Music Education Research in Canada
Lee R. Bartel
University of Toronto
Chair of the CMEA Research Commission

RESEARCH INTEREST PRIOR TO 1976

Music Education as an academic field of study and profession developed during the 1950's and 60's in North America. The "Music Education" major was established at the University of Toronto in 1946 and graduated its first class in 1949. A graduate program in music education was developed at the University of Illinois in 1953 by Charles Leonhard. The Journal of Research in Music Education in the United States was created in 1953 and the Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education was first issued in 1963. The Canadian Music Journal began publication in 1956 and the Canadian Music Educator in 1959.

Although universities were pursuing music education academically and research publications (largely filled with studies done for graduate credit) appeared, the music education professional maintained a focus on the practical -- teaching students how to play and sing. When the Canadian Music Education Association decided to organize a research committee in 1973, Margery Vaughan observed, "the average musician ... regards the topic of Canadian musical research in roughly the same way as he does that of Architecture in the Sahara: is there any? Actually there is a great wealth of activity in schools and colleges all across the country, and there have also been notable efforts to co-ordinate these activities, by Helmut Kallmann at the National Library in Ottawa, Keith McMillan at the Canadian Music Centre, and Wally Laughton at the CMEA Resource Centre" (Vaughan, 1973 p 16-17). Indeed, efforts to promote an interest in research were evident and did begin to have an effect. Several years later Margery Vaughan notes that "At past MENC conferences the research sessions have usually been rather sparsely attended -- and, with few exceptions, only by relatives and friends of the speakers. This year ... the sessions attracted SRO [standing room only] crowds..." (Vaughan, 1976, p7).

The Canadian Music Educator (CME) was created in 1959 but it took ten years before there was evident interest and attention to research. In 1969 the Newsletter (Number 5, p 11) of the CMEA introduced a feature titled, "Research News (a new department)." That same issue lists a new National Executive elected at the Regina Conference in April. Wallace Laughton is listed as "Research Coordinator and Newsletter Editor." The listing points out that he is a member of the Canadian Council for Research in Education. Also in that Newsletter issue there is a description of one of the "loan" services of CMEA "Research material: Thesis [sic] abstracts, Research Journals, U.S. State & Office of Education Research news." Apparently from the initial research promotion efforts of the CMEA there has been some problem "getting it right" and being consistent. In subsequent issues Wallace Laughton is listed with the CMEA Executive as "Research and information Chairman." In 1971 he was listed simply as "Information Officer." In the Fall 1973 issue, Margery Vaughan is listed as "Contributing Editor, Research, for the Canadian Music
In September of 1971 the CMEA Executive passed a motion requesting the formation of a research group within the association. Campbell Trowsdale was asked to undertake an exploration of interest and need. He solicited the assistance of Frank Churchley to share responsibility with him. Their investigation attempted to determine whether "our profession in Canada has reached that point where a rigorously defined research group differentiated from the materials and resources centre directed so ably by Wally Laughton is realistic at this time." (Letter to the Editor of the CME, Spring 1972, p. 24). They proposed to deal with the question at the CMEA conference in Ottawa in 1973.

**FORMATION OF THE CANADIAN MUSIC RESEARCH COUNCIL - 1973**

At the Ottawa conference of the Canadian Music Educators' Association in the spring of 1973 the first research presentation sessions were held. Paul Green was one of the presenters at the research sessions. His paper entitled, "A Proposed Doctoral Program in Music for Canadian Universities with Specific Recommendations for Specialization in Music Education" reflects an awareness of a need for graduate education in music education in Canada and with that, research. In recent correspondence Green (2000) said, "I think I can remember most of the other presentations given on that occasion. Frank Churchley was in attendance . . . Keith MacMillan and Ken Bray were among them."

At the Ottawa conference the CMEA formed a Research Committee consisting of Ian Bradley, Univ of Victoria, Deane Jensen (chair), Edmonton Public School Board, Martin Prevel, Laval University, and Margery Vaughan, University of Victoria. Vaughan called the group the "Research Committee" in an article in the CME that fall (Vaughan, 1973). Officially it was known as the "Canadian Music Research Council." Paul Green (2000) observes, "the casual naming of the council created waves in that some people thought the name should be confined to Music Education rather than Music." In the first publication of this research group in 1976, edited by Margery Vaughan, it is definitively called, "Canadian Music Research Council."

The 1973 "committee" was reformed and in 1976 is listed as the "executive" of Canadian Music Research Council (CMRC) with Margery Vaughan (chairman), Roger Mongeon, Harold Fiske, and Campbell Trowsdale. About 30 -35 people signed on as members of the association (Fiske 2000). In 1980 the executive changed to Harold Fiske (chairman), Estelle Jorgensen, Nancy Vogan, and Joel Wapnick and remained in place until 1983. Harold Fiske resigned from the position of chair in 1983 but did not announce a successor in the Bulletin (Number 13). Robert Walker was appointed to the position of chair and Allen Clingman, Harold Fiske, and Robert Wood were executive members. In 1990 Lee Bartel and Nancy Browne were added to the group.

Robert Walker stepped out of the "chair" in 1993 and the Executive of the CMEA appointed Lee Bartel to take the position. At the same time, they changed the "Council" to a "Commission" believing that the "commission" represented greater openness to CMEA members and that the "Council" had developed somewhat of an exclusivity or "research elite" sense. During the early years (1976-1983) when the *Music Research News* was published, a separate subscription was
required for the Bulletin. By 1983 the "subscribers list" to the *Music Research News* had reached well over 100 (Fiske, 1983). Harold Fiske (2000) points out that "after Bob Walker took over he immediately upgraded "Music Research News" to a regular issue of the CMEA journal." That meant that there was no longer a specific research interest group identified through subscription. That left the executive "Council" with its handful of members as THE council. The slight enlargement in 1990 did not change that sense of "exclusive research club." Changing the name to "commission" may have attempted to signal a greater openness but, in effect, did nothing to redefine the "research interest group."

In CME Volume 32 Number 3, the "research edition," Robert Walker listed all the contributors to the research issue. That in essence became the membership list. The CMEA Board in 1993 felt this was still too restrictive and a "member" should be anyone who had attended the research sessions at Conferences. A list of "attenders" was kept at the research sessions in London in the Fall of 1994. However, since 1994, CMEA has not held separate National Conventions and few of the provincial conferences feature research sessions so this approach did not work. At present membership in the CMEA Research Commission is all who have published in the research editions.

**PUBLICATIONS OF THE CANADIAN MUSIC EDUCATION RESEARCH COUNCIL**

The Canadian Music Research Council (CMRC) was formed in 1973. In 1976 the CMRC initiated the *Music Research News Bulletin*. From 1976 to 1983 this Bulletin was produced about twice a year as an 8 1/2 by 11 inch, Gestetner printed and stapled periodical. The start of the Bulletin was facilitated by a grant from the Canada Council General Fund to hire an assistant to create and produce the issue. Although there were initially about 35 members and later close to 100, "very few... contributed either to the newsletter or participated in conferences. What contributions there were consisted of abstracts, the occasional book review, and calls-for-papers for the next meeting" (Fiske 2000).

The appointment of Robert Walker as chair of the Research Council brought about the creation of a new research periodical - not simply the "newsletter" form that featured abstracts and announcements but full research reports. This new *Canadian Journal of Research in Music Education* (CJRME) appeared, in name, to be a counter-part to the *Journal of Research in Music Education* produced by the music educators' association in the United States. However, in the Foreword of the first issue, Robert Walker stated the intention to be different from the JRME from the U.S. by including "papers which comment on, or describe research as well as those reporting specific studies."

The first issue of the CJRME appeared in 1986, still as an 8 1/2 by 11 inch side stapled copy. The name appeared centred on the cover with "Canadian Music Educator" in a distinctly secondary role. It featured four papers by Allen Clingman, Harold Fiske, Brian Roberts, and Robert Wood. The second issue was produced in 1987 and featured a more professionally produced look in the 6 by 9 inch format typical of academic journals. From the first issue, support for its production was given by Simon Fraser University. This support made possible this more expensive form of the journal. Up to 1991 this size and form was maintained but in the third journal (January 1989) the name was changed to *Canadian Music Educator, Research Edition*. Paul Green (2000) may reflect the attitude of some of the original Council members when he says, "these research publications changed at the
whim of the various chairpersons (especially Robert Walker) in an effort to move beyond the somewhat unsophisticated newsletters in the early years." The main reason for the name change in 1989 was not to drive librarians to despair (although it seemed to have that effect), but to avoid various complications related to mailing and cataloguing regulations.


In 1991 the unexpected size and cost of publishing the papers of the Research Seminar of the International Society for Music Education (ISME) at the same time as dropping membership in CMEA created a financial crisis. Simon Fraser University, who had generously supported the journal since 1986, could no longer bear the cost. Appeals were made to other universities for support and some was given. In the end funding was inadequate to sustain "the luxury" of the distinct research edition. The result was an end to the "academic" sized research publications. The papers of the research council sessions at the Vancouver Conference in 1991 were finally published in two regular CME journals in January and May of 1993. Not only was this a discouraging turn for the research journal but an issue numbering mistake occurred with those two journals that caused serious confusion and complaint from libraries. Robert Walker resigned from the position as editor of the CME, the Research Edition, and as chair of the Research Council.

In 1993 Lee Bartel became editor of the research edition of the CME and chair of the Research Commission. From 1994 until 1999 an annual research edition was produced in the regular magazine format but more explicitly again called the Canadian Journal of Research in Music Education. The primary source for papers for the research edition from 1987 - 1993 had been the bi-annual conference Research Council sessions. In 1994 these national conferences were discontinued and the supply of papers diminished. The policy to restrict papers to those by CMEA members limited the pool of papers rather severely. With papers being strictly refereed by three reviewers, it became increasingly difficult to fill the journal with worthy papers. The "publication of last resort" reputation the journal seemed to develop among some Canadians eager to be published in the most prestigious (read foreign) journals, and the consequent criticism about its content and international reputation, led the CMEA Board in 1999 to discontinue the separate research issue. The CMEA Board also acted on a sense of obligation that the publications distributed to all its members be readily accessible by them and practically helpful.

**RESEARCH PRESENTATIONS AT CONFERENCES**

A central function of the Research Council was the organization of research paper presentations at the CMEA National conference. The first took place in Ottawa in 1973 where the Research Council was established. Every National Conference for 20 years featured a concurrent meeting of the Research Council to present papers. In most cases these sessions were only attended by the special research interest group. Harold Fiske (2000) recalls, "Some of us used to joke that the association held its meetings at a local pub where "all three" of us each presented a paper for ten minutes or so, then held the "official" meeting!! In a way this was not too far off." In actual fact, these were very
serious and hard-working sessions often dealing with esoteric, pure research reports that appealed to only a select group. Attendance was always a concern. Fiske (2000) observes that "Margery, Estelle, and I ...spent a great deal of time discussing how to enhance the association's image so that more would participate. The problem, of course, was that there were very few music education "researchers" in Canada."

A very important addition to the research dissemination process in Canada was the organization by the University of Western Ontario of a regular research symposium. The first was held in 1976 and brought in leaders in research from the U.S. including Jack Heller, Thomas Vasil, and Edwin Gordon.

A significant moment for the Canadian Music Research Council was the opportunity to present five short research reports as part of the CMEA sessions at the 1978 ISME Conference in London Ontario.

**FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

In place of the annual research edition, CMEA in 1999 decided to begin a new research-oriented topical "yearbook" type series produced every other year with a selected "yearbook" editor. This new topical "book" series should attract a more extensive market of international libraries and as a result become a more appealing medium in which Canadian researchers can publish. The intent is to maintain at least 50% Canadian authorship in each volume. This opening to international authors is intended to strengthen the publications and their appeal. Although the bi-annual series is to have a research emphasis, not necessarily all papers will be research reports. In that sense it is again in agreement with the initial goal of the CJRME. These bi-annual topical collections of papers will not be distributed to the CMEA membership with the journal subscription. A separate subscription will be necessary - again a return to the initial practice of the Research Council. Perhaps a new way to define membership in the Research Commission will emerge and a new energy will inspire research efforts in Canada.

**REFERENCES**

Fiske, Harold (2000) Personal email correspondence, April


Green, Paul (2000) Personal email correspondence, April


Vaughan, Margery M. (1973). Research in Canadian music education:
A challenge to action. *Canadian Music Educator* 15(1) pp. 16-17


**List of Published Contributors to the Canadian Journal of Research in Music Education 1986-1999 (not including the ISME paper publications).**

Adam Adler, 40(4) 1999*
Duane Bates, 30(1) 1989
S. Belleperche, 39(4) 1998
Wayne Bowman, 34(5) 1993
Nancy Browne, 31(1) 1989
Beata Buczkowski, 37(4) 1996
Linda Cameron, 35(7) 1994; 37(4) 1996
Allen E. Clingman, 27 (3) 1986; 30(1) 1989
Timothy G. Cooper, 31(1) 1989
Sandra Davies, 32(3) 1990; 34(3) 1993
Lori-Anne Dolloff, 40(4) 1999; 37(4) 1996
Sandra Ensley, 29(1) 1987
Ewert, Arlene, 39(4) 1998
Harold E. Fiske, 27 (3) 1986, 30(1) 1989; 34(3) 1993
Noel T. Gantly, 31(1) 1989
Theo Goldberg, 30(1) 1989
Peter Gouzouasis, 34(5) 1993
Betty Anne Hanley, 30(1) 1989, 31(1) 1989; 32(3) 1990; 34(3) 1993
Dallas Hinton, 30(1) 1989
Mary Hookey, 34(3) 1993; 35(7) 1994
Sharon Krebs, 30(1) 1989
Anne S. Lowe, 38(4) 1997
Esther H. S. Mang, 38(4) 1997
Theresa Mathers, 37(4) 1996
Marta McCarthy, 40(4) 1999
Francine Morin, 35(7) 1994; 36(7) 1995
L.L. Morton, 39(4) 1998
Bruce Pennycook, 37(4) 1996
M.C. Pietrangelo, 39(4) 1998
Ruth Precesky, 36(7) 1995
Nevaida L. Ries, 29(1) 1987
Brian Roberts, 27 (3) 1986, 31(1) 1989; 32(3) 1990; 34(3) 1993; 36(7) 1995
Sheena Roberts, 31(1) 1989
Sheila Scott, 38(4) 1997; 39(4) 1998
Selina Shrofel, 31(1) 1989
Katharine Smithrim, 35(7) 1994; 38(4) 1997
Donna-Joy Stone, 30(1) 1989
Eleanor Stubley, 40(4) 1999
Marlene Taylor, 29(1) 1987
Robert Walker, 29(1) 1987, 31(1) 1989;
Anne-Marie Walsh, 40(4) 1999
Cameron Walter, 36(7) 1995
Robert W. Wood, 27 (3) 1986;

*Numbers indicate Volume, Number and Year of contribution.

(with permission from CMEA)