A Comparative Study of Elite-English-Medium Schools, Public Schools, and Islamic Madaris in Contemporary Pakistan: The Use of Pierre Bourdieu’s Theory to Understand "Inequalities in Educational and Occupational Opportunities"

By

AKHTAR HASSAN MALIK

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education
Department of Sociology and Equity Studies in Education
University of Toronto

© Copyright by Akhtar Hassan Malik 2012
A Comparative Study of Elite-English-Medium Schools, Public Schools, and Islamic Madaris in Contemporary Pakistan: The Use of Pierre Bourdieu’s Theory to Understand "Inequalities in Educational and Occupational Opportunities"

Doctor of Education, 2012
Akhtar Hassan Malik
Department of Sociology and Equity Studies in Education
University of Toronto

ABSTRACT

This thesis has attempted to understand the role of mainstream schools: elite English-medium schools, public schools and Islamic madaris in reproducing various social classes in Pakistan. Bourdieu’s theory of social reproduction serves as a major conceptual framework in this study, and it has been complemented by Anyon’s thesis about social class and school knowledge.

My study suggests that an unequal availability of capital resources, agents’ class-habitus, and the type of their “cultural currency” act as selection mechanisms that clearly favour some social groups over others. This consolidates existing social-class hierarchy. The ruling classes ensure the transfer of their power and privilege to their children by providing them quality education in elite schools. The disadvantaged classes have no other option than to educate their children either in public schools or Islamic madaris. The new non-elite private schools have blatantly made education a commodity. This has contributed towards educational apartheid in the country. My study underscores that the working-class parents possess cultural capital which they transmit through building efficient learning environments in family settings. Yet, their class-habitus plays a causal role in keeping aspirations low.

The three types of schools constitute distinct fields of education and provide a fairly different schooling experience to their students. For instance, these schools have different standards of
material/human resources that are likely to instil a hierarchical view of the world among students. Likewise, differing curricular, pedagogical, and student evaluation practices emphasize different cognitive and behavioural skills. These differences can become central features for the reproduction of the division of labour at work and in society between those who plan and manage and those in the work force whose jobs primarily entail carrying out policies made by others. Public school knowledge has some exchange value in the marketplace, but it legitimates the ideology of production for consumption. I recommend that an integrated and equitable system of “national education” is vital for nation building. For future research, I suggest both considering different components of cultural capital other than exposure to high culture and exploring a wide range of dispositions to better understand how they influence one’s actions.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to the many people who helped me in so many ways to make this project a reality: the people who participated in this research, my thesis committee, colleagues, friends, and family. Without their support and guidance, the completion of this dissertation would have been difficult, if not impossible, for me to achieve.

I express a deep gratitude to my teacher, professional mentor, and thesis supervisor, Dr. David Livingstone. Thank you for your advice, encouragement, enthusiasm, honesty, and patience. Your consistent understanding, constructive advice, extensive editing, and ongoing support has made this academic journey meaningful and inspiring. I also wish to thank my thesis committee members: Dr. Stephen Anderson and Dr. Sarfaroz Niyozov, for their encouragement, their constructive critique of the research and their availability in spite of the many demands on their time. I am greatly honoured to have all of these distinguished scholars in my thesis committee.

My special thanks to my friends: Iqbal Anjum for expert editorial input and competent analytical help, and Dr. Takbir Ali for his continuous academic and moral support. These friends listened me patiently when things went wrong, laughed with me, commiserated with me, and gave me the kind of practical advice that usually kept me from veering too far off on the wrong tangent.

I am greatly indebted to all of the individuals who participated in this research and remained patient during intensive interviews, which were such a vital component of this study. These individuals shared their opinions and experiences with honesty and a level of detail that provided insight into this topic.

I express deep gratitude to my father: Dr. Muzaffar Hassan Malik, who never stopped believing in my ability to complete the dissertation (even when he wondered if it would be finished in his lifetime!). I also wish to thank my mother for her unconditional love and support.

I am also extremely grateful to my sister and brothers for inspiration, understanding, and moral support. They always encouraged me to pursue my dreams, and stood by me while I did.
Most heartfelt thanks go to Qaisra Firdous Malik, who cheered me when I felt most discouraged, believed in me when I stopped believing in myself, and who provided me will to stand up against challenges which seemed so insurmountable.

And finally, a special thanks to my children, Maria, Nauman, and Suleiman, for remaining patient and providing the mental peace necessary to let me remain focussed to complete this thesis project amicably. My son, Nauman, has also helped me overcome some of technical issues related with MS Word. I extend many thanks to him.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................................... ii  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................. iv  
TABLE OF CONTENTS ..................................................................................................... vi  
LIST OF TABLES, BOXES AND FIGURES ........................................................................... x  

## CHAPTER ONE: AN OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY .............................................. 1  
Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 1  
Locating the Study .............................................................................................................. 2  
Emergence of the Study .................................................................................................... 12  
  Theoretical and Conceptual Framework ........................................................................ 13  
  Research Questions ........................................................................................................ 14  
Personal and Subjective Location ................................................................................... 15  
Context of the Research .................................................................................................. 16  
Significance of Research ................................................................................................... 19  
Structure of the Thesis .................................................................................................... 21  

## CHAPTER TWO: CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND ECONOMIC DISPARITY IN PAKISTAN ......................................................................................... 23  
Facts about Pakistan ......................................................................................................... 23  
Major Cultural Patterns of Pakistan ................................................................................ 26  
  Hindu Influence .............................................................................................................. 27  
  Islamic Influence .......................................................................................................... 29  
  The Introduction of Western Culture in the Subcontinent .......................................... 32  
  Epilogue: Contemporary Pakistani Culture and Lifestyles ........................................ 33  
Economic Disparity and Dynamics of Elitist Model in Pakistan .................................... 36  
Chapter Summary ........................................................................................................... 43  

## CHAPTER THREE: THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE THESIS .......... 45  
Rationale for Assembling a Conceptual Combination ..................................................... 45  
Documenting Reproduction and Inequality: Anyon's Perspective ............................... 46  
An Overview of Bourdieu’s Theory of Social Reproduction ......................................... 48  
Three Key Concepts: Capital, Habitus, and Field ........................................................... 51  
Capital ............................................................................................................................... 51  
Economic capital ............................................................................................................. 52  
Cultural Capital ............................................................................................................... 53  
  Cultural Capital is Primarily Transmitted Through the Family .................................. 54  
  Different Ways to Operationalize Cultural Capital in Research ............................... 54  
Social Capital .................................................................................................................. 55  
Convertibility of Capital ................................................................................................. 57
The Relative Autonomy of Schools and contributing factors ........................................ 116
A Comparative Overview of School Cultures .............................................................. 130
Islamic Madaris ........................................................................................................ 130
  Reproduction of Islamic Culture and Lifestyles in Madaris ........................................ 132
  Obedience on Demand in Islamic madaris ............................................................... 135
  Reproduction of Islamic Identity and Upholding the Cultural Sanctity in Madaris .... 137
  The State of Co-curricular Activities in Madaris ....................................................... 138
The Public Schools .................................................................................................... 139
  A Mixed-Cultural Paradigm in the Public Schools ..................................................... 140
  Obedience on Demand in the Public Schools ............................................................ 141
  The Cane Still Rules in the Public Schools ............................................................... 142
  Laxity for having Proper Eating Places .................................................................. 143
  The Significance of Co-curricular Activities in Public Schools ................................. 144
The Elite Schools ....................................................................................................... 144
  Reproduction of Western Culture and Lifestyles in the Elite Schools ...................... 146
  The Students’ Involvement: An Essence of Elite School Culture ............................... 148
  The Significance of Canteens in Elite Schools ......................................................... 151
  The Importance of Physical Nurture in Elite Schools ............................................. 151
Chapter Summary ...................................................................................................... 152

CHAPTER SIX: THE CAPITAL (MONETARY AND NON-MONETARY FORMS) .... 157
Economic Capital: A Comparative Analysis ............................................................... 157
Cultural Capital: A Comparative Analysis ................................................................. 164
  Working-class Participants’ Learning beyond Schooling .......................................... 165
  Participants’ Ability to Choose a Suitable School ...................................................... 173
  Parents’ Practical Involvement in their Children’s Schooling ................................... 181
  Students’ Study Habits and Preferred Television Programs ...................................... 189
Social Capital: A Comparative Analysis .................................................................... 194
Chapter Summary ...................................................................................................... 200

CHAPTER SEVEN: SOCIAL CLASS AND SCHOOL KNOWLEDGE .............. 204
A Brief Overview of the Curricula and Pedagogical Styles ......................................... 204
Islamic Madaris ........................................................................................................ 214
Refutation: A Dominant Theme in Madaris Education .............................................. 222
Public Schools ........................................................................................................... 227
Islamization of Knowledge: A Dominant Theme in Public Schools ......................... 237
Elite English-Medium Schools .................................................................................... 244
Logical Positivism: A Dominant Theme in Elite Schools ........................................ 258
Schooling Experiences, Class Habitus and Future Prospects ..................................... 260
A Comparative Analysis of Students’ Political Worldviews ....................................... 269
Chapter Summary ...................................................................................................... 276
CHAPTER EIGHT: DISCUSSION AND ANALYSIS .......................................................... 281
The Study’s Key Findings and Social/Theoretical Implications .................................. 281
Limitations of Bourdieu’s Paradigm to Pakistani Case .................................................. 293
Concluding Remarks .................................................................................................. 294
Recommendations ...................................................................................................... 295
Limitations and Suggestions for Further Research ....................................................... 300

REFERENCES AND BIBLIOGRAPHY ..................................................................... 303

APPENDICES ............................................................................................................. 323
Appendix A: Letter Requesting Administrative Consent .............................................. 323
Appendix B: Administrative Consent Form for Administrator ................................... 325
Appendix C: Letter to Recruit Teachers ..................................................................... 326
Appendix D: Consent Form for Teachers .................................................................... 328
Appendix E: Letter to Recruit Parents ....................................................................... 329
Appendix F: Consent Form for Parents ...................................................................... 330
Appendix G: Performa for Participants’ Profiles ........................................................... 331
Appendix H: Interview Guide for Principal Research Participants ............................ 333
Appendix I: Classroom Observation Guide ................................................................ 335
Appendix J: Questionnaire for Students’ Survey .......................................................... 337
LIST OF TABLES, BOXES AND FIGURES

Tables
Table 2.1: Income Levels of Different Social Classes in 2003-04 ........................................ 40
Table 2.2: The Education Gaps by Socio-Economic Status, Gender, and Location 1990-91 ...... 42
Table 5.1: Detail of Academic/Non-academic Staff in the Islamic Madaris ................................ 103
Table 5.2: Detail of Academic/Non-academic Staff in the Public Schools under Study .......... 108
Table 5.3: Detail of Academic/Non-academic Staff in the Elite-Schools under Study .......... 111
Table 5.4: Detail of fees charged at O/A-levels in both schools ........................................... 123
Table 5.5: Detail of the Private Donations from the Elite Class............................................. 124
Table 5.6: A decreasing trend of newly enrolled students (in Grade 6) in public schools ....... 129
Table 5.7: Rules and Regulations as detailed in an Elite Schools’ Prospectus......................... 150
Table 6.1: The Number of Hours that Students Spend on Studies during After School Hours .. 191
Table 7.1: The Madaris Curriculum at ‘Khasa’ level of Education....................................... 207
Table 7.2: Student’s Political Worldviews: Survey Results ................................................. 271

Boxes
Box 6.1: Diversified Earning Activities of an Imam .............................................................. 162
Box 7.1: An Example of the Reproduction of Sectarian Ideologies during the Class-work ..... 226

Figures
Figure 6.1: Family income of students in a comparative perspective as per survey study ...... 158
CHAPTER ONE: AN OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

Introduction

The major aim of this study is to explore the magnitude of inequity in accessibility to educational opportunities in the urban context of Pakistan. The focus of inquiry is three types of mainstream schools: public schools, Islamic madaris, and elite English-medium schools. The participants are the major stakeholders in each school (e.g. principals, teachers, parents, and students). Using an ethnographic case study research method, this enquiry intends to understand to the extent to which these schools recruit their students from different socioeconomic classes, the kind of classroom knowledge and school experience these schools provide to their students, and how these school practices influence students’ class-based dispositions and future roles/prospects. In this research, I have employed Pierre Bourdieu’s theory of social reproduction as the leading framework and complemented it with Jean Anyon’s analysis of school knowledge and social class. However, alongside locating current discriminatory processes of schooling, an animating motivation for this study is to understand the potentially central role of the public schools in the redistribution of capital and a movement towards greater social justice. Moreover, a study from Rahman conducted in 2004 investigated students’ political perspectives in these three types of mainstream schools to understand the role of their education and other discourses inside and outside of schools on the development of these perspectives. He concluded that the students of these schools have widely divergent views about war, militancy, tolerance, and gender equity, with madrassah and elite school students being at the opposite ends of the spectrum. Such divergent views suggest that Pakistani society is being polarized between secular and religious ideologies. I perceive this claim as reflecting an alarming situation that needs to be addressed. Therefore, in this study I also have attempted to investigate the students’ political perspectives in an endeavour to verify Dr. Rahman’s original claim and put forth certain recommendations to address the causes. However, this investigation of students’ political perspectives is only a subsidiary aspect of my study.

This research study has a significantly pioneering value in several ways. For instance, it is the first time that Pierre Bourdieu’s sociological theory has been used as a conceptual framework in the context of Pakistan to understand how educational institutions under study “actually enhance
social inequalities rather than attenuate them” (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 117). Bourdieu’s theory has also provided an opportunity to investigate the non-monetary forms of capital, which I did for the first time in Pakistan. This aspect of the theory was one of the major reasons that I selected it as a framework in this study. Furthermore, there are many highly relevant arguments that, in the context of advanced Western countries, the schools make different types of school experience available to the students of different social classes (Anyon, 1980: 67). However, there has been little or no attempt to investigate such ideas empirically in schools and classrooms in the context of Pakistan. This study has the potential to fill this gap. Besides, this enquiry will contribute in a significant way to the academic literature that has attempted to understand comparatively the educational practices of three types of mainstream schooling by using an ethnographic case study research method.

**Locating the Study**

Social stratification in Pakistan is quite obviously in line with social origin. Ethnicity, clan/caste identity, biraderi (kinship networks) associations, gender and patriarchal relations, economic conditions, and affiliation with traditional and modern lifestyles are some of the key factors that make up the base of social stratification (Alvi, 1982; Qadeer, 2006; Saigol, 1993, 2000; Talbot, 1998). Likewise, inequality in income, ownership or non-ownership of property, and distribution of wealth are prominent features of disparity among different socioeconomic classes. The industrialists, feudal lords, tribal/clan chiefs, senior civil and military bureaucrats, business executives, and higher professionals form the privileged groups. Whereas, daily-waged workers, low-paid employees, low-level self-employed, and rural agricultural and landless labourers constitute the disadvantaged groups (Gardezi 1991, 1970; Juma, 1987; Qadeer, 2006). In regards to the relationship between these socioeconomic classes and the available educational opportunities in the country, social scientists and educationists claim that the education system provides a wide range of choices. It is generally argued that two systems of education are prevalent in the country—the traditional religious-based education system and the modern formal education system (Baldauf, 2001; Hayes, 1987; Rebecca & Lopez, 2002: 1014). The traditional educational system, which is represented by Islamic schools (predominantly known as

---

1 Some of the non-monetary forms of capital that Bourdieu discussed include: cultural capital, social capital, symbolic capital, religious capital, scholastic capital, etc.
Historically, madaris (plural of madrassah) have served as the center for educational activities that sought to provide guidance not only on religious matters, but also on worldly affairs. The broad and practical nature of their syllabi, which consisted of both professional and religious courses, produced both religious scholars and capable professionals, such as doctors, engineers, architects, teachers, and statesmen (Anzar, 2003; Pandya, 2004; Laipson, 1996). However, with the advent of British rule in 1857, madaris began to lose their influence. The British introduced a new system of public schools to train people for administrative affairs and divided the system of education into two separate domains—religious and secular, or traditional and modern (Anzar, 2003; Khalid, 2009, p. 57). Moreover, the biased treatment from colonial government forced madrassah scholars to adopt a defensive approach and to limit their educational activities to protecting the religious texts and transmitting them to younger generations (Khalid, 2009; Hussain, 2004; Sikand, 2006). The resultant disparity of frameworks and objectives between the curricula of madaris and the secular schools gradually resulted in the exclusion of madrassah graduates from the job market. After independence of the country in 1947, the madaris have, by and large, retained their identity as the centers of classical Islamic studies and the guardians of the orthodox Islamic culture and values. Hence, it is generally argued that madaris are the social sites for reproduction of Islamic orthodoxy (Chandland, 2005; Mumtaz, 1998; Talbani, 1996). Some writers have defended the conservative ideological orientation of madrassah education, arguing that these schools are intended to be as such, as their very raison d’être is the preservation of the integrity of the tradition (Mumtaz, 1998, p. 102). Therefore, the current madaris teach a curriculum, which is generally known as Dars-e-Nizami² (Nayyar, 1998; Rahman, 2004; Sufi, 1941). It is widely known that most of the books taught in this curriculum are canonical and out-dated texts. For instance, the books used in the philosophy and logic courses were written in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. The books prescribed for the astronomy, mathematics, and grammar courses range from five- to seven-hundred-year-old texts.

² Dars-e-Nizami is a study curriculum used in a large portion of madrassahs (Islamic religious school) in South Asia. It was standardized by Mullah Nizamuddin Sehalvi in 1748 at Farangi Mahall, a famous seminary of a family of Islamic scholars (ulema) in Lucknow, India. Before the standardized curriculum of Dars-e-Nizami, different teachers used different books to teach their students. Shah Abdul Rahim attempted to create a fixed curriculum. This was taught at the Madrassa-e-Rahimiya and it emphasized the maqulat (traditionalism). The Dars-e-Nizami, on the other hand, emphasizes the maqulat (rationalism). Thus, there were now more books on grammar, logic, and philosophy than before (Sufi, 1941, pp., 68-75).
Likewise, the books used for purely religious subjects also date back to the seventeenth century at the latest and the eleventh century at the earliest (Anzar, 2003; Mumtaz, 1998, p. 103). For that reason, Mahmoudi (1998), and Rahman (2004) argue that the assumption on which Dars-e-Nizami functions is that the past was a golden age in which all that was high-quality knowledge has already been attained. What remains for the modern age is merely the preservation of this golden past.

The modern education system, on the other hand, consists of both private English-medium schools and public schools, which are believed to be imparting modern and secular education in the country. Rahman (2004) explains that, based on their purpose, type of education (e.g. curriculum/teaching methods, etc.), and the amount of tuition fees, the private English-medium schools can be categorised into three major groups: (a) state-influenced elite public schools, (b) private elite schools, and (c) non-elite schools. Within each category there are sub-categories. The state influenced elite schools are mostly cadet-colleges/schools that are meant to provide high-quality education, on subsidized rates, to the children of military officers. British colonizers initially established the private elite schools with the sole purpose of educating the ruling class. Adam Curle emphasizes, “in fact, as in England, so in Indian subcontinent the education of ruling group was carried out in a virtually separate parallel school system from which the children of the lower orders were excluded by both social and economic sanctions” (Adam Curle, 1966, p. 69). Nyrop (1983) affirms that education in the colonial era was geared to staffing the civil service and producing an educated elite that shared the values of, and loyal to, the British colonizers. It was unabashedly elitist (Nyrop, 1983, p.127). The British colonizers established two kinds of elite schools on the subcontinent: those for the hereditary aristocracy, called the chiefs’ colleges, and those for newly emerging professional classes, called European or English schools (Juma, 1987; Rahman, 2004, p. 43). In both kinds of schools, the emphasis was put on English as the central symbol and tool in the process of Anglicization (Carnoy, 1974; Lewis, 1962). Lord Curzon, the Viceroy of India (1898-1905), believed that the young chiefs (who were supposed to learn the English language and become sufficiently familiar with English customs, literature, science, mode of thought, standards of truth and honour) would be allies of the British (Raleigh, 1906, p. 245). Likewise, the European or English schools had the same purpose of strengthening the upper social classes. Hyder (1966) explains that, “the European
schools in India had imitated British-type public schools, and adopted aristocratic view of
education with the purpose to strengthen the ruling class, to make them wiser and better rulers,
prepare high level bureaucrats, military officers, and professionals” (p. 34). The elite-English-
medium schools, even after political independence, have retained their existence and their
purpose of imparting high-quality education to the privileged classes and reproducing Western
culture and value systems in the country. The ruling class has always protected these schools as
they have served their vested interests. Hence, Iqbal, (2009), and Moniza (2009) argue that
Pakistani ruling class which is a mullah/military/bureaucracy/feudal nexus have followed the
methods used by British colonizers very successfully and adopted their philosophy of
maintaining an educational apartheid system in which only the selected few, who are born
privileged, can acquire good education and skills and to whom the rest of the populace is
supposed to be subservient. The side of the fence on which one lands depends on the accident of
birth and inheritance. Likewise, after analyzing the education policies developed immediately
after the independence of country in 1947, Adam Curle concludes that the “goal of Pakistani
society was not change, but stability. Education was not thought of as a means of promoting
democracy, or spreading egalitarianism, or increasing social mobility. On the contrary, its role
was to maintain the status quo” (Adam Curle, 1966, p. 71).

However, education is not only about the individual; it also has a societal role, which includes
selecting, classifying, distributing, transmitting, and evaluating educational knowledge that
reflects both the distribution of power and the principle of social contract. In a country with
alarming inequities in income and opportunity, eradicating social exclusion needs to be one of
the principal objectives of the national education policy. Thus, various commissions, which were
periodically appointed by the government to review and recommend measures for improvement,
suggested the need for an egalitarian and just education system. For instance, the Hamoodur
Rahman Commission emphasized that the government spends more money on elite schools than
on ordinary public schools and that this contradicts the constitutional assurance against
discrimination among citizens. Moreover, the idea of superior and inferior schools does not fit
with the principles of equality and social justice (Government of Pakistan, 1966, p. 18).
Likewise, the National Education Policy of 1972 recommended an “equalizing access to
education through provision of special facilities for women, underprivileged groups, mentally-
retarded and handicapped children, and adults in all areas in general and the backward areas in particular” (Government of Pakistan, 1972, p. 1). In addition, this policy set the following two significant objectives to make schooling more equitable. First:

educational institutions, generally known as [elite] public schools and including such institutions as Aitcheson College, Lahore, are at present wholly, or substantially financed by the government but inaccessible to the poorer students, however intelligent. All public schools and institutions falling within this category will be taken over by the government and converted into schools for the gifted. (Government of Pakistan, 1972, p. 19)

Second:

these schools, in future, will provide an enriched program of studies, entirely free, to gifted children drawn from all over the country without reference to their financial status or social background. In this way these renowned institutions, which in the past divided society on the basis of wealth, will now unite the nation on the basis of intellect and ability. (Government of Pakistan, 1972, p. 19)

Therefore, with an objective to eradicate social exclusion, the government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto decided to launch a massive campaign to “nationalize” institutions in the early 1970s. Hence, 175 private colleges underwent nationalization on schedule by September 1, 1972. Private schools, more numerous and diverse, were to be taken over in a ‘phased manner' beginning in October 1972 and ending two years later. However, ultimately some 3,334 private schools were nationalized (Government of Pakistan, 1979, p. 26). The teachers, media, and general masses welcomed this nationalization, as it was developmental in design, radical in spirit, and promised a framework of social mobility for underprivileged groups. Jones and Jones (1977) affirmed that, infused with ambitious egalitarian rhetoric, nationalization promised to bring about a wholesale restructuring of values, local participation in educational affairs, equal access to education, and eradication of illiteracy. However laudable, these objectives were more visionary than realistic under Pakistan's social and economic conditions. Therefore, this school equalizing process was not completely realized. For instance, 221 “high fee charging” English-medium schools were exempted from nationalization as they promised to reserve 20 percent of their enrolments for low-income students (Jones and Jones, 1977, p. 582). Likewise, Bergman and Nadeem (1998) explain that, in the end, schools for the privileged were saved from nationalization through the policy that they would recruit students on merit alone and poverty alone would not be grounds
for exclusion. However, a significant fact was ignored; these schools were English-medium institutions and their entry tests would be biased against underprivileged children who generally study in Urdu-medium schools. Rahman also concludes that the elite schools were allowed to exist and that they maintained their business as usual, and continue to cater to the elite of power and wealth in Pakistan (Rahman, 2004, p. 15). In view of the above-discussed history of contemporary schools for privileged students, I intend to clarify that the elite schools under study were not subject to the nationalization initiative of the early 1970s.

In the subsequent decades, it seems that the wave of neo-liberalism ostensibly influenced government policies. For instance, in the 1980s, the government officially recognized that, on its own, the public sector lacked all the necessary resources and expertise to effectively address and rectify low educational indicators (Government of Pakistan, 2004). Hence, the government decided to take bold steps to assert and involve the private sector and civil society organizations in the financing, management, and delivery of the education services in the country (Government of Pakistan, 2009, p. 4). Under a new scheme of denationalization and privatization, a new stream of non-elite private schools started emerging in early 1980s, and their numbers have increased ten-fold since 1983 (Andrabi, Das, & Khwaja, 2002). Pakistan Education and School Atlas (2002) explains that non-elite private schools accounted for 18% of all of the schools in the country in that year with an overall enrolment of 27%, furthermore this percentage “increased to 36% in 2009” (Government of Pakistan, 2009, p. 62). Most academic writers believe that one of the main reasons for this drastic growth of non-elite private schools is the rising demand for the English language in the country. Juma (1987), Moniza (2009), and Qadeer (2006) emphasize that English is the key to power as far as the modern, employment-based domains of control are concerned. Without competency in English, one cannot access the most lucrative and powerful jobs, both in the state apparatus and the private sector. Rahman (2005) affirms that because it is empowering to learn English, people all over the country are ready to invest in it for the future of their children. However, these newly emergent non-elite English-medium schools are varied to such an extent that they defy classification (Rahman, 2004, p. 42). Thus, it is imperative to properly understand these schools through evidence-based research with a focus on their purpose, nature and type of education, and other essential aspects of schooling. In large part, these schools sell education; therefore, it is also imperative to understand their precise role to
further increasing the lack of equitability of educational opportunities. Andrabi, Das, Khwaja, and Zajonc (2002) also suggest that it is the quality of education these schools impart that needs to be examined far more carefully and it is here that researchers should focus future work. In so doing, the researchers need to not only employ and better match existing data-sets (household level information with schooling and population census data), but also develop and conduct more in-depth surveys to examine these issues more carefully, with the hope of understanding the role these private schools are playing and how that role can be improved and strengthened through policy changes (Andrabi et al, 2002, p. 33). However, addressing these issues for the new non-elite English-medium schools with adequate evidence is beyond the scope of current thesis.

The academic literature which presents an analysis of the students’ family SES in three types of schools under study reveals two predominant shortfalls. First, a majority of authors have drawn their conclusions on secondary analyses of prior government surveys. Rahman verifies that most essays on education are of high quality, but lack an understanding of, or familiarity with, primary sources (Rahman, 2004, p. 4). The majority of secondary sources used in this regard are large-scale surveys conducted by the government, such as the Federal Bureau of Statistics Census of Private Schools (PEIP), Learning and Educational Achievement in Punjab Schools (LEAPS) Census, Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (PIHS), the Population Census, etc. (Andrabi et al, 2006, p. 471). By and large, the writers have developed their understanding of family SES by analysing the responses of questions that probe the extent of household public utilities, such as electrification and piped water and the quality of the housing stock (as a proxy for wealth) and then correlated these with responses vis-à-vis the type of schooling attended (Andrabi et al, 2006, p. 471). This fact has emphasized the need to have an accurate understanding of the family SES of students in different types of schools. To fill in this gap, this study has attempted to obtain the primary data about family’s economic capital (e.g. income, parents’ job status, etc.).

Secondly, the researchers who have employed different indicators have discovered relatively diverging results about students’ SES in the public schools and Islamic madaris. For instance, while investigating the parents’ nature of employment, Moniza (2009) argued that three main streams of education system cater to different strata of the populace: the government schools cater to the middle and lower-middle classes, while elite private schools take students from the
privileged class who can afford their through-the-ceiling fees and other charges. The madaris, on the other hand, impart education free of charge and, often, also provide boarding and lodging facilities to the poorest of the poor. Yet, Andrabi et al (2006) concluded that at an aggregate level, there is little difference between poor and rich households in the choice of religious schooling. Among households with at least one child enrolled in a madrassah, 75 percent have sent their other children to a public school, a non-elite private school, or both. This means that a significant number of parents under study (in this case 75 percent) could afford the educational expenses of public and non-elite private schools. Likewise, Rahman (2004) conducted a survey study in major cities of Pakistan in 2004 encompassing a population of 618 students and 243 teachers and, basing his findings on the income level of parents, concluded that the public schools provide education to lower-middle and working-class students only, because a majority of students declared their family income as less than Rs. 10,000 (equivalent to 100$ US) every month. The Islamic madaris attract very poor students who would not receive any education otherwise. Rahman concluded, “Pakistani educational scene is polarized according to socio-economic classes” (p. 24). This study also underscores that the present state of the education system perpetuates capitalism in its worst forms, the lower levels of society are geared towards providing cheap labour, the upper levels of society are taught to be selfish consumers, and both levels are not capable of ushering in an era of self-sufficiency, egalitarianism and dignity for the masses.

Moreover, the ethnographic studies that analyse the education and its distribution in public schools and Islamic madaris present contradictory viewpoints. For instance, most researchers argue that public schools are generally dull; stringent; often painted in dirt yellow with blue doors and windows with broken glass panes. These researchers continue that public schools are typically characterized by insufficient, small, and stuffy classrooms with no washroom or toilet facilities for students; a shortage of material resources; a lack of collaboration among teachers; a lack of teacher commitment; and inadequate management capacity. The public schools are also heavily criticized for the deterioration in the quality of education. Due to shortage of space, teaching aids, and extraordinarily large classes, teachers find it difficult to use group strategies and activity-based teaching and thus tend to force their pupils to memorize passages out of poorly written, poorly printed, and extremely dull books. The overcrowded classrooms also
present a highly regimented and discipline oriented atmosphere (Dawood, 2003; Jones, 1991; Warwick & Reimers, 1995). However, some researchers believe that certain public schools are successfully and adequately preparing their students for a bright future. They argue that, at an individual level, some teachers work hard to empower their students and act as a catalyst to transform their lives. Such teachers or head-teachers are termed “change agents” (Retallick & Farah, 2005) or “improvement-oriented-teachers” (Takbir, 2007, p. 1). In spite of all of the challenges, hindrances, and difficulties, such school personnel attempt to promote in-depth student learning (teaching for understanding) and a positive, stimulating, and interactive environment by modifying existing instructional practices, using innovative pedagogical methods and techniques, and building more egalitarian relationships with students. Such school-personnel attempt to create new structures and systems and renew existing practices in order to improve the way school is organised. In the community, they try to build better relationships between the school and parents, families, other community members, and educational officials (Takbir, 2007, p. ii). Likewise, Retallick and Farah (2005) argue that, at the individual level, certain public schools are playing their part to promote learning communities. Likewise, most writers about madaris argue that, as a method of instruction, memorization is one of the most negative features of traditional Islamic education, which generally fosters passivity in students and makes them susceptible to religious and political indoctrination. For instance, Talbani argues that in traditional Islamic pedagogy an authoritative acceptance of knowledge is stressed, with learning often based on listening, memorization, and regurgitation. A greater emphasis is placed on listening to a teacher, who is active as a transmitter of knowledge, while the students are passive (Talbani, 1996, p. 70). Niaz and Nazmul (2006) also emphasize that the students in madaris experience rote learning of religious scriptures with little room for critical thinking. This process dries up their faculty for analysis and creativity. However, Nelson (2006) concluded that in the context of Pakistani madaris, the discipline and cognitive style of Quranic education fosters understanding and responsibility among students. Boyle (2006) affirms that Islamic schools serve complex purposes in Muslim countries and cannot be reduced to a simple description of religious education through memorization. In the Islamic tradition, memorization of sacred, revealed knowledge is an appropriate first step in the process of learning, understanding, and developing reason and discipline. Learning, understanding, and the
development of reason and discipline are, in turn, ultimately meant to lead the student towards greater knowledge of God and the world (Boyle, 2006, p. 494).

In recent years both Islamic madaris and public schools have been highly criticised in the popular media for instilling an ideology in their students that justifies and endorses violence against all who fall short of the Islamic ideal. This negative portrayal has made it imperative to find out the factual situation. I have conducted ethnographic case studies in these schools; therefore, such issues will come up in my analysis. Regarding Islamic madaris, Boyle (2006) says that between December 2000 and June 2004 major U.S. and British newspapers published 42 articles on madaris in Pakistan alone, many of which characterized them as threats and many gave inaccurate or unverifiable figures concerning the number of madaris and the scope of their enrolment (Boyle, 2006, p. 479). Hence, the publicity that Islamic schools have attracted has shaped international (and to a lesser degree national) public perceptions and debate about these schools, often in a decidedly negative way. For instance, Islamic schools are mostly called “fundamentalist schools” (Pohl, 2006, p. 67), “universities of jihad” (Singer, 2001, p. 88), weapons of mass instruction” (Coulson, 2004, p. 2), “schools of hate” (Sinkler, 2005, p. 41), etc. Conversely, some scholars provide more complex perspectives and argue that the purpose of madaris is to train scholars to interpret Islam in relation to demands of the specific time, and also to preserve an authentic Islamic heritage by inculcating piety and promoting religious knowledge (Armanios, 2003; Niyozov, 2008: 10; Sikand, 2006). They also argue that, before the tragic incident of September 11, 2001, madaris had been performing this task for centuries without having been accused of promoting terrorism (Alam, 2004; Qasmi, 2005). Likewise, the public schools have received an analogous treatment in popular media and in articles that have insufficient and unreliable data (Andrabi et al, 2006). Such sources generally claim that the madaris are not the only institutions breeding hate, intolerance, and a distorted worldview. It is claimed that the educational material from the government run schools does so much more than at the madaris. The textbooks tell lies, create hate, incite jihad and Shahadat (martyrdom), as well as much more (Coulson, 2004, p. 7; Singer, 2001; Sinkler, 2005; Toronto Star February, 2010, p. A13).
Emergence of the Study
The above discussion underlines the hierarchical nature of the education system of Pakistan. The upper classes have separate schools that offer different training to their children than that which is offered to the general populace. However, the academic literature presents conflicting viewpoints about the students’ socioeconomic backgrounds, education, and the teaching methods within public schools and Islamic madaris. In addition, two fundamental elements have made it imperative to achieve an accurate understanding. First, with reference to SES of students, most academic writers have built their conclusions on the secondary analyses of prior government surveys, which have insufficient indicators, such as the use of electrification, piped water, and quality of the housing stock as proxies for wealth. Second, in recent years the popular media has incessantly presented controversial arguments about the actual role of current public schools and madaris, which, as previously discussed, are based on unauthenticated sources. Hence, I have designed this study to address such shortfalls in existing academic literature. More specifically, through this research I intend to attain a more precise understanding of the students’ SES in the different schools under study with regards to the volume and economic/cultural composition of their capital. In addition, this study will comparatively scrutinize school knowledge, students’ class work, and other reproductive mechanisms in each social site to gain an understanding of how they influence the students’ future social roles and job prospects. I also intend to examine if and how students’ class-habitus plays a significant role in social class continuation. In particular, I will examine how different schooling mechanisms can potentially influence students’ habitus and act as a symbolic violence to impose the spectre of legitimacy of the social order. In this research, I have employed critical theories of social reproduction (Bourdieu/Anyon) to facilitate this comparative analysis of current discriminatory mechanisms within schooling, with the goal of determining ways to eradicate social exclusion. This will be done in part through deepening an understand of how the public schools, which are usually all-inclusive, can very likely play a central role in the redistribution of capital and making educational opportunities more equitable. My research questions are largely grounded in the theoretical framework of this thesis; therefore, for the convenience of readers, I perceive it would be useful to briefly elaborate this theoretical framework at this stage.
Theoretical and Conceptual Framework
The major conceptual framework used in this study is Bourdieu’s theory of social reproduction, which I complemented with Jean Anyon’s analysis of “social class and school knowledge.” Initially, I considered a few other theoretical frameworks for this research, such as political economy theory, Marxist class-analysis, and “Banking style of Education” and “Conscientization” as put forward by Paulo Freire. However, I preferred Bourdieu’s sociological theory because it provides a more precise framework to investigate social reproduction through education. Bourdieu discusses at great length the ways in which the education system—more than the social institutions of family, church, or business—has become the institution most responsible for the transmission of social inequality in modern societies (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). Furthermore, Bourdieu argues that schooling provides not only the transmission of technical knowledge and skills, but also socialization into a particular cultural tradition. The schools conserve, transmit, and inculcate the cultural cannons of a society and, therefore, perform the cultural reproduction function (Bourdieu, 1971, p. 178). More importantly, in this research I have retained the multidimensional utilization of Bourdieu’s theory; through this approach, he conceptualized major concepts—field, habitus, and capital—as parts of an interrelated system and proposed applying them inseparably to achieve actual and in-depth understanding of social inequality (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 101). Bourdieu characterises social relations in the context of field, which he defines as a social space that has institutions, rules, rituals, conventions, categories, designations, and appointments. These constitute an objective hierarchy and produce and authorise certain discourses and activities (Bourdieu, 1983; Webb, Schirato, & Danaher, 2002). Through the notion of habitus, Bourdieu expresses the way in which individuals ‘become themselves’—develop attitudes and dispositions and also the ways in which those individuals engage in general life practices (Webb, et al, 2002, p. xii). Thus, this viewpoint emphasizes that the habitus is unique to every individual (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990).
Moreover, Bourdieu discusses four generic types of capital, which he classifies into monetary, or economic capital (money and property), and non-monetary forms of capital, which include cultural capital (knowledge and intellectual skills, including educational credentials), social capital (acquaintances and networks), and symbolic capital (accumulated prestige and sense of honour). Accordingly, Bourdieu distinguishes major class fractions in terms of the volume and economic/cultural composition of their capital (Livingstone & Mangan, 1996). However,
Bourdieu has mostly built his analysis on macro-level empirical research and did not attempt to investigate students’ class work and schooling experiences by employing ethnography as a method. Therefore, to fill in this gap, I have used Jean Anyon’s treatise of social class and school knowledge as a complementary framework. Her ethnographic analysis suggests that students of different social class backgrounds are likely to be exposed to qualitatively different types of educational knowledge. In the future, this can potentially lead to the development to a different relationship on the part of these students to physical and symbolic capital, authority and control, and the process of work. Therefore, Anyon’s analysis will guide the ethnographic aspects of this study to situate specific and socially meaningful differences in the educational knowledge made available to the students, as well as other reproductive schooling mechanisms. In view of this theoretical framework, the main research questions of this research study are as follows:

**Research Questions:**

- What kinds of “fields” of education do three types of schools—elite-English-medium schools, public schools, and Islamic madaris—in Pakistan constitute in terms of school knowledge, culture, and the provision of academic and physical facilities?
- How do the students in these schools differ in regards to the volume and economic/cultural composition of their family capital?
- How do the students’ school experiences in these three types of schools influence their dispositions toward a class-based society?
- How does the education of three types of schools shape the future roles/prospects of their students?

In this study, in contrast to the way in which theoretical frameworks are often operationalized, I do not intend to imply a rigid a priori paradigm or a set of presumed postulates to guide the research towards pre-set conclusions. Instead, although my framework does provide foundational principles and epistemic boundaries, it allows conceptual constructs to develop through the process of analysis of empirical data. In essence, this is an exploratory study and aims to elicit the participants’ responses in regards to their socioeconomic backgrounds, cultural practices, lifestyles, values, beliefs, experiences, expectations, grievances, awareness, and the nature of their involvement in the school. Besides, an ethnographic study of school knowledge, class-work
and curriculum-in-use, and school culture, will lead to an understanding of the influence of such vital schooling aspects on students’ class-habitus, worldviews, and how these schools cultivate intellectual capabilities to prepare students for future social/economic roles. In addition to Anyon, other leading sociologists also provide valuable insight that schools make available different types of school experience to students of different social classes. For instance, Bowles and Gintis (1976) argue that students from different social class backgrounds are rewarded for classroom behaviour that corresponds to personality traits allegedly rewarded in the different occupational strata—the working classes for docility and obedience, the managerial classes for initiative and personal assertiveness. Bernstein (1977), Bourdieu (1990), and Apple (1979) emphasize that knowledge and skills leading to social power and reward (e.g. medical, legal, managerial) are made available to the advantaged social groups and are withheld from the working classes, to whom a more ‘practical’ curriculum is offered (e.g. manual skills, clerical knowledge). Therefore, in view of the above discussion, this study also intends to understand the precise role that the schools under study play to reproduce social class hierarchy in Pakistan.

**Personal and Subjective Location**

My point of entry into the research area of inequality in educational opportunities is rooted in my background and many years of experience as a teacher, researcher, and an administrator with the government of Pakistan. This personal background gave me first hand, in-depth knowledge regarding the primary issues of the education system, including the inequality that, I believe, runs through the entire system. I started my education at a private English-medium school at the age of 5 years old and continued in the same stream of education until graduation. This gave me ample opportunities to experience the most modern system of education and unique facilities that a distinguished private school can offer its students. I received my subsequent higher education from public universities; this made me aware of the advantages I had due to my initial educational experiences when competing with the students from Urdu-medium schools. After completing my education, I decided to join the teaching profession and started my career at a public college. For much of that time, I also taught in a private elite educational institution, as a visiting resource person. This experience heightened my awareness of the advantages and disadvantages that students from different types of school can have in their learning. My work as a government researcher in the public school setting also provided chances for me to listen to
school personnel, parents, and students expressing their problems, aspirations, hopes, disappointments, and remedial suggestions, which they perceive as related to the improvement of their stream of education. I developed analytical papers to assist policy-makers in the provincial government. This particular assignment and, later on, my work as an administrator also provided me with an understanding of the thoughts, course of action, and vested interests that the ruling elite of the country has that are focused on ensuring personal benefit.

During my professional career, I also received unique opportunities to work in two Middle Eastern countries. This international exposure provided me with opportunities to see the oppression, illiteracy, hunger, and absolute poverty on the one hand and the dictatorship, power, and affluence on the other. This contradiction in standard of living and unequal distribution of wealth and power urged me to commit myself to work as an activist for equality and justice for all, intellectual and political freedom, diversity in education, equity of genders, and tolerance and respect for human beings regardless of race, nationality, religious orientation, or economic background. Thus, my experiences and observations in different settings have helped to structure and inform the personal and political investment that I bring to this research. Zine (2008) argues that writing ourselves into the discourses we produce is a part of the production of ethnographic knowledge. Accordingly, my situated nature as an “insider” has strong political implications in this research, because it intersects with my ongoing activism focused on providing egalitarian educational opportunities.

**Context of the Research**

For this research study, I picked two schools from each stream of education, e.g. elite-English-medium schools, public Schools, and Islamic madaris. To begin, my main criterion to differentiate these schools was the level of the majority of parents’ economic capital and occupational status (which was used as an indicator of their social class). Based on my multi-years experience within the Pakistani education system, I have an initial awareness that these three types of schools recruit their students from different social classes. However, since 2000, I have been residing permanently in Canada. Therefore, to gather current and accurate information about the social class of school clientele, I consulted with administrators and school personnel and gained insight from relevant literature. However, these are only the initial findings. Upon
completion of the study, I will have a more precise understanding of the actual social class
designations of the parents in the three types of schools. It is imperative to clarify at this point
that I do not intend to generalize my case study findings since they are based on a few schools
and may not be directly applicable to all of the respective types of schools throughout urban
Pakistan.

**Islamic Madaris**
The madaris personnel explain that their students largely belong to the underclass, poorest of the
poor, and underprivileged segments of society. More than 50% of parents are skilled, semi-
skilled, or unskilled workers. In addition, about 10% of the students are orphaned and
handicapped, and the madaris provide them complete support for survival. Regarding income,
the madaris personnel clarified that most families may live below the poverty line with a
monthly income of less than 5,000 rupees or a daily income of less than 1 U.S. dollar. At the
time of this study (2007-08) such families comprised 34.46 % of the total population in Pakistan
(Government of Pakistan, 2008b, p. 18). A large majority of students received the basic
amenities from madaris for free, which included textbooks, stationery, food, living, uniform, and
medical/treatment expenses.

**Public Schools**
Like madaris, the public school personnel explain that their clientele mostly belong to the poor
and underprivileged segments of society. More than 50% of the parents hold blue-collar jobs. A
few parents may belong to the lower-middle class but, due to the re-emergence of non-elite
independent schools, the middle classes are likely to choose them in lieu of government schools.
This is a significant claim about which my study has attempted to obtain some basic information.
In regards to income, the school personnel explain that most families appear to live below the
poverty line, with a monthly income up to 10,000 rupees, which also is less than 1 U.S. dollar a
day. As mentioned above, such families comprised 34.46 % of the total population in Pakistan
(Government of Pakistan, 2008b, p. 18). The public schools charge a meagre amount of 7 rupees
as the tuition fee every month and provide textbooks for free. In this way, the poor and working-
class parents can easily afford to educate their children in these schools.

---

3 At the time of this study (2007-08) 1 U.S. dollar was equivalent to 88 Pakistani rupees.
**Elite English-medium Schools**

The elite school personnel explain that their students’ families generally belong to the affluent classes. The parents either have white-collar jobs, own business empires or a substantial piece of land, or run trade firms, etc. Some fathers are also active in politics or part of the government machinery. Some mothers are actively involved in national/regional politics, social work, or in well-paid occupations. Most families have monthly incomes of over 100,000 rupees, with some families being in the one million range. The incomes in these schools represent less than 1% of the families in Pakistan (Gardezi, 1991; Qadeer, 2006). The elite schools are expensive and parents have to afford through the ceiling tuition fees along with expenses for textbooks, stationery, uniform, transportation, refreshment, and extra- and co-curricular activities locally and abroad, etc. The school personnel explain that only a small number of families in Pakistan can afford such expenses.

In addition to the economic capital/occupational status of the parents, I also examined some major aspects of the schools before finalizing them as research sites. My intent was to maintain a uniform criterion to select the most appropriate schools from each stream of education (or to avoid comparing apples with oranges). Hence, for this study I picked only the reputable and established schools with sound academic history. I also preferred schools that had at least 20 trained teachers, more than 500 students and, based on student enrolment, adequate classrooms, libraries, science and computer labs, playgrounds, equipment for science and sports, audio-visual aids, etc. For the most part Islamic madaris do not have science labs; therefore, this criterion was ignored. However, for this study I picked only the madaris that required at least 36 hours a week of class time, were supervised by a Mufti\(^4\) or a board of Muftis, and were registered with the government of Pakistan. The schools that run under the supervision of Muftis are considered reputable in Pakistan. Moreover, for elite schools, I also considered the students’ average monthly expenses and only selected those where the fees associated with education and other schooling activities were more than 50,000 rupees. Based on my experience, I deemed this amount adequate to classify a school as “elite.” Finally, for the purpose of this study I picked the

---

\(^4\) A mufti (مفتی) is an Islamic scholar who is an interpreter or expounder of Islamic law (Sharia). He is considered eligible to give legal judgments called *fatwa*. Madrassah personnel claim that the academic degree of a Mufti is considered equivalent to PhD from the public universities.
schools that were located in a major urban center for the following reasons. First, this was cost efficient for me, as my family lived in the city within which the schools were located. Second, for the most part, the schools located in cities have a larger number of students and trained faculty, which offered me the advantage of selecting the most suitable participants from a comparatively larger sample (Mann, 1968, p. 103). Third, most elite schools are located in the big cities of Pakistan.

**Significance of this Research**

This study is significant in many ways. For instance, this is the first time that Bourdieu’s theory has been used as a research framework in the context of Pakistan, which is a developing and Muslim majority country with relatively distinct cultural norms. This pioneering aspect has provided an opportunity to investigate the usefulness of this theory in a Muslim majority context.

Previous studies of Pakistan have mainly focused on family economic capital or the occupation status of agents as criteria to determine their positions in social hierarchy and their relationship to educational opportunities. This research has also included non-monetary forms of capital, which gives a significantly pioneering value to this study.

Moreover, Bourdieu’s theory has numerous strengths, but it has also been contested as being outdated, not allowing for agency, not elaborating the aspects of transformation, and therefore having no practical implications. By employing Bourdieu’s theory as a leading framework, this research has provided another opportunity to understand the theory’s efficacy as well as its limitations.

As mentioned before, academic literature regarding inequality in educational opportunities in the context of Pakistan contains discussions that are built on a secondary analysis of the large-scale surveys conducted by the government and other agencies. This study has attempted to obtain primary data (e.g. collected directly from first-hand experience) by employing multiple tools from qualitative and quantitative research methods.
This research also presents the most recent data regarding the area under investigation. In so doing, this study explores the perspectives of the people who are actually working in the field and thus provides first-hand knowledge about the current situation.

This study also has the pioneering value related to investigating the nature of school knowledge, students’ classroom experiences, and curriculum-in-use in three types of mainstream schooling in order to estimate the influence of such vital schooling aspects on students’ class-habitus, and their future roles and prospects.

My study is significant in that, while obtaining data from a different context, it has supported the validity of some prominent scholars’ criticism of Bourdieu’s analysis of cultural capital. For instance, Bourdieu has grossly ignored creative cultural practices, the independent education and learning, and collective cultural agency of the organised working classes. Moreover, my study supports the argument that variable types of cultural capital may exist within a social space, in which the struggle for power and legitimization exists. These findings can potentially serve to modify Bourdieu’s original theoretical stance.

The comparative and ethnographic aspects of this study are also significant since they have enabled an increased relative and profound understanding of the class-reproductive mechanisms in the three types of mainstream schools in Pakistan. However, throughout this study, I remained cognizant of not overlooking “productive” elements of schooling practices whenever they emerged. Besides, social class reproduction is not a passive process. It has to be actively produced, which indicates that the schools are not always apolitical. Presently, there is an apparent dearth in the academic literature in Pakistan dealing with this area. Therefore, this study has a potential to fill in certain gaps and, in doing so, become a useful addition.

Moreover, this study’s findings pertaining to Bourdieu’s theory in the context of Pakistan have the potential to become a reference for other researchers who might intend to acquire a comparative insight into a precise role of various educational systems towards class-reproduction in different parts of the world.
**Structure of this Thesis**

This section presents the organisation of thesis and the major points of the content of each chapter that follows.

Chapter Two provides the background information that can be useful to understand the discussion in subsequent chapters of data analysis. This chapter elaborates the nature of social and community life, cultural diversity, and socio-economic disparity in contemporary Pakistan.

Chapter Three focuses mostly on an examination of Bourdieu’s sociological theory as this is the major theoretical foundation of this thesis. This chapter begins by elaborating the rationale for picking Anyon’s analysis of school knowledge and social class as a complementary framework, and then puts forward an analysis of the key concepts of Bourdieu’s theory, its limitations and the criticism against it, and the research studies that investigated Bourdieu’s theory. Finally, this chapter elaborates why a multidimensional research paradigm was essential as a starting point for this thesis.

Chapter Four presents my methodological procedures and perspectives. It explains the rationale for preferring mixed methods as a research paradigm and assembling a combination of case study and ethnographic approaches. Next, it provides a detailed account of my main data collection tools with reference to their context, purpose, situation, and the ways they were used. It follows a discussion regarding data analysis designs, ethical issues, research challenges, and the limitations of this study.

Chapter Five presents an introduction to the schools under study in order to understand the kind of fields of education they constitute. The analysis examines human and material resources, relative autonomy of schools with contributing factors, and how different schools exploit their autonomy to undermine the government instituted reforms/regulations. This follows a comparative analysis of school cultures, perspectives, and practices.
Chapter Six discusses the nature of student’s family capital in terms of volume and economic/cultural composition. The focus of the analysis is to understand the degree to which students from different schools under study are privileged or underprivileged in this regard.

Chapter Seven attempts to comparatively understand school knowledge, the nature of students’ class work, and how these essential schooling mechanisms in different types of schools under study cultivate their intellectual capacities and prepare them for different socioeconomic roles in the society. A comparative analysis of the students’ class-habitus, future professional prospects, and political worldviews is also included.

Chapter Eight discusses the study’s findings, theoretical implications, recommendations, limitations and suggestions for future research. Most importantly, the discussion attempts to situate the contribution of this research in the theoretical debate regarding schools as sites of social reproduction.
CHAPTER TWO: CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND ECONOMIC DISPARITY IN PAKISTAN

This chapter provides a discussion about the nature of both culture and socioeconomic disparity in contemporary Pakistan. I have attempted to examine the main foundations of culture, their ideological underpinnings, how they emerged, and what significant influences the main cultural patterns exert on contemporary lifestyles. The discussion has also attempted to highlight the lifestyles that can be considered to be ‘high culture’ in the post-colonial era. Likewise, a brief analysis of socioeconomic disparity with a focus on the elitist model of economic growth is intended to diagnose the basic crisis of Pakistan, which is a gap between the ruling elite and large masses of the poor and powerless that has widened throughout history. The most obvious manifestations of this gap are the existence of economic extremes of both affluence and poverty. Equally significant, nonetheless, is the system of power and privilege that operates at national, as well as at international, levels and points to certain historical processes that began with the imperialist colonization of the Indo-Pak subcontinent. The end result of these processes is a system through which the country’s resources and the labour of a vast majority of its people are being exploited by a small group of elites. Hence, the agents of this group have become alienated—socially, culturally and politically—from the majority of their own people. I perceive that this contextual background is essential as it relates to the analysis in the subsequent data chapters, which mainly attempt to understand the precise relation of different social classes with available educational opportunities. In addition, these chapters also attempt to understand how various schools play a significant role in perpetuating socioeconomic disparity in the country.

The discussion will also attempt to understand the preferred lifestyles of different classes in various social settings and the role of these schools in the reproduction of different cultural bases and lifestyles in the society. Therefore, this chapter provides an essential foundation to properly understand the ethnographic analysis in subsequent parts of this thesis.

Facts about Pakistan

Pakistan gained independence on August 14, 1947, when British India was partitioned, and is located in South Asia. It has a total land covering 803,943 square kilometres, approximately the combined land areas of France and the United Kingdom and twice the size of California; its eastern regions are located on the Indian tectonic plate and its western and northern regions on
the Iranian plateau and Eurasian land plate (Nyrop, 1983; Talbot, 1998). In terms of area, Pakistan ranks 36th among the nations of the world (Qadeer, 2006, p. 5). Apart from 1,045 kilometres of Arabian sea coastline, 2,432 kilometres of Pakistan’s land borders with Afghanistan to the northwest, 524 kilometres with China to the northeast, 2,912 kilometres with India to the east, and 909 kilometres with Iran to the southwest (Blood, 1994). Contemporary Pakistan comprises of four provinces: Punjab, Sind, Khyber Pakhtun Khwa, and Baluchistan, as well as Federally Administered Tribal Areas, Azad Kashmir and Gilgit and Baltistan, and the Federal Capital Area (FCA) of Islamabad. Talbot (1998) explains that as a result of its geopolitical position, Pakistan received greater international interest than its size and economy would have otherwise warranted and that this was particularly true during the cold war era. Much of the country’s foreign relations and domestic priorities have been diverted to counterbalancing what is seen as the threat posed to its existence by the neighbouring Indian state. Pakistan’s resulting ties with America and China have greatly influenced its internal politics.

In socio-economic terms, Pakistan can be best categorized as a populous, rapidly growing, middle-income country. Arable land still remains the principal natural resource, with almost 26 percent of country’s total area under cultivation thanks to one of the most extensive irrigation systems in the world (Sinkler, 2005; Talbot, 1998; Ziring, 1997). The rapid increase in population and poverty are two prominent challenges for contemporary Pakistan. The total population in 2008 was 162.5 million with an annual growth rate of 3.1 percent (Government of Pakistan, 2008a). It not only undermines the entire progress but also poses certain new challenges for the government. Resultantly, as a society, Pakistan falls short in the provision of educational, health, nutrition, and welfare services to its people. In regards to the quality of life, Pakistan ranks 135 out of 174 countries on the Human Development Index (UNDP, 2000, p. 149). This index measures dimensions such as life expectancy at birth, adult literacy rate, combined primary and secondary enrolment ratio, and per capita income (Retallick and Farah, 2005, p. 2). The level of absolute poverty within the country can be understood by the fact that at the dawn of 21st century, more than 34 percent of the total population still lived at less than 1 U.S. dollar a day (Qadeer, 2006, p. 9, Musharraf, 2006, p. 148; World Bank, 2002).
Islam is the religion of the majority of people in Pakistan; almost 98 percent of the total population are Muslim (Government of Pakistan, 2008a). The main religious minorities are Hindus, Christians, Buddhists, Sikhs, Parsees, and Ahmadis (Rauf, 1988, p. 77). Siddiqui explains that ever since Islam was introduced in the subcontinent, the religion became an overriding factor in the make-up of the society in the regions comprising contemporary Pakistan. It provides an enduring form of people’s affiliation, transcending regional, ethnic, racial, and other social divisions. Islam unifies various castes, tribes, and races and contributes to the cohesion of an otherwise disparate people (Siddiqui, 1997, p. 24). Talbot (1998) explains that in Pakistan, Islam is not monolithic or, for that matter, monochrome; it includes significant sectarian differences and a lively Sufi tradition (p. 24). However, Nyrop (1983) argues that the precise role of Islam in society and government has been a frequent subject of debate. There is a visible gulf between adherents to the orthodoxy and secular-minded Muslims. However, for the masses Islam is largely a matter of customary practice and mores. Owing to the Islamic influence, the giving of religious alms is a widely shared custom in the society of Pakistan and is considered as a means of spiritual elevation and divine blessings. The poor and orphans, students, madaris, and mosques are preferred by most of the Muslim population in Pakistan when giving alms. Iftikhar (2006) explains that in rural areas, travelers are allowed to spend the night in a local mosque where worshippers may bring them food. This author continues that the peasants regularly apportion a share from their harvest for mosques, madaris, shrines, charity-seekers, and people performing menial jobs (p. 194).

Social attitudes and customs in Pakistan show an element of conservative stability in which social relations are held of prime importance. Sharing and caring for each other is evident in extended families and everyday community life. Iftikhar (2006) states that without having any official social security system in place, individuals look after their parents, siblings, and even grandparents (p. 193). This is one of the reasons that many parents prefer boys as opposed to girls. Boys help fathers as breadwinners and look after their parents and other close dependents during illness and old age. Elder boys assume major responsibilities toward the family as one generation bequeaths these shared values to the next (Iftikhar, 2006, p. 193). Pakistanis in diaspora also help their parents, close relatives, and other needy individuals of their communities.

---

5 A Muslim mystic or ascetic
back home. Marriages within the extended families become an added mechanism to further consolidate these traditions and kinship relations. Nyrop (1983) explains that members of a biraderi (kinship network) celebrate the major life events together. Patrilineal kin are expected to contribute food and help with guests in the ceremonies accompanying birth, marriage, and death. The patrilineage services are a sort of mutual aid and society-cum-welfare agency, which arranges loans to members, assists in finding employment, and contributes to the dowries of poorer families (Nyrop, 1983, p. 80).

The next section will briefly examine the major cultural patterns and embedded conflicting ideologies that generally shape everyday lifestyles in Pakistan.

Major Cultural Patterns in Pakistan

Although Pakistan is a young country carved out of the vast land and multitude of population of different racial stocks and lingual groups of the South Asian subcontinent, and although the ideological framework of the country is based upon the tenants of Islam, Pakistan is heir to a long process of cultural evolution and infusion deeply rooted in indigenous and external influences (Quddus, 1989, p. 122). Most of the prominent historians, anthropologists, and archaeologists push the chronological boundaries of Pakistan to the third-millennium B.C. and consider Indus Valley civilization as the starting point of contemporary Pakistan’s cultural and lifestyles (Gombrich, 1974; Kalim, 2001; Wheeler, 1950, p. 1). This highly developed civilization, symbolized by Moenjodaro in Sind and Harappa in the Punjab, testifies to the ancient past of Pakistan and to the high cultural level that, in certain aspects, surpassed the contemporary Egyptian, Persian, and Sumerian civilizations (Majumdar, 1981, p. i; Qadeer, 2006; Wheeler, 1968). The people of Indus Valley civilization not only excelled at city planning and agriculture, but were also an enterprising seafaring community who carried their seals and trade to the adjoining Gulf regions. As a result of the close commercial and maritime ties with the people of the Gulf, the Indus civilization developed a Middle-Eastern orientation (Quddus,

6 Moenjodaro (literally means the hill of the Dead) was one of the largest city-settlements of the Indus Valley Civilization of South Asia situated in the province of Sind, Pakistan. Built around 2600 BCE, the city was one of the early urban settlements in the world, existing at the same time as the civilizations of ancient Egypt, Mesopotamia, and Crete (Qadeer 2006; Wheeler (1968).

7 Harappa began as a small village in roughly 3300 BC and grew to a large city covering more than 150 hectares during the Harappa (Mature) Phase of the Indus Civilization (2600 - 1900 BC).
Abbasi (1992) argues that some vestiges of Indus civilization have survived in a modified form as a cultural tradition in the everyday life of the people of contemporary Pakistan. For example, the bullock cart embossed on the Mohenjodaro seals is not different from those plying on the dusty roads in the rural Punjab and Sind. The figure of a bearded man on the seals bears a striking resemblance to the young sinewy farmer ploughing the fields or playing the flute in the shady village retreats. The well-trimmed short beard that tapers to a point in a natty style depicted on the seals is still very much in fashion, even 5000 years later. The people of Indus Valley grew cotton and exported cotton cloth to Mesopotamia. To this day, cotton is the main foreign exchange earning crop of Sind and the Punjab. The villagers of these two provinces still use cotton dress in a style reminiscent of the Indus civilization.

The periodic invasions of other prominent civilizations, including White Huns, Persians, Arabs, Turks, Mongols, and various Eurasian groups, also left their mark on the culture of the subcontinent (Qadeer, 2006; Shuja Pasha, 1997; Kalim, 2001). However, the main cultural bases that imprinted the most overriding influences on present day Pakistani culture and lifestyles are the ancient Hindu culture, the Arab culture predominantly with Islamic ethos, and the Western culture, which were introduced by the British colonizers and continued to exist even after their departure (Baghir, 1960; Jamil, 1956; Nur, 1958).

**Hindu Influence**

Hindus possess a rich cultural tradition deeply entrenched in religion and reflecting multifaceted beliefs in gods and goddesses celebrated in their great religious epics of *Mahabharata* and *Ramayana*. Since the pre-historic period, the fine arts have formed an integral part of Hindu culture (Rawlinson, 1952). Hindus believed fine arts to be a significant key to salvation or ultimate release that must be sought by all good individuals. Traditionally, the vocal music in India has tended to be devotional music and temples have been places where musicians used to practice music to please the deity and the devotees (Kalim, 2001; Quddus, 1989; Rawlinson,
Since the Vedic times, Indians have been required to correctly recite the Vedas. Correctness in recitation was very important, as, in those days, the Vedas were transmitted through memory, as lettering was non-existent. This emphasis on correct pronunciation during recitation lead to studies in phonetics and sound manipulation. This was also the birthplace of Indian Musical Raga and Swaras (Kalim, 2001; Quddus, 1989). Instruments providing bass and rhythm usually accompanied music. Hindus also cherished dancing as a part of their worship. Quddus (1989) explains that in Hindu classical dancing, a story has to be told solely through actions and elaborate patterns of facial expressions (Mudra); hand movements (Hasta); and the simulation of various moods, such as anger (Krodha), envy (Matsara), greed (Lobha), lust (Kama), ego (Mada), etc. The mastery of a perfect expression of these feelings through subtle lip and eye movements forms the root of all of the classical Indian dance styles. Hindu paintings also drew inspiration from religious themes or epic events described in Mahabharata and Ramayana.

Muslims entered the Indian subcontinent through a military excursion of Arabs in the province of Sind in 712 A.D, which also marked the beginning of a cultural infusion. Accordingly, while the Islamic civilization made its great impact on Sind and afterwards the entire subcontinent, the Arabs also extended the horizons of their knowledge and culture by drawing upon whatever good they found in the Indian traditions (Quddus, 1989, p. 127; Mahmud, 1959). Abbasi (1992) argues that as a result of social interaction between Hindus and Muslims, Hindu music enriched Persian and Turkish styles of music, even though Muslims introduced new instruments and melodies. Amir Khusrau refined and enlarged the scope of traditional Hindu music. However, the music as it developed has a large content of Hindu tradition, which is still relevant to the classical and

---

8 The Vedic Period (or Vedic Age) is the period during which the Vedas, the oldest sacred texts of the Indo-Aryans, were being composed. Based on literary evidence, scholars place the Vedic period in the 2nd and 1st millennia BCE and continuing up to the 6th century BCE (Quddus, 1989; Rawlinson, 1952).

9 The Vedas are the primary sacred texts of Hinduism. They also had a vast influence on Buddhism, Jainism, and Sikhism. There are four Vedas, the Rig Veda, Sama Veda, Yajur Veda, and Atharva Veda. Scholars have determined that the Rig Veda, the oldest of the four Vedas, was composed at about 1500 B.C. and was codified at about 600 B.C.

10 Amir Khusrau Dehlavi (1253-1325 AD) was a prolific Indian musician, scholar, and classical poet. He was an iconic figure in the cultural history of the Indian subcontinent. A Sufi mystic, Amir Khusrau has been considered the "father of Qawwali" (the devotional music of the Indian Sufis).
semi-classical forms of singing in contemporary Pakistan (Iftikhar, 2006, p. 52; Quddus, 1989: 239; Rashid, 2004). Abbasi (1992) also acknowledges that music and dancing are two of the most prominent areas where Hindu influence manifests itself in present day Pakistani culture (p. 9). Likewise, Muslim kings also patronized Hindu painters with the result that a commendable blend of Persian and Hindu styles was achieved (Abbasi, 1992, p. 10). The provincial courts and Hindu Rajas followed the imperial example and employed many painters of different religions and backgrounds, which enhanced the process of cultural infusion (Percival, 1951; Richards, 1993).

Besides fine arts, Hindu lifestyles are also evident in contemporary Pakistani culture, tastes, and social relations. Iftikhar (2006), Siddiqui (1997), and Abbasi (1992) explain that the wearing of Hindu dresses during the hot summer months is also concession to Hindu custom done out of necessity. Muslims adopted Hindu taste in food, and the cooking of many Indian dishes is still a part of everyday life. Gradually, Muslim marriage ceremonies were overlaid by Hindu customs, such as excessive emphasize on dowry for brides, Rasm-e-Hinna, and excessive and at times unwarranted use of music on such occasions, etc. Most of the rich and culturally modern families hire expensive musical bands for the marriage ceremonies as a show of their social and economic status. The Indian caste and clan system has also had a significant impact on social relations in Pakistan (Kalim, 2001; Shuja Pasha, 1997; Siddiqui, 1997). The caste identities, such as Khans, Rajputs, Mughals, Qureshis, Sayyids, etc., are the part of Pakistani society, wherein people of certain castes consider themselves as superior. Likewise, clan and Biraderi (kinship) solidarities form an important locus of political authority in the politics of present day Pakistan (Talbot, 1998, p. 30). Biraderi solidarity has spread most strongly among independent peasant proprietors, though tribal and landed elites deploy its idiom for political mobilization (Talbot, 1998, p. 30).

Islamic Influence
As discussed before, Muslims brought with them new concepts in regards to learning and knowledge, fine arts, crafts, music, paintings, architecture, and other human skills. Yet, these new concepts only impacted the customs and traditions of the local people, which were not greatly inconsistent with Islamic teachings (Armstrong, 2001; Lewis, 1950; Lewis et al., 1958).
It is generally argued that ideology of Islamic culture is deeply steeped in the religious precepts articulated in the Quran and Sunnah (The Prophet Muhammad's way of life) and has certain salient features that distinguish it from other cultures around the world. Hence, Muslims tend to maintain their cultural identity, regardless of the part of the world in which they dwell. Jaffar (1950), Kalim (2001), Mahmud (1960), Quddus (1989), Rashid (2004), Rauf (1988), Shuja Pasha (1997), and Siddiqui (1997) have summarized the salient features of Islamic culture as follows:

- As every culture grows out of some ideology, the basis of Islamic culture is the teachings of the Quran and preaching of the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him).
- Islamic culture does not treat the spiritual aspects of life and the world as separate entities but regard these as unified components.
- The essence of Islamic culture is the unity and coherence. The institution of the mosque with its prime purpose of congregational prayers, meeting place for counselling and discussion on social issues signifies a strong spirit of brotherhood among the believers.
- Islam does not believe in extreme ways of life but urges moderation in social and cultural practices.
- Life in Islam has a meaning and significance. It is God’s bounty to man and has to be held in trust from Him. Preservation and promotion of life is, therefore, an act of virtue, while its destruction is considered to be sinful.
- Acquiring knowledge (worldly as well as religious) is one of the fundamental principles of Islam in which the holy Quran and the traditions of the Prophet (upon whom be peace) lay great emphasis. This is, therefore, one of the distinctive features of Islamic culture.
- Taqwa (piety) is a fundamental concept of Islamic culture which arises out of the rigid observance of Quranic injunctions of distinguishing between good and evil, sacred and profane, lawful and unlawful. When this criterion is applied to the daily life and conduct, as a means to earn Divine pleasure, it mounts to piety and righteousness. Although Islam allows an individual freedom of action, accountability to God produces moral responses which harmonize with the concept of life.
These principles emphasize that Islam imposes certain reservations on social and cultural practices. However, leading ulema interpret these reservations differently, which perpetuates two conflicting cultural trends in daily social life of contemporary Pakistan. The adherents to strict religious orthodoxy completely reject music, dancing, movies, painting, and sculpturing, and other aspects related to the fine arts, as these activities are considered to be against the religious teachings (Abbasi, 1992, p. 19). Conversely, some ulema argue that, with the exception of sculpturing and idolatry, other cultural elements, such as, music, dancing, movies, painting, do not contradict Islamic teachings if used properly. For instance, Imam Ghazzali, a Sufi as well as one of the greatest scholars of Islam, while settling the debate between Islamic scholars about whether music is lawful or unlawful in Islam, declared that music is only unlawful in the following five cases:

Musical songs by a beautiful woman or a young boy whose looks excite sexual passions. This illegality is not for songs, but for the exciting looks.
Musical instruments of drunkards, as they remind of unlawful things and incite the unlawful action of drinking and intoxicants. These are majamir, autar, and kubak, but not daff, flute and other musical instruments.
Obscene talk in music, obscene poetry, useless talks, and blasphemy. Descriptions of a particular woman and not woman in general and narrations of the beauties of a particular woman before the people are unlawful.
Songs which arouse any evil or immoral desire in mind.
Regular habit of listening to music is also not desirable. Excess of anything is bad. If too much food is taken, it is bad for health. If too much oil is besmeared on the face, it looks ugly. Similarly, excess of music and songs would also make a man its addict which is not a healthy sign. However, music as such (including vocal and instrumental) is no way against the teachings of Islam. (as cited in Quddus, 1989, p. 239)

Therefore, Islamic culture revolves around a fundamental belief that the mission of adherents’ life is to completely establish Islam in their lives and in the world around them. However, culture is a dynamic institution, open to new ideas and permeable to the influence of other cultures. As the core of Islamic culture is based on basic principles outlined in the Quran and Sunnah, reconciliation with other cultures is only based on epistemological compatibility. The discourses, practices, and lifestyles that are greatly incompatible with core Islamic beliefs are heavily resisted on the grounds of religious uprightness.
The Introduction of Western Culture in the Subcontinent

Western culture was initially introduced in the subcontinent of India by British colonizers; Western culture was entirely incompatible with Muslim culture in many ways. As discussed earlier, Muslim culture had Islam as its foundation and Persian-Arabic cultural traditions as its mainstay; furthermore, a religious entity had been formed through the impact of some selected local influences. In contrast, as explained by Abbasi (1992), English culture was a part of the vast Greco-Roman cultural matrix, Greek in thought, Roman in law, Christian in religion, secular in practice, and with a democratic political system and imperial outlook. It had distinct cultural traditions, and represented a diametrically divergent value systems and views on life (Abbasi, 1992, p. 22).

Initially, European missionaries played an effective role in providing information to the indigenous people about social, cultural, and traditional habits of the European people (Hunter, 1882). Later, the colonial government implemented a policy of cultural imperialism, which rested on the assumptions of the racial, religious, and intellectual superiority of the white races (Altekar, 1975; Carnoy, 1974; Hutchins, 1967; Lewis, 1962; Metcalfe, 1964; Robb, 2002). British colonizers attempted to achieve the goal of cultural imperialism by promoting the following activities: (a) introducing anglicised educational institutions, (b) using English as a medium of instruction in these institutions and making English the official language of the colonial government, (c) transforming the attitudes and lifestyle of the upper class Indians into that of lifestyles of the British (Lewis, 1962; Vakil & Natarajan, 1966). Lord Macaulay11 established English as the language of administration, education, and culture in the subcontinent of India. He emphasized, “We need a class of persons, Indian in blood and colour, but English in taste, in opinion, in morals, and in intellect” (Macaulay 1835, as cited in Aggarwal, 1983, p. 5, and Naik & Nurullah, 1951, p. 101). Resultantly, as stated by Juma (1987), “these efforts transformed selected Indians into ‘Brown Sahibs’ who not only had adopted the British lifestyle,

11 Lord Thomas Babington Macaulay (1800-1859) was the member of the governing council of the East India Company from 1834 to 1838 who successfully advocated the replacement of the native languages with English as the medium of education. He formulated his policy proposal in his Minute on Indian Education, delivered in Kolkata on February 2, 1835. The Governor-General of India, William Bentinck, approved the proposal on March 7, 1835, so that it became the cornerstone of British-Indian educational policy until Independence (and remained largely in force after that as well).
but also felt themselves superior to general masses and closer to the British rulers” (p. 38). They even took pride in learning foreign culture and literature and wanted their sons to follow in their footsteps (Juma, 1987, p. 38). The colonizers also attempted to transform the lifestyles of the lower classes. For example, as Saifur Rehman (1972) states, after the Mysore and Maratha wars, the British began to reform the native soldiers. These soldiers were drilled, dressed, and shaved in English fashion. They were polished into British soldiers, in the process losing their distinctive Hindu and Muslim characteristics (Saifur Rehman, 1972, p. 56).

Epilogue: Contemporary Pakistani Culture and Lifestyles

Contemporary Pakistani culture and lifestyles have diverse sources, many manifestations, regional variations, and embody various class-based dimensions. It is generally argued that religious diversity, intra-Muslim pluralism, and ethnic identities collectively underwrite the thought process, cultural norms, lifestyles, and pervasive outlook of the people of Pakistan (Iftikhar, 2006; Rauf, 1988; Smith, 1951; Symonds, 1951). Likewise, Kalim (2001) argues that despite the predominance of Islamic religion, the culture of Pakistan reflects a vast plethora of forces of modernity along with traditional practices, although the divide may not be always so explicit. At times it becomes quite difficult to differentiate between the Western characteristics in Pakistani culture from their Indian counterparts, although the culture equally reflects the forces of continuity as well as the forces of change. Siddiqui (1997) argues that Pakistani culture, as exhibited through numerous social customs, attitudes, lifestyles, and creative arts, may be overwhelmingly Muslim, but, in its more mundane domains, it shares several traits and mores with neighbouring India as well as with the West. Qadeer (2006) acknowledges that Pakistani towns and cities contain many different types of groups following different attitudes and lifestyles, varying from immensely conservative to completely liberal pursuits (p. 206). However, Abbasi (1992) explains that the impact of Western culture in Pakistan is an expanding process. Before independence, England was the main source of information and culture, but after 1947 the sources have become diversified. Now it is no longer predominantly the English influence that pervades Pakistan; rather it is an American cultural wave that seeks to swamp the cultural scene (Abbasi, 1992, p. 40). Increasing globalization has also increased the influence of Western culture in Pakistan, and now citizens of Pakistan have easy access to Western products,
media, popular culture, and food, among other things. Many Western food chains have
established themselves in the country and can now be found almost everywhere.

Regarding the class-based dimensions of everyday life, Qadeer (2006) argues that social class in
Pakistan has the broad contours of upper, middle, and lower strata arising from property relations
and a commercial economy. These strata are regional in scope and suffused with ethnicity.
Independence has interlinked and, to some extent, integrated, regional strata, especially the urban
segments and the middle and upper segments. Yet, each stratum is further divided into socio-
cultural groups differentiated by lifestyle and value orientations. Within the same social class,
there are lifestyles or socio-cultural segments defined equally by economic status, cultural values
(traditional versus modern in broad terms), and consumption patterns. The upper class segment,
which includes globally connected groups of capitalists, executives, and professionals, has
usually been the purveyors of modern/Western lifestyles. Their dwellings and neighbourhoods
are almost indistinguishable from the suburbs of Washington, London, or Athens, not only in
physical layout, but also in social ambience. The spoken language in these neighbourhoods is a
concoction of regional dialects and Urdu liberally mixed with English; the dress has a Western
flair; home life and family relations are modern in form; and, of course, evidence of affluence is
widespread. Even mosques in these areas are grandiose.

Qadeer (2006) explains that the dwellings of the lower and working-class segments are almost
the opposite. Here, vernacular languages and native dress rule and joint families and kin
compounds are the focal points of daily life. Mud or brick houses line dusty streets soaked with
stagnant pools of water and sewerage. Both mosques and shrines re the nodes of community life.
Reeves (1984) emphasizes that on Pakistan’s roads and streets cars and camel carts reflect as
much the difference of the affluence and poverty as they symbolize the cultural diversity of
having modern and traditional lifestyles. However, Qadeer (2006) concludes that there are many
communities in between these two extremes, representing the spectrum of global and vernacular
cultural idioms in a variety of combinations (p. 224). Besides, there is another very significant
segment of mullahs (clerics) and Islamic religious-minded people, who have always been part of
the social mosaic and national politics. These mullahs actively enforce Islamic religion as the
bedrock of collective life, feed it into a pluralistic national ethos with a strong accent of traditional Islamic values, and, hence, translate it into a powerful national characteristic.

Although many attempts have been made since 1947 to establish an Islamic political system, the issue of secularization and Islamization is far from settled. Tanveer (2004) explains that Pakistan has had constitutions that upheld governmental and legal institutions that were not specifically Islamic, and governments adopted liberal agendas rather than conservative Islamic ideologies. Consequently, the political and constitutional history of Pakistan has been characterized by increasing challenges from Islamic activists and intellectuals, and terms like “Republic” have had to be substituted with “Islamic Republic” or “Islamic State.” Such movements gathered momentum in the 1980s when numerous political developments across the Muslim world had dramatically pointed to a revitalisation of Islam’s political culture; for instance, the success and resilience of the Islamic revolution in Iran; the fierce and long Afghan resistance, popularly known as *Jihad*, against the Russian controlled government in Afghanistan; and devastating strife between secular military government and the Islamic popular opposition in Algeria. Likewise, Egypt and Malaysia were testimonies to the resilience of the Islamic political sentiment and resurgence of its political values in modern times. Tanveer further explains that, under the influence of such Islamic revolutionary movements, a military dictator general, Zia-ul-Haq, announced in 1978 to promulgate *Nizam-e-Mustafa* (Islamic political system) as a preliminary measure to counter what he saw as a lack of true Islam in Pakistan. Sharing the ideology of the *Wahabi* Saudi Arabian model, General Zia advocated purging Islam of what he considered to be impurities and innovations. He wanted to create a rigid *Sunni* Islamist state. However, his reforms were detested by *Hanafi* and *Shiite* sects, which faced widespread discrimination and human rights abuses during his rule. Although, an official effort to enforce Islamic Sharia laws in the country lost impetus after the death of General Zia in 1988, Islamic religious parties and mullahs continued to set up platforms to host reactionary movements to enforce Islam; restrict non-Islamic cultural influences, most notably Indian and Western; and motivate the citizens to once again embrace the traditional cultural roots exclusively associated with Islam (Rauf, 1988, p. 112).
In conclusion, the cultural orientations and lifestyles in Pakistan reveal a very complex system of social stratification. To a great degree, the pyramid of relationships between lifestyles and social classes contains a vertical fissure dividing the indigenous vernacular from the modern hierarchies. The upper social groups appear to have reproduced Eurocentric lifestyles, while a significant segment of lower classes cherish indigenous vernacular ways of life. While Islam-minded reactionary movements advocate for the revival of pure Islamic ways of daily life. Hence, various lifestyles and ideologies behind them reveal a tendency of conflict and approval/disapproval in everyday Pakistani life.

The next section presents a brief discussion of the socioeconomic disparity in Pakistan with focus on the elitist model of economic growth. The main argument is that benefits have been accumulated by a small minority—the elite class—which continues to enjoy an unjust accumulation of wealth in the midst of widespread poverty and destitute.

**Economic Disparity and the Dynamics of the Elitist Model in Pakistan**

The class structure of contemporary Pakistan owes its origin primarily to the colonial policies pursued by the British. Gardezi (1991) argues that, as was dictated by the administrative and economic needs of the empire, the British imposed stratification systems on the indigenous of the Indian subcontinent that created small groups of functionaries and privileged classes, whose orientations and interests were deflected from the common concerns of their own people to serve the interests of the Empire. From the beginning, these groups constituted several levels of titleholders of landed estates, who often maintained custodial armed detachments on behalf of the colonial authorities. Permanent land settlement programs were also used by the British viceroys to reward “loyal” subjects in the form of huge land grants. Hence, a powerful feudal class emerged that was ruthless enough to indenture masses of labour to serve the needs of the colonizers. Ishrat (1999) also argues that the distribution of land—the most important asset in the country’s history—was highly skewed, with large landholdings concentrated in the hands of a few families. These land titles were not earned; they were conferred on beneficiaries by the British for the loyalty demonstrated by these classes in keeping the British rule intact (Ishrat, 1999, p. 377). As the British acquired a stronghold over the land, the local systems of administration, justice, trade, and commerce were gradually replaced by those used in England.
This also necessitated the training and recruitment of administration and technical functionaries to hold different levels of positions in various governmental departments. Hence, as discussed earlier, a new education system was established along the lines of British schools and universities, where vocational and professional education was imparted along with a heavy emphasis on learning English language, customs, manners, political and moral ideas, arts and literature, and so forth. Adam Curle (1966), Nyrop (1983), and Rahman (2004) explain that these institutions produced/reproduced senior professionals, such as lawyers, college/university teachers, medical specialists, engineers, accountants, senior military, and civil bureaucrats and administrators. To run the government machinery, minor administrators, clerical workers, and technicians were trained in non-elite public schools. Likewise, a third dominant stratum began to emerge when the British belatedly started paying attention to industrial and commercial development of the subcontinent. Gardezi (1991) explains that the commercial and industrial activity was promoted in the best traditions of capitalism, and the 1930s witnessed the emergence of a substantial class of local industrialists and entrepreneurs whose mode of production and related social/economic discourses were imported ready-made from England.

Therefore, when the country received independence in 1947, the basic class apparatus of the capitalists system of production and political control had already been created. Alvi (1983), Gardezi (1991), and Juma (1987) explain that among the elite groups, the categories with disproportionate shares of political and economic power were the large landlords, the owners of large capital and industry, the senior administrators, and the professionals. Below them there was a somewhat larger heterogeneous “middle class” of medium and small-scale (self-employed) businessmen/shopkeepers, mid-level civil/military officers, clerical and technical workers, craftsmen, writers, poets, teachers, and religious scholar-functionaries. The masses of manual workers and peasants were at the bottom of the class structure. The basic cleavage of orientation and interest within this class structure was between the top elite and the masses of peasants and workers. Moreover, the British colonizers deliberately relinquished power to this newly created elite class, because their members had come in contact with Western ideas of nationalism, parliamentary democracy, and industrial/trade discourses. Lumby (1954) argues that the timing and manner of the transfer of power were affected by a view to ensuring that the leaders of new states of India and Pakistan would share the political language and ideology of the British rulers.
and would thus be willing to prevent a popular socialist movement from materializing after the end of colonial rule. Myrdal (1958) acknowledges that the members of the new elite group were fairly safe candidates for inheriting the imperial political power and, by their very class composition, were incapable of posing a real threat to the essential continuity of colonial policy in the post-independence period.

After independence, these ruling groups not only managed to maintain their social power and privilege, but further reinforced it through the capital and intrinsic connections within their class structure. While unravelling the current elite class interests, Gardezi (1991) argues that in the case of Pakistan where a dependent or ‘peripheral’ capitalist mode of production is grafted on to a modified feudalism, the big landlords and the indigenous and metropolitan bourgeoisie could not manage to establish independent control over the state apparatus. This situation has made possible the emergence of a strong bureaucratic-military ‘oligarchy’ at the helm of the state, which uses its regulatory and controlling powers to mediate the mutually competing and, at times, conflicting interests of different fractions of the dominant class, while at the same time protecting their specific privileges from potential, and sometimes actual, threats posed by the dispossessed and dominated classes. In this sense, the state is not only overdeveloped, but is an alien force that wields a disproportionate degree of power over the rest of civil society.

Pakistan has revealed a significant growth in GDP since independence, but it systematically underperforms on most of the social indicators, such as education, health, sanitation, fertility, instability, democracy—and most significantly—economic disparity between different social classes. William Easterly (2001) calls Pakistan’s pattern “growth without development,” (p. 1) and explains that while foreign aid and government programs have contributed to overall economic growth, they egregiously failed at the promotion of social and institutional development under circumstances of elite domination. Likewise, Dr. Ishrat Hussain (1999), a prominent international economist, argues that Pakistan's political economy can be adequately unravelled by understanding the dynamics of the elitist model of growth, within which all of the politico-economic processes are enacted. A number of characteristics of the elitist model of growth can be identified in practice in the country, such as:
• A strong leader or succession of leaders who enjoy almost regal powers and implement their own agenda with few or almost no checks and balances;
• A powerful bureaucratic class that implements the wishes of the leader without questioning their legality or relating them to the larger public interest and in the process arrogates to itself the task of defining the goals of the State, which are made to coincide with its own; and
• A dormant and subservient population that is passive and indifferent to the actions of the leaders and bureaucracy.

For almost half of its sixty-two years, Pakistan has been governed by strong military leaders. For the other half, Pakistan has been governed by strong civilian leaders who unwittingly adopted the same military leadership style as used by their role model. The bureaucratic class has been a powerful ally of the strong leaders and played a major role in advising and implementing the agenda for their political masters (Ishrat, 1999, p. 384). In addition, the underlying success of the elitist model in Pakistan was the use of power over political resources to acquire power over economic resources. This power was gained either through direct appropriation of state assets or, indirectly, by misappropriating or avoiding paying what was owned to the state. For instance, since the 1960s, a few families have controlled 66 percent of the industrial wealth and 87 percent of banking and insurance, indicating their monopoly over the state assets (Easterly, 2001, p. 22; Qadeer, 2006). Ishrat (1999) explains while the main productive sectors of the economy—agriculture and manufacturing—promoted a pattern of growth that benefited a small minority of the population disproportionately, the contribution of this class to the tax-generating capacity of the country was almost negligible (p. 380). Likewise, Easterly (2001) affirms that landowners have been prominent in virtually all of Pakistani government coalitions. Their power is so great that, for a long time, they have been able to block direct taxation of agricultural income, depriving the state of an important revenue source. Dr. Tanvir Hussain (2008) argues that the core state’s policy is to drastically tax the poor and to lavishly spend on the rich. Almost 80% of the state’s revenue comes from the dominated classes. The officials siphon off and squander the state’s revenue generated in polishing the already developed areas where they and their elite community dwell. They are indifferent and callous towards the development of the areas where the off-scorings of humanity eke out their existence, hoping against hope for a final reprieve.
In this way, income levels emphasize a discernible disparity between different social class groups in the country. For instance, Ishrat (1999) explains that the lowest 20% of the population receives only 7.3% of total national income, while the highest 20% have increased its share to 44.5% (p. 03). Hence, to understand the precise income levels of different social classes, Dr. Rahman (2004) conducted a survey study in 2003-04, and argued that an unequal distribution of economic capital has been increasing the gulf between the rich and poor. These findings are presented in the following table.

**Table 0.1: Income Levels of Different Social Classes in 2003-04**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Classes</th>
<th>Per Month Income in Rupees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working (lower) Class</td>
<td>Up to 5000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower-middle Class</td>
<td>5001 – 10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Class</td>
<td>10,001 – 20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper-middle Class</td>
<td>20,001 – 50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower-upper Class</td>
<td>50,001 – 100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle-upper Class</td>
<td>Above 100,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Dr. Tariq Rahman (2004), p. 155*

Moreover, a drastic increase in inflation from 3.1% in the 2003-04 fiscal year (Government of Pakistan, 2005) to 22.3% in 2007-08 (Government of Pakistan, 2008b) has contributed to an aggravation of poverty among the masses. Hence, millions possess bare resources and are living at a subsistence level. For instance, a survey study conducted in 2001 by the Federal Bureau of Statistics indicated that 35.2% of the population had a poor basic calorie intake. Likewise, the World Bank statistics reveal that the prevalence of rural poverty on the official poverty line is far greater than the urban poverty—42.9% of rural population compared to 26% of urban population was poor in 2002 (World Bank, 2002). These findings contradict most poverty reduction claims from government officials.

The elitist model of growth in Pakistan is also maintained through the elite ensuring that they continue to hold power by keeping the masses uneducated. It is generally argued that an oligarchy will oppose widespread education because educated peoples are more likely to demand political power, i.e. democracy. Even if the country is already “democratic,” more educated people will be more likely to be politically active and, thus, more likely to vote for the redistribution of income and for the removal of power from the oligarchy. Hence, the oligarchy
will resist mass education even in a democratic society (Acemoglu & Robinson, 1998; Bourgignon & Verdier, 1999; Easterly, 2001; Gradstein & Justman, 1997). Likewise, Galor & Moav (2000) argue that at an early stage of development when labour and land were abundant and capital was scarce, there would be a low return on investing in mass education. It was assumed that skill was complementary to physical capital but not complementary to land. Therefore, in a point relevant to Pakistan, Easterly (2001) argues that the ruling elites would have little incentive to tax themselves to pay for the schooling of the masses. It is also evident in the fact that despite persistent promises and rhetoric, none of the governments in Pakistan has ever spent more than 2% of the GDP on public education since the time of independence (Hoodbhoy, 1998; Iqbal, 2009; Rahman, 2004).

The indifference towards educating the masses is, in fact, the reproduction of colonial doctrine in the country. Lord Macaulay, one of the stalwarts of British education policy in India, emphasized that rather than the government taking direct responsibility for the education of the mass of people, it should focus on imparting Western values and concepts to the Indian elite; if this were successful, the Indian elite would in turn share their knowledge with their own people and, somehow, it would eventually all “filter down” (Macaulay, 1835, as cited in Carnoy, 1974, p. 102; Vakil & Natarajan, 1966, p. 119). Likewise, Ishrat (1999) argues that the ruling elite in Pakistan have deliberately maintained the tattered nature of the education system that exists within both the religious madrassahs and public education, because it suits their vested interests. Besides, the elites have maintained the delivery of social services highly centralized, with all decisions about the allocation of resources made at the top, which enabled them to enforce their preference of under-investment in human capital (Easterly, 2001, p. 23).

In this way, the public sector schools reveal a lack of proper management and poor performance. Gazdar (2000) conducted a survey study of primary schools in selected rural locales. In a sample of 125 schools surveyed with surprise visits, a quarter of the schools were not open at the time of the visit. There were several cases where the teacher was a relative of the landowner and, thus, was protected from any kind of disciplinary action. The schools were sometimes used as a personal building by the landowner. Only a quarter of the schools had electricity and only half had a latrine. There were no teachers present in 19 percent of the schools, and only one teacher
was present in 35 percent of the sample schools. The researchers on the Gazdar team classified only 38 percent of the schools as “functional” according to minimal criteria.

Moreover, the education gap in the country between the rich elite and the poor majority is startling. Table 2.2 shows various educational statistics in Pakistan by income level, using data on household surveys from Filmer (2001). There is a gap of nine years in median educational attainment between the richest 20 percent and the poorest 40 percent. The situation in rural areas was more acute. About 46 percent of poor participants did not have any kind of formal schooling, while 30 percent had primary education, 15.5 percent secondary school, and only 7 percent of poor participants declared having education up to college or above. This indicates that the lower classes have been shut out of education.

Table 2.2: Education Gaps by Socio-Economic Status, Gender, and Location 1990-91

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Richest 20 %</th>
<th>Poorest 40 %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Median grade attained 15-19 year olds</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rich male</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor female</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


To conclude, it appears that in case of Pakistan, the poor have been prevented from receiving an equitable share by virtue of a number of explicit disabilities which can be summed up as lack of physical and human capital and a lack of access. In the political economy of growth in Pakistan, a narrow minority of influential elites who were primarily landlords, military-civil bureaucrats, and members of the big business and the professional class dominated the economy throughout the past six decades and maximized their capital-collecting activities. Conversely, the poor have had to face a extreme difficulty in securing access to public services and the acquisition of physical and human capital. Moreover, to maintain their dominance, the ruling elites have found it convenient to perpetuate low literacy rates. The lower the proportion of educated people, the lower the probability that the ruling elite could be displaced.
Chapter Summary

This chapter provided an analysis of the main cultural patterns and the nature of socioeconomic disparity in contemporary Pakistan. It is generally argued that culture and lifestyles in the country have diverse sources, many manifestations, regional variations, and embodies various class-based dimensions. The culture, as exhibited through numerous social customs, attitudes, lifestyles, and creative arts, may be overwhelmingly Muslim, but in its more mundane domains it shares several traits and mores with neighbouring India and the West. The towns and cities have many types of groups that follow different attitudes and lifestyles, varying from immensely conservative to entirely liberal. However, the impact of Western culture in Pakistan is an expanding process. Before independence, England was the main source of information and culture, but after 1947 the sources of information have become diversified. It is now no longer predominantly an English influence that pervades Pakistan; it is an American cultural wave that seeks to swamp the cultural scene.

In Pakistan, the upper class segment, which includes globally connected groups of capitalists, landlords, executives, and professionals, has mostly been the purveyors of modern/Western lifestyles. Their dwellings and neighbourhoods are modern not only in physical layout, but also in social ambience. Here the spoken language is a concoction of regional dialects and Urdu liberally mixed with English, their dress has a Western flair, and home life and family relations are modern in form. Hence, the dominant culture in Pakistan is still Eurocentric, which effluent families reproduce across generations. Conversely, the dwellings of the lower and working-class segments are almost the opposite. Here vernacular languages and native dress rules and joint families and kin compounds are the focal points of daily life. Mud or brick houses line dusty streets soaked with stagnant pools of water and sewerage. It appears that most dominated classes tend to reproduce indigenous lifestyles across generations. In between, there are reactionary movements in Pakistan that want to turn away from Western/Indian influences and return to more traditional roots that are associated with Islam.

The class structure of contemporary Pakistan owes its origin primarily to the colonial policies pursued by the British. As was dictated by the administrative and economic needs of the empire, the British imposed stratification systems on the indigenous of the Indian subcontinent that
created small groups of functionaries and privileged classes, whose orientations and interests were deflected from the common concerns of their own people to serve the interests of the Empire. Moreover, the British colonizers deliberately relinquished power to newly created elites, because they had come in touch with Western ideas of nationalism, parliamentary democracy, and industrial/trade discourses. After independence, these elites have managed to maintain their social power and privilege and have further reinforced it through the capital and intrinsic connections within their class structure. Some leading economists argue that Pakistan’s political economy can be adequately understood by unraveling the dynamics of the elitist model of growth, within which the whole politico-economic processes unfold. Hence, a narrow minority of influential elites, made up mostly of landlords, military-civil bureaucrats, big business and the professional class, dominated the scene throughout the past six decades and maximized their money-collecting activities. Conversely, the poor have had to face an extreme difficulty in securing access to public services and the acquisition of physical and human capital. Moreover, to maintain their dominance, the ruling elites have found it convenient to perpetuate low literacy rates. Accordingly, low investment on human capital development highlights the perception by the elite that the lower the proportion of educated people, the lower the probability that their rule could be displaced.
CHAPTER THREE: THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE THESIS

This chapter includes a discussion of the critical theories of social reproduction that contribute to the main conceptual framework facilitating this comparative analysis. As Bourdieu’s sociological theory serves as the leading framework, I have attempted to analyse it thoroughly with reference to the main components, strengths and weaknesses, and criticisms put forth by certain prominent sociologists. On the other hand, I have only discussed the aspects of Anyon’s treatise that are relevant to this enquiry. I have also attempted to elucidate the rationale for combining these two prominent theories of social reproduction. At this point, I would like to emphasize that the thrust of this thesis is both academic and practical. It will not only identify the factors leading to educational disparity, but will also determine certain ways of making schooling provisions more egalitarian. I would also like to acknowledge that, although these theoretical frameworks are both frequently applied in research and highly appreciated, their perceived limitations are also profoundly criticised. This criticism will also be analyzed in the following pages. However, my justification for selecting these frameworks is the fact that they are recommended for research studies by even their most staunch critics. For instance, Jenkins (1992) finds Bourdieu good to think with, and Alexander (1995) recommends him as très amusant. Likewise, Ramsay (1983) acknowledges Anyon as a trail blazer and invites for more research studies to follow the path set by her.

Rationale for Assembling a Conceptual Combination

I was continuously frustrated by the inexistence of a framework that allowed for a complex analysis of the various schooling aspects and their precise roles in reinforcing inequality of the three types of schools under examination. No doubt, Bourdieu’s theory is a relatively cohesive paradigmatic grand theory and has become an exceptionally stimulating source for other researchers through which to study the educational inequality in contemporary research. Yet, it lacks any precise guidelines regarding school knowledge and the conduct of ethnographic analysis of classwork with special reference to the kind of cognitive capabilities such knowledge may foster. Bourdieu’s theory also does not address the relative independence of students in different kinds of schools in regards to being able to choose their learning activities. Bourdieu did not specifically develop such vital schooling mechanisms in his framework. To fill in this
gap, I have decided to include Jean Anyon’s theory in this research. Her ethnographic study of school knowledge and classwork in different schools has attempted to uncover the role of these vital schooling mechanisms in preparing students for life within the social class from which they come. I find Anyon’s analysis useful and relevant to my research, which seeks to study these same schooling mechanisms, although in a different context than used by Anyon. Moreover, Anyon’s major findings and theoretical analysis predominantly provide empirical support to Bourdieu’s theory. Basically, being theorists of social-class reproduction, they both argue that a strong correlation exists between one’s social class and choice of schooling. The schools of wealthy communities are usually better than those of the poor communities, in regards to resources, teaching methods, and philosophies of education. The student composition of these schools and the micro-political contexts (e.g. teachers’ perceptions and core beliefs about students’ capabilities and their sense of responsibility towards their learning) are deeply related. In predominantly low-income schools, teachers emphasize their students’ deficits and generally instil a low sense of responsibility. Conversely, when a larger proportion of students are from affluent classes, the teachers accentuate their intellectual assets and feel more accountable for what their students learn. Therefore, the teachers’ sense of responsibility for student learning is connected to their beliefs about students’ intellectual abilities through a set of organizationally embedded expectations about what is possible for students from particular backgrounds. Therefore, the teachers’ habitus and other vital schooling practices generally guide the students’ schooling experiences in a particular direction and lead them on a path of remaining within their social class. This obviously perpetuates the maintenance of the status quo and the ongoing gap between the rich and poor. In this way, based on commonalities in their arguments, I perceive that a Bourdieu/Anyon combination is quite legitimate. In short, while Bourdieu’s theory will guide my research towards understanding different schools as fields of education, students’ total volume of economic/cultural capital, and students’ class habitus, Anyon’s theory will help me recognize the schooling mechanisms that contribute towards social-class consolidation.

**Documenting Reproduction and Inequality: Anyon’s Perspective**

Jean Anyon (1981) argues that while one’s occupational status and income level contribute to one’s social class, they do not define it (p. 4). She determines social class on the basis of a series of relationships to several aspects of the process through which goods, services, and culture are
produced in society. For instance, agents of the affluent classes have more access to physical and cultural capital and greater control over the structure of authority at work and in society and the process of their own activity. Similarly, as compared to social roles of many middle class and most working class agents, social roles of those in affluent classes include the cultural capital related to independent thinking, creativity, and decision-making powers.

Based on these understandings, Anyon conducted ethnographic research in the late 1970s in elementary schools in New Jersey that served either working class, middle class, or affluent communities. She provided richly detailed descriptions of differential, social class–based constructions of epistemological standpoints within these different settings. She primarily asked three questions to the fifth graders at each school: 1) What is knowledge? 2) Where does knowledge come from? 3) Can you make it—and if so how? Students from the ‘working class’ schools viewed knowledge as a set of procedures handed down to them by authority. In contrast, students at the ‘affluent’ schools looked at knowledge as something that they could create through reflection and critical thinking (Anyon, 1980, 1981).

Based on her ethnographic data, Anyon concluded that even in an elementary school context, where there is fairly standardized curriculum, social stratification of knowledge is possible. In addition, differing curricular, pedagogical, and student evaluation practices emphasize different cognitive and behavioural skills and contribute to the development in the children of certain potential relationships to physical and symbolic capital, authority and control, and the process of work. Thus, schools serve as sorting mechanisms, with lower class students being taught through skills and drills methods that prepare them for future wage labour, which is more mechanical and routine. Insofar as it denies the human capacities for creativity and planning, such work is degrading. Moreover, when performed in industry, such work is a source of profit for others. Conversely, students from higher social classes are provided with classroom experiences through which they develop human capacities related to analysis and planning and become prepared for the work in society that requires these sorts of skills. In fact, their schooling helps them develop the abilities necessary for ownership and control of physical capital and the means of production in the society. Therefore, the school experience, which differs qualitatively by social class, may contribute to the development of certain types of economically significant relationships in the
children from each social class, thereby contributing to the reproduction of the system of class relations in society.

It is worth mentioning that, like other prominent scholars, Anyon’s discourses are also criticised. Ramsay (1983) argues that Anyon limited her sampling to elementary schools, focused on only grades three and five, and did not recognize diversity both within and between schools. Furthermore, Ramsay outlines that 80 percent of Anyon’s sampling was white. Anyon is further accused of operating from the narrow framework of social class. In this way, Ramsay (1983) states that in her study Anyon "began and ended with social class" (p. 216). Anyon did not consider that people do differ and their differences will be reflected in classroom practice, their emphasis on different forms of knowledge, and the organisational structure they develop. The school is in all probability society’s most complex institution and no one explanation could ever account for this complexity. However, while taking this criticism into consideration, I believe that, like Anyon, my sampling schools are relatively homogeneous in regards to the social origins of their students. When I found diversity among students’ schooling experiences, as Ramsay proposed, I was certain to include them in my analysis.

The following pages will present an analysis of Bourdieu’s theory with reference to its main components and their interaction, limitations, and criticism; an analysis of research studies that investigated this theory; and an explanation of ways I plan to employ it in my research.

**An Overview of Bourdieu’s Theory of Social Reproduction**

Pierre Bourdieu was born in 1930 in a small rural village in the Pyrenees Mountains. Hence, during his professional life, his very accent marked him as an outsider in Parisian academic world that was dominated by the people who had educational credentials from a handful of elite institutions and a smooth, urbane cultural style. Consequently, in order to secure his berth and achieve excellence, Bourdieu had to contest and show resilience throughout his professional life against the monopoly of so-called Parisian intellectual elite. Such experiences, along with fieldwork in Algeria, contributed to shaping Bourdieu’s distinctive perspective on the interplay of objective structures and subjective understanding and action that, in the long run, also provided a vital force to his theoretical orientations (Calhoun, 2003). Moreover, he started as a
student of philosophy, before embracing anthropology and, finally, sociology as his guiding academic disciplines. It would be erroneous to understand this as the rejection of one field for another. In fact, his theory and method were mainly shaped by all of these disciplines (Grenfell and James, 1998). Bourdieu’s versatile interests also lead him to study and analyze the labour markets in Algeria, symbolism in the calendar and house of Kabyle peasants, marriage patterns in his native Béarne region of France, photography as an art and hobby, museum visitors, patterns of taste, journalism, issues regarding the educational system, and the rise of literature as a distinct field of endeavour, among other things.

However, amid the abovementioned interests, Bourdieu’s main concern was studying the intimate relationship between class, culture, and power in modern advanced capitalist societies. This particular intent finally directed him towards investigating educational institutions and the potential role they can play in reproducing social inequalities (Swartz, 1997, p. 189). Accordingly, Bourdieu argues that education is the space where practices tend to legitimize social difference and social inequalities and where the regulation of access to resources is ideologically constructed. He further argues that institutionalization of education has allowed for the regulation of knowledge and the agents who are in power tend to assert social control, social selection, and symbolic domination. The materials produced for education (e.g. curriculum/textbooks) and educational practices (e.g. pedagogy/evaluation) are all used to reproduce a regime of social hierarchy (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990).

Bourdieu’s analysis also provides an understanding of the socially stratified character of the education system. For instance, he frequently discusses elite schools (grandes écoles) and argues that, more than other types of schools, these schools recruit their students in large part from the dominant class and prepare them for leadership roles in society. He argues that the “type and prestige of educational institution attended are as influential for later careers as are number of years spent in schooling” (Swartz, 1997, p. 193, emphasis in original). Bourdieu explains that elite schools provide both physical and mental exercises to students and, in doing so, instil an “ascetic culture” of self-control in preparation for control over others. In this way, all activities are designed to nurture a charismatic quality of entitlement. The students experience a kind of
social and intellectual life that fosters social homogeneity, a common culture, a shared sense of entitlement, and a common symbolic capital.

Conversely, Bourdieu’s theory of social reproduction explains that those from lower social class backgrounds are at a disadvantage economically and culturally, and, thus, have lower expectations regarding successfully gaining the capital necessary to succeed in the education system. Therefore, the children from lower social classes mostly give up on schooling once they have identified that they cannot compete with the other students (Ogbu, 1978). In contrast, upper middle class youth internalise their social advantages as expectations for academic success and, as a result, stay in school (Ogbu, 1978). In this regard, educational selection occurs through self-selection (Bourdieu, 1990).

Another important concept in Bourdieu’s theory is that of “symbolic violence,” which is fundamentally the imposition of categories of perceptions and dispositions upon dominated social agents, who then consider that the social order is legitimate. Bourdieu (1990) argues that such “soft” violence has been mostly overlooked in social theories and is subject to “misrecognition” in everyday life. Misrecognition allows symbolic violence to become hidden within dominant discourses, which are spoken, and within other forms of violence that are applied to bodies. Therefore, in some ways symbolic violence can be considered much more powerful than physical violence in that it is embedded in the very modes of action and structures of cognition of individuals and imposes the spectre of legitimacy of the social order. For example, gender domination and gender itself (in regards to the construction of sexuality) represent a prominent arena of symbolic violence. Likewise, a student may accept a low grade because he or she has come to accept the system.

Swartz (1997) sums up Bourdieu’s main arguments regarding the central functions of the education system as the reproduction of uneven social relations. First, the education system performs the function of conserving, inculcating, and consecrating a cultural heritage. This is its internal and most essential function. Schooling not only provides the transmission of technical knowledge and skills, but also socialization into a particular cultural tradition. Analogous to the Catholic Church, the school is an institution specially designed to conserve, transmit, and
inculcate the cultural canons of a society. Hence, it performs a function of cultural reproduction. When this first function combines with traditional pedagogy, the education system performs a second, 'external' function of reproducing social class relations. It reinforces rather than redistributes the unequal distribution of cultural capital. It also performs a social reproduction function. The education system also performs a third function, that of 'legitimation.' By consecrating the cultural heritage it transmits, the education system deflects attention away from, and contributes to the misrecognition of, its social reproduction function.

**Three Key Concepts: Capital, Habitus, and Field**

Bourdieu’s main theoretical concepts: capital, habitus, and field are the useful ‘thinking tools’ to unearth unequal power relations and their reproduction through education system. Bourdieu (1977, 1984) argues that the inculcated class-based dispositions that students bring with them to school are of vital importance in their interaction with the educational institutions, as schools value and reward the cultural capital of the dominant class and devalue that of students belonging to dominated classes. Bourdieu furthermore argues that knowledge of ‘high culture’ activities and social networks (especially those based on kinship) are important determinants of individual academic success. This occurs because of the unequal distribution of symbolic goods and the means of appropriation needed to acquire them, which ensure that students with high levels of cultural capital receive preferential treatment when interfacing with educational institutions. Likewise, influential social networks and acquaintances also result in differential treatment of students within schools and, afterwards, in the job market. Therefore, in general, schools tend to reinforce and consecrate initial inequalities through the cumulative fortification of privilege and deprivation. Following is a brief discussion of these theoretical concepts:

**Capital**

Bourdieu extended his notion of capital to include all forms of power, whether economic, cultural, social or symbolic. Calhoun (2000) explains that by conceptualizing capital as taking many different forms, each tied to a different field of action, Bourdieu stresses that: (a) there are many different kinds of goods that people pursue and resources that they accumulate; (b) these goods are inextricably social, because they derive their meaning from the social relations that constitute different fields; (c) the struggle to accumulate capital is basic as is the struggle to
reproduce it. In Bourdieu’s view individuals and groups employ strategies for accumulating, investing, and converting various kinds of capital in order to either maintain or enhance their positions in the social hierarchy. The four generic types of capital that are outlined in Bourdieu’s work (e.g. economic, cultural, social, and symbolic) are interrelated. For instance, rich people with prominent economic capital are more likely to educate their children in elite institutions (to accumulate cultural capital), tend to establish social circles as a strategy to reap benefits (social capital), and are regarded as respectable by others who value their capital (symbolic capital).

**Economic Capital**

Economic capital includes wealth, income, and property, which Bourdieu perceives as the “dominant principal of social hierarchy in modern stratified societies” (Swartz, 1997, p. 193). Along with other forms of capital, substantial possession of economic capital distinguishes the dominant class from other social groups. However, the dominant class is also internally differentiated by unequal distribution of the capital. Moreover, economic capital can be reproduced by being passed down from one generation to the next. Robinson (1984) states that economic capital (e.g. money, a shop, factory, machinery, raw material, or some other form of property) is easily transferable from one person to another. There is no need for formal education to play a mediating role in the transfer of ownership; that is, the children of petty bourgeoisie need not acquire a good education to inherit the family business. However, rich parents do provide better education to their children as a strategy of maintaining their positions or further thriving in the economic field (Bourdieu and Boltanski, 1978). Explaining the significance of economic capital in his theoretical framework Bourdieu (1986) states:

- Different types of capital can all be derived from economic capital. These “transformations” are not automatic but require effort, and the benefits often show only in the long term. Profits in one area are necessarily paid for by costs in another. For example, wealthy parents tend to purchase cultural/social capitals in elite private schools.
- The other three forms of capital (cultural, social, and symbolic) are not entirely reducible to economic capital—they have their own specificity—but economic capital is at their root. (p. 112)
Cultural Capital

The concept of “cultural capital” is one of the most original and distinctive features of Bourdieu’s theory, which encompasses a broad range of skills, knowledge, and practices that also act as class markers. Bourdieu (1977) describes cultural capital as the tool that an individual can utilize to gain the resources that are typically valued by the society (e.g. educational credentials).

However, Bourdieu did not provide a straightforward definition of cultural capital; instead, his definition of the concept is rather “intriguing, slippery and high-falutin” (Rikowski, 2002, p. 57). In *The Forms of Capital*, Bourdieu (1977) indicates that cultural capital can exist in three forms:

a) **Embodied Cultural Capital**: in form of long-lasting dispositions of the mind and body that help in appreciating and understanding cultural goods such as music, scientific formulas, works of art, and even popular culture. This is internalized by the individual through the socialization process, which begins in early childhood. Those children, who come from a privileged or more economically secure environment, are more likely to acquire embodied cultural capital, which requires time, money, and knowledge on the part of primary caregivers.

b) **Objectified Cultural Capital**: in the form of cultural goods (pictures, books, dictionaries, instruments, machines, etc.).

c) **Institutionalized Cultural Capital**: in form of educational credentials and credentialing system. (p. 47)

Bourdieu argues that, above and beyond economic factors, “cultural habits and dispositions inherited from” the family are fundamentally important to school success (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1990, p. 14). In doing so, he broke sharply with traditional sociological conceptions of culture, which tended to view it primarily as a source of shared norms and values or as a vehicle of collective expression. Instead, Bourdieu maintains that culture shares many of the properties that are characteristic of economic capital (Lareau & Weininger, 2003). In particular, he asserts that cultural habits and dispositions comprise a resource capable of generating profits, are potentially subject to monopolization by individuals and groups; and, under appropriate conditions, can be transmitted from one generation to the next (Lareau and Weininger, 2003).
Cultural Capital is Primarily Transmitted through the Family

Bourdieu (1986) argues that it is from the family that children derive modes of thinking, sets of meaning, and qualities of style including demeanour, social know-how, self-confidence, dress, and language refinement. These are then assigned a specific social value and status in accordance with what the dominant classes label as the most valued cultural capital (Giroux, 1983). Thus, the potential for a complex analysis of interactions between home backgrounds, the processes of schooling, and a child's educational career are integral to cultural capital (Reay, 1998). However, while the concept of cultural capital implies the centrality of the family, Bourdieu (1986) also seems to recognize the centrality of the parents:

It is because the cultural capital that is effectively transmitted within the family itself depends not only on the quantity of cultural capital, itself accumulated by spending time, that the domestic group possess, but also on the usable time (particularly in the form of parent’s free time) available to it. (p. 253)

Families, therefore, provide the link between individual and class trajectory and “should be the units of study for class analysis” (Wilkes, 1990, p. 127).

Different Ways to Operationalize Cultural Capital in Research

Due to the vagueness and complexity of the concept, cultural capital has been defined and operationalized in research by different sociologists and researchers in a variety of ways. Nugent (2008) has summarized them as follows:

- Participating in “high-brow culture” such as opera, ballet, art gallery, concerts, theatre, lectures, symposiums, and museums (Katsillis & Rubinson, 1990; Kalmijn & Kraaykamp, 1996; Robinson, 1984; Vryonides, 2005).
- Participation in classes related high-brow culture, such as, learning opera, musical instruments, dance lessons, etc. (Aschaffenburg & Maas, 1997).
- Possession of cultural/educational resources, such as, personal computer, internet, encyclopaedia, library, authentic artwork, newspapers, etc (De Graaf et al., 2000; Roscigno & Ainsworth-Darnell, 1999).
- Reading of high-brow culture such as classical novels and plays, biographies, etc, (Vryonides, 2005), and using the library as well as watching specific types of television programs (Sullivan, 2001).
• Knowledge about the education system and how it works (De Graaf et al., 2000; Davies & Guppy, 1997; Reay, 1998).
• Choice of appropriate schooling based on knowledge of the education system (DiMaggio, 1982; Reay, 1998; Tooley, 1997).
• Parent’s available time and negotiating their relationship with teachers to compensate for perceived deficits in children’s schooling (Reay, 1998).
• Language skills and refinement (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990; Sullivan, 1999)
• Social know-how (Deil-Amen & Rosenbaum, 2003), social confidence (Reay, 1998), and social rituals (Cookson & Persell, 1985).
• Cultural resources related to education, which are demonstrated as non-cognitive traits, including doing homework, not being disruptive in class, attendance, and proper demeanour, all of which are valued by gatekeepers such as teachers (Farkas et al, 1990).
• Self discipline (Nash, 2002).
• Foods, home furnishings, and leisure pursuits (Bourdieu, 1984).
• Tastes, preferences, lifestyles, language, dress, music, deportment (Carter, 2003).

Therefore, it appears that cultural capital incorporates many aspects of the human activity, such as behaviour, language, attenuates, deportment, body language, dress, attitudes, etc.

Social Capital

Social capital refers to individual as well as family social networks, acquaintances, and connections that provide not only educational benefits but also facilities for the pursuit of social outcomes in the status attainment process (Bourdieu, 1986, 1990; Dhesi, 2000; Green & Vryonides, 2005). As compared to his explanation of cultural capital, Bourdieu’s definition of social capital is much more straightforward (Rikowski, 2007); it is as follows:

Social capital is the aggregate of the actual or potential resources, which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition—or in other words, to membership of a group—which provides each of its members with the backing of the collectively-owned capital, a ‘credential’ which entitles them to credit, in the various senses of the word. (Bourdieu, 1997, p. 51)
Bourdieu’s conceptualization of social capital is different from the approach taken by Putnam and Coleman. Putnam (1993, 1995, 2000) appears to be more focused on social capital as a structural feature of communities and nations, while Coleman (1988) identifies social capital as a resource both within the family (in that it exists within the structure of intergenerational relationships, especially between parents and children) and outside the family (in that relations between parents, children, and social ties outside the family, which come together to create a dense social structure of norms, trust, and obligations) that frame appropriate behaviours (see also Dhesi, 2000; Edwards, et al, 2003; Vryonides, 2005). For Bourdieu social capital is the sum of the resources, actual or virtual, that are accrued by an individual or a group by virtue of possessing a durable network of more or less institutionalised relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 119). Social capital is constituted by the socially powerful and depends on the normality of practices of social inequality and exclusions.

Bourdieu’s social capital provides each of the group members with backing of the collectively-owned capital, a credential which entitles them to credit (Bourdieu, 1986). However, Bourdieu (1997) elaborates that an individual’s ability to credit the social networks he or she possesses is a function of their own economic capital, their place in the social hierarchy and the power this bestows on them, and their social status (p. 52). For instance, lower class networks may be as plentiful and varied as middle-class ones, but they are less productive in regards to social and economic outcomes. Thus, the effectiveness of social capital depends on, among other things, two important elements. One, is the nature of the networks families identified for accessing opportunities and the other refers to the way parents feel about using social networks to achieve social goals. The latter seems to determine, to a large extent, the families’ willingness and confidence to mobilise their social networks (Green & Vryonides, 2005, p. 330).

The existence of a network of connections is not naturally a given, or even a social given, constituted once and for all by an initial act of institution, represented, in the case of the family group, by the genealogical definition of kinship relations, which is the characteristic of a social formation. It is the product of an endless and lifetime effort. To maintain their social capital individuals need to ensure that, in the process of sociability, the reciprocity in their interactions
with others within their social networks is continually nurtured; furthermore, to increase their social capital, they must to increase these efforts. Bourdieu (1997) states that, “the reproduction of social capital presupposes an unceasing effort of sociability, continuous series of exchanges in which recognition is endlessly affirmed and reaffirmed” (p. 52).

**Convertibility of Capital**

In the social space (or field), agents strive to accumulate the appropriate resources (capital), which function as a crucial element in determining the practices of monopolization and domination. Such practices enable agents to transform one type of capital into another (such as economic capital into cultural, social, or symbolic capital, etc.). Calhoun (2003) states that there are two ways in which capital is converted from one form to another. One is as part of the intergenerational reproduction of capital. Wealthy people try to make sure that their children go to prestigious educational institutions, which, in fact, are often expensive private schools. This is a way of converting money (economic capital) into cultural capital (educational credentials). In this form, cultural capital can be passed on and potentially reconverted into economic capital because, in the modern age, educational credentials have become increasingly essential for gaining access to prestigious positions in the job market. Swartz (1997) affirms that, “such type of strategy is more readily available to the affluent” (p. 77). The second way for capital to be converted of is more immediate. For example, an athlete with great success and capital specific to his/her sporting field may convert this into money by signing agreements to endorse products or by opening a business such as a car dealerships or insurance agencies; in this case, celebrity status (symbolic capital) in the athletic field may help to attract customers (resulting in increased economic capital).

**Habitus**

Bourdieu (1977) defines habitus as “a system of lasting, transposable dispositions which, integrate past experiences, functions at every moment as matrix of perceptions, appreciations, and actions” (p. 82). Wacquant (2006) explains that habitus is actually an old concept in philosophy, used by writers including Aristotle, Thomas Aquinas, Hegel, Weber, and Durkheim.
The habitus appears in one way as characteristic set of dispositions for action within by each individual (Calhoun, 2000, p. 293) works through “the subjective expectations of objective probabilities” (Grenfell & James, 1998, p.15). Habitus is the structural view that postulates practice provoking dispositions, or dispositions to act in a certain way, to grasp experience in a certain way, to think in a certain way. Robbins (1993) affirms that habitus not only is a form of social inheritance, but it also implies habit, or unthinkingness in actions, and dispositions. Simply put, habitus denotes a social process of matching dispositions to the positions in the social order. Each individual learns to play the role that fits with his or her status. This helps people accept their position in social life and sincerely see it as that for which they were suited. Habit is a way of being that takes structure and propensity for granted (Bellamy, 1994). We do not think about or question our place because “habitus trumps cognition” (Frank, 2002, p. 390).

However, Jenkins (1991) argues that habitus is more than just perceptions and mental attitudes. Rather, Bourdieu in his work used the concept of habitus to signify deportment, (the manner and style in which actors ‘carry themselves’ including stance, gait, gesture, manner of speaking, etc.) (Jenkins, 1992, p. 51). Habitus literally includes the way a person uses his or her body (Bourdieu, 1990). Furthermore, habitus is not just a capacity of the individual, but is furthermore an achievement of the collectivity. It is the result of a ubiquitous “collective enterprise of inculcation” (Calhoun, 2003, p. 294). As a result strategies can work without individuals being consciously strategic, because they inculcate who they are and the existence of the social institutions depends on the strength of this inculcation in regards to orientations to action, evaluation, and understanding. Bourdieu (1977) himself refers to habitus as “structured structures predisposed to function as structuring-structures” (p. 72).

Habitus also exerts a strong influence on an individual’s perception of his or her opportunities in a particular social arena, such as an educational institution. It strongly influences aspirations and expectations. Opportunity is impacted in part by attributed characteristics. A further refinement of habitus is the concept of illusio (Frank, 2002). Habitus refers to the sense that one has the right to play the game (e.g. is entitled to participate in a particular activity). Illusio is the ability to understand which games should be taken seriously. These are the games that one should commit
oneself to playing. Therefore, a student may not work hard to comply with requirements for success in school if he or she does not perceive that education is important (Nugent 2008, p. 75).

Bourdieu saw habitus as a principle of both social continuity and discontinuity (Wacquant, 2006). However, the possibility of change in subjective habitus must be viewed by considering its relationships to the objective world of other people and things because Bourdieu suggests that habitus is the site of the internalization of reality and the externalization of internality (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990, p. 205). Furthermore, Calhoun states that the most fundamental social changes have to appear not only as changes in the formal structures, but also as changes in habitual orientations to action (Calhoun, 2000, p. 294).

**Examples of Habitus**

In explaining the concept of habitus, Calhoun (2000), gives the following examples:

- The Christian church, which is a product of two millennia that still seems alive to its members. Members both experience it as alive and contribute to it being alive by reinventing it in their rituals, their relations with each other, and their faith. Being brought up in the church helps to prepare members for belief (inculcation), but it is also something they must actively claim (appropriation). The connection between the institution and the person is the very way in which members produce their actions.

- Each of us reproduces the idea of a corporation every time we engage in a transaction with one (e.g. owning stock, renting an apartment, going to work), even though that may not be our conscious intention.

**Habitus Develops in Childhood**

Through the process of socialization, children start learning their place in the social structure by internalizing it at a very young age and evaluating themselves according to characteristics such as gender, race, socioeconomic status, and other forms of cultural belongings (Calhoun, 2000; Dumais, 2002; Nash, 1999; Sender, 2001). Parents play a very important role in preparing children for their adult roles. For example, children are asked what they want to be when they grow up and are advised that it to be wise to have an occupation. They are told to be well mannered, to sit up straight, and to speak when spoken to. They experience the reverence their
elders show before church, synagogue, or mosque, depending on their faith. Based on what is met with approval or disapproval and what does or does not work, they develop a characteristic way of generating actions or improvising the moves of the game of their lives. More importantly, every family has its own habitus—a sense of its place in society and what it deserves. Through socialization, the family inculcates within the child a social process of matching his or her dispositions to the positions in the social order. Simply put, “one learns to play the roles that fit with one’s status” (Calhoun, 2000, p. 293).

Habitus has implications not only for understanding educational practice, but also for understanding the assimilation of the messages in the culture industry or work experiences. Bourdieu (1977) explains that the habitus acquired in the family underlines the structuring of school experiences (in particular the reception and assimilation of the specifically pedagogic message), and the habitus transformed by schooling, itself diversified, in turn underlies the structuring of all subsequent experiences (e.g. the reception and assimilation of the messages of the culture industry or work experiences) and so on through perpetually forms of restructuring (p. 87). However, for Bourdieu, the habitus secures “conditioned and conditional freedom;” (p. 95). In this way, Bourdieu states that habitus is remote from a creation of unpredictable novelty as well as from a simple mechanical reproduction of the initial conditionings.

Field

Bourdieu defines field as a network, or a configuration, of objective relations between positions objectively defined, in their existence and in the determinations they impose upon their occupants, agents or institutions, by their present and potential situation…in the structure of the distribution of power (or capital), whose possession commands access to the specific profits that are at stake in the field, as well as by their objective relation to other positions (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992: 97).

Each field has a differing degree of autonomy (Calhoun, 2000, p. 295; Wacquant, 2006), which Bourdieu (1983) argues is the critical phase in the emergence of a field. Autonomy means that the field can be engaged in the play of its own distinctive game, can produce its own distinctive capital, and cannot be reduced to immediate dependency on any other field. Bourdieu argues that
in the way in which fields are organised or structured and the manner in which they function or operate, there are many homologies between them. For example, each field has a dominant class and certain subjugated classes, struggles for usurpation or exclusion, mechanisms of reproduction, and so on. But every one of these characteristics takes on a specific irreducible form in each field. Jenkins (1992) says that homology between fields; the resemblance, which is bound up with difference has two sources. First, it is a reflection of certain commonalities in dispositions (habitus) and practice as they are translated within the differing logics of separate fields. Second, it is a consequence of the power of dominant fields, particularly the field of power (politics), to impinge upon weaker fields and structure that which occurs within them.

**Examples of Field**

To explain his concept of field, Bourdieu (1997) gave the example of an intellectual field, which he explained as the matrix of institutions, organizations, and markets in which symbolic producers (such as writers and academics) compete for symbolic capital. Some other references of field in Bourdieu’s work include institutions of higher education, literature, art market, housing policy, religion, law, studies of social-class lifestyles (Calhoun, 2000; Grenfell and James, 1998; Jenkins, 1992; Swartz, 1997; Swingewood, 2000; Wacquant, 2006). Bourdieu also refers to the “field of power,” which he explains as the principle stratifying force in his analysis of the contemporary societies (Swartz, 1997, p. 119).

**Fields are Dynamic, not Static**

A field, by definition, is a field of struggles in which agent’s strategies are concerned with the preservation or improvement of their positions with respect to the defining capital of the field (Jenkins, 1992, p. 58). Wacquant (2006) also states that fields can be thought of as force fields or battlefields, capturing the essential element of conflict inherent in the concept. In addition, Swartz (1997) explains that field struggle centers around a particular form of capital: economic, cultural, scientific, religious, etc. Cultural capital is the key property in the intellectual field, and economic capital is the key property in the business world. Similarly scientists compete for scientific capital in the field of science. There are, therefore, as many fields as there are forms of capital. Thus, a field is a continual power struggle, with winners and losers. The rules of the field determine how the competition will take place. Some of the rules may be overt, but many more
are implicit. The implicit rules are often the most important for success, but one must have the correct form of capital and habitus to perceive, understand, and follow the implicit rules. The conflict and struggle within a field is also the struggle for legitimation for the right to monopolize the exercise of symbolic violence.

**The Interrelationship Between Capital, Habitus, and Field**

Bourdieu’s work can only be appreciated fully if we resist reading it in fragments, as his work on education, art, literature, or that which was devoted to overcoming the structural/action antinomy addresses the core issues of power and social inequality. Furthermore, while his key concepts (habitus, field, and capital) are useful in and of themselves, they “derive their greatest theoretical significance from their interrelationships” (Calhoun, 2003, p. 303). These concepts are best seen not mechanically in the abstract, but jointly at work in sociological analysis. Nugent (2008) explains that Bourdieu did not intend for these three concepts to be used in isolation. Rather, he stated that it is the interaction of these concepts which best describes and explains human behaviour as a social phenomenon (Nugent, 2008, p. 81). Likewise, Jenkins (1992) explains the relationship between field and habitus by stating that the objective structures of the field are inseparable from the genesis of subjective mental structures, which allow individuals to make sense of and act within that particular field. The field provides the rules that determine which tools are to be used, by whom, and when. Habitus, on the other hand, gives an understanding of the rules and the objective structures of a particular field, and gives a person the confidence, feeling of comfort, and sense of entitlement to use them (Frank, 2002). Therefore, field and habitus mutually complement each other. Grenfell and James (1996) affirm that field and habitus are based on identical generating principles and that there are structural homologies between the two (p. 16). Bourdieu (1967) himself explains that:

The relation between habitus and field operates in two ways. On the one side, it is a relation of conditioning: the field structures the habitus, which is the product of the embodiment of immanent necessity of a field (or of hierarchically intersecting sets of fields). On the other side, it is a relation of knowledge or cognitive construction: habitus contributes to constituting the field as a meaningful world, a world endowed with sense and with value, in which it is worth investing one’s practice (p. 44).
Similarly, there is a vital relationship between capital and field. Fields are the sites of social struggle between classes and fractions of classes each pursuing distinctive goals and strategies to accumulate substantial amounts of capital (Swingewood, 2000, p. 215). The relative volume and composition of the capital in turn determines a social hierarchy within the field. The individuals and groups that hold dominant positions due to their capital not only tend to influence the rules of a field, but also validate their own capital through their power and domination. The dominated classes tend to challenge the field. Consequently, “a capital does not exist and function except in relation to a field” (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 101).

Bourdieu’s concept of capital also reveals a vital relationship between its different categories. Reay (1998) argues that while cultural capital is Bourdieu’s best-known concept, it is primarily a relational concept and exists in conjunction with other forms of capital. It cannot be understood in isolation from the other forms of economic, symbolic and social capital, because together they constitute advantage and disadvantage in the society.

Swartz concludes that Bourdieu’s complete model of practice conceptualises action as the outcome of a relationship between habitus, capital, and field (Swartz, 1997, p. 141). Bourdieu (1948) offers the following equation as a summary formula of his model:

\([(\text{Habitus}) (\text{Capital})] + \text{Field} = \text{Practice}. \) (p. 101)

Therefore, it appears that Bourdieu’s key concepts are part of an interrelated system, which makes it imperative to incorporate all of them into our research studies if we intend to receive a real understanding of the processes causing social inequalities. Bourdieu (1989) himself suggests that “one must inseparably dissect both the social constitution of the agent and the makeup of the particular social universe within which he or she operates as well as the particular conditions under which they come to encounter and impinge upon each other” (p. 19).
Criticism about, and Key Concepts of, Bourdieu’s Theory

Bourdieu’s theory has received great appreciation as well as profound criticism in academic literature. The following section contains an account of this criticism put forth by prominent authors.

**Bourdieu’s Theoretical Model is not Completely Original**

Bourdieu’s work is criticised for being somewhat less original than at first it appears. Calhoun (2002) states that this is not an unreasonable point, for Bourdieu’s work was indebted to influences (such as: Goffman and Mauss) that are not always reflected in formal citations (p. 303). Jenkins (1992) argues that as a model of ‘social structure’ Bourdieu’s theory is not particularly novel. From Weber onwards, the history of social theory is full of examples of broadly similar understandings of society as inter-related arenas or domains. This would not even be a comment worth making, if Bourdieu did not persist in presenting his work as consisting of new and radical solutions to the old theoretical problems that had persistently stumped everyone else.

**Bourdieu’s Theory is Overtly Deterministic**

Many critics have expressed their deep concern over Bourdieu’s treatment of agency/structure issue and termed his theory as deterministic, in that it ignores the role of human agency (Calhoun, 2003; Grenfell and James, 1998; Jenkins, 1992; Kingston, 2001; Lamont & Lareau, 1988; Sullivan, 1999; Swartz, 1997; Swingewood, 2000). According to these authors, in his theory Bourdieu portrays a picture of individuals who are socialized from birth to accept their place in society. Behaviour appears to be without involvement of consciousness and entirely supportive of the social order. Alexander (1995) affirms that Bourdieu underplays the role of human agents and does not place sufficient emphasis on the capacity of agents to achieve liberation from durable objective structures. Alexander (1995) states, “in short, he was a determinist” (p. 143).

Likewise, Jenkins (1992) explains that the habitus emphasises a correlation between the scientifically constructed objective probabilities and agent’s subjective aspirations. The dispositions that are durably inculcated by the possibilities and impossibilities, freedoms and
necessities, opportunities and restrictions inscribed in the objective conditions, generate dispositions objectively compatible with these conditions and in a sense pre-adapted to their demands. However, Bourdieu himself responds to the accusation of determinism against habitus by stating the following. First, habitus only operates in relation to a social field. The same habitus can produce very different practices, depending on what is going on in the field. Second, the habitus can be transformed by changed circumstances, and expectations or aspirations will change as a result. Third, the habitus can be controlled as a result of “awakening of consciousness and socioanalysis” (Bourdieu, 1989, p. 116). However, Jenkins (1992) argues that these rebuttals do not amount to a defence against the charge of determinism, because it remains difficult to understand how, in Bourdieu’s model of practice, actors or collectivities can intervene in their own history in any substantial fashion.

**Bourdieu is Blinded by the Dominant Cultural Capital**

Bourdieu has been criticised for acknowledging the existence of only one cultural capital, that of the dominant group. Conversely, Carter (2003) argues that both dominant and non-dominant cultural capitals exist. Based on his research study in the United States, Carter tends to prove that poor black youth have cultural capital that they use within their social group, which includes specific language, behaviours, deportment, and dress. This is non-dominant cultural capital. They also have dominant cultural capital, which they use in the environments controlled by the dominant group, such as schools and courts. They are well aware that the dominant cultural capital is a vital requirement for the success in the fields of broader social world. They also understand that their own cultural capital is devalued in most fields. Carter concludes that non-dominant cultural capital of the deprived classes must not be ignored.

With respect to the variability of class, others have commented that Bourdieu ignores the existence and value of working class culture (Livingstone & Sawchuk, 2000). These authors argue that the working class agents are portrayed by Bourdieu as relegated to an inferior position, since he ignores the actual creative cultural practices of their social class.
Complexity and Vagueness of Theoretical Concepts
Several leading authors have pinpointed the complexity, vagueness, and ambiguity of Bourdieu’s theoretical concepts (Berger & Luckmann, 1967; Calhoun, 2003; Green & Vryonides, 2005; Kingston, 2001; Lamont & Lareau, 1988; Sullivan, 1999). It appears that Bourdieu did not completely define or elaborate some of his main concepts. For instance, Jenkins (1992) argues that there is a problem either of ontology or definition (or both) with respect to fields. Do they exist in the social consciousness of those actors who inhabit the social space in question, or are they simply analytical constructs? It is not wholly clear. Furthermore, Bourdieu does not fully explain the institutionalised nature of fields. There is little to be found in the way of a theorised model of institutions, their operation, or their relationship to the organisation of social life. They seem to exist as taken for granted, functioning entities with a status similar to individual actors.

Likewise, Bourdieu’s concept of habitus also receives criticism for being vague and complex. For example, Calhoun (2000) states that habitus is the term that is notoriously ambiguous, confusing, and difficult to pin down. Sullivan (2002) has also argued that the concept of habitus is too vague and for the most part not fully defined. DiMaggio (1979) finds habitus to be fuzzy and used to accomplish a broad range of conceptual tasks. He indicates that habitus is a “kind of theoretical deus ex machina” that takes care of all the niggling little concerns that have been expressed about Bourdieu’s theory (p. 164, emphasis in original). Nash writes that the concept of habitus often seems to exclude ideas like “self choice” and “action” by virtue of its emphasis on practices arising from the group’s relation to culture. Bourdieu seems to suggest that people are only rational when they step out of the automatic responses prompted by their habitus (Nash, 1990, p. 434). Furthermore, Jenkins (1992) argues that the most complicated of questions relates to the status of dispositions with respect to the conscious and the unconscious mind. Bourdieu refers over and over again to unconscious character of practical logic and the existence of dispositions as beyond consciousness. However, it is equally clear that consciousness must be involved. Speech, for example, is a complicated process involving a full range of mental/intellectual operations, both conscious and unconscious.

Jenkins (1992) further argues that the relationship between habitus and field is far from clear. In places, Bourdieu writes as if each field generates its own specific habitus. Elsewhere, it seems to
be the case that actors bring their own, pre-existing and historically constituted habitus to whichever field they are a part of. Both of these options may, of course, be true. Individuals must grow up, acquiring their habitus as part of their process of social and personal development, within a field or fields. But what about fields that agents only ever encounter as mature, informed adults? Similarly, how is it possible, if at all, for a field to “have” its own habitus, if the habitus is a property of embodied individual agents? Once again, we are back to problems of ontology and definition.

**Inadequate Explanation of Social Change**

The most frequent criticism against Bourdieu is that social change is peripheral to his model and difficult to account for. Jenkins (1992) argues that the centrality in his work of ‘external determinations’ as the motor force of change suggests an inability to account, or allow, for endogenous or internally generated change. Moreover, the ‘objective structures’ of fields appear to be as durable as the dispositions of the habitus and resist any type of change (Jenkins, 1992, p. 58-9). Swartz (1997) argues that Bourdieu’s fields are “sites of resistance as well as domination, one being relationally linked to the other, yet fields capture struggle within the logic of reproduction, they seldom become sites of social transformation” (p. 121).

Bourdieu’s model is one in which power and authority flow from the top down. Despite his apparent acknowledgement of, and enthusiasm for, resistance, it is difficult to find examples in his work of its efficacy or importance. The ongoing and successful reproduction of relationships of domination lies at the heart of Bourdieu’s social theory: there may be struggle, but it occurs within an endurably hierarchical social space. His social universe ultimately remains one in which things happen to people, rather than a world in which people can intervene in their individual and collective destinies (Jenkins, 1992, p. 122). Likewise, Giroux, (1983); Harker, Maher, & Wilkes (1990); and Robbins (1991) argue that Bourdieu’s concept of field elaborates an apparent mechanistic notion of power and domination, an overly determined view of human agency, and the over simplification of class cultures and their relationship to each other. It seems that there is no room for notions like resistance, incorporation, and accommodation.
A Discussion of Research Studies Investigation Bourdieu’s Theory

A relatively large body of research has been conducted based upon Bourdieu’s theoretical concepts. However, some researchers have supported Bourdieu’s theory due to their congruent results, while others challenged his arguments, as they received deviating results. As outlined below, Nugent (2008) has summarized some of the prominent research studies that support these both types of paradigms.

Research Studies that Supported Bourdieu’s Theory

- Bourdieu’s own study in France found correlations between cultural capital and educational attainment (Bourdieu, 1977b).
- Correlation between cultural capital and both high school grades and school attainment in the United States (DiMaggio, 1982; DiMaggio & Mohr, 1985).
- Similar results for Sweden (Roe, 1983); Czechoslovakia and Hungary (Boguszak, Mateju, & Peschar, 1990 quoted in Aschaffenburg & Maas, 1997), and Brazil (Amaral, 1991, quoted in Aschaffenburg & Maas, 1997).
- Significant impact of parental cultural capital on educational attainment in Netherlands (De Graaf, 1986).
- Significant correlation between parental cultural capital and school achievement only at the highest level of secondary schooling in West Germany (De Graaf, 1988).
- Cultural capital explained part of the effect of parental SES on school achievement in Czechoslovakia (13%), Hungary (20%), and the Netherlands (21%). (Mateju, 1990, reported in Kalmijn & Kraaykamp, 1990).
- Similar results for Hungary (Ganzeboom, De Graaf, and Robert, 1990) and for the United States (Teachman, 1987).
- More exposure to cultural capital is consistent with higher levels of schooling for both black and white Americans (Kalmijn & Kraaykamp, 1990).
- Cultural capital plays a strong role in determining school success (Aschaffenburg, & Maas, 1997).
- Reading of status materials is associated with academic success while beaux-art participation is not (De Graaf, De Graaf, & Kraaykamp, 2000).
• Cultural capital is transmitted in the home and has a significant effect on educational attainment (Sullivan, 1999).
• The family is significantly more influential than the school with respect to the child’s participation in the arts (Nagel & Ganzeboom, 2002).
• Success at secondary school is related to the students’ aspirations, self concept, skills of self analysis (Nash, 2002).

In addition to the abovementioned list compiled by Nugent (2008), I will like to add the following more research studies, which also supported Bourdieu’s theory.

• Aschaffenburg & Maas (1997) concluded that the effects of parental cultural capital and children’s cultural participation before age 12 have enduring effects across educational careers.
• Lamb (1989) concludes that not only is cultural consumption a significant source of differentiation between student’s plans to enter higher education, but it also mediates the relationship between social background and aspirations.
• DiMaggio & Mohr (1985) found that in the United States high-culture participation directly effects educational and marital expectations for men and women.
• Green and Vryonides (2005) concluded that the unequal social capital that becomes available between social class positions also acts as selection mechanisms that clearly favour certain groups and results in social class-consolidation effects in the macro field of Cyprus.
• Also in the context of Cyprus, Vryonides (2003) concludes that the upper classes are in an advantageous position as they possess the cultural capital, such as knowledge required for successfully engaging with various educational processes and assessing various options and opportunities for progressing to higher education.
• Darmanin (2003) concluded that the Maltese education system reproduces the global and national classist educational discourses in which low socioeconomic status students are contained by care, while middle-class students are offered quality education in a competitive market.
Research Studies that Contradict Bourdieu’s Theory

- Insignificant correlation between cultural capital and class reproduction in France (Robinson & Garnier, 1985).
- Weak correlation between family background, cultural capital, and academic achievement and strong support for importance of communicative competence (DiMaggio & Mohr, 1985).
- In Greece, family SES is transformed into educational achievement through the differential ability and effort of the students from different socioeconomic backgrounds (Katsillis & Rubinson, 1990).
- Very weak support for a correlation between cultural capital and academic achievement in Australia (Lamb, 1989).
- Teachers favour students who have high test scores and stay out of trouble, but do not favour students with the high status cultural capital (Broderick & Hubbard, 2000, as cited in Kingston, 2001).
- Cultural capital has little to do with academic performance (Roscigno & Ainsworth-Darnell, 1999).
- A substantial social class effect regarding educational attainment is not explained by cultural participation (Sullivan, 2002)

In addition to the abovementioned list compiled by Nugent (2008), I will like to add the following more research studies that do not support Bourdieu’s theory.

- Dumais (2006) concluded that cultural capital did not have an effect on students’ academic achievements.
- Crook (1997) concluded that beaux-art participation is not correlated with students’ academic success.
- In the context of Netherlands, De Graaf (1986) concluded that the strong associations between formal culture climate and family educational attainment, which Bourdieu so often uses to confirm his reproduction theory, are completely spurious. The social background variable predicts both the lifestyle and the educational attainment of the family. This has very serious negative implications for Bourdieu's theory (De Graaf,
De Graaf further elaborated that high-SES children whose families consumed a lot of formal culture did not perform better at school than high-SES children whose families did not consume much formal culture. Similarly, consumption of formal culture conferred no advantage on low-SES children (p. 245).

- De Graaf, De Graaf, & Kraaykamp (2000) argued that, in contrast to the core implication of Bourdieu’s reproduction theory, cultural capital of privileged parents do not contribute significantly to their children’s academic success.
- Through an analysis of a large survey of employed men and women in France, Robinson & Garnier (1985) concluded that Bourdieu’s theory of cultural reproduction has overstated the role of education in reproducing class advantage across generations. Among men, the reproduction of control over labour power (i.e. managerial/ supervisory positions) primarily happens directly, rather than indirectly through education. At the same time education plays no role in reproducing ownership of business (i.e. capitalist and petty bourgeois position) and there is little tendency for capitalist or petty bourgeois fathers to convert their economic capital into cultural capital (i.e. educational credentials) for their sons such that the sons can secure managerial positions.

The abovementioned research studies raise some fundamental questions, particularly related to the different results gathered by different researchers. Was the theory applied in the correct way as proposed by Bourdieu? Were the theoretical concepts understood properly in reference to the context of research studies? Nugent (2008) argues that the main reason for deviating results in research studies is either that the researchers did not completely understand Bourdieu’s theoretical concepts or improperly operationalized them. For instance, the study of Katsillis & Rubinson (1990) found that participation in activities related to high culture did not affect educational achievement. However, their results did indicate that “the major mechanisms through which family SES status is transformed into educational achievement are ability and effort” (Katsillis & Rubinson, 1990, p. 277). Likewise, Broderick and Hubbard (2000) found that American teachers favoured students who worked hard, achieved high test scores, and stayed out of trouble, but did not favour students with the high status cultural capital. A more insightful understanding of Bourdieu’s theory would lead one to realize that students’ effort and hard work are indeed the variables and that they do reflect Bourdieu’s theory, as they both represent the
cultural capital required to know how to work hard in the school environment. Furthermore, the studies that have focused on “high culture” and received negative results are due to the reason that cultural capital was operationalized in a manner that was not appropriate to the “context” and did not reflect Bourdieu’s intent. Bourdieu himself emphasized that cultural capital is a flexible concept. Moreover, culture is never static. It is always dynamic and changes or modifies with time. Therefore, it would not be wise to define “highbrow culture” as attendance at opera or symphony. It may be highly valued in 19th Century France but, in recent times, only a few people of even the highest class would participate in such events. For this reason, Dumais (2006), who had found negative results regarding the effect of cultural capital on students’ academic achievements, later on acknowledged the limitations of her data, in particular the variables that she used to represent cultural capital. Therefore, it is extremely important to ensure that the indicators used to define or operationalize the key concepts of the theory must be appropriate in the context of the study. Furthermore, it is generally argued that Bourdieu’s key theoretical concepts of field, habitus, and capital are the part of an interrelated system and should be applied inseparably in order to receive accurate and in-depth understandings of the issues at hand. For instance, Dumais (2002) has warned that it is essential to include habitus with cultural capital in research, or else we have “an incomplete picture of how Bourdieu’s model functions” (p. 49). Calhoun (2003) gave the same advice when he stated that Bourdieu’s key concepts derive their greatest theoretical significance only in their interrelationships. Robbins (2000) also argued that research results will be unsatisfactory if any of Bourdieu’s concepts are used in isolation. Therefore, it appears that the reason that most of the above-mentioned research studies received negative results was because they were unidimensional. For instance, Sullivan’s (2001) work, which found that cultural capital is an incomplete explanation for educational inequities, did not consider habitus at all.

A Multidimensional Research Paradigm as the Starting Point for this Thesis

In light of the abovementioned discussion, throughout this thesis I have retained the multidimensional utilization of the theory as it was intended by Bourdieu. Moreover, I have applied this theory at a secondary school level, with an understanding that this theory has efficacy at all educational levels. For instance, Dumais (2006) employed Bourdieu’s theory to investigate the impact of cultural capital and parental habitus on the teacher’s evaluation of the
academic skills of young children, who study at kindergarten and grade one levels; Reay (1998) utilized this theory at elementary school level in order to study home-school relationship as a key element to cultural reproduction. Aschaffenburg & Maas (1997) also studied the role of cultural capital and school performance among students younger than 12 years old. Also, Lamb (1989); Nash (2002); DiMaggio (1982); DiMaggio & Mohr (1985); De Graaf (1988); David, West, & Ribbens (1994); and Sullivan (1999) applied this theory at secondary and higher-secondary levels. Nugent (2008) and David James (1998) utilized this theory at the level of higher education. Most of the aforementioned researchers acknowledged the efficacy of this theory.

Furthermore, Bourdieu extensively discussed both secondary and higher educational institutions in his theory and saw them as the “mechanism through which the values and relations that make up the social space are passed on from one generation to the next” (Webb et al., 2002, p. 105). For Bourdieu, the higher education system resemble the school system in its work to “consecrate” social distinctions; he believed that both cultivate certain ways of acting that have the effect of reproducing social inequality (Webb et al., 2002, 128). For example, schools consecrate certain ways of acting, such as the ability to write elegantly, the capacity to exhibit an effortless superiority in one’s dealing with others, and so on, and, instead of correcting such ways of acting, the institutions of higher education further reinforce them. Another similarity that Bourdieu sees between secondary schools and the institutions for higher education is their distinction between elite and non-elite centers. According to Bourdieu, this distinction continues to reinforce the privileged classes. However, one important difference that Bourdieu perceived was that, while schools are primary concerned with the transmission of knowledge, institutions of higher education are much concerned with the production of knowledge, which is why in most universities, particularly in elite ones, teaching is accorded much less importance than research and publications. For Bourdieu, “if schools through the transmission of knowledge act as agents of reproduction, universities produce the form of knowledge that help make the objective relations into which people are reproduced” (Webb et al., 2002, p. 128).

Moreover, as discussed above, some authors have criticised an overly narrow interpretation of cultural capital as simply consisting of “beaux arts” participation and have suggested that cultural capital should be seen as including certain forms of skill and knowledge that are
rewarded in the education system. Therefore, to make it compatible with my research context, in this thesis I have adopted a broader interpretation of cultural capital and focussed on indicators that have been employed by various researchers as representative of Bourdieu’s theory, such as parent’s level of formal/informal education; parents’ knowledge of the education system and ability to choose the most appropriate school to educate their children; parents’ practical involvement in their children’s schooling; students’ study habits, etc. I have also investigated the nature of student’s “high culture” activities, such as type and amount of books read; library used; newspapers read; type of television programs watched; and participation in “public” or “formal culture,” such as lectures, symposiums, museum, art gallery, etc. I anticipate that these indicators will not only provide an in-depth understanding of the nature of cultural capital that agents from different social origins possess, but will also provide an understanding regarding the variance in their tastes and lifestyles.
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This chapter describes and explains the research paradigm used within this study. It starts by elaborating the major intellectual apprehensions that I faced while planning this research and explains the rationale for picking the mixed methods paradigm and assembling a combination of case study and ethnographic approaches. Next, it provides the detailed account of the main data collection tools used with reference to their context, purpose, situation, and the ways in which they were used. It follows the process and techniques I used for data analysis to integrate major themes, perspectives, and the knowledge generated from the data into a meaningful and insightful thesis. Finally, it elaborates the challenges and issues related to the research process, ethical considerations of the research process, and limitations of this study.

The Research Paradigm

At the earlier stages of planning the research design, I had three main intellectual apprehensions. The first apprehension was related to how I might go about acquiring the material to be used as “data” in this study. The second was related to how I might understand the nature of that material and the knowledge developed from it. The third apprehension was related to how I might move from acquiring this material to making sense of it, and developing an academic thesis that aligns with the intellectual traditions of structuralism and poststructuralism. These intellectual challenges led me first to opt for the mixed research methods: a combination of both qualitative and quantitative research paradigms. Secondly, as a result of these challenges, I considered the possibilities of assembling a combination of case study and ethnographic approaches.

The rationale for picking a mixed methods paradigm is related to the general perception that studies that combine quantitative and qualitative data offer a greater opportunity to understand the issues at hand (Dumais, 2006). In this way, qualitative research is argued as being more suitable for obtaining in-depth data from participants (Eisner, 1991; Eisner & Peshkin, 1990; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Schwandt, 1996). This is further heightened by partaking in the participants’ lives, working with them, and giving voice to their multiple viewpoints, which allows for increased understanding of the dynamic, ever-changing, and complex social realities (Clendenin & Connelly, 2000; Eisner, 1991). Furthermore, qualitative research stresses that any
phenomenon has meaning only within a context, which illuminates its history, development, main relationships, underlying assumptions, and current trends (Cheek, 2005; Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Merriam, 1998). In this way, quantitative research provides an opportunity to gather broad-based data (Creswell, 2002; Mann, 1968, p. 103; Smith, 1997). Also, quantitative research adds to the deductive reasoning when measurable tools are used to collect relevant data and the results are analysed with precise measurements (Travers, 1969). Therefore, in this research I have sought to employ these advantages from both research paradigms, as I perceive that, when combined, they will contribute to the reliability and validity of my analysis.

Moreover, it is generally argued that quantitative research has been thoroughly embraced in Pakistan and the research landscape is dominated by people counting numbers, in one form or another. Not only is number-counting a way of life, the recording of these activities is both rigorous and de rigueur. For instance, Smith (1997) explains that educational research in Pakistan reflects a strong commitment to quantitative methods and even educational policies are usually shaped by research that is not little more than folklore dressed up with statistics (p. 248). Likewise, Farooq (1989) argues that to understand the educational issues in Pakistan, most research conducts large scale surveys by following the patterns of the approved scientific model, precise measurements, and appropriate tests. Crossley and Valliamy (1997) acknowledge that in Pakistan’s educational research, there is clearly a high degree of faith in the use of mathematics as an appropriate language to sum up and interpret social events (p. 248). Therefore, as a researcher, I perceive it useful to break an obvious routine and include the “interpretivist” paradigm, as it has an added advantage of being a civic, participatory, and collaborative project (Creswell, 2002). Social issues are usually complex in nature and are intricately interwoven in society. As a result, these issues can be understood most correctly when working collaboratively with living participants. Another reason to choose mixed methods was a general perception that the theoretical concept of habitus cannot be measured empirically. For instance, Reay (1998) explains that in his book entitled “Distinction,” Bourdieu draws on both quantitative and qualitative data, because habitus cannot be directly observed in empirical research and has to be apprehended interpretively. However, my research has involved a greater number of qualitative elements and a range of approaches that will be discussed in the following pages. Nonetheless, the quantitative component is limited to the students’ survey, which investigates their capital and
class-habitus. In addition, the qualitative component of this research has required a large amount of my time and effort and contributed towards the richness of the data and the diversity in the perspectives articulated.

In this research, I also considered the possibilities of assembling a combination of “case study” and “ethnographic” approaches. I received this insight from many prominent authors who tend to use the term case study in conjunction with ethnography (Creswell, 2002: 484; LeCompte & Schensul, 1999; Stenhouse, 1979; Stake, 2005). However, this is not a straightforward alignment; researchers generally articulate contrasting paradigmatic viewpoints in this regard. For instance, Guba and Lincoln (2005) view the case study approach from a “post-positivism” paradigm and suggest the exclusion of the researcher’s influence as it taints the data. These authors view ethnography from a “constructivism” and participatory paradigm, which is, as a result, more inclusive of the researcher as formative in the research process. Likewise, Stake (2005) considers that the case study is a part of scientific methodology and insists upon the conventional approach to rigour when conducting a case study, for instance, triangulation of data to address the issues of reliability, validity, and objectivity (p. 462). In contrast, Willis (2007) views ‘case study’ from post-positivist paradigm and argues that case studies are more similar than dissimilar to ethnography. Used within an interpretivist framework, researchers do not seek to find universals in their case studies. Instead, they look for a full, rich understanding of the context they are studying (Willis, 2007, p. 240). He further suggests that case studies are about real people and real situations, rely on inductive reasoning, and illuminate the readers’ understanding of the phenomenon under study (Willis, 2007, p. 239). He outlines the following three specific features of case study research:

- It allows to gather rich, in-depth data in an authentic setting;
- It is holistic and thus supports the idea that much of what we can know about human behaviour is best understood as living experience in the social context;
- Unlike experimental research, it can be done without preset hypothesis and objectives (Willis, 2007, p. 240).

Creswell (2002) also argues that a case study is an in-depth exploration of a bounded system (such as an activity, event, process, or individual) based on extensive data collection. “Bounded” means that a case is separated out for research in terms of time, place, or some physical
boundaries (Creswell, 2002, p. 485). Whereas, Willis (2007) argues that a case study as an examination of a specific phenomenon such as a person or a group of individual (e.g. a teacher or several teachers), an institution (e.g. a school), a program, an event, or a process (e.g. a school curriculum or pedagogical process) that form the sequence of activities. Hence, to understand these different aspects I have treated each school as a separate case in this research and identified it as an object of study (Stake, 1995) as well as a procedure of inquiry (Merriam, 1998).

Moreover, Stake (2005) differentiates between three types of case study: the intrinsic, the instrumental, and the multiple or collective (p. 445). My research can best be described as an “instrumental case study” because the intention is not to focus on the individuals involved, but on the insights into the issues they provide.

Ethnography is an umbrella term for fieldwork, interviewing, and other means of gathering data in authentic (e.g. real world) environments; this form of research puts the researcher in the setting that he or she wants to study. The research is conducted in the natural environment rather than in an artificially contrived setting (Willis, 2007, p. 237). Besides, the key strength of ethnography as a method lies in the way in which, through close attention to the everyday and familiar through which the social world is both created and sustained, it has enabled the amplification of the voices of those who would otherwise be silenced (James, 2001, p. 255). The inquirers’ posture as an ethnographer researcher allows him for a number of emphases, for instance. The researcher might operate as a “transformative intellectual” who can be an advocate or activist. Or, the researcher might be more of a “passionate participant” who facilitates either the “primary voice” (the self-reflexive) or the “secondary voice,” which is illuminated through narrative and and other forms (Guba & Lincoln, 2005, p. 196). My stance in this research is a combination of both attributes. Moreover, one of the major ethnographic components of my research involves understanding the school culture, which include everything having to do with human behaviour and belief (LeCompte, Preissle, & Tesch, 1993, p. 5) as well as rituals, economic and political structures, life stages, interactions, and communication styles (Creswell, 2002, p. 481). Therefore, acting in a participant observers’ role, I broke down my fieldwork into three parts, each of which were 6 months in length; to spend time at each of the three streams of education. To match my research activities with the school schedule I would generally visit the elite and public schools from 9 A.M. to 4 P.M. in the winter and from 7:30 A.M. to 2:30 P.M. in
the summer. I would visit madaris in the morning, between 9 A.M. and 11 A.M., and in the afternoon from 2 P.M. to 5 P.M. I also adjusted my research program to accommodate the month of *Ramadan* (fasting), when madaris usually remained closed, yet the two other types of schools continued to work, although public schools reduced their daily schedules. Most of the time, I also stayed in afterhours in the schools to conduct interviews of the available participants.

**The Data Collection Tools**

An inherent strength of using mixed methods is that it allows for the use of a variety of data collection tools suitable to the research situation at hand. Thus, to best ensure this wide range of options and as I was seeking to triangulate in order to enhance “reliability and internal validity” (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 177) of the study, I used the following multiple data collection tools: semi-structured open-ended interviews with principals, five senior teachers, five parents and ten students from each school; school/classroom observations; post-observation reflections after each class.; document analysis; field notes; and quantitative surveys with students from each school under study. One of my main challenges in this research was the selection of schools that suitably fit the predetermined criteria, which I elaborated in Chapter One. However, the schools that I utilized as research sites for this enquiry should not be understood as typically representative cases of each stream of education. These streams are diverse and, as a result, may contain several schools that do not match exactly with my research sites. Therefore, I treat my sample schools as leading examples of their respective streams of education. After determining the research sites, I obtained permission (see Appendix B) through a written application (see Appendix A) from the relevant authorities to visit the school, meet people (e.g. principals/head teachers; teachers; and, on certain occasions, parents), collect initial information, and subsequently conduct research in the schools. I set the criteria such that I picked the teachers who had at least five years of teaching experience at the high school level; were recognised by the school administration as knowledgeable, inquisitive, and competent; had shown good results in the standardized exams; and were willing to express their ideas, strengths, and limitations. I used two strategies to recruit the most suitable teachers. First, I picked those from the list of candidates who matched the above criteria and voluntarily wanted to participate in this study. Second, I also purposefully recruited some participants who I perceived as skilful and capable of providing insightful data (Jackson, 1968; Merriam, 1988; Miles & Huberman,
I randomly selected parents and students from a list that was provided to me by each school’s administration. After having identified my participants and their willingness to work with me, I informed them about the purpose of my study, the research ethics, and details of the research activities including demands my study could place on their time and energy. I formally invited the teachers to participate in the study (see Appendix C) and obtained their consent on a written form that I provided (see Appendix D). Likewise, I provided formal recruitment letter to parents (see Appendix E), and obtained their consent on a written form (see Appendix F). After receiving final approval from participants, I requested that each participant fill in a “Performa for Participants’ Profiles” (see Appendix G), specifically designed to obtain their basic demographic information and an understanding of their socioeconomic status, living conditions, lifestyles, etc. Later, during the open-ended interviews, I used this information to further probe these areas to better understand the nature of their capital and class-habitus (see Appendix H for interview guide). In the following sections, I discuss the main data collection tools with reference to their context, purpose, situation, and the ways they were used in this research.

**Semi-Structured, Open-Ended Interviews**

My study is exploratory in nature and aims to elicit the participants’ responses regarding their capital (economic, cultural, social, etc.), class-based dispositions, cultural orientations and preferred lifestyles, social and educational knowledge, beliefs, expectations, disappointments, and the nature of their involvement in the school. It is generally argued that semi-structured, open-ended interviews are useful when collecting information on a large scale or when the research is exploratory (Hancock, 1998). Therefore, I conducted on average three 60-minute in-depth face-to-face semi-structured interviews with each participant. Each interview consisted of two parts. The first part was meant to further probe each participant’s demographic information. The second part dealt more specifically with capital, class-habitus, the nature of participants’ involvement in the school, and other issues relating to education. In the third interview, I specifically attempted to go back to the areas already discussed in order to attain further information on issues that I perceived to have remained relatively less explored. At the end of each interview, I summarized the main arguments and discussion points. I also asked each participant if there was anything that he or she would like to add to what we had discussed. This strategy helped me to obtain some additional useful information. Most of the formal/informal
conversations with participants involved in elite schools were in English, but at the other two types of schools I had to interview my participants in Urdu, the content of which I subsequently translated into English. I recorded most of the interviews on audiocassettes, which allowed me to capture the details of our conversations in full. Taping provided me with the advantage of being able to concentrate on listening, responding to the interviewee, and engaging him or her by using appropriate cues, probes, and prompts. I assigned a special code (pseudonym and date) to each recorded interview. I listened to each interview recording daily in order to note important points or gaps that could be filled in during our next meeting. Only two participants declined permission to record their conversation. Therefore, for those interviews I had to rely on note taking. During my extensive fieldwork, sometimes I had to conduct three or four interviews in one day to accommodate as many participants as were easily available. I had 126 participants, which is a fairly large sample for the qualitative research. However, this provided me with the advantage of gathering a diversity of perspectives that, afterwards, contributed towards an in-depth analysis.

**School/Classroom Observation and Post-Observation Reflective Discussion**

Observation is one of the most useful techniques for gathering data (Mason, 2004; Masemann, 1990). Hancock (1998) affirms that observation is a well-established method for exploring the social world and recommends its use in situations where detailed descriptions of a setting, activities, and people’s meanings and values are being explored. My observations within each 'case study' had both specific and general focuses. In order to understand the kind of field of education that each school constituted, I specifically focused on the school knowledge, provision of physical and academic facilities, function patterns, and culture of the school. This also included focusing on the written and unwritten rules for the daily social transactions, nature of the relationships, students’ level of obedience and resistance patterns, teacher’s time management, appearance of faculty and students, quality and styles of their clothing, cleanliness, mannerism, language and its level of refinement. The appearance and dress codes of teachers/students provided me with an idea of their cultural orientations, tastes, lifestyles, and socioeconomic backgrounds.
In addition, I conducted approximately 120 hours of classroom observation in each stream of education. In general, I focused on teachers’ actions, including the organisation of their classrooms, presentation of new concepts, teaching methods used, involvement of students in teaching-learning transactions, how students answers were handled, the extent to which students were given the liberty to chose their own learning activities, how students’ learning was evaluated, how discipline was maintained, etc. I also tried to explore how the teachers’ actions matched their thoughts, beliefs, and the activities they had planned. I also tried to understand the nature of hidden curriculum in each class and the objectives that the teachers intended to achieve with it. To facilitate classroom observations, I used a readymade observation guide (see Appendix I). However, this was not a rigid tool, but rather helped me capture as much detail as possible. Observations were mostly taken freely in a narrative mode. I modified this guide whenever I needed to capture certain additional aspects. After each classroom observation, I interacted with the teacher for post-observation reflective discussions. During these discussions, I tried to understand their beliefs and views about their pedagogical actions, what strengths/limitations they perceived, and how they would do the activity differently next time. I recorded conversations on audiocassettes and transcribed them verbatim afterward. The data from this source, along with my field notes of the classroom observations, provided rich information to triangulate the teachers’ practices in relation to their beliefs that they expressed during their open-ended interviews.

Document Analysis

I also used document analysis as a source of data in this thesis. Some researchers find document analysis useful to establish background data (Burgess, 1982; Heyman, 1979; Mufan, 1998, p. 66) and to help “the researcher to uncover meaning, develop understanding, and discover insights relevant to the research problem” (Merriam, 1988, p. 118). I studied the following documents from each school, which I deemed useful for the analysis in this study:

- School policies, governmental/individual;
- Detail of curriculum and relevant textbooks;
- School funding and its sources;
- Fee structure/cost per student;
- Academic and professional qualifications of the staff;
• Pay scales of the academic and administrative staff;
• Typical/average income and occupational status of parents;
• Details about academic and non-academic physical facilities;
• Management structure;
• Statistics concerning student’s enrolment, retention rates, number of students who received financial help from school, students’ performance in standardized examinations, etc.

These documents contributed to the development of an in-depth understanding about the schools as different fields of education, the nature of school knowledge, SES of students, and other factors that contributed towards attaining relative autonomy of schools, which are some of the important aspects of this study.

Field Notes
During my extensive fieldwork, I made several formal/informal and structured/unstructured observations around the school and about participants, their homes, living conditions, family relationships, and the area/community of their dwellings, etc. I noted important and relevant details that I deemed might be helpful in the analysis in a methodological journal. Within each school, I documented the internal dynamics, such as interactions between principal and teachers, among teachers, and between teacher and students; management styles; time-management; staffroom discussions; student’s overall demeanour; tidiness; canteen/food facilities, etc. I also documented my informal conversations with the research participants, which took place at different times during the school visits. I made a note of the barriers or challenges that I came across during data collection on a day-to-day basis. The field notes helped me identify, record, and describe relevant data, challenges, limitations, and major/minor issues.

The Student Survey
To gather broad-based data, I also asked the students to complete a survey questionnaire in the schools under investigation. However, the main focus of this study was to investigate students’ class-habitus and the nature of their capital (economic, cultural, and social). To develop an appropriate questionnaire, I took insight from different studies that had attempted to investigate
these theoretical concepts. This helped me properly operationalize these concepts in my questionnaire (see Appendix J). To understand the nature of cultural capital, I focused on students’ study habits, their interests in reading classical/highbrow literature, how much time they spend on homework, and the educational resources they possess at home and how do they benefit from them. Regarding students’ social capital, I attempted to investigate their level of confidence in their family social networks. To understand economic capital, I examined different variables including parents’ income level, professional status, possession of property, and affordability level in meeting family liabilities and school expenses. Similarly, to understand students’ class-habitus, I included the two following variables in the questionnaire: their expectations for educational/occupational destinations and their level of satisfaction about the education they were receiving. I was able to triangulate the data received through the survey study with that of participants’ ethnographies. I perceive that triangulation, crosschecking, and verifying data obtained through multiple sources has ensured credibility and reliability of the evidence to support my conclusions (Eisner, 1991; Wolcott, 1988; Mufan, 1998, p. 66).

It was convenient for me to develop and conduct questionnaires for the elite schools in English, but for both public schools and madaris I had to translate the questionnaires into Urdu. However, before conducting the actual research I did a pilot study. Wherein, I distributed questionnaires to five students in each participant school (in total thirty questionnaires) and, based on student’s feedback, did some changes to the questionnaire. For instance, I simplified the Urdu translation in certain places to make it more intelligible. Moreover, in a question regarding cultural capital, I added “Encyclopaedia of Islam” as an option to accommodate public school and madaris students. In the pilot study, I noticed that only a few students from these schools were familiar with the Encyclopaedia Britannica. Likewise, in the question about high-brow literature, I added an open option for student’s to write the titles of books they had read within the past twelve months. I thought that this would provide an additional understanding of the kinds of classical literature the students liked to read.

In order to distribute the survey questionnaires, I used the “quasi random” sampling method (Mann, 1968, p. 103; Travers, 1969). Hence, I picked a predetermined students' number from the available list. For instance, as public schools had relatively more student enrolment, I selected
every fifth student to participate in this study. Likewise, based on their enrolments, I selected every third student in madaris and every second student in elite schools. To ensure anonymity, I sent the questionnaires to the participant students through registered mail and requested that they return the completed questionnaires through self-addressed, postage-paid envelopes. The management of each school assisted me in this regard. I distributed 65 questionnaires in each stream of education. However, some of the questionnaires were either not returned, returned incomplete, or improperly filled in. Therefore, in this thesis, I have included 47 questionnaires from elite schools, 54 from public schools, and 50 from madaris.

Methods and Procedures for Data Analysis
My second concern related to this study was regarding how I could understand the nature of the material and knowledge developed from the data. In fact, the process of data management (e.g. collection, storage, and retrieval) and the data analysis, which involved several steps and levels (Cheek, 2005), started from initial stages of the fieldwork and continued throughout the thesis development process. Following is a brief description of this process:

Data Analysis during Fieldwork
I started reviewing and analysing the data at the initial stages of my fieldwork as I anticipated having a relatively large amount of it. As a routine, I reviewed school/classroom observations and other relevant field notes daily and added my reflections that I deemed might be useful in the analysis. Every day, I also listened to the tape recordings of the interviews, transcribed them, and attempted to identify relevant main themes that could become part of my analysis. After identifying the macro and micro themes, I started categorizing them according to each major theoretical concept under study, such as capital (economic, cultural, and social), class-habitus, the students’ classroom work and related activities, schooling experiences, etc. The macro and micro themes were primarily guided by my four research questions in this thesis. I created Word Files for the main theoretical concepts and started feeding the relevant data into these files. I also prepared memos and summaries in which I briefly described what a particular set of data was all about and whether I needed to further explore an idea or clarify a piece of information. I also followed up relevant and emerging issues with other participants. For example, if the issue was about the level of affordability, I sought the views of different parents, school personnel, and
students from the same SES group. I thought this sort of triangulation between perspectives at the initial stages would result in clarity and an in-depth understanding of the issues.

Altogether, I recorded and transcribed 256 audiocassettes of the interviews and wrote roughly 409 pages of school/classroom observations and 261 pages of field notes. In addition, I collected necessary documents, which I also reviewed during the fieldwork. The transcription of the data was rather challenging for me. The interviews and classroom observations contained numerous technical and scientific terms, because I observed classes of different subjects, such as chemistry, biology, English literature and grammar, Arabic grammar, fiqha, etc., and interacted with people who held different kinds of academic knowledge. However, my competency in English and Urdu, and a basic knowhow of Arabic and Persian languages helped me overcome the challenge of translating technical terms and understanding such diverse perspectives in a massive amount of data. In some cases, however, I had to refer either to a dictionary or seek help from an expert to translate a specific terminology without altering the core meaning.

**Data Analysis after Fieldwork**

My third intellectual concern was related to how I might move from acquiring data to making sense of it and developing an academic thesis that coincides with the intellectual traditions of structuralism and poststructuralism. This led me to properly plan my data analysis after I had completed the fieldwork. In this plan, I consulted and synthesised four major resources: my own research background and knowledge (Niyozov, 1995, 2001; Niyozov & Dean, 1997), my supervisor’s insightful guidance, the data, and existing literature on the research process. This literature included (a) materials on qualitative/quantitative data analysis, (b) literature/theories of social reproduction, (c) thesis of certain other students who have employed Bourdieu’s theory as their leading framework, and (d) research studies of renowned authors who have tested Bourdieu’s theory in different contexts. I continued reading the literature about doing and writing research throughout the whole process. I mainly employed a thematic analysis method to analyze the data (Merriam, 1998; Stake, 1995; Yin, 1994; Wolcott, 1994). This involved discovering main themes, looking for general orientations, trying to sort out what the data were all about, and understanding what one might have said and why (Hitchcock & Hughes, 1995; Wolcott, 1994). More specifically, I attempted to (a) examine the data’s internal patterns (e.g. meaning, purpose, commonalities/contradictions, accuracy, consistency, etc.); (b) organize and reorganize the data
according to main themes, concepts, and categories; (c) explore the relationships between these themes and concepts; and lastly (d) identify the relationship between data themes with those of the research framework, which is a combination of Bourdieu/Anyon theoretical perspectives. Next, I carried out a cross-case analysis in order to see more specifically the commonalities and differences that existed across the perspectives and practices of the participants associated with different types of schools. The cross-case analysis, which continued throughout the writing-up phase, provided diversity to the analysis (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

Write Up

My next intellectual concern was related to the integration of the macro and micro themes, perspectives, and the knowledge generated from the data into a meaningful and insightful thesis. Although the current literature provides insights into the processes of writing a research report, it does not specify any single way of doing so. Researchers have mostly emphasized aspects such as in-depth analysis, succinct reporting, audience interest, and description versus analysis (Merriam, 1985; Miles & Huberman, 1994; Van Maanen, 1995). Whereas Richardson (1990) has introduced the complexities that are involved in the writing our research:

In our work as researchers we weigh and sift experiences, make choices regarding what is significant, what is trivial, what to include, what to exclude. We do not simply chronicle ‘what happened next,’ but place the ‘next’ in a meaningful context. By doing so, we craft narratives; we write lives. (p.10)

Likewise, Liamputtong points to the impact of postmodernism and decentring of the researcher and comments that postmodern researchers express doubt in their work and are impatient with conventional ways of reporting qualitative research. She argues:

Postmodemism claims that writing is always partial, local, and situational and that our selves are always present no matter how hard we try to suppress them—but only partially present because in our writing we repress parts of ourselves as well. Working from that premise frees us to write material in a variety of ways—to tell and retell. There is no such thing as ‘getting it right’, only ‘getting it’ differently contoured and nuanced. (Liamputtong, 2007, p. 962)

Therefore, by being an insider, part of my understanding and experiences may be evident in the analysis. In addition, the process of writing and then re-writing was challenging; exhilarating; crucial; and, sometimes, arduous and painful for me. However, this analytical process was also a
rigorous learning opportunity, which applied, challenged, and enhanced my organisational, technical, critical, analytical, creative, physical, and emotional capacities (Richardson, 2000; Niyozov, 2001). I experienced the limitation and strengths of my intellectual capabilities, oral and writing skills, and capacities to give proper voice to the perspectives and recover and reconstruct meaning (Clendinin & Connelly, 1988, 1994; Niyozov, 2001). I re-wrote some chapters and the parts of others several times. Each time I did so, I did not simply edit, tighten, and decide what to include or exclude, but also re-planned, revisited, and ascended to a new level of conceptualisation (Niyozov, 2001). Each cycle of writing, therefore, carried both structural and conceptual improvements. Taking a reflective pause and developing plans for writing/rewriting each chapter were parts of this rigorous process. My thesis supervisor’s verbal/written guidelines, extensive editing, and insightful advice constituting a higher conceptual level of analysis helped me learn the proper ways to write a research report. In this regard, I am greatly indebted to Dr. David Livingstone (my thesis supervisor).

**Research Challenges/Issues**

In spite of the fact that I am professionally and personally familiar with a large number of bureaucrats, political stalwarts, and influential education-related executives, I initially faced problems selecting the appropriate schools and identifying and recruiting the most suitable participants. In particular, it was difficult to find the suitable madaris and convince their administrators and school personnel to participate in this study. I noticed that the national and international political developments after the tragic incident of September 11, 2001 have made madaris personnel careful and reluctant to let anyone onto their premises, especially people from advanced Western countries, such as Canada. However, I negotiated with the madrassah authorities and eventually convinced them that this study was purely academic and had no political motives, such as spying on them or causing any kind of harm to their institution. I used my social connections extensively in this regard. However, obtaining access to the two other types of schools was much less challenging for me, as most of their personnel were quite familiar with me and with my purpose of visiting them.

Subsequent to obtaining access to the madaris, I requested for permission from the personnel in authority to recruit female teachers and students to be involved in this study. Both madaris had
female sections, although they were strictly secluded. I thought the involvement of women would provide a greater diversity of perspectives in my analysis. However, only the authorities of one madrassah granted me such permission and only with certain restrictions, such as that I would only enter the premises after having received permission, the interviews would only be conducted in the presence of a female administrator; I would be escorted by female staff; females would observe full *purdah* (veil) during the meetings; and I would not do the classroom observations. However, after one week the authorities had to take away this partial permission (which held apparent restrictions), mainly because of a pressure from parents and objection from some of the male and female staff members. Therefore, in this study I did not conduct classroom observations of the female sections of the madaris, which can be considered a significant limitation.

As mentioned before, there was a total of 126 participants involved in the qualitative component of this study, which is a relatively large sample. During my fieldwork, I had to conduct three or four interviews per day to accommodate as all of the participants that were easily available. Therefore, it was very laborious to tape-record, transcribe, and listen to all of the interviews. I requested permission for the use of a transcription machine from the authorities of a local university. As mentioned before, the interviews with participants from public schools and madaris were generally conducted in Urdu. Translating them into English took time, labour, resilience, and patience.

Another challenge, which I encountered during the fieldwork, was how to handle the expectations of some of the participants as well as those of some of the non-participants. For instance, the madaris personnel expected a large monetary donation towards the school funds. They thought that people residing in Western countries are, for the most part, quite rich. Occasionally, they would subtly remind me of their expectations. However, one non-participant openly requested financial support to purchase his daughters’ dowry and another wanted a contribution towards his wife’s religious pilgrimage. Likewise, some of the participants from public schools expressed their interest to migrate to Canada. They were anxious to know how I could help them in this regard. On the other hand, the elite school participants mostly expected help in their desire to advance their academic careers, e.g. information regarding doctorate and
post-doctorate programs/admission procedures in Canadian universities, living facilities, academic atmosphere, resources, etc. On request of the school administrator, I conducted a one-day workshop at one of the elite schools, which a friend, who also has a PhD degree from the OISE, helped me organize.

**Ethical Considerations**

My study involved human participants; therefore, it was essential to make an ethical review application and have it approved from the Ethical Review Committee of the University of Toronto. Since the study involved minimal risk, it qualified for an expedited review. After having been granted permission, I proceeded to the data collection process with sampling in accordance with the principles underlined in the ethical review protocol. Through a written application, I obtained administrative consent from competent authorities of the schools and invited the participants to partake in this study. I provided the necessary information to each participant about my study, its purpose, style, potential risks of participation, and the demands the study would place on their time and energy. I also provided the contact information of my thesis supervisor and informed every participant of his or her right to withdraw from the study at any time without needing to provide a reason. I obtained the consent from every respondent on a written form that I provided. The participants were told that the information they provided would form the basis of primary data that might inform the future research. Participants were assured that their personal information would be kept strictly confidential and would be coded. Furthermore, they were informed that, in any future written and oral reports, they would be identified with a pseudonym. It was made clear that their discussions would be confidential and interviews would be conducted in an isolated location that would be the most convenient for them. Likewise, each participant was told that to ensure anonymity, the real name of the schools would never be disclosed in any written and/or oral reports. I also consciously remained respectful of each school’s internal culture and values, harmonizing my research activities with the school’s timetable and the participant’s work schedule. I also tried to make my presence less visible in the schools and classrooms in order to avoid any kind of inconvenience for anybody. I strictly avoided giving any information to anyone, especially school personnel and head teachers about my participants’ perspectives and practices. I also avoided providing any kind of information to head teachers that they could use to evaluate the teachers’ classroom
performance.

**Limitations of the Study**

This study has several apparent limitations, including:

- One of the ongoing issues in research related to Bourdieu is the choice of appropriate variables to represent his concepts. This is particularly true regarding the cultural capital. However, as discussed in Chapter Three, many authors have suggested that Bourdieu himself intended these variables to be flexibly conceptualized. Therefore, the indicators used in this research to map the cultural capital are not the “typical” indicators of Bourdieu’s variables that focus on this particular theoretical concept. These, in fact, are the reinterpretation of Bourdieu’s concepts. However, prominent scholars have previously been employed all of these variables in other research contexts.

- This research has been conducted in the urban context. In Pakistan, big cities usually have greater literacy rates as compared to the other areas. The independent and informal learning resources, such as public libraries, erudite lectures, media, computers, internet, etc., are also highly available in the cities. In addition, the agents of different social origin have greater opportunities to find knowledgeable people with whom they can exchange ideas and learn from their experiences. All of these resources are conducive to developing knowledge, general interest awareness, basic knowhow about the education system, etc., which are important markers of cultural capital. It is quite possible that the data from rural schools and from members of other populations would have generated different results about the working-class cultural capital.

- In this research I have picked two representative schools from the three main streams of education. This is a small sample. Therefore, I do not intend to generalize my case study findings because they may not apply precisely to all of the respective type of schools throughout urban Pakistan.

- Moreover, the newly emergent private non-elite English-medium stream of education was not included in this research, as "it is large, diverse, and so varied that it defies any kind of classification" (Rahman, 2004, p. 42). Therefore, at present it was not possible to find the representative schools of this stream to include in this comparative study.
In Pakistan, public schools and Islamic madaris are gender segregated, even in urban contexts. Therefore, my data collection efforts have been limited to the male population in these two types of schools. However, the elite schools are coeducational, which gave me an advantage of including the perspectives of female teachers and students in this study. But, including the female perspectives from the other two types of schools as well would have helped me to triangulate the analysis and receive further in-depth understanding.

In this study I could observe only the public school students’ resistance patterns against strict rules, one-sided policies, and whatever they perceived as unwarranted school practice. As I could not obtain sufficient data in this regard from other two types of schools, this should be considered a methodological limitation.

This thesis does not include an in-depth analysis of the social status/background of the school personnel in these three school systems, which should also be considered as a methodological limitation.

The sample Islamic schools picked for the study were exclusively Sunni madaris. I relied entirely on my participants, the textbooks, and other relevant reading materials that are used in madaris of other sects to understand the perspectives and ideologies of other sects of Islam.

To make it cost efficient, I have conducted the quantitative surveys in the same schools where I did the qualitative research.

Finally, I situate myself as a participant in this study, because one aspect of my research is qualitative, in which I have been intensively involved throughout the research process, from inception to presentation. This has certainly extended my own reflection on actions, biases, frame of mind, knowledge, and skills in my interactions with others (Hunt, 1987; Eisner, 1991). Besides, being an “insider” I am quite familiar with the participant’s languages, traditions, lifestyles, rituals, and habits, etc., which might have resulted in my own understanding and perspectives being identified in the analysis. Moreover, my love for justice and egalitarianism and my ambition to eradicate the evils of inequality and oppression can also be recognized as my bias in this study.
CHAPTER FIVE: A COMPARATIVE OVERVIEW OF THE SCHOOLS

This chapter presents a comparative overview of the schools under study. The discussion mainly intends to explain the structure and practices in each school, which will lead to recognizing how these schools constitute similar or dissimilar fields of education and to what extent they have the potential to provide different kinds of schooling experiences to their students. First, I have presented a detailed description of material and human resources to highlight their nature and standards in each school. This discussion will help determine how these essential resources are related to the social class of the school population. Next, I have attempted to examine the degree to which these schools have achieved “relative autonomy,” the conditions that are conducive to doing so, and how their relative autonomy has contributed to resisting government instituted reforms. In addition, my analysis regarding the relative autonomy of these schools attempts to situate the nature of their organizational patterns, interest in protecting the value of their respective scholastic capital, and their self-reproductive capacity due to making and implementing their own policies. Finally, a discussion about school culture and socialization patterns within each school attempts to explain the nature of written and unwritten rules about relationships, conduct, demeanour, ways to maintain discipline, etc. I also have considered how the school personnel of different schools inform their students about vital school processes and encourage them to participate in decision-making strategies. However, at certain places the analysis regarding structure and practices is intermingled, as it is difficult to draw a fine line of demarcation between structure and practices throughout the discussion. In the following section, I start my analysis with an introduction to the schools under study.

Islamic Madaris

The first madrassah selected for this study was established in 1906 in a rental building. In 1918, under the patronage of well-off Muslim families (both locally and abroad) and with the help of public charity, the madrassah Nazims (administrators) managed to build their own campus. However, in 1999, the madrassah Nazims had to abandon this original colonial-style building, as it was now insufficient to accommodate the expanding enrolment of the students. Hence, the madrassah was shifted into a newly constructed and more spacious building. This new campus was built in the suburbs of the city and covers an area of more than fifty acres. This building has
six different blocks. The main block is devoted to the academic needs of male students. It has classrooms, examination halls, and one computer lab. Next to it is a big block that served as a hostel for boys and a dining hall, called the mess, a reminder that the British had ruled the subcontinent. The cooking facilities are comprised of four kitchens, supervised by experienced cooks and containing the most up to date kitchen appliances. There was also a large mosque that had a versatile usage, such as a site for prayers, scholarly sermons, religious Manazras (debates), class-work, etc. The next block housed the academic facilities for female students. To ensure seclusion, this block had a separate entrance and was surrounded by an almost ten foot high boundary wall. One part of this block served as a hostel, which was supervised by the female staff. As a mandatory procedure, the girls had to receive prior permission from the Nazim or the hostel superintendent if they needed to go off of the premises. The next block included the offices for the Nazims and faculty and clerical staff, which contained cabinets to keep the school records safe. This block also housed a big library with bookshelves, reading desks, and carpets to accommodate readers. In the madaris tradition, the students and staff mostly sit on the carpeted floors when reading or doing other academic activities. The last block included residence facilities for Nazims, faculty members, and the other staff.

The second madrassah was founded in 1915, initially in a quadrangular three-storied building at center of a thickly populated area of the city. Soon this madrassah became recognized as one of the most authentic pivotal places for Islamic learning, mainly due to the hard work of the founder, who was a reputed Islamic scholar. A team of teachers with exceptional intellectual calibre assisted him. Over the years, the pressing demand from a large number of students from all corners of the country rendered the original building unable to accommodate this ever-growing population of new students. Therefore, a new building had to be built in 1955 over an area that covered more than forty acres. An addition to the building was added in 1963 and a second in 1976; a new mosque was built in 1983. Presently, this beautiful and capacious campus is comprised of two huge academic blocks, which contain classrooms, a computer lab, libraries, a big mosque, and an administrative block. It also has two spacious boarding houses and a hospital with facility of medical services for the staff, the students, and the population of the area around. The campus provides a number of residences for the Nazims, faculty, and other employees.
The Public Schools

The first public secondary school chosen for this study was initially established as a primary school by the British colonial government in 1882. It was subsequently upgraded to a middle school in 1904 and then to a high school in 1926. In 1963, under a new plan by USAID, this school was upgraded to a Pilot Secondary School. The original building of the school was built in 1924 and now needs repair in certain areas. Some parts are even declared dangerous and thus remained closed. The head teacher had sent numerous memos and reminders requesting the higher authorities to provide funds for necessary repairs and was still waiting for an appropriate action. However, certain new blocks that were added over the years, most of which were funded through foreign aid, were in a good condition. The total of the new and functional parts of the old buildings were insufficient to accommodate all of the classes. Consequently, some classes had to be conducted outdoors. In adverse conditions, the classes either shared rooms or took shelter in the verandas. The red-coloured school building spreads over an area of almost twenty acres. In Pakistan, the public schools are painted either red or yellow in order to distinguish them from other buildings. This school does not have residential facilities for the faculty, students, and other employees.

The second public secondary school chosen for this study was established as a comprehensive school during the 1960s. Its modern-style building is spread over an area of 6,54,704 square feet. Although, the school building was in comparatively good condition, it needed repair and renovation in certain areas. For instance, some classrooms needed to be repaired or repainted and certain electrical wires needed to be put back into working order. However, most classes in this school had their own rooms. The school had residential facilities for teachers, students, and other staff. But, the building for students’ hostel was taken over by the main district school management office, as all of the students were now day scholars. In sum, I tried to pick reputable public schools, but the poor condition of their buildings gave me an initial impression that the ruling elite was indifferent towards public education.

In the beginning, both public schools were built in the suburbs of the city, but due to the population explosion these schools are currently located in inner-city areas. Here, the main streets were narrow and mostly jam-packed with traffic. The residential areas were congested
and the houses were small and mostly built adjacent to one another with no space in between. The population was largely underprivileged lower middle class and working class.

**Elite English-Medium Schools**

The first elite English-medium school chosen for this study was established in 1978 and has a Western style, newly constructed, spacious campus, which spreads over an area of almost 150 acres. The main building is devoted to the academic needs of the students. It has four levels. The underground level accommodates junior, kindergarten, and Montessori classes, which is the most colourful section of the entire school. The ground and first floor provide room for elementary and middle classes, while the top two floors belong to O/A level students. All floors have offices for coordinators, teachers, and administrative staff; computer and science labs; libraries; and common rooms. In addition, a separate block is devoted to the main school administration including the offices of the principal, vice principals, deans, educational consultants, counsellors, and clerical staff.

The large and gorgeous campus of the second school picked for this study spreads over an area of 170 acres, and its main building has five different levels. The arrangement of the space is not much different from that of the other elite school in this study. All floors have well furnished and decorated classrooms, offices, faculty lounge, computer and science labs, large libraries, common rooms, and separate waiting rooms for O/A level students. In addition, both elite schools have separate assembly halls; amphitheatres; music rooms; swimming pools with bleachers for spectators; large playing fields with different sports courts; and extensive parking space for teachers, visitors, and students. Both elite schools are located in affluent areas. The streets in the neighbourhood are wide and lined with pine trees. The houses are large, mostly built in modern architecture and have full front porches and lawns in the front and back, many of which have beautiful flowers and fountains. Expensive cars can be seen parked either in porches or driveways. In short, affluence is written all over the area. The language and dress have a Western flavour. Males are mostly seen in Western dresses, while the females have mixed appearance. Some are dressed in Western style, while others prefer Eastern cultural dress, such as *Shalwar-Qameez*. 
At the time of this study, the political situation of the country was quite volatile. Incidences of terrorism, including suicidal bombing, were common. Therefore, as a precaution against such incidents, the elite schools had installed modern camera surveillance system and scanners and had hired trained security guards for access control and to do extensive patrolling. Therefore, on each visit, I would encounter this well-equipped security staff at the main gate of both elite schools and had to write down the purpose of my visit in the visitors’ book. I also had to reveal the details of my equipment before receiving the final approval to enter the main campus. This was a mandatory procedure that every visitor had to go through. Paradoxically, I did not see these kinds of precautionary measures in the other two types of schools. The madaris personnel mainly attributed this to the shortage of funds necessary to afford the expenses of costly equipment and to pay the staff salaries. However, each public school had the services of one security guard but, due to the shortage of office servants, they had to perform the duties of a peon (office servant) rather than to protect the school campus. Moreover, the government had not provided them the necessary training, skills and weapons to properly counter any kind of terrorist threat.

**A Comparative Overview of Material and Human Resources**

This section examines the nature of material and human resources that these three types of schools provide to their students. The discussion about material resources includes classroom amenities, science/computer lab and library facilities, and other necessary school services. I also have attempted to understand the students’ relative independence to be able to benefit from these available resources, their self-discipline, resistance patterns, and motivation to partake in school maintenance. However, these are only the preliminary explorations; these themes will continue to unfold throughout the chapters focusing on data. The discussion about human resources in each school attempts to understand the nature of the faculty, how the schools recruit new teachers, the qualities the teachers require, and to what extent their administration is independent to make decisions in regards to recruiting the most appropriate faculty. Because they implement all educational policies and reforms, teachers are considered to be the backbone of an education system and the most crucial factor. Hence, to understand their relative competency, I have also examined the nature of teachers’ professional development programs in these schools. I perceive
that an understanding about physical and academic resources in each school will lead to be able to situate their precise influence on students’ class-habitus in subsequent data chapters.

**The Material Resources**

Both madaris under study provide outstanding physical and academic resources to their students. This is contrary to the discussion in most of the literature. The school personnel believe that better academic atmosphere and physical amenities help promote social confidence in students. Accordingly, one Nazim explained, “Poor facilities within the school can damage self-esteem of the students, and they would start getting a sense of being inferior, which is not desirable” (personal interview, May 11, 2007). Thus, the classrooms in both madaris were decorated in a traditional style with carpeted flooring and small desks (about one foot high) on which to place books. Each classroom included a chalkboard and colourful placards on which selected verses from the Quran, sayings of the prophet (Peace be upon him), and moral messages were written. The classrooms had two to four fans on average and gas-heaters in order to provide comfort during adverse weather conditions. All of the appliances were in working condition. The schools had adequate water supply and a sufficient number of electric coolers with filtration plants to provide clean and cold drinking water. Moreover, one school had thirty, and the other had ten, washrooms in addition to the ablution places to clean the body before prayers. The buildings, washrooms, and places for ablution were tidy in both madaris. The students would voluntarily assist the cleaning staff in cleaning their alma mater, as they were repeatedly taught that an integral part of their faith is to keep their body, dress, and surroundings pure and clean. The students were also seen involved in serving food at lunch and dinner and cleaning utensils, dishes, and the mess floors afterwards. The students’ intentional partaking in the cleaning and serving activities underscores their self-discipline (which is a marker of cultural capital). Besides, most students considered their madrassah as a home, because it provided them with protection and fulfilled other basic needs for survival. In addition, their involvement in basic chores was also influenced by the dispositions of religious obligation and divine reward; therefore, I did not observe any incidence of discernible protest or resistance in this regard. However, it is quite possible that some other aspects of the schooling experience may arouse the students’ protests or resistance.
Both madaris had big libraries with over 100,000 books on versatile subjects. The students had a wide range of options to read from classical literature in Urdu, Arabic, Persian, or translations of selected ancient Greek and Western creative works. They could also benefit from reference books, such as Arabic, Urdu and Persian grammar, the Encyclopaedia of Islam, and dictionaries (i.e. Urdu, Arabic to Urdu, Persian to Urdu, etc.). Teachers’ reference books mostly contained educational philosophies and the creative intellectual works of great medieval Muslim thinkers. In both madaris, the qualified librarians, who were cordial and helpful, managed the libraries. Hence, most students articulated having easy access to the books and other reading materials. The school personnel explained that if students wanted to read books that were not available in the school library, they would arrange for them to be retrieved from other madaris or public libraries. However, they would constantly monitor the kind of literature that the students were reading. The students were strictly banned from reading “improper literature,” which the madaris personnel defined as film digests, love stories, novels, vulgar imagery, immoral fiction, and any kind of literature created and distributed by other religious communities or sects of Islam. They perceive that at secondary-school level the students still need to have “guided learning.” However, a few students did not appreciate this kind of overprotected treatment from their teachers.

Conversely, both public schools show an obvious scarcity in the provision of essential physical and academic resources for the students. For instance, only a few classrooms in both schools had sufficient furniture; although two to four electric fans were provided in the classrooms, on most occasions half of them were out of order; also, not a single classroom had a heating system and there was no adequate system for clean and filtered drinking water in both schools. To drink water, one school had the arrangement of an old-fashioned hand pump and a small tube well, while the other had a similar hand pump and one electric cooler to satisfy the thirst of the entire school community. In one public school the electrical wires were hanging loose at certain places without being properly covered with the protective material. Moreover, many of the washrooms in both schools, out of already insufficient number available, were clogged, non-functional, and thus remained closed. The functional washrooms were so dirty and stank to such an extent that most students did not like to use them and preferred to go outside in order to fulfil their needs. The head teachers of both schools regularly defended themselves with a common explanation of
not having sufficient funds to conduct the necessary repair and maintenance. Both schools had the services of only one janitor to clean the entire campus. Hence, they were not neat and tidy and students were forced to perform an additional duty of cleaning and dusting their classrooms. Every day, five different students from each class were picked in this makeshift procedure. However, most students did not like this top-down policy and would demonstrate a silent protest by throwing garbage and moving the dust from the classrooms into the corridors, where it stayed for a long time until noticed by an administrator who would ask the janitor to remove it. Most students explained that, although they own their alma-meter, the one sided decisions that are mostly meant to control their bodies agitate their anguish. Their narratives generally articulated a desire to be able to be fully involved in the decision-making process, which they apparently lacked.

Similarly, the academic facilities were also quite scarce. For instance, the classrooms had only blackboards and white chalk as teaching aids because both schools lacked overhead projectors. Photocopiers were not provided to serve the academic needs of staff and students. The science labs had some teaching aids, such as microscopes, thermometers, beakers, test tubes, chemicals, charts, maps, models, etc., but their quantity was greatly insufficient to accommodate all of the students. Consequently, to control the use of the materials, the students were asked to work in groups (usually comprised of five students). In these groups, only the academically prominent students would perform the science experiments, while the others just watched. Similarly, the computer lab in one school had eighteen computers, while the other had only fifteen. These computers, along with one instructor, were recently provided by the government to every public school through a new plan to introduce the Information Technology from the early classes. The school personnel considered this plan very useful, but, based on their enrolments, perceived the number of computers to be drastically insufficient. Therefore, only those students who had taken the optional Computer Sciences course in secondary school were provided access to the computers. The library facilities in both schools were also deficient and substandard. One school had 10,246 books, while the other only 1,263 books. The available volumes covered a limited variety of topics and most of them were very old and some even worn out. The daily Urdu language newspapers, which had been purchased for the library, were mostly seen in the staffroom and, thus, completely inaccessible for the students. The reference books, such as
dictionaries, were also worn out, and the teaching guides needed to be updated. Both schools did not have the services of a qualified librarian to supervise the library. A teacher had been assigned an additional duty to manage the library, without additional pay. Consequently, in both schools the students showed concern about the libraries remaining closed most of the time. The students also showed concern about facing restrictions from their teachers in regards to the choice of reading literature. For them overprotected treatment by elders makes them feel like a string-puppet.

Both elite schools provide outstanding and relatively more diverse physical and academic facilities than other two types of schools under study. In my perception, these elite schools can easily be compared to any other prominent educational institution in the world. The buildings are centrally air-conditioned and heated. The classrooms have sufficient and costly furniture for students in the form of chairs and tables and some of them are also carpeted. The students’ common rooms are well furnished, carpeted, and contain a television, cable, Internet, and telephone for local access. Each floor has a sufficient number of electrical coolers with filtration plants to provide clean drinking water to the students. Each floor also has an adequate number of students’ washrooms with all of the necessary and modern appliances. The campus, classrooms, corridors, and other facilities were neat and tidy, as in both schools around fifty janitors worked all day to clean them. Likewise, the grass in the lawns was properly mowed, and the hedges and bushes were trimmed and shaped. The students generally articulated the dispositions to own their school and explained that they would prefer to complete their forty mandatory voluntary hours to help with the maintenance of their school. In this regard, they could perform different activities based on their interests. Some liked to assist in cleaning the campus, trimming bushes, planting new trees or flower plants, etc. Others would assist at the school dispensary. A few students also explained that, with the help of their science or art teachers, they developed models, paintings, and sculptures, etc., to decorate different parts of their school. Most students said their teachers encourage them to share ideas, make plans and projects, and execute such ventures of their choice.

The schools also provide excellent academic facilities. Most classrooms have overhead and opaque projectors and a television with VCR. In addition, well-equipped practical classrooms are
available for art, science, design and technology, and music lessons. Likewise, modern and fully equipped kitchen labs were provided for the students, who take Food and Nutrition subjects at the O/A levels. The science labs have modern and sufficient equipment to accommodate each student individually. The computer labs in both schools are connected to the academic world through high-speed Internet. The students are given liberty to use the Internet without having any time limitations. One teacher explained, “Our state-of-the-art computer labs provide access to the advanced interactive technology throughout the school at all stages. We start to acquaint our students with computer technology and multimedia from the nursery classes” (personal interview, November 12, 2008). The computer labs also contain the latest educational software for various subjects, and students are encouraged to benefit from them. The software version of Encyclopaedia Britannica is also made available. Videoconferencing is provided for the teachers and students alike. The teachers consider it useful for networking with their colleagues locally and abroad. Each floor has a library with reading rooms and contains books that are appropriate to the level of classes on that floor. Both schools have more than a 100,000 books on various disciplines and titles. Reference books, such as Webster’s Dictionary, World Atlas, Encyclopaedia Britannica, etc., and the latest resource books for teacher are also available in the libraries. The libraries had a sufficient number of photocopy machines free to use for faculty members and for which the students had to pay nominal charges. English newspapers and national and international magazines on current affairs are accessible for the faculty and students alike. One shelf had a display of the prospectus, websites, and other material regarding information and admission procedures to prestigious educational institutions abroad. Similar information was also seen in corridors around senior classes. All of the libraries had computer and Internet facility for students and had access to other prominent libraries and electronic resources as well as research journals. Qualified librarians, who were cordial, accommodative, and helpful with the students, supervised the libraries. The students were entitled to borrow as many as fifty books at a time and keep them for one month without any fines. The students explained that, although their teachers sometimes recommend academic literature, they did not put restrictions on their choices. The teachers affirmed that “intellectual liberty” is the essence of their system, where students are encouraged to pursue the academic advancement of their choosing.
Human Resources

Both Islamic madaris under study have a sufficient number of qualified staff to teach the relatively small-sized classes. The student-teacher ratio in both schools is around twenty-five to one. The teachers emphasize that relatively small class sizes give them an advantage in being able to provide individual attention to the students; get to know their personalities, learning pace, issues and challenges; and deal with them accordingly. Table 5.1 presents the detail of academic and non-academic staff in both madaris. The school administrators explain that the minimum academic qualification to teach at higher classes is Shahadat-ul-Almia, but for the junior and Hafiz-e-Quran classes, teachers have an undergrad degree, such as Aliah (B.A), and a person with Hafiz certification can also be hired. In addition to the permanent faculty, both madaris have the services of visiting scholars, the number of which can be increased based on the need of the students. These scholars conduct erudite seminars on advanced topics, which can be academic, political, social, cultural, religious, etc. The Nazims (administrators) consider these seminars to be a useful supplement to the academic information, which the students receive in their usual day-to-day classwork.

Table 5.1: Detail of Academic/Non-Academic Staff in the Islamic Madaris

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Madrassah# 1</th>
<th>Madrassah# 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total enrolment</td>
<td>1436</td>
<td>1054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average class size in Grade 10</td>
<td>25 students</td>
<td>25 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazim-e-Ala / Department Nazims</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Teachers</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Teachers</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visiting Teachers/ Scholars</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hafiz-e-Quran</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support Staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical Staff</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Servants</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitor</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Main administration office of the schools under study

The madaris personnel claim that their Shahadat-ul-Almia degree is equivalent to Master's degree in Arabic and Islamic Studies from the public universities in Pakistan.
The Nazims affirm to have complete authority to increase or decrease the teaching vacancies and hire (or fire) teachers. However, the madaris have a strict protocol for hiring new teachers in which every candidate has to initially pass a scholarly written test. This test follows an extensive academic debate with a board of muftis, which is chaired by the Nazim. The candidates do not know the topic of this debate beforehand. The Nazims emphasize that new teachers must have profound knowledge of medieval Muslim thinker’s pedagogical traditions and the rich, sophisticated, and diverse scholarly discussions in the Islamic literature regarding educational theory and praxis. In addition, candidates’ proficiency in Arabic grammar is specifically taken into consideration, because every teacher has to teach it, no matter the level or grade in which he is working. Moreover, a large reservoir of knowledge (which is applicable in madaris) is in Arabic and a substantial familiarity with grammar is required to access that. Most importantly, the moral character, values, and personal conduct of every candidate are also taken into account before making the final decision. The school personnel explain that in madaris, the teachers are considered to be “ambassadors of Islam” and their conduct is expected to exemplify Islamic values and deportment in all they do. In fact, they are the “role models” for students to follow. One Nazim explains:

The most important attribute of teachers is how they act to be the role models for their students. This includes their conduct in the classroom, in the school, in the playground, in the mosque, and also in the community...Islam is a way of life, and they [teachers] must be able to live Islam completely. So their knowledge is as important as their practice of Islam and their ability to effectively deliver the message of Islam” (personal interview, November 7, 2007).

Therefore, to be a teacher in Islamic madaris, the cultural capital (educational credentials) of candidates is as important as their religious capital. Although the role of teachers is held in high regard and along with that comes high expectations, they also have to compromise on certain drawbacks. For instance, low wages are a major concern for teachers in Islamic madaris. As independent community-based schools, the madaris generally provide education for free to make access equitable, particularly for the poorest of the poor. As a result, teachers’ financial remunerations suffer. Moreover, all the recruited teachers are initially required to teach junior classes and are paid a lesser amount. However, experience, a demonstration of exalted performance, and high students’ results in the standardized exams help them receive approval from the administration to teach higher-level classes.
Despite certain concerns about low salaries, most teachers demonstrate a commitment to their profession. They believe that they are performing a religious duty by conveying knowledge and understanding of the Quran, Sharia, and other aspects of the religion to the next generations. Indeed, this is greatly rewarding in the eyes of God. They also acknowledge that to be a teacher, they follow the example of the Prophet Muhammad. For instance:

Prophet Muhammad declared himself a *mu‘alim* [teacher], whose prime duty was to educate humanity. We have adopted his *Sunnah* [example]; therefore, we must show a certain level of altruism. Disseminating the Islamic knowledge just for the monetary rewards is both a transgression and against the Islamic philosophy to be a mu‘alim. I always try to model myself in the line with Sunnah, and treat students the way Prophet did...you know...he used to treat them kindly, he used to respect them, and taught them with love and care. Besides, I try to perform my duties honestly with a perception that I would be held accountable on the Judgment-day. (personal interview, teacher, August 5, 2008)

Thus, teaching with a sense of religious obligation and performing responsibilities with a perception to be answerable before God underscore the teachers’ religious capital and self-discipline. This is an important attribute of cultural capital. The teachers tend to establish a spiritual bond with their students, which is a unique feature in the madaris culture. In this relationship, the teachers demonstrate a sense of willingness to make themselves available at any time of the day to guide their students, both academically and spiritually. Students, in turn, show a sense of respect and gratitude to the teachers and regard them as surrogate parents.

It would be erroneous to perceive that the administration of the madaris do not value the significance of pre-service and in-service teachers’ training courses. In fact, the madaris under study are fully aware of the classroom challenges and the competence required on the part of the teachers to handle them effectively. However, unlike public and elite schools, the madaris do not have an organized formal teachers’ professional development system. Instead, they rely heavily on the informal and experiential learning of the teachers. For instance, the madaris muftis tend to pass on their pedagogical experiences in a scholarly debate (*Manazra*) with existing and newly recruited teachers. The Nazims would also sit in the class to observe lessons, and then discuss the shortcomings and suggestions in one-to-one meetings with the teacher. In addition, the administration regularly invites distinguished religious scholars to conduct seminars on their
experiences with Islamic philosophy of education, curricular development, classical pedagogical
traditions, and classroom rules, etc. Thus, it appears that the mentoring in madaris is highly
recognized as an important way of teachers’ professional development.

The madaris personnel generally perceive that modern pedagogical techniques are incompatible
with their education because they were initially originated from Greco-Roman, Judo-Christian
foundations and subsequently developed in European-centered Western learning and scholarship.
Their faith in the classical Islamic treatises on education is normally grounded in the perception
that they were exclusively developed within the framework of Islam. One Nazim explained:

The schools which operate under modern and Western educational philosophies boast to
generate creativity among students from pre-school and Nursery classes, which obviously
we cannot do. We start education from learning the Quran, and cannot expect young and
raw minds to reflect upon high-level of conceptual discussions contained in this Holy
Book. Therefore, we start from memorization, and introduce understanding and reasoning
when students attain age and sufficient knowledge to accept that challenge. Besides, we
have greater faith in the intellectual heritage of classical Muslim thinkers, because they
provide us clear guidelines for child and adult education considering various stages of
development of human personality and character... (personal interview, October 10,
2007)

Such perceptions emphasize two significant arguments. First, the Islamic madaris must not be
reduced to a simple description of religious and faith-centered education through memorization.
Conversely, in madaris memorization is only the first step in the taxonomy of learning and leads
to the higher stages of understanding and reasoning. Thus, the goal of the approach taken by the
madaris of learning through memorization and the development of an understanding and
reasoning ultimately seeks to instil in students a greater knowledge of God, His rules, and the
duties and responsibilities of human beings in this transient life. Second, these perceptions
underscore a counter-hegemonic trend in thinking and praxis of madaris personnel, who largely
tend to challenge and resist the privileging of Western secular knowledge as an exclusive
standpoint for teaching and learning. Conversely, they gather insight from theories and
philosophies about pedagogy and didactics from a number of medieval Muslim thinkers and
reproduce the hegemony of their conceptual heritage to subsequent generations of teachers.
Consequently, the contemporary madaris in Pakistan still largely base their education on the
traditional Islamic framework of faith-centered epistemology and praxis. This will be further discussed in Chapter Seven.

Finally, my study underscores that although both madaris have gender-mixed faculties, open encounters between male and female teachers is strictly prohibited. The enforcement of purdah in madaris results in the exclusion of men from female domains as well as women from men domains. For madaris personnel, seclusion is imbued with multiple and complex religious, social, cultural, and political meanings. Mostly, they view it as an important marker of faith, modesty, and adherence to the Islamic code of conduct. In its symbolic and practical forms, some also view it as a means of maintaining the female body as a space of sacred privacy and also protecting it from male lust-gaze. Such perceptions identify seclusion as a symbol of a rejection of profane and immoral projection of female bodies, which is a predominant custom in the consumerist culture of the West and has also intricately intermingled in Pakistani society. In this sense, the madaris personnel also articulate anti-imperialist sentiment and perceive their alternative gendered norms as more adequate. In fact, gender seclusion is one of the most important aspects of the political agenda in which madaris personnel are actively engaged, along with their like-minded political allies, to promulgate it as a national policy in the county.

However, strict gender seclusion within madaris also has serious implications. It essentially rules out an open dialogue within faculty, prohibits diversity in opinions through the inclusion of female perspectives, and limits the scope of a collegial faculty effort to uplift the academic standards of the institution.

Conversely, the public schools reveal a perceptible dearth in the academic staff in teaching a reasonably large number of enrolled students. The student-teacher ratio in both public schools is around forty-to-one, which demonstrates that the teachers generally have to teach relatively large classes. Hence, most teachers perceive it to be a challenge to maintain discipline and effectively teach in these larger classes. This situation is even more challenging for them in Grades 9 and 10, where an average class size is more than seventy students. The following table provides a detail of academic and non-academic staff in both public schools under study.
Table 0.2: Detail of Academic/Non-Academic Staff in the Public Schools under Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pilot Secondary School</th>
<th>Comprehensive Secondary School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>Total enrolment</td>
<td>2033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average class size in Grade 10</td>
<td>90 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td>Head teacher</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deputy Head master</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Staff</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Total Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary School Teachers</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elementary School Teachers</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Physical Education teachers</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support Staff</td>
<td>Clerical Staff</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Office Servants</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Security Guard</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Janitor</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Main administration office of the schools under study.

In the public schools, to teach at the secondary grades one must possess the minimum required academic credentials of an undergrad with a B.Ed. professional degree. Likewise, to teach in Grades 6 through 8, a teacher must have, at minimum, a F.A/F.Sc. academic diploma and a professional certificate.

The head teachers explain that the provincial government sanctions vacancies of academic and non-academic staff and different recruitment boards fill in these vacancies by hiring teachers to teach at various levels of education. In this modus operandi, the head teachers are not consulted at any stage. The head teachers have persistently been requesting that the provincial government increase the number of teaching and non-teaching vacancies to facilitate an effective teaching-learning transaction within the classrooms and ensure the smooth operation of the school. However, their requests have never been entertained due to inadequate funds that are allocated every year in the national budgets for public education. These funds are hardly sufficient to meet the non-developmental expenditures, such as teachers’ salaries, maintenance, transportation, etc., and leave almost no space to plan and execute developmental tasks, such as increasing the
number of schools; teaching vacancies; and purchasing new furniture, books, and teaching aids, etc. One head teacher explained:

Our ruling elites do not support the notion of developing a capable human capital from the masses…how can they [ruling class] properly educate more than 180 million people by investing just less than 2% of GDP on public education? This is beyond my comprehension. In fact, they do not want common people to get quality education and critical cognitive skills to question the legitimacy of their rule…I believe that status quo suits their vested interests and political motives…(personal interview, February 11, 2008)

Thus, public school personnel believe that the underinvestment in the public education is because of an elite mindset to oppose widespread education, as educated people are more likely to demand for redistribution of income and power away from them. The ruling elite also sees little incentive to tax themselves to pay for schooling of the masses. In fact, they need a submissive labour class that generates capital for them without refusing to go along with their exploitative system.

In regards to teachers’ professional development courses, the school personnel explain that teachers are trained both in the educational concepts of medieval Muslim thinkers as well as modern/secular pedagogical techniques originating in the West. Hence, they are quite capable to use the diverse didactic techniques in their classrooms. However, most teachers expressed regret for not being able to properly employ these useful teaching skills in the actual classroom settings. They articulate the following barriers which they usually come across in this regard: large class sizes, unavailability of the teaching aids, unsupportive textbooks, time constraints to cover the syllabi, a greater emphasis on passing the exams, conventional student evaluation procedures in the standardized examinations, and a lack of courage to deviate from established pedagogical styles in a traditional classroom culture in the public schools. Moreover, the school personnel are highly critical of in-service professional development courses as being the least academically rewarding most of the time. Although such opportunities are regularly offered to every teacher, their effectiveness largely depends on the quality of the resource person conducting the course. The teachers argue that the resource personnel are paid attractively, which prompts many secondary school teachers, who are not adequately qualified, to access this position by virtue of their political connections. Consequently, such valuable opportunities become merely a
mechanical exercise, wherein the participants largely repeat already well-known curricular concepts. Conversely, if a resource person, who is obviously more qualified than secondary-school teachers, is hired on merit from college or the university faculty, in-service training courses become really effective. A teacher elaborated the difference a competent resource person can make to the effectiveness of in-service professional courses:

Kazmi Sb. [a college professor] conducted a refresher course\(^{13}\) last year...which was very useful...because he shed light on new curricular concepts, and also addressed teachers’ pedagogical issues, imparted insight on the effective use of audio-visual aids, advantages of the modern students’ evaluation techniques, and issues relating to the experiments in science subjects. His method was also effective as for the most part he attempted to initiate an intellectual debate, which gave us opportunities not only to learn from his knowledge and experiences but also from those of our peers. (personal interview, February 9, 2008)

Likewise, favouritism and political involvement have been negatively affecting another useful teachers’ in-service professional development program, which the government introduced very recently. In this plan, a resource person (or educator) visits every school and discusses with the teachers, on one-to-one bases, their problems and issues regarding the content and praxis and provides an appropriate counselling on the spot. The school personnel explain that, for the most part, educators either do not show up or provide unproductive counselling. They argue if government hired educators on merit and made them accountable for discrepancies, this program could become very rewarding. When I inquired, most teachers affirmed that they valued the faculty discussions, as they provide an opportunity to share expertise and experiences with one another. However, most of their discussions usually focused on finding ways to effectively handle their issues while maintaining the traditional classroom culture. Their discussions did not focus on transforming their pedagogy and introducing the latest teaching paradigms, the lack of which obviously, seems to be a limitation in the present-day public school academic culture. Besides, peer mentoring in the public schools seems to be unorganized and different from that of madaris, where it is relatively institutionalized as a process of teacher selection, induction, and socialization into the traditional ways of doing things. Likewise, the elite schools reveal

---

\(^{13}\) I observed that the public school teachers generally called in-service professional development courses as a "refresher course."
institutionalized mentoring, but mainly focused on sharing the expertise of the latest pedagogical paradigms. This will be further discussed in the following pages.

The elite schools under study have adequate numbers of well-trained and experienced faculty to teach reasonably small-sized classes. The student-teacher ratio in both schools is around eleven-to-one. The school personnel explain that, as a policy, they do not take more than twenty students in a class. During this study, I observed many instances that small class sizes provided opportunities for the teachers to provide individual attention and remedial support to their students. The students also affirmed that they value this arrangement, as they feel encouraged to excel academically in the environment where teachers have the advantage of being able to provide more individualized attention. The following table provides the details about the academic and non-academic staff in both elite schools under study. It is evident that elite schools have more official administrative positions (e.g., principals/vice-principals, deans, coordinators, etc.) because they believe that paid and specialized individuals are essential for an efficient functioning of their school. I noticed these full-time experts were always active in handling their staff and students’ daily issues because it was their primary responsibility for which they could be held accountable. This is contrary to that of other two types of schools where a few teachers were designated as “in-charge” without receiving extra pay. Most of the time, these teachers who were in-charge could not give enough time to handle other issues in the midst of their primary academic responsibilities.

Table 0.3: Detail of Academic/Non-Academic Staff in the Elite Schools under Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Elite-School#1</th>
<th>Elite-School#2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total enrolment</td>
<td>1058</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average class size</td>
<td>20 students</td>
<td>20 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice-principals</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordinators/Deans</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Teachers</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Teachers</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visiting Professors/</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholares</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spots Co-ordinators/ Physical Trainers/ Coach</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support Staff</td>
<td>Clerical Staff/ Assistants/Librarians</td>
<td>40+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Office Servants/ Security Guards</td>
<td>30+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitor</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Main administration office of the schools under study.

In both elite schools, the Board of Governors is the main body that hires teachers; the school’s principal usually acts as the chair of this board. In addition, the principal has main say in hiring new teachers or firing the services of existing teachers for misconduct, non-cooperation, incompetency, or any other significant reason. Both elite schools have a strict protocol in hiring teachers wherein every candidate has to pass through an severe screening process that includes an initial interview, a written test, a psychological test to judge the personality attributes, and a final interview with the Board of Governors. Only the candidates who are competent enough to deliver in accordance with the school administration and parent’s expectations receive the job contracts. One principal explained his concept of the most effective teacher as, “An average teacher tells, a good teacher illustrates, a superior teacher demonstrates, and a great teacher inspires. We always look for this great teacher, who does not just tell students what he expects from them, but arouses their own expectations” (personal interview, March 5, 2008). Hence, following are the main benchmarks that both schools adopt to hire the most suitable teachers:

- To teach at higher classes, the basic requirement is the masters’ degree in the subject to be taught. However, both schools prefer the candidates who have higher qualifications, such as, M.Phil. or PhD degrees.
- The minimum professional training is a B.Ed. degree; however, candidates having M.Ed. professional degree receive preference.
- To teach at the pre-school, junior and elementary classes, teachers must have a Master’s degree in Education (Elementary), Early Childhood Education, or diploma in Montessori.
- Candidates having better academic grades are preferred.
- At least 3-years teaching experience is required; however, more experience is sought-for.
- Candidates who are educated from Western reputed educational institutions are preferred.
- For local candidates, it is a must to have received education from English-medium stream of education throughout.

Moreover, analogous to the criteria in madaris, the elite school administrators also consider every candidate’s personality attributes. However, they prefer those candidates who have the capability to reproduce modern epistemology and praxis in their classrooms along with the Western value system to the next generations. This is evident in the following interview excerpt from a principal:

Educational credentials are undoubtedly very important...but we also consider every candidate’s personal and family attributes before awarding the final contract. It includes command in English communication—both verbal and written—correct accent, modern appearance and outlook, Western demeanour, and a refined character. We prefer only those candidates who can easily adjust in our school culture. (February 19, 2008)

Besides, both elite schools have the services of visiting professors/scholars, the numbers of which can be increased based on the need (as determined by the number of students and the innovative nature of the topics). Most visiting professors have authored books and research articles, which indicates their knowledge and experiential expertise of field in which they are actively engaged. The visiting scholars generally conduct O/A level classes to share their knowledge and experiences vis-à-vis the latest issues in their relevant fields with the students. Some examples of visiting professors in both schools are as follows:

- A business teacher primarily working as an executive in a multinational company.
- The accounting teacher, who was a Chartered Accountant with a renowned national company.
- The arts and graphics teacher had her own advertising agency.
- The music teacher primarily worked for a popular theatre.
- The sociology teacher primarily worked as a professor in a local university.

Most significantly, only the elite school personnel in this study articulated the necessity to transform their professional development programs to be consistent with the latest didactic
paradigms. They generally articulate more faith in “Eurocentric knowledge” and modern teaching theories and praxis that have been developed in the West. They perceive that, in order to keep pace with realities of globalization, powerful influences of capitalism, and an economic culture of open-markets, it has become vital to acquire the latest and progressive knowledge, the Western ways of knowing, and innovative pedagogical techniques that, undoubtedly, enable teachers to meet contemporary challenges. One elite school principal explained:

In this modern age it has become crucial to nurture the professional development of all school teachers, educational leaders, principals and managers...and provide them the opportunities to access the latest research regarding educational content and the most effective ways to deliver it...therefore, to keep pace with the international markets; we prefer the high-quality professional development courses, mostly in Western universities, because they are compatible with the demands we set for developing a self-motivated human capital, that has the knowledge and capability to act as a agent of change, and deliver to the utmost in transforming our educational institution into the center of excellence. (personal interview, November 11, 2008)

Therefore, elite schools offer both short-term and long-term courses to their teachers in reputable Western universities. The short-term courses include certificates that range in duration from two weeks to three months, and are usually offered during the summer vacation. The long-term courses include diploma and graduate degrees. Both elite schools have established separate professional development departments and have the services of the educational consultants who select the most appropriate courses for the teachers based on their individual needs. One consultant explained, “we select only those professional development courses, which we find appropriate to guide our teachers and educational managers through high quality professional development experiences in effective teaching and learning, innovative leadership, and school development for the purpose to ensure high standards” (Informal conversation, November 11, 2008). In addition, the resource personnel from reputable Western universities are also invited to the school to conduct workshops on latest pedagogical techniques. On such occasions, teachers from other elite schools are also invited to attend workshops, which is a routine shared reciprocally. One senior professor of the University of Strathclyde, who was conducting a short-term teacher development workshop in one of the schools under study, recorded his impression:

My colleagues and I have been honoured over the last twelve years for having the opportunity to work with [name of the school] on its sophisticated program of in-house faculty development. The commitment of the school personnel to enhance their skills,
It appears that professional development practices in elite schools are meant to develop the expertise of teachers, based on the strengths of the education systems in advanced Western countries, and develop a human capital capable of meeting the challenges of the modern age. In addition, the elite school administrators perceive that effective teacher development cannot be achieved merely through work within the classroom. Instead, teachers need to be exposed to various levels of learning and provided with opportunities for efficient peer mentoring. Therefore, the teachers are regularly sent abroad to attend seminars/symposiums, do presentations of their research work, and attend long-term master trainer programs to increase their capacity to develop educational materials and master concepts like learners’ autonomy, blended learning, self interest groups, etc. Upon return, these teachers are asked to conduct needs-based workshops and share their learning and experiences with colleagues. Moreover, during daily social interactions, the teachers were seen actively engaging in discussions about their social, academic, and classwork issues and seeking expert opinion/advice from colleagues and seniors alike. In addition, the schools had an institutionalized system for mentoring through which scholars (mostly qualified from elite English-medium schools), senior officials, and fellow teachers facilitate discussions to socialize and introduce new teachers to the traditions of the elite schooling system. The existing teachers also found mentoring useful as it enabled them to realize their strengths and enhance their confidence; knowledge; expertise and skills in education; and effectiveness as teachers within the classroom, the school, and community. In sum, akin to personnel at madaris, it appears that the elite school personnel value their institutionalized system of mentoring as an effective approach to their professional development.

Finally, analogous to madaris, both elite schools have a gender-mixed faculty with an approximate ratio of 70% females and 30% males. However, the teachers generally value gender diversity in the faculty and, unlike madaris, open encounters between male and female teachers provide potential opportunities to enhance the team performance. Some teachers perceive that there is usually more than one way to solve a problem and male and female teachers do not necessarily have the same approach to tackle that problem; therefore, the varying approaches
create a nice balance and enable the best possible decision-making to take place. Besides, divergent perspectives can sometimes see problems that would otherwise go unnoticed. One principal explained his school policy in this regard:

In the faculty meetings, we tend to move beyond gender stereotyping, and a win-lose type of discussion... instead... we believe in the strengths of male and female personalities, and... as a strategy... tend to use them effectively in our benefit... we encourage both male as well as female teachers to come up with their opinions and suggestions in a free and welcoming environment...In fact, we tend to build them into effective team workers, problem solvers, planners, decision makers and leaders to solve the school issues more amicably... (personal interview, November 18, 2008)

Therefore, by moving beyond the gender stereotypic perspectives and taking the advantage of different attributes and qualities that exist between men and women, the elite-school personnel tend to create a more collegial environment within their team of teachers. Their approach to considering gender diversity as an advantage and not a drawback, underscores their dispositions of “enlightenment” and “modernity.”” At the core of this enlightenment is the critical questioning of traditional social institutions, customs, morals, and a strong belief in rationality to reject illogical social hurdles that would come in the way of their progress. The dispositions of modernity for most school personnel is also perceived to be at the root of critical ideas, such as the centrality of freedom, democracy, and reasoning as primary values of their institution, which has the potential to guide them towards social progress.

**The Relative Autonomy of Schools and Contributing Factors**

The aforesaid analysis provides an initial understanding that the madaris and elite schools have attained a certain level of autonomy pertaining to their capacity to control recruitment and make policies in this regard, organize professional development courses which suit their needs, and provide the kind of academic/physical facilities, which they deem necessary for their students. In the following pages, I intend to provide a more in-depth understanding about the relative autonomy of these schools. Bourdieu’s use of the term “relative autonomy” did not permit him to specify the conditions under which educational institutions can achieve autonomy, the degree to which they do so, and the limits of that autonomy (Swartz, 1997, p. 208). However, my study suggests that financial independence that results from non-state sources of funding, patronage from wealthy allies, and protection from like-minded influential individuals appear to be the key
factors to ensure the relative autonomy of madaris and elite schools. However, there are some obvious boundaries and limitations to their autonomy. For instance, while they reveal independence from the government authority, Islamic madaris and elite schools have to follow the guidelines specified by their respective boards of governors and local administration regarding the nature of human capital, fund-allocation, mode of education, pedagogical styles, school cultures, etc. The main focus of these policies is to reproduce specific ideologies, train like-minded individuals, and undermine the government instituted reforms. Conversely, the public schools are entirely state funded and appear to have less autonomy and more interaction with the governmental apparatus. The following comparative analysis basically highlights that the schools under study have various levels of autonomy.

My study suggests that Islamic madaris and elite schools reveal a capacity to develop a distinct status culture marked by their organizational sovereignty, making and implementing their own policies, and the self-reproductive capacity and vested interests in protecting the value of their respective scholastic capital. Both kinds of schools recruit their leadership from within their own ranks and develop an organizational pattern that is more based on historical continuity and stability than change. For instance, the madaris run under the supervision of a board of governors (called Majlis-e-Shura), and chief administrator (called a Nazim-e-Ala) who is assisted by various departmental Nazims. They collectively make and implement core policies primarily focused on preserving the traditional Islamic faith-centered education and resisting the hegemony of Western secular knowledge in Muslim societies. The madaris personnel elaborate that their institutions have been providing a significant cultural alternative and an intellectual approach to the citizens. Being the bearers of the legal and Islamic religio-political traditions, the madaris personnel affirm to continue their mission at any cost, which includes: 1) to promote “Islamic knowledge” and “ways of knowing” as an exclusive vantage point for teaching and learning; 2) to preserve the orthodox beliefs and practices as disseminated by Islamic theology; 3) to ensure the promulgation of Islamic Sharia laws in the country and the socio-cultural rituals based on it; 4) to promote the unity and integrity of Muslims as a universal religious community; and 5) an honest reproduction of Islamic religious knowledge to the next generations. Therefore, the madaris personnel blatantly resist and criticize any of the curricular modernization efforts from the government and term them illogical because they perceive them as an effort to damage
the actual essence of madrassah education, which, at present, seeks only to preserve Islamic orthodoxy instead of providing training to the work force to engage in industrial capitalism. The two following interview excerpts from the school personnel of different madaris reflect the same mindset:

We basically impart religious education and training, and to achieve that objective tend to create Islamic faith-based culture within our madaris...secular knowledge does not fit in there as it belongs to a different domain...whenever, in the past it was attempted to mix religious knowledge with secular learning in madaris, it damaged the actual essence of madrassah education... (personal interview, Nazim, October 20, 2007)

The secular western countries always make sure that their ideology is fully integrated in the education system...similarly the ideology of our education system is based on Islam...and receives insight from the Quran and Sunnah...it, undoubtedly, reflects from each and every aspect of our education...if we import a few slots from secular scheme of studies in our education, it does not make sense to me...instead, I will advise the government not to insist ‘us’ to change our education, but seriously plan to increase the subjects on religious education in the government schools...” (personal interview, mufti, July 10, 2008)

Therefore, contemporary madaris in Pakistan seem to retain programs and activities that fulfill their own specific needs for self-continuation. They are still not willing to embrace the utilitarian knowledge and skills encouraged by industrialization. Moreover, the above statements also underscore that habitus is the unifying principle of practices in different madaris. This type of display of similar dispositions does not imply a kind of objectivism that would separate the function of a particular domain from the practices of individuals and groups. Conversely, it is the practical logic of habitus that ensures the underlying connection within the madaris. Therefore, it appears that there exists a “homology” across the educational fields of madaris in Pakistan.

The madaris personnel further clarify that, although, they virtually have complete sovereignty from government control, their daily practices and decision-making regarding core schooling aspects are greatly influenced by the Majlis-e-Shura, owners and central examining boards. The Nazims explain that while they have full authority to control the number of teachers, hire or fire a staff member, allocate responsibilities to the personnel, they only have partial authority to determine teachers’ compensation and allocation of resources across functional categories, such as administration, student support, instruction, etc. Nazims explain that for such issues they have to seek approval from the board of governors. Likewise, the curricular content is generally
determined by the examining boards and madaris personnel have very little authority in this regard other than to suggest appropriate proposals. The teachers also admitted that they mostly have to abide by the guidelines of the local authorities regarding the curricular content, teaching methods, and the time frame within which they must prepare their students for the final examinations.

The madaris personnel’s narratives explain that their relative autonomy from the government apparatus is greatly indebted to their effective system of fundraising, which provides them with self-reliance to meet their expenses, and empower them to resist any kind of dictation from state authorities or to follow legislations made without their consent. Some of these legislations and programs include curricular modernization and grant-in aid from Zakat (religious tithe) fund. The madaris personnel term such activities as “controlling tactics” and are determined to resist them at any cost. The madaris generally employ the following sources for fundraising:

- Both madaris under study have Boards of Trustees, which consist of like-minded local business class, landed gentry, bureaucrats, and prominent ulema, most of which are active in national politics. They support madaris by giving generous donations (which they may claim on their income-tax returns), religious alms or charity, etc. The influential members of the Board also support madaris by using their influence to resolve any kind of issue that the madaris come across;
- Religious parties and ulema in the politics give generous financial support to madaris for their own political gains. They need madaris as a platform to perpetuate their political agenda, increase the vote-bank, and inculcate their religious interpretations and ideology to create a mass of the like-minded people who can support them in politics;
- Religious alms and charity from common masses and people in diaspora, who usually support madaris as a religious obligation;
- Madaris send delegations of ulema to the oil-rich Middle-East countries or advanced Western countries to convince Muslim community to extend their support by giving their annual religious alms (Zakat) and other donations (such as Sadaqa, Khairat, etc.) to their madaris and the students who are getting the religious education, as this is considered to be highly rewarded in the eyes of God;
• Madaris students voluntarily offer their services to sell religious books, pamphlets, audiocassettes of religious lectures/symposiums, and visit door to door to gather financial support for their madaris. In such practices, the students generally articulate the dispositions of feeling a sense of ownership of their alma mater;

• The madaris also accept skins of animals that are sacrificed during the Eid festival and then sell them to leather goods manufacturing companies in order to generate funds. In Pakistan, people mostly prefer to donate these skins to madaris as a supplication towards blessings of God.

In addition, both madaris under study are registered with the government as charitable corporate bodies, which make them eligible for income and property-tax exemption and, thus, they receive an indirect subsidy from the government. Both madaris, nonetheless, provide free education, along with living/boarding and medical facilities, etc., to underclass children, but charge a reasonable amount for well-off students for tuition/registration fees (e.g. more than Rs. 5000 annually) and also ask for worthwhile donations.

In sum, it is worth-mentioning that over the years, madaris system in Pakistan has become an attractive platform for some individuals to generate money. These individuals earn their entire livelihood from this rewarding business and then pass it on to the next generations as family property. This is one of the key factors for a drastic increase of madaris in the country. Besides, the ruling elite, Islamic religious parties, and like-minded influential individuals have vested interests in protecting the madaris system. For instance, the ruling elite has effectively used madaris to sustain their dominance over the poor masses by denying them access to modern/secular knowledge, which is essential to success in the modern workplace. On the one hand, these elites (including the religious leadership) support madaris as being attractive for the poor (e.g., providing education/basic amenities of life for free) and, on the other hand, they mostly prefer modern education for their own children. Many of the respondents in this study explained that the previous two heads of a prominent Islamic political party had educated their children from expensive private schools and, afterwards, sent them abroad for higher studies. Likewise, the entire top leadership of another religious political party is educated from secular universities. Surprisingly, I found that some members of the Majlis-e-Shura had also enrolled their children
in expensive independent schools with the obvious rationale of securing modern knowledge and skills to dominate the masses. In addition, the Islam-minded segment of the ruling elite uses madaris to perpetuate their sectarian ideologies, create like-minded individuals, and, hence, increase their vote bank. This eventually helps them maintain their privileged position.

The elite schools under study also reveal an autonomy from the government with reference to their monopoly over recruitment, faculty training, making and implementing the school policies, rules and regulations, and appointing leadership from within their own ranks, which allows them to adopt programs and activities that accomplish the need for self-perpetuation. As compared to madaris, the elite school personnel are better equipped to allocate personnel and resources, and determine the number of teachers employed as well as their compensation. The school personnel explain that their boards of governors have delegated them complete authority to make efficient school policies and an effective use of their resources, make trade-offs among competing demands for resources, and decide the proportion of resources that should be devoted to staffing and meeting the students’ fundamental needs. Relatively more autonomy of elite schools under study over policy-making and staffing is also evident in that they have more administrative staff and teachers per pupil as compared to the two other types of schools. Their staff and teacher are also better paid. The school personnel further explain that, apart from some basic guidelines about curricula, human and material resources, and school culture, their boards of governors do not influence every day school practices and decision-making. The teachers also claimed that they have a complete independence in choosing the learning activities for their students. However, they deliberately effort tend to observe the main curricular guidelines. Likewise, the ruling elite of the country do not interfere with the elite schools; policy-making mechanisms or control them what so ever, because they understand the significance of these schools for the benefit of their social class. Accordingly, the organizational and professional interests of elite schools are deeply ingrained in dominant-class interests and economic-market demands. For instance, the main focus of policies is to disseminate the epistemological foundations of modern and progressive education and reproduce the hegemony of “Western secular knowledge” and the “ways of knowing” as an exclusive vantage point for teaching and learning. The school personnel consider this type of scholastic capital as a contemporary necessity and consider others naive who tend to close their eyes to this unavoidable reality. The school personnel say that, in
their schools, they initiate a process of preparing students for white-color jobs and leadership roles, which the students, later on, accomplish in the elite institutions for higher education locally or abroad. By and large, the schools give focus to three main ingredients in their programs: 1) Respect for diversity, which means that students must be recognized for their abilities, needs, interests, ideas, and social identity; 2) promoting a socially active and responsible citizenry, which means students that are capable of working in a team amicably and towards the common good, and; 3) development of critical and decision-making intelligence, which empowers students for future leadership roles. One elite school principal outlined the ultimate product of his school culture and educational programs as follows:

We are motivated for a serious mission...and...that is to create a better world through a purposeful education and training and, thus, create outstanding individuals, who are academically sound; have leadership qualities; enthusiastic for continuous learning and enquiry; creative; competitive and ambitious; have civic sense and feel responsibility for self, family, and society; have enlightened awareness and knowledge of democratic values, rights and responsibilities and, above all, they must be well-behaved, well-mannered, well-spoken, and well-groomed. (personal interview, October 26, 2008)

Thus, the school programs insist on the importance of emotional, artistic, and creative aspects of human development; disseminate Western epistemology and democratic values; and refine the human faculties for making the right decisions, which individuals would need when leading an organization, institution, department, or even a country. The school personnel value their sovereignty as it provides an authority to incessantly revisit their programs and improve them, consistent with the latest trends and international standards in an effort to amicably live up to the expectations of parents, students, and school administrators. The parents invest a reasonable economic capital and, in return, expect an effective contribution from the school towards their child’s overall development, whereas the administrators are sensitive about reputation of the school and the concurrence of their clientele, which is generally socially and economically privileged.

The main source of funds for elite schools, and their relative autonomy, is the lucrative fee contributions of their elite clientele. However, to some extent, government subsidies, private donations, and patronage from the ruling class also contribute in this regard. The school personnel elucidate that the amount generated from fees help them meet almost 80 percent of the
school expenditures. In regards to fee structure, both elite schools do not drastically differ in
amount, rules, method, and frequency of payments. The fees consist of two segments: refundable
and non-refundable. The security deposits are refundable and can be claimed at the time of
migration, termination, or school graduation. However, the schools accumulate a reasonable
amount of security deposits, which they can keep for a certain period of time and use for their
benefits. The non-refundable fee segments include registration fee, admission fee, tuition fee,
annual fee (mostly used for sports, library, laboratory, medical, and co-curricular activities),
transportation fee (if a student opts for the school transportation), computer studies fee, and the
examination fee. The amount of the fee increases with the increase in the educational level of the
student. Table 5.4 presents the details of fees charged at O/A-levels in both schools at the time of
this study.

Table 0.4: Detail of Fees Charged at O/A-Levels in Both Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency of Payments</th>
<th>Nature of Payments</th>
<th>Amount (In Rupees)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>School #1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the time of admission</td>
<td>Security deposit</td>
<td>15,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Admission Fee</td>
<td>28,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Registration Fee</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once a year</td>
<td>Annual Fee (includes sports, laboratory, medical, and co-curricular activities)</td>
<td>30,000 +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payable every two months (in advance)</td>
<td>Tuition Fee A-level O-level</td>
<td>25,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport Fee (opt.)</td>
<td>14,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computer Fee</td>
<td>6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computer Studies (opt.)</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Main offices of both of the schools under study.
Note 1: Examination fee is not included in this fee structure, as it is subject to change every year as per examining body’s policy.
Note 2: opt. means optional for the students that take up computer education stream.
Note 3: Dashes indicate data that could not be obtained.

The school personnel articulate having complete independence in determining the amount of the
fees, methods of payment, and the fallouts for non-payments, etc. However, I argue that through
the ceiling expenses in these schools serve as a “control mechanism,” because the affordability
factor ensures an inclusion of upper forms and an exclusion of the lower forms from these unique
educational institutions. For instance, to admit a child at O levels, the parents have to pay more
than eighty thousand rupees in one instalment, which only a few in the country can afford.
Besides, every parent has to sporadically pay certain other expenses, which include purchasing the tickets for annual functions, sports competitions, funfairs or sending the child to study tours or sports competitions locally or abroad. The amount of such expenses is not fixed and changes with time and the nature of the event. Moreover, uniform and textbooks are available only at the school’s retail stores, which are expensive and contribute to parent’s educational budget for the child. The fee payment rules include mandatory bimonthly payment; however, parents have discretion to pay fees on annual bases as an up-front payment. Fees can only be paid through cash or personal cheques and must be paid by the specified date, failing to do so can result in heavy fines, cancellation of admission or registration with the ministry of education (for international students), etc. As expected, both elite schools do not award any kind of fee concession to their students.

In addition to fees, the rich class and affluent alumni members contribute generous donations towards school funds to help sustain the excellence of academic and physical facilities. Table 5.5 presents the details of this financial support that the elite schools had received from 2005 onwards.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 0.5: Detail of the Private Donations from the Elite Class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic-year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elite School#1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elite School#2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: The management offices of both of the schools.*

Moreover, the ruling class use their authority to awards multiple subsidies to the elite schools. For instance, a considerable relaxation in income and property tax is granted every year. If the members of the board of trustees and other rich donors contribute a certain amount in the school funds, they are eligible to receive a tax exemption for that amount. The elite schools also receive exemption in custom duties and other taxes when importing educational equipment and materials. The faculty members receive tax exemptions on their income from research publications. Moreover, if an elite school plans to expand or to open a new branch, the
government either provides land for free or on subsidized rates depending on the nature of locality. The zoning rules are also relaxed for such kind of expansions.

Therefore, it appears that elite schools are autonomous bodies to the extent that they can make any policy that benefits their clientele, which is certainly the privileged class. Most importantly, these schools are the social sites that protect and reproduce scholastic capital that empowers elite children to access elevated social and economic positions. The ruling elites, in turn, use their authority to safeguard this separate schooling system as it ensures the reproduction of their own power and privilege to the next generations. In so doing, they openly breach constitutional assurance against discrimination among citizens (see, for instance: right No 6, paragraph 15, Constitution of Pakistan) and many recommendations put forth by seven different National Education Policies and periodically appointed Commissions for an egalitarian and just education system in the country (Government of Pakistan, 2009). In sum, by keeping parallel schooling systems in which the upper forms get different types of educational opportunities than the lower forms, the goal of ruling elite is not change, but stability and the maintenance of the status quo.

In contrast to other two types of schools in this study, public schools appear to be less autonomous and there exists more interaction between them and the government apparatus as well as the political field of the country. For instance, the public schools function under a centralized governance structure, wherein the provincial government (through Executive District Education Office) supervises schools and controls the hiring of new staff, including teachers as well as their transfers or termination from the job. Likewise, the high-bureaucrats exclusively carry out the educational planning and policy-making for the public schools. The school personnel only ensure the implementation of these policies and other directives within schools in true letter and spirit. However, in this collaboration reveals powerless, anguish, and dissatisfaction regarding top-down policies, on the part of the public school personnel, of all of which they consider to have partly affected their efficiency in promoting the academic standards of their schools. They referred to two very recently introduced documents: *Dastoor-ul-Amal* (School Manual) and the Academic Calendar. These documents were initially issued in 2006 by the government to every head teacher and teacher with instructions to strictly follow the guidelines contained therein. The head teachers explain that the School Manual outlines
guidelines ranging from minor aspects of the working of a school (such as school schedules, type of student’s uniform, total number of daily academic periods, and the procedures for the morning assembly) to certain more critical aspects (such as the administration of the school, teaching methods used for different subjects, co-curricular activities, handling of finances, and how to control drop-out rates, etc.). Similarly, the Academic Calendar specifies a list of lessons and topics that are mandatory for every teacher to cover from the textbook within a specified timeframe. The head teachers perceive that such kind of policies and directives make their job mechanical and also encourage teachers to rely solely on textbooks. One head teacher argued:

It would have been more conducive to uplift the academic standards, if the government had conferred the head teachers with liberty and confidence to make suitable policies for the school, and its teachers to develop their own lesson plans, choose learning activities, which they deem appropriate for their students, and select suitable teaching methods, while considering the needs and learning pace of their students. (personal interview, February 6, 2007)

Likewise, the public school personnel are not included in decisions and policies to improve the curricula. For instance, in an effort to attune to job entry and performance in the skilled manual labour market, the government has introduced a number of technical/vocational subjects, which include metal works, wood works, electricity, electrical motor winding, typing, shorthand, basic accounting, etc. However, the school personnel argue that these subjects are greatly deficient in theoretical content and the schools have not been properly equipped with the apparatus to give manual practice to the students and, thus, properly train them for the job market. Consequently, they remained unable to find a reasonable work in the manufacturing sector. One head teacher analysed:

To make the technical education successful in the public schools, it would be better to align courses with the industrial needs, introduce the latest concepts, increase the content of theory and practice, and reduce the burden of general subjects on students...but the government never consults ‘us’ while making important policies. (personal interview, February 7, 2007)

The public school personnel generally argue that if the ruling elite gave proper consideration to their expertise, as they are the ones who are working in the actual field, it could truly make a difference in the public-school education.
The government also controls another important aspect of the public schools, which is the system of fees and funding. Again the head teachers are required to follow the specified guidelines and are held accountable for discrepancies. One head teacher argues, “The way government handles our financial aspects, causes problems for us to efficiently run our schools” (personal interview, February 7, 2007). For instance, very recently the government introduced a plan where every school has to develop a budget and submit it to the District Education Office for approval. This budget generally contains the demands for essential contingency grants required to meet recurring expenses, such as to pay bills, buy newspapers and other basic amenities (e.g., uniforms, furniture, fans, etc.), and ensure a regular supply of teaching aids and other materials, especially consumable items. However, every year the District Education Office substantially reduces the requested funds, which adds to the inability of head teachers to meet the day-to-day expenses of the school. One head teacher explained that this year he requested more than fifty thousand rupees in the annual budget, but was granted only Rs. 21,300, an amount that hardly met the usual bills. Consequently, the school could not repair some of the electric fans, furniture, lawn mower, or buy new taps for the school mosque. Moreover, in recent years the government has introduced certain drastic changes in fee structure of the public schools. Initially, the government abolished tuition fees in 1993 and then the union funds in 2004. Now, every student has to pay only a meagre amount of 7 rupees every month, which is called Farogh-e-Taleem\textsuperscript{14} fund. These changes have further added to head teacher’s difficulties in being able to meet the expenses of the schools. The head teachers explained that old union fund system was helpful, as it had categories like the Science Fund, Sports Fund, Library Fund, and Red Cross Fund, and every student had to deposit a required amount in these funds along with their tuition fees. As a result, the head teachers had a substantial amount at their disposal to buy science equipment from the science fund, buy sports equipment and arrange competitions from sports fund, and help needy students to pay examination fees and buy uniform from Red Cross fund, etc. Those funds were also supporting the training of scouts and sending them to annual camps. Now, under this new arrangement, the amount of funds accumulated by the schools is greatly insufficient to meeting all of such expenses. Consequently, the head teachers had to cut the number of athletes, sportsmen, and scouts.

\textsuperscript{14} Farogh-e-Taleem can be translated in English as “spreading the education” or “raising the literacy rate.”
Excessive political involvement is another significant factor that has undermined the relative autonomy of the public schools. The head teachers reckon it the biggest challenge for them, as this kind of intrusion tends to impede almost every aspect of the functioning of their schools (e.g. appointment or transfer of teachers, admission or expulsion of students, passing or detaining the students, recruitment or termination of a peon (office servant), etc.). The two following interview excerpts from two different head teachers sufficiently explain the nature of such involvements:

Every year the local politicians try to influence our annual examination results in order to please parents and get their favour as voters, and we have to convince them that it is more beneficial for a failed student to work hard and come up with better results next time. (personal interview, August 7, 2008)

A head teacher terminated the services of an incompetent peon [Office Servant]...because most of the time he remained absent from the job...but had to reinstate him, as the local politician intervened and forced the head teacher to revert his decision...later on...it was disclosed that the peon had worked at that politicians’ residence and received salary from the school. (personal interview, September 6, 2008)

In regards to political involvement in teachers’ recruitment, influential politicians force the hiring authorities to overlook meritocracy and to hire candidates who are, for the most part, not professionally competent and, thus, inflexible in being able to adapt to changing learning needs. As a result, the job of head teachers to live up to expectations to achieve the highest standards of an academic performance is rendered that much more challenging when they are provided with poorly-qualified teaching staff that have been hired without their consent. One head teacher explained:

The political involvement in teachers’ recruitment has increased manifolds in current years...I give you a recent example...last month when new teachers were being hired, the politicians made the authorities to ignore many deserving candidates, and hire those who had B.Ed. degrees from [name of an Open University], which...you know... is not giving an adequate standard in pre-service teachers training courses...some of the hired teachers told me that they had not done the teaching practice in actual classroom settings during their education... some of them had their entire post-secondary education from the same Open University... what can you expect from such teachers?...they have often not studied core subjects, such as, mathematics and generally lack knowledge of other subjects, and are also unable to deliver effectively... (personal interview, February 6, 2008)
The frequent transfers resulting subjective and political considerations have also frustrated many teachers. Moreover, the re-emergence of non-elite private English-medium schools has posed certain new challenges to the existence of public schools. The public school respondents in this study explain that these schools are mostly autonomous, which enables their personnel to make their own policies, hire suitable teachers, introduce modern curricula, and use English as the medium of instruction, etc. Consequently, these schools mostly provide better academic standards, which encourage parents who can afford their charges to prefer them over public schools. Hence, the public schools are presently facing a continuous decrease in their student enrolment at a rate of 10 to 15 percent every year. In the following chapter, while examining the students’ family economic capital, I will try to explain precisely which socioeconomic classes are gradually being eliminated from the public schools. Moreover, I suggest further empirical studies for this significant claim from the public school personnel. Table 5.6 indicates a gradual decreasing trend of newly enrolled students in Grade 6, which is first level to enrol in the high schools and, hence, supports my respondents’ claim.

**Table 0.6: A Decreasing Trend of Newly Enrolled Students (in Grade 6) in the Public Schools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pilot H/S</td>
<td>949</td>
<td>873</td>
<td>805</td>
<td>709</td>
<td>602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. H/S</td>
<td>712</td>
<td>676</td>
<td>606</td>
<td>533</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: The administration office of both of the schools.*

Therefore, more control and less autonomy in the public schools has greatly undermined effective teamwork that could uplift the academic standards. The school personnel are not free to recruit teachers of their choice, generate funds, or make other necessary policies to efficiently run their schools. This has also aggravated their feelings of a lack of professional freedom and diluted their feelings of ownership, professional commitment, and motivation to work hard. Moreover, underfunding from the government and an excessive political involvement in almost every aspect has contributed towards poor performance of these schools. Consequently, contemporary public schools are gradually falling short in competition with other types of schools, especially the non-elite private English-medium schools.
A Comparative Overview of School Cultures

Just as culture is critical to comprehending core beliefs, values, and dynamics behind any thriving community, organization, or business, the daily realities and deep structures of school life hold a vital role in many aspects of student’s schooling experience, expectations, learning, and performance. Hence, my study reveals divergent kinds of culture in the three types of schools under study and provides an understanding that the school personnel’s core beliefs about the aim and purpose of education greatly influence the main cultural attributes, values, and social dynamics within their school. These core beliefs and standpoints are overtly incompatible. For instance, the madaris personnel generally view education from a faith-centered perspective and provide a pedagogical medium for Islamic beliefs and spirituality to inform daily social and cultural life within their schools. However, the public school personnel believe in the importance of integrating Islamic epistemology into the corpus of modern/secular knowledge, finding it essential for the personal development of their students in the modern age. Therefore, their schools also reveal a heterogeneous cultural model, for instance a combination of both Western and Islamic lifestyles. But, a conflict is also evident within their faculty between the proponents of these apparently contrasting cultural paradigms. Conversely, the elite school personnel believe that Western progressive education, ways of knowing, and lifestyles are necessary to keep pace with the global social and economic realities. Therefore, they tend to create a culturally congruent environment, which exclusively aims at the reproduction of Eurocentric lifestyles. The following pages will present a detailed discussion of these synoptic arguments. However, at present it is essential to return to the discussion in Chapter Two, which emphasized that the Western lifestyles constitutes the “dominant culture” in Pakistan. Moreover, I have also attempted to examine the nature of rules, regulations, and codes of conduct in these three types of schools and the students’ resistance patterns against what they perceive as one-sided or stringent regulations and unwarranted school practices.

Islamic Madaris

The madaris personnel generally believe that their education focuses on students’ moral training, character building, and spiritual grooming regardless of their social origin to enable them to understand the primacy of religious knowledge, culture, and values in daily life. Other worldly objectives, such as pursuit of wealth, social standing or power, titles of honour and designations,
and even the form of knowledge that has the sole purpose to benefit in the worldly life, are all undesirable, since they relate to the transient life. The madaris personnel perceive that Islam is at once a religion and a complete culture. As a religion, it provides an ideological foundation, which is informed by the divinely ordained guidelines and the praxis as outlined in the Quran and Sunnah (the Prophet Muhammad's example). This ideological foundation principally governs and regulates conduct, demeanour, the nature of relationships, and other cultural practices of its adherents as well as the daily transactions in economic, political, and social domains. The madaris personnel perceive one of their prime obligations as being adequately training individuals by reproducing Islamic ideology and cultural norms within their madaris. The following two interview excerpts from the muftis (Nazim-e-Ala) of two different madaris sufficiently explain an all-encompassing concept of madaris education and culture:

When we speak about madaris culture...first and foremost, we will have to understand what the term *ilm* [knowledge] implies in Islam...it encompasses the totality of life—the spiritual, intellectual, religious, cultural, and social—means that its character is universal. Therefore, we provide education and proper environment to foster all such aspects of *ilm*, which we believe must guide a person in the worldly affairs as well to his salvation in the life hereafter... (personal interview, August 2, 2008)

Education is not just the acquisition of knowledge, and that must not be an end in itself. Rather, the aim of education is righteous actions based on righteous knowledge. To promote this righteous knowledge, we provide an environment that idyllically aims at the total and balanced development of every student not only intellectually, but also morally, spiritually, socially, and culturally...In short, we tend to refine human character in the light of guidelines as prescribed by the Quran, the prophet’s *Sunnah*, and other religious teachings... (personal interview, November 18, 2007)

Therefore, in madaris, the organization, inculcation, and dissemination of *ilm* is perceived as a system of order and discipline pertaining to the *kulliyyah*, a concept conveying the idea of the “universal.” The madaris personnel argue that no other culture and civilization has ever applied a single term for *ilm* to encompass the whole set of human activities. Hence, to generate the opportunities for this holistic nature of education where training of mind and transmission of knowledge (*ta'lim*) is equally significant as the training of soul (*tarbiyah*) and upbringing of a refined character, the madaris provide a culturally congruent environment to validate spiritually-based values and practices and make them integral to the schooling experience of their students.
Reproduction of Islamic Culture and Lifestyles in Madaris

In essence, the madaris reproduce the “model” of behaviour and conduct that is documented in the Quran and was practically applied by the Prophet in his daily life. Muslims, mainly, agree upon the life of the Prophet Muhammad as the living embodiment of the Quranic principles. Hence, in the light of this model, the madaris construct a distinctive culture where written and unwritten rules tend to inculcate faith-based code of conduct. It starts with fostering an understanding and practical training in four major areas: beliefs (Aqaid), worships (Ibadat), morals and manners (adab), and social affairs (Maumlaat). The madaris personnel explain that beliefs provide the foundation, worship cultivates purity (tazkiya) in character, morals and manners provide social skills to properly behave, and the involvement in social affairs fosters an understanding of the norms and laws prescribed in the Quran and Sunnah to deal with various issues. The teaching of beliefs is built on fostering an understanding of the Quran, which is the core of madrassah education. The madaris personnel insistently argue: “the Quran is only beneficial when it reaches the heart and is firmly planted in it” (personal interview, November, 20, 2007). Thus, in daily madrassah routine the teachers help students to “embody” the Quran in their hearts with a belief that it leads to properly understand the spirit of its messages, which ultimately will guide them in every aspect of their lives. Likewise, worship and devotional practices (Ibadat) not only help to purify the “heart,” but also foster dispositions to submit against the will of God, Who is constantly monitoring individuals and their deeds. This kind of awareness promotes self-discipline among students and also regulates their dealings in social life (cultural capital) and advances them in the Islamic code of conduct (religious capital). Hence, the madaris personnel inculcate the praxis of Ibadat not just to perform certain legislated ritual acts, but rather to encompass the whole set of activities of a person. Besides, the madaris personnel relate Ibadat with the notion of “intention,” which they perceive as not the utterance of an individual’s words, but what overflows from his “heart” and runs like conquests inspired by God. A person whose heart is devastatingly “righteous” finds it easy to summon noble intentions. Thus, the “heart” of such a person is generally inclined to be based in the roots of goodness, which blossom into the manifestation of pious actions. Hence, madaris personnel believe that if they properly inculcate the real “spirit” of Ibadat among their students, the teaching of other aspects of their education becomes easy, such as morals and manners, cultural practices, social affairs, etc. One mufti explains his viewpoint about Ibadat as follows:
We make our students to understand that a person may even be rewarded for his daily normal activities, as long as their ‘intention’ is righteous, and those activities do not contradict Islam...Islam has urged and even placed an obligation upon its adherents for specific manners and mores with regards to practices outside the prescribed rituals of worship...It also has legislated in performing daily activities, and if a person acts in conformity to those legislations, his every action becomes Ibadat. (Interview, August 6, 2008).

Therefore, the concept of “intention” allows one’s entire life to become an act of worship, as long as the objective of that life is the pleasure of God, Whose pleasure can only be achieved by doing virtuous deeds and refraining from evil. Hence, madaris personnel tend to transform students’ everyday activities into acts of worship by inculcating the “dispositions” about the laws of God and how they can be applied in true letter and spirit to purify the intention and, thus, sincerely seek God’s pleasure through righteous actions. These dispositions subsequently regulate the inculcation of righteous morals and manners, cultural practices, and social skills.

Likewise, the overall aim of bringing about a sense of adab (morals and manners) and Maumlaat (social affairs) among students is not limited to the formal didactic activities that take place in the classroom; it is transmitted, practised, and reproduced through a non-formal teaching regime as well, such as written and unwritten rules, discipline, bodily control, and behavioural expectations, especially vis-à-vis those considered to be in positions of authority in madaris. The students are generally expected to observe the prescribed Islamic etiquettes in every aspect of their lives. Some of which include decency, decorum, courtesy, good-manners, appropriateness, respect, and performing righteous acts, such as helping the poor and destitute, feeding the hungry, serving the ailing and the distressed, etc. Similarly, making conversation free of filth, malice, falsehood, and abuse, speaking the truth, and doing all that which God has bound us to do is an essential part of madaris training. Hence, in madaris one can see students observing the established Islamic adab, such as greeting in an Islamic way, Assalam-o-Alaikum (peace be with you); showing respect to elders, teachers, and scholars; routinely gathering for five-time collective prayers; performing ablution (cleaning the body) according to Islamically prescribed procedures before offering the prayers; and cleaning the physical space for prayers as a religious obligation. Likewise, the students tend to observe Islamic manners in every aspect of their daily lives. For instance, while dinning, the students wash both hands up to the wrists, sit on floor
while eating, recite *Bismillah*, eat with the right hand, eat that which is in front, refrain from talking while engaged in eating, read the special supplication after meals, wash hands after eating, gargle the mouth.

The training of social affairs is, in fact, the application of Sharia laws in daily social, economic, and political domains, which basically require honesty and truthfulness. However, one prominent feature of the teaching of social affairs is to train students to respect parents, elders, teachers, and scholars associated with madaris. In so doing, I argue that the madaris tacitly inculcate the dispositions among students to accept their position in the social hierarchy. For instance, one madrassah Nazim explained the essence of such training in madaris as follows:

> We continuously teach our students that in Islam, one of the glorifications of *Allah* is to give honour to elders, parents, scholars, teachers, and bearers of the Quran in their heart [Hafiz]...it is one of the foundations of faith as well as one of the pillar stones of *Ikhlaq* [morality]...the society where elders, scholars, and hafiz are not properly respected and looked after is bound to tear apart. (personal interview, November 19, 2007).

Therefore, to show reverence to elders, the students are expected not to dispute with them; instead to accept their command, obey their orders, speak with them in a muted voice, lower eyes when addressing them, and try every effort not to displease them, etc. However, it appears that while giving an over-emphasis to respecting elders and placing that only second in importance to the duties towards *Allah*, the madaris personnel are making their students passive and training them to accept their commands, rules, and regulations without questioning their legitimacy.

In addition to customary practices, the madaris under study also have created many rules to specifically regulate students’ behaviour, etiquettes, social relations, appearance, dressing, etc. For instance, the admission brochures of madaris under study contain the following rules to regulate students’ conduct:

- The students’ dress and general appearance must be in accordance with Islam. Besides, it is mandatory for girls and female teachers to wear *hijab* (headscarf); *niqab* (face veil); and *abaya* (long pullover) during the school time;
- The students’ behaviour must be in accordance with Islamic teachings and Sharia Laws;
• Unethical conduct of the students will be seriously dealt with, and they can be expelled from the madrassah;
• The students must fully respect the teachers, founders, and ulema associated with the madrassah;
• The students must stay avoid controversy and pandemonium at all times;
• If a student has to go out, permission from the Nazim and hostel warden is obligatory;
• If the management comes to know that students go to cinemas, theatres, musical shows, or other such places of unethical entertainment, they will immediately be expelled from the madrassah, etc.

In addition, the madaris personnel have the authority to impose more rules, whenever needed, which they usually introduce at the morning assembly, Friday sermons, and lectures. As a rule the medium of instruction in madaris is Urdu; however, I observed that most students had internalized the communicative styles of their teachers and tended to load Urdu with Arabic and Persian phrases. The regional dialects are usually discouraged in the classroom. The madaris personnel also skillfully use posters and signs, which are pinned up in the hallways, dining halls, and classrooms, etc. Some posters contain messages regarding Islamic manners, while others contain messages elaborating the importance of learning and disseminating Islamic knowledge. These posters do not merely serve as a reminder of broader spiritual rules of conduct in the madaris, but also help to promote the Islamic character of being a true Muslim.

Obedience on Demand in Islamic madaris
In view of the above discussion, the madaris authorities, scholars, teachers, and elders expect full reverence from students and a complete compliance to their rules and regulations. The overall school atmosphere is discipline-oriented and regimented and a daily routine for the students has been predetermined, which appears to be blatantly mechanical. For instance, every student is required to finish breakfast before 7 A.M., school starts at 8 A.M., 4 P.M. to 6 P.M. is devoted for exercise and games, obligatory prayers are offered exactly at predetermined times, and a two hour compulsory study session is held before bedtime. The morning assembly is also a mechanical exercise during which there is the recitation from Quran, a religious hymn (Naat), a speech from a senior student about moral issues, and singing the national anthem are the
essential aspects. Although, the school personnel tend to create awareness among students about Islamic philosophy of discipline and what benefits it might create in their personal lives, they do not encourage them to participate in decision-making strategies. Instead, they require obedience and submission and on breaching their rules and prescribed daily schedule, the students receive penalties, which range from simple admonishment to corporal punishment.

The madaris personnel’s ethnographies generally articulate two kinds of perspectives regarding the infliction of corporal punishment on students. Some view punishment from the faith-centered perspective and generally argue that God has also built a system of accountability on *juza* (reward) and *suzza* (chastisement). The Quran elucidates this issue while presenting heaven and hell as reward and punishment for good and bad deeds respectively. In this way, it is understood that the students are inspired to engage in Islamically appropriate conduct by being given worthwhile rewards and prohibited from unlawful deeds through “fearing” punishment.

However, even the fervent advocates of punishment argue that teachers should not be permitted to beat students, instead, where the situation dictates, they should use sharp words or deny some privileges. The sharp words must not involve abuse, ridicule, and vilification against the child and the corporal punishment must be used very carefully and only as a last resort. One such teacher explained:

"If beating becomes the only option...then...we must do it lightly without inflicting marks on the students’ body...and if, by chance, the student’s body gets marks, the teacher will have to pay *diya* (compensation) to the student, which is clearly specified by the Sharia."

(personal interview, August 6, 2008).

Conversely, some respondents overwhelmingly differ in their opinion about inflicting any kind of punishment on students. They argue that, as a teacher, it is their responsibility to respect students’ sensibilities, feelings, and self-esteem and to not humiliate them through any of the methods mentioned above. Instead, they perceive that self-discipline will be automatically created if students are made properly aware of the schools’ expectations regarding their conduct and fallouts for misbehaving. They argue that madaris basically teach Islam, which provides a complete code of conduct and regulates every aspect of the social life of its adherents. Therefore, simply “living Islam” creates self-discipline in the conduct. One teacher explained:
Islam is a religion and a complete culture...it regulates daily routine and conduct. For example, when we offer prayers at prescribed times, it creates self-discipline...when we fast, which demands to control our baser lusts and material desires, it creates self-control. Likewise, in Islam the concept of accountability, where God is watching us all the times guides us to control our notions and regulates certain boundaries...all of which contribute towards self-control and self discipline... (personal interview, August 16, 2008)

Therefore, both perspectives, one that supports the essence of punishment and reward and the other that believes in a faith-centered consciousness of accountability of actions, contribute towards an overall disciplined atmosphere within madaris. The personnel generally believe that their education and the school culture has a potential to protect students from negative influences, reshape mores and behaviour of the individuals who have deviated from the “straight path,” and provide a faith-based alternative to the secular influences.

Reproduction of Islamic Identity and Upholding the Cultural Sanctity in Madaris

In view of the above discussion, it appears that madaris are the sites where Islamic oriented social identities, cultural norms, and lifestyles are reproduced. However, in a country like Pakistan, where almost 96% of the population is comprised of practising Muslims, the reproduction of “Islamic identity,” more or less means ensure the continuity of Islam as a religion, culture, and lifestyle in the community. This has emerged predominantly as an unwritten mandate of Islamic madaris since their inception. Moreover, it is not possible to view Muslim society in Pakistan in monolithic terms, as there are multiple orientations towards Islam, which are based on various sectarian interpretations of the “core” Islamic texts. Although, there is general consensus from madaris personnel about these doctrinal texts and divinely ordained fundamental religious tenets, such as the five pillars of Islam, in deeper terms, the school personnel perpetuate the interpretations of their own sects. Therefore, in this context, the essence of “Islamic identity” is also guided by the sectarian interpretations of the core religious texts. The madaris generally perpetuate the dispositions among students to strictly adhere to their rigid and conservative interpretations of the faith. They also train them to refute other sectarian interpretations and disseminate their own interpretations onto subsequent generations. This point will be further discussed in Chapter Seven.
Moreover, *Taqwa* (piety) is a fundamental concept of Islamic culture, which arises out of rigid observance of the Quranic injunctions to distinguish between good and evil, sacred and profane, and lawful and unlawful. In fact, Islam urges the promotion of moral values in social and cultural life and considers anything contradicting to morality as unlawful. Hence, to maintain “sanctity” of Islamic culture, the madaris personnel consider it their prime responsibility to purge the society from unlawful practices. In so doing, they start their efforts within their own madaris, with a belief that this ultimately will lead to cleansing the entire society. Hence, they initially ban students from watching immoral television programs; going to movies, theatre, or dances; listening to music or singing songs, or creating images in painting or to taking photographs of living beings, etc. Likewise, they forbid their students from partaking in cultural festivals, such as *Besant*, which has a Hindu origin; worshiping at graves of dead bodies; and necromancy, as they perceive such activities as “unlawful.” Instead, the madaris personnel encourage their students to participate in religious gatherings, lectures, and symposiums and visit historical places, such as museums, etc. because such activities have a didactic value. In contrast to painting, the madaris personnel advocate religious calligraphy, with a belief that it helps to disseminate the Islamic messages. Hence, they encourage students to visit art galleries that display the magnum opus of calligraphy. In Pakistan, artists predominantly select verses from the Quran to compose wonderful pieces of calligraphy.

**The State of Co-curricular Activities in Madaris**

Considered to be an integral part of their education, the madaris personnel usually patronize debates, speeches, discussions, *Qirat* (Quranic recitation), and *Naat* (hymn) competitions. They perceive that their students are the future orators, preachers, and disseminators of Islam; they need to refine their speech-making skills. Therefore, they generate opportunities and urge students to participate in them. In regards to games and sports, although madaris personnel claim that their holistic nature of education provides opportunities for the balanced development of every student’s personality, in reality, they do not patronize these useful co-curricular activities in their system. The madaris have sufficient sports goods but, due to the lack of availability of a qualified sports coach, the students were seen playing in a haphazard way during the break. The madaris also do not organize sports teams or attend to any kind of interschool, inter-board, or intercity competitions.
The Public Schools

The public school personnel perceive that their education aims at the development of individuals as per government prescribed guidelines. They focus not only on educating students to lead their lives according to the teachings of Islam as laid down in the Quran and Sunnah and, thus, be true practicing Muslims, but also to impart modern and secular education with a purpose of preparing students to enter the world of work or to pursue higher education. The school personnel perceive that both revealed knowledge and experienced reality must form the pedestal for producing a body of knowledge that has the capacity to heal the soul and also prepare students for modern, social, and economic challenges. The following interview excerpt from a head-teacher explains the vision of public school education:

We provide our students the kind of education and environment to make them true practising Muslims, who would be able to face the realities of life using the wisdom based on religious knowledge as well as modern skills. In fact, our ultimate goal is to bring about a change in student’s thought and behaviour as prescribed by Islam, and also enable them to play a vital and productive role in the national economic uplift. (personal interview, August 17, 2008)

Therefore, instead of antagonism, the public school personnel generally advocate harmonizing the faith-centered epistemology and Western secular knowledge in the content as well as in praxis. In this kind of a unified system, which brings together Islamic and secular knowledge, the school personnel, nonetheless, support Islamic vision as being the guiding force. They acknowledge that presently most of the research work and creation of knowledge are being done in the West and that it would be unwise to close their eyes to these valuable Western achievements. However, they criticise the elite English-medium schools for exclusively reproducing Western thoughts, ideals, worldviews, and cultural practices within their schools and making youth Westernized. Conversely, the public school personnel argue that it is vital to integrate Islamic epistemology into the corpus of modern secular knowledge by eliminating, amending, reinterpreting, and adopting its components to match the worldview, and values of Islam. The exact relevance of Islam to the philosophy, method, and objectives of each modern subject needs to be revisited. The public school personnel argue that it must to be the main task of present-day intellectuals, educational leaders, policy-makers, and teachers to produce such kind of reformed body of knowledge, which is saturated with Islamic wisdom and then teach it to subsequent generations.
A Mixed-Cultural Paradigm in the Public Schools

In view of their perspectives, the public school personnel provide a mixed cultural environment to their students, which, although it is Islamic in orientation, has certain obvious elements of Western and Hindu culture. For instance, a significant number of faculty members have Western appearance, dress, and demeanour, while the rest of them opt for Islamic cultural appearance, behaviour, and lifestyles. The teachers who were educated in madaris and their like-minded colleagues unequivocally advocate the reproduction of Islamic lifestyles within schools. They also discourage students from relishing Hindu or Western popular culture. Whereas, the teachers having educational background from public, non-elite private educational institutions, they mostly articulate modern cultural pursuits and an open-mindedness towards Hindu music or Western popular culture. Therefore, this kind of dichotomy in the perspectives and cultural practices appears to be an integral part of the schooling experience of public school students.

Occasionally, these apparently antagonistic perspectives about culture and lifestyles within the faculty fortify into a lively and hostile debate. For instance, very recently, on account of an official directive, the public schools had to change students’ uniform into Western style grey pants, white shirt, and black shoes. The proponents of Islamic lifestyles within these schools did not like this change and openly called it an un-Islamic move and an intrigue from the secular-minded ruling elite to shove the youth towards Western ideologies and culture. They advocated that the previous uniform of *kurta-shalwar* was congruent with Islamic culture. However, the proponents of Western culture considered it a timely and legitimate effort to keep pace with the latest global needs and trends. Likewise, in public schools, although a mosque was provided for noon-prayers, a significant number of teachers (and students as well) would not attend collective prayers. They considered it an individual matter, while madaris qualified teachers and their like-minded colleagues firmly advocated for mandatory collective prayers for everyone within the school. The language of communication in the school, classrooms, and staff meetings is Urdu but, due to the location of these schools, sometimes Punjabi is also incorporated. Some teachers, however, saturated their Urdu with English words, which they had developed due to their own background of modern education, which they considered necessary to teach modern/secular subject matter.
Obedience on Demand in the Public Schools

Like madaris personnel, the public school personnel tend to groom their students in accordance with their understanding of *adab* (mannerism), which are mostly inculcated through non-formal regime, such as written and unwritten rules, discipline, bodily control, and managing students’ behaviour, etc. The public schools under study did not reveal any activity or program specifically designed to raise students’ awareness about school mechanisms or encourage them to participate in the decision-making strategies. However, it was frequently observed that the school personnel demanded obedience from students, whether it be in the domain of relationships or their rules and regulations. In relationships, the teachers mostly demanded respect and misinterpreted this as being demonstrated by students behaving as followers and accepting all of their opinions, suggestions, and rules without questioning or challenging even those that are unwarranted. The students were constantly reminded in the morning assembly, during class-work, and literary meetings (*Bazm-e-adab*) to respect teachers/elders and follow rules and regulations until they become part of their habit. The students were heavily reprimanded and sometimes physically punished should they not follow these rules and regulations.

Like at madaris, the daily routine in public schools is overtly mechanical. It starts from the morning assembly, during which time students go through the routine rituals, such as recitation from the Quran, singing a famous children’s poem and the national anthem together and are then inspected to determine whether they have properly observed the rules related to uniform, tidiness, and appearance. The morning assembly follows a routine of academic periods, in which teachers usually go to their classes without wasting any time. If a teacher is not on time, it is responsibility of the class monitor to find him and remind of his class assignment. Moreover, to control students’ movement, the school personnel imposed certain exclusive rules for everyone to follow in true letter and spirit. For instance, the students were allowed to come out of class only to drink water or go to the toilet either at the beginning or at the end of a class period, no student was allowed to leave the class without a day pass, only one student was issued the day pass at a time and he was required to return within five minutes. In order to control the practice of students to run away during school time, recording their attendance was enforced twice a day. The student absenteeism was kept in check by expelling them from the school in the case of six continuous absentees without parent’s prior consent or a doctor’s note. The Physical Teaching
Instructors (PTI) were assigned an extra duty of enforcing discipline, which they would do by an extensive patrolling within school premises and inflicting penalties if they noticed any deliberate or inadvertent breaches of the school regulations.

**The Cane Still Rules in the Public Schools**

Although the government has strictly banned corporal punishment in the schools, there is sufficient evidence to believe that cane still rules in the public schools. In 2005, the government issued a directive banning corporal punishment and putting up a billboard carrying the official slogan “*mar nahin pyar*” (benevolence not beating) at the main gate of public schools. This was, in fact, a public announcement that banned this detrimental practice and the schools were obligated to follow this directive. This directive warned head teachers and district level educational administrators with strict disciplinary action, including termination from service, if they failed to ensure the placement of warning boards at the school entrance and inside the school building. However, in actual practice, it appeared that the cane continued to exist as it was before this directive. A simple directive was not enough to change the mindset of teachers. On numerous occasions, I saw a cane sitting either on a teacher’s table, on the bench, or in the corner of a classroom, which the teachers usually justified as being used as a pointer to assist during the lecture. However, some teachers openly admitted to flogging students and considered it an effective tool to discipline unruly students. Moreover, akin to their madaris colleagues, the public school teachers justified their acts of violence against students by misinterpreting selective citations of holy verses. They articulate things such as reward and punishment go equal in Islam. Occasionally, parental backing also encouraged teachers to hit and smack students. Some parents perceived that an iron hand policy was essential to keep children’s conduct on the “right path” and also raise their academic standards. Some of the pro-caning teachers linked the banning of corporal punishment to some conspiracy set forth by the government in connivance with foreign hands to spoil the nation’s youth. They wonder with heavy heart about how the spoiled children can be brought onto straight path without afflicting stern actions. Their narratives underscore that “the government has tied up the hands of its teachers,” that “we are not even allowed to touch them now,” and that “the students are now free to do whatever they want.” These teachers speak of the feeling that the rug is being pulled out from right under their feet, which, undoubtedly,
results in the perceived danger of further declining the educational standards in the public schools.

The contrast between teachers’ practices and the official message displayed on the billboard create a sense of resentment among students, which they demonstrate either through silent protests or open challenges. In the silent protests, the students would do wall-chalking to record their anguish against battering, hide the cane, or sometimes break it while the teacher was absent from the class. Initially, when the billboards were put on display, they carried the phone numbers of higher-authorities to facilitate the parents and students who wanted to report such incidents. It was embarrassing for the teachers to notice these phone numbers written on students’ palms. No sooner than a teacher raised the cane, the students would challengingly display their palms. The students perceived that this kind of reminder would ultimately make teachers to surrender battering. These facts indicate that, despite a demand from the school personnel for total obedience, the students are not learning to be docile and submissive in the face of present or future degrading conditions or humiliation. Conversely, they are developing an ability to resist or protest against any kind of exploitation.

**Laxity for having Proper Eating Places**

Healthy eating habits must be planned rationally. One learns them at home and respective educational institutions. Every school, college, university, or training institute has a range of facilities catering to the fundamental needs. Some of them include canteens, snack corners, tuck shops, cold spots, eateries, messing facilities, and the like. However, the public schools under study did not have a proper eating place. Instead, just before break time, the hawkers and vendors would gather at the main gate and sell cheap and unhealthy food to the students in an unhygienic way. I presented this matter before the head-teachers, but they repeated same excuse of the lack of funds to build a canteen within the school. However, I suggested that certain private schools have established canteens by giving contacts to catering parties, which would provide quality affordable snacks and also pay rent that contributes towards school funds. The head teachers promised to take this suggestion seriously.
The Significance of Co-curricular Activities in Public Schools

Although the school personnel complain about the shortage of funds, they tend to provide opportunities for co-curricular activities, such as debating, scouting, games, Qirat and Naat competitions, etc. The school personnel consider such activities to be a significant part of their education and helpful in instilling qualities like self-confidence, discipline, cooperation, and teamwork and creating physical and mental toughness. The students also acknowledge the usefulness of co-curricular activities. For instance, students who had attended the main Scouting Camp at Ghora Gali (a hill station) considered it a useful experience for moral training as well as learning the valuable traits, such as hiking, cooking, tenting, map reading, gadget work, etc. With the advantage of having qualified physical training instructors, the schools formally organize sports teams and participate in the interschool, inter-board, and intercity competitions.

The Elite Schools

The elite school personnel believe their education aims at empowering students according to the latest demands and current market realities of neo-liberalism and globalization. They perceive globalization has created many opportunities but, at the same time, has posed certain new challenges. It has made economic life more competitive and the development of human expertise more significant. The relevant quality education and training has become indispensable to develop a productive and informed global citizenry. Hence, the school personnel perceive it vital to incessantly update and modernize the curricular content and praxis in order to meet new challenges in a rapidly changing world. The following interview excerpt from a principal highlights such kind of mindset:

We must not close our eyes to the current realities where, within the range of political rationales, it is the neoliberal alternative that dominates, and it aims at the deregulation of economy, trade liberalization, and prevalence of the financial sector of economy—therefore, rapidly changing global realities demand for continuous transformation of the education to amicably meet the new challenges, and we are quite mindful in this regard. (personal interview, November 19, 2008).

The elite school personnel articulate that, although the emerging trend of neo-liberalism has made business courses more attractive for the elite class, their education mainly focuses on creating competitive and instrumentally rationale individuals, who can compete and excel not only in the marketplace, but also in any of the department where they would serve in their future
lives. The following three statements further highlight how do elite school personnel perceive the aim of their education:

- Our education aims at nurturing the analytical, imaginative and decision-making qualities of the students;
- We equip our students with skills necessary to face the realities that have emerged from new economic and social world-order;
- Our education aims at preparing the self-reliant individuals, who are creative and capable of demonstrating the original thinking.

Therefore, in comparison to the other two types of schools in this study, the elite school personnel articulate different perspectives regarding their education, which exclusively aims at providing the latest knowledge and developing human capacities of analysis, planning, and decision-making. Hence, these schools provide a different kind of symbolic capital to their students from those of madaris and public schools; this enables them to not only exert control over human capital, as within the labour force, but also over economic capital and the means of production. In fact, preparing a capable leadership has emerged as an unwritten mandate of elite schools since their origin in the subcontinent. Accordingly, to make their schools more efficient and effective, the school personnel perceive the privileging of Western secular knowledge and praxis, ways of knowing, and other educational discourses as an exclusive and legitimate standpoint for teaching and learning, as these approaches have solutions for present-day issues and challenges.

Moreover, while believing in the significance of scientific methods, reflection, and reasoning in current educational discourses, the elite school personnel consider it naïve in the 21st century to exclusively base education on “mysticism,” which is a common practice in madaris and, to some extent, in public schools as well. They argue that mysticism claims to a supernatural means of knowledge, such as revelation and intuition, which are contrary to the evidence of the senses and reason. Therefore, these schools inculcate that the “reality” we perceive is not real; instead, it is merely a reflection or distortion of “true” reality, which is supernatural. Hence, these schools place emphasis, not on this world, but on true reality in their education and inculcate mystical insight into this true reality, such as God and the Quran as the word of God revealed to the
Prophet Muhammad. Conversely, the elite school personnel argue that God Himself has invited the human, through the Quran to reason, reflect, and try to understand the secrets of this universe, the divine laws that govern it, and the saliency of divine messages contained in the Quran. Hence, in the approach to education they inculcate “reason” as a reality and perceive it a faculty that enables students to gain objective knowledge by organizing information gained through senses into concepts. They base reason on the view that reality, for instance the world we live in, is real, absolute, universal, and comprehensible to the human mind. Thus, the elite school education inculcates the legitimacy of reflecting and conducting scientific research to understand nature, the laws of universe, and even the authenticity of the Quranic messages. In this context, the schooling experience of elite school students appears to be quite different from those of madaris, where a blind inculcation of faith-based knowledge is encouraged. However, to some extent, a few teachers in public schools try to relate the Quranic knowledge with science, which will be discussed in Chapter Seven.

**Reproduction of Western Culture and Lifestyles in the Elite Schools**

The elite schools are the sites where Western culture and lifestyles are reproduced, which still appear to constitute the dominant culture in the country. For instance, the faculty members and students have Western appearance, dress, and deportment, which is the basic requirement in elite schools. Even the females (teachers and students) are required to observe Western dress codes and demeanour. It was widely observed that teachers as well as students greet one another in the Western style of “good morning,” “good afternoon,” “bye,” etc. The language of communication within school is English, which still is the language of power in the country. Hence, to exclude the masses, the English speaking elite overwhelmingly professes Urdu as a national language, but to benefit their own children they have institutionalized the process of acquiring English at home and school alike. Moreover, a language cannot be separated from the culture and lifestyles of its origin. The students acknowledge acquiring English language and Western lifestyles from home and, generally, do not find them incongruent from those employed in their schools. The following statement from a student underscores this fact:

I do not see a big difference between the lifestyles at my home and those at my school... nothing is new for me. I learned the same table manners from my parents, when I was very young. We speak English at home and school alike...and... my parents taught me
how to dress up, how to knot the tie and make the right combinations...I started playing piano with my father...I remember...since I used to sit in his lap [laugh]....I learned dancing at the local night club, where my parents would visit on weekends...my friends say that they have similar experiences. (personal interview, November 5, 2008)

Western culture and lifestyles exist as a living reality in nearly every nation that has experienced European imperialism. Pakistan is not an exception. The English colonizers initially established elite schools with the purpose of disseminating Eurocentric knowledge and value systems, which these schools appear to have continued even long after independence.

Moreover, it appears that elite school personnel generally prefer Western ideological discourses. For instance, most respondents reveal secular orientation when they articulate a conviction that religion must not be promulgated as a national system of governance. They perceive that religion is only useful to satisfy emotional and spiritual needs and to lead an upright life and must not transgress its limits to interfere with the collective, especially the political life of the society. Hence, despite an assurance for religious freedom and liberty to perform rituals, the elite schools do not have mosques for collective prayers. Likewise, the faculty members believe in gender respect and equality and perpetuate such discourses in their education and school culture. They consider Western culture as pro-human because it recognizes the values required for proper human survival, such as innovation, scientific enquiry, individualism, human rights, and capitalism. Since capitalism develops insofar as individuals are free to exercise their rights, the school personnel emphasis on providing an atmosphere where agents feel free to think, reason, express, and choose whatever they consider appropriate for themselves.

In elite schools, morning assemblies do not happen every day. Instead, every morning all students go straight to their classes and await the beginning of the school day. During this time the students were often seen idly chatting with friends and classmates and sometimes tossing paper balls at each other, which the teachers usually ignored. However, the students never got out of control and instantly stood up when listening to a call from the office or the national anthem on the school PA system. During the national anthem everyone stands in unison and remains silent. When the anthem ends, students retake their seats and listen to the daily announcements. The principle starts with a greeting (usually “Good morning colleagues and students”) and goes on to read the announcements from different clubs and teachers. These are
important club activities and event reminders as well as administrative duties for which the students are responsible. Sometimes the microphone is passed to a student or teacher who makes an announcement on behalf of a club or classroom. Other times victories (or losses) in sports over other schools are discussed and the athletes are honoured. Mostly, announcements are simple and straightforward. However, on certain occasions students tried to make them colourful. For instance, one memorable skit announced a sports event under the guise of “Hans and Franz” using a fake Eastern European accent. It went like this:

“Hello! I am Hans”
“And I am Franz”
“And we are here to—‘pump you up’—(both Hans and Franz together)
Come join us for the upcoming basketball game where the ‘Bulldogs’ fight the ‘Panthers’ this Friday at 4:30 P.M. in gym ‘B’...hear us now and believe us later...see you there...so long”

The phrases like ‘pump you up’ and “hear us now and believe us later” further highlight the cultural orientation of the elite school students. They are not only quite familiar with the terms used in Western popular culture, but also fully understand how to properly employ them to convey their massages effectively.

**The Students’ Involvement: An Essence of Elite School Culture**

Instead of controlling behaviour through one-sided rules and strict regulations, the elite school personnel consider it more conducive for student’s holistic development if they provide them liberty and involve them in the decision making process. One principal explained, “Our collaborative programs generally encourage students to feel that they belong at school” (personal interview, November 10, 2008). Hence, the school personnel incessantly arrange activities and programs to raise students’ awareness about school processes and working mechanisms. In addition, they invite opinions and suggestions from students and promise to accommodate those that are valid. The student union has the right to negotiate any of the rules that they find inappropriate alongside the administration.

Moreover, both elite schools have various clubs and societies, which are run by the elected boards of students, who make and implement policies and programs with the consultation of
administrators, counsellors, teachers, and fellow students. Some of them include the science club, arts club, music club, and sports and karate club. These valuable platforms offer competitive activities to students related to debating and discussions, creative poetry and essay writing, painting, drama, music, dance, social services, photography, language skills, Maths IQ, science projects, etc. The students are free to participate in the activities of their choosing based on their interests. On many occasions, I observed that students had arranged activities and subsequently invited others for analysis and ideas for improvement. In addition, they mostly took responsibility for their actions. For instance, during this research, I happened to witness the Shakespearian play “Julius Caesar” at one of the elite schools under study. The students had entirely arranged this event. Before the play, they distributed cards among the teachers, students, and general audience to receive their feedback, comments, and suggestions regarding strengths and weaknesses of the presentation. Although, I was amazed by the standards of this classical presentation, adoption of British accent and eloquence in Shakespearian blank verse, and remained unable to pinpoint any weakness, I observed an extensive brainstorm among students about this presentation afterwards.

This kind of engagement develops “dispositions” wherein the students view schooling as essential to their long-term wellbeing. They tend to build good relations with school staff and with other students, and feel that they belong at school. They take ownership of the rules and regulation and reveal a sense of respect and compliance. The students willingly share their ideas and experiences and also to create awareness among their fellow students. For instance, I observed some presentations in which the students attempted to explain some elements of the rules outlined in prospectus of one of the elite schools under study (see Table 5.7). The students used different clubs, societies, and even morning assembly for such presentations. On one occasion, the students explained the activities that fall under verbal or physical assault (rule# 11), the fallouts of smoking, using drugs, or intoxicants on health (rule# 13), and at some other time they elaborated what kind of printed material can be undesirable and why (rule# 14). Such knowledge is useful in creating self-discipline among students.
### Table 0.7: Rules and Regulations as Detailed in an Elite School's Prospectus

#### Partnership with you

Developing a sense of ownership to school is a part of the school philosophy; therefore, for a smooth functioning, following information concerning school rules and regulations is very important for which students’ support is requested:

1. All students are expected to be on time daily. Students who come late are required to report to the teacher on duty;
2. After three un-excused late comings in any one month, students will receive a progressive school intervention to improve punctuality. The consequences include parent conference, afterschool detention, and the child being sent home;
3. If a test or examination is missed because of absence caused by illness, a note from the parent is required stating the reason annexed with medical clearance certificate;
4. It is strongly recommended that students do not bring cell phones, video games or musical gadgets to school. Any emergency call can be made through office. Violation to this will lead to these items being confiscated and kept until the end of school term;
5. The prescribed uniform must be worn to school;
6. Girls are expected to restrict gold earrings to small studs and hair tied up properly. The use of multicoloured hair accessories is prohibited;
7. Boys are expected not to keep long hair or fancy hairstyles.

#### Partnership with you

The following breaches of discipline will lead to be expelled from the school.

8. Using unfair means in examination or tests;
9. Stealing;
10. Indulgence in immoral acts;
11. Rudeness, verbal abuse or physical assault towards staff or any other member of the school community;
12. Keeping or carrying firearms, knives or weapons;
13. Smoking, using drugs or intoxicants;
14. Distributing undesirable printed material/books/magazines;
15. Consistently poor academic performance;
16. Refusal to pay school fees/dues.

*Source: An Elite School within this study*

In sum, the aforesaid analysis emphasizes that the elite school personnel perceive the quality of educational outcomes are best achieved by harnessing students’ motivation through them being involved in the school processes. Thus, the school personnel tend to provide ample opportunities for deep participation, wherein the students are active, taken seriously, listened to, and do work of significance. They are encouraged to exercise participation in a variety of contexts within school, most notably through involvement in formal school governance processes and through student governance and other student-operated organizations. Moreover, the students are
involved in the emancipatory processes of communicative actions where they have voice, which endorses them as participants in and practitioners of education.

**The Significance of Canteens in Elite Schools**

In elite schools, it appeared that canteens were the happy places where young folks could be spotted in groups, marching and chatting in a carefree manner. For many students, the time spent in the canteen was the best part of the days because, in addition to having delicious and healthy food, the physical surroundings were aesthetically appealing, lively, and efficient. The available spaces in the canteens were properly designed for different weather challenges. Semi-covered lawns and terraces were part of the landscape and made up the most sought after spatial choices in the suitable weather. The canteens were supervised by the qualified and skilful staff, who were able to efficiently and properly serve the students. The quality of food items was adequately aboveboard and, as a rule, only the well-known brand of articles was put on sale. Maintenance of health and hygiene standards in the canteen management was considered a crucial issue. Therefore, this process started with the staff, who had to pass through a process of regular fitness screening by a qualified doctor. The packed and fresh food articles were served in disposable containers. Not surprisingly, the table manners used in the canteens were predominantly Western. Moreover, teachers and students were seen sharing tables and frankly chatting with one another. Sometimes they also shared food, which endorsed a happy relationship in which nobody liked to exert his or her authority. Notably, nobody overstayed in the canteen. The students rushed towards classes soon after finishing their food to accomplish the academic assignments, which seemed to be most important to them.

**The Importance of Physical Nurturing in Elite Schools**

The elite school personnel believe in the holistic nature of education and tend to provide ample facilities not only for cognitive development of the students, but also for their physical nurturing. Both schools under study have separate physical education departments that not only supervise school health facilities (such as fitness rooms, sports rooms, playground courts, and swimming pools) but also plan, conduct, and monitor sports events throughout the year. The fitness rooms are well equipped and sports rooms as well as playgrounds have many courts to provide various choices to the students. The sports gained immense popularity equally with both boys and girls
who can be seen involved in these games almost every school day. The students are trained by professional coaches, who help them discover their interests and abilities for a particular game. The school personnel deem sports vital for student’s all-round development. One coach explained, “Our sports training programs are designed to develop qualities of leadership, contest, sportsmanship, and also make our students tough to take up challenges” (informal conversation, October 11, 2008). In order to give a healthy exposure to their students both schools annually arrange different national and international sports events, in which they invite students from across a range of countries to participate. The atmosphere of fierce competition in such events also promotes a relationship of friendship among athletes, who, obviously, come from different cultures and nationalities. Both elite schools also send their athletes and sports teams to other countries for friendly matches and annual competitions. Furthermore, students recurrently participate in outdoor activities arranged by the Adventure Foundation, which is an organization of international standing and reputation. Its activities range from introducing students to nature study in secure weekend camps to rock climbing, skiing, camping, and expeditions to organizing exchange visits with schools abroad.

**Chapter Summary**

My study underscores that the three types of schools under study constitute divergent fields of education, because they provide different standards of physical and academic facilities, have incompatible faculty, reveal dissimilar relative autonomy, have different kinds of school cultures, and their school personnel articulate different perspectives about students’ education. Hence, these schools portray a picture of the highly stratified nature of education system in Pakistan, in which students can have potentially different kinds of schooling experience from one another. The madaris and elite schools provide outstanding physical and academic facilities and a well-educated faculty to their students, who have the advantage of receiving individual attention from their teachers. Both types of schools also arrange visiting professors and scholars to impart knowledge about advanced topics, which supplements their students’ usual classroom learning. In comparison, the public schools show an obvious scarcity in the provision of essential physical and academic resources to their students. Considering the number of enrolled students, their faculty resources are greatly deficient. Consequently, the teachers mostly have to teach
reasonably large classes, where providing individual attention to the students is almost impossible.

Moreover, these three types of schools also employ different teachers’ professional development strategies and programs. The madaris, contrary to public and elite schools, do not have formal teachers’ professional development system and, thus, rely heavily on informal and experiential learning of the teachers. The scholars associated with madaris value mentoring and tend to pass on their pedagogical experiences to new and existing teachers through debates and discussions, one-to-one meetings, and scholarly seminars. However, most faculty development practices are intended to reproduce Muslim understandings, pedagogical traditions, and rich, sophisticated, and diverse scholarly discussions in the Islamic literature about educational theory and praxis. Conversely, the public school teachers are trained in the educational concepts of the medieval Muslim thinkers as well as modern/secular pedagogical techniques, and are quite capable to use these diverse didactic methods in their classrooms. However, many factors impede their efforts to transform the traditional classroom culture in accordance with the latest pedagogical paradigms. In comparison, the professional development practices in elite schools are meant to develop expertise within students, keeping in view the strengths of education systems in the advanced Western countries, and to develop a human capital capable of meeting the challenges of modern age. The school personnel articulate more faith in Eurocentric knowledge and modern teaching theories and praxis that have been developed in the West. Moreover, in this study only madaris and elite schools have gender-mixed faculty. However, strict gender seclusion in madaris rules out an open dialogue within faculty and limits the scope of a collegial faculty effort to uplift academic standards. Conversely, the elite school personnel tend to move beyond gender stereotypic perspectives and, as a strategy, use open encounters between male and female teachers to create a more collegial environment within their faculty. They believe that including opinions and suggestions from both male and female teachers in a free and welcoming environment is vital for promoting the standards of the institution.

These three types of schools reveal relative autonomy, but in varying degrees and statures. My study suggests that financial self-reliance due to non-state sources of funding, patronage from wealthy allies, and protection from the ruling class appears to be the key factor in the
independence from the government machinery of madaris and elite schools. However, the madaris personnel face restrictions from the board of governors and/or owners in how they allocate personnel and resources, the nature of human capital they can employ, and the amount of teacher compensation they can provide. In contrast, the elite school personnel have more authority over resource decisions, making efficient and effective policies to use their human/material resources to better meet their pupil needs. In general, the madaris and elite schools use their autonomous status to develop a distinct status culture, make and implement their own policies, recruit their leadership from within their own ranks, and develop an organizational pattern that is more of a historical continuity and stability than change. However, the focus of madaris policies is generally the reproduction of the traditional Islamic-centered scholastic capital, and resisting the hegemony of Western secular knowledge. They tend to provide a significant cultural alternative and an intellectual mode to the citizens, which is an unwritten mandate of madaris since their inception. Conversely, the focus of elite school policies appears to reproduce modern Eurocentric scholastic capital and the Western ways of knowing as an exclusive vantage point for teaching and learning.

Moreover, through the ceiling fees and other expenses in elite schools serve as a "control mechanism" which ensures an inclusion of upper forms and an exclusion of lower forms from these unique educational institutions. Besides, the ruling elites use their authority to safeguard this separate schooling system as it ensures the reproduction of their own power and privilege to the next generations. The public schools, on the other hand, reveal less autonomy and more interaction with the government, where the senior bureaucrats carry out the educational planning and policy-making and the school personnel only ensure their implementation in true letter and spirit. This has aggravated their feeling of a lack of professional freedom and diluted their feelings of ownership, professional commitment, and motivation to work hard. Moreover, underfunding from the government and an excessive political involvement in almost every aspect of the schools has contributed to the poor performance of the public schools. Hence, they are gradually falling short in competitions with other types of schools, especially the re-emergent non-elite private English-medium schools.
These three types of schools also reveal divergent, and profoundly incompatible, kinds of culture that are greatly influenced by the school personnel’s core beliefs about education and students’ training. For instance, the madaris personnel generally view education from faith-centered perspective and provide a culturally congruent environment that helps students to inculcate Islamic beliefs, values, and lifestyles. The public school personnel believe in integrating Islamic epistemology into the corpus of modern/secular knowledge and find this essential for the personal development of their students in the modern age. Therefore, these schools also reveal a heterogeneous cultural model, for instance, a combination of both Western and Islamic lifestyles. However, a conflict is evident within their faculty between the proponents of these apparently contrasting cultural paradigms. Conversely, the elite school personnel predominantly believe in Western progressive education and, therefore, tend to create a culturally congruent environment, which exclusively aims at the reproduction of Eurocentric lifestyles.

In madaris and public schools, the overall atmosphere is discipline-oriented and regimented and students’ daily routine appears to be overtly mechanical. These schools do not reveal any activity or program specifically designed to raise the students’ awareness about school mechanisms or encourage them to participate in the decision-making strategies. Instead, the school personnel demand obedience from students whether it may be the domain of relationships or their rules and regulations. In relationships, the teachers mostly demand respect and misinterpret it as a trait according to which the students behave as followers and accept all of their opinions and suggestions (even those that are unwarranted) without questioning or challenging. In addition to the customary practices, both kinds of schools have created many rules to regulate students’ behaviour, etiquettes, social relations, appearance, dress, etc. On breaching these rules and regulations, the students are afflicted with physical punishment, which the teachers mostly justify through alternative interpretations of selective citations of holy verses. However, public school students’ practices underscore that they are developing an ability to resist or protest against any kind of exploitation. In contrast, the elite schools do not reveal tendency to control students’ behaviour through one-sided rules and strict regulations. Instead, they involve students in a variety of contexts within school, most notably in formal school governance processes, student governance, and other student-operated organizations. Hence, the students view their schooling as essential to their long-term wellbeing. They tend to build good relations with school staff and
with other students, and feel that they belong at school. To conclude, it appears that these three types of schools provide a different kind of *symbolic capital* to their students, in which elite school students have an advantageous position because they are being equipped with qualities that, in their future roles, would enable them to exert control over human capital, physical capital, and the means of production. This theme will further unfold in the following data chapters.
CHAPTER SIX: THE CAPITAL (MONETARY AND NON-MONETARY FORMS)

This chapter presents an analysis to understand total volume and composition of monetary and non-monetary forms of capital that students bring into the educational fields of the different types of schools under study. The discussion about economic capital, which includes students’ family income and their parents’ professional standing, will lead to determining how agents’ from different social backgrounds are at a advantage or disadvantage in accessing available educational opportunities. Likewise, the analysis of cultural and social capitals will help to understand social class trajectories in Pakistan with regards to Bourdieu’s proposed model. However, as mentioned before, in this thesis I have not employed a rigid approach to make presumed postulates and guide the analysis to achieve some predetermined conclusions. Instead, although my framework does provide basic principles and epistemic boundaries, it also allows conceptual constructs to develop through the process of analysis from the empirical findings. Therefore, if my data analysis does not entirely confirm with Bourdieu’s original standpoint in certain places, the purpose should be considered only as a humble effort to inform or refine his concepts.

Economic Capital: A Comparative Analysis

As discussed before, Bourdieu’s theoretical analysis encompasses four fundamental forms of capital: economic, cultural, social, and symbolic, which he considers to be the main sources of social advantages as well as social class differentiation. Disagreements have, nonetheless, emerged over which one of these capitals play a more significant or causal role in the process of generating inequality and disadvantage or in what combination this causal role occurs. However, Bourdieu (1986) himself placed economic capital at the root of other capitals (p. 125). This standpoint has emphasized a fundamental position for economic capital, which enables individuals to mobilize their resources to participate in high-culture or develop beneficial social acquaintances, etc. Hence, keeping in view the significance of economic capital, I have attempted to achieve a deep-seated understanding of students’ family income and, at certain places, also included parents’ professional standings in my analysis.
My study emphasises that the education system of Pakistan is overtly stratified along social and economic lines. In essence, it is a system that tells new generations within the country that, while all children are born equal in the eyes of God, some will be treated better than others by their education system. Hence, in this apparently apartheid schooling system the elite schools exclusively admit students from privileged backgrounds to the detriment or exclusion of other children from dominated classes, no matter how talented they are. This is not a shock or surprise in the context of Pakistan, where such schools were initially designed for this particular purpose. But the extent to which they have sustained this task is worth further examination. Figure 6.1 demonstrates a comparison of the students’ survey results and clearly specifies that students’ world is highly bourgeois.

**Figure 0.1: Family Income of Students in a Comparative Perspective as per Survey Study**

![Family Income Chart](attachment:image.png)

**Note:** Public Schools (N=51) as three students failed to fill in the column for the family income.  
2) Islamic Madrassah (N=48) as two students failed to fill in the column for the family income.  
3) Elite-English-medium Schools (N=47).
It is worth mentioning that if in my study, the income level digits of different socioeconomic groups vary slightly from those of Rahman (2004), presented in table 0.8, on page 40 of this thesis, the major reason is the growth in per capita income which increased from $586 in 2006 to $925 in 2007 (Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2007-08). Yet, during the same period, the country has also witnessed a drastic increase in inflation from 3.1% in the 2003-04 fiscal year (Government of Pakistan, 2005) to 22.3% in 2007-08 (Government of Pakistan, 2008b), which neutralized the benefits of this slight increase in wages to mitigate the economic destitute of the working classes.

Figure 6.1 indicates that about 77% of elite school students have a monthly family income of more than 300,000 rupees at the time of this study. However, the school personnel explain that some parents’ monthly income falls in range of millions of rupees. To obtain a precise picture of the students’ family economic capital, I triangulated their perspectives with those of their parents and the school personnel as well as the data contained in the parents’ performa in this regard. The ultimate information from all these sources corroborates that in Pakistan, elite schools are not so much engines of social justice as bastions of privilege even after six decades of political independence. The survey results, analysis of parent’s profiles, and my respondents’ ethnographies explicate that the professional standing of parents of students from elite schools are mostly landlords of large-scale properties, industrialists, owners of trade and business firms (e.g. import-export/construction), top executives in public or private business enterprises (e.g. chairman/vice-chairman), high-ranking professionals (e.g. doctors, engineers, chartered accountants, etc.) and senior bureaucrats. As discussed in Chapter Two, most of these elite groups have disproportionate shares of political and economic power since the colonial period, which they seem to have sustained over the years. Paradoxically, these elite groups are so indifferent that, in the midst of widespread poverty, they use their power to make policies to mainly enhance their own privilege. For instance, my respondents explained that landlords of large properties are so powerful that they veto any legislation for land reforms or that would result in the taxation of their agricultural income. Instead, they force the government to legalize subsidies on purchasing of seeds, fertilizers, tractors, etc. and grant rebates on agricultural products and their exports.
Likewise, the ruling elites pressure the banks and other lending agencies to receive loans to start new businesses and subsequently make legislations to completely write them off. This practice has been repeated continually since independence. The parents’ profiles also revealed that civil and military bureaucrats draw monthly salaries according to special pay scales and enjoy fringe benefits, such as almost free family accommodations with luxury amenities; free petrol and the government-maintained expensive vehicles with government-paid drivers; travelling and daily allowances; and retirement benefits including pension, gratuity, provident fund, and group insurance, etc. On retirement, bureaucrats are also awarded large plots of agricultural land, expensive commercial and residential plots in expensive areas, and newly built family houses with remarkably subsidized rates, which ensures the continuation of their economically privileged status. Accordingly, these families have enough physical capital to pay extremely high tuition fees to procure quality education in elite schools, participate in high-culture, maintain luxurious lifestyles (such as travelling in expensive cars, dinning out, purchasing pricey dresses, etc.), and develop rewarding social networks through holding parties and exchanging expensive gifts.

The elite school parents not only defend the existence of this parallel schooling system, but also articulate a determination to ensure its continuation. They argue that Pakistan is not the only country that has elite schooling; they are almost everywhere, even in advanced Western countries. They disagree with the popular view that elite schools generally produce “Brown Sahibs,” and argue that their existence is crucial as, over the years, they have been serving the country by providing the capable human capital. One elite parent explained, “such schools are indispensible as they produce some better type of professionals who would be more suitably disciplined and equipped for eventually taking up the challenges of executive positions” (personal interview, November 7, 2008). This is a paradoxical plea in a country where, as discussed in a previous chapter, the National Constitution assures that all citizens will be treated equal and seven different National Education Policies recommended for an egalitarian education system in the country. However, it is a relationship of mutual gains where both parties (the ruling class and elite schools) benefit from each other; the ruling class openly patronize these schools.

15 Brown Sahib is a popular term used in Pakistani politics and academic literature to represent natives who imitate Western and typically English lifestyles.
the elite schools also do everything in their power to admit their children. For instance, if they remain unable to get enrolled due to relatively low grades or prior poor academic performance, the elite schools take them through “back channels” which include: relaxation of admission rules, increasing the vacancies, or keeping the admission criteria low, etc. Some of the elite school participants in this study clarified that every year a significant number of students get admission due to some sort of “extra support” from their influential parents and the influence of rich alumni members who bequeath generous amounts towards school funds. Likewise, one respondent informed me that last year the daughter of a provincial minister had to be awarded admission despite of the fact that she had missed the deadline by almost two months. In sum, it appears that the privileged classes have completely monopolized the elite schools.

Conversely, it appears that the clientele of public schools and madaris generally belong to the poor, underclass, and underprivileged segments of the society. For instance, in both types of schools, a large majority of students fall in per month family income cohorts of less than 10,000 rupees every month. More specifically, about 28% of the students from public schools and 42% of the students from madaris declared having family income of less than 5,000 rupees every month. Likewise, about 37% of the students from public schools and 33% of the students from madaris indicated their monthly family income was between 5,000 to 10,000 rupees. Therefore, it appears that most families who educate their children in these two types of schools live on a subsistence level and an income of less than one dollar a day. The survey results and an analysis of parent’s profiles indicate that about 50% of parents in public schools and around 55% of parents in madaris are skilled, semi-skilled, unskilled workers, and agricultural labourers. However, in both kinds of schools a small percentage of parents also belong to the professional category of lower-middle class. For instance, about 20% of parents in public schools have professions of junior clerks, police constables, medical lab technicians, and junior teachers and about 16% are small-scale shopkeepers, etc. Likewise, approximately 10% of parents in madaris are small-scale farmers and about 18% work as imams. However, on my query, the public school personnel clarified that, in most cases, small-scale shopkeepers owned small-sized stationery stores or tea stalls or worked as utility vendors and hawkers. Likewise, the madaris personnel explained that in most cases small-scale farmers owned less than ten acres of agricultural land, which could generate an income barely sufficient to survive. Similarly, there is a minor
difference between the monthly income range of lower middle class and working class parents, which emphasizes a complex social class trajectory in Pakistan. For instance, the typical monthly income of a skilled factory worker was 6,000 rupees at the time of this study, whereas an imam was making between 3,000 to 5,000 rupees, largely depending on the size and location of the mosque. Likewise, the typical monthly incomes of a junior teacher and a junior cleric were between 8,000 to 10,000 rupees. Consequently, most working and lower-middle class parents had to either work overtime or do another job to make ends meet. For instance, the junior clerk had to prepare income tax returns (for an income tax lawyer) for meagre financial rewards; the junior teacher did private tutoring; the medical laboratory technician also worked at a private clinic in the afterhours; and the factory worker had to do overtime for additional income, etc. Box 6.1 presents an example of the diversified earning activities that a participant imam had to do for his survival. It also highlights the economic plight of underprivileged classes in Pakistan.

**Box 0.1: Diversified Earning Activities of an Imam**

1- The main job of the participant imam would earn him only rupees 3,000 as salary every month.
2- In the evenings he would visit the houses of well-off families to teach the basics of religion and the holy Quran to their children, for which he charged 500 rupees per student every month.
3- He also performed religious rituals, such as marriage contracts, supplications on food, funerals, etc. and charged according to the nature of such rituals, which ranged from 50 to 500 rupees.
4- Occasionally, some patients with superstitious orientations visited him in the hope of spiritual treatment for their serious ailments, such as diabetes, paralysis, epilepsy, etc., which they believed could be cured by his spirituality, blessings, and different kinds of religious charms, etc. He would charge such patients according to the seriousness of their disease. However, the participant clarified that these patients are mostly very poor and unable to pay. Hence, he does not refuse anybody for the spiritual treatment as it is rewarding in the hereafter.
5- Occasionally, he would perform exorcism, by reciting the verses from the Quran, in order to extract evil spirits or lift the influences of the black magic from victims, who visited him for this purpose. He requested 500 rupees for such cases. However, the participant says such occasions are far and few in between.

Consequently, financial destitution forces madaris and public school students to look for assistance from their respective schools. The madaris students have the advantage of getting total
financial support from the school for education, as well as for their personal upkeep. Conversely, a large number of public school students remain unable to secure any kind of support from their schools, mainly because of insufficient funds. The head teachers of both public schools explain that every year they receive an abundance of applications from the students for financial aid to purchase uniforms, stationary, and pay registration and examination fees of the Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE), in order to become eligible to write the final examination. At the time of this research study, the registration and examination fees of BISE were 400 and 700 rupees, respectively. However, due to inadequate grants, the government had made a legislation to award financial assistance to only 10 percent of the total enrolment. Therefore, the head teachers had to pick the most deserving students, which was not an easy task as most students had almost identical levels of impoverishment. Hence, to screen out a list of applicants, the head teachers also considered the candidate’s academic grades, level of class participation, overall conduct, etc. The students who remained unable to receive the financial help from their schools eventually depended on extended family support for education and living.

Most importantly, the analysis of students’ family economic capital indicates that most families that earn between 20,000 to 200,000 rupees every month have not enrolled their children in public schools. This is the typical family income of middle, upper-middle, and lower upper classes in Pakistan (Rahman, 2004). This fact supports my public school respondents’ earlier claim, discussed in Chapter 5, that the middle class students have gradually left the public schools and their enrolment is decreasing at a rate of 10-15% every year. This appears to be a major shift in the educational scenario of the country, which needs further empirical investigation. However, my public school participants provide an initial understanding that the “non-elite” private English-medium schools have significantly attracted middle and upper-middle class families mainly because they promise English as the medium of instruction, teach the latest curricula mostly adopted from Western advanced countries, provide better academic and physical facilities, and their autonomous status empowers them to make and implement their own policies. However, these private schools have many categories and provide educational standards in accordance with parents’ purchasing powers. This has blatantly made education into a commodity that can be bought and sold. Hence, the quality of schooling has become more
inaccessible for poor and working-class children. The public school participants in this study conclude this as another poignant example of educational apartheid in Pakistan. They perceive it a system that, true to its original design, reproduces two distinct sets of citizens—the future rulers and the future subjects.

**Cultural Capital: A Comparative Analysis**

To map participants’ cultural capital in the three types of schools under study, my analysis has encompassed the following components of this theoretical discourse; participants’ learning beyond formal schooling, parent’s ability to choose the most suitable school, parents’ practical involvement in their children’s schooling, and students’ study habits and the types of television programs watched. In addition, to support my analysis, I also have included a discussion about parents’ formal schooling; the nature of educational resources that students of different types of schools possess at home; and their tastes, lifestyles, and deportment. These components have been utilized by researchers to understand cultural capital in different settings (for instance see: Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990; Carter, 2003; Davies & Guppy, 1997; DiMaggio, 1982; Farkas et al, 1990; Livingstone and Sawchuk, 1999; Roscigno & Ainsworth-Darnell, 1999; and Sullivan, 1999). However, my analysis of cultural capital has two salient attributes. First, it has filled in certain obvious gaps in the previous research studies. For instance, Dumais (2002) has pointed out that most of previously conducted research on cultural capital and schooling has not addressed differences that may exist between schools. Schools in rural regions or poor districts may not have the same access to cultural resources as schools in other areas (Dumais, 2002, p. 50). Hence, this study has included three different types of schools to comparatively understand the nature of their students’ cultural capital and how it affects their schooling experience.

Second, my findings support the eminent scholars who point towards a perceived limitation in Bourdieu’s’ analysis of cultural capital in that he does not provide sufficient insight of the creative cultural practices, independent education and learning, and the collective cultural agency of the organised working-classes (Curtis, Livingstone and Smaller 1992; Livingstone, 1999). The main reason for this oversight appears to be the fact that Bourdieu had been preoccupied with delineating the cultural reproduction of inequality within fixed institutional forms. Thus, his accounts largely remained one-dimensional and functionalist descriptions of the status quo rather
than real explanations of it (Livingstone and Sawchuk, 1999). Therefore, the part of my analysis that elaborates on participants’ learning beyond formal schooling, further adds an emphasis to the arguments that, as adult learners beyond schooling, working class people are at least as active as those in the affluent classes and that the collective capacity for creative cultural production and critical learning is alive and well in the organized core of the working classes (Livingstone and Sawchuk, 1999). In addition, I argue that independent education and learning activities of working class agents foster their self-perception and, hence, dispositions of resistance against perceived economic exploitation. My working class participants’ narratives incessantly articulate a sense of rejection and aversion to pass on their misfortune to the next generations. Conversely, they articulate optimism in their planning to give better life opportunities to their children than they had themselves. They also recognize the difference that education can make in this regard. Therefore, their cultural capital is indicated through having an adequate knowhow about the national education system, mainly achieved through informal means, and making appropriate plans to educate their children from the available opportunities.

**Working Class Participants’ Learning beyond Schooling**

The analysis in this study regarding the working class participants’ learning beyond formal schooling mainly attempts to understand the nature of their “non-formal or further education, informal training, and self-directed or tacit informal learning” (Livingstone, 2001, p. 142). I have included evidence of relevant learning at the workplace, through involvement in religio-political domains, and through general interest and hobby activities. Livingstone (1999) argues that learning is a dynamic, inherently social process that cannot be isolated from the rest of social life in any simple way. Also, by virtually every measure, people are now spending more time acquiring knowledge than ever before in the history of our continually learning species. Hence, the escalation of numerous knowledge disseminating channels, such as electronic and print media, Internet, public libraries, trade union and political platforms, have increased opportunities for individuals to broaden their awareness. However, my study emphasizes that access to expensive electronic resources (e.g. computer, Internet, software) and quality structured employment-related courses (e.g. formal education) differ along hierarchal lines. Affluent classes (e.g. directors and managers) are more likely to access them easily. However, non-formal and unstructured informal training activities, such as asking questions from mentors, initiating debate
with coworkers, learning by watching and doing, and other similar kinds of self-directed and
tacit learning activities are more egalitarian and readily available across social classes.
Accordingly, the following narratives not only highlight many significant dimensions of the
working class informal adult learning, but also support the argument that these agents are as
active learners as the affluent and highly schooled classes.

The first narrative illustrates a working class agent’s learning advancements within work-related,
general interest, and religio-political domains. It also endorses that powerful learning instances
do exist in non-pedagogical modes of social interactions and evidently outside the conventional
schooling models. The participant is a 40-year-old male, gas station attendant, who had to quit
formal schooling immediately after high-school graduation, because his father died and no one
else was ready to financially support him. The realities of life compelled the participant to find
an employment and assist his elder brother in supporting an extended family of twelve. It was
not easy to find an appropriate job without connections in a highly saturated labour market.
Hence, at first, he had to work on daily waged basis, and sometimes on temporary contracts as
well. Finally, he could find a job at a gas station, which provided him with breathing space. He
started his job with a scanty pre-service training with a mentor, as structured non-formal training
was not available, and subsequently learned the complexities of the job with experience and day-
to-day activities. With the help of his coworkers and through learning by watching and doing and
dealings with the customers, the participant eventually gained essential knowhow of related
finances, language, and interpersonal skills (e.g. dealing effectively with difficult, demanding,
and unruly customers). While recollecting his memories the participant said, “[Initially] I would
become anxious while handling some difficult clients, but now with experience, I am confident
to tackle any kind of situation, no matter how challenging it might be” (personal interview,
November 1, 2008).

This kind of self-esteem and social knowhow, which this participant has achieved through
extensive everyday activities, are significant markers of his cultural capital. In addition, he had a
strong craving to achieve as much faith-centered knowledge as was possible for him. This thrust
was created in his mind and heart initially in his home/family setting, where, through various
daily interrelationships, his parents/elders inducted him to Islamic social and cultural life and
instilled an awareness of what his religion primarily required from him. The family had spiritual orientations and belonged to lively Sufi (mystic) traditions.

This initial faith-based training was subsequently strengthened by a teacher of Islamic studies at school, whom this participant greatly credited for his “lifelong” pursuits of Islamic religio-political awareness. The teacher effectively disseminated Islamic concepts of education, wherein it is a religious obligation for every Muslim man and woman to seek knowledge from cradle to grave. The teacher also illustrated certain selected hadith (the Prophets’ sayings) to underscore the importance of ilm (knowledge) and urged his students to critically analyse the current social and political issues in the light of Islamic teachings. Some of the initial questions that were raised during the everyday classwork haunted the participants’ mind in the subsequent years. For instance: why are significant number of contemporary Muslims not dedicated towards acquiring ilm, even if it is a divine decree for all of them? Why have they not committed to the “straight path,” which Allah had assigned for them? Are these the main reasons for their plight and oppression in the modern age, or is something else? Such kinds of questions urged the participant to make a promise to Allah, the Prophet, and to himself to devote his life to acquiring and disseminating Islamic knowledge to his fellow Muslims. Hence, subsequent to realizing his religious obligations, the participant started an informal academic journey based on learning the correct recitation of the Quran in Arabic with the help of a local imam. After completing the recitation and memorization of certain selected parts of the text, the participant’s quest for further Islamic knowledge directed him to explore ways of having a precise understanding of the complex concepts contained in the Quranic verses. He organized his informal academic activities in two domains. First, he started to attend a series of erudite lectures of a renowned Islamic scholar, who would explain the Quranic verses to the general audience free of cost. In addition, he regularly attended the religious sermons, lectures, symposiums, Manazras (religious debate), and workshops arranged at different religious platforms. Second, his passion for learning guided him to frequently visit public libraries and choose relevant books. Hence, he read some
outstanding volumes of religious knowledge, such as, *Tafhim al-Quran*\(^{16}\), *Seerat-ul-Nabi*\(^{17}\), *Sahih Muslim, Sahih Al-Bukhari*\(^{18}\), *The Rubayyat of Omar Khayyam*, etc.

These classical books contain elevated knowledge and discussions and are generally taught at the higher-levels in madaris. Therefore, initially the participant had difficulty understanding these books through independent reading. He had to seek help from educated friends, the local imam, and religious scholars. However, his motivation, patience, and hard work eventually helped him understand these books and also achieve a deep-seated knowledge of Islam as a religion and the precise application of its teachings in the personal as well as social life. Hence, at the time of this study, the participant was actively involved in delivering Friday sermons to share his religious awareness with the general audience. This part-time assignment also provided him with certain financial benefits, which he was saving with a plan to rent a place and start his own academy, where he could deliver “real” Islam to the youth. The participant perceived that many contemporary madaris have blended their education with misinterpretations and were disseminating narrow-minded and one-sided sectarian ideologies. He explained his disenchantment with formal education in madaris as follows:

> It is generally discussed in media, and scholars also endorse, that our madrassahs teach the sectarian interpretations of Islam and make their students intolerant, which is evident in the level of sectarian violence that we have every year. Besides, the wrongful dissemination of ‘Jihad’ has also earned bad name for Islam and Muslims in general...In addition, our madrassahs have badly failed to exert an effective role, nationally as well as globally, to wipe out the notoriety that had been afflicted on our religion...I think it is the right time to teach our youth the ‘real’ Islam, which must be free from misinterpretations and distortions... (personal interview, November 3, 2008)

Thus, the participant understands that the message of Islam has been distorted and misunderstood in current geo-political life. This message is increasingly being viewed in a negative light and has reached the point where people are not sure of what the religion actually stands for. Moreover, the disappointment with madaris education, their ineffective role in defending Islam, and a passion to disseminate “true” Islamic messages, free from distortions and sectarian

---

\(^{16}\) The Quranic commentary written by a famous Islamic scholar Sayyid Abul Ala Maududi. It has five volumes.

\(^{17}\) This book also has five volumes, written by a renowned Islamic scholar Shibli Nomani, and contains a detailed account of the life of Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him).

\(^{18}\) Both *Sahih Muslim* and *Sahih Al-Bukhari* are famous books of Hadith.
[mis]interpretations, underscore the striking features of this participant’s analytic capabilities. Moreover, the ethnographic interaction with the participant also demonstrated his awareness of the global issues and a concern to devise fresh solutions to contemporary problems in the light of the Quran and Sunnah. He perceives:

   Weaker religious faith among Muslims, lack of Islamic form of governments in Muslim majority countries, low literacy rates, unequal distribution of material resources and division of Muslims on the basis of nationalities and sects are the leading challenges of Muslim ummah in the current era. (informal conversation, November 3, 2008).

He argues that a great deal of changes have become apparent in the realms of economics, science, and global politics. Yet, the old books of Islamic fiqha (jurisprudence) do not provide precise guidelines about current issues, such as the banking system, IMF, how to manage inflation, capitalism, communism, and sales tax. Hence, it has become inevitable to reassess the leading issues of Muslim ummah, evaluate the depth and dimensions of each crisis, and put forth solutions to current issues while initiating the methodology of Ijtihad19 and maintaining centrality of the Quranic precepts.

To conclude, I would like to mention that a passion for Islamic knowledge is not uncommon within the Muslim majority population of Pakistan. The efforts for independent learning; which this participant had done to achieve a high level of understanding Islam as a religion, culture, and lifestyle; are very creditable. His multiple year struggle to understand the meaning of certain questions, which his teacher had posed for him and a conviction to raise similar questions for the youth to get them involved in acquiring and disseminating faith-based knowledge, suggests that working class agents are also active in the creation of knowledge.

The next two narratives illustrate the informal learning instances in the workplace, including both self-directed, tacit learning and informal training by mentors, which appears to be highly relevant to the workers’ needs and job-related demands. These instances also suggest that working class agents are currently engaged in substantial ongoing informal learning and acquiring a broad range of knowledge and skills, which provides them with valuable wisdom to

---

19 Ijtihad is a technical term of Islamic law that describes the process of making a legal decision by independent interpretation of the legal sources, the Quran, and the Sunnah.
effectively handle daily social, economic, and employment-related issues. The first participant is a 43-year-old male and presently working as a plumber. He had to quit school at Grade 8 due to the family’s financial situation and instead volunteered as a helper to an experienced and self-employed plumber. His aim was to learn the profession and subsequently make it his livelihood. This training-led learning continued for over two years, in which the mentor imparted job-related knowledge and skills as well as some basic accounting and bookkeeping skills. Afterwards, the participant acquired social skills, correct mannerism, and appropriate dealing with costumers through independent efforts and trial and error methods. The participant explained that with day after day job-related activities he learned that displaying refined manners, pleasant and welcoming attitude, and courteous language always helps to win over customers. The participant demonstrated his workplace learning of social skills as follows:

Every client has a different personality, so to begin with it is important to understand him as well as his needs. It always helps to develop a relationship of mutual trust...my experiences have taught me that if a customer is satisfied, he would refer many more to me. (personal interview, November 23, 2007)

Therefore, it appears that workers learn and expand their expertise almost every day while engaged in job-related responsibilities. They are also quite mindful of current developments and innovations in their profession. This respondent explains that plumbing has now involved many new technologies and equipment, which require a continuous updating of knowledge. For instance, the latest gadgets are mostly sensor-operated because people would prefer not to touch handles and surfaces in washrooms, new storage tank water heaters are hybrid, and the latest cooling/heating appliances operate on solar energy. Similarly, more efficient tabs, toilets, and showers are being inducted almost every day. These facts have made it inevitable to continuously learn and modernize skills. Hence, due to non-availability of relevant structured formal courses in the afterhours, the participant mostly learns new technologies through instruction manuals and learning modules that come with the products, other relevant self-reading materials, internet resources, and through discussions with coworkers and senior colleagues. The participant perceives that discussion with colleagues is one of the most effective channel “to learn new skills, exchange awareness and share expertise” (personal interview, December 2, 2007). The participant further argues that, in the current age, plumbers must be aware of customers’ various aesthetic preferences. Most customers now require appropriate
matching or contrast with their washroom or kitchen color schemes and select the most suitable gadgets from a wide range of available options, which obviously have different designs and colors. The participant learned the art of aligning his work with customers’ aesthetic requirements through extensive discussions with them and through a method of trial and error, which is laborious and time consuming as, sometimes, all of the gadgets are to be replaced. Therefore, to conclude, I argue that while, for some reason, skill formation, which can be work-led, informal training-led, or acquired through tacit informal ways (such as, observing or trial and error) could not find place in Bourdieu’s analysis, it is out there as an irrefutable reality in the field of workplace.

This next participant, a 34-years old skilled factory worker, argues his workplace training was more beneficial for him as compared to his formal schooling. His education until secondary school was irrelevant to his job needs. After being hired, he had to pass through a difficult three-month probation period, in which different supervisors trained him to operate the production machinery, properly handle tools, basic repairs, and maintenance. The participant explained that some supervisors had tough standards and would never compromise. They required every recruited worker to follow their procedures precisely. However, he liked the supervisors who had a more democratic orientation and encouraged questioning and discussions. This helped him gain an in-depth understanding of structured learning modules. During the probation period, the mentors continuously monitored every worker’s efficiency, use of proper skills and procedures, and, if they found anything lacking in a worker’s professional conduct, they would attach him to a new supervisor for further training. However, with multiple years of experience and workplace learning, the participant is now critical of initial workers’ training programs and refers to its many loopholes:

Initial workers’ training programs give sufficient knowledge about mechanics and procedures to operate machinery...but they give no insight about workplace politics, social skills, team-work, and communication skills, which, I believe, are as important aspects of workplace expertise as the learning of mechanics... (personal interview, April 8, 2009)

This kind of analysis emphasizes that the work place is as effective of a site for learning and creation of knowledge as any of the formally organised extensive educational programs. Besides,
knowledge economy is much wider and deeper than many product and profit-centered training programs would otherwise suggest. Hence, to fill in certain gaps in initial training programs, the participant had to employ many informal and formal learning activities. For instance, through everyday socialization and observation of the methods of relatively experienced colleagues and immediate coworkers, the participant learned workplace politics, proper demeanour, communication skills, and workplace ethics. To learn occupational health and safety, workers’ responsibilities, rights and benefits, the participant largely relied on self-reading materials, which he obtained from the Ministry of Labour and Manpower and labour union offices. However, to learn First-Aid and principles of “quality control,” the participant took formal courses in after work hours.

At the time of this study, with a desire of becoming a supervisor, the participant had applied for a company-sponsored management course. However, he explained that quality management courses are not easily accessible for workers and low-ranked officials, because these courses are usually distributed among top-managers. Likewise, senior officials have complete monopoly over company-sponsored computer/Internet learning resources and software. For their professional development, the company provides senior officials with both the authority and capital to purchase any kind of software or enrol themselves in the latest formal computer-based training courses, while grossly ignoring their workers. The participant called such inequitable practices “monkey business” (personal interview, April 10, 2009). Despite inequality, uneven access, and restrictions, the working-class thrust for learning cannot be contained. It is, perhaps, one of the strongest biological instincts that Allah Almighty has bestowed on human beings. Hence, this participant, after heavily criticizing in-service workers’ professional development workshops as being largely mechanical and a repetitive exercise of already well-known concepts, suggests many improvements that could satisfy his, as well as his community’s, learning needs. For instance, he suggests that the topic-range of these workshops should be expanded to include social skills, management skills, quality control skills, computer/Internet skills, workplace safety procedures, and First-Aid and also that the latest learning materials need to be included. At the previous labour union meeting, this participant outlined his suggestions and the union leaders agreed to put this matter before higher management during the next formal meeting for necessary action.
The above narratives illustrate the working-class participants’ passion for independent learning, the striking features of their analytic capabilities, active efforts to create knowledge, and social skills largely achieved through everyday life activities. In addition, informal adult learning has also provided them large degrees of wisdom to amicably handle their workplace and social and economic issues. Therefore, alongside Livingstone and Sawchuk (1999), I argue that if we expand Bourdieu’s analysis of “cultural capital” to include informal adult learning, it would provide a standpoint to better understand the creative cultural practices of the working class agents.

**Participants’ Ability to Choose a Suitable School**

Contrary to popular conviction, inequality is neither a natural phenomenon nor the fate of an individual or a group; rather, it is the result of sustained unjust state policies and an established societal order that is based on hierarchy and elitism. In Pakistan, the issue of social inequality stands out among myriad problems that plague the present-day country. Likewise, this inequality is evident in the education system, which has historically been organised along class lines and heavily biased towards the rich. Therefore, in this section I have focused on the elite and working-class participants in an attempt to understand how, in an unjust education system, parents’ class-habitus influence the educational plans for their children, the kind of awareness about educational opportunities they have, and what resources they employ to build such awareness. The ultimate objective of this discussion is to understand how parents belonging to different social classes can effectively make educational plans for their children, which will suggest the level of their “cultural capital.”

In this study, the elite-parents’ ethnographies generally demonstrate a sense that their economically privileged location has empowered them to make the best possible educational plans for their children. Their class-habitus reflects in their statements, such as “by the grace of God we have the purchase power,” “affordability is not an issue for us” and “I am ready to pay anything for his education here and abroad.” These statements not only emphasize how elites justify their wealth and a privileged position by sanctifying it, but also their precise understanding of the elite schools as the most appropriate sites to ensure that their children become skilled, rational, and productive human beings capable of carrying forward their
privilege and prestige. Their deep awareness about local and international education systems is either experiential, informal-based, or both. For instance, the student survey study (N=47) reveals that 100% of the male and 79% of the female elite parents have an education at, or above, graduation level. The elite parents’ ethnographies clarify that most of them have received entire, or a part of, their education from reputable and elite international institutions for higher studies. This experiential learning enables them to comparatively view the strengths and limitations of various elite schooling systems. These parents utilize this awareness to select the best school, which in their perception is the one that can offer standards consistent with reputable international elite schools in Pakistan. One male elite parent’s statement illustrates this perspective, which is largely experience-based:

Well...I do not see much difference in the education of expensive English-medium schools—which you call the elite schools—in Pakistan, because they mostly edify the most modern knowledge. However, my main interest is to know the extent to which a school has maintained the similar kinds of standards that historically distinguished schools have offered to their citizenry...I mean...the schools like Eton, Harrow, St. Paul’s Westminster, and how effectively a school prepares the students for future academic and social life in accordance with those renowned British schools. (personal interview, November 1, 2008).

Thus, while referring to British models of elite schooling and finding their replica in Pakistan, the elite parents understand that such prestigious institutions attract students with high cultural capital, which is then reinforced and extended. The intensive intellectual classroom experiences and mechanisms of tacit learning through school culture and socialization in institutions that are at the very top of the prestige hierarchy can properly equip students with qualities to access the highest possible social positions and, subsequently, to amicably handle the challenges of those unique positions. A comparative analysis of the students’ classroom experiences in these three types of schools will be presented in the next chapter.

In addition to experiential learning, the elite parents employ many channels to attain and update information regarding various schooling systems. For instance, before making the final selection, most parents benefit from school brochures, media, Internet, and social networks. The elite parents generally consider social connections with other elite families the most rewarding, because they provide an opportunity to share information, and seek the necessary counselling
and guidance from one another. The school’s alumni services provide an effective platform for elite parents’ socialization and exchange of insightful views and expertise. In this regard, the alumni services greatly contribute towards class reproduction. Moreover, some elite parents consider that school-based awareness programs and intensive discussions with teachers and management are useful to understanding a schools’ performance in multiple areas. For instance, how cognisant the school is to groom aspects of the student’s personality? How does the school help students understand the full range of opportunities open to them to actualize their ambitions? To what extent are the teachers able to develop analytical, judgemental, and decision making qualities among students? How are the students groomed to be the effective team players, while comprehending their social and citizenship responsibilities? How effectively are extra and co-curricular activities utilized to the benefit of students? Such critical perspectives further emphasize that elite parents have greater faith in bourgeois forms of schooling, which ensure knowledge and learning are distributed in hierarchical terms.

Working class parents also demonstrate an essential knowledge of the national education system and the functioning of different kinds of local schools. They fully understand that their choices are restricted due to limited financial resources in an inequitable schooling system. This awareness reflects in their class-habitus, such as, “I do not have income to educate my children in the reputed private schools,” “free education is a blessing for the poor like us” and “financial problems tie up my hands and sometimes I feel to have been stuck in that web forever.” In regards to the roots of their awareness about the education system, the working class parents also reveal certain levels of experiential learning. The student survey study reveals that a noteworthy number of about 56% of fathers (N=54) in public schools and about 54% of fathers in madaris (N=50) have either partial or complete secondary school education. Likewise, an aggregate number of 30% of working class mothers associated with public schools and about 26% of working class mothers associated with madaris have education up until the elementary school level and a few of them also studied some grades at a high-school. Besides, working class parents consider that, alongside electronic media and newspapers, participation in social networks outside of the family (including mosque, work-groups, Dera and Bathaks\(^20\)) as well as

\(^{20}\) *Dera* and *Bathaks* are two prominent forms of social gatherings in the culture of Pakistan.
relatives in the extended family are the most useful compensatory resources to resolve children’s schooling problems and to exchange educational information.

Most working class families in this study had relatives who lived nearby and their social life revolved around the extended family. Hence, during celebrations, other events, or usual family meetings, the parents would seek advice from elders and other comparatively educated relatives about their children’s academic, social, or disciplinary problems at school. Likewise, within the context of mosque groups, parents who struggled with their children’s problems, found someone to help them resolve their issues. Basically, the mosque setting appeared to be non-threatening for parents. Informally, mosque organizations also served as a resource for parents and supported them in their efforts to overcome their children’s schooling problems. For instance, one working class respondent was frustrated and wanted to resolve his son’s math problems at school. He was constantly receiving negative reports. The colleagues in the mosque group referred him to a resource person who would provide private tutoring in maths to compensate learning at school that was free of cost to the poor. For some working class respondents, the workplace was another setting in which a resource person could be found to consult about children’s school problems or initiate an insightful discussion to enhance knowledge about the education system. For instance, one working class respondent affirmed that his colleagues helped him learn an effective use of the punishments at home, such as not letting the child watch television or play outside and, conversely, how to reward him with a book or taking him to his favourite restaurant. The respondent added that if negotiations with the child failed, these tactics would greatly help to motivate him for learning. Therefore, social networks serve as an important supportive component for working class parents to enhance their educational knowhow and resolve children’s issues at school. They also help to effectively shape education-related socialisation in the home.

The profound awareness of the working class parents in this study about the national education system is evident when they argue that the ruling-class has deliberately maintained an apartheid schooling system in the country, in which only the select few can get good formal education and skills and rest of the populace is supposed to be subservient to them. Thus, on one side of this blatantly two-tier education system is the high-quality education for children of the privileged
elites and on the other is the public sector education which, although is free, is of markedly lesser quality. The private schools are allowed to charge exorbitant fees and, thus, exclude the majority from their population. The fault again lies along the economic divide and, unfortunately, the state connives to perpetuate such barriers. Moreover, the respondents of this study understand that another barrier comes in the form of English, which is the language of power in Pakistan. Since the ruling elites do not want to share their power, they ensure their children achieve excellent training in English through schooling experiences as well as at home. This provides them with an immense advantage to access the power echelons and preserve the privilege of the few. Conversely, Urdu and other regional languages remain the dominant languages of the masses and of the public schools, which are highly dependent on the state. The state, thus, perpetuates dependence on these less empowering languages. This makes working class children relatively disadvantaged in being able to access the better-paid job positions. The following working class parents’ statement presents this standpoint:

The state has been investing heavily in maintaining a parallel schooling system for the privileged, which provides quality education to those who would presumably run top positions in the higher echelons. Only the elites of wealth or that of power can access these schools. Conversely, the public schools get a step-motherly treatment from the state in allocation of funds, quality of teachers, provision of goods and services. In addition, the public schools function in regional languages, which means their students would have greater difficulty to access better job positions... (personal interview, November 12, 2008)

Therefore, the working class respondents in this study perceive that education in Pakistan has been used as one of the tools to reproduce those who are rulers and those who are ruled. By holding the key to areas of power and, hence, monopoly over policy making mechanisms, the dominant-class has ensured separate schools to preserve their status. Simultaneously, by ensuring the low standards of mass education, the ruling elite has deliberately perpetuated the cycle of poverty and subservience for dominated classes. This kind of critical reflection represents the cultural capital of the working class.

Moreover, the self-perception of the working class as being the victim of an exploitative system fosters the dispositions of conflict and resistance. Their resistance against the “status quo” and elite control is evident in two domains. First, they use political and trade union platforms to
become part of the political struggle for transition into a democratic and more just state, which would redefine the distribution of political and economic resources. Second, some respondents perceive that an effective use of available educational opportunities can provide them immediate relief, at least to some extent, from the reproduction of a cycle of destitution within the family. Therefore, as regards to a major change in the political system, one working class parent who is also an active member of an Islamist political party argues, “the unjust state policies can only be reversed through political and social revolution as enunciated by Islam and through enforcing the Sharia laws in the country, which would guarantee an equal distribution of resources” (personal interview, November 20, 2008). Another working class participant argues, “Creating a truly democratic and egalitarian socialist society in Pakistan largely depends on ability of the working classes to accomplish a political revolution” (personal interview, December 20, 2008). Hence, the working classes perceive that only a political revolution to counter capitalist can only ensure the termination of elite exploitation and the fair distribution of political and economic resources.

Likewise, the working class parents also desire a basic shift in the education system, which entails moving from apartheid, classist, and exclusive elite education to more inclusive, anti-class, and unbiased education. For instance, a working class participant argues, “the system of superior and inferior schools does not fit in with principles of equality and social justice” (personal interview, November 10, 2008), and suggests for a uniform schooling system in which the rich and the poor get similar kinds of education. However, most parents perceive that this sort of a major shift requires many drastic changes with regards to philosophy, structure, and practices, which is both time consuming and requires persistent efforts. Hence, besides an active effort for a entire change to the system, these parents understand that an immediate alternative to break the shackles of their economic plight is to make the most of the available educational opportunities. For them, education is the last and only resort to provide better life opportunities to their children than were available for themselves. Therefore, most working class parents expect their children to get good education to expand their opportunities in employment and possibly to become skilled resource personnel.

Emotional support appeared to be abundant in working class families. Parents would share their own educational limitations with their children of as well as their prime desire for them to remain
in the school, complete their education, and go beyond what they had accomplished. Therefore, parents would constantly remind their children to take full advantage of their educational opportunity. The following working class parents’ statement reflects this mindset:

We tell them [our children] that we did not have enough educational opportunities in the village. The solitary high school in the area was about 5-miles away and almost hard to access due to unpaved streets. Besides, we had to work in the family farm for hours in the afternoon to help our parents to earn bread and butter... also...we did not have computers, internet and other electronic learning resources...we believe such reminders are effective to constantly motivate them [our children] to work hard in education in order to achieve a good job, better than what we have right now...likewise, when our children prefer to play outside or watch favourite TV programs till late in night...we, again, remind them how important education is for their future lives. (personal interview, December 2, 2008).

Thus, for working-class parents, such life stories are conducive to guiding the children’s moral and emotional learning. These narratives also serve to motivate the children for education. However, due to financial limitations, there is an obvious tendency in working parents to make efficient short-term post-secondary educational plans for their children (mostly skill-oriented diplomas and certificates). Most parents articulate optimism in achieving such plans at any cost, regardless of if they have to take loan from a bank, financial help from kith and kin, sell anything valuable from family possessions (e.g. a mother’s gold jewellery), or pledge their only place of residence for a loan. Therefore, while articulating a desire to separate themselves from their histories and properly train their children for better job-related opportunities, the working-class parents also exhibit the “transformation of their habitus” (Bourdieu, 1993, p. 87).

In this way, to choose the most appropriate school from the opportunities that are accessible to them, working class parents articulate three broad orientations: secular, holistic, and traditional. For instance, some public school parents fully understand the significance of modern and secular knowledge in the present-day world of work. They generally argue that the accelerating pace of industrial growth and an ever-expanding utility of information technology, biotechnology, and cognitive sciences have reinforced the need for a skilled and knowledgeable human capital. Therefore, these parents prefer public schools with modern curricula that have the capacity to amicably prepare their children to meet the current workplace challenges. Hence, the parents specifically scrutinize the conduct of a school in imparting scientific knowledge, which is a basic
requirement for technological education in the country. The following statement of a working-
class parent from the public school underscores this standpoint:

This is an age of science...and you know...science is everywhere...if you go for higher
studies or apply for a job, they will see your grades in science subjects. If you have better
results in science, it means you were a good student...likewise, for my children; I want
them to be good in science...and then learn some skill at a technical college...because
technical knowledge helps getting better jobs here or anywhere else...say, for instance, in
the Middle-East... (personal interview, September 15, 2008).

Therefore, the participant understands the challenges of the current era, in which modern
knowledge and the learning of technical and mechanical skills have become crucial to keeping
pace with current developments. Besides, the participant articulates an ability to critically
analyse job prospects in the local as well as global markets. Hence, this kind of comparative
knowledge underscores working class parents’ capacity to make the most of their available
knowledge and material resources.

Some of my working class parents have preferred public school education because of its holistic
approach of integrating Islamic knowledge into secular curricula. Their ethnographies articulate
that pure secular education, which keeps knowledge and values in two separate compartments, is
not suitable for Muslim children. Besides, secular education generally does not put any worth in
knowledge that is not gained through sense perceptions. Conversely, the concept of education in
Islam integrates knowledge with values, envelops the factual insight with metaphysical concerns,
and promotes an outlook of balance and genuine synthesis. Hence, the parents with such
perspectives find public schools to be the most logical choice. A working class public school
parent explains:

The secular education can, undoubtedly, train our children for some decent profession,
but it never helps to discover the invisible world. It is the religion which imparts this kind
of awareness. Besides, religion trains us morally and socially. Therefore; I believe at least
the Quran must be allowed to permeate throughout the education... (personal interview,
October 11, 2008)

Hence, this participant favours a holistic approach to integrating Islamic knowledge in secular
education, one that uses the Quran not as a sacred text for students to simply memorize, but as a
basis for making curricular connections. In this way, the participant illustrates his understanding
that modern/secular subjects disseminate knowledge mostly attained through human attributes of
senses and reason, which are deficient and need to be reinforced by the divine properties of
revelation and inspiration that enable students to discover the metaphysical world.

Conversely, some working class parents intentionally prefer traditional Islamic education in the
madaris over modern/secular education in public schools. Their ethnographies articulate a desire
to pass on Islamic cultural capital to the subsequent generations; this includes: knowledge,
practice, lifestyles, tastes, and rituals. For such parents the spiritually based education in the
madaris is the major drawing point. The following statement of a working class parent
underscores this perspective:

I would not wish for my children to get education just to become an officer...because this
is nothing more than just a triumph of the material life, which is bound to finish at a
certain time...Instead, I would prefer pure Islamic knowledge for my children, which is
chiefly achievable in the madaris...I believe if the Quran runs through the blood, it leads
to recognize Allah, His words, the Prophet, and the self, and guides in the course of this
transient life and the life hereafter. (personal interview, November 17, 2007)

Therefore, the participant perceives that Islamic knowledge is preferable to worldly knowledge.
In his worldview, learning is about spiritual growth and religious enlightenment as opposed to a
more existential, rational, and secular knowledge, which seeks to promote the material success as
a primary goal in life. Therefore, to conclude, I argue that, akin to their elite counterparts,
working class parents’ decisions to choose the most appropriate school to educate their children
are grounded in their precise knowledge of different schooling systems and what kind of benefits
they can generate for their children.

Parents’ Practical Involvement in their Children’s Schooling
In the following pages, the primary units of analysis are parent-child interaction about
educational issues, including selection of literacy activities and strategies to complement
children’s schooling. Basically, I have attempted to understand the home socializing patterns by
focusing on physical and educational resources, motivational tactics, and interpersonal
interactions. In general, a common thread with parents from different social classes surfaced,
which demonstrated that they undoubtedly cared about their children’s education. They fully
understand that their children’s home environment, quality of parenting, provision of proper educational resources, and preschool experiences contribute in important ways to their emerging competencies related to their social, emotional, and academic development. Therefore, while being cognizant of their children’s appropriate personality development, the parents transmit their cultural capital by teaching their children how to think, act, and feel. They also tend to socialize them in the preferred lifestyles, beliefs, and language codes through tacit and planned daily interrelationships. Presumably, the children infer family cultural capital not only from parents’ verbalization, but also from their practices. However, an important aspect of socialization is to motivate children to learn as well as to value schooling. Moreover, to aid their children’s schooling, the elite and working class parents make deliberate efforts to fill in certain perceived deficiencies and sometimes add or go beyond what the school delivers.

The home learning environment is created through complex interactions between parents and children and is greatly influenced by the adults’ background as well as their cultural and economic capital. Hence, the early learning experiences and socialization in the family are shaped by the organization of the social systems within the family. Bourdieu (1984) argues that child rearing is a process that comes naturally. It is already ingrained in the habitus of many parents. However, the narratives of the elite and working class respondents in this study accentuate that effective child rearing neither comes naturally nor should be taken for granted. It has to be carefully planned and worked extremely hard for. For instance, most of my elite respondents argued that, at early stages, they carefully planned to use their toddlers’ structured experiences as a basis for “concept formation.” In so doing, they took insight from their own experiences of initial learning at home. Accordingly, they picked toys and common household objects, such as blocks, food, and clothing to relate them to abstract concepts such as shapes, colors, and sizes. This was followed by the teaching of more sophisticated concepts about properties of the physical world. The parents also helped children to learn intangibles, such as emotional expression and self-regulation of behaviour. The elite parents argue that children are like sponges, wanting to absorb information, understand, and acquire many skills. Hence, the tactful parents must involve them in extensive discussions to develop trust, be curious, help to learn new things, and encourage being skilful in social interactions. Conversely, the working class parents’ narratives do not articulate analogous detailed comprehension. Yet, they claimed
to play an active role in their children’s initial learning. At early stages, most working class parents taught their children correct recitation of the Quran, proper ways to offer prayers, and provided basic knowledge about the community’s cultural values. They helped their children to be well mannered, well behaved, speak to others kindly and respectfully, and be helpful to those who needed help. Some working class parents also claimed to have helped their children learn preliminary reading and writing and memorize math tables, while also providing necessary guidance to complete homework. A few parents also assisted children in solving math problems; going over spelling with them; and teaching the basics of grammar, poetry, and general sciences. However, most working class parents claimed that they did not receive the kind of parental support that they had provided to their children. The main reason for this advantage is more universal provision of formal primary education, which the parents of the parents in this study obviously lacked. However, this is another example of the working class parents’ disjuncture with their past as well as the transformation of their habitus.

Even at the higher grades of education, the parents across the social classes appear to share a great deal with children in the areas of aspirations, academic support, physical amenities, interpersonal interactions, all of which combine to organize aspects of the home learning environment. However, elite parents’ relative affluence, educational expertise, and self-certainty give them an obvious advantage in providing the necessary material comfort to their children. Hence, most elite students reported having a peaceful study room, air-conditioning, gymnasium, a well-equipped play area, a personal library, computers/Internet, and educational software at home. The elite parents also consider cultural and recreational goods (such as, musical instruments, paintings, videogames and play-stations) as helpful for their children’s overall personality growth. In addition, elite parents reveal a greater preference for fostering self-analysis, self-monitoring, and self-reliance in their children, rather than wielding external checks. They believe empowering children with an understanding of what is right or wrong for them is more beneficial than putting numerous restrictions. Therefore, most elite parents reported that their children were rather autonomous in completing their homework and required almost no supervision from them. These parents also accepted their children’s schedule for advanced study at home because they believed that their children properly understand their academic responsibilities. But, interpersonal interactions in elite families do not remain confined to the
school-related activities; the parents tend to include as many aspects as they deem essential for their children’s overall personality development. In so doing, elite parents, again, appear to replicate their own histories and cultural capital, which their parents had passed on to them. For instance, one elite mother explained:

My own childhood experience provided me an understanding that parents who care enough to take extra measures to involve in their children’s education and other relevant issues and help them to grow into balanced human beings are always rewarded for their efforts. Therefore, I regularly sit down with my children and steer the conversation in a much ‘civilised manner’ towards discovering their main challenges and problems, rights and responsibilities, and also plan with them to manage their issues in the most effective way. (personal interview, March 3, 2008).

Therefore, by engaging their children in reflective arguments, discussions and dialogues, and letting them express their issues and problems and suggest probable solutions in their own perspectives, the elite parents not only tend to enhance their cognitive capabilities, but inculcate democratic values among their children. This kind of training likely disposes children to remain civilized and open to new ideas even if they do not confirm their own way of thinking. It also creates the linguistic competence, patience, and vision to see things differently. These qualities would become helpful for elite children to engender success in their future life roles. Moreover, this kind of mothers’ involvement also supports Bourdieu’s (1984) original thesis, when he argues that educated mothers play the key role of transmitting the cultural capital across generations (p. 105). Likewise, another elite mother demonstrates her deep expertise about an effective pedagogy, which provides her with an advantage not only of meaningfully interaction with teachers through which she can monitor her child’s progress, but also enables her to pass on abundant cultural capital at home through every day tacit or active academic interactions. About an effective teaching, she argues:

I strongly believe that children must be encouraged to engineer the concepts and go beyond the knowledge level to the higher levels of thinking. It is vital to connect them with learning through something as natural as inquiry and questioning which would enable them to play a role in discovering things themselves. (personal interview, November 20, 2008)

Therefore, during every day home socialization, this participant regularly attempts to create pathways to effectively increase her child’s thinking and decision-making capabilities. She
engages her in verbal discussions or gives advanced assignments that generally require interrogating epistemological assumptions and going beyond her child’s knowledge level to the higher levels of thinking. This way, the participant not only provides a useful supplement to her child’s learning at school, but also reproduces cultural capital of the higher cognitive capabilities.

Likewise, working class parents tend to create a safe, comfortable, and stable environment at home that would be conducive to children’s thinking positively about their education. The parents support students’ motivation and learning efforts by providing material “rewards” for good grades, setting a regular study-time (at least two hours after dinner) for completing homework and doing advanced learning, and, when possible, designating a particular place in the home for school equipment. In most cases, physical space at home was extremely limited, which made it difficult for children to have a private space. Often they had to share a room with siblings and sometimes with parents as well and, as a result, had to use specific areas of the house for dual purposes. For instance, the only couch or a table were also used as a reading place alongside other activities.

Although, working class parents face greater economic constraints, most of them like to provide a computer and Internet to their children with their hard earned money. They understand the inevitability of such educational resources in the modern age and want their children to receive the benefits from whatever they can afford. Some parents also show their children how to properly use of computers and how to find educational resources while browsing various websites. Some parents who find expensive electronic resources unaffordable tend to compensate by helping their children to maintain their personal libraries. They tend to buy either cost-efficient or pre-owned volumes, which they can easily afford. Moreover, although the working class parents want their children to be self-reliant, at the same time they perceive the enforcement of certain rules is necessary to regulate their daily academic routine and overall conduct. Most significantly, the parents in this group liked to enforce highly structured rules for completing homework and other education-related activities, including advanced studies. However, the rule enforcement does not reflect dictatorship and despotism; instead, the parents tend to enlighten their children with the rationale and legitimacy. The following statement of a working-class parent expresses this standpoint:
As a parent it is my obligation to make essential rules to regulate children’s academic and daily routines. But, I strongly believe that rules are only useful if children properly understand their purpose and what difference they can make in their life. Hence, instead of making my children to simply follow the rules, I try to make them understand their purpose and efficacy. (personal interview, September 21, 2008)

In this way, the working class parents instil an understanding among children of realizing how certain rules are necessary to regulate an individual and communal life. Such awareness is also essential to develop social and citizenship responsibilities.

To modify the provisions of the school, both elite and working class parents employ a range of strategies. At the least, they encourage their children to use electronic resources at home to access educational websites and research journals. In addition, a few madaris parents explained that they would buy or rent audiocassettes from Islamic organizations regarding erudite lectures and encourage their children to benefit from the advanced discussions contained therein. Some parents also tend to share their own knowledge and experiential learning with children in one-to-one discussions. For instance, an elite parent explains:

This is an era of knowledge explosion, and everything cannot be taught at school through textbooks. There is so much information out there which can be gained and shared with children...for example; Ahmad [pseudonym] was writing a project on fallouts of Neoliberalism on the third world economies...and it gave me an opportunity to share my understanding which I had very recently gained in a seminar at [the name of an elite school] on the same topic. (personal interview, November 11, 2008, emphasis in original)

Likewise, an integral part of home socialization in the working class families appears to explore ways to efficiently modify the learning provisions at school. However, parental assistance to their children varied depending on their different schooling experiences. Some relatively educated parents reported sharing their knowledge and advanced learning with their children. For instance, a working class parents who, after completing formal schooling, also had attended workshops in maths and English grammar courses reported providing advanced coaching to complement his child’s learning at school. He argues that the public school teachers greatly confine students’ learning to mere memorization of the grammatical rules in English and formulas in maths, and do not give enough practice to infer their own rules and formulas. Hence, he greatly helped his son to infer necessary rules and formulas in these two subjects to construe
complex concepts. Other parents, who did not get enough formal education or attend workshops, preferred to communicate frequently with their children’s teachers to seek help about how to modify the school provisions. In some cases, working class parents who felt frustrated by not knowing how to help their children also sought aid from older siblings to fulfill this particular task. Such kinds of home socialization practices greatly contribute to motivate working class students to value schooling in a concrete manner.

Another commonality across social class is the parents’ tendency to supplement their own efforts with private tutoring. For most elite and working class respondents, professional coaching is greatly useful to compensate what they perceived to be the gaps in their children’s schooling. In accessing tutoring, the parents also articulate an aspiration for their children to succeed in school and secure future employment and career opportunities. However, economic capital of elite parents provides them with an advantage to engage renowned professors to visit their home and provide one-to-one tutoring to their children. This kind of arrangement costs them approximately 10,000 rupees a month for one subject at the time of this study. Most elite school students acknowledged having private tutoring in all major subjects. They considered one-to-one tutoring more effective as it provided them with the liberty of discussing more advanced concepts than those contained in the textbooks. Likewise, the working class parents send their children to tuition centres mostly run by the public-school teachers, who provide their services at affordable rates. Most of the public school students reported paying 1,000 rupees every month to have private tutoring in all major subjects, including physics, chemistry, biology and English. The students’ accounts mostly indicate that, at tuition centers, the teachers are more friendly, give the students the liberty to discuss any topic, and tend to explain essential concepts in a more detail. However, it is worth mentioning that paid private tutoring is almost non-existent in the Islamic madaris. Most students reside in the campus and get all necessary academic help from the teachers during mandatory study hours before bedtime. The teachers provide this academic support as a spiritual practice and to seek divine blessings.

To add and go beyond to what the school delivers, elite parents use their undisputed advantage of economic capital to provide visual learning experiences that greatly support the abstract descriptions in the textbooks. They also find these practices conducive to motivate children for
education as well as to learn preferred cultural ideas, values, and lifestyles. The following elite parents’ statement articulates this standpoint:

Reading of a Shakespearean play from the book is vastly a different experience than watching it live in the theatre...similarly, attending to an opera performance, visiting an art gallery, or a museum is more effective than just reading about them or watching in a documentary...hence, we try to provide such visual learning experiences to our child as we believe in their educational value. (personal interview, November 15, 2008).

This is a typical example of bourgeois cultural capital and is obviously beyond the normal reach of working class families. Moreover, as mentioned before, such experiences serve to reproduce the “cultural orientations” of elites to subsequent generations. These orientations are no other than Eurocentric tastes and lifestyles. In addition, the elite schools play a decisive role in fortifying these tastes and lifestyles. It has been previously discussed that, since the colonial period, the main essence of elite schools has been to reproduce Eurocentric knowledge along with culture, in terms of speech codes, dress, styles, deportment, music preferences, and other attributes. My study emphasises that these schools have carried out this task very successfully to date. Besides, the possession of this cultural “currency” has incessantly been generating advantages for the ruling class through accessing in the upper echelon of academic institutions and social and professional organizations.

Conversely, many working class practices endorse an effort for “revitalization “of Islamic culture and lifestyles in the country according to pre-established Islamic precepts. They understand the significance of learning English to effectively access work-related opportunities, but seek to establish their precise role to protect and reproduce Islamic tastes, dress codes, deportment, and other cultural attributes across generations. Accordingly, their cultural viewpoints sometimes articulate a sense of antagonism against Western lifestyles. For instance, a working class public school parent argues: “Personally, I don't adhere to the concept that my children learn Western singing, dance and lifestyles in general. It is against our religious and cultural values. Instead, I would prefer Islamic culture and ways of life for them...” (personal interview, September 15, 2008)

Therefore, many working class parents purposely ensure their children’s participation in their favoured cultural activities (such as Islamic religious lectures, symposiums, and sermons) and
spend as much time as it is possible with like-minded people. This will not only ensure that they achieve epistemic competence, but also that they acquire common lifestyles. Madaris, to a greater degree, and public schools, to a lesser extent, also help to reproduce Islamic lifestyles due to the brand of education and environment they provide. Moreover, the working class parents also articulate a yearning for Islamic lifestyles to be enforced at the highest echelon of the government. For that they look towards Islamic political parties and mullahs in politics, who claim to be the torchbearers of Islamic culture and pledge to enforce it as a national agenda.

To conclude, I argue that cultural capital is context-specific because its currency may vary across different social fields where the struggle for power and legitimization exists. Hence, the working class agents’ adult learning beyond formal schooling, their active involvement in creating knowledge, and their practices of building effective home learning environments emphasize an existence of “non-dominant cultural capital” (Carter, 2003, p. 86) in urban Pakistan. However, the working class agents fully understand that the dominant cultural capital is a vital requirement for the success in the fields of broader social world. They are well aware that their own cultural currency is highly devalued in most fields. I also argue that the fault of relying on overtly simplistic explanation of the learning environment in the working class families, such as the cultural deficit explanation, needs to be revisited and non-dominant cultural capital of the underprivileged classes must not be ignored.

**Students’ Study Habits and Preferred Television Program**

The above discussion has mainly attempted to understand the cultural capital of parents belonging to different social classes. However, to map students’ cultural capital in these three types of schools, I have conducted a survey study with focus on students’ reading habits and the types of television programs watched. I perceive this study will also provide an understanding how effectively (or ineffectively) these parents reproduce cultural capital in the home/family settings. Sullivan (2001) has employed both of these attributes to map the cultural capital in her study. She argues that the effect of cultural capital on students’ educational attainment is due to the “educative resources,” such as analytic and cognitive skills that are developed through reading, rather than to the communication of status via participation in formal culture (p. 897). Hence, in my analysis about students’ reading habits includes the types of books read as well as
the amount read, I reviewed only those books/reading materials that have sophisticated knowledge and recognized as “classics” by the prominent scholars. Likewise, I categorized the list of television programs that students regularly watched according to vocabulary sophistication or cultural references as having the cultural capital content.

My study accentuates a relatively privileged position of the elite school students in accessing diverse reading materials, both printed as well as on-screen. Approximately 63% of the elite students affirm that their families have maintained a library at home, which contains a large amount of texts on a variety of topics. The students’ ethnographies articulate that most elite parents habitually update their personal libraries and encourage children to benefit from their advanced reading resources. Some students also affirmed having been influenced from their parents’ regular reading habits and see their parents as their “role models.” Therefore, it appears that the parents who read frequently set a benchmark for their children and improve the learning process in the family, which can promote their children’s analytical and cognitive skills.

Moreover, in recent years reading from computers has become widespread and many people favour studying digitally, citing ease of storage and retrieval and the convenience of access at one’s pleasure. The elite students, due to their privileged economic situation, are clearly advantaged in accessing electronic reading resources. For instance, 100% of elite students have personal computers and a high-speed Internet access at home. For these students, access to the Internet provides a unique portal to explore their interests. Most students access research materials on the topics of their likings, look up references, browse discussion portals, and keep themselves updated on world events. Hence, the analytical articles about national and international political, economic, social, and cultural issues greatly help students in their development of knowledge. In addition, the discussion and peer-review portals provide opportunities for students to exchange views and information as well as refine linguistic and communicative skills and styles of expression. These advantages prove to be extremely conducive in terms of students’ intellectual growth and academic productivity. Table 6.1 indicates that a significant number of elite students spend three or more hours every day in advanced study-related activities at home.
Table 0.9: The Number of Hours that Students Spend in Studies during After School Hours

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of hours</th>
<th>Elite-English-Medium Schools (N:47)</th>
<th>Public Schools (N:54)</th>
<th>Islamic Madaris (N:50)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than one</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than three</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The student survey from different schools under study.
Note: (---) stands for zero value

Conversely, only 15% of the students in public schools and 14% in madaris claimed to have both facilities of a PC and Internet access at home. This means that only a handful of students in these two types of schools can use these modern and effective channels to update their awareness and cognitive skills. However, the working class students’ thirst for knowledge and significant parental support inspires them to compensate this obvious deficiency by frequently visiting the public libraries. Hence, about 28% of the students in public schools and 21% in madaris are the regular visitors of the public libraries. In addition, about 33% of the students in public schools and 44% in madaris claim to have maintained their personal library at home, which contains at least twenty books. Table 6.1 indicates that a majority of the public school and madaris students spend two to three hours on completing homework and advanced study at home. These students generally observe mandatory study hours, which their parents/elders enforce to make sure that they spend this time in education-related activities.

The students’ reading habits and the types of television programs they watched emphasize different tastes, which seems to contribute towards fortifying their lifestyles, knowledge of their cherished culture, and their competency in their preferred language(s). For instance, as expected, most elite students like to read Western literature and watch English television programs. The elite students cited the titles of some unique English classical books, autobiographies, science fictions, and novels, etc., which they had read during the last twelve months. A separate space was designated for this purpose in the questionnaire. Likewise, about 85% of the elite school
students claimed to read English newspapers or magazines almost every day. About 92% of the elite students daily watch television and usually prefer factual programs (e.g. English documentaries, news, or talk shows) as well as entertainment programs (e.g. English movies or comedy shows) and find these cultural activities useful in attaining linguistic competency in English and learning Western popular culture and ways of expression. The elite students claim to have a complete liberty from which to choose television programs to watch. The students explain that their parents do not wield control and gladly join them to watch whatever they are watching. In addition, the students explain that parents often initiate discussions with them about leading global and national issues to pass on their advanced understanding. Therefore, by initiating discussions, developing reading habits, and encouraging children to use the Internet and television for learning, the elite parents tend to pass on abundant cultural capital in the home/family environment.

Conversely, the public school and madaris students prefer to read religion and indigenous classical literature and watch local television programs in the afterhours. Most students referred to Islamic religion-related books that they had read during the last twelve months. However, a few students also cited the titles of Urdu or translations of Arabic/Persian classical literature and fables that mostly had Islamic and Middle-East cultural references. The public school and madaris students’ ethnographies emphasize a dominant trend among working class parents to encourage their children to attain competency in advanced faith-based concepts. Hence, most parents persuade their children to use leisure time to read tafsir (Quranic commentary) to properly understand the Quranic wisdom, Sunnah (the prophet’s life), hadith (the prophetic wisdom), and Sharia laws. Some parents also share their advanced knowledge about the applicability of religious principles in personal and collective lives. Hence, it seems that the underprivileged parents are quite cognizant of passing on the cultural capital of advanced religious wisdom to the next generation.

About 60% of the students in public schools and 67% in madaris acknowledge of reading Urdu newspapers almost every day. Likewise, about 71% of the students in public schools and 43% in madaris daily watch television. But, most students claim to face restrictions from elders in the choice of programs. They are banned from watching English and Indian movies as they show
scenes of romance, kissing, and open contact between males and females, which the parents
genormously believe as against their cultural norms. However, these students have a permission to
watch news, current affairs, and Urdu dramas, which contain sobriety and sophistication, and are
predominantly directed towards watching religious programs. Most students affirmed that their
solitary reading habit and the types of programs watched are helpful in gaining knowledge,
learning the Islamic/indigenous culture, and acquiring new vocabulary and competency in Urdu
and regional languages. For these students, despite restrictions, watching television is useful as it
transmits diverse kind of knowledge.

In sum, I argue that cultural capital is strongly transmitted from parents to their children, which
appears to be a commonality across different social classes in urban Pakistan. The two variables
that I used in my analysis suggest that television, along with reading books and sophisticated
literature, introduces individuals to advanced knowledge, cultural awareness, new vocabulary,
and linguistic competence. Hence, private cultural consumption in home/family setting appears
to be an effective means of attaining intellectual self-development. However, the above
discussion raises an important question that if elite and working class children acquire cultural
capital from home/family settings, why do elite students gain higher educational/occupational
success. My study suggests that the type of “cultural currency” that the students acquire from
home/family settings and through schooling experiences as well as their class-habitus play a
significant role in this regard. For instance, the elite students acquire the cultural capital of
competency in English and analytic and cognitive skills from home that are further fortified by
their schooling experience. Their class-habitus also provides them with an impetus to perceive
that they can achieve any educational, as well as occupational, target. Conversely, the lower class
students acquire the cultural capital of competency in Urdu or regional languages from home and
school alike and their schooling experiences generally promote the qualities of memorization and
rote-learning, which do not help them access the higher echelons related to their education and
occupation. Moreover, the deficiency of the class-habitus of these students in regards to
economic capital also plays an important role in keeping their aspirations within the limited
scope that can realistically be achieved. Hence, it appears that the schools also play a significant
role in reproducing the socioeconomic hierarchy by promoting different kinds of cultural capital.
This will be further discussed in the next chapter.
Social Capital: A Comparative Analysis

My study accentuates that, in the context of Pakistan, social capital (which entails the mobilization of durable networks) is not empirically self-evident and involves certain complexities. For instance, parents within and across different social groups maintain different ideologies concerning the use of their social capital resources. A majority of respondents perceive it as valid and legitimate to employ their social networks to seize as much benefit as possible, because certain predominant attitudes legitimize using contacts with different power centers and networking to achieve access for preferential treatment on an individualistic basis. This is known as Safarish, wherein parents attempt to seek favours, educational, and employment from influential people who issue directives on their behalf, while ignoring the legalities of meritocracy. However, parents’ ability to obtain such favours is unequally distributed within and across different social classes. Therefore, parents belonging to different social groups purposefully or unintentionally employ multiple strategies to maximize their possibilities to use their social capital resources. Conversely, some parents articulate the dispositions of legitimizing individual advancement by instilling competitive capabilities and acquiring sound educational credentials, which would certify that their children access unique occupational positions. Bourdieu (1977b) argues that such discourses often disguise class inequalities in advanced capitalist societies by providing primary ideological support for social reproduction through educational institutions and practices. However, most respondents who support this ideology also do not entirely rule out the possibility of utilizing their acquaintances. In contrast to both these perspectives, a small number of respondents view social capital from a faith-centered perspective and deliberately reject securing advantages on the bases of merely employing this institution. They regard such practices as unethical. The spiritual mindset of such respondents blossoms into reactionary practices to eradicate this “evil” from a Muslim society.

I argue that the social networks of the parents associated with three types of schools generally take the form of horizontal or vertical relationships and have uneven and complex relations to social class. These parents, nonetheless, have a variety of networks from which they intend to draw support but, in actuality, elite school parents’ social networks appear to be far more effective compared to their counterparts in other two types of schools. The majority of elite respondents indicated having social connections with influential people in the higher echelons
(e.g. members of parliament, senior executives in public and private organisations, feudal lords and tribal chiefs, and public attorneys, etc.). To maximize possibilities for using their social connections, elite parents, purposefully or sometimes unintentionally, participate in various socio-cultural events (e.g. matrimonial or birthday celebrations, house-warming, dinners). In Pakistan, such occasions provide opportunities to exchange gifts, which is a well-established cultural practice, and help promote social bonds. The elite parents also tend to exploit “blood relationships,” as their relatives hold high-ranking positions and can be handy to lend useful support. Hence, their socioeconomic position makes them part of a social network where they have an advantage of initiating a range of horizontal social relationships.

However, the degree to which these parents are ready to mobilise their social acquaintances varies across individual cases and has direct implications for the specific decisions that these families make about their children’s future. A notable majority of elite parents perceive the use of social networks has emerged as an appropriate selection mechanism, because, in the modern capitalist age, competing candidates usually possess identical educational credentials. In their view, an ineffective use of social networks in such a cutthroat competition can cause a notable drawback to their children. Hence, they plan to effectively exploit their social connections, which would guarantee that they transmit and reproduce power and privilege to their children.

However, some elite parents claim to have effective social networks, yet tend to express an unwillingness to employ them to seize benefits. In fact, they want their children to work hard, develop competitive qualities, and obtain exceptional cultural capital in form of credentials. They perceive that if their children start relying heavily on the family’s social acquaintances, it will harm their expectations and advantages of being educated in expensive private schools. The following interview excerpts from two different elite parents support such notions:

Elite Parent 1: Our contacts can help them [our children] to achieve anything...but... for their educational and occupational goals; we continuously tell them to rely on their own, and if we support them right now, then there will be no ending to it... we want them to work hard for a goal and achieve that goal with their own abilities, and then feel the happiness of that success, which is far glorious than anything else in this world.... (personal interview, November 1, 2008)

Elite Parent 2: We tell our children to win over things instead of getting them easily through our contacts...If they become complacent, they will lose motivation to compete, which
This kind of motivation to work hard and achieve their life goals gives an extra advantage to the elite children. First, they learn to be tough in a cutthroat competition and to put maximum effort towards accomplish success. Second, if they inadvertently fall short in the competition, their family social acquaintances are always there to push them forward. The parents acknowledged that if, in a competition, other candidates possessed similar credentials or received advantage merely because of their social capital, they would never hesitate to utilize their own.

The empirical analysis of survey results also highlights a complex nature of elite school students’ perspectives about their family’s social networks. For instance, out of respondents (N=47), about 70% of students are “very confident” that their family connections have the capacity to get them good opportunities for education and careers. Conversely, a scanty, but notable, number of 9% students declared to have “somewhat confidence” of the support they can receive. It can be interpreted that such students do not want to rely completely on their family’s social capital because, every so often, during interviews such dispositions were articulated by some students. The following two excerpts from elite student’s interviews support this argument:

Student 1: My father can easily find an effective safarish for me to achieve anything...but I feel ashamed to ask him to arrange stuff like that. He has been spending a fortune to properly educate me... and it is my obligation to pay him back as it should be. The best way for that is to work hard and try to achieve whatever he aspired from me to do... (personal interview, February 21, 2008)

Student 2: One must believe in one’s potential and not solely rely on acquaintances... because...achieving some lucrative position can be easy but sustaining it with efficient work-output needs skills and competence, which can only be acquired through putting an effort in the education. (personal interview, October 29, 2008)

 Apparently, these students have developed a habitus of self-reliance instead of utterly depending on the support from their family connections. This has occurred partly due to a continuous effort on the part of parents to motivate them through hard work, contests, and accomplishing success. However, it has to be noted that such vocabulary of legitimizing individual advancement by the
acquisition of unique credentials primarily provides ideological support for social inequalities and the role that educational institutions play of reproducing them across generations.

Likewise, a notable majority of parents associated with public schools and Islamic madaris reveal a willingness to use their social networks. They also perceive it to be their responsibility to provide their children with as much support as possible in education and their subsequent careers, expecting that doing so will further enable them to have better life opportunities than they had themselves. Hence, most working class parents acknowledged having as plentiful of social connections as parents of any social class can have. But, occasionally, they also articulated certain reservations regarding their quality and effectiveness and the kind of benefits they might confer. In fact, their socioeconomic status gives them an advantage only to materialize the networks that have a more vertical characteristic of relations. For instance, most of the parents referred to having relations with personal assistants or secretaries of influential personnel, campaign managers of politicians, junior and mid-level officers in the public and private organisations, or supervisors. Consequently, such parents, instead of having a direct contact with the influential personnel, require some kind of mediation from people who can bridge the gap between them and those who can put their requests into action. For instance, one public school parent said, “I do not have direct access to the Director of Public Instructions, but I do know his secretary who can approach him on my behalf” (personal interview, December 19, 2007). Another working class parent hinted at the same ideology when he said:

I have been working in this factory for more than twenty years and always tried to build a good rapport with my supervisors, and if I need their help to approach the general manager to achieve any kind of favour...I am sure...they will not disappoint me. (personal interview, January 15, 2008)

However, to maximize the possibilities for using social connections, working class parents tend to intentionally build a connection with political parties and politicians in general. The parents’ perceptions to have an easy access to politicians is based on the obligations that representatives of the political parties maintain to provide services in return for voter support. The following interview excerpts from two different working class parents support such notions:
Parent 1: I told the secretary of our Member of the Provincial Assembly that if he cannot request him [MPA] to send a directive to the principal to admit my child in his college, then forget about our votes in next elections. (personal interview, January 18, 2008)

Parent 2: ...why should I support a politician if he does not help me in my needs...I told the local political representative, whom we usually vote, that I have a simple rule of business... which is...to help only those who would help me in return. (personal interview, November 9, 2008)

Therefore, in this relationship of mutual gains, a politician as a “patron” provides any kind of favour including money, employment, promotions and protection to his client, while gaining power and positions of social prestige form the client, who has to extend a full support, work, and vote for his patron. Some parents also affirmed the effectiveness of their connections with trade unions, local religious bodies (such as mosque committees), and members of the local governments.

In spite of having plentiful social networks, the habitus to keep aspirations low is also evident in working class participants’ narratives. This can be interpreted as an indication of recognizing the limitation of their social capital with implications on restrictions in career planning. The working class respondents perceive that “mediation” does not always confer the desired results. It is greatly related to interests of mediating party and the level of expectations they would associate with the clients. Accordingly, working class parents keep their expectations within a narrow scope. For instance, most parents desired only the low-level positions for their children, such as skilled labourers, technicians, draftsmen, or an apprentice in an auto workshop and deemed these positions as being realistically achievable. Such kinds of dispositions are also evident in students’ accounts, who clearly understand that their parents’ capacity to access and mobilize social networks have certain perceived limits. The following public school student’s statement vividly illustrates this mindset:

My father says that to find a suitable safarish for me to achieve low-level jobs will be easy for him, but if I obtain the higher qualifications, he will be unable to help me...and then I will be on my own. (personal interview, September 26, 2008).
Such a trend is also evident in the students’ survey study, where out of public school respondents (N=54) and madaris respondents (N=50), a significant majority of 54% and 60% students, respectively, affirmed of having “somewhat confidence” about the level of their familial social capital. Apparently, they have internalized the dispositions for the limitations of the social capital to achieve their future goals. Such kinds of realization can lead to the compromises that the working class students tend to make in education and their subsequent careers.

Despite a widespread attitude of accepting the use of social connections as a pragmatic practice for promoting interests, only three of the participants in this study (two imams from madaris and a gas-station attendant from public schools) predominantly viewed social capital from the faith-centered perspective. Regardless of a small number, I did not ignore their standpoints, because it is quite possible that many other individuals across the social class in a Muslim majority country might have similar kind of religiosity and spiritual mindset. Hence, my respondents mainly argue that social capital is against the Islamic teachings, as it is unethical, undermines social justice, and is oppressive, as it might deprive the deserving candidates from their legitimate privileges. They argue that injustice and oppression in Islam are totally forbidden, as these are forms of destructive social behaviour. My respondents further argue that, in Islam, it is not acceptable to unduly oblige ones allies, while depriving someone else from his legitimate rights, even if he or she is the enemy. Hence, in their perceptions, developing social bonds for personal gains is not a legitimate excuse for being unjust or practicing oppression. The gas-station attendant explained, “I do not care to make connections simply with an intention to use them later for my personal gains or to benefit my children...instead, I would prefer to plead before God, Who always listens to the supplications” (personal interview, October 17, 2008). Similar kinds of dispositions are apparent in an imams’ narrative:

I do know some people who can help me to find an effective safarish whenever I need but, principally, I do not agree with this channel, because supplications of one whose privileges have been robbed by the wrongdoings rises to Allah with no barriers in-between. (personal interview, August 1, 2008)

Therefore, it appears that parents with this kind of mindset would prefer to accept “whatever” their children can achieve with their own potential, instead of depriving the deserved ones from their legitimate privileges by wrongdoings, such as using safarish. They perceive that Allah
Almighty has the ultimate powers to determine the amount of *rizq* (material resources) for His human beings, and no individual on this earth has power to increase or decrease it and that people who believe that, with their individual powers, they can change their fate and the amount of material resources that God has bestowed upon them, apparently, have a weak religious faith. Moreover, my respondents explained that they are actively engaged in educating the masses against social evils, including the unjust use of social capital. They use the platforms of madaris, mosques, media, and private social gatherings for the purpose of disseminating faith-based knowledge with the hope of ultimately creating a just Pakistani society as proposed by Islam.

**Chapter Summary**

The analysis about economic capital supports the notion that, out of many perceived ills and shortfalls in the education system of the country, none is more virulent than the evil of economic apartheid. In more explicit terms, the three types of schools are polarized on family income scale; the affluence and power abundantly prevails in elite schools and poverty and destitution in other two types of schools. The overrepresentation of the privileged classes in elite schools also gives impression that they are the bastions of privilege, even after many years of independence. This has occurred because the elite “oligarchy” makes policies in the country that are greatly biased towards protecting their own political and economic interests. The existence of elite schools is evidently important for the elite oligarchy as it ensures the reproduction of their power and privilege to the next generations. Moreover, the elite families have enough economic capital to convert it into cultural capital (such as, acquiring valued educational credentials in elite schools), maintain the luxurious lifestyles, and also develop social networks by holding parties and exchanging expensive gifts. All of these factors provide the elite class with an absolute advantage in the society. Conversely, the public schools and Islamic madaris have a majority working class populations. The parents mostly have insufficient economic capital to make ends meet. Hence, they may have to either work overtime or do another job to earn their livelihood. Hence, the family economic destitution forces the working class students to look towards their schools for financial help. The madaris students get complete financial support from the school for their education as well as for their personal needs. However, due to bureaucratic restrictions, only 10% of the most deserving students can receive financial support in the public schools. Consequently, the working class students in the public schools have to take financial help from
other earning members in the family (mostly brothers) or from kith and kin living in the extended families in order to meet their educational and other expenses.

The analysis of students’ family economic capital also indicates that most middle class families, which earn between rupees 20,000 to 200,000 every month, have been gradually eliminated from the public schools. These families tend to enrol their children in re-emergent educational stream of “non-elite” private schools. This has had a drastic result of education being turned into a commodity that can be bought and sold. These private schools have many categories and provide educational and physical facilities in accordance with parents’ purchasing powers. Quality schooling has further become inaccessible for working class students. Hence, it has further contributed towards educational apartheid in the country, wherein the system has already been producing two distinct sets of citizens: the rulers and those to be ruled.

My findings serve to modify Bourdieu’s original theoretical stance regarding cultural capital. Bourdieu argues the cultural capital, which is comprised of linguistic and cultural competence and a broad knowledge of culture, belongs to members of the upper classes and is found much less frequently among the lower classes. However, the components of the cultural capital that I employed in this thesis support the arguments of other scholars that Bourdieu’s analysis does not provide insight into the creative cultural practices, independent and general interest learning, and collective cultural agency of the organised working classes. This occurred because Bourdieu was preoccupied with delineating the cultural reproduction of inequality within fixed institutional forms. Thus, his accounts largely remained one-dimensional and functionalist descriptions of the status quo rather than real explanations of it. This is an apparent significance of my study, which, while obtaining data from a different context, has supported the validity of above-mentioned useful criticism on Bourdieu’s analysis of cultural capital. Moreover, I argue that independent education and learning activities of adult working class agents foster their self-perception and dispositions of resistance against perceived economic exploitation. They articulate a sense of rejection and inversion to pass on their misfortune to the next generations. Hence, they demonstrate an optimism to give better life opportunities to their children than they had themselves, the illustrations of having the fundamental knowledge of the education system, and making appropriate plans to educate their children from the available opportunities indicate their
cultural capital. Moreover, Bourdieu did not acknowledge the multidimensionality of his concept of cultural capital more specifically. In the case of urban Pakistan, the dominant group cherishes Eurocentric tastes and lifestyles and, through learning experiences inside and outside their homes and effectively using the platform of elite schooling, the elite parents tend to reproduce these lifestyles in the next generations. They fully understand that this cultural currency can generate advantages for their children in future social and economic roles. Conversely, many working class practices endorse an effort for “revitalization” of Islamic culture and lifestyles according to pre-established Islamic precepts. Most working class respondents believe their precise role is to protect and reproduce Islamic lifestyles and cultural attributes across generations. These working class parents fully understand that their cultural currency has been openly devalued even in the post-colonial era, but show optimism that once religious political parties enforce Islamic form of government in the country, their cultural currency will also start generating the desired benefits for them.

The analysis of students’ study habits and the types of television programs watched provides further insight that cultural capital is strongly transmitted through private cultural consumption in the home/family settings and appears to be an effective means to attain intellectual self-development across different social classes in urban Pakistan. The elite students have certain advantages in accessing diverse learning resources through screens, but the working class students tend to compensate this deficiency by finding alternative educative resources, such as frequently visiting public libraries. However, the types of classical literature read and the television programs watched seem to fortifying students’ lifestyles, knowledge of cherished culture, and competency in preferred languages. For instance, most elite students like to read Western classical literature and watch English television programs. Hence, it contributes to attaining English language competency and learning Western culture and ways of expression. Conversely, the public school and madaris students prefer to read religion, indigenous classical literature, and watch local television programs. These cultural practices help them to learn Islamic/indigenous culture and acquire new vocabulary and competency in Urdu and regional languages. Therefore, reading is not the only cultural activity that provides advanced knowledge and cultural competency in the modern age, television and digital resources also greatly contribute in this regard.
In my analysis of social capital, I have attempted to draw attention to the possibility of unequal distribution of opportunities in accessing social networks as constituting one of the significant factors for inequality. Although parents from different social groups have a variety of networks from which they intend to draw support, elite parents’ social networks, for the most part, seem to be more effective as compared to their counterparts in the two other types of school. Their social positions makes them part of a more powerful social network where they have an advantage to initiate a range of horizontal social relationships. Their children also understand the effectiveness of their family connections. Conversely, the social positions of the working and lower-middle class parents appear to materialize networks that have a more vertical characteristic of relations. Hence, they need some kind of mediation with higher-level authorities to actualize their claims. Their children have also internalized that their family social capital can render limited benefits. Moreover, mobilization of social capital resources is not an empirically self-evident process. It involves certain complexities. For example, parents within and across different social groups maintain different ideologies vis-à-vis employing social networks to reap social and economic benefits. Many parents perceive it as an inevitable, valid and legitimate practice because, in the form of safarish, it is deep-rooted in the social fabric. Such parents, no matter their social origin, intentionally or unintentionally employ multiple strategies to maximize their possibilities of using their social capital resources. Some elite parents prefer to legitimize individual advancement by acquiring unique educational credentials, which would certify their children to access the privileged job positions. Such dispositions support Bourdieu’s original stance that educational institutions and practices provide primary ideological support for social reproduction. However, such parents acknowledged using social connections if other candidates would possess similar credentials or get advantage merely because of their social connections. Moreover, the working class parents, while recognizing the limitations of their social capital, tend to keep their expectations within a narrow scope. However, a few parents view social capital from a faith-centered perspective and deliberately reject securing advantages on the bases of merely employing networks. They regard such practices as unethical and detrimental for social justice. Therefore, in contemporary Pakistan, it appears that different ideologies and the unequal way social capital becomes available to agents of different social classes act as a selection mechanism, which clearly favours some social groups over others and is a significant factor for social-class consolidation.
CHAPTER SEVEN: SOCIAL CLASS AND SCHOOL KNOWLEDGE

This chapter presents an analysis of the nature of classwork and work-related activities in each type of schools under study. First, I present a brief overview of the curricular and pedagogical frameworks employed in each type of school. This is followed by illustrative examples of the students’ classwork, which were gathered as part of the ethnographic study of the curricular, pedagogical, and student evaluation practices in the schools. In my analysis, I have tried to ensure as much comparability in the choice of curricular content as possible. For instance, public and elite schools predominantly teach modern curricula; therefore, it was easy for me to pick subjects from natural sciences and language arts for this enquiry. In addition, to have an apt understanding of classroom practices in these two types of schools, I attempted to select the same curricular topics for observation. For this purpose, I sometimes requested that the teachers teach the same topic that I had observed in other schools and offered them sufficient time for preparation. In other cases, I waited until they are going to teach this topic according to their prearranged schedule. To accommodate madaris, which have different curricula, alongside the language arts, I had to pick some subjects from traditional sciences. The students’ similar (or different) kinds of classwork and schooling experiences will help to locate the reproductive mechanisms in each of the types of schools under study. However, my analysis in this chapter has drawn insight from Jean Anyon’s (1980) framework concerning students’ relation to the capital (e.g. as manifested in any symbolic capital that might be acquired through school work); students’ relation to persons and types of authority regarding school work; and students’ relation to their own productive activity (p. 73). Both Bourdieu and Anyon emphasize that schools generally tailor coursework so as to prepare children for life in the social class from which they come. My study is intended to add further insight to such arguments. In addition, I have examined how students’ schooling experiences relate to their class-habitus, future social and professional roles, and their political worldviews. The last parts of this chapter present an empirical analysis in this regard.

A Brief Overview of the Curricula and Pedagogical Styles

This comparative curricular analysis attempts to locate major patterns, the nature of their content and design, and what intellectual faculties they are capable of promoting. Regarding pedagogy, I
have attempted to understand the extent to which teachers go beyond simply transmitting
textbook knowledge to create new epistemological possibilities. It is generally argued that
examination systems wield prominent impacts on teaching, learning, and other aspects of the
educational praxis (Hughes, 1993; Smith, 1991; Shepard, 1993; Vallette, 1994). Likewise,
Morris (1990) argues that due to their wide use, tests (particularly high-stake tests) can exert an
influence on teachers and students with an associated impact on what happens in classrooms.
Pierce (1992) acknowledges that the style of tests has a great impact on classroom pedagogy,
curriculum development, and educational policy (p. 687). Therefore, in my analysis, I also have
included students’ evaluation patterns and their probable effects on their classwork.

The three types of schools in this study teach curricula that are designed by different
organizations and prepare their students for different standardized examinations that are
supervised by different examining bodies. For instance, *Tanzim-ul-Madaris*, the main controlling
organization of the madaris under study, generally determines the syllabi, collects registration
and examination fees, and prepares and distributes the question papers to the madaris where
students take their exams. The madaris still exclusively aim their education at disseminating
faith-based knowledge and have retained their traditional curriculum, known as *Dars-e-Nizami*.
It was devised by an 18th century Islamic scholar, *Mulla Nizamuddin*, who insisted upon the
supreme pedagogical value of the classical Islamic knowledge. Hence, most of the books in
*Nizami curriculum* are canonical texts written either in Arabic, Persian, or their translations in
Urdu. Such books contain out-dated topics, which, in many respects, are unable to meet the
challenges of the modern life. For instance, the book titled *Sharh-e-Aqa‘id* (The Principles of
Beliefs) contains discourses on theology and was written some eight hundred years ago. It was
written in an archaic style and is full of references from ancient Greek philosophy that students
today can hardly understand. Rather than providing students with a profound understanding of
the basic principles of Islamic theology, it presents hypothetical imageries and illogical puzzles.
For example, it asks questions such as: is there one sky or seven or nine skies? Can the sky be
broken into parts? All such concepts have convincingly been disproved by the modern sciences.
Another book of Islamic jurisprudence, titled *Noor-ul-Ezah*, which was written in the 9th century, presents the arguments that water is divided into the following seven fundamental categories: sky water (rain), sea water, river water, water from wells, snow melted into water, water from hails, and water from springs (see: page 24). Modern science proves that there is no difference in the composition and properties of water obtained from all these sources.

Likewise, references from the creative works of *Euclid* (dates at approximately 300 B.C.) and *Avicenna* (980-1037) are profusely found in different texts used in madaris. Their ideas are disseminated as authentic and irrefutable even in the modern age. However, in reality, Avicenna’s ideas were greatly influenced from Greek presumptions that the imbalance of humours in the body creates disorders and disease. Similarly, the books on philosophy were also written at the time when Greek philosophy and the *Motazela* posed a major challenge to Islamic knowledge. Hence, most of the discussion in these books is meant to refute alien intrusions. These refuting discourses are still disseminated in madaris despite of the fact that challenges from such rival sects no longer exist, and the followers of *Motazela* died out by the third century of Islam. Likewise, the madaris have retained two classical books: *Jalal’ayn* (written in 1459) and *Bayazavi* (written in 1571) in order to teach *Tafsir* (the Quranic commentary). These books were written by the medieval ulema and contain arguments that were influenced by the social location of the writers, the general prevailing social environment, and the then available stock of knowledge. Since Muslims believe that the Quran has eternal validity and provides guidance for all times, they need the latest interpretations and commentaries of the texts to address current issues. Similarly, the books on *Fiqha* (Islamic jurisprudence) teach laws that govern trade, sales and purchase, which were developed in the medieval times. Hence, they do not refer at all to modern economic and capitalistic developments. Although many ulema have produced some valuable books that deal with fiqha responses to new forms of commercialized transactions or other modern economic and social developments, these books, nonetheless, could not be found within the current curriculum used in the madaris.

---

In addition to out-dated knowledge, the books are also designed to foster memorization and rote learning. For instance, most books are the oldest treatises in rhymed couplets and are so obscure that they are taught through commentaries and super-commentaries. For example, a book on Arabic grammar titled *Kafia-Ibne-Malik* is taught through a commentary called *Sharah-Ibne-Aqil*. In fact, the original book and its commentaries are so scholastic and archaic that students have no other option than to memorize them word for word. Hence, on numerous occasions the students responded to my queries by admitting to not have even reasonable comprehension of the concepts contained in these books. Likewise, another ancient text titled *Misbah-ul-Nahv* contains erudite illustrations that only those who have familiarity with the medieval philosophical discourses can understand. The teachers mostly defend memorization with a plea that it eventually leads to properly understanding the textbook knowledge if the students show commitment and dedication, as their teachers had shown over the years. Likewise, the translator of *Noor-ul- Ezah* acknowledged the memorizing design of his book when he mentioned, “the salient features of this translation are that it has made easy to teach the lessons, memorize them, and then reproduce in the examinations” (page 8). Standardized examinations seem to greatly influence the educational praxis in madaris. They generally require written responses to essay-type questions and students are evaluated on the accuracy with which they have memorized and reproduced the textbook knowledge. Table 7.1 presents the detail of curriculum taught at secondary school level (called *khasa*) in madaris.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 0.10: The Madaris Curriculum at &quot;Khasa&quot; Level of Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Traditional Sciences</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Basics of Computer Training, although mentioned in the curriculum, is not offered in practice. Initially, the government provided fifteen computers and an instructor to modernize madaris curricula. But, the instructor resigned from his job and the government never filled the position. The madaris personnel are also not enthusiastic to induct modern and secular subjects
in their plans of study. This was evident when a madrassah Nazim argued, “If we start infusing modern subjects in our education now, then there will be no ending to it” (personal interview, June 26, 2008). Hence, the madaris personnel reveal a commitment to preserving their identity as being the distinctive educational institutions and reproducing the traditional brand of education, which primarily aims to discover truth, and ultimately, the truth. Viewed from this vantage point, education is not a means of preparing students to excel in the job market, but predominantly holds a moral and spiritual mission in the society. The result is that students are inadequately prepared and lack the ability to engage critically in the challenges of the modern professional world. This is one of the main reasons that their degrees are highly devalued in the modern job market.

On the other hand, the public school plan of studies offers three major categories at the secondary school level: science group, humanities group, and technical group. A major portion of the curricular content of all these groups seeks to impart modern and secular knowledge. The subjects offered are: English and Urdu as compulsory subjects, physics, chemistry, biology, maths, social sciences and a number of technical subjects (such as computer sciences, metal works, wood works, electricity, and electrical motor-winding, etc.). In addition, a number of ideological subjects (such as Islamic Studies, a portion from the Quran, and Pakistan Studies) are also the integral aspects of public school education.

The Curriculum Wing of the government of Pakistan lays down criteria for the Textbook Boards, which have a monopoly on authorizing books for use in public schools in their respective provinces. This monopoly allows the Textbook Boards to act as ideological gatekeepers, making sure what they see as ideologically acceptable text enters into the classrooms. During this research study, I observed that the textbooks, even those of modern subjects, are heavily loaded with doctrinal material. It appears that the process of Islamization of education, which was initiated during the decade of 1979-89 by the National Education Policy of 1979, has persisted and been reproduced over the years without any obvious change. At that time, public school textbooks were rewritten to include the ideological material (Qadeer, 2006; Rahman, 2004; Government of Pakistan, 1982). The theme of the Islamization of knowledge will be further
elaborated in the following pages. However, the textbooks that I observed were either written in 2002 or before; since March 2002, the curricula have not been revised.

It appears that the traditional examination system in the public schools also greatly affects the curricular design, patterns of the textbooks, and eventually what happens in the classrooms. As the students are mainly evaluated through the written responses of lengthy essay-type questions in the standardised exams, the textbooks and exercises after each lesson are designed to facilitate this process. The post-lesson questions do not pose any academic challenge to the students or inspire their analytical or reflective capabilities. Instead, they generally require the reproduction of textbook content, sometimes without the slightest deviation. The following questions, which have been taken from post-lesson exercises of different textbooks, support these arguments:

- Write down the fourteen points of Quaid-e-Azam? (Pakistan Studies Class 9 & 10, p. 38)
- Explain the salient features of objective resolution? (Pakistan Studies Class 9 & 10, p. 55)
- Write a detailed note on the importance of Zakat? (Islamic Studies Class 9 & 10, p. 66)
- Explain the contributions of different Muslim scientists in the field of biology? (Biology Class 9, p. 20)
- Describe an illustrated account of root of mustard plant? (Biology Class 9, p. 59)
- Describe in detail the structure of a bacterial cell? (Biology Class 10, p. 78)
- Write a detailed account on Hazrat Ali with special reference to the great qualities he possessed? (English Class 10, p. 34)

In contrast to both the madaris and public schools, elite schools exclusively impart Eurocentric knowledge and prepare their students for Cambridge GCE O/A level examinations. They have adopted the most modern curricula, which are being taught in the prominent British schools. The books are very recent and contain up-to-date information. For instance, the textbook of biology for O-level was re-written in 2007, which coincidentally was also the time of this study. The writers explain in the preface of the textbook:

Care has been taken to ensure that all new topics in the syllabus are adequately covered, for example, requirements in biotechnology and genetic engineering. The chapter ‘Effect
of Human Activity on the Environment’ has been completely re-written to keep it up to date. (Kwan & Lam, 2007, p. iii)

Throughout the textbook, emphasis is generally placed on thinking skills, wherein the questions are posed to stimulate students’ analytical and reflective capabilities. For instance, a “Thinking Room” at the end of each chapter invites students to apply their conceptual understanding to solve related problems. In the preface of the textbook, the writers explain the kind of qualities they intend to foster through exercises in the Thinking Room: “The scientific methods and thinking skills employed by the students in the Thinking Room include those of analysis, observation, inference, comparison, classification, planning investigations, decision-making, creative problem-solving and so on” (Kwan & Lam, 2007, p. iii).

The other textbooks used in elite schools are not much different in the nature of their content and design. For instance, the style and content of the English textbook also encourages students’ original thinking, when they write summaries, compose communicative writing, or respond accurately to the comprehension questions. The writer himself explains, “The purpose of this book, therefore, is to give students enough guidance to enable them to reach the highest standard they are capable of” (Etherton (1994, p. V). In general, all books contain a list of reference material for further study. Moreover, the examination system in the elite schools employs a variety of methods including written, practical, and oral exams to evaluate the learners. The teachers elaborate that in exams the students are generally assessed on the standards of their academic analysis, independent thinking, reasoning, and problem-solving skills; therefore, the designs of textbooks are quite helpful to promote these human capacities. They also acknowledge that textbooks provide them with enough flexibility to modify and expand the curricular content in order to impart more advanced concepts.

In regards to pedagogical techniques, the madaris personnel strongly believe that the didactic discourses instigated by the medieval Muslim scholars are grounded within Islamic framework; therefore, they are the most suitable for their classwork, even in the current age. However, in this study, I did not observe the well-documented sophistication of traditional classwork, where, though highly respectful of the views of their teachers, the students were often engaged in lively discussions, debates, and questioning with them. It was not anomalous to have students revealing
views that differed from those of their teachers. Similarly, a student who proved his brilliance in the discussion was usually given a favoured position in the classroom (Anzar, 2003; Mumtaz, 1998; Nayyar, 1998; Talbani, 1996). Instead, the classwork that I observed was largely a unidirectional monologue than a feedback-based communicative lecture that would ensure the students’ involvement.

In general, the present-day madaris have retained their traditional practice of employing distinctive teaching methods for children and adults. To teach children, reliance is exclusively put on memorization. This insistence is based on the presumption that, at this tender age, memory is usually more active and must be fully exploited. Thus, many children could memorize several chapters from the Quran by heart, if not in its entirety. Madaris teachers consider classes of memorizing the Quran as the most exigent, because they have to work with students on a one-to-one basis. However, the teachers would receive assistance from older and more accomplished students to work with and guide the younger and less accomplished ones. On several occasions, I observed that, as part of traditional methodology, the teacher would start the class by asking students to recite what was taught the previous day. After ensuring that the students had learned to read and pronounce the Quranic words in an adequate manner, he then would read the next few lines in a paragraph three to four times with a student, until the student began to correctly pronounce and read the new text. In subjects other than the Quran, however, a generally accepted view is that the teacher should proceed from that which is simple to that which is more difficult, keeping in mind the students’ ability to inculcate what he is being taught. At the higher grades, for instance, at the khasa level, which is the focus of this study, the teachers usually lecture from memory and tend to limit the information conveyed to that which is within the framework as specified by the textbooks. A usual scene during the classwork time is the students’ deep commitment in taking notes such that they can memorize them in the evenings. Consequently, the most sought for intellectual faculty at the higher levels of education is, again, memorization.

Likewise, the public school teachers rely heavily on lectures as their favoured teaching method at secondary school level. However, most of the lectures observed were dull, dreary, and reflected a one-way flow of information from teacher to the students. On rare occasions, I could see a smile on the teacher’s face or an impression that could make students smile or feel at ease. In general,
the public school teaching appears to be focused on the transmission of knowledge and it equates learning with memorization of the factual information, whether it is contained in the textbooks, lectures, or teachers’ own notes. The public school teachers mostly regretted not being able to apply the latest pedagogical techniques during the classwork, which they had learnt in pre-service and in-service teaching courses. They usually mention the following barriers in this regard: the large class sizes, unavailability of the teaching aids, unsupportive textbooks, time constraints to cover syllabi, passing the exams as a focal point, and conventional student evaluation procedures in the standardized examinations. Some teachers also characterized their most students as “tough” and unable to completely “inculcate” the textbook knowledge. Hence, they would only help them learn important concepts, which simply prepare them to pass the examination. For instance, a public school teacher argued, “If all of my students properly study the entire syllabus, I will consider it a bonus” (personal interview, September 2, 2008). However, such perspectives also emphasize a lack of courage on the part of teachers to take the challenge of helping the “tough students” learn the advanced concepts.

Generally speaking, in both Islamic madaris and public schools observed, the teachers tend to demonstrate absolute authority, dictate commands, and assign work and work-related activities as well as the homework. They rarely bother to explain why the work has been assigned, how it might connect to other learning topics, or the rationale behind their rules and procedures. Instead, in both kinds of schools, the teachers generally valued passivity and did not allow an assertive behaviour from their students. Hence, in this type of entirely controlled study setting, the students are left only with the option of being content with whatever has been bestowed on them, rather than developing their creativity through independent thinking. Moreover, students’ everyday performance is evaluated on the basis of accuracy in reproducing the textbook knowledge, which is generally specified by the teacher.

The madaris and public school teachers also rarely adopt strategies to expand or transform the curricular contents or generate new epistemological possibilities. When they do happen, such rare efforts are confined only to limited areas. For instance, the madaris personnel usually initiate reasoning to analyse the current socio-political issues in the light of religious teachings or to find ways to refute alien philosophies, heretical beliefs, and interpretations of other sects of Islam.
However, they generally perceive the revealed knowledge as the most authentic, reliable, and unlikely to be questioned or modified. Hence, they encourage students to memorize it without even the slightest deviation from the scriptures. Likewise, the public school teachers tend to integrate the “Quranic knowledge” into the content as well as the praxis of apparently secular and modern curricula of even scientific subjects, such as biology, physics, and chemistry. In so doing, they argue that their initiative of “Islamizing” the school knowledge resolves the fundamental methodological issues in education and provides accurate, authentic, and effective ideas and plans to reform present-day academic life of the Muslims.

Moreover, during the classwork, public school teachers reclaim the glories of medieval Muslim scientists and try to disseminate that Muslim scholastic brilliance has actually provided the foundation to Western intellectual and scientific advancements. They also perceive that students at secondary-school-level may not be competent enough to reason through the revealed knowledge or make logical connections between Quranic knowledge and the worldly issues or with science per se. These themes will be further developed in the following pages. In sum, the public school classwork primarily limits students’ educational experience to internalize whatever the scholars reveal to them.

In contrast to both Islamic madaris and public schools, the elite school teachers primarily believe in the creation of knowledge through empirical and deductive processes. They also believe that any kind of knowledge can be questioned or analysed, including faith-based knowledge. They argue that reflection over revealed knowledge would be helpful to ensure an in-depth understanding of the Quranic messages. In general, the elite school teachers take on various methods to go beyond the curricular contents and develop classroom environments that are conducive for advanced learning. Their pedagogical practices mainly aspire to develop students’ intellectual and analytical capabilities, equip them with necessary skills to reason out the solution to a problem, conceptualize rules by which components may fit in a system, and then apply these rules to solve relevant puzzles. During classwork, I observed that the elite school teachers encourage students to explore knowledge, interact meaningfully with learning materials, construct meaning, and test their concepts and hypothesis, while taking responsibility for their own learning. The teachers also raise questions in order to engage students to do independent
research and discover the appropriate answers themselves. In addition, it is common during the classwork for teachers to challenge and probe students to produce arguments that are logically sound and of higher academic quality. When the teachers allocate homework assignments, they expect the students to observe the same high standards of creativity as they do during the classwork. Moreover, the teachers attempt to improve the social scenario of the class by building confidence and responsibility among students, responding to individual differences, and promoting ethical behaviour and moral virtues. They involve students in determining appropriate classroom rules, which promotes students’ feelings of ownership, commitment to the rules and procedures, and sense of shared responsibilities. Hence, the students have a chance to understand why they have particular set of rules and why they do things in certain ways. In short, the elite schools provide their students the kind of schooling experience that is meant to prepare them to excel in the future roles. The following empirical analysis of the classwork and education related activities in the three types of schools under study provide illustrations of the general patterns outlined above.

**Islamic Madaris**

The study of Islamic *fiqha* (jurisprudence) was, in fact, the reproduction of traditional faith-based knowledge, elaboration of major textbook concepts, and an effort to disseminate sectarian interpretations of core Islamic concepts including the Sharia laws. The teacher rarely attempted to connect the fundamental concepts to prevailing social circumstances. However, during the classwork, he raised some questions to promote the students’ creative dispositions; but this was done in a limited way, for instance, simply to challenge the interpretations of other sects of Islam. During a one hour and 30 minutes lecture, which was the longest that I observed, the teacher strictly controlled the classroom time and space and incessantly warned students to stay attentive. He did not let any student leave the classroom or interrupt his lecture by asking a question to get further understanding. At certain points, I observed the students appeared worn-out with the regimented control and the flow of superfluous one-way knowledge, but did not have the courage to record their uneasiness. During the lecture, the teacher completely ignored the bells to switch class. It is a customary practice in current madaris that if a teacher delivers a lecture on an important topic, he is allowed to prolong his discussion past the allocated class time.
In madaris traditions, when a teacher enters the classroom, all students are expected to stand up as a mark of reverence; they are to remain standing until the teacher instructs them to sit down. The teachers usually begin the classwork by asking questions about the previous day’s lesson and listening to the responses. They randomly pick students for this purpose and, based on the students’ performance, either praise or harshly ridicule them. For instance, during one class, the teacher picked some students and asked questions about the previous day’s lesson. That lesson was about “different kinds of fasting in Islam.” The students demonstrated that they had memorized the textbook knowledge and could reproduced it like a “parrot.” For instance:

Teacher: How many kinds of fasting are there in Islam?  
Student A: Six.  
Teacher: Name all the six kinds?  
Student B: Farze, Wajib, Masnoon, Mustahab, Nafali, and Makrooh.  
Teacher: What does Farze Rozah (obligatory fasting) means in Islam?  
Student C: It means that Fasting in the month of Ramadan is a mandatory religious duty for every Muslim male and female who is mature and sane [exact textbook wording].  
Teacher: What is the purpose of Fasting?  
Student D: The purpose of fasting is to divert human conduct to the submission of Allah. Fasting is meant to promote the self-purification, self-righteousness, and spiritual-development of Muslims both men and women [exact textbook wording].  
Teacher: What are the things that break one’s fast?  
Student E: [Stood up and started reproducing line by line the same that was written in the textbook. The teacher interrupted him when the student missed one line from the lesson. The student corrected himself] (classwork, June 25, 2008)

The teacher asked similar questions of other students and demanded the same perfection in response, not allowing them to add or miss anything from what he had taught the day before.

After that the teacher announced the topic of that days’ lesson was the Islamic concept of “Zakat and the deserving recipients.” The teacher began his lecture by explaining the literal meanings of the word “Zakat,” which is purification and growth. In keeping with these qualities, Allah has prescribed Zakat as essential alms and a duty to Allah upon every Muslim who possesses the minimum amount of wealth, called Nisab, within an entire lunar year. Zakat has been prescribed in order to purify the individuals’ wealth, heart, soul, and, by extension, the Muslim society in general of the negative characteristics of selfishness, avarice, and materialism and replace them with desirable qualities of generosity, affection, care, and providing help to the needy. After this,
the teacher explained in detail the rules and criteria of Zakat payment, rules to calculate Zakat, *Nisab* (a limit under which Zakat needs to be paid), and the rules of how Zakat is distributed. In the latter half of the lecture, the teacher explained who deserves Zakat, the modes of Zakat payment, and the etiquette that are involved in giving these religious alms. During the lecture the teacher abundantly cited references from the Quran and Hadith, explaining them in simple Urdu. He also wrote some selected Quranic verses on the blackboard, which was the sole teaching aid used during the lecture, and instructed students to learn them by heart. At the end of his lecture, the teacher distributed a readymade “Zakat Calculation Form” among students that they were to use in future. It would have been a better idea, if the teacher had involved students to develop this form, while applying their learning.

During the lecture, the teacher raised some questions for students and then answered them himself when he noticed that students were not responding. In madaris tradition, the teachers believe that asking questions and then properly answering them is the reproduction of the prophetic Sunnah (example). However, most of the questions asked and their corresponding answers did not mean to expand the curriculum or give students advanced concepts. Instead, they were largely restrained within the framework of the textbook knowledge. For instance, the teacher asked what fiqha stipulates for Muslims who do not pay Zakat. He then answered that, like prayers, Zakat is a compulsory article of the faith, and whoever denies a single article of faith goes beyond the pale of Islam and is deemed an infidel. He also raised the following question: what is the justification of Zakat, when the citizens have to pay so many other taxes? The teacher answered that Zakat is a religious obligation and honestly paying it in full is greatly rewarded in the eyes of God. Besides, Zakat is exclusively spent on the deserving poor, which gives them significant relief from their economic plight. In this sense, Zakat fund can become an important resource with which to begin to achieve economic equality in an Islamic society. The teacher continued that, “our beloved prophet achieved an economic equality by enforcing an efficient Zakat system. It is evident in the fact that at that time there were plenty who wanted to pay Zakat, but there was none to receive it” (classwork, June 25, 2008). Other taxes are not specified by the religion; therefore, there are more chances that people may hide their wealth to evade taxation.
The teacher raised another question: do Shiite Muslims pay Zakat? He explained that the Shiite sect of Islam has different religious interpretations with which we do not entirely agree. Similarly, their fiqha interpretation regarding Zakat is quite different. They believe in a separate alms system that consists of one fifth of the earnings and is called the Khums. Hence, according to Shiite Muslims, Zakat is a tax on specific goods, such as gold, silver, camels, cow, sheep, wheat, dates, barley, and raisons. Each of these types has its own Nisab. The teacher concluded, “We must believe in the truthfulness of our fiqha, and abide by it in true letter and spirit” (classwork, June 25, 2008).

In this way, it appears that during every day of classwork, knowledge is created to reinforce sectarian identities. This will be further discussed in the following pages. In general, the students are strictly forbidden to read books or any kind of literature created by the scholars of other sects. In this regard, a madrassah teacher emphasized, “As teachers it of our obligation to teach whatever we perceive is appropriate for our students” (personal interview, June 26, 2008). Such perspectives and praxis underscore that madaris teachers intend to control students’ knowledge and keep it within the strict limits that they determine.

The teaching of language arts in the madaris under study is largely based on the translation method and focuses on explaining basic grammatical rules and procedures. The teachers require rote-behaviour and do not involve students in any kind of discussion or ask them to make examples to use their prior learning. The classwork is mainly the inculcation of the teacher-specified knowledge, and the students have little liberty to make decision or have choices. In general, three different languages (i.e. Arabic, Persian, and Urdu) are taught in madaris. Arabic is predominant because the Quran, hadith, and other prominent religious literature were developed in this language. Hence, a certain level of competency in Arabic is essential to properly understand this central faith-based literature. Persian, which, before colonization, was socially and academically necessary in Muslim India, still forms an integral part of the curriculum. However, in madaris Arabic and Persian are taught as “dead” languages and, as a result, the teachers generally translate the scholastic material of textbooks as well as their commentaries into Urdu. They also write the meaning of difficult and newly introduced words on the blackboard for students to copy into their personal notebooks to memorize afterwards. In
general, during study periods more communication is done in Urdu than in Arabic or Persian. Therefore, the students simply become able to read and, to some extent, understand fundamental religious literature in Arabic or Persian, but do not attain linguistic competency for independent oral or written communication in these languages. This is evident from responses of some randomly picked students to whom I asked the same question: is it possible that for the next ten minutes we converse solely in Arabic or Persian without reverting to any other language? The students’ responses were:

Student A: No.
Student B: Sorry, I cannot.
Student C: Even the students of Shahadat-ul-Almia (Master’s level) cannot totally converse in Arabic or Persian.
Student D: We do not speak in these languages...I mean during the class...instead we always communicate in Urdu. (informal conversation, June 26, 2008)

The teaching of grammar is an integral part of language arts pedagogy. However, in both madaris observed, the teaching of grammar of Arabic, Persian, or Urdu focused on the mechanics of fundamental rules. The teachers generally argue that learning simple grammar is essential for students to attain linguistic competency as well as the correct pronunciation. The teachers emphasize that incorrect pronunciation might alter the actual meaning of the words; therefore, one must be able to pronounce words correctly, especially if the student intends to recite the Quran effectively. Therefore, in one of Arabic grammar classes observed, the teacher explained eight rules that govern the proper making of the Murakab-e-Izaafi (relative phrase) in Arabic language, while he held the textbook in one hand. For each rule, he wrote some examples on the blackboard for the students to copy. Finally, the teacher made a table on the blackboard elaborating the examples of singular, dual, and plural relative phrases. Whenever, the teacher wrote an entry in the table, he would ask students to repeat after him in order to pronounce it correctly. The students also copied this table in their notebooks in order to memorize it, as they understood that during the next day’s class they would have to reproduce every entry exactly.

I did not see the teachers giving creative written assignments to the students or posing oral challenges to test their learning. The students also did not ask questions for further elaboration of a concept. The homework largely involved the translation of allocated passages, memorization of
the grammar rules and meaning of difficult words, and solving the after lesson exercises by using knowledge extracted directly from the textbook. In sum, it appears that language pedagogy in madaris is still based on the traditional concepts that presume that the learning of grammatical rules and the translation method are sufficient to attain mastery in a language. The teachers are still not mentally prepared to modernize their teaching skills or at least consider the latest developments in this domain as a legitimate remedy to the shortfalls of their cherished heritage, which was undoubtedly developed in the medieval times. The current didactic developments demand madaris authorities to seriously reflect on their pedagogic status quo.

The classwork of the “Islamic Manners and Behaviour” course is another illustration of the reproduction of faith-centered epistemology. However, the overall aim of bringing about the sense of Islamic manners and behaviour in madaris is not limited to the formal didactic activities that take place within the classroom. In fact, they are inculcated, practised, and reproduced through non-teaching regime as well. Therefore, the classwork, rules, discipline, overt body control in the madaris culture, and behavioural expectations combine to groom students according to established Islamic manners and behaviour. Generally, the madaris personnel regard learning of Islamic manners and behaviour as an integral part of and promoting *Taqwa* (piety) among Muslims.

The class that I observed, which was focused on the topic of “rights and responsibilities to the parents/elder,” began with an introduction to the Islamic concept of *Taqwa* and its importance in the religion. The teacher elaborated that *Taqwa* has been defined in various ways, including “piety,” “fear of God,” and “God-consciousness.” But, in fact it carries all these meanings as well as many more. Allah mentioned *Taqwa* and its derivatives twenty-six times in the Quran, always emphasizing that *Taqwa* is the driving force behind the religious faith. Without it, faith is only a meaningless muddle of memorized words and phrases and righteous deeds are only “fantasies” of self-deception and hypocrisy. Thus, piety guides all aspects of the life of followers. After introducing *Taqwa*, the teacher linked it with the topic of that days’ lecture; for instance, “the holy Quran commands the followers to be obedient to parents and show benevolence to them in such a manner that it appears to be the next to divine worship. It is essence of the faith as well as of *Taqwa*” (classwork, October 30, 2007). During the 45 minute
the teacher focused on the following: the Quranic commands about status of father and mother; love and affection; financial support; care during old age; parents’ rights even after their death. The teacher emphasized, “The parents must be respected in any case, even if they are polytheists and want you to follow their faith. In that case you politely refuse and continue to be kind and reverential to them” (classwork, October 30, 2007). As it is a custom and an integral part of madrassah education, the teacher repeatedly referred to the Quranic verses and hadith and lavishly quoted them to emphasize his points. Moreover, in the madarisi traditions, to create self-discipline among students, the teachers usually emphasize concepts such as “God is always watching,” “good deeds earn you the paradise,” and “hell is a punishment for ill-doers.” However, during this study, the coercive tendency in madaris pedagogy was frequently demonstrated where teachers laid more emphasis on divine punishment than on rewards. For instance, during this lecture, the teacher only mentioned three times that kindness towards ones parents will be rewarding in the hereafter and projected the concept of divine chastisement that would result from the mistreating the parents seventeen times. He declared that disobeying parents is a “great sin” and would result in severe penalty on the judgement day. Therefore, it appears that the madarisi teachers perceive that initiating the feelings of “fear” of divine chastisement is more effective to keep followers on the “straight path” than instilling love for God in their hearts and minds. In fact, while God will hold evil-doers accountable in the hereafter, He is also generous and benevolent and the greatest forgiver.

My study underscores that some aspects of teaching the “Islamic Manners and Behaviour” foster the dispositions among students of being excessively submissive and submitting even to unwarranted demands and behaviour on the part of elders. Inside and outside the classroom, the students are trained to respect teachers, obey their commands, and submit to their rules without questioning. Violators, of course, are subject to punishment. Consequently, the madaris education and culture teaches students to learn to be passive, docile, subservient, and surrender before authority no matter the level of obedience required. For example, during classwork the usual teachers’ commands include the following: “clean the blackboard,” “bring the chalk from the office,” “bring a glass of water for me,” “clean my table.” Mostly, the teachers do not include any pleasant prefaces, such as, “please” or “would you please,” before such commands. In my opinion such a preface are highly recommended according to the Islamic concept of manners.
Similarly, during one of my informal visits to a madrassah, the teacher greeted me, offered chair, and directed a 5th Grade student to bring tea from a canteen that was located at quite a distance. On my protest, the teacher quoted a Persian proverb, “ba adab ba murad, be adab be murad” (one who respects elders succeeds in life as compared to one who does not) and explained that serving elders is an integral part of Islamic manners and behaviour. Paradoxically, this kind of interpretation, and the nature of commands mentioned above, may not be purely Islamic; instead, they appear to be very much part of the educational praxis of present-day Pakistani madaris.

The classwork of Al-Tawheed provides opportunities for madaris teachers to promote the Quranic notion of one God and project Islam as Unitarian, monotheist, and the “true” religion. However, the madaris teachers’ persistent practice of refuting the philosophies and interpretation of other religions and sects of Islam sometimes leads them to create knowledge that, when internalized by the students, has the potential to negatively influence their dispositions about other religious communities. In one of the madaris under study, I observed a 45-minute lecture during which the teacher explained the Islamic concept of Tawheed and said that it is most expressed precisely in the first tenant of Islam: “Lâ ilâha illallâh” (there is no God but Allah). The teacher explained that this seemingly simple formula clearly draws a line of demarcation between Eemân (true belief in God) and Kufir (disbelief). The teacher concluded, “We Muslims have faith in one God, Who alone deserves our worship” (classwork, August 9, 2008). Moreover, consistent with the madaris traditional pedagogy and to emphasize his viewpoint, the teacher recited the Quranic verse “Al-Ikhlas” as “Allah is one and only; He is the eternal and absolute; He begetteth not nor is He begotten; and there is none like unto Him” (classwork, August 9, 2008). After that the teacher presented a detailed tafsir (elucidation) of each part of this Quranic verse and emphasized that one who does not believe in the Islamic concept of Tawheed is a Kafir (infidel).

During the classwork, the teacher argued that some of the worlds’ leading religions and their books undoubtedly originated from the divine wisdom. However, these religions are now diluted, because their followers have mixed man-made epistemology into the words of God. Conversely, God himself has taken responsibility to protect the Quran up until doomsday. This will ensure that the Quran remains pure and devoid of any sort of human contamination. The teacher further
explained that Christians and Jews also project their religions as monotheistic, but in actuality, these religions have not remained pure. Christians believe Jesus is the son of God, which makes their religion “polytheist.” Similarly, Judaism can be considered to be a fine example of “idolatry.” To explain his viewpoint the teacher said:

In Christian, Hindu and Buddhist traditions, some individuals claimed to have achieved a spiritual excellence and thus performed some supernatural feats in the public to confirm that status. Consequently, the masses either started seeking mediation through them or worshiped them as gods. Hence, these religions have lists of *pundits, Gurus, Avatars, saints*, etc., to whom people still ardently pray. Conversely, Islam forbids such practices, as they are against the concept of *Tawheed*.... (Classwork, December 14, 2008)

During the lecture, the teacher also refuted certain interpretations of other sects of Islam by explaining that some Muslims construe *Tawheed* to signify that Allah is all and all is Allah, and there is only one existence, which is Allah. In fact, such a belief falls under the definition of *pantheism* and, as such, is a *Kufr* (irreligious). Other Muslims interpret *Tawheed* to undermine Allah’s attributes and claim that He exists everywhere and in everything. Such discourses are *heretical*. The teacher warned students to remain vigilant against such wrongful interpretations of core Islamic concepts.

These kinds of discourses, which are produced and reproduced during everyday classwork, have the potential to influence students’ dispositions and worldviews. The students are made to believe that their sect is the only true version of Islam and all others are false. As a result, they believe that they must work diligently to protect Islam at any cost and also to disseminate it to the people whose religions are either diluted or lack the authenticity of a God-bestowed epistemology. Such dispositions, if displayed negatively, have the potential to intensify sectarian conflict, which is already a volatile situation in Pakistan. It can also express itself in the *Jihadist* perspective of wiping out *un-Islamic* beliefs, such as polytheism, adultery, and paganism and replacing them with the true “words of God.”

**Refutation: A Dominant Theme in Madaris Education**

Traditionally, one of the unwritten mandates of Islamic madaris has been to refute Western educational philosophies, political and economic systems, heretical beliefs, and ideologies of
other religions. The earliest endeavours of refutation surfaced when the personnel associated with the legendary Nizamiyah madrassah in Baghdad attempted to counter the influence of “Greek philosophies” in the eleventh century (Malik, 2008; Nayyar, 1998; Nashable, 1989; Rahman, 2004). Islamic scholars generally perceived these philosophies as an intellectual invasion in Muslim academic domain. Likewise, the personnel of contemporary madaris have continued to reproduce ideologies to refute whatever contradicts the “sanctity” of their intellectual heritage.

The madaris participants in this study mainly argue that, in the past, ulema have resisted the powerful cultural invasion mounted by the British imperialism and have also devoted their lives to protecting the traditional brand of Islamic schooling. In so doing, they have created some outstanding chapters in the history of courage, nobility, religious dignity, and self-respect. In current times, Western imperialistic ideologies, under the guise of the “New World Order,” have yet again intended to subjugate Islamic intellectual heritage. These ideologies project secular knowledge as the universal standard that, in reality, is simply one among many possible ways of knowing. Hence, the imposition of Western secular education has seemingly decentred “revealed knowledge” (or the Quran) and faith-based knowledge as the base of education in Muslim societies and, with it, the corollary aspects of spiritual development have also been decentred. Accordingly, the madaris personnel deem their precise role to be resisting the hegemony imposed by the canons of pure Western knowledge and, inevitably, exerting a powerful influence on revitalizing Quranic knowledge and spiritually centered ways of knowing as part of legitimate academic knowledge building and praxis.

However, in refuting the Western educational philosophies, the madaris personnel, evidently, base their arguments on intellectual discourses that were instigated by the medieval Muslim thinkers. They generally argue that the “core” of madaris education is the revealed knowledge, which is the “word of God,” and, indisputably, a superior way of knowing. Conversely, the Western secular educational philosophies insist upon the rationalistic faculty of the human mind as the exclusive, and only valid, means of knowledge. As the human intellectual capabilities are limited, this kind of theoretical approach is deficient. For instance, a madrassah mufti emphasized:
The light of “divine revelation” guides the quality of knowledge in “our” educational system, whereas in the most of Western education theories, “revelation” does not occupy the core position. Instead their foundation is the human rationality and hence based on profane ways of knowing. Therefore, we perceive no common point between these two types of philosophies. (personal interview, August 9, 2008).

Likewise, the madaris personnel argue that modern and secular theorists have ignored the culture of the “heart” and completely limited their focus to human intellectual capacities. The traditional Islamic concept of schooling, alongside the use of intellectual capabilities, also connotes paying attention to the implications of “heart” within education. However, “heart” must not be confused with the biological organ. In reality, “heart” is a transcendental spirituality, which, although it is connected to the physical heart, in essence thinks, learns, comprehends, and, in particular, helps human beings make connections with the spiritual world. A madrassah teacher explains:

> We, as teachers, have great obligation to take a special care of ‘heart’ and convert it into a noble place, where Quran can be engraved. If done so, it will not only guide students towards spirituality, but also to reflect on messages of the Quran as well as on the secrets of this universe... (personal interview, August 9, 2008)

Therefore, human “heart” is given a central position in the traditional Islamic concepts of education. The “heart” can only achieve perfection if the Quran is imprinted upon it and the “light” of revelation incessantly floods within it. The madaris personnel consider it as a distinctive aspect of their education. They further criticise Western philosophies of education for generally addressing limited and selected aspects of the human nature, which might be individual, social, economic, or psychological. Therefore, they have a contingent standpoint. Moreover, the general focus is on achieving worldly goals, such as wealth, social standing, and power, which have fragmented the heart and consciousness of the modern man.

Conversely, the mission of Islamic education is to reintegrate this fragmented consciousness by once again revitalizing the “revealed knowledge” at the core of the human mind, the binding and nurturing core that has been wiped out by the secular project. Finally, the madaris participants in this study argue that the Western educational philosophies disseminate contradictory viewpoints in a never-ending intellectual debate, in which they challenge, criticize, or negate one another’s point of views. From a traditional standpoint, this situation is alarming for the simple reason that the acute differences among various philosophical schools of thought have put forth confusion in
the domain of education philosophies, which usually provide a guideline to define the goals and orient the educational content as well as praxis. In sum, current madaris in Pakistan provide space for an anti-colonial move, as they offer a central place to revealed knowledge in educational discourse and praxis. Hence, these madaris have kept the development of an alternative way of thinking and non-secular articulations of knowledge and ontology alive.

Besides refuting other educational philosophies, the madaris personnel disseminate “controlled” knowledge to emphasize exploitative elements of Western economic discourses and disruptive influences that Western democracy, liberty, and individualism may have exerted on Muslim societies. In contrast, the madaris personnel tend to project Islamic brands of economic and political systems as the sponsors of egalitarianism. The following excerpt from the classwork of a course entitled “Islamic fiqha” supports these arguments:

The Western democracy works on the distribution of authority between elected people, and they collectively make policies by consulting one another. This system does not work on the principles of a religion...Conversely, in Islamic form of government, rule of God is supreme, and everyone has to act according to the principles outlined in the Quran, and Sharia laws. In Islam, the Shurah (parliament) does not have power to do any kind of amendment in the Sharia laws...instead; the Sharia Laws have to be enforced in true letter and spirit. In essence they guarantee justice, equality, human rights, and respect for individuals, no matter if they are white or black, poor or rich... (classwork, December 14, 2007)

Therefore, it appears that the educational discourses and praxis in present-day Pakistani madaris are greatly embedded in Muslim hegemony. The school personnel tend to portray Muslim intellectual heritage as superior and flawless. In contrast, the knowledge that is produced and reproduced during daily classwork for refutation aims at undermining the accomplishments of other nations. Such kinds of controlled knowledge and one-sided perspectives are not conducive to the development of analytical skills in madaris students.

Another significant aspect of madrassah education is the “creation” of sectarian identities. My respondents clarify that each sect of Islam has its own chain of madaris, which, while following *Dars-e-Nizami*, teaches different interpretations of the “core” subjects. These interpretations are generally compatible with their respective sectarian ideologies. Hence, these madaris become the
educational spaces for transmission of sectarian beliefs and constitution of identities (of “us” and “them”). During every day classwork, sectarian differences are produced by the teachers and then internalized by the students. This is then reinforced in the debating courses, which instil students with advanced knowledge and confidence in presenting their ideology as the only “true” ideology. For instance, the preface of a textbook titled “Ilm-ul-Quran²²” (knowledge of Quran) presents the following content to refute other sects:

It is evident on all and sundry that the world is passing through an era bristled with twists and turns. On the one hand, a crashing wave of infidelity and agnosticism is dominating; one the other hand, a sectarian storm of Ahmadi and Dewbandi groups, is rising. New religious sects are being crafted every day, and each sect is striving to trap others by citing the Holy Quran. Whosoever you may come across, you will observe that he is proclaiming his truth after reciting the Quran. The most illiterate person declares himself the scholar of his times and does not avoid using sarcastic remarks against the great men in Islam, even the pious companions of the Holy Prophet. In order to achieve their covetous motives; these so-called scholars are striving to mislead the innocent and simpleton Muslims by presenting their desired interpretations of the Quran. They are propagating infidelity under the cover of interpretation of the Quran. (Ilm-ul-Quran, 2008, p. 7)

Therefore, besides adherence to the reproduction of primitive education and abhorrence of other religions and philosophies, Islamic seminaries also refute the religious interpretations of other sects of Islam. There are numerous books on the reading list of senior classes that openly project a conflict between different sects. Such books are also widely available in madaris libraries, which provide supplementary material for teachers to use in their arguments during classwork. Box 7.1 presents an excerpt from the classwork to highlight the nature of arguments teachers use to reproduce sectarian ideologies. Moreover, the texts for sectarian refutation are more generally in Urdu than in Arabic or Persian; therefore, they can easily be comprehended by the students, rather than simply memorized.

**Box 0.2: An Example of the Reproduction of Sectarian Ideologies during Classwork**

| During a lecture, teacher told the class about an incident that took place in his village. He said that there once lived an adherent to the Ahl-e-Hadith sect of Islam, whom he [teacher] decided to intermingle with more often so as to make him realize that he was |

following the wrong path—a path that would ultimately lead him to destruction in this world and in the hereafter... After a continuous preaching for 6-months, and sharing some reading material with him, Alhamdulillah, he finally converted to the Barelvi beliefs. We [Barelvi Muslims] embraced him open-heartedly and congratulated him on entering into the factual Islam. We gave him the good news that from now onwards he is a true Muslim and the doors of Hell have been closed on him forever.

At this spot, a student sought permission to share another incident, which was somehow different from this one.

After receiving permission, the student explained that there was a group of rigid Deobandis in their village that kept on propagating their faith despite certain restrictions. Occasionally, some physical confrontations also occurred, but they won’t refrain from their activities. Due to their efforts, a Barelvi Muslim had converted his faith to a Deobandi. What directive do we have for him?

Teacher: How old is he?
Student: Around 62 or 63.
Teacher: Let him know that all his life-time prayers have been dissipated and he has become a MURTID [divert from Islam]. His Nikah [marriage contract] with his wife has been culminated and any relationship with her would now fall under ‘adultery.’ In the present day life when we are surrounded by innumerable evil attractions, staying firm in our faith is the most difficult struggle. Hats off to those who protect their ‘religious beliefs.’

Source: Classwork of a madrassah within this study, August 10, 2008

Therefore, it appears that the “ideological” construction is actively reproduced in madaris education, which portrays other sects of Islam as having “false” interpretations and being a potential threat to “our” true Islam. Hence, the students, who belong to a range of different social and cultural backgrounds, are likely to internalize a common sectarian identity of being Ahl-e-Hadith, Deobandi, Barelvi, or Shiite. When internalized by the students, this kind of school knowledge has the potential to express itself in sectarian violence.

Public Schools

In the public schools observed, the general theory and praxis of language arts teaching is largely analogous to that of madaris. For instance, the teachers perceive that the correct learning of rules is essential to ensuring the students’ proficiency in a language. Hence, they mainly focus their teaching on explaining the basic rules and procedures that govern the English language. However, these rules are explained in their native language, as a result of which, the students mostly translate Urdu sentences into English, while applying the correct procedures. Like
madaris, no emphasize is given on interactive communication in English between the teacher and students or between students. Consequently, the students remain unable to attain fluency and confidence to in applying their learning in real life settings.

In addition, no creative oral or written assignment is usually given to students during the classwork or as homework. For instance, in one of the schools under study, I observed a grammar lesson on “understanding the present continuous tense” in which the teacher spent almost twenty minutes explaining the essential rules of how to construct a correct sentence. He then wrote the following simple formula on the blackboard and explained its composition in the native language of the students (Urdu):

\[
\text{Subject + is, am, are + verb + ing + preposition + object.}
\]

After that, a series of drills began, in which the teacher illustrated this formula by constructing many sentences, for example:

- He + is + going + to + school.
- I + am + waiting + for + you.
- She + is + knocking + at + the door.
- We + are + looking + for + your + lost watch, etc.

Every time the teacher wrote a sentence on the blackboard, he read it three to five times and instructed the class to repeat after him out loud. The teacher later explained to me that this is a vital step to engraving the formula on the students’ minds, as most of them did not have ability to infer it on their own. The teacher then asked the students to open the textbook, which was prescribed by the provincial Board for teaching English Grammar. He would read an Urdu sentence and ask students to translate it, turn by turn, into English.

During the classwork, the teacher did not emphasize other aspects of the same tense (e.g. how to change an affirmative statement into a negative or interrogative or the use of “who, what, where, when, why and how”) as this was not mentioned in the textbook. Moreover, the teacher also discouraged students from taking the liberty to explore concepts beyond his teaching. For instance, when a student translated a sentence as “My father is considering to take an early retirement” (classwork, December 16, 2007), another student interrupted and, after receiving
permission, said, “can we translate it another way as my father explained me last night” (classwork, December 16, 2007). The teacher emphatically denied this students’ request and instructed him to sit down. The student insisted and said that my father told me to add “ing” with “take” to make a correct sentence, such as, “I am considering taking an early retirement.” The student was correct, but the teacher admonished and insulted him by called him “Shakespeare.” Moreover, the teacher instructed students to follow the textbook, which does not give an example of using the “ing” form twice in a sentence. It appeared that the teachers’ motive was not focused on linguistic creativity, but on grades in the final examinations. The grades are not based on how differently a student thinks or creates, but on homogeneity of grammatical structures, blind textual obedience, and reproduction of an unaltered, crammed, and memorized knowledge.

The teacher also grossly neglected some other important features of the present continuous tense, such as that it can be used to describe the background of a story, a joke, and an event. The teacher did not mention anything about using “have” when it has non-state meaning, which is another important aspect of the present continuous tense. For instance, it can be used in place of “to eat” “take” and “drink” etc. For example: “They are having lunch,” “We are having a party tonight,” or “She is having coffee.” Moreover, the teacher did not recommend any kind of literature for further reading. Instead, he assigned students the memorization of thirty sentences from the textbook as homework. On my query about why he did not ask students to construct their own sentences, the teachers expressed that he anticipated that most of them would be unable to do such an assignment. He said, “They will make wrong sentences and then ask me for correction or further understanding...obviously, I do not have time to repeat a topic over and over again...I have to cover the syllabus as well” (post-class reflections, December 16, 2007).

In the public schools, the teaching of English literature is purely the translation of the text into Urdu. The teaching, akin to that in Islamic madaris, begins by revisiting the previous day’s lesson. The students are required to precisely translate what the teacher had taught a day before. They are also asked to correctly spell the difficult English words. They are heavily rebuked or physically punished when they make mistakes. On one occasion, a few students told me that their teacher had fixed a punishment quota of four sticks for one spelling mistake. These students
were too frightened to even attend the class. In this way, like madaris, the coercive tendency in public school pedagogy is greatly evident.

After the routine of the students listening to a condensed version of the previous days class, the teacher would generally ask students to open the textbook to start the new lesson. For instance, during one of the lessons that I observed, the teacher asked students to open the page five of the textbook in order to start a new lesson, titled “Festivals of Pakistan.” He then started translating the text into Urdu. Whenever a difficult word came up he would write it with its definition (in Urdu) on the blackboard for students to copy into their personal notebooks. Throughout the 40-minute study period nothing else happened besides the translation of the text and the highlighting the difficult words.

During the lesson, however, the names of some important festivals in the Muslim community came up, which the teacher could have used to expand the textbook knowledge by explaining their background and the purpose. He could also have asked the students to do this in order to infuse some “creativity” into his teaching. Yet, he grossly ignored all such vital aspects. Likewise, the teacher could also have used after-lesson exercises to let students find their own answers. But, contrary to such expectations, the teacher distributed readymade notes to the class, which included the answers to all of the questions. These answers were nothing else than exact replications of the textbook material and wording. As homework, the teacher asked the students to practice translation and memorize correct spellings and the meaning of difficult words. He also asked students to memorize his provided notes verbatim. In general, the work of language arts in the public schools does not require creativity. Furthermore, English language is not taught as a complex system that could equip students with the cultural capital of linguistic competency such that they could skilfully apply it to ultimately attain social power and financial rewards. As previously discussed, competency in English is an essential requirement for access to the higher echelons in Pakistan.

The classwork in the “Pakistan studies” course in the public schools was also mechanical rote work and the explanations were largely one-dimensional and promoted one-sided perspectives. Some of the curricular content discussed in the class was “distortion” of historical facts or
encouraged the dispositions of “hatred” against Hindus as well as India. For instance, in one of the schools under study, I observed a lesson on the “Fall of East Pakistan,” in which the teacher generally elaborated the causes of separation of East Pakistan (now Bangladesh) from the textbook. As explained to the class, they include incompetent leadership, control of Hindus on trade and services, economic backwardness, role of Hindu teachers, Indian interference (see: pp. 53-54 of the textbook\textsuperscript{23}). A larger portion of the 45-minute lecture portrayed Hindus as the worst enemies of Islam in general and of Muslims of Pakistan in particular. Likewise, India was projected as the biggest threat for the existence and sovereignty of Pakistan.

Some very important factual information regarding the causes of the country’s separation was altogether missing from both the curriculum as well as teachers’ elaborations. For instance, at the time of independence of Pakistan in 1947, Bengalis in East Pakistan were the majority population and demanded Dhaka as the capital for this new state. It was forcefully declined by the politicians of West Pakistan who, incidentally, inherited power from the colonial government. Instead, they declared Karachi as the capital because it was located in the territory of West Pakistan. These politicians also declined another popular demand of East Pakistan’s population to accept “Bengali” as the national language. Moreover, Bengalis generally faced economic deprivation for many years after independence, which eventually aggravated their demand for a separate homeland. It is evident in the historical facts that Bengalis were never awarded equal share in the national budgets or in the government, civil, and military bureaucratic positions and other lucrative jobs. On top of that, the politicians of West Pakistan declined to hand-over the government to the \textit{Awami League} of Sheikh Majibur Rahman, which received an absolute majority in East Pakistan in the general elections of 1971. On my query into the reasons for omitting these historical facts from the lesson, the teacher replied, “It is a sensitive issue and I do not want to go beyond the boundaries specified by the Curriculum Wing” (personal interview, September 29, 2008). Hence, the textbook material completely supported the teachers’ arguments of projecting the fall of East Pakistan as a conspiracy of non-patriotic Bengalis and Hindu leadership of India. For example, under the heading “Control of Hindus on Trade and Services” the textbook explains: “In East Pakistan trade and services were totally under the

\textsuperscript{23} Pakistan Studies for classes 9-10, Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore. Approved by the Ministry of Education (Curriculum Wing) Islamabad, Vide NOC letter No. F-11-2/2002-SS
control of Hindus and they inculcated the seeds of separation among the Bengalis under a specific plan” (p. 53). Likewise, under the heading “Role of Hindu Teachers” the textbook specifies: “Education sector in East Pakistan was totally under the control of Hindus. Under the guidance of India they fully poisoned the minds of Bengalis against Pakistan and aroused their sentiments” (p. 53). Neither the textbook nor the teacher explained how it became possible that Hindus gained complete control of the trade and services as well as the education sector of a Muslim majority province in a country that was governed by Muslims. However, this kind of distorted information and one-sided perspective undoubtedly influence the dispositions and worldviews of the students. The teaching of hatred in public schools will be further elaborated in the following pages.

The chemistry course in the public schools was simply the elaboration of specified information, essential rules and procedures for making and balancing a chemical equation, and rote behaviour normally achieved through regular drilling exercises. The innovative thoughts that are usually emphasized through creative activities and scientific experimentation were grossly missing. Likewise, in both schools the teachers did not invite a question-answer session of any sort to satisfy the students’ curiosity for knowledge. On many occasions the teachers also ignored or averted the opportunity to go beyond the textbook knowledge and deliver some useful advanced concepts. For instance, in one of the schools the teacher started the new lecture about “single and double displacement chemical reactions.” He began by holding the textbook in one hand and the chalk on the other, and wrote the definition on the blackboard. He used exactly the same wordings of the textbook material, writing “When a neutral element becomes an ion during a chemical reaction and replaces or displaces another ion in a compound, it is called a single displacement reaction” (classwork, February 14, 2008). The teacher then wrote the following formula to clarify how a correct equation of single displacement chemical reaction can be made.

\[
\begin{align*}
A + BC & \rightarrow AC + B \\
A + BC & \rightarrow BA + C
\end{align*}
\]

The teacher explained that in the first case a neutral element has displaced a positive ion and in the second case a negative ion respectively from the compound. When a metal is more reactive with a strong tendency to lose an electron, it can replace a metal ion from a compound in the solution form. Such reactions fall into the category of positive single displacement reactions.
Conversely, if a non-metal ion has a strong tendency to gain an electron in a compound, it will generate negative displacement reaction, and so on and so forth. Then the teacher wrote a number of examples on the blackboard to elaborate his points. Some of them were as follows:

**When positive ion has been displaced**

\[
\begin{align*}
Zn + 2HCl & \rightarrow ZnCl_2 + H_2 \\
3Mg + Fe_2O_3 & \rightarrow 3MgO + 2Fe \\
Zn + 2 AgNO_3 & \rightarrow Zn(NO_3)_2 + 2Ag
\end{align*}
\]

**When negative ion has been displaced**

\[
\begin{align*}
F_2 + 2KI & \rightarrow 2KF + I_2 \\
F_2 + 2KCl & \rightarrow 2KF + Cl_2 \\
Br + 2Li I & \rightarrow 2Li Br + I_2
\end{align*}
\]

Likewise, the teacher elaborated that, in double displacement chemical reactions, two compounds exchange their partners and, hence, are displaced mutually. He then gave his formula to enable the students to understand his point and make the correct chemical equations. For instance:

\[
BC + DE \rightarrow BD + CE
\]

After that, a series of examples were used, such as:

\[
\begin{align*}
Al_2(SO_4)_3 + 3BaCl_2 & \rightarrow 2AlCl_3 + 3BaSO_4 \\
3Ca(OH)_2 + Al_2(SO_4)_3 & \rightarrow 3CaSO_4 + 2Al(OH)_3
\end{align*}
\]

However, during the entire 45-minute lecture the teacher did not involve students by asking them to suggest a relevant chemical reaction or balance an equation. It was more or less a one-sided communication and flow of information. The students mostly remained busy by taking the notes or copying the chemical equations from the blackboard. No one raised a relevant question or even asked the teacher to repeat or further elaborate a concept. However, a few students asked a question about the winter holidays, which was quite irrelevant, but at least made the class alive again. It appeared that the students needed a break from the “tough” classwork. The teacher also changed the topic briefly and responded to the question eagerly as if he was also anxious for the holidays. Moreover, during the lecture I noticed that students would frequently start whispering as soon as the teacher turned to write something on the blackboard. It appeared that their interest
in the topic was considerably low and they wanted to distract the teacher. A few times they actually succeeded in doing so, and the teacher had to warn the class that there would be serious repercussions if they would continued.

Chemical reactions are also categorized on the basis of emission or absorption of energy (i.e. endothermic and exothermic reactions). Yet, this aspect of categorization was ignored altogether. This information would have been valuable for the students, especially when they have to handle different types of chemicals during lab work. For instance, sodium (Na) is a very reactive metal and must be handled with extreme care. Sodium instantly reacts with water to make sodium hydroxide base and hydrogen gas. This reaction is so exothermic that the inflammable hydrogen can easily ignite explosively in the atmosphere as soon as it is oxidized. Hence, for such chemical properties sodium, metal is usually kept under mineral oil so as to save it from reacting with oxygen. At another point, the teacher wrote the following chemical equation on the blackboard:

\[2 \text{Mg (solid)} + \text{CO}_2 (\text{gas}) \xleftrightarrow{} 2\text{MgO (gas)} + \text{C (solid)}\]

He then explained that carbon dioxide is used to extinguish fire but omitted a very important aspect that it is not used on magnesium fire. Magnesium is one of the highly combustible substances in the world and, if its fire is attempted to be extinguished with carbon dioxide, the situation could become even worse. In sum, the focus of the chemistry class was not more than just giving explanations for facts or concepts. The students were not asked to choose learning topics or projects for further study. Instead, almost all learning exercises appeared to be mechanical and predetermined by the teacher.

Likewise, the work in the biology class was not based on the ”creation of knowledge” that results from an activity; rather, it was focused on how much had been internalized. Hence, the best student was not the one who had a different viewpoint or possessed innovative ideas on a topic; the student that was considered the most intelligent was the one who had the ability to reproduce each step from the textbook or the content discussed in the class. At certain places, however, teachers attempted to integrate the Quranic knowledge in their pedagogy or highlighted the achievements of medieval Muslim scientists in an effort to reclaim glories of the past. Apart
from that, I did not observe any effort from teachers to modify or expand the curricular content to include some advanced information. For instance, the biology teacher in one of the classes observed invested almost fifteen minutes to make a colourful drawing of a human heart on the blackboard, as it was the topic of that day’s classwork. It would have been a better idea if, to save time, the teacher had brought a readymade chart or a model of heart in the class. However, after completing his diagram, the teacher opened the textbook and started reading the functions of different parts, while pointing at them in the drawing. For example, “right and left ventricles make up the largest part of the heart. (This is right ventricle and this is the left). Both of them form the whole lower portion. They have thick and strong muscles, which help to pump blood throughout the body. Similarly, the right and left atriums form the upper part of the heart. It is smaller and has relatively thin walls as compared to ventricles. It helps them to receive blood that flows into the heart” (classwork, January 7, 2008). The teacher repeated the biological names and new concepts several times until he became satisfied that the students had internalized them. At the end of the lecture, a student raised his hand and requested permission to ask a question. The interaction went as follows:

**Student:** What are the components of our blood?

**Teacher:** Water, plasma and three types of cells called white blood cells, red blood cells and platelets. But remember water is the most important ingredient and in its absence the transportation of blood from one part to another is impossible. (classwork, January 7, 2008)

To emphasize his point the teacher referred to a Quranic verse: “And We created every living thing from water” and explained that the advancement in the scientific knowledge has helped to better understand Quranic messages. He also referred to a renowned medieval Muslim physician and surgeon Ibn al-Nafis and explained that he was the first physician to discover the exact anatomy of a human heart and how blood circulates in a human body. (The theme of Islamizing scientific knowledge will be further discussed in the following pages.) As homework, the students were asked to draw and label the same diagram and memorize the names of different components of a human heart and their functions.

In the public schools, science experiments were more or less class demonstrations led by the teachers. The teachers did not encourage students to develop their own hypotheses, test them, or
choose which mechanisms and equipments to use. They also did not invite the students’ suggestions or assign them work for further investigation. Moreover, during this one-sided presentation, which usually lasted over one and half hours, I observed that the teachers in both public schools missed some valuable and relevant information and, hence, could not create an in-depth understanding of the topic among students. For instance, students in both public schools were involved in the biology experiment of dissecting a frog only once an academic year, during which time the teachers attempted to impart as much information as possible. In one of the schools observed, before the actual experiment, the teacher gave a 30-minute lecture about the procedures and mechanisms involved in the dissection as well as salient features of external and internal anatomy of the frog and the functions of major organs and organ systems. He showed some diagrams and sketches to elaborate certain vital concepts. He then asked a student to take a “big” frog from a jar, which was uncovered so that the frog could breathe easily. The frog was chloroformed; the body was put upside down on a wooden dissection board and fixed with the help of paper pins. The teacher performed the dissection and verbally explained various procedures that he was following at different steps. Starting from the digestive system, the teacher exposed different body parts and systems and verbally explained their structures and functions. However, except for the heart, the teacher did not open any other major organ or system to elaborate their internal anatomy. He also did not explain the precise functions of the liver and pancreas and what kind of enzymes they produce to aid the digestive process. The teacher rarely elaborated the coordinating mechanisms between different body parts or systems. The nervous system and the nature of nerve impulses, along with factors that affect their transmission, were altogether ignored. Moreover, the shortage of necessary resources became evident when, at one point, the frog’s body began to bleed, but there was no cotton or any kind of other arrangement to clean it. A student provided some tissue papers to the teacher to clean the blood drops so that different organs could be seen easily.

In conclusion, during this presentation the students appeared to be more in the position of spectators than participants. The teacher did not initiate creative discussion or raise questions to involve students in any sort of reflection that could lead to the development of a scientific approach among them. Instead, it was a solo performance mainly dominated by the teacher, who held absolute authority. In the second public school, the teacher performed almost the same
exercise with the slightest procedural variations. However, a strange incident occurred when the dissection was completed. A student asked the teacher what to do with the dissected frog. Before the teacher could reply, a wrestler-type student stepped forward and said, “I know what to do with it.” He caught the dissected frog by legs and whirled it around his head and then threw it with full force into the playground. I thought that the teacher would give the student a full lecture on the impacts of this act on the environment and the kinds of diseases that could spread due to decaying body of the frog or, at least, he would warn the student to not repeat this kind of foolish act in the future. Yet, amazingly, the teacher smiled, which encouraged the class to laugh wholeheartedly. Later, I asked the teacher about possibilities of educating the class about lab safety procedures, potential hazards, and the proper ways to dispose of the dissected materials. The teacher smiled and said, “How much stuff can I cover within one and a half hour?” (post-class reflections, February 10, 2008). He then argued that theoretical knowledge would not be enough unless it is supported with necessary equipment. Presently, he has not been provided with sufficient financial resources to buy the essential safety materials, such as plastic gloves, aprons, and antibiotic lotions. However, a lack of will maybe another factor that the teacher did not like to mention, because buying a plastic bag to dispose of the frog is not too expensive.

Islamization of Knowledge: A Dominant Theme in Public Schools

A dominant theme that emerged from the public school education was an excessive practice of Islamizing the school knowledge. This has two significant aspects. First, the teachers attempt to integrate the “Quranic knowledge” into apparently modern/secular subjects. Second, the teachers tend to reclaim historical narratives from Western discourses and disseminate the achievements of Muslim scientists and philosophers, which they perceive have been grossly undermined by the West. However, I observed that some aspects of Islamizing the school knowledge perpetuate hatred against certain non-Muslim communities. These components of public school education can be considered analogous to those of Islamic madaris.

Most significantly, the textbook content provides impetus to the teachers’ practices of Islamizing secular knowledge. Almost every public school textbook is loaded with doctrinal material and contains plentiful quotations from the Quran and hadith. For instance, the Grade 9 Biology
textbook\textsuperscript{24} contains as many as thirteen Quranic references on pages 12 and 13 to emphasize only one basic scientific concept, which is the “Origin of life.” Some of them include:

- “Allah hath created every animal from water. Some of them creep up on their bellies, others walk on two legs, and others on four. Allah creates what He pleases. He has power over all things”
- “Then fashioned We the drop a clot, then fashioned We the clot a little lump, then fashioned We the little lump bones, then clothed We the bones with flesh”
- “He sends down water from the sky and with it brings forth the buds of every plant. From these We bring forth green foliage and close-growing grain, palm trees laden with clusters of dates within reach, vine yards and olive groves and pomegranates (which are) alike and different. Behold their fruit when they bear fruit and ripen surely. In these, there are signs for the believers”

Similar kinds of Quranic references can be found in textbooks of other subjects. For instance, the Grade-10 English textbook\textsuperscript{25} contains the following reference from the Quran to further emphasize the concept of the “Origin of life”: “Read in the name of thy Lord who created. He created man from a clot of blood. Read! And thy Lord is the most Bounteous who taught by the pen.”

Some Quranic references are predominantly meant to promote spirituality among the students through reflecting upon and understanding the scientific mechanisms in their surroundings. The Grade 9 English textbook\textsuperscript{26} contains such a reference: “In the creation of the heaven and the earth, in the alternations of day and night, in the ships that sail and benefit the men, in the clouds, in the rain—there are signs for those who think, understand and believe.”

The public school teachers generally endorse the integration of the “Quranic knowledge” into the content and praxis of secular/modern subjects and find it useful for the students’ holistic growth. They argue that, by making curricular connections, the Quranic knowledge becomes a “living curriculum” and allows students to understand and appreciate the spirit of its messages as well as

\textsuperscript{24} Biology Grade 9 Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, 2002. (P. 12 & 13)
\textsuperscript{25} English Grade 10 Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, 2002. (P. 1)
\textsuperscript{26} English Grade 9 Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, 2002. (P. 46)
their relevancy to social life. Hence, while the modern subjects adequately prepare students for material success, the Quranic knowledge promotes their spiritual attributes, enlightens their minds with Islamic religious knowledge, and creates self-discipline in their character and actions. A public school head teacher argued the following advantages for Islamizing the school knowledge:

If our teachers amicably combine the Quranic knowledge with the curricular content of modern subjects, it will generate two advantages...First, the students who usually do not get enough opportunities to properly understand the Quran—the way it has to be—will gradually become able to appreciate the spiritual and social significance of its messages. Second, when they will see the relevancy of Quranic messages to their lives, they will never deviate from the code of Islamic conduct...no matter what profession they adopt after completing their education... (personal interview, August 26, 2008)

Therefore, only preparing the students for worldly achievements is not a desired educational objective for the public school personnel. They highly recommend incorporating faith-based epistemology to further elaborate the concepts of modern subjects. In this way, the students will precisely comprehend the divine rules that govern the entire universe that also have a direct applicability in their personal lives, every day social transactions, and the eternal life hereafter. Thus, to reproduce this kind of an integrated knowledge during the classwork, a public school biology teacher explains his strategy as follows:

There is a great deal of knowledge, which we can draw from the Quran and bring into the classroom of science. Hence, I always try to find the relevant information from the Quran and then introduce or try to incorporate in my lessons. For example, with the grade-nine ‘Abiogenesis and Biogenesis’ which is the unit for ‘origin of life,’ the first thing I do is to introduce what Quran says about this particular topic, and then elaborate the Islamic perspective. Similarly, while teaching an Atom, I introduce the Quranic verses that elaborate the power and command of God, Who can create anything—including this kind of a complete micro-cosmos within such a tiny particle called atom. (personal interview, September 11, 2008)

Likewise, the chemistry teacher engenders pedagogical possibilities to relate scientific concepts with the Quranic epistemology. He believes that raising questions and then properly answering them is useful to make students “attentive” as well as to inculcate important information in their minds. Hence, during the classwork he tends to raise questions, such as the following: Who created acids and alkali and gave them specific properties? Who created matter, which, if
converted into energy, attains altogether different characteristics? Who has made iron expand when heated and water increase in size when frozen? Who has made water a compound of two highly inflammable elements, hydrogen and oxygen, that, when combined, are bestowed the unique property of extinguishing flaming fires? The teacher concludes, “I always assist my students to understand that there is no one else besides Allah, Who has the power to do all this” (post-class reflections, September 16, 2008). Another teacher explained that replacing the world “nature” with “Allah” (the almighty) during an ecology lesson gives the opportunity to live in His divine presence during classwork with consciousness and awareness of his marvellous creative powers.

Therefore, the science lessons are taught in the public schools in light of its inherent scientific truth, without taking into consideration the unjust perspectives of “agnosticism,” which implies that the name of God must not be mentioned in any of the scientific theory and research. In contrast, introducing such metaphysical elements can hinder the projection of the “unreliability” of scientific knowledge because it has solely been generated through human reasoning and rationality. Therefore, after rejecting the antagonistic approach in science, the public school teachers perpetuate that only God is the creator and all of the scientific phenomena in this universe bear witness to this fact.

Most importantly, in the Islamizing of scientific knowledge, the teachers remain cognisant to not give an impression about the Quran as being a book of science. It is much more than that. In fact, it is the biggest encyclopaedia, which contains all the sciences of this world and the hereafter.

One science teacher explained:

> Whenever, I quote Quranic verses in my lessons...I make clear [to students] that Quran is the ‘word of God” and has many topics including the science. Its content will never change. Conversely the scientific knowledge is changeable. In the past, the research in science has changed many precepts, and challenged many more. This is a continuous process in the science. However, the scientific discoveries also help us to understand the real meanings of the Quranic verses. Resultantly, when students come to know that the human discoveries help to understand the Quran, it enhances their faith in Islam, oneness of God, and the truthfulness of His revelation in the Quran. (personal interview, September 14, 2008)
In sum, the public school personnel have trust in maintaining a “holistic” approach in their educational praxis. They believe that if the “Quranic knowledge” is allowed to permeate throughout the coursework, it will help students to have a greater appreciation of how Islam is beneficial to them and their learning. Simultaneously, the teachers want their students to become skilled by learning the modern subjects and being capable of reaping the material advantages. While doing so, the Quranic knowledge will help them not to go astray from the “straight path” as specified by Islam.

The second fundamental aspect of the Islamization of knowledge is the continuous attempt on the part of teachers to reclaim the historical narratives from Western discourses during the classwork. The teachers generally claim that, during the Islamic golden era, many Muslim mathematicians and scientists made significant contributions in science, mathematics, and medicine, which are grossly ignored within Western literature. In reality, Muslim scholars provided an impetus to Western scientific discoveries and advancements in other fields, such as education, philosophy, maths, and astronomy. The textbook material also provides support to the teachers to make such claims. For instance, the Grade 9 biology textbook mentions the names of ten Muslim scientists and gives examples of their original contributions in the domain of science. Some of the statements assert that Muslim scientists actually corrected the Western misconceptions. For example, the following excerpt has been taken from a table presented on page 9 of the same textbook:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Scientist</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Books</th>
<th>Important Contribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ibn-al-Haitham</td>
<td>965 – 1039 AD</td>
<td>Al-Manazir</td>
<td>These two books were translated into Latin, Hebrew, Greek and other western languages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mizan-ul-Hikma</td>
<td>He corrected the Greek conception of vision, locating retina as the seat of vision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This kind of textbook knowledge encourages the teachers either to cite other examples or, sometimes, go a step further in asserting that Western literature has actually portrayed the Muslim scholars’ accomplishments as if done by their own scientists. In so doing, the teachers claim that they always tend to quote facts in their classes, which they mostly select from authentic resources. To provide an illustration, I have picked a few statements from chemistry,

27 Biology Grade 9 Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, 2002. (P. 9)
physics, and biology classes, which the teachers used mainly to reclaim the glories of medieval Muslim scientists:

- Abu Musa Ibn Hayyan was recognized as the father of chemistry in the Muslim academic world due to his magnificent contributions, such as, perfection of scientific techniques in crystallization, calcinations, preparing the steel, and dyeing the cloths and tanning the leather, etc. but these achievements were not endorsed by the West.
- The medieval Muslim scholar Al-Battani determined with remarkable accuracy the actual length of a solar-year, which is 365 days, 5 hours, 46 minutes and 24 seconds.
- Ibn-al-Nafis was the first scientist to explain the pulmonary blood circulation with exact details some 400-years before Sir William Harvey, who has solely been credited for this discovery.
- The surgical instrument for internal examination of human ear was initially discovered by a Muslim scientist known as Abul Qasim Al-Zahravi.
- Muslim scientists, in fact, invented the Mariners’ Compass, which revolutionized travelling in the ocean. The Western literature on science generally does not recognize this remarkable contribution of Muslims to the world of science.

The aforesaid arguments also underscore that, akin to madaris, the ultimate thrust of the public school education appears to be the Islamization of the entire society. The public school head teacher acknowledged this fact when he said, “we mainly intend to guide our students towards a definitive goal of Pakistan, which is none other than to create a completely Islamized state” (personal interview, September 1, 2008).

Hence, the vocabulary and concepts used in the textbooks (and during the classwork as well) are consistent with the vocabulary and concepts that are generally found in the political rhetoric of the pan-Islamists, who are mostly proponents of Islamic Sharia laws being promulgated as a national policy. Most significantly, the “ideology of Pakistan” is incessantly blended with the “Islamic ideology” in the textbooks. For instance, the following excerpt from the textbook of “Pakistan Studies” highlights this obvious trend:

---

28 Pakistan Studies for grades 9 & 10 Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, 2002 (p. 1)
The ideology of Pakistan and the Islamic ideology are supposed to be having the same meaning. No doubt, the Islamic ideology is the foundation of the ideology of Pakistan. Thus we can say that the ideology of Pakistan was the consciousness of the Muslims in the historical perspective of the South Asian subcontinent that they were a separate nation on the basis of the Islamic ideology. (Pakistan Studies, p. 1)

The government is central in defining the ideological core of the national education/curriculum policy as well as the parameters of “who belongs” (Adeney and Lall, 2005). The public school teachers in this study clarify that Islam-minded educational bureaucrats play a decisive role in determining the ideological core of the public school curricula. Hence, their main objective of presenting Islam as a national ideology in the textbook is to sanctify the political role of Islam in the politics and society in general. However, some of the textbook material, which is primarily concerned with the Islamization of the students and, through them, of the entire state, has the potential to provoke students’ negative dispositions against non-Muslim communities. For instance, non-Muslims, especially Hindus, are portrayed as wicked and treacherous and India is portrayed as a big threat to the existence of Pakistan. Besides, some textbooks themes encourage intolerance, extremism, and jihad against non-Muslims. Normally, this kind of textbook material can be classified as teaching hatred. The following illustrations, which I gathered from the textbooks of different classes/subjects with the help of the public school participants, support these arguments:

- “The Mughal ruler Akbar left no stone unturned to please the Hindus. He even sabotaged the interests of Muslims in trying to do so. He appointed them on high posts. These steps encouraged Hindus so much, so that they started conspiring against the Muslims.”
- “In the partition of Bengal in 1905 the Muslims of that area took a breath of relief but the Hindus could not tolerate the Muslims progressing and forming their own government.”
- “Hindus very cunningly succeeded in making the British believe that the Muslims were solely responsible for the [1957] rebellion”
- “The British government took possession of all lands from Muslims and gave them to Hindus”

31 Social Studies Class VIII, Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, March 2002, p. 90
• “Hindu has always been an enemy of Islam”33
• “The Hindus declared the congress rule as the Hindu rule and started to unleash terror on Muslims”34

Likewise, textbook material also incites militancy by encouraging the dispositions of jihad and martyrdom. For instance:

One of the reasons of the downfall of the Muslims in the subcontinent was the lack of the spirit of jihad. Muslims could only establish their rule because of this spirit. The spirit that was the real source of strength to the Muslims rule disappeared gradually.35

Therefore, it appears that the madaris are not the only educational institutions in Pakistan that breed hatred and distorted worldviews against other religious communities among their students. The knowledge created and reproduced during the public school classwork likely has the same implications. Hence, the presumption that the public schools in Pakistan promote tolerance is erroneous. My study provides a significant understanding that the state-run public schools have, over time and with faulty polices, gradually grown into chauvinistic and intolerant institutions. Their capacity to promote educational themes (e.g. that the spirit of jihad is the real source of strength for the Muslims) is alarming. Such themes can incite some segments of youth to get involved in acts of violence without actually realizing their consequences.

Elite English-Medium Schools

In elite schools, one of the cardinal objectives of English language arts classwork is to promote the kinds of teacher-student interaction that equip students with presently required interactive and communicative language skills. It is a contrast to the dominant linguistic pedagogical trait in the other two types of schools, which emphasized fostering the students’ ability to translate from one language to another or vice versa. In elite schools, the teachers mainly facilitate students’ ability to master the complexities of English language. They tend to create a classroom environment where the students are expected to learn on their own and through their own

32 Social Studies Class VIII, Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, March 2002, p 91
33 Urdu for Class 5, Punjab Textbook Board, Lahore, March 2002, p.108
thinking, planning, and peer/self-correction of their work; in this way, the teachers limit their role to that of a facilitator and moderator.

The teachers persistently challenge students’ knowledge to enhance their intellectual capabilities, conceptual development, and correct application of linguistic principles and grammatical rules in oral and written communication. For instance, during the 45-minute classwork on “Understanding the Present Continuous Tense,” the teacher in one of the elite schools actively engaged the class in different learning activities. He emphatically told me, “My objective is to create a student-centered, activity-based classroom environment conducive for an in-depth understanding, where students can infer grammatical rules by themselves” (personal interview, April 14, 2008). The teacher started the warm up session by greeting the students and asking them how they spent their weekend. After listening to some brief narratives, he told a joke from a renowned British television program “Mind your language.” He said that Mr. Brown, the teacher, while stepping up to his class came across a brown-skinned Asian and introduced himself “I am Brown.” The Asian immediately interrupted and said “No, Sir...you are not brown: you are white – I am brown.” The students laughed with joy. Subsequently, the teacher initiated a discussion to review the study material about the present continuous tense that he had suggested the students read on their the previous day. During this brainstorm activity, the teacher wrote the essential points and some fundamental dimensions of present continuous tense on the whiteboard. He then asked the class to arrange themselves into four groups and distributed a funny story mainly focusing on the present continuous tense. The students were asked to identify various dimensions of this particular tense through group discussion and explain the essential grammatical rules constitute them to the class. They were also asked to illustrate situations or events where these dimensions can be employed effectively.

I found that the students were comfortable during this exercise, as they already had acquired a reasonable competency in English through reading on their own and from both school and their home environments. The students of the other two types of schools obviously lacked this advantage. The first group of students presented their finding: “She is exhausted. She is not going to play next match tomorrow” (classwork, April 13, 2008). The following interaction
demonstrated how the teacher further probed the students’ understanding about this particular dimension of the tense:

Teacher: This sentence represents future activities or events that are yet to be done. How can we place it in the present continuous tense?
Student A: [Justified and explained] sometimes a future tense is not correct while we talk about arrangements or intentions; although we use shall or will to represent future.
Student B: Yea! Such as, I am participating in an international tournament next month.
(classwork, April 13, 2008)

A few students added sentences. For instance, “the city government is closing old gymnasium next year” (classwork, April 13, 2008). At this point, the teacher brought the students’ attention towards a slight variation in this dimension, saying, “Sometimes to represent future intentions and arrangements, we have to use ‘going to’ in a sentence, instead of just ‘is’ or ‘am’ [with present participle]” (classwork, April 13, 2008). He then invited students to suggest some examples:

Student C: Before she leaves for England next year, she is going to improve her pronunciation.
Teacher: That’s correct; it’s better than saying “she is improving her pronunciation” in this sentence.
Student D: [made another sentence] He still has toothache, so he is going to consult his dentist next week. He then explained that using “he is consulting his dentist next week” will be inappropriate. (classwork, April 13, 2008)

Likewise, along with urging students to discover various dimensions of the present continuous tense, the teacher continuously created situations where the students had to defend their grammatical concepts with logical reasoning. For example, when a student used the subordinate conjunction “although” in a sentence, the teacher intentionally took exception to it and raised a question as why the student did not add “yet” with it. The student explained that “yet” itself is a conjunction called “coordinate conjunction” and it is not essential to use it with “although.” The study provided the following example: “although her parents work very hard, they are unable to meet her expenses.” The student explained that he had learnt this grammatical rule from an authentic book titled: “Longman dictionary of common errors.” At another occasion the teacher attempted to shake a students’ confidence in the grammar, when she said, “Tom believes that the
world is flat” The teacher inquired as to why we cannot say, “Tom is believing that the world is flat” The student defended that verbs such as believe, hate, love, like and know are not normally used in the progressive tense. (classwork, April 13, 2008).

Most significantly, the teacher did not attempt to limit the classwork within the specified topic. Instead, based on students’ interests, he used every possible opportunity to modify and expand the content. For instance, when a student raised an off context question about the use of “gerund” and “infinitive,” the teacher briefly explained their correct application. To promote students conceptual understanding that meanings of a sentence change altogether if gerund is used instead of the infinitive, the teacher quoted the following example and provide explanations:

- I stopped to see an old friend of mine. (Indicates: I stopped as I wanted to see my friend)
- I stopped seeing an old friend of mine. (Indicate: I broke with my friend)

In sum, the teacher attempted everything to enable students to explore as much grammatical knowledge as was possible for him to do during the 45 minutes of class time. In addition, to learn more about the present continuous tense and its various dimensions, the teacher suggested some advanced reading material, including some authenticated publications from Oxford and Cambridge University Press. The teacher also informed that he had already emailed some useful websites to every student to further understand this topic. As homework, the teacher asked the students to write a story, dialogue, paragraph, an analysis of a news item, a running commentary of a game/event, based their interests, which should contain at least four dimensions of present continuous tense. To explain his grading criteria for this creative assignment, the teacher said, “I expect the precision of language and correct application of grammatical rules....”(post-class reflections, April 13, 2008).

The focus of the English literature course in elite schools was on engaging students in dynamic and insightful discussions and reflecting on current social circumstances. The general emphasis was on analyzing main curricular themes, exploring supplemental knowledge, and also figuring out the correct application of linguistic tools. The teacher argued, “I always help my students to attain ability to effectively express their thought while using the correct language” (personal interview, April 4, 2008). Therefore, I observed many occasions during the classwork of the
teacher facilitating students to attain perfection in the language and also doing an in-depth analysis of the subject matter. For instance, in poetry lesson titled “Taj Mahal” the teacher emphasized that, although this splendid palace is signified as an epitome of love, it contains many significant messages for the writers who perceive it as a sign of social inequality. At the outset, the teacher explained that this poem was actually written by a “progressive” poet, who generally included mention of the social evils in his creative work and invited people to reflect on such issues. The progressive writers are usually the “utopian dreamers: who wish for an equal distribution of resources. Hence, the main theme in this poem is social inequality: on one side, the poor lack even the necessities of life and, on the other, the rich enjoy the luxuries when alive and are buried in gorgeous places like the Taj Mahal. The poor visit these places every night to light the candles without knowing if the dead person buried there did any good deeds for “people like them” when he or she was alive and in a position of authority. After explaining the poem, the teacher divided the class into four groups and, based on previously assigned research work, gave one question for each group to discuss. She asked groups to choose a leader who would brief the entire class on the gist of their findings. Five minutes were allocated for this within the group discussion. The questions assigned were the following: Which would you regard as the most significant objective of the progressive literary movement in Pakistan, and why—give some illustrations? How would you compare progressive literary movement in Pakistan with that of American progressive movement of 19th century? What do you believe is the major dimension of social inequality in Pakistan and why? Social inequality is shaped by a range of structural factors, which do you perceive is the most important and why? (classwork, April 4, 2008).

When the leader of each group briefed the class about their main findings, the teacher urged other students to challenge or supplement the information. She would also incessantly ask the class if someone wanted to add a new perspective. For instance, when a student elaborated the main achievements of American progressive movement, a student added that abolitionism was another significant achievement of this movement, as it marked the end of the institution of slavery in the U.S. On another occasion, some students challenged the information provided, such as in the following example:
Student A: Progressive literary movement in Pakistan was, in fact, supported by Russia and China, and it mainly perpetuated the communist ideology in the country.

Student B: This claim does not have enough empirical support.

Student C: I believe that this movement was more influenced by Marxism than Communism.

Student D: I like the progressive movement because instead of presenting love as the sole theme, the poets generally addressed the realities of life... (classwork, April 4, 2008)

While teaching the poem “Taj Mahal” the teacher asked students, one after another, to read a verse and explain their understanding of the main theme. When a student finished, the teacher would either correct or add more information, as demonstrated in the following example:

Student: In this verse the poet informs that the elegant constructions like Taj Mahal although mark the splendour of great kings, they do not provide an idea of great works which they did when alive.

Teacher: Actually, this verse highlighted a comparison that some people are known by their splendid tombs, while the others who though do not have dazzling graves or other symbols like that, are known by the splendid work they did, such as, invented anything or served the humanity… (classwork, April 4, 2008)

Such instances demonstrate that the teacher is focused on conveying to the students that their task is not to look at superficial meanings but to discover the hidden messages through deep analysis. Furthermore, during the classwork, the teacher never remained unmindful of the precision of language. She incessantly corrected her students and introduced grammatical tools to support her claims. For instance, at one occasion when a student said, “The civil war in America has ended in 1865” the teacher corrected it as “the civil war in America ended in 1865” (classwork, April 4, 2008). She then explained that the present perfect tense describes actions that have continued to the present; therefore, we cannot use it in place of simple past tense. Occasionally, the teacher also involved students in correcting a sentence. For example, when a student said, “a majority of voters opposes the proposal,” the teacher invited class to point out the mistake in this sentence. A student explained that “majority” can be used as singular or plural depending on the word that follows it. Such “voters” is plural in this sentence, the correct structure would be: “a majority of voters oppose the proposal.” The mechanism of linguistic correctness continued throughout the classwork.
At one point the teacher used the above picture to highlight the dimension of economic inequality in Pakistan. Just before the end of the classwork, the teacher displayed this picture again on the overhead screen and assigned a project. Based on their interests, the students were asked to find a situation that represents a dimension of inequality, be it related to ethnicity, gender, race, social or economic situations, photograph it, and write an analysis paper that emphasizes the main themes, causes, suggestions, and the lessons learned from their selected situation. The teacher explained that her criteria to grade this creative assignment would be the clarity of thought, profound analysis, correct use of grammatical rules, and the effective use of the tools of academic writing. The teacher also announced that the best photographs would be displayed in the annual exhibition with students’ names on it.

The work of chemistry in elite schools was mostly based on decision-making processes, where the teachers posed new challenges to the students and guided them towards making the correct decisions. While correct answers are very important in science, they were not given to the students. Instead, the students were encouraged to come to the appropriate answers themselves by reasoning through the problem. For instance, the chemistry lesson on single and double displacement chemical reactions generally invited students to make decisions about how to
balance the equations of a chemical reaction, distinguish between various types of reactions, and apply these concepts in problem-solving situations. The teacher wrote the following chemical reaction on the blackboard and asked students what would be the first step to balance this equation:

\[ C_2H_6 + O_2 \rightarrow H_2O + CO_2 \]

The following interaction resulted:

Student A: First, I will balance elements with larger number and defer other to take up later.
Student B: I will start with balancing hydrogen and Oxygen atoms on both sides of the equation, and then balancing carbon is easy
Student C: It’s better to count atoms on both sides of the equation and then balance them.

(classwork, January 17, 2008)

The teacher prodded the students for further suggestions. He wrote all of them on the blackboard and involved the class in a discussion to decide which suggestion had the strongest merits. The teacher then distributed a worksheet containing five chemical reactions and asked students to balance them while reasoning through the different possible options discussed in the class. In the end, he randomly picked students to explain the procedure that they had adopted and why they had chosen that procedure. Later, the teacher told me that he favours creative activities that carried out independently, as they promote confidence as well as self-expressiveness among students. Moreover, instead of telling the class the definitions of chemical terms and asking students to memorize them word for word, the teacher created situations that encouraged students to apply these concepts. For instance, while discussing endothermic and exothermic chemical reactions, the teacher initiated the following dialogue with a female student:

Teacher: [name of the student] is it possible that during endothermic and exothermic reactions energy can be created or destroyed?
Student: No Sir! Energy is neither created nor destroyed; it is only absorbed or released during the chemical reactions.
Teacher: Ok! During our next lab, if I ask you to break table salt into its components, what energy would you add?
Student: I will add electrical energy?
Teacher: Why not heat energy?
Student: I know only the electric energy can cause this chemical reaction. (classwork, January 17, 2008)

The teacher mainly used the classroom as an open forum without limiting either individual activity or the range of topics covered. During the discussion, he expanded the content to include other categories of chemical reactions, which were based on the displacement of the reactants, such as synthesis, decomposition, and combustion reactions. The teacher also used students’ own practical experiences to modify the curricula. He asked the students if they had observed any examples of endothermic or exothermic chemical reaction during their everyday life events. A student mentioned that he had observed such an incident at home, when a painter mixed limestone in water to make paint for whitewash. The cold water began to boil a few minutes after the limestone was added to it and a lot of steam was released. The teacher then involved the class to determine the chemical formulas of the reactants in this example and develop a correct and balanced equation. To further probe students’ knowledge, the teacher asked how much energy is released when a chemical reaction takes place between limestone (CaCO₃) and water (H₂O). After receiving some incorrect responses, the teacher assigned the task to the students to find out correct answer through research on their own. It appears that while encouraging the students to observe and understand the chemical phenomenon in their surroundings, the teacher attempts to develop their capacity to use a scientific approach. Towards the end of the classwork, the teacher showed a 5-minute videotape titled “The Thermite Reactions,” which contained some advanced information on various concepts discussed during the classwork. Subsequently, the teacher asked students what they learned and how they relate this learning with the topics discussed in class. As homework, the teacher gave every student a worksheet of 35-incomplete chemical equations and asked them to write chemical formulas, predict the product of reactants, balance each equation, and identify the nature of chemical reaction.

The biology classwork in the elite schools generally involved analysis, observation, inference, decision-making, and planning and investigation. The teachers valued higher-level conceptual discussion and encouraged students to apply their knowledge and biological concepts to solve related problems. In both schools, the teacher had already provided a course outline to the students, detailing the topics that were to be covered each month. The course outline had a list of reference books and research articles and also suggested some web resources to be consulted.
before each class. Hence, the lessons that I observed in both schools on “Human Heart: Its Anatomy and Functions” exemplified the ways that students’ independent research and group activities were specifically designed to share conceptual learning to further explore the relevant concepts.

In one of the schools, to refresh students’ prior reading on the topic, the teacher gave a quiz, that the students took individually, which contained eighteen multiple choice and fill in the blanks questions, such as: The tricuspid valve is located between which two chambers of the heart? Which heart chambers pump deoxygenated blood? Which of the following statement exactly defines the pulmonary arch? A systole and a diastole make up one_______? The formation of local blood clot in an artery is called________? (classwork, April 16, 2008). The teacher gave five minutes to complete this quiz. At the end, the teacher did not give the correct answers but left the students to evaluate themselves at the end of the classwork. Next, while placing a “model of heart” on the board the teacher initiated a discussion with the class regarding the anatomy and mode of action of the heart. He mostly raised questions and encouraged students to reflect, discuss, and come to the correct answers. For example, while teaching about the main heart valves, the teacher explained that a human heart contains four valves that maintain a unidirectional flow of blood through the heart. The left atrioventricular valve controls the blood flow from left atrium to the left ventricle. It is also known as bicuspid valve. Why? Can anybody explain? The following interaction resulted:

Student A: Because it consists of two cusps or flaps.
Student B: It is also called mitral valve because its shape somewhat resembles to a bishops’ miter.
Student C: Likewise, the term tricuspid valve is applied to right atrioventricular valve because it has three flaps.
Teacher: That’s’ right! Can anybody explain the anatomy of these valves and how it is different from that of heart itself?
Student B: (participated in discussion again) these valves are made up of fibrous connective tissues that originate and extend from the heart walls.
Student D: It means the composition of valve tissues is similar to that of heart.
Student E: I read the composition of heart is more complex. It has three major tissue layers, which contain some specific tissues, such as, squamous and areolar tissues. Squamous tissues secrete lubricating fluid, which helps regulate the activity of myocardium...(classwork, April 16, 2008)
At one point, a student shared his research that four valves of a human heart open and close approximately 103,000 times a day and about 3.7 billion times during an average lifetime.

Another student said that audible sounds are made by the closing of heart valves. The ventricular contraction (systole) makes a “lub” sound and the ventricular relaxation (diastole) produces a “dub” sound and that a systole and a diastole make up one heartbeat. Another student added that rate of heartbeat varies with the age and size of an individual. During the classwork, some students also actively engaged their teacher in advanced conceptual discussion, for instance:

Student F: I read an article that sometimes heart valves are to be replaced through surgical procedures.
Teacher: Yes! Diseases can affect any of four heart valves, but diseases of aortic valve are more common and cause high mortality rates every year. The most common treatment for them is the surgical replacement.
Student G: Are the valves taken from human donors?
Teacher: Yes! Human donor is one of the sources to get these valves. They are also taken from animals or mechanically produced. Very recently, medical scientists have also started generating these valves from the patients’ own cells through standard cell culture techniques called tissue engineering.
Student H: What chemical substance is used to produce artificial valves?
Teacher: Generally the scientists use carbon, ceramic, plastic or cobalt-chromium alloy...
Students C: What complications do the patients face during surgery and afterwards when they start living with artificial valves…? (classwork, April 16, 2008)

The students asked some more questions, which were both relevant and thought provoking. In view of their interest in the topic, the teacher wrote these questions on the whiteboard. However, instead of answering them he said, “All questions are very important…but I will not answer them now. I will prefer all of you to take this subject-area as a ‘project’ for further investigation” (classwork, April 16, 2008). The students were then asked to make a decision about the specific theme they wanted to explore in this area, the resources they would use, and how they would conduct this research (i.e. individually or in a group). The teacher offered that if anyone needed further understanding, he or she could meet him in the after class or send him an email. After deciding the mechanics and procedures of this project, the teacher asked students to make four groups and assigned one question to each group. The students were asked to discuss the questions to determine the best answers and then present them before class for further discussion. The questions were: how heart attack is different from cardiac arrest, and what are the most
common causative factors for them; what are the most common symptoms for heart attack and cardiac arrest, and how they can be distinguished; what does angina pectoris means, and what are its causes and symptoms; how can you help to keep your heart healthy (classwork, April 16, 2008). When students presented their best answers, the teacher prodded the class to either agree, disagree, or add information. For instance, a student added, “cholesterol oxidation is lesser known but an important factor for heart diseases, because it damages or clogs blood vessels.” Some students disagreed with an answer that fatal heart diseases rise by 150% in overweight individuals. The students gave different percentages. Some students also disagreed with a statement that during sexual intercourse the heart beat increases from 100-150%, therefore, heart patients must completely refrain from sexual relationships. Such kinds of discussions in a gender-mixed class also represent an open-mindedness of the elite community.

In the elite schools, the use of science experiments involves creative activity and is carried out in the small groups of students. The students are encouraged to develop their hypothesis, make decisions for appropriate methods and materials, and determine what they want to learn from this hands-on experience. In the experiment of dissecting a frog, unlike the public schools (where dissection was conducted only once in an academic session), in elite schools a series of multiple dissections were carried out. Each time a single system, or specific areas, was explored, which provided an in-depth understanding for the students. For instance, in one of the schools, a day before the actual experiment of dissecting the frog and observing the digestive system, the teacher had asked students to watch a video and some computer simulations of the dissection, for which he had suggested some websites. The following day, the teacher initiated a discussion in the class about what the students had learned from websites, what had interested them, and the scientific themes they were going to explore in this experiment. Different students had different interests and hypothesis. For example, a student had hypothesis that a frogs’ digestive system has more similarities than differences with that of human beings. He was excited to explore the facts for himself. Another student had a hypothesis that stomach mucus cell are different from those of other body cells. He had an interest in extracting some mucus cells from the inner walls of stomach and looking at them under electronic microscope in comparison with other types of cells. Yet another student wanted to see the connection between the stomach and liver and how bile is transported to the digestive system. The teacher cooperated with these interested,
providing time and equipment to conduct such investigations. Apparently, he was cognizant of helping to create the scientific approach among students.

At the end of this discussion, a summary of the goals of the experiment, along with key tips, was provided on the blackboard. The teacher once again asked the students if they had any questions about the procedure or wanted to further discuss a concept or add a perspective. He specifically reminded students to wear their lab coat, safety goggles, and disposable plastic gloves at all times while working and handle hazardous materials carefully. In addition, various charts containing information regarding lab safety mechanisms were hanging all around the lab. The students were free to pick their partners. The teacher made sure that approximately four students were at all benches and each bench was assigned one frog to dissect. As the experiment began, the teacher hovered around the lab watching students perform the exercise and providing feedback as necessary. The students were observed actively engaged in exchanging ideas, sharing expertise, and helping each other out. Moreover, if a student or group became confused about the location of a particular tissue/structure or had problems extracting particular cells, the teacher was always there to assist.

In the other elite school, the students were interested in exploring the nervous system and find out the direction of transmission of action potentials (nerve impulses) and factors that affect this transmission. After an active discussion, the students agreed upon a hypothesis that nerve impulses would not be able to travel upwards through the peripheral nervous system to stimulate the muscle in the opposite leg and that fatigue would be observed earlier if electrical stimulation was stronger (in volts). In this hypothesis, properties such as conductivity and fatigue were stressed, as well as the direction of impulse (this was to be done by stimulating one sciatic nerve and checking to see if the opposite muscle also twitched). Before the experiment, the students were instructed to review the assigned pages provided online as MS WORD files. These contained instructions and proper procedures to follow as well as some suggested study questions at the end. The teacher explained that the frog was used as a model because it has particularly large sciatic nerves, which are ideal for beginner students since they can be easily isolated and artificially stimulated. The teacher briefly went through the experimental procedure and explained that students must keep the nerve preparations moist using the provided “ringer’s
solution,” a clear liquid solution of necessary ions that resembles interstitial fluid and keeps action potentials going. Along with this tip, the teacher covered other common pitfalls that students usually face during the dissections, such as severing the nerve accidentally and not being able to find the location of the specific nerves.

During the dissection the teacher and students worked as a team to discover the brain, which conducts action potentials that travel down the spinal cord. Here, the signals are picked up by efferent nerves that run to several muscle groups. The class generally focussed on the gastrocnemius muscle found in the frog’s leg, which is innervated by the sciatic nerve. The sciatic nerves come out separately from either side of the spinal cord, and are large in diameter in comparison to visceral (organ) nerves. When the electrical signal reached the gastrocnemius muscle, the muscle contracted, which was observed by the students as a twitch. The students then artificially stimulated the muscle with an electrode and observed properties such as contractility and fatigue. A students explained to me that fatigue can be observed in such a system and is defined by a marked decrease in contractility as the muscle is continuously bombarded by impulses. The physiological cause of this is the exhaustion of ion stores in the neuromuscular junctions, also called the motor end plates, which are the regions where the nerve makes contact with the muscle.

During the post-experiment session, the students explained that the main hypothesis was partially accepted. While it was true that a stronger stimulation caused early onset of muscle fatigue, it was also found that the nerve impulse from stimulation of the sciatic nerve in one leg could travel up and then down the other leg to cause the other muscle to twitch. This was more easily observed at higher voltages. During this discussion, the teacher also went through some of the questions in the back of the provided notes, as well as other sample questions that tested concepts that students should have observed or picked up during this experiment. The teacher asked students to explain what they found and what they should have found before revealing the right answers. He mostly tried to guide students towards the right answer and would ask them why they thought their response was the right answer. After the class had grasped these concepts, the teacher would elaborate on the mechanisms behind the concept for further clarity. In both
elite schools, as students finished up, they were told to properly throw away the animal waste according to safety protocol. All equipment was cleaned and placed away properly.

**Logical Positivism: A Dominant Theme in Elite Schools**

My study suggests that certain prominent aspects of the elite school education represent logical positivism, where scientific knowledge obtained through senses and logical reasoning is disseminated as genuine and the most authentic. The elite school personnel’s ethnographies signify their conviction over the legitimacy of logical positivism in education. For instance, an elite school principal emphatically concluded, “the essence of our education is creativity, effective reasoning, and facilitating the students to create knowledge based on logical inference from observable facts” (personal interview, May 7, 2009). Likewise a teacher argued, “only the logical analysis of scientific knowledge has a definite meaning” (personal interview, December 03, 2008). Yet another teacher said, “real life events can be observed empirically and explained with reasoning and rational analysis” (personal interview, May 6, 2008).

Such perspectives appear to guide and shape the overall educational practices in elite schools, where the students are encouraged to “create knowledge” through efficiently employing the rules of empirical and deductive reasoning and rationality. This is contrary to that of the other two types of schools where emphasis is given on memorization and, more or less, “recycling” the existing knowledge. In sum, the elite school students are constantly provided with the kind of learning experiences that require reasoning through the problem, making sense of the internal structure of a system, and determining how its various components are, or can be, arranged. They are provided with the liberty to develop hypothesis and then test their ideas and concepts through active experimentation. The students are generally expected to be the problem-solvers, original thinkers, and capable of making sense through scientific inquiry. Hence, there is a sense that students are equipped with the “cultural capital” of the rationality of logic to make correct decisions, engage in independent thought, and possess the ability to make meaning of their experiences as well as of the social and cultural life around them. They are also provided with an awareness of how to manipulate socially prestigious language (e.g. English) and an insight of being able to control their own ideas and potentially those of others as well. This is one of the
basic requirements to maintain executive roles, power and privilege, and probably to be able to “command” others through making policies.

Another vital aspect of logical positivism involves the analysis of students of religious knowledge. In contrast to the other two types of school, the elite school curricula are not loaded with doctrinal material. However, the teachers of Islamic studies explain that they generally invite students to reflect upon the Quranic revelation during classwork, instead of demonstrating blind faith, which they consider be unwise. They generally argue that the Quran will neither be understood nor will its objectives be properly realized except through reflecting on each verse and giving its due right of contemplating to discover the meanings and wisdom contained therein. The teachers explain that God Himself has invited followers to reflect and reason upon the Quranic wisdom. To support her viewpoint, a teacher of Islamic studies quoted a Quranic verse, “reflect upon its verses and that those of understanding would be reminded” (Quran, 38:29). Another teacher explained, “During my classes, I always invite students to comparatively study major religions of the world. It helps them to properly understand the essence of divine wisdom” (personal interview, April 11, 2008). These practices are contrary to those of other two types of schools, where a blind adherence to the religion is demanded. In these other school, any type of questioning and analysis about the Quranic epistemology and hadith is strictly forbidden and sometimes considered to be a sin. Likewise, reading other religions or even interpretations of other sects of Islam is discouraged. Such practices are likely engaged in to keep the students’ academic horizon within limited range.

It is worth-mentioning that, due to the nature of their curricula, the elite schools teach only the half credit subjects of Islamic studies as well as Pakistan studies. However, to compensate for this obvious curricular deficiency, both elite schools rely heavily on the students’ non-formal and informal learning in these important areas. For instance, both schools frequently arrange lectures, seminars, and symposiums in which moderate scholars impart religious knowledge and knowhow about the fundamental issues of Pakistan. Besides, as mentioned above, the teachers regularly give research assignments to the students that greatly contribute towards their knowledge of advanced concepts in these subjects. The elite school personnel also show confidence in their students’ capacity to learn about religion and Pakistan in their home/family
setting and through private tutoring, which the parents mainly arrange to supplement what their children learn at school. On my query, the students also acknowledged that these schooling activities are conducive to their learning about Islam and Pakistan. However, they added that independent reading and media (such as television and Internet) are also greatly helpful to enhance their individual knowledge.

However, a few teachers in elite schools, who mostly are not directly involved in teaching of Islamic studies, assert that they are admirers of enlightened modernity and thus undermine religion. They consider religion, metaphysics, and ethics as meaningless and void of cognitive reasoning and, hence, nothing more than just an expression of feelings and desires. Thus, they disseminate unorthodox beliefs during the class time, whenever they get an opportunity. For instance, a science teacher argued, “I clarify to the students that many aspects of revealed knowledge are unverifiable. In contrast, empirical knowledge is completely verifiable, and indeed the most reliable knowledge that the man has” (personal interview, October 05, 2008). Such perspectives support an existence of logical positivism in elite school educational practices and greatly contradict those of public schools, where science teachers tend to combine revealed knowledge with science to achieve a holistic approach. However, contradictory perspectives among teachers about faith-based epistemology and their practices not only reveal the complexity in elite school education, but also are likely to promote the dispositions of tolerance and open-mindedness among students about other faiths and religious communities.

Schooling Experiences, Class-Habitus, and Future Prospects

Although cultural capital is a significant part of Bourdieu’s theory of social reproduction, it is merely one component of his theoretical framework. Bourdieu (1990) accentuated that capital, habitus, and field all work together to generate practices, social actions, and profits. My study underscores that, although working class families tend to efficiently build learning environments at home to pass on cultural capital, the students’ habitus and economic backgrounds play a vital role in shaping their future prospects. The students’ habitus is generated by internalizing their place in the social structure; helps them to determine what is, and is not, possible; and develops aspirations, plans, and practices accordingly. It appears that this internalization takes place during early childhood and is a largely unconscious process. However, I argue that although
schools help to approve, validate, certify, and perpetuate the powerful narratives and ideologies of society’s dominant social groups, as they are a significant source of socialization process they are also able to construct their own narrative and reason. The knowledge produced and reproduced during every day classwork is, in most cases, likely to influence the students’ hopes, aspirations, and expectations about their future occupational roles. The following data analysis suggests that different schools provide sufficiently different habitus due to hierarchal possession of economic capital.

The school knowledge in madaris involves an explicit recognition of socioeconomic exploitation that was initiated by the British colonizers and has been carried on even after independence. The students are incessantly told that in the past madaris had created a class of ulema (theologians), muftis (jurist-consults), and qadis (judges), which efficiently managed the Muslim states over the years. In the name of modernization, the British colonizers marginalized madaris and excluded their graduates from senior public and executive positions. This injustice faced by madaris and their graduates has been continued by the Westernized ruling elite as a policy in a country that attained independence in the name of Islam, social justice, and egalitarianism. Hence, the students are taught to value the political interests that they share with others as well as the historical struggle in which their social group has been engaged to achieve economic and social dignity.

During the class time, I observed numerous contentions from teachers that had a potential to instigate the dispositions of conflict against powerful ruling groups in the social arena, who are generally projected as the proponents of Western political and economic systems, which are potentially exploitative in nature. For example:

Our Westernized ruling elite want madaris ineffective and their graduates financially deprived and worried...they are actually scared of madaris and their political role, because if the Sharia laws are enforced in true letter and spirit, they will have to relinquish their unfair privileges. (classwork, October 14, 2008).

I also observed the following quotes from teachers: “Since the colonial period our ulema have been challenging the exploitative and unjust Western political and economic systems in the subcontinent...now...it is our responsibility to carry on this noble mission...” (classwork,
September 23, 2008), and “Only the Islamic brand of government and legal system can guarantee meritocracy and equal rights to the citizens...” (classwork, October 12, 2008).

Therefore, this kind of school knowledge provides students with habitus that more likely can express itself in an active political conflict and resistance against perceived exploitative groups and systems. In this way, when I asked about what they perceived as obstacles to achieving their ambitions in life, the students mainly indicated structural disadvantages. Most students believed that a lack of meritocracy, open-competition, and an official ban on applying for better job positions have largely restricted their occupational choices. They explained that, paradoxically, the government officially recognizes the equivalency of madaris degrees to those from public sector universities, but in the actual practice they are not allowed to apply for the corresponding jobs.

The madaris personnel also emphasized that their graduates generally have a better knowledge base than people with Master’s degrees in Islamic studies or Arabic from public universities. If the government were to provide them with an equal opportunity to apply for positions as professors in Arabic or Islamic studies, they are sure that the madaris graduates are capable attain many, if not all, of such positions. Likewise, most students’ statements acknowledged their understanding as being the victims of an unjust system. The following example demonstrates this:

Student A: “After completing masters’ level education, we are only eligible to apply for a junior teacher position in a school, and not for a college or university teacher. I want to know why.”
Student B: “We have to face a step-motherly treatment in our own country, where our own government denies us better jobs”
Student C: “After spending 17-years in education, I will have to work just as a musjid imam, whose earnings hardly make both ends meet. Sometimes, I think why people like us have to suffer such miseries...”
Student D: “Only Islamic political revolution can break the shackles of our exploitation.” (classwork, October 26, 2008).

Therefore, the madaris students understand that structural barriers in the system deprive them of being able to achieve better occupational opportunities. They find the solutions to their social and economic plight in a systemic revolution. In addition, the madaris students fully understand
that the knowledge and skills that their schools provide do not sufficiently prepare them to engage critically and face the challenges of the modern professional world. Hence, when I asked students what they wanted to do after graduation their first and foremost response was to be an imam. Similar low expectations are evident in the students’ survey results, where almost 90% of students expected nothing more than a position as an imam after completing their education. Regrettably, due to the lack of an official patronage, the position of an imam is one of the least economically rewarding in the country. At the time of this study, most imams were earning between 3,000-5,000 rupees (equivalent to 40$CDN) every month, which is almost equivalent to what daily-waged and untrained workers make per month.

Conversely, most public school students indicated that a lack of physical resources (e.g. not having sufficient money to get better education, not getting access to college/university, and not knowing the right people for help) was the major drawback that lead to their incapacity to accomplish their ambitions. “Financial difficulty” was also a common response from the students in both public schools under study when what they perceived to be obstacles to achieving their ambitions in life. For instance:

Student A: “I have a great desire to finish university and prepare myself for better job options. But, my parents say they do not have money to pay for it...”

Student B: “I want to be a computer programmer but...you know...it’s expensive, and my family do not have financial capacity to help me achieve this ambition”

Student C: “My parents are unable to meet the expenses of even one-year diploma at [name of a technical college]...it will leave no other option for me than to find a job after the high school...” (classwork, February 27, 2008).

Therefore, social class is commonly perceived as a barrier for achieving aims/goals amongst public school students. They mostly indicate structured obstacles, such as a lack of money or resources as a prominent drawback to being able to access quality higher education and better occupational opportunities. Some students (for instance Student C above) also perceive that their low family SES is going to be the biggest factor to “stop” their education. Besides, the public school students fully realize that they are at a disadvantage when competing with the students of private English–medium schools for lucrative careers, such as commission in the Army as an officer or in the Air Force as a fighter pilot. They argue that their schooling has not properly
equipped them with necessary skills to achieve such careers. The following students’ statements underscore this mindset:

The candidates’ assessment for commission in the Army is done in English...which is an obvious drawback we have to face... last year a few graduates from our school appeared in that exam. They say that they could not properly understand the language of question papers and what they demanded... therefore, they could not perform well... (personal interview, August 22, 2008)

They [elite students] have better access to resources at school and things like that...I think their class sizes are smaller...and they get more attention than what we do, because we have like 70 students in each class...their courses are modern and they lean everything in English...(personal interview, September 9, 2008)

Such perspectives indicate a notion that speaks both to socioeconomic class as a status as well as an opportunity. The students understand that their social class position makes them underprivileged in regards to accessing quality education and skills necessary to compete for better jobs. Some students also foresee the lack of quality social capital, such as the kind of family connections that build a middle class career, as an apparent drawback. The following students’ statement supports this argument:

Its’ not about what you know, its’ about who you know...it is about social linkages...the area I live in is mostly occupied by the poor, who lack direct access to the high-ranking officials for help...however, students from the rich families have the type of connections which get their way much easier in life. (personal interview, September 17, 2008)

Therefore, the class-related obstacles (both physical resources and social networks) were perceived to be quite common at public schools. Besides, on numerous occasions I observed teachers’ remarks that would have the potential of influencing the students’ motivation. I consider such practices as highly unethical, but they appear to be the significant part of public school students’ daily schooling experiences. For instance, different teachers reminded the students about their underprivileged social class location as well as the restricted choices as follows:

Teacher A: “A labourers’ son is only ordained to be a manual worker or at the maximum a mason...if he desires to be an officer...it is as if living in a fools’ paradise” (classwork, September 28, 2008)
Teacher B: “How can you consider yourself equal to the students of private schools...where parents spend more than what your entire family earns on their child’s education every month?” (classwork, September 26, 2008)

Teacher C: “Every year many of our students remain unable to get into college or university even after obtaining more marks than the required merit, mainly due to lack of funds” (classwork, September 21, 2008)

Teacher D: “Even if you complete a university...how will you find the recommendation of an MPA [Member of Parliament] to whom the rich have an easy access” (classwork, September 20, 2008)

Such perspectives, no matter how true, have the potential of damaging the students’ self-esteem and motivation and limiting the extent to which they engage in active struggle to transform their lives. Their awareness of the drawbacks makes them limit their future hopes and expectations. Hence, the students’ low expectations about their future prospects are greatly apparent in the survey study. For instance, about 20% of students perceive they will have to join the labour force immediately after high school in order to assist their parents to earn the necessary income. About 25% of respondents perceived that it was better to quit the school if they could find an apprenticeship opportunity at a mechanical workshop. They thought that spending money and time to earn a certificate or diploma after high school graduation was not worthwhile if they could earn the same amount after completing some kind of apprenticeship. Only 30% of respondents expect to gain admission in short-term diploma or certificate courses to be able to become eligible to be hired as skilled workers. Thus, it appears that in addition to the inculcation about social class trajectories in home/family settings, the discourses created during classwork to encourage or discourage students greatly contribute to shaping their future expectations.

In contrast to the students of both Islamic madaris and public schools, the elite school students appear to assume that the material resources and cultural capital provided by their families would bring them success in the future. Hence, they do not nominate structural or class-related obstacles as barriers to achieving their aims and goals. When I asked the same question as outlined above (what do you perceive as the main obstacles to achieving your ambitions in life?) I observed that most students struggled to identify any hurdle in their way of accomplishing ambitions. Instead, they acknowledged that their relative privilege of having plenty finances and family support provides them with a good foundation to do whatever they want. However, a few
students clarified that if, by any chance, they fell short of achieving their perceived destinations in life, it would be nothing else than their own fault, lack of application, or vacillation to find the most appropriate professional trajectory. For instance, the following students’ statement provides a sense of indecision to choose between two lucrative career paths:

My parents want me to do MBA and manage the family business...but, I have a dream to make politics my career...for that I believe a degree in “International Relations” or “Bar at Law” would be more suitable...I think doing one-year gap after A-levels will be helpful to decide and get the motivation for the path I prefer to travel...(personal interview, May 18, 2008)

Therefore, it appears that the elite children are confident enough that, instead of taking directions from elders, they are able to make their own important life decisions. It appears to be part of their training to take the time to reflect and make the right decisions, which is something that they do frequently. However, it is very rare that elite students exhibit any kind of weakness. Mostly, they are quite clear about their occupational paths and show motivation to accomplish their goals. Their only need is the strength of proper application to achieve their objectives. For instance, an elite school student explained:

I come from a family where I do not need to worry too much...I have everything...I mean...I am in a perfect position financially. Only, I need is to properly apply myself to work hard and make my way towards success... (personal interview, June 1, 2008)

Hence, I found that most respondents were quite mindful of their financially privileged location as well as self-reflexive in explaining their aspirations of achieving upper white-collar professions (e.g. executive and administrative positions in public/private enterprises or medical profession; consultant accountants; engineering, civil, and military bureaucratic positions; politically elected executive positions). Likewise, during the survey study, 100% of elite school students expressed a desire to gain admission into international elite institutions for higher education and indicated that they find them to be the most suitable sites to achieve their ambitions.

In this way, daily socialization and discourses crafted during the classwork can potentially equip students with socially prestigious knowledge. For instance, students are taught to command,
make the right decisions, and develop policies for others to follow. Some of the teachers’ remarks during the class time include, “good leaders often have a clear vision of what they intend to accomplish,” (classwork, May 8, 2008) “executive positions require the abilities to lead from the front,” (classwork, May 10, 2008) and “workers when believe that their leader is caring will often set a more comfortable and productive workplace” (classwork, April 30, 2008). To a student who had an ambition to be the military officer, the teacher cautioned, “wrong tactical moves always jeopardize your life and the lives of many others” (classwork, June 03, 2008). This kind of school knowledge more likely provides students with the cultural capital of unique intellectual capabilities and inculcates the spirit of ruling over others.

One of the most prominent limitations of my study is the social and cultural restrictions that I faced to recruit the female participants. I could get female representation only from elite schools, mainly due to gender tolerance that is an obvious feature of this elite social class. My study emphasizes that an individual’s habitus can also be gendered as a result of the different opportunities available to male and female groups. Bourdieu (1984) emphasizes, “Sexual properties are as inseparable from class properties as the yellowness of a lemon is from its acidity” (p. 107). Hence, the following female students’ perceptions indicate that girls with same professional ambitions are more likely to face restricted opportunities than boys:

I wish to get admission in Oxford…after completing my school…the way my brother is planning but… I know…I will not get this opportunity…never….not in million years. They [parents] say that it is not safe for daughters to live in foreign countries without supervision…they [Western countries] are open societies and provide chances for the mixing of gender…making relationships with boys….but when parents make decisions for male children…they do not consider such factors…(personal interview, October 19, 2007)

Therefore, it appears that while boys and girls may begin their lives with an analogous class location and cultural capital, the social reproduction process functions in such a way that girls attain less privileged positions than boys. For girls, the socio-cultural stereotypes outweigh the disposition or attitude about having a professional job. In sum, the female students’ perceptions of the opportunities available to them are greatly influenced by the traditional model of the division of labour between sexes (Bourdieu and Passeron), which makes them take on roles as expected by their society.
Finally, it appears that the youth studying in the elite schools are overtly obsessed with elitism. The students’ perspectives and practices indicate that they have systematically become alienated from the majority of other people, psychologically, socially, and culturally. The most obvious manifestation of this fact is evident in the students’ narratives wherein they designated themselves as “the chosen ones,” (personal interview, elite school students, November 20, 2008) “the superior beings,” (personal interview, elite school students, October 2, 2008) or “I was born with a silver spoon in mouth” (personal interview, elite school students, September 30, 2008). Another elite student emphasized, “Our ancestors had received the leadership of this state due to exceptional qualities, and now it is our responsibility to demonstrate the same calibre and competence to maintain whatever they achieved” (personal interview, November 22, 2008). Such perspectives emphasize that the rich environment at home/school alike tacitly and almost unconsciously have inculcated dispositions among students that they belong to a “superior class.” Hence, they believe that it is their birthright to prevail and rule over the large majority of “commoners.”

Moreover, Bourdieu (1984) argues that among the members of the dominant class, a unitary lifestyle emerges around what he calls “the sense of distinction” (p.199). The lifestyle and cultural practices through which the processes of mutual classification unfold are lodged in the habitus and thus situated below the threshold of reflexive consciousness. Accordingly, the elite children’s lifestyles generally refer to those elements of culture that are universally recognized as worthy, canonical, and distinguished in some ways. For instance, as discussed elsewhere, the elite children are most likely tend to maintain tastes in regards to food, clothing, sports, art, and music that corresponds with the lifestyles of the Western petit bourgeoisie. The most elite students claimed to have inherited English as their first language. Most of them also admitted that they have more understanding of American and British political systems than that of Pakistan. The elite school education promotes this kind of knowledge, as their textbooks exclusively discuss such topics. There is an insignificant amount of information about Pakistan and Islam in their textbooks. Therefore, for elite children, Eurocentric tastes and lifestyles serve as a vehicle through which they symbolize social similarity with their group and social difference from underprivileged socioeconomic classes. Moreover, some elite students who plans to permanently reside in any of the advanced Western countries after the school graduation,
revealed a mindset of considering Pakistan as a failed state and unworthy to permanently live in. They were anxious to leave this “jungle state” to their dream country, which will be compatible with their elite status. This kind of elite mindset is not surprising for Pakistanis, who understand that a major segment of this dominant class have dual nationalities, permanently live in, or have established business empires in advanced Western countries.

A Comparative Analysis of Student’s Political Worldviews

A “worldview” is the way of looking at the world from a specific standpoint or perspective. It provides context, direction, and meaning to life and life experiences. Worldviews are generated by the mind’s aspiration to form a unified comprehension of the universe by drawing together facts, laws, generalizations, and answers to ultimate questions (Naugle, 2002, p. 09). The term worldview has two implications. The first has a philosophical meaning that involves a person’s concepts of human existence and reality, and the second is an individual’s picture of the world in which he or she lives. In general, the term worldview refers to “culturally-dependent, implicit, fundamental organisations of the mind” (Cobern, 1991, p.19). Moreover, worldviews may be explicit or implicit. Explicit worldviews are those that are publicly expressed and communicated to others. Implicit worldviews, on the other hand, are unvoiced, sometimes hidden, and sometimes unrecognized or unaccepted, yet still disclosed in deeds and actions. Implicit worldviews form the basis for the old adage that “actions speak louder than words” (McKenzie, 1991, p. 8). The term “worldviews” is also multifaceted as it is used in a great many areas, ranging from the natural sciences to philosophy to theology (Naugle, 2002). However, in this study I have limited my focus only to understand the student’s “political” worldviews, because Rahman (2004) concluded in a previous research that the students of these three types of schools have conflicting political worldviews, suggesting that Pakistani society is polarized and that this could be potentially alarming in an uncertain post-9/11 world (p. 150). This claim needs further investigation in order to suggest appropriate measures to accurately deal with this issue. Hence, in this research, I have, with slight alterations, retained the same questionnaire Rahman had used in his study. This questionnaire covers different aspects, such as agents’ secular and religious orientations, tolerance, and militancy. In sum, my attempt is to understand how students’ standpoints are similar or different regarding human existence, reality, and the world in which
they live. This will help determine the extent to which their explicit or implicit worldviews provide context, direction, and meaning to their life and life experiences.

My study suggests that the cultural, social, and political orientations in which children are born, live, and participate provide them a set of instilled worldviews. Their initial worldviews are largely shaped from their family/home environment and then educational institutions appear to reinforce identities that dispose them to perform different social and political roles in the society. As McKenzie (1991) argues, “worldviews are given to us, handed over to us, when we are young, and subsequently reformulated and constructed when we reflect on experience” (p. 15). This becomes what is known as tradition (meaning “handed over”). While controversy rages regarding whether or not tradition unnecessarily indoctrinates children, it does have both a purpose and an indelible effect. For those who are not developmentally able to perform their own worldview integration, tradition establishes patterns of preferred thought and behaviour to enable people to respond to situations without taking the time to reflect in precise detail what the appropriate response should be (McKenzie, 1991, p. 15). Therefore, my survey results (presented in Table 7.2) underscore a fixed nature of worldviews among elite school and madaris students who stand at the opposite ends of the spectrum. Their identities are polarized mainly between religious and secular ideologies. Public school students appear to go in one direction in response to certain questions and the opposite direction in response to other questions. The ethnographies, however, shed light on the fact that, for most respondents, tradition seems to determine patterns of preferred thought, response, and integration of new information. Besides, the students’ dominant family discourses are profoundly compatible with those produced and reproduced in the respective schools. For instance, the first question (about Sharia laws), which attempts to gather insight into students’ current operational religious worldviews, emphasizes that religion is both a lifestyle and an “explicit worldview” for madaris students as well as their families. A very high response of about 88% indicates that, for madaris students, religion provides an organized interpretation of both reality and other significant life issues. The madaris parents’ ethnographies of family discourses contain claims that “Islam is a complete code of conduct,” (personal interview, December 15, 2007) “believing in and acting upon Islamic principles is our religious obligation” (personal interview, January 1, 2007) and “I take insight from Islam whatever it prescribes for individual and communal life.” (personal interview, December 23, 2007).
In addition, as previously discussed, Islamic madaris predominantly teach Islam, whereby such discourses are created and reinforced during every day school experiences. Therefore, responses to the subsequent questions accentuate that religious interpretations (or misinterpretations) also permeate through other aspects of students’ worldviews. For example, 100% of madaris students reject Western democratic system for a Muslim majority country like Pakistan. Also, only a few students favoured giving equal rights to females and religious minorities as done in Western countries. Such perspectives also reflect the level of intolerance among madaris students about Western political discourses. In conclusion, it appears that for madaris students, initial operating worldviews, developed from a combination of tradition and religious beliefs, becomes the foundational cornerstone to control new information, intrinsic learning, and future integration of new information.

The public school students’ responses to some questions correspond with madaris students, while other responses correspond with those of elite school students. More accurately, both religious
and secular doctrines are evident in their responses. Basically, public school respondents show commitment to the areas that involve “core” Islamic beliefs. A conspicuous response of 80% in favour of enforcing Sharia laws underscores this standpoint. Likewise, a meagre response of 5% in favour of promulgating Western democratic political system in Pakistan underscores its rejection by a vast majority on the basis of their core religious beliefs. However, in areas other than core beliefs, they exhibit an integration of secular worldviews and religious ideologies. For instance, there are significant percentages in favour of equal rights to women and religious minorities, freedom of the press, and the possibility of a female and a minority agent being the leader of the country. This has happened because most parents do not reveal strict orthodoxy, which could be considered compatible with their madaris counterparts. For instance, a public school parent explained, “Islam has laid down Sharia Laws, but it also has prescribed the institution of Ijthad36 to make logical modifications to address the present-day social, economic and political issues” (personal interview, December 19, 2007). Another parent remarked:

I favour to prevent religious groups to exert an excessive governmental and judicial control...in fact, our founding father advocated Pakistan to be a secular state, and not the theocratic one...which must ensure the freedom for all religious communities and not for just one... (personal interview, February 3, 2008)

Therefore, if most public school families perpetuate core Islamic beliefs, some also do not completely rule out Western political discourses, such as secularism. It is evident in the above statement when a public school parent favours a secular society over theocracy, because it does not tend to base the “constitution” and “state laws” on divine knowledge (or Sharia law) alone. This parent also understands the harmful traits of theocratic governments where public institutions tend to set themselves up as arbiters of religious discourses. When internalized, such perspectives have the potential to urge students to profess Western discourses alongside revealed teachings. Besides, as discussed before, although the public schools put overwhelming emphasis on the “Islamization of knowledge,” at the same time a major portion of their education is comprised of modern/secular subjects, where Western doctrines are also produced and reproduced during every day school experiences alongside religious ideologies.

---

36 Ijthad is a technical term in Islamic law that describes the process of making a legal decision by independent interpretation of the legal sources, the Qur’an, and the Sunnah.
The elite school students’ responses, on the other hand, predominantly underscore dispositions of secularism, which entail the right to be free from imposition of orthodox religious rule, whether it may be from the government or the Islamist parties active in the national politics. Therefore, it appears that elite agents’ dispositions, which are not biased by religion, generally form the foundational base for new information, intrinsic learning, and future integration of worldviews. This mindset also controls their activities (especially the political ones) and important decisions regarding their own life or the lives of others when they are in the leadership roles. It is evident from students’ responses where a noteworthy 77% favour the promulgation of a Western secular democratic political system in the country. Besides, the elite respondents’ ethnographies elaborate that, for them, religion is a useful source of morality and a “personal matter,” which is only professed when pragmatically useful. Hence, their approach to secularity is predicated on the view that the manifestations of the religious beliefs must be kept away from civic functions that are under the auspices of the state. The following arguments from two different elite parents articulate this standpoint:

If we seriously want our society to be more tolerant, we will have to ensure keeping the religion in the private realm...and do not let it to intervene in the public square... (personal interview, October 21, 2009)

I strongly believe that the state must not assert itself on religious matters...not because it ought to be officially atheistic or hostile to religion...but because it must recognize the existence of a multiplicity of faiths, perspectives, and religious practices, which must not be allowed to influence the public policies... (personal interview, February 11, 2009)

Therefore, the elite families pronounce “aggressive” secularity and desire to consign all religious manifestations to the private realm. For them religion should be reduced from the rank of a true operative worldview to a “claimed worldview” (Apostel, 1994, p. 43). Such perspectives are also evident in the elite students’ radically favourable responses for equal rights to women and religious minorities as in Western countries, freedom of the press, and the possibility of a female and a minority agent to be the leader of the country. Therefore, for elite agents an aggressive secularity is both an explicit and implicit worldview. It is implicit in the sense that the westernized ruling elite, although, they do not openly rule out Sharia laws, prefers to promulgate western secular democratic system in the country. This is evident in the fact that, since independence (except during the regime of Zia-ul-Haq, 1977-88) almost every government has
implemented secularism as a policy to rule the nation. Therefore, the elites’ actions speak for themselves.

However, paradoxically, the elite respondents’ perspectives on aggressive secularity and their rationale that society can be deemed tolerant only if the religion is kept in the private realm give the impression of their intolerance against religious orthodoxy and political discourses. Moreover, elite agents’ ethnographies articulate that the integration of their worldviews is based on “logic,” which entails reason as important perimeter and boundary for acceptable beliefs. They critically examine their current assumptions and integrate only those worldviews that they find logically acceptable. Likewise, the education of elite schools, as discussed before, is the most modern, with secular, progressive, and Westernized discourses being produced and reproduced during school experiences every day.

My survey results provide further insight about the tolerance (or intolerance) of the students in these three types of schools. In the majority areas, madaris students seem to be the most intolerant among all of the students groups under study. For instance, only 14% and 20% students favour to give equal rights to females and religious minorities, respectively. This means that a vast majority of madaris students are against giving equal rights to non-Muslims (e.g. equal to those held by Muslims) and women (e.g. equal to those held by men). In comparison, public school students appear to be more tolerant than their madaris counterparts. A significant proportion of about 76% and 61% students are in favour of giving equal rights to women and religious minorities, respectively. Hence, in this respect the public school students’ worldviews are akin to those of their elite counterparts. These results are different from those of Rahman (2004), which did not show this substantial difference between madaris and public school students.

Similarly, there is a difference in the perspectives of the public school students and madaris students regarding friendly relationships with Western countries and India. Only 14% and 12% of madaris students favour good relations with the West and India, respectively, whereas about half (54% and 46%) of public school students did so. This means that the agents associated with madaris support an antagonistic foreign policy against non-Muslim countries. Conversely, the
elite school students appear to be the most permissive among all student groups, with 92% and 72% favouring friendly relations with Western countries and India, respectively. Their responses generally favour foreign policy geared towards friendship and harmony among all nations to ensure global peace. The following perspective of an elite parent, although expressed in another context, emphasizes the permissiveness and an open-mindedness of such families:

We should learn from the example of Jews who are far less in number as compared to other religious communities, but due to their high-quality training they not only managed to survive in the Middle-East, but also showed remarkable progress in the fields of commerce, banking, and the ownership of prominent media channels. (personal interview, November 11, 2008)

I could not find such a complimentary sense about Jews, Christians or Hindus in the narratives of agents associated with other two types of schools. Instead, most of them express ungracious perceptions of these religious communities. Such dispositions are alarming because they have the potential to be misused by those with vested interests. In this regard, the madaris students may be more vulnerable because they have the least exposure to discourses created in the outside world.

Moreover, the student survey results suggest that madaris, and to some extent public schools, may be potential centres of Islamic militancy. Only 10% of students from madaris and 24% of students from public schools perceive that the Kashmir issue can be resolved through negotiation. This means that a vast majority believes war or militancy is the only solution. This has happened because after the tragic incidence of 9/11 and the rise of new world order, ulema have become more conscious of global politics. In addition, the Iranian revolution of 1979, the defeat of the Soviet Union in Afghanistan by the Islamic mujahidin, and the rise of Taliban in the power echelons convinced ulema that Islam is a power in its own right. Hence, ulema in madaris and public schools (public schools hire Arabic teachers from madaris) produce and reproduce discourses that invoke political Islam. Such discourses describe the Israel-Arab conflict and Palestine and Kashmir issues with reference to religion. In addition, epistemic frameworks generated in these schools also portray the current involvement of the West, especially the U.S., in Iraq and other Muslim countries as a crusade. Conversely, such discourses are mostly absent from the elite school classwork. This is reflected in the finding that almost 90% of elite school students believe that Kashmir issue can be resolved with India through political negotiations.
To conclude, it appears that students of these three types of schools have different standpoints about religion, secularism, and other significant national and global issues. This has happened, at least in part, because the school knowledge that is produced and reproduced in each type of school is different and also the discourses to which these students are exposed to inside and outside schools (especially in families) are drastically different. The study of worldviews has also provided evidence that Pakistani society is visibly divided into sections, where people have hostile attitudes against one another. The madaris students consider their elite counterparts as Westernized and having weaker Muslim faith, if not being infidels. Conversely, the elite students call their madaris counterparts potential mullahs, who, if given power, would enforce curfew in the name of Islam and deprive everybody from their basic rights, the way the Taliban did in Afghanistan. The public school students are still in between and, if not handled seriously, tactfully and appropriately, there are chances that hatred material in textbooks coupled with prejudicial teaching practices may work as a catalyst to trigger rigid, extremely conservative, and antagonistic ideologies among them. Hence, they may pose a serious threat to global stability in general and the regional peace in particular by developing religious clashes and ideological conflicts based on their acquired philosophies of life. Tactfully, in a sense that, as discussed earlier, there is strapping resistance from the right wing in the curricular change and, appropriately, alludes to the process of taking on textbook board only those liberal and visionary scholars who possess the propensity of designing a balanced and unbiased curriculum for the future public schools.

**Chapter Summary**

This chapter has attempted to comparatively understand the nature of school knowledge while analysing the data regarding students’ classwork, which were gathered as part of ethnographic study of curricular, pedagogical, and student evaluation practices in each type of schools under study. It appears that these three types of school operate on different education philosophies, have different aims and objectives for their students, and employ divergent epistemological and pedagogical frameworks. For instance, Islamic madaris, even in the modern age, exclusively structure their education towards the dissemination of faith-based knowledge and, hence, have retained their traditional curriculum known as *Dars-e-Nizami*. This curriculum insists upon the supreme pedagogical value of the classical Islamic knowledge. However, most of the books in
this curriculum are canonical texts written by the medieval ulema and contain arguments that were influenced by the social location of the writers, the general prevailing social environment, and by the then available stock of knowledge. Thus, these books disseminate knowledge that is out-dated and in many respects irrelevant to address the social and economic challenges of the modern life.

Moreover, a rigid commitment from madaris personnel to preserving their identity of being distinctive educational institutions and reproducing the traditional brand of education leaves only one purpose for their students, which is the moral and spiritual undertaking in the society. This incapability of madaris education for not adequately preparing their students to live up to the challenges of the modern professional world is the main reason for their degrees being highly devalued. In addition, during every day classwork, the madaris also have continued reproducing discourses to refute Western educational philosophies, political and economic systems, heretical beliefs, and ideologies of other religions. Such discourses appear to be greatly embedded in Muslim hegemony. Because, the school personnel tend to portray their traditional Islamic heritage as superior and flawless and, in contrast, undermine Western achievements, depict their religions as diluted, educational philosophies as faulty, and political and economic systems as the roots of inequality. Such “controlled” knowledge and one-sided perspectives have potential to promote the dispositions of prejudice against Western discourses among the madrassah students. Besides, over the years, madaris also have started creating and reproducing discourses to refute ideologies of other sects and disseminating what is “true” and “false” Islam.

The public schools mainly teach modern/secular subjects, yet many significant components of their education are greatly akin to those of madaris. It appears that Islam-minded educational bureaucracy in the government acts as ideological gatekeepers, making sure what they see as ideologically acceptable texts get into the classrooms. Therefore, the process of “Islamization of education,” which was initiated during the decade of 1979-89, has persisted and been reproduced over the years without any obvious change up to the time of this study. Thus, the public school curriculum and even modern subjects are heavily loaded with doctrinal material. The vocabulary and concepts used in the textbooks are consistent with vocabulary and concepts that are generally found in the political rhetoric of the pan-Islamists, who are mostly proponents of Islamic Sharia
laws to be promulgated as a national policy. It seems that the purpose of presenting Islam as a national ideology has been to sanctify its political role in politics and society in general and to provoke social forces against potentially non-Muslim threats, most significantly India, Hindus, and the West. Therefore, some material in the textbooks, and its implications in the classwork, can be classified as teaching hatred. The knowledge produced and reproduced in this regard through the classwork has the potential to shape the worldviews of the students in quite negative ways.

In regards to pedagogical techniques and the kind of work-related activities employed in the classrooms, both Islamic madaris and public schools show more similarities than differences. In both types of schools the teaching is primarily focused on the transmission of knowledge and equates learning with memorization of factual information, whether it is contained in textbooks, lectures, or teachers’ own notes. The design of books also encourages memorization and rote learning. The teachers tend to act as absolute authorities, dictate what happens in the classroom environment, and assign work and work-related activities and also homework. Therefore, in this type of control and hierarchical relationships, the ideal for the students is to simply comply and obey. Moreover, during everyday teaching-learning transactions, the students’ work is evaluated on the accuracy to which they have memorized the textbook content and followed rules and steps which were specified by their teachers. Likewise, the standardized examinations, which are based on written responses to essay-type questions, also require an accurate reproduction of the textbook knowledge.

In contrast to both Islamic madaris and public schools, the elite schools exclusively impart Eurocentric knowledge that is the most modern and analytical. The textbooks are designed to stimulate students’ reflective capabilities. For instance, a Thinking Room at the end of each chapter invites students to analyse, infer, compare, plan investigations, make logical decisions, and apply conceptual understanding to solve related problems. Besides, contrary to the other two types of schools where the student were not encouraged to go beyond the boundaries of textbook knowledge, the elite school teachers constantly attempt to expand curricula to impart advanced concepts. The students are regularly persuaded to express their ideas and concepts. Moreover, instead of providing readymade answers, the teachers like to raise questions to engage students
to think, reflect, and research to discover the appropriate answers themselves. During the classwork teachers tend to challenge and probe students to produce arguments that are logically sound and of top academic quality. The teachers demand the same standards when they assign creative assignments as homework. The teachers usually do not make an effort to control the class or students’ movements; instead, they give liberty regarding the choice of a learning activity, appropriate method and material, or overall conduct in the classroom. The students, in turn, do not attempt to misuse this liberty, but reveal responsible behaviours. In general, all books contain a list of reference material for further study. The student evaluation during class time and in examinations is done through a variety of methods including written, practical, and oral. The students are normally assessed on the standards of their academic analysis, independent thinking, reasoning, and problem-solving skills.

Moreover, my study suggests that, although the working class families tend to build learning environment at home to pass on cultural capital, their children’s habitus and socioeconomic backgrounds play a fundamental role in shaping their future prospects. Besides, the knowledge produced and reproduced during everyday classwork and the patterns of socialization at school are more likely act as significant markers to influence the students’ aspirations and future expectations. Hence, the madaris students articulate dispositions of anguish to be discriminated against within their own country by the ruling elite, which has continued the unjust policies against madaris and their students that were instigated by the British colonizers. Most students also understand that they have restricted job options, such as being an imam, after completing their education. Conversely, most public school students perceive a lack of physical resources is the major drawbacks for their incapacity to accomplish ambitions. They fully understand their options are limited to obtaining a short-term diploma, completing a certificate program, or an apprenticeship at a workshop, if they are even able to continue their education at all. Besides, the public school students fully realize that their schools have not properly equipped them with necessary skills to compete with the students of private English-medium schools in achieving lucrative careers.

In contrast to both madaris and public schools, the elite school students appear to assume that enough material resources and cultural capital provided by their families would bring them
success in the future. They generally aspire for upper white-collar professions and reveal tenacity in achieving their ambitions at any cost. They also understand that their schooling has equipped them with socially prestigious knowledge to command, make the right decisions, and develop policies for others to follow. My study also underscores that one’s habitus can also be gendered as a result of the opportunities available to each group. The female students’ perceptions indicate that girls with same professional ambitions are more likely to face restricted opportunities than boys. Finally, it appears that elite schools reproduce dispositions of elitism in the society where their students mostly act snobbish and consider themselves as superior beings. Such perspectives and practices alienate them psychologically, socially, and culturally from the majority of citizens.

Similarly, different types of education and other discourses to which the students are exposed to inside and outside the schools potentially shape their divergent worldviews. In this regard, the elite school and madaris students appear to stand at the opposite ends of the spectrum. Their identities are polarized mainly between religion and secularism. However, public school students appear to sometimes go in one direction in response to certain questions and sometimes go in another direction. Their worldviews are akin to those madaris students regarding religion and militancy. However, in areas other than core religious beliefs, public school students have integrated secular ideologies as well. In this respect, their worldviews seem to be comparable with their elite school counterparts. The mixture of religious and secular views expressed by public school students suggests that they are being influenced by both worldviews. Finally, the worldviews of elite school students are predominantly influenced by secularism, which entails the right to be free from imposition of orthodox religious rule. The elite school students are also the most tolerant student group, who favour solving issues through political dialogue rather than militancy. My study also underscores the correspondence between students’ worldviews and those of their families, which supports the argument that the cultural, social, and political orientations in which children are born, live, and participate provide them with a set of “instilled” worldviews.
CHAPTER EIGHT: DISCUSSION AND ANALYSIS

This chapter concludes the thesis. The discussion encompasses the study’s key findings and their social and theoretical implications. More specifically, this chapter outlines that what is deemed as knowledge in the three types of schools differs along dimensions of structure, content, and the way that content is delivered. These differences have been scrutinized and discussed in preceding data chapters. This chapter mainly includes an analysis to assess the reproductive features of knowledge and other schooling mechanisms in each social-class setting. In this discussion, “reproductive” refers to aspects of the schooling mechanisms that contribute directly to legitimization and dissemination of ideologies, practices, and advantages constitutive of prevailing socioeconomic hierarchy. The final sections of this chapter include relevant recommendations, limitations, and suggestions for future research. A brief discussion of my experiences with the theoretical framework and limitations of Bourdieu’s paradigm has also been included.

Key Findings of the Study and Social/Theoretical Implications

The study delineates the highly stratified nature of the education system in Pakistan; wherein these three types of schools constitute distinct fields of education. They provide contrasting academic and physical facilities. Their curricula, pedagogical methods, micro-political contexts (e.g. the school personnel’s perspectives and practices and the school cultures), and “organizational habitus” are differ greatly. Their “relative autonomy” also reveals different categories and scales. Therefore, these schools have the potential to provide very different schooling experiences to their respective students. This has significant implications for reproduction of students’ class-habitus and political worldviews and determines different social roles and occupational trajectories. In sum, it appears that these schools prepare their students for life in the social class from which they come. For instance, different standards of material and human resources in these three types of schools are more likely to project among students to view the world hierarchically—on a scale from higher to lower social classes. This is a specific culturally reproduced way of thinking and one that systematically encourages support for socioeconomic hierarchies and ‘misrecognition’ of the actual nature of what people think, do, or value. Since political independence, the government has persistently spent less than 2% of the
GDP on public education. Consequently, the public schools provide substandard facilities, which are act as symbolic violence and encourage the students to accept the legitimacy of their dominated position in the social order. The madaris under study, although they provide impressive physical and academic resources to their students, constantly teach a long history of socio-economic exploitation and injustice from Westernized ruling elite, which eventually results in the marginalization of madaris graduates. The students are generally indoctrinated to value political interests that they share with others and the multi-years struggle in which their social group has been engaging to achieve social and economic dignity. In contrast, the rich environments at home and school alike have helped the elite children to tacitly inculcate the class-consciousness, sense of distinction, and a shared habitus of being privileged. Thus, I argue that contrasting academic/physical facilities in the schools are likely to impose the spectre of legitimacy of the social order on their students.

Moreover, these schools conserve and inculcate their preferred cultural heritage and consecrate uneven social relations by providing different scholastic capital to their students. For instance, Islamic madaris, even in modern age, prefer to gain insight from the educational philosophies that were instigated by medieval Muslim thinkers. Hence, they base their schooling on traditional frameworks of faith-centered epistemology and praxis. Moreover, general schooling practices in madaris emphasize a counter-hegemonic trend where privileging of modern/secular knowledge as an exclusive vantage point for teaching and learning is challenged and resisted. Instead, madaris personnel tend to reproduce the hegemony of their own conceptual heritage and cultural currency to subsequent generations. The students inculcate out-dated concepts that are largely irrelevant to the needs of the modern job market.

Conversely, the public schools base their education in integrating Islamic knowledge into the corpus of secular and modern subjects. The school personnel perceive such practices as useful for the students’ holistic development. They argue that modern education adequately prepares their students for material success, while faith-centered school epistemology promotes their spiritual attributes, enlightens their minds, and creates a self-discipline in character and actions as enunciated by Islam. In contrast to madaris and public schools, the focus of the main policies in elite schools is to disseminate epistemological foundations of modern and progressive
education and reproduce the hegemony of Western knowledge and ways of knowing as an exclusive standpoint for teaching and learning. These schools also conserve and sanctify Western culture in the society. This kind of knowledge and cultural currency is socially prestigious and has a high exchange value in the job market as capital.

The teachers’ professional development programs and practices are also designed to induct and socialize them into the traditions of these three types of schools. They are provided with expertise to reproduce aforesaid specific ideologies, skills, knowledge, and culture. I argue that the organizational habitus is a vital aspect of the schools’ micro-political context and greatly influences the teachers’ sense of responsibility about their students’ learning. Organizational habitus is defined as class-based dispositions, perceptions, and appreciations transmitted to individuals in a common organizational culture (Diamond and Randolph, 2004, p. 76; Horvat and Antonio, 1999, p. 320; McDonough, 1997). Therefore, my study suggests that there is a profound relationship between student composition of the schools, teachers’ beliefs about students’ abilities, and teachers’ sense of responsibility for student learning. In predominantly low-income schools (e.g. Islamic madaris and public schools), the teachers generally perceive that their students are disadvantaged in regards to possessing cultural and intellectual resources. Thus, they reduce their sense of responsibility for student learning and tend to engage them in rote learning and memorization. In contrast, elite school teachers have faith in students’ cultural and intellectual assets and, therefore, tend to engage them in creativity and empiricism. This will be further analyzed in the following pages.

My study emphasizes that these three types of schools also reproduce different cultural patterns in the society. The madaris are the sites where Islamic oriented social identities, cultural norms, and conservative ideological orientations are reproduced. This has been the very raison d’être since their origin, which they have evidently retained across generations. In their plan of studies, the madaris tend to disseminate the “model” of behaviour and lifestyles that is documented in the Quran and practically applied by the Prophet in his daily life. The madaris, although they have female students and a gender-mixed faculty, make policies to sanctify the traditional ideological interpretations of gender seclusion. The seclusion is generally imbued with multiple and complex religious, social, cultural, and political meanings. But it is usually consecrated as an important
marker of faith, modesty, and adherence to the Islamic code of conduct. By projecting their alternative gendered norms as more adequate, the madaris appear to reproduce anti-imperialist sentiments in the society. In the West, the gender diversity in an institution is usually valued and an intellectual encounter between males and females is considered useful to enhance a team’s performance.

The elite schools, on the other hand, have retained their original role and purpose to consecrate Western lifestyles as a dominant culture in the country. These schools have coeducation and a gender-mixed faculty but, unlike madaris, make policies to take on board advantages of different attributes and qualities that exist between men and women and create a more collegial environment within their team of teachers. Therefore, by moving beyond gender stereotype and considering gender diversity as an advantage rather than a drawback, the elite schools consecrate the Western discourses of modernity and enlightenment in the society. In contrast to madaris and elite schools, the public schools tend to synchronize Western and Islamic cultures in their schooling. Such practices, however, reproduce an active conflict among faculty between the proponents of these apparently different paradigms. I argue that this conflict is not confined in the faculty, it is also evident at the national scene. Islamic political parties and a large section of like-minded citizens are actively engaged in the revitalization of Islamic ethos, culture, and lifestyles in the country. Conversely, the ruling elite and their allies, more likely associated with the public schooling, find Western culture essential to keep pace with current economic and global realities. Therefore, it appears that the three different kinds of schooling are playing a central role in perpetuating different ideologies, dispositions, and practices regarding culture in the country.

In regards to the “relative autonomy” of the schools, my study suggests that madaris and elite schools have attained an almost complete independence from government influence. This is evident in their monopoly over recruitment, training of faculty, making and implementing the schooling policies, and appointing leadership from within their own ranks. The madaris personnel generally attribute their autonomy to an efficient fund-raising system, generous donations, and protection from influential like-minded individuals. Likewise, the main source of funds for elite schools and their autonomy is the elite clientele’s lucrative fee contributions. The
private donations from rich alumni and ruling elite also significantly contribute in this regard. Moreover, the government provides multiple subsidies to elite schools every year in form of capital and relaxation in duties/taxations, which contribute towards maintaining an excellence in the provision of physical and academic resources to the students.

This also connotes the mindset of ruling elites that they intend to use state-authority to ensure enough capital for these schools to maintain brilliance and do not leave them reliant simply on non-state sources of funding. State subsidies are not intended to bring elite schools and madaris under state control. Elite schools make policies to better serve the rich and provide knowledge that ensures easy access for their children to the higher echelons of society. Madaris knowledge does not provide this kind of advantage to the poor. Therefore, it appears that the ruling class effectively uses the current schooling model to sustain their dominance over underprivileged masses.

However, my study delineates that relative autonomy of these schools from the state is also counterbalanced by a lack of autonomy from an alternative source of governing authority, such as the board of governors. This kind of autonomy has some major class-reproductive implications. For instance, the board of governors and school personnel work together as a team to make and implement policies to protect their vested interests, maintain a distinct status culture, and develop the organizational patterns that emphasize active historical continuity more than change. For instance, the madaris effectively use their relative autonomy to resist any kind of curricular modernization effort from the government. Therefore, as discussed above, these institutions have maintained their original role to reproduce Islamic orthodoxy rather than to provide a trained work force for industrial capitalism. They make policies to preserve their conservative ideological orientation and the integrity of the tradition, while providing a significant cultural alternative and an intellectual approach to the citizens.

Conversely, the organizational policies of elite schools are deeply ingrained in dominant-class interests and economic-market demands. These schools have retained their original purpose as sites to disseminate progressive education and Western intellectual ideologies. This cultural currency helps elite agents keep pace with current realities of globalisation, capitalism, and neo-
liberalism. Besides, to better serve the ruling class, the autonomy of elite schools empowers them to effectively use through-the-ceiling fees and other schooling expenses as a "control mechanism." This ensures an inclusion of only the upper classes in these unique institutions. The elite schools also make policies to admit elite children at any cost. For instance, if students somehow remain unable to get enrolled mainly due to relatively low grades, prior poor academic performance, or some other reason, the elite schools take them in through back channels. Such policies eventually ensure the continuation of ruling-class power and privilege to next generations.

In contrast, the public schools reveal less autonomy and more interaction with the government, and carry out major and minor school policies mainly to reproduce the scholastic capital that is approved by the educational bureaucracy. The institutionalization of education allows the agents in power to regulate school knowledge and determine curricula and textbooks as well as pedagogy and evaluation practices that do not provide higher cognitive skills to underprivileged students to compete with those of elites. In this way, the ruling-class tends to assert social control, social selection, and symbolic domination, which help to reproduce a regime of social hierarchy. Moreover, the fact that the public school administration and teachers do not have liberty to choose learning modules for their students or engage them in creating knowledge has implications of intellectual passivity and ideological capitulation.

My study suggests that total volume and economic and cultural composition of the agents’ capital and class-habitus act as selection mechanisms, which clearly favour some social groups over others. For instance, the study of economic capital reveals that an apartheid schooling system exists in the country with severe inequalities in income and many other factors related to access to quality education. What is worse is that this seems to be escalating. Similar to their original design, the elite schools are still bastions of privilege even after more than six decades of political independence. This has occurred because the elite class makes policies in the country that are biased towards protecting their own vested interests. The existence of elite schools is evidently important for the elites because it provides an advantage to their children to legitimize individual advancement by acquiring unique educational credentials, which would certify them to access privileged job positions.
Moreover, elite parents’ relative affluence, educational expertise, and self-certainty provide them an advantage to build effective home learning environments and afford necessary educational materials for their children. During everyday home socializations, most elite parents regularly attempt to create pathways for children to effectively increase their cognitive capabilities. They initiate discussions that require interrogating epistemological assumptions and go beyond knowledge level to the higher levels of thinking. This way, the elite parents tend to reproduce their cultural capital, which eventually ensures the maintenance of their family power and privilege. The elite classes also effectively utilize their affluence to build rewarding social networks through holding parties and exchanging expensive gifts. Hence, their powerful social capital, which provides them an advantage to initiate a range of horizontal relationships, maximizes their children’s chances of accessing unique educational and occupational opportunities. The elite children fully understand the effectiveness of their family capital. Their perspectives generally indicate a notion that speaks of socio-economic class as a status as well as an opportunity. This kind of awareness has class-reproductive implications, as it is likely to channel the elite children’s efforts to conserve their socially and economically privileged status.

The study of economic capital further highlights that the students’ world in Pakistan is highly bourgeoisie. In contrast to elite schools, most families that tend to educate their children in madarīs and public schools live on subsistence level and have an income of less than one dollar a day. These findings emphasize that economic capital is at the root of other capitals and plays a more significant and causal role in the process of generating social inequalities.

However, my findings about cultural capital question Bourdieu’s fundamental theoretical assumptions that linguistic and cultural competence and a broad knowledge of culture belongs to members of the upper classes and is found much less frequently among the lower classes. My study finds that working class agents are as active as adult learners beyond formal schooling as any of the affluent and highly schooled classes. They are also active in creating knowledge and updating their social, economic, job-related, and educational knowledge through informal and non-formal channels. This emphasizes an existence of “non-dominant cultural capital” (Carter, 2003, p. 86) in urban Pakistan. Moreover, the working-class agents actively pass on their cultural capital through private cultural consumption in home/family settings. Likewise, the working
class agents demonstrate an ability to effectively use their educational knowledge to make
efficient short-term, skill-oriented educational plans for their children. However, despite having
cultural capital, class-habitus plays a vital role in making working class agents limit their future
hopes and expectations to that which can realistically be achieved. They generally understand
that it is not possible for them to overcome class-related and structured obstacles, such as a lack
of money, ineffective social capital, lack of meritocracy, and discrimination to amicably achieve
their ambitions. The working class agents can only materialize networks that have a more
vertical characteristic of relations. Therefore, they need some kind of mediation with “higher
ups” to achieve their claims. Their children also have internalized such drawbacks. Therefore,
class-habitus appears to be a conceptual link between structure and agency. It helps to
understand the interplay between individuals, their mindset, and broader social structures, which,
hence, acts as a significant marker to reproduce inequalities.

Arguably, a combination of many factors after secondary schooling determines the students’
future occupations and relationship to the system of production and control. However, the nature
of school knowledge and classroom work in these three types of schools provide an
understanding that their future roles and professional trajectories are already being formed.
These schools have different curricula, pedagogical styles, and student evaluation methods,
which mainly emphasize different cognitive and behavioural skills among students. These
differences can become central features for the reproduction of division of labour at work and in
society between those who plan and manage and those in the work force whose jobs mainly
entail carrying out regulations and policies made by others. Therefore, it appears that education
is the space where practices tend to legitimize social difference and social inequalities and where
the regulation of access to capital resources is ideologically constructed. For instance, the
madaris still teach their traditional curriculum, which mainly contains canonical texts and out-
dated concepts. Thus, the students inculcate knowledge that has no exchange value in the
marketplace, workplace, and even in working-class jobs.

Conversely, the public schools legitimize modern and secular knowledge, which has some
exchange value in the market place. Anyon (1981) terms the school knowledge that has some
exchange value a “commodity” and explains that it has a reproductive aspect in part because it
helps to legitimate and reproduce the ideology of production for consumption, such as production of knowledge and other cultural products for the market rather than for personal use or for social transformation (an actively consuming public is, of course, a material necessity in a capitalist system and thus legitimates of the ideology of consumption-of production for consumption-has direct economic reproductive consequences as well). The classwork in these two types of schools also offers cultural capital of “memorization” to their students. The teachers generally act as an authority in the classroom, dictate commands, and assign work and work-related activities. Similarly, to encourage a complete reliance on memory, it appears that the developers of the board exams have intentionally maintained a content-heavy pattern, where the students are graded mainly on exact reproduction of the textbook content. Therefore, it appears that the madaris students’ classwork does not provide knowledge and cognitive capabilities that help them engage critically and take on challenges of modern professional world. However, the public school students seems to be relatively more advantaged, as they are offered knowledge and cognitive skills that can help them at least earn blue-collar jobs. These jobs mostly require mechanical work to carry out regulations, plans, and policies made by others.

In contrast to madaris and public schools, the elite school knowledge is socially prestigious, modern, and analytical. Their classroom practices are also designed to equip them with the cultural capital of personal expression, active use of ideas, thoughts and concepts, meaning-making, creativity, and the manipulation of socially prestigious language. The students are graded on standards of their academic analysis, independent thinking, reasoning, and problem-solving skills. Thus, the overall purpose of elite school education seems to be the promotion of the human intellectual capacities related to creativity. This kind of empiricism is socially reproductive because it provides a framework for independent thought. Therefore, it appears that the elite students’ schooling experience generally prepares them for leadership roles in the job market and society. Such roles predominantly require the cognitive capabilities of analysis, reflection, inference, comparison, planning investigations, and making logical decisions. To conclude, I argue that an interplay between the structural forces, school-level institutional practices, and students’ responses to these structures and practices contribute to the passing on of privilege to the children of the wealthy and to cementing the disadvantages for students from poor and underprivileged families and, hence, contributes towards social class reproduction.
My study accentuates that some aspects of school knowledge in Islamic madaris and public schools have repercussions for disseminating the ideologies of hatred in society. For instance, knowledge produced and reproduced in Islamic madaris tends to refute anything that contradicts the sanctity of Muslim intellectual heritage; this has the potential to shape the worldviews of their students in quite negative ways. Besides, “controlled” knowledge and one-sided perspectives to perpetuate what is “true” and “false” Islam is also potentially perilous, because it provides the framework for sectarian hostility. Likewise, although, they teach modern/secular subjects, the textbooks in public schools are heavily loaded with doctrinal material. The vocabulary and concepts used in these textbooks are consistent with vocabulary and concepts that are generally found in the political rhetoric of the pan-Islamists. Besides, the purpose of presenting Islam as a national ideology is to sanctify its political role in politics. The creation of these kinds of material and discourses during classwork has implications of provoking the students’ dispositions against the potential of the threat of non-Muslim countries, most significantly India, Hindus and the West.

My study also underscores that underprivileged students in public schools and Islamic madaris are developing a potential resistance and conflict relationship against whatever they perceive as “iniquitous” or “exploitation,” whether it is done by a group of individuals or by a system. For instance, many events in these schools indicated a sense of resentment among students against unjust practices. The students may potentially use these abilities and skills of resistance in future roles to produce industrial conflict over wages, working conditions, and political control. Anyon (1980) perceives that such resistance in industry does not succeed in producing, nor it is intended to produce, fundamental changes in the relationship of exploitation or control. Therefore, the methods of resistance that working class children are developing in school may be only temporarily and potentially liberating. However, I argue that the students’ abilities of conflict, if systematized into a collective political movement, have the potential to bring about a fundamental change in the relationship of exploitation and control. In the history of Pakistan, students’ antipathy against exploitative forces and systems was the guiding force of two major political movements. First, the guiding force for a political movement to topple a strong dictatorship in 1967 was, in fact, the public school students, who desired a democratic system and equality of rights in the country (Maleeha Lodhi, 1979; Naseem, 1981; Talbot, 1998).
Second, the political movement to promulgate Islamic Sharia Laws in 1977 was successful in overthrowing a secular government mainly because of madaris students and graduates (Musharraf, 2006; Qadeer, 2006; Talbot, 1998). However, some sociologists argue that both political movements were subsequently seized by the ruling elite to achieve their own vested interests (Sinkler, 2005; Gardezi, 1991). Such discourses emphasize that the working class students’ abilities for conflict can potentially be misused in the political arena, because their schooling experiences do not equip them with intellectual capabilities to analyze, reflect, and make appropriate decisions.

In regards to political worldviews, my study highlights that the students of these three types of schools have widely divergent standpoints about religion, secularism, militancy, gender equity, tolerance for religious minorities, and other significant national and global issues. In this regard, the elite school and madaris students appear to stand at the opposite ends of the spectrum. Their identities are polarized mainly between religious and secular ideologies. The public school students, nonetheless, go in one direction in response to certain questions and go in the other direction in response to others. This has happened, at least in part, because the school knowledge that is produced and reproduced in each type of school is different, as are the discourses to which these students are exposed to inside and outside schools (especially in families).

In regards to religion, war, and militancy, the worldviews of public students are akin to those of the madaris students. This can be potentially alarming in an uncertain post 9/11 world, where the war against terrorism has escalated and the ideology of Islamic Jihad has grossly been misinterpreted and misused to achieve vested interests. However, in areas other than core religious beliefs, it seems that the public school students have integrated liberal/secular ideologies as well. In this regard, their worldviews seem to be comparable with their elite school counterparts. The mixture of religious and secular views expressed by public school students suggests that they are being influenced by both worldviews. The study of worldviews has also provided evidence that elite school students are the most tolerant student group, favouring solving issues through political dialogue rather than militancy. My study also underscores the correspondence between students’ worldviews and those of their families, which supports the
argument that the cultural, social, and political orientations in which children are born, live, and participate provide them with a set of “instilled” worldviews.

My study has detected a major paradigm shift in the education system of the country. There is a gradually escalating trend among middle class families to take flight out of the public schools. These families are more likely to enrol their children in new independent “non-elite” private English-medium schools. These schools provide educational and physical facilities in accordance with parents’ purchasing power. Hence, education has blatantly become a commodity, which can be bought and sold. This has made educational opportunities more inequitable and added to the educational apartheid in the country. Under current circumstances, it appears that the public schools are gradually transforming into exclusively working class schools. Therefore, it has become indispensable to initiate effective school equalization programs, without further delay.

I perceive that despite revealing a declining trend in numbers, the public schools still have a potential to be all-inclusive and serve middle, lower-middle socioeconomic groups alongside working classes. These schools have a mixture of modernizing and traditional Islamic practices and a few fundamental policy reforms in education can amicably help their students to nurture into adults who have skills, attitudes, and knowledge of how to be productive community members, leaders, parents, as well as workers. I also perceive that equal educational opportunity can be achieved if the schools have equal access to the resources necessary to provide any given amount of education.

The share of funding received by the public schools needs to be drastically increased so as to improve their infrastructure and curricula; better train the faculty to impart the latest concepts; and enable other improvements as necessary to enable that all children have adequate and equal educational advances. The curricula need to offer many rich opportunities rather than focusing only on narrow basic skills. Likewise, schools do not improve if the people within the schools, particularly the teaching staff, do not improve. To compete with other streams of education, it is vital to update the teachers’ existing pedagogical skills so that they can help students to identify their interests and abilities, support students in setting personal learning goals, facilitate student involvement and learning in decision-making regarding their own learning and the use of power
and responsibility in the classroom and school, create a culture of care where students learn to support one another and take responsibility for the well being of each other as well as the entire student community, and assess student skills and learning styles to facilitate learning and promote personal excellence. I perceive that these basic considerations can potentially make public schools more attractive for parents across social classes and regain their role as contributing towards a more equitable educational and economic opportunities for youths in the country. However, it is also vital to adopt an egalitarian principle as a national agenda that focuses more on the output of the educational process by calling for a system that achieves equal education for all students within the state.

**Limitations of Bourdieu’s Paradigm in the Case of Pakistan**

It is almost impossible to completely replicate a theory in all contexts. Therefore, as anticipated, I encountered some limitations in Bourdieu’s paradigm while examining the issues of social reproduction in the case of Pakistan. For instance, Bourdieu developed his concept of cultural capital by determining the level of attendance at opera or symphony as marker for “high culture.” However, the perceivable high culture of France in the 1900s is different than the definition of in the 21st century. Moreover, attendance at the opera or symphony is not particularly highly valued by the current educational system in Pakistan. Only a few people from the highest class might participate in such events, and also mostly within advanced Western countries. Therefore, I selected different attributes of cultural capital, which were used by other prominent researchers. Based on my background, I perceive that these variables are more suitable to gain an in-depth understanding of cultural capital across the social class in Pakistan. In addition, Bourdieu acknowledges the existence of only one form of cultural capital, which is that of the dominant group. He does not provide insight about non-dominant cultural capital and the position it can have within mechanisms of social class reproduction.

Moreover, I find Bourdieu to be a pessimistic conservative who did not acknowledge agency. Nor did he believe that human behaviour might be the result of an agent’s personal intentions, feelings, and calculations. My ethnographic encounter with working class parents guided me to understand that class-habitus also allows for a wide range of creative and purposive actions. For instance, their ability to create knowledge and use this knowledge to make efficient educational
plans as well as their determination to provide better life to their children than they had themselves, underscores the transformation of their habitus. Bourdieu did not provide an efficient framework to analyze such themes.

Bourdieu generally developed his paradigm of social reproduction in the context of the highly centralized French public schooling system of 1970s, which does not provide precise tools to comparatively investigate public and private schools and their role in consolidating socio-economic hierarchy. Pakistan has a complex education system where three types of established schools, as well as a rapidly growing stream of non-elite private schools, play significant roles in the reproduction of social inequalities. These schools have different kinds and degrees of relative autonomy, which they efficiently use for self-perpetuation. Bourdieu mentions the term “relative autonomy” in his analysis, but does not provide insight as to how it contributes towards social class reproduction. However, I discovered findings that I recommend to be used as a modification in Bourdieu’s theoretical framework. Moreover, I detected certain curricular modification practices in public schools and Islamic madaris, but these are greatly undermined by other class-reproductive schooling mechanisms. I also could not find an insight in Bourdieu’s analysis in this regard.

However, despite a few limitations, I find that Bourdieu’s theory is a paradigmatic grand theory that is relatively cohesive and, if applied multidimensionally, has efficient tools to examine the issues of social inequality through education. As well, Anyon provides useful parameters to understand class reproductive mechanisms of schooling.

**Concluding Remarks**

To conclude, I argue that the research studies are usually context-specific. The research context that I viewed predominantly highlighted that the agents’ individual actions and organizational processes were determined by the demands of broader structures of domination. They generally performed vital functions in the re/creation of conditions for social class-reproduction. Thus, social reproduction does not simply come about; it has to be worked on within specific cultural sites, such as the family and schools. However, I do not intend to undermine another popular notion that schools can exhibit relative autonomy from the larger systems of domination in which
they are embedded (Apple, 1995) and that some school personnel can exhibit agency and school organizational structure can challenge the forces of social reproduction (Carlson, 1996). Yet, it seems that the potential to resist and counter hegemonic practices remains a challenge to the teachers and administrators in urban schools of Pakistan. Teachers and administrators need to be cognizant of how their beliefs and practices are influenced by perceptions of student abilities tied to their social class and work to interrupt the reproductive tendencies these perceptions can potentially entail. In essence, everyday choices made by the teachers and administrators can either contribute to continued inequality or help promote long overdue social transformation. In light of the mixture of modernizing and traditional Islamic practices discovered in current public schools and the expression of contradictory views by both teachers and students, it appears that these schools—although they are presently declining in numbers—retain the potential to contribute to the development of more equitable educational and economic opportunities for disadvantaged youths in Pakistan.

**Recommendations**

A continuous rhetoric in twenty-two major reports on education issued by the government from time to time has been the need for an integrated system of national education. Various national education policies also endorsed this as an objective to be achieved. For instance, the National Education Policy (1998-2010) reiterates to “evolve an integrated system of national education by bringing Deeni Madaris [Islamic Seminaries] and modern schools closer to each stream in the curriculum and the contents of education” (p. 12). The present schooling model, which follows different kinds of education as of Grade One, appears to create polarized identities in terms of socioeconomic status, thinking patterns, worldviews, class-habitus, and lifestyles, which, I believe, is not conducive for nation building. Therefore, I strongly recommend some serious steps from the government and educational bureaucracy to achieve an integrated system of national education without further delay. I would suggest the Canadian schooling model, where different types of schools (such as public schools, Catholic schools, Jewish schools, and Islamic schools) teach curricula that contain the same core subjects.

The present class-differentiated schooling model undoubtedly suits the ruling class, as it helps their children maintain easy access to elite domains of power. But, it also excludes a significant
portion of the population, especially the underprivileged classes, from getting quality secondary and post-secondary education and learning worthwhile skills to properly contribute their share in national progress. Therefore, I recommend making elite schools accessible for intelligent poor students, who secure outstanding grades in the standardized examinations, by providing merit-based scholarships and student loans. The lack of a proper funding system for students in the country is another issue that needs to be addressed. This minimizes the opportunities for underclass students to gain higher education because of incapacities to afford the expenses. Therefore, to assist such deserving children, I also recommend establishing a proper student funding system (e.g. loans and scholarships), which would ensure their inclusion in quality human resource development opportunities.

At the same time, I point to the need for serious and logical policy reforms to drastically improve public school and madaris education. Public school education is vital, as it is usually inclusive in its treatment of students from different social origins. However, the present public education is challenged by material constraints, such as well-constructed and well-furnished school buildings and classrooms, resources, well-designed curricula, and manageable class-sizes. Other non-material factors (such as lack of vision and goals, a learning environment, ineffective leadership, and lack of students’ involvement) also appear to be greatly influencing the public school effectiveness. Therefore, to make these schools successful and capable of retaining their clientele, I recommend raising the allocated funds up to 6 percent of the GDP with a particular emphasis on upgrading public school infrastructure, including essential physical and academic facilities. Paradoxically, the educational expenditures have been hovering around 2% of the GDP since independence.

In addition, the curricula and textbooks have been driven by subject specialists and experts with little input from practising teachers and school personnel. The textbooks are designed to encourage memorization rather than help the teachers include creative projects in the curriculum. Therefore, I recommend more liberty for teachers to determine their classroom practices and more involvement of the teachers in the curriculum development. Moreover, the curricula need to be developed in light of recent educational research with a greater emphasis on thinking skills and stimulating the students’ analytical and reflective capabilities. In addition, the present
students’ evaluation practices, which generally require the reproduction of textbook knowledge, greatly influence the classroom practices. Therefore, I recommend an alternative model of Cambridge GCE O/A level format where students are predominantly evaluated on standards of their academic analysis, independent thinking, reasoning, and problem-solving skills.

Most importantly, the teachers play a crucial role in making schools effective. The personal and professional development of teachers also has a direct impact on students’ achievement. However, the teachers’ development strategies are scarce, obsolete, fragmented, and non-involving. Relevant to the case of Pakistan, Fullan and Hargreaves (1992) argue that many teacher development initiatives take the form of something that is done to teachers rather than with them and even less by them. Such top-down approaches to staff development embody a passive view of the teacher as empty, deficient, lacking in skills, and needing to be filled with new techniques and strategies. Being a teacher myself, I strongly believe that teachers observe, examine, question, and reflect on their ideas, such that they can develop new practices. Hence, it is important to reconceptualise the existing teacher development programs by giving importance to teachers’ knowledge, skills, practice, and experiences. I would also recommend continuous research to examine the complexity of teacher development in the context of Pakistan and refine programs such that they are compatible with modern needs and challenges.

Likewise, I recommend fundamental reforms in the madaris education. However, I do not intend to call for the secularization of the madaris or suggest that they teach secular/modern subjects to the extent that their Islamic identity suffers. But, surely there must be a revision of some aspects of Dars-e-Nizami, which have no longer remained relevant to the modern age. For instance, the “rational sciences” component of Dars-e-Nizami is overloaded with books that contain archaic Greek concepts, theories, logic, and philosophy, which do not correspond to the current age. While maintaining the Quran and Hadith at the center of the curriculum, it is quite possible to replace antiquated books with modern rational subjects, such as English, social and natural sciences, and vocational subjects. I emphasize that the madaris must be empowered once again to focus on producing capable scientists, medical professionals, mathematicians, and civil servants, alongside religious scholars, which was historically the case before British colonization (Mumtaz, 1998, p. 103).
The vocational subjects somehow disappeared with time and with a changed madrassah role during the colonial period. The re/introduction of modern and vocational subjects can cause three constructive effects. First, this can equip current ulema with the necessary skills to provide an appropriate leadership to the community capable of proposing new solutions to the current issues by outlining realistic interpretations of the Islamic jurisprudence. Second, the vocational training will empower ulema towards financial independence. In the Islamic traditions, delivering sermons was not a paid profession. It was honorary, voluntary, and mostly done as a religious calling. For instance, Imam Abu Hanifa, whose school of law most Sunni Muslims follow, was not a professional scholar. He earned his livelihood by conducting business. Today, as a general rule, large sections of ulema live on charity and donations of others. If one is dependent on others, how will he earn the respect due to him? The ulema can gain respect only when they are seen as providing benefit, in terms of proper leadership and guidance to the masses, rather than benefitting from them. Hence, financial independence of the ulema is a necessity, which can be attained only by introducing vocational training in the madaris.

Third, English is now the most employed lingua franca and, if the ulema are to address the new generation and people of other faiths, they must know the language. Besides, if English and the basics of modern subjects are included in the curricula, there are chances to attract the students from economically better-off families. At present, madaris are largely the refuge of the poor, while lower middle and middle class parents prefer to send their children to “secular” schools, because they gain knowledge that would help them get a better job in the future. If the madaris were to include such subjects in their syllabi, at least on a certain basic level, they would potentially attract well-off students as well. However, at present, the curricular reforms in Islamic madaris is an uphill task, as they are greatly opposed by some stubborn and traditionalist ulema who argue that Dars-e-Nizami has produced good scholars in the past and can also do so today. They easily brand anyone who calls for change as an apostate, conspirer, or an agent of un-Islamic forces. Thus, I suggest that ulema must be kept abreast with current developments and workplace needs and challenges. A basic point that needs to be emphasized regarding how can a person become a real scholar if he studies books written eight to eleven-hundred years ago, and by totally ruling out the latest epistemological developments.
Moreover, I recommend that instead of pure mentoring, self-reading of sophisticated medieval Muslim thinkers’ philosophies about school knowledge and praxis, and fragmented efforts to pass on experiential learning, the teacher development programs in madaris must be conducted in a well-organized manner. Teachers must be imparted with an insight of modern pedagogical methods and empowered to comparatively know the strengths and weaknesses of their own “heritage” of medieval Muslim educationists and those of modern and Western philosophers. This will help them to better organize classroom practices by employing activities from a range of teaching concepts.

Presently, the hate-material in public school and madaris curricula is reproducing intolerance, sectarian violence, and extremist ideologies against other religious communities, nations, and Islamic sects. The disturbing themes, such as Pakistan is for Muslims alone, the world is collectively planning against Pakistan and Islam, and Muslims are insisted upon to fight jihad against the infidels must be weeded out from the textbooks. Moreover, to control illiberal and distorted worldviews, a conscious move to teach tolerance and respect for diversity is needed. Besides, if included in the textbooks, opposing perspectives and differing ideas will encourage children to analyse and reflect before making the final choice.

Presently, the degrees and scholastic capital of madaris graduates are highly devalued in the job market. Part of this discrimination lies in deep-rooted historical prejudices. Therefore, I would recommend for meritocracy and open competition between Islamic scholars created by the public universities and those by madaris. The best scholars must be given opportunity to work at higher positions, such as professors of Islamic studies/Arabic in the colleges and universities. Besides, there is a tendency on the part of large sections of the mainstream media to portray the ulema and madaris as if having negative or destructive motives and agendas. The media often picks on some “uncanny” mullahs who disseminate sensational and irrational interpretations of core Islamic beliefs (e.g. Jihad) and present them as speaking for all the ulema, which is undoubtedly not the case. A key to solving this problem is to encourage what is known as collective *Ijtihad*, through which ulema and scholars in various secular branches of learning work together to provide realistic interpretations. In addition, the most pressing need today is for the ulema to act as a bridge between Muslims and other religious communities, rather than adding to the on-going
conflicts. I perceive that madaris can act as an active platform for an inter-faith dialogue to discard parochialism and save the world from catastrophe in the name of religion. It will also help to project an image of madaris as constructive, and not destructive, institutions.

My study highlights that working class parents and their children create a learning environment in the home/family settings, which need to be recognized by the policy-makers and also by the schools in order to build effective community communication linkages that enhance educative opportunities for students and their families.

The present model of different schools’ relative autonomy also needs to be revisited. The elite schools and Islamic madaris appear to have almost complete sovereignty from the government in making and implementing policies. This kind of independence greatly contributes to the self-reproductive capacity of the schools. The public schools, on the other hand, face absolute control, which is not conducive for their academic uplift. I suggest that the public school personnel should be allowed more authority to manage their schools. At the same time, the elite schools and Islamic madaris must be made answerable to the government for their policies and conduct.

**Limitations and Suggestions for Further Research**

This thesis is a starting point in many ways. For instance, while employing Bourdieu and Anyon theoretical frameworks, this study has attempted to understand the total volume and economic/cultural composition of the students’ family capital, class-habitus, and reproductive mechanisms of the three types of mainstream schools in Pakistan. However, I have selected only two representative schools from each stream of education, which is a small and inadequate sample to generalize the findings. Therefore, I suggest much larger evidence-based research studies to provide more support of my findings as well as to increase understanding of the areas that were addressed.

Also, given the small numbers in survey of the current study to explore students’ monetary and non-monetary forms of capital, a much larger follow-up study is needed. Likewise, I suggest much larger evidence based and illustrative research to explore students’ worldviews. This will
not only deepen our understanding, but also help to develop a more reflective analysis to properly address the shortfalls in the present schooling system.

My urban-based working class adult respondents also demonstrated their possession of cultural capital. The study of the working class agents’ independent learning beyond formal schooling, at the workplace, through involvement in religio-political domains, and through general interest/hobby activities suggests that they are as active and self-directed learners as the affluent and highly schooled classes. Besides, their self-perception of being the victim of an exploitative system, dispositions, practices of rejection and resistance against this exploitation, and optimistic planning to provide better life opportunities to their children than they received themselves indicate their cultural capital as well as a transformation of habitus. Further research in these areas is needed to provide more support to the findings of the thesis as well as increase basic understanding of these important premises.

My study was not able to examine the newly emergent education stream of private non-elite English medium schools. However, it provides an initial understanding that these schools have many categories and offer academic and physical standards according to affordability levels of the parents. Therefore, it is necessary to continue examining these schools to identify their precise role in reproducing socioeconomic classes in the country. This would aid the policy-makers to suggest the suitable reforms to make the education system more egalitarian which guarantees an equal opportunity for all Pakistani youths.

One of the fallouts of newly emergent non-elite private English-medium schools is a continuous decrease in public schools’ enrolment from 10 to 15 percent every year. This is a significant phenomenon for which I suggest further empirical studies.

For researchers who intend to work with Bourdieu’ theory of social reproduction, I suggest that the typical cultural capital variables that Bourdieu employed in his empirical studies need to be re-evaluated. Participation in cultural activities may not be an adequate and appropriate measure of cultural capital in modern societies. At the very least, the researchers must consider some different and more complex components of cultural capital than simple exposure to high culture.
This will also contribute to enrich Bourdieu’s original theoretical treatises. Moreover, there must be many other factors that constitute one’s habitus than simply occupational expectations. For instance, gender, ethnicity, or race can also contribute towards shaping dispositions. I suggest the need for in-depth studies to explore a wide range of dispositions to better understand how they influence one’s actions. Moreover, based on my personal experience in this research, I suggest the multidimensional utilization of the theory, as originally proposed by Bourdieu, is useful to better understand reproductive mechanisms.
REFERENCES


Farooq, R. (1989). Research in support of decision making or policy making in Education, Islamabad, Pakistan, AEPAM.


Morris, P. (1990). Curriculum development in Hong Kong, Faculty of Education: The University of Hong Kong.


Nugent, Jo Anne, C (2008). Why at-risk students persist: Pierre Bourdieu’s theory applied to student retention at Humber College, Doctorate thesis, OISE, University of Toronto, Canada


Appendix A: Letter Requesting Administrative Consent
(On OISE/UT letterhead)

Date: ____________

Subject: Permission to Conduct Research in the School

Dear Sir/ Madam ____________________

________________________________

(Principal’s Name)

Name of School ________________________________

________________________________

I am a doctoral student in the Departments of Sociology and Equity Studies in Education (SESE), and Comparative, International, Development Education (CIDE), Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto, Canada.

Presently, under the supervision of Dr. David Livingstone, I am conducting a research study in connection with my doctoral thesis. In this research, I intend to study comparatively the education of Elite English Medium Schools, Public Schools, and Islamic Madrassahs, their capacity of catering to different socioeconomic classes, and the impact of their distinct approaches of education on society, including class reproduction.

To collect data, I intend to work in your school and need your permission to conduct this research. My major data collection tools will include interviews with the principal, five senior teachers, five parents whose children are studying in your school, a focused-group discussion with 10 students, classroom observations, and the document analysis (including statement of school mission, school policies, academic and professional qualifications of the staff, detail of curriculum, fee structure, and statistics concerning student enrolment, retention rates, student profiles, examination results, and evaluation reports). My study will not evaluate the school or the other participants involved in the study; rather, it seeks to understand the participants’ perceptions regarding the nature of education they are delivering or receiving. The purpose of document analysis is to understand the latest educational trends in the country.

In addition to your permission for working in your school, I will be highly grateful, if you kindly agree to personally take part in this study as a participant. I would like to interview you one-on-one at a time and in a location that would be convenient for you. The interview would last about 60 to 90 minutes and would be tape recorded. All interviews will occur in a mutually agreed upon, public location. The interviews will focus on your perceptions of the education and the role of your school in society.

All type of data collected from your school including interviews will remain confidential. The actual names of the participants and locations will not be used in thesis and any kind of other reports. Instead they will be assigned pseudonym. Only Dr. David Livingstone and I will have access to the primary data which will be stored in a safe and locked location. All data will be destroyed once the study is
concluded. The potential risk that you might be identified as a participant in this study is extremely low.

You are under no obligation to participate in this study. Throughout the process, you will be free to raise any questions or concerns with myself or my thesis supervisor Dr. Livingstone.

You can withdraw from the study at any time if you wish to do so.

Thank you for your consideration of this request. I will telephone you in the next two weeks to follow up on this letter. In the meantime, please contact me at 533-603754 or my email address akhtarmallik@hotmail.com if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Akhtar Hassan Malik  
38. Marghzar Colony,  
Gujrat, Pakistan  
533-603754  
akhtarmallik@hotmail.com

Project Supervisor  
Dr. David Livingstone  
416-923-6641, extension 2703  
dlivingstone@oise.utoronto.ca
Appendix B: Administrative Consent Form for Administrator

I, __________________________________ have read the description of Mr. Akhtar Hassan Malik’s research project and am satisfied that I understand its content. I support the research and give permission to Mr. Akhtar Hassan Malik for working in my school and conducting research, including observations, and interviews with teachers, students, and parents that will be selected for this research project. I also agree to participate in in-depth interviews with the researcher. The school will assist Mr. Malik in his research regarding school documents, including statement of school mission, School policies, academic and professional qualifications of the staff, detail of curriculum, fee structure, and statistics concerning students’ enrolment, retention rates, student profile examination results and evaluation reports. I understand that the project will commence on_______________ and end on ___________. I also understand that all the participants have the right for choosing to withdraw from this research project at any time before its completion, and the information collected will be kept confidential and used only for research purposes (completion of his doctoral thesis and the publication of subsequent articles).

Principal’s Signature ____________________ Date ___________________
Appendix C: Letter to Recruit Teachers
(On OISE/UT letterhead)

Date: _________________________

Dear Sir/ Madam _____________________
____________________________________
(Teacher’s Name)

Name of School _______________________________

I am a doctoral student in the Departments of Sociology and Equity Studies in Education (SESE), and Comparative, International, Development Education (CIDE), Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto, Canada.

Presently, under the supervision of Dr. David Livingstone, I am conducting a research study in connection with my doctoral thesis. In this research, I intend to study comparatively the education of Elite English Medium Schools, Public Schools, and Islamic Madrassahs, their capacity of catering to different socioeconomic classes, and the impact of their distinct approaches of education on society, including class reproduction.

I would highly appreciate if you kindly agree to participate in this research study. Your participation will involve the following:

- Three 90-minute formal interviews regarding your teaching experiences, perceptions, and beliefs.
- Eight one-day classroom observations, each followed by an informal interview (no more than 20 minutes). Focus on teaching and learning activities, student teacher interactions, and the learning environment;
- Opportunities to read transcripts (of formal and informal interviews), field notes (of observations), and drafts of chapters.

The interviews will be conducted on a location mutually agreed upon. All data collected during interviews will remain confidential. Your actual name will not be used in the thesis and other reports of any kind. Only Dr. David Livingstone and I will have access to the primary data which will be stored in a safe and locked location. All data will be destroyed once the study is concluded. The potential risk that you might be identified as a participant in this study is extremely low.

You are under no obligation to participate in this study. Throughout the process, you will be free to raise any questions or concerns with myself or Dr. Livingstone.

You can withdraw from the study at any time if you wish to do so.
Thank you for your consideration of this request. I will telephone you in the next two weeks to follow up on this letter. In the meantime, please contact me at 533-603754 or my email address akhtarmallik@hotmail.com if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Akhtar Hassan Malik
38. Marghazar Colony,
Gujrat, Pakistan
533-603754
akhtarmallik@hotmail.com

Project Supervisor
Dr. David Livingstone
416-923-6641, extension 2703
dlivingstone@oise.utoronto.ca
Appendix D: Consent Form for Teachers

I, _________________________________ have read and understood the terms and conditions of this study and agree to participate in this study under the following conditions:

a) At three separate occasions I will engage in 90 minutes face to face interviews with the researcher, which will focus on my teaching experiences, education system in the country, education and training background, beliefs and feelings about teaching and learning, perception about teacher’s images, activities and interaction with people inside and outside the school, contribution to school reform and development over career;
b) I will allow the researcher to visit my classroom and observe my classroom activities arranged at mutually convenient time;
c) I will keep a weekly reflective journal;
d) I will allow the formal and informal interviews to be audio-recorded;
e) I understand that all information I provide to the researcher will be used in the doctoral thesis and subsequent research articles;
f) I understand that all information regarding my personal and professional practices will be kept confidential;
g) I understand that I do not derive any material benefits from participating in the research.
h) I agree to participate in a survey study conducted in order to understand my perceptions regarding the type of education with which I am involved.

Date______________ Name ____________________ Signature ______________

Postal address _____________________________________________________

Email address__________________ Phone number (Office) ________________

(Home) ________________________
Appendix E: Letter to Recruit Parents

Date: _________________________

Dear Sir/ Madam _____________________
______________________________________,
(Parent’s Name)

I am a doctoral student in the Departments of Sociology and Equity Studies in Education (SESE), and Comparative, International, Development Education (CIDE), Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto, Canada.

Presently, under the supervision of Dr. David Livingstone, I am conducting a research study in connection with my doctoral thesis. In this research, I intend to study comparatively the education of Elite English Medium Schools, Public Schools, and Islamic Madrassahs, their capacity of catering to different socioeconomic classes, and the impact of their distinct approaches of education on society, including class reproduction.

Therefore, I am asking you to assist me by agreeing to take part in this study. I would like to interview you one-on-one at a time and in a location that would be convenient for you. The interview would last about 60 to 90 minutes and would be tape recorded. All interviews will occur in a mutually agreed upon, public location. The interview will focus on your experiences with the school that you have chosen for your child to educate.

All data collected during interviews will remain confidential. Your actual name will not be used in the thesis or any other kind of reports. Only Dr. David Livingstone and I will have access to the primary data which will be stored in a safe and locked location. All data will be destroyed once the study is concluded. The chance that you might be identified as a participant in this study is extremely low.

You are under no obligation to participate in this study. Throughout the process, you will be free to raise any questions or concerns with myself or thesis supervisor Dr. Livingstone.

You can withdraw from the study at any time if you wish to do so.

Thank you for your consideration of this request. I will telephone you in the next two weeks to follow up on this letter. In the meantime, please contact me at 533-603754 or my email address akhtarmallik@hotmail.com if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Akhtar Hassan Malik
Project Supervisor
38. Marghzar Colony, Gujrat, Pakistan
533-603754
akhtarmallik@hotmail.com

Dr. David Livingstone
416-923-6641, extension 2703
dlivingstone@oise.utoronto.ca
Appendix F: Consent Form for Parents

I, _________________________________ have read and understood the terms and conditions of this study and agree to participate in this study under the following conditions:

a) At three separate occasions, I will engage in 90 minutes face to face interviews with the researcher, which will focus on my perceptions and issues regarding education system in the country, and the reasons for selecting this particular school;
b) The interview study is anticipated to begin as soon as Toronto University Ethics Board approval is received in October 01, 2007, and be completed by October 15, 2008;
c) I will allow the formal and informal interviews to be audio-recorded;
d) I understand that there is a potential risk to my anonymity in the electronic correspondence. All efforts will be taken for the secrecy of passwords and storing the information in sub-files, but I do understand this is a potential risk of my involvement in this interview study;
e) I understand that all information I provide to the researcher will be used in the doctoral thesis and subsequent research articles;
f) I understand that all information regarding my personal and professional practices will be kept confidential;
g) I understand that I do not derive any material benefits from participating in the research.

Signature ___________________________ Date________________________
Appendix G: Performa for Participants’ Profiles

**Demographic Questions:**

1. Name of the School of your child (optional) ____________________________________________

2. Gender: (a) Male  (b) Female

3. Age_____________________________________________________________________

4. Marital Status _____________________________________________________________________

5. Education: _____________________________________________________________________

6. Professional Experience: _____________________________________________________________________

7. What is your income per month (in Rupees)? _____________________________________________________________________

8. Is your spouse also working?    (a) Yes     (b) No

     If “yes” Nature of his/her work ______________________________________________

     What is his/her income per month? _________________________________________

9. Family size and their achievements ________________________________________________

   __________________________________________________________________________

   __________________________________________________________________________

10. Area/locality of residence _______________________________________________________

**Detail of Property**

11. Do you own the House of your residence?         (a) Yes     (b) No

     If “yes” what is its total area and market value? ____________________________

12. Total number of houses owned by the participant/spouse___________________________

     Market value of houses ______________________________________________________

13. If the participant lives as a tenant, how much is the rent ________________________
14. Total number of cars owned by the participant/spouse __________________
Make and market values of cars?
Car#1 ___________________________________________________
Car#2 ___________________________________________________
Car#3 ___________________________________________________
Car#4 ___________________________________________________
Car#5 ___________________________________________________

15. If owns any other mode of transportations (pl. specify) ________________________

16. Do you own agricultural/commercial property? (a) Yes (b) No
If “yes” pl. specify ______________________________________________________
Market value __________________________________________________________

17. Any other property/assets, please specify ________________________________

Notes about locality and living conditions of the participant
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Appendix H: Interview Guide for Principal Research Participants

Part One

Relating to Life History
Tell me about yourself, family background, about parents, spouse and his/her family background, nature of their professional work, locality of residence (merits/demerits), nature of family relationships (democratic/authoritarian), beliefs and practices about relationships within family (general/educative)

Relating to Education
Tell me about your childhood/early education/higher education/education achieved through informal ways/efforts for general interest and workplace learning/some other channels you employ for learning and why?/ How effective are these channels and why? Experiences, achievements, and disappointments about formal/informal learning

Relating to the Worldviews
What do you perceive about nationalism-religion and Sharia laws/secular ideologies/democracy/human rights (e.g. gender, religious minority etc.), jihad/militancy/relations with international communities and why?

Part Two

Relating to Schooling Practices (Principals and Teachers)
Vision and mission statement of the school/what kind of knowledge and skills do you perceive are the most appropriate for your students and why? What kinds of characteristics do you try to foster in your students? Why so? What strengths/weaknesses do you perceive in the curricula of your school? What improvement do you suggest? What are the elements of good teaching in your view? How do you perceive your role as a teacher in the classroom? What kind of pedagogical strategies do you prefer to use? Why so? What role does the textbook play in your classroom and why? To what extent and in what ways your students are independent in choosing their learning activities? And how do you find it useful in developing their analytical and intellectual powers? What are the main classroom challenges and how do you handle them? How do you know you are doing a good job in your classroom? What strategies do you employ to further improve your teaching? What kind of relationships do you try to build with your students, and why? What in your opinion motivates the students’ learning, and why? What are your satisfactions/dissatisfactions regarding your colleagues and why? What kind of teacher would you like to prefer for your school and why? Perceptions/practices about school culture/relationships in the school/student evaluation/classroom rules/rewards/ punishments

Relating to Class-habitus (Parents/students)
Why to prefer this particular school/future plans/expectations/ambitions and advantages/disadvantages to educate child in this particular school/satisfactions/dissatisfactions about schooling/teachers/class-work/schoolmates, school culture and why?
Relating to Capital (Parents/students)

Family income/sources of income/nature of property/nature of educational resources at home/nature of cultural participation/Information about educational system/what ways/means are conducive in this regard/the most appropriate school in your view/ practical involvement in the children’s schooling/nature of contact with school/teachers/ social confidence/nature of family social networks/level of confidence on these social connection to achieve educational/occupational goals/what role the schools play to develop social networks
Appendix I: Classroom Observation Guide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Classroom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Subject Matter</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Setting of Classroom**

**Focus is on:**

- Academic Competency
- Affective/Social Needs
- Individual needs
- Group Needs

**Content:**

- Adherence to the Textbooks
- Use of Additional Material
- Reference to the local environment
- Reference to the experiences of the students and teacher
- Teacher is confident
- Lacks knowledge

**Acceptance of Students is Based on:**

- Respect for the Individual
- Compliance to the rules
- Fear of the teacher/other authority
- Other

**Classroom Materials:**

- Available for students as needed
- Dispensed by teachers
- Developed locally
- Brought from outside
- Quality (Relevance, language, accessibility)
- Other

**Expectations from Students:**

- Cooperation
- Obedience
- Responsible decision making
- Other

**Students’ Behaviors Addressed When:**

- Appropriate
- Inappropriate
- Others

**Student/Teacher Interactions Are:**

- Interactive
- Teacher Initiated
- Student Initiated
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Encouraged</th>
<th>Discouraged</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student/Students’ Interactions Are:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraged</td>
<td>Discouraged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students’ Assignments are:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directed and evaluated by teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chosen, shared and evaluated by students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forms (praise, grading, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content and purpose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who does it (teacher, peers)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teaching Strategies and Methods:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Centered</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students/Learner centered</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Appeals to Authority:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secular</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Connecting Classroom with Life outside:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local culture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Note: The guide is a not a rigid tool but a helping frame to allow me to capture the classroom inasmuch as I could. Mainly observations were taken freely in a narrative mode. The guide was used for focusing myself to see if I have covered as many aspects as possible.
Appendix J: Questionnaire for Students’ Survey

July, 2008

The education system of Pakistan offers diversity in the educational opportunities to the students through three types of schooling: Government Schools, Elite-English-Medium Schools, and Islamic Madaris. The purpose of this study is to examine comparatively the social origin of students with focus on the nature of their economic, cultural, and social capitals.

Please complete this questionnaire and then return to the postage-paid, self-addressed envelope. Pilot tests indicate a complete time of about twenty minutes. We appreciate the many demands on your time, including our request for information. This information will only be used for the purposes of my doctoral thesis, and perhaps later for subsequent research articles. The anonymity of all respondents is guaranteed. Neither schools nor individuals will be identified in any reports on the research.

Your cooperation in completing this survey is greatly appreciated.
SECTION 1: Cultural Capital

Do you possess the following cultural/educational resources at home? *(You can choose more than one response)*

a. Personal computer/laptop,
b. Internet facility,
c. Encyclopaedia Britannica,
d. Encyclopaedia of Islam,
e. Your personal library,
f. Authenticated Artwork (Painting, Religious Calligraphy, etc.)

If you choose “e,” how many books are there in your library ______________________

How often do you use internet at home?

(a) Every day (b) Once a week (c) Once a month (d) Never use at all

In what ways internet helps you in your education ____________________________

________________________________________________________________________

How often do you read newspapers?

(a) Every day (b) Often (c) Occasionally (d) Rarely (e) Never read at all

Please name the newspaper that you prefer to read? ___________________________

How often do you watch television at home?

(a) Every day (b) Often (c) Occasionally (d) Rarely (e) Never watch at all

What kind of programs do you like to watch on television? *(You can choose more than one response)*

a. Entertaining programs (music, drama, comedy shows etc);
b. News;
c. Documentaries;
d. science fictions;
e. English movies;
f. Programs regarding national/international politics;
g. Religious programs;
h. Any other, Pl specify: _________________________________________________

How many hours do you spend on your homework/advanced reading?
Do you prefer to do your homework independently?  (a) Yes  (b) No

If you choose “No,” who helps you in your homework?

(a) Father  (b) Mother  (c) Brother  (d)  Sister  (e) Tutor  (f) Other, pl. specify ______

If you choose “tutor” how much you have to pay him every month __________________

How regularly do you go to the public library?

(a) Every day  (b) Once a week  (c) Once a month  (d) Never go at all.

Acquaintance with high-brow literature

How many books or magazines have you read in each of the following groups in the past 12 months? (not including those required for school) Pl. mark your answers as follows:  A. 5 or more.  B. Four.  C. Three.  D. Two.  E. One.  F. None  (You can choose more than one response)

1. Science fiction………………..A B C D E F
2. Classical Plays, poetry, essays, Literary criticism, classics……A B C D E F
3. Politics, world affairs,
4. Biography, autobiography……A B C D E F
5. Classical/historical novels……A B C D E F

Please write the title of the classical books that you read during last 12-months ______________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

SECTION 2: Social Capital

To what extent are you confident that your family’s social contacts will help you in finding an appropriate job/profession, when you will finish you education?

a. Very confident
b. Confident
c. Somewhat confident
d. Not at all confident
e. Do not expect any help
SECTION 3: Student’s educational/professional expectations

What are your expectations regarding opportunities for higher education after completing your secondary school?

a. Admission in foreign educational institutions
b. Admission in private elite national institutions
c. Admission in Government Colleges/Universities
d. Admission in Islamic Madrassahs
e. Do not expect any opportunity for higher education
f. Any other Pl. specify_____________________________________________

What would be your choice for future educational plans?

a. High Professional Courses (Medical/Engineering/Computer Technology etc.)
b. Languages, Fine Arts, Literature Courses
c. Philosophy, Sociology, History, Political Science
d. Studies in Religion
e. Any other, Pl. specify: __________________________________________

What kind of job/profession are you expecting after completing your education, and why?
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

Are you satisfied with the type of education you are receiving? Please explain
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

Will your education help you to achieve your goals? Why/why not?
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
**SECTION 4: Please select the most appropriate answer from the following:**

1. Your gender:  a. ( ) Male         b. ( ) Female         (check one)

2. Would you please describe your father’s education? _________________________

3. Would you please describe your mother’s education? _________________________

4. What is your father’s profession? _________________________

5. What is your family income per month (in Rupees)? _________________________

6. How many brothers and sisters do you have?  
   a) Brothers _________________________
   b) Sisters _________________________

7. Is your mother working?  
   a) Yes  
   b) No

8. Does your family own a House?  
   a) Yes  
   b) No

   If “yes” how many? _________________________

9. Does your family own a car?  
   a) Yes  
   b) No

   If “yes” how many? _________________________

10. Does your family own property?  
    a. ( ) Yes  
    b. ( ) No

    If “Yes” Pl. specify____________________

11. Where do you live?  
    a. ( ) With parents  
    b. ( ) With other relatives  
    c. ( ) In school boarding  
    d. ( ) In Madrassah building

    Any other Pl. specify____________________

12. Who supports you financially including educational expenses (e.g., uniform, books, tuition fees, living, etc)?  
    a. ( ) Father  
    b. ( ) Mother  
    c. ( ) Brother  
    d. ( ) Any other relative  
    e. ( ) School  
    f. ( ) Other: _________________________

13. Do you pay fee for your education at school?  
    a) Yes  
    b) No

   If Yes,” How much? (in rupees) _________________________

Thank you very much for completing this questionnaire. Please seal the questionnaire in the self-addressed envelope provided and return it to the researcher.