous persuasion condition, the researcher attributed the participants' success to unstable or external events. These statements included, "Gee, this is your lucky day," and "you got off easy there" (p. 91). In the no persuasion group the researcher either remained silent or spoke to the participant on topics unrelated to the game. Each participant played the game for 10 minutes while being exposed to one of the three verbal persuasion conditions. At the conclusion of the 10 minute period, the game scores were recorded (without comment), and the participants completed the PSE and outcome judgement questionnaires. Next, participants were given the opportunity to continue to play Super Mario Brothers without the researcher present. The amount of time that the participants continued to play was recorded and served as a measure of persistence.

Participants had difficulty evoking imagery in this study. The 60 participants who received guided imagery prior to playing the game were asked to report on their degree of success in imagining their scenarios. Only 21 reported that they had been successful in using imagery. Thirty-eight participants stated that they tried to engage in the imagery treatment but reported that they were not successful. One participant reported being
unsuccessful in using imagery and that he or she made no attempt to participate in the process.

Despite the above difficulty with the imagery, the success imagery group scored significantly higher than the failure imagery group and the no imagery group on the PSE measures. None of the remaining contrasts related to imagery were significant. The internal/stable persuasion group scored significantly higher than the ambiguous persuasion group and the no persuasion group on all dependent variables (performance, persistence, PSE, outcome judgements, and generalization).

The authors suggest that a Type II error may have been committed in their study, and that future investigations should address the problem of helping clinically depressed adolescents to successfully imagine success and failure. One difference between verbal persuasion and imagery is that imagery is under the participants' control. Depressed individuals often have difficulty imagining themselves being successful or doing well. In fact, cognitive theorists like Beck (Beck & Weishaar, 1989) base their theories of depression on this very fact. Beck's theory of the depressed person's paralysis of will being due to the belief that one lacks the ability to cope or control an event's outcome sounds very much like a definition of low PSE. Whereas the researcher had no difficulty saying, "You're a pro" (p. 91), the participants, because they were depressed, may have found it very hard to imagine being a pro. For this reason, it would have been interesting to find out if the participants who could not imagine their scenarios were disproportionately represented in the success imagery group. Finally, the criticisms I
made of Feltz and Riessinger’s (1990) study are very apropos here. Once again, the imagery used was very brief. If any population warrants a longer period of exposure to success imagery, it would be those suffering from depression.

**Studying Imagery's Mediating Factors**

Gregerson et al., (1996) studied the effects of imagery and relaxation on immune responses in the body, especially mucosal immunoglobulin A (m-IgA). M-IgA indicates a rapidly occurring immune response related to pathogens entering through the oral and nasal passages. In addition, the researchers were interested in whether the cognitive factor, "absorption" mediated between the act of imagery and the increased immune response. Absorption is a person's ability to use concentration to evoke intense physiological responses. Those individuals who have good absorption abilities may be the people best able to make use of relaxation and imagery interventions.

Although no hypotheses were formulated for these additional mediating factors, the participants also completed a daily stress, a calmness, an anxiety, a PSE, and a mindfulness (defined as creative cognitive flexibility) scale. Secondary analyses were performed to determine if these variables might also be mediators between imagery and higher m-IgA levels. PSE magnitude, strength, and generalization were measured using an adaptation of Bandura's technique.

From over 400 undergraduate volunteers, 121 students were chosen to be in this study. These 121 participants were considered to be in good health, medication free, had no major immunological illnesses, and were identified as being either high or low in
absorption ability. The participants were randomly assigned to one of three conditions: relaxation; relaxation and imagery depicting powerful, positive mucosal immune functioning; or a vigilance task control group (a group that worked at discriminating between two tones after variable intervals).

The participants, upon arriving in the morning for the study, were asked to complete a battery of tests to measure the mediating factors and then provide 2 mls. of saliva. They were then randomly assigned to one of the three interventions, each lasting approximately 1 hour. After the intervention, the participants provided another saliva sample and completed a second set of questionnaires.

In terms of mediating factors, participants in the imagery condition reported higher posttreatment PSE scores corrected for pretreatment PSE than either the relaxation or the control participants. High absorption participants receiving imagery showed a greater increase in their m-IgA levels compared to all other participants. No other mediating factor was significant. Imagery enhanced PSE, and imagery effected immune functioning with absorption and PSE mediating the effect.

This study has a special relevance to this thesis because relaxation was studied by Gregerson et al., not as a state of being but as a technique. Although the data clearly indicate that PSE is a better predictor of behaviour than arousal level, as mentioned below there is some reason to believe people who successfully use relaxation techniques will, at least to some degree, enhance their PSE.
Imagery not Affecting PSE

Martin and Hall (1995), like Feltz and Riessinger (1990) examined the ability of imagery exercises to counter the effects of negative performance feedback. Martin and Hall found that imagery enhanced motivation and performance but did not affect PSE. Their results are both promising and disturbing: promising because they indicated that imagery had a strong influence on performance, but disturbing in that they did not clearly indicate the role PSE had in enhancing motivation.

In this study, 39 participants who were complete novices to golf were randomly assigned to one of three groups: a performance imagery group, a performance plus outcome imagery group, or a no imagery control group. Each participant attended six sessions with the researcher. During the first three sessions, all participants were taught how to putt a golf ball. During the initial session, participants were asked to estimate their PSE magnitude and strength using Bandura's technique and given an introductory putting lesson. They also began their mental training programs. Performance imagery participants imagined performing a perfect stroke but were told to not imagine a golf ball. Performance plus outcome imagery participants imagined the perfect stroke and imagined the golf ball rolling across the green into the hole. The control participants were taught and asked to practice golf-related muscle stretching and strengthening exercises. At this point, the researcher explained to the participants that they were to do their imagery or physical exercises at home for at least 10 minutes each day. Participants were then offered time to practice putting before the next participant arrived. The amount of time
spent practicing was the objective measure of the dependent variable of motivation. During the next two sessions, there were 35 minutes of training and the invitation to do some practice putting alone which was always recorded.

At session four, participants were told that they had entered the performance phase of the study and that the experimenter would record the number of putts they had sunk. Participants were presented with a list of specific goals (e.g., 6 holes in one out of 20) for each set of putts. The researcher suggested to the participants that these goals were developed from performance norms from other beginner golfers. In fact, the goals were inflated standards used to convince participants that their performance fell below average. Thus, the participants were coping with the negative feedback of being told that they were not as proficient as their peers. During sessions four and five, the experimenter read out the inflated goal for the upcoming set and asked participants to strive for it. The participants then completed the PSE scale, putted 20 balls, and were given free time to practice. Again, the free time was timed as a measure of motivation. During the sixth and final session, the participants were given the goal, putted 20 times, given free time to practice, and then told to come to the researcher's office. When the participants came to the researcher's office, she asked them to complete the PSE scale again and to do the questionnaire on motivation again. Participants were then informed that the experiment was over, and the participants filled out several additional questionnaires.

Martin and Hall discovered that the participants in the performance imagery condition practised significantly longer than the other groups, and the outcome imagery
group performed better (sunk more holes in one) than the other groups. Interestingly, imagining the perfect golf stroke but not "seeing" the successful putt did not improve scores at all. In fact, participants in this group occasionally performed worse than the control group.

There was no relationship between PSE and either self-reported motivation or motivation measured through time spent practising. Martin and Hall (1995) stated that this could be a floor effect because the PSE of the participants could have initially been very low. However, an alternative explanation could be that the imagery enhanced motivation without enhancing PSE. For instance, imagining the goal may have reminded people of the importance of the goal without changing their beliefs about their abilities to reach the goal.

The Effects of Guided Imagery on PASE

Only one study has directly examined the effects of imagery on PASE. Covalt (1996) examined the effects of guided imagery on mathematics anxiety, locus of control, PASE, and mathematical performance. Her 38 undergraduate educational psychology students were placed in either a guided imagery group or a relaxation group. During the first session, all participants completed the Mathematics Anxiety Rating Scale (MARS; Suinn, 1972), the motivation scales of the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire (MSLQ; Pintrich et al., 1991), a student survey, and a mathematics pretest that Covalt derived from two Pre-Professional Skills Test (PPST) preparation books. Next, the participants met once a week for five weeks at which time
they engaged in either relaxation exercises and mathematics practice or relaxation, imagery, drawing, and mathematics practice. During the seventh week, the participants completed posttests.

Covalt (1996) had one significant result. Those participants in the imagery group scored higher at posttreatment than they had on pretreatment on one scale of the MSLQ called the Control of Learning Beliefs scale. There were no significant differences on math performance, math anxiety, or PASE. To better understand this result, it is helpful to understand the MSLQ. Covalt analyzed two of the motivation scales of the MSLQ: the Control of Learning Beliefs scale and the Self-Efficacy for Learning and Performance scale. The Control of Learning Beliefs scale Covalt describes as a measure of another type of PASE. This is not quite true; it is a locus of control scale. As Pintrich et al., (1991) explain, this scale, "...concerns the belief that outcomes are contingent on one's own effort, in contrast to external factors such as the teacher" (p. 19). In Covalt's modification of the MSLQ, this subscale includes such items as "If I try hard enough, then I will understand the mathematics material in this mathematics workshop" or more negatively, "If I don’t understand the material in this mathematics workshop, it is because I didn’t try hard enough" (p. 131). Thus, those participants who did poorly on this scale (i.e., had an external locus of control) could still have had high PASE. For instance, they may think if they did not understand the material in the workshop, it was because of poor instructors, not because they did not try hard enough.
The second MSLQ scale Covalt (1996) examined more directly asked about PASE (the Self-Efficacy for Learning and Performance scale of the MSLQ). Pintrich et al., (1991) describe the variable this scale was developed to measure as, “a self-appraisal of one’s ability to master a task” (p. 13). In Covalt’s modification of the MSLQ, this subscale includes such items as the following: “I’m certain I can understand the most difficult questions presented in this mathematics workshop” (p. 129). Participants did not significantly change on this scale pre- to posttreatment. Thus, Covalt’s intervention enhanced locus of control but not PASE.

Covalt (1996) considers some of the reasons that she did not have more significant results. Some of these reasons are quite tenable. Covalt stated that one reason that imagery did not have more positive effects was because of the type of imagery she used. The imagery used in this study involved encouraging participants to create symbols of their mathematical difficulties, their confidence and power, their skills, and the interaction of all these things together. For instance, in the second imagery session, Covalt asked the participants to imagine being a powerful gorilla, a dolphin, to evoke a memory of being confident, and then to “… allow an image to emerge that represents the feeling of power for you. It may be anything – a symbol, a person, an object, a color, an animal – anything is alright” (p. 172). The participants would then draw the symbol in crayon on white paper to help them to understand their symbol. Covalt comments that perhaps imaging symbols may not have been as effective as concrete imagery. She notes that anxiety is often dealt with using systematic desensitization which uses very concrete imagery.
A reason for the lack of change in anxiety scores had to do with Covalt’s sample. The sample should have had a high percentage of math anxious students. Covalt mentions that 28 out of 38 of her participants were preelementary education majors. According to past research elementary education students typically have disproportionate numbers of math anxious people. For some reason, her group was an exception to this norm. The participants had only moderate MARS scores at pretreatment. When answering the student survey question, “How do you feel you will perform on future mathematics tests?” only 7 of the 38 reported they believed they would do poorly. As well, in theory, most of the participants should have had a math exam in their near future. All elementary education majors at Northern Illinois University, where Covalt found her participants, were required to pass the PPST. However, only 7 of the 38 reported they were going to write the entrance exam. (It seems, unexpectedly, many participants had already taken the PPST test before participating in the study). It is hard to reduce math anxiety in people who are not presently math anxious and who do not have much math in their future.

A disappointing result in Covalt’s study was that guided imagery did not affect math performance. Covalt presents two possible reasons for this. First, the participants tried a different type of math problem in each of the five sessions in which they did math. Covalt (1996) states that the lack of improvement in math scores could have been because one session of cooperative practice was insufficient to increase mathematics skills. This seems like an unlikely explanation. In fact, Covalt follows the above statement with a comment that her goal was not to give people math skills, but to help the already skillful
do better by increasing their confidence and lowering their anxiety. The issue in Covalt’s thesis is not math skill, but use of math skills (mathematics achievement). In other words, regardless of whether they learned more skills or not, the participants should have done better if they were not panicking or losing their concentration because of intrusive negative cognitions.

The second explanation Covalt (1996) presents is more plausible. Those participants who had developed an internal locus of control may have become more persistent. However, Covalt states that her 15 minute mathematics pretest and posttest may have been too short to show any benefits of enhanced persistence. If given untimed math quizzes, the imagery participants may have scored higher at posttreatment than pretreatment because of their enhanced internal locus of control. I believe Covalt’s comments on persistence are apropos, but persistence does not just show itself in a willingness to use all available test time. Just as there was no imagery work assigned between sessions in Covalt’s study, so there were no math assignments between sessions. The math that was done during sessions was done in a group. In other words, peer pressure and Covalt were controlling persistence. In real college entrance exams, there are no teachers asking examinees if they would like to come in and do seat work. Students must have the discipline and persistence to study on their own when no one else is there to encourage them. Having an internal locus of control may well help participants believe that there will be a reward for their self-discipline. If imagery enhances math performance by enhancing persistence then Covalt would have been better off if her study included
either mathematics homework or, better still, used real academic achievement, such as the PPST scores or university grades, to measure mathematics achievement.

A third reason for the lack of significant results that Covalt did not mention was that this study, like several of the previously mentioned studies, involved using a particular imagery exercise just once. Although Covalt comments that her participants could call forth their symbol during an exam, I do not believe her procedure adequately allows participants the repetition of imagery that would make changes in self-referential beliefs more likely.

In summary, Covalt is definitely on the right path to be studying the effects of guided imagery on PASE. Admittedly, she did not get very convincing results, but she did argue convincingly that this may have been caused by methodological problems and not because of the lack of value of imagery.

Conclusions

Many studies have suggested that enhancing PASE increases academic motivation, academic achievement, cognitive skill usage, and lowers anxiety. There are three reasons to believe imagery can successfully enhance PASE. First, imagery has a long and diverse history of use. Second, imagery as a form of persuasion has many benefits by combining the control and flexibility of nonenactive treatments with the sensory and perceptual experiences of active treatments. Thirdly, previous research indicates that imagery enhances PSE in nonacademic areas. Only one study did not find this relationship. Admittedly, the one study that directly studied the effect of guided
imagery exercises on PASE did not have positive results, but there is reason to believe that with more concrete and persistent imagery use, guided imagery could prove to be a valuable tool for students.

**Imagery and Relaxation: Can They be Separated?**

If it is reasonable to believe that imagery exercises will significantly increase PASE magnitude and strength, it may be more useful in this study to not only determine whether this is an intervention that can enhance PASE, but whether it can enhance PASE better than other treatments. Although many studies have demonstrated how PASE affects academic achievement, few have studied how to increase PASE. Relaxation training may constitute a credible alternative treatment to imagery. Relaxation training has been found to increase the PSE of participants with other than academic concerns and relaxation training has enhanced the academic achievements of postsecondary students. In one instance, this result came as a surprise to the researchers. Streim and O'Brien (1981) compared the effects of differing arousal levels in imagery techniques on achievement and anxiety in math anxious students. Participants were placed in one of two treatment groups: those who imagined difficult academic situations while exaggerating their anxiety and those trained to relax while imagining difficult academic situations. On average, participants in both groups showed equivalent increases in the numerical abilities section of the Differential Aptitude Test and equivalent decreases in the Math Anxiety Rating Scale. These increases were significantly higher than changes in scores in one of the control groups, the waiting list control group. Surprisingly, the participants in the
treatment groups did not improve more than a fourth group that learned to imagine neutral scenes and trained to become attuned to bodily sensations. This last, nonspecific intervention, which simply lowered physiological measures of arousal, was not to have any therapeutic effect; it was added as an "attention-placebo control." Nevertheless, it was as effective as treatments that focussed on covert rehearsal of mathematics while changing arousal. In fact, the Math Anxiety Rating scale scores dropped by almost a third in this "control" group. One explanation that may help explain why these "control" participants dramatically improved could be that generalized lowered arousal enhanced PASE. Bandura (1977) has pointed out that people do use arousal levels to assess efficacy. Some people perceive their anxiety to be a sign that they do not have the resources needed to deal successfully with their present challenges. When anxious, these people will experience a reduction in PSE. It seems that no research has been conducted to determine how common this form of estimating PSE is, although it is central to some therapeutic techniques (e.g., Morita). If it is common, then we would expect that generalized relaxation exercises, in and of themselves, would be sufficient to enhance PASE. Thus, it would be interesting to determine if relaxation and imagery are equally good at enhancing PASE.

Streim and O'Brien's (1981) study was not designed to, and did not, determine if PASE was increased. Even if they had included a PASE scale, the population chosen would make the results difficult to generalize. In those who self-identify themselves as math anxious that with which they believe they cannot cope is their anxiety. It would be an interesting test of Bandura's theories on how people assess their efficacy to determine
if those who do not identify their academic difficulties as an inability to cope with anxiety could benefit from generalized relaxation exercises.

Comparing relaxation exercises to guided imagery is also very appealing in that it helps pinpoint the reason for the improvements in PASE after the intervention. Typically, imagery exercises begin with relaxation exercises and many clinicians and theorists believe these are crucial to improving the vividness and control of the clients' imagery (e.g., Pope, 1987). However, this creates a confound that has plagued most research on the effects of imagery on PSE because it is difficult to determine if it is the imagery or the preceding relaxation exercise that enhances PSE. In this thesis, relaxation interventions were compared to an imagery intervention that used a relaxation introduction.

Selecting the Students who will Benefit from Imagery

There may be client characteristics that would allow the clinician to predict which students will most likely benefit from these interventions. Theorists and researchers over the past thirty years have suggested that two individual differences in participants' ability to evoke images may be important: vividness and control. Some theorists have emphasized that those who easily control their images may be the best candidates for imagery work (Sheikh, Sheikh, & Moleski, 1987), others have emphasized vividness, (Lazarus, 1964), still others the interaction of the two (Start & Richardson, 1964), and some believe these factors are irrelevant to the success of imagery interventions (Gawain, 1979).

The early research results on these topics were equally confusing and contradictory. Some researchers found vividness was correlated to success in
desensitization (Jones, 1971). Others found vividness to be unrelated to therapeutic effectiveness in desensitization (Davis, McLemore, & London, 1970; McLemore, 1972). Some found the interaction between control and vividness correlated with successful performances (Start & Richardson, 1964); others did not (Jones, 1971). Over the past quarter of a century, researchers have come to some agreement, but certainly not a consensus (e.g., see Ahsen, 1986 for a contrary position), that these conflicting results may be attributable to problems with the discriminant validity of vividness and controllability measures (Moran, 1993). Tests of vividness and control are attempting to measure constructs that heavily overlap and which are interdependent. Factor analyses of controllability and vividness tests suggest that they share a great deal of variability. Moran (1993) believes that these terms cannot be conceptually or empirically distinguished. However, when tests of vividness and controllability are seen as general aptitude tests, studies using these tests have proven to be valuable. Richardson (1988) stated that research using existing tests of imagery, with all their deficiencies, have supported that voluntarily produced vivid imagery, but not vague uncontrolled imagery, assists individuals in the voluntary change of affective states, in the modification of physiological responses, and improvement of perceptual motor skills (Richardson, 1988). Thus, screening with an imagery test may be of assistance in selecting which clients will respond to imagery-based treatment to enhance PASE. In this thesis, participants in both imagery and relaxation groups will be asked to complete an imagery test to determine the effects of "imagery aptitude."
Identifying the Postsecondary Students Most in Need

In theory, using guided imagery to change PASE is an intervention that can benefit students of all aptitude levels. In practice, the research on the PASE of postsecondary students has focussed on the academically "typical" or the academically gifted student (see O'Brien, Brown, and Lent, 1989 for a listing of this research). One exception to this is O'Brien et al.,'s study of students on academic probation because of low American College Test scores. They introduce their study by stating that previous research has revealed that self-efficacy beliefs serve a compensatory function that assists moderate aptitude students in performing at levels typically achieved by high aptitude students. However, they go on to state, it is important to determine whether such beliefs can assist the less proficient student. They found that the probation students' PSE in achieving necessary academic milestones (e.g., to complete the social sciences core requirements with a C or above) correlated significantly with their first semester GPAs. No other academic scores (American College Test or high school rank) or demographic states (race, sex, age, etc.) related significantly to GPA. Thus, there is tentative support for the theory that PSE can assist those most in need. However, it may well be that those most in need will find it most difficult to change their beliefs. They have had the largest amount of prior information to suggest their poor expectations are accurate. This may be most true of the academic low achiever, the population of interest in this thesis.

It may be worth emphasizing that the participants in this thesis self-identified themselves as low achievers. In particular, I asked for participants who believed that their
self-doubts hindered them from doing well at school. The methodology of this study was such that participants could not have completed the questionnaires or participated in the imagery if they had not self-identified self-doubts that were hindering them academically. Admittedly, the participants also completed two aptitude tests (Vocabulary from the WAIS-R and Raven's Standard Progressive Matrices) and they were asked to provide their previous and current school grades. These scores tentatively confirmed that the participants were not receiving the school marks that their peers were receiving, and, very tentatively, they were not receiving the school grades one would expect given their aptitude test results. However, it was the students' belief that they were low achievers, not the results on a formal aptitude/achievement discrepancy model that determined inclusion in this study.

Aptitude/achievement discrepancy models have limited utility with postsecondary students partially because of the specialized nature of postsecondary classes. This specialization typically takes three forms. First, postsecondary students have fewer breadth requirements. For instance, math phobic English majors may excel at university despite poor scores on academic achievement tests. Second, professors do not have curriculum guidelines that require the assessment of basic academic skills. For example, a student who did poorly on the writing portion of an academic achievement test may perform well in a class given by a professor who marks only on “content.” Third, postsecondary classes may themselves be more specialized than most secondary classes. Two other reasons for the problems in the aptitude/achievement model in postsecondary schools are the lack of norms beyond grade 12 on many formal academic achievement
tests and the lack of variability between postsecondary students on aptitude tests (Thorndike & Hagen, 1977). Thus, self-identified low achieving students were chosen as the participants for this study. Partially, this was done because participants had to identify themselves as low achieving or it would have been impossible to measure their self-doubt or give interventions to change their self-doubt. More important, formal aptitude/achievement discrepancy models have serious validity problems when dealing with postsecondary students (some researchers such as Stanovich, 1991 and Siegel, 1989 would argue discrepancy models have fatal validity problems for any age group), thus, making the use of such formal models difficult to defend.

Summary

In summary, this thesis has four purposes. The first is to study whether postsecondary students self-identified as low achievers that have been given imagery exercises to do at home will have greater increases in their PASE than those who were not asked to engage in any exercises to enhance PASE or those who engage in relaxation exercises. The second purpose of this study is to determine whether self-identified low achieving postsecondary students asked to use imagery exercises have greater increases in their study skills (including effort-related activities, cognitive skill usage, and goal orientation) than those asked to use relaxation exercises or not requested to engage in exercises to enhance PASE. The third purpose is to determine if self-identified low achieving postsecondary students asked to engage in imagery exercises have greater increases in their grades than those asked to use relaxation exercises or not asked to
engage in exercises to enhance PASE. The third purpose is to determine whether participants who have an aptitude for imagery will also be best able to enhance their PASE by means of guided imagery. The three purposes will be operationalized in the following six ways:

Hypotheses

Hypothesis #1: Postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy strength scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the imagery group will be significantly larger than the postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy strength scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the comparison group and the relaxation group.

Hypothesis #2: Pre- to postexperimental changes in perceived academic self-efficacy magnitude scores in the imagery group will be significantly larger than the changes in the pre- to postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy magnitude scores in the comparison group and the relaxation group.

Hypothesis #3: Postexperimental self-reported study skills scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the imagery group will be significantly larger than the postexperimental study skill scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the comparison group and the relaxation group.

Hypothesis #4: Postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy strength scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the high aptitude imagery group will be larger than postexperimental perceived efficacy strength scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the low aptitude imagery group.
Hypothesis #5: Changes in the pre- to postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy magnitude scores in the high aptitude imagery group will be significantly larger than the pre- to postexperimental changes in the magnitude scores in the low imagery group.

Hypothesis #6: Postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy magnitude scores corrected for preexperimental scores in the relaxation group, will be significantly larger than corrected postexperimental scores in the comparison and significantly smaller than corrected postexperimental perceived academic self-efficacy magnitude scores in the imagery group.
Method

Participants

Participants were recruited from undergraduate classes at a university in a large Canadian city and from community college courses offered in a mid-sized Canadian centre of 68,000. When speaking in these classes, I asked for participants who believed that they had unrealistically negative beliefs about their academic abilities and that these beliefs resulted in their underachieving academically. The three experimental conditions (imagery, relaxation, and comparison) were randomly assigned by class.

Of the 104 participants, 25 were male and 79 were female. They ranged in age from 17 to 49 with a median age of 20.00 (M = 23.97, SD = 7.81, N = 104). Participants were primarily first year students (n = 62, 59.6%), and the majority were enrolled in colleges of arts and science (either in university or community college) (n = 77, 74.04%). These arts and science students had very diverse majors; those who had indicated their major (n = 41) came from 20 different departments. Other colleges and programs the participants enrolled in included special students (e.g., upgrading, transitional year, and special students) (n= 5, 4.81%), human service programs (e.g., law & security and social service worker) (n = 4, 3.85%), business (n = 3, 2.88%), and engineering (n = 3, 2.88%) programs. The remainder of the participants were from the "undecided" and "other" categories. The majority of participants were university students with 92 (88.5%) participants enrolled in university and 12 (11.5%) enrolled in community college.
In terms of socioeconomic status, the participants came from homes with a median income of $21,000 to $30,000 ($n = 15, 14.4\%). However, the participants had considerable diversity in their socioeconomic status. A quarter ($n = 27, 25.9\%) came from homes with an income of $20,000 or less, and 31.7\% ($n = 33$) came from homes with incomes of more than $40,000. In practical terms, this included several students who tried to fit their studies around working full-time in low paying jobs such as waitressing in bars or restaurants or working in very small family owned businesses. Two participants who spoke of having considerable problems with time management and exhaustion were single mothers with very small children. Both of these participants had low incomes that excluded the hiring of nannies or sitters. On the other end of the spectrum were people whose parents or partners had secured very high paying jobs and were paying for all of the participants’ educational and home expenses.

Of these 104 participants, 71 (68.27\%) completed the program. The relaxation group had a 40.00\% drop out rate with 27 out of 45 participants completing the program. The imagery group had a 20.69\% drop out rate with 23 out of 29 completing the program. The control group had a 30.00\% drop out rate with 21 out of 30 completing the program. There was not a significant difference between treatment groups on drop out rates ($\chi^2[2$, $N = 104] = 3.09, p = .213$). Similarly, there was no difference between those who completed the program and those who did not in terms of their socioeconomic status (K-S $Z = .284, p = 1.000$), past average ($t[94] = .91, p = .367$), or age ($t = [70.07] = -2.14, p = .036$). See Table 1 for means and standard deviations. Finally, there was no significant
difference between completers and noncompleters in terms of sex ($\chi^2[1, N = 104] = 2.09, p = .148$). Twenty-five men volunteered for the program with five dropping out; 79 women volunteered for the program with 28 dropping out. The proportion of men to women who volunteered for this project does not reflect the general student body of the schools at which they studied. In the university setting, where most of the participants were enroled, 55.80% of the full-time undergraduate students were female (Kelly, 1998). In the community college, 50.00% of the student body were female (B. Marges, personal communication, December 4, 2000). Conversely, 75.96% of those who volunteered for this project were women. This over-representation of females may better reflect the makeup of the clientele of the counselling and study skills centres in Canadian postsecondary schools where approximately 75% of the clientele are female (B. Sveinson, personal communication, December 4, 2000).

Of those who completed the program, many had taken previous workshops to help them become more effective students. For instance, 20 (28.2%) of the participants had taken a study skills workshop, 15 (21.1%) had taken a relaxation training workshop, 12 (16.9%) had taken a test taking workshop, and 5 (7.0%) had previously taken an imagery workshop.
Table 1

Comparison of Participants who Completed the Program with Drop-Outs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographics</th>
<th>Completers</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Drop-Outs</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>24.47</td>
<td>7.75</td>
<td>66*</td>
<td>21.85</td>
<td>5.72</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past average</td>
<td>73.21</td>
<td>9.78</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>74.91</td>
<td>7.93</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*71 participants completed the program. However, only 66 submitted completed Background Questionnaires. Typically, this was because older participants could not remember past averages. One exception to this was a young first year university student living with her parents who could not estimate her family's income.

bThe figures for income are based on the following scale: 1 = incomes <$10,000 annually, 2 = $10,000 to $20,000, 3 = $21,000 to $30,000, 4 = $31,000 to $40,000, 5 = > $40,000.

All the students had self-identified themselves as low achieving. No standardized achievement test scores were available to confirm this at the time of recruitment. There were some data to indicate that the university participants had aptitude scores similar to those of other university students and marks somewhat lower than their peers. Gregory
(1987) estimated that incoming university students would have IQs of approximately 113 (81%-ile). Similarly, the mean age-scaled WAIS-R Vocabulary score of the university sample was in the >75%-ile range (M = 12.39, SD = 2.21, n = 59). Their mean Raven's Standard Progressive Matrices (SPM) score was well into the grade two (>75%-ile but < 95%-ile) or "Definitely above average" range (M = 2.52, SD = .72, n = 60).

Some of the school grades the university participants achieved during their last year of academic study were lower than would be expected of students at this university. Amongst university student participants whose past program was high school, their mean grade was 79.06% (SD = 8.90, n = 24). However, at this university the entering grade average of full-time students registered in the first-year level of first-entry undergraduate programs who applied from secondary school or CEGEP was 85.3% (Kelly, 1998). Those university participants who were able to provide university grades (typically those who participated during the summer months) as their last academic program had a mean grade of 69.05% (SD = 9.08, n = 31). This university did not calculate overall first year averages. However, a researcher for the department of arts and science at this university suggested that the participants' university marks would be similar to the first year marks for previous years in his department. These first year arts and science marks typically ranged from 68.0% to 69.5% (G. Artling, personal communication, June 14, 2000).

The community college sample had a different profile. There was some information to indicate that their aptitude scores were higher than their peers, but their marks were very similar to their peers. The community college participants had a mean
WAIS-R Vocab. score in the average range ($M = 9.83$, $SD = 2.12$, $n = 12$) and Raven's Standard Progressive Matrices (SPM) score in the grade three or "intellectually average" range (>25%-ile but <75%-ile; $M = 3.36$, $SD = .50$, $n = 11$). Tentatively, this seems higher than would be expected of this population. Recently (1999), this community college had started collecting General Aptitude Test Battery (GATB) scores from its students. The first data available, from a mean of the GATB General learning, Verbal, and Numerical sections standard scores earned by their law and justice program students, indicated that the mean score would be in the slightly below average range (GATB = 87.39; L. Hage, personal communication, June 27, 2000).

The mean school grades for those community college participants whose program was high school was 70% ($SD = 6.95$, $n = 8$). These school grades were not different from the average high school grades for this college. The reported first semester grades for students enroled full-time in this college was only 69%, almost exactly the grade for these participants (M. Hubble, personal communication, September 2, 1999).

Two different counsellors met with the participants, thus controlling for the effects of meeting with a counsellor with a particular personality or manner. Both counsellors were doctoral students in applied psychology programs.
Measures

Background Questionnaire

The Background Questionnaire (Appendix A) elicited information about the participants' age, sex, academic program, past GPA, social-economic status, and whether they had ever been assessed for academic or cognitive problems.

The Learning and Study Strategies Inventory (LASSI)

Using the LASSI, the participants rated statements about their study skills. The LASSI (Weinstein, Schulte, & Palmer, 1987) is a norm-referenced, self-report questionnaire used in this study to compare the participants' responses to the normative responses of American university students. It consists of 77 statements that refer to the participants' study skills and attitudes. These skills and attitudes are divided into ten scales: a) Attitude, b) Motivation, c) Time Management, d) Anxiety, e) Concentration, f) Information Processing, g) Selecting Main Ideas, h) Support Aids, i) Self-Testing, and j) Test Taking Strategies. The participants received a percentile score for each of these categories but no overall score.

Weinstein (1987) reported in the manual that the coefficient alphas ranged from .68 to .86 with a median reliability of .81. Test-retest reliability was assessed for a three-week interval with values ranging from .72 to .85. The median test-retest reliability was .795 (Weinstein, 1987).

Studies with at-risk community college and at-risk university students show that the norms of the LASSI can be expanded to include these students as well as regular
university students (Deming, Valeri-Gold, & Idleman, 1994; Nist, Mealy, Simpson, & Kroc, 1990).

Factor analyses of this scale indicate that the LASSI measures three student factors: Effort-Related Activities, Goal Orientation, and Cognitive Activities (Olejnik & Nist, 1992). These factors were used in this study. To receive an estimate of the Effort-Related Activities factor one sums the raw scores for the Motivation, Time Management, and Concentration scales. Thus, through this factor one examines the degree participants persist even when their studies are dull or difficult, the degree they overcome procrastination, and the degree they focused as opposed to letting their minds wander when studying. The estimate of the Goal Orientation factor is the sum of the raw scores for the Anxiety, Test Strategies, and Selecting Main Ideas scales. Thus, through the Goal Orientation factor one examines the degree to which the participants have immediate, very short-term goals during an exam, lecture, or study session. It includes such statements as, “I try to identify the main points when I listen to lectures,” or more negatively, “I do poorly on tests because I find it hard to plan my work within a short period of study” (Weinstein, Palmer, & Schulte, 1987, pp. 2-3). This factor does not examine whether the participants have general goals about completing a degree or becoming qualified for an ideal job. Finally, the estimate of the Cognitive Activities factor is the sum of the raw scores for the Information Processing, Study Aids, and Self-Testing scales. Cognitive Activities is an estimate of metacognitive skill usage and includes such statements as, “I try to find relationships between what I am learning and
what I already know," and "I translate what I am studying into my own words"
(Weinstein, Palmer, & Schulte, 1987, pp. 2-3). The tenth scale, Attitude, had relatively
consistent and low loadings on all three factors. Therefore, Olejnik and Nist did not
include it in their factors, and it was not used in the main analyses for this thesis. One
reason for the use of the factor scores in this study was that the internal consistency
reliabilities for the LASSI in this study were good for the factor scores. These scores
ranged from $\alpha = .772$ for pretreatment LASSI Goal Orientation to $\alpha = .877$ for
posttreatment LASSI Goal Orientation. Conversely, the internal consistency reliabilities
for scale scores of this administration of the LASSI were extremely variable ranging from
$\alpha = .223$ for posttreatment Support Techniques to $\alpha = .902$ for posttreatment Anxiety
(see Table 2 for internal consistency reliability scores for LASSI scales and factors).

Questionnaire on Imagery Control (QIC)

The QIC (Lane, 1976) measures the participants' ability to manipulate their mental
images. For instance, in this questionnaire, respondents are asked to imagine the sound of
a thunder storm with heavy rain, wind, and thunder. Next, the participants are asked to
change the image to, "The gentle patter of rain as the storm dies down" (Lane, 1976,
p.99). The QIC contains seven different subscales, a subscale for each sense modality.

The reliability and validity that Lane (1976) reports for the QIC are good for the
total score, but considerably lower for the subtest scores. The coefficient alpha for the
total score was .85. The coefficient alphas for the subscales are as follows: Visual, .50;
Auditory, .53; Cutaneous, .46; Kinaesthetic, .57; Gustatory, .56; Olfactory, .64; and
Table 2

Internal Consistency Reliabilities for the LASSI Factor and Scale Scores (alphas)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>.812</td>
<td>.902</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude</td>
<td>.674</td>
<td>.418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentration</td>
<td>.615</td>
<td>.500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information processing</td>
<td>.818</td>
<td>.892</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>.526</td>
<td>.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-testing</td>
<td>.536</td>
<td>.826</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selecting main ideas</td>
<td>.713</td>
<td>.826</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support techniques</td>
<td>.510</td>
<td>.223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test taking strategies</td>
<td>.434</td>
<td>.644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time management</td>
<td>.859</td>
<td>.632</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Factors

| Effort-related activities          | .818         | .812          |
| Goal orientation                   | .772         | .877          |
| Cognitive activities               | .797         | .808          |

Note. N = 71 for all scales and factors both pre- and posttreatment

Feeling States, .53. Component factor analysis of modality scores yielded one factor.

Loadings ranged from .76 for the Cutaneous modality (e.g., "The feel of a scratchy wool sweater next to your skin," p. 99) to .59 for the Gustatory modality ("You are eating a rich
milk chocolate bar," p. 100). In light of the above, only the total QIC score was used in this thesis. In this study, the total QIC score internal consistency reliability was $\alpha = .77$

The QIC has moderate concurrent validity. This test has been given concurrently with two other popular tests of imagery control: the Gordon Test of Visual Imagery Control (Gordon, 1949) and the revised form of the Betts Questionnaire Upon Mental Imagery (Sheelan, 1967). The intercorrelations were all significant (QIC and Gordon .53; QIC and Betts .57; Gordon and Betts .47). Nonetheless, important differences exist between the tests. The QIC is superior to the Gordon in having scores that are more widely distributed than those on the Gordon test. The Gordon’s low ceiling provides little discrimination among normal participants who generally score near the maximum on the test (Richardson, 1972). The QIC is similar to the revised Betts in that it examines more modalities than just the visual, but whereas the QIC has an imagery control emphasis, the Betts has an imagery vividness emphasis. A copy of the QIC and Lane’s written permission for me to use, reproduce, and/or adapt the QIC can be found in Appendix B.

**Task Specific Self-Efficacy Scale (TSSE)**

An adaptation of the procedure Bandura, Adams, and Beyer’s (1977) used to estimate PSE amongst individuals with snake phobias was used to measure PASE in this study (Appendix C). To complete this scale, the respondents write out up to five different behavioural scenarios of increasing difficulty related to their self-limiting beliefs. The most difficult scenario depicts the target behaviour in which the respondents desire to engage. For instance, a person who procrastinated when assigned readings wrote as her
easiest scenario reading three pages of university text an evening. The second scenario was reading six pages an evening; the third, 12 pages; and the fourth, 20 pages. The fifth scenario was her target or desired behaviour of reading half a chapter of university text a night.

When the behavioural scenarios are completed, the respondents are asked to check those behaviours they believe that they can presently perform. For each task that they check, they are asked to rate the strength of their efficacy belief on a 100-point scale. On this scale, 10 indicates high uncertainty. Fifty indicates moderate certainty. One hundred indicates complete certitude. In the above example, the participant only checked the first (easiest) scenario. She rated this scenario a 40, i.e., she was somewhat certain that she could read three pages of university text a night. This scale provides the user with two scores. The first, PSE magnitude, is the number of behaviours with a value of 10 and above. The second, PSE strength, is the averaged number of values (Bandura, Adams, & Beyer, 1977). TSSE test-retest reliability ranges from $r = .70$ to $r = .99$ (Feltz & Riessinger, 1990). In this study, the internal consistency reliability at pretreatment for the TSSE was $\alpha = .948$. At posttreatment, the internal consistency reliability was $\alpha = .949$.

The scoring of the TSSE was slightly adapted for this study such that the magnitude and strength scores were only based on the target (or hardest) behavioural scenarios. The reasoning for this was that for academic tasks often the participant accurately believed that unless they mastered their target behaviour they would not be successful in their studies.
Raven's Standard Progressive Matrices (SPM)

The SPM is a 60-item, untimed test of reasoning ability based on figural test stimuli. The test measures the ability to form comparisons, to reason by analogy, and to organize spatial perceptions into related wholes (Sattler, 1992). Raven designed this test to be a test of eductive mental activity. Eductive mental activity involves creating new information from what is already known. In this test, respondents educe relationships (J. C. Raven, J. H. Court, & J. Raven, 1996). In the more difficult questions in the SPM, the respondents are given a series of designs with one design missing. The participants have to decide how the given designs are related to one another to decide correctly what the missing design should be.

As one of the most commonly used aptitude tests, the SPM has had extensive standardization (J. C. Raven, J. H. Court, & J. Raven, 1996). It has excellent reliability, especially in terms of item consistency. In the US standardization, the correlations between the item difficulties established separately for different ethnic groups (African-American, Anglo, Hispanic, Asian, and Navajo) ranged from .97 to 1.00. The correlations between the item difficulties established separately in the UK, US, East and West Germany, New Zealand, and Chinese standardizations ranged from .98 to 1.00. The test is robust, measuring the same thing in a wide range of cultural, socioeconomic, and ethnic groups despite the sometimes large variation in mean scores between these groups, especially differences between groups that differ in socioeconomic status.
The majority of the split-half internal consistency coefficients reported in the literature exceeded .90, having a modal value of .91 (J.C. Raven, J. H. Court, and J. Raven). The intervals between test and retest in studies of test-retest reliability range from 1 week to 3 years. Short intervals of approximately 1 week have reliabilities around .90. Longer intervals of several months have reliabilities around .80 (J.C. Raven, J. H. Court, & J. Raven, 1996).

The SPM has extremely good construct validity and acceptable concurrent and predictive validity. Factorial construct validity is the greatest strength of the SPM. For sixty years, the SPM has been considered one of the best measures of "g" or "general intellectual functioning" available. Studies with children and adults with English and non-English participants have all found high loadings in the .80s and .90s with "g" (J.C. Raven, J. H. Court, J. Raven, 1996).

Concurrent validity for the SPM is acceptable. For English-speaking children and adolescents, reliable correlations of the SPM with the Binet and Wechsler Scales typically range from .54 to .86 (J.C. Raven, J. H. Court, & J. Raven, 1996). The one concurrent validity Canadian study quoted in the manual did receive slightly higher scores. Rogers and Holmes (1987) demonstrated SPM and WISC-R correlations between .83 - .92 in a stratified sample of Canadian 7 to 11 year old children. Concurrent validity for adults is similar to slightly stronger in magnitude and pattern to those for children (e.g., Burke & Bingham, 1966, r = .85; 1969, r = .75; Sheppard et al., 1968, r = .88). In this study, the internal consistency reliability was very low (α = .185). The scores on the Raven's in this
study were clustered very close to the ceiling, and this lack of variability accounted largely for the lack of reliability found in this study for the Raven's.

**The State-Trait Anxiety Inventory - State Scale (STAI)**

The State-Trait Anxiety Inventory (Spielberger, Gorsuch, & Lushene, 1968) is the most widely used measure of anxiety having been used in thousands of studies (Chaplin, 1984). It is divided into two sections: the State scale and the Trait scale. The STAI Trait scale has difficulties with construct validity as it does not discriminate well between anxiety and general psychopathology. Conversely, the STAI State scale (called SAI or State Anxiety Inventory hereafter) has good construct validity and good internal consistency with coefficient alphas ranging from .86 to .95. In this study, the internal consistency reliability at pretreatment was \( \alpha = 0.885 \) and at posttreatment it was \( \alpha = 0.938 \). Only the SAI was used in this study. The SAI is a self-administered, 20-item scale that takes less than 5 minutes to complete.

**Imagery and Relaxation Diaries**

The Imagery Diary and Relaxation Diary are logs in which the participants were asked to record the frequency of their use of the imagery and relaxation exercises and the vividness and controllability of their imagery. There were two questions related to controllability, "How often did you find yourself imagining irrelevant or tangential material?" and "How often were you troubled by intrusive, negative images?" The participants were also given a space to jot down any concerns they might have. The diaries allowed me to determine if the relaxation and imagery groups were similar in the
frequency of their use of the interventions and if they differed in their imagery experiences. Appendix D contains a copy of the instructions and the first page of the Imagery Diary and Relaxation Diary. The Imagery Diary and Relaxation Diary are very similar. The only major difference is the examples used in the description of tangential and intrusive images. In the Imagery Diary, the examples involve academic imagery, such as imaging giving in-class presentations and doing mathematics problems. In the Relaxation Diary, the imagery examples involve imaging relaxing, safe places.

**Vocabulary subtest of the Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale-Revised (WAIS-R)**

The Vocabulary subtest of the WAIS-R is very often used as a quick test of verbal aptitude. There is strong and multifaceted support for interpreting Vocabulary in this way. Factor Analyses of the WAIS-R have indicated that this subtest contributes substantially to the Verbal Comprehension factor (Mdn loading = .83) of the WAIS-R. Vocabulary also correlated very highly with the overall Verbal subscale of the WAIS-R (r = .85) (Sattler, 1992). It is also the most reliable subtest in the WAIS-R (r = .96). Performance on the Vocabulary subtest tends to be stable over time (Sattler, 1992). In this study, the internal consistency reliability was $\alpha = .719$.

When examining many different scholastic aptitude tests in an attempt to find a good predictor of university achievement for Ontario high school students, researchers discovered that the Vocabulary subtest of the WAIS correlated much higher with first year university grades than any scholastic aptitude test used in Canada (Khan & Richard, 1971). The Vocabulary subtest actually correlates slightly higher with first year university
marks ($r = .46$) and with high school rank at graduation ($r = .65$) than did the WAIS full scale IQ ($r = .44; r = .62$ respectively) (Conry & Plant, 1965).

The Vocabulary subtest contains 35 words arranged in order of increasing difficulty. Each word is presented orally and in writing and the respondents are asked to explain aloud its meaning.

**Procedures**

**Outline of the Five Treatment Sessions**

Summaries of the elements found in each session in which the participants attended are listed in Tables 3 through 7. Initially, the participants were randomly assigned by class to one of three treatment conditions.

**Session #1.** As can be seen in Table 3, the general format of session #1 was the same for all three groups. Typically, participants met in small groups of three to five participants. During the first session, the participants were asked to read a summary of the project (Appendix E). The comparison group summary of the project differed slightly from the imagery and relaxation groups in stating that there would be three, 1 hour meetings instead of five. The imagery and relaxation summaries were introduced with the sentence, "This project is designed to explore how people can use their own imagination to help them be more successful at school." The comparison group summary was introduced with the line, "This project is designed to explore how people can be more
Table 3
Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups

Session #1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Imagery</th>
<th>Relaxation</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants read general summary of the program</td>
<td>Participants read general summary of the program</td>
<td>Participants read general summary of the program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Researcher gave the oral description and rationale of Imagery program</em></td>
<td><em>Researcher gave the oral description and rationale of Relaxation program</em></td>
<td><em>Researcher gave oral description and rationale of Comparison program</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants completed informed consent forms</td>
<td>Participants completed informed consent forms</td>
<td>Participants completed informed consent forms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants identified and behaviourally defined academic self-doubt</td>
<td>Participants identified and behaviourally defined academic self-doubt</td>
<td>Participants identified and behaviourally defined academic self-doubt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants complete pretest questionnaires including: the TSSE, the Background Questionnaire and the STAI</td>
<td>Participants complete pretest questionnaires including: the TSSE, the Background Questionnaire and the STAI</td>
<td>Participants complete pretest questionnaires including: the TSSE, the Background Questionnaire and the STAI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Bolded procedures are procedures that differ across groups. Procedures in a regular typeface are procedures completed by participants in all three groups.
successful at school.” The researcher next gave the description and rationale for the group to which the participants had been assigned (Appendix F), participants filled-out consent forms (Appendix G), identified hindering beliefs, and filled-out pretest questionnaires.

The majority of the first 1 hour session was needed for the participants to identify and operationalize the academic self-doubts that they believed were most disruptive to their education and to complete the accompanying TSSE Scale. In two of the small groups in which the participants met, two sessions were needed to do this task as opposed to the one originally planned. As can be seen in Table 4, The description and rationales of the experimental groups varied between groups.

Discussion of hindering beliefs would, at times, result in a discussion of study skills. In all three treatment groups, questions about study skills were answered openly. Thus, in all groups, participants gained useful knowledge about how to study postsecondary level material. For at least two participants (one in the relaxation group and one in the comparison group), this information about study skills had a significant impact. For example, the participant in the comparison group relied heavily on memorization. She would copy word for word very large segments of her text into her notes and then would proceed to memorize the material word for word. Suggesting she try selecting main ideas and put them into her own words shifted her emphasis to understanding the text.

Session #2. As can be seen in Table 5, in the second session the imagery and relaxation groups received a guided imagery exercise. Notice that the imagery and
Table 4
The Description and Rationale of the Programs given to Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Imagery</th>
<th>Relaxation</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Program described as five, 1 hour meetings</strong> that involve identifying hindering beliefs, learning an imagery technique, and receiving feedback on study skills and academic aptitudes</td>
<td><strong>Program described as five, 1 hour meetings</strong> that involve identifying hindering beliefs, learning a relaxation technique, and receiving feedback on study skills and academic aptitudes</td>
<td><strong>Program described as three, 1 hour meetings</strong> involve identifying hindering beliefs and receiving feedback on study skills and academic aptitudes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic self-doubt disrupts academic performance emphasized</td>
<td>Academic self-doubt disrupts academic performance by increasing anxiety emphasized</td>
<td>Academic self-doubt disrupts academic performance emphasized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The effectiveness of imagery exercises countering academics self-doubt emphasized</td>
<td>The effectiveness of relaxation exercises to counter the harmful effects (anxiety) of academic self-doubt emphasized</td>
<td>The effectiveness of concretely and specifically identifying self-doubt in determining whether academic self-doubts are reasonable or remediable emphasized</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note.** Bolded procedures are procedures that differ across groups. Procedures in a regular typeface are procedures completed by participants in all three groups.
relaxation procedures were similar, differing in only two ways. First, the relaxation technique included a passive muscle relaxation component. In this component, the participants focused their attention on major areas in their bodies (feet and calves first, then upper legs, etc.) and then loosened and relaxed the muscles in those areas. The imagery technique did not include this component, but rather it included a component where the participants were asked to imagine as convincingly as possible their successfully engaging in the academic behaviour in which they had doubts. The overlap between these two techniques was to ensure that it was not the relaxation component of the imagery exercise that was responsible for changes in the dependent variables. Also notice, that the relaxation group was encouraged to practice their technique slightly more frequently than the imagery group. Because the rationale behind the relaxation group was symptom management, it made sense to encourage these participants to use their technique during exams and presentations. Transcripts of the exercises are found in Appendix H. A relaxation tape was played in the background when the guided exercises were done. The relaxation tape used was Oriental Sunrise by Riley Lee (1982). The comparison group completed the SPM and WAIS-R Vocab. during the second session.

Sessions #3, #4, and #5. As seen in Table 6, the third session was the final meeting for the comparison group. They completed the posttest questionnaires and were debriefed. The relaxation and imagery participants, during the third session, were initially asked for information on their experiences with the imagery or relaxation techniques. If
Table 5
Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups

Session #2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Imagery</th>
<th>Relaxation</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants completed LASSI</td>
<td>Participants completed LASSI</td>
<td>Participants completed LASSI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery Procedures</td>
<td>Relaxation Procedures</td>
<td>Participants completed SPM and WAIS-R Vocab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-diaphragmatic breathing</td>
<td>-diaphragmatic breathing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-deepening (auto-suggestion)</td>
<td>-passive muscle relaxation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-creating a sanctuary</td>
<td>-deepening (autosuggestion)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-imagining the difficult behaviour</td>
<td>-creating a sanctuary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants received the Imagery</td>
<td>Participants received the Imagery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery Diary and audiotapes of the</td>
<td>Diary and audiotapes of the relaxation procedure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>imagery procedure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants encouraged to</td>
<td>Participants encouraged to practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>practice technique up to five times</td>
<td>technique up to five times a week</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a week</td>
<td>and before or during stressful events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants completed the TSSE Scale</td>
<td>Participants completed the TSSE Scale</td>
<td>Participants completed the TSSE Scale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Bolded procedures are procedures that differ across groups. Procedures in a regular typeface are procedures completed by participants in all three groups.
individuals were experiencing difficulties with these techniques, these problems would be discussed in the group. The researcher or other group members would often offer support and suggestions on how to deal with these issues. The description in Table 7 of sessions #4 and #5 is self-explanatory. In these sessions, participants completed the QIC, LASSI, STAI, and TSSE; received feedback on their study skills and academic aptitudes; and were debriefed.

**Integrity Checks**

All sessions were audio taped and a random sample of 30% of the tapes were rated by two individuals unaware of the hypotheses of the study. To be considered a valid delivery of the program, both raters had to agree that the description of the program, the explanation of the interventions, and the instructions for the standardized tests were conducted as described. To assess the audiotapes these individuals were given a checklist that contained statements or elements that were to be covered in the sessions (See Appendix I for checklists). For instance, an element from the first session for all groups was, "Ask the participants to jot down as concretely as possible the belief that is hindering them academically." In the second session, an element searched for in the relaxation and imagery groups was, "Introduce deep breathing at the beginning of the relaxation exercise." An element for all groups when introducing the SPM was, "Every page of the (SPM) test booklet has a pattern with a piece missing." The assessors were asked to check each statement that was covered in the audio taped session. To be considered valid, the session could be missing no more than one element.
There was 97.74% (130/133) agreement between assessors on their decisions whether an element was covered or not. When the assessors disagreed whether an elements was present or not, it tended to be because of stylistic differences in the presentation. For instance, one statement was, "We have to break our goals down into reasonable chunks, creating a hierarchy of goals." During one session, the counsellor stated, "We have to work up to our goals; create a hierarchy of goals." One assessor believed this was straying too much from the original statement. Over 20 sessions, the assessors searched for 133 elements that were to be included; 128 elements they agreed were clearly present on the audiotapes. Thus, 96.24% of the time the necessary elements were present. No more than one element was missing from any session.
Table 6

Session Outline for Experimental and Comparison Groups

Session #3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Imagery</th>
<th>Relaxation</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discussion of Imagery Exercises</strong></td>
<td><strong>Discussion of Relaxation Exercises</strong></td>
<td>Participants completed posttest questionnaires including: LASSI, STAI, TSSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants completed the SPM, WAIS-R Vocab., and TSSE</td>
<td>Participants completed the SPM, WAIS-R Vocab., and TSSE</td>
<td>Researcher gave participants feedback on study skills and academic aptitudes and gave suggestions on how to improve participants study skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Debriefing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Offer to teach relaxation or imagery techniques</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note.* Bolded procedures are procedures that differ across groups. Procedures in a regular typeface are procedures completed by participants in all three groups.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session #4</th>
<th>Session #5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Imagery</strong></td>
<td><strong>Relaxation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discussion of Imagery experiences</strong></td>
<td><strong>Discussion of Relaxation experiences</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants completed QIC and TSSE Scale</td>
<td>Participants completed QIC and TSSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Session #5</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants complete posttest questionnaires including: LASSI, STAI, and TSSE</td>
<td>Participants complete posttest questionnaires including: LASSI, STAI, and TSSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher gave participants feedback on study skills and academic aptitudes, and gave suggestions on how to improve participants study skills</td>
<td>Researcher gave participants feedback on study skills and academic aptitudes, and gave suggestions on how to improve participants study skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debriefing</td>
<td>Debriefing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note.** Bolded procedures are procedures that differ across groups. Procedures in regular typeface are procedures completed by participants in all three groups.
Results

Comparison of Pretreatment Scores

Five separate univariate ANOVAs were conducted on pretreatment scores to determine if the treatment groups differed significantly on the dependent variables before treatment. No correction for alpha slippage was made in this instance to ensure that no pretreatment differences remained undetected. As detailed below, two significant differences were found. For the dependent variables that had significant between treatment differences, Bonferroni pairwise comparisons were conducted to identify which treatment groups differed significantly from the others. The pretreatment scores can be seen in Tables 8 through 15.

There were no significant pretreatment differences between treatment groups on two LASSI factors (cognitive activities $F\left[2, 70\right] = 0.27, p = .765$; effort-related activities $F\left[2, 70\right] = 0.570, p = .568$). However, significant differences were found between treatment groups on pretreatment TSSE strength scores ($F\left[2, 70\right] = 4.08, p = .021$) and on LASSI goal orientation scores ($F\left[2, 70\right] = 3.55, p = .034$). On the pretreatment TSSE strength scores, a significant difference existed between the imagery group and the comparison group (See Table 8 for mean TSSE scores by treatment groups), and with pretreatment LASSI goal orientation scores, a significant difference existed between the imagery group and the comparison group (See Table 10 for mean LASSI goal orientation scores by treatment group). In addition to the univariate ANOVAs discussed in the
previous sentences, a Pearson chi-square was conducted on the dichotomous pretreatment TSSE magnitude scores. No significant pretreatment differences existed on this variable ($\chi^2[2, N = 71] = 4.42, p = .110$). To summarize, the treatment groups were similar at pretreatment. Out of six dependent measures, treatment groups at pretreatment differed on two dependent variables: TSSE strength and LASSI goal orientation. In any case, these pretreatment differences were taken into account somewhat in the analyses performed to test for treatment effects. In those analyses posttest scores were corrected by pretest scores.

Two other analyses were conducted to rule out pretreatment differences. A t-test was conducted to determine if the participants, when divided into two groups according to imagery aptitude, differed on TSSE strength. A Pearson chi-square was conducted to determine if imagery ability groups differed in TSSE magnitude. No significant differences were found (TSSE strength $t[46] = 0.40, p = .692$; TSSE magnitude $\chi^2[1, N = 48] = 0.36, p = .551$).

The Effects of the Treatments on TSSE Strength and LASSI Factors

A multivariate repeated measures design ($1 \times 4$; treatment $\times 3$ LASSI factor scores and the TSSE strength scores repeating pre- to posttreatment) was used to determine if there were any significant pretreatment-corrected posttreatment score differences among the treatment groups. Pillai's Trace was used as the test statistic. Once it had been determined that there were significant multivariate differences, univariate analyses of variances (ANOVPAs) were computed to identify the dependent variables for which there
were significant treatment effects. For the dependent variables for which there were significant between treatment differences, Helmert contrasts were used to identify the treatment groups that differed significantly from the others. The t tests used in the Helmert contrasts were all one-tailed.

Significant multivariate differences existed between treatment groups (F[8, 132] = .343, p = .001; eta square = .171). Treatment groups differed in mean TSSE strength (F[2, 68] = 12.08, p < .001; eta square = .262) with the imagery group having significantly higher pretreatment-corrected posttreatment scores than had the relaxation group on TSSE strength (t[5.25] = 2.42, p = .009). The comparison group had significantly lower pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE strength scores than the combined TSSE strength scores of the two treatment groups (i.e., imagery and relaxation groups) (t[4.81] = -4.38, p < .001) (see Table 8 for mean TSSE strength scores by treatment group). The treatment groups did not differ significantly on pretreatment-corrected posttreatment effort-related activities (F[2,68] = 0.05, p = .945; eta square = .001) goal orientation (F[2, 68] = 0.64, p = .528; eta square = .019) or cognitive activities (F[2, 68] = 0.33, p = .718; eta square = .009) (see Tables 9, 10 and 11 for mean LASSI effort-related activities, goal orientation, and cognitive activities scores by treatment group.)
Table 8
Mean Task Specific Self-Efficacy Strength Scores by Treatment Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td>16.09</td>
<td>22.31</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>29.63</td>
<td>25.76</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>37.14</td>
<td>26.53</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9
Mean Learning and Studies Strategies Inventory—Effort-Related Factor Scores by Treatment Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td>80.13</td>
<td>13.44</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>75.07</td>
<td>19.85</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>75.62</td>
<td>19.38</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 10

**Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Goal Orientation Factor Scores**

by Treatment Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>70.57</td>
<td>12.07</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>61.07</td>
<td>10.47</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>65.57</td>
<td>15.30</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11

**Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Cognitive Activities Factor Scores**

by Treatment Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>68.78</td>
<td>11.91</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>70.85</td>
<td>14.89</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>71.57</td>
<td>12.07</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Effects of the Treatments on TSSE Magnitude

In addition to TSSE strength and LASSI factors, I was interested in whether TSSE magnitude was affected by the treatments. However, it could not be included in the initial repeated-measures design. TSSE magnitude is dichotomous; the repeated-measures analysis can only be used with continuous variables. Therefore, a Pearson chi-square test was used to determine if treatment groups differed in terms of changes in TSSE magnitude. Repeated t tests were used to determine which groups differed significantly from each other.

Bandura (Bandura & Adams, 1977; Bandura, Adams, & Beyer, 1977) originally set the cutoff for TSSE magnitude at scores greater than 10. If participants achieved a score greater than 10 on the TSSE scale, they were believed to have achieved PSE magnitude (i.e., they believed they could cope with the task). If they rated themselves as 10 or lower, they were believed not to possess PSE magnitude (i.e., they did not believe they could cope with the task). In this study, the TSSE cutoff score was set at 20 rather than 10 to avoid ceiling effects. Several participants began the study with TSSE scores above 10, thus making it impossible for them to gain magnitude during the course of the study. This increase in the cutoff point was not considered a meaningful theoretical change in the analyses: At both scores of 10 or 20, the participants were rating themselves as barely believing they could cope with their academic tasks. However, an analysis based on Bandura's original cutoff score of 10 was also computed and can be found in Appendix J.
As detailed there, the results were similar to the results obtained using the higher cutoff point.

Increases in the magnitude of the participants' TSSE scores differed according to treatment group ($\chi^2[2, N = 71] = 13.79, p = .001; \eta = .441$), with the increases in the magnitude of the imagery group participants being significantly higher than increases in the TSSE magnitude scores of the comparison group ($t[30.46] = 4.47, p < .001$). In the imagery group, only 30.43% began the study with PASE magnitude. At the end of the study, 82.61% achieved PASE magnitude. Conversely, 61.9% of the participants in the comparison group started already having PASE magnitude. By the end of the study, only the same 61.90% of participants had achieved PASE magnitude. The relaxation group magnitude change scores were significantly higher than those of the comparison group ($t[38.14] = 2.75, p = .005$). In the relaxation group, 48.15% started the program with PASE magnitude. By the end of the program, 74.07% had achieved PASE magnitude (see Table 12 for group percentages).

**The Effects of Imagery Ability on TSSE.**

The effects of the participants' imagery ability on pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE strength scores and changes in TSSE magnitude were analyzed by splitting the relaxation and imagery participants into high and low imagery ability groups. The mean Lane's QIC score was 111.13 ($SD = 14.41, N = 48$). Those participants above 111.13 were placed in the high imagery group; those below were placed in the low imagery group. Once the two groups had been created, a two-way ANCOVA was used to
Table 12

Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude
by Treatment Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td>30.43%</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>48.15%</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>61.90%</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

determine if there was a treatment by imagery ability interaction and whether the imagery ability groups differed on TSSE strength pretreatment-corrected posttreatment scores. A Pearson chi-square test was used to determine if imagery ability groups differed on TSSE magnitude.

There was no significant interaction between treatment groups and imagery ability for TSSE strength \( (F[1, 46] = 1.80, p = .187; \text{eta square} = .042) \). Furthermore, the high-imagery-ability groups did not have significantly higher TSSE strength pretreatment-corrected posttreatment scores \( (F[1, 46] = .72, p = .401; \text{eta square} = .019) \). However, the high imagery ability group experienced greater gains in TSSE magnitude \( (\chi^2 [1, N = 48] = 4.15, p = .042; \text{eta} = .294) \). See Tables 13 and 14 for mean TSSE strength scores and the percentage of participants who achieved TSSE magnitude by imagery ability.
Table 13

**Task Specific Self-Efficacy Strength Scores by Imagery Ability**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ability</th>
<th>Pretreatment M</th>
<th>Pretreatment SD</th>
<th>Pretreatment n</th>
<th>Posttreatment M</th>
<th>Posttreatment SD</th>
<th>Posttreatment n</th>
<th>Change M</th>
<th>Change SD</th>
<th>Change n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Ability</td>
<td>21.25</td>
<td>24.73</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>57.79</td>
<td>26.79</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>36.54</td>
<td>33.73</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Ability</td>
<td>24.17</td>
<td>25.99</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>51.54</td>
<td>31.29</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>27.38</td>
<td>26.63</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The imagery ability of the comparison group was not assessed.

Table 14

**Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Imagery Ability**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ability</th>
<th>Pretreatment %</th>
<th>Prettreatment n</th>
<th>Posttreatment %</th>
<th>Prettreatment n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Ability</td>
<td>33.33%</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>83.33%</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Ability</td>
<td>41.67%</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>70.83%</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The imagery ability of the comparison group was not assessed.

Subsidiary Analyses

**Counsellor effects.** Four subsidiary analyses were conducted. In the first analysis, the participants were split into two groups according to the counsellor who provided the intervention. A Pearson chi-square test was used to determine if counsellor groups differed on TSSE magnitude. A multivariate repeated measures design (1 x 4; counsellor
x 3 LASSI factor scores and the TSSE strength score repeating pre- to posttreatment was used to determine if the two groups varied in their LASSI study skills or TSSE strength pretreatment-corrected posttreatment scores. Pillai's Trace was used as a test statistic.

There were no significant differences in TSSE magnitude ($\chi^2[1, N = 71] = .657, p = .417; \text{eta} = .096$), TSSE Strength, or LASSI factors ($F[4, 66] = .635, p = .667; \text{eta square} = .040$) between participants who received the intervention from different counsellors. See Tables 15 through 19 for means, percentages, and standard deviations. Note, however, that the groups seen by the two counsellors had unequal sample sizes. Thus, more exploration of counsellor effects in future studies could conceivably reveal differences despite the nonsignificant finding in this thesis.

Table 15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counsellor</th>
<th>Pretreatment M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Posttreatment M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Change M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 1</td>
<td>28.75</td>
<td>25.79</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>51.02</td>
<td>28.96</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>22.09</td>
<td>29.73</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 2</td>
<td>15.71</td>
<td>26.99</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>54.27</td>
<td>36.90</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>38.57</td>
<td>31.32</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 16

Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Effort-Related Activities Factor Scores by Counsellor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counsellor</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 1</td>
<td>77.77</td>
<td>17.37</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 2</td>
<td>68.71</td>
<td>20.69</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 17

Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Goal Orientation Factor Scores by Counsellor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counsellor</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 1</td>
<td>65.47</td>
<td>13.01</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 2</td>
<td>65.57</td>
<td>14.06</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 18

Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Cognitive Activities Factor Scores by Counsellor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counsellor</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 1</td>
<td>69.95</td>
<td>12.96</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 2</td>
<td>74.29</td>
<td>13.21</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 19

Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Counsellor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counsellor</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 1</td>
<td>48.44%</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counsellor 2</td>
<td>28.57%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Effects of the sex of the participants.** There was a disproportionate number of women in the sample used for this study. To ensure this did not effect the results by the treatments having a different effect on men and women, two subsidiary analyses were
conducted. In the first analysis, a Pearson chi-square test was used to determine if men and women differed on TSSE magnitude. In the second, a multivariate repeated measures design (2 x 4; sex and treatment x 3 LASSI factor scores and the TSSE strength score repeating pre- to posttreatment) was used to determine if men and women varied in their LASSI study skills or TSSE strength pretreatment-corrected posttreatment scores. Pillai's Trace was used as a test statistic. Men and women did not significantly differ in terms of their change in TSSE magnitude ($\chi^2[1, N = 71] = .333, p = .564; \text{eta} = .069$). There was no significant sex by treatment interaction ($F[8, 124] = .066, p = .834; \text{eta square} = .033$), and there was no significant difference between men and women's pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE Strength and LASSI factor scores ($F[4, 69] = .040, p = .642; \text{eta square} = .040$). See Tables 20 through 25 for means, percentages, and standard deviations.

Table 20

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>32.5</td>
<td>28.95</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>25.86</td>
<td>24.94</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21

Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Effort-Related Activities Factor Scores by Sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Pretreatment M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Posttreatment M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Change M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>74.90</td>
<td>15.40</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>75.9</td>
<td>19.45</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>11.77</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>77.02</td>
<td>18.34</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>81.48</td>
<td>19.86</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>4.46</td>
<td>9.34</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 22

Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Goal Orientation Factor Scores by Sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Pretreatment M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Posttreatment M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Change M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>67.95</td>
<td>10.53</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>70.05</td>
<td>14.82</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>10.33</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>64.34</td>
<td>13.93</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>69.58</td>
<td>14.89</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>5.24</td>
<td>11.36</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 23

**Mean Learning and Study Strategies Inventory—Cognitive Activities Factor Scores by Sex**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>71.40</td>
<td>12.07</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>69.88</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 24

**Percentage of Participants who Achieved Task Specific Self-Efficacy Magnitude by Sex**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>55.00%</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>43.14%</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Imagery diaries.** The second subsidiary analysis was conducted on the data from the imagery diaries. A t-test was carried out to determine if the imagery and relaxation groups differed in terms of how frequently the participants performed their respective
exercises. Three $t$ tests were executed to determine whether the relaxation and imagery groups differed in the number of irrelevant images they experienced, the negative, intrusive images they experienced, or whether they differed in the vividness of their imagery. These $t$ tests were two-tailed because no hypotheses had been formulated to suggest a predicted outcome. Because the analyses were not hypotheses driven and there was a repeating of tests, the probability level was set at .013 (.05 divided by the number of $t$ tests).

There were 31 diaries returned: 17 out of 23 from the imagery participants and 14 out of 27 from the relaxation participants. The treatment groups did not differ significantly in the number of times they performed their respective (imagery or relaxation) exercises during the course of the program ($t[29] = 1.89, p = .069$). The imagery participants, on average, used their technique 16.88 times ($SD = 6.19, n = 17$); on average, the relaxation participants used their technique 12.64 times ($SD = 6.25, n = 14$).

When asked to rate their imagery experiences on a seven-point Likert scale (with higher numbers associated with more positive experiences), participants occasionally found themselves imagining irrelevant or tangential material ($M = 4.69, SD = 1.60, N = 468$), occasionally found themselves troubled by intrusive negative images ($M = 5.25, SD = 1.47, N = 468$), and had somewhat vivid images ($M = 5.11, SD = 1.43, N = 461$). The individual group means and standard deviations on these three imagery experience variables are found in Table 20. There were no significant differences between treatment
groups in irrelevant images ($t[466] = -0.84, p = 0.399$), negative images ($t[350.49] = -0.79, p = 0.428$), or vividness ($t[410.45] = 1.96, p = 0.051$).

The effects of the treatments on state anxiety. In the third subsidiary analysis, a one-way ANCOVA was used to determine if the treatment groups differed significantly on the SAI. Because of the problem of probability pyramiding in posthoc analyses, the more conservative Bonferroni pairwise-comparison technique was used to analyze between treatment group differences on the SAI (Lomax, 1992).

Table 25

**Mean Imagery Experience Ratings by Treatment Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Irrelevant</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Vividness</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td>4.64</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>283</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.20</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>282</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>4.73</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>178</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>178</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Scores could range from 1 through 7.

Pretreatment-corrected posttreatment SAI scores did differ according to treatment group ($F[2, 63] = 5.92, p = .004$; eta square = .155), with the imagery group experiencing significantly greater reductions in their anxiety than the comparison group. The relaxation
group was not significantly different from the other groups (see Table 26 for the mean state anxiety scores by treatment group).

**Alternative Analyses**

The initial repeated-measures design is one of several possible ways of dealing with the omnibus test. Although I believe this is the best analysis of the current data, four alternative analyses were also computed. First, I reanalyzed treatment group differences using Bandura's original cutoff point of TSSE 10. Although this allows for a better comparison to some of Bandura's original research, it also allows for more problems with ceiling effects. Second, rather than using the 3 LASSI factors and TSSE strength, I

Table 26

**Mean State Anxiety Scores by Treatment Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td>57.65</td>
<td>7.82</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>56.13</td>
<td>10.47</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>53.75</td>
<td>8.08</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

conducted a repeated measures analysis using all 10 LASSI scales and TSSE strength as dependent variables. Although this may have given some additional information, it
certainly was not a parsimonious analysis. Two additional analyses based on gain scores were conducted (one employing the 10 LASSI scales and TSSE strength and one based on the three LASSI factors and TSSE strength). These one-way MANOVAs (i.e., $1 \times 11$, treatment x 10 posttreatment minus pretreatment LASSI scores and posttreatment minus pretreatment TSSE strength scores) allowed for more numerous pairwise comparisons but also posed a higher risk of violating the assumptions of normality and did not deal adequately with pretreatment differences. The results of these analyses can be found in Appendices J, K, and L. Also in Appendix L are analyses based on the gain scores of the effects of imagery ability on TSSE strength.

As detailed in these appendices, the alternative analyses for TSSE magnitude, LASSI factors and LASSI scales scores and imagery ability resulted in results identical to those obtained using the analyses from the main body of this thesis.

**Summary of Findings**

To review some of the most notable findings that will be addressed in the Discussion section, the imagery group participants achieved significantly higher pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE strength scores than the relaxation-group participants. The comparison group had significantly lower pretest-corrected posttreatment TSSE strength scores than the combined TSSE strength scores of the imagery and relaxation group. The imagery group also had significantly higher pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE magnitude scores and significantly lower pretreatment-corrected posttreatment SAI scores than the comparison group. High-
imagery-ability participants experienced greater gains in TSSE magnitude than their low imagery aptitude peers.
Discussion

In general, using guided imagery exercises assisted self-identified low achieving students and was of more assistance than using relaxation exercises alone. After treatment, the imagery participants in this study had higher PASE strength and had less generalized anxiety than the comparison group participants. The imagery participants also had significantly greater changes in PASE magnitude than did the comparison group. In addition, after treatment, imagery participants had significantly higher PASE strength than the relaxation participants. The relaxation participants did not do significantly better than the comparison group participants in terms of PASE magnitude, and, occasionally, the relaxation participants' scores were significantly lower than the imagery group participants. Finally, I found only tentative support that the participants' imagery ability was related to whether they benefitted from the guided imagery exercises. The high imagery ability participants had significantly higher PASE magnitude, but they did not have significantly higher pretreatment-corrected posttreatment PASE strength than the low imagery ability participants. These, and related results, are discussed in detail below.

The Effects of Imagery Exercises on PASE

Significantly more imagery participants went from not believing to believing that they would reach their academic goals (i.e., PASE magnitude) than did participants in the comparison group. At posttreatment, the guided-imagery participants also had more confidence in these positive beliefs (i.e., PASE strength) than either the comparison or the
relaxation participants. From these results, one can strongly endorse the use of imagery exercises to enhance the PASE of self-identified low achieving postsecondary students. These results extend previous research on guided imagery. In addition to all its previous uses, from enhancing sports performance (Martin & Hall, 1995) to increasing immune functioning (Achterberg, 1985), there is now initial evidence that guided imagery can also successfully be used to enhance the PASE of some students.

**The Effects of Relaxation Exercises on PASE**

These results give less support for the use of relaxation techniques to enhance PASE. I will argue below that, at best, relaxation techniques helped participants believe they could achieve their academic goals, but that relaxation participants did not have much faith in these beliefs.

The relaxation and imagery groups did not significantly differ from each other in PASE magnitude. In fact, had I used a more forgiving statistical test (i.e., not used a Bonferroni correction for alpha slippage) the relaxation group, like the imagery group, would have been found to have significantly higher PASE magnitude than the comparison group. In other words, using this more forgiving analysis, the imagery and relaxation techniques would have been considered to be equally effective in enhancing PASE magnitude. However, the relaxation-group participants clearly did not do as well as their imagery peers in terms of PASE strength, and this lack of confidence in their beliefs could result in any change in PASE magnitude being quickly reversed. As mentioned in the introduction, PASE strength is related to resiliency. Self-identified low achieving
students would (and did) occasionally receive negative feedback on their academic performance, and, thus, the resiliency of their beliefs in the face of bad news is important. Therefore, although somewhat useful, relaxation techniques would not be the technique of choice for most self-identified low achieving postsecondary students wanting to enhance their perceived efficacy.

Bandura (1995) has mentioned that people make assumptions about their PSE partially on the basis of their physiological arousal. For instance, when anxious, people may question their ability to cope. On the surface, the relatively good performance of the relaxation participants on PASE magnitude seems to provide the basis for my assertion that physiological arousal may have a small effect on PASE, but this would be unfounded. Counterintuitively, after treatment the relaxation participants did not self-report being more relaxed than the imagery group participants. In terms of the participants' general anxiety (see SAI scores) and academic anxiety (see LASSI Anxiety scale in alternative analyses), the imagery and relaxation groups were equally relaxed at posttreatment. Because there is not a clear comparison in the design between a more and a less relaxed group, and because some (i.e., those preferring the greater protection against alpha slippage) would argue that the relaxation participants did not significantly differ from the comparison participants on PASE magnitude, these results cannot be used to either support or contradict Bandura's assertion that people use physical states to assess their PSE.
The Effects of Imagery and Relaxation Exercises on Study Skills

The treatment groups did not significantly differ from each other in their study skills. Although participants did improve on their study skills, and typically the imagery group improved more than the other treatment groups, these changes were modest (3 to 6 raw scale points on scales where the maximum possible scores were 40 or less). This lack of significant results was somewhat surprising. There is no research on the effects of imagery on academic effort, but, as noted in the introduction, there is research that indicates that enhanced PASE increases effort (e.g., Schunk's 1981, 1983 studies on children and long division). Nonetheless, in this thesis, the group with the best PASE had only marginally higher effort scores.

In the literature, there is less support for the dependent variables of cognitive factors and goal orientation. As mentioned in the Method section, these last two dependent variables measure aspects of metacognitive skill usage. There is no previous research on metacognitive skill usage and guided imagery. Thus, the use of imagery to enhance metacognitive skill usage is not supported. To speculate, one reason for this could be that metacognitive skills are better understood in terms of two variables: knowledge of metacognitive skills and use of metacognitive skills. There is anecdotal evidence to suggest that imagery did enhance the knowledge of metacognitive strategies of the participants. The client mentioned in the Introduction of this thesis (p.16) is a good example of this. This person decided to imagine reading his texts without becoming anxious and having negative intrusive thoughts about his abilities to succeed at school.
During the imagery exercise, he was able to recognize some of his own self-defeating behaviours that encouraged these intrusive thoughts and emotions. Without any prompting, he chose to imagine himself reducing his rate of reading and taking more notes in the margins of his text. In other words, through his imagery, he was able to develop metacognitive strategies that (if actually used) would allow him to be more effective. If imagery enhanced knowledge of metacognitive skills but not skill usage, there are two reasons why this would have probably gone undetected in this study. First, the study skills questionnaire used in this study, the LASSI, allowed researchers to measure skill usage not skill knowledge. Second, even if the LASSI included questions related to skill knowledge, there are reasons to believe that the participants in this study already had good knowledge of metacognitive skills, thus causing a ceiling effect. First, 28.2% of the participants had previously taken a study skills workshop, and, second, all participants had at pretreatment completed the LASSI which refers extensively to metacognitive skills. Despite the above and similar anecdotes, the speculation that imagery can increase the knowledge of metacognitive skills seems counter intuitive. If participants in this study had good knowledge of metacognitive skills, then there was a dramatic difference between knowledge and use of metacognitive skills, because the individual posttreatment LASSI scores that make up the cognitive factors variable were not close to ceiling (see alternative analysis). A dramatic difference between knowledge and practice may seem odd, but, in fact, probably existed. Many participants commented that there were large differences between what they knew about studying and their actual
practices. One participant in the relaxation group, in particular, after I gave her in-depth feedback on her posttreatment LASSI, gave me an unimpressed glance and stated she knew how to study; it was using what she knew that was difficult. In summary, the use of imagery and relaxation techniques did not enhance the use of metacognitive strategies. However, there is anecdotal evidence to suggest that imagery techniques may have affected knowledge of metacognitive strategies but not use of metacognitive strategies.

The lack of significant differences between groups on cognitive factors and goal orientation in this thesis does throw into question previous research that tentatively documented the ability of PASE to enhance metacognitive skills usage. In particular, the questions on the LASSI cognitive factors scales tap into the same sort of metacognitive skills that Pintrich and DeGroot (1990) measured in their Cognitive Strategies scale. Pintrich and DeGroot found that the students who had higher PASE and believed their studies had intrinsic value used more metacognitive techniques. Yet, in this thesis, the group with the highest PASE did not differ significantly from the comparison and relaxation group on a factor that included such metacognitive items as "I try to find relationships between what I am learning and what I already know," and "I translate what I am studying into my own words" (Weinstein, Palmer, & Schulte, 1987, pp. 2-3).

Neither Pintrich and DeGroot’s study nor this thesis used designs that can be used to demonstrate the path of causality. For instance, in Pintrich and DeGroot’s (1990) study, it is possible that believing in the intrinsic value of a topic, not PASE, encourages metacognitive skill usage. Unlike this thesis, Pintrich and DeGroot’s study did not contain
any intervention, thus, making comments about causation is even more difficult in their study. In the case of their study, it also could be that if there is a causative effect, it is in the opposite direction, namely, those people who use more metacognitive techniques are more likely to have faith in their abilities. In the face of these ambiguities, the effect of PASE to enhance metacognitive skill usage has not been supported.

**The Effects of Imagery Ability on PASE**

The participants' ability to evoke controllable and vivid imagery did have a small effect on PASE. More participants with high imagery ability enhanced PASE magnitude than did participants with low imagery ability, but imagery ability groups did not differ in pretreatment-corrected posttreatment PASE strength. Although the group scores were ordered in the expected direction in terms of PASE strength, both imagery ability groups showed good gains. Superior imagery ability may not be a substantial benefit to students who want to use imagery to enhance their PASE.

To speculate, one possible reason for the lack of significant differences between imagery ability groups in PASE strength could be in the type of imagery used and the type of change desired in this study. It seems that using concrete imagery (i.e., imagining actual future events or difficult situations) as a strategy to allow participants to consciously change their attitudes and beliefs (e.g., PASE) does not require great imagery ability. Conversely, previous research (see Miller & Bower, 1993 summarized below) indicates that superior imagery ability may be needed when using symbolic or metaphorical imagery (e.g., imagining inner-guides or using hypnotic suggestions) to
change more automatic, less consciously controlled, mental events (e.g., perceived pain or cravings). Presently, difficulties exist in determining whether it is the technique (i.e., concrete or symbolic imagery) or the object of change (i.e., conscious or nonconscious) that demands the high imagery ability, because there is always a pairing of technique and goal in the successful interventions: symbolic with nonconscious and concrete with conscious. The converse is also true. Imagery as symbol or suggestion seems to be ineffective in changing conscious beliefs, and imagery as cognitive strategy may be ineffective in attempting to change automatic, nonconscious events. For example, the consciously chosen, concrete images used in this thesis did result in a change in PASE and anxiety. However, Covalt (1996) was unsuccessful in enhancing PAUSE or lowering anxiety when she asked her participants to imagine symbols and inner-guides. Miller and Bower (1993) found the opposite results when trying to reduce perceived pain: suggestion was more effective than imagery as a coping strategy. These researchers compared stress inoculation (i.e., consciously using distraction and positive thinking to avoid pain) and hypnotic suggestion among high and low hypnotizable participants. They noted that among the high ability participants, the hypnotic suggestions were more effective than the stress inoculation in controlling pain even though, when using suggestion, the participants did not deliberately adopt strategies for coping with pain. In other words, they did not perceive their suggestions as a form of distraction or a form of attitude readjustment, they were simply given the suggestion that their arms would feel as if they were blocks of wood or stone and the perception of pain diminished. In fact, in the pain control literature
there is a well-established positive correlation between hypnotic ability and psychologically induced pain analgesia (e.g., \( r^2 = .50 \) in Hilgard & Hilgard, 1975). In summary, the type of imagery used in this thesis is concrete imagery to consciously change self-referential beliefs. Such imagery does not seem to require superior imagery ability. Therefore, any student who can understand the procedures and use them could benefit to some degree from this intervention.

**The Effect of Guided Imagery on Generalized Anxiety**

Imagery participants had lower overall pretreatment-corrected posttreatment anxiety than did participants in the comparison group. This is an interesting finding because the strength of both the concept of PASE and this particular imagery procedure is their specificity: Both focus exclusively on academics. It is not obvious that trying to enhance academic confidence (PASE) via imagery would in general make people more relaxed (i.e., they might continue to be worried over interpersonal difficulties, financial difficulties, etc.), and yet PASE and overall anxiety were related. To speculate, perhaps the reason that PASE is related to generalized anxiety is because beliefs about academic abilities are such an important part of students' self-concepts. Perhaps students find it impossible not to have confidence in their academic abilities and still feel calm.

Examining how a specific confidence (PASE) is related to generalized anxiety involves considering specificity in the opposite way as was done by early researchers who believed that if, in general, students had better self-concepts (i.e., thought better about their bodies, their friends, their families, etc.) then they would improve in academic specific domains
(e.g., academic grades, academic anxiety, etc.). However, the results from research studying the value of attempting to enhance overall self-concepts in students were contradictory at best (See Dupont, 1986; Hansford & Hattie, 1982; and Lalonde, 1979 for comments on the contradictory nature of this research). The results from this study indicate that the above researchers may have had things backwards. Educators should help their students have more confidence in their academics. By doing so, educators will, in general, be helping to create calmer, more relaxed people.

As an area for future research, it would be very interesting to find out if the relationship between PASE and overall anxiety generalizes to younger students. Primary and secondary teachers are often called on to be life skills coaches, counsellors, and moral supports to the nonacademic parts of their students' lives. The public may get more benefit from educators if they asked teachers to focus more narrowly, and to focus more closely on what they know best: academics. However, this finding that enhancing PASE in general lowers participants anxiety is a result that may not generalize well. It could well be that postsecondary students' understanding of their value is based more on their success in school than is true of the typical primary or secondary student.

**Threats to Research Validity**

**Issues in statistical conclusion validity.** Statistical conclusion validity is concerned with the appropriate use of statistics to derive accurate conclusions (Parker, 1990). When significance is found, one must consider the possibility of a Type I error. The most common cause of Type I errors is probability pyramiding; however, there was protection
against probability pyramiding in this thesis. The analyses were typically hypothesis-driven (a priori) analyses for which probability pyramiding does not apply. (By definition, probability pyramiding occurs when researchers run statistical tests beyond those hypothesized in an attempt to find significant findings [Parker, 1990]). In the subsidiary analyses in this thesis, I used the Bonferroni correction of dividing the alpha level (.05) by the number of tests to set the probability level of subsidiary analyses at a more conservative level. In addition, when a statistical test was repeated several times, as in tests of PASE magnitude, even though the analyses were hypothesis-driven, the more conservative Bonferroni correction was used.

Not all findings were significant. For instance, for imagery ability, there were some nonsignificant findings, thus the possibility of a Type II error exists. In terms of statistical conclusion validity, there is a large number of things that can cause a Type II error. Two of these did emerge throughout the study, but they did not affect the analyses of imagery ability. For instance, one reason for erroneously believing that treatment groups are identical can be the random heterogeneity of the respondents. This can increase error variance and obscure real differences. Although in two areas in this study (TSSE strength and LASSI goal orientation), the groups were statistically different at pretreatment, this was not the case with imagery ability level. Similarly, a Type II error can occur when there are violations of assumptions such as unequal sample sizes. However, the analyses of imagery ability were the two analyses in which there were exactly the same number of participants in both treatment groups. Less positively,
nonsignificant findings also existed for the LASSI factors. There were differences in sample sizes in these analyses, and these may have contributed to the inability to find significant differences between treatment groups in study skill usage.

**Issues in construct validity.** The construct validity of a variable refers to whether the variable being studied is adequately defined and accurately measured by the instruments, procedures, manipulations, and methods employed in the study (Parker, 1990). In this study, I used multiple methods to measure the dependent variables which strengthened construct validity.

**Issues in internal validity.** Internal validity refers to the extent to which error variance is experimentally controlled (Parker, 1990). Difficulties with internal validity result in effects being caused by extraneous variables rather than by the treatment. The best technique for controlling for problems in internal validity is randomly assigning participants to treatment and control groups. This was only partially possible in this study for two reasons, one of which is relevant to internal validity (random assignment by class); one of which is relevant to external validity (volunteers within the class).

Random assignment by class as opposed to individuals was inevitable because of the slightly different introductory talks needed to recruit for the different treatment groups. In Appendix M is a copy of the request for volunteer talks given to classes for all three treatment groups. The requests only differ in one paragraph. Every attempt was made to draw treatment groups from similar classrooms, and a considerable amount of
demographic data was reported to assist the reader in determining how similar the groups were.

**Issues in external validity.** The results of this study can probably be generalized to other self-identified low achieving, female, university students who volunteer to be assisted with their academic problems. As is true of almost all intervention studies, the results cannot be generalized to nonvolunteers. In practical terms, this is not much of a concern. For instance, only "volunteers" generally come to counselling centres. Nonetheless, in at least one case, a professor suggested to me that an entire class should be given such an intervention. The value of such a practice has not been assessed.

Perhaps a comment about the relatively small number of community-college students and male students in my sample should also be made here. This makes generalization to these students tentative. It also brings up a research issue. Although I spoke to large assemblies of students at the community college, approximately half of which were male, a relatively few number of these students chose to participate. Future researchers may want to consider not only what techniques can most help these students, but also consider how to get more of these students interested in doing the extra work that is involved in these techniques.

**How this Study Informs Practice**

This research is relevant to the practice of counselling postsecondary students. Postsecondary counselling centres typically have relaxation programs for the nervous student. The results of this thesis indicate that making a very small change to these
relaxation exercises should result in postsecondary students having more PASE and less anxiety.

This research also has some relevancy to the lay population. Bookstores often carry a multitude of relaxation and imagery tapes. This research allows consumers to make a more informed decision. Given the option between the relaxation and the imagery tape, the imagery tape will probably be more helpful in reducing anxiety and enhancing PASE. However, there needs to be a caveat here. Imagery techniques range from imagining your inner master to imagining efficacious behaviour. In this study, I examined only one type of imagery technique, and, thus, the results do not indicate whether other types of imagery techniques are of more or less value.

Conclusions

Gaining a full understanding of how students can use imagery to enhance their studies is very important. At least in this one subpopulation of self-identified low-achieving postsecondary students, imagery was able to enhance PASE and reduce anxiety. Conversely, these research results indicated that PASE may not be the panacea previous researchers have suggested, and that I summarized in the introduction. Whereas past researchers argued that PASE may affect effort (Schunk, 1981, 1984; Lent, Brown, & Larking, 1984) and metacognitive skill usage (Pintrich & DeGroot, 1990), I did not find support for those conclusions in this study.

Finally, generalizing these results to other students is also of the utmost importance. A weakness of this thesis may be problems with generalizing the results to
other groups. I can say with some confidence that self-identified low achieving, female, university students receive substantial benefit from using imagery exercises to enhance their confidence. More weakly, there is some suggestion that it is effective with self-identified low achieving community-college students and male students. It would be of great interest to determine if what is true of these adults is also true of younger students. Despite these limitations, when considering the results of this study, I would suggest that imagery has considerable promise as an academic tool and that it has earned the right to be considered for future research.
References


Appendix A

ID # ___

Background Questionnaire

This questionnaire asks basic background questions to help us determine if the techniques we are studying work better for some people than others. This questionnaire is anonymous, so please do not write your name anywhere on the questionnaire. The number on the top of the questionnaire will be matched with the number on later questionnaires so your name will never be linked with this data.

1. What is your age? ___

2. What is your sex? ___

3. In what program are you presently enrolled? ______________

4. In what year are you in your program? ___
5. Have you taken any previous courses or workshops in any of the following?

__ Study Skills
__ Imagery
__ Test taking strategies
__ Relaxation Training

6. Have you ever been assessed because of suspected educational or learning problems?

__ Yes
__ No

a) If yes, what were the results of this assessment?

__ You were diagnosed as having a learning or developmental disability.
__ The results of your assessment suggested that you did not have any disabilities that would disrupt your education.
__ You do not remember the results of the assessment or choose not to disclose the results.
7. Based on the last year of your studies, approximately what is your average grade in school (in percents please)? ____

   a) In what program of study did you earn this grade? (Please mark one)

      ____ high school
      ____ college
      ____ university
      ____ other please specify ____________________
Wayne Schlapkohl  
1519-30 Charles Street West  
Toronto, Ontario, Canada  
M4Y 1R5

Dear Mr. Schlapkohl:

Thank you for your interest in my Questionnaire on Imagery Control. You have my permission to use, reproduce, and/or adapt all or part of the questionnaire for use in your research.

Enclosed please find a copy of the 1977 article, the questionnaire items and instructions (scoring is by simple summation of ratings for modalities and of modality scores for the total score), and selected tables summarizing internal consistency and other correlational data. Questionnaire 9c was an early form of a research questionnaire developed by Auke Tellegen. I believe the current and probably published version is called the Differential Personality (or Experiences) Questionnaire. I don’t have a reference handy, but I do know that the instrument was used in the Minnesota Twin Studies, which should help your search for a reference. The correlational data is the only sort of validity data available for the QIC.

I am surprised that no one has developed a more sophisticated instrument, but this may reflect the inherent difficulties in distinguishing vividness and control, as I discussed in the 1977 article. In retrospect I would develop a larger item pool and do more extensive pretesting of items and include external measures that were not dependent on self report.

You have my best wishes for your research and future endeavors.

Sincerely,

James B. Lane, Ph.D.
Director

June 13, 1996
Instructions

This questionnaire is concerned with the ease with which you can control your imagery or imagination. For the purposes of this questionnaire, imagery means an experience that is like a sensation, perception, emotion or other feeling that occurs without any real, external cause. This experience is different from simply thinking about something. If you imagine that the sun is setting, you "see" it in your "mind's eye."

Some people find it quite easy to control their imagery, while for others it is quite difficult. For example, one person may be able to see in his mind's eye a friend performing impossible gymnastic feats, while another may find that when he tries to recall the face of a friend, he has an image of another person. Both types of experience are normal and occur frequently.

Each item of this questionnaire consists of two parts. After reading the item, close your eyes and try to call to mind the image suggested by the first part of the item. When you have the first image clearly in your imagination, try to change it as suggested by the second part of the item. Next, rate the ease with which you were able to change the image. Be sure to refer to the accompanying Rating Scale.

Record your answers in the brackets provided. Just write the appropriate number after each item. If you find that you cannot produce any image at all for the first part of a
particular item, simply rate the item "0" and proceed to the next item. Try to rate each item independently of how you may have done on other items. Be sure to familiarize yourself with the different categories on the Rating Scale and to read the example before beginning the questionnaire. Refer to the Rating Scale provided on each page as you judge each item.

Rating Scale.

Unable to imagine the first part of the item. Rating 0
Unable to image the second part of the item. Rating 1
Able to change the image as suggested, but could not hold it steady in my imagination. Rating 2
Able to change the image as suggested and to hold it in my imagination with some effort. Rating 3
Able to change the image as suggested and to hold it in my imagination very naturally and easily. Rating 4

Example. Try to see the following scene with your mind's eye. Next change the image as suggested by the second part of the item. Consider the image carefully, paying attention to the visual aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified in the Rating Scale.
An elephant walking in a circus parade.

The same elephant performing a trick, standing on its hind legs. ( )

If you were unable to see the elephant walking in the parade, you would rate the item "0." If you experience a fluctuating image of the elephant on his hind legs, you would rate the item "2," and so forth.

Now begin with the items below. Be sure to complete all items.

Try to see each of the following scenes with your mind's eye. Next, change the image as suggested by the second part of each item. Consider each item carefully, paying attention to the visual aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified by the Rating Scale.

1. A close friend sitting in a chair.
   The same friend now riding a bicycle. ( )

2. The Canadian flag.
   The Canadian flag, now with no maple leaf. ( )

3. Watching a television screen that is very fuzzy and dim.
   Seeing a bright sharp picture after adjusting the set. ( )
4. The sun shining in a cloudless sky.

A dark cloud passing in front of the sun and hiding it. ( )

5. A blind man with his cane walking down a side walk.

The same blind man walking the tightrope at the circus. ( )

Try to hear each of the following sounds with your mind's ear. Next, change the image as suggested by the second part of the item. Consider each image carefully, paying attention to the sound-like aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified in the Rating Scale.


The singing is now accompanied by a piano. ( )

7. The sounds of a wooded scene, including birds and the wind.

The wind dies down. ( )

8. The sound of a faucet dripping as you try to sleep.

The gradual stopping of the sound when you turn off the tap. ( )

9. The sound of a thunder storm: heavy rain, wind, and thunder.

The gentle patter of the rain as the storm dies down. ( )
10. A violinist playing in a large concert hall.

He's now playing on the beach, with surf and sea-birds in the background. ( )

Try to feel each of the following sensations with your mind's touch. Next change the image as suggested by the second part of each item. Consider each image carefully, paying attention to the touch-like aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold it in your imagination as specified in the Rating Scale.

11. The texture of sand as you rub it between your fingers.

The sand now wet. ( )

12. The feel of a light rain and gentle breeze on your skin.

The breeze stops. ( )

13. The feel of brushing your hair gently with a fine, soft brush.

Now you are brushing vigorously with a stiff brush. ( )

14. The feel of a scratchy wool sweater next to your skin.

You take it off and replace it with a soft cotton one. ( )
15. The feel of washing dishes in very hot water.

Suddenly your hand closes around an ice cube in the water

Try to perform each of the following movements mentally. Next, change the image as suggested by the second part of each item. Consider each item carefully, paying attention to the movement-like aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified in the Rating Scale.

16. You are jogging around a lake.

You come to a very steep hill and run up it.

17. You are speeding around a curve in an automobile.

The automobile is now going straight.

18. You are coasting down a gentle hill on a bicycle.

The hill becomes much more steep and you speed up greatly.

19. You are floating quietly on a rubber raft.

A large wave lifts the raft and sets it down again.
20. You are riding up an escalator.

The escalator malfunctions, and you are suddenly going backward.

Try to taste each of the following flavours with your mind's taste. Next change the image as suggested by the second part of each item. Consider each image carefully, paying attention to the flavour-like aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified in the Rating Scale.

21. You are eating a rich milk chocolate bar.

As you bite into the centre, the taste of peanut butter blends with the chocolate.

22. The taste of coffee with cream and sugar.

The taste of black coffee.

23. The taste of a tender, juicy steak ruined by too much salt.

The taste of the same steak with the right amount of salt.

24. The taste of a raw onion.

The taste of onion sauteed in butter.
25. The taste of the first bite into a Red Delicious apple.

You find that inside is a vanilla cream filling. ( )

Try to smell each of the following smells with your mind's nose. Next change the image as suggested by the second part of each item. Consider each image carefully, paying attention to the smell-like aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified in the Rating Scale.

26. The rich smell of coffee brewing.

Add the smell of frying bacon. ( )

27. The smell of gasoline and exhaust fumes at a service station.

The smell of gasoline alone. ( )

28. The strong smell of household ammonia as you first open the bottle.

The fainter smell of ammonia used in solution to clean windows. ( )
29. The stale, musty smell of a long-closed room.

The clean, fresh smell as you let in the night air by opening a window. ( )

30. The strong smell as you enter a freshly painted room.

In the next room, the smell of peppermint is in the air. ( )

Try to experience each of the following feelings in your imagination. Next, change the image as suggested by the second part of the item. Consider each image carefully, paying attention to the feeling aspect of it. Rate the ease with which you were able to produce the change and to hold the new image in your imagination, as specified in the Rating Scale.


At the same time you feel full of energy. ( )

32. Lying in a warm, snug bed, feeling very sleepy.

Lying in the same bed, but now wide awake. ( )
33. Feeling greatly elated at attaining an important goal.
   Feeling mildly self-satisfied at attaining a similar, but less important goal.

34. Feeling very thirsty.
   Feeling very satisfied after drinking your fill.

35. Feeling very much at peace and in love with the world.
   Hating someone intensely.
Appendix C

Date __________ ID#___

Task Specific Self-Efficacy Scale

Please write in the below spaces, five images of increasing difficulty related to the belief in your abilities that you desire to change.

_1. __________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________

Perceived efficacy strength ___

_2. __________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________

___________________________________________________________

Perceived efficacy strength ___
If, at this time, you believe you can perform any of these tasks, please place a check mark beside the number. For those statements that you have checked, please describe how certain you are that you can perform these behaviours. Estimate your degree of certainty using the below scale.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>30</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>50</th>
<th>60</th>
<th>70</th>
<th>80</th>
<th>90</th>
<th>100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Highly</td>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>Completely</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncertain</td>
<td>Uncertain</td>
<td>Certain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix D

ID# _____

Imagery and Relaxation Diaries

Imagery Diary

You have been asked to use your imagination as a tool to help you change your thinking. Part of what I am interested in is the facility you have with your imagination. In particular, I am interested in the degree to which your imagery is vivid, positive, and on topic. I am also interested in how frequently you do the exercises. What I recommend for this study is that you do the imagery exercises a minimum of once a day, five days a week, although you are certainly free to do the exercises more frequently than the minimum.

So that I may get an idea of how your imagery use is going, I will be asking that you fill out the relaxation diary. It should only take a few seconds to fill out.

Below, I have described in greater detail what information I desire in the imagery diary.

Question 1. What is your identification number? The number on the top of your imagery diary is your ID number. This allows me to match up your responses in the diary with your responses on the questionnaires you have done in person.

Question 2. What day are you reporting on? Typically this will be straightforward. This study lasts for 28 days, day number one being the day after your initial meeting with the researcher. There are sheets number 1 to 28 in your diary. The only time
this gets tricky is when you either do not do any imagery for a day or when you do imagery more than once a day.

Fill in the questionnaire even on days you have not done any imagery. On days you do not do any imagery please fill in the questionnaire anyway. Simply fill in the first three questions (ID number, day of the study, whether you used the technique or not). That way when I look over the diaries, I know which days participants have not used the technique as opposed to used the technique but just forgotten to fill in the questionnaire.

Fill in the questionnaire every time you use the imagery exercises.

For example, if you do the imagery exercises twice on day one, the first time you answer the questions call the day "day 1a," the second time call the day "day 1b."

Question 3. Did you perform the imagery exercises today? Self-explanatory.

Question 4. How often did you find yourself imagining irrelevant or tangential material?

Question 5. How often were you troubled by intrusive, negative images?

Question 4 and 5 are related. I am interested in the controllability of your imagery. It is possible that the controllability of your imagery can be divided into two categories. You can examine the extent to which you arbitrarily lose control of your images. This is the extent to which you find yourself drifting into unrelated images. Conversely, sometimes your fears or anxieties may cause your imagery to change in very specific and unwanted ways. These two distinctions will be discussed in greater length below.
Sometimes when you use imagery, you may find yourself losing your concentration and starting to think about or imaging irrelevant or tangential events. Maybe imagining doing mathematical problems will remind you of some high school experiences, and you find yourself day dreaming about this experience instead of doing your self-efficacy imagery. This type of lack of controllability is fairly common. When this happens just gently bring yourself back to your original imagery. By gently, I mean do not berate yourself for losing your train of thought. Don't try to force or push the other thoughts out of your mind. Simply replace them with your efficacy imagery.

Some people also find that there are times that their imagery is more negative than they wish. Their fears or negative beliefs become intrusive to the imagery. As an example, perhaps you are imagining speaking in class and your fears become intrusive. Without consciously directing your imagery to do so, you imagine yourself freezing in the presentation or stuttering. This type of loss of control of the imagery is more rare. Again, gently replace the intrusive images with your efficacy imagery. If you find this very difficult to do, it may help to remind yourself that the fantasy is under your control and then to consciously "replay" the scene with the more positive images. If the intrusive images continue you may wish to slowly change the negative imagery. For example, if you spontaneously imagine yourself becoming anxious and confused when reading textbook and you cannot seem to control these images, you may want to consciously imagine something which is easier for you to believe in. For instance, you may wish to imagine reading the textbook and getting confused but continuing to read and
understanding at least some of the materials. The next time you do the exercise again imagine being somewhat anxious, but understanding even more than previously. Conversely, you may want to simply imagine yourself reading a text that is at a simpler level. Please tell me about these experiences and we will work out a plan to get these intrusive images more under control.

**Question 6. How vivid were your images?** Vividness describes how real your imagery is to you. If your imagery is clear, distinct, vibrant, and strong, it is vivid. If it is almost like living the experience itself, it is vivid. Conversely, if you have difficulty seeing, hearing, or feeling events in your imagery, your imagery is vague.

**Question 7. Are there any concerns or problem on which you would like to be advised?** This is your opportunity to ask any questions you may have of the researcher.
Day 1

1. What is your identification number? ____

2. What day are you reporting on? ____

3. Did you perform the imagery exercises today?
   __ yes
   __ no

If yes, answer the below questions.

4. How often did you find yourself imagining irrelevant or tangential material?

   _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ _____
   1  2  3  4  5  6  7

   Frequently       Occasionally       Not at all
5. How often were you troubled by intrusive, negative images?

1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Frequently Occasionally Not at all

6. How vivid were your images?

1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Not Vivid Somewhat Vivid Very Vivid

7. Are there any concerns or problems on which you would like to be advised?  

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Relaxation Diary

You have been asked to use your imagination as a tool to help you relax. Part of what I am interested in is the facility you have with your imagination. In particular, I am interested in the degree to which your imagery is vivid, positive, and on topic. I am also interested in how frequently you do the exercises. What I recommend for this study is that you do the imagery exercises a minimum of once a day, five days a week, although you are certainly free to do the exercises more frequently than the minimum.

So that I may get an idea of how your imagery use is going, I will be asking that you fill out the relaxation diary. It should only take a few seconds to fill out.

Below, I have described in greater detail what information I desire in the imagery diary.

**Question 1. What is your identification number?** The number on the top of your imagery diary is your ID number. This allows me to match up your responses in the diary with your responses on the questionnaires you have done in person.

**Question 2. What day are you reporting on?** Typically this will be straightforward. This study lasts for 28 days, day number one being the day after your initial meeting with the researcher. There are sheets numbered 1 to 28 in your diary. The only time this gets tricky is when you either do not do any imagery for a day or when you do imagery more than once a day.
Fill in the questionnaire even on days you have not done any imagery. On days you do not do any imagery please fill in the questionnaire anyway. Simply fill in the first three questions (ID number, day of the study, whether you used the technique or not). That way when I look over the diaries, I know which days participants have not used the technique as opposed to used the technique but just forgotten to fill in the questionnaire.

Fill in the questionnaire every time you use the imagery exercises.

For example, if you do the imagery exercises twice on day one, the first time you answer the questions call the day "day 1a," the second time call the day "day 1b."

Question 3. Did you perform the imagery exercises today? Self-explanatory.

Question 4. How often did you find yourself imagining irrelevant or tangential material?

Question 5. How often were you troubled by intrusive, negative images?

Question 4 and 5 are related. I am interested in the controllability of your imagery. It is possible that the controllability of your imagery can be divided into two categories. You can examine the extent to which you arbitrarily lose control of your images. This is the extent to which you find yourself drifting into unrelated images. Conversely, sometimes your fears or anxieties may cause your imagery to change in very specific and unwanted ways. These two distinctions will be discussed in greater length below.

Sometimes when you use imagery, you may find yourself losing your concentration and starting to think about or imaging irrelevant or tangential events. Maybe, while imagining your ideal place, your mind drifts off to plans for the evening or...
what you need to do during the day. This type of lack of controllability is fairly common. When this happens, just gently bring yourself back to your original imagery. By gently, I mean do not berate yourself for losing your train of thought. Don't try to force or push the other thoughts out of your mind. Simply replace them with your relaxation imagery.

Some people also find that there are times that their imagery is more negative than they wish. Their fears or negative beliefs become intrusive to the imagery. Perhaps you are really trying to relax and imagine a calming and safe scene, but images of your upcoming math exam intrude. This type of loss of control of the imagery is more rare. Again, gently replace the intrusive images with your imagery of an ideal, safe place. If you find this very difficult to do, it may help to remind yourself that the fantasy is under your control. Please tell me about these experiences and we will work out a plan to get these intrusive images more under control.

**Question 6. How vivid were your images?** Vividness describes how real your imagery is to you. If your imagery is clear, distinct, vibrant, and strong, it is vivid. If it is almost like living the experience itself, it is vivid. Conversely, if you have difficulty seeing, hearing, or feeling events in your imagery, your imagery is vague.

**Question 7. Are there any concerns or problem on which you would like to be advised?** This is your opportunity to ask any questions you may have of the researcher.
Day 1

1. What is your identification number? _____

2. What day are you reporting on? _____

3. Did you perform the imagery exercises today?
   __ yes
   __ no

   If yes, answer the below questions.

4. How often did you find yourself imagining irrelevant or tangential material?

   __ __ __ __ __ __ __
   1 2 3 4 5 6 7

   Frequently       Occasionally       Not at all
5. How often were you troubled by intrusive, negative images?

<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Frequently Occasionally Not at all

6. How vivid were your images?

<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Not Vivid Somewhat Vivid Very Vivid

7. Are there any concerns or problems on which you would like to be advised?  

__________________________________________________________________________  

__________________________________________________________________________
Appendix E

Summaries of the Project given to the Different Treatment Groups

Summary of the Project for the Imagery and Relaxation Groups

Dear participant

Thank you for showing an interest in this study. This project is designed to explore how people can use their own imagination to help them be more successful at school. This is an experimental intervention, although similar procedures have been proven successful in previous studies.

The study will involve your attending five 1 hour meetings. During the first session, you will be asked to identify what beliefs you think are holding you back academically. In the second session, you will be given a technique to lower anxiety and change negative beliefs. As well, you will be asked to complete a study skills questionnaire. During the third session, you will be asked to complete a puzzle solving task and a short word task. The fourth session will be somewhat shorter, consisting of discussion of the technique and a short questionnaire. A full explanation of the study will be given during the fifth session.

There are two possible benefits to participating in this study: Participation may help you do better at school, and participation may assist you in developing a more realistic view of your abilities. Not being aware of one's abilities may lead to poor future choices. In addition to these potential benefits to yourself, you are helping us develop new ways of enhancing students' academic performance.
I wish to emphasize that your participation is entirely voluntary. If for any reason you should wish to discontinue your participation in the study, you are free to do so at any time without academic penalty.

Data from the questionnaires you fill out and background information gathered during our sessions will be used in a doctoral thesis at OISE at the University of Toronto. In order to maintain confidentiality, your name will be replaced by a code number in our files. This code number will be known only by the primary researcher.

Should you be interested, a summary of this thesis will be made available at the conclusion of the study. Should you have any concerns, you are welcome to contact me at (416) 966-3569.

Thank you, once again, for your interest.

Sincerely,

Wayne Schlapkohl
Summary of the Project for the Comparison Group

Dear participant

Thank you for showing an interest in this study. This project is designed to explore how people can be more successful at school. This is an experimental intervention, although similar procedures have been proven successful in previous studies.

The study will involve your attending three 1 hour meetings. During the first session, you will be asked to identify what beliefs you think are holding you back academically and complete two short questionnaires. During the second session, you will be asked to complete a study skills questionnaire, a puzzle solving task, and a short word task. During the third session, you will receive information on how you can improve your present study skills. A full explanation of the study will be given during this session as well as an offer for some follow-up support in your efforts to be a more efficient student.

There are two possible benefits to participating in this study: Participation may help you do better at school, and participation may assist you in developing a more realistic view of your abilities. Not being aware of one's abilities may lead to poor future choices. In addition to these potential benefits to yourself, you are helping us develop new ways of enhancing students' academic performance.

I wish to emphasize that your participation is entirely voluntary. If for any reason you should wish to discontinue your participation in the study, you are free to do so at any time without academic penalty.
Data from the questionnaires you fill out and background information gathered during our sessions will be used in a doctoral thesis at OISE at the University of Toronto. In order to maintain confidentiality, your name will be replaced by a code number in our files. This code number will be known only by the primary researcher.

Should you be interested, a summary of this thesis will be made available at the conclusion of the study. Should you have any concerns, you are welcome to contact me at (416) 923-6641 ext 2373.

Thank you, once again, for your interest.

Sincerely,

Wayne Schlapkohl
Appendix F

Descriptions and Rationales Given to the Different Treatment Groups

Description and Rationale Given to the Imagery Group.

Thank you for coming out and showing your interest in this project. Before we begin tonight, may I ask if I may audiotape this session? I use these audiotapes to ensure that every group I talk to gets essentially the same message. *(If all agree, begin taping. If the group does not consent for taping continue on with the session. However, this is far from preferred, as the data from untaped groups are considered to be harder to interpret.*)³

Tonight, we will be doing three things: First, I will ask you to read over a general summary of this project, and I will give an in-depth description of the group to which you have been assigned. That way you can make an informed decision as to whether you desire to participate or not. Secondly, I will be asking you to spend some time defining as specifically and concretely as possible the negative academic belief that concerns you and you wish to change. Thirdly, I will ask you to fill-out a few questionnaires. Next time we meet, we will do an exercise related to changing those beliefs.

The first form in your package is called the "Summary of the Project" form. This form gives you a description of the program in general. It explains how much time this program will take, what sort of things I will be asking of you, and how you may benefit from this program. After you have all finished reading the summary, you are free to ask

³Text that has been bolded is directed to the counsellor providing the treatment.
me any questions you might have about the program. I would like you to read over the "Summary of the Project" now. (Allow three to four minutes for everyone to read over the form.)

Do you have any questions?

In the "Summary of the Project," I state that you will be using your imagination to change your beliefs about what academic tasks you can successfully perform. The impetus for this study is that every year school counsellors meet students who have the "smarts" to make it in college or university, but because of their doubts, anxieties, and insecurities, they mess up. For these students, what messes them up is the difficulty they have studying while being disrupted by thoughts like, "I will never understand this text," "I am not smart enough to be in college," "Why did I come here anyway?" Similarly, it is hard to stay motivated when in the back of their minds they have this belief that they would never graduate from their program. Thus, the goal of this study is to learn how to assist students in replacing these negative, persistent beliefs with more positive or realistic beliefs about their abilities. So the question is, "How do we get people to have faith in themselves?"

One technique used to change persistent beliefs that has been shown to be very effective is imagery. Research has shown that those things we play over again and again in our imagination, we tend to start to see as possible even likely. In one of my favourite studies of this phenomenon, people who did not believe they could stand up for themselves were asked to imagine themselves being assertive. Doing these imagery
exercises not only convinced most of them that they could be assertive, but when the researcher tested them, they had become more assertive. The imagery had helped them to change their behaviour. That is what we are shooting for in this program.

All of us who have been inhibited by our doubts have probably fantasized about being more confident and successful. The problem is that we have little faith in those images. We see those images as being merely wishful thinking. Previous research done in the areas of sports psychology, phobias, and unassertiveness suggest that our imaginings are most convincing, if the people using the imagery slowly work up to them.

For instance, let me give you an example of the sort of thing I will be asking you to do. Imagine that a woman is convinced that she could not participate in a French language lab. Her college instructor may mention that every Friday the class meets for 2 hours to practice informal conversational French with a facilitator. Immediately, this student has images of being in the laboratory, being asked a question, and not being able to find the right words. She imagines studying all those verb tenses but somehow not understanding how and when they are to be used. It is probable that such images will make her nervous and inhibit her performance in the laboratory. In fact, she may have had experiences of going to such labs and being too nervous to participate effectively.

To counter these negative beliefs (that is, to get a little confidence), she may choose to repeatedly imagine being successful with conversational French. But what exactly should she imagine? She may choose to not begin by believing she is proficient in the college level laboratory. That may seem too unrealistic. It would be hard to believe
such imaginings. Rather she may begin by imagining something a little more believable. She may begin by imagining being successful in a lab where she only needs to read simple French passages with the correct pronunciation. She might imagine this scene for a few minutes every day until she starts believing she could handle such a situation in the real world. It is realistic to believe that such could happen after a week or two. Then she would be encouraged to imagine herself being successful in a lab where she needed to answer simple questions with one sentence answers. Next, she would imagine being successful in a lab where the conversations were kept at a basic level. She would be encouraged to continue to imagine more difficult situations until she was imagining using college-level conversational French in the laboratory with her classmates. In the work we have done in this project so far, we have found that it is realistic to believe that people can become significantly more confident in the 28-day period of the study, and, usually, they change their images about four times in that period.

This is an example of the type of exercise that will be used by this group. In this group, individuals will be asked to counter their negative, unrealistic, hindering academic beliefs by replacing them with beliefs that are more positive and realistic. To encourage this change in beliefs you will be asked to imagine yourselves actually engaging in school activities that presently you believe to be too difficult for you. To make these images convincing, you will be asked to start by imagining behaviours that presently seem almost possible to you.
Description and Rationale Given to the Relaxation Group

Thank you for coming out and showing your interest in this project. Before we begin tonight, may I ask if I may audiotape this session? I use these audiotapes to ensure that every group I talk to gets essentially the same message. (If all agree, begin taping. If the group does not consent for taping continue on with the session. However, this is far from preferred, as the data from untaped groups are considered to be harder to interpret.)

Tonight, we will be doing three things: First, I will ask you to read over a general summary of this project, and I will give an in-depth description of the group to which you have been assigned. That way you can make an informed decision as to whether you desire to participate or not. Secondly, I will be asking you to spend some time defining as specifically and concretely as possible the negative academic belief that concerns you and you wish to cope with better. Thirdly, I will ask you to fill-out a few questionnaires. Next time we meet, we will do an exercise related to coping with academic doubt.

The first form in your package is called the "Summary of the Project" form. This form gives you a description of the program in general. It explains how much time this program will take, what sort of things I will be asking of you, and how you may benefit from this program. After you have all finished reading the summary, you are free to ask me any questions you might have about the program. I would like you to read over the "Summary of the Project" now. (Allow three to four minutes for everyone to read over the form.)
Do you have any questions?

In the "Summary of the Project," I state that you will be using your imagination to change your beliefs about what academic tasks you can successfully perform. Presumably, you have volunteered for this project because you believe that your doubts or insecurities about your scholastic ability are holding you back academically. The particular group that you have been assigned to examines the link between those negative beliefs and anxiety. Many students find that, when they are studying, in the back of their minds they are saying to themselves, "I will never understand this text," "I am not smart enough to be in college," "Why did I decide to attend college anyway?" One result of all this negative self-talk is that it increases anxiety. Anxiety does not need to be increased very much before it starts to limit people's ability to concentrate. If anxiety becomes fairly high, it also hurts people's motivation. For instance, one of the simpler reasons that people have difficulties with procrastination is that being anxious is uncomfortable, and we avoid activities that make us uncomfortable. Sometimes anxiety is physically uncomfortable with people getting stress headaches or butterflies in their stomachs. Always anxiety is psychically uncomfortable. It is unpleasant for students to replay images of themselves failing courses, worrying about their parents' reactions to their grades, and worrying about the lack of future job prospects if they drop out of school. Thus, students naturally defer anxiety producing studies. There are students who say that they feel great when they are watching television. However, as soon as they sit down in front of their books they start getting the butterflies in their stomachs, and their minds
start racing with thoughts of failure. It is not surprising that these students find themselves watching too much television and not doing enough studying. Often these students will continue to put off doing their studies until the pain of not studying is worse than the pain of studying. The night before their term paper is due, they will be sitting in front of the television and they will be thinking, "What on earth am I doing? I have to get that paper done right now." So they spend the entire night finishing the paper and straggle into class looking like they have not slept in a month. This does not make for good term papers. Finally, if anxiety becomes high, it profoundly affects people's studies. For instance, it disrupts their sleep which in turn very seriously affects cognitive abilities.

We need to find a way for these self-doubting students to find their studies more tolerable. We need these students to be able to approach their studies in a more relaxed and motivated manner. In this study, I am comparing the effectiveness of different imagery interventions that attempt to help these students achieve their academic potential. As you may have guessed, the goal of the group to which you have been assigned is to help students become more motivated and to become better thinkers by lowering their anxiety. Furthermore, I am examining whether or not students who begin to think clearer and who are calmer when they are studying might also begin to start to change their negative beliefs about their academic abilities. Perhaps, they will start to believe in themselves. Therefore, the imagery technique given to you next week will function predominantly to reduce your anxiety.

Any questions at this point?
Description and Rationale Given to the Comparison Group.

Thank you for coming out and showing your interest in this project. Before we begin tonight, may I ask if I may audiotape this session? I use these audiotapes to ensure that every group I talk to gets essentially the same message. (If all agree, begin taping. If the group does not consent for taping continue on with the session. However, this is far from preferred, as the data from untaped groups are considered to be harder to interpret.)

Tonight, we will be doing three things: First, I will ask you to read over a summary of this project, and I will talk for some time about the group to which you have been assigned. That way you can make an informed decision as to whether you wish to participate or not. Secondly, I will be asking you to spend some time defining as specifically and concretely as possible the negative academic beliefs that concern you. Finally, I will ask you to do a few questionnaires.

The first form in your package is called the "Summary of the Project" form. This form gives you a description of the program in general. It explains how much time this program will take, what sort of things I will be asking of you, and how you may benefit from this program. After you have all finished reading the summary, you are free to ask me any questions you might have about the program. I would like you to read over the "Summary of the Project" now. (Allow three to four minutes for everyone to read over the form.)

Do you have any questions?
Rationale for the Project

In the "Summary of the Project," I state that you will be receiving information about your study skills and asked to identify your academic self-doubts as clearly and specifically as possible. The impetus for this study is that every year school counsellors have students who have the "smarts" to make it in college or university, but because of ineffective study skills, they mess up. Many students have never been taught how to study at the college level. They may have never learned how to figure out what are the main ideas in text or lectures. They may have not learned how to prepare for exams or how to review or organize their notes. Because of their poor study habits, they walk into the exam and find that they have studied all the wrong stuff, or the night before an exam they realize that they will never be able to cover all the material that they have to.

In this project, I am going to ask you to give me two very different types of information about how you study. I will ask you to fill out a questionnaire that helps me compare your study habits to other postsecondary students. But first I want you to identify for me as clearly and concretely as you can what you believe is holding you back academically. I have found this type of information to be extremely helpful in the past. But the key is for you to be as concrete or specific as possible. Doing this can be helpful in one of two ways. First, when you get as specific as possible in what your academic self-doubt is, you often find that it is remediable. If you just say, "Well, the problem is that I am too dumb," obviously, that is pretty hard to fix. But if you get really specific and
say, "I think the problem is that I have the hardest time putting my ideas on paper," that is something we can work on. I can give you information on the structure or outline that most academic papers follow, and this may help you narrow your topic down and organize your thinking. I can refer you to the writing lab here at the school where people will read over your drafts and correct them. The university even has personal tutors who will sit down with you and reteach you the basics of writing. The same is true of most problems that students come up with. If they get really specific, there is usually a way of remediating or accommodating their difficulty.

The second way being really specific about your academic self-doubt can be helpful is that you may find out that your self-doubt is absolutely incorrect. For example, one situation that we encountered was a woman who erroneously was told that she should be able to read over one page a minute of university level text if she was going to keep up in her studies. She was not even close to this speed, and because of this, she was a nervous wreck. When she brought this up, we were able to talk to some of our professors who said this suggested reading speed was entirely unrealistic. No truly effective student reads a page of Aristotle in a minute and adequately understands it. Nobody reads a page of organic chemistry in a minute and understands it. At best, reading 10 to 15 pages an hour would be realistic. As soon as she heard this, her anxiety became manageable and her studies became easier. Thus, in this study, we want to make sure you are not worrying about something that is inaccurate or unnecessary.
Finally, I believe that the group support that occurs when we share our fears and anxieties is also helpful. It is easy to believe that nobody in class is struggling as much as we are or that nobody has as much self-doubt as we do, and this just adds to our insecurity and fear. Sometimes that can further hinder us from reaching out to others, and such reaching out can be very important. It can be a great relief to say to someone else, "Is it just me or was that last test really difficult?" and to hear others say, "I thought I would never finish." Similarly, it is great to be able to brag to others when having a major break through. Spider Robinson, the Canadian science fiction author, summed it up nicely when he stated shared joy is increased and shared pain is diminished (1986). So, in conclusion, we hope to help you study smarter and to reduce your anxieties.

Any questions at this point?
Appendix G

Informed Consent Forms

Informed Consent Form for the Imagery and Relaxation Groups

I, __________________, have read a description of the study, "The effects of imagery on perceived academic self-efficacy." I understand its purpose, and what my involvement in the study will entail, and what types of information will be used. I understand that I am able to discontinue my participation in this study at any time.

_________________________________________  ______________________________
Signature of the participant               Date

_________________________________________  ______________________________
Signature of the witness                  Date
Informed Consent Form for the Comparison Group

I, ______________, have read a description of the study, "The student success project." I understand its purpose, and what my involvement in the study will entail, and what types of information will be used. I understand that I am able to discontinue my participation in this study at any time.

__________________________________________  ______________________________
Signature of the participant                     Date

__________________________________________  ______________________________
Signature of the witness                          Date
Appendix H

Description of the Imagery and Relaxation Exercises

Description of the Imagery Exercise: Part I Relaxation

Breathing. This exercise has two parts. The first section is to help you relax. It seems to be easier to create vivid and controllable images if you are calm and quiet. In this first section, I will be first asking you to consciously choose to breath slower and deeper. This extremely simple technique is very effective in increasing relaxation. When most people breath, they do a pretty good job of keeping their abdomens or stomach areas flat, and you can see their chests rise and fall. Unfortunately, that is not a very healthy way to breathe. Our lungs go way down to the bottom of our rib cage. If you only see your chest rise and fall, you are not using the bottom half of your lungs. You’re breathing shallowly. This shallow breathing makes your body work harder so you never quite relax. Your heart has to beat a bit faster; your blood pressure stays a bit higher. Part of really relaxing is to loosen our abdomen and to let air get right down to the bottom of your lungs. When you breath that deeply you will notice your abdomen will even rise and fall: not that your lungs actually go down into your lower abdomen, but because a muscle called the diaphragm is giving your lungs more room when you inhale by sticking your abdomen out a bit. That is why it is called diaphragmatic breathing.

Autosuggestion. Next, I will be giving you a lot of suggestions on how to feel more relaxed. If what is making you anxious and destroying your confidence are messages of failure and pressure, then it makes sense that it would also be successful to
give yourself messages of relaxation and calmness. I will ask you to imagine being on top of a small flight of steps and with every step allowing yourself to feel more relaxed, more comfortable, and more tranquil.

Imagining a sanctuary. Finally, I will be asking you to picture in your imagination a calming place.

Description of the Imagery Exercise: Part II Imagery

The relaxation section will take approximately five minutes. The next section consists of you creating images that will help you get a more realistic and more positive picture of what you can achieve academically. Because you may have all chosen slightly different images, I will be giving you very few suggestions in this section. I will ask you to create the image you are working on and then you will have a silent period of several minutes to create those images. Typically, what people use for an image is an image of themselves engaging in the target behaviour. For instance, they may see themselves giving a talk to four other people. They may hear the presentation in their imagination. They may imagine the excitement they would feel when they find themselves actually doing something they had doubts about. During the imagery they may say to themselves statements that affirm their abilities. For instance, they may say to themselves, "I really can speak in public. This is easier than I thought. If I just prepare well and use cue cards to put my key statements down on, I do a fine job of public speaking." Many people find these affirming statement very helpful. Conversely, they might imagine other people coming up to them after the presentation and telling them that they perceived them to be
very good speakers, they learned a great deal from the presentation, or that they enjoyed listening to them. Feel free to experiment with your images and to use that which you believe to be the most convincing.

Here are two ground rules for this exercise.

1. Do what feels right to you. If you do not listen to all the suggestions that is O.K. If you think, "The image I decided on for my sanctuary simply is not going to be effective," feel free to replace it with another image.

2. At the beginning of this exercise, I will ask that you get into a comfortable position. Do whatever you need to do to get comfortable. Lying on the floor or sitting with your back straight are two good positions. I will suggest that you do not cross your legs or arms. I find crossing your legs can be particularly annoying. This is a fairly long exercise, and those people who cross their legs often find their feet falling asleep halfway through it. That can be very disruptive. Nothing can break your chain of thought quite like having pins and needles rush up your legs.

Any comments, concerns, or questions?

Please get into a comfortable position.

The Imagery Exercise. Begin by concentrating on your breathing. Breath very deeply. So deeply that your abdomen rises and falls. Just breath deeply -- slowly -- and as you concentrate on your breathing -- your body will gradually and steadily become very, very, relaxed. Breathing slower -- and deeper. In -- and -- out. Soon, you will feel more and more relaxed.
Notice that you have already begun to relax. Your breathing has slowed down. Your muscles are more relaxed. Next, imagine. . . . Imagine a very small flight of stairs with only five steps on it. In a moment, you are going to walk down this flight of stairs and with each step let yourself feel even more relaxed. Take the first step now, and let yourself feel more relaxed, feel more content, more at peace. And the second step, very tranquil and comfortable. And the third step, very calm and peaceful. Take the fourth, very relaxed, very comfortable, and take the fifth step, allowing yourself to feel completely relaxed and at ease.

You are now completely relaxed, and being relaxed you can imagine very clearly and very vividly. In your imagination, create an ideal place: a sanctuary. This place is a place where you will be totally safe and feel totally secure. It can be any place that you can imagine. It can be a tropical beach, a beautiful green forest, or a great mansion. Whatever you want. And when imagining this ideal place use all of your senses. Take a minute to imagine your sanctuary.

When you are ready, imagine yourself engaging in the target behaviour you have chosen for today. Just imagine this scene for a few minutes, and as you imagine this scene, recognize that this scene can and will become a reality. Imagine this scene now. (Approximately five minute break.)

When you are ready to leave this scene, you may wish to return to your sanctuary to begin the process of coming back to reality. . . . In the sanctuary, you again see the small flight of five steps. In a moment, you will imagine yourself going up those steps.
With every step, allow yourself to feel more alert, more energized, and more awake. And as you become more alert, recognize that every time you do this exercise you will become more confident in your abilities, more likely to engage in the academic behaviours that you now are uncertain about, and more likely to succeed academically. Take that first step now, feeling more alert and energized. And the second step, feeling refreshed. The third step, ready to take on the day. The fourth step, more energized and invigorated. And now take the fifth step, allowing yourself to feel alert, refreshed, and now return back to this room.

Any questions or comments?

Does anyone want to mention how they felt or how the exercise went for them?

Some typical questions. There are a few concerns that are fairly typical. Just in case they are concerns that you later run into, let me mention them to you now.

Some practitioners have suggested that imagery is a learned skill. So if the imagery exercise did not work that well today, do not worry. With practice, it will get better.

How often should you do these exercises? That to some degree is up to you. However, I suggest once a day, five days a week. Those people who have been most successful with these exercises have explicitly scheduled ten to fifteen minutes a day to do these exercises. For example, some contracted with themselves to do the exercise
every evening just before they went to bed, every morning when they got up, or during their lunch break.

How long will you be asked to try out this exercise? I am asking that you try out this exercise for the next 28 days. That should give me a sense of how effective the exercise is.

What if you do not remember how to do the exercise? Up front, there are audiotape copies of the exercise we just did. You are all encouraged to take one and to use it. I will request that you return the tape after the 28 days so we may reuse them. This allows us to reduce our costs. Of course, if you desire to make a copy of the tape, you are more than welcome to do that.

Any other questions?
Description of the Relaxation Exercise

This exercise has three parts: breathing exercises, relaxing your muscles, and imagining a calming and safe scene.

Breathing. I will begin this exercise by asking you to simply breath deeply and slowly. This extremely simply technique is very effective in increasing relaxation. I will ask that you allow air to get right down to the bottom of your lungs. Most people breath very shallowly. When they breath, they see only their chests rise and fall. You may want to see if, when you totally relax, your abdomen does not also raise and fall. To facilitate this, you may wish to place your hand on your abdomen while you are doing the exercise.

Passive muscle relaxation. Next, I will ask you to relax your muscles. I will do that by working through your muscle groups. First, I will ask you to relax the muscles in your feet and calves and slowly I will move all the way up to your face. When I ask you to relax a muscle group, just let that muscle go limp and soft and notice how you feel calmer and more relaxed as you do this. Stressors not only encourage us to clench our jaws and tighten our shoulders, but this muscular tension actually adds to our feelings of anxiety. For instance, such tension makes our cardiovascular system work harder increasing our pulse and blood pressure.

Autosuggestion. Next, I will be giving you a lot of suggestions on how to feel more relaxed. If what is making you anxious and destroying your confidence is messages of failure and pressure, then it makes sense that it would also be successful to give yourself messages of relaxation and calmness. I will ask you to imagine being on top of a
small flight of steps and with every step allowing yourself to feel more relaxed, more comfortable, and more tranquil.

**Imagining a sanctuary.** Finally, I will be asking you to picture in your imagination a calming place.

Here are two ground rules for this exercise.

1. Do what feels right to you. If you do not listen to all the suggestions that is O.K. If you think, "The image of a sanctuary I decided on simply is not going to be effective," feel free to replace it with another image.

2. At the beginning of this exercise, I will ask that you get into a comfortable position. Do whatever you need to do to get comfortable. Lying on the floor, or sitting with your back straight are two good positions. I will suggest that you do not cross your legs or arms. I find crossing your legs can be particularly annoying. This is a fairly long exercise, and those people who cross their legs often find their feet falling asleep halfway through it. That can be very disruptive. Nothing can break your chain of thought quite like having pins and needles rush up your legs.

Any comments, concerns, or questions?

Please get into a comfortable position.

**The Relaxation Exercise.** Begin by concentrating on your breathing. Breath very deeply. So deeply that your abdomen rises and falls as well as your chest. Just breath deeply -- slowly -- and as you concentrate on your breathing -- your body will gradually and steadily become very, very, relaxed. Your arms will relax -- Your legs will relax.
Breathing slower — and deeper. In —and — out. Soon you will feel more and more relaxed. And as you relax, your body will feel warmer and heavier.

Notice that you have already begun to relax. Your breathing has slowed down. Your muscles are more relaxed. And that's good. Now, concentrating on the muscles in your feet and calves, completely loosen and relax those muscles. As you relax, you will notice how your feet and calves do feel warmer and heavier. Warmer and heavier. Next relax your thighs. And as you do that, notice the warmth and heaviness continue to move up. And as you feel warmer and heavier, notice how you feel more tranquil and relaxed. Relaxed and peaceful.

Next relax the muscles in your pelvis and buttocks. Feeling very relaxed and very peaceful. Next relax the muscles in your lower back and abdomen. Notice the warmth and heaviness continues to expand.

Next relax the muscles in your chest. Allowing yourself to feel warm and relaxed, tranquil and comfortable. Relax the muscles in your upper back. Feeling warmer and heavier, content and at peace. And relax the muscles in your shoulders and arms and hands. Feeling very comfortable, very much at peace. And next relax the muscles in your neck allowing yourself to feel very tranquil. And finally relax the muscles in your face: loosening the muscles of your jaw, unfurrowing your brow, and releasing any tension around your eyes. And notice how you now feel very comfortable, very relaxed, very peaceful.
Imagine. . . Imagine seeing ahead of you the top of a very small flight of stairs with only five steps on it. In a moment, you are going to walk down this flight of stairs and with each step let yourself feel even more relaxed. Take the first step now, and let yourself feel more relaxed, more content, more at peace. Two, very tranquil and comfortable. Three, very calm and peaceful. Four, very relaxed, very comfortable, and five, completely relaxed and at ease.

You are now completely relaxed, and being relaxed you can imagine very clearly and very vividly. In your imagination, create an ideal place: a sanctuary. This place is a place where you will be totally safe and feel totally secure. It can be any place that you can imagine. It can be a tropical beach, a beautiful green forest, or a great mansion. Whatever you want. Take a minute to imagine your sanctuary.

And when imagining this ideal place use all of your senses.

What do you hear in your ideal place? Can you hear the waves hit the shore, or birds, a fireplace crackle? What do you hear?

And feel, what do you feel? Can you feel the sun warming your skin?

And smell. . . Are there any aromas in the air?

And see. . . What can you see?

When you are ready, return to the small flight of five steps. You are now on the bottom of this small flight of stairs. In a moment, you will imagine yourself going up those steps. With every step allow yourself to feel more alert, more energized and more awake. And as you become more alert, recognize that every time you do this exercise you
will be able to become relaxed quicker and stay calm longer. Being calmer and more relaxed you will be better able to concentrate on your studies and engage in other academic behaviours. Take that first step now, feeling more alert and energized. And the second step, feeling quite refreshed. The third step, ready to take on the day. The fourth step, more energized and invigorated, and take the fifth step allowing yourself to feel alert, refreshed, and return back to your room.

Any questions or comments?

Does anyone want to mention how they felt or how the exercise went for them?

Some typical questions. There are a few concerns that are fairly typical. Just in case they are concerns that you later run into, let me mention them to you now.

Some practitioners have suggested that relaxation is a learned skill. So if the relaxation exercise did not work that well today, do not worry. With practice, it will get better.

How often should you do these exercises? That to some degree is up to you. However, I suggest once a day, five days a week. Those people who have been most successful with these exercises have explicitly scheduled ten to fifteen minutes a day to do these exercises. For example, some contracted with themselves to do the exercise every evening just before they went to bed, every morning when they got up, or during their lunch break. You may also want to do this exercise just before a very stressful event like an exam or an in-class presentation.
How long will you be asked to try out this exercise? I am asking that you try out this exercise for the next 28 days. That should give me a sense of how effective the exercise is.

What if you do not remember how to do the exercise? Up front, there are audiotape copies of the exercise we just did. You are all encouraged to take one and to use it. I will request that you return the tape after the 28 days so we may reuse them. This allows us to reduce our costs. Of course, if you desire to make a copy of the tape, you are more than welcome to do that.

Any other questions?
Appendix I

Integrity Checks for the Study

The Effects of Guided Imagery Exercises on PASE

Imagery Group

In this study, although the presenters were encouraged to be flexible, certain comments should have been made. I am asking that you listen to the audiotape for session #1 and make note of the below.

Session #1: Description of the program. The goal of the first session is to have participants receive a basic understanding of the rationale for this program. To do this, I ask that the presenter mentions an example of previous research using imagery to enhance assertiveness. The presenter will explain next that the repetition of cognitions and the imagining of behaviours which seem close (i.e., slightly out of reach) to those in which the participants do believe they can engage are what make these techniques useful. Next, they should give an academic example of using imagery, and, finally, they ask the participants to jot down what cognitions they believe are hindering them academically. Please use the following checklist to see how many of these comments the presenter made.

a) ___ Individuals are practising assertive behaviours in imagination.

___ Individuals did act more assertively after imagery practice.
b) Repetition of cognitions makes those cognitions seem more believable.

c) However, imagery alone is not sufficient. The imagery must seem believable.

   We have to break our goals down into reasonable chunks, creating a hierarchy of goals.

d) Introduce conversational French lab example of creating a hierarchy of anxiety producing situations.

   Participants may be asked to imagine a class where they must repeat simple sentences in French.

   Participants may be asked to imagine a class where they must have simple conversations in French.

e) Ask the participants to jot down as concretely as possible the belief that is hindering them academically.

   Total out of a possible nine checkmarks.
Session #2: Imagery exercise. In session 2, the presenter is to describe the imagery exercise. This should involve talking about the relaxation component involving deep breathing, suggestions of calmness, and creating a sanctuary. The presenter should mention that the imagery section involves imagining the academic situation with which the participant has doubts. This session should have the following comments:

a) __ Introducing deep breathing as the beginning of the relaxation exercise.

__ The breathing exercise involves breathing deep enough that the participants can notice their abdomens, as well as chests, expanding and contracting.

b) __ The participants will give themselves suggestions of relaxation.

__ To give themselves these suggestions, the presenter will be using the example of walking down a small flight of steps.

c) __ The participants will be asked to create a sanctuary in their imagination.

d) __ The participants will be asked to imagine successfully doing that with which they have doubts.

e) __ The imagery section is not guided; the relaxation section is guided _____________ Total out of a possible seven checkmarks.
Session #3: Ravens. Much of the rest of the project involved giving self-administered tests. However, one of these tests (Raven's Progressive Matrices) involved some fairly specific instructions. Ideally, the instructions would involve the following components:

a) Every page of the test booklet has a pattern with a piece missing.

b) The questions are very easy at the beginning, but they progressively get more difficult.

c) By doing the easier questions, the participants may get hints on how to do the harder ones (or the harder ones may become easier).

d) There are no trick questions.

________________ Total out of four possible checkmarks.

________________ Signature of Reviewer
Relaxation Group

In this study, although the presenters were encouraged to be flexible, certain comments should have been made. I am asking that you listen to the audiotape for session #1 and make note of the below comments.

Session #1: Description of the program. The goal of the first session is to have participants receive a basic understanding of the rationale for this program. To do this, I ask that the presenter mentions the link between self-doubt and anxiety and that anxiety interferes with students' abilities to think clearly, promotes procrastination, and disrupts sleep. Next, the presenter should explain the goal of this group and ask the participants to jot down what cognitions they believe are hindering them academically. Please use the following checklist to see how many of these comments the presenter made.

a) __ Many students find that when they are studying they are also engaging in negative self-talk.

   __ One result of negative self-talk is the increase of anxiety.

b) __ Anxiety does not need to be increased very much before it starts to limit people's ability to concentrate.

   __ Anxiety is one of the reasons people have difficulties with procrastination.
Being anxious is uncomfortable, and we avoid activities that make us uncomfortable.

Sometimes anxiety is physically uncomfortable with people getting stress headaches or butterflies in their stomachs.

If anxiety becomes too high it can affect one's sleep.

c) The goal of this group is to help students become more motivated and become better thinkers by lowering their anxiety.

The imagery technique given to you next week will function predominantly to reduce your anxiety.

e) Ask the participants to jot down as concretely as possible the belief that is hindering them academically.

Total out of a possible nine checkmarks.
**Session #2: Relaxation Exercise.** In session 2, the presenter is to describe the relaxation exercise. This should involve talking about deep breathing, passive muscle relaxation, suggestions of calmness, and creating a sanctuary. This section should have the following comments:

a) ___ Introducing deep breathing as the beginning of the relaxation exercise.

__ The breathing exercise involves breathing deep enough that the participants can notice their abdomens, as well as chests, expanding and contracting.

b) ___ First, the presenter will ask the participants to relax the muscles in their feet and calves and slowly they will move all the way up to their faces.

__ Muscular tension actually adds to our feelings of anxiety

c) ___ The participants will give themselves suggestions of relaxation.

__ To give themselves these suggestions, the presenter will be using the example of walking down a small flight of steps.

.

d) ___ The participants will be asked to create a sanctuary in their imagination.

_________________________ Total out of a possible seven checkmarks.
Session #3 Ravens. Much of the rest of the project involved giving self-administered tests. However, one of these tests (Raven’s Progressive Matrices) involved some fairly specific instructions. Ideally, the instructions would involve the following components:

a) __ Every page of the test booklet has a pattern with a piece missing.

b) __ The questions are very easy at the beginning, but they progressively get more difficult.

c) __ By doing the easier questions, the participants may get hints on how to do the harder ones (or the harder ones may become easier).

d) __ There are no trick questions.

________________ Total out of four possible checkmarks.

_________________ Signature of Reviewer
Comparison Group

In this study, although the presenters were encouraged to be flexible, certain comments should have been made. I am asking that you listen to the audiotape for session #1 and make note of the below comments.

*Session #1: Description of the program.* The goal of the first session is to have participants receive a basic understanding of the rationale for this program. To do this, I ask that the presenter mention that poor study skills interfere with the students' abilities to be successful in their studies, that if students are clear in defining their area of academic concern they often find their concerns are remediable, and that some academic concerns are inaccurate. Next, the participants should be encouraged to jot down what cognitions they believe are hindering them academically. Please use the following checklist to see how many of these comments the presenter made.

a) __ I will ask you to fill out a questionnaire that helps me compare your study habits to other postsecondary students.

__ But first I want you to identify for me as clearly and concretely as you can what you believe is holding you back academically.
If they (students) get really specific in identifying their academic problems, there is usually a way of remediating or accommodating their difficulty.

Your academic self-doubt is sometimes incorrect.

b) Reading speed Example: A woman erroneously was told that she should be able to read over one page a minute of university level text if she was going to keep up in her studies.

She was not even close to this speed, and, because of this, she was a nervous wreck.

As soon as she heard that efficient studiers do not read this quickly, her anxiety became manageable and her studies became easier.

Thus, in this study, we want to make sure you are not worrying about something that is inaccurate or unnecessary.
c) ___ Ask the participants to jot down as concretely as possible the belief that is hindering them academically.

___________ Total out of a possible nine checkmarks.
Session #2: Ravens. Much of the rest of the project involved giving self-administered tests. However, one of these tests (Raven's Progressive Matrices) involved some fairly specific instructions. Ideally, the instructions would involve the following components:

a) ___ Every page of the test booklet has a pattern with a piece missing.

b) ___ The questions are very easy at the beginning, but they progressively get more difficult.

c) ___ By doing the easier questions, the participants may get hints on how to do the harder ones (or the harder ones may become easier).

d) ___ There are no trick questions.

______________ Total out of four possible checkmarks.

______________ Signature of Reviewer
Appendix J

Alternative Analysis for PASE Magnitude

When using a TSSE score of 10 as the cutoff for PASE magnitude, increases in the magnitude of the participants' TSSE scores continued to differ according to treatment group ($\chi^2[2, N = 71] = 10.07, p = .007; \eta_t = .377$) with the increases in the magnitude of the imagery group participants being significantly higher than increases in the TSSE magnitude scores of the comparison group ($t[30.34] = 3.69, p = .001$). The increases in the relaxation group's magnitude scores were significantly higher than the comparison group ($t[38.14] = 2.75, p = .005$). See Table 22 for the percentages of participants who achieved TSSE magnitude. However, the problem of ceiling effects became very apparent. At pretreatment, the imagery group had 43.48% of the participants already possessing TSSE magnitude. The relaxation group had 48.15% of the participants possessing TSSE magnitude. However, the comparison group had 80.95% possessing TSSE magnitude. The comparison group could not have matched the 39.13% increase seen in the imagery group. A further problem with these data was that the imagery group and the comparison group were significantly different at pretreatment on TSSE magnitude ($\chi^2[2, N = 71] = 6.94, p = .031; \eta_t = .277$).
Table 27

When using a cutoff of TSSE<10

Percentage of Participants who Achieved TSSE Magnitude
by Treatment Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th></th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagery</td>
<td>43.48%</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>82.61%</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxation</td>
<td>48.15%</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>74.07%</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>80.95%</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>80.95%</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1Task Specific Self-Efficacy
Appendix K

The Effects of the Treatments on Individual LASSI Scales and TSSE Strength

I conducted a multivariate repeated measures analysis with treatment as the independent variable and all 10 LASSI scales and TSSE strength repeating pre- to posttreatment as the dependent variables. There were differences between treatment groups on these scales (F[22, 118] = .469, p = .048; eta square = .235). As seen in Table 23, the treatment groups differed on the pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE strength scores. The imagery group had higher TSSE strength (t[5.25] = 2.42, g = .009) than the relaxation group. The comparison group had significantly lower pretreatment-corrected posttreatment TSSE strength scores (t[4.81] = -4.28, p < .001) than the combined means of the imagery and relaxation groups (LASSI scale pretreatment, posttreatment, and gain scores by treatment group can be found in Table 24).
Table 28

Mean Scores and Univariate F-tests for the LASSI\textsuperscript{a} and TSSE\textsuperscript{b} scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study skills</th>
<th>Pretreatment</th>
<th>Posttreatment</th>
<th>F (2, 67)</th>
<th>Sig. of F</th>
<th>η\textsuperscript{2}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>22.61 (7.28)</td>
<td>23.69 (7.48)</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.431</td>
<td>0.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude (interest)</td>
<td>32.07 (4.18)</td>
<td>32.20 (4.79)</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>0.188</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentration</td>
<td>24.99 (6.13)</td>
<td>26.39 (6.88)</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.808</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information processing</td>
<td>24.86 (5.53)</td>
<td>26.39 (6.45)</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.635</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>28.99 (6.72)</td>
<td>30.28 (6.58)</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.541</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-testing</td>
<td>22.31 (5.64)</td>
<td>24.25 (5.93)</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.879</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selecting main ideas</td>
<td>16.06 (3.92)</td>
<td>17.53 (4.17)</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.933</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support techniques</td>
<td>23.21 (4.50)</td>
<td>25.13 (5.66)</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.461</td>
<td>0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test taking strategies</td>
<td>26.82 (5.24)</td>
<td>28.62 (5.83)</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.633</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time management</td>
<td>22.90 (7.62)</td>
<td>23.63 (8.19)</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.888</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSSE strength</td>
<td>27.46 (26.01)</td>
<td>51.34 (29.53)</td>
<td>12.08</td>
<td>&lt; 0.001</td>
<td>0.262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. N = 71 for all scales both pre- and posttreatment

\textsuperscript{a}Learning and Study Strategies Inventory

\textsuperscript{b}Task Specific Self-Efficacy
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LASSI scales</th>
<th>Imagery (n = 23)</th>
<th>Relaxation (n = 27)</th>
<th>Comparison (n = 21)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pretreatment M(SD)</td>
<td>posttreatment M(SD)</td>
<td>change M(SD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>25.74 (6.52)</td>
<td>26.13 (6.80)</td>
<td>0.39 (8.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude</td>
<td>32.96 (3.91)</td>
<td>33.83 (4.47)</td>
<td>0.87 (3.92)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentration</td>
<td>26.44 (5.67)</td>
<td>28.22 (5.74)</td>
<td>1.78 (5.90)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Info. process.</td>
<td>24.26 (5.07)</td>
<td>26.26 (5.29)</td>
<td>2.00 (4.35)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>29.30 (5.30)</td>
<td>31.17 (5.63)</td>
<td>1.87 (4.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-testing</td>
<td>21.39 (5.22)</td>
<td>23.57 (4.59)</td>
<td>2.17 (4.20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main ideas</td>
<td>16.56 (3.51)</td>
<td>18.00 (3.64)</td>
<td>1.43 (3.58)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support tech.</td>
<td>23.13 (4.51)</td>
<td>25.17 (5.30)</td>
<td>2.04 (4.51)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test strategies</td>
<td>28.26 (5.43)</td>
<td>30.00 (5.50)</td>
<td>1.74 (6.24)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time manage.</td>
<td>24.39 (6.16)</td>
<td>24.74 (6.79)</td>
<td>0.34 (7.12)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix L

Analyses using Gain Scores

Four different analyses were conducted based on gain scores. As seen below, the results based on gain scores were similar to those obtained through MANCOVAs and repeated measures analyses. The first analysis conducted on gain scores was to determine whether the treatment groups differed on LASSI scale scores and TSSE strength (one-way MANOVA; treatment x the 10 LASSI and TSSE strength gain scores). The results obtained were similar to those results obtained through the repeated measures design. In fact, the only change that occurred by moving from a repeated measures design to a MANOVA design using gain scores was a very small change in TSSE strength from $F = 12.08$ to $F = 12.05$. There were differences between treatment groups ($F[22, 118] = .470$, $p = .047$; eta square= .235) on TSSE strength (see in Table 25). The results obtained using the Bonferroni pairwise comparison technique indicated that the imagery and the relaxation groups both had significantly greater TSSE strength than the comparison group.
Table 30

Univariate F-tests for the LASSI* and TSSEb scale gain scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Skills</th>
<th>F(2, 67)</th>
<th>Sig of F</th>
<th>η²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.431</td>
<td>0.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>0.188</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentration</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.808</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information processing</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.635</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.541</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-testing</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.879</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selecting main ideas</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.933</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support techniques</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.461</td>
<td>0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test taking strategies</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.633</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time management</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.888</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSSE Change</td>
<td>12.05</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
<td>0.262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Mean scores and standard deviations reported in Table 28

*Learning and Study Strategies Inventory

bTask Specific Self-Efficacy
Gain scores were used to determine if the treatment groups varied on the three LASSI factors and TSSE strength. The omnibus test was again significant (F [8, 132] = .34, p = .001; eta square = .171) with the treatment groups differing on TSSE strength (F [2, 68] = 12.05, p < .001; eta square = .262). Using the Least Significant Difference pair-wise comparisons, the imagery group had significantly higher gain scores than the relaxation group on TSSE strength. The comparison group had significantly lower gain scores than both the relaxation and imagery group. Finally, when using gain scores, there was not a significant interaction between treatment and imagery ability on TSSE strength (F[1, 47] = .702, p = .407; eta square = .016), and there was no significant effect for imagery ability alone on TSSE strength (F[1, 47] = .554, p = .461; eta square = .078). These results were similar to those found using MANCOVAs.
Appendix M

The Request for Volunteers

Imagery Group

Thank you for letting me speak to your class. My name is Wayne Schlapkohl. I am a doctoral student in applied psychology at OISE/ U of T (say just University of Toronto when speaking to Sir Sandford Fleming students). I asked Prof.____ if I could speak to your class because I am looking for volunteers for a project I am doing called the Student Success Project. The Student Success Project is designed to help students who believe their doubts or insecurities are hindering them from doing well at school.

Let me give you a quick thumbnail sketch of how this program began. As part of my degree, I was asked to do several counselling internships. Half of these I did in university counselling centres. As you might imagine, in these internships, I would often work with students who had the "smarts" to make it in school, but because of their self-doubts or insecurities they would mess up. These were people who would study hard for tests, but because of their worrying and self-doubts, they could not concentrate once they got into the exam room. Or other students believed that their chance of passing was so low that they could not get motivated to do their work, so procrastination was killing them. The counsellors and I would find ourselves saying, "I wish we knew what sort of program would most help these students who are low achievers, who are smart but whose insecurities are getting in the way of their expressing their potential and stopping them
from doing as well as their peers." So, as my thesis, I am examining different ways of assisting low achieving students so I can determine how best to help them. If you believe you are not doing as well as your peers, and, in particular, if you think you are not doing as well because of your self-doubts and insecurities, you are the type of volunteer for whom I am looking.

The program I am offering this class consists of three components: identifying and changing your self-defeating beliefs, feedback on your study skills, and, finally, group support. Often by having you define your self-doubts as clearly and concisely as possible you can start feeling better about yourself. First, you may feel better because some of what you are worried about is remediable. For instance, learning to write better or increasing your math skills are learnable skills. More important, doubt itself can be overcome. As part of this program, I help you have a more positive and realistic belief about your academic skills and abilities. I do this through guided imagery. Often students' doubts are maintained by their thinking about and imagining such things as failing exams and dropping out of school. I will be asking you to replace these doubts with images of success. For instance, You may have heard or read that most athletes imagine or mentally rehearse being successful and that this helps them be more confident when the heat is on. Well, in the same way that basketball players imagine the perfect basket or figure skaters imagine the perfect triple lutz before competition, I will be asking you mentally to rehearse successful academic performance. And I ask you to do this for much the same
reasons as athletes engage in mental rehearsal: often your self-doubt is the most important thing stopping you from being successful. Nonetheless, it may not be the only thing holding you back.

In the second part of the program, I will ask that you to fill out a standardized study skills questionnaire. This questionnaire compares how you study to other university students. It looks at such areas as how you figure out what are the main ideas in text or lectures, how you prepare for exams, how you review or organize your notes, how motivated you are, etc. This allows me to give you feedback on how you are studying and to give you ideas on how to study more effectively. The third thing this study offers is support. Often just talking about your concerns can reduce your worry and self-doubt. As Canadian science fiction writer, Spider Robinson (1986), stated, shared joy is increased, and shared pain is diminished.

The good news about this program is that it makes a lot of sense to believe that being more confident, studying more wisely, and getting peer support will help you in your studies. However, it will take some commitment on your part. For those of you who decide to volunteer for this project, I will be asking that you meet with me or a colleague of mine for five 1-hour meetings. In addition, I will be asking that you do approximately 10 minutes of homework a day while you are in this program. So, the program has a fair bit to offer you, but it also asks a fair bit of you. Do you have any questions of me at this time?
Let me hand out these slips of paper. They have my name, my telephone number, and my e-mail address on them. If you have any interest in the program, please drop me a line. As well, I will be available at the end of the class if you want to speak to me in person.
Control Group

Thank you for letting me speak to your class. My name is Wayne Schlapkohl. I am a doctoral student in applied psychology at OISE/ U of T (say just University of Toronto when speaking to Sir Sandford Fleming students). I asked Prof._____ if I could speak to your class because I am looking for volunteers for a project I am doing called the Student Success Project. The Student Success Project is designed to help students who believe their doubts or insecurities are hindering them from doing well at school.

Let me give you a quick thumbnail sketch of how this program began. As part of my degree, I was asked to do several counselling internships. Half of these I did in university counselling centres. As you might imagine, in these internships, I would often work with students who had the "smarts" to make it in school, but because of their self-doubts or insecurities they would mess up. These were people who would study hard for tests, but because of their worrying and self-doubts, they could not concentrate once they got into the exam room. Or other students believed that their chance of passing was so low that they could not get motivated to do their work, so procrastination was killing them. The counsellors and I would find ourselves saying, "I wish we knew what sort of program would most help these students who are low achievers, who are smart but whose insecurities are getting in the way of their expressing their potential and stopping them from doing as well as their peers." So, as my thesis, I am examining different ways of assisting low achieving students so I can determine how best to help them. If you believe
you are not doing as well as your peers, and, in particular, if you think you are not doing as well because of your self-doubts and insecurities, you are the type of volunteer for whom I am looking.

The program I am offering this class consists of three components: identifying and changing your self-defeating beliefs, feedback on your study skills, and, finally, group support. Often, by having you define your self-doubts as clearly and concisely as you possibly can, you can start feeling better about yourself. How is that possible? Very often when you very specifically and concretely identify why you believe you will not be successful in university (college), you will find that your doubts centre around skills that are remediable. For instance, learning to write better, increasing your math skills, or enhancing your reading comprehension are all learnable skills. The other thing I have found is that some self-doubts are absolutely, utterly irrational, and, once you find out that your beliefs are unfounded, a great deal of self-doubt will disappear.

In the second part of the program, I will ask that you to fill out a standardized study skills questionnaire. This questionnaire compares how you study to other university students. It looks at such areas as how you figure out what are the main ideas in text or lectures, how you prepare for exams, how you review or organize your notes, how motivated you are, etc. This allows me to give you feedback on how you are studying and to give you ideas on how to study more effectively. The third thing this study offers is support. Often just talking about your concerns can reduce your worry and self-doubt. As
Canadian science fiction writer, Spider Robinson (1986), stated, shared joy is increased, and shared pain is diminished.

The good news about this program is that it makes a lot of sense to believe that being more confident, studying more wisely, and getting peer support will help you in your studies. However, it will take some commitment on your part. For those of you who decide to volunteer for this project, I will be asking that you meet with me or a colleague of mine for three 1-hour meetings. So, the program has a fair bit to offer you, but it also asks a fair bit of you. Do you have any questions of me at this time?

Let me hand out these slips of paper. They have my name, my telephone number, and my e-mail address on them. If you have any interest in the program, please drop me a line. As well, I will be available at the end of the class if you want to speak to me in person.
Relaxation Group

Thank you for letting me speak to your class. My name is Wayne Schlapkohl. I am a doctoral student in applied psychology at OISE/ U of T (say just University of Toronto when speaking to Sir Sandford Fleming students). I asked Prof ___ if I could speak to your class because I am looking for volunteers for a project I am doing called the Student Success Project. The Student Success Project is designed to help students who believe their doubts or insecurities are hindering them from doing well at school.

Let me give you a quick thumbnail sketch of how this program began. As part of my degree, I was asked to do several counselling internships. Half of these I did in university counselling centres. As you might imagine, in these internships, I would often work with students who had the "smarts" to make it in school, but because of their self-doubts or insecurities they would mess up. These were people who would study hard for tests, but because of their worrying and self-doubts, they could not concentrate once they got into the exam room. Or other students believed that their chance of passing was so low that they could not get motivated to do their work, so procrastination was killing them. The counsellors and I would find ourselves saying, "I wish we knew what sort of program would most help these students who are low achievers, who are smart but whose insecurities are getting in the way of their expressing their potential and stopping them from doing as well as their peers." So, as my thesis, I am examining different ways of assisting low achieving students so I can determine how best to help them. If you believe
you are not doing as well as your peers, and, in particular, if you think you are not doing as well because of your self-doubts and insecurities, you are the type of volunteer for whom I am looking.

The program I am offering this class consists of three components: a relaxation component, feedback on your study skills, and, finally, group support. We have known for a very long time that for cognitively challenging tasks you do best if you have a low level of arousal. Too aroused and your ability to sustain attention, your recall from memory, and your ability to comprehend complex text are all reduced. So in this project, I ask you to do two things to help you relax. First, I ask you to define your self-doubts as clearly and concisely as possible. Often you will find that when you specifically nail down what worries you about academic, that your worries centre around academic skills that are very remediable. For instance, learning to write better or increasing your math skills are learnable skills. Knowing you can learn to overcome your deficits certainly can make you feel calmer. It may not, however, be enough, and I also ask that you practice a relaxation technique during the five weeks of this program.

In the second part of the program, I will ask that you to fill out a standardized study skills questionnaire. This questionnaire compares how you study to other university students. It looks at such areas as how you figure out what are the main ideas in text or lectures, how you prepare for exams, how you review or organize your notes, how motivated you are, etc. This allows me to give you feedback on how you are studying and
to give you ideas on how to study more effectively. The third thing this study offers is support. Often just talking about your concerns can reduce your worry and self-doubt. As Canadian science fiction writer, Spider Robinson (1986), stated, shared joy is increased, and shared pain is diminished.

The good news about this program is that it makes a lot of sense to believe that being more confident, studying more wisely, and getting peer support will help you in your studies. However, it will take some commitment on your part. For those of you who decide to volunteer for this project, I will be asking that you meet with me or a colleague of mine for three 1-hour meetings. So, the program has a fair bit to offer you, but it also asks a fair bit of you. Do you have any questions of me at this time?

Let me hand out these slips of paper. They have my name, my telephone number, and my e-mail address on them. If you have any interest in the program, please drop me a line. As well, I will be available at the end of the class if you want to speak to me in person.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.
NOTE TO USERS

This reproduction is the best copy available.

UMI
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NOM DE L'AUTEUR / NAME OF AUTHOR:</th>
<th>PERRY, Michael L.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADRESSE POSTALE / MAILING ADDRESS:</td>
<td>701-99 Holland Avenue, Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 0Y1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRADE / DEGREE:</td>
<td>Ph.D. (Religious Studies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANNÉE D'OBTENTION / YEAR GRANTED</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TITRE DE LA THÈSE / TITLE OF THESIS:</td>
<td>The Historical and Theological Bases of the Christian Religious Education Program in Ontario Public Schools</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

L'auteur permet, par la présente, la consultation et le prêt de cette thèse en conformité avec les règlements établis par le bibliothécaire en chef de l'Université d'Ottawa. L'auteur autorise aussi l'Université d'Ottawa, ses successeurs et cessionnaires, à reproduire cet exemplaire par photographe ou photocopie pour fins de prêt ou de vente au prix coûtant aux bibliothèques ou aux chercheurs qui en feront la demande.

Les droits de publication par tout autre moyen et pour vente au public demeureront la propriété de l’auteur de la thèse sous réserve des règlements de l’Université d’Ottawa en matière de publication de thèses.

N.B. LE MASCUIN COMPREND ÉGALEMENT LE FÉMININ

Dec. 4, 2000
(AUTEUR) M. L. Perry
DATE SIGNATURE (AUTHOR)
THE HISTORICAL AND THEOLOGICAL BASES OF THE CHRISTIAN RELIGIOUS EDUCATION PROGRAM IN ONTARIO PUBLIC SCHOOLS
THE HISTORICAL AND THEOLOGICAL BASES OF THE CHRISTIAN
RELIGIOUS EDUCATION PROGRAM IN ONTARIO PUBLIC SCHOOLS
by Michael L. Perry

Dissertation presented to the
Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
University of Ottawa
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Ottawa, Canada, 2000
© Michael Perry, Ottawa, Canada, 2000
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-58291-4
Abstract

This dissertation is a study of the historical and theological bases of the Christian religious education program in the public schools of Ontario. The role of the churches in the introduction, maintenance, decline and disappearance of the program is investigated.

In the early years, the Christian Churches in Ontario reflected the religious divisions of Europe following the Reformation. The overwhelming majority of citizens belonged to five major churches, but these were often in conflict with each other over doctrine and vied for government support for their own schools. A system of non-sectarian public schools which provided for optional religious instruction outside of the regular school hours emerged by the middle of the nineteenth century.

It was not until the late nineteenth century when Canada was expanding in territory and in population that a movement towards unity in the Protestant churches emerged -- partly as a strategy to evangelize the West and partly as a result of like-mindedness in combatting social ills. The union of churches and their increased cooperation in moral and social crusades was a pre-condition for their concerted efforts to obtain increased Christian teaching in the schools. Devotion to a common Bible enhanced these efforts.

Under wartime conditions, the Conservative government of George Drew introduced a mandatory program of Christian
religious education in the schools in 1944. Supporters of the program thought Christian teaching to be a remedy for various ills: the threats of fascism and communism, juvenile delinquency, sexual promiscuity, moral decline in general. Adherence to the regulations grew lax due to increasing opposition from minority religions and secular groups.

The factors which led to the establishment of the program of Christian religious education in 1944 included: reaction to the growth of Roman Catholic separate schools, Protestant ecumenism, concern about juvenile delinquency, the institutional aims of the churches, fears about decline in Sunday School attendance, general concern for the spiritual welfare of children, fears about the growth of secularism and atheism. The factors in the decline of the program relate to the exclusivity, christocentrism, and irrelevance of the Teachers' Guides, but more importantly to the rise of secular attitudes, the indifference of the public to the churches, increased diversity in society, and the basis of minority rights in the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

The program was gradually abandoned and officially dropped in 1990. The factors which led to this development included: the multifaith nature of the society, dated or non-existent curricula and materials, lack of support from society-at-large, the exclusivity of the Christian program, and little interest from teachers and students.
Acknowledgements

This dissertation was completed with the supervision of Professor Robert Choquette, Ph.D., of the Department of Religious Studies of the University of Ottawa. Dr. Choquette's timely advice and unfailing good humour were greatly appreciated.

The assistance and cooperation of the staff of the following archives are gratefully acknowledged: Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada, Toronto; Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec, Hamilton; Archives of the City of Ottawa; Archives of Ontario, Toronto; Archives of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Toronto; Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, Toronto; Archives of the United Church of Canada, Toronto; National Archives of Canada, Ottawa; National Archives of Quebec at Montreal; The Ontario Jewish Archives, Toronto. Dorothy Kealey of the Anglican Archives forwarded much useful material. Cathy Imrie of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education provided valuable practical assistance.

Financial assistance for the support of the project was provided by Huron College, London, Ontario, in the form of two graduate scholarships and by The Royal Canadian Legion in the form of a bursary.

Finally, I wish to thank my wife, Una, for her love, support, and encouragement during the research and writing of this dissertation.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract of The Historical and Theological Bases of the Christian Religious Education Program in Ontario Public Schools

INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1

1. The 1944 Program ....................................................... 1
2. Related Works ........................................................... 6
3. Method ................................................................. 16
4. Sources ............................................................... 19
5. Overview ............................................................... 21

Chapter

I. THE HISTORY OF THE RELIGIOUS EDUCATION QUESTION IN ONTARIO PUBLIC SCHOOLS TO 1950 ............................... 25

1. The Historical Background 1791 – 1943 ............................. 25
2. The Regulations of 1944 A Change of Policy .......................... 40
3. The Impact of the 1944 Regulations ................................ 46
4. 'State Religion' in Ontario Schools .................................. 54

II. THEOLOGIES IN THE CLASSROOM IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY ................................................................. 61

1. Introduction .................................................................. 61
2. The Anglican View ....................................................... 62
3. The Methodist Model .................................................... 77
4. Presbyterian Doctrines ................................................... 85
5. Baptist Beginnings ....................................................... 91
6. The Roman Catholic Ethos in Education ............................ 98
7. Other Christian Bodies ................................................... 105
   a) Lutherans ............................................................. 105
   b) Congregationalists ................................................. 107
8. Summary and Conclusion ............................................... 108

III. THE EMERGENCE OF A PROTESTANT CONSENSUS .............. 112

1. Introduction .................................................................. 112
2. The Importance of the Bible ........................................... 113
3. The Trend Towards Unity  ............................................. 121
   a) The Presbyterian Union ........................................... 124
   b) The Methodists .................................................... 126
   c) The Anglicans ..................................................... 127
   d) The Baptists ....................................................... 129
   e) The United Church of Canada .................................. 130
4. Cooperation Among the Churches ................................... 139
5. Summary .................................................................... 155
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IV. COOPERATION WITH THE STATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PROTESTANTISM IN THE CURRICULUM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education and Denominational Initiatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Churches Press the Issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) The Anglicans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) The Presbyterians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) The Baptists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) The United Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Issue of Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Drew Government's Policy Realized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Responses to the Drew Government's Policy on Religious Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. PROTESTANTISM IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DENOUEMENT AND PERPLEXITY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Teachers' Guides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Inter-Church Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Jewish Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Report of the Royal Commission on Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Teachers and Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Dissatisfaction and Reappraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. THE SECULAR PUBLIC SCHOOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Churches and the Mackay Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Christian Religion and Moral Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Abandonment of Christian Religious Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION | 270

APPENDICES | 286

A. A Summary of the Table of Contents of the Guide Books for Instructors in Public Schools | 286

B. A Chronology of Some Important Events in Ontario Public School Religious Education | 290

C. Report re Work of Ontario Inter-Church Committee | 293

D. Religious Education in the Public Schools: A Memorandum for the Department of Education from the Inter-Church Committee on Week Day Religious Education, April 3, 1944 | 296
E. Memorandum Regarding the Findings of an Informal Sub-Committee Reporting on Religious Education in Ontario to the Study Committee of the Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario on the Evening of April 19, 1944 .................303
F. Letter to the Clergy of the Anglican Diocese of Toronto from the Right Reverend F. H. Wilkinson ..................................................307
H. Statement of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec re Religious Instruction in the Public Schools of Ontario, 1965 .................313
I. Regulation 262, Revised Regulations of Ontario, 1980: Religious Exercises and Religious Education in the Public Schools ..................316
J. Policy/Program Memorandum No. 112: Education About Religion in the Public Elementary and Secondary Schools ..................319

BIBLIOGRAPHY........................................................................324

A. Archival Material..........................................................324
   1. Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada ........324
   2. Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec ........326
   3. Archives of the City of Ottawa .........................326
   4. Archives of Ontario ........................................326
   5. Archives of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education ....327
   6. Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada ................329
   7. Archives of the United Church of Canada ........329
   8. National Archives of Canada, Ottawa ...............330
   9. National Archives of Quebec at Montreal ........330
  10. The Ontario Jewish Archives .........................330
B. Published Sources......................................................331
C. Theses and Dissertations...........................................341
D. Newspapers and Journals.............................................342
INTRODUCTION

1. The 1944 Program

In 1944 a mandatory "Programme for Religious Education in the Public Schools" was initiated by the Government of Ontario. The regulations concerning religious education were revised to provide for religious teaching as an integral part of the school curriculum. A detailed course of study in religious education was stipulated. The program was promoted by the Protestant churches. By regulation, it was to be non-sectarian and non-divisive, and to be Christian rather than of a multi-faith character. The program stipulated that "scriptural interpretations are to be non-sectarian, and will not follow the tenets or doctrines of any particular creed. They will be confined to those expressions of the Christian faith upon which all Christian denominations are in substantial agreement."3

Although it was claimed that the program was based on what all Christians believe, this presumed a conflation of distinctive doctrines which were never harmonized. Characterized as Christian, the program was narrowly Protestant in its concerns. It was a strategic alliance

2Ibid., 7
3Ibid.
rather than a theological identity. The participating churches did not always agree in theology or doctrine, but they shared moral and behavioural ideals based upon a Protestant ethic of rectitude and conformity to convention.

The content of the program resembled its British predecessor. It was concerned with making good Christian children. The theological content of the Apostles' Creed and the Ten Commandments, upon which the program was purportedly based, was rarely mentioned in the material taught to the children. However, there were many examples of Scripture verses being a starting point for a discussion of conventional behaviour and democratic citizenship. Minority groups, such as Ontario Jews, did not accept the assumption that democracy was based upon Christianity.

The church officials and politicians who promoted the program were white, middle-class, Protestant, male clerics and secular officials of British cultural and racial origin. Dominant in both church and state, they enjoyed privileges in the governance of public education which were denied to others. Their official doctrines, as evidenced by catechisms and official church pronouncements, reflected adherence to traditions passed down from their European parent denominations. Their social views tended to reflect conservatism in religion and education.

While in the 1930s, curricular trends had moved toward a progressive pole, the Second World War brought an intentional swing toward traditional education. The 1944 program of
religious education was a retrogression which, enabled by wartime exigencies, was not to be reversed until the 1960s and not to be eliminated until 1990.

The terms 'religion' and 'religious' are so broad that a few words of clarification are needed. For the purposes of this dissertation, the term 'religion' usually denotes the Christian religion and its doctrines. More specifically, the dissertation is concerned with organized religion as, for example, major Christian denominations which are characterized by a definite structure, polity, significant membership. Although 'religious' is used as an adjective with education, the emphasis of the religious education program of 1944 was specifically Protestant, indoctrinational, and easily distinguished from the secular portion of the curriculum. It was concerned more with matters of belief than with matters of fact. Moreover, in spite of claims by the Protestant churches that the program was broad enough for all children, there were objections to its exclusivity by minority parents. The program obtained for a time because of the dominance of the Protestant churches in Ontario society during the post-World War II period. Later on, religious education came to denote something more closely resembling comparative religion or religious studies of a non-indoctrinational nature. The 1944 program was more concerned with religion than it was with education. The aim was to influence children's thought and behaviour according to predetermined values and beliefs. The
material to be presented to students was sometimes imaginary and mythical, rather than factual.

'Religious education', for the purposes of this dissertation, means the passing on, as normative, of Christian knowledge, beliefs and values to the young. These denotations are most often implied in the sources, even though they could hardly obtain today. A narrow, rather than a liberal, understanding of the term 'religious education' suits the 1944 program.

The purpose of the religious education program was identified:

... preparing children to live in a democratic society which bases its way of life upon the Christian ideal. ... to lead the child to choose and accept as his own those ideals of conduct and endeavour which a Christian and democratic society approves. ... to bring home to the pupils as far as their capacity allows, the fundamental principles of Christianity and their bearing on human life and thought. Religious Instruction must aim to set up ideals, to build attitudes, and to influence behaviour, as well as to teach Scriptural facts and Biblical text.\(^4\)

The Course of Study consisted of two parts: the religious exercises and the systematic study of the Scriptures.\(^5\) The religious exercises, to be conducted at the beginning of each school day, were devotional in character and consisted "largely of Scripture readings, prayer, and music".\(^6\) Two thirty-minute periods per week were to be set aside for the study of the Scriptures. The basis of the

---

\(^4\)Ibid., 5-6

\(^5\)Ibid., 7.

\(^6\)Ibid.
Scripture study was a series of six graded teachers' guides which had been used in English Schools and which were revised for use in the schools of Ontario. Each lesson in the manuals included the reading and studying of a definite passage of Scripture, an expanded story about the Scripture passage to be studied, background notes for the teacher on historical information regarding the setting of the Scripture story, and suggestions for additional class work and activities appropriate to the topic. In the primary grades the main emphasis in Scripture teaching was "the background of family and community life as Jesus knew it." For grades four to six, the selected stories from the Old Testament were "action and adventure oriented" and "rich in picturesque detail". They were "about men and women to whom God was the greatest reality, however primitive and undeveloped their ideas may have been. The heroes of the early Hebrews, sometimes savage and primitive, appeal to the young child." The stories and parables from the New Testament selected for inclusion in the program were deemed "incomparable for telling".

The teachers' manuals were organized thematically as follows: Grade I - The Friend of Little Children; Grade II - Stories of God and Jesus; Grade III - Jesus and His Friends; Grade IV - Servants of God; Grade V - Leaders of God's

---

7 Ibid., 10.
8 Ibid., 11.
9 Ibid., 12.
10 Ibid., 11.
People; Grade VI - Jesus and the Kingdom; Grade VII - The Story of Jesus according to Mark; Grade VIII - The Ethical Teachings of Jesus. "A Summary of the Table of Contents of the Guide Books for Instructors in Public Schools" is included as Appendix A.

The program depended on compliance with traditional views of the place of religion in the education of children. Although accepted widely in post-war society, it began to unravel by the 1960s. The widespread rejection of the program after 1970, however, encouraged conservative Christians to lobby for Christian teaching in the schools precisely for this reason. This polarity continues to affect the question of religion in the public schools.

The program was titled "Programme for Religious Education in the Public Schools". However, the curricular and pedagogical contexts of the program will be addressed only insofar as these relate to Protestant religious instruction.

2. Related Works

While a substantial amount of literature exists on the history of Ontario education, the place of Protestant doctrines within it, other than Victorian moral precepts, has

---

11[Inter-Church Committee]. "A Summary of the Table of Contents of the Guide Books for Instructors in Public Schools", 1961. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
received little attention. For example, Curtis\textsuperscript{12} has viewed religion within the context of a bourgeois project to reshape society along middle class lines. He emphasized the fascination of bourgeois educators with the "values of regularity, orderliness, predictability, reliability, sobriety, intellectualism, respect for property, religion and the ever elusive 'cheerful and willing obedience' to authority."\textsuperscript{13} He was interested in applying sociocritical theory to the history of the construction of the educational system in nineteenth-century Ontario. In a similar work, Prentice,\textsuperscript{14} a social historian, has written about early Ontario education. Prentice's concern was the expansion of the professional bureaucracy into state education and its concern to adumbrate class conflict. She has noted that Christianity was prominent in the opening and closing exercises of schools, and that Ryerson put pressure on school bureaucrats and teachers to conform to these.\textsuperscript{15} There was no provision for mandatory religious instruction in the classroom with a prescribed curriculum until 1944.

\textsuperscript{13}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{14}Alison Prentice, \textit{The School Promoters: Education and Social Class in Mid-Nineteenth Century Upper Canada} (Don Mills, Ontario: Oxford University Press, 1999).
\textsuperscript{15}Ibid., 128-9.
Tomkins' has presented a broad account of Canadian education focusing on curriculum. He has made a few brief references to religion in the curriculum. He has discussed the importance of religion and morality in the Victorian curriculum, noting the attempts of reformers to teach "moral precepts and standards of conduct by building moral education into all subjects." He has noted also that, following the recommendation of the MacKay Committee in 1969, values education began to replace religion in most Ontario public schools. While Tomkins has given brief mention of this development, he has not examined the Ontario religious education program of 1944. In many histories of education, the 1944 program of Protestant religion in the public schools has received little attention.

The program of 1944 was influenced by the war and the renewed imperialism and traditionalism which it brought. Robert Stamp, in The Schools of Ontario--1876-1976, has situated the 1944 program of religious education within the broad framework of education for democratic citizenship which characterized the period during and after World War II. Stamp viewed Premier George Drew's program in religion as training for such citizenship. As Stamp has stated: "In

---

17Ibid., 60.
18Ibid., 346.
20Ibid.
Drew's mind, a 'Christian society' and a 'democratic society' were closely linked, if not synonymous.\textsuperscript{2} Moreover, when the religious education question became controversial during the election of 1945, Conservative leader Drew entered the election by charging that the Liberals would take religion out of the schools and that the Co-operative Commonwealth Federation (CCF), because of its divisions over the issue, had no clear platform. Portraying himself as a defender of Christianity, Drew supported the program as long as he held office\textsuperscript{22} and even in later years.\textsuperscript{23} Evidence gathered in this research supports Stamp's interpretation.

Manzer\textsuperscript{24} has made only brief reference to the issue of religion in Ontario schools. He has explained non-sectarian education as a triumph of conservative liberalism under Ryerson.\textsuperscript{25} He has mentioned the campaign by the Protestant churches, begun in 1927, to institute religion in the schools.\textsuperscript{26} The thrust of his argument was that liberal ideology underlay educational policy in Canadian schools. Regarding religious instruction, he has recapitulated briefly the shift from mandatory religious instruction to an optional multicultural, multifaith program by 1990. However, his book

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{21}ibid., 181
\textsuperscript{22}ibid., 181-182
\textsuperscript{23}"Religion in the Schools", Kirkland Lake Northern Daily News (April 1, 1969), 4.
\textsuperscript{24}Robert Manzer, Public Schools and Political Ideas: Canadian Educational Policy in Historical Perspective (Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1994),
\textsuperscript{25}ibid., 55.
\textsuperscript{26}ibid., 172-3.
\end{flushright}
is so broad in scope that he has not dealt with religious ideas in detail.

Gidney and Millar have recognized that "throughout the first half of the nineteenth century the churches remained major participants in the educational enterprise." They have recognized the influence of Victorian culture with respect to segregation of the sexes, the Christian family, patterns of authority, and class differences throughout the nineteenth century. They have recognized also that because the secondary schools became secularized later in the nineteenth century, the influence of Protestant clergy decreased accordingly.

The emphasis in this dissertation is upon how the Protestant churches were able to get their characteristic teachings into the regular public elementary school program. This campaign, which culminated in the 1944 program, had its genesis in the nineteenth century. The role of the churches in the actual program and the role of the churches during the eclipse of the program will be investigated. The present study is concerned with explaining how a once acceptable program came to be rejected even by the participating churches themselves. In looking at the influence of the Protestant churches, it is important to consider their doctrines and catechisms because the program was ultimately

---

rejected by its detractors due to its Protestant doctrinal exclusivity.

Nineteenth century Canadian theological history has been researched by Michael Gauvreau.\textsuperscript{25} He has shown that evangelical theology persisted in the mainline churches well into the twentieth century, even as the threats of liberalism and social science were displacing it in academia. The framers of the antecedents to the 1944 program paid little attention to the claims of liberal scholarship, as is evidenced by their conservatism. There was a consensus within Ontario Protestantism which Gauvreau has named 'orthodoxy'.\textsuperscript{29} Evangelical themes continued to be explicated in preaching by many clergy, even while the more theologically literate among them attempted to address challenges such as Darwinism, critical views of Scripture, and explanations of reality based on the experimental and social sciences. The theology of the 1944 program was not concerned with the liberal-fundamentalist debate in religion, but its weak orthodoxy attracted critics from both the left and the right. The watered-down biblical information presented in the program did not survive without serious attacks from liberals and fundamentalists. The 1944 program was for elementary school students. This may be a reason why the insights of scholarship were rarely canvassed. However, Gauvreau's work


\textsuperscript{29}Ibid., 5.
is important in order to situate Protestant religious education within the wider theological context. The content of the 1944 program, meant for young children, neglected most modern theological scholarship in favour of a simple view which presupposed a naive literalism. The child was expected to accept uncritically the Bible-based lessons in the program.

McKillop\(^{30}\) has written about nineteenth-century Canadian intellectual history in colleges and universities. He has acknowledged that clergy were influenced by the debates over such issues as Darwinism, doubts about the Bible, and philosophical challenges to orthodoxy. However, the promoters of religious education in the classroom, clerical or lay, were little affected because they based their religious beliefs upon faith. McKillop has noted that even when new ideas triumphed over the old religion, "the moral imperative in anglo-Canadian thought remained a constant presence".\(^3\)

Previous dissertations and theses have focused on philosophical, political, and social factors related to religion in public education. Coppin\(^{32}\) has studied underlying philosophical issues of religion in secular education. He has discussed the major philosophical problems of having


\(^{31}\)Ibid., flyleaf.

religious studies in elementary and secondary schools. He has claimed that religious events and the human responses to certain claims in religion, and therefore religion itself, have effected significant events in history and culture. He has concluded that secular religious education can be legitimately investigated wherever history, culture, and religion intersect. Young\textsuperscript{33} has discussed the problem of whether or not religious education is possible within a public school context. He has examined the philosophical and pedagogical implications of such a project and concluded that, while religion could be taught, it must be subject to open examination by those involved.

Organ\textsuperscript{34} has shown how denominational schooling can exist in a publicly-funded provincial system. He has chosen Newfoundland as an example. This option has been mooted by Christian fundamentalists and other religious minorities.

Dyck\textsuperscript{35} has studied the place of religious and moral education in the public schools of Ontario in the 1960s, 1970s, and 1980s. He has concluded that religious education is desirable, essential, and unavoidable for public schools in a pluralistic society and that moral and religious education should continue to be linked. He preferred that

\textsuperscript{33}Gordon Leslie Young, "Religion, Knowledge, and Public Education" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Toronto, 1985).
students be allowed to study moral issues in both a religious and a secular way.

Matthews\textsuperscript{36} and Schweyer\textsuperscript{37} have studied the historical development of religious education in Ontario schools. Matthews, an educational bureaucrat, was sympathetic toward religion in the schools. His study focused on elementary education. Although now dated, his dissertation remains valuable for historic details to 1950. Schweyer has provided a brief historical survey of religious education in Ontario schools from the early nineteenth century to 1973. Neither author has treated the specifically religious or theological foundations of the 1944 program in depth.

In a brief study, Mobley\textsuperscript{38} concentrated on the campaign by the Protestant churches to implement the 1944 program of religious education in the schools of Ontario. He concluded that this foray into politics on the part of the churches was ill-advised and ultimately detrimental to their image. In his view, the strategy of the Protestant churches in the field of education was a reaction to fears about the growing Roman Catholic school system. He was more narrowly concerned with the program as an anomalous event than with its earlier historical and theological genesis.

\textsuperscript{36}D. E. Matthews, "The History of the Religious Factor in Ontario Elementary Education" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Toronto, 1950).

\textsuperscript{37}Douglas Schweyer, "The History and Development of Religious Education in Ontario Schools" (Masters thesis, Concordia Theological Seminary, St. Louis, Missouri, 1973).

\textsuperscript{38}J. A. Mobley, "Protestant Support of Religious Instruction in Ontario Public Schools" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, Ann Arbour, 1962).
Thomas\textsuperscript{39} has examined aspects of church-state relations concerning religious education in the public schools of Ontario. He has recognized that Ontario society was greatly influenced by the Protestant churches and he was familiar with the influences of the churches on public education. He has written an account of the political background of the 1944 religious education program which has been helpful as a context for the present study. However, he has mentioned the historic doctrines and teachings of the churches and the period of church unions and cooperation only in passing.

While the philosophical, social, and political context is very important to an understanding of the 1944 religious education program, explanations which contribute to a clear picture of its specifically religious and theological bases are also important. These theological and religious bases have received little attention. Although the 1944 program is addressed in part in some of the studies cited above, little research has been published about its theological and ecclesiastical foundations.

Robert Stamp\textsuperscript{40} has studied fully religious exercises in Ontario schools. Therefore, this topic will not be examined closely here. This dissertation is concerned with the portion of the program which consisted of Bible study.


\textsuperscript{40}Robert Stamp, Religious Exercises in Elementary and Secondary Schools, (Toronto: Queen's Printer for Ontario, 1986).
A key reason for the genesis of the program was a shift from a perception of doctrinal incompatibility among the Protestant denominations in the early nineteenth century to a later willingness to downplay differences in favour of a strategic alliance aimed at a program of Bible-centred education in the public schools. The study of this development has necessitated an examination of the churches and their interaction over the century preceding the installation of the program.

3. Method

While other lines of investigation have been, and are, possible, the present study is an attempt to describe clearly, accurately, and fairly the history of Protestantism and the public schools of Ontario over a period exceeding a century. Such longterm investigations have been undertaken fruitfully by the religious historian, Jean Delumeau in more than thirty monographs.41 One of these investigations, Sin and Fear,42 is translated into English. In this work,

---

42Jean Delumeau, Sin and Fear: The Emergence of a Western Guilt Culture in the 13th-18th Centuries. Translated by Eric Nicholson (New York: St.
Delumeau has taken up the religious theme of sin, a theological category, over a wide period in order to explain its continuing impact on modern society by providing "a historical record of an era rapidly receding into the past."\textsuperscript{43} His "historical inquiry"\textsuperscript{44} has aimed to document the changes over time within the cultural phenomenon of an era by examining it in three parts. The first part entailed tracing the origins and causes of that phenomenon back in time. The second part was one of investigating that phenomenon within the world in which it was formerly perceived and practiced. The third part was intended to close the circle by demonstrating diffusion of the phenomenon.\textsuperscript{45}

This dissertation is concerned with change over time in the religious instruction of children in public schools, specifically the change from an optional religion program of the nineteenth century, to the appearance of the mandatory program in 1944 and its abandonment in 1990. Therefore, the long view has been taken. Reasons for these developments may not be apparent from a micro-study of each period in isolation.

The vertical axis is chronology. At a critical point, the topic is considered horizontally; it is taken up in greater detail and analyzed in greater depth.

\textsuperscript{43}Ibid., 4.
\textsuperscript{44}Ibid., 5.
\textsuperscript{45}Ibid., 4.
This type of exploration has entailed locating relevant primary and secondary resources which shed light on the churches and their ventures into public education. On occasion, the facts and ideas unearthed from the sources have been analyzed for their significance for an understanding of historical and theological trends, and their impact on religious history in Ontario over a period of more than a century. Therefore, the sources have been cited often at length in order to represent more clearly their historical flavour.

Certain premises underlie this investigation. First, the religious education program of 1944 was part of a strategy by conservative Ontarians to reassert the mythical past of loyalty to Crown and Empire and traditional religion. This past was largely a dream of white, Protestant Anglo-Ontario. It did not endure intact in a multicultural milieu.

Second, Protestantism itself has two poles, Law and Gospel. Protestant catechesis and religion have stressed Law, God's judgment, more often than God's mercy. During the present inquiry, a legalistic interpretation of the tradition was found to prevail. The 'Social Gospel' of God's grace and forgiveness and the need to reform society, advocated by radical clergy such as J. S. Woodsworth and Salem Bland, played little part in the thinking of promoters of public school religious education. They wanted to entrench the

---

status quo. The 1944 program was more an attempt to 'lay down the Law' than to lay bare causes of social injustice.

Ontario was conservative--indeed it was governed by the Conservative party from 1943 to 1985. The conservatism of the Protestant Churches was both a factor in Ontario's history and, by about 1970, an anachronism. The major churches did rediscover 'Gospel', but this rediscovery probably came too late. The assumption in this project has been that while the Protestant community shaped theology, theology also shaped the Protestant community.

4. **Sources**

The primary materials for the present research are archival. Major sources consulted have been the following: the collection, "Religion in the Schools--Ontario" and the papers of "The Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in the Schools" at the Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada; "The Historical Collection" of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (which included the Teachers' Guides of the 1944 program and the Briefs to the Hope Commission of 1945-50); the Briefs to the Mackay Committee of 1965-69 located at the Archives of Ontario; the minutes of various church bodies located at the Archives of the Anglican, Baptist, Presbyterian, and United Churches; the correspondence files on "Religion in the Schools" of the Ontario Jewish Congress located at the Ontario Jewish
Archives; the Minutes of the Montreal-Ottawa Conference of the United Church of Canada located at the National Archives of Quebec at Montreal; the Minutes of the Ottawa Presbytery, United Church, located at the Archives of the City of Ottawa; various historic catechisms, pamphlets, and church records. These materials have been amassed, analyzed, and organized. Inferences have been drawn. The materials are necessary for a clear understanding of the role of the churches in the genesis and development of the program.

The dissertations and theses cited in the text were consulted at the National Archives of Canada or ordered from the Interlibrary Loan Service of the University of Ottawa. Government publications concerning the program were unearthed at the various sources named above.

A study of the archival material has shown how the churches affected, and were affected by, the 1944 program. The church-related documents were most useful in determining denominational doctrines as well as policies concerning religion in the schools. The program of 1944 was distinct from the other subjects in the regular curriculum. The religious content sprang from the Protestant churches, not from the educational bureaucracy. While the present research emphasizes developments within the churches, the significance of the program within the context of the history of Ontario is considered as well.
Major authors who stimulated thinking were William Westfall47 and John Webster Grant.48 Westfall's thesis, that there was a "growing religious consensus" and "an informal Protestant alliance on a large number of moral issues" between 1850 and 188149, has been borne out. How this Protestant culture shaped the problem of religious education in the schools is taken up in the present study. Grant's treatment of the history of the major denominations of nineteenth-century Ontario was helpful for its deft portrayal of Protestantism. Neither Grant nor Westfall have discussed religious education in the schools in detail. It is this author's contention that both cooperation between churches and church unions during the period 1875-1925 were critical to an understanding of Protestant influences on religion in the schools.

5. Overview

Chapter I is a survey of the history of the question of Christian religious teaching in the public schools to 1950. The emphasis is on the introduction of a mandatory program of Christian religious education in 1944. This chapter lays the groundwork for a more detailed examination of theological and

49Westfall, 11.
ecclesiastical developments as well as providing a basic chronology and overview.

In Chapter II, "Theologies in the Classroom in the Nineteenth Century", the use of catechisms and other religious material in teaching children is discussed. The particular religious ethos of each denomination is explored. It is posited that there were differences among the churches over doctrine, even though consensus on moral and social issues began to emerge. Denominations were as divided in early Upper Canada by doctrine, polity, and views on education as secularists and conservative Christians are today. They did not begin to contemplate common action until they realized that their many solitudes could accomplish little for the church or the state.

In Chapter III, "The Emergence of a Protestant Consensus", Ontario Protestants, depicted as often poles apart in doctrine, are found to be bibliocentric. While they could not agree always on a specific interpretation of the Scriptures, the Bible was the most important book in the world to them. This explains a coordinated effort to obtain Bible reading in the public schools which their children attended. This hope has a long history which only became effective by 1930, when a graded program of Bible readings was introduced into the schools. There was agreement that the Bible readings were not to be interpreted in a sectarian manner.
The cooperation of the churches with the state is the focus of Chapter IV. The contribution of the Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education to the development of the religious education program, the official positions of the major Protestant denominations represented on this committee, the issue of control, and the responses of the Committee and the churches to the Regulations of 1944 are presented as part of the process of making the mandated Christian religious education program a reality in the public schools of Ontario.

In Chapter V, "Protestantism in the Public Schools", the problem of the Teachers' Guides, and the continuing involvement of the Inter-Church Committee and the churches in the program are outlined. The development of opposition to the program on the part of minority groups, which viewed the religious education program as a course in Protestant indoctrination, is examined.

The rather abrupt decline and disappearance of the religious education program is outlined in Chapter VI, "The Secular Public School". The Mackay Committee Report of 1969 recommended the incidental teaching of religion, rather than the existing indoctrinational program in the schools. In 1990, the Watson Report recommended the abandonment of the program in favour of a mandatory, multifaith, non-indoctrinational program of studies focusing on the world religions. Although the program was not dropped immediately, it began to decline. In 1990, the courts struck down the regulations concerning the program.
A guiding question throughout this research has been: What were the historical and theological bases or foundations of the 1944 program? More specifically, how were the churches able to get the religious content of the program into the schools, how did the churches continue to be involved once the program was mandated, and what role did the churches play in the program during the period of time that it was being abandoned?
CHAPTER I

THE HISTORY OF THE RELIGIOUS EDUCATION QUESTION IN ONTARIO PUBLIC SCHOOLS TO 1950

1. The Historical Background: 1791 - 1943

It is often believed that the province of Ontario was founded and maintained on Christian principles and morality. That, certainly, was a desideratum of the British governing class. Simcoe, governor in 1791, aimed to "inculcate in all ranks and descriptions of people a sober and an industrious, religious, and conscientious spirit which shall be the best security that a government can have for its internal preservation". But in the early days, churches and schools, which were the preferred agents for this inculcation, were few in number and scattered throughout the province. Early schools were private and denominational and were open only to those who could afford the tariff--that is, the gentry. Teachers were often clergy who supplemented their stipends by taking in students. The curriculum was British in pattern. While religion was incidental to it, the aim was to prepare students with a modicum of instruction thought necessary to their station in society. Some of the gentry hired private

---

tutors or sent their children abroad for their education. Most settlers were too beset by the challenges of the backwoods and lacked cash enough, or inclination enough, to secure formal education for their children, who were needed to work at home or to pursue a gainful occupation as soon as possible. That is not to say that they would not acquire some basic literacy or numeracy at home or in a Sunday School. Full-time study was beyond their reach.

The influence of religion was not negligible during the early period of settlement. In the towns and villages there might be a church or at least a resident clergyman. Even in the backwoods missionaries and preachers visited periodically. These visits were great occasions upon which baptisms were administered and other ministrations exercised. If the minister was licensed to do so, he performed marriages. Any other worship or devotion was left to the heads of families who might possess a Bible or prayer book. While the Church of England was slow to develop due to lack of clergy and desultory finances, Methodist circuit riders, often based in the United States, spread their evangelical gospel to many in the sparsely-populated province. There were also Roman Catholic and Presbyterian settlers and lesser numbers belonging to other denominations and sects. No group dominated the political scene, except for an Anglican oligarchy in the early years.

In 1807, public schools were authorized in each of eight areas of the province, but they were intended for the gentry.
By 1816 the population of the province had expanded to the point that provision for the education of the populace was made in the Common Schools Act. The institutions authorized by this act were rudimentary and poorly-staffed. There was little mention of religion or morality. In the same year, suggested rules for Schools and Teachers for Niagara and the Home District provided for opening prayers before school, religious instruction on Wednesday and Saturday morning, and permission to teach a catechism approved by the parents.

In 1820, a small amount of money was voted for Sunday Schools. This was discontinued in 1833. A half-hearted measure for Sunday Schools could not remedy the perceived lack of religious instruction in weekday schools.

In 1835, Dr. Charles Duncombe made an extensive survey of education in Europe and the United States. He advocated religious and moral teaching in the schools to be given by the classroom teacher\(^2\). Nonetheless, instruction in religion was irregular, even though the Bible was used as a reader.

There was little opposition to Christian teaching in the schools, but little agreement as to the form of it. John Strachan, Anglican priest and future bishop, wanted the doctrines of the Church of England taught. Egerton Ryerson, Methodist minister, favoured a voluntary system which could accommodate the local situation. Because agreement on

\(^2\)Rbid., 2:303-304.
doctrine could not be secured, no uniform system was ever adopted in the nineteenth century. Ryerson's bug-bear was sectarian controversy. When he became the head of the education department in 1844, he was careful to try to avoid it. This greatly curtailed the elaboration of content in any provincial religious education scheme.

The School Act of 1843 left the question of religious education largely untouched, except to say that students could receive the religious instruction approved by their parents and guardians. The first statutory acknowledgement of religious teaching in the public schools provided that no child be required to attend devotional exercises or religious instruction to which parents or guardians objected.

In 1844, Dr. Egerton Ryerson was appointed Assistant Superintendent for the education department of the province. From 1846 to 1876, Ryerson held the office of Chief Superintendent of Education for Canada West. His aim was to foster a non-sectarian approach to religious education in the schools by emphasizing the tenets of 'common Christianity'. These Ryerson defined in terms of moral precepts held in common by all Christians. In Ryerson's opinion, only this approach would avoid sectarian controversy. The difficulty of defining exactly what was held in common by Christian denominations was to hamper the complete acceptance of Ryerson's program.

Religious education was left to local boards to define in the School Act of 1846. The tone was to be non-
denominational and based on the Bible and common Christianity. Bishop Strachan continued to recommend an Anglican curriculum, at least for Anglican students. He lamented the lack of religious teaching and therefore proposed parochial schools as the remedy. Anglicans under Strachan never possessed the numbers or influence to overturn Ryerson's system. Both Ryerson and Strachan agreed that Christianity, however defined, was the basis for proper education.

The implementation of a curriculum for religion was left to local boards. Religious instruction was placed on a voluntary basis. In the Act of 1857, religious study could be left to visiting clergy after school hours. Where this provision was followed, some clergy did visit the schools, but there was no uniformity in the matter. While religious education was still a desideratum of almost all, the form of it was vague and optional, based on virtues which Christians supposedly held in common—piety, justice, truth, love of country, humanity, universal benevolence, sobriety, industry, frugality, chastity, moderation, temperance, and other virtues. Bishop Strachan was convinced, however, that the voluntary system of religious education was secular and godless. Ryerson continued to argue for a non-compulsory

---

3Ibid., 16:115.
4Ibid., 9:197.
5Ibid., 6:148.
system, and often quoted statistics in his annual reports to illustrate that his policy was bearing fruit.

Until 1884, religious exercises were left to the local trustees to implement. In practice, this meant to the teacher. However, according to Ryerson's yearly reports on education, there was increasing compliance with the recommendation that religious exercises be incorporated into the school day. Religious instruction was more haphazard. Optional instruction by the clergy before or after school hours was not general. However, there were a few attempts to teach Christian Morals, the instructor being the classroom teacher. A "general lesson" based on Scripture had been made optional in 1847. From 1871 to 1875, Christian Morals was part of the senior program. These efforts became controversial. The popular press cautioned that prescribed religious exercises or instruction violated the separation of church and state. Moreover, by the 1860's, there had been a tacit acceptance of the idea that religious instruction should be restricted to the Sunday School.

Ryerson had written a book, *First Lessons in Christian Morals*, in order to inject some Christian instruction into the curriculum. *First Lessons* was well-received initially, but then criticized by the Baptists as being too sectarian!

The grounds for this complaint were unspecified. An

---

alternate text was permitted. In 1874 the subject of Christian Morals was quietly dropped as mandatory. Ryerson had not been able to define satisfactorily the common Christianity which he advocated throughout his tenure.

Dr. Ryerson's *First Lessons in Christian Morals* was very conventionally Christian. It is difficult to understand that there were objections to it on the grounds of sectarianism, as most Christians of the day would have subscribed to its precepts. In language that seems rather advanced for children, the book stressed piety and duty to God and others. No moral teaching of the major denominations was absent. The whole was based on the Ten Commandments and the Old and New Testaments, supplemented by abundant Scriptural references and quotations by respected British theologians.³

The Bible was taken literally by Ryerson. It was presumed to be inerrant and unified--the word of God. There was no leeway for skepticism or doubt. In speaking of morality, Ryerson referred primarily to personal virtue. The usual vices were castigated: stealing, lying, 'sensuality', drunkenness, gambling, etc. The virtues of honesty, frugality, sobriety, and industry were extolled. While Ryerson commended the theological disciplines as a higher study than secular learning, he commended the usefulness of the latter, particularly agriculture. As may be expected

from the pen of a prominent Methodist, Ryerson's book stressed the importance of conversion to Christianity, but in the context of baptism and first communion rather than as an independent action. There was no sense of free-thinking, private interpretation, or salvation apart from church membership present in Ryerson's book.

The tone of First Lessons in Christian Morals was unremarkable for the time. Ryerson assumed that the teaching of religious principles in the schools would produce hardworking, God-fearing, virtuous, and obedient citizens for Ontario. Although others would have shared that belief, the goal of discovering doctrines to undergird public morality which would be acceptable to all proved to be a chimera.

Ryerson's problem was one of authority. While nineteenth-century Ontario was a Christian society, religious belief was a private matter. There was no organ of the church powerful enough to compel compliance with its dictates. Church membership was voluntary, but attendance at school became customary and obligatory. How to implement religious and moral teaching in a pluralistic society was Ryerson's dilemma. First Lessons appealed to the authority of scripture. This, Protestants at least, were bound to admit. Since no uncontested magisterium with authority to interpret the Scriptures existed in the nineteenth century (some would say any century), there was bound to be dissent from any attempt to define doctrines of universal acceptance. Moral precepts need some basis of authority if they are to be
followed. Because revelation and reason admit of various interpretations, the best that could be achieved was a discussion or a dialogue about religious authority—hardly agreement on what constituted common Christianity.

In 1876, Ryerson retired. His benevolent, yet paternalistic, oversight of Ontario education had created a common school system in which religious education was recommended yet rarely required. Ryerson was committed to voluntarism in religious matters, but he continued to believe that some elusive, non-controversial core of teaching could be adopted as a basis for religion in the classroom. He attempted such a project in First Lessons in Christian Morals. Christians in Ontario shared a common origin and early history, but they did not agree sufficiently on the interpretation of scripture or tradition to endorse any system of universal Christian education, whether optional or prescriptive. Most denominational groups agreed that religious teaching was desirable, but none were able to define a content or method for such teaching which would have secured lasting general approval and consent.

Pluralism, in the nineteenth-century context, connoted a diversity of opinion which could not be molded into a piece by legislation, exhortation, or any other means, except the prospect of mutual benefit. During the period of Dr. Ryerson's tenure, there was little of the friendly ecumenical climate of a later period. Denominational rivalries ran deep, not least because of the rancour that surrounded the
Clergy Reserve question. Money realized from the sale of land set apart for the support of the "Protestant" Clergy was a source of dispute between Presbyterians, Anglicans, Methodists, and others until the matter was resolved by an Act of 1853.

In addition, the efforts of Strachan and the Anglicans to establish the Church of England in Canada had occasioned violent opposition by Ryerson and his followers. Relations between Roman Catholics and Protestants were often strained, especially over the question of Roman Catholic separate schools. The anti-Roman Catholic Orange Lodge was active in the province and "No Popery" was a frequent cry from Protestant pulpits. There was little reason to expect much cooperation in the matter of religious education -- even among Protestants. Many would have wished for denominational schools at public expense, but Ryerson considered this too costly and impractical, as evidenced by his remarks in a newspaper article in 1852. Ryerson's earnest desire that the schools be Christian conflicted with his cautious, democratic, and non-sectarian principles. A common school system based on Christianity was Ryerson's ideal, but he could not secure the necessary consensus for the fulfillment of his dream.

Ryerson was an appointee, not an elected member of the government. Since 1876, there had been ministers of

\footnote{The Christian Guardian (Nov. 10, 1852), 1}
education in Ontario who were also politicians. Those wishing changes in the school system had not hesitated to use political pressure to advance their cause. Advocates of religious education in schools saw clearly their opportunity. In 1878, permission was given to school boards to require teachers to not only use the Bible in the classroom, but to provide rudimentary exegetical commentary. By 1884, Bible reading without comment became optional, and religious exercises became mandatory with the usual exemptions. However, the difficulty of providing a common set of lections became apparent almost immediately.

Partly as a result of the Roman Catholic emphasis on religion in their separate schools, Protestant groups began to urge an equivalent emphasis in public schools. By 1881, opening and closing exercises had become general, presaging the regulations of 1884. In 1885, the Minister of Education, George W. Ross, proposed a list of selected Bible readings for use in the schools. This met with initial enthusiasm, but then rejection. As an alternative, the entire Bible was authorized as a basis for lections in 1887. The reasons for the wide rejection of the "Ross Bible" were the suspicion that passages which might offend Roman Catholics were expurgated in it, and the possibility of

---

"mutilation of Scripture". For a time, the matter rested uneasily with no change until the next century.

Some advocates of religious education pointed to the poor preparation of teachers as a reason for the paucity of religious teaching in nineteenth-century public schools. The real difficulty lay in securing the agreement of a religiously-diverse population. Local trustees to whom the implementation of religious education was left, preferred to avoid the divisive potential of a mandatory system. The appearance of compulsory religious exercises had occasioned controversy after all. Mainline denominations lobbied the government for increased attention to religion in the schools. Labour groups, Jews, and some Baptists opposed mandatory religious instruction. One suspects that governments of the day would have liked the issue to go away. It did not.

During the period from World War I to World War II, the belief that perceived declining moral behaviour among youth could be alleviated by augmenting religious education in schools occasioned agitation for such education. The proponents of increased religion in the schools tended to be members of the mainline churches which had increased in adherents, particularly in urban centres, by the early years of the twentieth century. An interdenominational committee of Anglicans, Methodists, Presbyterians, and

\[\text{Mackay Report, 9.}\]
Congregationalists, augmented by other groups in 1929, produced a graded program of Readers for schools. However, these were judged too costly for general implementation.

In 1927, the Ontario Religious Education Council, a committee of representatives from eight Protestant denominations, had been formed to secure mandatory religious education taught by clergy during the school day. In 1939, a committee of the Ontario Educational Association, a voluntary body of Ontario educators, school trustees, and ratepayer groups, proposed that religion be included in the regular curriculum. This proposal met with widespread approval from trustees and the church-affiliated public. By this time, the Inter-Church Committee had prepared a syllabus for the use of clergy and teachers with the cooperation of the Ontario Religious Education Council. The opportunity to implement such material came soon afterwards. With regular teachers as instructors and with written examinations required, the syllabus was used in local trials. In other instances, increasing numbers of clergy gave lessons in religion. Some schools allowed clergy to teach one-half hour before official opening hours in order to circumvent the existing regulations. Local school boards could allow deviation from traditional practice by such questionable, yet technically legal, subterfuge by simply resolving to do so. By 1941, when the call for regular religious instruction in the
schools had mounted, the practice had become common enough to encourage further developments.\textsuperscript{14}

Other efforts by coalitions of Protestant Christians, particularly the Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education founded in 1936, were able to secure a more lasting influence. As interest in promoting religious education in the schools increased between the World Wars, the Inter-Church Committee and other groups became increasingly active. The aim was to establish religious education in the schools and to foster the reading of the Christian Bible. As a result of the challenges of war and depression and the rise of socialist elements, the climate of religious opinion had become more conservative. Religion was seen, as it had been in previous centuries, as an antidote to societal collapse—or at least fragmentation—in the face of economic disorder, liberal tendencies, or the enemy without. Local action was taken by religiously-motivated citizens to supplement the work of the Inter-Church Committee.\textsuperscript{15} The right of clergy to appoint qualified representatives to teach in the schools was reinstated in 1941 at the urging of the Inter-Church Committee. When the standards required of these representatives were approved by the committee in 1942, they

\textsuperscript{14}E. R. McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools: Based on the Minutes of the Inter-Church Committee on Religion in the Schools, 1922-1965 (Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1965), 14-15.
\textsuperscript{15}A full discussion of the work of this committee is included in Chapter IV.
included religious knowledge, education and training not common for the laity of the time.\textsuperscript{16}

As the movement for religious education in the schools expanded its influence, the question of adequate materials arose. Many clergy used British texts, such as the "Cambridgeshire Syllabus" guide books.\textsuperscript{17} However, a need for materials which suited the Canadian context became evident. This deficiency was never corrected completely, even with the development of Canadian versions of British texts during and after the war. The decision to employ British guide books as a model for Canadian versions was ill-advised in the long term, because the development of the British system of religious education in public schools had followed a different course. However, the demand for materials had seemed to excuse expediency.

During World War II, the forces for the implementation of religious education programs in public schools increased their efforts. Perhaps because of the struggle with fascism, or in tandem with the threat of the social dislocation occasioned by wartime conditions, many Ontario citizens sought solace in the comforts of traditional religion. Interest in the religious training of youth rose steadily throughout the war. That is not to say that those opposed to legislated religion in the schools had been silenced. The

\textsuperscript{16}\textit{Mackay Report}, 141.

\textsuperscript{17}These manuals, published by the Religious Education Press in England in 1939 were revised to become the core of the Ontario program. The revisions were mainly cosmetic.
times favoured the religiously conservative element of Ontario society which had been almost galvanized into action by the war. The moment for the political expression of the conservative agenda was at hand.

2. The Regulations of 1944: A Change of Policy

In 1943, there began a process of change in the policy regarding religious education in Ontario. Prior to that time, the policy of Ryerson had remained in place with few alterations. Ryerson's policy had been that the state provided the facilities for religious education, but that the teaching was done primarily by the parents, guardians, and pastors. Although locally there had been considerable experimentation in the classroom with religious education curricula, the official policy remained intact throughout Ryerson's tenure as Chief Superintendent of Education and until the introduction of new regulations in 1944. The purpose of this section is to outline the shift in policy of 1943-44 and to comment on the implementation what can be considered a drastic change.

On the strong recommendation of the Inter-church Committee on Week-day Religious Education, the government of Ontario began considering how and if compulsory religious education could be introduced into Ontario's classrooms. The general recommendations of the Committee were as follows:
1. That it would be wise to proceed cautiously in the matter.
2. That the worthy traditions and healthy co-operation which now exist between the Church and the Public School should not only be preserved but, if possible, strengthened.
3. That the following fundamental principles . . . should be noted.
   (a) That the purpose of all this work should be instructional and religious. It should include not merely a knowledge of the Scriptures but the relation of those Scriptures to life and conduct.
   (b) That in view of the responsibility that rests upon the Church for the teaching of religion, the Church must always have a voice in the choice of what is to be taught in this field, and who is to teach it, in elementary and secondary schools and in teacher training schools.
   Those who give religious teaching in the schools should be willing, competent, and should also be acceptable to the Church.18

It was clear that the Inter-Church Committee on Week-day Religious Education viewed religion in the schools as the domain of the Church, not only in establishing what was to be taught, but in selecting who was to teach it.

The specific recommendations of the Committee, not all of which were adopted, were the following:

1. That the Department of Education should prepare and publish a statement setting forth its views as to the purpose and function of education and the place of religion therein, along the lines embodied in the Introduction to the Programme of Studies, 1937.
2. That in view of the place already made for a worship period at the beginning of each school day, the Department of Education should provide further guidance and help for teachers in the performance of these duties by publishing and making available for use in the schools a Worship Book for Schools, such as has been prepared by the Inter-Church Committee on Week-Day Religious Education.

18R. R. McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools: Based on the Minutes of the Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in Schools, 1922 - 1965 (Toronto: Ryerson, 1965), 25.
3. That the Department of Education should extend and strengthen the training now given by the Church in Normal Schools in two ways:

   (a) By providing more adequate instruction in courses on the Bible.

   (b) By providing instruction and guidance in order that teachers would know how to use their opportunities so that "the curriculum . . . should be pervaded by the spirit of religion (Programme of Studies, 1937, Page 9).

4. That the Department of Education should make provision in the Ontario College of Education and in the Ontario Training College for Technical Teachers, for courses similar to those recommended for the Normal Schools as set forth in Number 3 above.

5. To enable present teachers to equip themselves for better service in this respect, courses similar to those mentioned in No. 3 and No. 4 for Normal Schools and Training Colleges should be provided in Teachers' Summer Schools.

6. That persons chosen to give religious instruction in the elementary and secondary schools should have the following qualifications:

   (a) A knowledge of the needs and interests of children of various ages;

   (b) A knowledge of the best methods of teaching various ages;

   (c) Acquaintance with the present Public School curriculum for the different grades;

   (d) A knowledge of Scriptures and Scripture truth and its adequacy for the needs of boys and girls in various stages of their development;

   (e) A living Christian experience;

   (f) A definite relationship with the Christian Church;

   (g) If neither a minister nor a regular school teacher, the teacher of religion should have academic standing equivalent to high school graduation and special training equivalent to that required by the Religious Education Council of Canada for the Standard Leadership Training diploma.19

The Inter-Church Committee had taken the opportunity to provide detailed recommendations on the statement required from the Department of Education on the teaching of religion, appropriate education of teachers of religion, and the qualifications required to provide this instruction to

19 Ibid., 25-6.
children. Only those living the Christian experience and in a definite relationship with a Christian Church were viewed as potential candidates.

Suggestions on how the Education Act could be amended to accommodate the proposed change in policy were cited. The thrust of these recommendations was that clergy, teachers, or their deputies, should give religious instruction, and that exemptions from such measures should be allowed any Board of Education that applied for such consideration. Suggestions involving changes in Statutes were made explicit to provide harmony with the fundamental principles of the instructional and religious nature of the project. These suggestions were

1. That every School Board shall make provisions to have religious instruction given in every school by one of the following means:
   (a) By one or more clergymen;
   (b) By one of more lay persons authorized by such clergyman or clergymen, the school teacher being eligible to be chosen as such lay person.

2. That the Minister of Education shall have the authority to exempt any School Board from the operation of Section 1, above, provided the Board shall by resolution ask to be exempted, and submits a statement of reasons for such request.²⁰

Children in the public schools of Ontario were to participate in the program. School Boards could be exempted on presentation to the Minister of a board resolution which detailed reasons for the request.

The problem which presented itself immediately from the outset of the religious education project, as envisaged by

²⁰MacLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 27.
the Committee, was the lack of suitable curricula and textbooks. Suggestions were written as follows:

1. A proper curriculum and set of Teachers' Guides or textbooks are needed. Eventually we should have workbooks for pupils of certain ages. This is true whether the teaching is done by a clergyman, the school teacher, or other authorized representative.

2. Certain materials already are available. The Inter-Church Committee of Ontario has prepared and published an outline under the title, "Syllabus of Bible Study". This has been and still is widely used, but there are no Teachers' Guides or textbooks to accompany it. In England several syllabuses have been prepared, the best known of which is the Cambridgeshire. To give help on these syllabuses the Religious Education Press of England and the Sheldon Press of England have jointly prepared and published Teachers' Guides in several volumes. These have been widely used and highly approved in many parts of Canada. The International Council of Religious Education is preparing a number of courses some of which are definitely Bible-centred and some more experience centred. Eight textbooks on these courses are available now. Still other groups have been making a similar effort.

   We are not completely satisfied with any of these but are willing to co-operate with the Department in working out a suitable curriculum. In any case we would ask for the privilege of being consulted about any curriculum proposed.

3. A Suggested Course of Action: It would seem that we might look forward to the publication of a Canadian Edition of the English texts, with such revisions as may be necessary or desirable to make them fit our Canadian constituency. With this there would be a revision of our Ontario Syllabus to make it suit the revised texts. When this is done, the Bible readings now authorized by the Department and on which the present Ontario syllabus is based, should be revised so as to fit the new Syllabus.

4. An Interim Policy: We would recommend to the Department as an immediate practical measure and as an interim policy that approval be given for use either of
the Ontario Syllabus or the English texts as a basis for formal teaching.\footnote{Ibid., 27 - 28.}

It is evident that the Inter-Church Committee considered the program to be promoted and developed by the Churches, and that they expected editorial control. The fact that the program harmonized with Premier George Drew's political agenda must be considered serendipity from their point of view.

A summary statement by Robert Stamp tells us all but the details about the regulations of 1944. "The children of Ontario were to be prepared to live in a democratic society which based its way of life on the Christian ideal."\footnote{R. M. Stamp, The Schools of Ontario: 1876-1976 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981), 181.} Premier Drew had identified his plan to extend religion in the public schools with 'the Three Rs' and renewed loyalty to the empire in the 1943 election.\footnote{Ibid., 178.} Appealing to the conservative element of Ontario society, he implied that these measures were necessary in order to redress the excessive progressivism of the 1930s in education. In wartime, discipline, loyalty, and obedience were deemed as necessary for the schools as well as for the armed services.

The Conservative view prevailed. In the election of 1945, which followed a motion of non-confidence in the Conservative minority government over its handling of religion in the schools, Premier Drew won a landslide victory. In fact, he had successfully portrayed himself as
the defender of Christianity against the CCF-Liberal opposition, which, Drew suggested, wanted Christianity out of the schools.  

3. The Impact of the 1944 Regulations

The government's response to the recommendations of the Interchurch Committee was to make study of the Scriptures mandatory in elementary schools. Two half-hour periods per week were to be devoted to such study. Regulation 13 of 1944 attempted to impose religious exercises and Bible study throughout the province subject only to exemptions granted to children whose parents objected. Many school boards introduced religious exercises and religious education or augmented those that were in place. According to Ministry of Education statistics, few applied for exemption.  

The period following the war was one of increased interest in the Churches and in Christianity in general, and the 1944 Regulations were generally accepted by the public. However, the proposal that the Education Act be amended to reflect all the recommendations of the Interchurch Committee was not accepted by the government. Critics of the Drew government's religious education policy, such as Liberal leader Mitchell Hepburn, objected to any curtailment of religious liberty imposed by legislation. Proponents

24 Ibid., 181-2.
25 McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 38-42.
countered that parents were free to remove their children from religious education classes at any time, thus protecting their rights. However, the stigma of removal from class and possible psychological damage to the children concerned became a secondary objection.

On the issue of Church-state separation, which rallied opponents to Regulation 13, the Interchurch Committee and its allies responded that no such tradition existed in Canada. The Church had always cooperated with the state for the welfare of society.26

Premier Drew's initiative in public school religious education did not receive unqualified public support. In June 1944, a Gallup poll recorded that forty-nine percent of the Ontario population favoured Drew's policy, forty-four percent were against, and seven percent were undecided.27 Nevertheless, Drew introduced mandatory religious education in the first six grades of the public schools in September of 1944. His later landslide victory in the election of 1945 demonstrated either a change in public opinion or flawed polling procedures.

The introduction of a Protestant curriculum of Bible study in the public schools received general assent, in spite of objections from Jews and other minorities, and from Protestants who felt that public schools should be truly non-

26 McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 37
sectarian. Ryerson had constructed a system in which religious instruction was optional. The regulations of 1944 were preferential at a time when religious coercion collided with principles of democratic freedom. While Premier Drew assumed that democratic and Christian principles were practically coincident, his assumptions were ill-advised as time would show.

While only 63 of 5405 school boards applied for exemption from the new religious education programme\(^\text{28}\), this did not necessarily imply a whole-hearted acceptance. The Inter-Church Committee chose to interpret these figures as encouraging. However, the problems of such a wrenching change as the 1944 regulations were substantial and not only administrative. Vocal opposition from civil libertarians, non-Christians, and Protestant groups which could not accept the approach or the content of the new program emerged. The Inter-Church Committee and its allies undertook to explain and gather support for the program. According to Department of Education statistics, religious instruction was being given in the majority of public school classrooms (8,913 of 13,764 by 1947)\(^\text{29}\). Criticism, however, continued to mount, especially concerning the theological teachings of the Teachers' Guides and texts which pertained to the program.

The basic flaw in the program, which was to become evident in time, was that it could be sustained only in a

\(^{29}\)Ibid., 41.
religiously homogeneous rather than a pluralistic society. Ryerson's policy of optional religious education in the schools, with local self-determination, permitted religious groups access to the schools. No mandatory common curriculum could be enforced. Furthermore, the right of parents to determine the type of religious education of their children was respected. Because religion in the schools was a perenially contentious issue, Ryerson had left the content, provided that it was purportedly "Christian", to pastors, parents, local trustees, and in practice, often to the teacher. The government merely provided the facilities. While Ryerson was careful to avoid particularity, he was also determined to ensure that Christianity pervaded the school system. The program begun in 1944 was mandatory and centrally determined. Ontario society-- more diverse religiously than a century earlier-- had not achieved a consensus in religious matters which would permit indefinitely a program of religious instruction that was determined by the government rather than by local authorities.

Although criticism of the religious education program was voiced since its inception, the program was not seriously challenged in the 1940s or 1950s. Continued support from the major Protestant denominations and public acquiescence seemed to suggest that the innovation was accepted. The fact that few boards of education requested exemption was frequently cited as proof that the program was working and that a
diverse religious population could be served by it.\(^3\) While it is likely that many schools followed an assertive program of religious education, it is now clear that such a program was often less than vigorously pursued--notwithstanding the letter and spirit of the regulations.\(^3\) An exact statistical picture is unavailable.

Enthusiasm for a conservative religious education program born of the Depression and the Second World War waned during the peace which followed. It is now clear that during the war many had thought, as had Premier Drew, that democratic principles were somehow rooted in the Christian tradition. In a speech delivered to the Protestant Women's Federation on May 10, 1944, the Reverend Canon F.H. Wilkinson, rector of St. Paul's Anglican Church in Toronto, stated that "if Democracy is to remain Christian the basic truths of that religion must be taught in our schools" and that "were it not for Christianity, there would be no Democracy."\(^3\) These statements by the incumbent of the largest Anglican parish in Ontario reflected conventional Protestant opinion for some time.\(^3\) When the crisis of the war had passed, less urgency seemed necessary in order to

---

\(^{30}\) Thomas, 204

\(^{31}\) "Although many boards dropped religious education during this time [the 1950s] they did not necessarily obey the legislation by asking for an exemption". G. A. Watson, The Report of the Ministerial Inquiry on Religious Education in Ontario Public Elementary Schools (Toronto, Government of Ontario, 1990), 11.

\(^{32}\) "Links Democracy to Protestantism," The Globe and Mail (Toronto, May 11, 1944), 16.

\(^{33}\) Thomas, 159
ensure the survival of Christian and democratic principles in society. The appearance of compliance was to be revealed as a sham by the 1960s.

From the beginning, the program had been attacked by minority groups on the basis of religious freedom, state interference, defective theology, and indoctrination. These grounds for complaint, while not effective in causing the immediate abandonment of the program, became more plausible over time.

The groups which rejected the program on the basis that it abrogated religious freedom were Non-Christian, most prominently Ontario Jews, who were vocal in defending their rights in education. To the charge that the religious rights of Jews were ignored by the religious education program, supporters of the program replied that parents could excuse their children from religious education classes. However, Jewish leaders, such as Rabbi Abraham Feinberg of Toronto, objected to the negative psychological effect of such exemption.34

There was no absolute right to religious freedom in Ontario at the time of the Regulations of 1944, even though most reasonable people would grant it as customary. Although religious freedom is enshrined in American constitutional history and law, this has not always been so in Canada.

34Feinberg, Rabbi Abraham L., Religious Instruction in the Public Schools/The Ontario Plan - Good or Bad? (Toronto, n.p., 1945). [National Archives of Canada and the Ontario Jewish Archives]
While there is no established Church, Christian groups throughout Canada's history have been accorded prerogatives and favours such that the principle of Church-state co-operation was seriously defended in 1945 and later by the Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education.  

When answering the protests of religious minorities, proponents of the religious education program replied that "majories have rights too". To abandon the religious education program because it purportedly infringed minority rights seemed to be undemocratic in the sense that democratic government was the rule of the majority.  

In addition to protests from minority religious groups, there was opposition to the 1944 program from civil libertarians. Most of these objected to state interference in religious affairs as unconscionable. The Association for Religious Liberty, a vocal proponent of the separation of church and state, accused Premier Drew of foisting a state religion on the province. Its membership consisted of members of minority sects, such as the Jehovah's Witnesses, as well as Protestants who felt that too close a connection between church and state was a threat to minorities and ultimately divisive.  

Some Protestants objected to the religious education program on theological grounds. They criticized the program

---

35McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 37
36Thomas, 224
37Thomas, 198-9
38Thomas, 199-200
for being watered-down and unscriptural.\textsuperscript{39} Some groups, such as the Independent Baptists, had split with liberal Protestantism earlier in the century; these 'fundamentalists' objected to any compromise of the literal interpretation of Scripture. They had condemned the historical-critical method which they believed challenged the literal interpretation of Scripture and over-emphasized the humanity of Christ. Any program which departed from their conservative theological stance, in spite of or because of its endorsement by mainline liberal churches, met with their condemnation. In their opinion, the mainline churches were apostate and the dissemination of their theological views could not be tolerated in the state-supported schools.

The 'state religion' which the new policy promoted was merely a flagrant example of indoctrination in the eyes of its detractors. Was the state to teach theology when it was unsuited and even incompetent for the task? In the eyes of civil libertarians, Christianity, or any other creed, should not be taught in the schools since it infringed religious liberty. In the eyes of Christian fundamentalists, the creed which was being taught in the schools was sub-Christian and heretical.

\textsuperscript{39}Thomas, 205
4. 'State Religion' in Ontario Schools

In 1950 the Royal Commission on Education in Ontario, chaired by J. A. Hope, delivered its report. The commissioners did not recommend any change in the policy on religious education. They endorsed it as it was, with the exception that sections of the guide books found offensive by representatives of the Canadian Jewish Congress were to be reconsidered and amended.\(^4^0\)

The Protestant churches which were represented on the Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education continued to support the principle of church-state cooperation in public school religious education. The Canadian Jewish Congress, the Association for Religious Liberty, the Ontario Committee of the Labor Progressive Party, and the Public School Supporters League\(^4^1\) all presented briefs strongly opposed to state-sponsored religious education. Although they were given a hearing during the Commission's deliberations, their objections did not result in a recommendation to repeal the regulations on religious education.

The arguments of the supporters of the religious education policy, however, were based on its purported


\(^4^1\)This body represented the view of the Orange Lodge of Ontario that any sectarian religious education, and especially Roman Catholic religious education, should be disallowed in public schools.
general acceptance by the public and its benefits to the state. In briefs by the Anglican, Presbyterian, and United Churches, and the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec, the charges of the bodies which opposed religious education in the public schools were addressed and refuted. To the majority Protestant bodies, the program seemed beneficial not only to their own cause, but to the welfare of Ontario society. The Church of England brief extolled the teaching of Christianity in the schools as the remedy for, rather than as the cause of, disruptions in society. Religious education was extolled as "one of the first ways of breaking down that middle wall of partition which divides race from race, and of helping to create a national unity for which all true citizens hope and pray". Judge G. W. Morley, an Anglican layman, suggested in his brief that a thorough program of Bible teaching in the schools would reduce juvenile delinquency. The Reverend T. F. Summerhayes, also an Anglican, believed that the Christian religion should be taught in the schools because the structure of Ontario society, its laws and customs, were derived from it. Furthermore, the teaching of Christianity would be a potent

---

43 Judge G. W. Morley to the Royal Commission, Toronto, "The Urgent Need of Teaching Christianity in Our Schools", Brief No. 103, 1945, 1. [Archives of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education].
remedy for crime, the proliferation of sexually transmitted diseases, and dysfunction in family relations. 44

The underlying and unproven assumption of such notions as those of Summerhayes and Morley was that moral behaviour was rooted in religious conviction. Various prohibitions against anti-social behaviour which could be culled from Scripture must surely produce well-behaved children—if effectively taught. Such thinking was commonplace in Victorian times. Religion was thought to be the bulwark of the social order. The question was, "Which religion?" In 1950, the answer for many was the Protestant religion. However, that notion defied close definition.

The Protestant churches had another motive in their support of religious education in the public schools; it was proselytization of children who did not attend Sunday Schools. The United Church brief expressed the view that the government was obliged to teach religion to the many young children who absented themselves from Church Schools. 45 Many Christians believed that religious instruction was the foundation of a meaningful philosophy of life and the bedrock of a moral existence. This notion often was expressed by supporters of religious education prior to the 1944

45 The United Church of Canada, Board of Education, "Religion and the Public Schools", Brief No. 64, Toronto, 1945.
regulations and underlay many opinions stated in briefs presented before the Hope Commission.

The Ontario Education Association recommended the adoption of a program of study for secondary schools based on the Bible, the purpose of which was to impart not only Biblical knowledge, but the "fundamental truths of religion and their bearing on life and thought".\textsuperscript{45} The sentiment that religion was fundamental to education echoed through briefs by the Ontario Federation of Home and School Associations, Inc.\textsuperscript{47} and the Ontario School Trustees' and Ratepayers' Association.\textsuperscript{48} The Ontario Teachers' Federation, whose members were charged with the responsibility of teaching religious education in the classrooms, agreed that religion was an important aspect of moral development, but doubted the qualifications of teachers to teach it.\textsuperscript{49}

The opposition to the religious education program centered on the issues of church-state separation and minority rights. The Public School Supporters' League continued to demand total separation of church and state in educational matters in its brief.\textsuperscript{50} In reality the goal of

\textsuperscript{46}The Ontario Education Association, "General Recommendations on Education", Brief No. 69, Toronto, 1945, Appendix A.
\textsuperscript{47}The Ontario Federation of Home and Schools Associations, Inc., "Recommendations on Education", Brief No. 135, Toronto, 1945. [Archives of the Ontario Institute of Studies in Education].
\textsuperscript{48}The Ontario School Trustees' and Ratepayers' Association, "Education in Ontario", Brief No. 36, Toronto, 1945. [Archives of the Ontario Institute of Studies in Education].
\textsuperscript{49}Thomas, 229.
\textsuperscript{50}The Public School Supporters' League, "The Public Schools of Ontario", Brief No. 205, Toronto, 1945. [Archives of the Ontario Institute of Studies in Education].
the League was the abolition of state support for Roman Catholic separate schools—or indeed any form of sectarian teaching in the publicly-funded school system. The pre-war policy of allowing clergy to instruct school children according to the wishes of their parents was seen by the League as a privilege granted by the state. However, the teaching of religion by salaried teachers of a program prescribed by the state seemed to be a violation of religious freedom and a misuse of public funds. The thousand-member strong Association for Religious Liberty and the Canadian Jewish Congress concentrated on the issues of religious freedom and minority rights in their submissions to the Royal Commission. The Association opposed any form of "state religion in Ontario". While the arguments of the League were high-toned, they veiled partisan sentiment. However, the recommendation of the Association for Religious Liberty that sectarian religious education be withdrawn from the public school curriculum was brought forward again by both the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario [1969] and the Ministerial Inquiry on Religious Education in Ontario Public Schools [1990].

The introduction of compulsory religious education into the public school curriculum was part of a broader program

---

51The Orange Association in Ontario, Separation is Wrong, Toronto, 1963. [National Archives of Canada].
52Ibid.
53The Association for Religious Liberty to the Royal Commission on Education "Religious Education in Ontario Schools", Brief No. 45, Toronto, 1945, 2. [Archives of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education].
designed to foster loyalty to conservative beliefs. Premier Drew's educational agenda included also a reorganization of Ontario's cadet corps movement; individual cadet units were to come under the direct governance of the Department of Education so that training would become part of the school curriculum. Drew himself was an anglophile and an ex-officer of the Great War. He did not hesitate to exploit the patriotic fervour of the Second War for the purpose of bolstering traditional and conservative attitudes and values. The inculcation of a conscientious and religious spirit among Ontario citizens, which had been such an alluring desideratum for Governor Simcoe in 1791, had achieved its highest political moment by 1950.

The roots of this phenomenon in a British-dominated Ontario become clear. The white Anglo-Canadian majority had been hampered in implementing the religious phase of this inculcation by denominational squabbles. The threats of foreign ideologies and socialism had bound them in a common cause, as was evident from the re-formation of the Inter-Church Committee in 1936. Hence, Anglo-Protestants were able to use their dominant position in society to obtain ascendency in the public schools.

The conservative elite had found World War II to be a convenient moment for entrenching its position in Ontario society. Its creed was Cross, Crown, and Empire. Through

54 "To Name Director of Cadet Training", The Globe and Mail, Toronto, May 3, 1944, 11.
the agencies of the churches and the schools, children of all classes were to be indoctrinated in a Protestant form of Christianity and a Canadian and imperial way of thinking. Little attention was to be given to minorities and radicals in this vision. Reaction to the 1944 program and to the domination of Protestants in Ontario society was not to be effective until the 1960s.

This purpose of this chapter has been to provide an outline of the history of the religious education question in Ontario public schools. The topics introduced will reappear in greater detail in the chapters which follow. "A Chronology of Some Important Events in Ontario Public School Religious Education" has been included in Appendix B as a convenience to the reader.

---

1. Introduction

In order to discuss the role of the churches in the development, implementation, and abandonment of the 1944 program for religious education in the public schools of Ontario, it is necessary that the origin and character of the doctrines of the major denominations be examined. Although there were doctrinal differences which were never harmonized, methods of catechesis were similar. A Protestant Church was never formed, but a Protestant ethos in religious education began to develop during the nineteenth century. This Protestant ethos had implications for the events which followed in the twentieth century. Basic doctrinal similarities and differences are important in comprehending the difficulties involved in coordinating Protestant strategies regarding religion in schools in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

In this chapter, the basic doctrinal beliefs of the major churches and the manner of religious education of their children, whether within or without the common school system, will be investigated. The focus of the study will be the leading religious groups of nineteenth-century Ontario: the
Anglicans, Methodists, Presbyterians, Baptists, and Roman Catholics. The character of some other Christian bodies, which together constituted less than two percent of the Protestant population by 1881, will be discussed briefly as well.

2. The Anglican View

The Church of England was formed as a separate body during the Protestant Reformation of the sixteenth century. Its essential difference from Roman Catholicism was a denial of the authority of the Bishop of Rome over English Church affairs. In liturgical and theological matters, it tended to express a moderate position between extreme Protestantism and Romanism. Although Catholic order was maintained, its reformed theology, as expressed in the Thirty-nine Articles of Religion, had Calvinist elements. Anglican Church historians have characterized Anglicanism as the 'Via Media'—the middle way.2

The Church of England in Canada in the nineteenth century was influenced by two internal developments: the Evangelical Movement and the Anglo-Catholic Revival. The Evangelicals were not necessarily theologically or liturgically different from the majority of Anglicans, but

1Census of Canada, 1880–1, Ottawa, 1882.
they were more fervent in religious sentiment and devotion.\textsuperscript{3}\ They emphasized evangelism and missionary work. Many of the clergy who came from Britain to minister in Upper Canada had been sponsored by evangelical groups such as the Church Missionary Society. The concern for conversion to 'vital religion' extended to the religious education of children. Formal piety was not sufficient; there had to be wholehearted commitment to Christ and the gospel evidenced by virtuous living, observing the Sabbath, works of charity and devotional exercises such as prayer and Bible reading. For Evangelical children, confirmation was not a mere rite of passage, but a mature profession of faith. Therefore, catechetical instruction had to be thorough and reverent. Regular religious instruction was very important.

The Anglo-Catholic Revival, also called the Oxford Movement, began in 1833 with the sermon on National Apostasy by the English priest, John Keble. The essence of Keble's protest was that the Church of England was not a department of government but a part of the holy, catholic, and apostolic Church. It was worthy of high devotion as a mystical rather than an administrative entity. The liturgies of the Church were not merely ceremonial and indifferent but sacramental and divinely-ordained. The sacramental life was the \textit{sine qua non} of Anglo-Catholic theology. Frequent and reverent communion and sacramental confession were thought essential

\textsuperscript{3}Neill, 232.
to a pious life.\footnote{Ibid., 258.} Anglo-Catholic clergy, though not numerous in Upper Canada, were usually missionaries of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel. Some clergy, including John Strachan, were warmly disposed toward the Oxford Movement.\footnote{For a discussion of Strachan and the Oxford Movement, see Mark C. McDermott, "The Theology of Bishop Strachan: A Study in Anglican Identity" (PhD. diss., University of Toronto, 1983), 125-141.} The roles of priest and, especially, bishop were Apostolic in the eyes of Anglo-Catholics and quite above that of a mere Protestant minister. Priests and bishops handled holy things and were set apart by ordination and consecration for this high duty. Sacramental confirmation by a bishop was taken as seriously by Anglo-Catholics as it was by Evangelicals. The bishop stood in place of Christ.

The Anglo-Catholic Revival was criticized because it seemed to be "Popish" with its Catholic elements. When Anglo-Catholic priests began to adopt Roman Catholic ritual elements, such as the wearing of eucharistic vestments, this suspicion seemed to be confirmed. Some Anglo-Catholic clergy, notably John Henry Newman who was founder of the movement, did defect to Rome. There were cries of "No Popery" from the Evangelicals who thought of themselves as Protestants. Violence had attended the introduction of ritualism by Anglo-Catholic clergy in England, and the tensions between the two camps continued through the nineteenth century. Although rivalry between Anglo-Catholics and Evangelicals was present in Ontario, it centered upon the
founding of theological colleges such as Trinity (Anglo-Catholic) and Wycliffe (Evangelical) and upon episcopal elections in the latter half of the century.6

A third group, the Broad Church,7 stood in the tradition of the Latitudinarians. These more liberal Anglicans gave little adherence to party and placed more significance on reason in religious affairs than on formality of an Evangelical or High Church flavour. In the society of today, members of the Broad Church would be termed Modernists.

Although polarities existed in the nineteenth-century Anglican Church, most Anglicans did not belong to a church party. Anglicans, in general, were united in their devotion to the Book of Common Prayer, whatever ritual attended it. There was never any serious theological schism.

Anglican theology is not a monolith which can be seen easily in dogmas or even customs; it is to be found primarily in the practice of worship and only derivatively in theological doctrines. The principle of Anglican theology most cited by learned Anglicans was lex orandi lex credendi, that is, the faith which is believed is the faith which is prayed.8 Central to Anglican theology is the Book of Common Prayer (BCP) and its many versions in the course of Anglican

---

8The Book of Alternative Services of the Anglican Church of Canada (Toronto: Anglican Book Centre, 1985), 10. Anglican theology is not inflexible, but rather consists of shared liturgical expression and also theological diversity.
history. The editions of most concern in this dissertation are those of 1662, 1918, and 1962. Most Anglican prayer books have contained not only extensive liturgical forms, but also articles of belief and catechisms for the instruction of the young.

The catechism which was used most extensively by Anglicans in the early years of the Province of Ontario [Upper Canada] was that contained in the Prayer Book of 1662, which was the approved manual. An examination of the Catechism reveals its basic conservatism, which suited the period following the Restoration of the Monarchy in 1660 to the Great War of 1914-18—at least in Anglican historical development.

In reaction to the English Civil War (1642 - 1645) and the Protectorate of Oliver Cromwell (1649-1659), the BCP of 1662 was solidly royalist. The BCP stood for monarchy as against the "unhappy confusion" of the period of war and "usurped powers". The view of the revisers was that the Cromwellian period was chaotic and that the return of Charles II to the throne was "happy". In the seventeenth century, religion and politics had been loosely linked. Followers of the King had tended to be Catholic in taste, the rebels

---

9See F. L. Cross and E. A. Livingstone, eds., The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church [Third Edition] (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 384-5 for a history of the BCP and its editions. Of particular interest is the background of the proposed 1928 Prayer Book for the Church of England, as the issues surrounding it were debated. The Canadian revision of 1918 was little changed even though clergy interpreted rubrics and directions less rigidly than before.

10Preface to The Book of Common Prayer, 1662.

11Ibid.
Protestant during the Civil War. Having had a bitter taste of sectarian strife, most English people were glad to reunite under the restored monarchy and to accept the stability of hereditary rule.\textsuperscript{12} With the Restoration of the monarchy came the rehabilitation of the Church of England to its established role. The Prayer Book, and particularly the Catechism, naturally reflected reverence for ecclesiastical and royal authority. This conservative view characterized the Anglicans of Upper Canada throughout the nineteenth century.

Most Anglican settlers had witnessed the American War of Independence (1775-1783) and had supported the British side in that conflict. Their leaders had been British officers who were Anglican and Tory in sentiment. Rebellion against constituted authority was abhorrent to them. They had chosen to remain loyal to the Crown. It was natural for them to reverence hierarchy and authority and to wish to impart this principle to their children. The Catechism, and the Prayer Book in general, suited their traditional values and opinions perfectly. The patriarchal and rigid tones of the Prayer Book of 1662 were not to be challenged until the slight revisions of 1962 and the more permissive and liberal \textit{Book of Alternative Services} (BAS) of 1985. Even the Revision of 1918 left the Catechism basically intact. In 1893, the first General Synod of the Church of England in the Dominion of

\textsuperscript{12}Neill, 159.
Canada had vowed to transmit the Anglican Prayer Book "unimpaired to our posterity". This is not to say that there were not challenges to the patriarchal and rigid tones of the Catechism and of the Prayer Book as a whole, but for most Canadian Anglicans, the beliefs stated in the Catechism reflected their already traditional values and private opinions.

The Catechism was "to be learned of every person before he [sic] be brought to be confirmed by the bishop". It was drilled into the minds of catechumens regularly at church and during other instruction, the teacher usually being the resident clergyman or missionary. It was presented in question and answer form, the answer being given by the candidate and learned by rote until satisfactorily delivered. The components of the Catechism were the Creed, the Ten Commandments, the Lord's Prayer, the Sacraments and other popular and pious nostrums. They provided the basis for a dutiful, reverent and Christian life which was lived in hope of salvation and election to eternal life.

The child was to restate the vows of his or her godparents to "renounce the devil and all his works, the pomp and vanity of this wicked world, and all the sinful lusts of the flesh," to "believe all the articles of the Christian faith, and to keep God's holy will and

14The Book of Common Prayer (London: Queen's Printer, 1662), The Catechism, 1
commandments". The child was to thank God also for calling him or her "to this state of salvation" and pray to continue in the same. Then followed the Creed and the Ten Commandments with an explanation of each. These explanations provided a bulwark for traditional morality and hierarchical notions of order. The Commandments were grouped in two sections: duties toward God, duties toward neighbour. Duties toward God included total commitment and obedience. Duties toward neighbour included the Summary of the Law and explicit subservience to all authority, particularized in such injunctions as "to love, honour and succour my father and mother: To honour and obey the King, and all that are in authority under him: To submit myself to all my governors, teachers, spiritual pastors and masters: To order myself lowly and reverently to all my betters . . . ." Included in duties toward one's neighbour were injunctions against hurting others, malice and hatred, drunkenness, unchastity, unfair dealing, "picking and stealing", "evil-speaking, lying, and slandering", covetousness and sloth. The last injunction was "to do my duty in that state of life into which it shall please God to call me"—an explicit direction to accept one's lot in life and to see it as the will of God.

---

15 Ibid.
16 Ibid.
17 Ibid.
18 Ibid., 2.
19 Ibid.
The explanation of the Lord's Prayer enjoined service, obedience, and dependence towards God, particularly that God "keep us from all sin and wickedness, and from our spiritual enemy [i.e. the Devil], and from everlasting death." The discussion of the Sacraments covered only Baptism and The Lord's Supper "as generally necessary to salvation." The doctrine of original sin was explicit, Baptism being the remedy. Infant baptism was defended on the basis of the confirmation of the godparents promises. The necessity of self-examination and repentance prior to receiving the Lord's Supper was stressed since the elements were "taken and received by the faithful" only.

A series of rubrics followed the Instruction, which indicated the ideal method of teaching the Catechism. The minister was to instruct and examine the children of his parish on Sundays and holy days "openly in the Church". It was the duty of parents and guardians to ensure that their children and young servants attended. When the Catechism was completely learned, the child was to be presented to the Bishop to be confirmed.

These provisions of the Catechism, which reflected a long-ago view of society, were not altered substantially until the Canadian Prayer Book of 1962. In that version, the duty of obeying authority was confined to God, the Queen, and government officials. Parents were to be helped and pastors

---

20 Ibid.
21 Ibid.
and teachers respected rather than slavishly obeyed. The injunction to show deference to one's 'betters' was removed. However, the duty "to be courteous to all" replaced it.22

The Catechism provided a bulwark for traditional morality and hierarchical notions of social order. Such sentiments would have come naturally to the British governing classes and, to their mind, to any religious and sensible person. The Commonwealth was founded on the rule of God and, in God's place, upon the King and other ministers both temporal and spiritual. This was the firm belief of the convinced members of the Church of England in the nineteenth century.

In the early years catechisms were allowed in common schools for the purpose of religious instruction so long as parents or guardians did not object.23 It is not known how assiduously Anglican students were drilled by clergy and teachers in the Catechism, but it is likely that parents would not have objected to such indoctrination. In mixed schools, where the adherents of more than one religious denomination attended, Dissenters and Roman Catholics probably desired the use of their own manuals or catechisms. The situation depended on parental wishes and the approval of local trustees and teachers. Where Anglicans dominated, it is likely that the Anglican catechism prevailed; where others

23 Hodgins, 6:67; 4:259. The School Acts of 1843 and 1846 contained a clause which excused students from reading or studying any religious book to which parents or guardians objected.
were in the majority, some other and more suitable devotional manual would have been used.

The leading clerical exponent of the teaching of Anglican doctrine and practice in the schools was the Reverend John Strachan, an Anglican clergyman who arrived in Upper Canada from Scotland in December, 1799. Strachan had taught in a private academy in Cornwall before being ordained in the Church of England. Because of his influence with the gentry, some of whom had been his pupils, and because of his outstanding services during the War of 1812, Strachan soon became an influential figure in the province. He assumed important posts in government, including the chairmanship of the General Board of Education.

Until 1841, major appointments to the Department of Education were made by the lieutenant-governor of Upper Canada—with whom Strachan had great influence. Strachan thus hoped to promote the Anglican view of religious instruction through political means. He intended to place education "under the direction and control of the regular [Anglican] Clergy." He believed that "the true foundation of the prosperity of our Establishment must be laid in the Education of our Youth."25

---

25 Ibid.
Strachan's views on religious instruction had been formed in Scotland, where the Church controlled the education system. Spragge has stated:

In that country, the ideal was the policy of John Knox, whose conception of education was that character counts for more than mere knowledge and that there can be no real knowledge apart from the knowledge of God.  

Strachan considered religion to be essential for public security, true liberty and popular morality. In a sermon of February 4, 1821, he stated his theology of Church-state relations: "The fear of God must always be considered as the surest foundation of freedom."

As Bishop of Toronto, Strachan exercised a far from disinterested role in religious and public education. Convinced that non-sectarian public education was "godless" and little disposed to teaching the truths of religion, Strachan's preferences in matters of religious education tended towards the inculcation of morality based upon the traditional doctrines of the Church of England. These included notions of the place of the Church in a society which reflected his High Church beliefs. In his view, the function of religious instruction was to impart the truth of religion unimpaired to the young. Theories of Christian education which did not rest upon the principles of the

---

27 Ibid., 331.
28 Cited in McDermott, 331.
29 Hodgens, 10:271.
30 McDermott, 332-333.
established Church were thought by John Strachan to be dangerous. Based upon the Scriptures and the tradition of the Church of England, education must make Christians of those who without this instruction would remain in ignorance. The practical sciences were important to Strachan, but Anglican religious instruction for the youth of the province implied "the proper moral development of the colony." In fact, "only an established Church that was directly linked with the schools of a nation could assure that the Christian gospel was taught".

While Strachan was anti-republican in matters of government, he was supportive of measures to ensure that every child of ability had access to a good education. This was merited on the basis of "superior talents". Presumably, if gifted children were taught the principles of the Establishment, they would be less inclined to imbibe republican philosophies.

Strachan's educational strategy included the fostering of an attachment to the Anglican Church and the British Monarchy--Anglican religious instruction in the schools being the desired instrument of his purposes. The emphasis upon loyalty to the Crown and to the Church would provide an

---

31 In Strachan's opinion, the spread of dissenting religious views and republican ideas contributed to societal disorder. Ibid., 333-35, passim.
32 Ibid., 332.
33 Ibid.
34 Christian Recorder, April, 1819, 52. Cited in Spragge, "Contribution to Education", 156.
35 Ibid., 156.
orderly and peaceful society in the province and uphold "the moral character of the nation". These notions were commonplace in nineteenth-century Britain, but less palatable to colonial society, which was neither uniformly nor predominantly Anglican, in spite of Strachan's efforts.

Although the elite in the early years were Anglicans (22% in 1842), the majority of the population belonged to the other churches, notably Methodist and Presbyterian. A political conflict developed between the Anglican elitists and the "Reformers" over the issue of responsible government. The Legislative Assembly protested the veto power of the Governor and Council. In 1837, radicals under William Lyon Mackenzie staged a rebellion which was quickly quelled, but responsible government was granted by the British in 1848 in spite of Tory objections. While the attachment to Monarchy and British institutions remained strong, there was to be no Church Establishment in Canada; the religious denominations were voluntary organizations. The largest group, the Methodists, benefitted most from this development. The voluntary principle was a factor in the formation of an autonomous Canadian Anglican Church.

Strachan's relations with the other denominations were distant. He thought that the Methodist circuit riders had

---

36 McDermott, 331.
been educated inadequately for the ministry.\textsuperscript{35} He was suspicious of revivalism. The Roman Catholics and the Protestants he found to be "dangerous and extravagant extremes".\textsuperscript{39} Between these unstable elements, Strachan saw the Anglican Church as a society of order based on tradition and reason.\textsuperscript{40} For Strachan, the Anglican Church represented a bulwark against ignorant superstition on the one hand and unbridled enthusiasm on the other. In time, Anglicans accepted the voluntary system of church membership and worked with Strachan for a strong Anglican presence in the plural context.\textsuperscript{41}

Strachan opposed any system of theology or education other than his own.\textsuperscript{42} He cherished the ideal of state schools in the Anglican tradition, but his hopes were disappointed by the establishment of a viable non-sectarian public education system in Ontario. The adherents of the Protestant and the Roman Catholic Churches, while desiring an orderly and moral society, did not see the guarantee of its preservation in Anglican doctrine and church polity. Most convinced Christians worked for the dissemination of their own

\textsuperscript{38}John Strachan, \textit{A Sermon Preached at York, Upper Canada, Third of July 1825, on the Death of the Late Lord Bishop of Quebec} (Kingston: Macfarlane, 1826).
\textsuperscript{39}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{41}Ibid., 105.
\textsuperscript{42}Strachan thought that only the doctrines of the established Church of England should be taught in the schools. When he could not secure this state of affairs, he advocated Anglican parochial schools supported from the public purse. Ibid., 19-49.
religious ideas and a religious education for their children based on their own theological doctrines and religious practices. Strachan's ideal of Establishment was not to be, even though his early influence on education in the province had been great. Of necessity, he had come to accept the voluntary system of Church membership. However, he remained an advocate of Anglican influence in Ontario society and education and continued to shape, if not dictate, Anglican policy on religious education until his death.

3. The Methodist Model

Methodism began as a movement within the Church of England during the latter half of the eighteenth century. Essentially, it was a call to greater piety and religious devotion among the masses of lay persons on the fringes of the Church of England. Its founder, John Wesley, was a priest of the Church of England who wanted to emphasize the revival of the experiential element in religion. He had no intention of founding a separate denomination. However, in 1784, the first Methodist ministers were ordained to the presbyterate in Scotland and England. Thomas Coke, who was in Anglican orders, was "set apart" as Superintendent for America. After John Wesley's death, the break with the Anglican hierarchy became complete. However, many Methodists

---

continued to use the Book of Common Prayer as a devotional manual. 44

Methodism spread into Upper Canada from Britain and the United States. In the portion of Upper Canada along the United States border, missionaries came often from New York on their circuits to preach their revivalist gospel. Anglicans in Upper Canada were suspicious of these American preachers because many had little formal training and because it was rumored that they encouraged republican sentiments. By 1825 most Methodist clergy in Upper Canada were Canadians by birth or naturalization 45, and although their usual theological training was not university based, as Egerton Ryerson himself demonstrated, many were literate and competent to preach. The training they received was based on the works of John Wesley and on the works of Anglican divines, such as Bishop Joseph Butler's The Analogy of Religion. Their practical training was rigorous. In fact Anglican priestly formation could often be considered deficient in comparison. 46

Methodists based their catechisms on the theology of John Wesley. Wesley extended the logical consequences of Protestant doctrines extant in his time. Following Martin Luther, he taught the doctrine of justification of the

44 Neill, 189-190.
46 Westfall, 24-27.
believer through faith in Jesus Christ. Due to the sin of Adam and Eve, humanity was made unacceptable to God. Through the atoning death of Jesus Christ, the world was redeemed. Baptized believers were made acceptable [justified] to God through faith in Christ. By the agency of the Holy Spirit, justified believers were regenerated spiritually, thus losing the stains of original sin. Through a commitment to holy living, believers continued to grow in holiness, that is sanctity, throughout their lives. Wesley believed that it was possible to become entirely sanctified in a lifetime. Because Wesley believed in free will, it was possible also to fall back into a state of depravity. Hence, the need for the disciplines of Church attendance and religious activities, moral probity and generous works of charity.  

Methodist catechisms emphasized traditional components such as the Ten Commandments, the Creed and the Lord's Prayer, but they included also the doctrines of justification by faith, regeneration by the Holy Spirit and the sanctification of the believer.  

Salvation was offered to all, but only effected by conversion to a holy life. In Canada, Catechisms were produced by the Wesleyan Methodists in 1838 and in 1866, and by the Methodist Church, Canada in 1898. These catechisms were in general use in Church and school, but they were rather theologically sophisticated for

48 The Catechisms of the Wesleyan Methodists (Toronto: William Briggs, 1866), Section 4.
young children. Even the Catechism of 1866, which was recommended for children as young as seven years, seemed too long at seventy-eight pages to be memorized. The 1898 Catechism, approximately half the length, was an improvement. In any case, not all children would have proceeded to Church membership for which the Catechism was a preparation. The religious education of the young during the nineteenth century consisted of the memorization of Bible verses and stories. A more sophisticated curriculum developed slowly. 49

A strong sense of duty was encouraged in the catechisms. The Catechism of 1898 stressed duties to parents and others and the following virtues: truth, honour, kindness, equity, fidelity, honesty and industry in business, help to the needy and respect for age and authority. 50

In educational matters, Methodists supported common schools as a cost effective measure. 51 The common schools must be Christian in character and must include biblically-based religious education. A Christian education based upon what all Protestants held in common would be supplemented by the work of the individual churches. Egerton Ryerson, the Methodist minister who headed the Department of Education from 1846 to 1876, was convinced that Christians held in common the moral law contained in the Ten Commandments and the teachings of Jesus. The difficulty of defining exactly

49Semple, 373-4.
50Catechism of the Methodist Church, Canada containing a summary of Christian doctrine (Toronto: William Briggs, 1898), Section 6.
51Semple, 240-1.
what Christians held in common became evident over time. Under Ryerson, non-sectarian public education became the Methodist policy.\textsuperscript{52}

Based on a tour of European educational systems taken before he commenced his duties as Superintendent of Education, Ryerson concluded that religion could be taught in the schools without sectarian bias. He admired particularly the Irish National Schools, which featured a set of readers which incorporated religious material thought to be not objectionable to either Protestants or Catholics. When the Canadian Legislature passed a bill banning the use of any religious book in the public schools in 1849, Ryerson threatened to resign on the basis that the Bible, and even the Irish National Readers, would be excluded. The Legislature backed down and revoked the proposed legislation. Thus, some as yet undefined religious content was allowable in the curriculum. Ryerson appealed to 'common Christianity' as the basis for non-sectarian religious instruction. He found this in the Ten Commandments and the teachings of Jesus. He thought that the content of common Christianity was moral and presumed that all would agree that revealed religion provided a sound basis for the moral law. He brushed aside sectarian doctrines as secondary to the Judeo-Christian ethic. They were not to be taught in the schools,

\textsuperscript{52}Hodgins, 14:266.
but to be left to pastors and parents. The moral law could be taught to all.\textsuperscript{53}

Ryerson's views were in large part supported by the general Protestant assumptions of the Victorian era. Few would deny that religion was the basis for morality. Humanity had fallen from grace due to the sin of Adam and Eve. Therefore, there was a need for humanity to be restored. The vehicle of restoration was the Christian religion--to be found primarily in the Ten Commandments and the teachings of Jesus. Religion was indispensable to the betterment of fallen humanity. Adherence to religious principles would produce moral behaviour and would be the agent of a redeemed social order. Atheism was a grave threat which must be countered by a sustained effort to teach and preserve the Christian moral law. The law of God was anterior to any human law and the basis for proper human relations. This would be granted by most nineteenth-century Ontarians. The need for religious education would be granted also. The debate ensued over whether the public school was to be the vehicle for religious education in a religiously heterogeneous society, or whether the church and the family would better serve the need. The conflict remains unresolved as far as the churches are concerned.

\textsuperscript{53}For a fuller discussion see J. Donald Wilson, Robert M. Stamp, and Louis-Phillippe Audet, \textit{Canadian Education: A History} (Scarborough, Ontario: Prentice-Hall, 1970), 214-239.
Ryerson elaborated the content of 'common Christianity' with the publication of First Lessons in Christian Morals. Many of his ideas on moral education were cribbed from the works of William Paley. In the preface, Ryerson assumed the "truth of Christianity and the authority of the Holy Scriptures". He assumed, further, that his work was "in harmony with the views of all religious persuasions"—a view later gainsaid by the Baptists and some other Protestants. Ryerson's First Lessons was concerned primarily with moral duties contained in God's Law. A knowledge of God's Law was necessary because the child's natural faculties were insufficient to discover and to learn moral truth. Therefore, revealed religion was superior to natural religion in this regard.

The duties most prominent in First Lessons were those owed our neighbours, our parents, and all in authority, as well as our duties towards ourselves in virtuous living. In all of this, the child was in a subservient position.

---

54 Egerton Ryerson, First Lessons in Christian Morals (Toronto: Copp Clark, 1871).
55 These ideas recognized Paley's contribution to a moral philosophy consistent with natural religion. In Paley's Principles of Moral and Political Philosophy [1785], he enumerated duties of parents and children similar to those outlined in Ryerson's text. Ryerson believed that revealed religion, though complimented by natural evidences, was more important in teaching children morals than natural religion. For the influence of Paley on Canadian theology, see A. B. McKillop, A Disciplined Intelligence: Critical Inquiry and Canadian Thought in the Victorian Era (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1979), 63-4.
56 Ryerson, First Lessons, preface, i.
57 Ibid., 63-66.
Ryerson reminded his readers that the ancient biblical
punishment for disobedience towards parents was death: 58

Ryerson's nostrums are echoes of lists of duties found
in Paley, 59 supplemented by the views of John Wesley on the
upbringing of children. Paley had concerned himself rather
stringently with the duties of children, 60 while Wesley
counted it no favour to "spare the rod" in correcting
improper behaviour. 61 For a child to obey authority was to
obey the will of God. Therefore, morality could not be
taught without reference to the revealed will of God found in
the Christian Scriptures. According to Wesley, and also to
Ryerson, the moral formation of the child was based on the
Christian religion. The ignorant child needed to be educated
in the Christian religion in order to be set on the road to
salvation and sanctification. This knowledge, absent from
natural religion, was to be found only in the saving
knowledge of Jesus Christ. 62 The goal of moral behaviour
necessitated indoctrination in Christianity as well as the
compulsion of divine and human law. Religion was the
foundation of the child's education. Other studies were
useful but secondary, human rather than divine. Morals, for

58 Ibid., 29
59 William Paley, The Principles of Moral and Political Philosophy [Third
60 Ibid., 304-310.
61 Alfred C. Outler (Ed.), The Works of John Wesley (Nashville: Abingdon,
1984), 367.
62 Ryerson, First Lessons, 64-65.
Ryerson, were "those principles and duties which Christianity teaches".  

There was little criticism of the object of Ryerson's book, which was the necessity of teaching morals in the schools. However, there were complaints, mainly from the Baptist churches, that First Lessons was too sectarian. First Lessons was quietly withdrawn as a text. The subject of Christian Morals was dropped from the curriculum by 1875. It remains as the most forceful attempt to inject evangelical Christianity into the mandatory curriculum. Although this opportunity did not reappear in the nineteenth century, the growing strength of the mainline evangelical churches, led by Methodism, was translated into agitation for Protestant theological content in the school curriculum during the latter years of the nineteenth century and into the new century.

4. Presbyterian Doctrines

The Church of England was not the only church in nineteenth-century Ontario with a claim to establishment. The Reformation had produced the Church of Scotland under the aegis of John Knox, a Calvinist minister. Commonly called the Kirk, this Presbyterian body was a force in the life of the province during the century. The ideal first iterated by

---

63Ibid., 9.
John Knox was a church and a school in every community. However, even a century and a half later, the parish school system had been imperfectly developed in Scotland. Nevertheless, education was a preoccupation of Scottish Presbyterian settlers in Ontario as it had been for their forebears in the mother country. Following the tradition of Calvin and Knox, this education was to be scientific as well as theological. In the elementary and secondary schools which were envisioned, catechisms and the Bible were to be central. When common schools appeared, religious training based on these appeared also. Presbyterian children were disciplined harshly on occasion, if they were not proficient in answering prescribed questions during catechetical instruction.

John Calvin's Catechisms of the Church of Geneva was the model for Reformed religious instruction. The use of these catechisms was framed by Calvin in Institutes of the Christian Religion. Calvin had hoped that children would be sufficiently instructed by the age of ten years to make a public profession of faith and to be admitted to the

---

65 Klempera, William, ed. The Burning Bush and a Few Acres of Snow: The Presbyterian Contribution to Canadian Life and Culture (Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1994), 1
congregation. Knox enjoined a period of instruction of two years. The ideal was church-sponsored schools in sufficient numbers to ensure the catechesis of young Presbyterians. However, in the early years, the common complaint was that the schools were inadequate. In their zeal for catechesis, the Presbyterians hoped for better, but their ideal of parish schools was never realized. The public schools, therefore, needed a religious dimension more rigorously pursued than heretofore. This goal occupied the Presbyterians and the zealots of other denominations for many years. When Ryerson introduced his system of non-sectarian public schools, it seemed hardly adequate.

The doctrines which were taught to young Presbyterians were modeled on Scottish versions of the Catechism of the Church of Geneva, supplemented by precepts drawn from Calvin's Institutes. Besides the interpretation of the Lord's Prayer, the Creed, the Ten Commandments, and the Sacraments (of which Calvin recognized only the Lord's Supper and Baptism), were found the two doctrines most peculiar to the Reformed religion: the total depravity of the human race and the predestination of the individual to salvation or reprobation. Although these were emphasized by Calvin's later followers out of proportion to his overall theology, they left their mark on Presbyterianism. Children, being

---

68Ibid., Chapter 19, Section 13.
69Ibid., 209.
totally depraved due to original sin, must be restrained from vice so as not to offend the majesty of God—whether they were the elect or not. Knowledge of God and His Law was paramount in Presbyterian catechesis. Infractions of the Law, as understood by Knox and his ecclesiastical successors, were to be punished severely according to the rules of the Book of Discipline. Calvin thought the pestilent and persistent immorality of the race punishable by damnation, but that the sentence had been commuted for the elect by Christ's atoning death. Following St. Paul, Calvin believed that the role of the secular authority was to restrain and punish vice. Under the tutelage of the Reformed Church, as at Geneva in the sixteenth century, religious education was essential to the furtherance of godliness and to the restraint of vice in a Christian commonwealth. All of this presupposed the subordination of the State to the Reformed Church—a desideratum hardly to be realized in Upper Canada, and only imperfectly achieved even under the domination of the Kirk of Scotland.

The Shorter Catechism of the Church of Scotland was a 'second Bible' for many Presbyterians. A version published at Montreal in 1840 was intended for children. The question and answer form was concerned with doctrines of God and Jesus Christ. Particular to Calvinism was the doctrine of the

---

72The A. B. C. with the Shorter Catechism (Montreal: William Greig, 1840).
predestination of the elect to salvation. The corollary doctrine of the predestination of the lost to reprobation was absent. The doctrines of justification by faith in Jesus Christ, the adoption of the elect as sons and daughters of God, and the sanctification of the elect were present. The Creed, the Lord's Prayer and the Ten Commandments were included. In the explanation of the commandment to honour one's father and one's mother, the view was presented that society consisted of one's superiors, equals, and inferiors, and that this was a just arrangement. The traditional doctrine of original sin and the consequent depravity of the human race was contrasted with the sublime majesty of God who is absolute perfection. As a consequence, humans might be elected by God to salvation, but only because of God's grace and justice and through no merit of their own. Presbyterian children were expected to learn their catechism thoroughly and were punished for not rehearsing it adequately. The method of imparting the Shorter Catechism has been described as "often a lifeless process of learning by rote".

---

73 Ibid., ii.
74 Ibid., i.
76 John T. McNeil, The Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1875 - 1925 (Toronto: General Board, Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1925), 156.
unimaginative procedure was common in the nineteenth century and was replaced slowly by more modern teaching methods.

When it became clear that a system of publicly-funded parish schools was impractical, the Presbyterians in Upper Canada were concerned that their doctrines of religious education be permitted in the common school system. The Anglicans and Roman Catholics continued to campaign for their own schools. In the event publicly-funded parish schools were not allowed to any religious body, but, under the Act of Union of 1841, separate schools were permitted "whenever any number of the Inhabitants of the Township, or Parish, professing a religious faith different from the majority" so desired. Thus both separate Protestant and Catholic schools were permitted, but not encouraged. This concession fell far short of the Erastian ideals of the Presbyterians and the Anglicans. When the Presbyterians, and many other Protestant bodies, attempted to enact the use of the Protestant Bible as a class book in the common schools on the grounds that it contained "duties to God and others," the Romans demurred and were permitted to establish their own separate schools. In general, Protestants came to accept non-sectarian common schools with the provision that their children might receive

77Susan Houston and Alison Prentice, Schooling and Scholars in Nineteenth Century Ontario (Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1988).
78McNeil, The Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1875-1925, 156.
79Moir, Enduring Witness. 100.
80Hodgins, 4:5.
religious instruction by their own clergy outside regular school hours.

5. Baptist Beginnings

Baptist beginnings in Ontario were shaped within the American revivalist movements of the later eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Congregations were independent, but shared a common theology. Baptists were among the religiously-diverse United Empire Loyalists who migrated north of the Great Lakes after 1783. By 1797, a congregation at Haldimand had covenanted as "brethren and sisters assembled for the purpose of obtaining fellowship with sister churches". By 1802, three churches near the Bay of Quinte, one of which was in Haldimand, grouped to form the Thurlow Association. Until the War of 1812, American Baptist missionaries regularly ministered in churches throughout Upper and Lower Canada.

In 1836, the Ottawa Baptist Association was organized for "the promotion of united exertion in whatever may best advance the cause of Christ". Its constitution, modelled on that of the Baptist Union of Great Britain and Ireland,

---

82Harry A. Renfree, "Baptist Unity", in Priestly, 142.
83G. Richard Blackaby, "The Establishment of the Canadian Convention of Southern Baptists", in Priestly, 100.
84Phillip A. Griffin-Allwood, "Baptist Unity in the Midst of Diversity: Canadian Baptists in the 19th-Century Evangelical Debate over Christian Unity", in Priestly, 130.
declared that membership consisted of 'Baptised Believers', it being understood that "every separate Church has, and ought to retain, within itself, the power and authority to exercise all Church discipline, rule, and government, and to put in execution the laws of Christ necessary to its own edification, according to its own views, independently of any other Church or Churches whatsoever."  

In 1851, German Baptist beginnings resulted from an American-led revival among German immigrants living in Canada West. August Rauschenbusch, of the American Tract Society, conducted evangelical services in Waterloo County. Upon baptism, converts were organized as members of the Bridgeport German Baptist Church, with Heinrich Schneider as pastor.

The unique ministry of the German Baptists was centred in and reinforced by the German language. A desire to worship in their own tongue was fundamental; religion lost something for German Baptists when it was conveyed in a strange language. As the growing membership spread over a larger geographic territory, the Bridgeport group divided into three. These and other emergent churches organized the German Baptist Conference, thoroughly German in composition, operation, and mission, and developed to meet the religious and social needs of the German population—predominantly the

---

87 Ibid., 69-70.
lower socioeconomic class of peasant farmers, unskilled labourers, and tradesmen. German Baptist churches emerged and expanded in the Great Lakes region where those of German origin tended to concentrate. Their modest economic circumstance affected severely their educational interests and their concern for religious instruction. At their first conference in 1851, the membership unanimously resolved that their children be instructed in the German language in German Sunday schools and, where practical, German week-day schools.

Although the majority of early Baptists were rooted in British Baptist tradition, usually arriving in Ontario via the United States, the origins of the Particular Baptists were different. Baptist Calvinism was transplanted to rural Upper Canada in 1818, when Dugald Campbell headed a group of the Particular Covenanted Baptist sect who emigrated from the Scottish Highlands. Arriving to Elgin County, Upper Canada via Pictou, Nova Scotia and Quebec City, their move was precipitated by religious intolerance of the Particular Covenanted Baptist sect by the established Church of Scotland and by economic hardship brought on by "an elite desire to modernize the Highlands". On arrival in Elgin County, the

---

88 Ibid., 72-74.
89 Ibid., 73.
91 Paul R. Wilson, "Church and Community: Old School Baptists in Ontario, 1818 - 1901", in Priestly, 83-86.
92 Ibid., 83-86.
families applied for land grants from Colonel Thomas Talbot and settled in Aldborough Township. For a brief period, they worshipped as the first Protestant Church in Aldborough with Highland Presbyterians who had maintained belief in the deterministic elements of Calvinistic theology.

In 1820, doctrinal differences precipitated a split from the Protestant Church. Elder Dugald Campbell and his followers withdrew to form the Baptist Church of Christ in Aldborough, later called the Particular Covenanted Baptist Church. Their independent development began with a statement of their doctrinal position of Old School Baptist faith and function in the form of their "Articles of Faith". The articles spelled out in detail their "belief in human total depravity, absolute predestination, limited atonement, effectual calling, and justification by faith alone". Upon creating a "separate Baptist church committed to faith in the absolute sovereignty of God" these Baptists, otherwise known as Old School Baptists, Calvinist Baptists, Predestination Baptists, Primitive Baptists, and Scottish Baptists, took a hardline position affirming their "belief in biblical authority, inerrancy and inspiration, the Church, the Trinity, salvation, sanctification, and glorification. Sundry articles revealed that in doctrine the Old School

---

93Ibid., 87.
94Ibid.
Baptists represented a Calvinist extreme in the Baptist theological spectrum.  

By 1857, the Particular Covenanted Baptist Church in Canada had created its own niche, distinguished by its hyper-Calvinistic faith, within the Ontario's Baptist community. A new stage of development began with the establishment of a connection with American Old School Baptists, who had already made in-roads in associations development over the preceding two decades.  

By 1840, a version of the 1833 constitution developed by the Niagara Baptist Association of New York State had been adopted by 76.5% of Ontario's Baptists. The second article, a compendium of doctrines, became the "keystone of tradition in this constitution". With only minor stylistic modifications to the compendia by local congregations, it was adopted and passed on to other Ontario associations during the rest of the century. To illustrate the second article of the constitution, the 1844 Grand River Association constitution follows:  

The Association shall be composed of such churches only, as embrace in substance the following doctrines: The being and unity of God--the existence of three equal persons in the Godhead--the divine inspiration of the scriptures of the Old and New Testaments, as a complete and infallible rule of faith and practice--the total and moral depravity and just condemnation of all mankind, by the fall of our first parents--the election of grace according to the foreknowledge of God--the proper

95 Ibid.  
96 Ibid, 90.  
97 Gillespie, in Priestly, 30.  
98 Ibid.
divinity of our Lord Jesus Christ--the all-sufficiency of his atonement--regeneration and sanctification of the Holy Spirit--sanctification by grace alone--perseverence of the saints--immersion only baptism--the Lord's Supper, a privilege peculiar to immersed believers, regularly admitted to Church fellowship--and the religious observance of the first day of the week--the resurrection of the body, and general judgment--the final happiness of the saints, and the eternal misery of the wicked--the obligation of every intelligent creature to love God supremely--to believe what he says, and to practice what God commands.99

At the turn of the 19th-Century, Canada's Baptists were divided into a variety of denominations with two primary means of transcongregating -- associations and societies. Baptist associations were organic unions consisting of churches grouped together for concerns about faith and order; Baptist societies consisted of members who contributed financially, representing an individual form of church union.100 In the Canadas, the first society was the Baptist Missionary Convention of Upper Canada (BMCUC), which was organized in 1833. Membership in the convention was open to individuals who paid one dollar. By 1836, the work and treasury of the BMCUC was assumed by the Upper Canada Baptist Missionary Society (UCBMS), an auxillary which supported seven missionaries in Upper Canada. In the same year, the Canadian Baptist Missionary Society was organized, uniting a

100Griffin-Allwood, in Priestly, 125.
variety of Baptist denominations: Scottish Baptists, British Particular Baptists, and American Free Comunion Baptists. In Upper Canada, regular Baptists, Free Christian Baptists, Free Communion Baptists, Freewill Baptists, and Scottish Baptists, were included in the evolving denominations. As the century progressed, a number of attempts toward unity met by varying degrees of success.

In educating their young, Baptist catechists tended to concentrate on preparation for believers' baptism. Only those able to make a mature profession of faith were baptized. Formal theology was less important than a conversion experience, publicly attested. However, once saved, a believer was expected to follow a strict rule of life which emphasized sabbatarianism and clean living. Alcohol, sexual transgressions, public amusements and elaborate dress were to be shunned. The body, after all, was the temple of the Holy Spirit and must be kept pure and chaste. This was the ideal of all Christian bodies, but the Baptists were more stringent in enforcing it than most. The Baptists were evangelical in belief. They were willing to cooperate in such social causes as temperance, however, they retained a certain exclusivity in matters of theology. Convinced that a salvation experience was paramount, they did not count those who they did not consider to be "saved" as co-religionists. They rejected appeals to non-sectarian

\[101\] Ibid., 129.
religion as counter to their own deeply held evangelical beliefs.

6. The Roman Catholic Ethos in Education

This section of the dissertation does not purport to be a history of Roman Catholic Education in Ontario. That history has been completed already by Franklin A. Walker. However, the picture of the development of non-sectarian religious education remains incomplete without some treatment of the Roman Catholic ethos, because the history of public school religious education has been related often to developments within the Roman Catholic School System and because students of the Roman Catholic faith always have been present in the common schools.

The first Catholic elementary schools were established by Alexander Macdonnell, who was a priest in Upper Canada from 1804 and Bishop from 1820 to 1840. These were poor institutions, scattered throughout the province, for which Macdonnell secured limited and desultory government aid. The first Roman Catholic separate schools were authorized in 1841. Before this, Catholics attended either the few Catholic private schools or the common schools with

Protestant children. In areas of Catholic predominance, trustees were allowed to permit some Roman Catholic catechesis, and in mixed schools the regulations permitted a Roman Catholic religious education where the parents desired it. The Roman Catholic bishops preferred separate schools as the ideal. Bishop Charbonnel campaigned for the same financial aid as the public schools.\(^{104}\) In a lenten pastoral of 1856, he used his episcopal authority to remind Roman Catholic parents of their educational obligations. If children did not know the Lord's Prayer, the Apostles' Creed, and the Ten Commandments, the Act of Confession and "the manner of hearing mass" by age seven, their parents or guardians were guilty of mortal sin. Any Roman Catholic failing to vote for separate schools was guilty also of mortal sin, as were Roman Catholic supporters of mixed schools.\(^{105}\) In Charbonnel's mind, only separate schools were suitable for Roman Catholic children and youth. In mixed schools, Catholics would be exposed to the Protestant Bible and to unorthodox teachings.\(^{106}\)

Throughout Ontario history, the Roman Catholic hierarchy has desired a Catholic education for its young.\(^{107}\) This implied not only the imparting of knowledge, but also spiritual formation. During the nineteenth century, the Roman Catholic population, clergy and laity alike, desired a

\(^{104}\)Rbid., xi.
\(^{105}\)Rbid., 181.
\(^{106}\)Rbid., 182-3.
\(^{107}\)Rbid., vii.
separate education from Protestants, not least because of differences regarding the Bible. Bishop Power of Toronto wrote on the matter in a letter of 1845:

You ought to know that the Bible cannot be made use of as a mere class book and that no Catholic child can attend to readings from the Protestant version of the Holy Scriptures. The Catholic children should be allowed to remain in a separate room until the usual lesson from the Holy Scriptures is read; they can read by themselves a chapter from the authorized version of the New Testament. It would be preferable in every way if the parents of Catholic children could have a separate school of their own, but this must depend in a great measure on the number of Catholics in each locality.

In a similar vein of thought members of the Toronto Catholic Institute, composed of leading Catholic laymen, discussed the position of Catholics in relation to the "educational problem". In an address to all Catholics in Canada West, while admitting to deficiencies in the education of young Catholic immigrants, the Institute underlined the necessity of religious education for Catholic children:

... not merely secular education which consists in a knowledge of things human without distinguishing between that which is good and that which is evil; but an education that has religion for its foundation—that teaches the tender mind to look first to the Kingdom of Heaven as the only country worthy (of) the intrinsic love of man's soul; while at the same time it inculcates that regard, that esteem for the world we live in and its inhabitants, which forms the grand distinguishing feature of the Christian Religion. It is not what a child learns or knows that should be chiefly taken into consideration, but the nature and tendency of that learning and that knowledge; in other words, as in all things, quality rather than quantity should be the

---

108Ibid., 78-79.
109Power to Mills, July 8, 1845, Toronto Archdiocesan Papers, Power Papers quoted in ibid., 54.
110Ibid., 106.
distinguishing feature of a general elementary education for the Catholic youth of Canada.\footnote{The Canadian Mirror of Parliament, September 26, 1851, quoted in ibid., 106-107.}

There was opposition to Roman Catholic separate schools on the part of Protestants. Egerton Ryerson hoped for every child to attend the free, non-sectarian public schools. George Brown, the Reform editor of the Toronto Globe, opposed separate schools.\footnote{Ibid.} Many Protestants agreed and anti-Catholic sentiment was often strong. Some Protestants, notably members of the fiercely Protestant Orange Lodge, believed that the Church of Rome was a threat to their own institutions and religious freedom. The issue of separate schools has been divisive and controversial throughout Ontario history, even though the establishment of separate schools in 1841 was a relatively calm affair.\footnote{Ibid., 45.}

The question of Biblical instruction activated debate between supporters of and objectors to Roman Catholic separate schools. Because of the controversy over the Bible, some wanted the Bible not to be used in the common schools because of the fear that teachers would present the Bible according to their own particular theological views.\footnote{Ibid.} Views on the topic varied from a proclamation in a Catholic Reform paper that "no Roman Catholic can expose his child at a tender age to what he believes to be spiritual destruction, without doing violence to the purest dictates of his
conscience" to the belief expressed in a Presbyterian journal that "every man is answerable for his religious belief and his own conscience and his God, and every man should be at liberty to instruct his children in the faith which his conscience dictates." Others, notably Anglicans, represented by the Church of England paper, The Church, expressed an opposing view:

Now natural and strong is our indignation at the virtual exclusion of the Bible from our Common Schools, in deference to those who do not like that the light of truth should be shed upon their errors and corruptions, shall we reiterate the loud complaint of every honest and religious mind in the Protestant community, but be patient a little longer in the hope that this too will be heeded? Among those who feared that their "errors and corruptions" might be exposed would be Roman Catholics, in the mind of the Anglican writer. Moreover, George E. Clerk, a convert to the Catholic Church and its vocal supporter as editor of the Catholic Chronicle, explained why Catholics could not join with Protestants in teaching a common religion --"the Catholic religion came from God, while Protestantism came from the devil." A major reason that separate schools were allowed in 1841 was that no agreement could be secured between Protestants and Catholics as long as most

---

114 The Canadian Mirror of Parliament, August 8, 1851, quoted in ibid., 104.
115 The Canadian Church Examiner and Presbyterian Review, July 21, 1841, quoted in ibid., 41.
116 The Church, July 8, 1843, quoted in ibid., 47.
117 Ibid., 105.
Protestants insisted on the use of the Protestant Bible in the Common Schools.

In 1844, Bishop Power affirmed the rights of Catholics to their own schools exclusive of Protestant influences:

"Catholics have the right to a school of their own. . . . The trustees must be in every case Catholics chosen according to the law and the School Master a member of the Catholic Church."118 Differences between Protestant groups were regarded as differences of opinion, but the difference between Protestants and Catholics "was a difference of Faith—a difference in the belief of certain dogmas which they [Catholics] are taught to regard as of the greatest importance, while any deviation from this belief would be attended with future punishments."119 Differences between Protestants and Catholics over deeply-held theological beliefs precluded their agreement on a common school system. Catholics were not amenable to Anglican domination of the schools under Strachan in the early years, nor to the 'non-sectarian' Protestant inspired scheme of Egerton Ryerson. On the other hand, Protestant prejudices against Roman Catholic separate schools were common. George Brown, editor of the Toronto Globe, wrote that "the worst example of priestcraft's wicked influence . . . was the separate school provision in the Upper Canadian school law."120

118 Power to Sanderl, June 28, 1844, Toronto Archdiocesan Archives, Power Papers quoted in ibid., 54.
119 The Mirror, August 15, 1851 quoted in ibid., 105.
120 Ibid., 76.
Egerton Ryerson allowed both Catholic and Protestant separate schools, but hoped they would dwindle. He objected to their inefficiency, uneconomical nature, and their perceived threat to his public school system.\(^2\) Protestant accounts of the establishment of Roman Catholic separate schools, such as that of J. George Hodgins, Ryerson's assistant in the Department of Education, credit the intransigence and persistence of the Roman Catholic Bishops and their political manoeuvring for the appearance and maintenance of the separate school system.\(^22\) This is to mistake the motives of the Catholic Bishops. They were convinced that only a Catholic institution could be entrusted with education of young Catholics.\(^23\) They were not in favour of Catholic children attending schools in which Catholic theology would be either absent or controverted by Protestant heresies. While study was important, the dogmas of the Universal Church were paramount. The Church was guardian of the Truth. If ignorance, irreligion, and heresy were to be avoided, no other body could be entrusted with the education of young Catholics. In all areas of the curriculum, the Church was the supreme teacher.\(^24\) Only a vigorously orthodox and Catholic education could be a vehicle for the Truth.

\(^{121}\)Ibid., 313.
\(^{122}\)J. George Hodgins, *The Legislation and History of Separate Schools in Upper Canada from 1841 until the Close of the Reverend Doctor Ryerson's Administration of the Education Department in 1876* (Toronto: William Briggs, 1897).
\(^{123}\)Letter of Bishop Charbonnel to Dr. Ryerson (May 1, 1852). Cited in ibid., 39.
\(^{124}\)Ibid.
Non-sectarian education was anathema. Catholics did not object to a Protestant education for Protestant children. However, they wanted the same privilege.

7. Other Christian Bodies

According to statistics cited by Westfall¹²⁵, by 1881 Catholics made up seventeen percent of the total population of Ontario. Anglicans, Methodists, Presbyterians and Baptists constituted approximately ninety-eight percent of the non-Catholic population of Ontario. Other Protestant religious bodies together made up less than two percent of the non-Catholic population. Understandably, they had less impact on the development of religious education in the public schools than the four larger Protestant groups. Nevertheless, they catechized their young according to distinctive principles. The Lutherans and the Congregationalists were significant in view of later developments.

a) Lutherans

Lutheranism developed in Europe.¹²⁶ Lutherans were overwhelmingly German in origin and were collected in

¹²⁵Westfall, 10-11.
discrete settlements. In the early years, they spoke German in church and catechized their young in that language. The catechism was Luther's Small Catechism, which was drilled thoroughly into the catechumens during their tender years until confirmation at about age thirteen. The Catechism presented a conventional Protestant view of the Ten Commandments, the Creed, and the Lord's Prayer. Luther recognized only two sacraments: Holy Baptism and Holy Communion (The Sacrament of the Altar). He treated also Confession and Absolution, but not in a sacramental sense. Luther composed Prayers for Morning and Evening and Grace at Table. These were to be led by the head of the household. The Catechism concluded with a Table of Duties.

In articles on the Creed, Luther taught the doctrine of the atoning death of Christ and of the sanctification of the believer by the agency of the Holy Spirit. Of interest from the point of view of disciplining and training children was the Table of Duties. This consisted of Scripture passages meant to encourage obedience to teachers, pastors, civil authorities, husbands, parents, and masters, as well as respect owed widows and elderly persons. The injunction to honour father and mother, which is the Fourth Commandment, was extended to authority in general.

---

128 Ibid., 343.
Although there are early examples of separate schools conducted in the German language, these did not endure. Catechesis was carried on by the local pastor and supplemented by church school instruction. Up until the 1950's, there continued to be Lutheran "Saturday schools" which specialized in confirmation instruction—especially in rural areas. Lutherans have never depended on public education for the religious training of their young and showed little inclination to combine with other Protestants in non-sectarian religious enterprises.

b) Congregationalists

Congregationalists trace their history to the time of the Reformation. When it became evident that the Church of England did not intend to become wholly Protestant, these "gathered Churches" outside the normal parish structure increased. Congregationalists held the doctrine that the local church was independent and autonomous. Associations of Congregationalists were formed for mutual support but they had no legislative authority. Congregationalism entered Upper Canada primarily from the United States. Its models were the Puritan Churches of New England.

The Congregationalists were Calvinist and evangelical. Warmly disposed to the claims of the intellect, they held

---

129 Ibid., 399.
130 Ibid., 399-400.
131 Ibid., 399.
education in high esteem. They were never numerous in Ontario and were absorbed into the United Church in 1925.

Non-sectarian education had been practiced in New England, a Congregationalist stronghold in the late eighteenth century. Ryerson was influenced by the view of Horace Mann, the New England educator, that moral virtues and principles based on Christianity could be taught without sectarian bias in the public schools. Congregationalist children received the bulk of their religious instruction in church schools.

Although Congregationalists were evangelical in worship, as the nineteenth century developed, they became more sedate and came to resemble the major denominations. Always a minority, the Congregationalists had minor impact on politics and education, and gradually came to an acceptance of non-sectarian education along the lines proposed by Egerton Ryerson. In 1925, they were absorbed into the United Church of Canada, which was predominantly a union of Methodists and some Presbyterians.

8. Summary and Conclusion

Although Upper Canada contained a religiously-diverse population, the vast majority of the inhabitants belonged to

---

the five leading denominations: Anglican, Methodist, Presbyterian, Baptist, and Roman Catholic. The Anglicans under Bishop Strachan desired an established Church of England with control over the school system. When this could not be achieved, Strachan pressed for publicly-funded Anglican schools. The Methodists, led by Egerton Ryerson, came to support a common school system free of sectarian bias, but based on Christian moral principles shared by all, such as the Ten Commandments and the teachings of Jesus. The Presbyterians, after failing to obtain their own publicly-funded schools, came to accept the common schools, but were uneasy about the possible divisiveness of state-sponsored religious instruction. The Baptist churches were independent bodies united by a similar theology. They suspected Ryerson's efforts to define a common curriculum of religious education. The Roman Catholics demanded and obtained a separate school system.

When the Protestant churches realized that they would not get public funding for denominational schools, they still desired greater religious instruction in the curriculum than Ryerson's common Christianity. They had not been able to reach an agreement on what that would entail.

The divisions among Protestant denominations were greater in the nineteenth-century than in the twentieth century. Most of the early disputes had evolved around the question of Establishment. Within the denominations, there had been doctrinal tensions. As the century progressed,
there emerged a common social conservatism which reflected class-consciousness, a sense of order, and a concern for moral reform. However, the doctrinal debates of the Reformation had not been resolved. There were those who remained suspicious of both evangelicalism and Romanist superstition. The ethnic basis of theological rivalries had further complicated the matter.

For some time in its early history, Ontario had allowed local determination of religious education in particular school districts. Subject to the wishes of trustees and parents, catechisms and other distinctive religious teachings were allowed. Where there was local religious homogeneity, this was acceptable. When a centrally-controlled common school system was erected under Ryerson in the mid-nineteenth century, it was supposed to be non-sectarian and based upon what Christians held in common. Sectarian teaching was not allowed during regular school hours, even though ministers of the various recognized denominations were permitted to use school facilities for religious instruction at other times. Critics of non-sectarian education felt that the system was godless, on the one hand, or divisive on the other. While the common schools provided an efficient method of educating Ontario's children, they could never satisfy the natural desires of Protestants to have their children instructed in their own particular creed. Nevertheless, there was increased interest in religious education in the schools on the part of the major Protestant Churches in the latter part
of the nineteenth century, although no common program was presented which would satisfy all.

There were significant similarities among Protestants in their use of catechisms and the Bible. The Ten Commandments and the Apostles' Creed were almost always the basic components of catechisms. This suggests that a common program of religious instruction in the schools would have been possible if only the churches could have set aside their historic divisions.
CHAPTER III

THE EMERGENCE OF A PROTESTANT CONSENSUS

1. Introduction

The churches of Upper Canada had desired religious instruction of their own denominational type within the common school system. Denominational education did not emerge, however, with the exception of Roman Catholic separate schools. As Roman Catholic schools increased in number throughout the nineteenth century, the Protestant churches began to demand a Protestant emphasis in the schools greater than the non-sectarian Christianity advocated by Egerton Ryerson. Most Protestants, in spite of doctrinal differences, could agree that the Bible should be more prominent in the schools.

Beginning in the nineteenth century, there were unions of various Protestant bodies which had theological similarities, and cooperation among the churches in social crusades such as temperance. William Westfall\(^1\) has proposed the emergence of a Protestant culture in nineteenth-century Ontario. This culture, which Westfall has termed 'the religion of order' was based upon social views and moral

convictions which Protestants shared. John Webster Grant\(^2\) has noted an era of Protestant cooperation in connection with Canadian Confederation. Clifford\(^3\) has noted the problems of sustaining a Protestant hegemony in a multi-cultural Canada. Building on these insights, the present study explores the positive impact of Protestant alliances and amalgamations from 1875 to 1925 upon the question of religion in the public schools.

All Protestants agreed upon the importance, if not the supremacy, of the Bible in catechesis. They differed in doctrine, polity, and custom based on their interpretation of the Scriptures. However, they supported measures to increase the amount of Bible reading and Bible study in the classroom. The purpose of this chapter is to examine the increasing Protestant agitation for Bible-teaching in the public schools, the extent of cooperation among the churches in pursuing this goal, and the impact of church unions and cooperation among the Protestant churches upon the religious education question in the public schools.

2. The Importance of the Bible

In the nineteenth century, the Bible, for most English-speaking Protestants, was the version of 1611, commonly


called the Authorized Version or the King James Bible. It consisted of the Old and New Testaments but not the Apocrypha. The King James Bible had been immensely popular—even greatly loved—among nineteenth century English-speaking Protestants. It became the final authority in matters of doctrine, polity, and morality. Its importance to Protestantism is hard to overstate.

Most Protestant parents desired that their children receive Biblical instruction not only in church but at school. "A deeply personal knowledge of the Bible" was considered the foundation of learning for those subscribing to Methodist beliefs. Daily Bible reading with discussion of its important message "provided not only the one sure guide for salvation and an understanding of God's demands and expectations, but it also established rules of conduct and ethical behaviour that were essential for spiritual and moral growth". To Presbyterians, as well, it was important that the Bible be used daily in the schools. When, at the first session of the united parliament of Canada in 1841, Governor General Lord Sydenham introduced "a bill to restructure elementary education in Upper and Lower Canada, thirty-nine petitions were received, each asking that the Bible be a prescribed text for any school receiving public money".

---

5Ibid.
7Ibid.
When responding in the Legislative Assembly to these demands and their potential for divisive results, William Morris highlighted the importance of the Bible to the Protestant population:

> If the use by Protestants, of the Holy Scriptures in their Schools is so objectionable to our fellow-subjects of that other faith, the children of both religious persuasions must be educated apart; for Protestants never can yield to that point, and therefore, if it is insisted upon that the Scriptures shall not be a Class-book in Schools, we must part in peace, and conduct the education of our respective Bodies according to our sense of what is right.\(^8\)

The Committee on Union of the United Presbyterian Church and the Presbyterian Church of Canada represented the state of Protestant opinion in 1857, when it stated that "it is highly important that the Bible should be used in the Common Schools of the country, and that the Church should constantly aim at this direction."\(^9\) The Synod of the United Presbyterian Church resolved in 1861 that "the Scriptures of the Old and New Testament should be read daily"\(^10\) in the Common Schools.

Dr. Ryerson regarded the Bible as "a symbol of right and liberty dear to the heart of every Protestant freeman, to every lover of civil and religious liberty—a standard of

---


\(^10\) Minutes of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, June, 1861 (Toronto: W. C. Chewett & Co. 1861), 458. Also cited in Thomas, 59.
truth and the rule of Protestant morals."11 In his Annual Report of 1869, Ryerson highlighted that Bible reading was being conducted in almost seventy percent (70%) of the public schools under his Christian but non-sectarian approach to religion in the schools.12 However, the optional basis of religious instruction under Dr. Ryerson did not satisfy all. The Anglicans pressed for more religious teaching, and Presbyterian church courts urged not only more instruction, but the mandatory use of the Bible as a text in the schools.13 After Ryerson retired as Superintendent of Education in 1876, Protestants sought obligatory use of the Bible in schools. Cooperation within and among the denominations seemed advantageous in the attempt to achieve this goal.

In 1875 the Presbyterian churches had joined together to form The Presbyterian Church in Canada. By 1884, the various Methodist bodies had become The Methodist Church, Canada. Larger churches carried greater weight in influencing political and social issues. The Methodist Church represented 17.6% of the Canadian population by 1891.14

In reaction to the increase in Roman Catholic separate schools, the major Protestant denominations began to press with greater vigor for the mandatory use of the Protestant

---

12Thomas, 68.
13Ibid., 76.
14Ibid., 80 fn.
Bible in the schools. They cooperated where possible in pursuit of that goal.\(^{15}\)

In 1878, the Synod of the Presbytery of Hamilton and London, a Presbyterian body, requested clarification by the Minister of Education, Adam Crooks, of the regulations regarding the use of the Bible in public schools. The Synod asked whether or not the Bible could be used as a textbook in the regular school program without contravening the regulations.\(^{16}\) Crooks replied that such use of the Bible in religious teaching was allowable insofar as parents did not "expressly object". He later wrote a memorandum stressing that Bible teaching was entirely optional, as parents and trustees desired, not mandatory.\(^{17}\)

While Presbyterian and Methodist bodies continued to lobby the government of Ontario for mandatory Bible reading in the schools, not all Protestant groups concurred in this strategy. The Congregationalists were satisfied with the permissive use of the Scriptures at the local level and objected to the enforced use of the Bible as a classbook.\(^{18}\) Their long tradition of separation of church and state could not countenance such a development. The Reverend William Robertson objected to any attempt of the state to legislate matters of religion in the schools: "The authority thus given

\(^{15}\)Ibid.
\(^{16}\)Ibid., 83.
\(^{17}\)Ibid.
\(^{18}\)The Congregational Yearbook, 1882-1885 (Toronto: Congregational Publishing Co., 1882), 198. Also cited in Thomas, 86.
to the state to prescribe in matters of religion is really of a very despotic character".\textsuperscript{19} Robertson was concerned that the state was not qualified to determine a religious education curriculum which might offend religious minorities: "It is impossible, among people holding different religious views, for the State to assume the function of a religious teacher without due discrimination between them".\textsuperscript{20} The imposition of a mandatory system of religious teaching, rather than the permissive but not obligatory regulations then in place, would create religious division and, perhaps, spell "the dissolution of the educational system"\textsuperscript{21} of the province. Robertson claimed that the permissive system of religious education was sufficient as it was\textsuperscript{22} because the regulations of the time protected the "voluntary character of religion."\textsuperscript{23} He believed that a policy proposing mandatory use of the Bible was "a feeble reproduction of the Romish claim"\textsuperscript{24}--a reference to Protestant attempts to institute comprehensive religious education such as was current in Roman Catholic separate schools. Robertson preferred to have Bible instruction left to the home and the church.\textsuperscript{25}

In 1884, appeals from Protestant groups for increased Bible reading in the schools led the Minister of Education, 

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{19}William Robertson, Religion in the School: A Protest (Toronto: Globe Printing and Engraving Co., 1882), 4.
\item \textsuperscript{20}Ibid., 21.
\item \textsuperscript{21}Ibid., 23.
\item \textsuperscript{22}Ibid., 1-2, 20.
\item \textsuperscript{23}Ibid., 2.
\item \textsuperscript{24}Ibid., 10.
\item \textsuperscript{25}Ibid., 18.
\end{itemize}
George Ross, a convinced Protestant layman, to change the regulations. Selections from the Bible and approved prayers were made mandatory for use in public and secondary schools. However, teachers or pupils objecting to these practices could apply for exemption. Clergymen or their deputies could continue to visit schools for the purpose of religious instruction, but outside regular hours. These regulations changed the previous permissive regulations of Dr. Ryerson dramatically. Local parents and trustees could no longer determine the type and content of religious or Bible instruction: these were prescribed by the provincial government. There were protests based on the right to freedom of religion, and heated debate concerning the selection of Bible passages now imposed by the Ministry of Education.26

Although the committee which authorized the 281 Scripture readings for use in the schools had included clergymen from the major Protestant denominations, Education Minister Ross had submitted them to Roman Catholic Archbishop Lynch of Toronto for his comment. As a consequence, the initial favourable reaction to the Scripture selections was blunted by the suspicion by some Protestants that Lynch had dictated changes which minimized Scripture references favourable to Protestant doctrines.27 The 'Ross Bible' controversy had hinged on the substitution of 'who' for

27Thomas, 92.
'which' in the Lord's Prayer. Archbishop Lynch had suggested this alteration and Ross had agreed. In 1887, the 'Ross Bible', although still authorized, could be replaced by the entire text of the King James Bible as a basis for Scripture selections. This was intended to address the concerns of some Protestants about Roman Catholic interference.  

Protestant leaders who favoured the "Ross Bible" defended the Minister's actions. They denied any Roman Catholic influence in their selection. The Reverend William Caven and Dr. E. H. Dewart produced a pamphlet to this effect. Caven noted that the Minister of Education had been supported in his actions by representatives of the Congregational, Methodist, Episcopal [Anglican], and Presbyterian Churches. He maintained that Archbishop Lynch had exercised no influence in the selections of the Scripture and that it was preposterous to claim that the major Protestant Churches would countenance such a development.

Dr. Dewart stated flatly that the "Ross Bible" was not the work of Archbishop Lynch and that the committee which produced it, whose members he named, were representative of the major Protestant Churches. Dr. Dewart defended the nature of the selections themselves: "some portions of the

---

28Stamp, Schools of Ontario, 28-29.
30Ibid., 3.
31Ibid., 3.
32Ibid., 4.
33Ibid., 5-6.
Scripture are better adapted to instruct and edify children and youth than others".34

However, Protestants continued to debate, sometimes fiercely, the issue of the Scripture selections to the extent that Ross was forced to give way. In 1887, the Scripture selections were revised. Local trustees were permitted to decide whether the "Ross Bible" or the Bible as a whole would be the basis for Bible reading.

The "Ross Bible" controversy demonstrated suspicion and fear of Roman Catholic influence on the part of some Protestants and it made clear that Protestant opinion was not unanimous concerning the use of the Bible. The principle of Bible reading in the public schools was established and maintained. However, the rights of local trustees to determine the type and content of religion in the schools were diminished.

3. The Trend Towards Unity

A trend in late nineteenth-century Ontario toward cooperation and union within and among Protestant bodies has been noted above. When the hope for denominational schools became politically impractical, Protestants sought Protestant, as differentiated from Roman Catholic, religious

---

34Ibid., 6.
emphasis in the schools. If the schools were not to be denominational, they must be at least Protestant.

The Bible was a common authority in religious matters among Protestant bodies. However, there were denominational differences in the interpretation of Scripture. These two facts must be held in tension as the history of Protestant cooperation in religious education is examined. Some Protestant bodies had agreed sufficiently in doctrine to unite. Others were to remain independent. Nonetheless, by the twentieth century, the major Protestant bodies spoke with an authoritative voice on the issue of religion in the public schools.

A significant development for the major Protestant denominations in the latter nineteenth century was the establishment of national Canadian Churches. Four Presbyterian groups had united in 1875 to form The Presbyterian Church in Canada. By 1884, six Methodist bodies had combined in the Methodist Church, Canada. The national governing body of the Church of England in Canada, General Synod, was formed in 1893. Although the political union of 1867 was not the only factor in the amalgamations, temporal coincidence may "suggest some connection with Confederation".35

In 1866, a correspondent of Presbyterian had written that "with the coalescing of our divided provinces it is not

---
35 John Webster Grant, "Canadian Confederation and the Protestant Churches", Church History 38, 3 (Sept. 1969), 6.
unnatural to connect the coalescing of our divided churches". In an address to the Evangelical Alliance in 1874, George Munro Grant, a prominent Presbyterian minister, had prophesied a "Church of Canada" consisting of a union of the major Protestant, and possibly Roman Catholic, bodies. However, the reasons for church unions were complex. To most Protestants it seemed clear that these included the need to present a common front toward the expansion of Roman Catholicism and the need for increased efficiency in evangelizing the West. The Reverend A. B. Courtice wrote of the impending Methodist Union of 1884:

The present movement, if not balked, is to be a great and gracious blessing to the North-West portion of this Dominion, now providentially opened up as an inviting mission-field.

The West was seen as a mission field in which the regionally-organized Protestant bodies were ill-equipped to evangelize. Previous missions to the west, directed by such European bodies as the Anglican Church Missionary Society or the Roman Catholic Oblates of Mary Immaculate, had concentrated on the proselytization of native Indians. The Protestant Churches of Central Canada did not begin to send out significant missions to the West until the 1860s. As eastern settlers migrated to the West, the churches became interested in extending their organizations to include the

---

36 *Presbyterian* (October 1866), 311.
37 Grant, "Canadian Confederation", 7-8.
38 Ibid., 8 fn.
new lands. The imperative of coordinating this effort through national Protestant bodies became clear.³⁹

a) The Presbyterian Union

The Presbyterian Churches in Scotland had suffered the 'Great Disruption' of 1843, wherein the evangelical Free Churches separated from the Established Church of Scotland. Thomas Chalmers, the Free Church leader, had withdrawn from the Kirk over the issues of lay patronage and the interference of the British Government in Church affairs.⁴⁰ Although not immediately relevant to the Canadian situation, Free Church principles became popular in Canada West. More important to Canadians than church-state issues in Scotland was the commitment of the Free Church to "a renewed missionary zeal and a powerful evangelical vision".⁴¹ Free Churches in Canada West were vigorous promoters of moral reform, temperance, and Sabbath observance, and found themselves closer to other evangelicals than to other Presbyterians.⁴²

However, the Presbyterians were the first Protestant body to obtain national organic union in 1875. Intimations of this had come in 1861 with the amalgamation of the United Presbyterians and the Free Church Presbyterians to form the

---

³⁹Ibid., 9-10.
⁴⁰Terrence Murphy and Roberto Perin, eds., A Concise History of Christianity in Canada (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1996), 172.
⁴¹Ibid.
⁴²Ibid.
Canada Presbyterian Church. The differences which had divided these groups had originated in the Scottish homeland and no longer seemed unbridgeable. In particular, attitudes toward church-state relations, including the issue of Bible-teaching in the public schools, had been contentious. In the final agreement on union, the wording was broad enough to allow ambiguous interpretation.43

The voluntary system of church membership had prevailed in Ontario. Any opposition to it became meaningless. Because there would be no state Church, the obstacle to Presbyterian union had been removed. Although secondary matters, such as the use of organ music in worship, had occasioned controversy, there was little theological divergence among Presbyterian bodies. During discussions of union, it was agreed that congregations would be allowed their current worship practices. Doctrinal agreement was established within a matter of days at a General Assembly of the Canadian Presbyterian Church, the Canadian Kirk Synod, the Presbyterian Church and the Kirk Synod of the Lower Provinces [the Maritimes] in 1870.44

In 1871, the agreement of the General Assembly of the previous year was sent to the four churches of the proposed Presbyterian union for independent discussion. A period of three years of negotiation and revision culminated in 1875 with a solemn ceremony to form the Presbyterian Church in

43Moir, Enduring Witness, 131.
44Ibid., 139-40.
Canada. Congratulations were received from Methodist and Anglican Churches and the event received favourable reports in the press. The Union of 1875 made the Presbyterian Church in Canada the largest Protestant denomination in the country. It became a powerful voice for Protestantism and a model for unions of other Canadian Christians.

b) The Methodists

Preliminary meetings to discuss Methodist union had been held in the 1850s. By the 1860s, permanent committees on union had been established. Negotiations continued into the 1870s. The Bible Christians, who had splintered from the Wesleyan Methodists, stayed out of these discussions. In 1874, the Wesleyans in Atlantic and central Canada and the Methodist New Connexion Church in Canada joined to create the Methodist Church of Canada. Egerton Ryerson assumed the role of honorary President. This union encouraged the major Methodist groups to seek fuller unity. In addition to the apparent advantages of a truly national church, this new organization could better serve western expansion.

Difficulties to be overcome centred on church government and the role of the laity. The Methodist Episcopal Church was governed by an American-style episcopacy. The Bible Christians and Primitive Methodists were wary of excessive...

45 Ibid., 143.
clericalism. Many Episcopal and Wesleyan Methodists had feared that excessive lay control of a national church would weaken administration and the effective central control needed. Eventually, laymen were accorded equal status to the clergy in all church courts, and authority was vested in a General Superintendency. This arrangement was acceptable to most Methodist Episcopal clergy.

Further issues of polity and administration were resolved rapidly by 1884 when the new Methodist Church, Canada, became a reality. The new Church included the Primitive Methodists, the Methodist Church of Canada, the Methodist Episcopal Church in Canada, and the Bible Christians. A powerful and well-financed body was ready to face the challenges of the growing country and to take a major role in national life.

Methodists equated religious instruction in the public schools with Bible teaching. They adhered to Ryerson's system throughout the nineteenth century.

c) The Anglicans

The connection of the Canadian Anglican Churches with Britain had faded by the 1880s. The Establishment of the Church of England had failed in the Canadian setting. The Clergy Reserves had been secularized. Funds from British missionary societies had become limited and would apparently

47 Semple, 197.
cease. With Confederation, Canadian nationalism appeared. Cross-country communications provided an impetus to a Canadian Anglican union.\(^{48}\) This was first proposed by a resolution of the Diocese of Huron in 1886.\(^{49}\) In the following year, the Association for Canadian Church Union was founded by Charles Jenkins.\(^{50}\) In 1888, the Synod of the Province of Rupert's Land approved the principle of a Canadian Anglican Church and appointed a committee to consult with the Province of Canada, which was already committed to union. A conference to discuss the matter was held in Winnipeg in 1890. A committee of this conference drafted a report which was adopted as a plan for union. The composition, powers, administration, and leadership of the proposed General Synod were agreed. The Provinces were left largely intact and a new Canadian Primate was to be elected by the Metropolitans of the Provinces. The first General Synod met in Toronto in 1893 and adopted its constitution—a "Solemn Declaration" which is a conservative statement that committed the new church to the historic Anglican faith and the Book of Common Prayer. The formation of a national Anglican Church was an administrative, not a theological, accommodation.

\(^{48}\) By the terms of the Colonial Clergy Act of 1874, the Church in Canada had become voluntary and autonomous, but not yet united. See H. R. S. Ryan, "The General Synod of the Anglican Church of Canada: Aspects of Constitutional History", Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society 34, no. 1 (April 1992), 30.
\(^{49}\) Ibid., 52.
\(^{50}\) Philip Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada: A History (Toronto: Collins, 1963), 183.
Anglicans were often at the forefront of attempts to introduce Bible teaching into the schools. In 1897, a group of Anglican clergy made such an attempt in Toronto, only to meet resistance from the Jewish community to the extent that the effort resulted in failure.

d) The Baptists

Unions of Baptist churches in the early days of Ontario were associative but not organic. In Baptist tradition, individual congregations remained independent. With Confederation, compelling reasons for closer ties between like-minded Baptists transcended congregational interests. In 1867, the Baptist Missionary Convention of Ontario had investigated the possibility of "a closer cooperation in regard to matters of general denominational interest and importance"\(^{51}\) with the Baptists of the Maritimes. Further action was delayed for years. Provincial conventions of Baptists in Ontario and Quebec began to discuss union in 1882. The Canadian Baptist Union, an Ontario association, proposed a federative union of Baptists, which was realized as the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec in 1888. By 1890, this convention represented a church membership of approximately 33,000 in a total of 388 churches.\(^{52}\)

---

\(^{51}\)Minutes of the Baptist Missionary Convention of Ontario, 1867, Canadian Baptist Register (1868), 17.

\(^{52}\)Harry Renfree, "Baptist Unity", in Priestly, 143.
Similar unifying movements took place in the Maritimes in 1879, in Manitoba and the North-West in 1884, and in Western Canada in 1909. The modernist-fundamentalist divisions of the early twentieth century were to fracture these federations.

On the question of religion in the schools, in the nineteenth century, the Baptists had no common voice. In the twentieth century, those who remained in the Baptist Convention tended to favour religious education in the public schools. However, those fundamentalists who defected in 1925 and thereafter desired independent Baptist schools where possible, or a share of public funding for the education of their children.

e) The United Church of Canada

The first concrete move toward church union came from the Anglicans. In 1881, when addressing a gathering of the Synod of the Diocese of Toronto, Canon James Carmichael suggested a conference on Christian unity. The Synod appointed a committee in 1886 to explore interest in Canadian church union. At the same time, the Presbyterian, Methodist, and Congregationalist Churches established similar committees. In a spirit of ecumenism, the Bishops of the world-wide Anglican Communion adopted a basis for church union at the Lambeth Conference of 1888. The four points of this basis, which became known as the Lambeth Quadrilateral were the Holy Scriptures, the Nicene Creed, the sacraments of
Baptism and Holy Communion, and the historic episcopate. The Anglicans, for whom disunity had always been regrettable, urged other churches to accept their plan for unity. However, the Methodist, Presbyterian, and Congregationalist Churches, while accepting the first three points of the Anglican plan, responded negatively to the fourth, the historic episcopate, and while continuing to discuss the matter with Anglicans, began to concentrate on union of non-episcopal bodies. The Methodists began to suspect that the Anglicans intended to reunite what they considered to be splinter groups into the Anglican church rather than to look toward the creation of a new inclusive body.

Discussions on the possibilities of union continued into the 1890s. At the Methodist General Conference of 1890, proposals were made for continuing informal discussions on church union with Presbyterians and Congregationalists and, where possible, with the Anglicans and the Baptists. As a basis for union, the Methodists proposed that all denominations concerned should recognize the validity of each other's ordinations and forms of ministry, that pulpit exchanges should be encouraged, that members of the cooperating churches should be welcome to the Lord's Supper in the other churches, and that congregations should cooperate in community-wide evangelistic crusades. They added that, should organic union be impractical, at the least

---

Protestant mission work should be coordinated by a joint body. These measures helped to encourage harmonious relations among the churches and to further the acceptance of the concept of a Protestant church union.55

Outreach to the Baptists faced certain dilemmas. There was no body which could speak for them nationally on theological and church government matters. In 1888, the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec had united the previously incorporated Baptist associations within these two provinces, but local congregations retained considerable authority. Also, Baptist insistence on adult "believers baptism" presented a stumbling block to those churches which baptized infants and children.56

The Presbyterians at their General Assembly of 1890 continued to pursue church union. Like the Methodists, they expressed serious reservations about the Anglican proposal of the historic episcopate as a basis for union. They doubted that the Nicene Creed by itself was a sufficient statement of doctrine. Thus, they turned toward the non-episcopal churches in future plans for union.

In 1893, committees of the Presbyterian and Congregationalist churches met to discuss union, and the Methodists formally proposed federal union with these two bodies in the following year. In 1899, the three denominations agreed not to build churches within six miles

---

55Ibid.
56Ibid.
of each other in the rapidly-expanding mission-fields of Western Canada.57

While the desired union of all Protestant denominations seemed to be reaching a stalemate at the turn of the century, continued cooperative discussions among Methodists, Presbyterians, and Congregationalists began to bear fruit. Cooperative ventures in youth programs, Bible classes, and other Christian education became popular and on-going.58 Negotiations had been so productive that by 1904 a basis for union was sought. Committees of the three churches met together and agreed that union was practicable. Subcommittees were established to seek agreement on doctrine, ministry, polity, administration, and church law. Progress, however, would be governed by the approval of details by the memberships of the individual churches. By 1906, the Baptists had concluded that they should not enter the proposed union.59 The Anglican General Synod had declared that any discussion of church union must presuppose acceptance of the principle of the historic episcopate, to which the joint committee of the churches could not agree.

A draft Basis of Union was submitted to the presbyteries and conferences of the churches in 1907, and by the following year a Basis of Union was published. The doctrinal statement was based on a creed prepared by the Presbyterian Church in

---

57 Grant, *The Church in the Canadian Era*, 107.
58 Ibid., 59.
the United States of America and was an expression of central beliefs held by Protestants and reflected a balance of "mild Calvinism with a mild Arminianism". Because Presbyterian theology was still officially predestinarian, and because Wesley had admitted the possibility of universal salvation, the twenty articles of belief were written in language that was elastic enough to satisfy the three churches. The Basis of Union, prepared by the joint committee, stressed the Old and New Testaments as the primary source and ultimate standard of Christian faith and life, and accepted the creeds of the ancient church and the "evangelical doctrines of the Reformation as set forth in common in the doctrinal standards" of the negotiating Churches. In effect, these were the Westminster Confession of the Presbyterians and the Articles of Religion of the Methodist Church, Canada. The twenty articles of belief which formed the Basis of Union for the new church were brief and general, avowing the power of God to order all events and the freedom of human individuals. The doctrines of original sin and the natural sinfulness of human beings were counterbalanced by a stress on God's offer of "all sufficient salvation to all men [sic]". Liberal Protestant clergy felt at liberty to

---

60 Grant, The Church in the Canadian Era, 108.
62 Ibid.
63 Ibid., 84.
64 Ibid., 85.
interpret the twenty articles in the light of modern biblical and theological scholarship, and few serious objections were raised. The objectors to union, of whom most were Presbyterian, were concerned about preserving their denomination. William MacLaren, the conservative principal of Knox College, declared the doctrinal agreement to be "on the whole pretty good", yet he withdrew his support for church union for other reasons, chiefly because he wanted the tone of the historic Presbyterian Church to continue.65

Practical popular support for the idea of union developed once the Basis of Union had been drafted. Members of local churches began to arrange amalgamations without waiting for an official act of union. In the West there was a widespread desire for union. This spontaneous movement organized itself into the General Council of Local Union Churches which ultimately became one of the constituents of the United Church.66

Approval for union came fairly easily on the part of the Congregationalists and Methodists. By 1910, an overwhelming majority of the independently governed Congregationalist Churches had voted in favour of union and the Methodist General Conference had approved the Basis of Union. By 1912, Methodist bodies had voted almost unanimously in favour of

---

66Grant, The Church in the Canadian Era, 110.
union. The Baptists and the Anglicans continued to stand aloof\(^67\) for reasons stated previously.

The problem concerning form of ministry for the new church was solved by combining the mobility of the Methodist itinerant system with the practice of allowing congregations a dominant role in the choice of ministers. The validity of the orders of the three churches was accepted without question. However, the Presbyterian principle of a high standard of education for ordinands was accepted for the new church.

In establishing the structure of the united church, the three churches agreed that the functions of their church officers were similar even if their current titles differed.\(^68\) The basic unit of the new church was established as the pastoral charge consisting of one or more congregations. The pastoral charges were organized into presbyteries, annual conferences, and a General Conference.

The Presbyterians were seriously divided. Principal MacLaren and Ephraim Scott, editor of the Presbyterian Record, led the anti-union forces. They supported inter-church cooperation, but stopped short of organic union. In a statement to the Methodists in October 1914, Scott declared that "our two churches will do more by working in harmony and cooperation; adjusting our fields where this can be done,

\(^{67}\)Ibid., 108-9.
\(^{68}\)Moir, Enduring Witness, 202.
than by attempting organic union".69 MacLaren had opposed union at the 1889 Conference on Unity sponsored by the Anglicans. He believed that doctrinal and administrative differences with the Methodists and lack of consensus among Presbyterians made organic union unwise.70

The Senior Clerk of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church, Robert Campbell, also objected to union. He believed that there could not be "a coalescence between types so different as the Methodists and Presbyterians",71 and insisted that federation or cooperation were more appropriate.72 When Campbell became Moderator of the Presbyterian Church in 1907, he continued to resist absorption into the United Church.

Although the General Assembly, the presbyteries, and the congregations of the Presbyterian Church had approved the Basis of Union by 1912, and a vote for union was supported by 50 out of 70 presbyteries and 70% of the membership73, the Assembly decided to delay the final vote. Further discussion might lead to even fuller agreement. The opposite result materialized by 1916. Even though the Assembly of that year supported union by a vote of 406 to 90, the war situation led

70 Moir, Enduring Witness, 199.
71 Presbyterian (18 June 1904), 790. Cited in Clifford, Resistance to Church Union, 27.
72 Ibid., 26.
it to postpone indefinitely implementation. During this time, opponents of the union organized the Presbyterian Church Association. Its aim was to perpetuate the Presbyterian Church in Canada.

Local churches, especially in the West, had proceeded to amalgamate during the wartime moratorium on implementation of organic union. By 1921, almost a thousand pastoral charges had established a united church form. However, anti-union feeling had increased in some areas during this delay, so that congregations became divided on the issue. Opponents mounted challenges in the courts and a public campaign against union. When the votes to implement union were finally taken in 1925, about one-third of the members of the Presbyterian Church remained out of the union, whether or not their congregations had voted affirmatively. The opponents of the union had no rallying theological issue. They opposed union primarily because they objected to the extinction of the Presbyterian Church.74

It is possible that the fifteen-year delay between the approval of the Basis of Union and the actual formation of the United Church allowed opposition to organize and coalesce in a manner that would not have been possible had decisive action been taken. However, the decline of popular support during this period is more puzzling. Grant75 has postulated that the period of consensus had begun to wane at a time of

---

74Grant, Canadian Experience, 51.
75Ibid., 56.
Protestant Consensus...

ethnic, party, and regional conflict in the country as a whole. Within this climate, he believed it possible that some Presbyterians may have been uncomfortable with the radical activities of some of the social gospelers, who were predominantly Methodist.

The impetus toward union had been to enlarge Protestant influence throughout the country, especially in the expanding Western Provinces. As a result of the union of Methodist, Congregationalist, and some Presbyterian Churches, the United Church of Canada became the largest Protestant denomination, with potentially great impact on the spiritual, moral, and even political life of the country. However, this union had not brought together all the Protestant churches. Even so, Protestants were able to combine forces in social action due to shared theological and moral convictions.

4. Cooperation Among the Churches

During the late nineteenth century, coalitions of Protestants had been formed in response to perceived social problems. Public morality was a common concern. Temperance and other social issues became a common cause for cooperation. John Webster Grant has characterized this cooperation as follows:

In the late years of the nineteenth century there was building up of an informal sort of coalition of central Protestants. There was nothing like a conscious alliance, but leaders of the three churches [Methodist, Presbyterian, and Congregationalist] began to be aware
of a certain affinity. They met on the platforms of temperance rallies, at meetings of the Evangelical Alliance, at Sunday School conventions, in campaigns for supporting the evangelization of French-Canadians. Their chief badges of mutual recognition were receptiveness to new forms of Church life, old-fashioned evangelical zeal, and a moral earnestness closely akin to the English non-conformist conscience. They were all beginning to think of themselves as churchmen rather than sectarians.76

The concept of Protestant Church union was a response to these concerns, but even when a unified Protestant Church was not achieved, Protestant cooperation was common. Protestants saw the cause of late Victorian problems such as drunkenness, gambling, poverty, prostitution, and crime as moral failure which could be alleviated by education in Bible truths. However, due to immigration, industrialization, and urbanization, there were many who were untouched by the churches' moral and theological teachings. Teaching religion in the public schools was proposed as an antidote to the social problems which were presumed to afflict the unchurched. The schools were seen as potential agents of moral and social reform and as forces for integrating immigrants into Canadian society: "The teaching of religion in the schools . . . was now proposed as one of the means the State should use in its training for citizenship".77 Although they had been divided in the nineteenth century over the issue of Bible instruction in the schools, the major Protestant Churches began to warm to the perceived social benefits of moral instruction beyond the mere reading of

76Grant, Canadian Experience, 25-26.
77Thomas, 108.
scripture passages. However, concerted effort to realize this idea was desultory until World War I.

The major Protestant Churches had urged the government to extend Bible reading in the schools during the late nineteenth century, but little change had resulted since the scripture reading regulations of 1884. By 1914, most schools were involved in the reading of scripture passages, without elaboration, and some clergy used the schools for the purpose of religious instruction as permitted by trustees. The results of these measures seemed inadequate. However, it had become obvious that Protestant cooperation in moral and social crusades could bring success. The temperance crusade had helped to bring about prohibition and concerted efforts to obtain legal observance of the Sabbath had resulted in the Lord's Day Act. Religious education in the public schools was adopted as another common cause.

In 1913, the Synod of the Anglican Province of Ontario appointed a committee to lobby the provincial government for increased religious education in the schools. Representation was made to other denominations. This resulted in a meeting of an interfaith delegation of Presbyterians, Anglicans, Methodists, Congregationalists, Roman Catholics and Jews with Education Department officials.

---

78 Thomas, 103.
in 1914. The result of this ecumenical event was the introduction in 1915 of a new series of graded readers with purported moral content. The renewed call of the Provincial Synod in 1916 for more religious content in the curriculum produced little effect. By 1919, the Committee on Religious Education in the Schools reported to Synod that, under the current regulations, religious influence in the schools seemed minimal:

There has been little or no progress in Biblical instruction in our schools for the last twenty years. In so far as Biblical or Religious Instruction is concerned, there is none given or permitted as such. A Biblical passage may be read at the opening, but not taught. A Biblical passage may form a lesson in the Reader, but it is taught as ethics or literature, not as religion.

As a consequence, the Synod was asked to cooperate with other denominations to press the issue with the government. A united effort might secure a wider hearing. A formal invitation to other denominations to work together to prepare a syllabus for religious teaching in the schools. The Presbyterians, Methodists, and Congregationalists accepted, but the Baptists cited separation of church and state, their traditional stance, as reason for their refusal.

---


81 Journal of the Fourth Session of the Provincial Synod of Ontario, The Church of England (Toronto: Parker Bros. Ltd., 1919), 86. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].

82 Ibid., 87.
The Archbishop was buoyed by the possibility of inter-Church joint action:

It is surely significant that three of the largest non-Romanist Communions in this Province, making with ourselves some 83.4 percent of the non-Romanist population, have agreed to join us in shaping a syllabus of religious instruction to be used in our Public Schools, in school hours, as a part of the recognized school curriculum, and have consented to join us in an appeal to the Department of Education for its adoption.83

A joint committee of Anglicans, Presbyterians, Methodists, and Congregationalists met with the Minister of Education in 1923 to present the following resolution:

(1) "That some additional provision should be made in the Public School Curriculum of the Province for such systematic reading of the Bible as will present a comprehensive view of its contents to the Public School pupils of the Province; for the memorization of the great library masterpieces of the Bible; and for instruction in morals and good citizenship drawn from carefully selected Scripture passages."

(2) "That to this end, a Scheme of Scripture passages suited to each grade in the Schools should be prepared."84

A change of government curtailed further action. However, the following year, the Joint Committee met with the new Premier and Minister of Education, the Honourable George Ferguson, with similar proposals. The Committee received a sympathetic hearing.85 Regulation 13 was amended in 1924. The selections of Scriptures were extended to include any

83Journal of the Proceedings of the Fifth Session of the Provincial Synod of Ontario (Toronto: Parker Bros. Ltd., 1922), 59. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
84Journal of the Proceedings of the Sixth Session of the Provincial Synod of Ontario (Toronto: Parker Bros. Ltd., 1925), 57-58. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
85Ibid., 58.
list approved by the Minister as well as previously approved sources. This change motivated the Joint Committee to begin preparing a new Syllabus of Readings for submission to the Minister for approval. This work was interrupted in 1924 while difficulties concerning the formation of the United Church were resolved, and resumed in 1926, when subcommittees were established to continue formulating lists of Bible readings appropriate for the public school curricula. By 1930, a comprehensive selection of Bible Readings for Schools for use by elementary pupils had appeared. These readers, in three volumes, were published by the Macmillan Company and "Issued for the approval of School Boards by consent of the Department of Education for Ontario". This careful wording indicated that the decision to actually use these books rested with local authorities. The "Macmillan Readers" were sold at a cost of seventy-five cents each, an expense which discouraged some schools from purchasing them when the Department of Education still provided a list of approved readings free of charge. Not until 1949 was a cheaper version of the Readers offered, as well as a free pamphlet containing a list of the Bible passages, with the aim of enlarging their use in the classroom.

---

86 McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 7.
87 Ibid., 7-8.
88 Ibid., 8.
During the course of developing the list of Scripture passages, the Committee had expanded to include representatives from the Anglican, United Church, Disciples of Christ, Evangelical, Evangelical Lutheran, and Presbyterian denominations. The Congregationalists and the Methodists, with the majority of Presbyterians, had formed the United Church in 1925. The cooperative momentum was to issue in further ecumenical work towards a religious program in the schools.

The work of the Joint Committee had produced tangible effects. Departmental regulations were changed to allow religious instruction by clergy at the beginning of the school day rather than after regular school hours. An agreed-upon syllabus of Bible readings had been produced for the public elementary schools and the memberships of the cooperating Churches had been encouraged by their governing bodies to press, both locally and provincially, for increased religious instruction in the schools.

Throughout the 1930s, the churches had noted the rise of Fascism and Communism with dismay. They saw totalitarianism as a threat to democracy and morality. They viewed democracy as indistinguishable from Christianity and Fascism and Communism as neo-pagan and atheistic ideologies contrary to Christian teaching. When it was reported in 1935 that a Communist youth club had been established in a school, Anglicans, once again, sounded the alarm. At the Provincial
Synod of Ontario of 1935, Judge G. W. Morley presented the following motion:

Whereas it appears from the report of the Rev. Dr. Hiltz recently presented to the Executive Council of the General Synod that Communism and Atheism are being taught in one or more Public Schools in a certain district in Ontario;

Therefore be it resolved that enquiry be made as to whether any action has been taken by the said Council with reference to the same.

Be it further resolved that if the result of such an inquiry is that no action has been taken, that his Grace the Archbishop of Ontario, communicate a strong letter of protest to the Honourable Minister of Education for this Province, requesting (after the necessary particulars have been obtained) that an investigation be made with a view to eliminating the teaching of such doctrine.  

The Synod was warned further of the danger of Communism in a motion by Canon Warner and Dr. Bedford-Jones which read in part:

Resolved, That this Synod of the Ecclesiastical Province of Ontario recognizes in the propagation of the tenets of communism and the attempts to teach along the lines of atheism, the evidence of the unrest in the minds of many people . . .

The remedy for such unrest was "personal witness to what Christ has done for us through his Church" as "the means of answering the needs of spiritually hungry people and put to silence the ignorance of foolish men."  

In response to the threat of atheistic Communism in the schools, representatives of the Baptist, Anglican, Disciples

---

90 Ibid., 26.
91 Ibid.
of Christ, Evangelical, Presbyterian, Lutheran (Missouri Synod and Ontario Synod), and United Church denominations met in 1936 to reform the Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in Schools. The aim of the Committee was to establish "a greater measure of instruction in religious knowledge in our public schools", to be achieved by the preparation of a syllabus for clergy and teachers based on the previously approved Bible Readings for Schools. For the first time, an inter-denominational group had ventured into the area of religious instruction, rather than Scripture readings, in the schools. The threat of anti-Christian philosophies had triggered this change, for the churches believed that Christian teaching in the schools was the necessary antidote. The Synod of the Diocese of Huron passed a resolution in 1937, which was moved by Judge G. W. Morley and seconded by Canon Warner:

Whereas the menace of Communism was brought to the attention of Provincial Synod at its last session in September, 1935, and

Whereas it was thought advisable that the best method of attacking Communism was by the persistent teaching of the Christian religion, and

Whereas Communism has since made great strides due to opportunists who have taken advantage of the depression.

Now, therefore be it Resolved that all Dioceses of the Church of England in Ontario and other communions unite in recommending that the provisions of Public Schools Act [sic] be taken full advantage of by all local municipalities, and Boards of Education with a view of requesting local ministers of the gospel in each

92 Thomas, 134-135.
93 McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 13.
religious denomination to give religious instruction for a certain period each week to children of their particular religious body.

Be it further resolved that the Clergy and Laity of this Diocese sponsor this suggestion by taking the necessary action in the local municipality in which they reside. Be it further resolved that the Legislature of this Province be requested to pass enabling legislation permitting religious teaching in the High Schools and Universities.

Be it further resolved that a copy of this resolution be forwarded to the Secretary of each Diocese of the Church of England in Canada, and the General Synod with a request that action be taken along similar lines.94

The tone of the motion by Judge Morley, who was an aggressive promoter of public school religious education, was presumptuous. The Boards of Education were presumed to be welcoming. The members of all of the churches were to take action on this issue and religious education was to be extended to the high schools and universities. The other denominations were expected to join this Anglican crusade.

In reality, the threat of Communism was insignificant. The basis for this brand of paranoia was the political xenophobia of extreme conservatives such as Judge Morley.

In reference to the threat of Nazi totalitarianism, the Bishop of the Anglican Diocese of Huron summarized his assessment of the situation: "In short it is Christianity itself which is threatened".95 He further warned Synod:

... that the concept of the totalitarian state in any form is the absolute antithesis of our philosophy of Divine truth, that it is a deadly negation of that

---

95 Ibid., 54
The glorious ideal of a catholic humanity gathered up in the universal love of the Eternal Father through the redemption that is in His Son in which neither time, space, race, or any such thing has any relevance whatever, but in which all men, through the redemption, are called children of the universal Father. It is antichrist. ... Dictatorship in any form cannot coexist with religious liberty, nor with any other form of liberty, and the liberty of the children of God is part of the heart's core of Christianity, and one of its great central contributions to the welfare of human kind. 96

The love of God, according to the Anglican Bishop, knew no divisions of race, time, geography, or any such thing. The doctrines of Nazism were antithetical to Christianity, which had been the champion of liberty and the unity of humankind. These high-flown sentiments masked the real concern—that the hearts and minds of school children might be swayed by atheism.

The assumption of the Anglicans, and of their Protestant colleagues, was that Communism and Fascism were godless philosophies which undermined the Canadian way of life. The freedom of religion which Canadians enjoyed was "one of the foundation stones of democracy". 97 Anti-Christian movements threatened not only the churches, but the freedom of the people everywhere. Religious liberty had been curtailed severely in Communist Russia and Nazi Germany. Totalitarianism was a threat to both the political and religious order of the Western democracies.

As the threat of war increased after 1936, the Churches and the state found a common interest in the promotion of

---

96 Ibid., 54-55.
97 Ibid.
religious instruction in the schools as a bulwark against foreign ideologies. Prompted by the resolution by Judge G. W. Morley and Canon Warner of the Huron Diocese, action was taken by the Protestant churches to coordinate and accelerate religious teaching in the public schools in order to counteract perceived threats of Communism, Fascism, and atheism.  

The threat of atheistic ideologies was not the sole reason for increased attention to religion in the schools on the part of the Protestant Churches. There were internal difficulties as well. During the 1930s, Sunday School attendance had declined steadily to an alarming level. In 1938, the Diocesan Board of Religious Education (D.B.R.E.) of the Anglican Diocese of Huron reported: "In common with Sunday Schools throughout the Anglo-Saxon world those of our Diocese have suffered during recent years". The D.B.R.E. believed that the remedy for this situation, too, was increased religious instruction in the schools, with Protestant clergy actively involved in classroom instruction.

In the City of Brantford, the Ministerial Association had worked cooperatively and successfully within the classrooms of local schools to ensure that all children in the public schools had opportunity to benefit from Bible teaching. The D.B.R.E. reported that the Department of

---

98 McLean, Religion in the Schools.
Education was "distinctly favourable to the introduction of Bible Teaching in the Public School" and that the Brantford experiment had been "so successful that no complaint has been received, nor child absent through religious bias."\(^{100}\) It offered the Brantford procedure as a model for adoption by clergy:

Suggested procedure:
1. Agreement among the local ministers, upon whom the work will fall; (a) To undertake the work; (b) As to a course or courses of teaching.

2. Obtain the consent of the School Board and have them pass a resolution directing that upon a certain day of each week, the regular school instruction in the given class, begin at 9:30 a.m. instead of nine and that the period from 9 - 9:30 a.m. be devoted to Bible Teaching.

The Act permitting this may be quoted to reluctant boards.

3. The names of the ministers undertaking the work are to be forwarded to the Department of Education and permits to teach will be issued. They thus become recognized teachers on the staff, and failure to appear at class will be reported to to the Department and reasons asked.

4. The recommended course is 30 lessons, commencing in Oct., one lesson per week. Schedule of lessons should be prepared that a substitute teacher may know the lesson to teach. The course used: The Gospel of St. Mark. Tuesday has been found better than a later day.

5. The term "Bible Teaching" is preferable to "Religious Instruction", as it has aroused no prejudice. Bible Training strictly as apart from doctrine is the key to agreement and success.\(^{101}\)

\(^{100}\)Ibid., 54.

Clergy were to be accorded status as professional teachers, but with no preparation except their theological training. The schools were presumed to be welcoming of initiatives by the churches. Significantly, the churches would assume control over who would teach and what would be taught. The Brantford experiment did provide a model which was taken up elsewhere. These 'Suggestions' by the D.B.R.E. were followed more vigourously by Anglican clergy, and were better received by Boards of Education than they had been heretofore. Local clergy who had neglected such opportunities found them harder to evade. The Brantford experiment became an example to ministers of all denominations.

The Presbyterian Church, the United Church, and the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec favoured the efforts to integrate teaching of religion into the regular curriculum to the extent allowable by law. Clergy were encouraged to take full advantage of the existing regulations. They exhorted their members to lobby for public school religious education at the local and provincial level and to actively support the Inter-Church Committee.

In 1936, the Presbyterian Synod of Hamilton and London presented a motion to the General Assembly that its Board of Sabbath Schools and Young People's Societies "approach the appropriate bodies in other denominations in order to draw up a course of study in religious education for the Province of
Ontario, for recommendation to the Minister of Education". This motion was intended to further Protestant influence in the schools. However, it incited fears that Roman Catholics, whose children attended public schools in substantial numbers, would demand an extension of their separate school system in response. Presbyterians debated the issue until the crisis of the Second World War prompted them to take more resolute action.

The United Church Conferences in Ontario encouraged their ministers to capitalize on opportunities to give religious instruction in the public schools in their communities. In 1936, The Hamilton Conference appointed a "sub-committee on mid-week religious education to promote religious and biblical instruction in the primary and secondary schools within the bounds of our Conference". Cooperation with other Protestant clergy in this venture was encouraged. The following year, the Bay of Quinte Conference noted the provisions of the Public Schools Act allowing clergy to teach religion for one-half hour before or after regular classes and urged clergy to cooperate with ministers of other denominations in order to give such

102Minutes of the Sixty-Second Synod of Hamilton and London of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1936 (Toronto, 1936), 22. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada]
103Thomas, 141-2.
104Record of Proceedings of the Twelfth Meeting of the Hamilton Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1936 (Hamilton, 1936), 31. [Archives of the United Church of Canada].
105Ibid., 32.
Similarly, the London Conference encouraged clergy to take advantage of all opportunities to teach religion in the schools.\textsuperscript{107}

The Baptist Convention noted with approval "the cooperative foundation which has been laid for the development of religious teaching in our Public Schools".\textsuperscript{108} The Baptist Board of Christian Education urged its membership to work with other Protestants for religious instruction in both elementary and secondary schools in 1940.\textsuperscript{109}

In the years leading up to the war, United Church Conferences, Anglican Synods, and some Presbyterian Synods favoured increased religious education in the schools. Protestant clergy began to take seriously the task of providing such instruction. However, these efforts were merely a more systematic pursuit of opportunities allowed under existing regulations. A full-scale program of religious instruction in the schools became possible politically only during wartime conditions.

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{106}The Minutes of the Bay of Quinte Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1937 (Toronto, 1937), 52. [Archives of the United Church of Canada].
\textsuperscript{107}Minutes of the London Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1937 (London, 1937), 49. [Archives of the United Church of Canada].
\textsuperscript{108}Yearbook, Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec, 1939 (Toronto, 1939), 83. [Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec].
\textsuperscript{109}Baptist Yearbook for Ontario and Quebec and Western Canada, 1940 (Toronto, 1940), 152. [Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec].
\end{flushright}
All Protestants agreed that the Bible should be taught in the public schools. However, during most of the nineteenth century, they could not agree upon a method of accomplishing this goal. Due to greater harmony within and among Protestant groups, which was an outcome of church unions and cooperation in moral crusades, such as temperance and Sabbath observance, the religious education of public school children had become a cooperative effort by the 1930s. Common concerns over the expansion of the Roman Catholic school system, the lack of moral training of youth, decreases in Sunday School attendance, and fears of foreign ideologies led Anglicans and Protestants to press for a greater emphasis on religion in the public schools of Ontario. Their efforts were aided by more tolerant attitudes toward doctrinal differences as exemplified in the formation of the United Church. What had begun as a campaign to secure Scripture readings in the schools in the nineteenth century had expanded in the years prior to the Second World War to a joint effort of the churches for compulsory religious education within the regular curriculum of Ontario public schools.

As early as 1919, the Anglican Archbishop of Ontario, in his Charge to Provincial Synod, had noted that "one result of the rising tide of public opinion in favour of Church Union might well be a greater readiness to agree on a syllabus of
religious instruction as part of our school curriculum . . . for I am persuaded that no scheme can be satisfactory that fails to make religion a part of the recognized course of study".110 By 1939, the administrative apparatus and a convergence of Protestant opinion favoured the Archbishop's hopes.

COOPERATION WITH THE STATE: PROTESTANTISM IN THE CURRICULUM

1. Introduction

While Protestant bodies continued to pass resolutions urging religious instruction in the schools, their clergy began to take advantage of the opportunities allowed under existing regulations. The Christian Education Committee of the Ottawa Presbytery of the United Church reported that while in 1931 only about 3% of pupils received religious instruction in public schools of Ontario, by 1943 the figure had risen to 20% or 75,000 pupils.\(^1\) Church officials found Boards of Education receptive to their approaches\(^2\) and willing to adjust the school hours to allow a half-hour of instruction for one day a week for each class.\(^3\) Some clergy prepared their own materials while many used the Syllabus which had been prepared by the Inter-Church Committee and was recommended by most of the Churches to their clergy as a course of study. When the Second World War broke out, concern that the majority of students were receiving no

---

\(^1\)Minutes of the Presbytery of Ottawa of the United Church of Canada (December 15, 1943), 1699. [City of Ottawa Archives].

\(^2\)Acts and Proceedings of the Sixty-Fifth General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1939 (Toronto, 1939), 127. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada].

\(^3\)Accounts and Reports of the Incorporated Synod of the Diocese of Huron [Church of England in Canada], 1938 (London: Haydon Printing, 1939), 33. [Anglican Church of Canada Archives].
concern that the majority of students were receiving no systematic religious or moral training made previous efforts seem inadequate.

While the Churches were not unaware of difficulties in entering the public arena, they were convinced of the necessity for action. In 1937, the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of the General Synod of the Anglican Church stressed the moral imperative for a religious education program:

While the question of the relation of Church and State in the field of Religious Education raises many problems, it is essential that something be done, and not merely to combat the growing spirit of secularism in its various forms, but to build up the citizenship of this country on a sound Christian basis. There is no province in this land which does not declare, in its regulations governing the education of boys and girls, that sound moral principles are to be inculcated. But it cannot be expected that sound moral character can be built up if it does not rest upon solid religious convictions. Morals, apart from religious sanctions, are bound to suffer shipwreck, sooner or later.¹

The assumption that religious instruction was training for democratic citizenship might have caused unease in some quarters, but the equation of Christianity with Canadianism was to provoke objection. Yet the essence of democracy is not Christianity but rather liberty, and not inculcation in a creed but free choice. This difficulty, pushed aside by the clamor of the Protestant Churches for religion in the schools, was to be revisited. In wartime, the need to

morally indoctrinate the young seemed to excuse the broad-brush approach advocated by the major churches.

Reports of Christian Education Committees at all levels of organized church bodies noted the opportunities for clergy to instruct in the schools and recommended such action in cooperation with other denominations. A typical example is taken from the Report of the Christian Education Committee of the Toronto Conference of the United Church for 1939:

We call the attention of ministers to the clauses in the regulations of the Department of Education which make it possible, with the consent of the local Board of Education, for clergymen to give religious instruction in the schools at least once a week. We note an increase in the number of ministers who are taking advantage of this opportunity and we urge that so far as possible all should do so.

When Boards of Education, with the consent of the Minister, began to arrange for school classes to begin at 9:30 a.m. instead of 9:00 a.m. on any particular day, so that that half-hour interval might be devoted to religious instruction, more schools made such provision. This, along with the increased interest in religious and moral training in general, provided new opportunities for the churches.

---

5Record of Proceedings of the Montreal and Ottawa Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1937 (Montreal, 1937), 1251. [National Archives of Quebec at Montreal]; Minutes of the Bay of Quinte Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1938 (Toronto, 1938), 59. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
6Minutes of the Toronto Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1939 (Toronto, 1939), 21. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
7Ibid.
8R. R. McLean, "A Brief Synopsis for the Benefit of the Members of the [Inter-Church] Committee", 1956, 2. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
2. The Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education and Denominational Initiatives

By 1936 the major Protestant denominations of Ontario were in agreement that religious instruction in the schools was desirable and that interdenominational cooperation was important in devising a course of study. The Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education was reactivated and immediately began to plan a syllabus. On September 10, 1936, a sub-committee for this purpose, composed of two representatives from each participating communion, was struck.\(^9\) The sub-committee recommended that a syllabus be based on the existing *Graded Bible Readings for Schools*, which had been approved for some time.\(^10\) The Syllabus Committee which ensued consisted of representatives from the Anglican, Baptist, United, Evangelical, and Presbyterian Churches, the Church of Christ and the Missouri and Ontario Synods of the Lutheran Church.\(^11\) The Committee studied the Ontario School Readers in order to determine the number of scripture citations already present in approved materials, and presented a summary of their findings in January 1938.

During this time, the full Inter-Church Committee met seven times up to January 1941, with the following results. Normal Schools were encouraged to inform their students of

---

\(^10\) Ibid., 14.
\(^11\) Ibid.
their opportunities to teach religious education when they became teachers. Five thousand three hundred copies of the pamphlet "Religious Education in Public Schools" \(^{12}\) were circulated, but the demand required a reprint of two thousand and fifty copies, and even a second edition of three thousand four hundred copies. This suggested the increasing popularity of religious instruction. The Anglican Provincial Board of Religious Education and the United Church Board of Christian Education were asked to prepare a list of helps for clergy in teaching courses from Grade Four to Grade Eight. The approved Scripture lessons, which had been printed as *Bible Readings for Schools* by the MacMillan Company in 1930, were printed in list form at no cost to the schools, so that where the texts had not been purchased the syllabus could be used. \(^{13}\)

During the period 1938 to 1943 opportunities for religious instruction were enhanced. The classroom teachers already had the right to give religious instruction based on the approved Scripture readings within regular school hours. Clergy were permitted to teach in the schools only one-half hour before or after the school day. Local school boards, however, could determine opening and closing times. A model had been established based on the City of Brantford

---

\(^{12}\) Inter-Church Committee on Week-Day Religious Education, "Religious Education in The Public Schools of Ontario" (Toronto: Thorn Press, May, 1945), 18p.

\(^{13}\) E. R. McLean, "The Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools, Report of the Secretary," Jan. 3, 1941, [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
experiment. This model was followed in Peterborough and Toronto and elsewhere.

The Inter-Church Committee was deemed "qualified to represent the considered judgment of the great majority of Protestant citizens of Ontario" by the Christian Education Committee of the Montreal-Ottawa Conference of the United Church. Indeed, the combined membership of the denominations represented on the Committee formed the majority of church members in the province in 1941. Both through the Inter-Church Committee and through the official bodies of the Protestant churches efforts to increase religious teaching in the schools were general during the war years.

The Presbytery of London of the Presbyterian Church in Canada had passed a resolution in 1940 which echoed similar proposals by other church bodies:

Whereas our public schools offer the widest possibilities for fostering principles of Christian citizenship through the teaching of Bible knowledge.

Therefore we, the Presbytery of London, humbly recommend that the General Assembly make an unequivocal pronouncement in favor of putting such subjects on the regular time-table of our Public Schools.

Further, as a Church, we should indicate our willingness to be represented on an interdenominational committee appointed to prepare and select text books for the purpose. Agreed.

---

15 Minutes of the Montreal-Ottawa Conference of the United Church of Canada (1944). [National Archives of Quebec at Montreal].
17 Minutes of the Presbytery of London of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (May 14, 1940), 807. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada].
Although clergy had the right to teach religion during the half-hour prior to the official opening of the school day, many were reluctant to act upon this opportunity. The minutes of the Presbyterian Church's General Assembly confirm that this issue was addressed in the 1940 report of the Week-Day Religious Education Committee:

In every province in the Dominion provision is made for the local clergymen to give Bible instruction in the public school to members of their own communion, but very few take advantage of this privilege. Many gave as a reason for not undertaking such a task the lack of a syllabus or course of studies. This need has been met by the issuing of a syllabus covering the eight years of public school instruction. The General Secretary will be pleased to send a copy to any minister who is interested, and to give information regarding the organization of such classes.

Most of the Provincial Departments of Education, and local school boards, are very sympathetic to such work, and your Board urges every minister to seize the opportunity of bringing to all the children of the community the message of the Bible. Such instruction would make the work of the Church much more effective.  

At the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada of the same year, the Report of the Committee on Church Worship was received and its recommendations considered seriatim:

That this Assembly ask for Legislative action making Religious Instruction in Protestant Public Schools obligatory, and that an hour be found during the morning period, for that period of instruction.  

---

18 Acts and Proceedings of the Sixty-Fifth General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (1939), 126-127. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada].

19 Acts and Proceedings of the Sixty-Sixth General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (1940), 25. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada].
Similarly, the Report of the Board of Education of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec of 1940 indicated support for increased cooperation with other Protestants in securing religious instruction in the public schools:

Many communities within the Convention have been organized, usually through the local ministerial association, to broaden the field for religious instruction by going into the public and high schools of their own towns or cities. There are various plans of work but usually there is an agreement on the material to be covered, the grades to be taught and the time -- ordinarily one-half hour per week. The work is more than justified by reason of the large number of boys and girls contacted who otherwise might get little if any instruction in affairs of the Christian life. A pamphlet on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario and a Syllabus of Bible Study have been prepared by an Inter-Church Committee and are much in demand by ministers who seek to avail themselves of the provision of the Provincial Act allowing them time for instruction in the public schools.20

However, some Baptists were later to be cautious about state-mandated instruction because of their principle of separation of church and state.

Believing religious instruction to be essential to the proper education of young people, the United Church also supported a strong program of religion in the schools. The Committee for Week-day Religious Education of the Montreal-Ottawa Conference of The United Church of Canada reported forcefully and at length on religious education at the 1941 annual meeting. Deploiring the "divorce of effective

---

20Baptist Year Book for Ontario and Quebec and Western Canada, 1940 (Toronto: Standard Publishing Company, 1940), 170. [Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec].
religious instruction from the week-day educational system" and the "trend in education toward a complete separation from religion"\textsuperscript{22}, the Committee believed it a "great error when almost all religious instruction is left to the homes and the Churches . . . . [It] inevitably leads to a lack of respect for religious values, and issues in what has been well described as 'Dualism in Education'.\textsuperscript{23} The Board of Christian Education had reported as follows:

The Board pronounced the time ripe for a concerted effort by the Church to secure for every child the largest possible measure of Religious Education in his day school experience, this to include: worship, teaching of history and geography of the people and lands of the Bible, and religious instruction given by Ministers, teachers, or other lay people, under the direction of the Church, in time made available by the school authorities.

Your Committee on Christian Education urges upon the attention of all Ministers the need of their taking fullest possible advantage of the opportunities for religious instruction now provided by the School Acts of the two Provinces in which our Conference is situated.\textsuperscript{24}

The Bay of Quinte Conference of the United Church of Canada in 1941 put forward the following resolution concerning Week-Day Religious Education:

Whereas a number of Public Schools within the bounds of the Bay of Quinte Conference are now receiving religious instruction, in accordance with the Provincial Education Act, and

Whereas it has met with general approval and is now beyond the experimental stage, your Committee of Religious Education would recommend that all ministers and lay delegates in our Conference make a determined effort to introduce Week Day Religious Education in

\textsuperscript{21}Minutes of the Montreal-Ottawa Conference of the United Church of Canada (1941), 1731. [National Archives of Quebec at Montreal].
\textsuperscript{22}\textit{Ibid.}, 1732
\textsuperscript{23}\textit{Ibid.}
\textsuperscript{24}\textit{Ibid.}, 1732-1733.
their own communities. The following procedure is recommended:

1. A meeting of the ministers to arrange cooperative interdenominational action.
2. A conference with the local Board of Education to secure their consent and arrange time of instruction.
3. A discussion of the arrangements with the Principal of the School and Teachers concerned.  

These resolutions marked a concerted effort to place religious and moral training into the schools. They were typical of resolutions passed from time to time by the same church bodies in support of increased religious instruction in the public schools. This similarity demonstrated not only effective work by the Inter-Church Committee, but increasing militancy and cohesion in strategy on the part of the churches. The majority of students were not being reached by the optional program allowed by the regulations.

Complementing the work of the major denominations and the Inter-Church Committee, the Bible Study Committee of the Ontario Educational Association (O.E.A.) adopted the following resolutions in May of 1942:

1. that a course on the English Bible and the Christian Religion be an obligatory subject in the public and secondary schools of Ontario similar to other subjects;
2. that pupils receive credits for examinations in this course as in other subjects;
3. that teachers of this course be trained in the Normal Schools and the College of Education and certified by the Department of Education;
4. that a syllabus and teachers' manuals be prepared by the Department of Education, but that the Bible be the only book in the hands of the pupils;
5. that a list of supplementary reading books be recommended by the Department of Education.

---

25 Minutes of the Bay of Quinte Conference of The United Church of Canada (1941), 63. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
26 McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 19.
The O.E.A. represented those with a vested interest in education: trustees, ratepayers, teachers and parents. The popularity of mandatory religious instruction in the schools had spread beyond the churches to others who advocated conservative values. It is interesting to note that, only a few years before, the O.E.A. had provided a forum for progressivist views in education at its annual conventions.\textsuperscript{27} The government eventually incorporated some of the recommendations of the O.E.A. in its policy of 1944.\textsuperscript{25}

3. The Churches Press the Issue

a) The Anglicans

At the General Board of Religious Education (G.B.R.E.) Committee Meeting of the Anglican Church on May 19, 1942, the General Secretary presented letters telling "of the efforts being made in the Diocese of Ottawa to provide for Religious Instruction in the Public Schools, in the Deaneries of Carlton (sic), Pembroke and Lanark . . . . the success of the effort in connection with the release of children from the Schools to attend the Ash Wednesday and Ascension Day Services . . . . [and that] plans had been made for the giving of Religious Instruction in the Public Schools of Norwood and Havelock, and that the work was developing

\textsuperscript{27}Stamp, \textit{The Schools of Ontario}, 174.
\textsuperscript{28}McLean, \textit{Religion in Ontario Schools}, 19
Cooperation . . .

satisfactorily".  

A verbal report stated that "arrangements had been made for giving Religious Instruction in the Public Schools at Whitby".  

A Report Re Work of Ontario Inter-Church Committee, outlining recent work on the Syllabus, Worship, Tests, and Publicity to School Boards, was attached to the minutes. A copy is included as Appendix C.

At the General Synod of the Anglican Church, the following resolutions were passed on September 13, 1943 concerning Religious Education in Public Schools:

Moved by the Archbishop of Kootenay, seconded by Canon Naylor that, having heard of the progress made in the matter of providing Religious Instruction in the Public and High Schools of the various Provinces of this Dominion, the General Synod commends the efforts which have been responsible for this progress, and, while urging their continuance, would express the hope that these efforts will be regarded only as a step in the direction of making more satisfactory and more adequate provision for the full recognition of the place of Christian Religion in Education; further, that, in consultation with Boards of Religious Education of other communions, our Department of Religious Education be, and is hereby instructed, to take the necessary steps to formulate a general policy in this field, with a view to presenting the same to the proper Educational authorities of each Province.

Carried in both Houses.

Moved by Judge Morley, seconded by Rev. H. A. E. Clarke, that the Fifteenth Session of the General Synod of the Church of England in Canada, assembled, cooperate with all other Christian communions in Canada, Provinces of the Dominion of Canada, except where action has already been taken to introduce Bible Teaching as part of the curriculum in the public and secondary schools, and that a copy of this Resolution be forwarded to the heads of the other Christian communions in the various interested Dioceses in the Dominion of Canada,

---

29Minutes of Meeting of Committee on Religious Education in Public Schools (Toronto, May 19, 1942). [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].

30Ibid.
with a request that they take action along the lines mentioned.

Carried in both Houses.\textsuperscript{3}\textsuperscript{3}\textsuperscript{3}

In 1943 the Board of Religious Education of the Diocese of Huron reported as follows on the urgency of securing Religious Education in Public Schools:

Our return shows an increase of 30 schools over last year, 115 schools in which Bible is taught one-half hour per week. The gain is slow and only touches the fringe of the great need. Never before has the Public Press been so urgent in this most important matter. In England, in U.S., and in this country the daily Press discusses the subject. Educational authorities, Social Service workers and the Church as a whole are alive to the need. There can be no quick solution; the only action that can be taken is in our own parish. A revolution is in progress in this most conservative of all realms of thought. What to teach children about the Bible--God and Jesus is a live question as well as how to teach. Study and experiment point the way, and it is a long road.\textsuperscript{32}

The full recognition of religious education in the curriculum was considered by Anglicans to be an urgent matter. They were quick to urge a coordinated Protestant strategy.

b) The Presbyterians

With the war Presbyterians began to take a serious look at mandatory religious education as a bulwark for social order in the struggle against totalitarianism. In 1942 the Presbytery of Hamilton passed the following resolution:


\textsuperscript{32}Image Journal of the 84th Session of the Synod of the Diocese of Huron (London, Ontario: Franks, Haggard and Mitchell, 1943), 79. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
Whereas the war in which our country is engaged is testing the very foundation of our social order showing a lack of faith in Christ Jesus by a portion of our citizens, and

Whereas the course of study for the Public and High Schools of Ontario does not include Bible Study as a subject, and

Whereas the present permissive arrangement available is quite inadequate to give a thorough grounding in the Christian gospel, and

Whereas religious instruction has been made obligatory in every school in the United Kingdom.

Synod's Committees on Sabbath Schools to consult with the same committees of the other Synods located within Ontario to invite the other Protestant denominations to join in preparing a recommendation to the Minister of Education of Ontario to establish a course in Bible Study for every pupil whose parents do not ask him to be excused.\textsuperscript{33}

Christianity, as seen by the Presbytery, was part of the social fabric. It was being threatened by a lack of faith on the part of unbelievers or backsliders, which had to be addressed by religion in the schools.

At the 69th General Conference of the Presbyterian Church in Canada in 1943, it was recommended that the efforts for religion in the schools be combined with the work of the Christian Advance, a movement by the major denominations to evangelize the country:

a. That the Churches co-operate to the fullest extent with all Home and School Clubs, or Parent-Teachers' Associations which are sponsoring religious education in the Public Schools.

b. Believing that Religious Teaching in the Public Schools is meeting a crying need, every opportunity

\textsuperscript{33}The 68th Session of the Hamilton Presbytery of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (1942), 33. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada].
should be seized to broaden the scope of instruction in this field.

c. That Presbyteries be urged to make provision for Teachers' Training Courses within their bounds.
d. That Scripture Texts, authorized and published by the Board of S.S. [Sunday Schools] and Y.P.S. [Young Peoples' Societies] be used to a larger extent.  

The Presbyterians seemed ready to support any other religious body which would advance the common cause.

c) The Baptists

The Baptist Board of Religious Education introduced a keenly optimistic view of progress in religious education in the public schools. Their report on Week-Day Religious Education at the Baptist Convention of 1943 reads as follows:

"The programme of religious instruction in the Public Schools has gone forward with great zest. As at January, 1943--"852 clergymen are giving instruction in 1909 class rooms in the Province." In most cases this means working with children in only one or two grades. In this way a total of some 60,000 boys and girls are being helped. There is an increase of about one hundred schools over last year.

Behind this work have been the combined efforts of several committees, together with the support of the Ontario Education Association, and prospects for the future are very bright indeed."

A coalition of Protestants, including the Baptist Convention, had been formed. Doctrinal differences had paled before the great mission of reaching the youth of Ontario.

34Acts and Proceedings of the Sixty-Ninth Session of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (1943), 9. [Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada].
d) The United Church

Conferences of the United Church of Canada were eager to secure for every child the largest possible measure of Christian education in his or her day school experience. The Bay of Quinte Conference in 1942 cited the unfortunate secular and materialistic attitudes within Ontario society, the general lack of knowledge about Christianity, and the practicality of improving this situation through religion in the schools. The conference recommended:

1. That ministers and congregations give special attention to the problem of Christian education in the schools under three main aspects:

   (a) The most important is that of the spirit and atmosphere in which the work of the school itself is conducted;

   (b) The Religious teaching in connection with the regular school curriculum, especially in the subjects of history and literature;

   (c) Formal Christian teaching.

The report suggested further that schools should have a Christian atmosphere, that history and literature courses should stress the Christian heritage, that the Bible be taught as Literature, and that all religious instruction, whether by clergy or lay teachers, be under the direction of the Church.

The Committee on Christian Education reported to its London Presbytery in 1942, noting the growing demand for week

---

36 Minutes of the Bay of Quinte Conference of The United Church of Canada (1942), 63-64. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
37 Ibid.
38 Ibid.
day religious instruction in the schools by secular, religious, and educational organizations. They recommended increased cooperation among the Churches, the Government, and educational organizations on the following matters:

i. who shall teach
ii. Who shall take the initiative in arranging teaching.
iii. The time and frequency and period of instruction.
iv. An official syllabus outlining courses and suggested Bibliography.
v. The possibility of having the teacher give the religious instruction in as much as provision is already made for such training in religious instruction on the Normal School course of study.\(^{39}\)

The Committee suggested that Church take these initiatives through the Inter-Church Committee, and that each denomination be represented on that committee.\(^{40}\)

In 1943 the Weekday Religious Education Committee of the Bay of Quinte Conference responded to a proposal of the Minister of Education, Premier Drew, to place Bible teaching in the hands of the regular teaching staff. Stressing the "right and responsibility of the Church for the teaching of religion,"\(^ {41} \) the Conference urged that the churches be represented by the Inter-Church Committee in the determination of the following:

(a) In the preparation of an adequate curriculum.
(b) In the preparation of approved texts.
(c) In training of teachers.
(d) In the selection of those who give religious instruction.

\(^{39}\)Minutes of the London Presbytery of The United Church of Canada (1942), 23. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].

\(^{40}\)Ibid.

\(^{41}\)United Church of Canada, Bay of Quinte Conference (1943), 30-31. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
In maintaining and strengthening contacts between the church and the school at such times as special religious and national occasions such as Thanksgiving, Christmas, Easter, Empire, and Dominion Days.\textsuperscript{42}

It is clear that there was a militant attitude on the part of the churches in support of mandatory religious education in the schools. This was spurred on by the apparent concurrence of the Ontario Education Association, the new Conservative government of Premier Drew, and the encouragement of the success of the efforts of the churches from 1938 to 1943. The war was an occasion for conservatives to appeal to traditional values in education. Religious instruction seemed to be an opportunity for character training. It was also a forum for Christian evangelism. The assumption of the churches was that Ontario was a Christian society. Ryerson had always believed that Christianity should pervade the curriculum. However, in his time, the churches could not set aside doctrinal differences in their pursuit of a Protestant, non-sectarian curriculum. In the 1930s and 1940s, while the churches were not entirely in agreement on doctrine, they exhibited a single-mindedness in pressing for religion in the schools which had heretofore eluded them. Much of the documentation above repeats a similar theme. It could be magnified tenfold. The churches wanted access to all the public schools of Ontario. They wanted to control the religious aspects of the proposed course of study, the staffing, the materials, and the

\textsuperscript{42}Ibid.
training of teachers. However, they were still supplicants to the government. Cooperation with school boards was general, but when the government acted to mandate a centrally-controlled program of religious education in the schools in 1944, the Inter-Church Committee and some of the major denominations were taken by surprise.

4. The Issue of Control

The issue of who was to control the content of Bible instruction exercised the churches and the Inter-Church Committee. Cooperation was one thing, but the churches were reluctant to give control of the curriculum to the state. The Reverend G. F. Dangerfield, a United Church minister, neatly summarized the advantages and disadvantages of the impending move toward compulsory religious education in his report to the Ottawa Presbytery of December 15, 1943:

Advantages of Compulsory Religious Instruction.--1, 100% would be reached; 2, Children would have a better knowledge of Bible, giving Sunday School an opportunity to relate teaching of Bible to daily life; 3, Would be looked upon by teachers and pupils as an essential part of education and not something added.

Disadvantages of Compulsory Religious Instruction.--1, Many teachers have inadequate knowledge even to teach Bible; 2, They may have no religious conviction; 3, The Church is not the State, it is custodian of Christian Faith; 4, The plan may cause discord in some Christian communities. 43

43Minutes of the Ottawa Presbytery of The United Church of Canada (December 15, 1943), 1699. [Ottawa City Hall Archives].
Mr. Dangerfield suggested steps toward an amicable introduction of religious instruction from the point of view of the churches:

*Steps that might be taken to strengthen work.*—1, Department should publish a pamphlet stating their position; 2, Department should provide further guidance, for instance a Worship Book; 3, Department should extend and improve training of teachers in Normal Schools; 4, Department should provide for training of special teachers for task of Religious Instruction; 5, Act amended whereby every school make arrangement for Religious Education. As the matter stands now, ministers through Board and Department, may give Religious Instruction; but if changed, then all schools would be compelled to give it unless permission by the Department.

Mr. Dangerfield's assessment of the possible negative impact of the impending change in policy was to be magnified by those opposed to religion in the schools. Most of the issues raised by Dangerfield were to become contentious. In gaining access to the public school classroom, the churches could not foresee the difficulties which were to come. In fact, the dream of access to the majority of Ontario's children blinded most enthusiasts to the thorny problems which Mr. Dangerfield had enumerated. The Conservative government and the churches overrode all objections.

5. *The Drew Government's Policy Realized*

Shortly after the Conservative Party was returned to power in 1944, Premier and Education Minister George Drew

---

44Ibid.
informed a deputation from the Inter-Church Committee of plans to review, in the immediate future, the whole matter of religious education. The announcement of policy which followed contained striking changes from the former Regulations for public schools. Religious instruction was to be given by the classroom teachers for two half-hours per week within the regular school timetable. A school board, if it so wished, might continue to use local clergy, or might secure an exemption from including religious education in the school day, if such were the wishes of the constituents. A pupil whose parents so requested might be exempt from religion in the schools on written request.45

McLean has written that "the policy of the Minister came as something of a surprise to the Inter-Church Committee and was received with something less than rejoicing".45 The Committee presented a lengthy memorandum to the Department of Education on April 3, 1944, expressing general approval of the "radical change", but drawing attention to its concerns such as adequate training, religious conviction, textbooks, and teaching aids. The full text is included as Appendix D. The Memorandum, described as "a clear portrayal of the collective judgment of the Inter-Church Committee and the Ontario Educational Association"47, emphasized the fundamental role of the Churches in religious education in the schools.

45McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 22.
46Ibid., 23.
47Ibid.
The members of the Inter-Church Committee asserted their right to approve the selection of teachers, content, and materials in any official program. They cautioned that the program should be introduced with care because, in some communities, there could be objections. They doubted that the program at the Normal Schools was adequate, and although they were not entirely satisfied with the Teachers’ Guides available from Britain, they were prepared to recommend a Canadian revision of the 'Cambridgeshire Syllabus'. They were most concerned that the Church lose none of its accustomed perogatives, which had been gained when the program was optional.

In spite of these reservations, the Committee placed on record "its gratification at this recognition of the importance of a knowledge of the Bible in general education and the need for giving a larger place to teaching it." It recapitulated the positions of the Churches and the O.E.A. in one authorized document. Several recommendations were ignored by the government. The Ministry of Education was not about to cede control over who could teach a regular subject in the curriculum—even if it were religion. The Ministry did exempt teachers from this duty on grounds of conscience. No program of worship other than that authorized by existing regulations was allowed. Most glaringly, Drew chose to

48Inter-Church Committee on Week Day Religious Instruction, "Religious Education in the Public Schools: A Memorandum for the Department of Education of the Province of Ontario" (Toronto: April 3, 1944). [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada, Box 29, General Board of Religious Education]. Also in McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools,
introduce his reforms without delay, in spite of the caution of the Committee. He did accept in principle the view that the churches should be consulted in the matter of curricula—and they were. However, the more insistent requests of the churches regarding organizational control of the program on the basis of supposed rights and responsibilities of the Church were denied.

Two weeks later, on April 19, 1944, an Informal Sub-Committee reporting on Religious Education in Ontario to the Study Committee of the Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario met in the Board Room at Trinity College in Toronto. The fourteen member group was composed of two principals of Toronto Collegiates, five principals of Toronto elementary schools, two educational authorities of Protestant Communions, four ministers representative of Protestant churches, and one member of the parent committee. The group discussed the system of religious education then in use in approximately 20% of the elementary schools, its strengths and weaknesses, and its possibilities for the future. They then moved on to the "pronouncements on religious education recently made by the Provincial Minister of Education".49 The memorandum prepared by the Interchurch Committee was before the group throughout the discussions. The results of this meeting are recorded in a Memorandum Regarding the Findings

49Memorandum Regarding the Findings of an Informal Sub-Committee reporting on Religious Education in Ontario to the Study Committee of the Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario on the evening of Wednesday, April 19, 1944, 2. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
of an Informal Sub-Committee on Religious Education which may be found in full in Appendix E. A summary of the five resolutions resulting from this meeting follows:

1. The Sub-Committee was pleased by the Government's intention of two one-half hour periods per week of Biblical study throughout elementary and secondary schools, and anxious that "this excellent plan should be introduced into the schools under the most favourable conditions; that the syllabi and textbooks should be prepared carefully and co-operatively, and be available to the principals and teachers . . . in ample time for study and preparation for the courses which they are to teach". The project should be introduced gradually over the course of several years, and voluntary in the initial year.

2. The present system should be continued and developed during the transition. Both the principals and the ministers of the Committee reported that the half-hour at 9:00 a.m. was most productive to pupils and convenient to clergy. "In most of the schools . . . . teaching has been of a very co-operative and non-controversial quality".

3. During the transitional period, compulsory courses in Religious Education in Normal Schools and Colleges of Education should ensure that every new graduate was competent in teaching the Bible. Summer courses should be provided. Principals believed that some current staff might be

---

50 Ibid., 1.
51 Ibid., 2.
reluctant to teach religion "because of their lack of experience, training, and instruction in teaching the Bible".52

4. The syllabi and textbooks should be submitted as early as possible to the Inter-Church Committee for Week-Day Religious Education, to the Ontario Teachers' Federation, and to the Ontario Educational Association for their consideration.

5. Experimentation should be carried out on a voluntary basis during the transition year with a "view to the formation of a suitable syllabus and text book for each grade, the whole to be effectively integrated that a sequence may be provided".53

During the spring and summer of 1944, the Government's policy on Religious Education in the Schools received much discussion throughout the Province. Meanwhile, the Department of Education prepared a draft of the Regulations it proposed and presented it to the Inter-Church Committee on June 19, 1944. The Committee's request that the Regulations setting the time for instruction during the first half hour of the morning or the last half hour of the afternoon be amended by the addition of the words, "or at such other time as the Board may determine" was denied. However, the Committee's second proposal requesting that the words "secure

52Ibid.
53Memorandum Regarding the Findings of an Informal Sub-Committee on Religious Education (1944). [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
permission to teach the required course" be changed to "secure permission to give religious instruction", making it permissible for clergy to give instruction acceptable to their denomination rather than being restricted to the curriculum, was granted.54

6. Responses to the Drew Government's Policy on Religious Education

The Anglicans seemed more enthusiastic and less cautious than some Protestants in commending the government's approach. They had no fear of church-state problems and had been the prime movers during the many years which preceded the formal introduction of Bible teaching in the public schools. Rev. Dr. Hiltz, General Secretary of the Board of Religious Education of the Church of England in Canada, addressed the 1944 Synod of the Anglican Diocese of Huron on the subject of Religious Education on May 16, 1944. A motion to commend Premier Drew followed his presentation:

That a resolution of approval and encouragement be drawn up by the D.B R.E. and sent from this Synod to Premier Drew in view of the efforts of his Department of Education for Religious Education in the schools of the Province. Carried.

Later the following resolution was presented: "The Synod of Huron now assembled, sends greetings and assures you we wholly approve and heartily commend your efforts on behalf of the children and youth of the Province by furthering the spiritual element in their

54McLean, Religion in Ontario Schools, 29-
Cooperation... education through Bible Instruction and other means in our Public and High Schools."^55

The response of The United Church to the Regulations of 1944 was equally laudatory, but it reflected a concern to maintain the principle of cooperation rather than diktat. The Ottawa-Montreal Conference of The United Church reported on religious education in the schools at its June 1944 meeting:

We must also approve the interest of the Ontario Premier and Minister of Education in his proposal to extend the scope of religious education in the schools of that Province. His proposals have not yet been presented in detail, and this committee would express the hope that the plan of the Ontario Department of Education may be worked out in full co-operation with the Interdenominational Committee on Week-Day Religious Education that has studied the situation for many years and is qualified to represent the considered judgment of the great majority of the Protestant citizens of Ontario.^56

At the Twentieth Annual Toronto Conference of The United Church of Canada participants were alerted to the dangers of the secularization of education in schools, the recognition of inadequacies in this regard by both the Church and the State, the remedial measures underway in response to the consensus of opinion that religion must have a greater place in the curriculum, and the rise from three to twenty percent of schools participating in religious instruction.^57

---


^56Minutes of the Montreal-Ottawa Conference of The United Church of Canada (1944). [National Archives of Quebec at Montreal].

^57Minutes of the Toronto Conference of The United Church of Canada (1944), 37. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
Recognizing the need for formalization and expansion of religious instruction in the schools, the Christian Education Committee submitted the following recommendations:

(1) We commend the Government of Ontario for its desire to make greater provision for the teaching of religion in our schools.

(2) We desire to maintain the worthy tradition of helpful co-operation which exists between the Church and our School system.

(3) We affirm the principle of Freedom of Religion and the right and responsibility which rests upon the Church for the supervision and teaching of religion.

(4) We urge the Department of Education pending development of plans to strengthen and extend the present arrangements and we call upon our ministers to avail themselves of the opportunities afforded at present.

(5) We commend the work of the Interchurch Committee and find ourselves in substantial agreement with the memorandum recently presented to the Government.

(6) We are most anxious to confer and co-operate with the Government at all times in this important matter.\(^5^5\)

By 1945, when the government plan was underway, the Toronto Conference of The United Church expressed a desire for the fullest cooperation in providing religious courses in the schools:

... our ministers and churches, acting wherever possible in co-operation with other religious bodies seek every opportunity to encourage the public school teachers in the discharge of their important work of religious instruction, such encouragement and assistance being given through conferences of church workers, parents, and public school teachers, and through training courses in Biblical knowledge and interpretation for public school teachers.\(^5^9\)

\(^{58}\)Ibid.

\(^{59}\)Minutes of the Twenty-First Annual Toronto Conference of The United Church of Canada (1945), 23-24. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
The Baptists had been more cautious than the Anglican and United Churches, but they accepted the new policy. By the time the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec met in 1944, the government had already changed the regulations and "A Memorandum for the Department of Education of the Province of Ontario From the Inter-church Committee on Week Day Religious Education, April 3, 1944" had been submitted. The report of the Baptist Board of Religious Education was lengthy and detailed. It accepted Premier Drew's plan. However, the report highlighted certain concerns which had already been enumerated by the Inter-Church Committee: the need for adequate Bible training for teachers and an adequate curriculum and textbooks, the right of the churches to approve those who taught the program, the need for teachers to have a living Christian experience and to be in a definite relationship with the Christian Church.\textsuperscript{50}

While the imposition of a program of religious education in the schools heartened the churches in their goal of providing Bible teaching to every child, certain difficulties were to plague the program thereafter. The voluntary, or quasi-optional character, of Bible teaching had almost disappeared. The charge of sectarianism was imminent and the rights of individual churches appeared to be infringed in the matters of curriculum and selection of teachers. The issue

\textsuperscript{50}Baptist Year Book for Ontario and Quebec (Toronto: Standard Publishing Company, 1944-5), 184. [Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec].
of Church-state separation immediately activated opposition from political opponents, minority groups and even individual members of the churches. The years after the war were to be relatively calm as the program developed but opposition gathered strength readily. Theological doctrines and political fiat did not necessarily mix well in a democratic and multi-faith society.

Objections to the program of religious education centred upon its mandatory nature. The Canadian Jewish Congress insisted that religious education belonged to the "church and synagogue and, even more, to the home." The teaching of a sectarian creed in the schools would produce "obstacles to unity". The Jews had not objected to Christians of any denomination teaching their own children under the voluntary system of religious education. However, they did not care to have Jewish children singled out by having to leave the classroom during what had become a regular subject. They believed that psychological damage and friction between children might result. Confuting the assertion that Christianity and democracy were inseparable, the Congress warned that "the separation of Church and State, a historic

---

61 "Official Declaration by Canadian Jewish Congress on Religious Education in the Public Schools" (March 22, 1945), 1. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada; Ontario Jewish Archives].
62 Ibid.
63 Rabbi Abraham L. Fineberg, Religious Instruction in the Public Schools/ The Ontario Plan - Good or Bad? (Toronto: n.p., 1945). [National Archives of Canada and Ontario Jewish Archives]
principle vital to the progress of the democratic way, is being imperilled".54

The essence of the Inter-Church Committee's defence of the program was that the Church had a historic right to teach Christian theology and morality in the schools:

While control of our schools has long since passed over from the Church to the State, this, fortunately, has not meant that the school is cut off from all religious teaching and influence. Those who in the earliest days in this Province pressed for a system of free public and compulsory education, and desired to make it non-sectarian, never intended that the schools were to be non-Christian.55

In this statement, the Inter-Church Committee was referring to the intentions of educational bureaucrats, such as Ryerson. The impasse between defenders and attackers of the program centred upon the right of the Christian Church and the government to impose any kind of religious teaching on the schools. However, the indoctrinational content of the program provoked opposition as well. As in the optional program of the nineteenth century, the 1944 program was to be Christian, but non-sectarian. With church unions and ecumenical ventures, the clergy of the major Protestant denominations were more in agreement than they had been a century earlier. However, there were critics of the syllabi and the Teachers' Guides who based their charges on defective

54 "Official Declaration by Canadian Jewish Congress on Religious Education in the Public Schools" (March 22, 1945), 1.
55 Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in the Schools of Ontario, "Brief to the Royal Commission on Education Respecting the Place of Religion in Public Education" (1945), 4. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
Cooperation . . .

theology. A statement on the doctrinal basis of the Guides provided by Basil Yeaxlee, a professor of Oxford University, was used to allay fears regarding the orthodoxy of such materials:

It should be clearly understood by teachers that the doctrinal basis of all the lesson material in these volumes, and the convictions of the individual writers and of the members of the Editorial Board, are those held by the vast majority of Christians of all denominations, and summarized in the Apostles' Creed. These convictions are those upon which the Agreed Syllabuses for use in Day-schools are based, and in consequence the Guides are in complete accord with such syllabuses.\(^6\)

Objections to the approved materials based on theology appeared in a pamphlet entitled, "The Christian Faith and the Religion in Ontario Schools" by the Reverend Arthur Cochrane, Ph.D. and others. Dr. Cochrane was President of the Association for Religious Liberty, which consisted of minority groups such as the Jehovah's Witnesses and some Protestants who were disgruntled with the Drew government. The essence of their complaints was that the Guide Books presented a defective theology of the Person of Christ—what is usually termed Christology. Although the Guide Books had presented Jesus as an attractive human figure, Dr. Cochrane would have no diminution of Jesus' full divinity, as difficult as that concept might be for young children to grasp. Cochrane criticized the attempt in the Guide Books to create fables about the boyhood of Jesus. The New Testament

\(^6\)"A Suggested Syllabus of Lessons", n.d. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
is practically silent on this matter. There were other criticisms regarding departures from Scripture, most spurious, but some telling.

In spite of such criticism, the overwhelming majority of the electorate had approved the government's religious education policy in the election of 1945. The Conservatives had been returned with a majority over the issue. In the churches and in society, support for religious education in the schools had grown, while criticism went largely unheeded. The critics of the program were not silenced, however. By the 1960s, almost all of their objections to the government's religious education policy had gained a wider hearing.

In a letter of 1946 to the Canadian Forum supporting religious education in Ontario schools, R. C. Chalmers, a Christian minister, expressed the view that "the genius of the Christian faith has never meant that the Church must have 'no dealings' with the State, for from the Christian viewpoint the State is also under God and He must be Lord of all or He is not Lord at all." Few could imagine that post-war Ontario was a true theocracy or that governments of the day were subject to the tutelage of the churches. However, it seemed that conservative views of society had been reflected in the churches, schools, and homes of Ontario during the post-war period and for some time thereafter. In

---

68 Ibid.
allying itself with the Drew government's traditionalist program in religion and education, the churches had received criticism unknown during the long period of optional religious instruction in the schools.

7. Summary

The intent of this chapter has been to describe the imposition of the Drew government's policy of religious education within the context of the campaign of the churches, from the early 1930s, to extend their influence in public education. The achievement of the program of 1944 was a mixed blessing for the churches. Riding the wave of Premier Drew's conservative program for a renewed imperialism, and a return to the Three Rs in education, the churches were willing to accept his policy on religion in the schools. If religious education were to become province-wide, the churches were optimistic about the prospect of reaching every Ontario public school student. However, there was less enthusiasm, and even criticism, on the part of civil libertarians, minorities, fundamentalists and other Christians, and opposition politicians.

Under the optional program, the churches had been able to exercise control over who could teach religion in the schools and what materials could be used. Although they continued to possess rights of consultation in these matters, the proposition that professional educators could be subject
to the dictates of the Church was not entertained by the government. Distrust of this alliance between Church and state, which had been a sore point to critics, would undermine the hopes of the churches during the more liberal 1960s.
CHAPTER V

PROTESTANTISM IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS: DENOUEMENT AND PERPLEXITY

1. Introduction

By September 1944 religious education was a subject in the regular curriculum of public elementary schools in Ontario. The program consisted of two half-hour periods of instruction per week based on the Christian Bible. The regulations provided that "issues of a controversial or sectarian nature shall be avoided". The materials used were Teachers' Guides and the Bible itself. The Teachers' Guides consisted of a series of graded lessons based on passages of Scripture, with moral or theological teaching. The Guide Books were published originally for the first six grades and centred on stories of Jesus and other major figures in the Bible. Typical titles for a unit of study were "Jesus, the Kind Healer", "Jesus, the Friend of Little Children", "Pioneers of Jewish History: Abraham, Jacob, Joseph" and "Leaders of the Early Church". The original Guide Books were Canadian versions of a British series published by the

1Ontario Regulations 30/44, 13 (i) (c).
2“A Summary of the Table of Contents of the Guide Books for Instructors in Public Schools”, n.d. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
Religious Education Press. They had been agreed upon by the major Christian denominations in England.

The content of the program had been vetted by the Inter-Church Committee and was acceptable to the major Protestant Churches. Usually, the classroom teacher was expected to teach the material for grades one to six, and clergy taught grades seven and eight. Guides for the latter grades were not published until 1960, so that clergy were at liberty to use their own materials. To their credit, advocates of the program aimed to foster the moral and spiritual well-being of the child. Their assumption that a program of Protestant theology in the schools was the best method to achieve this aim was not approved by all.

Some criticized the potential of the program to divide people of differing religious faiths. Some claimed that religious freedom was infringed. Some Christians declared that the theology of the program was defective—it was too liberal. These critics and their disagreements with the program have been identified previously. The wonder is that the Conservative government and the churches were able to answer their critics and to convince the public that, despite its defects, the program met a crying need and was supported by a majority of citizens. The optional nature of the program was used constantly to blunt criticism. School boards, teachers, and students could be excused.

3The Canadian Jewish Congress, the Association for Religious Liberty, Dr. Arthur Cochrane and others, various evangelical sects. (Chapter IV).
2. **The Teachers' Guides**

The question of the theological base of the religious education program is both difficult and controverted. Compilers of the Guides claimed that they were based upon convictions "held by the vast majority of Christians of all denominations, and summarized in the Apostles' Creed." Even though this explanation satisfied the Inter-Church Committee and its member churches, it did not satisfy some theologians and some sub-units of the churches. The Guides assumed support for a broadly Protestant view of the Scriptures and suited most mainline churches, but dissatisfaction grew over time. Some caricatured the theology of the Guide Books as anemic, too liberal, even heretical. No program could have avoided criticisms from the right and the left of the theological spectrum.

Although teachers were encouraged to prepare their own materials rather than slavishly follow the Teachers' Guides, the biblical base was to be followed. Each lesson was supported by a verse or verses to be read and memorized. Most lessons consisted of homely examples of spiritual or moral virtues. In the unit on "Home and Helpfulness", family members were given traditional roles. Children were expected to "help Mother" in minor domestic chores. They were encouraged to be obedient and compliant. The virtues of

---

politeness, gentleness, and truthfulness were named. Similarly, the virtue to be exemplified from the story of the healing of the centurion's servant (Matthew 8: 5-10) was "promptness." The centurion was obeyed promptly by his soldiers! In the primary grades, the virtues of polite society received as much emphasis as the Bible stories themselves. Where there was no Biblical evidence for a virtue they wished to stress, the authors resorted to fabrication. In the unit, "The Child Jesus," three of the four stories included have no foundation whatsoever in Scripture. These appeals to the child's imagination vexed some adult critics. In the pamphlet, "A Brief on Religious Education in the Schools" the Association for Religious Liberty noted that "only 9 [sic] stories that could be described as accurate retelling of the Bible narrative" were included in the sixty-four stories of the Teachers' Guides for the first two grades. The Association complained about "fabricated stories about Jesus for which there is not the slightest element of scriptural truth concerning Jesus' childhood and boyhood."

The aim in the Teachers' Guides for primary grades was to portray Jesus as a friend of little children. From a

---

6 Ibid., 26.
7 Association for Religious Liberty, "A Brief on Religious Education in the Schools" (March 7, 1945). [National Archives of Canada. Also at General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
8 Ibid., 5.
religious point of view the aim was laudable. However, the method was questionable from an academic viewpoint. The program continued for grades four, five, and six was less dependent upon fable. The kindly portrayal of Jesus gave way to one of "virile humanity". The Jesus of the Teachers' Guides possessed all the virtues which the authors wished to instill in the children.

Although the greatest emphasis was on virtues supported by examples from the Christian Bible, the Teachers' Guides contained explicit Christian doctrine, most notably the doctrine of the resurrection of Christ and the story of Jesus' birth. The Guides were catechetical in intent; the specifically Christian elements were presented as simple fact. No mention was made of a world religion other than Christianity. It is not surprising that religious minorities, atheists, and rationalists objected to the narrowness of the content. When deficiencies in the Guides were identified, the supporters of the program appealed to the good which had been achieved to counter such objections.

3. The Inter-Church Committee

The Inter-Church Committee had expressed some reservations about the government's religious education policy in April 1944. However, by the time the policy had

---

9Ernest H. Hayes, *Jesus and the Kingdom [Grade Six]* (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1944), 1.
been promulgated and criticized by others, the Committee had become an apologist for the new regulations. The Association for Religious Liberty and the Canadian Jewish Congress, Ontario Division, protested infringement of religious freedom. The Committee prepared a statement entitled, "Religious Freedom Upheld," in support of the government's policy. It was signed by representatives of the Anglican, United, Convention Baptist, Presbyterian, and Evangelical Churches and the Churches of Christ (Disciples). The statement highlighted that the regulations had not reversed, but rather had extended, traditional policy:

In the regulations issued by Egerton Ryerson in 1848 is found the following: "As Christianity is the basis of our whole system of elementary education, that principle should pervade it throughout."

To discount charges of widespread disunity, the Committee noted that local school boards could apply for exemption and that only 45 of 6,405 school boards had applied. In response to criticisms about the abridgment of freedom of conscience and freedom of worship, the Committee pointed to the conscience clause which allowed teachers and students to be excused from the program and to the right of clergy to teach their own faith group should parents desire it. To counteract the charge of psychological damage to

---

10 Inter-Church Committee for Weekday Education, "Religious Freedom Upheld" (1945). [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
11 Ibid.
12 Ibid.
13 Ibid.
minority children on being withdrawn from class, the Committee replied that minority parents had withdrawn their children from classes for as many as twelve holy days per year. Committed to the belief that the regulations were flexible enough to accommodate minorities, the Committee summed up its position:

'It should be observed that majorities have rights as well as minorities, and so long as rights of conscience of the minorities are respected, the desire of the majority should prevail.'

Ever anxious to maintain a cordial relationship with the government and to retain influence over the religious education program, the Inter-Church Committee wrote Premier Drew to advise him of the necessity of a permanent Joint Advisory Committee to consist of the representatives of the Inter-Church Committee and the Department of Education. The proposed committee would consider any revision of the courses and the Teachers' Guides, the preparation of Bible Readings, and any other related matters. Through this forum, the Inter-Church Committee hoped to influence worship in the school, the training of teachers in religious education, and the selection of materials for grade seven and grade eight. The Joint Advisory Committee was established as requested.

The Secretary of the Inter-Church Committee, the Reverend E. R. McLean, prepared a memorandum for the member

---

14Ibid.
15Ibid.
16Inter-Church Committee to the Prime Minister and Minister of Education of Ontario (n.d.). [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
denominations on February 19, 1945. The memorandum, "Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario," was an apology for the religious education program and a defense of the position of the Inter-Church Committee. McLean grounded his defence in the statements that "religion is the only true basis for morality" and that "to teach morals apart from religion avails little." He emphasized the importance of religion in shaping the child's character; secular studies alone could not accomplish this.

McLean noted that while church and state governed their own spheres, in the history of Ontario it was never intended that they should be entirely separate. The intention was that they would cooperate. As long as there were provisions for local input and rights of conscience, there was no legal reason why this should be otherwise. McLean quoted from the historic and revised statutes to demonstrate that the Christian religion had always been a part of Ontario Education. He commended the statement in the Programme of Studies for Grades I to VI, Ontario Public and Separate Schools (1937) that "the schools of Ontario exist for the purpose of preparing children to live in a democratic society which bases its way of life upon the Christian ideal." He

---

17 E. R. McLean [for the Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education] (February 19, 1945). [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
18 Ibid.
19 Ibid., 1.
20 Ibid., 2.
denied that the school was ever, or should ever be, neutral in the matter of religion.\(^{21}\)

McLean reiterated the reservations that the Inter-Church Committee had expressed to the government regarding who should teach.\(^{22}\) Teachers of religion must be acceptable to the Church as well as to the government. In support of the new system, he called upon the clerical members of the Committee to work diligently with teachers and school officials to promote the religious education program.\(^ {23}\)

The comments and concerns cited in earlier documents from the Inter-Church Committee reappeared in its formal Brief to the Royal Commission on Education of 1945. Citing the historic inclusion of Christian principles in the public school curriculum, the Committee recapitulated statutes and curriculum guides which assumed Christian teaching in the schools.\(^ {24}\) It requested that the Royal Commission consider the intimate connection between democratic ways and Christian belief: "Is the democratic way of life safe without religion?"\(^ {25}\) The threat of moral decay, without the foundation of religion, made it imperative that church and school cooperate in the provision of religious instruction.\(^ {26}\)

---

\(^{21}\)Ibid., 4.

\(^{22}\)Ibid., 6.

\(^{23}\)Ibid.

\(^{24}\)The Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education, "A Brief to the Royal Commission on Education Respecting the Place of Religion in Public Education" (1945). [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada], 1-2.

\(^{25}\)Ibid., 6.

\(^{26}\)Ibid.
The Committee thus wanted the Commission to endorse the 1944 regulations. In the end it did.

The Inter-Church Committee continued to promote the religious education program with teachers and the Department of Education in the post-war period. On his retirement as Secretary, the Reverend E. R. McLean noted some activities of the Committee: Guide Books were revised, conferences on religious education for teachers and clergy were held, requests for the extension and enforcement of the religious education program were made to the Minister of Education, curricula for grades seven and eight were proposed. Although it appeared that there was support for the program from teachers and students, the government decided not to proceed further. When asked to approve Teachers' Guides for grades seven and eight, the Minister, W. J. Dunlop, answered: "We feel that we have gone as far as we can safely go". In retrospect, Dunlop had a firmer grasp of what was possible politically than did the Inter-Church Committee.

4. The Churches

The Anglican Church was most anxious to maintain the religious education program and expressed this desire in its Brief to the Royal Commission on Education of June 1945.

E. R. McLean, "A Brief Synopsis for the Benefit of the Members of the Committee" (1956), 7-8. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].

Ibid., 8.
Anglicans took exception to "the fact that the place of religion in Education is being challenged in this Province by certain groups". The purpose of their brief was to counter the protests of the minority groups with the majority view "that religion has an essential and proper place in any Educational System". It was essential that Home, Church and State work together towards a common goal. The Brief detailed the long and intimate connection between religion and the schools. Anglicans assumed that religion was indispensable to the character formation of the child and that "morals cannot be taught effectively apart from religious sanctions". The conscience clause, they believed, was sufficient to accommodate those dissenting from Christian beliefs, while retaining the "religious liberty of that vast majority of our citizens who believe in God and desire that the education of their children give proper place to religious belief".

When addressing the citation of cases of "viciousness, unhappiness, discrimination and bad teaching" by opponents of religious teaching in the schools, the Anglican Brief stated that, for every such case, there were "hundreds of cases where the direct opposite had resulted from religious

29 "A Brief Submitted to the Ontario Royal Commission on Education by the Church of England in the Ecclesiastical Province of Ontario" (June, 1945), 1. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada]
30 Ibid.
31 Ibid., 2.
32 Ibid., 6.
33 Ibid., 7.
Religion must not be removed from the schools because of opposition. Without it "the forces of evil will have no qualms of conscience about training [the children] in the opposite direction". The Brief refuted the charge of the Canadian Jewish Congress that the religious education program contributed to disunity and racial discrimination by stating that "the teaching of the basic principles of the Christian faith cannot but be one of the finest safeguards possible against racial discrimination." God was "no respector [sic] of persons . . . . in Christ there is neither Jew nor Greek, bond or free". Comments concerning religious education ended with a quote from an editorial in The London Times: "the healthy life of a nation must be based on spiritual principles." Religion in the schools was indispensable.

The Board of Christian Education of The United Church supported the religious education program in its Brief to the Royal Commission. The need to provide basic Christian education for the many children who did not attend a church school was highlighted as a reason for continuing the program. The exclusion of religion from the curriculum might lead children to conclude that it was of little

---

34 Ibid.
35 Ibid., 8.
36 Ibid.
37 Ibid.
38 Ibid., 9.
39 Board of Christian Education, The United Church of Canada, "A Statement of the Relations Between Religion and Public Education", Brief No. 64 to the Royal Commission on Education (Toronto, 1945), 3. [Archives of The United Church of Canada].
After reviewing alternatives to the government policy of church-state cooperation in religious education, the Board concluded that the program which had evolved was best. The right of the churches to interpret the historic faith was retained while the state provided the classrooms and staff. Each was in its proper sphere. The United Church Brief did not refer to "majority rights" nor to the criticisms of the program and the teaching materials.

The representative of the Presbyterian Church in Canada reported that although some Presbyterians had opposed a close connection between church and state, the denomination had "with surprising unanimity supported largely the regulations as they had been set forth by the Department [of Education]." The Report of the Special Committee on Religious Education in the Schools of the Synod of Hamilton and London of the Presbyterian Church gave approval of the religious education policy of the government, but made a series of eight recommendations for improvement: 1) The government should continue to seek more religious education in the schools; 2) that content and methods of presentation become more Scripture oriented; 3) that radical revisions be made to the first three books in order to augment scriptural content; 4) that consideration be given to engaging full-time and fully-trained teachers of religious education who were

---

40 Ibid.
trained and supervised by the Church; 5) that minority faiths be granted full-time staff if requested; 6) that the Synod submit these recommendations to the Royal Commission on Education as a contribution to the resolution of the separate schools issue; 7) that the Synod overture the General Assembly to ensure that the Inter-Church Committee had strong appointees from the Presbyterian Church; and 8) that the special committee continue to pursue its study of religion in the public schools. This special committee on Religious Education from the Presbyterian Synod of Hamilton and London had taken a fervent stand on the need to focus the content of the program on the Scriptures and to ensure that the teaching was controlled by the Church.

In 1948, the report of the special committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools recommended:

1. "That concerning religious instruction in the public schools, the Synod of Hamilton and London affirm its adherence to the basic principles underlying Recommendation No. 4 of the Committee's 1947 Report, viz., that Christian education, including the supervision and training of those who teach the Christian faith, must be entirely under the direction of the Church, as represented by the cooperating churches. Agreed."

Thus the Synod supported the long-held position of the Inter-Church Committee that the churches, not the state alone, must approve and train teachers of religion as well as the long-

---

42 Minutes of the Seventy-Third Synod of Hamilton and London of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (Toronto, 1947), 12-13.
43 Minutes of the Seventy-Fourth Synod of Hamilton and London of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (Toronto, 1948), 15.
held position of the Presbyterian Church that the Scriptures should be taught to young children.

Dr. Leland Gregory of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec stated that the Teachers' Guides did "no violence to the standards of Christianity as we think of them". The Board of Religious Education for the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec expressed approval for "support in this matter of teaching the Bible [coming] from the courses on Religious Education in the PUBLIC SCHOOLS OF ONTARIO AND QUEBEC". However, the Board cautioned that the Ontario system was "still in process of development and revision and during the past year the members of the Board have maintained a watchful eye". Baptists had given suggestions regarding the memorization of Scripture and revision of the Teachers' Guides, and the Board continued to recruit instructors in religious education for the Baptist students in Normal Schools. The Baptists considered the Ontario program in the schools to be supplementary to the overall efforts of the Church in Bible teaching.

---

45 Baptist Year Book for Ontario and Quebec, 1946-47 (Toronto: Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec, 1947), 145. [Archives of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec].
46 Ibid.
47 Ibid.
48 Ibid.
5. The Jewish Congress

In its brief to the Royal Commission, the Jewish Congress, Central Division, detailed its objections to the principle of religious education in the schools and to the program as it existed.\(^49\) The program violated the separation of church and state.\(^50\) There was danger of totalitarianism because the state could choose to teach dangerous religious ideas in the schools.\(^51\) Jewish and other minority religions were accorded unequal status with Christianity and this was unacceptable in a democratic society. The instruction itself was sectarian. Students exempt from instruction were made to feel inferior.\(^52\) The Teachers' Guides were "biased and unfriendly" toward the Jewish religion.\(^53\)

The Jewish Congress objected to the texts because they misrepresented Judaism and cited many errors concerning Jewish Law and customs.\(^54\) More seriously, they contained evidence of anti-Jewish sentiment. For example, on page 92 of the Grade Four Guide, the Jewish rulers were characterized as murderous.\(^55\) There were other examples of friendly Jewish rulers in the New Testament, but these were strangely absent.

\(^49\) Canadian Jewish Congress, Central Division, "For Children in a Democracy: Religious Instruction in the Public Schools of Ontario", Brief No. 46 to the Royal Commission on Education (Toronto, 1945). [Archives of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education; Ontario Jewish Archives].
\(^50\) Ibid., 2.
\(^51\) Ibid., 3.
\(^52\) Ibid.
\(^53\) Ibid., 12.
\(^54\) Ibid.
\(^55\) Ibid., 18.
in the texts. The Congress wanted a thorough revision of the Guides so as to remove anti-Semitic bias.

6. Report of the Royal Commission on Education

When the Report of the Royal Commission on Education was published in 1950, it endorsed the regulations of 1944 on religious education in the schools.\(^5^6\) The principle of Protestant religious instruction was upheld. The historic regulations on the matter were recited and approved and the reasons for the 1944 regulations were considered to be valid.\(^5^7\) Many children were receiving no religious instruction in Sunday Schools or at home. The change to the regulations had become necessary to accommodate the "rapid increase" in clergy wanting to teach in schools during the war. The Commissioners had been influenced by the conviction of many who appeared before them that "education can never be complete without religion".\(^5^8\) Support for this view had come from the Inter-Church Committee, the Board of Christian Education of The United Church of Canada, the Church of England, the Catholic Bishops of Ontario, the Canadian Jewish Congress [although it opposed the current policy] and private individuals.\(^5^9\) The Commissioners must have been convinced

\(^5^7\) Ibid., 123-4.
\(^5^8\) Ibid., 125.
\(^5^9\) Ibid.
that the dissenters, "certain Presbyterian ministers, certain Baptist ministers, and some members of the Jewish faith", did not represent public opinion, for the Commission concluded:

. . .[e]vidence submitted to us has demonstrated that if our aims in education are to be achieved, religious education should be included as a subject of study in the proposed curriculum of the elementary schools. The present regulations relating to religious education in public schools seem to be eminently satisfactory.  

The recommendations of the Commission were the following:

(a) that religious exercises continue to be conducted and religious education continue to be a subject of instruction in public elementary schools;
(b) that the present regulations relating to religious exercises and religious education in public schools be continued;
(c) that in any revision of the guide books in religious education careful consideration be given to specific items raised by the Canadian Jewish Congress in Brief 46, Appendix 1;
(d) that consideration be given to the advisability of granting approval for the use of children's Bible stories containing such parts of the Scriptures as may be especially suitable for elementary school pupils;
(e) that the Department of Education seek the cooperation of The Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education in the preparation of a list of daily Scripture readings, based directly on the course of study for religious education, for use in the senior division of the elementary school;
(f) that provision be made in the programmes of junior colleges of education and in the elementary school option of the Ontario College of Education for instruction in methods of conducting religious exercises and of teaching religious education in public elementary schools.  

60 Ibid., 126.
61 Ibid.
This was to be the only time that the status quo regarding religious education was endorsed by a government commission or inquiry. The Commissioners had gone further than to endorse the religious education program for elementary schools. While cautioning the need for careful consideration to the Jewish concerns of misrepresentation of their faith, they suggested approval for the use of children's Bible stories (which would address the limitation about which the Hamilton and London Presbyterian Synod had been adamant). Methods of instruction in teaching the religious education should be provided to teachers by the College of Education. Further, the Commissioners recommended that the course in religious education be extended to secondary schools and junior colleges as the Inter-Church Committee had requested:

In our opinion, it is essential that students in the new secondary schools and in the first two years of junior college receive either instruction in religious education given by clergymen or instruction in ethics from members of the regular staff of the school.63

In formulating its conclusions, the Commission noted that few boards had asked formally for exemption, and that the few formal requests for exemption from 1945 to 1948 implied little objection to the program.64 The practice of abandoning formal instruction in religion grew. Although exact figures are unavailable, by the 1960s many boards had quietly let religious education classes lapse.

63 Ibid., 127.
64 Ibid.
7. Teachers and Students

In this section, the attitudes of teachers and students to the 1944 religious education program will be explored. Their opinions were not uniform.

In 1948, a questionnaire regarding the religious education program was sent to women elementary teachers in southern and eastern Ontario by the executive of Region 4 of the Federation of Women Teachers' Associations of Ontario. The results were presented in a memorandum, "Research in Religious Education, Region 4, Easter, 1949."\(^{65}\) Twenty-one percent of the addressees had replied. It is possible that those who took the time to reply placed more significance on the program than those who did not. The content of the Teachers' Guides was rated as "satisfactory" by 69% of the rural teachers who responded and 58% of the city teachers who responded.\(^{66}\) Suggestions for improvement of the Guides included:

[1] All Bible stories, please. Delete myths and fictitious stories in order that the children not be confused between truth and fiction.
[2] There is need for a great many stories--at least one for each week preferably two. (3) the need of teaching pictures to accompany text.\(^{67}\)

\(^{65}\)Federation of Women Teachers' Associations of Ontario, "Research in Religious Education, Region 4, Easter, 1949." [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].

\(^{66}\)Ibid., 1-2.

\(^{67}\)Ibid., 2.
The primary teachers wanted coloured pictures and maps to accompany the lessons.\textsuperscript{68} Their request that fictitious material be deleted reflected the concerns of the Association for Religious Liberty cited earlier. Although little information was received from grade five and six teachers, most of the respondees viewed the Teachers' Guides favourably. They, too, wanted more maps and pictures to accompany the lessons and more background information on such social customs, geography and history of ancient Palestine.\textsuperscript{69} The grade seven and grade eight teachers noted the lack of Guide Books and requested that, when provided, they should contain only stories based on the Bible, accompanied by illustrations, maps and background material.\textsuperscript{70}

When asked about difficulties, the teachers reported few:

Practically nil so far as giving Religious Instruction is concerned but teachers' work is sometimes made difficult by

1. lack of religious background in the home
2. In a few instances, the children have no Sunday School
3. Lack of interest in spiritual things.\textsuperscript{71}

While few teachers reported that the program presented difficulties, many thought it beneficial. In Ottawa, 52% of the responding teachers found it beneficial to the attitude of children toward school work, to each other, and to other races and denominations. The benefits of the program

\textsuperscript{68}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{69}Ibid., 3.
\textsuperscript{70}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{71}Ibid., 4.
compiled from the Ottawa teachers' responses included the following:

(1) releases tensions  
(2) creates proper attitudes  
(3) less dishonesty among pupils  
(4) higher morals as a result  
(5) children are more reliable, more considerate of others  
(6) Religious Education periods are most beneficial  
(7) Increases the sense [sic] of responsibility  
(8) children are learning that happiness consists of sharing with others.72

The women teachers reported that the comments from grade seven and grade eight children about the opening exercises and Bible readings were uniformly positive. The students' verbatim answers quoted in the teachers' research paper follow:

GRADE 7.  
"I do need the Opening Exercises because I have a grand feeling that stays with me all day".  
"They have helped me to understand that God is forever near me".  
"It helped me to forgive a girl".  
"It gives me assurance for the day".  
"God has helped me to see the other person's way and that I am not always right".

A new Canadian Canadian child whose A.D.P. card is marked "no religion" wrote:  
1. It made me believe in God  
2. It helped me to learn to pray  
3. It helped me that I have every day a nice "happy life".

Another child who according to time-table is in different classes each morning of the week says:  
"No, the Bible reading does not help me. In one class the teacher reads part of a chapter and then stops. I don't get the meaning of the Bible when it is read that way".

72 ibid., 5.
GRADE 8
(1) "They help me to forget myself and think of others."
(2) "They give me a feeling of safety and faith".
(3) "I get along better at school and at home".
(4) "They help me control my temper and get on better with others.
(5) "I was helping Mother wash - complaining - began to think how tired Mother was and of what Jesus would have done in a similar position."
(6) "They help me to know what kind of girl God wants me to be"
(7) "Made my girlfriend say "Hurlbut's Story of the Bible is the most interesting book I ever read."
(8) "They help me to be calm and gentle with other children".
(9) "They have made me realize that everyone no matter what colour or race or financial standing is the same in God's eye".
(10) "They help me get along in everyday life and help me get along with other people. They show me how much I have cinned [sic] -- "They help me feel that God is nearer than anyone else in the world".

The summary to the teachers' research report revealed the strong support of the Region 4 teachers for the existing program, their desire to teach it, their enthusiasm for voluntarily assuming a leadership role in formulating improvements to be considered by the educational authorities, and their expectation that teachers be familiar with the Scriptures. These teachers believed that their opinions represented the general opinion of public school teachers in the province. In their view, the major limitation was lack of concrete teaching materials. They offered to assist in any revision of the Teachers' Guides and supplementary Bible reading lists.

73 Ibid., 5.
74 Ibid.
75 Ibid., 6.
The teachers who replied to the survey may have been teaching the program with evangelical zeal. The students' comments which the teachers cited suggested various responses to the program—from attitudinal changes which influenced behaviour at home and at school, to purported religious conversion, to hyperbole.

Results of the survey were summarized in the memorandum as follows:

On the whole the information gathered in this report reveals (1) a "vote of confidence" in regard to the course as it is at present (2) is at once gratifying and challenging. Gratifying in that much excellent progress has been made in the comparatively short time (4 yrs.) in which Religious Education has been compulsory. Challenging because the enthusiastic promotion of this work does not yet seem to be general.

The Committee is more convinced than ever that an inspirational message is essential. Therefore your convenor will set aside every other claim to out-of-class hours until that is accomplished, in the hope of presenting it along with the pamphlet of Prayers for Little People to the Directors at their next meeting.

In concluding her report, the Provincial Convenor for Research in Religious Education, Eva Gordon, tapped the conservative sentiments of the post-war years with the following passage:

In our own province let us go forward with the conviction of one who said "No man can be wholly uneducated who really knows the Bible, nor can anyone be considered a truly educated man who is ignorant of it". Churchill has again challenged us "to move forward together in discharge of our mission and our duty, fearing God and nothing else." Is it not also a fitting message for the class-room?

76 Ibid., 6.
77 Ibid., 8.
This Churchillian prose was reminiscent of the imperialist and traditionalist sentiments of Premier George Drew to which Eva Gordon had added an evangelical tone.

In summary, it would appear from this research report that the attitudes of the teachers and the students canvassed were positive. Teaching the Bible was accepted as a normal classroom activity; while there were numerous suggestions for improving teaching materials, few negative comments about the program as such were recorded. Without the support of elementary teachers, most of whom were women, the program would have faltered sooner than it eventually did.

In contrast to the above, 67.7% of the male elementary public school teachers of Forest Hill, North York, and Weston wanted the program removed from the schools. The men teachers stated that there had been 'a general concern' among them over the question of religion in the schools. The Brief by the men teachers was submitted almost twenty years later than the information from the Region 4, F.W.T.A.O. It should be noted that Forest Hill, North York, and Weston were areas of minority settlement by this time. Those teachers who opposed the program echoed the continuing criticisms which had been made by the Jewish Congress and the Association for Religious Liberty. They included themes such

---

78"A Survey Report on Religious Education', A Brief Submitted by the Male Elementary Public School Teachers of Forest Hill, North York, and Weston to the Minister's Committee Investigating Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario", May, 1966. [The Ontario Jewish Archives]
79Ibid., 1.
as the lack of qualifications of teachers, the lack of time in the curriculum, possible intrusion on personal rights, the discriminatory nature of the regulations, the possibility of indoctrination, parental objections, the impossibility of a program set up by the Church being unbiased, and the fact that, in many areas, the regulations were being ignored. The fact that the questionnaire which had been distributed received a 95.8% return indicated not only the importance of this question but the validity of the survey. The most telling result was that only 7% of the teachers canvassed wanted to retain the 1944 program while 24% desired substantial change:

The two examples of surveys of teachers' opinions represent polarities. First, they are separated by almost two decades—enthusiasm for the program was stronger in its early years. Second, the survey taken by the women teachers represented views of a relatively homogenous population: the men teachers' survey represented views from an area of suburban Toronto which evidenced ethnic and religious diversity. In the context of wrangles about religion in the schools, teachers were more apt to desire that their board request exemption from the program or that the program be scrapped.

Educational bureaucrats had often favoured religious education in the schools, not only for its educational value,
but because of their own faith. At a meeting of teachers and clergy sponsored by the Ontario Educational Association in 1954, Dr. G. A. Wheable, Superintendent of Schools for the London Board of Education, spoke passionately in favour of religious education. His opening remark was that "The need for a stronger faith in God has never been more urgent and imperative than in this day". He not only commended the program, but advocated its extension. Drawing on a survey of 11,529 elementary pupils, he reported overwhelming acceptance of the religious education program. He claimed that there were no examples of 'disunity' ensuing from it. Dr. Wheable concluded his address with the following remarks:

... I am convinced that the course in Religious Instruction as given in our public schools is very worthwhile and can be conducted without violating the religious liberty or offending the religious beliefs of our pupils or their parents.

In a survey of Grade Twelve students conducted in 1957, opinions about religion were canvassed. With few exceptions, these students would have been exposed to the religious education program during their earlier years. The sample consisted of 1,100 students from schools in all parts of Ontario. Responses were grouped according to gender.

---

83Ibid., 3-4.
84Ibid., 5.
Replying to the statement, "Moral development of children in the prime responsibility of: the church, the home, the school", 88% of boys and 93.3% of girls chose the home. Only 6.4% of boys and 2.5% of girls chose the school, and 5.6% of boys and 4.2% of girls chose the church. The rationale of the Inter-Church Committee and the Churches that morals were a major concern of the cooperative efforts of school and church was gainsaid by these results.

A rationale of the proponents of the religious education program had been that it would be "a bulwark against Communism." Only 2.6% of boys and 1.5% of girls in the survey chose this statement as a major purpose of religion. The conclusion of the pollster was that "an insignificant proportion of both sexes believed the most important purpose of religion is to act as a bulwark against Communism".

When given the multiple choice statement, "Students should be taught: what beliefs are correct, nothing at all about beliefs, how to arrive at their own beliefs", the overwhelming majority (79.1% of boys and 84.7% of girls) chose the option, "how to arrive at their own beliefs". The religious education program, as it existed, tended to stress 'correct' beliefs. Independent thinking, after all, was antithetical to its catechetical purpose.

85Ibid., 27.
86Ibid., 28
87Ibid.
8. **Dissatisfaction and Reappraisal**

The pinnacle of cooperation among schools, the churches, and the government came in 1956 when religious education was made an option in high schools. Boards of Education could invite clergy to teach two half-hour classes per week in local high schools. However, only a few years later, a debate over the propriety of the religious education program emerged. In 1959 the Ethical Education Association was formed for the express purpose of opposing religion in the schools. During the 1950s Sunday School attendance, as a percentage of the population, began to decline. Post-war immigration had brought large numbers of people of different cultures and religions to Ontario, especially to the major cities. A Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools, under the chairmanship of J. Keiller Mackay, former Lieutenant-Governor, was struck in 1966 in answer to requests from boards of education in North York and Scarborough. The municipalities of these school boards contained significant numbers of immigrants and minorities. There had been organized resistance to the 1944 program in these areas.

In a submission to the North York Board of Education in 1961, the Canadian Jewish Congress reiterated its opposition to "a Protestant form of the Christian religion in the public
school system".\textsuperscript{59} Quoting the respected educationalist, Charles E. Phillips, the representatives of the Congress claimed that mandatory religious education in the schools, as instituted in 1944 in Ontario, was an historical anomaly in North America.\textsuperscript{90} The Congress posed the question that if religious education were optional even during times of Protestant hegemony, "how can such a curriculum be justified today in a context of much greater diversity and complexity?"\textsuperscript{91} Although the Congress did not object to the study of religion "as an objective factor in the learning process", it abjured "indoctrinating children in the particular tenets of a variety of Protestant Christianity".\textsuperscript{92}

In its closing paragraphs, the Congress pointed out the religious diversity of the municipality and pleaded that the school board apply for exemption from the religious education program:

The Township of North York is made up of a wide variety of religious and religio-ethnic groups: Seventh Day Adventists, Baptists, Unitarians, Roman Catholics, Jews, Eastern Orthodox, and a wide variety of Protestants each dedicated to its beliefs and each observing them in the freedom of this land. There is sufficient evidence of growing dissent and controversy arising from the presence of sectarian religious education in the schools, coming from pupils, parents, and teachers alike. This Township would make a tremendous step forward if it applied for exemption from teaching the prescribed course of sectarian religion in its schools. Such a step has ample precedent. Full provision exists

\textsuperscript{59}\textsuperscript{Meyer W. Gasner and Sydney M. Harris of the Canadian Jewish Congress (Central Region) to the North York Board of Education (1961). [Ontario Jewish Congress].}
\textsuperscript{90}\textsuperscript{Ibid.}
\textsuperscript{91}\textsuperscript{Ibid., 2.}
\textsuperscript{92}\textsuperscript{Ibid., 5.}
for it. Other boards throughout the province in areas widely divergent as to physical and demographic characteristics have asked for such exemption which is always granted without question.\footnote{Ibid., 7.}

Groups opposing the religious education program prior to 1959 represented the views of various faith groups which saw their rights curtailed by the program. Such were the Canadian Jewish Congress and the Association for Religious Liberty. But the Ethical Education Association was an inter-faith group dedicated to the preservation of the public school system free of sectarian influence. In 1961, the Association sponsored a public lecture by Dr. C. E. Phillips on "Religion and our Public Schools". Dr. Phillips' lecture was a learned address, the essence of which was that while religious history could be taught, but "beliefs cannot be taught as a public school subject".\footnote{C. E. Phillips, "Religion and our Public Schools". A lecture given under the auspices of the Ethical Education Association at the Royal Ontario Museum Theatre (March 22, 1961), 12. [University of Toronto Library].} Teachers were not to tell pupils "what [they] must believe".\footnote{Ibid.} Phillips concluded with a plea to keep the public schools inclusive and non-sectarian. In other words, the schools were to be entirely secular.

The latter point was not to be granted by the Christian Women's Council on Education, formed in 1959. The Council claimed to represent all Christian denominations and had as its aims:

---

\footnote{Ibid., 7.}
\footnote{C. E. Phillips, "Religion and our Public Schools". A lecture given under the auspices of the Ethical Education Association at the Royal Ontario Museum Theatre (March 22, 1961), 12. [University of Toronto Library].}
\footnote{Ibid.}
(1) To retain the teaching of the Bible in Public Schools.
(2) To help preserve the Christian heritage of Canada.
(3) To promote harmony and cooperation among people of different races and faiths. 96

The arguments of the Executive of the Council in favour of religion in the schools, were reminiscent of the 1930s. Opponents of religion in the schools were characterized as "those who are campaigning to paganize our schools". 97 Citing the regulations regarding Bible Study in the public schools, and claiming that the majority of parents desired it, the Council Executive castigated delinquent educators:

Principals and teachers who neglect Bible teaching, without legal exemption, are actually breaking the law in Ontario. We do not expect the teaching profession to set such an example to our youth. 98

To emphasize the danger of paganism, the Council Executive quoted Anglican Bishop F. H. Wilkinson of Toronto:

It is well to be reminded that what gave impetus to the concern for Religious Education in our schools was the demonstration of evil consequences of the Nazi pagan state upon the education of the youth of Germany. 99

Another argument from the 1930s, namely that Bible teaching was an antidote to juvenile delinquency, was buttressed by a quotation from the Anglican journal, The Canadian Churchman:

Our immature youth, who receive no restraining teaching, succumb to evil influence. Juvenile Court authorities point out the fact that fear of punishment is no deterrent to crime. If we are to prevent instead of

96 Executive Committee of The Christian Women's Council on Education, "Report on Religious Education in Public Schools" (1960), 1. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
97 Ibid., 4.
98 Ibid., 5.
punish delinquency, we must inspire our youth to be law-abiding and self-controlled. This is impossible without the inspiration and power that comes from the Bible, the source of our moral law.\textsuperscript{100}

In turning to objections raised by opponents of the program of religious education, the Executive of the Christian Women's Council on Education restated familiar arguments for retaining the program. Children who did not attend Sunday School must be reached. Parents who objected were allowed to excuse their children. Canada was "founded and pioneered by Christians" and "immigrants are constantly bringing new demands which can be democratically satisfied without disrupting the very foundation upon which the country was built".\textsuperscript{101} The Bible was an indispensable textbook of ethics.\textsuperscript{102}

In defense of the Teachers' Guides of the religious education program, the Executive characterized criticisms in the press as taken out of context, or based on reports of children which were "not necessarily accurate".\textsuperscript{103} Whatever shortcomings the Guide Books had, they were soon to be revised, "and the next edition of these books will show that all necessary revisions have been made".\textsuperscript{104}

The Executive of the Christian Women's Council on Education reiterated much of the position of the churches and

\textsuperscript{101}\textit{Ibid.}, 9-10.
\textsuperscript{102}\textit{Ibid.}, 11.
\textsuperscript{103}\textit{Ibid.}, 12.
\textsuperscript{104}\textit{Ibid.}
the Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education in deploring any secularization of the schools. ¹⁰⁵

Should the schools be secular? This was the issue as understood by all sides of the religious education question. When the Jewish Community and the Ethical Education Association began to lobby for secularization, the major churches, and especially the Inter-Church Committee, organized resistance. The government was aware of the debate but did not act to adjudicate it immediately.

In an address to the Clericus of York Mills on April 25, 1961, Bishop H. R. Hunt of the Anglican Diocese of Toronto discussed the religious education controversy at length. ¹⁰⁶ Bishop Hunt was to become a spokesman for the Anglican Church on religious education in the schools. Although partisan, the Bishop's comments revealed a clear grasp of the positions of the parties in conflict. He conceded that the Jewish Community was "unanimous in opposition to the teaching of religious education in the public schools". ¹⁰⁷ He identified the Ethical Education Association, whose President "happens to be Unitarian" ¹⁰⁸, and the Jewish Congress as the major opponents of religious education in the schools. Reminding his hearers that religious education had been a "hot issue in

¹⁰⁵Ibid., 13.
¹⁰⁷Ibid., 1.
¹⁰⁸Ibid.
the 1945 election" 99, he warned that history might be revisited:

It may come to this again. The people of Ontario are annoyed. Opponents are trying to get the public behind them. We agree that revision is necessary, but we do want Bible instruction of some kind in the schools.110

Bishop Hunt pointed out that although the Jewish Congress desired the discontinuation of the religious education program, it did not object to opening exercises, which included Bible reading and the Lord's Prayer. The Ethical Education Association wanted all overtly religious activity dropped.111

After the Bishop's speech, the Clericus of York Mills committed itself to opposing the activities of the Jewish Congress and the Ethical Education Association by presenting a motion to the North York Board of Education supporting religious education in the schools. Further, it was reported to the Clericus that the Joint Executives of the Ministerial Associations of the Township of North York intended to encourage a letter-writing campaign, legal action, and the mailing of literature to every household in North York in aid of retaining religious education in the schools.112

The campaign to discontinue religious education in the schools of North York had failed. Similar battles over the issue were waged in Etobicoke and Scarborough, but were also

99 Ibid.
100 Ibid., 2.
110 Ibid., 2.
111 Ibid., 3-5.
without immediate result. However, the issue had been raised and would continue to be a public controversy throughout the 1960s.

A letter to the clergy from the Anglican Bishop of Toronto, F. H. Wilkinson, in March 1961 is a statement of the issue of religion in the schools from the proponents' point of view. It was published in the heat of the conflict with the Canadian Jewish Congress and the Ethical Education Association. The text, without attachments and enclosures, is reproduced in full in Appendix F.

After reviewing the history of the controversy over religious education in the schools, Bishop Wilkinson stressed that those who opposed the 1944 regulations, particularly in Metropolitan Toronto, were a vocal and active minority. However, they had been able to seize media attention. He noted that they intended to present a motion to the Ontario Federation of Home and School Associations to delete the word Christian from the Public Schools Act. Bishop Wilkinson deplored this attempt to remove Christianity from schools while secularizing them. He maintained that the spiritual and moral values of the nation would be damaged. The clergy were asked to bring the matter to the attention of their parishioners so that they might be fully informed. The clergy were advised to avoid the media and to encourage the laity to

---

be present at any meeting which might be associated with the question of religion in the public schools. 114

Realizing that the matter needed to be studied further, Bishop Wilkinson had established a Committee on Religious Education in the Schools. In 1962, the Committee had reached the following conclusions:

The Churches must take the lead in urging upon the Province a more realistic attitude towards the whole question of religious education. The rights of parties to both views of education are to be protected. We feel that the time has come to establish a Royal Commission or some similar body to deal with the whole situation and to take it out of public dog-fighting and letters to the press. 115

As with the North York and Scarborough Boards of Education, the Bishop's Committee was looking for government arbitration of what had become a heated controversy over religion in the schools.

The issue became the subject of an hour-long television documentary, "Religion in the Schools", presented on January 6, 1963 on the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation network. 116 The program was hosted by J. Frank Willis. Major church and educational authorities were interviewed individually and in groups on the questions of the funding of separate schools and on religion in the schools generally.

---

114 Ibid.
115 The Anglican Church of Canada, Diocese of Toronto, "Bishop's Committee on Religious Education in Schools" (February, 1962), 2. [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
116 "Religion in the Schools," Close-Up (January 6, 1963), Canadian Broadcasting Corporation. [Print Nos. 3894 and 3895, National Archives of Canada].
Bishop Emmett Carter of the Roman Catholic Church explained that the public schools were "basically secular". Catholic children, therefore, needed to be educated in their own publicly-funded schools in order to obtain a religious education.

Dr. C. E. Phillips, the noted educator and champion of non-sectarian public education, gave a short history of the question of religion in the schools. He stated that the elementary schools in Ontario were Protestant rather than truly non-sectarian. He believed that the question of whether religion should be taught in the public schools should be addressed by the government.

All of the representatives of the Protestant churches were opposed to extension of funding to the Roman Catholic high schools, yet they defended the retention of Protestant teaching in the public schools. Bishop Hunt of the Anglican Church claimed that the teaching in the public schools was not specifically Protestant, but rather Christian and non-sectarian! The United Church spokesman, Dr. Long, claimed that the religious education program stressed what Christians held in common and reflected the current ecumenical theology of the major churches.

Douglas Fisher, Member of Parliament, stated that parents wanted values--not theology--taught in the schools. He considered most public school students to be religiously illiterate. The religious education program was a failure. The society-at-large, he believed, considered religion in the
schools to be irrelevant. Although the schools originally had been based on the religious conception of life, they had become secular. Society itself was tending to become secular in the 1960s. Secularists, claimed Fisher, were afraid of programs which exacerbated religious divisions or infringed the rights of minorities. Religious belief should not be a concern of the state. Fisher believed that the religious education program was "turning children off".

A panel of expert academics consisting of Dr. Lewis Beattie, Professor Leslie Dewart, and Professor John Seeley could reach no consensus. Dr. Beattie had helped frame the 1944 regulations on religious education in the schools. He felt that schools should pass on tradition, which in the case of Ontario, was Christian tradition. He believed that people were naturally religious, that their curiosity should be served by a study of religion without sectarian doctrines being imposed, and that this could be accomplished through the study of religious literature in the English program. Dr. Beattie felt, however, that the atmosphere of the school should reflect Christian values.

Dr. Dewart, a Roman Catholic academic, insisted, as did Bishop Carter, that Catholicism was a "whole way of life" and required its own system of education. A school was not 'objective', but rather should be concerned with values. In order to maintain Catholic values, Catholic schools were necessary.
Professor Seeley, a secularist, wanted religious education removed from the schools on the grounds that religious teaching was indoctrination. However, the academic study of religion was to be allowed. No religious doctrine should be taught under state auspices because of the "danger of totalitarianism". The scientific study of religion, such as was done in universities, however, could allow students to "break from their parochialisms".  

Douglas Fisher had the last word. Because of the wide range of views within the religious community, he felt that the question of religion in the schools was a difficult issue to resolve.  

What is of particular interest about this CBC television program is that secularist opinions were stated and were acknowledged also by the parties involved. The Protestant church officials appeared to be somewhat out of touch with both the Roman Catholic and secularist positions. Their statements about religion in the schools reflected earlier positions which were not in tune with the social realities of the 1960s.  

The churches had promoted, with conspicuous success, a program of religion in the schools from the 1930s to the 1950s. By the 1960s they were forced to defend their hegemony. Their rearguard action rested on familiar arguments, the essence of which was that Christian  

117Ibid.
instruction in the schools contributed to the character of children. Dr. Lewis Beattie, in an official statement of the Board of Christian Education of the United Church, stated that "Education is incomplete without religion", and that there should be in the curriculum "an emphasis on the Hebraic-Christian heritage as a source of the religious and cultural motive for character." However, a paper produced by the General Board of Religious Education of the Anglican Church on January 3, 1964 indicated that the Church must recognize its position realistically:

The claim that the Church should control society has in the twentieth century been made quite untenable both by the rise of secularism and the divisions of Christendom. Those who persist in pressing such a claim must find themselves ultimately in one of two positions. Either they continue to fight a defensive rearguard action on behalf of a dying, if not defunct, tradition of ecclesiastical control or they withdraw from a contaminated society and set up a dream world of their own in separate and private schools. However, a paper produced by the General Board of Religious Education of the Anglican Church on January 3, 1964 indicated that the Church must recognize its position realistically:

The claim that the Church should control society has in the twentieth century been made quite untenable both by the rise of secularism and the divisions of Christendom. Those who persist in pressing such a claim must find themselves ultimately in one of two positions. Either they continue to fight a defensive rearguard action on behalf of a dying, if not defunct, tradition of ecclesiastical control or they withdraw from a contaminated society and set up a dream world of their own in separate and private schools. However, a paper produced by the General Board of Religious Education of the Anglican Church on January 3, 1964 indicated that the Church must recognize its position realistically:

The recognition that society had become increasingly secular alarmed many Christians who supported religion in the schools, while others accepted this trend as fact. Thus, the Christian Women's Council on Education continued to warn about the dangers of secularism, while Christian academics spoke of a post-Christian society. The privileged position of the Protestant churches in Ontario was in doubt by the

---

118 Dr. Lewis Beattie, Secretary of the Board of Christian Education, The United Church of Canada, "The Relation of Religion and Education" (1964), 3. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].

119 General Board of Religious Education of the Anglican Church of Canada, "Religion and Public Education in Ontario" (January 3, 1964). [General Board of Religious Education, Box 30, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
mid-1960s. This was true particularly with regard to Protestant teaching in the schools.

After calls for a study of religious education in the schools by opponents and supporters of the program, on January 27, 1966 the government appointed a special committee to examine religious education in the public schools of Ontario. Before presenting its report, frequently referred to as the Mackay Report, the Committee heard representations from 141 groups or individuals. The churches were heavily represented, and there were briefs from the Jewish community and secular groups, such as the Canadian Civil Liberties Association.

The Canadian Jewish Congress presented an extensive Brief which opposed the program of religious education in the schools. The revisions to the Teachers' Guides, made in the early 1960s, were unsatisfactory to the Jewish community. Even though some disparaging views of Judaism had been deleted, there remained "clear bias and distortion". Specific examples of bias against Judaism were detailed in an Appendix. In the Grade Six text, for example, the phrase, "the Jewish rulers bent on murder", had been changed to "the rulers, bent on revenge". The Congress claimed that the "whole spirit of the passage" was unchanged, in that the Jewish authorities were still portrayed as "a group of evil

---

120 "Brief of the Canadian Jewish Congress, Central Division, to the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario" (February 10, 1967), 27. [Archives of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education]
121 Ibid., Appendix C, A7.
and diabolical persons . . . plotting and scheming to get Jesus 'into their clutches', 'trap Him' and 'kill Him'."  

Aside from references to the texts which it found upsetting, the Congress claimed that Canadians-at-large did not support religion in the schools. In a Gallup Poll of 1957, it appeared that a majority of members of the major Protestant Churches actually opposed religious teaching in the schools. In addition to arguments about the harm the program caused to minority children and parents, the Jewish position rested on the contention that "any instruction in doctrinal religion has no place in the public schools".

In at least one instance, dissatisfaction with the religious education program centred on the activities of fundamentalist teachers belonging to a group known as the Bible Club Movement. A group of parents in the Township of Gosfield South in Essex County were upset with the literalistic and evangelistic teachings of the Bible Club teachers. With the help of the Ethical Education Association, the parents petitioned the Gosfield South School Board to redress their grievances. The school board denied the petition "until such time as the Minister of Education for Ontario, in his wisdom, makes changes [in the

\[122\] Ibid., Appendix C, A7.  
\[123\] Ibid., 41-42.  
\[124\] Ibid., vi  
\[125\] A Delegation of Parents from the Township of Gosfield South to the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario, Brief No. 85 (1966), 8. [Archives of Ontario]
Neither the validity nor the propriety of the parents' complaints were upheld. The Ethical Education Association presented a brief to the Board on April 19, 1966 asking the Board to apply for exemption from the religious education program. This was denied, but slight changes were made to the program, and parents were polled as to whether or not they supported a program of religious education at school.¹²⁷

The Ethical Education Association suggested to the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools that there were "similar situations in other jurisdictions", but that they could not be publicized due to the reluctance of the parents concerned to indulge in public controversy".¹²⁸ Finally, the Association asked for the religious education program to be abandoned.

The Special Committee on Religious Education in the Schools claimed to have given careful consideration to all of the material presented to it during its three-year period of deliberation, and to have been guided by the principle that "in a democratic society every adult, and every young person, has the right to choose freely the spiritual and moral values he wishes, or, indeed, to reject them".¹²⁹ The Committee

¹²⁶ Ethical Education Association to the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario, Brief No. 57 (1966), 6.
¹²⁷ A Delegation of Parents. . . , 9.
¹²⁸ Ibid., 7.
noted also that "our society has been altering greatly in recent decades, and is continuing to change rapidly".\textsuperscript{130} There was to be no endorsement of the status quo as there had been by the Royal Commission on Education Report of 1950. In fact, the Committee concluded that the religious education program, as it existed, consisted of indoctrination and should be abandoned.\textsuperscript{131} In its appraisal of the program, the Committee characterized the content as "definitely Christian and Protestant"; therefore, it was "a vehicle leading to religious commitment rather than true education".\textsuperscript{132} While the Committee recognized that a "general knowledge of religion [was] necessary to form a well-educated person, this, however, [did] not mean that religious indoctrination should take place in the public schools".\textsuperscript{133} The Committee had no objection to indoctrination as a normal function of churches, synagogues and homes.\textsuperscript{134} The conclusions of the Committee were opposed to the aims of the Inter-Church Committee.

In its Brief to the Committee on Religious Education, the Inter-Church Committee on Public Education, as it had been renamed, had continued not only to support, but to suggest improvements for religious education in the schools. A concession was made that "there will be suitable times and

\textsuperscript{130}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{131}Ibid., 93.
\textsuperscript{132}Ibid., 21.
\textsuperscript{133}Ibid., 23.
\textsuperscript{134}Ibid., 25.
occasions when some other of the resources of the world religions would be included" in religious instruction, but the Christian core of the program would remain.  

The churches were dismayed that the Mackay Report had ignored their supplications. The Provincial Board of Religious Education of the Anglican Church in Ontario declared the Mackay Report to be unsatisfactory:

We will not stand passively by and allow the religious orientation of our public education system to be overthrown through the skillful opposition of a vocal minority, blind to the true dimensions of religion and education.

The Conservative government did not follow the recommendation of the Committee on Religious Education to abandon the program of religious education because it did not want to alienate conservatively-minded Ontarians for the sake of appeasing dissidents. However, the emphasis on moral values education recommended by the Committee as a replacement for Bible study gradually supplanted the teaching of religion. There remained to Boards of Education the legal option to continue to teach the Christian Bible in their schools. In some areas, such teaching continued through the 1980s. But the churches were unable to maintain the province-wide program. The reason that boards began to abandon the program in greater numbers even without permission was because it was totally unsuited to the times.

 bibliography:

135 Ibid., 25.
The pendulum in education had swung towards permissiveness. \(^{37}\)
The religion program had been formed in an era of traditionalism, patriotism, and imperialism. It had become obsolete. Moreover, all of the complaints about the program -- indoctrination, psychological harm to minorities, disunity, and undue influence on the part of the churches -- had been validated by the Committee on Religious Education. \(^{38}\)

9. Summary

The religious education program in the public schools was enthusiastically promoted by the Protestant Churches which had pressed for its establishment. There was evidence of support from teachers and the public. Although criticism of the Teachers' Guides arose immediately from a vocal few, and objections from the Jewish Community were ongoing, serious threats did not emerge until the late 1950s. In fact, in 1950, the Royal Commission on Education had recommended a continuance of the program. The Churches and the Inter-Church Committee characterized the program as Christian, but non-sectarian. Opponents called it a course in Protestant indoctrination. Aware of considerable controversy over the program, especially in religiously-diverse municipalities, the provincial government appointed a special committee to review the question of religion in the

public schools in 1966. The Churches were shocked by the conclusion of the Committee that the program consisted of indoctrination and must be scrapped.

During the twenty years following World War II, Ontario society had become more diverse due to immigration. The Churches' privileged position in society had come into question. Secularist opinions had grown and the danger of secularism was noted by the Churches. In the 1970s and the 1980s, the Churches continued to lose their prestige and influence. Even though the provincial government did not legislate an end to religious education in the schools after the publication of the 1969 Mackay Report, enthusiasm for the program waned dramatically. The Protestant Churches had begun to fight a rearguard action only twenty years after the Drew government's victory in the field of religious education. The Mackay Report was a defeat--the full implications of which were not to be clear until the 1980s.
CHAPTER VI

THE SECULAR PUBLIC SCHOOL

1. The Churches and the Mackay Report

The Churches were less than pleased that the Mackay Report had recommended the incidental teaching of religion rather than a definite program in the schools. The proposal that religions other than Christianity should be part of the curriculum was more readily granted.

The United Church's Board of Christian Education accepted the thrust of the Mackay Report. It affirmed that religion in public education must not be sectarian, but "must be religion defined on an extensively broad inter-faith basis". It accepted that curricula were not to be developed by the churches but by the Department of Education, and that classes were not to be taught by clergy but by "highly-qualified public school teachers". Any further involvement by the United Church with public school religion would include its work on the Ecumenical Study Commission on Religious Education. Thus the United Church was not committed to continuing the rather intimate connection between the churches and the actual program of religious

---

1 The United Church of Canada Year Book, Vol. II (Toronto: United Church of Canada, 1970), 128. [Archives of the United Church of Canada].
2 Ibid.
education begun in the schools in 1944, but it did want some study of religion in the schools.

The Hamilton Conference of The United Church responded at length to the Mackay Report. The full text is included as Appendix G. Although the Conference was critical of some aspects of the Mackay Report, it agreed that the present course of studies should be dropped because it was divisive. The Hamilton Conference Colloquium wanted a substantial, rather than an incidental program, of religious instruction. Although the Colloquium could envisage a study of non-Christian beliefs, it wanted the major emphasis placed upon Judaeo-Christian beliefs. It saw the Mackay Report as a basis for experimentation in moral values and religious education at the local level. The Colloquium accepted that the Church was only one agent among many in the field of education and that clergy would have no special privileges in the schools. The automatic rights of clergy to visit and to instruct in religion would be abolished. The Colloquium concluded its report to the Hamilton Conference of the United Church with the following summary statements:

We agree with the proposed policy of dropping the present course of studies for the reasons stated in the Committee's report.

We commend the Committee for its recommendation that the legislation pertaining to school visitors . . . be repealed. We support the elimination of the privileged position of the clergy, and recommend that clergy assume appropriate responsibilities on the same basis as other resource persons in the community when invited by school authorities.
We agree with all other recommendations of the report, and we wish to commend the Committee for its recommendations to remove some of the factors dividing our society on sectarian grounds.3

The Board of Religious Education of the Anglican Ecclesiastical Province of Ontario was not so charitable. While accepting the need for revision, it deplored the trend toward de-emphasizing religion in the schools. It formulated three recommendations:

Recommendation 1: a revised, dynamic program
Ontario Anglicans recommend that religious education in the public schools be continued—with a revised program and a revitalized approach. . . .

Recommendation 2: more status as a subject
We also recommend that immediate steps be taken to make religious education in the schools as significant and up-to-date a subject as other disciplines. . . .

Recommendation 3: courses in world religions
We urge that the proposed Grade 11 and 12 courses in world religions be introduced soon, and be taught by persons qualified in both religion and theology.4

The Board was dissatisfied with the Mackay Report because its proposals would diminish the role of religion in the education of public school children:

The Mackay Report we challenge on two main grounds: its unsatisfactory view of both religion and education. If true education involves the development of the whole person, it should include a significant encounter with the religious dimension of life—with its spiritual insights and moral ideals, its impulse to conviction and fellowship and service. Some people reject these qualities. Others are indifferent. But is there any doubt that the great majority of the citizens of Ontaríó

---

value the religious dimension of life and wish to see it adequately presented in our public schools?

We will not stand passively by and allow the religious orientation of our public education system to be overthrown through the skilful opposition of a vocal minority, blind to the true dimensions of religion and education.\(^5\)

There is no doubt that the majority of Ontarians to which the Board of Religious Education referred were Anglo-Protestants like themselves.

The Anglicans wanted a revised program of religious and moral education based on "crucial life-issues" which were to be "illuminated by the insights of religion".\(^5\) Religious education would be a definite subject taught by properly-prepared teachers. The Anglicans thought that the majority of Ontario citizens would wish to see such a program. They "would not stand passively by and allow the religious orientation of our public education system to be overthrown through the skilful opposition of a vocal minority".\(^7\) The Anglicans assumed that, because the majority of the population was Christian, Christianity should be prominent in the schools. Their hopes were to be disappointed.

The Provincial Synod of the Anglican Church criticized the Mackay Report. It approved the emphasis on moral values education, but it lamented a perceived diminution of the role of religion in determining values:

\(^6\)Ibid.
\(^7\)Ibid.
Moral development turns out to be the main concern of the Mackay Report. We commend their emphasis on increasing moral sensitivity and encouraging "moral reasoning". We appreciate the insights presented from the writings of Lawrence Kohlberg and other developmental psychologists.

But the Mackay Committee are [sic] unrealistic in looking so completely to reason to produce moral decisions. Christian experience shows that the best moral reasoning is undergirded by objective standards--the religious values found in the Biblical revelation. In the words of the Diocese of Toronto's brief,

we question whether moral education in terms of abstract reasoning will be sufficient to achieve the desired goal of moral maturity. Kohlberg's definition is too simplistic in its assumption about human nature.5

The Presbyterian Board of Christian Education had deputized a scholar to present its Brief to the Mackay Committee. Michel Despland characterized his Committee on Church and Public Education as a "special interest group thinking about schools".9 Despland accepted secularization completely. He argued that the churches also must do so, and challenged Christians to accept the new society with its free exchange of ideas. The power of majority status must not be exploited; "power politics" was an unseemly activity for "communicators of the Christian Gospel".10

Despland recommended a religious studies approach--the academic study of religion with no one religious tradition as normative. In a prophetic way, he insisted on teaching about

8Ibid., 60.
9Michel Despland, "A Rationale for Religious Studies in the Public Schools", Brief No. 106 to the Special Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of the Province of Ontario (1968), 1. [Archives of Ontario].
10Ibid.
religion, rather than teaching a religion as had been done since 1944. The program he advocated would be "a course designed to enable students to examine religious traditions and the religious values which have been conveyed to them by their families, churches, and synagogues, in an atmosphere of academic integrity and knowledge". The church should contribute to an open-ended inquiry into religion which was "not directly useful to the purposes of the church". It should contribute to, not catechize in, the schools.

The Brief submitted on behalf of the Presbyterians was the most forward-looking of those presented by the churches. The church was not to further its own ends through religion in the schools, but to promote unselfishly the welfare of a secular enterprise.

The Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec had not submitted a Brief to the Mackay Committee. However, it had adopted a position which supported religious education in the schools and continued to allow freedom of conscience. While stressing the separation of church and state, the Baptists affirmed that religion had a place in the life of the citizenry and the schools. They reaffirmed their opposition to secularization in the schools and their support of the religious education program. The Baptist statement, included in full as Appendix H, concluded with the following resolution:

\[^{11}\text{Ibid.}, 4.\]
\[^{12}\text{Ibid.}\]
we recognize the fact that each person within our Churches must act according to his own conscience and his own sense of duty to God and to our Province even as the laws regarding 'religious education in the schools' recognize that there will be those pupils who do not participate in any religious studies or any exercise of devotion objected to by his parents or guardians.\(^3\)

The churches accepted that the exclusive position of Christianity in the curriculum could not endure; other religions were to be included in the course of studies. They preferred a definite program of, or about, religion rather than an incidental approach to the topic. However, the denominations had responded in different ways to the prospect of abandoning the 1944 religious education program. The United and the Presbyterian Churches had been more accepting of secularization than the Anglican and Baptist Convention Churches.

2. The Christian Religion and Moral Education

The Ecumenical Study Commission on Religious Education was formed in 1969 to deal with the implications of the Mackay Report. Its task was to represent the major denominations in the matter of religious education in the schools. It was established jointly by the Protestant and Roman Catholic Churches and included representatives from the United, Lutheran, Baptist, Anglican, Presbyterian and Roman

\(^3\)Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec Year Book, 1964-65 (Toronto: Baptist Church House, 1965), 50-51.
Catholic Churches. In its Brief to the Minister of Education in 1970, the Commission recognized that, in a pluralistic society, it would be inappropriate to teach only Christianity in the schools, yet some treatment of the Christian religion as a part of Canada's heritage seemed to be required in order to understand Canadian society. The other major religions basic to this understanding were seen to be Judaism and secular humanism. The Commission proposed a "course in Religion, rather than one particular religion, namely, Christianity. Secondly, it would be taught by certified specialists in religious studies on the regular full-time staff of the school . . . ." The type of program proposed by the Commission "would be stronger and more vigorous than the amorphous Religious Information Programme advocated by the Keiller Mackay Report."

Returning to the theme which the churches had once advocated as the rationale for religious education in the schools, the Commission noted the intimate connection between morality and religion:

Ontarians seem to be unanimous in desiring their children to be instructed in "values", but values are never disembodied, and are much more likely to be

---

14 These churches accounted for over eighty percent of the church population of the province. James M. Houston, "Moral Values Education", *Crux*, 18, 2, (1982), 8.
15 The Ecumenical Study Commission, "A Brief Concerning Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario" (1970), 5-6. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 30, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
16 Ibid., 6.
17 Ibid., 7.
18 Ibid., 8.
imparted when embedded, as they have been throughout human history, in religion.¹⁹

The Ecumenical Study Commission was alarmed by the trend in educational circles to consider moral values education apart from religion. When the Minister of Education, the Honourable Thomas L. Wells, in a speech in 1974, advocated a moral education program without a religious base for the schools, the Commissioners declared themselves to be "unsettled", because they felt that religion and morality were intimately connected.²⁰ However, they were encouraged that the door was left open for religion by Mr. Wells' comment that "perhaps we need to consider new ways of accommodating some form of religious education for those who wish it, as well as moral education."²¹ The Commission was concerned that if religion were to be excluded effectively from the schools, then the philosophy of secular humanism would replace it.²²

In separating the teaching of moral values from religion, the Ministry of Education was pursuing a policy designed to avoid sectarian controversies over the teaching of religion in the schools. Everyone could agree on the importance of moral education. The government's relative

¹⁹Ibid., 8.
²⁰The Ecumenical Study Commission on Religious Education, "Moral and Religious Education" (Toronto, 1974), 9. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 30, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].
²¹Ibid.
²²Ibid.
conflict. The Ecumenical Study Commission was apprehensive about the official shift to values education:

What is bothering us is that religious education may become the neglected step-child of Ontario education, whereas we would like to see the same kind of investigation and research done in Ontario on religious education as was done on moral education.23

Although moral education apart from religion is not the subject of the present inquiry, the fact that it came to overshadow religious education in the schools must be stated. Based on Lawrence Kohlberg's theory of moral development24, promoted in Ontario by Clive Beck of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, the notion that children could arrive at moral judgements by reason alone, apart from religious revelation, became acceptable to educators. Kohlberg's system was based on a theory of six stages of moral development, which ranged from total self-concern to principled behaviour founded on a concern for universal justice. Discussion of 'moral dilemmas' was integrated into the regular curriculum. How the students resolved a dilemma would reveal a greater or lesser ability to reason morally. The teachers were not to impose their own religiously-based beliefs.

From the point of view of the Commission, moral values education was a good thing, but somewhat limited by its reliance on "reasoning" alone. If reasoning meant merely

23Ibid., 10.
"the cognitive functioning of the mind", then it missed the wider sense of being "in relation to ultimate ends". The Commission challenged Dr. Beck and other moral values educators to define 'reason' and 'the reasoning process'.

The members of the Commission would not support a program of moral education devoid of religious content. They believed:

a) moral education divested of any rootage in religion is exceedingly hard to achieve effectively
b) Religion is a subject worthy of study in its own right.

The Churches represented by the Ecumenical Study Commission were convinced that "a public education programme which bans Religion is gravely defective". The inclusion of a World Religions option for Secondary Schools in 1971, for example, was welcome, but did not "exhaust the meaning of religion in education". While attempts to clarify and improve the ability of students to reason morally were laudable, there were dimensions of life which transcended moral education and should be included in the curriculum:

In short, religion as well as morality is a function of human life so intimately meshed with the human spirit and its cultures that the aims of Ontario Education so often summarized as for the whole child cannot be achieved without its inclusion as a respected discipline.

---

26 Ibid., 16.
29 Ibid., 17-18.
In the opinion of the Commission, moral values education was not an adequate substitute for religion; religion had educative value in its own right.

The divorce of moral education and religion was significant in several ways. If moral education could proceed without a religious base, then the often-stated argument of the churches that morals required roots in Christian teaching was gainsaid. If reason alone could lead humans to discover universal principles of morality, then revelation was not necessarily required. Revelation, however, is a critical component of Christian theology:

In Christian theology the word [revelation] is used both of the corpus of truth about Himself which God discloses to us and the process by which His communication of it takes place. Traditional theology has tended to conceive of revelation in the latter sense as taking place through propositions; but there has been an increasing tendency among many theologians to insist that Divine revelation reaches us largely, and even primarily, through God's activity . . . rather than in propositional statements. Since it is commonly held that there are certain truths about God which can be learnt through man's natural endowments . . . while others . . . are not knowable except by faith, Christian philosophers have often held that a sharp distinction must be drawn between "truths of reason" and "truths of revelation" . . . . Christians of the Protestant tradition hold that all revelation is sufficiently contained in Scripture; Catholics on the other hand commonly maintain that part of it is also found in the unwritten truths of the Church.30

Three commonly-accepted bases for Christian doctrine on faith and morals are Scripture, tradition, and reason.31

---

Protestants give primacy to Scripture. Reason of itself is insufficient as a means of finding universal truth. Christians who are unwilling to accept reason alone as a means of finding truth often place great emphasis on Scripture, and especially on such revelations as the Ten Commandments and the teachings of Jesus. They want these taught as unvarying and absolute truths. Where the public schools no longer included this teaching in the curriculum, fundamentalist Christians were perturbed by the prospect of the secular humanism, which they detested, replacing it. Some began to lobby the government for a return to Christian teaching in the public schools. Private Christian schools became another option for them.

Mainstream Christianity, represented by the Ecumenical Study Commission, did not recoil from the moral education movement. However, it insisted that a person not educated in religion could understand neither modern society nor the past. The Commission deplored the lack of studies in religion in the schools and continued to press the government for its inclusion in the curriculum.

As a plea for the inclusion of the study of religion in the curriculum, the Ecumenical Study Commission published a series of articles under the title Religious Education Belongs in the Public Schools. James Perkin's article

---

33 Ecumenical Study Commission, Religious Education Belongs in the Public Schools (Toronto, 1985).
considered the question of whether religious education and public education were compatible. He did not see humanism as necessarily secular. There could be a Christian humanism. In Perkin's view, humanistic learning could be used to understand Western culture, even Christianity. In the pluralistic school system, students studied various religious and moral codes in the process of working out their personal values. Values education had replaced moral teaching based on Christianity. Perkin recognized that for evangelical Christians, for whom there was no salvation outside the Christian faith, there seemed to be no real alternative but private schools.

Priestly wrote that values education, for all its social-scientific basis, was "historically unaware" and had "little regard for the past." The answers of the past need not be overlooked just because the student was to arrive at his or her own values. Priestly believed that the problem with moral values education was its relativism. It was based entirely on reason, and ignored, or never came to grips with, the claims of revelation. In the schools, the relationship

---

34 James Perkin, "Religious Education and Public Education: Are They Compatible?", in Ecumenical Study Commission, 1-6.
35 Ibid., 3.
36 Ibid., 5.
37 Ibid., 6.
38 Ibid., 4.
between religious education and values education was ambivalent.  

The Ecumenical Study Commission believed that the study of religion had worth in its own right. It was valuable as a basis for moral judgment, but it was much more than that.

Tom Malcolm and Harry Fernhout\textsuperscript{41} of the Curriculum Development Centre critiqued the attempt of the Mackay Report to separate religion from morality in education. They mirrored the comments of the Ecumenical Study Commission that "moral education is a religious issue in spite of current attempts to separate the two".\textsuperscript{42} The Ecumenical Study Commission, according to Malcolm, saw religion as an "integral part of all teaching which interprets the meaning of life or its depth values".\textsuperscript{43} Therefore, religion was not separate from moral values education. Malcolm's own conviction was that every educational issue was a religious issue.

Harry Fernhout,\textsuperscript{44} in his article "Education versus Indoctrination: Religious Education in Ontario's Public

\textsuperscript{40}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{41}Tom Malcolm and Harry Fernhout, \textit{Education and Public Purpose: Moral and Religious Education in Ontario} (Toronto, Curriculum Development Centre, 1979).
\textsuperscript{42}Ibid., 36.
\textsuperscript{43}The Ecumenical Study Commission, \textit{Religion in Our Schools: An Ecumenical Reaction to the Keiller Mackay Report} (Toronto: n.d.), 12.
\textsuperscript{44}Harry Fernhout, "Education versus Indoctrination: Religious Education in Ontario's Schools", T. Malcolm and H. Fernhout, \textit{Education and the Public Purpose: Moral and Religious Education in Ontario} (Toronto: Currim Development Centre, 1979).
Schools" stated that religion and morals had become separated in the increasingly secular society in Ontario:

In previous times it would have been impossible to consider moral education apart from religion: religion was understood as providing the context for a code of moral conduct. In Ontario's secularizing society, however, a separate consideration of religion and morals became not only possible, but necessary. 

Malcolm and Fernhout advocated Christian schools, which would retain Christian teachings as an alternative to the bifurcation of Christian beliefs and moral values, within the public school system. They believed that the moral values approach was unfair to religion and favoured secularism.

James M. Houston, Chancellor of Regent College, a conservative theological institution, was highly critical of the values education movement. He claimed that moral values education was

a deliberate attempt to build up the character of 'Joe Citizen' with a morality that is without religion. Behind it lies the brave effort, unique perhaps in human history, to build a whole civilization on secularism, without any religious foundation, whether pagan or Christian, Jewish or Moslem, Buddhist or Hindu.

Houston stated that the basic assumption of moral values education, that morality can be taught and practiced without any need for a religious basis, was precisely the reason why values education was unacceptable to conservative Christians. He credited "the lack of religious cooperation and the suspicions between the major denominations", "the

45 Ibid., 24-25.
47 Ibid.
general secularization process in the modern world that sees confessional religion as having no place in the public life of society and of its education", and "the increasing awareness of society as being pluralistic and having multi-belief systems and pressure groups" for hastening the secularization of school boards.48

Huston stated that the intellectual framework for Kohlberg's moral values education was based on the psychology of Piaget49 and the moral philosophy of Hare.50 Moral values education had been popularized in Ontario by Clive Beck. It had become the basis of major recommendations by the Mackay Committee. Out of the Mackay Report of 1969 came "a whole re-orientation of public school religious instruction, away from a nurturing, towards a more critical use of moral values education".51

Although there was no unified reaction to the implementation of moral values education in the schools, Huston noted several areas of objection by Christians. By ignoring religion altogether, religious history and development became obscure, if not absent. The use of reason alone in determining values was reductionist. Moral values education was not "objective" but presupposed secularism.

48 Ibid., 6-7.  
51 Huston, 7.
Its underlying core was utilitarianism, which is but one philosophical perspective.\textsuperscript{52}

Brian Crittenden, a philosopher upon whom Huston leaned heavily in his critique of moral education, thought that "if the notion of religion is interpreted rather loosely (e.g. as a sense of the mystery of the universe, or what Tillich calls ultimate concern) it seems to me likely that religious attitudes form an integral, and perhaps necessary, part of any moral system".\textsuperscript{53} The Mackay Report, however, "seems to assume that morality is necessarily a secular (or only vaguely religious) matter".\textsuperscript{54}

For many Christians, the seemingly arbitrary and artificial separation of religion from moral education was disturbing. They were unsure about their children receiving moral education from which Christian beliefs would be absent, and perhaps, unwelcome.

3. The Abandonment of Christian Religious Education

Although the provincial government had not acted to discontinue the Christian religious education program in the

\textsuperscript{52}Ibid. \\
\textsuperscript{54}Ibid.
public schools, the program had been abandoned in over ninety-five percent of school systems by the 1980s.\textsuperscript{55}

The Ottawa Public School Board had met several times to discuss the matter of religious education in the schools prior to preparing its submission to the Committee on Religious Education in the Schools in November 1966. In its Brief, the differing concerns of the nine trustees were expressed, but no consensus on a course of action was evident.\textsuperscript{56} Only one trustee supported the program as it was. Three trustees, including the former, favoured Christian teaching. Three favoured teaching about all religions. Two opposed any form of religious instruction. One trustee, while favouring some form of religious instruction, could not be specific.\textsuperscript{57} However, a perusal of the Minutes of the Ottawa Public School Board from 1965 to 1973 revealed little mention of religious education. In 1965, reference was made to the Mackay Committee, indicating that the Board would make a submission.\textsuperscript{58} In 1968, records indicated that no clergy visited the Ottawa Public Schools.\textsuperscript{59} There is no evidence of a discussion of exemption from religious education, yet it is clear that the program was dropped. There is no record of its continuance after 1968, and, in the recollection of

\textsuperscript{56}City of Ottawa Public School Board, Submission to the Ontario Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools (November 18, 1966). [Archives of Ontario].
\textsuperscript{57}Ibid., 2.
\textsuperscript{58}Minutes of the Ottawa Public School Board for 1965, 335.
\textsuperscript{59}Minutes of the Ottawa Public School Board for 1968.
former administrators, it was quietly discontinued.

According to Meyer, "As jurisdictions became more pluralistic and less rooted in Western Christian traditions, religious education in schools became less implemented as instruction." This statement is borne out by data collected in the 1980s. A Ministry of Education survey of 117 elementary schools and 98 secondary schools showed that only 4% of elementary schools had regular religious education classes and 71% of elementary schools had no formal religious education program. However, 95% of elementary schools reported having integrated moral and values education into the curriculum. The reason most often stated reason for neglecting religious education was the lack of ministry guidelines. Inadequate teacher training in the subject area was another reason cited. It is likely that the boards of education which attempted to follow the regulations regarding religious education (see Appendix I) either relied on visiting clergy or used locally-produced curricula.

By 1985, the Canadian Civil Liberties Association had identified a number of jurisdictions where an exclusively Christian program of religious education continued to be provided. In a letter to the Minister of Education, it objected not only to these boards of education favouring one

62 Ibid., 14.
religion, but to the regulations which allowed such partiality. The Civil Liberties Association was hopeful that the regulations would be rescinded.

In the Elgin County Board of Education, the curriculum contained the doctrine that "only through the blood of Jesus can ... sin be taken away". Moreover, in the Elgin County program, students were encouraged to indoctrinate others. Similarly, in the Norfolk Board of Education program, students were encouraged "to share with others the fact that Jesus died, arose, ascended into heaven and will return". The Civil Liberties Association claimed that indoctrination was being conducted in the schools of Frontenac County. It based this claim on the statement by Ron Axford, President of the Kingston and District Bible Club Movement, that its representatives were going into the schools "to offer pupils an opportunity to ... learn about what God says to them through the Bible about Himself and about Jesus Christ".

The Northumberland and Newcastle Board of Education had rejected the possibility of teaching comparative religion instead of the religious education program. The Association suspected that the negative stance of the Christian Port Hope Ministerial Association toward the introduction of comparative religion had affected the decision.

---

63 Quoted in Canadian Civil Liberties Association to The Honourable Keith C. Norton, Minister of Education (March 14, 1985), 2.
64 Ibid., 3.
65 Ibid., 3.
66 Ibid.
67 Ibid., 4.
The teaching of Christianity as an exclusive truth in religious matters seemed "to violate the equality rights guaranteed in Section 15 of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms--the right to the equal...benefit of the law without discrimination ... based on religion'",\(^{58}\) because minority rights were clearly infringed. The Minister did not act to discontinue the program. However, concerns such as those expressed by the Association eventually led to a ministerial inquiry.

The lack of religious education in the schools had been addressed by the Ecumenical Study Commission, yet throughout the 1970s and 1980s no new program had been developed for the province. Lack of up-to-date ministry guidelines was one reason that Boards of Education did not follow the regulations, but the other reasons for not teaching the program were not clear. The Ecumenical Study Commission commented that the inactivity of the government during the 1970s and 1980s was another contributing factor:

... it created a larger vacuum with regard to religious education in the schools in recent years. In some places the vacuum has been filled by religious groups who have been allowed access to the schools or by programs, official or unofficial, which have sometimes been the subject of controversy or even court challenge.\(^{69}\)

The Ministerial Inquiry on Religious Education in Ontario Public Elementary Schools was conducted by Dr. Glenn

\(^{58}\)Quoted in ibid., 5.
\(^{69}\)The Ecumenical Study Commission on Public Education to the Ministerial Inquiry on Religious Education in Ontario Public Elementary Schools (May 15, 1989).
A. Watson in 1989 and 1990. The mandate given by the Minister of Education, The Honourable Chris Ward, was the following:

To:

* review the existing policy with respect to religious education;

* identify curriculum options for an appropriate religious education policy for the public elementary schools which responds to the multicultural and multifaith nature of the population of the province;

* identify appropriate teacher preparation strategies to support the proposed curriculum options;

* examine religious education policies of other Canadian provinces;

* examine the 1969 Report of the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario and reports of other similarly-mandated inquiries from other Canadian provinces;

* conduct extensive consultation with interested parties;

* make recommendations to the Minister of Education with regard to the adoption of a religious education program policy. 70

Public boards of education were surveyed "to obtain information on the status of religious education in elementary schools". 71 Sixty-one of seventy-eight boards replied. Of these boards, eighteen had received exemption from teaching religious education. The reasons for so doing were summarized as follows:

* the multicultural, multifaith nature of the community;
* the lack of ministry guidelines;
* the shortage of time in the school day;

---

71 Ibid., 28
the lack of resource materials;
the absence of appropriate teacher preparation, and
the existence of moral and values education as an alternative program.\textsuperscript{72}

Twelve boards did not offer a religious education program even though they had not applied for exemption. Twenty-two boards reported that they offered some religious education, ranging from some classroom instruction to special Christmas and Easter activities. Only nine of the sixty-one boards which replied to the survey were offering a full religious education program according to the regulations.\textsuperscript{73}

Based on student enrollments, only four percent of elementary students appeared to be receiving religious education in class time.\textsuperscript{74} This approximated the level, relative to student population, of religious instruction in the schools in the 1920s and prior to a concerted effort by the Churches to obtain Bible teaching throughout the Ontario educational system.

Theoretically, the 1944 program, as revised, was still mandatory. However, after the Mackay Report, it seemed unlikely that anyone would demand that the program be taught. The materials were dated and out-of-step with theological and pedagogical developments and impossibly christocentric and ethnocentric for the times. Nevertheless, the government did not move to produce new materials or curricula. Local preferences more-or-less obtained.

\textsuperscript{72} Ibid., 28.
\textsuperscript{73} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{74} Ibid., 28-29.
When boards of education were asked to give suggestions about religious education, the following "received an equal amount of support":

- provide ministry guidelines for a multifaith program;
- integrate religious education into current programs;
- permit boards to develop their own religious education programs;
- provide ministry guidelines but allow board exemptions;
- provide ministry guidelines for a mainly Christian program, and
- have no religious education in the schools.

There was also limited support for the enhancement of the moral values education program as an alternative to religious education. Support for the continuation of a mainly Christian program of religious education stood at about sixteen percent. It was clear that curriculum options appropriate to the multifaith nature of the population of Ontario would go beyond the Christian religious education program as it existed.

While letters from individuals to the Ministerial Inquiry on Religious Education generally favoured "the continuation of a Judeo-Christian emphasis in religious education . . . the majority of briefs supported a program that would be a multifaith or multireligious approach, to include information about other religions as well as Christianity".

---

75 Ibid., 29.
76 Ibid., 29-30.
77 Ibid., 29.
78 Ibid., 30.
The Protestant, Bible-based program dating from 1944 was found to be unsuitable. The new program of "Religion Studies" which the Ministerial Inquiry recommended was to be a compulsory multifaith, non-indoctrinational and non-sectarian program for all public elementary schools. The focus would be on major world religions. Before the government could act further, however, a development which had great repercussions on Christian religious education in the schools emerged from another quarter--the Courts.

On January 30, 1990, the Ontario Court of Appeal struck down the provincial regulation on religious education in the public schools. A group of parents from Elgin County had sought to remove religious education completely from their public schools. Their claim was that subsection 28(4) of Regulation 262, which required two half-hour periods per week of religious education, violated section 2(a) of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms in that it infringed the rights of minority children by requiring their participation in classes intended for majority [Christian] children. The school board argued that its classes in religion were not exclusively concerned with Christian beliefs and that the purpose for teaching religious education, in any case, was primarily to teach morality. The court, however, found that subsection 28(4) constituted indoctrination and violated the

79Watson Report, 2.
80Canadian Civil Liberties Association vs, Ontario [Minister of Education] (1990), 71 O.R. (2d) 341 (C.A.)
Charter and, therefore, ordered the Elgin County Board to drop its religious education curriculum.  

On December 6, 1990, the Ministry of Education ordered all public schools to end any indoctrination in a particular religious faith in Policy/Program Memorandum No. 112. (See Appendix J). Regulation 262 was amended to reflect the court decision. Under the title Religion in Schools, the Regulation, now numbered 298, subsections 27, 28 and 29 reads as follows:

27. Sections 28 and 29 do not apply to a separate school board or to the Roman Catholic sector of The Ottawa-Carleton French-Language School Board.

28. (1) A board may provide in grades one to eight and in its secondary schools an optional program of education about religion.

(2) A program of education about religion shall,

(a) promote respect for the freedom of conscience and religion guaranteed by the Charter of Canadian Rights and Freedoms; and

(b) provide for the study of different religions and religious beliefs in Canada and the world, without giving primacy to, and without indoctrination in, any particular religion or religious belief.

(3) A program of education about religion shall not exceed sixty minutes of instruction per week in an elementary school.

29. (1) Subject to subsections (2) and (3), a board shall not permit any person to conduct religious exercises or to provide instruction that includes indoctrination in a particular religion or religious belief in a school.

(2) A board may enter into an agreement with a separate school board or the Roman Catholic sector of

---

The Ottawa-Carleton French-Language School Board that permits the separate school board or the Roman Catholic sector to use space and facilities to conduct religious exercises or provide religious instruction for the purposes of the separate school board or the Roman Catholic sector.

(3) A board may permit a person to conduct religious exercises or to provide instruction that includes indoctrination in a particular religion or religious belief in a school if,
   (a) the exercises are not conducted or the instruction is not provided by or under the auspices of the board;
   (b) the exercises are conducted or the instruction is provided on a school day at a time that is before or after the school's instructional program, or on a day that is not a school day;
   (c) no person is required by the board to attend the exercises or instruction; and
   (d) the board provides space for the exercises or instruction on the same basis as it provides space for other community activities.

(4) A board that permits religious education or instruction under subsection (3) shall consider on an equitable basis all requests to conduct religious exercises or to provide instruction under subsection (3).\(^{82}\)

The most significant fact about the new regulations on religion in the schools was that a program about religion was entirely optional. This corresponded to the actual situation in the schools. Few boards had been offering a program in religion. Most had switched to some form of secular moral values education. The second significant fact is that even if a program of religion were offered, it could not be exclusively Christian, even if a local school board area contained a Christian population which supported such a program. Thirdly, even though the program about religion was

---

an option, there was no Ministry of Education curriculum guide (until 1994) and no plan for teacher preparation. These facts discouraged boards from enthusiastically adopting a program, although in some locations experimentation did ensue.

4. Summary

Of major significance for the present inquiry is that the Christian-based religious education program, in whatever form, had become a relic. The atmosphere of the public schools, moreover, was no longer to be pervaded with the principles of Christianity nor with its doctrines and customs. In spite of the protests of the mainline and conservative Protestant groups, the era of Protestant pre-eminence in the religious instruction of Ontario schools had come to a close. The primacy of Christianity, or any religious faith, could not obtain legally in a public school in Ontario. According to the new regulations, neither religious exercises nor religious instruction favouring a particular religion were valid in the public schools. Therefore, after forty-six years of prescribed Christian religious education in Ontario, the schools had become secular.

Whether the public education system can maintain its present neutrality is another question. The desire of parents from different faiths to have their children
instructed in their faith could challenge the integrity of the public education system. At present, as in the nineteenth century, some religious groups are hopeful of public funding for their schools. But, the 'non-sectarian, yet Christian' and Protestant formula can no longer be applied, and it is unlikely that opening up further funding for religious schools would be a peaceful venture.
CONCLUSION

At the founding of Upper Canada in 1791, the British governing class intended that, as in England, the Church of England would prevail. But the Church of England was never really established, and the settlers belonged to different denominations which competed for members. The early schools were not necessarily religious by law and religious observances or instruction were haphazard and perfunctory. Trustees determined the manner of religious instruction according to local conditions. These provisions suited the pluralistic religious situation, but resulted in irregular instruction in religion, even though the Bible was used as a reader.

The Reverend John Strachan, an Anglican priest and educator, pressed his view that the schools should be administered by an established Church -- the Church of England -- in order to ensure religious orthodoxy and loyalty to British institutions. The Reverend Egerton Ryerson, a Methodist minister and later Superintendent of Education, promoted a non-sectarian common school system, which became the public school system. In Ryerson's common schools religion was recommended but not required. Ryerson aimed to avoid controversy by stressing a "common Christianity", which was primarily moral. The doctrinal controversies of the time were to be avoided in the classroom. In the Education Act of
1850, religious instruction was entirely voluntary, according to local initiative. There is evidence that Ryerson's attempts to deal with pluralism, while building a common school system, did not result in effective or widespread instruction in religion. Pluralism was a contributing factor in inhibiting common religious instruction in the nineteenth century, and was to be again in the twentieth century.

Religious divisions imported from Europe were exacerbated by political tensions over questions such as the Clergy Reserves and popular government. Among Protestants rivalries ran deep. Roman Catholics were beyond the pale. Denominational conflict precluded any cooperation in a religious education program in the nineteenth century because Christians held to their distinctive tenets with unyielding loyalty. The price paid for the establishment of efficiency and economy in the common school system was a non-controversial but weak program of religion in the public schools.

Yet most parents desired their children to be religiously educated in spite of the diversity of religious opinion. Ryerson was unable, in spite of his attempt in *First Lessons in Christial Morals*, to define a theological content for moral instruction which would please all. There was some supplemental instruction in religion permitted in the early common schools. Where parents did not object, such instruction became rote learning based on catechisms or other manuals. Catechisms emphasized conformity, subservience to
authority, and loyalty to British institutions. Beliefs peculiar to the denominations were emphasized, for example predestination to salvation or reprobation for Presbyterians, while the Ten Commandments and the Apostles' Creed were frequently stressed. This was allowed according to local conditions. During catechesis by a minister or a teacher, children were to be passive and obedient. The catechism was drilled into them, and although they may have memorized the content, it was not certain that real learning had occurred. Such Christian formation may have been a pious hope.

During the fifty years from 1875 to 1925, the major non-Roman denominations found that they had more in common. Although divided by polity and doctrine, they could agree that the Bible should be prominent in the schools. Due to cooperation in social crusades, such as temperance, they found that more could be achieved in Christianizing the expanding nation by joining forces for a common mission than by their individual efforts. After gaining government accession to a program of Bible reading in the schools in 1884, the major Protestant bodies began to consider a full program of Protestant religious education in the schools.

By the twentieth century, the major denominations had become organized into national churches. This was due in part to the influence of Confederation and the imperative of Christianizing the West. In order to achieve efficiency and economy, churches could set aside their doctrinal differences
and cooperate, if not unite, in a common mission. Out of this impulse emerged the Presbyterian Church in Canada, the Methodist Church, Canada, the General Synod of the Church of England in Canada and several Baptist unions. There was a dream of a united Protestant Church, which was only partly realized in The United Church of Canada in 1925. The aim of expanding Protestant influence in the country encouraged inter-church cooperation in the area of religious education in the schools.

The Anglicans initiated a call for combined efforts for religion in the schools in 1913. The Baptists refused at this time due to qualms about separation of church and state. But after World War I work was continued towards a syllabus of Bible readings for schools which would be acceptable to the major denominations. The purported benefits to society of mandatory Bible reading in the schools were an uplifting of morals and good citizenship. A graded series of Bible readings was published in 1930. Shortly after this accomplishment, efforts to obtain religious instruction increased.

Protestant bodies began to cite reasons for the necessity of religious education in the schools in the 1930s. They pointed to the threats to democracy of non-Christian ideologies such as fascism and communism. Their assumption, sometimes explicit, was that democracy was based on Christianity. The Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education was reformed on such a basis in 1936. As
well, the churches noted with dismay a general decline in Sunday School attendance with a supposedly consequent drop in morals and increased juvenile delinquency. The government became increasingly sympathetic to the concerns of the Inter-Church Committee, especially since it spoke for churches which represented the majority of Ontario citizens.

The threat of foreign ideologies in Ontario was more imagined than real. However, the prospect of reaching unchurched children in the schools enticed the churches. The Baptists began to cooperate, as well, by the late 1930s. But while there was Protestant consensus, Jews and sectarian minorities objected.

By 1939, the proponents of religious education in the schools were organized under the Inter-Church Committee to cooperate with the provincial government. The aim was to build up the citizenry on a Christian moral basis. The "forces of evil" to be combatted were not only the Axis powers but secularism and materialism. Protestant opinion was favourable to Christian religious education in the schools. The rights and wishes of Jews and the other minorities were not considered. When a Conservative minority government sympathetic to the churches was elected in 1943, and religious education was made mandatory in 1944, the issue was controverted—especially by minorities. However, the government was returned with an overwhelming majority in 1945 and the program was continued for some time. The fact that religious education had been introduced into the English
school system had influenced the Anglophile premier, George Drew. He also placed the cadet movement under the Department of Education. In wartime, children must be trained in a creed and be prepared for military service. The urgency of winning the war demanded it. However, the rights of minorities, unheeded in 1944, were to be revisited by future governments, and ultimately to be the basis for legal challenges to the program of religious education.

The change from an optional program to a government-directed mandatory program ceded control over major issues, such as curricula and staffing, to politicians and civil servants. In the short run while the churches were powerful, they gained influence. As society became secular, they lost it. Although the Christian religion and education had a long and intimate connection in Ontario's history, this began to unravel as society became increasingly secular and plural.

The theological base of the program of 1944 was never specified. The Teachers' Guides were based on British manuals which claimed to be rooted in what all Christians held in common and summarized by the Apostles' Creed. The regulations in Ontario specified that controversial doctrines were to be avoided. Most of the Guides contained moral teachings based on Bible verses. The virtues championed by the Guides, such as kindness and honesty, were commonplace. In fact, the Scriptures were seen through a cultural lens -- that of polite Protestant society. Critics questioned the considerable amount of fictional material, especially
concerning Jesus. The Jewish community protested examples of anti-Semitism.

The program was defended by the Inter-Church Committee and the churches as being consistent with Egerton Ryerson's policies and the extant program of studies. It was defended also on the basis of "majority rights". The belief that public morality was based on the Christian religion and the identification of Christianity with democracy made Christian religious education in the schools essential in the opinion of the churches. Protestants saw church, home and school as partners in this good work. Opponents of the program were characterized as sinister and, in some instances, non-Christian groups were viewed as un-Canadian in their resistance to the majority culture.

The Canadian Jewish Congress, Central Division, objected to the program of religious education from the outset on the basis of minority rights. It also pointed out that such a program was an anomaly in North America. Yet the program continued without serious challenges until the 1960s.

As the question of religious education in the schools was debated in the 1960s, school boards asked the government for a study of the matter. In areas of significant minority populations, there had been unrest. Avowed secularists had organized to oppose the program. In 1966 the government referred the matter to an arm's-length committee which recommended that the program be dropped on the grounds of indoctrination. The government did not want programs which
incited divisiveness or seemed to infringe minority rights, yet it did not act to change the regulations. The tone of the Ministry of Education pronouncements from 1970 onward was not enthusiastic about religious education and warmed instead to a non-religious values education program. Most Boards of Education dropped the Christian education program, either formally or informally, and adopted some kind of values education program. In some boards the program continued, but often with conservative Christian teachers and materials. This occasioned objections by parents and civil libertarians. Conservative Christian churches wanted either a return to a Bible-based program or public funding of Christian schools.

During the 1970s, governments recognized the multicultural nature of Canadian society. The notion of the country as a Christian society was abandoned. Therefore Christian-only teaching in the schools of Ontario, although at a low ebb, was an anachronism. Since the society had changed, assumptions about the primacy of Christianity in institutions changed also. The major Christian denominations would accept the teaching of the world religions in the schools as long as the importance of Christianity to Canadian history and development was included. How to construct an appropriate curriculum became a problem since materials and expertise were not general within the public system. In most cases, little was accomplished. Even the Senior Division option in World Religions dwindled in strength during the 1980s.
As measured by meaningful association, religion became less important to Ontarians from the 1960s. Attendance declined for the major churches. Their voice in society weakened. That voice became critical of society rather than supportive of the status quo. The Ecumenical Study Commission made representations to the Ministry of Education for inclusion of a study of religion as well as moral values in the curriculum. Such study was deemed essential to general education and to children personally. The Ministry preferred to avoid controversies about religion in the schools. The government was anxious to promote the ideal of multi-cultural harmony.

Although a purportedly non-sectarian program of Protestant religious education in the schools could obtain when Ontario society was almost uniformly Christian, the program could not be maintained as that society became religiously and culturally diverse. The churches could assume for many years that religious education was the basis for the moral training of the young. This argument lost ground after the Mackay Report of 1969 emphasized moral values education apart from religion. Any public school program of religion thereafter which was in any way indoctrinational, or exclusive to one faith, was suspect. The 1944 program, which the Mackay Report recommended be abandoned, was not elastic enough to accommodate religions other than Christianity theologically, yet the government did not move to change the regulations or to introduce a new
curriculum. The situation was ambiguous. Religious education was still allowed, but the form and content of it had not been adapted officially to a new age. In practice many jurisdictions abandoned the program and others continued to offer a modified Christian program or some variation between these alternatives. The major churches, having abandoned the 1944 program, wanted a new program of world religions with major emphasis on Christianity. The failure of the Ministry of Education to provide a curriculum guideline for teaching religion in the schools was a major reason why boards of education did not follow the regulations and a discouragement to proponents of religion in the schools.

The major Protestant denominations hoped for some treatment of religion as a regular subject, albeit on a multi-faith basis. Their often-cited reason was that education without religion was incomplete. Secularization was admitted as a fact. The possibility of teaching morals without any religious reference was not. Religion should be taught and the greater stress in a Christian society should be on Christianity. Protestant officials seemed out of touch with the new secular society, using arguments for their position which only obtained under the conditions of the 1930s and 1940s.

The churches represented by the Ecumenical Study Commission on Public Education were the major Protestant denominations and the Roman Catholic Church. The Commission never wavered in its insistence that religion should be
taught. It was unconvinced that morals could be taught apart from religion. It insisted that religion was integral to Canadian society and history and that morality was rooted in religion. If religion were not part of the curriculum, secular humanism would take its place.

Support of the churches, as measured by meaningful connections such as attendance, began to wane during the 1960s. This weakened the tutelage of the churches in society. In addition, the government policy of multiculturalism and the guarantee of equal rights and freedom of religion in law undercut the claims of the churches in the field of public school religious education.

The provincial legislation on religious education in the schools was struck down in 1990 by a court decision which declared that it infringed minority rights. The Ontario Court of Appeal ruled, however, that education about religion could be allowed under specified conditions which precluded indoctrination into any particular faith. Any confessional teaching of Christianity was now unlawful in the public schools.

Religion had been the foundation of any education system for Strachan and Ryerson; it was now a carefully hedged-in object of study on a purely optional basis. The liberal denominations could hope for a curriculum on this basis; the conservatives began to press for publicly-funded Christian schools. Secular humanism, which seemed to them to
characterize the public school system, was unacceptable. The schools no longer had a vestigial Christian basis.

The secularization of the public education system ended the historic and intimate connection between Protestantism and education in Ontario public schools. This development could not be overturned by the churches who were now powerless to influence either the government or the courts. Society had changed since the 1960s. Assumptions about the primacy of Protestant Christianity in the culture of Ontario had changed also. Ontario was no longer a Christian society in any legal or cultural sense.

The moral crusades of the Protestant churches had achieved some political successes in Ontario. The Lord's Day Act of 1906 had enforced Sabbath observance. The temperance movement had been able to introduce prohibition in some jurisdictions. Bible instruction in public schools had obtained for a time. Public morality in general was a concern for the Protestant churches. Yet the measures which they had secured did not endure. Prohibition proved unenforceable and was withdrawn. The Lord's Day Act was repealed, after being often flouted, in 1985. And compulsory Christian religious education in Ontario public schools was struck down by the courts in 1990. Victorian Protestant morality had lost its power. Vestigial remnants of Protestant domination in institutions had been, and continue to be, challenged in the courts.
The secularization of the public school system is an indicator of the larger process of secularization within Canadian society and its institutions. The Christian religion is no longer the foundation of society's moral convictions, but an optional allegiance for a declining number of active worshippers in an open market.

The problem which has been delineated in this dissertation is that of church involvement in public school religious education. Churches changed their policies and acted in ways meant to further their own interests. When they hoped for denominational public schools, their outlook was parochial. They were not united on the issue until after the First World War. Prior to this time, the foundation for cooperation had been a common interest in Bible reading, which prepared the way for a more unified stance on religious education before and after the Second World War. The cultural and historical context of the late 1930s helped accelerate the Protestant strategy. A return to traditionalism and imperialism, combined with the religious conservatism of the Churches, favoured the introduction of the 1944 program of religious education.

Doctrinal and political differences among the Churches, which had seemed formidable in the nineteenth century, were set aside for the perceived common good of religious instruction in the public schools. The 1960s brought increased ecumenism. However, the 1960s was an era of radical critique of religion and of greater religious and
ethnic diversity in Ontario. Anglo-Protestant Ontario could not accommodate sufficiently to these trends. Of greater importance, the Government did not act with sufficient vigour to introduce acceptable programs of religion in the public schools in the new multifaith, multicultural environment.

When the mandatory 1944 program had appeared, Rabbi Abraham Feinberg noted that the Jewish people had not opposed the previous regulations which allowed optional instruction in religion in the public schools to be extended. Had this method continued, the program might have gained ground without the opposition—and even rancour—which it attracted. The Churches were not overjoyed at the prospect of government control. The program became a political football. By the end of the 1960s, the 1944 program no longer suited the new Ontario society of ethnic, religious, and cultural diversity which had emerged. Perhaps the 1944 religious education program continued as long as it did because of the reluctance of successive Conservative governments to alienate Anglo-Protestant Ontario.

The problem of historical change in relation to religious traditions has been examined in this study. The specific focus has been the question of Protestant Church involvement with the public school religious education program in Ontario. During this investigation, the

---

1Rabbi Abraham Feinberg, "Religious Instruction in the Public Schools", Canadian Schools Journal (June, 1945). [Ontario Jewish Archives, File 32, Reel #1].
conclusion has been drawn that most Churches retained their corporate identities while they forged alliances to further their institutional goals. The United Church was able to state a moderate doctrine and polity sufficient to create a new denomination. The Protestant Churches were conscious, through their spokesmen, of representing their traditions in relation to social and political questions. Through church assemblies, official policies were formulated and promulgated with regard to the issue of public school religion. In the main, the faithful supported these policies. Doctrine continued to be important in expressing denominational identity. However, even where there was little doctrinal identity among the churches, there was cooperation because a viable Protestant culture had been formed.

The ethnic similarities which were shared by most Protestants and their kinship within British cultural tradition helped to strengthen common strategies surrounding social issues. In the case of public school religion, even doctrinal disimilarities could be set aside. An example of this is the 'weak orthodoxy' of the 1944 religious education program.

This study has examined the question of how the churches initiated, implemented, and finally abandoned the 1944 program. It has revealed that, where Anglo-Protestants could band together with a common aim, their advances into the field of public education prospered. However, Protestant domination ended due to the impact of secularism,
multiculturalism, and religious diversity—all of which emerged in Ontario during the latter half of the twentieth century. Traditional Protestant churches no longer possess the influence in Ontario culture and society which they once had.
APPENDIX A

A Summary of the Table of Contents of the Guide Books for Instructors in Public Schools
## Appendix A

A SUMMARY OF THE TABLE OF CONTENTS OF THE GUIDE BOOKS FOR INSTRUCTORS IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

### GUIDE BOOK I. THE FRIEND OF LITTLE CHILDREN. (6 yr. olds)

1. Harvest Stories  
   - 3 lessons

2. Home and Helpfulness  
   - The Gospels 3 lessons  
   - Modern Illustrations 3 lessons

3. The Coming of Jesus  
   - 5 lessons

4. The Child Jesus  
   - The Gospels 5 lessons  
   - Modern Illustrative story 1 lesson

5. Jesus the Kind Healer  
   - 5 lessons

6. Springtime Stories  
   - All  5 Illustrative stories

7. Little Sita of India  
   - 3 lessons  
   - 33 lessons

### GUIDE BOOK II. STORIES OF GOD AND JESUS. (7 yr. olds)

1. God's Wonderful World  
   - Lessons to awaken wonder and reverence.  
   - One of them a modern illustrative story.  
   - 5 lessons

2. Jesus, the Friend of the Children  
   - The Gospels 2 lessons  
   - Modern illustrative stories 2 lessons

3. Stories of the Baby Jesus  
   - The Gospels 3 lessons  
   - Modern illustrative stories 1 lesson

4. The Boyhood of Jesus  
   - The Gospels 4 lessons  
   - Modern illustrative stories 1 lesson

5. Stories Jesus Told  
   - Friendly host, good shepherd, loving  
   - Father, Good Samaritan.  
   - 4 lessons

6. Eastertime  
   - 2 lessons

7. Stories of God's Loving Care.  
   - Abraham, Isaac, Jacob, Samuel, Elisha  
   - 30 lessons
Table of Contents - 2.

GUIDE BOOK III. JESUS AND HIS FRIENDS. (8 yr. olds)

1. Stories of Harvest 4 lessons
2. Stories of Worship and Service 4 lessons
   Solomon's temple, built and repaired 2 lessons
   Brother Francis and building of St. Sophia 2 lessons
3. Friendliness to animals 3 lessons
   Three medieval stories
4. Birth and Infancy of Jesus 5 lessons
   Birth and Infancy of Jesus 3 lessons
   Modern Illustrative Stories 2 lessons
5. Old Testament Stories of Friendship 6 lessons
   Abraham and Lot, Rebecca 2 lessons
   Joseph 4 lessons
6. Friends of Jesus 8 lessons
   Fishermen, Boys and Girls, Zacchaeus, Martha and Mary, Peter
7. More Stories of Friendship 5 lessons
   Good Samaritan, Moses, Elijah, Syrian Maid 35 lessons

GUIDE BOOK IV. SERVANTS OF GOD. (9 yr. olds).

1. Jesus Mighty in Deed and Word 18 lessons
   a. Life of Jesus, Call of Disciples to Resurrection, almost wholly from Mark (Guide Book VII) 16 lessons
   b. China and India 2 lessons
2. Leaders of the early Church 6 lessons
   Peter, Stephen, Phillip, Barnabas, John, Mark, Timothy
3. Modern Servants of God 6 lessons
   Dr. Barnado, Florence Nightingale 2 lessons
   Wilfrid Grenfell 4 lessons 30 lessons
Table of Contents - 3

GUIDE BOOK V. LEADERS OF GOD'S PEOPLE. (10 yr. olds)

1. Pioneers of Jewish History
   Abraham, Jacob, Joseph 10 lessons
2. The Exodus
   Moses, Joshua, Gideon 9 lessons
3. Leaders of Jewish History
   Samuel, Saul, David, Solomon 12 lessons
   31 lessons

GUIDE BOOK VI. JESUS AND THE KINGDOM. (11 yr. olds)

1. A rapid survey of Jesus' life and work
   From Nazareth to Emmaus 9 lessons
2. Service for the Kingdom
   Five from life of Jesus
   Wilberforce, Damien 7 lessons
3. Teaching about the Kingdom
   Parables 5 lessons
   Sermon on the Mount 2 lessons
   7 lessons
4. Pioneers of the Kingdom
   The Acts 8 lessons
   David Livingstone 4 lessons
   4 lessons
   31 lessons

GUIDE BOOK VII. THE STORY OF JESUS (12 yr. olds)

From the Gospel according to St. Mark. (the entire book)

GUIDE BOOK VIII. (13 YR. OLDS)

Tentative plan: The ethical Teachings of Jesus with relevant
Old Testament passages and the beginning of the early
Church.

NOTE: PARTS OF THE BIBLE ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE GUIDE BOOKS.

Historical portions after Solomon
Most of the poetry
The Wisdom Literature
The Prophets
The Story of Paul
The Epistles
The Revelation
APPENDIX B

A Chronology of Some Important Events in Ontario Public School Religious Education
### Appendix B

A CHRONOLOGY OF SOME IMPORTANT EVENTS IN ONTARIO PUBLIC SCHOOL RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1843</td>
<td>The passage of the School Act of 1843. Exemption from religious instruction granted if parents or guardians objected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1846</td>
<td>The School Act confirmed that religious education could be taught in the public schools, but it must be non-sectarian.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>The School Act granted discretionary power to local authorities concerning religious education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1857</td>
<td>The School Act permitted clergy or their deputies to teach religion in the public schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>The British North America Act recognized Roman Catholic Separate Schools in Ontario and Protestant Separate Schools in Quebec.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871-4</td>
<td>Christian Morals was a subject in the regular public school curriculum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1876</td>
<td>The Ontario Ministry of Education was created. Dr. Ryerson retired.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1884</td>
<td>Bible reading was made mandatory as part of the religious exercises. The classroom teacher was allowed to discuss the Bible reading as long as controversial doctrines were avoided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1897</td>
<td>The Jews objected to an Anglican plan to introduce Christianity into the regular curriculum in Toronto.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914-18</td>
<td>During World War I, support for the teaching of religion in the schools increased.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1927</td>
<td>Ontario Religious Education Council (OREC) formed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>A series of graded Bible Readings for elementary schools was published.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Activation of the Inter-Church Committee on Week-day Religious Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1939-45</td>
<td>World War II rekindled concern for the necessity of teaching religion in the schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1944</td>
<td>A mandatory religious education program was instituted in the public schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>The Hope Commission approved the 1944 program of religious education in the public schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>The Mackay Report recommended that traditional religious education be abandoned in favour of &quot;Religious Information and Moral Development&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>The Watson Report recommended multifaith, multicultural religious education to replace the old indoctrinational program. The courts struck down the 1944 program of religious education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX C

Report re Work of Ontario Inter-Church Committee
Appendix C

REPORT RE WORK OF ONTARIO INTER-CHURCH COMMITTEE

1. Syllabus.

An examination of the Teachers' Guides, published by the Religious Education Press, and by the Sheldon Press, of England, in connection with the Agreed Syllabuses for use in the Council Schools, shows that there is a great deal of material which is common with the Syllabus recommended for use in the Ontario Schools.

While it was not considered advisable to take the necessary steps to revise our own Syllabus, until more of the volumes in the series were ready, the Inter-Church Committee decided to recommend the four volumes of the series, as already issued, for the use of those giving the instruction based on our syllabus.

The four volumes are:

i. The Friend of Little Children - 40 lessons, for those under 5 years of age.

ii. Stories of God and Jesus - 50 lessons for those from 5 to 7 years.

iii. Servants of God - 54 lessons for those from 7 to 11 years.

iv. God and Myself - 63 lessons for those from 11 to 15 years.

2. Worship.

Forms of Service for use at various times during the year have been prepared. These make provision for such occasions as:

i. The Opening of Term.

ii. Thanksgiving Day Week.

iii. Remembrance Day Week.

iv. Last day of School before Christmas Holidays.

v. The New Year.

vi. Last day of School before Easter Holidays
vii. Empire Day Week

A List of Suggested Hymns has also been prepared. These will be submitted to the Department of Education.

3. Tests.

With a view to encourage the right use of tests and the use of the right kind of tests, a statement is being prepared which it is hoped will be issued by the Department of Education.

4. Publicity to School Boards.

A Statement setting forth what is being accomplished in some places in the Province of Ontario has been prepared for sending to Boards of Education in places where, as yet, nothing of this nature is being done. It is hoped that this will stimulate them to action.
APPENDIX D

Religious Education in the Public Schools

A Memorandum for the Department of Education of the Province of Ontario from the Inter-Church Committee on Week Day Religious Education, April 3, 1944
Appendix D

RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

A Memorandum for the Department of Education of the Province of Ontario

From the Inter-Church Committee on Week Day Religious Education, April 3, 1944

The Inter-Church Committee on Week-day Religious Education has given careful consideration to the proposals of the Minister of Education on this subject. We understand these proposals to include the teaching of the Scriptures as a definite part of the regular school curriculum, the work to be done by the regular teaching staff.

The Committee fully appreciate the spirit and motive which have prompted the Minister to make the proposals and desires to place on record its gratification at this recognition of the importance of a knowledge of the Bible in general education and the need for giving a larger place to teaching it.

Analyzing these proposals the committee recognizes the following advantages. Practically 100% of the schools would be reached instead of the 20% (public elementary) as at present. Even a factual knowledge of the Scriptures would give the Church Schools a basis on which to build and thus enable them to do their own work more satisfactorily. The instruction would be given by teachers who are trained to teach. The instruction being given by the regular teacher and as part of the regular school day would be looked upon by the pupil as an essential part of education and not as something appended.

The Committee, however, sees also some difficulties.

1. To do this work properly it is essential that the teachers should have a preparation in Biblical knowledge more adequate than that afforded them at the present time in our Normal Schools and Training Colleges.

2. There are as yet no adequate curriculum and textbooks.

3. If such teaching is to have religious and not merely instructional value, it is essential that the teachers themselves should be persons of religious conviction.
4. We fear such a plan as the Minister of Education proposes if carried out at once would probably cause division and discord in some of our communities and even among Christian people themselves since it might raise the old question of the relation of Church and State in this field.

In reference to these difficulties it may well be that the Minister and his Department have thought through the problems raised and have already made provision for meeting them. If this be so, we would appreciate any information which the Minister may see his way clear to give.

A. General Recommendations

In the light of our present knowledge and the above analysis, we offer the following recommendations:

1. That it would be wise to proceed cautiously in the matter.

2. That the worthy traditions and helpful co-operation which now exist between the Church and the Public School should not only be preserved, but, if possible strengthened.

3. That the following fundamental principles already in substance in the memorandum of February 25th, 1944, should be noted.
   (a) The purpose of all this work should be both instructional and religious. It should include not merely a knowledge of the Scriptures but the relation of those Scriptures to life and conduct.
   (b) That in view of the responsibility which rests upon the Church for the teaching of religion, the Church must always have a voice in the choice of what is to be taught in this field, and who is to teach it, in elementary and secondary schools and in teacher training schools.
   (c) Those who give religious teaching in the schools should be willing, competent, and should also be acceptable to the Church.

B. Specific Recommendations with the present Statutes

In harmony with the above we offer the following specific recommendations of ways in which we think this work could be strengthened within the provisions of the present statutes.

1. That the Department of Education should prepare and publish a statement setting forth its views as to the
purpose and function of education and the place of
religion therein, along the lines embodied in the
Introduction to the Programme of Studies, 1937.

2. That in view of the place already made for a worship
period at the beginning of each school day, the
Department of Education should provide further guidance
and help for teachers in the performance of these duties
by publishing and making available for use in the
schools a Worship Book for Schools, such as has been
prepared by the Interchurch Committee on Week-Day
Religious Education.

3. That the Department of Education should extend and
strengthen the training now given by the Church in
Normal Schools in two ways:

   (a) By providing more adequate instruction in
courses on the Bible.

   (b) By providing instruction and guidance in order
that teachers would understand how to use their
opportunities so that "the curriculum ....should be
pervaded by the spirit of religion" (Programme of
Studies, 1937, Page 9).

4. That the Department of Education should make
provision in the Ontario College of Education and in the
Ontario Training College for Technical Teachers, for
courses similar to those recommended for Normal Schools
as set forth in Number 3 above.

5. To enable present teachers to equip themselves for
better service in this respect, courses similar to those
mentioned in No. 3 and No. 4 for Normal Schools and
Training Colleges should be provided in Teachers' Summer
Schools.

6. That persons chosen to give religious instruction in
the elementary and secondary schools should have the
following qualifications:

   (a) A knowledge of the needs and interests of
children of the various ages;

   (b) A knowledge of the best methods of teaching
various ages;

   (c) Acquaintance with the present Public School
curriculum for the different grades;

   (d) A knowledge of Scriptures and Scripture truth
and its adequacy for the needs of boys and girls in
various stages of their development;
(e) A living Christian experience;

(f) A definite relationship with a Christian Church;

(g) If neither a minister nor a regular school teacher, the teacher of religion should have academic standing equivalent to High School graduation and special training equivalent to that required by the Religious Education Council of Canada for the Standard Leadership Training diploma.

C. Suggestions Involving Changes in Statutes

If the Minister desires to go further than the present Education Act permits, we would offer the following suggestions as to ways in which the statutes themselves might be amended and still be in harmony with the fundamental principles under A.3 above.

1. That every School Board should make provision to have religious instruction given in every school by one of the following means:

   (a) By one or more clergymen;

   (b) By one or more lay persons authorized by such clergyman or clergymen, the school teacher being eligible to be chosen as such lay person.

2. That the Minister of Education shall have the authority to exempt any School Board from the operation of Section 1, above, provided that the Board shall ask by resolution to be exempted, and submits a statement of reasons for such request.

   Note: Under the present Act and Regulations, religious instruction can be provided only before or after the regular school day and even that becomes effective only when the local School Board and clergymen of the district go to the trouble of having a special resolution passed and having that special resolution endorsed by the Minister of Education. The onus is upon those who want something done. The above suggested amendment puts the onus upon those who want nothing done.

D. Suggestions regarding Curriculum and Textbooks

1. A proper curriculum and set of Teachers' Guides or textbooks are needed. Eventually we should have work books for pupils of certain ages.
This is true whether the teaching is done by a clergyman, the school teacher, or other authorized representative.

2. Certain materials already are available. The Interchurch Committee of Ontario has prepared and published an outline under the title "Syllabus of Bible Study". This has been and still is widely used, but there are no Teachers' Guides or textbooks to accompany it. In England several syllabuses have been prepared, the best known of which is the Cambridgeshire. To give help on these syllabuses the Religious Education Press of England and the Sheldon Press of England have jointly prepared and published Teachers' Guides in several volumes. These have been widely used and highly approved in many parts of Canada. The International Council of Religious Education is preparing a number of courses some of which are definitely Bible-centred and some more experienced-centred. Eight textbooks on these courses are available now. Still other groups have been making a similar effort.

We are not completely satisfied with any of these but are willing to co-operate with the Department in working out a suitable curriculum. In any case we would ask for the privilege of being consulted about any curriculum proposed.

3. A Suggested Course of Action: It would seem that we might look forward to the publication of a Canadian Edition of the English texts, with such revisions as may be necessary or desirable to make them fit our Canadian constituency. With this there would be a revision of our Ontario Syllabus to make it suit the revised texts. When this is done, the Bible Readings now authorized by the Department and on which the present Ontario Syllabus is based, should be revised so as to fit the new Syllabus.

4. An Interim Policy: We would recommend to the Department as an immediate practical measure and as an interim policy that approval be given for use either of the Ontario Syllabus or the English texts as a basis for formal teaching.

We believe that both the Minister and ourselves are desirous of obtaining the same ultimate results and have largely the same goal in mind. It is for this reason we offer this memorandum and with it our readiness to co-operate. While both Church and State have their distinctive responsibilities in the field of education, we believe that by co-operative effort on the part of
both, those objectives of education which we have in common can be better achieved.

In the preparation of this memorandum as well as in the whole work of the committee we have had the valuable co-operation and assistance of representatives of a committee of the Ontario Educational Association. The Interchurch Committee, however, is solely responsible for the suggestions and statements contained in this document.

The Committee must call to the attention of the Department that there has been no opportunity to present this memorandum to the authoritative bodies of the various denominations but as their official representatives we offer these recommendations in good faith believing that they fairly represent the judgment of our respective units.

Signed on behalf of the Interchurch Committee

A. R. BEVERLEY Chairman

E. R. McLEAN Secretary

---

1 "Religious Education in the Public Schools: A Memorandum for the Department of Education of the Province of Ontario From the Inter-Church Committee on Week Day Religious Education" (April 3, 1944). [Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada]. Also in McLean, Religion_in_Ontario_Schools, 23-29.
APPENDIX E

Memorandum Regarding the Findings of an Informal Sub-Committee Reporting on Religious Education in Ontario to the Study Committee of the Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario, on the Evening of Wednesday, April 19, 1944
MEMORANDUM REGARDING THE FINDINGS OF AN INFORMAL SUB-COMMITTEE reporting on Religious Education in Ontario to the Study Committee of the Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario, on the evening of Wednesday, April 19, 1944.

On the above date, a group of fourteen men spent the evening in the Board Room of Trinity College, Toronto, discussing religious education in the province. Of the fourteen present, two were Principals of Toronto collegiates; five were Principals of Toronto elementary schools; two were educational authorities of two of our Protestant Communions; the other four were ministers representative of Protestant Churches. One of the members of the Parent Committee, Mr. J. M. Macdonnell, was able to be present for most of the evening.

The Chairman in the opening discussions suggested that we deal, first of all, with the present system now in use in twenty percent of the elementary schools of the province, discuss its strength and weakness, together with its possibilities for the future. Thence we would pass on to the pronouncements on religious education recently made by the Provincial Minister of Education and by Dr. Althouse. Throughout these discussions we had before us the memorandum prepared for the Educational Authorities by the Inter-Church Committee for Week-Day Religious Education and dated April 3, 1944.

The Chairman of the meeting did not find it difficult at any time during the evening to keep the discussion on the go! Everyone present was intensely interested in the whole issue and, selected as they were because of their special knowledge and experience, almost everyone brought fresh angles to bear on each point of our discussion. After a couple of hours of steady work, we arrived at the point where certain resolutions were beginning to form themselves in our minds. These we tried to put on paper and, after being read and re-read, they were unanimously adopted as recommendations to be passed to our parent committee, with the request that they should consider them and, if they so desire, commend them to the Educational Authorities. The following are the resolutions, together with a few necessary comments and expansions.

1. Our representative group wanted to express their unqualified pleasure in learning of the Government's intention to establish religious education throughout both our elementary and our secondary schools of the province. Our interpretation of the official pronouncements is that in each room in the elementary and secondary schools of the province there will ultimately be two periods of Biblical instruction each week. Our anxiety is that this excellent
plan should be introduced into the schools under the most favourable conditions; that the syllabi and text books should be prepared carefully and co-operatively, and be available to the principals and teachers on a date that will give them ample time for the study and preparation for the courses which they are to teach. The unanimous opinion of the committee was that the project should be introduced gradually into our schools over the course of several years, beginning, perhaps, in this coming September with a course for Grade 9, provided the syllabus and text book for this course can be in the hands of the principals and teachers by June of this summer. It was also agreed that this beginning of the whole plan throughout Grade 9 of the elementary schools should be on an optional, rather than a compulsory, basis for this current year, i.e. where the school authorities are willing to introduce it this September, this should be done, emphasizing as much as possible the voluntary side of it for this coming fall and then later, probably the September following, commending the course to the schools as a necessary part of instruction.

2. Our committee recommends that the present system in use in twenty percent. of the public schools (over fifty percent. of the public schools in the city of Toronto) be continued and developed throughout the transitional period during which the Educational Authorities are preparing and establishing the more complete system which they have announced. The public school principals present had had experience in the operation of the system in Toronto and were unanimous that it had been beneficial, and that it was well worth continuing. They recorded no serious difficulty that the plan had presented to them, and they were agreeable that it should continue and develop, in so far as the ministers of the city are able to take up this work and carry it forward. The ministers present spoke with warm preference for the 9:00 a.m. half-hour which had been accorded to them in almost half of the Toronto schools now sharing in the plan. They find the children fresh and keen at that hour; also, it is a time when it is much easier for a minister to be regular in these teaching obligations. When the half-hour at the close of school in the afternoon is given to them, their other pastoral engagements, funerals, etc., are constantly interfering with the regularity of the course. The Rev. H. R. Hunt, who is the Secretary of the Inter-Church group in charge of this teaching programme in Toronto, commissioned both by the Churches and the Board of Education to give it supervision, said that in Toronto his committee hopes to expand their (sic) work, so that most, if not all, of the elementary schools will be enjoying these benefits before the end of next year. In most of these schools, Grades 7 and 8 are being reached by the ministers. The teaching has been of a very co-operative and non-controversial quality.
3. In the elementary schools, then, our recommendation is that the Authorities should let this present plan continue and develop throughout the transitional period during which the more complete plan of the Educational Authorities takes form and moves into operation. During this transitional period the courses in Normal School and College of Education should be adjusted, so that every new teacher graduated becomes competent to take a share in teaching the Bible. Summer courses in this instruction should also be provided. While there are some teachers who, at present, would not wish to teach this subject, the consensus of opinion among the principals present was that most of the men and women who would hesitate to accept such a task do so not because of opposition, but because of their lack of experience, training and instruction in teaching the Bible. But as our training schools turn out the two hundred new teachers each year, our schools will soon be provided with a good proportion of trained teachers capable of doing this work and enjoying the experience.

4. It was agreed by our committee that the syllabus and text books to be used in all the courses should be submitted as early as possible by the Governmental Authorities to the Provincial Inter-Church Committee for Week-Day Religious Education, to the Ontario Teachers' Federation and to the Ontario Educational Association for their consideration.

5. During the transitional period, it is recommended that experimentation be carried on in elementary and secondary schools in view to the formation of a suitable syllabus and text book for each grade, the whole to be effectively integrated that a sequence may be provided from the early grades to the senior ones. All present expressed their desire that the writing of the text book should not be a hurried job carried through at high pressure. For the fall of 1944, let us concentrate on preparing equipment for Grade 9. Although this preparatory work will of necessity be quite hurried, still it can be given necessary revision as the whole integrated plan begins to take shape and the sequence of instruction is matured through the revision that comes with experience and experimentation.

All of us realize, of course, that the Educational Authorities of the province have probably weighed the considerations which we have listed above and have already faced the obvious difficulties to which we have called attention. Yet it may be of some assistance to them to know that an independent group of experienced and interested people has spent an evening bringing their thoughts on this vital subject into some clarity and complete unity; and expressing them, as we now do, in the recommendations which are submitted above.

G. N. LUXTON, Chairman.
APPENDIX F

Letter to the Clergy of the Anglican Diocese of Toronto from the Right Reverend F. H. Wilkinson
Appendix F

Letter to the Clergy of the Anglican Diocese of Toronto from the Right Reverend F. H. Wilkinson

March 1961.

My dear Brethren:

The subject of religious education in the tax-supported schools of the Province of Ontario is becoming increasingly a matter of vigorous public debate. In 1944 the Public Schools Act was revised in respect especially of its provisions for religious instruction in the primary schools, so that what formerly had been a permissive arrangement became compulsory. The regulations governing religious exercises and education included "conscience" clauses allowing exemptions to local school boards, teachers or pupils in classrooms in those cases in which objection was raised. The relevant section of the Act and the 1944 regulations are appended for your information and study. Also appended is a comparative schedule of religious statistics in Canada, revealing that in the 1951 Dominion census 94.8% of Canadians reported themselves as members of the Christian Church in one or other of its Communions.

The opposition to the 1944 Regulations by certain groups within the Province and particularly in Metropolitan Toronto, always vocal, has become especially active at the present time. The views and arguments of the critics are published widely in the daily press, in magazine articles and editorials, and over the radio and television. Public meetings are frequent. So that you may be familiar with the viewpoints of the critics of the present system of religious education in the schools we enclose copies of two briefs on this subject, presented by the Canadian Jewish Congress and the Ethical Education Association, representing the Unitarians.

The most recent action of the opponents is the preparation of a resolution for consideration at the forthcoming annual meeting next month of the Ontario Federation of Home and School Associations, Inc. This resolution, also appended, calls for the deletion of the word "Christian" from that section of the Public Schools Act which defines the duties of a teacher. Clearly it is the intention of the critics to remove entirely from our school system any reference to Christian ideals and culture as well as the study of the Bible. This attempt to "secularize" education is a most serious development and must be resisted by all who cherish and would maintain the spiritual values and moral principles from which our nation derives its character and ideals.
In the month of January a special committee was appointed to make a careful study of this whole matter and to prepare a report with recommendations. This committee, under the chairmanship of the Suffragan Bishop, has had several meetings. Through one of its members, the Reverend Newman Bracken, a most valuable paper has been produced, reviewing the history of religious education in Ontario. This is enclosed and we commend it to you for study and use.

The committee is also preparing a statement on the philosophy of religious instruction and in support of the retention of this vital subject within the school curriculum. In due course this also will be forwarded to you. In the meantime we draw your attention, for purposes of study, to the document, entitled, "Why?", prepared by the Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in the Schools and in which thirteen reasons are given for the preservation of Bible study in our schools. You are also reminded of the statement on the subject embodied in the Bishop's Charge to the 1960 session of Synod.

Some improvement can be made in the present regulations and this is a matter which, no doubt, will receive attention by the Department of Education. The entire abandonment of the whole system and the removal of the word "Christian" from the Public Schools Act would be most injurious to the well-being of our people and future good of our nation. We ask, therefore, that you make this a matter of prayer, and so acquaint your parishioners with the matter under debate, by sermon and conversation, that they may be fully aware of the situation. We do not counsel public debate with the critics over radio of television, but would advise adequate representation at meetings of local school boards, where petitions may be presented, and also at meetings of Home and School Associations and the annual meeting of the Ontario Federation of Home and School Associations, Inc., where resolutions may be advanced, so that the case will be presented for the retention of religious exercises and Bible instruction in our public and high schools.

Faithfully yours,

Frederick Toronto

George B. Snell (signed)
Bishop Coadjutor

Henry P. Hunt (signed)
Bishop Suffragan

---

APPENDIX G

Appendix G


On Implementation:

The Colloquium regrets that the Committee seems to have given great importance to recommendations based on consensus of presentations given to it, rather than on that of sound educational principles. It disagrees with the Committee . . . that there should be a continuance of opening exercises on the ground that such meaningless and innocuous use of forms is a discredit to real religious values and does more harm than good.

The Colloquium was concerned about recommendation numbered 7 that in achieving a "program of incidental teaching and study" the new concepts of religion should be outlined as specific content for such a program, and not left completely without substance. Such content may become part of the social studies or reading programs, but should be carefully prepared to include much more than ancient tradition and myths, both of Judaeo-Christian and/or other religions, even including Marxist Communism and Humanism. Such content need not be labelled as a specific religious tenet but may be included in stories about peoples of the world, or as part of the social studies program concerned with a culture. We would expect however that greater stress was given to the Judaeo-Christian beliefs as being basic to our own cultural pattern, and that these were included in such a way that all children would be exposed to the challenge of these ideas in a controversial atmosphere, with no thought of manipulation or indoctrination.

We agree with recommendation numbered 8, that a formal course dealing with the principal religions of the world be offered as one of the optional courses in grades 11 and 12 in Secondary Schools. We feel however that a special department of religion should handle such a course or courses and that they should place major emphasis on Judaeo-Christian beliefs and not omit Marxist Communism, Humanism, or the "American Way of Life" since these are important religions of our day.

On Further Experimental Study:

It is our contention that we are not ready to implement throughout the province, a uniform course in religion and/or moral development, but that we are still at a stage where much experimentation would be of value. Furthermore, we are encouraged by (a) the fact that the Hall-Dennis Report makes experimentation possible in Public Education and (b) the fact that presently there is a time slot available according to the school legislation for religious education.
In order (a) to encourage creative experiments in Religious Education in our government school system and (b) to involve local community members to a much greater extent, in the study of the whole area dealt with by the Keiller MacKay Report, we recommend that the delegates to this Colloquium seek out a few interested parties in their local communities and encourage them to become involved in the designing of well-thought-out experiments on implementation in the local school setting and on trial basis. Accounts of such experiments should be carefully recorded and sent to the Department of Education.

We would share some suggestions concerning local action. (1) We suggest that the minister might play a behind-the-scene role in the preparation of such experiments. It might be his role to get a few others interested in such projects. There are many highly competent people in the community capable of leadership in creating useful designs.

(2) School authorities obviously should be involved in the discussions at a very early stage.

CONCLUSION

We agree with the proposed policy of dropping the present course of studies for the reasons stated in the Committee's report.

We commend the Committee for its recommendation that the legislation pertaining to school visitors . . . be repealed. We support the elimination of the privileged position of the clergy, and recommend that clergy assume appropriate responsibilities on the same basis as other resource persons in the community when invited by school authorities.

We agree with all other recommendations of the report, and we wish to commend the Committee for its recommendations to remove some of the factors dividing our society on sectarian grounds.³

APPENDIX H

Statement of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec re: Religious Instruction in the Public Schools of Ontario, 1965
Appendix H

STATEMENT OF THE BAPTIST CONVENTION OF ONTARIO AND QUEBEC RE: RELIGIOUS INSTRUCTION IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS, 1965

WHEREAS
1) We live in the Province of Ontario where there is religious liberty and where all 'Churches' are separate from the organized 'State' and do cherish the heritage that is ours; nonetheless as citizens we are concerned about the future of our Province, our children, and their children.

2) Our public school system was inaugurated in 1843 to guarantee to every child the right to an education and from that day our laws have permitted, encouraged and provided for the teaching of religious education in the Public Schools of Ontario.

3) Religion has a place in the making of citizens and the preparation for life along with reading, writing, arithmetic, social studies, and science.

4) There are those citizens who are endeavouring to secure the complete secularization of our Public Schools.

5) There are those who believe that secularization leads to materialism and Godless materialism to the City of Destruction.

6) Baptists of this Convention have since 1929 been active on Inter-Church Committees on Religious Education in the Schools, and have availed themselves of the opportunity to teach the Bible in the Public Schools as well as in the province's Teachers' Colleges.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:

1) That we re-affirm our support of the teaching of Religious Education within the school system of the Province of Ontario.

2) That the Department of Christian Education of the Baptist Convention of Ontario and Quebec be represented officially on those committees whose concern is religious education in the schools of Ontario.

3) That we encourage laymen and ministers of the Convention Churches to show interest in this aspect of the School Curriculum and to give support to the School Boards as opportunity is given them.
4) That we urge those ministers who do avail themselves of the opportunity of teaching in the classroom to acquaint themselves with 'The Regulations and Programme for Religious Education in the Public Schools'.

5) That we recognize the fact that each person within our Churches must act according to his own conscience and his own sense of duty to God and to our Province even as the laws regarding 'religious education in the schools' recognize that there will be those pupils who do not participate in any religious studies or any exercise of devotion objected to by his parents or guardians.⁴

APPENDIX I

Regulation 262: Revised Regulations of Ontario, 1980
Religious Exercises and Religious Education in the Public Schools
Appendix I

RELIGIOUS EXERCISES AND RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

28. - (1) A public school shall be opened or closed each school day with religious exercises consisting of the reading of the Scriptures or other suitable readings and the repeating of the Lord's Prayer or other suitable prayers. R.R.O. 1980, Reg. 262, s.28 (1).

(2) The readings and prayers that form part of the religious exercises referred to in subsection (1) shall be chosen from a list of selections approved for such purpose by the board that operates the school where the board approves such a list and, where the board does not approve such a list, the principal of the school shall select the readings and prayers after notifying the board of the principal's intention to do so, but this selection is subject to revision by the board at any time. O. Reg. 617/81, s.21, part.

(3) The religious exercises under subsection (1) may include the singing of one or more hymns.

(4) Two periods per week of one-half hour each, in addition to the time assigned to religious exercises at the opening or closing of a public school, shall be devoted to religious education.

(5) Religious education shall be given immediately after the opening of a public school or immediately before the closing of school in either the morning or the afternoon session.

(6) Instruction in religious education shall be given by the teacher and issues of controversial or sectarian nature shall be avoided.

(7) By resolution of a board, a clergyman or clergymen of any denomination, or a lay person or lay persons selected by the clergyman or clergymen, may give religious instruction in the schools of the board in lieu of a teacher or teachers.

(8) Where two or more clergymen of different denominations, or lay persons selected by the clergymen, upon written application to the board, secure permission under subsection (7) to give religious instruction in the same school, the principal of the school, by resolution of the board, shall arrange for such accommodation within the school and such times within the periods referred to in subsection (5) as are agreeable to both the principal and the clergymen or the lay person selected by the clergymen.
(9) Where the number of rooms in a public school is insufficient to meet the needs of the groups organized for religious instruction under subsection (7) or (8), the principal of the school, by resolution of the board, may arrange for additional accommodation elsewhere. R.R.O. 1980, Reg. 262, s.28 (3-9).

(10) No pupil shall be required to take part in any religious exercises or be subject to any instruction in religious education where a parent of the pupil, or the pupil where the pupil is an adult, applies to the principal of the school that the pupil attends for exemption of the pupil therefrom. O.Reg. 617/81, s.21, part.

(11) In public schools without suitable waiting rooms or other similar accommodation, if the parent of a pupil or, where the pupil is an adult, the pupil applies to the principal of the school for the exemption of the pupil from attendance while religious exercises are being held or religious education given, such request shall be granted. R.R.O. 1980, Reg. 262,s.28 (11).

(12) Where a parent of a pupil, or the pupil where the pupil is an adult, objects to the pupil's taking part in religious exercises or being subject to instruction in religious education, but requests that the pupil remain in the classroom during the time devoted to religious exercises or instruction in religious education, the principal of the school that the pupil attends shall permit the pupil to do so, if the pupil maintains decorous behaviour.

(13) If, because of the right to be absent from religious exercises or instruction, any pupil is not present in the classroom during the periods specified for religious education or instruction in religious education, the absence shall not be considered a contravention of the rules of the school.
APPENDIX J

Policy/Program Memorandum No. 112

Education About Religion in the Public Elementary and Secondary Schools
Appendix J

POLICY/PROGRAM MEMORANDUM NO. 112

Date of Issue: December 6, 1990 Effective: January 1, 1991

Subject: EDUCATION ABOUT RELIGION IN THE PUBLIC ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS

Application: Chairpersons of Boards of Education
Directors of Education of Boards of Education
Principals of Public Elementary and Secondary Schools

I. Background

On January 30, 1990, the Ontario Court of Appeal unanimously struck down subsection 28(4) of Regulation 262 concerning religious education in the public elementary schools. The court ruled that the subsection infringed on the freedom of conscience and religion guaranteed by section 2(a) of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms. Neither the subsection nor the court decision applied to schools operated by the Roman Catholic separate school boards.

Section 29 of Regulation 262, regarding provision of religious instruction by clergy or designates in the public secondary schools, was not before the court, and the court's ruling did not apply expressly to that section. However, subsequent advice by legal counsel indicates that the principles outlined in the decision make section 29 equally untenable.

In its decision, the court made it very clear that subsection 28(4) of the regulation was invalid because it permitted the teaching of a single religious tradition as if it were the exclusive means through which to develop moral thinking and behaviour. The court also ruled that education designed to teach about religion and to foster moral values without indoctrination in a particular religious faith would not contravene the charter.

In distinguishing between religious indoctrination and education about religion, the court made the following statement:

While this is an easy test to state, the line between indoctrination and education, in some instances can be difficult to draw. With this in mind it may be of
assistance to refer to the following more detailed statement of the distinction:

- The school may sponsor the study of religion, but not sponsor the practice of religion.
- The school may expose students to all religious views, but may not impose any particular view.
- The school's approach to religion is one of instruction, not one of indoctrination.
- The function of the school is to educate about all religions, not to convert to any one religion.
- The school's approach is academic, not devotional.
- The school should study what all people believe, but should not teach a student what to believe.
- The school should strive for student awareness of all religions, but should not press for student acceptance of any one religion.
- The school should seek to inform the student about various beliefs, but should not seek to conform him or her to any one belief.

Subsequent to the court's ruling, an interim policy for public elementary schools, dated February 28, 1990, was established, whereby boards were permitted to provide programs in education about religion in the time previously used during the school day, as long as these programs were in accordance with the court's ruling. Boards of education were also advised that they could continue to provide space outside the school day, as they do for various community-related activities, if parents requested that their children be taught religion by clergy or designates. This interim policy for elementary schools was intended to remain in effect only until policy considerations related to the public elementary and secondary schools were finalized.

II. Permanent Policy

The Ministry of Education will amend sections 28 and 29 of Regulation 262 to reflect the following permanent policy, which will apply to public elementary and secondary schools:

1. Boards of education may provide programs in education about religion in Grades 1 to 8 during the school day for up to 60 minutes per week.

2. Boards of education may continue to provide optional credit courses in World Religions in secondary schools, as specified in the curriculum guideline entitled History and Contemporary Studies, Part C: Senior Division, Grades 11 and 12, 1987. The program described
in the guideline meets the court's definition of permissible education about religion.

3. Schools and programs, including programs in education about religion, under the jurisdiction of boards of education must meet both of the following conditions:
   a) They must not be indoctrinational.
   b) They must not give primacy to any particular religious faith.

4. Boards of education may continue to provide space before the beginning or after the close of the instructional program of the school day for indoctrinational religious education. Given the provisions for the equality of treatment in the Canadian Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms, boards choosing this option must make space available on an equitable basis to all religious groups.

This policy will come into effect on January 1, 1991.

III. Purpose

The purpose of programs in education about religion is to enable students to acquire knowledge and awareness of a variety of the religious traditions that have shaped and continue to shape our world. The programs enable individuals to understand, appreciate, and respect various types of religious beliefs, attitudes, and behaviour.

The purpose of these programs is not to instil the beliefs of any one particular religion. It is the prerogative of individual pupils and their families to decide which religious beliefs they should hold. Indoctrinational religious education has no place in the curriculum or programs of public elementary and secondary schools of the province.

IV. Content

Since the world's religions are many and varied, a particular program in education about religion cannot be expected to include every one of them. As a minimum, programs in any grade should include a balanced consideration of world religions that have continuing significance for the world's people.

Both content and method should be appropriate to the ages and levels of maturity of the pupils. In developing programs of education about religion, consideration may be given to various organizational frameworks.
V. Resources

The Ministry of Education will develop a resource document to assist boards of education in developing programs in education about religion for elementary schools.

Programs for the secondary schools will continue to be developed in accordance with History and Contemporary Studies, Part C: Senior Division, Grades 11 and 12, 1987.

VI. Context

This permanent policy and the forthcoming amendments to Regulation 262 are to be understood within the context of the long-established vision of the public elementary and secondary schools as places where people of diverse backgrounds can learn and grow together. The public schools are open and accessible to all on an equal basis and founded upon the positive societal values which, in general, Canadians hold and regard as essential to the well-being of our society. These values transcend cultures and faiths, reinforce democratic rights, and are founded in a fundamental belief in the worth of all persons.
A. ARCHIVAL MATERIAL

1. ARCHIVES OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH OF CANADA, TORONTO

Minutes and Proceedings


Memoranda and Miscellaneous Papers


"A Suggested Syllabus of Lessons", n.d. [General Board of Religious Education, Box 29, Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada].


"Bishop's Committee on Religious Education in Schools". Diocese of Toronto, February, 1962.

Canadian Jewish Congress. "Official Declaration by the Canadian Jewish Congress on Religious Education in the Public Schools", March 22, 1945.


Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in the Schools of Ontario. "Brief submitted to the Royal Commission on Education Respecting the Place of Religion in Public Education", 1945.

Inter-Church Committee on Week Day Religious Education. "Religious Education in the Public Schools: A Memorandum for the Department of Education of the Province of Ontario", April 3, 1944.

[Inter-Church Committee]. "A Suggested Syllabus of Lessons". n.d.

[Inter-Church Committee]. "A Summary of the Table of Contents of the Guide Books for Instruction in Public Schools". n.d.

"Inter-Church Committee to the Prime Minister and the Minister of Education of Ontario". n.d.


_________. "For the Inter-Church Committee on Weekday Religious Education", February 19, 1945.

_________. "The Inter-Church Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools", Report of the Secretary, January 3, 1941.

_________. "Memorandum of the Interchurch Committee to the Department of Education of Ontario", April 3, 1944.

"Memorandum Regarding the Findings of an Informal Sub-Committee Reporting on Religious Education in Ontario to
the Study Committee of the Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario", April 19, 1944.


2. ARCHIVES OF THE BAPTIST CONVENTION OF ONTARIO AND QUEBEC, HAMILTON, ONTARIO

Minutes and Proceedings


Minutes of the Baptist Missionary Convention of Ontario, 1867, Canadian Baptist Register, 1868.

3. ARCHIVES OF THE CITY OF OTTAWA

Minutes and Proceedings

Minutes of the Presbytery of Ottawa of the United Church of Canada, 1925-1945.

4. ARCHIVES OF ONTARIO, TORONTO

Briefs Submitted to the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario, 1966-1969


City of Ottawa Public School Board. "Submission to the Ontario Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools". Brief No. 41. November 18, 1966.

Delegation of Parents from the Township of Gosfield South and Surrounding Area. Brief No. 85.

Despland, Michel, "A Rationale for Religious Studies in the Public Schools". Brief No. 106. [Presbyterian Church].

Diocese of Toronto of the Anglican Church of Canada. Brief No. 16.

Eastern Canada Synod of the Lutheran Church. Brief No. 15.

Ethical Education Association. Brief No. 57.

Federation of Women Teachers' Associations of Ontario. Brief No. 93.

Ontario Alliance of Christian Schools. Brief No. 75A

Ontario Education Association, The Religious Education Section. Brief No. 25.

Ontario Inter-Church Committee on Public Education. Brief No. 1.


5. ARCHIVES OF THE ONTARIO INSTITUTE FOR STUDIES IN EDUCATION, TORONTO

Briefs Submitted to the Royal Commission on Education, 1945-1946.

Association for Religious Liberty. "Religious Education in Ontario Schools". Brief No. 45.

Canadian Jewish Congress, Central Division. "Religious Education in Ontario". Brief No. 46.

________. "Attitudes of Various Christian Denominations to the Interference of the State in Matters of Religion". Supplementary Statement to Brief No. 46.

________. "Statement on the Presentation of the Jewish Religion in the Textbooks for Religious Education of the
Ontario Public Schools." Supplementary Statement to Brief No. 46.


The Inter-Church Committee on Protestant-Roman Catholic Relations. "Protestant-Roman Catholic Relations." Brief No. 113.

Morley, Judge G. W. "The Urgent Need of Teaching Christianity in Our Schools". Brief No. 103.


_________ . "Recommendations from the 1945 Regional Conferences of the Ontario Education Association." Brief No. 156.


The United Church of Canada, Board of Christian Education. "Religion and Public Education." Brief No. 64.
Memoranda and Miscellaneous Papers


6. ARCHIVES OF THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN CANADA, TORONTO

Minutes and Proceedings


Minutes of the Presbytery of London of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1931-1950.


7. ARCHIVES OF THE UNITED CHURCH OF CANADA, TORONTO

Minutes and Proceedings

The Canadian Congregational Yearbook. Toronto, 1876-1924.


Memoranda and Miscellaneous Papers

8. NATIONAL ARCHIVES OF CANADA, OTTAWA

Memoranda and Miscellaneous Papers


9. NATIONAL ARCHIVES OF QUEBEC AT MONTREAL

Minutes and Proceedings


10. THE ONTARIO JEWISH ARCHIVES

Miscellaneous Papers

"Brief of the Canadian Jewish Congress, Central Division, to the Committee on Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario." Toronto, February 10, 1967.

Canadian Jewish Congress, Central Division, "For Children in a Democracy: Religious Instruction in the Public Schools of Ontario." Brief No. 46 to the Royal Commission on Education. Toronto, 1945.


"Official Declaration by the Canadian Jewish Congress on Religious Education in the Public Schools", March 22, 1945.

B. PUBLISHED SOURCES


The Book of Common Prayer. London: Queen’s Printer, 1662. [Church of England.]


Chadwick, Owen. The Victorian Church. London: Adam & Charles Black, 1966


Feinberg, Abraham L. *Religious Instruction in the Public Schools/ The Ontario Plan - Good or Bad*? Toronto: Association for Religious Liberty, 1945.


Hayes, Ernest H. Jesus and the Kingdom [Grade Six]. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1944.


The Legislation and History of Separate Schools in Upper Canada: From 1841, Until the Close of the Reverend Doctor Ryerson's Administration of the Education Department in Ontario in 1876. Toronto: William Briggs, 1897.


Interchurch Committee on Weekday Religious Education. Religious Education in the Public Schools of Ontario. Toronto, 1940.


Purdy, J. D. "John Strachan's Educational Policies, 1815-1841". Ontario History, 64 (March 1972): 45-64.


Bibliography


C. **THeses And DISSERTATIONS**


D. NEWSPAPERS AND JOURNALS

The Canadian Forum (Toronto), 1935-1960

The Christian Guardian (Toronto), 1850-1860

The Globe and Mail (Toronto), 1939-1945

The Kirkland Lake Northern Daily News (Kirkland Lake, Ontario), 1969

New Outlook, (Toronto), 1925-1939

Presbyterian (Toronto), 1866