Sounding the Inner Voice: Emotion and Vocal Emulation in Trumpet Performance and Pedagogy

by

Geoffrey Tiller

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts
Faculty of Music
University of Toronto

© Copyright by Geoffrey Tiller 2015
Sounding the Inner Voice: Emotion and Vocal Emulation in Trumpet Performance and Pedagogy

Geoffrey Tiller

Doctor of Musical Arts

Faculty of Music

University of Toronto

2015

Abstract

This dissertation examines the aesthetics of trumpet performance with a focus on the relationship between a vocal approach and expressiveness in trumpet playing. It aims to improve current trumpet pedagogy by presenting different strategies for developing a theory of a vocal approach. Many of the concepts and anecdotes used in respected pedagogical publications and by trumpet teachers themselves are heavily influenced by the premise that emulating the voice is a desired outcome for the serious trumpet performer. Despite the abundance of references to the importance of playing trumpet with a vocal approach, there has been little formal inquiry into this subject and there is a need for more informed teaching strategies aimed at clarifying the concepts of vocal emulation.

The study begins with an examination of vocal performance and pedagogy in order to provide an understanding of how emulating the voice came to be so central to contemporary notions of trumpet performance aesthetics in Western concert music.
Chapter Two explores how emotion has been theorized in Western art music and the role that the human voice is thought to play in conveying such emotion. I then build on these ideas to theorize how music and emotion might be better understood from the performer’s perspective. The final chapters develop a pedagogy of voice-like expression by integrating exercises based on Constantin Stanislavski’s acting method, narrative analysis, and applied vocal practices to trumpet performance to strengthen the links between voice, emotion, and expressive musical communication.
I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my committee members, Dr. Jeffrey Reynolds, Dr. Jeff Packman, and Dr. Gillian MacKay for their guidance throughout my doctoral studies at the University of Toronto. Special thanks go to my current and former students who played a major role in this research and I want to thank them all for their understanding, and willingness to try something a little different during their lessons. Finally, I would like to thank Stacey, for her patience, support, understanding, encouragement, and editing skills throughout the researching and writing process.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgments........................................................................................................ iv  
List of Figures ...................................................................................................................... vi  

Chapter  

Introduction......................................................................................................................... 1  

1. A Historical Background of Vocal Music and Pedagogy ............................................. 7  

2. Musical Emotion and Aesthetics.................................................................................... 38  

3. Ways of Developing Voice-like Expression ................................................................... 66  

4. A Vocal Approach as Applied to Trumpet Performance and Pedagogy....................... 90  

Bibliography....................................................................................................................... 124
List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Jim Thompson, Example of <em>Portamento</em></td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Herbert L. Clarke, Second Study in F Major</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>R. Murray Schaffer, <em>Aubade for Two Voices</em></td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Throughout the history of Western music, vocal music has served as the archetype for musical expression at least in part because many theorists, musicians, and pedagogues embrace the idea that the human voice reaches the deepest feelings of the human spirit.\(^1\) Those supporting this belief argue that singing is a method of communication that can convey diverse forms of emotion via voice quality, timbre, phrasing, facial and body expressions, and text. In a similar fashion, numerous trumpet teachers adhere to the premise that using a vocal approach, that is, emulating the voice in instrumental music performance and pedagogy is an effective means toward more emotionally expressive and indeed musical playing.

What exactly does a vocal approach entail? What is the relationship between emulating the voice and emotional performance? This dissertation argues that conveying emotion should be a primary goal of trumpet performance and that singing is a useful metaphor for accomplishing this goal. While this is not a revolutionary assertion, much of the language of trumpet pedagogy that is used to help students find an ideal sound such as vocal approach, expression, musical, and emotion are based on a wide-range of hard to define aesthetic values and founded on abstract and subjective principles that are often uncritically accepted. Further compounding the problem is that terms are often used inter-changeably. Consequently, two juxtaposed, inter-related, and even interconstituted concepts, the singing voice metaphor and emotion, are used inconsistently and confusingly.

The objective of this dissertation is to critically examine the aesthetics of trumpet performance with a focus on the relationship between a vocal approach and emotional expressiveness in trumpet playing. Singing in Western art music has often been discussed as a channel for human emotion and its expression.\textsuperscript{2} This dissertation will argue that emulating the voice is a basis for good trumpet playing because it encourages the musician to think about expression before technique, thereby facilitating a more meaningful communication of the musical message. Despite the abundance of references to the importance of playing trumpet with a vocal approach, there has been little formal inquiry into this subject and there is a need for more informed teaching strategies aimed at clarifying the aesthetic concepts of vocal emulation. The ultimate aim of this dissertation is to clarify the idea of a vocal approach for application in trumpet pedagogy.

A recent study conducted by Alan Hood, Assistant Professor of Trumpet at the University of Denver, revealed that numerous university trumpet studios in the United States share a vocal approach as a basis for their pedagogy. Hood attended private applied trumpet lessons and observed that when teachers spoke of a vocal approach students were advised to, “Think Opera – Italian Chianti!” or “Play it like a monk in a monastery singing.”\textsuperscript{3} I am not suggesting that using esoteric symbolism is the backbone of a vocal approach; in fact, using these types of expressions to colour already established concepts can be a useful technique. Yet when taken out of context, these metaphors fail

\textsuperscript{2} The earliest record on this is found in 1602 in Caccini’s \textit{Le Nuove Musiche} (The New Music), but in more recent times this theory of expression is valued by numerous scholars including, Donald Ferguson (1960); Owen Jander (1980); and Peter Kivy (2001).


\textsuperscript{4} Phil Collins, \textit{In the Singing Style} (Portland, ME: PP Music, 1993), ii.
to make a connection between the emotion we might have when drinking fine Italian wine or the religious symbolism of a monk singing Gregorian chant and sounds that students produce on their instruments. If teachers can create less abstract associations between emotion and music they can provide students with clearer objectives for the music, ensuring that emotion and expression might be more readily achieved in performance.

There are many trumpet teachers who encourage a vocal approach but offer little to no discussion about the details, including the expression of emotion. Furthermore, a considerable amount of the instruction found in method books does not offer instrumentalists conceptual clarification or comprehensive implementation of vocal emulation. For example, a widely used book that promotes a vocal approach on the trumpet is *In the Singing Style* (1993) edited by Phil Collins. Collins writes, “Careful consistent practice of this material should help to develop more sensitivity to phrasing, greater endurance, and motivation for more expressive playing.” ⁴ Another popular book is *The Complete Solfeggi of Giuseppe Concone* (2008) edited by John Korak. Korak writes, “The benefits of a ‘singing’ approach to instrumental music have long been recognized.” ⁵ These books recognize the importance of vocal emulation in trumpet performance and were edited by well-known trumpeters, yet they do not offer students conceptual clarification or methodical instructions for further implementation of the

---

voice-like ideal.\textsuperscript{6}

By creating and using well-defined exercises as a means of clarifying and accomplishing emotional expression, the pedagogical gap between theory and practice will begin to close. In contrast to a philosophical or musicological approach that might lead me to focus primarily on printed scores, I examine the aesthetics of performance. Rather than creating a detailed account of every theory and idea about musical aesthetics, I will discuss those that I find to be especially pertinent to trumpet performance and a vocal approach. These include music symbolism, music and text associations, prosodic features, and theories of emotion; concepts that have received substantial attention from music scholars.

Chapter One queries what it has meant to be voice-like at various key junctures in Western Music history and explores if and how the ideals have changed over time. An important consideration is the history of vocal performance and pedagogy because examining how a vocalist creates emotion and communicates meaning is one of the foundations of the quest for vocal emulation on the trumpet. Previous research has indicated that early vocal music was based on simplicity but as vocal pedagogy and compositions developed, concepts such as phrasing and style became an art as opposed to the mechanics of the craft.\textsuperscript{7} For reasons that will be developed in this chapter, it is my contention that as vocal pedagogy and performance progressed, instrumentalists


\textsuperscript{7} Edward Foreman. \textit{Authentic Singing: Being the History and Practice of the Art of Singing and Teaching} (Minneapolis, MN: Pro Musica Press, 2001), xxv.
responded to advancing forms of expression, and this expressiveness is tied directly to ideas about the voice. The chapter, then, surveys key secondary sources on the topic of vocal performance and pedagogy in order to provide an understanding of how emulating the voice came to be so central to contemporary notions of trumpet performance aesthetics in Western concert music.

Chapter Two explores how emotion has been theorized in Western art music, the role that the human voice is thought to play in conveying such emotion, and what aesthetic ideas are significant to emotional expressiveness in instrumental music. I then build on these ideas to theorize how music and emotion might be better understood from the performer’s perspective. The goal is to connect theories of emotion with the ongoing valorization of a vocal approach to trumpet performance.

Chapter Three establishes a process by which the performer can develop an approach to creating emotions in music performance by establishing a narrative analysis. One way that emotional content in vocal music is understood is through text because it usually provides concrete information to the listener and the performer. Given that instrumental music by definition does not contain text, a narrative theory may generate stimuli that help instrumental music performers create an emotional connection to the music they are performing. Additionally, I investigate the potential of applying particular elements of artistic interpretation and rehearsal methodology from Constantin Stanislavski’s acting method to trumpet performance. Similar to a vocalist, an actor’s level of artistry is based on a set of criteria related to the use of sound in his or her voice such as, timbre, phrasing, dynamic control often in service to conveying specific emotions. Indeed, Stanislavski’s method emphasizes the harnessing of emotion as a
means to express it and thus, is in many ways relevant with how I understand a vocal approach to trumpet.

Chapter Four develops strategies for applying a vocal approach. Through a sequential learning process, students revisit foundational trumpet and vocal concepts that will effectively change how they approach the emulation of the voice on the trumpet. This chapter applies vocal practices to trumpet pedagogy and integrates exercises from Stanislavski’s acting method to strengthen the link between voice, emotion, trumpet performance and expressive musical communication.
Chapter One

A Historical Background of Vocal Music and Pedagogy

As stated in the Introduction, this dissertation is concerned with exploring how ideas related to the aesthetics of the voice have influenced trumpet playing and how this link can be developed further. In doing so it also aims to clarify understandings of vocal emulation as a pedagogical tool for teachers and a means toward better playing for performers. These goals are rooted in my conviction that emulating the voice does indeed have a positive effect on trumpet performance because it encourages the musician to think about expression in addition to technique. Despite the widespread embrace of a vocal approach, many terms in trumpet pedagogy that are used to help students find an ideal sound such as vocal approach, expression, musical, and emotion are based on a wide-range of hard to define aesthetic values. Furthermore, these values are often founded on abstract and subjective principles that are often uncritically accepted. My approach to this problem is to emphasize that endeavoring to play with emotion can make a performance voice-like. I believe that actively striving for emotional expression guided by a vocal concept is a clearer path toward effective trumpet performance than trying to sound voice-like in and of itself. To this end it becomes important for the teacher to encourage the student to search for effective stimuli to deepen their emotional engagement with the music. Maintaining a connection to an idea of how the voice might express emotion can be an effective means of achieving this end.

This chapter is devoted to studying the history of vocal performance and pedagogy, and the underlying reasons why instrumentalists are encouraged to emulate the voice. Based on the initial importance of vocal music in shaping instrumental sonic
ideals, I suggest that instrumentalists responded to changing forms of expression and that notions of expressiveness have continued to be tightly linked to ideas about the voice. After surveying several written histories of Western Music focusing on shifts and continuities in the practice of singing, it is clear to me that the aesthetics and techniques developed in five historical periods have had the most influence on trumpet performance and pedagogy. The eras in question are the Middle Ages, The A Capella Period, The Age of Bel Canto, The Age of the Grand Opera, and the Era of Wagnerian Opera. These historical periods of vocal music are not typical periods referenced by musicologists when discussing general music history. Rather, vocal music historians value these eras because they provide a broad and comprehensive understanding of vocal performance and pedagogy. Numerous vocalists during each of these periods were considered by their contemporary musicians and musical authorities as not only masters of technique but also of musical performance. Thus it follows that aspects of their vocal performance aesthetics might have informed how instrumentalists would idealize their sound.

The Church and Singing

The Christian church believed that God should only be worshipped via the human voice. Church leaders repudiated the use of instruments because of the associations they shared with pagan cults and immorality. Saint Basil, the Bishop of Caesarea, wrote,

---

8 (Crocker, 2000); (Duey, 1951); (Marek, 2007); (Reid, 1950)
As to instruments, the Fathers identify two interrelated evils arising from their use: playing instruments is essentially idle and unproductive, and it can lead to licentious behaviour. From the use of flutes it is but a step to “shameful songs,” and thence to drunkenness and worse. (Saint Basil 362 A.D., quoted in Deferrari 29, 1934)

Because performing on instruments was forbidden in church, vocal music became an important part of worship services. One of the earliest vocal forms in church was Gregorian chant, widely accepted throughout Europe as one of the primary ways to exalt the word of God and to further express the spiritual meaning of the liturgy.

Despite various debates over how music was (and should be) used in Church services, scholars agree that during the Middle Ages a choir of monks or Nuns performed chant. Richard Crocker, a historian and performer of chant, argues that monks were given this responsibility because chant was a very specific and important repertory that was too complex to be sung by the congregation. Crocker maintains that during the Middle Ages chant was viewed as the music of the angels that created a “mystic ascent to eternity and serenity.”

This widely influential vocal genre provided an important early model for artistic vocal expression because it facilitated an emotional and personal experience for the participants. An important feature of chant was that it was based on a liturgical text; composers tried to imitate the spoken rhythm of the liturgy because a similar rhythm

---

10 Ibid., 7.
would help the congregation to understand the text when it was being performed.\textsuperscript{11} Composers emphasized what were emotional texts by moving the melody to the upper \textit{tessitura} as well as increasing the note lengths. So a common compositional technique was to compose phrases that resembled an arch, beginning low, rising to a higher range, and eventually descending.\textsuperscript{12} This technique of phrase construction influenced composition well into the sixteenth century.\textsuperscript{13} As suggested by these examples, which reinforce the importance placed by the church on vocal music and illustrate the centrality of the Church in the Western music tradition, we can begin to trace the idea of a voice-like ideal to Christian liturgical music.

**Early Vocal Pedagogy**

By the eighth century there was a standardization of the Roman Catholic liturgy, and part of that process entailed composing and assigning new music and scripture readings to certain Sundays throughout the year.\textsuperscript{14} As a result of this standardization many church cantors traveled throughout Europe to teach the new chants to local parishes by rote. During this time period musical notation was in its earliest stages, therefore, the cantors usually traveled in pairs; if one of the cantors forgot the melody, hopefully the second cantor would remember it. This is one of the earliest forms of music education and it is tied directly to vocal practice.

Another early form of organized music education was the \textit{schola cantorum}.

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{11} Donald Grout, \textit{A History of Western Music} 8\textsuperscript{th} ed. (New York: W.W. Norton, 2010), 50.
\textsuperscript{12} Ibid., 53.
\textsuperscript{13} Ibid., 51.
\textsuperscript{14} Weiss and Taruskin, \textit{Music in the Western World}, 35.
\end{flushleft}
Originally the *schola cantorum* was the official papal choir but when Pope Gregory was elected Pope of the Roman Catholic Church he created schools called the *scholae cantorum*. These schools provided instruction to boys and men in singing and composition, which strengthened the relationship between church and early vocal pedagogy. Because the Roman Catholic Church valued the voice as central to its liturgical music, and because the Church’s perspectives on music were promulgated throughout Europe via its particular system of music education, the belief in the primacy of the voice in music became very widespread during the Middle Ages. Moreover, the tradition of teaching music orally strengthened the association between church, music education, and voice. In comparison, as we begin to recognize new developments and functions for vocal music and performance, we also witness changes in music education.

**Attempting to Describe the Ideal Sound**

It was during the Medieval era that the ideal sound of the human voice was first discussed and defined. However, many early attempts to characterize a beautiful singing voice seem insufficient today as a pedagogical tool because there is a lack of concrete instruction as to how a singer might create an ideal sound. For example, in 600 A.D. St. Isadore of Seville (560-636), considered by many scholars as the “last scholar of the ancient world”\(^\text{15}\) asserted that, “The perfect voice is high, sweet, and clear; it is high so as to be adequate in the upper range; it is clear so as to fill the ears amply; it is sweet so as to delight the spirits of the listeners. If any of these is lacking it is not perfect.”\(^\text{16}\)

Applying Isadore’s definition directly to a piece of music rooted in a similar aesthetic, however,

---

\(^{15}\) Philip A. Duey, *Bel Canto in its Golden Age* (New York: King’s Crown, 1951), 32.

\(^{16}\) Duey, *Bel Canto in its Golden Age*, 32.
offers audible, albeit subjective clues as to how a voice ideal might sound. Although numerous clerics and musicians interested in vocal aesthetics embraced his idealizations, contemporary pedagogical perspectives may find shortcomings in these descriptions. It is important to accept these concepts in the context of their historical placement and not judge them from a contemporary point of view. For example, Isadore only mentions the upper range and does not take into account the voice in all registers.

Voice production technique, that is, the manner of making vocal sound, is difficult to ascertain during this period because hundreds of years of music pedagogy was formulated with the understanding that a direct experience with a teacher was necessary to understand the function of the human voice. The earliest treatises on singing dealt with instruction in music theory, singing in a comfortable range, pronunciation, and encouraging the vocalist not to breathe in the middle of a word.\(^\text{17}\) This emphasizes that the meaning of the text was primary and that singing was a method for the dissemination of that meaning. It also illustrates that a definition of a voice ideal was always subject to local interpretation either by a teacher or the student himself. To some extent this is still true today. In effect, since the beginnings of music until we could record or broadcast performances, one had to be present with the sound to be emulated and its producer at the moment he or she produced the sound.

By the thirteenth century composers of sacred and secular music began to favour polyphony over monophony for vocal music; a pivotal moment in Western music history. This development allowed composers to combine multiple melodic lines, which created contrapuntal and harmonic complexity. It is worth considering that composers wanted to

experiment with a wider range of timbre and sonorities, which may have included instruments being paired with the voice. For example, Andrew Lawrence-King a Renaissance music scholar writes that Renaissance instrumentalists usually played from a vocal score and the “ideal that instrumentalists strove for was to have the same flexibility and expressivity in an instrumental version of a piece that one could hope for in a vocal version.”  

Because the voice had been established as the primary instrument centuries before polyphony was introduced, it is quite likely that these specific historical conditions, cultural beliefs, and discourses informed a vocal approach in instrumental performance.

The A Capella Period

The *A Capella* period began in 1474 and ended in 1640, thus encompassing some of the Renaissance and Baroque eras. The typical choral genres during the Renaissance were the mass, motet, and the madrigal and it was during this era composers and librettists came to emphasize explicitly in vocal scores associations between song text and conveying emotion. In his preface to *Le Nuove Musiche (The New Music)*, published in 1602, Giulio Caccini prescribes specific kinds of ornaments to express pity, torment and longing. Vocalists facilitated these emotions by using popular ornamentations like the *messa di voce* and the *esclamazione*, both of which involved

---

20 Ibid.
variations in dynamics. The *messa di voce* was a gradual *crescendo* and *decrescendo* on a sustained note and the *esclamazione* was a *fortissimo* attack with a *decrescendo* on a sustained note. The addition of these dynamics implies that composers and librettists believed that by increasing and decreasing volume levels on certain words would provide added expression, thus conveying emotion.

This type of vocal expression did not have an immediate impact on trumpet playing. One reason for this is that, at the time, many people held negative associations with the instrument. For example, the trumpet of the period, the so-called natural trumpet, was restricted by the overtone series. This made it very challenging to play diatonically with good intonation and limited its utility for melodically elaborate music. Furthermore, trumpets were usually played outside for the purpose of signaling. Thus the instrument gained a reputation for having a loud and unappealing tone quality that was out of place in most concert or liturgical settings.

However, the *cornetto*, a hybrid between brass and woodwinds that used a cup-shaped mouthpiece similar to a trumpet, was considered an excellent instrument for accompanying for singers because of its adaptability. This flexibility, moreover, made the *cornetto* effective for vocal emulation and thus it was often used to reinforce vocal lines in liturgical settings. John Wallace, an internationally acclaimed trumpeter writes, “The tone of the *cornetto* was sometimes indistinguishable from the human voice and it was lauded for its vocal qualities from its beginnings until its obsolescence.”

---

diatonically became favoured to accompany singers. Eventually the trumpet would inherit similar respect from composers and musicians alike, but for the duration of the Renaissance era the *cornetto* and the trumpet coexisted as two distinct entities with the trumpet relegated primarily to outdoor signaling use by hunters and soldiers.

The relationship between instrumental and vocal performance would continue to change during the *A Capella* era. The invention of the printing press in 1455 was significant in this process because it allowed for the mass production of comprehensive music theory treatises, books related to the art of singing, and numerous other texts that were written exclusively for instrumentalists. This meant that ideas could be shared with a greater number of people and circulated more widely than was previously possible. Perhaps predictably, during the *A Cappella* era we find more evidence of various instrumentalists starting to emulate the voice. In fact, teachers, music theorists, and composers advocated for it in an attempt to provide a foundation for a vocal approach applicable to other instruments.

*Opera Intitulata Fontegara (A Treatise on Playing the Recorder and Ornamentation)* was the first instruction book specifically written for wind and stringed instruments. Written by Venetian musician Sylvestro di Ganassi and published in 1535, this important Renaissance treatise may be the first document that states that since instrumentalists are inferior to singers “we (instrumentalists) should learn to imitate the voice.”\(^{24}\) In Chapter One Ganassi writes,

---

Be it known that all musical instruments, in comparison to the human voice, are inferior to it; for this reason we should endeavour to learn from it and imitate it... Just as a gifted painter can reproduce all the creations of nature by varying his colours, you can imitate the expression of the human voice on a wind or stringed instrument... Just as the painter imitates natural effects by using colours, an instrument can imitate the expression of the human voice. As one says a picture only lacks breath, so can one say of a skillful player that his instrument only lacks the human form.

(Ganassi, as translated by Swaison, 1959, 9)

These ideas, while abstract and sometimes difficult to dovetail into the more literal process of playing a wind or stringed instrument, clearly demonstrate an early and important connection between the voice, humanness, and musical ideals.

Ganassi clearly understood that the spoken voice was capable of expressing emotion. He also believed the singing voice not only communicated the semantic meaning of the text, but also conveyed emotion by exploiting the flexibility of the voice in terms of pitch, timbre, dynamics, and articulation. Ganassi maintained that spoken text, such as poetry, had strong and weak beats; altering the volume and duration of the words indicated these beats. He speculated that vocalists approached singing in a similar fashion, so he devised several distinct categories of articulation based on the way vocalists articulated certain words.²⁵

Ganassi’s idea consisted of pairing various consonants such as “t, d, l, r, p” with various vowel sounds, such as “eh ah, oh, oo, ee.” For example, to mimic crude and harsh words instrumentalists used te and che. Le and re were employed to mimic pleasing and pleasant vocabulary. Ganassi was convinced that if wind players could

---
²⁵ Ganassi, Opera intitulata Fontegara, 9.
imitate how the voice articulated sound then instrumentalists would come closer to approximating its ability to express emotion. Edward Tarr, the world’s foremost historian of the trumpet, provides evidence that Ganassi’s method was widely embraced. Tarr states that the treatises written by Cardano (1546) and Dalla Casa (1584) directly borrowed Ganassi’s ideas.  

Girolamo dalla Casa, like Ganassi, was another Venetian composer and cornettist. Along with his two brothers he created the first permanent instrumental ensembles in St. Mark’s Basilica from 1568-1601. Much of Dalla Casa’s treatise, *Il Vero Modo di Diminuir con Tutte le Sorti de Stromenti di Fiato & Corda & di Voce Humana (The True way of Making Divisions on all Sorts of Instruments, Wind and String and with the Human Voice)*, published in 1584, dealt with how to properly employ what he called diminutions or divisions. Divisions were a form of improvised ornamentation in the Renaissance era. Vocalists were encouraged to use them at cadential points, to fill in large intervals, and to highlight text painting. Divisions were used by vocalists to demonstrate their virtuosity and they eventually became part of performance practice for instrumentalists as well, thus highlighting their own ability. Similar to Ganassi, Dalla Casa also believed that varying articulations was necessary on a wind instrument in order to emulate the voice. Dalla Casa wrote, “The *cornetto* is the most excellent of the wind instruments since it imitates the human voice better than the other instruments…The

---

tonguing should be neither too dead nor too strongly articulated but should be similar to the *gorgia*.\(^{28}\) The *gorgia* is an articulation in vocal pedagogy that is produced in the throat and dalla Casa’s reference to *gorgia* indicates how closely instrumental practice was linked with vocal pedagogy in the Renaissance period.\(^{29}\) While his statements on articulations were almost verbatim restatements of Ganassi’s *Opera Intitulata Fontegara*, his small paragraph on articulation demonstrates another strong correlation between the desire for wind and brass instruments to emulate the voice.

As previously discussed, Ganassi’s concept of varying the articulations while playing was to approximate an emotional performance similar to that of a vocalist. As a result, a long musical phrase would be broken up into notes of greater and lesser emphasis. This method of unequal tonguing or utilizing various articulations is similar to the French Baroque performance practice known as *notes inégales*, which gained popularity throughout Europe in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. This is of central concern because this practice can be linked to the expression of emotion in song. Patricia Ranum, a French Baroque scholar, reports in *The Harmonic Orator*, published in 2001, that singers were encouraged to ‘dot’ rhythms on evenly written notes in order to suit the emotion being expressed and its intensity.\(^{30}\) Ranum goes further by adding,

---


A singer is a harmonic orator, and his mission is indistinguishable from that of orators who speak rather than sing. All orators strive to please and persuade listeners, and therefore to stir emotions by the expressive accents of their voices… Instrumentalists too must be harmonic orators, for instrumental music observes the same poetic and rhetorical rules as vocal music. Instrumental music may be wordless; but it is not speechless. (Ranum, 1997, 26)

This raises the possibility that varying articulations for emotional purposes had gained a substantial following. Moreover, applying this technique to the trumpet, as Cesare Bendinelli did in *Tutta L'arte della Trombetta*, reveals a widening of interest in vocal emulation.

The earliest treatise specifically written for trumpet, *Tutta L'arte della Trombetta* (*The Entire Art of Trumpet Playing*) written by the chief court trumpeter in Munich, Cesare Bendinelli, reveals a commonality between wind and brass instruments because of their shared technique of articulating notes. Published in 1614, this method is derived from a collection of music that Bendinelli had written down from his lessons, including the first musical examples of *clarino* playing (fourth register of the overtone series), which was a style of playing that developed in the sixteenth century.  

The development of *clarino* playing is a key moment in the history of the trumpet. Early in the Baroque period, the trumpet was limited to the *principale* (low) register and it was not possible to play diatonically in this register. Because the majority of music for the military or courts preceded the development of the *clarino* register, lower tessitura

---

fanfares highlighted and emphasized chordal structure. However, eventual experimentation with the upper partials of the overtone series led to a new manner of playing, which would become known as the clarino style. The development of the clarino register forever changed trumpet music because it allowed composers to utilize the trumpet for diatonic and therefore more melodically interesting and expressive lines. Because the trumpet could now perform melodies that were similar to vocal melodies, including those that were written for or in imitation of voices, composers exploited the instrument, allowing for its eventual acceptance into the realm of art music. Furthermore, with a full range of notes now available, the trumpet could realistically be expected to convey the range of expressivity valued in the performance of other instruments, which, as we have seen, were often evaluated in comparison with the human voice.

**The Rise of Bel Canto Singing**

The term bel canto (beautiful singing) generally refers to a vocal style or the virtuosic singing of solo songs that originated in Italy but gained popularity throughout most of Europe during the seventeenth century. Numerous bel canto resources maintain that teachers made a variety of changes to vocal style, aesthetics, and performance practices during this period. Vocal teachers and performers developed more of a scientific approach in their teaching that stressed the importance of an impeccable legato throughout the singer's range; the use of a light tone in the higher registers; an agile, flexible technique capable of dispatching ornate embellishments; the ability to execute fast accurate divisions; the avoidance of an ‘airy’ or aspirate sound and

---

avoidance of a wide vibrato. In addition to demonstrating these qualities, vocalists were encouraged to convey genuine emotion by focusing on clear diction of the text and using a variety of timbres to make their sound unique. For example, vocal historian Edward Forman notes that, one of the objectives in bel canto singing was to “seduce the ear of the listener by performing with a flawless vocal emission as a starting point.” Voice teachers believed that an impeccable vocal tone would lead to expression and virtuosity and when combined with the imagination would create an emotional climate. This shows that there was strong relationship between tone and emotion during the Bel Canto era, which bolstered the supremacy of vocalists as the ideal musical performers because of their ability to communicate emotion through a beautiful tone, agility, and virtuosity.

The beginning of the Bel Canto era can be traced back to the Florentine Camerata, a group of influential poets, scholars, and musicians that met periodically in Florence from 1577-1582. One of their projects was to revive Greek dramas with music, believing that ancient dramas were perfect in their synergy between text and music. The Camerata was powerful enough to encourage a type of monodic style that allowed words to dominate the music and where the music would have to be composed according to the following guidelines,

First, the text was to be sung with the simplest accompaniment,

---
33 (Duey, 1980), (Franca, 1959), (Marek, 2007), (Ware, 1998), (Whitlock, 1968).
34 Ibid.
35 Edward Foreman, Authentic Singing, 197.
36 Rodolfo Celletti, A History of Bel Canto
Translated by Frederick Fuller. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 11.
such as a lute or, preferably, a lyre, played by the singer himself. The words were to be clearly understood, therefore there was to be no polyphonic writing. Second, songs were to follow natural speech rhythms, avoiding dance-like meters of popular songs or textural repetitions and free of the contrapuntal restrictions found in madrigal and motet writing. Third, the music was to reflect the true emotions and accents felt by the protagonist, not mere abstract detail. (Marek, 2007, 9)

The Florentine Camerata believed that when natural speech rhythms were paired with a simple accompaniment the music could elicit emotional responses in the listener. To address emotional issues, they devised a detailed treatise that discussed philosophies regarding evoking emotions through music from a compositional and performance perspective.

Like the directives for recitative developed by the members of the Florentine Camerata, the Doctrine of the Affections was a well-known theory in musical aesthetics that placed a certain expectation on compositions whereby emotions, such as joy, anger, love, hate and fear would be elicited through the music.37 This philosophical theory had a profound influence on how music was composed because composers tried to persuade listeners toward a specific emotional response. From a performance perspective, although ornamentation of the melody line gained importance in the Renaissance era, it was generally used for decoration. However, during the Baroque era vocalists embellished the melody line with more complexity than ever before. Composers allowed vocalists to have more autonomy with the music as long as the ornamentation best served the overriding ideal of this era which was, “Pure musical beauty of melody and the

singing voice as long as it was done tastefully and could express the emotion of the text.”

*Bel canto* is important in the development of singing in Western art music, and it has also been the primary reference for instrumentalists seeking to embrace vocal aesthetics. Indeed, trumpet pedagogues have borrowed this term to encourage a singing approach to the trumpet for many years. In 1922 Giulio Silva explained why *bel canto* characteristics set precedents that continue to be at the forefront of vocal and instrumental pedagogy to this day. Silva wrote,

> The quest of beauty and purity of vocal tone in its highest degree, a conception which, during the course of the sixteenth century, was asserting itself in practice, took on a definitive form in the seventeenth, and finally attained to full and complete development in the eighteenth century and the first decades of the nineteenth. And the like principle was, of necessity, destined to spread throughout all branches of instrumental technique. So we arrive at the conclusion, that the qualities inherent in musical beauty of tone form the prime, indispensable condition for an artistic production. From this axiom (as we venture to term it) were derived all those consequences of the didactic and practical tendencies which characterize the methods of singing and instruction in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, besides all the methods, even the modern ones, of instrumental teaching. (Silva, 1922, 60)

The *Bel Canto* era inspired instrumentalists to achieve new levels of excellence because the extreme vocal elements prevalent in Italian opera would have resonated with many instrumental composers. For example, Johann Quantz notes in his treatise, *On Playing the Flute*, originally published in 1752, that instrumentalists emulated the voice by

---

performing complex ornamentation similar to that of a vocalists.\(^{39}\) He also suggested that because vocal music started to reach the highest pinnacle in the *Bel Canto* era, many composers sought to emulate the *bel canto* style by incorporating virtuosic equivalents or vocal imitations directly to instrumental music.\(^{40}\)

Despite the many advances in instrumental composition during the Baroque era, instrumental music remained subservient to the prevailing *expressive* ideal that was believed to be best served by vocal music since solo singing was able to convey emotion so directly and efficiently. Vocalists were taught to guide phrases with meaningful and elegant expressions of emotion that would precisely communicate the meaning of the text. Perhaps attempting to create emotional phrases was the foundational reasoning for why instrumentalists were encouraged to emulate the voice. Nevertheless, vocal tone and its relationship with musical expressions of emotion seem to have been rarely addressed in concrete ways in early treatises.

**Early Discussions of Tone**

In examining ideas about tone during the *Bel Canto* era, one would be remiss not to discuss the importance of the *castrati*, who were revered for their resonant tone quality and exceptional sonic flexibility. Castration at a young age prevented some effects of puberty, particularly voice change, from occurring, allowing the singer to physically mature into a man while still retaining the voice of a young boy. This medical procedure, along with extensive musical training enabled many *castrati* to become accomplished singers.


\(^{40}\) Ibid.
Because of the tonal qualities they possessed, composers favoured the *castrati* for singing the high soprano parts in operas, leading to their dominance in all forms of vocal music throughout the 1700’s. In *Singing: the First Art* (2007), vocal scholar Dan Marek suggests,

> The most important point was that the castrato voice retained the quality of a boy’s voice, but because it was driven by the strength of grown man, it was much more powerful and penetrating. Also the small larynx, large chest capacity, and attention to attacks accounted for the fantastic length of the musical phrases that these superb artists were able to perform. (Marek 2007, 12)

Their large chest cavity and lung capacity permitted the *castrati* to have incredible breath control that enabled them to dazzle audiences with their flexibility and range (up to three octaves). Because the public increasingly loved the vocal spectacle, composers soon began writing music to specifically display the virtuosity of the *castrati*. This florid style of singing was intended to show off the singers’ abilities.

The *castrati* developed an unprecedented level of skill that set new standards for the expectations of vocal sound including range and tone. While the *castrati* continually raised the level of singing and inspired new methods and improvements of training and technique for most voice types, the influence of the *castrati* is also far reaching in the history of instrumental performance practice. For example, Rodolfo Celletti, an Italian musicologist and *bel canto* historian, suggests that in the spirit of competition, both the *castrati* and instrumentalists took turns goading each other on to higher levels, thereby

---

41 Marek, *Singing: The First Art* 11. One of the reasons Castrati dominated the music scene was because of the *Pauline Dictum*, which was an ecclesiatical law that forbade women to sing in church.

advancing the expectations of instrumental performance. Celletti also maintains that instrumentalists abandoned the “elementary procedure of sustaining a note” in favour of improvisation and contrapuntal imitation of the voice. The unprecedented skill of the castrati also fostered the development of instrumental compositional practices when composers “interweaved vocal trills” with other instruments to “create an exquisite interplay of timbres.”

It is often difficult, and perhaps not even desirable, to avoid subjective evaluations when discussing tone because describing any sound can be difficult. However, attempts to provide a useful definition for a clear concept of tone quality were eventually made. For example, Giambattista Mancini (1714-1800) a castrato singer, teacher, and author borrowed the term chiaroscuro from the visual arts medium, meaning bright-dark tone. Mancini used the term in 1774 in his book Pensieri e Riflessioni Pratiche Sopra il Canto Figurato (Practical Reflections of Figured-Singing). He advocated that practicing scales slowly would aid singers in developing the chiaroscuro timbre that he believed was needed for every style of singing. Giovanni Battista Lamperti, another famous nineteenth century vocal pedagogue, argued further that, “Although you may acquire a wide range of voice, you cannot modulate the sounds until the resonance of your tone becomes round and rich, chiaroscuro…the ‘dark-light’ tone should be always present.”

---

43 Rodolfo Celletti, A History of Bel Canto, 5.
44 Ibid.
45 Ibid.
47 Giambattista Mancini, Practical Reflections of Figured-Singing (Champaign: Pro Musica Press, 1967), 42.
While it is useful that Lamperti’s explanation includes the word resonance we should consider that this is still not a complete definition of tone quality.

Using the framework of Mancini and Lamperti, Richard Miller, a present-day voice teacher, has elaborated on this important concept. Miller’s contemporary use of the word provides a physiological description.

The term *chiaroscuro*, which literally means the bright-dark tone, and which designates that basic timbre of the singing voice in which the laryngeal source and the resonating system appear to interact in such a way as to present a spectrum of harmonics perceived by the conditioned listener as that balanced vocal quality to be desired – the quality the singer calls resonant. (Miller, 1986, 135)

Resonance is an important contribution to the discussion because it was believed that a resonant timbre was necessary in order to create a proper tone quality. Miller argues that in contemporary vocal pedagogy *chiaroscuro* means the ideal distribution of lower and upper harmonic overtones.49

Scholars working in fields other than music have also discussed the question of resonance in relation to tone production. For example, Hermann Hemholtz, a German physicist, made a significant contribution to acoustical theory and music with his book *On the Sensations of Tone* (1863). The book combines physics and the psychological aspects of hearing in an attempt to explain the origins of musical harmony and dissonance. Hemholtz theorized that, “Tones consist of a fundamental pitch as well as upper partials, or overtones, whose frequencies are in multiples of the fundamental

---

frequency. “After years of study he came to believe that the voice could produce very rich upper partials that no orchestral instrument was able to reproduce.

Although Helmholtz’s theories were developed considerably later than the first discussion of chiaroscuro and tone, his acoustical theory and work in vocal physiology lent strength to the idea that resonance is central to good tone. In addition to these ideas about resonance and chiaroscuro, there were many other colourful adjectives to describe the ideal tone quality during the Bel Canto era. Even so, as in the present day, these verbal assessments used to describe an idealized sound quality are broached through abstract descriptions. Words ultimately fall short in trying to describe the ineffable in ways that are concrete enough for developing a consistent pedagogy and basis of evaluation. These ideas of resonance and tone put the performer between two poles; tone is considered personal, yet there seem to be particular ideals held to be universal. Consequently, the performer must mediate between a personal tone and a set of ideals held to be universal.

The Trumpet in Art Music

The new high-level of singing in the Bel Canto era facilitated the trumpet’s incorporation into the realm of art music throughout Europe. By the eighteenth century the trumpet had become a frequently featured instrument in collaboration with vocalists in arias and Cantatas such as J.S. Bach’s Cantata No. 51, Alessandro Scarlatti’s Su le Sponde del Tebro and Seven Arias con Tromba Sola. However, in order to be accepted into the genre trumpeters needed to overcome two important obstacles; the difficulty of

---

50 Stark, Bel Canto, 46.
51 Ibid.
playing impure partials of the harmonic series in tune and the challenge of playing softly. This newfound ability to play the trumpet diatonically and chromatically allowed composers to utilize the trumpet in independent and inter-related roles, often blending or providing contrast to the voice using harmony and melody. What was once an instrument that was relegated to courtly or military use now had new sound possibilities that allowed it to function as a solo instrument as well as collaborating between other instruments including the voice. New tonal concepts, which were rooted in the dominant musical aesthetics of the time, made attempts at emulating the voice more attainable than ever. This led to new expectations and conventions as to what the trumpet could sound like and created new and diverse performing contexts for the trumpet.

The treatises of Cesare Bendinelli (1614), Girolamo Fantini, *Modo Per Imparare a Sonare di Tromba* (1638) (*Method for Learning to Play the Trumpet in a Warlike Way as well as Musically*), and J.E. Altenburg *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Heroisch-Musikalischen Trompeter und Paukerkunst* (1795) (*An Essay on the Introduction to Heroic and Musical Trumpeters' and Kettledrummers' Art*) are valuable documents that provide insight into the early development of a vocal approach on the trumpet, revealing also the beginning of the trumpet's role in art music. Bendinelli’s book primarily consists of two sections; military signals and the first etudes specifically used for developing *clarino* playing. Bendinelli suggested that articulating notes on the trumpet should be approached in a way that resembled how vocalists sung text.  

While Bendinelli’s treatise was very important, perhaps the most important aspect of his career was his influence on the trumpet being accepted into art music. Bendinelli’s

---

innovative five-part trumpet ensemble arrangement of *Fit porta Christi* alternated between trumpets and choir and was the first to integrate trumpet ensemble with voice in a sacred setting.\(^53\) It was originally prepared for Christmas Day services in 1581 but was subsequently performed every Christmas until 1614 in Munich, which helped to establish the ongoing usage and development of the trumpet throughout the Baroque era.\(^54\)

Although Fantini’s text acknowledged the traditional military fanfares, his treatise explored the artistic capabilities of the instrument for the first time in pieces he called, “*In Concerto di Voci o Altro*” (*In a Concert of Voices or Other*).\(^55\) These compositions are the first known collection of solo trumpet pieces with continuo. John Wallace, a renowned trumpet performer, teacher, and author argues that the *concerto di voci* pieces found in Fantini’s book propelled the trumpet’s acceptance into art music in Italy.\(^56\)

While there are similarities between Bendinelli and Fantini’s treatises, Fantini’s demonstrated a wider breadth of knowledge. He recommended that any note longer than two beats should be “sustained in a singing fashion”.\(^57\) His concept of a singing fashion was to start a note softly, make a crescendo to the middle of the note and then make a decrescendo until the release.\(^58\) This was similar to the *messa di voce*, a vocal technique previously discussed in this chapter.

---

\(^54\) Ibid.
\(^58\) Ibid.
Johann Altenburg, author of The Trumpeters' and Kettledrummers' Art (1795), was a clarino player in the latter half of the Baroque era. While Bendinelli and Fantini’s treatises explicitly encouraged vocal emulation through varying articulations, Altenburg actually suggested that, “Some instruction in singing would be very beneficial to the trumpeter.” Altenburg wrote,

Seek to express well the singing character of the slow movements and to execute properly the ornaments which occur. Long notes must be sustained with moderation and be skilfully joined to one another. It is well known that the human voice is supposed to serve as the model for all instruments; thus should the clarino player try to imitate it as much as possible, and should seek to bring forth the so-called cantabile on his instrument. (Altenburg 1795, 96)

Altenburg’s treatise is a valuable resource for trumpeters and musicologists since it discusses the usage of the instruments both prior to and in Altenburg’s time.

These treatises by Bendinelli, Fantini, and Altenburg are indispensable from a historical perspective since they clearly illustrate the links established between how trumpet sound quality was idealized and the sound of the human voice. However, despite these important texts and the vast amount of repertoire that extended the instrument’s potential, the clarino style declined for both political and economic reasons. Eventually Classical era composers such as Stamitz, Boccherini, Haydn, and Mozart approached composition differently, diminishing the role and the function of the trumpet and effectively returning it to an arpeggiated principale style.

\[59\] Altenburg, Trumpeters’ and Kettledrummers’ Art, 115.
Art Song and the Vocalise

During the age of Grand Opera and the Romantic era (1815-1910) there were some monumental changes in vocal technique and sound ideals. Towards the end of the eighteenth century Pope Benedict XIV (1740-1758) declared castration illegal and this led to a decline in the use of castrati.\textsuperscript{60} This change in religious aesthetic also coincided with a change in public opinion that the castrati were becoming too unrealistic for opera buffa.\textsuperscript{61} This permitted women (soprano, alto) and other male voices (tenor, baritone and bass) to assume leading roles thus providing an opportunity for more vocal variety in the music. As composers broadened and diversified their compositions the new style required more lyricism and dramatic nuances as opposed to long melismatic runs.

During this era the art song became overwhelmingly popular. Operas and cantatas continued to be well received, but the art song took hold in a different setting that gave it a particular appeal. It was usually performed in a recital or parlour setting, which allowed for more intimacy than a large opera theatre. Adding to the genre’s popularity was that some critics believed that art songs were the perfect fusion between composer, poet, vocalist, and piano.\textsuperscript{62} While various forms of vocal songs with accompaniment have been performed since Medieval and Ancient times, it was composers like Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms who brought this genre to its zenith.

Another type of art song that gained popularity in this era and eventually contributed a great deal to trumpet pedagogy was the vocalise. The underlying rationale for vocalises was to improve a specific area of the voice such as phrasing, agility,

\textsuperscript{60} Stark, \textit{Bel Canto}, 197.
\textsuperscript{61} Ibid., 199.
\textsuperscript{62} Foreman, \textit{Authentic Singing}, 311.
flexibility, and to increase the range of the voice.\textsuperscript{63} Furthermore, teachers believed that having piano accompaniment would help students to sing these exercises in an artistic manner, resulting in an improved voice quality in performance.\textsuperscript{64} For that reason vocalises served as training exercises based on the art song model. The main difference between the vocalise and the art song was that the vocalise had no articulated text and was to be sung on one or more vowels with piano accompaniment.

The vocalise tradition dates back to the early eighteenth century when teachers published singing treatises that included numerous textless vocal exercises with piano accompaniment.\textsuperscript{65} Some of the earliest vocalises can be traced back to the Pier Francesco Tosi’s treatise, \textit{Opinioni de’ Cantori Antichi, e Moderni o Sieno Osservazioni Sopra il Canto Figurato} (1723) (Observations on the Florid Song). Tosi’s vocal instruction put an emphasis on solfege and vocalises because it helped students develop reading skills, flexibility, agility, and quality of tone.\textsuperscript{66} In 1822 Manuel Garcia, a prominent opera singer and teacher, published \textit{Exercises Pour La Voix} (Exercises for the Voice), which provided exercises for developing the \textit{messa di voce}, cresendi, diminuendi, and agility.\textsuperscript{67} Vocal historian and author Brent Monahan states that by the end of the

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{64} (Corri, 1810; Garcia, 1824; Myer, 1897)
\item \textsuperscript{66} Berton Coffin, \textit{Historical Vocal Pedagogy Classics} (Metuchen: The Scarecrow Press, Inc.1989), 101.
\item \textsuperscript{67} Ibid., 105.
\end{itemize}
19th century there were more than one hundred vocal treatises containing vocalise exercises.⁶⁸

**Forms of Vocal Pedagogy and Music in the Nineteenth Century**

As Romantic Opera evolved, vocal music and pedagogy underwent significant changes. Prior to the early 1800’s vocal melody floated over light orchestral accompaniment and emotional expression was felt to be achieved with the voice through ornamentation and florid runs. Wagnerian operas used larger orchestras that often featured thick and heavy orchestrations, placing new demands on vocalists. To combat these new challenges singers began to force and exert pressure within their body and on their sound.⁶⁹ This singing technique was known as Sprechgesang and not only did it push the voice to extremes in range and volume but it featured melodramatic phrasing often interrupted by breaks in place of long flowing melodic lines.⁷⁰ Although Sprechgesang solved some of the projection and endurance issues related to singing with a large orchestra, it was met with much criticism because numerous vocalists lost or ruined their voices.⁷¹

To combat the challenges of projection and endurance vocal pedagogy shifted to a more scientific approach. Between 1840 and 1847 Manuel Garcia II, son and vocal

---

⁶⁸ Foreman, *Authentic Singing*, 211.
⁶⁹ Foreman, 265. The great Grand Opera tenor Giovanni Rubini had built up so much pressure in his chest while trying to sing a high Bb that he broke his clavicle on stage in a performance. Foreman notes that vocal emission changed dramatically during this time period and that tenors could only reach high notes by shrieking.
⁷¹ Ibid., 40.
⁷² Physiology of Singing (1840); *Abstract of Elocution and Music In Accordance with the Principles of Physiology* (1842); *The Physiology of the Human Voice* (1845)
student of Manuel Garcia I, received recognition for writing several significant detailed textbooks on the physiology of the voice. His concepts were based primarily on the physical structure and function of the voice, along with various theories of breath, enunciation, and resonance controls. Garcia II is credited with inventing the laryngoscope in 1855, which was a small angled mirror that allowed him to see the larynx, lending further support to his theories.\(^7\) The laryngoscope allowed practitioners to view the larynx and other parts of the vocal instrument for the first time. This eventually led to theories of how vocal function and musculature play an integral role in vocal pedagogy. This became the dominant focus of vocal instruction by the mid nineteenth century.

Present day writings lead us to believe that the bel canto style of singing was considered a natural approach to sound production and that vocalists studied the natural qualities of song.\(^7\) Yet the evolution of vocal practices in the nineteenth century pulled students away from the natural approach of bel canto and into a technique that was based on visual analysis. This implies that the bel canto teachings may have been accepted as the pinnacle of vocal pedagogy because when vocalists did not adhere to the bel canto ideals or principles they lost or ruined their voices. As mentioned earlier, the bel canto teachers stressed that technique and articulation were secondary to an impeccable tone throughout the singer's range. Undoubtedly, trumpeters striving to emulate the voice should be guided by similar principles.

\(^7\) Scholars who claim that singing was approached naturally during the bel canto era, Edward Herbert-Caesari, 1936; Phillip Duey, 1951; Edward Foreman, 2001.
Final Thoughts

The purpose of this chapter was to determine what it has meant to be voice-like at various key junctures in Western Music history. Considering the time span that exists between the Middle Ages and the twentieth century, one would expect that the art of singing, vocal pedagogy, and a voice-like ideal to undergo many changes, and indeed it has. This is especially true when one considers that Italy, Germany, and France have contributed significantly to vocal genres while maintaining diverse stylistic identities and vocal techniques.

When Constantine declared Christianity as the official religion of the Roman Empire around 325 A.D, we not only begin to see the origins of Western music but we also begin to understand the subjective nature of labeling a voice-ideal. Although many early scholars tried to define a ‘good’ voice, it was not until the bel canto era that treatises and vocal teachers started to agree on what qualities embodied a ‘good’ voice.74 Bel canto students underwent a methodical and empirical training period where teachers heavily valued exercises that were designed to increase agility and flexibility that helped to develop florid embellishments. But as vocal pedagogy evolved these types of exercises were replaced by theories of musculature and vocal function.75

Keith Johnson, Regents Professor of Trumpet at the University of North Texas writes, “Good vocalists possess a natural and seemingly effortless quality. To understand this quality is to comprehend the relationship between ‘singing’ and instrumental

---

74 Foreman, *Authentic Singing*, 101. For example, vocalists were to demonstrate at all times a beautiful tone that was based on a flowing line, whereby they could express the correct emotion as defined by the composer.
75 Ibid., 141.
Singing is a personal form of communication that conveys diverse forms of emotion and even without text vocalists can transform a melodic line into emotional content. Therefore, the emotive power is not only in the text but also in the emotion produced by the human voice and the emotion that is perceived by a listener.

Because instrumental music developed as accompaniment or as an extension of vocal melodies, a vocal approach has been embraced by many instrumental performers and pedagogues based on their belief that it allows the musician to focus on what is intrinsic. Historically, this has been facilitated by striving to imitate the voice. For trumpeters, this means the creation of a series of sustained and connected tones with no verbal significance that allows the audience to draw emotional meaning from the music. This concept underpins much of what instrumental music itself tries to accomplish, a notion I will explore further in the following chapter.

---

Music’s relationship with emotion has long been a topic of debate among scholars interested in philosophy, musicians, and the listening public. Thus the issue has been approached from a range of perspectives. This chapter investigates some key ideas about music and emotion from the perspective of the performer. This pursuit is rooted in a widely held belief that the human voice is especially effective at articulating musical meaning and especially the communication of various emotions. My goal is to connect theories of emotion with the ongoing valorization of a vocal approach to trumpet performance that I explored in the previous chapter.

Before delving into these theories of musical emotion, however, it would be beneficial to more clearly define what I mean by the term emotion. A broad definition of emotion offered by psychologists in the area of the affective sciences is,

> Emotions are relatively, brief, intense, and rapidly changing responses to potentially important events (subjective challenges or opportunities) in the external or internal environment, usually of a social nature, which involve a number of subcomponents (cognitive changes, subjective feelings, expressive behaviour, and action tendencies) that are more or less synchronized. (Davidson, Scherer, & Goldsmith, 2003, xiii)

Building on this definition I embrace the idea that musical emotion might be productively defined as short-term feelings that are inspired by musical sounds perceived by a listener.

As suggested by the vast literature on the topic, the relationship between music and emotion can be contentious. Scholars such as Leonard Meyer, Patrik Juslin, and John
Sloboda claim that an important part of music’s meaning and value is its capacity to express, communicate, represent, or symbolize a certain aspect of emotion. Conversely, some scholars and composers such as Eduard Hanslick and Igor Stravinsky were strongly invested in formalism, the idea that the meaning of music is found within the composition and is determined by form. For example, Eduard Hanslick’s *On the Beautiful in Music* (1854) insists that if there is beauty found in music, it has nothing to do with extra musical associations, but the musical form itself. Several generations later Igor Stravinsky developed this notion further by writing,

> I consider that music is, by its very nature, essentially powerless to express anything at all, whether a feeling, an attitude of mind, or psychological mood, a phenomenon of nature, etc…Expression has never been an inherent property of music. (Stravinsky, 1935, 163.)

Yet when listening to Stravinsky’s compositions listeners may perceive strongly expressive music so it seems that Stravinsky was contradicting himself. Or perhaps in keeping with the tenets of modernism with which he was a key player, he simply did not want his music to be over-romanticized.

Rather than embrace formalism, I follow scholars such as Meyer, Juslin, Sloboda and the like in my belief that music is *and should be* a powerful means of communicating emotion. It is notable, however, that in these scholars’ studies and numerous others that address issues of music and emotion, the issue is considered primarily from the audience member’s or composer’s perspective. This is the case in one of the most often cited

books on the topic; *Emotion and Meaning in Music* written by Leonard Meyer in 1956. Meyer deals with the problems of musical meaning and the manner of musical communication with a focus primarily on listeners — that is, those who listen to others performing music. As important as considering listener perception may be for taking sound seriously and for de-privileging the composer as the sole arbiter of meaning, the role of the performer in processes of the communication of emotion remains under theorized or even denied in Meyer’s work, and in many contexts of Western music performance.

Ironically, the tendency to overlook or deny what performers contribute to the expression of musical emotion is very much the norm in the case of orchestras. For example, Tom Stevens, former Principal Trumpet with the Los Angeles Philharmonic states, “The musician is only a tool, and conductors don’t even have the decency to hide it…Conductors enjoy such authority that they can strongly influence the musical environment of a city or a region.”\(^7\) During my own tenure as Co-Principal Trumpet in the Monterrey Symphony Orchestra the musicians were certainly taken for granted and seen as pawns at the service of the conductor, especially when considering questions of emotion.

While focusing on the performer’s perspective in considering the relationship between music and emotion is a key aspect to my project, many challenges remain. Even if we accept that music does or can evoke feeling, the fact remains that instrumentalists work without text, which is, as I have suggested, a highly effective means of communicating emotion. Still further complications arise in the case of so-called

absolute music, which is not only textless but also conceived of as divorced from any kind of narrative in a manner resonant with Stravinsky’s ideals. Thus instrumentalists performing this music do not have much in the way of concrete references from the composer (words, stories, images, etc.) to use as a basis for evoking emotional responses or expressing specific sentiments. It follows, then, that any emotional content that might be perceived is indirectly and abstractly representational and evocative rather than concretely communicated and directly conveyed. Without words as a key means of expression let alone communication, trumpeters must manipulate different aspects of sound such as dynamics, melody, articulations, and timbre in order to represent and/or evoke musical emotion if we are to have any hope of expressing it musically as (or nearly as) effectively as a voice singing a text that has semantic meanings.

Yet this challenge even befalls vocalists in certain situations. In vocalises, like instrumental music, semantic meaning is also unclear. Yet even in the absence of text, the voice’s capacity to create various tones, intonation, line contour, pace, volume, and timbres is highly effective for communicating, representing, and connecting to emotional meanings. As discussed in Chapter One, not only were vocalises originally designed to help voice students develop flexibility and quality of tone, but singing melodies on an open or pure vowel, such as ‘A’ or ‘E’ was intended to develop emotional expression without the use of text. Paul Barker, author of Composing for Voice (2004) states, “The singer is concerned with line, for which the vowel represents a continuous, uninterrupted

79 A few of the scholars who advocate this view, Kivy (1990); North & Hargreaves (1997); Juslin & Sloboda, (2001); Gabrielsson (2002); Scherer (2004).
stream of air…The vowel remains the core of emotional communication.” Barker is affirming that the vowel has the potential to evoke emotion and that doing this is the ultimate goal for a vocalist. Barker’s statement with respect to singing thus resonates with my assertions from the introduction; that the voice-like performance ideal on the trumpet is rooted in the goal of conveying emotion. Moreover, the voice’s capacity for communication, even without text, lies at the heart of why voice emulation has traditionally been central to instrumental performance.

Like the singer of vocalises, an instrumentalist must bring music to life without the benefit of text. In Western Art music performers rely on a score but they must translate what the composer has written into sound. While it is desirable to play the correct rhythms, articulations, dynamics, and pitches (i.e., technique), that is only one part of the work involved when trying to create a sonic rendering that is more than perfunctory and is, instead, expressive. Expressive performances, those which many would call “musical”, are contingent on producing in sound something that goes well beyond just playing the notes specified on a page. Many of us have probably attended a lesson or masterclass and have heard the teacher say “You played the notes, but where is the music?” or “Great technique, but no feeling”. One way to move beyond the mechanical reproduction of notes on a page is to endeavor to express emotion and thus evoke it in the listener through the sound created, as notation is realized in performance.

Early Treatises

To begin addressing how a vocal approach towards trumpet playing might be an

---

effective means of emotional expression and communication, it is important to understand theories of how the human voice does so. One of the first philosophers to address the idea of text, emotion, and music was Gioseffo Zarlino. Zarlino was an Italian composer and music theorist whose contribution of Le Istitutioni Harmoniche (The Art of Counterpoint), published in 1558, became one of the most influential music theory treatises during the Renaissance. Zarlino believed that the music of antiquity had the power to move the emotions but that music during the Renaissance had progressively become cluttered and languid as a result of too many musicians performing without taste. He argued that polyphonic music did not allow the text to be fully understood and therefore the emotional meaning was being obscured. The Fourth part of his treatise states,

> It now remains to be determined how one ought to combine the harmonies with the words placed beneath them. I say ‘to combine the harmonies with the words’ for this reason: although...we have said in Part Two that melody is a combination of speech, harmony and rhythm, and although it seems that in such a combination no one of these things is more important that any other, Plato suggested that speech should have priority, and that the other two elements should be subservient to it… For if a poet is not permitted to write a comedy in tragic verse, a composer will also not be permitted to make an unsuitable combination of these two elements, namely harmony and words. Thus it will not be fitting if in a joyful manner he uses a mournful harmony and a heavy rhythm, nor where funeral and tearful matters are treated is he permitted to use a joyful harmony and a rhythm that is light or rapid, call it as we will. On the contrary he must use joyful harmonies and rapid rhythms in joyful matter, and in mournful ones mournful harmonies and heavy rhythms, so that

---

81 Gioseffo Zarlino, The Art of Counterpoint
everything may be done in an appropriate manner.
(Zarlino, 1558, quoted in Fubini, 1990, 126)

Zarlino was offering instructions for composers when he indicated that melodies and harmonies were supposed to match the words and subsequent emotional responses. His ideas had a lasting influence over two important groups, the Council of Trent and the *Florentine Camerata.*

The Council of Trent was an ecumenical body of the Roman Catholic Church that convened twenty-five times over a twenty-year period during the sixteenth century. The Council produced decrees and canons that eventually supported what is known as the Counter-Reformation. One concern of the religious leaders who made up the Council of Trent was the belief that sacred text was becoming incomprehensible and obscured due to the increased polyphony of the compositions to which it was set. Consequently, they encouraged composers to make liturgical music subservient to the text. This is exactly what Zarlino had advocated four years earlier. In an effort to make the words more intelligible the Council decreed in 1562,

> The whole plan of singing in musical modes should be constituted not to give empty pleasure to the ear, but in such a way that the words may be clearly understood by all, and thus the hearts of the listeners be drawn to the desire of heavenly harmonies, in the contemplation of the joys of the blessed.
> (Gustave Reese 1959, 449)

---

Even though composers in the thirteenth century were beginning to favour polyphony over monody, by the sixteenth century philosophers rejected polyphony because text was incomprehensible when presented in multiple musical lines. The Council believed that if the text could be clearly understood this would create a stronger emotional relationship between the congregation and God. 84 This supported the prevailing ideal held over from the Middle Ages that emotions in music were positive as long as the music glorified the almighty Heavenly Father. Peter Kivy, a Professor of Philosophy at Rutgers University, who has also written extensively about philosophical problems with emotion in music, believes that the mandate set forth by the Council of Trent actually transformed singing into a representational art form. 85 In other words, vocal music began to represent emotional speech and even though these trends were concerned with words as the conveyors of emotion, the result was that music became more emotionally expressive, and this would later influence instrumental performance. Eventually the Counter-Reformation changed how sacred music was used in the Roman Catholic Church, but troubadours had been combining music with poetry on a wide range of emotional secular subjects as early as 1100. 86

**Baroque Treatises**

During the Baroque Era the classification of human emotions was an important

---

85 Ibid., 48.
issue that was addressed by Florentine scholars in the *Doctrine of the Affections*. This treatise was an attempt to categorize and establish an ordered system for the representation of emotions in music. For example, philosophers and theorists suggested that minor modes and small intervals depicted sad and dark emotions while major modes, large intervals, and diatonic harmonies represented happiness.\(^8\) The *Doctrine of the Affections* was based on principles of oratory and rhetoric and was widely embraced by the *Florentine Camerata*. After studying and debating the music of ancient Greece, the *Camerata* indicated that ancient music consisted of a single vocal melody, which, when juxtaposed with rhythms and inflections found in speech, was capable of communicating an actual emotion. This prompted *Florentine Camerata* member Vincenzo Galilei (1520-1591) to write, “True music [vocal music] was to be sought in the art of orators and actors and that singing should imitate the characteristics of emotional speech.”\(^8\) The *Camerata* started to encourage composers and vocalists to study how great speakers used the principles of rhetoric to convey their messages and this was significant because rhetoric was now being used in music for communication of a narrative or of an emotion.

One concern with the philosophical theories found in the *Doctrine of the Affections* is that specific rules regarding expressing emotion and compositional practices were developed by philosophers and theorists and not musical performers. This means that their theorizing about music and emotion remained focused on composition and paid little attention to performance. Furthermore, emotional singing was governed more by rhetoric than by musical principles. As a result, even the Baroque composer, like the

---

instrumentalist, was largely excluded from conceptualizations of an emotional aesthetic in vocal music. Nevertheless, the *Doctrine of the Affections* offers some insight into how emotion might be created musically. As such, these strategies promise to be of some use for understanding the relationship between a voice-like sound on trumpet, the expression of emotion on the instrument, and the means to achieve these objectives.

René Descartes wrote a comprehensive study about the *Doctrine of the Affections* entitled *Les Passions de l’Ame (On the Passions of the Soul)*, published in 1649. Descartes believed that human beings possessed “animal spirits” and they were contained throughout our bodies in the central nervous system. He speculated that these spirits were aroused when people faced specific challenges or certain situations. This would create emotions and activate our sense modality, ultimately encouraging our body to react in a certain way. An example of sense modality is finding oneself in a situation in which one’s life is threatened. In this instance an emotional response is perceived because the body and the soul are threatened through a physical stimulus. According to Descartes, such an experience arouses both the body and the soul, triggering an emotional response that is followed by the necessary steps towards the appropriate defense behavior.

The idea of being able to stimulate the animal spirits without a physical stimulus was an important concept because composers attempted to write music that could mimic the motions of the animal spirits, thus creating a cognitive stimulus. Descartes agreed with earlier scholars that instrumental music could replicate speech-related emotions but he also advocated that instrumental music could and should do more than just imitate

---

90 Ibid.
rhetoric. He theorized that if compositional practices could imitate the six passions: wonder, joy, hate, love, desire, and sadness, this would allow composers to potentially explore and exploit the capabilities of instruments, especially those that were capable of carrying a melody, a capacity they shared with the voice. As a result, instruments that could be played rapidly, with dynamics, and in the upper registers lent themselves well to Descartes’ concepts.

The Italian composer Girolamo Frescobaldi (1583-1643) appears to be one of the first composers and performers who directed his attention to emotional expression in instrumental music. Frescobaldi argued that instrumental music was akin to vocal music in conveying emotion by applying rhetorical techniques such as dynamics and repetition. But he furthered the idea by claiming that the use of rubato was equally important when attempting to convey emotion. By utilizing these concepts, instrumentalists could now compensate for the lack of text by using their creative instincts to express emotion through personal interpretation of the music. Thus, expressing emotion in instrumental music was becoming an established practice and instrumental music started to be seen as expressive, symbolic or representational of emotions.

One criticism that can be made about the Baroque era thinking about music is the emotions were somewhat manufactured. It was standard compositional practice that only one affect was to be implied by the music, therefore multiple performances of a piece or an aria would always be trying to create that one specific emotion. This may have had more to do with how emotions were theorized in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

92 Ibid.
as opposed to compositional practice. Nicholas Cook, a British musicologist writes, “The eighteenth century view of emotion was a rationalized attitude of the mind, but there was a fundamental shift by the nineteenth century, emotions came to be understood as personal and spontaneous expression or experience.”

With this broader shift, vocal and instrumental music began to be viewed by composers, performers, and scholars as being able to express more than one emotion.

**Early Aesthetics of Instrumental Music and Emotional Expression**

Before investigating some of the theories of aesthetics concerning instrumental music and emotional expression it is important to define the characteristics of an aesthetic experience. In *Foundations of Music Education* (1984), Abeles, Hoffer, and Klotman reported that there are six characteristics that are significant in creating an aesthetic experience. They state,

First, an aesthetic experience has no practical or utilitarian purpose. Instead, it is valued for the insight, satisfaction, and enjoyment that it provides.
Second, an aesthetic experience involves feelings. There is a reaction to what is seen and heard.
Third, an aesthetic experience involves the intellect. Thought and awareness are necessary, and a person is quite conscious of the object being looked at or listened to.
Fourth, an aesthetic experience involves a focus of attention. To gain an aesthetic satisfaction from looking at a painting, you must center attention on the painting; you must contemplate it – consider it thoughtfully.
Fifth, an aesthetic experience must be experienced. It is almost worthless to have someone describe a song or painting to you.
Sixth, the result of aesthetic experiences is a richer

---

more meaningful life.
(Abeles, Hoffer, and Klotman, 63, 1984)

Aesthetics is not a synonym for emotion so examining the characteristics of an aesthetic experience will help to make connections to theories between aesthetics and emotions more explicit.

Throughout the seventeenth and into the eighteenth centuries, there was no shortage of treatises discussing emotional expression and vocal music. There were a number of intellectuals positing many ideas about instrumental music aesthetics; the only problem was that their arguments were likely dependant on oratory skills and vocal music models. For example, during the Age of Enlightenment (1650-1790), vocal music was the prevailing paradigm because text helped give musical compositions more concrete meaning. Even in the realm of vocal music, however, there were numerous ideas about the expression of emotions and thus, various competing theories of emotion in music. Many of the opinions had to do with whether or not music should be subordinate to text. For example, theorists such as Francesco Algarotti and Estaeban de Arteaga argued that text should dominate over the music, while others, including Jean-Jacques Rousseau and Giuseppe Tartini, believed that text and music should have equal importance. Debates also raged about the place of instrumental music and the reliance on poetry and vocal music. This became problematic as instrumental melodies became more complex making them increasingly difficult to relate to the impassioned voice. Consequently, these

---

95 Edward Lippman, *A History of Western Musical Aesthetics* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1992), 83-107. During the 17th and 18th centuries scholars such as, James Beattie (1776); Daniel Webb (1769); James Harris (1744); François-Jean de Chastellux (1754) claimed that expression in instrumental music is limited by imitation of the voice and based on poetry.

differing beliefs created a divide between vocal and instrumental music that ultimately led to further developments of instrumental music as a practice unto itself. \(^97\)

The word aesthetic is derived from *aisthesis*, which meant sense perception in the classic Greek language. Originally the meaning represented material things that stimulated the five senses. \(^98\) However, Alexander Baumgarten (1714-1762), a German philosopher, created a new meaning for the word that emphasized “subjective sense activity” with a focus on “human creativity of art.”\(^99\) Baumgarten defined a broader meaning of taste in which aesthetics was understood to mean subjective sense activity, thus creating a link between good and bad taste in reference to art.

In his *Critique of Judgment* published in 1790, Immanuel Kant created a formalist aesthetic theory that had broader implications than Baumgarten’s because it defined aesthetics as the philosophical theory of beauty. Musicologist Peter Kivy sums up Kant’s ideas in relation to the fine arts by writing, “They [fine arts] possess beauty of form; and they possess representational deep content: the power to excite a chain of ineffable ideas, the aesthetic ideas capable of engaging the free play of the cognitive faculties.”\(^100\) Kant’s idea, then, places value on form. However, within form, he notes that we can find “deep content” that represents something that is not easily described. Kant further acknowledges that there is a “free play of cognitive faculties,” which I interpret as a reference to cognitive processes of trying to understand abstract musical expressions.

\(^{98}\) Raymond Williams, *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1976), 27.
\(^{99}\) Ibid.
want to further suggest that emotions can be included in these abstract musical expressions. Kant believed that melody and harmony were mathematical; yet he also believed that music was the language of the affections and he derived this from the tonal inflections of speech.\textsuperscript{101} This implies that his aesthetic ideas had to be influenced by the *Doctrine of the Affections*, which emphasized voice and text.

Kant’s formalist perspective viewed expression of emotion in instrumental music as part of the music’s form as opposed to something that could happen through performance. Therefore, if there was any emotional pleasure to be experienced through instrumental music it would be derived from formal characteristics. Moreover, Kant felt that instrumental music only promoted a “bodily relaxation” instead of creating “harmonious free play of the imagination and understanding.”\textsuperscript{102} Valuing the mind over the body, Kant ultimately concluded that instrumental music was an intellectual pursuit and somewhat trivial when compared to music set to a text. This suggests that Kant never moved away from the primacy he gave to the expression possible in texted music.

While Kant influenced philosophical inquiry for future generations, Edward Lippman, former Professor of Music at Columbia University, felt that Kant’s philosophy was eventually viewed as inadequate because the beauty of instrumental music was deepened by emotional elements and not by intellect.\textsuperscript{103} Based on my experience as a teacher and a performer, intellect does play an essential role in pre-performance preparation such as practicing to develop the skills to perform the piece, but in

\textsuperscript{101} Lippman, *A History of Western Musical Aesthetics*, 292.
\textsuperscript{102} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{103} Ibid., 133.
performance the performer needs to move past intellect because when the mind is focused on thinking about the mechanics of making music it is difficult to be immersed in communicating the music to others.

The Age of Enlightenment witnessed a continued rise of philosophical ideas and their application to instrumental music. By the eighteenth century vocal music as a basis for instrumental music had fallen out of favour. Thus, we begin to see musicians and scholars validating the abstractness and the interpretation of meaning and expression in instrumental music by challenging the performer to create emotion without the use of text. For example, Francesco Manfredini an Italian composer and violinist believed that emotion could be felt in instrumental music as well as vocal music. Manfredini wrote,

> The pleasure that derives from vocal music may derive, if not entirely, then at least partially from the words; however, when the music that touches the soul of the listener is purely instrumental, we have to admit that the entire merit is due to music alone. (Manfredini trans. by Howard, 2002, 51)

This is useful because he argues that instrumental music has the capability to evoke emotions even without text.

Composer and theorist Jean-Phillipe Rameau made an equally important contribution to musical aesthetics during the Enlightenment. In *Observations sur notre Instinct pour la Musique (Observations on our Instinct for Music)*, originally published in 1754, he wrote,

> Often we think we hear in music only what exists in the words, or in the interpretation we wish to give them. We try to subject music to forced inflections, but that is not the way to be able to judge it. On the contrary, we must not think but let ourselves be carried away by the
feeling which the music inspires; without our thinking at all, this feeling will become the basis of our judgment. (Rameau, 15, 1754)

Like Manfredini, Rameau was encouraging instrumentalists to seek expressiveness and develop emotional qualities beyond text. Rameau’s point of view is significant because prior to the mid eighteenth century instrumental practices were linked with rhetorical technique, text, and vocal music. Rameau’s ideas had a profound influence on composition because composers were now seeking ways to express more natural and true emotions and this helped to develop the primacy of the composer. As a result this widened the already existing divide between instrumental and vocal music.

**Aesthetics in the Romantic Era**

Throughout the Romantic era there were many ideas circulating regarding the aesthetics of form and the aesthetics of feeling. The aesthetics of form stressed that music was an abstract image of feeling and the only connection it could have with emotions was on a metaphysical level. Alternatively, the aesthetics of feeling valued music as a language of feeling and embraced the viewpoint that instrumental music was able to communicate emotions with varying degrees of intensity. As mentioned earlier in this chapter, one philosopher who staunchly opposed the ideals of the aesthetics of feeling was Eduard Hanslick, an outspoken music critic for several Viennese newspapers.

Hanslick’s philosophical views have been highly influential in the area of musical

---

106 Ibid., 240.
aesthetics. It is important to note that Hanslick’s opinion, especially his rejection of emotion as an important aspect of musical aesthetics, were bound up with his support of Johannes Brahms (1833-1897) and in opposition to the musical values of Richard Wagner (1813-1883). Hanslick was an advocate of Brahms because they shared an absolutist viewpoint.\textsuperscript{107} This outlook suggests that music expresses only musical ideas, no emotion, and that the music should not be tied to programmatic meanings, as was so much of Wagner’s music.

Although history portrays Hanslick as Wagner’s opponent, in 1843 after the premiere of \textit{Tannhäuser} in Dresden, Hanslick gave the opera rave reviews. He called Wagner, “The great new hope of a new school of German Romantic opera.”\textsuperscript{108} However, \textit{In Artwork of the Future} (1849) and \textit{Opera and Drama} (1852) Wagner set forth new theories regarding opera, which relied on dramatic plots and incorporating word painting to increase extra-musical associations. Hanslick, being musically conservative, believed that Wagner’s reforms were too radical and that his use of music as a dramatic tool lowered the value of his compositions.\textsuperscript{109} Thomas Grey, a musicologist specializing in Wagnerian opera at Stanford University argues, “\textit{On the Beautiful in Music} was written in riposte of Wagner’s polemic grandstanding and overblown theorizing.”\textsuperscript{110} Hanslick dismissed the idea that Wagner’s emotions could directly inspire or inform his musical creation. He wrote that, “Composing is a deliberate, complex process that is not possible

\textsuperscript{109} Grey, \textit{Richard Wagner and His World}, 35-36.
\textsuperscript{110} Ibid., 410.
when there is too much passion.”

With *On The Beautiful in Music* (1854), Hanslick considered the “beauty of music” to come from the inherent properties found within it. He concluded that instrumental music expresses musical ideas only, that it is the object of intrinsic beauty, and is therefore an end in itself. He believed that music could not represent feelings or thoughts. His theory insists that if there is beauty found in music, it has nothing to do with extra musical associations, but the musical form itself. A serious weakness with his argument is that Hanslick focused on notated scores, which are wholly rational and disembodied, thus lending themselves more readily to being understood as unemotional.

**Twentieth Century Aesthetics**

In the twentieth century there was a profound shift away from the primacy of the composer to the listener and to the performer’s role in mediating between composer and listener. Many notable writers argued that music should evoke our imagination and emotions. For example, Meyer’s *Emotion and Meaning in Music* (1956) is an important treatise on music that moves beyond the perspective of the composer. Focusing instead on listeners, Meyer wrote, “Affect or emotion-felt is aroused when an expectation—a tendency to respond—activated by the musical stimulus situation, is temporarily inhibited or permanently blocked.” Thus he created his theory from the listener’s perspective, which was based on musical expectation and cognitive processing of music’s formal

---

112 Ibid., 46-47.
Meyer defines four contrasting positions in philosophical aesthetics, significantly illuminating how music communicates meaning. Those adhering to an *Absolutist* position believe that, "Musical meaning lies exclusively within the work itself." The *Referentialist* differs in that they accept that, "Musical meanings refer to the extra-musical world of concepts, actions, emotional states, and character." The *Formalist* finds that the “meaning of music lies in the perception and understanding of the musical relationships set forth in the work of art and that meaning in music is primarily intellectual.” Finally, the *Expressionist* would argue that these same relationships are in some sense capable of exciting feelings and emotions in the listener. While Meyer’s philosophies explicitly focus on the listener’s point of view, understanding his theory of music and emotion can be very beneficial for the performer since it may help to connect with the audience on an emotional level. In order to satisfy the listener, I would follow the *Expressionist* and *Referentialist* theories because the emphasis can be placed on expressive qualities such as phrasing and interpretation as opposed to a formalist approach.

American composer and scholar Roger Sessions maintains that a live performance is an activity that includes the composer, performer, and the listener. While this is not a revolutionary assertion, Sessions claims that the listener wants an experience that is

116 Ibid.
117 Ibid., 1.
118 Ibid.
119 Ibid.
meaningful, either emotionally or as entertainment. Sessions implies that the composer must seek to create melodic structures that communicate a vivid emotional experience for the audience.

In *Music and Imagination*, written by Aaron Copland and published in 1970, Copland emphasizes that music should be composed from an emotional point of view. Copland writes,

> I put down a reflection of emotional states: feelings, perceptions, imaginings, and intuitions. An emotional state, as I use the term, is compounded of everything we are: our background, our environment, our convictions. Art particularizes and makes actual these fluent emotional states. Because it particularizes and because it makes actual, it gives meaning to *la condition humaine*. (Copland, 1970, 111)

An example of trumpet repertoire composed from an emotional state is [*From the Wreckage* (2004)](2004) by Mark Anthony Turnage. According to Turnage [*From the Wreckage*](2004) reflects the personal psychological journey that he went through while trying to put his life back together after dealing with devastation. As Copland suggests then, Turnage’s composition aims to externalize and express his own emotion into his music.

Meyer, Sessions, and Copland advocate that instrumental music should be expressive, symbolic or representational of emotions. Yet one must ask what a performer can do to generate the emotion of a composition when the expectation in many Western art music contexts is that he or she must simply recreate the musical ideas of the

---

121 Håkan Hardenberger, interview with author. 3 January 2012.

Boston, Mass.
composer. While I believe that it is imperative to stay true to the composer’s vision, the performer also has the capacity to make his or her own personal statement with the music as it is interpreted and made audible. Indeed, doing this is how a performer can create a unique musical performance and a key aspect of this, I believe, is the search for ways to convey emotion. The challenge for the performer here is that this is an ongoing process in which he or she must become a conductor, in the electrical sense, between the ideas of the composer and those of audience so that a message, including an emotional one, flows freely between them. Rising to this challenge demands that, in the rehearsal phase, the performer focuses attention on what the composer has written in the score in order to develop a firm understanding of the music from a structural point of view. Indeed, how can emotion be expressed if the performer does not understand the form of a piece, its key(s), or its cadences? However, even if the score is treated as a strict framework, in performance it is necessary for the performer to try to free him or herself from its strictures in order for emotions to reach the audience. In this context, the performer can and should focus on making particular kinds of sounds in particular, voice like, ways.

Malcolm Budd further discusses emotion from a performer’s point of view in *Music and the Emotions*, published in 1985. Budd wrote,

> For if someone wishes to express an emotion he feels by performing music, and he wishes his emotion to be expressed in the music he plays, then normally he will play music which he considers to possess the quality of emotion he feels, and he will intend the music as he performs it to possess this quality of emotion. (Budd, 1985, 19)
Budd’s argument provides a significant challenge to formalism. Indeed, he is underscoring emotional expression at the level of performance and making explicit connections to emotions that are conveyed in the composition. Like Copland, Budd is also creating a more holistic notion of musical aesthetics endeavoring to take into account not only the emotion of the composer, but also that of performer and listener.

Stephen Davies (2010) suggests another way to examine emotions in performance is through the expression theory. Davies, Professor of Philosophy at the University of Auckland writes, “The expression theory analyses the music’s expressiveness as depending on the composer’s expressing his or her current emotion through the act of composition.” This theory implies that the composer intentionally composed the music to resemble his or her feelings. This is significant because the expression theory asserts an important correlation between the composer’s emotional state and communicating it through music, just as Aaron Copland wrote in *Music and Imagination*. Consequently, this renders the emotion found in the composition a characteristic that the performer is obligated to communicate.

**Final Thoughts**

This chapter has shown that there are numerous opinions and elaborated theories about music and emotion. The aforementioned theories and treatises illustrate that questions regarding the relationship between music and emotions have long been of concern to scholars and musicians. Many scholars offer compelling explanations about

---

how music might or might not express those emotions. However one problem remains in nearly all of them, regardless of how strongly they advocate for music’s emotional expressive power; very few address how performers communicate musical/emotional messages off the printed page to the listener. This is rather surprising, since most people have experienced some form of emotional response to musical sound, regardless of any understanding of the form or mechanics of music and often in the absence of text. Yet formalism’s emphasis on the inherent properties found in the music and that music is not supposed to have a reference to anything outside of itself, can have a negative impact on performance because it has potential to force performers into thinking too much and over focusing on technical details. This risks encouraging the performer to ignore the effect that music has on feelings or the effect that feelings can have on musical expression.

On the other hand, numerous musicians, scholars, composers, theorists, and philosophers have long argued that music can and should seek to do more than just draw attention to its properties. Formal characteristics consist of everything that can be interpreted or analyzed in a score, but as musicians dating back to Frescobaldi have noted, the performer has the ability, indeed, the task of giving the formal characteristics meaning. ¹²⁴ While vocal music with text might make this job easier, contemporary scholar Roland Barthes has argued that textual meaning is always open to interpretation. Since Barthes is writing about literary texts, which are meant to be read silently, a new range of possibility for meaning is introduced when the text is made audible. Applied to music, then, there must be a link between sonic elements and textual expression including

both structures and other components such as volume, timbre, and the like. In fact, Barthes’s notion of the grain of the voice makes this argument.

In *Musica Practica* Barthes writes, “There are two musics (at least so I have always thought) the music one listens to, the music one plays.” Barthes also maintains that young music students engage in the creation of sound but listening takes on a subordinate role. From a vocal approach perspective, listening should not be a passive activity. In fact, listening serves as a guide to the mental sound or imaging we hear in our head. In some ways Barthes' statement is similar to how Arnold Jacobs, (1915-1998), a world-renowned brass teacher, engaged with music. Jacobs stated, “There are two instruments, one in the hand and one in the head. The instrument in the hand is a perfect mirror reflecting the one in the head.” The ability to listen is one of the most important skills a musician should develop. While instrumental music does not express text *per se*; a vocal approach on the trumpet can similarly convey meaning to be interpreted. At a most basic level, this can be accomplished by mimicking a voice declaiming text but it needs to be a pre-conceived sound.

Meyer’s expressionist approach argues that formal properties have potential to express states of feeling. Therefore, teaching the formal properties of music such as melody, harmony, and form is integral to developing a well-rounded musician.

Understanding formal characteristics is valuable because it encourages the musician to be

---

126 Barthes, "Musica Practica" In *Image, Music, Text*, 149.
127 Ibid.
responsive to the music as written in the score, helping him or her to become more
sensitive to such musical characteristics as phrasing or melodic contour. More than that,
though, as Budd and Copland suggest, understanding formal elements of the composition
can also help the performer define and express the character of the piece. This in turn can
help the performer make his interpretation more meaningful and enjoyable for the
audience. In response to the supposed weakness in the expressionist approach, that
emotions and states of feeling are subjective, ineffable, and always open to question, I
argue that this variability is precisely what allows for the creation of individual and
personal understandings of music and is, therefore, central to the pleasure it brings for
listeners and performers.

In complement to the use of a degree of formalism nuanced by expressionist
thinking, there are many expressive gains to be made through Meyer’s referentialism.
For example, we can examine music for its nonmusical references to ideas, events,
imagination, or metaphors and we can teach the student to be aware of associations
between musical and nonmusical stimulus. Clearly, then referentialism can help us make
connections between music and meanings, including emotions, especially in the context
of programmatic music. A weakness in this philosophy is that deciphering an extra
musical message can be like guesswork and it also has the potential to distract the
performer from other possibly more important concerns such as proper fundamentals or
technique. But if the trumpeter puts the emphasis on musical expression this may
circumvent any technical challenges. This idea is also reminiscent of Arnold Jacobs’s
approach to brass playing. Jacobs stated, “You have to make yourself as close to a singer
as you can so you get away from the philosophy of the trumpet and into the philosophy of
the voice. If you concentrate on that you are going to play trumpet automatically.”

The world renowned trumpet teacher Vincent Cichowicz also agreed that technical issues must be translated into musical ideas, and by “mentally singing the passage properly (breath included) success was never far away.”

From a trumpeter’s perspective, I do not challenge the idea that the score is a vital component of discovering meaning in a composition. But unlike Hanslick, who would have tried to find the answers in the musical structures and particularly their notation, I see the score as a guide for the performer to produce sound and convey meaning, be it formal or emotional. Certainly some composers also push against Formalism and embrace the idea that they can instill or convey an emotional message in their music. Even so, the score can only go so far in doing this. Performers’ interpretation, then, becomes crucial and their approach must balance the tension of the assumed authority of the score, the artistic conventions of the specific era, and the liberty they take in creating their individual statement. Regardless of whether the composer intended to express emotion in a piece of music, the performer, as the person who translates the composer’s notation to the audience is empowered to amplify or diminish any emotional content he interprets in the composition. Or, through the manner of performance, he might even add emotional content even if the composer intended none.

Without text to convey meaning, trumpeters must look to other means of doing so by exploring phrasing, dynamics, how we move from one note to another, or even the

inflection that we give to specific notes. Until the nineteenth century vocal music was given primacy of value and influenced by rhetorical treatises. Then, instrumental music was elevated in relation to the period’s emphasis on rationality and form. Yet even in the context of instrumental music, I argue that it is worth re-evaluating some of the characteristics found in successful oration because using a similar approach has potential to de-emphasize form and make more explicit emotional content, which remains for many, an important component of musical aesthetics. Furthermore, involving rhetorically based training allows the musician to be relaxed, be in the moment, lets the instrumentalist focus on being a storyteller that will ultimately convey some form of emotion. At the same time, it is important to make the distinction clear between conveying emotion and actually feeling it. As a performer our primary goal is to provide the audience with an emotional experience of the work and this is based on whether an emotional connection was perceived by the audience - not whether the basis of the emotion was from a real life event experienced by the performer.

As I have been arguing, a vocal-like aesthetic is deeply entangled with the expression of emotion rather than pure form. In the next chapter I will discuss a model for doing this in relation to the composer’s intentions (as conveyed by the score) based on techniques culled from drama. In particular, the theatrical teachings of Constantin Stanislavski provide a compelling starting point for this because his method offers a logical and natural way of preparing actors for any role that connects with the actor’s emotions. Chapter Three will begin to link principles, techniques, concrete applications, and concepts of Stanislavski’s acting method to trumpet performance in order to better serve the wide range of human emotions that instrumentalists need to communicate.
In *The Quest for Voice: On Music, Politics, and the Limits of Philosophy* (1988), Lydia Goehr, Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University writes, “Instrumental playing should approximate to the condition of singing.” Although Goehr’s statement specifically refers to Wagner’s music I think the condition of singing indicates a human and natural approach that instrumentalists should aspire to, regardless of the music they perform. For years many trumpet teachers have acknowledged the voice metaphor and the need for *song* in our performance. However, this simple idea reveals a significant dilemma.

A key aspect of my research is that there is very little material concerning the specific application of emulating the voice on the trumpet, despite the abundance of references to the importance of playing with a vocal approach. As noted in the previous chapters, singing in Western art music has long been characterized as having a close relationship with emotional speech. As a result vocal qualities have often been discussed as a channel for human emotion. The earliest record of this is found in Caccini’s *Le Nuove Musiche* (*The New Music*), published in 1602, but in more recent times this theory of expression is valued by numerous scholars including, Donald Ferguson (1960); Owen Jander (1980); and Peter Kivy (2001). As these writings suggest, and as this

---


dissertation has argued thus far, the question of emotion is central to the notion of a vocal approach. That is, aiming to convey emotion is a primary goal of trumpet performance and that singing or adopting a vocal metaphor is useful for accomplishing this goal.

In daily life, emotional response is almost automatic in the face of a stimulus. But when we need to recreate emotions in music the same emotional stimulus is not always present. Thus, in order to engender an emotional response, that is to make the performance more emotional, performers need to find ways to create the stimulus for emotional experiences. This is not an easy task because our efforts to create emotion can get lost in the mechanical demands of playing the instrument, not to mention in performance anxiety. Yet the subjective nature of emotion in music enables us to make our performances personal, allowing for the potential of a human element, helping us avoid sounding mechanical even in the face of technical challenges. Imagining the sound of a voice provides a useful means of doing this and emulating the voice can facilitate the creation of an individual rendition of the piece instead of a standard or generic interpretation.

This chapter is divided into four parts and the goal is to begin the complex task of developing specific artistic and pedagogical guidelines for vocal emulation. The first part examines the theory of emotional contagion. Patrik Juslin, a Professor of Psychology at Uppsala University, describes emotional contagion as the communication of emotion from music to a listener through non-verbal channels.\footnote{Kivy, \textit{Sound Sentiment}, 622.} This is significant since it refers exactly to what I believe a vocal approach can accomplish for the trumpet player. The second part of the chapter discusses narrative theory as applied to the performance of a
composition. While developing a narrative for a piece of music is in many ways a kind of formal analysis, I stress that it is different from more conventional theoretical types of analysis that examine issues such as components of a fugue, binary form, harmonic functions, key themes and motives, motivic development, etc. in service to understanding how the music “works.” Creating a narrative based on the piece’s musical materials, even if that narrative is based on information gleaned from conventional analysis techniques, can support a vocal approach because it connects with the search for creative stimuli to deepen the trumpeter’s emotional engagement with the music he or she is playing. The third part of this chapter features an interdisciplinary approach between music and theatre as I investigate the potential of adapting particular elements of artistic interpretation and rehearsal methodology from Constantin Stanislavski’s acting method to trumpet performance. Notably, Stanislavski’s concepts focus intensely on emotion and the use of the voice. Part four examines how expression or conveying emotion is currently being taught and how emotional contagion, a narrative analysis, and elements from Stanislavski’s acting theory have potential to help trumpeters create emotion in musical performance.

**Music and Emotion: A New Approach to an Old Problem**

Chapter Two examined a number of scholarly studies on emotion. For many scholars and performers the expression of emotion is an important aspect of Western art music. Research concerning music and emotion in the early to mid 1900’s focused on how emotion was perceived as opposed to how it was induced in the listener. Emotion perception is concerned with how a listener discerns or recognizes emotions in specific
music. For example, an interval of a minor third can represent sadness without the participant feeling sad. Emotion induction research focuses on how music evokes emotion and is actually felt in the listener.  

Patrik Juslin, Professor of Psychology at Uppsala University, is emerging as a leader in emotion induction research, specializing in music performance. In 2000, he and Renee Timmers conducted a study that focused on expression and communication of emotion in music performance. They theorize the concept of “emotional contagion” as being especially relevant to performing because it allows for the conveying of emotion through non-verbal channels. They define emotional contagion as the “process whereby an emotion is induced by a piece of music because the listener perceives the emotional expression of the music and then mimics this expression internally.” In this way, emotional contagion shares similarities with the arousal theory discussed in Chapter Two because it elicits emotion in the listener.

In a similar study completed in 2001, Juslin hypothesized that listeners and performers can become aroused by voice-like aspects in music. He concluded that neural modules found in our brain respond to certain stimulus features, which leads us to mimic the perceived emotion internally. This is a significant finding because in order for the listener to experience emotion, music will pass through complex brain processing which eventually elicits an emotional response. It is interesting to note that Juslin’s findings demonstrate the communicational efficacy of instrumental music imitating emotional

---

135 Ibid.
136 Ibid., 622.
137 Ibid.
speech, just as the *Florentine Camerata* argued during the Baroque era.

In 2003, Juslin and Petri Laukka furthered the previous research by completing a study entitled *Communication of Emotions in Vocal Expression and Music Performance*. This study investigated how the expression of emotions in vocal music influenced its listeners. Although there are many descriptive words used to depict emotions, they identified five primary emotions: anger, fear, happiness, tenderness, and sadness. They then associated them with particular characteristics as follows:

*Anger* - fast tempo of speech, high voice intensity and sound level, numerous pitch variables and energy, rising pitch contour, many irregularities in structure, outbursts followed by silence, followed by short interjections.

*Fear* - fast tempo of speech, lower voice intensity (except in panic fear), numerous pitch variables and energy, rising pitch contour, structure is more regular.

*Happiness* - fast tempo of speech, medium-high voice intensity and sound level, rising pitch contour, very irregular in structure.

*Tenderness*, slow speech tempo, low voice intensity and pitch level, very little pitch variability, falling pitch contour.

*Sadness*, slow speech tempo, low voice intensity and pitch level, very little pitch variability, falling pitch contour.  
(Juslin & Laukka, 790, 2003)

Their investigation and findings clearly demonstrate the link between musical sounds (as opposed to sung text), the human voice, and the emotion that can be evoked. It is possible then that trumpeters can communicate emotions to an audience by using these aforementioned emotion-specific cues that are determined from vocal expression. One possible shortcoming in their research is that they fail to state if these concepts and
musical correlations are applicable to all individuals, languages, and cultures - their study was conducted in English. My initial suspicion is that they are not; emotions may be expressed differently in different languages and in different cultures. Nevertheless, assuming a shared language and vocabulary of emotional expression, as one might expect within a given culture, Juslin and Luakka’s ideas emerge as useful for thinking about how a vocal approach might be effective for evoking emotional responses. Yet trumpeters can often find it challenging to interpret and apply emotional ideas because the instrument also demands tremendous technical facility.

**Technique versus Expression**

Trumpet performance is often conceptualized as comprised of two integral parts, a technical component and an expressive component. Yet trumpeters are generally unable to discover expressive gestures unless they have developed strong fundamental techniques. In order to become proficient musicians it is necessary combine these two facets into our practice. Technique is related to the mechanics of producing fluent coordinated outputs to actually make the trumpet resonate and I break it down into six main categories; Sound or Tone production, Articulation, Flexibility, Agility, Range, and Endurance. Learning a new technical component such as multiple tonguing is something that requires thinking consciously about specific principles and their application. On the other hand, conveying expression or emotion requires the technique to be engrained and embodied to the degree that it is virtually automatic. In other words, it is difficult to perform expressively when we are thinking about the technical aspects of playing.

Like the theorists I discussed in prior chapters, many teachers and performers would agree that an outstanding performer is someone who can play expressively and
communicate an emotional message. Typically, this does demand a degree of technical fluency. Yet ethnographic literature on performers of Western art music as well as my own experiences as a performer suggests that, in addition to nurturing strong technique, expression in performance is a central concern for musicians regardless of whether they are instrumentalists or vocalists. As Henry Kingsbury illustrates in *Music, Talent and Performance: A Conservatory Cultural System* published in 1988, achieving “technical and musical aspects of performance is an all-pervasive concern among conservatory musicians.”\(^{138}\) Much of Kingsbury’s book queries the idea of “musicality” and the ways those at the conservatory relate it to emotional performances that go beyond technical rendering. Kingsbury argues that undergraduate programs focus on a “music curricula centered on highly disciplined approaches to musical technique, and formalistic studies in music theory” and that expressive components are taught in a “haphazard way.”\(^{139}\) Research conducted by Goolsby (1996) and Rosenshine (2002) support Kingsbury’s argument because they report that instrumental music instruction is focused on teaching technical skills rather than the student’s emotional engagement with music.\(^{140}\) Although Kingsbury does not say so directly, he implies that technique and expression are often conceptualized as separate and that developing expressive qualities depends on the quality and nature of the teaching to which students are exposed.

Despite research such as that done by Kingsbury, Goolsby, and Rosenshine, researchers actually know relatively little about the ways in which most instrumental

---


\(^{139}\) Ibid., 5.

teachers teach expression to their students since individual lessons are largely hidden
from view. Furthermore, teaching emotional expression is challenging because of the
indeterminate nature of emotions and the fact that gauging emotional performance is so
subjective and difficult to quantify. This is a marked contrast to teaching and assessing
analysis ability or technique, which can more easily be gauged against a standard.
Despite the subjectivity and the indeterminacy of emotional expression, an important
intervention provided by the vocal approach is that it always directs technical work
towards expression, musicality, style, and emotion. By placing an emphasis on song and
not the mechanical, trumpet technique is developed and informed by expressive playing
thereby minimizing the supposed dichotomy between expression and technique.

**Narrative Analysis**

A formal analysis of musical components including fundamental harmony and
progressions, melodic construction, rhythmic combinations, timbral juxtaposition, and
voice leading is often thought of as a dry process. This type of analysis directs attention
to examining the forms and construction of musical structure as opposed to “extra-
musical” concerns, for example emotion. As mentioned in Chapter Two, formalist ideas
about musical beauty are conceived in isolation, working with an idealized view of the
score being *the music* and free from any perceptible emotional content. Yet as I have
been arguing, the performer’s primary goal is to provide the audience with an emotional
experience of the work. Therefore, a formal type of analysis alone is not the most
appropriate for helping a performer achieve an emotional connection with his audience
because it overlooks the fact that, in most instances, the music presented in a score is
meant to be realized in sound and performance.
I embrace the idea that performance interpretation should be based on some type of analysis. The key, however, is music analysis needs to be fostered by a creative and artistic approach that helps the musician connect with the emotional nature of a story that unfolds from the analysis. While there are different types of analysis, some more involved than others, some understanding of what the composer aimed to express through critical engagement with his directives in the score can only benefit the interpreter. This view has a good deal of support among music scholars and is sustained by the work of John Rink, Professor of Performance Studies at the University of Cambridge. Rink outlines a useful and pragmatic approach,

> Temporality lies at the heart of performance and is therefore fundamental to ‘performer’s analysis’.

> Its primary goal is to discover the music’s ‘shape’, as opposed to structure, as the means of projecting it.

> The score is not ‘the music’: ‘the music’ is not confined to the score.

> Any analytical element that impinges on performance will ideally be incorporated within a larger synthesis influenced by considerations of style (broadly defined), genre, performance tradition, technique, instrument and so on, as well as the performer’s individual artistic prerogatives. In other words, analytically determined decisions should not be systematically prioritized.

> ‘Informed intuition’ guides, or at least influences, the process of ‘performer’s analysis’, although a more deliberate analytical approach can also be useful. (Rink 2002, 39)

Taking Rink’s model seriously involves remembering that, as interpreters, an effectively utilized analysis will inform how we perform even without conscientious attention to its details during performance. In the moment of performing it is not necessary to think
about our analytic procedures and conclusions because, ideally, we have internalized them.

Opportunities to express emotion are present in the gestures, procedures, and structures of a score. Yet performers have to read the score with the aim of locating those notated directives, which, in their judgment, are most useful and relevant to their interpretation. While there are many ways to develop expression in the sonic realization of scores, in keeping with the ideas of a vocal approach and its relationship with emotion in music, an analysis that creates a narrative promises to be an effective approach. A narrative theory or narratology is commonly associated with the literary world whereby a narrator communicates with an audience. Yet the narrative need not be exclusive to literature. For example, American musicologist Carolyn Abbate suggests that, “Certain gestures experienced in music constitute a narrating voice”.141 Furthermore, Abbate’s interest in the “drastic” in music, that is, music’s existence in the present as a performed art, suggests the utility of a narrative analysis that might help the performer better connect with the unfolding, in the moment, aspects of a piece of music. In this way, working with a narrative that is based on information in the score is a form of analysis that pushes against the ideas of those who advocate what Abbate might call the gnostic aspects of music as a basis of performance. That is, analysis that emphasizes the close dissection of the score with sound being secondary.

Creating a story to underpin our music is an important tool for the performer because it can provide a more concrete basis from which to convey a vivid message for the listener. If a composition is programmatic then the actual story that inspired the

music is an obvious point of analysis for the performer. If a composition is conceived by its composer as absolute music, the musical structures, for example, the melody, may serve as the basis of the performer’s narrative and help to accomplish a kind of storytelling.

Adolph Herseth, former Principal Trumpet with the Chicago Symphony Orchestra, believed that emphasizing the storytelling aspect led to exciting performances.\(^{142}\) Herseth, who is considered by many orchestral musicians and conductors to be one of the greatest orchestral trumpeters, is frequently praised for his ability to make the orchestral trumpet literature his own through his interpretations. As part of his process, Herseth admits that he used to compose his own lyrics to a good portion of the music he performed.\(^{143}\) While this might seem like a divergence from practicing or analyzing the music, there could be great benefits to following Herseth’s example. Certainly, his success supports this. By creating or imagining lyrics, based on a personal or fictitious story, the musician is creating a role, which can be infused with tangible feelings and finally communicated in practice and performance.

Recently I was preparing Jennifer Higdon’s *Trumpet Songs* for an upcoming recital, and although it is not a technically challenging piece, each movement requires different characterizations. I was becoming increasingly frustrated with the third movement, *In Our Quiet*, because what I had initially conceived in my mind was not evident during rehearsals. In order for me to replicate the mental concept I had created, I


needed to change my approach to preparing this movement. I devised a narrative for *In Our Quiet* that reflected my relationship with my son (at that time eight months old). Over a period of time I wrote a narrative that developed into an inspirational message that I would tell my son before departing from this world. As opposed to viewing it as sepulchral, I viewed it as a peaceful reflection on my hopes for him during his lifetime. Although my narrative may appear trivial, it was in fact crucial in terms of developing the emotional aspect of my performance, and it was effective because my connection between the melody and the emotion was conceived of by imagining my “voice” communicating the message.

Even though the semantic meaning was unclear to the audience, creating a text and building a narrative allowed me to create sounds around a story. Expressing the narrative in a wordless fashion using only the breath and the instrument is similar to a singer. Vocalists tell a story through text and sound so the meaning is conveyed at least partly through the sound, without the words. Even in the absence of text, such as a *vocalise*, the voice’s capacity to create various tones, intonation, line contour, pace, volume, and timbres is highly effective for communicating, representing, and connecting to emotional meanings. Given the absence of verbal content in trumpet repertoire, a trumpeter has to work even harder to convey whatever expression can be expressed, using *rubato*, dynamics, tone colour, all of the things that a speaker or a vocalist uses to help express the text. Although there are differing interpretations of what constitutes a musical narrative, Richard Walsh reports in *The Common Basis of Narrative and Music: Somatic, Social, and Affective Foundation*, that creating a narrative similar to what I
developed for *Trumpet Songs* helps to emphasize telling a story through music.\(^{144}\)

Therefore, my interpretation for developing a narrative in performance helped me to interpret a score more like an actor’s script. This often-invoked notion of the score as a script, then, serves as an important bridge to a vocal approach and emotional trumpet performance.

**Interdisciplinarity and the Place of Acting in Musical Performance**

Throughout the pedagogical literature there are many arcane directives toward achieving voice-like and emotional musical performances. One practical solution to this problem is to draw on other disciplines invested in similar goals such as drama and emotional communication. This interdisciplinary approach promises new ways to teach vocal emulation and apply it more effectively to musical performance processes. In fact, noted brass pedagogue Arnold Jacobs suggested using actors as a model because he was convinced that studying acting would benefit brass musicians. Jacobs claimed, “A musician, like a singer or an actor, must train to be extroverted…a musician should be like an actor delivering a message.”\(^{145}\) In another example he stated,

> Be an actor and pretend to be someone else for a moment. Use imitation and hear the different players in your head. Put it in your head and demonstrate how a great player sounds. (Loubriel 2005, 74)

---


As Arnold Jacobs has suggested, drama provides a useful model for bringing emotional expression into a performance based on what is written in the score.

The Stanislavski Method

The theatrical teachings of Constantin Stanislavski provide a compelling starting point for a dramatic concept of music-making because his method offers a logical and natural way of preparing actors for any role by helping them make connections to their emotions. Stanislavski’s philosophy was built on his valuing of realistic and natural expression on stage. Just as when we speak in conversation, or when an actor delivers lines when playing a part, musical expressions must have inflection, articulation, dynamics, and direction that helps convey the meaning intended. For the musician who aims to make the most of such inflections for the purpose of expression, Stanislavski’s method can be quite effective for accessing and communicating a wide range of human emotions. Accessing these emotions, according to Stanislavski, facilitates a natural mode of expression that is full of meaningful and communicative nuances.

Stanislavski revolutionized American acting because his approach to theatrical instruction, also known as Method Acting, encouraged actors to closely examine the psychological state of their character and to make a personal and emotional connection to the role. This included drawing on their own emotions and memories to bring about more life-like performances.\(^{146}\) Stanislavski’s systematic approach to training actors eventually led him to become regarded as one of the most influential acting teachers in history. He was recognized as being the first person to apply psychological ideas to

\(^{146}\) Andrew Godoski. “Method Acting”
acting, an idea that later became the foundation of most mainstream acting theories. His method is closely aligned with emotions and the use of imagination; applying aspects of his teachings to trumpet performance and pedagogy will result in an approach that lends itself to creating artistic and emotional performances for musicians.

In order to gain a better understanding of why Stanislavski’s method is compatible with a vocal approach it is important to note that other types of theatre and actor training do exist. Research suggests that many of these other styles of acting, including Theatre of Cruelty, Postdramatic theatre, Epic theatre, and Theatre of the Absurd, were born out of opposition to Stanislavski’s natural approach. These methodologies do not serve musicians appropriately in performance preparation because any emotion they achieve and convey is rooted in the unreal and too easily comes across as unnatural.

Prior to the development of Stanislavski’s method many actors subscribed to the classical approach. This technique tended to be melodramatic; Stanislavski believed that actors who used this approach produced unrealistic performances. Through intense character development the Stanislavski system sought to make performances real or truthful. This meant moving away from the otherwise artificial style of acting that was the accepted norm. Importantly, the term truth for Stanislavski is based on whether an emotional connection was perceived by the audience - not whether the basis of the emotion was from a real life event experienced by the actor. This is a key concept for applying Stanislavski’s method to musical performance because it allows the musician’s sound to represent or symbolize an emotion as opposed to actually entering the

---

psychological state of a real emotional situation.

Despite his emphasis on real-life experiences in the creation of a character, one of the central tenets of Stanislavski’s system is imagination. He encouraged imagination through a concept called the “Magic If.”\textsuperscript{148} The process begins by the actor asking the question, “What would I do if I were in these circumstances?” By posing a “magic if” question, creativity and imagination occur instantaneously because the actor begins to create details about a character or an object that is rooted in a personal response. This further allows the actor to believe in a fictional story, helping to transform the character’s aims into the actor’s. The same is true with music and can be applied to trumpeters as follows; “How would I play this piece if I were Adolph Herseth?” or “How would I play or sing this phrase if it were an operatic aria?” Stanislavski believed that the best way to achieve realistic performances was to work from the inside out and he encouraged his actors to live the lives of their characters. Creating the narrative for Higdon’s In Our Quiet was a similar process since I developed the story inwardly and then provided an external expression for the experience, which resulted in a direct and clear way of communicating the musical message.

Stanislavski developed a process of character development based in the exploration of the “Given and Inner Circumstances” and “Substitution.” These analysis exercises helped the actor create a performance that was a product of creative experimentation and the use of real emotional connections. In the initial stages of preparation, a method actor would explore the “Given Circumstances” of the play. This would entail a detailed examination of what the playwright has provided as clues for

character development. This is similar to how a musician might develop a knowledge around the piece they are performing. For example, studying the background of the composition, listening to a lot of music of this composer if possible, the emotional environment of the time, the historical period of the composer, programmatic versus absolute, and a general understanding of form.

Stanislavski suggested that once the “Given Circumstances” were understood, the actor could begin to explore the “Inner Circumstances” of the character. This process suggests that the actor use his own life experiences to inform the emotional decisions that he makes for the character in order to create a detailed portrayal of a real person. For the instrumentalist, the goal of this phase is to shift from an intellectual analysis to a creative process with the outcome of establishing emotional connections with the music.

Stanislavski called the ability to recall emotional feelings from a past experience Substitution.\(^\text{149}\) During the initial stages of rehearsal the actor may need to use personal real-life experiences for his or her substitutions in order to access a real emotion that connects well with the character’s life. Stanislavski encouraged actors to transfer these feelings to their current character thus generating “human depth and personal involvement.”\(^\text{150}\) While he encouraged actors to create their character as close to themselves as possible in order to convey a sense of truth, only ‘extreme’ actors (for example, Robert De Niro or Heath Ledger) actually adopt or live the life of the character. Most people have no idea how it feels to be a fugitive on the run and Stanislavski certainly did not advocate that an actor needs to become a wanted man in real life in order

to portray the role of a criminal successfully. Rather, he stressed that in order to effectively communicate the emotional realism of such a character, it requires that the actor find a similar emotional event in his or her life that brings a closer understanding of the emotional content of the role. Stanislavski and his many highly successful students believe that using this type of substitution helps the actor create an inspired and truthful performance.\textsuperscript{151}

For the trumpeter, the benefits of Stanislavski’s ideas lie in giving and shaping the character of the music. The hope for the musician, like the actor, is that through the creative process he can create effective substitutions in order to convey the character of the piece. Both the script and the score exist as artifacts, items without life, yet there is meaning to be found through studying them. Similarly, when musicians understand the intention or character of the piece of music, they can engage their imagination as a means to express things beyond what is notated.

Just as an actor or a vocalist uses his voice to convey emotion through a narrative, it is imperative to understand that emotion is not only conveyed through text but also through sounds. While actors and opera singers need to consider the specific vocal and physical aspects of a character in relation to their overall objective, instrumentalists can use the sound to do so by developing thoughts, feelings, or a narrative that help convey the emotional aspects of the music. Considering the characteristics such as timbre, shadings, and textures as the beginning of our personalized interpretation of the music is consistent with a vocal approach in that it allows internalized emotions to become

\textsuperscript{151} As mentioned earlier, Stanislavski used to refer to the term truthful on whether the audience perceived an emotional connection, not whether the basis of the emotion was from a real life event experienced by the actor.
externalized and audible. Voice-like and emotional expression are tightly entangled but thinking vocally becomes the mediator between emotions the performer feels and the emotions that the performer wants the listener to hear and perceive.

**Teaching Emotional Expression on an Instrument**

One of the most effective ways of teaching expression on a specific instrument is the use of metaphor.\(^{152}\) This represents a critical and effective teaching approach because metaphors, similar to emotions, can be subjective. People understand and respond to emotions differently yet metaphors help establish connections to abstract concepts with a comparatively more concrete reference. Thus, the use of metaphors resonates in many ways with Stanislavski’s method and even narratology. In particular, creating a narrative, thinking about emotional experiences, finding metaphors related to musical gestures, conjuring relevant imagery, and perhaps most of all, imagining the expressive sound of a voice offer useful means of bringing expressivity into musical production, in a sense making emotion audible and perceivable to listeners. In a music performance setting, the score serves as a guide that allows the performer to draw from the music itself to accentuate metaphors and imagery. As teachers, our vocabulary and verbal directives to students are important in this regard. In *Principles and Processes of Music Education* (1984), Malcolm Tait and Paul Haack write,

> The vocabulary brings together what is heard with what is felt, what is imagined and what is sensed, what is analyzed and what is reflected upon. The vocabulary may be in terms of an image such as an event, a place, color, shape, or person. It may be in terms of a metaphor dealing with a quality of feeling or a quality of movement such as

\(^{152}\) Marchand (1975); Dalgarno (1997); Johnson (1998); Solboda et al (2003).
eager, calm, or energetic; or, alternatively, it may relate to the living process and include such words as growth, decay, distortion, cohesion, gravitation, stability, tension, or relaxation. (Tait & Haack, 1984, 78-79)

Given the complex nature of emotion in music, metaphors can help form a more concretely conceptualized understanding of expressive aspects in a piece of music.

It is important to note that instrumentalists and vocalists have a different approach to learning expressivity because vocalists generally use the meaning of the text as a source of emotion. Robert Woody documents this in his examination of emotion-based pedagogy in university teaching (2000). Woody reports that instrumental teachers promote the use of critical listening while vocal teachers encourage felt emotion and extra musical meaning. He claims that extra musical meaning is transferred to vocal students through metaphorical and imagery based language.

Similarly, in *Power Performance for Singers: Transcending the Barriers* (1998), Shirlee Emmons and Alma Thomas recognized the importance of metaphors when working with the voice. They write, “Singers find that almost every physical skill that is part of their technique is hidden from view…Your only recourse is to turn inward, to listen, to feel, and to remember your kinesthetic responses so that you can repeat them at will.”

---


154 Ibid., 20.


157 Ibid., 5.
Yet this inward turn is not particular to vocalists. Evidence in support of this position is found in *Metaphors We Live By* (1980), written by George Lakoff and Mark Johnson. Both of these American scholars argue that because the mind is embodied, our day-to-day living is metaphorical in nature. In addition to this idea, they maintain that people conceptualize the world in terms of bodily perceptions, acquired through our senses. If a metaphorical approach is conducive to understanding numerous situations in life, then it should be successful at addressing complex and subjective issues, such as those we find in music, including instrumental music.

Lyle Davidson, a composer and Professor of Theory at the New England Conservatory suggests that a “metaphor creates an affective state within which the performer can attempt to model.” In order for metaphors to work they require contextual understanding. For example, Ray Sasaki’s instruction, as noted in the Introduction regarding a monk singing in a monastery, does not work on its own because Sasaki fails to provide any tangible information as to how a monk sounds in a monastery or even the purpose of Gregorian chant. By understanding the significance of Gregorian chant then, an association can be made between religion, emotion, and music, which, in this case, provides the student with stronger objectives for the music.

A teaching strategy using metaphors can be an invaluable tool for trumpeters because it supports kinesthetic, auditory, and visual learning styles. Offering metaphor and imagery concepts have the potential to create an affective state that the performer can

---

attempt to model. Notably, Arnold Jacobs’ work with instrumentalists also included ideas related to imagery. Jacobs used to say, “Words will not bring about change, unless they are used to create images…our thoughts must go to stimuli (songs in the head) as we overcome the challenges of music and the physical phenomena.”159 This idea allows students to conceptualize with what is unseen, creating an internal perspective. If metaphors are used as an imaging technique it can help to maintain a mental commitment to singing, which will also direct thoughts away from technical and endurance issues, leaving energy to be focused on communicating a musical message.

**It’s All in Our Imagination**

Numerous studies from varying perspectives have identified that the use of imagination plays an important role in music performance.160 Further, as noted by Arnold Jacobs, using our musical imagination is also a necessary component for effective trumpet playing, which he characterized as emotionally expressive.161 Jacobs firmly believed that a common weakness in students was that they did not use their imaginations enough. Jacobs concluded that,

> The lack of musical imagination in the musical endeavors [of students] is the number one problem in most cases. With these students whose brains are crowded out by how to play their instrument from a technical standpoint you find that they are not able to play music from a musical

---

160 Areas include, but not limited to, musicology, sociology, ethnomusicology, cognitive, social, and developmental psychology, neuroscience, education, psychiatry, and therapy.
standpoint. One should learn first how to play music and through it learn how to play the instrument. (Loubriel 2005, 74)

Imagination is vital for effective trumpet performance, even in contexts where its place might not be so obvious like when reading a score or even playing exercises.

To a large extent, most vocal music in the Western art music tradition requires the singer to portray a character and to tell a story. Singing an aria or a leid is similar to storytelling because the vocalist is communicating a narrative that may contain emotional qualities. This may require the vocalist to use her imagination because she might have to communicate with another character, (imagined or onstage), herself, or to the audience in complement to what is expressed in the text. Because the singer is communicating to someone it gives the story a destination. Given the lack of text in trumpet music, imaginative use of narrative, metaphors, images, and emotional recall can help the instrumentalist envision a musical dialogue with other players and the audience.

David Elliott, Professor of Music Education at New York University, is firm believer that imagination is integral to enhancing performances. In *Music Matters* (1995), he writes,

> Forming images and linking images in the absence of actual events and objects is not merely duplicating the look or sound of something in one’s mind, it’s a matter of generating and selecting as yet unseen or unheard possibilities…Being musically imaginative refers to the process of generating and selecting as yet unsounded musical patterns and designs in one’s mind as part of creating a real musical outcome. (Elliott 1995, 228)
At the heart of my views on trumpet performance and aesthetics is a conviction that in order to be effective, expressive musicians we should engage our musical imaginations because it can provide auditory and mental images that will establish goals for achieving a desirable sonic result.

**Conclusion**

This chapter has given an account of several concepts that help a trumpeter establish an approach to creating emotions in music performance. Performing music in the Western art music tradition is, to varying degrees, based on the re-creation of the composer’s musical ideas. In this sense, all performances involve a degree of re-creation or realizing something that has in many ways been imagined, composed and often performed before. By developing a narrative, utilizing Stanislavski’s substitution concept, creating metaphors, and developing imagery, in other words drawing on the imagination, can help the performer seamlessly integrate his or her understandings of the composer’s intent and their own interpretive choices. In so doing, the musician may move past simply rendering technical or formal structures. Another important implication is that these ideas are all ways to engage the mind and body toward feeling and eventually expressing emotion.

The following chapter continues to explore ways to achieve emotional expressiveness on the trumpet. To do this, I demonstrate ways to establish clear links between the voice and trumpet pedagogy by applying vocal concepts directly to trumpet repertoire. Providing some concrete vocal techniques and exercises based on Stanislavski’s method are central to these new teaching strategies, all of which are rooted in the vocal approach to trumpet performance.
Chapter Four

A Vocal Approach as Applied to Trumpet Performance and Pedagogy

As I have been discussing throughout the dissertation, it has long been held by musicians, teachers, and music philosophers that vocal song is the most expressive and natural form of music and that, because it is so closely related to vocal expression and emotion, it has become the paradigm of musical expressiveness in instrumental music. Similarly, it is a widely held belief, one with which I agree, that the human voice is especially effective at articulating musical meaning and especially the communication of various emotions. This dissertation has argued, further, that a primary use of a vocal approach in trumpet performance and pedagogy should be to help the musician convey emotion. This argument is predicated on my, and many others’ strong conviction that emulating the voice is an effective means toward more emotionally expressive playing because it encourages the musician to think about expression first as opposed to focusing entirely on technique, thereby facilitating a more meaningful communication of the musical message. Yet based on my experience as a student, teacher, and performer, the connection between voice and trumpet is not talked about clearly and teachers use singing terms in esoteric ways to make a connection between sounding voice-like and being musical.

As outlined in the Introduction, many well-known method books recognize the importance of vocal emulation in trumpet performance, yet they do not offer trumpeters suggestions or methodical instructions for further implementation of the voice-like ideal.

---

nor any other tangible ways of how a vocal approach can be achieved. Teachers such as Michael Sachs, Principal Trumpet of the Cleveland Orchestra, suggest that students play vocalises and lyrical etudes with the end goal of achieving emotional expression. However, Sachs admits that he does not talk about expressing emotion with students. While I cannot speak for all trumpet teachers, there are many who embrace the concept of a vocal approach, but in my experience as a student very rarely did they address the question of how to express emotion with the instrument. More importantly, despite the abundance of references to the importance of emulating the voice, there has been little formal inquiry into how a trumpet sound becomes expressive, symbolic or representational of emotions.

The purpose of this chapter is to help trumpeters maximize their potential for expressive musical communication. Engaging with some concrete vocal techniques, exercises based on Stanislavski’s method, and other means of utilizing the imagination such as imagery, narrative, and metaphor will improve teaching strategies and strengthen the link between voice, emotion, and trumpet performance. This chapter asks the teacher and student to revisit basic steps on a daily basis so the student can make continuous progression towards emulating the voice. The idea of returning to the basics is not a revolutionary concept, but by understanding the impact it will have on building foundation blocks for a more voice-like approach is essential to the change it may have among various teaching strategies. Vincent Cichowicz wrote,

Each new day we must rebuild the foundation of our musical structure, thinking like a beginner and

---

going through the basics or A, B, Cs of trumpet playing…I always began my playing day as if I were a beginner. I took nothing for granted. I thought, “Alright you are a good player and you are in the Chicago Symphony Orchestra. No! You are a beginner. Think! Think! Think!” What I found was that if I didn’t think that way- if I was careless- my playing would slip back. To avoid that, one has to take just a few minutes of the beginning of each day and go through each step of what makes the instrument work. (Cichowicz, as quoted in Loubriel, 2009, 128)

If we develop a vocal approach according to building on skills one level at a time and always revisiting and reconnecting with those skills it allows a voice-like ideal to vary with the individual understanding, interpretation, personality, and skill level of the performer. The following outline provides a daily routine of establishing a vocal approach that, as Cichowicz suggested, returns to the basics.

**Breath Management**

A vocal approach on the trumpet logically starts with utilizing the tool that the voice and the trumpet share in common; the body’s breathing apparatus. Since the breath is a key component of a singing sound we can never underestimate the importance of revisiting breathing exercises and breath awareness on a daily basis. Efficient breathing is the foundation of trumpet playing: a concept that cannot be stressed enough. There are many schools of thought concerning breathing and students can be easily confused because some ideas are based on systems of misinformation. For example, as a teenager I studied with a private teacher who instructed me to do a series of breathing exercises that encouraged *holding* the breath before exhalation. I strongly disagree with this approach because it encourages a conscious stoppage of air, which results in a pressurized air
stream.

While I was living in Tokyo, Japan in 1997, a well-known Japanese trumpet teacher shared another breathing idea with me. At the first (and only) lesson I had with this esteemed teacher, he started the lesson by asking me the date, the year, and approximately the time of my birth. When I provided my answers, the teacher consulted a German textbook and reported back to me that it was not necessary for me to take a deep breath while playing. He based this false hypothesis on the fact that I was born in late July and that the moon was in a specific position at the time of my birth, specifically in that year. In other words, he was asking me to breathe like I was not playing a brass instrument. However, breathing normally, as per the instructions in the lesson, does not require a large volume of air. If a student followed the advice of this teacher this would result in a thin, weak, fuzzy tone because there would be insufficient air moving past the embouchure and into the instrument. This shallow breathing concept directly contradicts what is already accepted as practical breathing for a brass instrument, which is the ability to move large quantities of air through the embouchure and the instrument with maximum efficiency. This view is exemplified by Arnold Jacobs, who suggested that, “The ideal breath should have the sound of wind: a large volume of air taken in freely”.

For their part, vocalists also deal with differing opinions, theories, and

---

schools of thought concerning natural and efficient ways to breath.\textsuperscript{165} However, a well-established vocal technique called the \textit{appogio} promises to be of great use to trumpeters.\textsuperscript{166} Shirlee Emmons, a former Professor of Voice at Columbia, Princeton, Boston, and Rutgers Universities, summarizes the \textit{appogio} using the following directives: keep the chest up during the breathing cycle because it allows for the intercostal area to expand and do not raise or tense the shoulders.\textsuperscript{167} Emmons suggests that once the correct position of the \textit{appogio} is attained vocalists will improve the tone in all registers, flexibility, singing large intervals, and singing at different dynamic levels.\textsuperscript{168}

While we do find contradictory comments among professional trumpeters in relation to breathing, I believe that the \textit{appogio} concept is appropriate because our sound is directly related to the type of breath we take.\textsuperscript{169} The \textit{appogio} allows for maximum air intake and it encourages a relaxed state so there is very little tension, thus providing an efficient breathing technique. Shirlee Emmons reports that Keith Underwood, a New York City flautist, is gaining recognition in the vocal community for his development of a

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{165} Clavicular breathing, Diaphragmatic breathing, Intercostal breathing, Appogio versus Belly Breathing, Upper-dorsal breathing, Nose breathing. This list is meant to highlight some of the common terms that appear in vocal pedagogy and does not encompass every breathing concept.
  \item \textsuperscript{166} Some common directives are: The ‘Noble’ position – similar to a soldier standing at ease, shoulders back and relaxed, this helps to expand the chest. Chest out and up, lateral and outwards flexibility in the stomach area for expansion. Several early vocal treatises mention this type of posture, such as Lamperti (1931); Garcia (1847), the difference seems to be how it is worded.
  \item \textsuperscript{167} Shirlee Emmons, “Focus on Vocal Technique: Breath Management” http://shirlee-emmons.com/breath_management.html (accessed July 14, 2013)
  \item \textsuperscript{168} Ibid.
\end{itemize}
simple approach to the *appogio* that he has applied to woodwind players. Notably, Underwood credits Vincent Penzarella, former student of Arnold Jacobs and former second trumpeter with the New York Philharmonic, for teaching him the basis of a song and wind approach. Although we do not see Arnold Jacobs borrow or use the term *appogio* in his teachings, Jacobs was a trained singer and it is logical that he would have been concerned with the breath since it is of such importance. Even if he did not adapt the *appogio* concept for brass, Jacobs was essentially advocating the same approach to breath as is used by singers, and now, as it is readapted by Underwood for wind instruments and vocalists.

Another consideration for proper respiratory function is posture and tension. In *Musical Performance: Learning Theory and Pedagogy* (1992), Daniel Kohut writes, “The primary source of excessive tension in performance is poor posture.” Arnold Jacobs believed that the best posture for inhalation and exhalation was standing because the body can be relaxed and aligned, which provides efficiency for musical purposes. While it is not always possible for students to stand, I recommend that they focus on a posture that allows for the most freedom during breath renewal instead of discussing musculature and focusing on the numerous muscles involved in proper body alignment.

---

172 Early in Arnold Jacobs’ career he was offered a voice scholarship at the Curtis Institute.
174 Bruce Nelson, *Also Sprach Arnold Jacobs*, 35.
If I see students slouching or slumped over, I ask them to picture a marionette puppet with several strings attached to the top of their head pulling them up. Almost immediately there is improvement in the posture, regardless of whether they are standing or sitting, and this almost always translates to an improved sound. I have found that keeping the head in roughly the same position as speaking alleviates tension in the neck and shoulders. But because everyone’s physique is different it is important to focus on the sound of the breath and our sound from the instrument because that is always a good indicator if we are doing things correctly.¹⁷⁵

Air should always be in constant motion, either in or out. The student should strive for a free flowing, uninhibited breath because a relaxed full breath results in a full sound, while a tense, or restricted breath (‘hiss’ sound) results in a tense or tight sound. Listening for the sound of an effortless breath is an important stimulus, so during inhalation listen for the sound of HO (Hoe), this keeps the tongue down in the jaw and the oral cavity is relaxed, allowing for maximum air intake. Try to eliminate tension so that musculature can be flexible and encourage students to think large volume of air.

A common occurrence in the breathing process is a hitch or stoppage of air right before the exhalation, resulting in tension and a slight closure of the throat. This tension will be present in the sound; therefore, it is imperative to develop an uninterrupted airstream. There are two simple exercises that I like to use that are designed to alleviate closing off the throat. They help to establish effective breath management and should be carried out away from the instrument to help develop a natural approach and used daily.

¹⁷⁵ Arnold Jacobs had a similar concept he called “Stand while Seated”. He wanted students to retain the natural curvature of the spine as opposed to slouching. While sitting, the upper body would mirror the position of the chest in the standing position.
One is to take a big breath and sigh. (Repeat this many times throughout a practice session) and the other is to take a big breath and simply say, “Hello my name is (your name here).”

Although one exercise is about speech and the other is about breathing and breath sound they are wonderful exercises because of the simplicity involved. A hitch or stoppage of air right before exhaling is also common in vocal pedagogy and vocalists address it with vocal tract shaping. Similar to trumpet players, vocalists want to have the same sound throughout all the registers. If tension is present in the throat of a vocalist when singing, the sound will be “constricted and it will stifle the tone.” The reason these simple breathing exercises are beneficial is that if the throat is tense or closed off it is easy for the teacher and the student to hear tension in the sound of the breath or the spoken voice. Obviously these can be difficult to do in a performance but the key is to revisit them often so an unrestricted air stream becomes a natural process.

**Imagery-Based Exercises**

Imagery-based exercises are designed so that students can see the results of airflow or wind in motion and they are both common in vocal and trumpet pedagogy. However, there are several important differences between the exercises a singer might do and the exercises I would prescribe for a trumpet student. According to Dr. Pamela Phillips, Director of the American Musical Theatre Conservatory and author of *Singing*

---

176 Dr. Jeffrey Reynolds, Professor at the University of Toronto, shared this exercise with me, 2009.
178 Ibid.
for Dummies (2010), there are two common imagery-based exercises that vocalists utilize; visualizing that the air weighs fifty pounds when inhaling and secondly, blowing a feather around a room in every direction.\textsuperscript{179} Dr. Phillips claims the heavy air concept is beneficial because it creates imagery of air falling low into the body.\textsuperscript{180} A trumpet player needs to be encouraged to move the air out past the embouchure and through the instrument so “heavy air” has a negative connotation. While it may be beneficial for a vocalist to blow a feather around a room because of the type of movement they may have to do on stage, I do not see the value in it for a trumpet player because it seems to defeat the purpose of a natural and relaxed approach.

The following exercises are beneficial for instrumentalists because they will help students develop tangible breath imagery that can be applied later to the instrument. They should be carried out away from the instrument at the beginning of a practice session or when required during rehearsals. Begin by holding out a piece of paper in front of the mouth at varying distances and blow towards the bottom of the paper, making sure it is moving. As long as you are working with older students, you can ask them to blow out the flame from a lighter or a candle from varying distances. Finally, blowing into the palm of the hand allows the student to feel a concentrated air stream, I like to begin with the palm of the hand close to the face but on subsequent repetitions the hand can be moved outwards to increase the distance. The ultimate goal with these exercises or breathing devices, such as a breathing tube or a breathing bag, is to develop an inhalation and exhalation process that is seamless and natural and then apply it to the

\textsuperscript{180} Ibid.
music. Although there are slight variations in the exercises they are all meant to complement each other.

**Playing the Mouthpiece**

Keith Johnson, former Professor of Trumpet at the University of North Texas and author of *The Art of Trumpet Playing* (1981) writes, “Mouthpiece practice greatly enhances one’s understanding and appreciation of the importance of producing sounds with all the skillful simplicity possible…Practicing the mouthpiece reduces playing to its most elementary level.” ¹⁸¹ It is difficult to create an argument against Mr. Johnson’s statement because the mouthpiece, (along with wind and lip vibration) provides the initial source of sound. However, one of the pitfalls when playing the mouthpiece is that students fall into doing mindless drills. I encourage my students to play children’s songs or other familiar pieces because playing songs that you would otherwise sing brings us back to the basic concept of staying closely linked to the voice. Playing on the mouthpiece is similar to the voice in that there are no valves or use of overtone series so perform the songs on the mouthpiece just as you would sing them and focus on the following: an uninhibited breath, free flowing air, resonant sound, correct pitch, and phrasing. Developing these skills on the mouthpiece can later be transferred to the trumpet.

When children start singing songs, the majority of them have very little knowledge of how the voice works. Yet they begin to develop breath support, tone quality, articulation, intonation, and phrasing, all of which are applicable to instrumental

performance. By playing familiar vocal songs on the mouthpiece, not only are these concepts being reinforced, but also the voice begins to serve as a model for emulation. As Arnold Jacobs stated, “Buzzing on the mouthpiece will connect thought through tissue...Mouthpiece playing should be aggressive, tonal, articulate, and interpretative. Play music, not drills on the mouthpiece.”

Establishing a Tonal Concept

In order to establish a tonal concept with trumpet students I have found it useful to use the terms placement and projection because it helps to move the sound out beyond the body and the instrument. The placement theory can be traced back to vocal pedagogy as it is often referred to as singing in the mask. This provides another link between the voice and the trumpet.

It was during the Bel Canto era that singing in the mask and the concept of resonance imagery became an indicator of a pleasing tone quality and good vocal function. The mask consists of the “nasal pharynx, the sinuses, cheekbones, and the back of the teeth” and is often used in reference to vocalists who possess a ringing tone. It encompasses the area from the upper lip extending up to above the eyes and reaching around to the back of the ears. As the mask area contains many bones, aiming the sound into the mask creates resonance in the bones helping the voice to project.

As part of my undergraduate program I participated in a vocal techniques course with Winston Purdy, Professor of Voice at McGill University. In preparation for my vocal jury at the end of the semester, I found that when I sang my throat would ache very

---

182 Nelson, Also Sprach Arnold Jacobs, 29-31.
183 Stark, Bel Canto: A History of Vocal Pedagogy, 51
184 Ibid.
quickly. Professor Purdy suggested there would be considerable improvement if I could shift my sound into the mask because it would take pressure off my throat, allowing me to focus on vowel and consonant clarity and hence, open up my sound. Purdy explained the primary goals of resonant imagery,

> It is imperative for vocalists to start by focusing on the placement of the first note of the phrase and continue singing the rest of the phrase in the mask setting. Although the pitches change in the phrase the placement of sound and resonant qualities do not. (Vocal Techniques, unpublished lecture notes, Purdy, 1993)

In contrast to how vocalists refer to this concept, trumpeters do not have to try and place the sound into the mask, but the concept of sound placement or projecting is a helpful tool for developing a consistent and resonant sound in all registers.

Every trumpeter’s sound is unique and ultimately our tonal concept may determine our overall success with the instrument. Hákan Hardenberger, who I believe is the greatest trumpet soloist today, states, “I had a personal sound very early on, to the point where you could turn on the car radio and you can hear it is me…For a musician, especially a trumpet player, the sound is the image of the soul.” In addition, Hardenberger believes that he is very lucky because he has been able to develop his sound in great concert halls, which has allowed him to see what it means to play *pianissimo*, but a *pianissimo* that goes to every inch of the hall. In contrast to Hardenberger, some students sound as if their tone barely makes it past the bell of the

---

185 Hákan Hardenberger, interview with author. 3 January 2012.
186 Hardenberger, 3 January 2012.
horn. The use of imagery and using a specific location in the hall or beyond the bell as a focal point will help the student place the sound well beyond the embouchure and even the instrument.

Another way to develop a tonal concept is to have students listen to recordings of great singers and try to verbalize what it is about a particular voice that they like. While there are many excellent singers I have found great value in listening to Elizabeth Schwarzkopf, Kathleen Battle, Jussi Björling, and Bryn Terfel because for me, these vocalists possess an endless palate of colours and shadings, vocal power and gradations of intensity, and the ability to give every word and phrase meaning. Students should be encouraged to not only listen to singers but also listening to professional trumpeters since it will develop expressive ideas that can be applied to the instrument, a vital aspect of a musician’s education. Critical listening is strongly recommended because it is difficult to establish an aesthetic ideal if there are no comparative experiences on which to base our knowledge. Having detailed discussions with students concerning aspects that can be transferrable to trumpet will also help to clarify the evasive idea of being voice-like. Additionally, students should be encouraged to perform a section of vocal music after verbalizing the qualities they identified in the voice and try to produce a replica of those qualities in an endeavour to literally emulate the voice. This works very well on both the instrument and actually singing it.

Articulation

Vincent Cichowicz wrote, “We have to base articulation on singing – otherwise, we will get undesirable percussive effects of tonguing. Essentially, the production has to
still be vocal.”\textsuperscript{187} Clear diction for vocalists promotes “good intonation, text comprehension, and expressiveness in performance.”\textsuperscript{188} Evidently, Constantin Stanislavski shared a similar perspective for actors when he wrote that, “Actors must acquire an unbroken line of sound similar to that of a vocalist and this could be achieved by excellent diction.”\textsuperscript{189} Diction is a fundamental part of singing and is examined here to see what parallels can be drawn and then applied to the trumpet. In an article entitled, \textit{The Singer’s Dilemma: Tone versus Diction} Shirlee Emmons writes,

\begin{quote}
The singer’s indefatigable quest for a higher level of expression defines the basic elements of singing. They are two: the musical element of the voice (accurate, sustained vowels) and the expressive communication of speech (well-defined consonants). Singers and their teachers seek a diction that is as clear as speech. (Emmons, http://www.shirlee-emmons.com/diction.html)
\end{quote}

Clearly, the existence of a voice-like ideal and all of the attention paid to it suggests that articulation on the trumpet carries the same importance that diction does for vocalists and actors alike.

The difficulty in teaching articulation is that the entire process is hidden from view and therefore it is difficult to discuss articulation without mentioning some of the physiological aspects of playing. Yet in this absence of visible cues our most reliable asset is listening for a good balance between tongue and air. A balanced articulation occurs with a fast ‘T’ consonant while emphasizing air and vowel (‘OOO’) as opposed to

\textsuperscript{187} Luis Loubriel, \textit{Back to Basics for Trumpeters} (Chicago: Scholar Publications, 2009), 119.
\textsuperscript{188} Debra Cairns, http://www.choralcanada.org/(accessed July 16, 2013)
\textsuperscript{189} Constantin Stanislavski, \textit{Building a Character} Translated by Elizabeth Reynolds Hapgood. (New York: Routledge, 1946), 88-91.
emphasizing the consonant (‘T’).\textsuperscript{190} This provides an interesting correlation between vocal and trumpet pedagogy because the vowel also represents a continuous, uninterrupted stream of air for vocalists.\textsuperscript{191} Although the standard and desired consonant sound is ‘TU’ (think ‘tOOOO’) or ‘TOH’ (think ‘tOOOH’), periodically there is a need for ‘DU’, which is especially effective for legato passages. Similar to that of a singer, trumpeters need to develop numerous articulations that range from a delicate whisper to strong percussive tonguings; however, it is the character of the music (or ideals of the section leader) that ultimately indicates the type of articulation that should be used.

The following exercises establish a relaxed approach to articulation by eliminating a stoppage of air, either by the tongue or throat closure. Start by blowing into the palm of your hand without any articulation. Repeat, but this time add a ‘tOOOO’ articulation. Repeat both exercises above, except hold up a piece of paper and blow into the bottom third paper of the paper. Follow this by producing the desired articulation on the mouthpiece. Complete the process by playing the desired articulation on the trumpet. If articulation problems occur with the instrument, repeat the earlier steps in the process without the trumpet.

Interestingly, at the time of writing this chapter, my son is six months old. Each night before he falls asleep in his crib he sings away exploring many phonetic possibilities. Most, if not all, of the words are unintelligible but at the same time definite consonant and vowels are being sounded. This serves as an important reminder that a

\textsuperscript{190} Arnold Jacobs. “Mind Over Metal”. 
child-like approach, that is, not thinking too much about the actual process of what the tongue does when forming words, allows for teaching with simplicity. Because articulations help the trumpeter to express emotion, an effective technique for teaching articulation at any stage is to not separate it from artistry.

**Ways to Emulate the Voice: Expansion and Phrasing Exercises**

One of the most significant ways to emulate the voice is to emphasize phrasing. Vincent Cichowicz composed a series of warm-ups that over the years have become commonly known as Long Tone Studies, VC I / VC II, or Flow Studies. They are a set of simple melodies that are to be transposed down chromatically to include all valve combinations and eventually expanded to incorporate the upper tessitura. His approach to playing them was simple; play the exercises with a free and steady sound, connect the notes together, and phrase as if a beautiful solo was being played. These exercises also incorporate many basics of trumpet playing such as dynamic range, upper register, positive airflow, and articulations. But most importantly the exercises are to be played in an expressive musical fashion. I was not introduced to the Cichowicz exercises until I was a teenager but I make a point of exposing these to students early since the exercises develop phrasing and the concept of playing through the line.

An alternative set of exercises that I believe are beneficial for establishing a vocal approach are the “Alternative Warm-Ups II (3b)” found in *Warm-ups and Studies* (1978), written by James Stamp. Stamp (1904 -1985) is internationally acknowledged to have

---


193 James Stamp, *Warm-ups + Studies*

been one of the great teachers of brass playing rudiments and his exercises focus on connecting or flowing from one note centre to the next without letting up the air, similar to singing. Pursuing this concept further is Jim Thompson, currently Professor of Trumpet at the Eastman School of Music. Thompson tells us that one of the best ways to emulate the voice is to connect the notes. His idea broadens our understanding by asking us to actually sing and evaluate what happens. He suggests that if we sing up a perfect fourth, using the syllable ‘A-AAH’, it results in a very fast and good glissando. He maintains that the glissando is the key to the vocal sound and insists that this is vital to a vocal approach on the trumpet.¹⁹⁴

Figure 1

Håkan Hardenberger uses a further example of singing to help clarify the connecting concept,

There are a lot of players out there who can’t play a large interval slurred. But when they sing the interval you hear ‘ah – HA’, which gives them the right air speed to land straight into the slurred note. But when they go back to the trumpet they tense up and don’t do what they did when they sang it, hence not a clean slur. (Hardenberger, 2012)

The historical significance of this legato or portamento concept has been the basis of the

vocal art since the Middle Ages. Guido d’Arezzo, (991-1050) a Benedictine monk who is credited with changing neumatic notation to the modern notation that we use today, wrote, “Voices [tones] should melt together…so that one tone begun seems limpidly to flow into another.” More recently, James Starks defines the *portamento* ideal for vocalists,

*Portamento* is meant nothing but a passing, tying the voice, from one note to the next with perfect proportion and union, as much is ascending as descending. It will then become more and more beautiful and perfected the less it is interrupted by taking a breath, because it ought to be a just and limpid gradation, which should be maintained and tied in the passage from one note to another. (Stark 1999, 165)

What is crucial to Hardenberger’s point of view, also shared by Cichowicz, Stamp, and Thompson is that we should play each note with direction, without letting up, making certain there is a total connection of sound if we are to achieve an emulation of the voice.

**Lyrical or Cantabile Studies**

Lyrical studies should be an essential part of a vocal approach curriculum. Early in Cichowicz’s teaching career he compiled a book of lyrical etudes from a variety of sources. In the Introduction of his book he wrote,

These studies are an important medium in which to develop a free, flexible production of sound upon which all aspects of trumpet technique depend. It would be a mistake to view

---

them solely as a means to develop finger dexterity. Herbert L. Clarke, who deplored so called "long tone" studies, espoused the practice of material with movement instead of long tones (i.e.: Technical Studies) and is the forefather of this concept. These studies are an extension and elaboration of this principal. They are most effective when practiced at moderate speeds, taking care to produce a clear, flexible sound and that the connection of the notes be smooth and without distortion. I view finger dexterity as a collateral benefit rather than the main purpose of these etudes. Further benefit may be had by utilizing varied articulations and transpositions. (Cichowicz, unpublished)

Many concepts such as an uninterrupted airflow, consistency of sound in all registers, phrasing, and artistry are all found in cantabile studies and are relevant applications of a vocal approach. Perhaps the biggest challenge in Cichowicz’s compilation is that even in the more technical etudes the lyrical properties should always be present, making an obvious connection to a well-trained voice.

**Vocalises**

As stated in Chapter One, vocal teachers use vocalises to improve the quality of phrasing, agility, flexibility, and extend the range of the voice. Trumpet pedagogy has used vocalises for decades to help develop similar concepts. An alternative way to further develop a vocal approach with vocalises is to work with a pianist on this diverse repertoire. In the university setting it is usually mandatory that when a vocalist has a lesson they pay to have an accompanist. Yet, when trumpeters are working on vocalises, very rarely do they work in this collaborative format. One of the reasons for this is that

---

197 Vocalises help the trumpeter to develop airflow through a phrase, ease of playing as opposed to forcing, a consistent sound in all registers, playing a lyrical line with a free and beautiful sound, phrasing, legato and portamento styles of playing, and slurring larger intervals.
the majority of vocalises that are marketed towards trumpet players such as Bordogni, Rochut and some editions of Concone, usually only contain a single melody line.\textsuperscript{198}

Håkan Hardenberger believes working with piano accompaniment provides an opportunity to work on intonation, which further supports the importance of working with a pianist. Hardenberger states that, “Intonation is not always about fitting into the chord vertically; intonation can also be horizontal. Sound can lead in certain directions and not necessarily fit into the chord, but it eventually resolves to create emotion, and that is emulating the voice.”\textsuperscript{199} The advantage of using an accompanist is that pianists are not concerned with technical aspects of the trumpet, and therefore this provides an opportunity to work on ideas related to expression.

**Applications of Stanslavski’s “Magic If”**

There are two ways we can apply Stanislavski’s concept of the “Magic If” when working with instrumentalists. From an early age, people imitate others that they want to be like because it gives them a sense of confidence to role-play in the shoes of another person without the risk of failure. Imitation is a direct application of the “Magic If” because instrumentalists can identify a musician that they admire for the qualities that sets them apart and they can begin to emulate the sound of that performer. Several years ago I began to test Stanslavski’s “Magic If” with classical instrumental music majors at Mohawk College in a solo performance class. I explained that the “Magic If” principles had the potential to shape a piece, a phrase, or even a single note, but would work only in

\textsuperscript{198} The *Complete Vocalises of Giuseppe Concone*, edited by John Korak (2008), includes Smart Music piano accompaniment and a printable piano part.

\textsuperscript{199} Hardenberger, interview with author. 3 January 2012.
conjunction with consistent practice and application of the concept. The students were encouraged to apply the ideas to their own performance and a course requirement was to observe and document in a pedagogy journal how the “Magic If” helped to improve the performance of their colleagues.

The following questions and directives were presented to the class at Mohawk College to explore this concept; what defines an exceptional instrumentalist? Who do you admire and why? What qualities in their performance set them apart from the rest? What if you were able to play just like them? Use your imagination and pretend that you are in fact, that person. How do they hold themselves physically as they walk on to the stage? Allow yourself to hear their sound in your ears and become that person. Now play. After performing, reflect on what differences, if any, were present in your playing. Allowing yourself to “become” another performer and imagining, “what if I was that instrumentalist”, gives you permission to emulate the qualities that you identified as exceptional.

One important observation during this informal study was that the “Magic If” has a positive impact on music performance. For example, when a tuba player first performed some of J.S. Bach’s Cello Suites his interpretation was at a basic level (i.e., most notes and articulations were correct, but it lacked phrasing and conviction). After encouraging him to create some “Magic If” questions such as “How would Arnold Jacobs play this?” or “How would Yo Yo Ma perform this?” he started to make progress. However, before he made progress this student needed to discern and identify what qualities constitute an exceptional tuba player and cello player. Once he understood these qualities it became more tangible that he might be able to replicate the same in his own
performance of the piece.

A further extension and second application of this exercise is to ask the instrumentalist to examine the piece they are performing and to discover what the aim of the music is. The character of the music has a particular message that needs to be communicated and once the student has identified what the message is the student can begin to imagine himself or herself in the story and connect to the emotions that come with it. For example, if the piece is an exploration of war, turmoil, or grief, the instrumentalist can apply the concept of the “Magic if” by asking himself or herself, what if I were in this scenario? How would I feel? What emotions are connected to this part of the message for me? Each “Magic If” question is rooted in a personal response so it forces the instrumentalist to use his or her imagination instantaneously, giving the student the ability to apply his or her own personal experiences to the music.

A good example of this concept was a guitar student in my performance class performing a *Barcarolle, Julia Florida* composed by Agustín Barrios. While her first performance showed some technique deficiencies, I was more concerned with the lack of understanding of the *Barcarolle* style. I reminded her that the style should be similar to an Italian folk song and reminiscent of a Venetian gondolier and she needed to immerse herself in this style. When I spoke to her the following week she told me about her Italian heritage and she was now going to go to Venice for two weeks at Christmas. When she performed this particular piece on her recital six months later the level of performance was extremely high and her immersion in the Italian folk song repertoire gave the student the ability to apply her own personal experiences to the music. Another observation I made with this student was the ineffectiveness of the “Magic If” if the
instrumentalist is fighting technique or does not fully understand the score. If the musician has learned the music well, the “Magic If” has potential to provide the instrumentalist with a much broader palette of emotions and expression from which to create music.

The basis for Stanislavski’s “Magic if” is its pursuit of emotional truth. As stated above, the term truth for Stanislavski is based on whether an emotional connection was perceived by the audience, not whether the basis of the emotion was from a real life event experienced by the actor. The hope is that when an instrumentalist uses this concept to personalize their approach to the music, either by imitating the qualities of a virtuosic performer or by connecting to the emotions of the musical message, that the end result will communicate emotion. I have found that the application of this concept in my teaching has yielded greater success for the instrumentalists with whom I am working. When we discuss a vocal approach and the avenue that we need to take to achieve it, tangible exercises like these ones tend to resonate more with the students than the less specific, but widely used approach of “Can you make it sing more”, or “Can you play it with more emotion.” While that is the end result that we hope to achieve, it lacks the how that the “Magic If” provides.

**Practical Applications of a Vocal Approach towards Trumpet Repertoire**

As mentioned in Chapter One, Gregorian chant was an important aspect of church services in the Middle Ages and became a cornerstone of Western art music. Because one of the most commonly required orchestral excerpts at trumpet auditions is the off-stage solo from the second movement of Ottorino Respighi’s *Pines of Rome*, the connection between Gregorian chant and trumpet performance and pedagogy is of great
importance. Respighi’s performance instructions for “Pini Presso una Catacomba” (Pines Near a Catacomb) states, "From the depth rises the sound of mournful psalm singing, floating through the air like a solemn hymn, and gradually and mysteriously dispersing." Respighi’s description directly emphasizes singing and as discussed in Chapter One; his notion of singing a psalm resonates with Richard Crocker’s assertion about chant in its references to a sound that ascends and disappears. When interpreting Respighi’s comments in conjunction with the mention of mournfulness and solemnity, it is entirely consistent with Crocker’s “ascent to eternity and serenity.” In other words, Respighi’s instructions make it clear that his goal is to provide the listener with an emotional experience. The implication, then, is that by understanding more about chant, and specifically what the current thought is on their performance by vocalists, we as trumpet performers can enhance our performances of this specific orchestral literature.

Since Respighi clearly states that his intent is for the piece to mimic a chant, the goal of the following exercise is to challenge the trumpeter to perform the piece as if it were actually a chant. An effective way to approach studying this trumpet solo with a general understanding of conventions of chant performance in mind would be to use a score that has no note stems and no time signature (Figure 2). In addition to this, eliminating the bar lines in this exercise has the potential to realize in sound a particular understanding of what a vocal approach might be, especially as it relates to Respighi’s sonic vision.

As a means of identifying specific emotions that can be communicated in the piece, integrating several original exercises based on Stanislavski’s “Magic If” may also prove to be very beneficial. In the rehearsal phase the following emotion connection exercises can assist the player in developing the character of a piece in order to convey an intended emotion to the listener.

**Exercise One (Based on Stanislavski’s Given Circumstances)**

Using the *Pines of Rome* excerpt (or another piece of solo literature) complete the following: obtain a general knowledge about the political, social and economic climate at the time the piece was written. Determine what you think the composer is trying to communicate through this piece of music. Look for cues in the music itself that will help to convey a theme or message. (Motivic, rhythmic, tonal relationships, style, and tempo,
etc.) Once you have established the facts of the piece, you can now begin to attach personal emotional experiences to the work so that it takes on a life and voice.

**Exercise Two**

Play a recording of the music with the score in front of you. As the music is playing write down emotions that you feel in each section. Now take each emotion that you identified and think of a time that you have felt that emotion in your life. Write down a word in that same section that will remind you of this personal experience. Using the trumpet, perform a section with that experience in mind – stop and start over each time you feel you lose connection with the image or experience.

**Exercise Three**

This exercise asks the student to write original lyrics to the *Pines of Rome* solo (or a selected solo piece from any era) and attach emotion to specific sections. Writing lyrics to a piece of music suggests a foundation for a vocal approach since it creates bonds between words, the score, and expressive performance. When the text has been completed imagine you are a great operatic tenor or soprano and really sing those lyrics as you play the instrument. By using Adolph Herseth’s concept of creating lyrics to develop a narrative for our playing, the musician is applying a “Substitution” similar to what Stanislavski established with his method. This exercise establishes some potentially useful conceptual and pragmatic linkages to a vocal approach because it encourages the musician to use imagery. Vincent Cichowicz believed that imagery had the potential to create an aesthetic message that would pull all of the components of trumpet playing together. Cichowicz stated, “If the musical thought you want to convey is clear in your mind the result will be reflected in the appropriate application of the techniques required
to achieve your goal.”

One of the key aspects of performing the *Pines of Rome* solo well is playing efficiently; a good airflow provides a good sound. While we are obligated to play with the correct articulations, tempo, notes, and rhythms, other qualities such as expressiveness and tone are purely up to the individual. A common problem with performances of this excerpt is that the quality and presentation of sound is not the same in the upper tessitura as it is in the lower register. One way to address this is by using *Clarke’s Second Study* from the *Technical Studies* book.

Figure 3

If we were to create a visual representation of the contour of the musical line it may look something like this:

![Graphical representation of the contour of a musical line]

When the study is played similar to the shape of the musical line the presentation of sound is inconsistent. One of the problems that students encounter with Clarke’s study is the difficulty of maintaining consistent tone on the repeated pitch on the first and fourth

---

eighth note of each grouping. When this exercise is transposed to the upper register, the inconsistency in sound only becomes more apparent.

Some of the issues emerging from the Clarke study will also be magnified when performing the solo from the *Pines of Rome* because of the chordal structure and large intervals. The mask concept can be helpful here because when the vocalist is singing in the mask the sound remains consistent from note to note despite the pitches changing. Furthermore, it encourages the vocalist to think of the sound as being forward or in front of the face. This is applicable for a trumpeter insofar that consistency of sound needs to remain the same and thinking forward or projecting can help the trumpeter to move the air through the trumpet, which helps the overall tone and projection.

The concept of resonance and quality of sound can be developed further on the trumpet through *vocalises*.

![Figure 4, Lyrical Studies for Trumpet #1, Giuseppe Concone. Musical excerpt is used with the permission of the publisher: www.editions-bim.com](image)

Although there are going to be alterations that occur with air speed and lip tension, the basic approach of keeping the notes sounding or resonating is similar to the *bel canto* practices and contemporary teachers. A well-produced vocal sound will seem to be floating because successful vocalists are encouraged to let go and trust their technique to
achieve this seemingly effortless approach, especially in the upper range.\textsuperscript{202} However, many trumpet students do the exact opposite. Trumpeters have a tendency to grip the upper register with tension or fear, but this only produces a tight sound, which is not acceptable in vocal approach. Another by-product of tension is that we end up pinching our embouchure and our air stops both at the source and at the lips.

During several repertoire coachings on R. Murray Schaffer’s \textit{Aubade} (for unaccompanied voices or trumpet) in 2010, Mary Morrison, Professor of Voice at the University of Toronto, reflected on how having a consistent sound can help with endurance. While Schaffer’s piece is not long, it does keep both soloists in a fairly high tessitura with very little rest. As we can see in the excerpt, (Figure 5) the repetitive ascending melodic pattern is used as a basis for variation and passed between the soloists. The lowest notes in this excerpt are in the mid-range for both soloists, however both the soprano and myself were dealing with endurance issues towards the end of the piece. Professor Morrison suggested if both of us could imagine that our mid range was C\textsuperscript{5} (the C above middle C), and move to the upper and lower notes from there, this may ease our endurance issues. This created a feeling that all the notes were within a frame. Not only did her advice improve endurance, it alleviated the issue of reaching up and down for pitches.

\textsuperscript{202} Winston Purdy, MUCT 235, Vocal Techniques, McGill University, 1993.
By focusing on the mid-range, the position of the notes stay constant and all notes are sung or played in relation to the original (mid) position, making this one of the reasons that vocalists are able to make a musical phrase so natural. While Schaffer’s *Aubade* is high-level repertoire, this concept can be introduced using exercises in the *Arban's Complete Conservatory Method for Trumpet*.\(^{203}\)

**Conclusions**

An important factor for students developing a vocal approach is that a number of other skills must be developed, such as breathing, playing on the mouthpiece, articulation, and establishing a tonal concept; these technical aspects of the instrument are the basis for creating emotion. However, in my experience working with college students, one of the most consistent shortcomings in developing vocal emulation is a lack

of listening. While a major concern is listening for a good breath and the correct pitch, those are primary concepts and characteristics that will eventually lead to a refined sound. Students need to listen to live and recorded performances because it is difficult to establish an aesthetic ideal if there are no comparative experiences on which to base their knowledge.

Vincent Cichowicz exemplifies the application of vocal technique to trumpet pedagogy in that he encouraged his trumpet students to perform vocal works on recitals. He believed that vocal repertoire was important because it would force the trumpeter to accept the challenge of conveying the meaning of the text. Cichowicz wrote, “If you use vocal materials, you can most effectively make the connection between musical thought and musical expression by encouraging the use of a vivid musical imagination in terms of phrasing.” One of the biggest challenges when the text is removed is to still communicate a meaning with only the melody. While understanding the text is a vital first step towards accomplishing this, techniques such as imagery, metaphor, the “Magic if”, promise to take trumpeters even closer to the goal of emotional communication.

A recurrent theme in music treatises is that Western art music has the potential to express and induce emotion and this notion is generally accepted among scholars. Early philosophical writings concerning vocal music were based on the understanding that the music itself acquired emotion via text. As a result, vocal music became the paradigm or ideal for which purely instrumental music was judged. This led to a general hypothesis that emotion in instrumental music is abstract and indeterminate.

---

205 Loubriel, Back to Basics for Trumpeters, 115.
The voice expresses emotion either by emotional vocalizations such as cries and laughter or by the tone of the voice as in speaking or singing. Vocalists communicate musical concepts and literary ideas that often contain drama and emotion and it is the beauty of the singing voice that makes a musical experience human. It is undeniable that our voice contains our history and our personal experiences and so by choosing to emulate the voice on the trumpet we are striving to connect with the consciousness of a human being.

A vocal approach, then, helps trumpeters to replicate the strong visceral connection that is often found between a vocalist and the music. Emulating the voice on the trumpet needs to be based on processing and establishing numerous musical concepts, communicating emotion, and conveying our personal understanding of the music to the listener with conviction. An important consideration then for students striving to emulate the voice, is how to artistically transform emotion so the audience can share the affect with the performer.

A considerable amount of abstractness in instrumental music can be related to the fact that any emotions instrumentalists try to create through performance can only be represented in sounds rather than expressed in text. Although there are compelling explanations about how instrumental music might or might not express emotion one problem remains; very few of these explanations address how instrumentalists communicate emotion off the printed page to the listener. This problem is further compounded because many respected trumpet methods do not refer to expressing emotion.

As I have suggested, understanding a work only through analysis of formal
characteristics suggested by formalists avails a musician of merely some of the insights necessary in creating a valuable artistic interpretation of the composition in performance. In order to make the most of analytical techniques, it is imperative to be aware of a purpose beyond merely identifying structures. Without being able to rely on text as singers do, a trumpeter has to work even harder to convey the composer’s intentions and most any other kind of expressive content. Communicating an emotion by developing a narrative or writing lyrics creates a personal connection to music. Additionally, a narrative analysis lends itself to interpreting a score more like an actor’s script, which may serve as an important bridge to voice-like and emotional trumpet performance.

The benefit of Stanislavski’s method lies in giving and shaping the character of the music. Concepts such as the “Magic If, Inner, and Given Circumstances, and Substitution” promise to be more effective in eliciting musical expression from students rather than vague verbal directives because his method encourages an emotional connection. Just as actors must create an original personification of the character by applying emotion, action, and intellect, a musician can apply these concepts to the interpretative process in order to communicate an imaginative performance of the composition and an individual voice on the trumpet.

I have presented a number of viable strategies that I believe can help performers develop emotion in instrumental performance. Using these diverse concepts is an effective form of teaching vocal emulation because it leads the student to guided discovery. While the approaches may differ, a common link is the use of imagination and ultimately the teacher and student need to discover what is most effective. Not all of the concepts have to be used in a piece but using a variety of ideas allows a vocal approach to
become accessible for all levels and ages. As teachers, a necessary requirement for teaching voice emulation is to have strategies and techniques to help students apply the skill. It is my hope that fellow trumpet teachers and performers will strive to make further connections to the music by adopting the concepts herein so we become more effective and successful singers, who just happen to play the trumpet.
Bibliography


Corredor, J.M. *Conversations with Casals.*

Crocker, Richard. *Introduction to Gregorian Chant.*


Davidson, L & Scripp, L. *Surveying the Coordinates of Cognitive Skills in Music* 

Davidson, R.J., Scherer, K.R. *Handbook of Affective Sciences.*


Duey, Philip, A. *Bel Canto in its Golden Age.*
New York: King’s Crown, 1951.


_________, and Michael Cichowicz, *Vincent Cichowicz: Long Tone Studies.* 


Falkner, Keith. *Voice.*

Fantini, Girolamo. *Modo per Imparare a Sonare di Tromba.*


Frederiksen, Brian. *Arnold Jacobs: Song and Wind.*

Fubini, Enrico. *History of Music Aesthetics.*


Geiringer, Karl. *Instruments in the History of Western Music.*


Grey Thomas S. *Richard Wagner and His World.*

Grout, Donald Jay. *A History of Western Music.*


Helmholtz, Hermann. *On the Sensations of Tone.*


Kay, Elster. *Bel Canto and the Sixth Sense.*


Kent, Timothy. *Within the Sphere of the Master: Trumpet Lessons with Adolph Herseth, Trumpeter Supreme of the Chicago Symphony Orchestra.*


Kivy, Peter. *Introduction to a Philosophy of Music.*

Lee, Vernon. *Studies of the Eighteenth Century in Italy.*
London: Unwin, 1907.

Lehmann, Hans. *Postdramatic Theatre*

Lester, Joel. “Performance and Analysis: Interaction and Interpretation.”
In *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation.*

Levinson, Jerrold. “Song and Music Drama.”

Ling, Dorothy. *The Original Art of Music.*

Lippman, Edward. *A History of Western Musical Aesthetics.*
Lincoln; University of Nebraska Press, 1992.


Mancini, Giambattista. *Practical Reflections of Figured-Singing.*


Marek, Dan, H. *Singing: The First Art.*
Plymouth, Scarecrow Press, Inc. 2007.


**Articles**


Mahrt, William. “Gregorian Chant as a Paradigm of Sacred Music.”


Sawyer, Keith. “Group Creativity: Musical Performance and Collaboration.”


Silva, Guilo. “The Beginnings of the Art of Bel Canto.”
*The Music Quarterly* 8 (January 1922): 53-68.


Whitwell, David. “Introductory Thoughts on the Role of Emotion in Early Music.”


**Interview**


**Dissertations**


**Electronic Resources**


Gary, Fred. “Some Publications of Johann Mattheson.”


Godoski, Andrew. “Method Acting.”


Lucas, Chris. “Creativity and Consciousness.”

Jander, Owen. "Vocalise."

http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/15030c.htm (accessed 6 May 2014)

Moore, Andrew. “Studying Bertolt Brecht”

O’Conner, Karyn. “Singing With an ‘Open Throat’: Vocal Tract Shaping”

http://www.dummies.com/how-to/content/breathing-basics-for-singing.html (accessed June 12, 2014)


“Saint Isidore of Seville.”
Wright, Craig and Brian Simms. “In Their Own Words.”

“The Theatre of the Absurd”

Westley, Ben. “Key Elements of the Kodály Concept.”

“Who is Constantin Stanislavsky and what is the System?”

Yates, Alex. “Cichowicz Philosophies.”