Education In Rhythm and By Rhythm:
Exploring Holistic Experiences in Dalcroze Pedagogy

by

Sharon Elizabeth Dutton

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Curriculum, Teaching, and Learning
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

© Copyright by Sharon Elizabeth Dutton 2015
Abstract

Holistic education seeks to engage students intellectually, physically, spiritually, and emotionally, and to build connections between the student’s inner and outer worlds. Dalcroze Eurhythmics is an approach to music education that uses movement to teach musical concepts in a socially interactive setting. Jaques-Dalcroze developed a system of rhythmic training to provide a foundation for later musical studies; his méthodé also provides students with increased awareness of self and of social and spatial relationships and interactions. This dissertation investigates holistic education as it occurs in Dalcroze pedagogy. Five Dalcroze teachers and students with varying levels of experience were asked to consider and express holistic learning experiences they encountered when participating in Dalcroze classes. The data is developed and portrayed as narratives, guided by the qualitative research philosophies of Beattie, Eisner, and Clandinin and Connelly. The ensuing discussion explores emergent themes that illustrate holistic aspects of the participants’ lived experiences. Dominant themes include: community, global education, mindfulness, transformational learning, creativity, personal connections, and emotional involvement.

Keywords: Holistic Education, Spirituality in Education, Music Education, Dalcroze Pedagogy
Acknowledgements

I consider myself extremely fortunate to be one of Dr. Jack Miller’s doctoral students. His compassionate and insightful approach to education is beyond inspirational, and his extensive research in holistic education has provided the foundation for this dissertation. It is an honour to be part of this very supportive community of holistic education researchers.

I deeply appreciate the support of my thesis committee members, Dr. Linda Cameron for her interest and feedback on this project, and Dr. Lori-Anne Dolloff for her continued support and guidance throughout my 30-year academic journey in music education. A note of gratitude goes to my external examiner, Dr. Rebecca Lloyd, for so carefully reviewing my dissertation. I especially appreciate being included in Lori’s Fireside Gatherings at the Faculty of Music. The ideas, knowledge, and experience I found there have helped shape the ways I think about professional music education.

Words cannot express my gratitude toward the many inspirational Dalcroze teachers I have studied with, in particular, Dr. Marja-Leena Juntunen and Dr. Louise Mathieu. Their lessons never fail to nurture my musical spirit. I also appreciate the support and encouragement of the members of Dalcroze Canada, including the late Donald Himes, diplôme supérieur honoris causa.

This doctoral project could not have happened without the enthusiastic participation of my co-researchers, whose voices I hear and whose faces I see every time I re-read their testimonials. I appreciate their honesty, dedication, and generosity, and I cherish the relationships that we have developed through this narrative research process.
I am grateful to my friends and colleagues for their generous support and light-hearted camaraderie, especially to my long-time friend Dr. Davileen Radigan, a source of unfailing inspiration. To my sisters Louise and Andrea, thank-you for your continued friendship and encouragement. To my grown-up children Emily and Isaac, thank-you for believing in me.

Lastly, but most importantly, to my dear friend Dr. Janet Spring, I could never have done this without your support and encouragement. Words fail.

I will always consider the past eight years among my fondest memories.
Dedication

I dedicate this doctoral thesis to my mother Stella Dutton, who taught me the value of education and life-long learning, and to Dalcroze teachers and students everywhere.
Table of Contents

ABSTRACT......................................................................................................................... ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ...................................................................................................... iii
DEDICATION........................................................................................................................ v

PART I

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................... 1
FOREWORD ........................................................................................................................... 1
MUSICAL BEGINNINGS .......................................................................................................... 3
   Post-Secondary Education .................................................................................................. 6
INTRODUCTION TO DALCROZE PEDAGOGY ..................................................................... 8
   Embodied Musical Experiences ......................................................................................... 9
PROFESSIONAL TEACHING EXPERIENCES AND MOTIVATION FOR RESEARCH ............. 10
   Graduate Studies .............................................................................................................. 12
   Spirituality in Education .................................................................................................. 13
MUSIC AS EMBODIED KNOWLEDGE ................................................................................. 13
   Non-dualistic Ways of Knowing ....................................................................................... 14
HOLISTIC EXPERIENCES WITH DALCROZE PEDAGOGY .................................................... 15
DEVELOPING THE RESEARCH QUESTION ........................................................................ 16
PLANNING THE RESEARCH DESIGN .................................................................................. 17
THE RESEARCH DESIGN ...................................................................................................... 18
   Research Question ........................................................................................................... 18
   Research Sub-questions ................................................................................................... 18
   Sub-question One ............................................................................................................. 18
   Sub-question Two ............................................................................................................ 18
   Sub-question Three ......................................................................................................... 19
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY .......................................................................................... 20
LIMITATIONS TO THE STUDY ............................................................................................. 21
OVERVIEW OF THE DISSERTATION DESIGN .................................................................... 22
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................. 24
  HOLISTIC EDUCATION .................................................................................................. 24
  SPIRITUALITY IN EDUCATION .................................................................................. 26
  BODILY WAYS OF KNOWING .................................................................................... 30
  ARTS-INFUSED EDUCATION AS SPIRITUAL EDUCATION ........................................ 34
  MUSIC AS SPIRITUAL EXPERIENCE .......................................................................... 37
    Community Music ..................................................................................................... 40
    Ritual Music ............................................................................................................ 41
  DALCROZE EURHYTHMICS – HISTORICAL CONTEXT ............................................... 42
    Child-Centred Education and Music Education ..................................................... 45
  DALCROZE PEDAGOGY AND EMBODIED KNOWLEDGE ......................................... 47
  DALCROZE PEDAGOGY AS HOLISTIC EDUCATION ................................................ 50
  CONNECTIONS BETWEEN MUSIC AND MOVEMENT .............................................. 51

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH DESIGN ....................................................................... 53
  QUALITATIVE RESEARCH .......................................................................................... 53
  HERMENEUTICS ......................................................................................................... 54
  ARTS INFORMED AND ARTISTIC PORTRAYALS OF RESEARCH ............................... 55
  RESEARCHING EXPERIENCE THROUGH NARRATIVE INQUIRY ............................... 57
  CONVEYING MEANING IN NARRATIVE RESEARCH ............................................... 58
  NARRATIVE METHODOLOGY AND HOLISTIC EDUCATION .................................. 61
  DATA COLLECTION .................................................................................................. 62
    Recruiting the Participants .................................................................................... 62
    Conducting the Interviews .................................................................................... 63
    Co-constructing the Narratives ............................................................................ 64
  DATA ANALYSIS AND REPORTING ........................................................................ 64
PART II – THE PARTICIPANTS

CHAPTER FOUR: ANN ........................................................................................................................................ 66

BACKGROUND ........................................................................................................................................ 66
PLASTIQUE ANIMÉE ................................................................................................................................. 70
SPIRITUAL CONNECTIONS THROUGH MOVEMENT ........................................................................... 72
BONDING AND TRUST .............................................................................................................................. 76
COMMUNICATION ................................................................................................................................... 77
DALCROZE EDUCATION AS HOLISTIC EDUCATION .......................................................................... 80
TRANSFORMATIONAL LEARNING .......................................................................................................... 82

CHAPTER FIVE: ZANE .................................................................................................................................. 84

BACKGROUND ........................................................................................................................................ 84
SERENDIPITOUS CONNECTIONS .............................................................................................................. 87
EXPERIENCING TRANSFORMATIONAL LEARNING ........................................................................... 88
EXPERIENCING INTERPERSONAL GROWTH AND AWARENESS ...................................................... 91
BONDING AND TRUST .............................................................................................................................. 94
SOMATIC EMPATHY ................................................................................................................................ 96
SELF-ACCEPTANCE ................................................................................................................................... 97
EMOTIONAL RELEASE AND ‘LETTING GO’ ............................................................................................. 97

CHAPTER SIX: MONIQUE ............................................................................................................................ 102

BACKGROUND ........................................................................................................................................ 103
MUSIC EDUCATION AS EQUITY EDUCATION ................................................................................... 106
PRACTICUM .............................................................................................................................................. 110
‘UNEDUCATION’ ..................................................................................................................................... 113
DISCOVERING DALCROZE PEDAGOGY AS EQUITY EDUCATION .................................................. 115
GLOBAL EDUCATION ............................................................................................................................ 119
MONIQUE’S EXPERIENCES AS A FIRST-YEAR TEACHER .................................................................. 123

CHAPTER SEVEN: HANIA ............................................................................................................................. 130

BACKGROUND ........................................................................................................................................ 130
CHAPTER TEN: CONCLUSION ......................................................................................... 207

SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH .............................................................. 218

REFERENCES ........................................................................................................... 223
PART I

Chapter One

Introduction

Foreword

This research project poses and addresses the question, *In what ways does a Dalcroze approach to music education exemplify holistic education?* Dalcroze pedagogy is an approach to music education that utilizes the body’s own rhythmic movements to develop knowledge and understanding about music in a socially interactive setting. According to the participants in Jun-tunen’s (2002) narrative study, “It is music education based upon the individual physical experience, as it connects to the aural and intellectual. The interaction between the sensations, thoughts, emotions, and physical experiences is very important” (pp. 2, 3). The originator of the method, Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) frequently claims that his classes educate students beyond musical skills, and that exercises in rhythmic gymnastics develop the whole person.

Education based on an experience of rhythm evokes and ensures freedom for the greatest number of subconscious manifestations, and those, instead of manifesting themselves wildly, losing half their force because they cannot be concentrated in one direction, will profit by the order and harmony set up in the organism, combine with the conscious powers of the individual and ensure his all-round development. (p. 54)

This research project is not concerned with musical learning per se, but with the learning experiences that occur in Dalcroze classes that concur with holistic education, or the “all-round development” to which Jaques-Dalcroze refers. Holistic education seeks to involve the whole person – body, mind, heart, and especially soul. Orr (2005) explains, “Holistic education means that we strive to teach the whole person as a human soul which includes mind, body, emotions,
and spirit” (p. 87). It is primarily education through Dalcroze pedagogy, of a person’s inner, intuitive, soulful self that I am seeking to explore.

Soulful education involves personal learning and development, but is often confused with religious education. Kessler (2000) describes soul in education as “attention in schools to the inner life; to the depth dimension of human experience; to students’ longings for something more than an ordinary, material, and fragmented existence” (p. x). Moore (1992) claims, “The human soul is not meant to be understood” (p. xix), and reminds us, “Definition is an intellectual enterprise anyway; the soul prefers to imagine” (p. xi). He often refers instead to qualities and experiences of soul, for example: “It has to do with depth, value, relatedness, heart, and personal substance” (p. 5). For my purposes, education of the soul refers to the making of personally meaningful connections and insightful revelations, and to intuitive ways of knowing and understanding our relationships, our surroundings, and ourselves.

This research study is based on narrative methodology, and depicts the personal experiences of five Dalcroze teachers and students. They were asked to consider their Dalcroze experiences in terms of holistic education. They shared their experiences with me during one-on-one interviews, which were then developed into individual narratives, comprising Chapters 4 through 8. These chapters are intended to closely capture and convey the essence of their experiences.

Narrative methodology offers the researcher a means to re-create and to thereby inform the reader of various experiences and points of view. The stories that are told hold and convey meanings that can be understood in context. They offer the potential to elicit an embodied or felt response in the reader. Eisner (1997) comments on artistic research portrayal: “the material presented is more evocative than denotative, and in its evocation, it generates insight and invites attention to complexity” (p. 8). Dalcroze pedagogy is a form of arts education; the experiences
portrayed in this research are very closely linked to personal artistic experience. Beattie (2007b) claims, “Narrative inquiry therefore is seen as an appropriate way in which to research experience and to understand it from the perspective of the individual who is having the experience” (p. 12).

Qualitative research is situated in an interpretative realm. The researcher’s own past experiences and viewpoints will affect the collection and interpretation of the data, its analysis, and its portrayal. Creswell (2007) claims, “Researchers recognize that their own background shapes their interpretation, and they ‘position themselves’ in the research to acknowledge how their interpretation flows from their own personal, cultural, and historical experiences” (p. 20). Barrett and Stauffer (2009) claim,

Implicit in the identification of a researcher’s autobiography as the starting point of narrative inquiry is the need to interrogate the set of beliefs and practices that are brought to the inquiry endeavour, the researcher’s epistemological and ontological stance, and the ethical obligations that extend from these. (p. 12)

I therefore offer my personal background and reasons for pursuing this research to provide contextual perspective for the reader.

Musical Beginnings

When I was a child, my family lived in Cooksville, Ontario on a 2-acre property that I believe was awarded to my father after his service in World War II. My mother had a collection of classical LP’s, while my father collected early rock’n’roll and swing records. My father was an excellent dancer. So was my mother, except she seldom made the time for it. I can still clearly recall a song that I wrote around age five, Here You Left Me, Sitting all Alone in the Darkness. It was set in a ‘Frankie Valli’ style. I must have composed it as a response to my two older (twin) sisters, who were forever being asked by my mother to take me with them, and who would for-
ever make their displeasure crystal clear. But when they came home from school, they would teach me all that they had learned that day at our back porch ‘play-school’.

One Christmas, when I was around eight years old, my grandparents on my father’s side gave my family an apartment size Mason & Risch piano. I was amazed that they could afford such a thing, as we were quite used to never having money for any ‘extras’. My father was a mechanic and for many years, the only breadwinner in a family of six. (Another sister came along when I was five years old.) My mother purchased a beginner method book – *Leila Fletcher Book 1* – and with this book, we three older girls proceeded to teach ourselves to play the piano. We took turns, watching the clock to make sure that no one got a minute more than the allotted 30 minutes of daily practice. When we could play through the entire book in 30 minutes, we were allowed to advance to Book 2. Thus, by the time I was eleven, I worked my way up to Book 4 while my older sisters, who were going on fourteen, lost interest.

I don’t remember learning any music in school until Grade 5, when my home room teacher taught us to sight read using *The New High Road Book of Songs*. With this newly acquired skill, I learned every song in all of the books. She also taught us to play the recorder, and I remember practising for hours in my room (*Cockles and Mussels* was one of my favourites). I was a hysterical 9-year-old when the Beatles made their North American debut on the Ed Sullivan Show in 1964. I cried inconsolably in front of the living room television set, while my parents played cards in the next room with their friends. When my girlfriends got together for sleepovers, we would sing and dance to all of the Beatles songs that had been released. My three sisters and I chose our favourite Beatle to be our future husbands; my favourite was George. We acquired a typewriter a few years later, and I spent a whole summer typing out all the words to all of the Beatles songs – by heart.
When we moved to the suburban community of Rexdale, Ontario, I alone was given formal piano lessons, being the only one in my family who really enjoyed playing. My third piano teacher, an older and very beautiful teacher from the Netherlands became a beloved life-long mentor. Her house was also beautiful, set back in a wooded lot in Thistletown, Ontario, about a 45-minute walk from my high school. Her name, Elske Albarda, can still be found in my library, on repertoire collections that she gave me from time to time. The music was wonderful – all the standard traditional and contemporary piano literature. She was encouraging, cheerful, musical, and highly cultured and I enjoyed playing for her, although her big Heintzman grand piano was much harder to play than our little Mason and Risch. She had an old black Labrador dog named Shanka, who would greet all of her students at the door, and then sleep under the piano for the duration of the lesson. Her husband Jan, was a world-renowned harpsichord builder, and the only harpsichord builder in Canada at that time. Mrs. Albarda would often invite me to play my baroque repertoire on one of his instruments. It was in the early 1970s that she gave me a copy of J. S. Bach’s *Chromatic Fantasy and Fugue*. She must have thought I might learn it someday, because it was much too difficult for me at that time. I still love to play many of the pieces that I learned with her, and we kept in touch after the lessons ended. Years later, I would visit her and Jan in their beautiful old estate home on the Elora River.

I did not encounter music in school again until high school. I took Music as an elective, learned to play the trumpet, and joined the concert band. I was also drawn to Theatre Arts, and was frequently given a lead part in any school musical that our high school produced. My friends and I were all listening to rock music, and I taught myself to play my favourite songs on the piano by ear. Toward the end of my high school career, I formed a band with some of my friends; we called ourselves *Spring Water* and played folk-rock (Bob Dylan, Arlo Guthrie, and James
Taylor repertoire). I sang, played keyboards, and wrote arrangements for the instrumentalists. We performed once for a lunch-time concert at Humber College, but went our separate ways after we graduated. After my grandfather died in 1973, my family moved again, this time into the city of Toronto to be nearer to my grandmother, and I stopped taking lessons. I was in Grade 13 and it was enough to ride the public transit for an hour each way to finish my high school diploma without having to change schools.

**Post-Secondary Education.** Shortly after graduating from high school, I ‘moved out’ with one of my older sisters, (the other was married already). After a year of working as an office clerk, I decided to pursue post-secondary studies in Music. I aspired to be a conductor, and was accepted into a Bachelor of Music program at the University of Western Ontario in London, expecting to get funding from the Ontario Student Awards Program. The funding application was denied, but I went anyway. I found inexpensive, shared accommodations and a part-time job accompanying vocal lessons. I also hitch-hiked back and forth to school to save money. The first year of the program was a general year; the conducting program was offered by the performance department beginning in second year. I knew I had to improve my piano performance skills in order to be admitted to that department. My habit was to arrive on campus as soon as the building opened and practise at school for six hours a day, six days a week. I studied with a well-loved and supportive teacher, Sylvia Novak, and I enjoyed my pieces, but it was a difficult year, with no funding and no support.

To make matters worse, my third floor bedroom ceiling leaked and the plastic roofing tiles slammed open and shut with the London winter winds. I had to ask the University for funding in order to complete the year. My final mark in piano performance was just two marks short of the 75% required to proceed in the performance department and I felt defeated. I finished the
year and eventually moved back to Toronto – coincidentally, next door to a young and aspiring rock guitarist.

I played keyboards with his band and then with a series of other rock bands until I found one that was a good ‘fit’. In hindsight, things were going well, but at the time, I considered the whole rock music experience more as recreation than as potential career. In the late ’70s I moved to British Columbia, married, purchased a piano, continued to take lessons, taught piano at a local studio, and occasionally played for restaurants, churches, weddings, or other functions.

When my marriage collapsed five years later, I decided to return to Ontario with my two young children, and go back to university, this time to become a music teacher. I thought my experience would enable me to be a compassionate and effective teacher; I especially wanted to offer support and understanding to children from single-parent families. Going back to school was a day-by-day allegiance, as both of my children were still very young and I was on my own. As a full-time student I was flexible enough to be available whenever they were sick or needed support and occasionally they came with me to my classes with a craft to work on or a book to read, never causing any fuss, happy to be ‘at university’ with me. It took five years for me to complete the 4-year music education degree program. During this period, I also obtained an Associate of The Royal Conservatory of Toronto diploma (ARCT) in piano pedagogy, an Associate diploma in Music (A. Mus.) from the Canada Conservatory in performance, and a Grade 8 Voice certificate from the Royal Conservatory of Music (RCM). After graduation, I formed a trio with some friends from the music faculty – a violinist and a flautist. We promoted ourselves around Toronto as The Champagne Trio, playing for weddings, corporate and private functions at such venues as the Royal York and the Harbour Castle Hotels in downtown Toronto.
Introduction to Dalcroze pedagogy.

In the music education program of the University of Toronto, I was introduced to the Orff, Kodály, Suzuki, and Dalcroze music pedagogy methods. My introduction to the Dalcroze method was at a weekend workshop held at the RCM during the late ‘80s, given by the late Donald Himes.¹ I sensed immediately that I was getting more out of this workshop as a musician than as a potential teacher. Juntunen (2002) reports a similar observation from the compiled responses of several Dalcroze teachers: “I was already a trained pianist and a composer when I had my first Dalcroze lesson. It was so musical; I felt a huge door opened to me” (p. 1).

I was re-discovering very basic musical concepts such as tempo and pitch, through movement exercises, and with newly awakened and attentive ears! Phrases were not just events in time, but were now moving through space; I was carrying them with my arms, and passing them to other participants. I was experiencing harmonic dissonances by stretching large elastic bands, and discovering relationships between metre and rhythm by bouncing, rolling, and tossing tennis balls across the floor. It occurred to me that everything musical – pitch, harmony, rhythmic nuance – could be experienced and felt through the body, and the body in turn was teaching me an entirely different way to understand these concepts. For me, this was a completely new way of knowing and learning about music, about which I knew very little. I also realized that although I had attained a respectable degree of competency at the piano, I had no understanding of the embodied aspect of music. The newly acquired embodied knowledge could not be unlearned; it positively affected my musical performance, my artistic understanding, and my future pathway.

¹ Donald Himes (1930–2011) was a highly respected dancer, musician, composer, choreographer, director, and Dalcroze master-teacher.
**Embodied Musical Experiences.** The sensation of embodying rhythm and of allowing my body to respond to musical improvisations awakened my mind and heart to new layers of meaning in the language of music. The shapes and embodied sensations of musical nuances re-appeared in my piano playing, infusing it with new energy, insight, and depth of communication. I realized that my musical understanding up to that point had been incomplete. I had understood music only partially, cognitively and analytically – not entirely without emotion and sensitivity, but certainly without the depth and insight that embodying musical nuance provided.

I attended a week-long Dalcroze session at York University in Toronto one summer, and discovered by the end of the week that there were significant consequential learning outcomes in my life besides musical development. There was an overall improvement in my relationships in general. It felt coincidental at the time, but I attribute it now to a personal sense of connection and wholeness that I had developed by the end of the week. In hindsight, I believe that it was the playful character of the classes and the multiplicity of connections that enabled me to be more joyful, accepting, and open-hearted with everyone else in my life, and to so joyously embrace these first Dalcroze Eurhythmics class. By approaching music through the rhythmic body rather than through the intellect, I was discovering music's ability to simultaneously engage mind, body, and spirit, allowing me to ‘play’ in an artistic, creative, and spiritual sense.

During my fourth year at the University of Toronto, I visited with Mrs. Albarda in Elora, and told her about my Dalcroze experience. I remember feeling surprised to learn that she had also studied Dalcroze Eurhythmics as a child in Holland, and was quite familiar with the pedagogy. When I also told her that I was learning to play Bach’s *Chromatic Fantasy and Fugue* – the piece that she had given me 15 years earlier – she invited me to play it for an upcoming recit-
al at the Wellington County Museum, which of course, I did. It was also the last time that I saw her.

**Professional teaching experience and motivation for research.**

I eventually became a full-time music teacher for the Halton District Board of Education. My first position was at my community high school where my son was in Grade 11, and my daughter in Grade 9, but it was only an occasional position. I accepted a permanent position teaching a band program in a middle school in Oakville, and soon realized that the band program excludes many students in multicultural classrooms, because of their former community experiences and cultural differences in terms of musical traditions. Some of the ‘English as a Second Language’ (ESL) students were not familiar with major-minor tonality, and unlike the local students, many had not had two or three years of learning to play the recorder as preparation for band instruments. Many ESL families believed that music was something that belonged in church or at family events, and some tried to remove their children from music class altogether and into an extra mathematics class instead. Roughly half of my students were from non-western countries, with varying degrees of experience with western culture. Many of the ESL students were clearly at a cultural disadvantage in the band program. My formal western background, training, and perceptions of music were foreign to the backgrounds and cultures of many of my students. In order to teach equitably, I was challenged to adjust not only the curriculum expectations, but also my approach to teaching.

Ontario’s 1998 Ministry of Education curriculum document stressed achievement, and policy was rigidly clear: all students were to be evaluated based on their achievement of the specific expectations, regardless of circumstance or ability. Clearly this was not an appropriate directive for the ESL students, who would need years of encultured musical experiences to be mu-
sically equivalent to the local students. My principal understood and was supportive of my concerns, but the business and politics of education in Ontario were in a deliberate crisis mode. Teachers were mandated to not only deliver the ministry curriculum, but also to provide an assessment based exclusively on observable evidence of achievement. The band approach could not provide equitable learning experiences for my diverse student populations. I wondered:

What is it that really matters in music education and what would be the most valuable experiences that I can provide for my students?

I continued to study Dalcroze pedagogy by attending workshops and by spending several weeks every summer in training classes in the United States. I practised eurhythmics games and developed eurhythmics lessons to use with my students in class.² The eurhythmics exercises provided a way to equalize the ability level in my classes, as well as provide a grounded, embodied approach to learning musical concepts. In my classes, I gradually spent less time on band technique, and more time on movement and creativity. For example, I asked my students to create sound and movement patterns to accompany a poem. The net result was a beautiful combination of creative movement and choral speech. Together with an excellent visual arts teacher, we developed integrated arts projects for our students, which enabled them to create their own instruments, and to develop and perform their own music based on parameters other than those of traditional western music. The ESL students appreciated the opportunity to be expressive, and created beautiful instruments and music. We were invited to present our work to other arts teachers in our board. But not everyone was happy with our equitable solutions. Some parents wanted

² See examples of Dalcroze Eurhythmics classes at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wEy6oe_t-U (lessons and explanation by Lisa Parker, Longy School of Music) and at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TZwyXjg12Y (students from the Dalcroze Institut, Geneva)
their children to continue with the band program so that they would be better prepared for high school music.

**Graduate Studies.** It was with an intention to research and engage in a more equitable music education praxis\(^3\) that I entered the Music Education Master’s degree program at the University of Toronto. One pedagogical principle resonated very clearly with me: in order to become a great teacher, I needed to look inward to critique my personal teaching philosophy, to develop strong character traits, and to be a person who would be a positive influence on my students.

When I read Karen Agne’s (1999) article, *Caring, the way of the Master Teacher*, I discovered the benefits of teaching from an educational perspective that is based on compassion:

> We do not teach; we facilitate the learning of another. And apparently we facilitate best by presenting ideas in a setting that we have prepared to be the most conducive to each student’s highest level of focus, a setting that offers the most care. (p. 167)

Olson (2009) reinforces this philosophy; “the live connection between two human beings in the instructional environment – the emotional experience of this interaction – is the soul of educative practice” (p. 166).

When an opportunity to transfer schools presented itself to me, I accepted a teaching assignment much closer to home, teaching Kindergarten through Grade Five music. I incorporate the methods and pedagogical principles of Orff, Dalcroze, and Kodály into my lessons, to enable my students to be as freely creative and expressive as possible. I am very grateful for my double-size, fully equipped music room, and for the five large windows that look out onto our ‘Peace Garden.’ I play my guitar and sing every day, dance, play musical games, play the piano, and

\(^3\) Regelski (2013) explains *praxis*: “to be praxis, the conduct of music education must be ‘informed' by theoria of various kinds” (p. 140).
practise eurhythmics with the students. There are still challenges here, but more or less, it feels again like a good ‘fit.’

**Spirituality in Education.** I began studying spirituality in education as a doctoral student at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE) with Dr. John Miller as my faculty advisor. Dr. Miller teaches several courses about holistic education at OISE. His students maintain and explore various spiritual practices, including meditation, mindfulness, and creating art. Dr. Miller spoke of spirituality in education as “timeless learning”, as being in “flow”, and of “knowing with every cell in our bodies” (notes from J. Miller lectures, March 2009). As I made notes, I became increasingly aware that what he was saying about spirituality could also apply to musical and artistic experiences. When a musician is in the state of flow, he or she is totally absorbed in the performance and with executing that performance with every cell in his or her body. Csikszentmihalyi (1996) describes flow as:

> a feeling that sometimes borders on traditional religious values but more often seems to depend on a spiritual sense for the order and beauty of natural phenomena that transcends any particular creed. (p. 316)

**Music as Embodied Knowledge.**

Music exists and has existed in some form in every known human culture throughout history; it is experienced in an embodied sense, a *felt* sense, and not necessarily through reading and analyzing. Although music is an aural phenomenon, in western cultures we often create and learn music through visual and spatial constructs that enable us to conceptualize music. For example, we think of pitch as being high or low, and of rhythms as moving from left to right (as they are represented on a page). The ways that people conceptualize and express music in the various world cultures differ from place to place. When I think of a ‘C’ major chord, I imagine its position on a keyboard, and the shape that my hands would make to play it. And although the ways
that music is conceptualized and incorporated into a society’s traditions and beliefs are unique to each culture, the essence of music as an embodied form of expression remains constant and common to all cultures.

**Non-dualistic Ways of Knowing.** It was through Juntunen’s (2004) writings, that I discovered the French philosopher, Maurice Merleau-Ponty. In his *Primacy of Perception* (1945/1962), he rejects the dominant Western Cartesian belief – that knowledge and understanding are acquired and controlled by the mind independently of the body, and that the body serves the mind. He claims instead that both the subject and the object of perception have an inter-physical presence; each forms a part of the other’s terrain or reality. Juntunen (2004) claims, “In the immediate bodily exploration of the world, the sense experiences and sensations blend with one’s inner world” (p. 18). There are multiple levels of knowing that affect the ways that we perceive ourselves within the world. We bring our bodies, concepts, beliefs, and histories with us as we make sense of our surroundings and of our relationships within our world; therefore, our individual perceptions of the world are unique to each one of us. These same backgrounds and perceptions also explain why we perceive and react to art in unique and personal ways. Juntunen (2004) explains the interdependent nature of non-dualism:

In this study, the mind and body are considered to manifest the holistic duality, yet without dualism. In this duality, a human organism is a functional whole and the mind and body are inseparable from, although different aspects of, that wholeness. (p. 18)

With regard to Dalcroze pedagogy, encountering music through the whole body allows students to experience music’s embodied nature. The educational axiom, “Experience precedes cognition” is upheld by Dewey (1938/1998) and Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985). In Dalcroze classes, students move freely and expressively in response to the music, allowing themselves to become one with the music. Merleau-Ponty (1945/1962) refers to a pre-reflective way of knowing
the world in his description of phenomenology: “To return to things themselves is to return to
that world which precedes knowledge” (pp. ix, x). Juntunen (2004) acknowledges the application
of this concept in Dalcroze pedagogy: “Pre-reflectively the body perceives anonymously, before
any sense of the reflective ‘I’ appears” (p. 40). Dalcroze students engage in consciously reflect-
ing on their experiences only after they experience musical concepts through rhythmic move-
ment.

**Holistic Experiences in Dalcroze Pedagogy**

Music students who have studied the Dalcroze approach often experience a sense of
wellness and balance that extends beyond music relevancy, affecting the relationships in their
lives in general (Schnebly-Black and Moore, 1997, p. 86). Students may become aware of con-
nections between music, art, expressivity, movement, and the whole body for the first time. Jun-
tunen (2002) provides responses from participants in her narrative study that suggest holistic
learning experiences: “And I am convinced that Dalcroze practice really does change people, the
way they look at things, helping to make connections and expand the view of the world. It is sort
of alternative medicine — holistic — that has something to offer for everyone” (p. 4).

A recent phenomenological study by van der Merwe (2014) investigates general experi-
ences of first-year Baccalareus Musicae (BMus) students with Dalcroze pedagogy. She found the
following common themes: social integration, joyful experience, bodily experience, easier un-
derstanding, and musical expression. She claims, “The students connected with each other in the
Dalcroze class. They even felt they got to know each other better just by moving together. They
also connected with themselves and stood in a clearer relation to their inner being” (p. 12).

Music has the capacity to connect us with our intuitive and playful selves. When we al-
low ourselves to move freely to music we experience a direct connection between body and soul.
It is this sense of connection that epitomizes the holistic features of Dalcroze pedagogy, and that I wish to further explore through qualitative research methods. In order to investigate this connection, I have invited five Dalcroze teachers and students to describe the soulful connections they experience when participating in Dalcroze classes, to share with me the ways Dalcroze pedagogy has affected their musical understanding, and to disclose the ways that their experiences in Dalcroze Eurhythmics have enhanced or developed their sense of self.

**Developing the Research Question**

I continued to study Dalcroze pedagogy during the summer breaks from teaching. Until 2011, the closest training centre was at Carnegie Mellon University (CMU) in Pittsburgh, PA. I also studied at the Juilliard School in New York, and then at the Dalcroze Institute in Maryland. I noticed a wide stylistic interpretation of Dalcroze philosophy among the master teachers with whom I studied. Yet, each approach provided me with a greater appreciation for the links between Dalcroze pedagogy and holistic education. Juntunen (2002) claims,

> [Dalcroze teachers] believe that as the exercises engage one’s whole self—the mind, body and emotions—the approach promotes personal growth. It makes students more aware of themselves, develops their imagination and creativity, and also helps them to get in touch with other people. (p. 7)

During the initial doctoral project planning phase, I conducted a semi-structured pilot project and met with several Dalcroze teachers and students. I was interested in investigating their ideas regarding the connections between their Dalcroze experiences and holistic and spiritual education. Some of them also provided personal stories that shed light upon their understanding of holistic education and spiritual education. In general, there was support from the Dalcroze community at large for the idea of a research project that would explore holistic experiences that occur in Dalcroze classes, and it seemed apparent that there would be no shortage of experiences to be shared and told as narrative data.
Planning the Research Design.

Qualitative inquiry is a well-accepted form of research inquiry in educational research, particularly in arts education, wherein one wishes to understand abstract, non-observable, non-quantifiable concepts. Eisner (1998) notes, “In the case of education, it [qualitative thinking] provides the kind of understanding we need in order to create better schools and to evaluate the results of our efforts” (p. 23). Eisner (1997) further suggests that artistic forms of research portrayal are appropriate for conveying authentic experience to the reader by providing a sense of reality as well as empathy. He considers artful experiences as being non-quantifiable ways of knowing and understanding, best conveyed through experiential and creative forms of communication or art. Such artistic experiences can convey personal experience and interpretation, multiplicity of meaning, and artistic expressions of human experience in general. Eisner (1997) comments:

I will count as research reflective efforts to study the world and to create ways to share what we have learned about it. Research can take the forms that echo the forms of the arts and humanities or those of the natural and social sciences. Its forms of data representation are open to invention. (p. 8)

One mode of artistic research portrayal is narrative, or story. Beattie (1995) claims,

A narrative approach to teacher education allows for the kinds of collaborative programmes and research ventures where teacher/researchers and teacher/participants raise questions of their practices, pose and choose from multiple possibilities and co-create new meanings as they bring about growth, change, and reform in those practices and in their own lives. (p. 54)

The stories that I wish to explore and convey to the reader are the experiences of five participants that they believe resonate with the spiritual aspect of holistic education. I have asked them specifically to relate experiences that they deem as holistic – that have not only inspired insights into musical development and understanding, but have also nurtured their personal
growth and sense of well-being, and that they consider to be soulful and personally life-changing. Their accounts provide the data for this investigation, and are portrayed as narratives. Investigating the holistic experiences of Dalcroze teachers and students through narrative offers readers a glimpse into an aspect of music education that has not hitherto been explored.

The Research Design

**Research Question.** The central research question for this project is: In what ways does a Dalcroze approach to music education exemplify holistic education?

**Research Sub-questions.** The following sub-questions further explore and direct the central question:

**Sub-question 1:** What are the lived experiences of Dalcroze students and teachers that exemplify holistic education (e.g., developing connections between body, intellect, and spirit)? In order to answer the central research question, it is necessary to determine and describe experiences that the participants feel are holistic, or that have caused them to experience soulful or personally meaningful connections. The experiences that the participants choose to divulge are personal experiences, and their choices will depend upon their unique and personal ways of approaching and understanding music, particularly their understanding of the synthesis of music and movement. As participants share their personal experiences with Dalcroze pedagogy, they also disclose their understanding of holistic education and of Dalcroze pedagogy.

**Sub-question 2:** In what ways do students and teachers derive meaning from their experiences? Because the participants’ backgrounds, learning styles, approaches to musicianship, experiences with music and music education, and personalities are unique, the ways that they make meaning from their experiences will reflect their individuality. My participants have had varying
amounts of experience with Dalcroze pedagogy. They have pursued its study for different reasons, and have different impressions and learning outcomes from the classes.

There are also many levels of learning, as expected in any artistic pedagogy. The arts deal with human expression – expressing thoughts, feelings, and impressions and connecting with other people in unique and deeply personal ways. A work of art has the inherent potential to resonate with or move its audience on a soulful level. van Manen (2014) states, “What we recognize in a worthwhile work of art is always a human truth that we come to know in a deeper, formative, and transformative manner” (p. 134). The research participants’ experiences with Dalcroze pedagogy may be generated by an overall interest in performance or in pedagogy. As performers, they will be more attuned to the potential for their own artistic development as insightful musicians, dancers, or actors, while as pedagogues, they will be more cognizant of the potential applications for developing rhythmic and musical understanding in their students.

**Sub-question 3**: In what ways is music education holistic? If holistic education is assumed to mean education that engages the body, intellect, and soul, then this question is asking if music education engages and develops students on corporeal, intellectual, and soulful levels. It is often assumed that arts education provides creative and soulful educational opportunities for student expression, but it really depends upon how the arts are taught. Kessler (2000) highlights this point by providing Guarino’s (1999) example of two ‘arts education’ scenarios: “I see two kinds of teaching – one where the teacher is very clear about the shapes and how they should fit together. Another where the teacher says, we’re going to make penguins, do it however you want to” (as cited in Kessler 2000, p. 93). Although music has the potential to connect with us on a soulful level, music education does not necessarily move students in a spiritual capacity. A dis-
Cussion of holistic education in Dalcroze pedagogy poses consideration for the holistic nature of arts education in general, and in music education in particular.

**Significance of the Study**

Recent decades have witnessed a growing interest in spirituality in education. Kessler (2000) traces its resurgence to Gardner’s (1993) work on intrapersonal and interpersonal intelligence and Goleman’s (1994) work on emotional intelligence (Kessler 2000, p. xiv). The current interest in spirituality in education could also be a result of an increasingly apparent lack of spiritual education provided for children at home or at school. People sometimes confuse spirituality with religion, and educators are careful not to include any references to religion in their classrooms lest they contravene public educational policy. Orr (2005) notes, “the idea of bringing spirit or soul into education can be difficult for some to accept, especially where there is a strict ‘separation of church and state,’ or a concern that addressing the soul will involve religious proselytizing” (p. 87). Children are under pressure to achieve high standards at school, and are often hurried at home, shuffled from school to baby-sitters, to after-school activities. Carlsson-Paige (2001) writes, “This is a time when the inner lives, deeper selves, and spiritual longings of students are crying out for educators’ attention” (p. 24).

There are few studies that have investigated spirituality as it occurs in classrooms in music education, in education in general, and none that have done so specifically within the Dalcroze approach to music education. Curriculum standards do not generally include spirituality in their mandates for education. London (2007) reports, “No evidence was found in the National Standards for Arts Education (USA) that indicates the spiritual purposes of art are to be addressed at any grade level of instruction” (p. 1481). Yet learning about intrapersonal and interpersonal connections and relationships is considered necessary for balanced development and
overall health and wellness. This study therefore will add to the body of educational research that investigates holistic experiences in education.

The subject of the holistic aspects of Dalcroze pedagogy has not been studied in depth and will be of value to Dalcroze teachers, to music educators and to arts educators in general. Music educators and music teacher candidates may find the relationship between holistic education and music education relevant to their practice. In addition, this dissertation will benefit holistic educators and teacher candidates who wish to understand arts education (particularly music education) in terms of holistic education. It will also add to the increasing body of educational research literature that employs narrative methodology to convey multiple layers of meaning to its readers. Finally, this study will contribute to the valuable discourse on the interconnectedness of intellect, body, and spirit within Dalcroze pedagogy, music education, and arts education in general.

**Limitations to the Study**

With the exception of one, all of the participants in this study have had several years of experience with Dalcroze classes and pedagogy. The Canadian Dalcroze community, (Dalcroze Canada⁴) has offered a summer training program in Toronto for the past three years. I announced my research interests to the society and with their permission, invited the summer students of 2013 to participate in my research project, thereby obtaining three of the five participants from this organization. Our Canadian Dalcroze community is comparatively small and I have been associated as a member of the Dalcroze Society of Canada (known now as Dalcroze Canada) for approximately 25 years. I knew four participants in this study on a professional level through

---

⁴ www.dalcrozecanada.com
Dalcroze and/or Orff training classes or through my affiliation as a member of the Dalcroze Canada executive. Overall, three Dalcroze students and two teachers agreed to become participants.

My interests and connections with Dalcroze Canada have been disclosed to provide context for the reader. Although my involvement in Dalcroze pedagogy has been comprehensive, I attempt to retell the participants’ stories from an objective viewpoint, being careful to present their stories as I believe the participants intended them to be told. Eisner (1998) argues that qualitative research enables a reader to understand a subject through its qualities. As the researcher re-stories the data in qualitative narrative, she enhances the texts so as to clarify quality, context, and understanding for the reader who is not able to witness the setting and circumstances, or hear the tone of voice firsthand. Referring to literary portrayals of research, Eisner (1998) explains, “The means through which such knowledge is made possible is the enlightened eye – the scene is seen – and the ability to craft text so that what the observer has experienced can be shared by those who were not there” (p. 30).

**Overview of the Dissertation Design**

The dissertation is presented in three parts. Part I, Chapter 1 comprises the *Introduction to the Study*, which includes my personal background, the development of the research questions, significance of the study, its limitations, and an overview of the research design. Chapter 2 is a review of the relevant academic literature and conceptual framework for this study. Chapter 3 provides an overview of the methodology. In Part II the reader meets the five participants through five narrative chapters. Theoretical and contextual data is interwoven throughout the narratives, to provide a *thick description* of the concepts portrayed. Part III includes Chapter 9, *Discussion*, in which the data from the narratives is directly linked to various aspects of holistic

---

5 *Thick description* is a term used in qualitative research to describe multiple and overlapping layers of data in order to provide deeper insight and more meaningful impressions of the subject.
education. Finally, Chapter 10 provides a summary of the entire research project, its findings, and recommendations for further study.
Chapter Two

Literature Review

Holistic Education

Making connections is one of the tenets of holistic education – connections between self and others, self and earth, self and the universe, and connections within self between mind, body and spirit. R. Miller (1991) contends that connections can extend to the realm of the spiritual, and describes the inner development that is associated with holistic education: “Holism seeks to understand humankind’s place in the cosmos, for this is ultimately the true source of connectedness, wholeness, and meaning” (p. 54). Making spiritual connections constitutes an education that is not within the exclusive realm of the intellect, but which benefits and nourishes the whole person. Ponlop (1999) suggests, “Joining knowledge and wisdom is the most important part of education: not only within the Buddhist tradition but also, so to speak, for the great tradition of all sentient beings” (p. 59)

J. Miller (2007) describes holistic education as “an education of balance (for example, right relationship), inclusion, and connection” (p. 14). Public schools however tend to emphasize intellectual knowledge and therefore do not typically provide a balanced education for students. J. Miller (2002) claims, “The student who can meet standards that are connected to competing in the global marketplace has become the primary focus of our educational efforts” (p. vi). Holistic educational experiences provide opportunities for students to discover, explore, and develop relationships, thereby integrating the whole person – mind, body, heart, and soul – and transforming their understanding of themselves and their relationships with the world. J. Miller (2007) describes holistic education:
The focus of holistic education is on relationships: the relationship between linear thinking and intuition, the relationship between mind and body, the relationships among various domains of knowledge, the relationship between the individual and community, the relationship to the earth, and our relationship to our souls. (p. 13)

A holistic approach to curriculum fosters equity, peace, respect, and love of learning by affirming not only the child’s cognitive achievements, but also all of his or her personal strengths and interests.

J. Miller (2007) differentiates between holistic education, which includes a spiritual component, and wholistic education, which includes multi-sensory experiences such as physical and social interaction (p. 6). Wholistic learning describes learning that includes several educational approaches, or that encompasses several disciplines, or that engages several intelligences. A holistic curriculum “lets us realize our deeper sense of self, our soul” (J. Miller 2007, p. 14). According to this delineation, Dalcroze pedagogy is a wholistic approach to music education because it includes movement, social interaction, and musical listening, performance, and improvisation. It can also be considered a holistic pedagogy if participants experience personal development and connections between intellect, body, and soul. The purpose of this paper is to explore the holistic aspects of Dalcroze pedagogy – the experiences that elicit inner connections in students. The participants were asked to share experiences that they have encountered in Dalcroze pedagogy that have ignited insightful or spiritual connections at a deeper and more personal level than the development of musical experience and understanding.

J. Miller (2007) outlines two distinct but often intersecting streams in the history of holistic curricula. The first stream includes holistic curricula that tend to emphasize personal growth, including the pedagogical developments of Rousseau in the eighteenth century, and Pestalozzi, Froebel, and Alcott in the late nineteenth century (pp. 68–71). Their educational philosophies were based on their Christian beliefs and values. According to R. Miller (1991), “Seeing human
nature as a direct expression of this divine source and intimately connected to it, [Rousseau, Pestalozzi and Froebel] were not paying homage to a remote, wholly external God so much as celebrating the deep essence of human creativity, love, and compassion” (p. 56). Jaques-Dalcroze made positive referrals in his early essays to the educational theories of Pestalozzi and Froebel, and lamented the lack of their application in the public schools (1921/1972, p. 21). J. Miller (2007) refers to a second holistic stream as being concerned with social change (p. 80). Proponents of this stream include Plato and Marx, and more recently, Ferrer, Dewey, Counts, and Horton (J. Miller 2007). This stream strives to educate about oppression and social injustice. R. Miller (2005) refers to two more philosophical streams of holistic education; one that rejects a reductionist view of the universe, and advocates instead for a universe that is “dynamically unfolding, comprised of intricate patterns and relationships, as being meaningful rather than mechanistic” (para. 8). The other stream is concerned with living in an ecological balance and relationship with the world and all of its inhabitants (para. 10).

**Spirituality in Education**

Spirituality in education addresses the inner sense of being as well as the connection that one feels with life in all of its many manifestations. Lodewyk, Lu, and Kentel (2009) describe spirituality as “a fundamental, everyday life process involving a joy of living, sacrifice and love for others, and a connection to self, others, nature, and to a larger meaning or purpose” (p. 170). Too often, our school curricula ignore the spiritual aspect of students, perhaps out of an obligation to be ‘politically correct’, to avoid any potentially offensive reference to religion, or out of a desire to focus exclusively on preparing the child for a successful future in the workplace. Carlsson-Page (2001) paraphrases Kessler (2000): “What has happened as teachers try to keep religion out of school, she says, is the suppression of students' exploration of their own beliefs, longings,
and search for spiritual meaning” (p. 24). Schools tend to focus instead on developing students’ skills and intellectual capacities, alongside the acquisition of a sense of responsibility (homework completion, respect, and acceptable community behaviour). Carlsson-Paige (2001) claims, “The current standards-driven educational climate has edged out multiple ways of seeing and being and has driven an even bigger wedge between curriculum expectations and children’s views of the world” (p. 24). Indeed, Ontario schools continue to implement standardized testing for language arts and mathematics. However, by neglecting their students’ spiritual development, they fail to cultivate their students’ sense of being well balanced, intuitive, spiritually aware, and wide-awake members of a worldwide community of compassionate individuals. Glazer (1999) explains spirituality in education as: “Attending to the present; attending to what presents itself; taking things firsthand. Taking care, and bringing care. Seeing in each moment – this very moment – the opportunity for transformation” (p. 249). He further claims, contemporary education teaches us “to succeed in this world as it is, rather than to heal this world into what it might become” (p. 249).

One of the problems that hinders the teaching of spirituality within Ontario public schools is that spirituality is understood differently by the diversity of cultures and communities that are represented in the population of Ontario. There is also a lack of standards for a curriculum of spiritual development. Diversity aside, there are degrees of human sensitivity and awareness of which all humans are capable of developing, and which, I believe, are common to all of humankind. R. Miller (2006) suggests, “Spirituality is the attitude, and the practice, of suspending our imagined reality in order to stand in wonder and awe at that which unfolds and emerges beyond our conceptual grasp” (para. 4). Curricula do not provide the time to ‘stand in awe and
wonder”; teachers are under pressure to include as much curriculum as possible into their students’ allotted and fragmented schedules.

Holism is a way of being, embracing all aspects of humanity and one’s relationship with the world. J. Miller (2007) provides several suggestions for helping students connect with their inner, spiritual energy, as part of a holistic curriculum. They include storytelling, meditation, dreamwork, journals, the study of world religions, literature, and Swimme and Berry’s (1992) *The Universe Story* (pp. 178 – 189). J. Miller (2000) also notes, “The arts have always been among the ways that human beings have nurtured soul” (p. 75). When students engage in arts-based activities, they are given the opportunity to connect with their creative, inquisitive, and intuitive selves, often with an accompanying sense of joy and adventure.

Kessler (2000) identifies “seven gateways to the soul in education”, in no particular order. They are: “the yearning for deep connection, the longing for silence and solitude, the search for meaning and purposes, the hunger for joy and delight, the creative drive, the urge for transcendence, and the need for initiation” (p. 17). She explains that students may experience spiritual awakening and development in any or several of these gateways. In any case, in order for spiritual growth to occur, the student must be given the opportunity to pursue avenues for making deep connections and for awakening unto their true selves, rather than being inundated with knowledge and skills and the pressures of achievement expectations. R. Miller (1991) discusses holistic thinking apart from education, as the “transpersonal nature of the true self” (p. 57).

It may be helpful to offer clarification of the meanings of spirituality, soul, and religion. Gradle (2007) differentiates between *spirituality* as a way of being, and *soul* as “piritual energy

---

– it is the active, questing, mindfulness that places all experience inside a sacred world” (p. 1502). For the purposes of this paper, spirituality refers to a practice, an element of personal philosophy, while soul is understood as that personal place wherein we find wisdom, solace, self, God, love, and/or a connection to universal truth. Gradle (2007) describes religion as a practice with “institutions, acknowledgement of doctrines, and adherence to beliefs” (p. 1502). Holistic education seeks to develop students’ spirituality along with their intellectual and physical abilities.

In this study, I consider intellect as the human capability for reasoning, logic, inquiry, and problem-solving, and mind, as that which encompasses the sense of self, or ‘I’, and consciousness. My mind can imagine, dream, lament, delight in, and know, while my intellect processes information, generates questions, and organizes thoughts. Emotions are felt in the body, and are sometimes generated by the mind. Damasio (1999) states, “feelings are largely a reflection of body-state changes” (p. 288). Gradle (2007) notes that there is the mind, which is localized within each individual, and a collective mind, the ideas of which “iterate over time, with thought, and through expression, taking shape as new art forms, as genres of literature, and as cultural evolutions” (p. 1504). She continues, “This way of being in relationships suggests intelligent functioning is connective, a fact that has long been known by Eastern and Western mystics and many indigenous populations as well” (pg. 1504). In this sense, we can be thought of as interrelated beings, as part of one universal mind, interconnected and interdependent. Gradle (2007) references Capra (2000) as she explains this interdependency as deep ecology:

Thus, deep ecology examines the physical connections, patterns and processes that seem similar to all life in the universe whether it be the human body’s intricate system, the environment, or global economics (Capra, 2000) while also alluding to a sense of belonging, a commitment to relationship, and the desire to understand life in many contexts. When perceived as both, deep ecology suggests an orientation that is spiritual and physical. (p. 1505)
For this research project, holistic education will be taken to include and embrace learning that includes and connects three realms: intellect (problem-solving, rational thinking), body (corporeal movement, feelings and sensations), and soul (inner knowing, mindfulness, and connection to universal truth).

**Bodily Ways of Knowing**

The idea of body knowledge is not yet fully accepted in our western approach to understanding the ways in which we ‘see’, feel, and experience the world. Our modernist frame of reference detaches us from the world, deconstructs the world; we tend to consider ourselves as observers rather than inter-actors in the ways that we understand phenomena. This is in part because North American institutions have been heavily influenced by the Cartesian philosophy of dualism, which tends to view the world from an object/subject perspective (Walker 2000). Rather than perceiving ourselves as an integrated and inter-relational whole being, dualism separates the sensibilities of the mind from those of the body, and tends to regard the body as being subjugated by the mind. In the seventeenth century, the highly influential French philosopher, René Descartes differentiated between *I* as “the thing that thinks” and *the body* as “an extension of the mind” (as cited in Scott, n.d., Section 3, Descartes’ Dualism, para. 1). The resulting philosophy of *dualism* has become an assumption that is deeply embedded in western culture – in its ontology, religion, and language.

Twentieth century philosophers, (Husserl 1913, Merleau-Ponty 1945/1962, Polanyi 1966, Abram 1996, Lakoff and Johnson 1999) challenged Cartesian dualism by suggesting that intellectual knowing is interdependent with bodily knowing – that our intellectual perceptions and sense of self are based on our corporeal perceptions and sense of self. Merleau-Ponty rejected the
dominating Cartesian belief that knowledge and understanding are exclusively acquired and governed by the mind. He argued that our perceptions of the world around us are subject first to the ways that our bodies experience and exist within it, and that these perceptions constitute what we believe to be knowledge. Merleau-Ponty (1945/1962) claims, “All knowledge takes its place within the horizons opened up by perception” (p. 241). He argues that both the subject and the object of perception have an inter-physical presence and each forms a part of the other’s terrain or reality. Merleau-Ponty (1945/1962) further claims that the body employs a pre-reflective, tacit way of knowing, of which it is aware, and through which it also perceives the world:

It [phenomenology] is a transcendental philosophy which places in abeyance the assertions arising out of the natural attitude, the better to understand them; but it is also a philosophy for which the world is always ‘already there’ before reflection begins—as ‘an inalienable presence;’ and all its efforts are concentrated upon re-achieving a direct and primitive contact with the world, and endowing that contact with a philosophical status. (p. vii)

Sheets-Johnstone (2011) asserts that movement is itself primal, that humans have a propensity to move in and of themselves. She notes, “When we learn to move ourselves, we do so on the basis of what is already there; an original kinetic liveliness or animation” (pp. 200–201). She explains,

To gain insight into the developing structures of an I that moves, an I that emerges on the ground of movement, we turn to movement itself, to movement that is already there and to the kinesthetic consciousness that is quintessentially and consummately attuned to it. (p. 201)

Her theory underscores the pre-reflective nature of movement, and reinforces the nature of a “foundational kinesthetic perceptual consciousness” (Sheets-Johnstone 2011, p. 212).

Gibbs (2006) refers to a growing affirmation in the fields of cognitive and psychological science that recognizes the inter-dependency of mind and body in the formation of perceptions about the world. He claims, “perception, concepts, mental imagery, memory, reasoning, cogni-
tive development, language, emotion, and consciousness have, to varying extents, groundings in embodiment” (p. 9). Herbert and Pollatos (2012) note, “While it is well known that bodily responding and its perception are key processes in the construction of emotion experience, the fact that bodily processes might be of enormous importance for many more psychological functions, including cognition or decision making, is quite new” (p. 693).

Using a somatic approach to teach core subjects would provide a holistic alternative and some balance to an otherwise cognitive approach to education. The arts are considered to be somatic ways of knowing in their own rite. Powell (2007) claims, “In the arts, the body is, and always has been, the place and space of reasoning, knowing, performing, and learning” (p. 1083). Therefore, incorporating the arts as part of an integrated curriculum would ensure that bodily ways of knowing become assimilated into students’ repertoire of knowledge.

Teaching music through artistic movement provides two levels of somatic learning, the subject in this case being embodied as well as the teaching method. The connection between sound and movement seems evident, with obvious connections between music and dance. McCarthy (2002) claims, “Considering the evidence suggesting that many musical concepts are grounded in bodily experience, it follows that movement can enhance musical understanding by triggering our schematic memory of such experience” (p. 220). Biological evidence confirms that music and movement are intimately connected in our bodies and have the potential to mutually inform each other. Neuroscientists Zatorre, Chen, and Penhume (2007) report a neurological connection between the motor and auditory systems of the brain; this connection is observable during listening to music and while performing music. They report, “Neuropsychological and neuroimaging studies have shown that the motor regions of the brain contribute to both percep-
tion and production of rhythms” (p. 550). When moving to music, it is therefore not only possible, but also probable, to discover and experience a sense of deep connection within ourselves.

Embodied sensibility provides the philosophical basis for interpretive perception and therefore, the unique ways we understand the world differs according to our sensibilities, perceptions, and experiences. Our individualism also explains why we perceive and react to music (or any other art form) distinctively – because of the unique backgrounds and sensibilities that we bring with us to each experience. Linden (1994) makes reference to somatic literacy. He explains, “For greatest safety, health, productivity, comfort and enjoyment, people must understand and be skilled in the operation of the mind-body unity. This intellectual/experiential knowledge is what I call ‘somatic literacy’, and it is an essential element in lifelong wellness” (p. 2). Rae Johnson (2007) also makes reference to somatic literacy, or “the ability to access knowledge encoded in kinaesthetic and non-verbal material” (p. 63). It is this somatic perception that forms the pedagogical foundation for Dalcroze classes; somatic experience and knowledge enhance and inform musical understanding.

Jaques-Dalcroze discovered that his conservatory students’ performances became more sensitive after experiencing musical concepts kinaesthetically. He insisted that music students should have a foundational background of somatic rhythmic experiences before approaching an instrument for performance studies. Embodied musical experiences would inform their understanding of musical concepts and develop their sense of musical artistry, thereby enhancing and enlivening their musical performances. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) claims:

The whole method is based on the principle that theory should follow practice, that children should not be taught rules until they have had experience of the facts which have given rise to them, and that the first thing to be taught a child is the use of all his faculties. Only subsequently should he be made acquainted with the opinions and deductions of others. (p. 119)

Dalcroze Eurhythmics shares with Merleau-Ponty the idea that the body and bodily involvement with the world are primary tools of knowing the world and oneself. Dalcroze approach applies body movement to musical learning based on the belief that knowing through the body and embodied actions happens at the deeper level than knowing only through abstract thinking and, thus, that bodily interaction with music enriches musical experience … Such embodiment is always lived through the first-person perspective: My embodiment and physicality is fundamentally conditioning my experience and sense of self. (p. 64)

The pre-reflective, embodied nature of knowing and understanding is the fundamental pedagogical principle in Dalcroze pedagogy.

An embodied approach to music education allows students to experience the essence of music in our bodies and hearts, before analyzing any musical knowledge or understanding intellectually. When we pay attention to the subtle responses of our bodies to music, we discover a somatic way of understanding music, one that would perhaps otherwise be overlooked in our daily practising or in our music listening. Without embodied experience, we would miss the immediate connection that occurs between music, movement, and soul. Experiencing musical details and concepts in our bodies, with attention to the fusion of kinaesthetic and musical artistry, provides students with the opportunity for acquiring deeper and more meaningful understandings of those same musical details and concepts.

**Arts-Infused Education as Spiritual Education**

When applied to any subject-specific curriculum, arts-infused learning creates a multi-disciplinary experience that provides opportunities for creativity, personal awareness, and artistic expression. The arts can be incorporated into any lesson, at any grade level, and in any classroom. By infusing core curriculum subjects with a connection to the arts, students are given an
opportunity to enter into an embodied, non-cognitive realm where they can be true to themselves, where they can meet their inner selves within an atmosphere of play, and where they can both nurture and give expression to their souls. The arts are vehicles for sharing soulful perceptions and messages, for eliciting responses to and providing glimpses of an unseen reality, and for facilitating interconnectedness between intellect, body, and spirit. Nozawa (2005) claims, “By living the process in the here and now, creating art can be a way to take us to the deeper self, and to go beyond the ego boundary” (p. 225). She describes the spiritual experiences of adult students who participated in expressive art activities: “They were lost in time and space through art making. They were in the realm where we connect within ourselves and with others beyond the ego world” (p. 230).

Including the arts in educational activities provides a forum conducive to peace education. Greene (1995) advocates for the “relevance of art in overcoming the inability to see others” (p. 136). Students of different cultural backgrounds, cognitive abilities, and with various strengths and dispositions can engage in and produce expressive works of art in any medium, whether visual arts, music, poetry, dance or drama, story-telling, or any other mode of personal expression.

Maleuvre (2005) offers the concept of love as a metaphor for art, stating, “The aim of art is not art. Its destination is elsewhere; its aim is reality encountered and lived with. And the vehicle by which art travels into reality is not just skill, insight, knowledge, or intelligence. It is love” (p. 77). He claims that love connects the spiritual reality to the material reality, and that love drives within us a desire for connection, i.e., with people, nature, art, and God. For Maleuvre, art is “woven out of the veil that hangs between us and reality” (p. 78).

Love says this: that our connection to other people and things is basic, organic; that separation is an illusion. ... Likewise art. At first glance, art seems to be about
images and representations. This is a surface impression. In actuality, art is concerned with participation. ... In answer to the perennial question of what makes art, let me venture the following axiom – an image is art to the extent that love runs through it. (Maleuvre 2005, p. 85)

Students are able to experience the transformational and spiritually developmental aspect of education through the creative process of artistic exploration and experimentation. Kessler (2000) writes, “Young and old reminded me that creativity replenishes the soul not only through the arts, but also in the way we meet challenges in every domain of the curriculum and of life” (p. 92). Sometimes the arts are considered a ‘relief’ from more demanding scholastic concerns and activities. When we are involved in artistic expression, our concerns with work, whether work is intellectual or physical, are temporarily suspended. Kessler (2000) notes, “Although our beliefs certainly differ about the source of creative inspiration – God, the music, the collective conscious, the complexity of each person’s inner being – most of us have had some experience of being connected to the spirit through creative expression” (p. 91). Kessler cautions however, that the professional practice of arts education does not necessarily provide a creative opportunity for student creativity or expression. For example, imposing a singular, correct way to participate in artistic expression would subvert its creative, spiritual purpose. She claims, “Students and educators have observed not only a devaluation of the arts, but also an ethos in which the arts curriculum is devoid of an invitation to genuine artistic expression” (p. 92).

The arts are not the only vehicle that offers opportunities for students to practise and develop creativity. Kessler (2000) continues: “Grief, violence, science, math, conflict resolution – solving the problems of daily life all become the playground, the laboratory for a creative response” (p. 94). She notes however, that most students’ experiences in schools involve predetermined outcomes; students are not commonly provided with the opportunity to actively engage in creative problem solving on a day-to-day basis. She claims, “for many students and edu-
cators, messages and methods of our current pedagogy suppress rather than stimulate creative solutions” (p. 94). In an educational system that requires students to achieve high performance standards in intellectual knowledge and skills, there is little time for students to engage in creative problem solving. If teachers were encouraged to value creativity and spiritual development as much as intellectual achievement, and if more time and resources were allotted to enable and encourage students to develop their own unique talents in an unhurried, stress-less environment, then students might feel a greater connection with themselves, each other, the world, and nature.

When we are moved emotionally by a work of art, we experience multiplicity of meaning as we discover something about ourselves, about the artist, and about art as reality. Eisner (2002) claims that art provides a way in which “reality, whatever it is, seems to be made more vivid” (p. 83). He claims, “The arts, when experienced in the fullness of our emotional life, are about becoming alive” (pp. 84–85). The arts provide a means through which the student-artist can develop connections within herself, and also with her audience. They allow us to explore our own existential questions, to discover unexpected answers, and in turn, to pose the same questions to our audience.

**Music as Spiritual Experience**

Music utilizes and opens avenues of expression that synthesize and flow between our emotional, spiritual, and social realities. When a musician (or listener) is connected intimately with the music, she becomes the music in a spiritual sense. It has been said of a good performance that the listener cannot decipher where the performer ends and the instrument begins, that the performer and instrument become one. J. Miller (2006) describes timeless learning as being holistic, embodied, soulful, and in the moment (pp. 4 – 8). He explains, “In timeless learning we find the barrier between ourselves and the world disappearing as distinctions such as inner and
outer drop away” (p. 11). This state of becoming the music has also been described as being in a state of flow. Csikszentmihalyi (1996) describes flow as “an almost automatic, effortless, yet highly focused state of consciousness” (p. 110). Athletes sometimes describe the same sense of flow when they are in the zone; they are so focused on their game that time stands still and the world fades away. Csikszentmihalyi further explains this phenomenon of being in a state of flow as, “distractions are excluded from consciousness … we are aware only of what is relevant here and now” (p. 112). When a musician is focused only on the here and now she is able to enter a spiritual reality wherein cognitive functions are less relevant than being fully present to the music.

Yob (2010) suggests that we consider music as a manifestation of inherent human spirituality, and that creativity in general is born out of spirituality:

While we must remain silent if that means talking about music’s meaningfulness in rational terms, it might be possible that spirituality has its own languages and music is one of them. So the question is chiefly not, How can we talk about spiritual music? but How does music talk for the soul? (p. 150)

Children are conditioned in schools to value intellectual abilities over spiritual and artistic abilities. Yob (2010) writes, “It may be easy to dismiss spiritual musical meaning-making as irrational (that is, illogical and unreasonable) when in fact it may rather be unrational (that is, the rules of reason in the Western tradition simply do not apply)” (p. 150). The suggestion that cognition might even impede artistic flow was made by Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972), who noticed that the intellectual constructs and preconceptions of his more advanced conservatory students hindered their natural aural understanding. Children with much less musical experience and knowledge were able to hear and process what they were hearing more easily and fluently than his more advanced music students (p. v).
Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) describes the spiritual effects that he believed resulted from participating in his classes:

I have said that rhythmic gymnastics – whatever method of teaching may be adopted – is more than an educational method. Indeed, it is a force analogous to electricity and the great natural forces of chemistry and physics; it is an energy, a radio-active agent whose influence restores us to ourselves, in making us aware, not only of our own powers, but also of those of others, those of humanity. It compels us to meditate upon the unfathomable depths of our enigmatical and changing nature. It enables us to glimpse the secrets of the eternal mystery which governs the lives of men throughout the ages, it gives our thoughts that original character of intense religious feeling which links together the past, the present and the future to create closer relations between body and mind to unify the moral and physical forces of the individual, and to give a firmer foundation to the relations between men. (pp. 57–58)

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) insists that teachers approach their students with compassion;

“Children need – above all else – masters who love them and make a point of getting to know them” (p. 13), thereby acknowledging that a teacher’s compassionate approach to her classes is of equal, if not greater importance than her knowledge of the subject.

A phenomenological longitudinal study by Collier-Sloan (1991) found that students who had previously studied music through the Suzuki method reported “expansion of internal self” and “development of interpersonal relationships” as adults, which they attributed to their Suzuki music lessons. As musicians sharpen their musical craft through disciplined practice, patience, humility, and determination, they become better at listening, communicating, understanding, and at connecting their imaginations to their musical expressions. No matter how impressive a performer’s technical virtuosic abilities may be, without these deep intuitive skills, the resulting sound can only be noise. These are the skills of artistry, and they are the musician’s most valuable skill-set; these are the skills that Dalcroze originally sought to develop in his conservatory students.
Community Music. Music is believed to have been part of every culture known in the history of the world. Ball (2010) claims, “We know of societies without writing and even without visual art – but none, it seems, lack some form of music” (p. 2). While there are no conclusive explanations for music’s evolutionary development as a human behaviour, Ball claims, “the theory that music’s adaptive value lay in the way it brought communities together and promoted social cohesion enjoys wide support” (p. 26). Levitin (2006) also supports the theory that music likely evolved in humans to provide a unique and important avenue for socializing and community building. He suggests,

Collective music making may encourage social cohesions – humans are social animals, and music may have historically served to promote feelings of group togetherness and synchrony, and may have been an exercise for other social acts such as turn-taking behaviours. (p. 258)

Making communal music together forces us to attend carefully to our sense of awareness as we listen and add our sounds to the music that is simultaneously happening around us. In a music ensemble, people listen attentively and react instantly to the music that is already in progress, while creating and contributing a complementary voice. We become more alert and attentive as we strive to hear and understand what the other musicians are doing and playing. We are invited into the ensemble through music, playing in tune and in time with the musical sensibility of the group, and we become connected to the group through music, in a non-linguistic, non-cognitive, non-visible, and non-tangible way. Community living is vital to our safety, survival, and cultural development as humans; the playful interaction of music-making within a community contributes to our cognitive development by developing memory, communication, and social skills.

Community music making offers an avenue through which people can experience being in flow together, fusing their music with the music of the ensemble. This communal and spiritual
connection in turn provides a sense of great joy and satisfaction. Jazz musicians experience this when they improvise together. Students – even a Grade 4 recorder class – can experience this connection when they are listening carefully to each other’s music and adding their own sound to what is already being played. The flow experience is more intense when musicians know their piece and have mastered their instrument well enough to be unhindered by cognitive functions such as deciphering notes and rhythms, or by technical (skill) limitations. They are then able to focus more exclusively on producing music in the here and now. It should not be the goal of music education therefore, to learn to play a piece competently, but rather, to allow the students to use the piece as a vehicle for experiencing authentic artistic communication, to facilitate deep and spiritual connections by playing, listening, responding, and being in a state of flow. Yob (2010) proposes:

Music is more than the expression of mental states through the production of sound. Certainly the body and mind are implicated, but despite prolonged efforts through centuries of theoretical and philosophical debate, we have not yet been able to unravel that “something more” that we intuitively know is there in a significant way in all of these endeavors. (pp. 147–148)

When musicians perform for an audience, music can also become an avenue for a shared meditation. If we play from our hearts, and if the audience listens with their hearts, then, for these few moments, we are all suspended together in a unique, timeless, and wonderful communion of thoughts and feelings, which can be experienced no other way. Maleuvre (2005) argues that art is a form of communication between our feelingful selves and feelingful others. Art, as such, is born of love, from our desire to share the things we believe and know intuitively as being deeply true.

Ritual Music. Music often appears in spiritual rituals and sometimes functions as a link to the spiritual world. Native American music, according to Burton (1993), is considered by in-
digienous people to be a gift from the creator. He claims “all music is part of the Universe and individuals are allowed by the Creator to ‘catch’ a song from this source” (p. 22). Native North Americans use drums to communicate with the spirit world; the sound of the drum “is considered ... to represent the heartbeat of Mother Earth” (p 26). Many cultures use chant in religious and meditative experiences to lift our minds out of the ego-self realm and into the non-intellectual, universal realm. Mantras are non-linguistic sounds that are intended to facilitate a meditative state of mind. Simon (1997) claims,

Because they are free of the associations that accompany the words we use in everyday speech, primordial sounds temporarily interrupt the otherwise continuous internal dialogue that progresses from one meaningful idea to another and allows us to enter the silent space between thoughts. (p. 90)

Dalcroze Eurhythmics – Historical Context

The mid-to-late nineteenth century was a dark period for music education in Europe. Formal education in music was a luxury belonging only to the cultured few at the top of the socio-cultural pyramid. Music was highly respected, but only those who could afford to pursue its study would employ private music teachers to ensure the expected enculturation of their children. Students attended conservatories for advanced training, much as they do today (Preussner, 1953). Forward-thinking music educators such as Carl Orff, Zoltan Kodály, and Émile Jaques-Dalcroze developed new approaches to music education during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries in response to the lack of generally available public music education.

Carl Orff, together with Gunild Keetman, developed a child-centred approach to music education, Das Schulwerk in Germany in the 1920s. It is a wholistic and participatory approach, incorporating speech rhythms, drama, movement, and improvisation in a joyful setting. Its inten-
tion is to provide music education for all children, not only the wealthy or talented. In Hungary in the 1930s, Zoltan Kodály developed an approach to music education based on singing, intended for wide use in elementary schools, and incorporating a repertoire of children’s songs, folk songs, and composed songs of high artistic quality. Kodály believed that the child’s first (and most natural) instrument was the voice, and is therefore the preferred avenue for internalizing and developing musicianship. He used these songs to teach children to read and think musically.

The Kodály method utilizes hand signs to denote scale degrees and rhythm symbols to facilitate rhythmic literacy. Both the Orff and Kodály approaches are still widely used in contemporary music classrooms. Both methods are holistic, their intention being to nurture the child’s artistic spirit, and to develop the whole child.

Jaques-Dalcroze developed an approach to music education through rhythmic gymnastics, believing that the body is the first instrument, and therefore the most natural way to access, develop, and refine rhythmic fluency. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) claims, “whereas movement is instinctive in man, and therefore first in importance” (p. 51). Mead (1994) claims it is the “total absorption of mind, body, and emotions in the experience of actualizing the musical sound” that differentiates Dalcroze Eurhythmics “from other approaches to teaching music” (p. 5). In a Dalcroze class, the body is the instrument, through which students become the music. Jaques-Dalcroze was already familiar with the rhythmic gymnastics, which was a popular and respected component of a comprehensive, general education in Europe at that time (Campbell 1991). He adapted the practice to music pedagogy to train students to listen attentively, and to respond intuitively and artistically to musical nuances through movement. His applications of Gymnastique

---

7 see http://www.orffcanada.ca/about_us.html
8 see http://kodalysocietyofcanada.ca/who-was-kodaly/
*Rythmique* were designed to develop rhythmic fluency in his students. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) writes, “Rhythmic gymnastics attempts to set up relations between instinctive bodily rhythms and those created by the senses or by the will” (p. 5). He was also an accomplished musician, and ensured that his eurhythmics classes were both musical and joyful. His movement classes became known as Dalcroze Eurhythmics; they stressed the development of an efficient, fluid, and artistic mastery of embodied rhythm. His approach was unorthodox; his students wore tunics and moved freely to the music that he improvised at the piano. Jaques-Dalcroze’s classes included lessons in improvisation and ear training; all three disciplines (including eurhythmics) comprise Dalcroze pedagogy, and all three were taught through movement.

Jaques-Dalcroze encountered frequent opposition to his new *méthode*, and for years, experienced a turbulent relationship with his employer, the Geneva Academy of Music (Schnebly-Black and Moore, 1997, p 7). Consequently, he moved to Hellerau, Germany in 1910, and along with others, established a thriving school, which he had to eventually abandon for political reasons. Schnebly-Black and Moore (1997) describe the educational goals of the school founders:

> Their intent was to build a Utopian city whose ideal was to find individual self-worth through the study of rhythm. For them the word “rhythm” had universal meaning. It alluded to the rhythm in the human body (the circulatory system and the breathing), rhythm in the human environment (movement in music, in art and architecture, of machines), and rhythm in nature (movement of animals, of plants, of tides, of light, or of seasons). (p. 7)

Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) maintained that students should experience music and all of its nuances in the body first, before starting to learn any vocal or instrumental performance skills. He writes:

> The pupil, who will have acquired a perfect confidence in his consciousness of rhythm and sound, with a rich experience of forms of movement and perfect mastery of a well-trained muscular system to draw on, may henceforth devote his whole attention to his instrument, practice at which will have become no longer a torture, but a delight. (p. 63)
Ferguson (2005) agrees that movement, especially large motor rhythmic movement, is beneficial to music students’ musical development.

The consensus seems to be that movement is helpful in the music classroom ... it may be wise for practitioners to plan for the use of large-motor movements to music, as this style of movement has been shown to garner the most positive pedagogical results in both preschool and elementary-aged students. (pp. 29, 30)

Dalcroze students often claim that the sense of balance and connection that they experience in Dalcroze classes stays with them, infusing their personal relationships and daily living experiences with balance as well. Schnebly-Black and Moore (1997) remark:

Feeling yourself wholly involved – mind concentrating, body demonstrating, heart full of sensitivity, in synchronization with beautiful music – sets a condition of being that is accessible to all, transferable to other endeavors, and renewable throughout one’s life. (p. 84)

This ‘condition of being’ will be explored more fully in this research study. The narrative portrayals of the research participants’ experiences convey a sense of this condition for the reader.

**Child-Centred Education and Music Education.** There were other innovative and revolutionary educators working in Europe in the early nineteenth century. Maria Montessori and Rudolph Steiner were developing a more child-friendly style of education than what was commonly in practice. The first Montessori school opened in Italy in 1907 with a learning environment that was designed to nurture the child’s physical, intellectual, and emotional wellbeing. The child-centred atmosphere encouraged and nurtured the child’s natural curiosity and creativity. R. Miller (2002) describes Montessori’s approach: “she maintained throughout her long career that education must follow the universal laws of human development as these are revealed in the lives of actual children, rather than seek to achieve social aims by imposing adult ideals on young people” (pp. 228–229).
Steiner opened the first Waldorf School in Germany in 1919; these schools emphasized peace, nature, and art. Steiner’s view of education included an emphasis on spirituality. His claim, "Waldorf school education is not a pedagogical system but an art – the art of awakening what is actually there within the human being" (as cited in Reynolds, [n.d.] para. 6) is similar to the foundational philosophy of the Montessori schools. Although both Montessori and Waldorf schools are spiritually based, they differ in their actualization: Montessori emphasized the importance of the child learning through interacting with her environment, while Steiner emphasized “cultivation of the imagination” (R. Miller 2002, p. 237).

Steiner (1920/1998) developed a new art form around 1912 which he called *Eurhythmy*. It was meant as a physical expression of our “supersensible” (p. 246) or spiritual selves. He refers to eurythmy as “visible speech” and “visible song” (p. 268):

> We immerse ourselves in how the forces of human nature work in speaking and singing. Having grasped these forces, we can then transfer them to the forms of the entire body’s movement, just as we transfer the forces of the cosmos to the stationary human figure in sculpture. (p. 268)

Steiner’s *eurhythm* differs from Jaques-Dalcroze’s *eurhythmics* in its intention. Whereas Dalcroze used rhythmic gymnastics to teach music, Steiner’s eurythmy had a spiritual intention: “In the case of Eurythmy, body, soul and spirit work harmoniously together, so that here one has to do with an ensouled and spiritualised form of gymnastics” (Steiner 1923, para. 77).

Jaques-Dalcroze’s pedagogical philosophy was congruent with those of Dewey and Montessori, by using a discovery approach to encourage his students to develop their own artistic potential. Dewey also shared some of Jaques-Dalcroze’s pedagogical views, as noted by Juntunen (2004): “Like Dewey, Jaques-Dalcroze stresses the importance of *experience* in learning. For both, knowledge should not be separated from doing, similarly as theory should not be separated from practice” (p. 58). Dewey believed that if educational practices provided meaningful experi-
ences for students, their understanding of concepts would be more compelling, thus fostering the development of the whole child.

Mathieu (2013) highlights three of Pestalozzi’s educational principles that were influential on the development of music education during the 19th century:

1) To teach sounds before signs and the child how to sing, before he learns the names of the notes or the written notation.
2) To teach him principles and theory after practical experience.
3) To lead him to perceive similarities and differences between sounds, through listening and imitation instead of explanation – in a word, to offer him active, rather than passive learning. (p. 2).

Jaques-Dalcroze inherited some of Pestalozzi’s educational philosophy from his mother, a music teacher who was known to adhere to Pestalozzi’s pedagogical principles (Mathieu, 2013, p. 2). Mathieu (2013) notes,

For Dalcroze, the principal aim of education is to help the child to know himself and to develop his personality. In his view, the arts, and music in particular, had the power to arouse a person’s vital forces, so enabling him to act and think for himself. (p. 2)

Thereby is Jaques-Dalcroze’s (1921/1972) educational philosophy summarized as *education in rhythm and by rhythm* (p. 9)

**Dalcroze Pedagogy and Embodied Knowledge**

Jaques-Dalcroze developed a pedagogical philosophy for music education upon the premise that our bodies are rhythmic beings. Dalcroze Eurhythmics is an embodied approach to music education in which the body and its natural, responsive movements are experienced and then noticed, thereby enlightening and informing music students in a very corporeal and personal way. Using a discovery approach, Dalcroze pedagogy utilizes and develops non-cognitive connections
in the realms of artistry, expression, and intrapersonal communication. This approach depends on pre-reflective experience. Students first experience music in their bodies, and then reflect on their experiences, thereby making conscious what they have experienced subconsciously.

In many of the exercises, students respond with their bodies to details in the music, which is being played or improvised by the teacher, thus integrating their sense of sight, hearing, touch, rhythm, and motion. The classes are socially interactive; two or more students often work with each other to experience details of melodic nuance, rhythm, or harmony. They move as freely and fluently as possible – becoming one with the music and with each other. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) explains:

Music forges a link between the pupils. A multiple life animates every organism, constituting a single rhythm traversed by many currents, all differing in expansion, though inspired by one will. [...] The sense of being one in an ensemble of vibrant thoughts and wills momentarily destroys all personal preoccupation. (p. 115)

By advocating for education through experience, by dispelling dualism, and by recognizing the embodied nature of experience, early twentieth century educators Dewey, Steiner, Montessori, and Jaques-Dalcroze foreshadowed Merleau-Ponty’s philosophy of integrated perception. Dewey (1934) writes, “Experience occurs continuously, because the interaction of live creature and environing conditions is involved in the very process of living” (p. 35). Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) claims, “Rhythmic gymnastics starts from the principle that the body is the inseparable ally of the mind; it affirms that body and mind should harmoniously perform their diverse functions not only separately but simultaneously” (p. 108). More recently, Bowman (2004) claims, “All human knowledge draws its sustenance from corporeal roots. Mind is inextricably biological and embodied; and what it can know is always grounded in the material and experiential world” (p. 30). Furthermore, Abram (1996) agrees:
The human mind is not some otherworldly essence that comes to house itself inside our physiology. Rather, it is instilled and provoked by the sensorial field itself, induced by the tensions and participations between the human body and the animate earth. (p. 262)

Embodied sensibility, our embodied understanding of self, and our corporeal interactions with the world comprise a unique embodied perspective of the world for every individual. What we understand to be real in the world is really a complex interaction of prior knowledge and perceptions. Bowman (2004) writes:

Embodied understanding is always the view from somewhere, and therefore always partial; yet it remains profoundly ours, the experiential ground all claims to know require as the fundamental condition of their possibility. Partiality, multiplicity, and complexity are its inherent phenomenological conditions, but fluency at navigating such rough ground is precisely the heart of human genius. (p. iv)

An understanding of embodied knowledge is crucial to understanding the pedagogy of Dalcroze Eurhythmics. Music itself is neither cognitive nor figurative; it lives in the body and in the spirit – neither of which can be fully understood intellectually. There are abundant references in music education literature depicting music and the arts in general as embodied experiences (Stubley 1998, Walker 2000, Montana 2010). When a student experiences a musical concept through becoming aware of the movements of his or her own body, the knowledge thus gained is somatic, and easily accessible as musical intuition. Juntunen (2004) claims:

Thus, a musical action, including body movement, can be seen as a bodily understanding of musical meaning. In this light, the Dalcroze approach primarily seems to develop a pre-reflective mode of knowing, ‘a bodily way of being in sound’ (Stubley 1998), (including sensing, feeling, and thinking) that form the basis for subsequent reflective thought. […] Mindful action, thus, can be considered not only as a step towards reflective thought, but also as embodied understanding. (p. 68)

She compares Merleau-Ponty’s pre-reflective, embodied knowledge to the pre-reflective experiences that one encounters in Dalcroze pedagogy.

Applying Merleau-Ponty’s (1968, 154–155) notion of gesture (and speech) to situations where musical sounds are expressed through body movement, we conclude that listening to music is thinking and the body movement that results is a complet-
ed emotion or thought. Thus, listening and moving inform each other simultaneously; there is no ‘one after the other’. (Juntunen 2004, p. 63)

The arts are modes of expression that incorporate ways of conveying ideas that are meant to elicit a felt experience, a ‘gut’ reaction. It is the capacity for art to move its audience that renders it an embodied form of communication. The implications for education are that human beings continuously learn, communicate, and understand through their embodied selves – a self that incorporates the intellect, the body, and the soul interactively and harmoniously. Embodied, artistic experience is particularly difficult to convey through words, and must be experienced in order to be fully understood. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) refused to describe his method for that reason, and preferred to invite curious inquirers to participate in a class in order to understand it (pp. 147–148).

**Dalcroze Pedagogy as Holistic Education**

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) believes that rhythmic wellness helps to bring balance and order to a person’s overall state of being: “It is rhythm that sets up communication between our inner forces and the outer forces that assail them” (p. 56). He further believes that the ensuing integration of mind and body promotes a sense of peace: “by harmonizing the functions of the body with those of the mind, it ensures free play and expansion to imagination and feeling through the state of satisfaction and joyful peace that follows” (p. 6). Although his exercises were intended to teach music (*education in rhythm*), Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) referred to his students’ consequential achievement of a more balanced overall awareness and sense of self as an *education by rhythm*:

The child will thus be taught at school not only to sing, listen carefully, and keep time, but also to *move* and think accurately and rhythmically. One might commence by regulating the mechanism of walking, and from thence proceed to ally vocal movements with the gestures of the whole body. That would constitute at once instruction *in* rhythm and *education by* rhythm. (pp. 8, 9).
While Jaques-Dalcroze’s essays were written to inform practitioners of music and rhythmic education, they emphasize the value of soulful learning as an important component of his educational philosophy. He describes an educational philosophy that has as much to do with character and wellness as with intended musical learning outcomes:

The object of education is to enable pupils to say at the end of their studies, not ‘I know,’ but ‘I experience,’ and then to create the desire of self-expression. For when we experience an emotion strongly, we feel the need to pass it on to others, to the utmost of our power. The more life we have, the more we shall be able to give to others. To receive and to give: such is the great rule for all mankind. (Jaques-Dalcroze 1930/1985, p. 58)

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) contends that his ‘education by rhythm’ would awaken and nurture an artistic sensibility in his students: “The aim of rhythmic gymnastics is to develop mind and feeling in everything connected with art and life” (p. 102). He also believes music education has the potential to extend beyond its musical intentions, and to have positive effects on his students’ lives:

The main thing to remember is that the function of parents and teachers is to strengthen and develop the child in such fashion that mind and body form a perfect instrument whereon to learn to play the song of life. (Jaques-Dalcroze 1930/1985, p. 101)

He offers a quote from Plato: “Rhythm, i.e. the expression of order and symmetry, penetrates by way of the body into the soul and into the entire man, revealing to him the harmony of his whole personality” (as cited in Jaques-Dalcroze 1930/1985, p. 102).

**Connections Between Music and Movement**

Recent research on embodied ways of knowing supports the claim that movement enhances the understanding of music concepts (Walker 2000, Bowman 2004). Human beings are born with a biological predisposition to not only create music, but to dance to it as well. When a toddler bounces to the beat of rock’n’roll music, she is joyously doing what comes naturally, being as yet uninhibited by cultural adult perceptions. Gruhn & Rauscher (2008) affirm, “The
foundations for making and sharing musical sounds and dancing movements of the body are there long before a baby can stand” (p. 58). Levitin (2006) believes the strong connection between music and movement was critical to human evolution. He notes that, allowing for evolutionary lag, we are perfectly adapted now to succeed in a society that is 50,000 years old. He paraphrases anthropologist John Blacking: “The embodied nature of music, the indivisibility of movement and sound […] characterizes music across cultures and across times” (p. 257). He also notes, “it has only been in the last hundred years or so that the ties between musical sound and human movement have been minimized” (p. 257). Rhythmic communal movement, such as folk dancing, provides a way for humans to connect both with our immediate communities, and to our extended communities. Rhythmic movement alone, without music, such as Tai Chi provides a means through which humans can experience and connect with our spiritual selves. Music moves us, and it is arguably music’s ability to be felt so strongly, especially within a community performance, that makes it essential to our human nature.

---

9 see remarks on Levitin, page 40.
10 Tai Chi is an ancient Taoist movement and meditative practice designed to restore health and well-being.
http://www.taoist.org/taoist-tai-chi-arts/
Chapter Three

Research Design

The purpose of this dissertation is to investigate and portray the ways that Dalcroze pedagogy exemplifies holistic education. The project employs narrative research tools and techniques to develop and depict the data. Five Dalcroze teachers and students were invited to consider the research question: In what ways does a Dalcroze approach to music education exemplify holistic education? They describe experiences that they believe are holistic, or that have caused them to experience soulful or personally meaningful connections in Dalcroze classes during semi-structured interviews with the researcher. Narrative methodology provides the opportunity to investigate the personal, professional, and scholarly (Beattie 2009) perspectives of teachers and students, and to convey the nature of their experiences. The participants’ stories are told using their own words, thus revealing meaningful events and personal experiences to the reader. I have provided my relevant history in Chapter 1 so that the reader may observe the points of resonance between my story and the stories of the participants.

Qualitative Research

Academic research has traditionally assigned more credence to quantifiable, observable knowledge than to artistic ways of understanding and portraying human relationships because of a belief that presupposes the idea of an absolute truth. In research, this is known as a positivist or modernist approach. Traynor (1997) describes modernity as “a period characterized by a belief that the use of reason and rationality offers the key to social progress and human destiny” (p. 100). In contrast, qualitative research inquiry provides practical knowledge, points of view, and a means for studying inexact sciences and complex human thoughts and behaviours. Educational research is a social science in which people seek to understand educational issues, human beliefs
and intentions, and the interactions of students, teachers, and curricula within the context of diverse circumstances. Beattie (1995) stresses the importance of research providing practical knowledge for teachers, and identifies five orientations of practical knowledge: “situational, theoretical, personal, social, and experiential” (p. 57). Eisner (1998) states,

Qualitative inquiry – in this case the study of schools or classrooms – can provide the double advantage of learning about schools and classrooms in ways that are useful for understanding other schools and classrooms and particular teachers in ways that are useful to them. (p. 12)

Particularly in the case of arts education, research aims to inform practitioners’ understanding of their craft, and to advance academic knowledge and scholarly literature in ways that are true to artistic understanding and sensibility.

Hermeneutics. Within qualitative research, a variety of approaches provide the opportunity to understand multiple meanings and points of view, including those of the researcher. Interpretation is both inherent and necessary and is understood as a basic tenet of undertaking qualitative research. The theory of hermeneutics recognizes that all knowledge is filtered through our own culturally influenced points of view. Bresler (1995) states:

Understanding cannot be pursued in the absence of context and interpretive framework. In hermeneutic perspective, human experience is context-bound and there can be no context-free or neutral scientific language with which to express what happens in the social world. At best we could have laws applying only to a limited context for a limited time. (p. 8)

In this research project, there are at least two levels of interpretation that occur during the construction of the narratives. The participants convey their interpretations and recollections of their experiences as the interviews unfold, and the researcher interprets the intentions of the participants and the meanings of their stories. Their experiences are embodied and hold profound and deep meaning; in some cases, their experiences are life changing. Brogden (2010) explains the phenomenon of a double hermeneutic:
The concept is used to name interactions present between the text attributable to the research focus, topic, or participant and the text the researcher brings to the inquiry. These two contexts – the context of that which is being researched (often referred to as the object of the research) and the context of the researcher (often referred to as the subject of the research) – interact dialogically and co-inform one another within the research process. (p. 323)

A third hermeneutic comes into play as the reader interprets and makes sense of the narratives as they are filtered and understood through yet another level of perspective and point of view. Coulter and Smith (2009) claim, “Multiple interpretations by multiple readers are expected and promoted” (p. 578). Thus, the audience’s interpretation of the participants’ stories is also part of the co-creation of knowledge. Greene (1995) shares her own perspective as reader: “It was essential for me to make my own sense of what I read, to incarnate it, to learn what it had to tell me” (p. 105).

**Arts Informed and Artistic Portrayals of Research**

Eisner (1998) claims, “History, art, literature, dance, drama, poetry, and music are among the most important forms through which humans have represented and shaped their experience” (p. 2). He argues that artistic portrayals of research are also valid forums for conveying and expressing humanity, human perceptions, and human knowledge. Eisner (1997) explains, “the material presented is more evocative than denotative, and in its evocation, it generates insight and invites attention to complexity” (p. 8). Arts-based research deals with interpretative meaning, multiplicity of meaning, and individual perception and creativity. In order to be understood, it must be experienced and felt, absorbed, and reflected upon. Just as art enlightens and informs our spiritual sensibilities, artistic research acknowledges and gives voice to the mysterious and intuitive aspects of humanity. Beattie (1995) claims, “The arts and the humanities have used narrative forms to interpret and describe our experiences as human beings down through the centuries, as
through literature, music, drama, history, art and dance, we have continually tried to describe what it means to be human” (p. 59).

Arts-informed portrayals of research can include any art form – photographs, films, literature, drama, music, and/or dance. They are particularly suitable in applications of critical enquiry because the arts have the ability to equalize issues of privilege and power. In the arts, differences and inequalities in cognitive ability are not relevant. Greene (1995) notes that personal stories will downplay the notion of differences in pluralist societies. She claims, “the more continuous and authentic personal encounters can be, the less likely will it be that categorizing and distancing take place” (p. 155). Artful portrayals of research can therefore be an effective way to convey meaning and understanding equitably.

Artful portrayals of research de-emphasize logistical thinking. They have the potential to connect with the reader through an embodied realm, and to elicit a powerful emotional reaction – a lived experience – from the audience. The arts are an embodiment of their subject – linking the subject directly to its portrayal. They therefore have the potential to elicit a personally meaningful reaction from their audience, beyond the acquisition of knowledge. It is through experiencing, and not passively receiving knowledge that we become more fully and deeply awakened to meaningful understanding. In arts-informed research portrayals, the reader assumes an active role – as questioner, inter-actor, and interpreter of the research. In this sense, artistic research portrayals have the potential to elicit a transformational learning experience for the reader.

In this research project, the participants’ experiences are conveyed to the reader in the form of literary narrative, frequently using the participants’ own words to engage the reader in a responsive and felt experience. By including original quotes and conveying the atmosphere and general setting of the interviews, it is the intent of the researcher to draw the reader in to the text,
so that the reader becomes familiar with the participants, understands the contexts of their stories, empathizes with them, and attempts to understand the impressions and meanings they are trying to convey. Beattie (2007b) notes, “Their [the participants’] narrative excerpts show the interconnectedness of the intellectual, imaginative, emotional, and social dimensions of their lives” (p. 1). I invite the reader to ‘hear’ my participants’ words, to empathize with them, to consider their perspectives, and to be moved by their stories.

**Researching Experience through Narrative inquiry**

Narrative methodology allows the researcher to investigate the deep meanings of the participants’ lived experiences within the contexts of their individual perceptions and perspectives. Connelly and Clandinin (1990) claim, “Narrative is a way of characterizing the phenomena of human experience and its study” (p. 2). This research project explores the personal relationships and insights that the participants have had through their experiences with Dalcroze pedagogy, particularly the ways in which their experiences have affected them, their lives, their sense of self, of music, and of being, if indeed they have been affected.

Although my participants have all had some experience with Dalcroze pedagogy, their backgrounds and roles within this method are diverse. As complexity is a significant structural element in crafting an effective qualitative research design, I strive to present and explore several different perspectives through my five participants’ individual accounts of their personal lived experiences. The ways in which we make meaning from experience are unique to our individual personalities, backgrounds, knowledge, and values. Therefore the participants’ stories will be diverse and personal. It is the meaning held by the participants of their holistic experiences in Dalcroze pedagogy which I seek to explore and convey. The participants are being asked to con-
sider and to share the ways in which Dalcroze pedagogy affected them and the ways in which they think their experiences relate (or do not relate) to holistic education. Beattie (2007b) claims,

Narrative methods allow the researcher to acknowledge the values intentions and purposes which give these individuals' lives their meaning, and to explore the frameworks within which they make the links between intellect and imagination, between past present and future, and between self, school, and society. (p. 12)

**Conveying Meaning in Narrative Research**

As a methodology, narrative inquiry is particularly applicable to education research. It provides the researcher with a medium that conveys meaning that develops and enriches knowledge and understanding. Education is an evolving process, based on interactions, relationships, and connections. According to Beattie (1995), narrative research “allows us to describe and represent the human relations and interactions inherent in the complex acts of teaching and learning, and to validate their multiple realities and many dimensions” (p. 54). It is through the telling and re-telling of stories that both the researcher and the reader obtain insights into their own praxes and professional learning.

Clandinin and Connelly (2000) claim that understanding education is about understanding experience, and those experiences, the “epiphanies, rituals, routines, metaphors, and everyday actions” (p. xxiv), are both acknowledged and conveyed through narrative thinking. The meanings assigned by the participants’ in regard to their experiences are affected by factors such as context, background, and perspective. Clandinin, Pushor, and Orr (2007) claim, “Narrative inquiry requires attention to narrative conceptualizations as phenomenon and method, and to the interplay of the three commonplaces of temporality, sociality, and place in the inquiry process” (p. 33). Their individual stories inform the reader of their experiences, and also reflect their different backgrounds and perspectives. The reader makes sense of the stories by taking context into account. Barrett and Stauffer (2009) claim, “what makes an account a narrative inquiry rather
than a story – is one’s willingness not only to look for connection and consonance, but also to recognise that different perspectives, voices, and experiences exist and can inform” (p. 2).

After I wrote the interviews as narrative chapters, the participants were invited to make edits, omissions, additions, and to provide clarification as they wished. Thus, the data chapters become collaborative narratives, co-created by the participants and the researcher. Beattie (2007b) explains, “Collaborative relationships with participants are at the heart of this kind of research, and they create a context for dialogue and story-telling, sharing ideas, the mutual construction of interpretations, and the co-creation of meanings” (p. 11). Through the ongoing process of collaborative development, narratives assume greater clarity and insight, and convey deeper levels of meaning. Connelly and Clandinin (1990) describe this development as “a shared narrative construction and reconstruction through the inquiry” (p. 5). Narrative methodology functions both as a means to portray the research data, and also, because of its literary portrayal of the data, assumes an important function within the story-telling, directly governing the ways the stories are being told. As a result, Clandinin and Connelly (2000) consider narrative methodology as “both the phenomena under study and method of study” (p. 4).

At best, the narratives that I construct can only represent the verbal depictions of the participants’ actual experiences; words cannot adequately convey their actual, multifaceted perceptions. Their experiences are sometimes so personal, that they have difficulty articulating them. As they tell their stories, they reconstruct their impressions of recollected and often poignant experiences. Eisner (1998) recommends, “To help others see and understand ... one must be able to use language to reveal what, paradoxically, words can never say” (p. 3). Clandinin and Connelly (2000) claim, “people live stories, and in the telling of these stories, reaffirm them, modify them, and create new ones” (p. xxvi). The participants’ co-created narrative chapters are intended to re-
create their experiences as closely as possible for the reader. As I convey their experiences through narrative story-telling, I use their words, but also provide what I believe to be relevant, contextual reflections and comments on their experiences. Beattie (1995) states,

The main goal of this kind of research is in observing and understanding, and in providing rich descriptions of the settings observed and of the activities, beliefs, understandings and ways of knowing of those who live out their lives in those settings. (p. 56)

Clandinin and Connelly (2000) describe the role of the researcher as one that fluctuates between acting as observer and as interviewer. By this, they mean that the researcher interacts with the participants to obtain their stories, and then steps back to collect and depict unbiased data to the best of her ability. Beattie (1995) suggests, “ethnographers are not concerned with maintaining detachment from the target of their inquiry, but instead strive towards attachment and ‘indwelling’ (p. 56, referencing Polanyi 1958). The researcher and the participant develop a relationship that is reflected in the narratives. Clandinin and Connelly (2000) state:

The way an interviewer acts, questions, and responds in an interview shapes the relationship and therefore the ways participants respond and give accounts of their experience. The conditions under which the interview takes place also shape the interview; for example, the place, the time of day, and the degree of formality established. (p. 110)

Creswell (2009) also notes, “not all interviewees are equally articulate and perceptive” (p. 179). As the researcher, I encourage my participants to disclose as much detail as possible, all the while being aware of and careful to minimize my influence. Narrative inquiry allows the researcher to engage in exploring, interpreting, and conveying personal experiences and meanings, and also to connect with the reader in a very personal way.

The interviews were co-constructed into separate narratives, comprising Chapters 4 through 8. Four of the five participants edited and re-edited their chapters, clarifying points of confusion, and sometimes offering additional information. As such, the final rendering of the da-
ta, the narrative chapters, are co-created narrative depictions of their experiences. Coulter and Smith (2009) state, “narrative researchers strive to re-describe events retrospectively (Freeman 2007) through the lens of collaborative interpretations with participants” (p. 578, referencing Freeman 2007). At best, the narratives are portraits of the phenomena being studied. Lawrence-Lightfoot and Davis (1997) use the term portraiture to refer to social science inquiry. They comment, “The portraits are designed to capture the richness, complexity, and dimensionality of human experience in social an cultural context, conveying the perspectives of the people who are negotiating those experiences” (p. 3).

Coulter and Smith (2009) claim, “narrative research strives to portray experience, to question common understandings, to offer ‘a degree of interpretive space’” (p. 577, quoting Barone 2001). They also claim that narrative offers an opportunity to “bring the two parts of human experience [reason and emotion] together” (p. 578). In discussing narrative research, Barrett and Stauffer (2009) suggest, “The moment of disquiet, the instance of unsettling, and the recognition of certainties troubled may be the very times and spaces where insight takes root – the places of fertile ground” (p. 2).

**Narrative Methodology and Holistic Education**

Narrative methodology involves analyzing the participants’ experiences, in this case, to unveil themes that relate to holistic education. Themes and clusters of themes were derived from the interviews, discussions, and correspondences, allowing for a flexible process of analysis. Narrative methodology is considered holistic employing interconnections of mind (intellectual understanding), body (felt experience), and spirit (deep and insightful meaning), while enabling the exploration of multiplicity of meanings. Beattie (1995) states:
The research is also grounded in Miller’s (2000, 1996, 1993) work on holistic education where the education of the whole person involves making connections between linear thinking and intuition, between mind and body, among domains of knowledge, between self and community, to the earth, and between the various dimensions of the self. (p. 11, referencing J. Miller)

Through the collaborative co-creation of my participants’ stories, the data developed into meaningful, rich narratives, through which the reader will gain a deeper understanding of the ‘condition of being’ (Schnebly-Black & Moore 1997) that is experienced in Dalcroze classes.

**Data Collection**

The central research question for this inquiry is: *In what ways does a Dalcroze approach to music education exemplify holistic education?*

Data for this research project consists of the recollected experiences of these five participants – two teachers, and three students, as shared with the researcher through multiple recorded interviews and written correspondence. These were reconstructed as narratives for each participant. The narratives were then sent to each participant for editing and any other changes, omissions, additions, and clarifications that they wished to make.

**Recruiting the Participants.** The Canadian Dalcroze community, (Dalcroze Canada\(^\text{11}\)) has offered a summer training program in Toronto for the past three years. With their permission, I distributed a general invitation to participate in the study. Three of the participants for this study were students at the summer training session offered in 2013. They represent various levels of experience with Dalcroze pedagogy; one of them is new to the pedagogy, one has been studying for many years, the other is an Orff teacher who studies Dalcroze pedagogy as part of an overall lifetime interest in arts education. The other two participants are Dalcroze teachers. One of them has significantly more teaching experience than the other. They both accepted my direct

\(^{11}\) www.dalcrozecanada.com
invitation to participate. With the exception of one, all of the participants in this study have had several years of experience with Dalcroze classes and pedagogy.

**Conducting the interviews.** Participants were provided in advance with a brief description of my research interests, a description of holistic education as being concerned with relationships, and the main research question as stated above, as well as the following interview prompts:

1. Describe any or some of the experiences of connection that you have encountered in Dalcroze Eurhythmics classes.
2. What contexts or situations have influenced or affected these experiences, (Creswell 2013, p. 81), such as personal history, background, musical, educational, dance, or other experiences? Depending on the response to these questions, follow up questions may include:
3. What are your personal connection experiences that have resulted from experiencing the fusion of music and movement in music education?
4. As a Dalcroze Eurhythmics student / teacher, based on your own experiences, describe instances or experiences that would demonstrate a connections between:
   i) student – music, ii) student – teacher, iii) teacher – music, iv) student – student
5. Describe the 'spark' of the embodied experience that occurs during the fusion of intellect, body, and spirit when moving as a spontaneous or choreographed response to hearing music.
6. How does the fusion of movement and music affect the ways that you understand
   i) music notation? ii) ensemble playing? iii) any of the elements or foundational concepts of music, namely melody, harmony, rhythm, form, timbre, phrase, or texture?
7. Please feel free to introduce or share any other experiences that you have had, or thoughts
that might provide insight into the holistic aspects of Dalcroze Eurhythmics, specifically the spiritual or insightful connections(s) which occur or start to develop when learning or teaching music through movement.

**Constructing the narratives.** All of the interview sessions were recorded and transcribed verbatim, and then reconstructed into individual narratives, one for each participant. For the most part, the narratives were structured as temporal stories, following the paths of the participants’ lives as they occurred in time. Details regarding the settings of the interviews are also provided, to provide context and to bring the reader into the stories. The narratives were sent electronically to each participant. Most of them commented that the narratives accurately and intuitively captured the meanings that they had intended to describe. Four out of the five participants participated in editing and revising their personal narratives, some with great attention to accuracy and details. The fifth participant acknowledged receiving the narrative, but did not respond with any suggestions or edits.

**Data Analysis and Reporting**

Qualitative research is open-ended; the outcome unpredictable, and the data analysis procedure depends in part upon the data that is presented. Narratives are “snap-shots in time”, presenting knowledge and perspectives that are as unique as the individuals who created them. (Beattie 2007a, p. 163). With the narratives completed, it remained to identify and present any common themes among the participants that were illustrative of holistic pedagogy.

I returned to the original transcriptions, re-reading them to highlight references to holistic education. These references were collected in a separate document and then re-organized into themes. Clandinin and Connelly (2000) state, “An inquirer composing a research text looks for the patterns, narrative threads, tensions, and themes either within or across an individual’s expe-
rience and in the social setting” (p. 132). Recalling Clandinin, Pushor, and Orr’s recommendations (from p. 58 of this thesis), consideration is also given to temporality, sociality, and place when constructing meaning in the narrative process. However, this process shifts with the researcher’s unfolding understanding of meaning that she derives from the data. Creswell (2009) states, “qualitative data analysis is conducted concurrently with gathering data, making interpretations, and writing reports” (p. 184). The emergent themes that formed the foundations for the findings of this inquiry were derived through analyzing the lived experiences of the five participants in terms of holistic education. The findings and their implications are discussed in the ensuing discussion chapter, with suggestions for further studies included in the final summary chapter.

According to Creswell (2009), a narrative passage might include “the detailed discussion of several themes (complete with subthemes, specific illustrations, multiple perspectives from individuals, and quotations) or a discussion with interconnecting themes” (p. 189). In qualitative methodology, the process is always interpretive – the researcher extrapolates and creates themes and outcomes. To help legitimate qualitative studies in general, Creswell also suggests the use of triangulation, member checking, using thick descriptions, and using an external auditor. Triangulation is evident in the content of the emergent themes, being rich with transformational experiences.
PART II

THE PARTICIPANTS

Chapter Four

Ann

Ann studies Dalcroze for the love of it, rather than to acquire accreditation. She attends any workshops and courses are offered in Toronto, which amounts to a few weekend sessions and perhaps a week of summer classes per year. She works as a teaching assistant, supporting children and youth with special needs in grades Kindergarten to Grade 8. Ann offers Dalcroze Eurhythmics to the students at her school during physical education classes, as well as to the Primary Choir, and the Grade 3 Orff Group. She enjoys observing the progress her students make and appreciates their positive feedback.

I had met Ann a few times at Dalcroze workshops over the years. She was attending the summer training program in Toronto when I announced to her class that I was looking for participants for a research study. She and another student met with me during their lunch break. I met with Ann again at her home in Toronto on a summer afternoon in August of 2013 for a more in-depth discussion; she had prepared a delicious lunch for us to eat while we conducted our interview.

Background

Ann’s experiences with and exposure to music education started in nursery school, when she was still quite small. There were two well-established teachers at her nursery school who offered music and movement as part of their program. She recalled the musical experiences from those days long ago:
Well, actually then it goes back even further because in nursery school, I went to Branksome Hall\textsuperscript{12} – just for nursery school. They had 2 teachers who had a music and movement program. They played games, singing games. They were hugely established, the two of them. We did all kinds of wonderful things. I actually went back and bought their book. They finally wrote something down on paper, because then it was just sheets of this and that, and finally they actually wrote out some of their lessons. And I was very young, before the Conservatory. I was very shy, and I had to be able to hold my arms and be partners. I can remember doing \textit{In and Out the Windows} from a very early age. (personal correspondence, August 26, 2013)

From there, and while still in her formative years, she completed two years of lessons with the Kelly Kirby Kindergarten Method through the Royal Conservatory of Music (RCM) in Toronto. This program was popular for children in the late twentieth century, and offered group classes for young children in piano performance and theory. She explained that her mother was a strong proponent of music and dance for children:

From a very early age I was very active, and I already had in fact, the music and movement and the social aspects of being with other children. So, I took Kelly Kirby Kindergarten piano lessons, from Mrs. Kirby and her assistant. That was up on Avenue Road – a satellite branch of the Royal Conservatory of Music. We were four, five, and six years old. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

After completing the Kelly Kirby program, Ann attended Orff\textsuperscript{13} classes through the RCM. Orff is a very child-centred approach to music education. In group classes, children play, sing, dance, improvise on specially designed pitched percussion instruments, and explore the rhythms through speech games and poetry.

I was in one of the first Orff classes in Canada, when I was 6! And, it was brand new – it would have been in the late 50s early 60s. I had all of these exceptional experiences when I was very young, and then I continued with my musical training with piano ... violin in school, and other instruments. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann received the best musical opportunities that were available at the time, and continued to study music through her elementary school-age years. Her childhood included more musical

\textsuperscript{12} Branksome Hall is a private school in downtown Toronto.

\textsuperscript{13} Orff – short for Carl Orff Music for Children. It is a child-centred music education program that employs speech rhythms, improvisation, percussion instruments, movement, and singing. See http://www.orffcanada.ca
training than most people experience in their lifetime. The very early musical experiences were never forgotten:

It was that very early beginning with music and movement at Branksome Hall and then into Kelly Kirby Kindergarten piano, and then the Orff, and then of course, as I said, I had more formal training from then on, but that very early beginning stuff made a lasting impression. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

After graduating from secondary school, Ann became a teacher for the Kelly Kirby Kindergarten Method, which was still being offered at that time by the RCM as their introductory piano and theory program for young children. She also completed the Child and Youth Worker Diploma (honours) program, which provided training for teachers who work with children and adolescents. This course is similar to the current Early Childhood Educator (ECE) course, except today’s model is designed for teachers who instruct younger children. She found that her formal training in education was lacking movement pedagogy, perhaps because of her strong background in comprehensive early childhood music programs. She began looking for something that would tie her two career interests together; which were to become a specialized child and youth worker, and a music teacher:

I had just finished doing my child and youth worker certification. And I realized as I finished my formal training … that it was just too dry. There was no place for movement in it … I’d heard that there was this connection between ECE and the advanced certificate in Early Childhood Music Education being offered through the Conservatory and Ryerson University. I was accepted into the program, taking the Dalcroze Level 1 course as an introductory course at the RCM. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann immediately felt that she had made the right decision in pursuing training in Early Childhood Music Education (ECME). Her first encounter with Dalcroze pedagogy not only reawakened the joy and passion for music and movement she remembered from those early musical games, but also provided an epiphanic moment, ‘erupting’ in a spontaneous sensation of pure joy:
… and from the moment I walked in that room, the sorts of things that we were asked to do, I just thought – something happened in me … all of my early childhood music experiences kind of erupted inside of me, and I had this huge, epiphany right from the very beginning. I almost started laughing to myself, saying this is far too easy. What am I doing? This is what I did as a child! It was musical play for me and I was just so … immediately happy. I hadn’t had very much happiness in my life, so it was a real impetus to take a closer look at it. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann believes the very early training that she experienced as a young child laid the foundation for her later study of Dalcroze pedagogy. Her first Dalcroze class was composed of adult students who were studying this pedagogy as part of their ECME training. Even though this was her first session, the experience of moving to music and of walking to the beat was very familiar to her, having had similar experiences in the Branksome Hall nursery program.

So this is what sort of, all came into alignment when I walked into this Dalcroze class, and this huge “PFPFFFP” of – Oh my God – I know all this, and I don’t just know it, I – I have it in me! That was a huge connection for me. That was … primal. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann was experiencing deep connections to her childhood experiences through the Dalcroze exercises. Whereas some of the other students were experiencing hesitation and perhaps some inhibitions, moving to music felt very natural for her:

I could do whatever they wanted me to do. And it felt so easy, and everybody else was struggling, and it just felt … innate. It started to come out when I hadn’t even thought about it or looked at it since that early age, really. So, it became the foundation for my higher learning in Dalcroze, and then into plastique animée14, and then just continuing for the love of it! (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

She continued to take the Dalcroze courses, obtaining Level I and Level II as requirements for ECME certification. She also enrolled in workshops and courses through the Dalcroze Society of Canada, as she said, “for the love of it … ’cause I have nowhere else to put it! It’s all

---

14 Plastique animée is a form of Dalcroze pedagogy that Ann encountered after her basic training. The intention is to realize music through choreographed movement. The movement is choreographed to represent musical aspects, to embody or kinaesthetically translate the details of music literally and comprehensively, yet artistically.
just very ethereal and wonderful.” She believed that she had found the connection between music education and her interests in childhood education.

**Plastique Animée**

Pedagogy Levels I and II were the only Dalcroze courses available in Toronto at that time. Ann wanted to continue studying Dalcroze pedagogy, but travelling to other cities where advanced level courses were available was not a viable option. Instead, one of the Dalcroze teachers decided to implement a plastique animée group to provide further Dalcroze training for interested students.

I had finished the formal Dalcroze I, Dalcroze II, and there wasn’t anything more to do, so this was like … and one of the teachers was also saying, on that level, that the plastic animée was the next level of expression. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

The phrase *plastique animée* translates loosely into *animated sculptures* or *moving models*. In Dalcroze pedagogy, plastique animée can be experienced and studied as a soloist or as part of an ensemble. Students incorporate their understanding of all of the elements of Dalcroze pedagogy, and create a choreographed representation of a piece of music. Jaques-Dalcroze developed plastique animée as an extension of his pedagogy, and envisioned that one day it would become a new art form in movement, separate from music and dance. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) explains:

The final culmination of studies in moving plastic is certainly the direct expression of aesthetic feelings and emotions without the aid of music or even of speech. “Silent” plastic, however, requires wonderful technique gained through an experience that stretches beyond a single human existence. (pp. 28–29)

In a plastique animée experience, students apply the principles of eurhythmics – attending to space, time, and energy to analyze and then choreograph the music. It is different than dance, in which a reciprocal as well as independent relationship exists between the music and the body. In dance, the music and the movement complement each other, but retain their unique, correspond-
ing formal qualities. Conversely, plastique animée is an extended exercise in moving to music, in which eurhythmics students embody or ‘become’ an entire piece of music by imagining, planning, and practising their movements to reflect one or more of the music’s elements — form, texture, harmony, rhythm, melodic structure, intensity, articulation, or nuance. It is an exercise intended to benefit and develop the Dalcroze student’s sense of the music, as she embodies various aspects of the music as closely as possible. The fact that it is also beautiful and intriguing to watch is consequential and not as significant as the experience of creating and performing it, although Jaques-Dalcroze considered plastique animée as an art form in its own rite.\(^\text{15}\)

The Toronto group, under the direction of Dalcroze instructors, provided a way for the advanced students to continue their studies. The founding teacher believed that a plastique animée group would be of benefit to all students by providing both an opportunity for spiritual centring through artistic creativity and a fulfilling and edifying musical adventure. It was a new forum for this group of teachers and students, and a unique chapter in the history and development of Dalcroze pedagogy in Toronto. Ann elaborated:

The group would meet, and it became very solemn in some senses, but then very joyful. It started out almost like a centring, we would centre, do things together, just centre. Someone was responsible for warm-ups, and then we would have ideas on what it was that we were going to do – it was like a lesson. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann was delegated as the keeper of the memoirs, and kept comprehensive notes after each class. She was also, on occasion, given the task of leading the warm-up exercises:

I was set in charge of doing the warm ups which I felt honoured to lead. I thought, ‘these are world-renowned people who have been teaching me, and now I am being asked to lead them.’ I tried not to think about it, and just do it. One time, Jason\(^\text{16}\) walked in with his flute, and immediately joined in with my plan. I was really moved. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

\(^\text{15}\) An example of plastique animée can be seen at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8ZX6bMWcNTM

\(^\text{16}\) Jason is a fictitious name.
For Ann, the plastique animée group provided not only a forum in which to continue studying music through Dalcroze pedagogy, but also an opportunity to discover a new relationship with the Dalcroze community as the group began to re-create the music through movement. One of the members, Donald Himes\textsuperscript{17} was a Dalcroze master teacher and diploma supérieur honoris causa recipient\textsuperscript{18}. Ann described his gentle but erudite presence:

Donald was always in his own world, silently contemplating the energies within the group, how the group was developing, where the line was going. He would then take it one step farther into unknown territory, where people were definitely challenged, and let us struggle with whatever the concept was. It was always difficult, but challenging in that he wanted us to use all of the information that we had, and turn it into a new creation. He relied on Marina\textsuperscript{19} to begin with the nuts and bolts of development, and then he would throw an abstract concept at us and wait to see what would happen. He always made sure that he could do it before he asked the group to attempt it. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

With this group, Ann felt that she was not only a student, but also a member of a new and exciting Dalcroze community. She discovered a new source of personal creativity and artistry within herself as she delved deeper into her own musical expressivity.

**Spiritual Connections through Movement**

During the first few years of the twenty-first century, the Dalcroze community in Toronto was small in number, with a population of less than twelve teachers and students. The ‘Monday night plastique animée group’ met once a week during this time, but has since disbanded. Ann described the deep connections that were forged between the members:

I found that the warm ups were a way to take the class to another level of understanding. It was almost meditative in that all the cares and concerns of the outside world needed to be put aside, so that the stream of consciousness linking our formal musical education with our teaching experiences, and then this ‘in the moment experience’ somehow con-

\textsuperscript{17} Donald Himes (1930–2011) was a highly respected dancer, musician, composer, teacher, choreographer, and director.
\textsuperscript{18} The diplôme supérieur is the highest level of Dalcroze pedagogy accreditation awarded by l’Institut Jaques-Dalcroze, Geneva, and is considered to be a doctoral equivalent.
\textsuperscript{19} Marina is a fictitious name
nected. The language of music and the Dalcroze experience always took me to another level of understanding. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann’s experiences within this group spawned very personal connections and dream-like episodes for her that seemed to come from a different level of awareness. She recounted one of these experiences that occurred during a demonstration performance. This performance was held to honour the life and lifetime contributions of Donald Himes to Dalcroze pedagogy and to the Dalcroze community. The group was participating in an exercise, which required the students to stand in a circle facing toward the centre, and to occupy higher or lower planes in space, following each other’s movements around the circle like a wave, as if they were all part of an oscillating orbit. Although Ann was merely observing this exercise, she still became completely involved in the activity. She was so attuned to the students’ movements and so singularly caught up in the moment that she temporarily envisioned or felt the movements of planets:

Ann – I had another epiphany last summer, when I was sitting out, observing the rest of the class. It was one of the few times I actually just sat out and observed. We were doing works with the different planes, and suddenly, as I was watching, it was almost as if I could see three planets, in the same section of the sky at a certain time at night, in relation to the horizon, which was water. And suddenly I had this perspective of space, and I could actually see the distance that was going to these three objects, and the relation that it had with the earth, and with me standing there just looking at it.
All of a sudden, I could understand, I could see the relation of time, space and energy in a very meaningful and almost … tangible way. And then I could also see that space was parting, like the molecules in space were allowing it to happen. Sometimes there are blockages of things, for whatever reason, energy doesn’t pass through. But the energy was passing through so there was this give and take, this … transparent, invisible relationship between the movement and the stationary articles in space and the movement of the bodies through it.

Sharon – It sounds like you were all in that non-verbal state of flow20 together.

Ann – That’s right, no words could describe it, and as a matter of fact, I had a hard time later, trying to put it into words, because it was on another level, and I felt like I was experiencing this very cerebrally, and yet very inwardly, like there was this huge connection

20 A term used by Csikszentmihalyi to denote a deep, embodied experience, being totally absorbed in the performance. See Chapter 1, p. 13 and Chapter 2, p. 38.
between my mind and my body, and this seemed very spiritual – this kind of relationship, because there were no words. And I went whoa! That’s really quite something – because it … it must have also had something to do with the way the light was shining through the windows. It was a very new and wonderful experience for me to witness that event. With everybody doing the exercise; the music, the movement, the timing, it was the essence of Dalcroze pedagogy. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

The students’ movements were more than a metaphor for planetary movements, rather, the plastique animée and the movements became parallel metaphors for the interlocking, living relationships between time, space, and energy. The interdependence of those three elements of movement became very real for Ann as she focused on the movement, seeing and feeling the students interact with each other and with the music. She was completely empathetic with the students’ deep surrender to the music within the exercise. She was in flow with them as they surrendered their bodies to the energy of the music, creating one moving system, much like a living solar system.

I asked Ann to elaborate on the ways that the connection between the students related to the music. Although the music inspired the movement, I wondered if a reciprocal experience were occurring, if the movement in turn helped to bring everyone into focus on the music, to experience a state of flow:

Everyone has the same intention. It’s the rhythms inside the body. It’s the connecting of the spiritual, I think, really, initially, although we would never say that. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann recognizes the spiritual experience that the movement of that exercise inspired, but she also understands that within the Dalcroze community, spirituality is not normally mentioned or discussed. In Toronto, as in most North American cultures, people generally do not openly disclose or discuss their personal spirituality; hence her remark, “although we would never say that.”
Ann also became interested in *Qi Gong*\(^{21}\) during this time. She was recovering from a serious illness, and the Qi Gong classes enabled her to become more in touch and in tune with her body:

I was definitely discombobulated. I mean I could feel ... like there was no connection at all anymore, at all. So, it took several months before I could actually think about taking this course in this summer. Because I know how ... how careful one must be ... and that it’s very demanding physically. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

She described the connection that she felt in her Qi Gong classes:

This year, I’ve become more aware of that connection, *[between spirit, mind and body]* because I was not in my body for a long time, and then I took Qi Gong classes. When I first took that class, I just was not in my body, and it was the most incredible experience to feel ... to have that ... connection. It was connecting spirit, mind, and body, – it’s the same idea, but it’s not with music. It’s more to do with these ancient structures, and lines and dealing specifically with the body, and trying to bring it and your energy into alignment. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann recognized the spiritually developmental sensations of being more centred, balanced, and self-aware, and attributed them to participating in movement exercises:

The postures are what have helped me get back into that alignment. Now, I’m much more aware of that alignment. That’s all I’m trying to say. The alignment of the spiritual, and the emotions, and the physical body ... there’s not much intellectually any more!!!!! *(laughs)* (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Participating in Dalcroze classes also enables Ann to develop her personal connection between spirit, mind, and body. Her experiences in the Dalcroze classes reminded her of the holistic connections that she experienced in her Qi Gong classes. They had the same developmental effect on her of honing those personal connections, whether the classes were Qi Gong or Dalcroze.

---

\(^{21}\) *Qi Gong* is an ancient Asian practice that employs movement to achieve a balanced state of spiritual, mental, and physical wellness. See [http://www.qigonghealing.com/qigong/whatis.html](http://www.qigonghealing.com/qigong/whatis.html)
**Bonding and Trust**

Students who are new to Dalcroze pedagogy often feel self-conscious, especially when they do not know the other people in the class. They may wonder if their movements and responses to music are ‘correct’. One of the main purposes of the opening exercises is to dispel any feelings of self-consciousness and fear, to put the students more at ease with movement and with each other. She described how the warm-up exercises felt to her as a student:

Some of the very first exercises that we did were about making connections with the people in the classroom first, before you did anything else, making that eye contact. Sometimes the teachers start with movement, sometimes looking everybody in the eye – very direct. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

A movement class is more instructive and beneficial for the students if they release their inhibitions.

Ann noted that connections also develop between the students, and this has to occur in order for a class to be really meaningful for the students. The students become aware of each other as other moving and thinking bodies:

It also goes back to very, very fundamental Dalcroze exercises, where I can remember the very first, some of the very first exercises that we did … were about making connections with the people in the classroom first, before you did anything else. I find that with the older groups, there’s this expectation that people will just do it and it will happen. But when we first started, at the very beginning, this was very difficult for the people in the classroom, to even make eye contact with anybody else. The students or participants usually never know each other, so the time for warming up takes longer, because people are reluctant to make eye contact initially. Everyone is self-conscious. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

A successful warm-up exercise establishes a sense of security and trust among the students and teacher, guiding the students to release their inhibitions, to become more comfortable with each other, and to thereby derive more benefit from the class. Therefore, the initial exercises in Dalcroze classes are often intended to encourage students to move and to interact freely with each other, and within their space. Once they become comfortable with moving and interacting
together, they are encouraged to engage their bodies artistically with the music, and to interact kinaesthetically with the other students.

Ann works mostly with students who have been identified as needing remedial assistance in school. She indicated that her students are often very withdrawn emotionally from other people. Some of them have a history of neglect, abuse, anxiety, or confusion, all of which lead to general mistrust. Ann commented that it is often more difficult for her students to allow themselves the vulnerability that is required to move with freedom in a classroom setting than it is for the non-supported students because many of her students have been too often and too deeply wounded in their pasts:

I think that for people to be able to trust each other enough, to even look at each other in the eyes takes time. They have become withdrawn emotionally, from other people. It takes a long time before they are able – before they have the inner strength to be able to trust anything about themselves … taking risks. They think they’ll be laughed at. They may have a history of neglect, or they might have experienced some other kind of negative experience that has affected them emotionally. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

She suggested that it is more challenging and difficult for her students to overcome feelings of mistrust, “to even look at each other in the eye”, as compared to other students in the class. We agreed that because the risks are greater for them, they may experience greater fulfillment in overcoming that feeling of risk, when they do start to trust each other. Ann believes that her students benefited in this way from the centring that occurs in the warm-ups. The warm-up activities bring the class into focus, and also provide a bonding experience for the students, so that they can begin to feel safe enough to trust each other.

**Communication**

Ann referred a few times to intention. A musician or composer has an intention – something to convey other than a melody, a good rhythm, or an inspired harmony. She wishes to con-
nect and communicate with an audience through the music, just as any artist may through any other art form. The connection may be on one or several levels; it may be whimsical, or deeply moving, even disturbing, but there must be an intention to connect, in order for there to be communication. Ann described a class experience that required the participants to move their arms; their arms were describing the beat, but each student’s movements were unique and beautiful. Although the music was the same, each student brought their own unique movement preferences to the class, and was hearing and responding to different nuances in the music. Dalcroze (1930/1985) offers this explanation for this phenomenon:

Here rhythm is the link between mind and senses, and this to such a degree that each pupil speedily rejects the current opinion which looks upon the body as inferior to the mind. He quickly comes to regard his body as an instrument of incomparable delicacy susceptible of the noblest and the most artistic expression (p. 111)

Ann remarked, “the music tells you where to move, you just have to be open to it.” By actively listening, each individual student is connected to the music, and in turn, is connected and also responds to the composer’s intent:

I keep going back to this word from last year – it is intention – the intention of the composer, because they exist in some other plane. Composers are not using words, they don’t use words. It’s these ideas and these intentions that they have, about … “How do I bring this, what I’m hearing, into a form that somebody else is going to be able to interpret or understand?”… It’s a huge component of listening. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann inferred that musicians try to discern the composer’s intention, and then convey that intention through music. If we only hear and express the elements of music, our performances could fall flat. They might be technically brilliant, but without artistic intention, they are not authentic. This is what distinguishes a moving performance from a technical one. In order for a performance to be an authentic arts experience, the music must have a soulful connection and communicate on a spiritual level.
Dalcroze classes are often about discovering those intentions, first through our bodies by listening and attending to musical nuance, and then by reflecting on our expressions and experiences as moving, musical bodies. Ann described the musical encounter, but also stipulated the important role that trust plays within the group in order for the students to feel free enough to experience and embody the composer’s intent:

There’s that sense of trust. There’s something there that is really important. We yearn for it. It’s almost like being on another planet, where we can have this freedom, because we don’t have it any other time in our life. It’s, when we come together, and suddenly we have this freedom because we think similarly, we have similar experiences, we know what we’re experiencing, although we may not use words. It’s a bit ethereal, you know, it’s other-worldly in a sense. It’s a presence and a ‘being’ that escapes terminology, really, and that’s the essence of … when we hear music, and we think, “What is it that moves us so much?” (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Dalcroze students can become deeply involved in their embodied experiences on many levels, including listening, interpreting, socially interacting, and moving responsively and expressively. The experience is difficult to convey with words. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) advises that the only way to understand his pedagogy is to experience what happens in class, “The minute work of analysing and constructing rhythms can only be appreciated in the lessons, and then only by persons who are themselves actually taking part with their whole body and mind, i.e., personally experiencing them” (pp. 147–148). Ann emphasized the importance of personal experience in Dalcroze pedagogy, “to experience what happens to You”. Not everyone will get the same expression or insight from the class, but she believes that if students are open to it, there will be a revelation. She described the revelation and the circumstances:

Because each person is experiencing it in a different place in their body, or in their mind, or in their being. It’s a different experience within their whole being. But it’s also, I think, a connection to each person’s spirituality. I think there is an element of trust, and … this connection to your whole being … allows yourself to do it. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)
Ann believes that when musicians are playing, they are often not ‘in their bodies’. Sometimes they are thinking too much – perhaps about what notes to play, how to voice a chord progression, or how the harmonies are progressing. Or perhaps they are reading notes and processing information, while their fingers are executing the realization or translation of the score. The music is not necessarily being felt in the whole body. Ann commented:

But, sometimes, when you’re playing music, the body just isn’t always in line – that’s the thing – there’s too much – just trying to get it right – trying to get the right notes at the right time … especially when you’re reading. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann was noticing that during practice sessions, the brain often thinks about the notes, and does not always ‘step back’ far enough to notice how those notes feel in the body. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) contends, “Consciousness of sound can only be acquired by experiences of the ear and voice; consciousness of rhythm by reiterated experiences of movements of the whole body” (p. 80).

**Dalcroze Education as Holistic Education**

Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) suggests that students became better coordinated, healthier, and more intuitive as a result of becoming more rhythmically connected with their bodies: “Perhaps my method of training by and in rhythm will help him [the American child] to advance with more confidence on the path of spiritual and physical self-conquest” (p. xiv). Ann described the balance and sense of wellness that she experiences in Dalcroze classes:

I think that wellness … becomes self-evident, because there’s fluidity where once there was none. There are connections, and the connections become apparent. There are no angles, or, if the angles are there, they are meant to be there. There is a greater sense of self, with a clarity of intention. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann believes that Dalcroze pedagogy works well in a classroom due to the fact that students are required to mingle and interact. Ann feels that there is a deliberate attempt at establish-
ing a connection between the students in Dalcroze classes, so that they are able to work more securely and creatively in relation to each other:

Dalcroze worked also with people who were actors, so he did a lot of observing of the way that people move. He didn’t want to see people in isolation; he wanted to see people in relation. He wanted to see people in community. And I thought that was really interesting, because that’s the natural form. What he was trying to do, in my mind and understanding, was to somehow bring that ability or that natural way of moving with music into a more isolated kind of venue, which would be specifically, instrumental playing or orchestras, or other musical ensembles. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)

Ann believes that Jaques-Dalcroze used his students’ natural inclination to interact with others within a safe community setting to create an enjoyable social forum for his movement classes. Social interaction is critical to the pedagogy; students interact with each other, and respond to each other’s movements.

Dalcroze students are trained to notice and to embody as many of the musical details and as much of the musical nuance as they can hear, and to perform these movements with ease and fluidity of motion. It is not enough to merely be accurate in a Dalcroze exercise, but students are expected to also demonstrate musical nuance through their bodies and their interactions. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) claims:

Sensibility is closely allied to sensation. To be a sensitive musician, it is necessary to appreciate the nuances, not only of pitch, but of the dynamic energy and the varying rapidity of the movements. These nuances must be appreciated not only by the ear but also by the muscular sense. (p. 100)

The movements can be very beautiful and insightful to watch. Ann commented on the aesthetic quality of these movements:

I think that the aesthetic quality is evident in the use of space. It develops through the initial instructions – clapping, showing the actual length of the beat, where it is, and how it is. It’s what your body does. I used to just watch my arms and be absolutely astounded watching other people, how the same idea of beat – just by showing it in its width, or its height, or it doesn’t even need to be in circles, we always used to do circles, it could be this or that, and all of a sudden, the planes start opening up. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)
Ann observed that although everyone was hearing the same music, every person`s movements were slightly different. This could be due to physical differences and movement habits, or it could suggest that their perception of the music is slightly different. The students may be hearing and noticing different aspects of the music; the meaning may be slightly different for each person. For each participant, the way that they perceive (and consequently embody) a musical phrase depends on their previous and unique experiences and musical understanding.

**Transformational Learning**

Ann and I discussed the idea of transformational learning, as being something that changes an individual’s perspectives, and possibly her beliefs and values. Transformational learning can lead the student into greater personal development and insights, and is therefore often more effectual for the student than the content of the lesson. If a student experiments by taking a personal risk during the class, and reaches a new level of expression, she may learn a concept more completely, while also becoming more confident in herself as an artist. Ann therefore believes that her emotionally wounded students particularly benefitted from experiencing a sense of trust in the Dalcroze classes. She also felt that her experience with the plastique animée group affected her, endowing her with an insightful and heightened sense of community and artistry. She described the personal and transformational effects that she experienced when practising plastique animée:

The same process that a person goes through internally, through Dalcroze training, becomes the same process a participant in a plastique animée goes through as a member of the group. Individually the process might be considered introversion. With the group it may be considered extroversion. I experienced it as a very similar process. Once I was confident, I could express my ideas outwardly. It`s like an organic process, which is what the plastique animée is – an extension of that – that`s why it`s a growth process within the individual. You`re not the same. You`re different and you`re growing and you`re changing. You are – in fact each person – is a plastique animée. (personal correspondence, Aug. 26, 2013)
Recalling the meaning of plastique animée as ‘animated sculpture’ or ‘moving model’, Ann was suggesting that each participant is growing through his or her own journey, through his or her personal development, and is, as yet, still only a model or intention of his or her fulfilled, enlightened self.
Chapter Five

Zane

Zane teaches Dalcroze classes in a large urban centre. He is also continuing studying at l’Institut Jaques-Dalcroze in Geneva to obtain the diplôme supérieur, a level that distinguishes the teacher internationally as a master Dalcroze teacher, and is considered a doctoral equivalent. When I first met him, about ten years ago, he had recently finished a Master of Music degree in Dalcroze studies. I asked him to participate in my study because of his comprehensive experience as both student and Dalcroze teacher. We met in the food court of a large retail outlet.

Background

I asked him to provide some details about his musical and pedagogical background for this research study:

I have always known I would be a teacher since I was a child. I have always loved singing and solfêging\(^\text{22}\). Music classes in school were always my favourite. I used to walk to my elementary school practising my solfège syllables, and made up my interval exercises. I did not begin formal instrumental lessons (piano) until age 13. In two years, by age 15, I felt I had to study music for the rest of my life – practising 4 to 6 hours daily, like a newfound passion and obsession. Any free time during my teenage years was spent on trips to the library, taking out books about Glenn Gould\(^\text{23}\), reading interviews about concert artists, and listening to music. I knew composers’ opus numbers better than my high school locker combination! (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

After high school, Zane completed a Bachelor of Music degree in piano performance. However, he did not intend to be a professional performer; his career goal was to be a piano teacher.

\(^{22}\) *solfège* is a French term that refers to a system of naming pitches. Zane used the term here and added the English suffix ‘ing’ to mean that he was using the solfège system as he was singing. It comprises part of the Dalcroze pedagogy, together with eurhythmics and improvisation.

\(^{23}\) Glenn Gould, 1932–1982; Canadian classical pianist. See www.glenngould.com
My heart was always set on teaching – to recognize and appreciate pedagogy in music as a rich and fascinating area. It connects with other art forms, the aesthetics, and the realm of mind-body-spirit. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Learning piano generally involves a mentor-student relationship. Piano lessons are often private, and are most successful when the student enjoys a good personal and working relationship with the teacher. The teacher’s role is to encourage the student, to awaken and motivate her potential for musical artistry, offering advice in such a way as to be more inspirational than critical. Zane described some of the major pedagogical influences that he experienced during his under-graduate years:

The dedication and inspiration from my piano professors during those life changing sessions, through their subtle coaching, wording, gesture, and demonstrations led to triggers of opening and growing in my personal musical path. The intense and disciplined training in preparing for concert programs (both solo and chamber music) and magical/challenging experiences on stage had taught me a lot. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane also spent some of his time at university as a piano accompanist for a vocal teacher. Those sessions introduced him to new concepts of expressivity and nuance:

During my last two years of the under-grad program, I began to work with singers. That was another great opening. It helped me to think of music in a more embodied way. There were many more elements to consider: the resonance, the vocal colour, the poetry, the diction, the phrasing, breathing, subtle shift of tempi, balance, support from piano, and still taking into account the theoretical and structural analysis. During that period of under-grad, I finally fell in love with music theory courses and Bach chorales24. All these experiences still inform and enrich my teaching. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane was in his early 20’s when he completed the Bachelor of Music degree in piano performance. He had just started working toward a Master in Piano Performance degree when he encountered Dalcroze pedagogy. By chance, he was walking by a Dalcroze class that was in progress, and feeling intrigued by the music and movements of the students, he wandered in. The

24 Bach chorales are 4-part (soprano, alto, tenor, and bass) harmonizations of melodies used in church. They are often studied in advanced harmony courses because of their rich harmonic vocabulary.
teacher allowed him to observe the class and invited him to participate. He described the joyful sense of artistic freedom that he felt when he first moved expressively to the music. As he began to freely interpret the music with his entire body, he experienced the essence and expressivity of the music without being hampered by the restrictions and mechanics of his instrument:

So I started to move with them, and I thought, “This is the best thing ever in the world, because I get to leap, I get to skip, I get to run … with the music.” It was the first time I had ever improvised something out of using a very simple scale, and we just played a scale up and down in different rhythms, on the piano. It was so liberating, so … I thought, “I MUST do this”. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane’s joy is obvious. His fortuitous introduction to the Dalcroze class that was in session represents a pivotal moment in Zane’s career. He found a university that offered a graduate degree program in Dalcroze studies and immediately changed his course of study from piano performance to Dalcroze. Although it was much farther away from his home, he began full-time graduate studies in Dalcroze pedagogy.

I just went back to where my home is, and I said, I’m not going to finish this program – I asked for tuition withdrawal and then I searched, and I found a Dalcroze graduate degree program. So that was just a liberating experience, to be able to move through space, and jump, and leap with the music – to make this connection with the music, to articulate music and feel the music in my body, without being tied up with an instrument. For the very first time, it was so liberating. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

He described some of the specific experiences that affected him so deeply:

Then Dalcroze work entered my life – an arena where one does not just ‘study’ Bach chorales through theoretical analysis. One gets up and steps one voice while singing the other in solfège. Or, one sings one part while playing another part at piano. Or one improvises off the chorale and upon a "hop" signal (from the teacher), one changes metre. With a Dalcroze perspective to underlie the pedagogy, the musical journey seems to have taken a thrilling leap into … a whole new perspective. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Up to this point, Zane had encountered conventional ways of studying classical music, usually through reading, listening to, and analyzing music. The Dalcroze classes introduced him to an embodied perspective, which was an entirely new and refreshing way for him to understand mu-
sic. He discovered the potential for performing and experiencing musical interpretation through the kinaesthetic sense, which he had not previously been exposed to.

**Serendipitous Connections**

Zane’s encounters with Dalcroze pedagogy resonated very deeply and personally with him.

One day, when I was studying Dalcroze, we had to move to a piece of music by Bach. And we were just told to express whatever we hear, so I was moving. And the direction from the teacher was intentionally, I believe … not very clear – just to move to what we hear. So we’re moving, and I suddenly had an epiphany … my footsteps or … the body that I was trying to move – the nuances I’m trying to move to, at that instance I felt …. I was the music, and … AND, … the more musically I stepped, the more musical I became. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

As Zane was moving to the music, he was able to notice and discover various connections and sensations. He pointed out that the directions were vague, which meant that he did not have to listen for any particular element of the music such as harmony or volume, nor did he have to focus on any particular movement such as stepping or conducting to respond to the music. Having no particular point of focus, allowed him to freely encounter, experience, and enjoy moving to the music and its accompanying nuances. Because he was open to learning, he noticed the ways that his stepping movements personified the music. And because he allowed his entire body to be both receptive and perceptive, his musical experience became embodied – his body was moving as if it were the music, without any analytical or other intellectual processes inspiring the movement. Had there been a clear direction from the teacher, he may not have experienced the revelation of *becoming* musical. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) describes the phenomenon of experiencing and embodying musical nuance:

> All the nuances of time – *allegro, andante, accelerando, ritenuto* – all the nuances of energy, *forte, piano, crescendo, diminuendo* – can be “realized” by our bodies, and the acuteness of our musical feeling will depend on the acuteness of our bodily sensations. (p. 115)
Jaques-Dalcroze encouraged his students to notice and respond kinaesthetically to musical nuances so that they were able to internalize the embodied meanings of the various musical inflections and details. The intention was that their embodied experiences would provide greater sensitivity and depth to his students’ performances. Consequently, Dalcroze pedagogy enables us to approach and experience musical concepts through our bodies; we then ‘know’ how the music feels by the ways that our bodies move, and it is a different way of knowing music than knowing with the mind. Zane described his experience in regard to making connections with music through his body:

So, I always make that connection now, not just trying to step what you hear, but how you put your foot on the floor, with a certain intensity … to articulate the nuance, the energy, and the shape of the phrase. I suddenly realized, – so that’s what the teacher meant by, ‘step musically’! Because before we had to step durations and rhythms, and I thought that was sort of it, but, then, through that free exploration, I discovered, - How I am musical has everything to do with how I move my body! (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Jaques-Dalcroze believed the rhythmic patterns that we experience in our bodies – in our feet, knees, hips, back, pelvis, ribs, shoulders, and arms, comprise an ‘embodied’ sense of rhythm. When Zane made the profound discovery of “How I am musical has everything to do with how I move my body”, he was declaring what Dalcroze believed, that the body is the primary site for rhythm, and therefore also for musical intelligence, intuition, and expression.

**Experiencing Transformational Learning**

Zane described a sense of being totally absorbed in the music through his body. He felt that he was affected by the experience in a way that would thereafter influence everything he knew about music, especially his understanding of musical expression and performance. Jun-tunen (2004) summarizes this concept, “this substudy examines how within the frames of Dalcroze Eurhythmics, body movement can facilitate musical knowing and how such bodily exper-
ences can provide a means of developing skills, competencies and understanding necessary to the expressive mode of musical knowing” (p. 60). Zane elaborated:

Those are the experiences when you realize – I’m not going to be the same as before, you know because there are those experiences that propel us forward a bit, and they are the experiences that make you look at something from a different angle, it’s just like an ‘a-ha moment’. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

These ‘a-ha moments’ are evidence of transformational learning. Zane learned to understand music and its relationship with movement in a new way, which would inform his musical perspectives and affect his future performances. I asked him if he could describe some of the effects that Dalcroze classes have had on him. He discussed the capacity of music and musical movement as mediums for communication:

I think through moving, you sense something, you feel something, you perceive something and therefore you facilitate certain discoveries, that it is either musical or not musical. There’s a personal wellness or wellbeing – a musical well-being. As musicians, we use ourselves to bring meaning, to bring interpretation and to communicate, right? - So really, it enriches my capacity to communicate. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

An artist (musician) draws her capacity for artistic expression from her personal experiences, insights and perspectives. Dalcroze exercises are designed specifically to provide personal and unique experiences that directly inform a student’s understanding of music through kinaesthetic experience. The musical exercises therefore provide a bank of embodied, inspirational experiences for musicians.

One of the foundational premises of Dalcroze pedagogy is; “Experience precedes cognition.” If a student is experiencing difficulty synchronizing her movements with the music, a Dalcroze teacher will provide another, easier movement exercise (or exercises) that will clarify and facilitate the student’s understanding of the musical concept. The student then has the opportunity to experience and become aware of any misconception, and then, to discover a way to move that will enable the music to be more fluently realized in the body. By allowing the student to
notice the discrepancy by herself, a Dalcroze teacher is engaging in transformative education, as opposed to transmissive education (telling the student what the mistake is).

In one of Zane’s classes, a point of confusion arose for a student who was having difficulty understanding how staccato notes\(^{25}\) could still be part of a legato\(^{26}\) musical phrase. For this exercise, he was asking his students to move through the direction of the phrase, even though the notes were staccato.

My goal was to have them experience the line of the phrase – to travel. But the beginning phrase happened to be all staccato, but then, staccato can still have a line too, right? So when we’re doing the line, the student says to me, “Well, it doesn’t fit … the staccato. How can we move like a legato line?” Because in her mind, she didn’t see that staccato can have a sense of legato. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane’s student had previously learned that a phrase was always legato. She was aware of staccato notes, but she believed that they could not be part of a legato phrase. Zane recognized her perceived discrepancy, but rather than verbally explain to her that staccato notes can still be part of a phrase (which would have been transmissive teaching), he devised another movement experience that would allow her to discover on her own, through her own movement experience and sensation, that staccato notes can still be part of a legato phrase (transformational learning):

So the next day, I devised another exercise, having them draw the lines with their hands as if they were sewing – pulling threads. I gave them the vocal scores and I told them to vocalize any sound they like. Then I asked them to pay attention to the sound they were making. Some people’s sounds were very connected and very sustained, and some people’s sounds were more on the choppy side. Then I asked them all to sing in a choppy style, while drawing the line, giving them all a staccato experience while still drawing the line, and then they did it with a partner. Then, the concept was okay for her. Her musical bearing in other words, she could make peace with that. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

\(^{25}\) staccato is an expressive term used to indicate that notes are to be detached from each other

\(^{26}\) legato is an expressive term used to indicate a smooth and connected style of performance
It is an important aspect of the pedagogy, that a Dalcroze teacher is able to create supplementary exercises in a remedial capacity to enable the student to develop his or her ability and understanding. Conversely, there are times when the students have already received a comprehensive grounding in the topic, and would be best served with more challenging exercises. In this sense, each lesson is itself an improvised composition. This is one of the reasons that Jaques-Dalcroze did not provide any ‘teaching manuals’. Dalcroze pedagogy is developmental: the teacher observes her students’ learning styles and musical abilities, then applies appropriate pedagogical techniques to facilitate her students’ learning experiences.

**Experiencing Interpersonal Growth and Awareness**

Zane discussed a developing sense of interpersonal growth and awareness that occurs in the study of Dalcroze pedagogy, noting that many of the activities require cooperative learning and intermingling among the students:

In a Dalcroze setting, we learn very quickly to make friends. We work a lot with people, and there are a lot of interpersonal activities, so we have to collaborate. There are moments when a relationship with an individual is not the greatest, but somehow we are paired up with them to do an improvisation, and it has to work. And so, we learn a great deal about each other, and we learn to appreciate each other, so then our music becomes *in sync*. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

He noted that when the same group of students has been working together for a few years, they develop a close bond. He feels that having a sense of cohesion within a class is an integral component of a successful Dalcroze class. Not only do the students move to the music, but they also move together, observing and responding instantaneously to each other’s bodies and movements, embodying aspects of the music that they hear and perceive:

When I teach, I have to bring a group together. It’s more, almost more effort on my part versus say, when a group has been together for 2 to 3 years, and we come together right away, we have that resonance – that sense of … we are one unit. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)
Zane feels very strongly about the importance of interpersonal relationships in Dalcroze classes. Students are often asked to interact and work together. For example, an exercise may require students to work with a partner; perhaps one student embodies the rhythm, and the other embodies the harmony. He explained the ways that he as a teacher, encourages his students to bond:

Dalcroze talks about time, space, and energy, in terms of musical movement, but I use time space and energy almost in a different way. I notice time space energy of the students – I look at them as individuals, or as a group or as a whole … how are they using the space around them – their individual space around them, and the space around the group? Is it a space that is very hard to penetrate? Are the students open and receptive – in that kind of space? And then, I will start noticing, how are they moving in rhythm, is the group together? Are they able to modulate their … collective identity, at a very slow pace or quickly? It’s an invisible dimension, that is not necessarily musical, but, interpersonal, time/space. And then also I start noticing the energy of the class – are they coming in with this tiredness? Or somewhat dull? I can’t always tell if they are happy or not. It’s hard to feel their pulse almost – their wellbeing pulse. So I have to devise different things just to perk them up – to get them to rub their hands – get them to move, get them to move around each other, and suddenly they might … break into laughter. It relaxes them and gets them to transform their energy a bit, so there’s that energetic modulation, if you will. I don’t know how else to put it. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

In the performing arts – drama, dance, and music – performers collectively use time, space, and energy together. Musicians learn to cultivate an intuitive level of awareness that enables them to predict what another player is doing or is going to do. For example, as musicians rehearse a phrase that slows down, they do not memorize how long the other players are going to hold every note. Rather, they become familiar with each other’s tendencies, and get into ‘flow’ with each other, sensing and intuiting when a note will end without counting, just by basing their collective decision upon what has just transpired. Zane described this sense of intuition:

Very seasoned musicians, they automatically snap into that space very quickly, – ensemble players – very quickly. And it depends on the class. Sometimes a class comes in that is very new to Dalcroze. They don’t do much music making themselves, and then it comes, – that sense. You can tell. It’s something to be cultivated along the way. You can tell them to step the fanciest pattern in the world, but it still doesn’t get to the core of the music. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)
First-time Dalcroze students, unless they are dancers, or are used to using their bodies in expressive ways, often feel very inhibited or ‘out of their element’ when they are asked to perform tasks that require them to use their bodies expressively. Music students who learn through traditional methodologies are not generally used to allowing their bodies to incorporate and express the dynamic nuance or the specific articulation of a phrase of the music. They may have had extensive training in internalizing such concepts through cognitive learning, and have already habituated patterns of practice that do not include freedom of movement. It is a challenge for Dalcroze teachers to achieve and maintain a comfort level in the class, in order to ‘open everyone’s doors.’ Zane considers this as he prepares for his classes:

I make a mental note as I’m driving to the class, I need to check into the time / space / energy of the students – of the collective body, and their energetic body (if that’s such a word) … their well-being. With children – they come in, the four-year olds, and if it’s new, they’re a little bit like this [shy] … but the minute they move, they get there faster, and if they really know you very well – I mean, they’re right there. It’s more … tangible, it seems, for me to see it. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Students need to feel safe with the teacher, and with the other students before they can fully engage in a lesson. In order to maximize the benefits of the lesson, they should not be hampered by any fears or feelings of inadequacy. Zane notes that trust is essential to the group’s cohesion and well being; he can only go on to other concepts once trust is established:

Oh, you can definitely feel in a group of adults when they suddenly have this moment of galactic trust – amongst the students and the instructor. You can feel that with adults even more – it’s an energy shift. I can sniff it, and I know when I have the whole group. And we can go on, and we can do certain things, and they perhaps can handle certain challenges. When you feel the trust is there, the eyes are beaming differently. They look at each other and at the instructor with different eyes. Children have it already, but with adults, there’s a … transition. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane explained that building trust and nurturing the interpersonal relationships of the students are some of the goals that he hopes to accomplish in the initial warm-up. Social interrela-
tion is a very important element in a Dalcroze class. Students interact non-verbally with a smile perhaps, or eye contact, and are instantly understood and responded to. Interpersonal skills are generally not taught per se, but rather learned consequentially through experience – experience acquired through playing in ensembles in schools, in choirs, and in community music ensembles.

Students come into Dalcroze classes with a variety of unique backgrounds, personalities, and musical skills, yet their success depends upon their ability to bond as a class. Their varying backgrounds and conceptual understandings of music in general and of specific musical concepts, coupled with their unique personalities, all affect their responses to the Dalcroze exercises, and their reactions to the other moving bodies in the class. As Zane mentioned earlier, a teacher may wish to encourage further bonding within a diversified group through an element of play, perhaps by introducing an element of surprise into the class as the lesson progresses, to stimulate and maintain their interest. This could be achieved through improvised changes in the music designed to elicit certain responses and a sense of play from the students.

There are many ways to bring awareness, you can point it out. Looking at posture – as simple as that, or asking, “Did you notice that?” or you simply do a demonstration, a false demonstration, without pointing to certain individuals. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

The false demonstration refers to a demonstration, one that includes an exaggerated, often humorous, intended mistake, so that the students can see what they should not be doing, and that inappropriate movement does not truly represent the music, and might even be in opposition to the music.

**Bonding and Trust:**

Zane notes that it is important to set a tone at the beginning of the class that will enable the students to quickly bond together through music. He does this through warming up their capacity for sensitivity. The students are developing their awareness, becoming sensitized to each
other, to each other’s movements, and to their surroundings. He feels that this awareness development is a necessary prerequisite to prepare them for the kinds of learning that they will experience in the class, and eventually as musicians.

So, on the note of trust and letting go, all of these things are done interpersonally in the Dalcroze classes during the initial warm-up, just tuning into their spaces. The warm-up is not just for physical technique or to prevent injury, but also to warm-up their senses, their grooves, and their sensitivity, and to pave the way for the rest of the work to come in the class. Because we don’t have a movement teacher, the first part of our classes is all about teaching movement technique in the beginning. When the music is on though, it allows them to tune in to that extra stimulus, and that stimulus agent can serve as a powerful tool to get them to integrate, to let go, to trust each other, and that will bind them together. So often I find their energies a bit stuck, where they are trying something out without music, and the minute I play the music, it just goes so much better. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

It is through movement, that the students discover musical truths (and sometimes musical misconceptions). As the group grows in acceptance and mutual support, everyone begins to feel more liberated and able to focus on the task at hand, and to move in whatever way their bodies want to. Zane gave an example of a ‘bonding moment’:

In one of the exercises, I gave them 2 measures of a 4/4 pattern, using ternary and binary beats, they had to clap it back, but they had to articulate it in space. So, they all did it very well, and they all began to appreciate the beauty of the spatial differentiation that everybody brings – some people do it like this, some people do it like this ... they just really appreciated each other, they had that acceptance. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

When the class acquires a sense of trust, they also become more encouraging toward each other, so that no one feels embarrassed if they make a mistake.

Students who come to a Dalcroze class will typically be asked first to remove their socks and shoes, and then to take a walk while the teacher starts to play music. With young children, there is almost no hesitation or inhibitions. They are eager to ‘join the game.’ Yet older children, who have been conditioned to believe that their bodies have nothing to do with learning, will hesitate. As they cautiously start to ‘take a walk’ they acquire more confidence, and may engage
in the class with increased freedom. They may than allow their bodies to respond to musical cues and changes instantly, without thinking about whether their movement is right or wrong, indeed, without thinking at all, eventually (as Zane stated earlier), allowing themselves to become the music.

**Somatic Empathy**

The late Donald Himes, often commented, “We teach who we are”. Agne (1999) explores this idea: “The person I projected in the classroom could have direct implications for the success of a thousand future students” (p. 166). She continues, “It is the internal, feeling, thinking, believing aspect that determines which behaviors will occur [in the classroom] (p. 169). I asked Zane if there were any experiences in his background that may have affected his teaching philosophy and his praxis. He mentioned somatic empathy, a concept that was explored by Olivia Cheever. Cheever (2000) claims, “somatic educators utilize a special kind of empathy that involves a bodily based sensing of one’s own and another’s somatic experience and, as such, might be called ‘somatic empathy’” (p. 16). Zane explained the ways that he experiences somatic empathy:

What does it mean, to feel another person – what does empathy mean, and … to be compassionate – to feel their joy as my joy and their confusion as my confusion, and also to stay centred as a teacher! I literally feel things when I see a student play. I don’t know how to explain this, but when I see a piano student play, for example, or a student improvising in class, or just watching them, I can feel which part of their body is blocked, which part of the body requires alignment. So I can tell them, “It’s because the wrist is not activated. It’s because your elbow is out too much. Because I feel that your body – your weight is too much”. I feel these things, so I will offer ideas based on my sensation, according to how they are feeling, simply with the way they are moving. When they are confused, I can definitely feel their body language is different. And as a teacher, I also have to block this a little bit, so it doesn’t affect me too much. I have to be free, to be communicative, but also keep a little bit of what I call a ‘space bubble’. To be able to observe, but not be absorbed into it, so I can keep my centre, and my alignment, and my awareness open, and receptive and embracing, while acknowledging their confusion. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)
Through somatic empathy, Zane is able to feel his students’ movements as well as their joy (or confusion), to notice if their energy is blocked, and how their bodies may need realignment.

**Self-Acceptance:**

Zane noted that one of the consequential learning outcomes in a Dalcroze class is improved self-acceptance. Due to the fact that all students possess varying learning styles and interact differently in group situations, in order for true cooperative learning to occur, there must be acceptance within the group, which he feels, leads to increased awareness of acceptance of self.

I think that one of the gifts that Dalcroze work provides, aside from all the musical things, is how students start to feel that acceptance of themselves – coming to a self-acceptance in class. A student who was confused, obviously comes with different gifts and awareness, so I have to acknowledge that and just embrace her in my class. So she feels, she is more open, instead of … closed, because she couldn’t do certain things, she started to shrink away, you know, so, just to be aware of certain individuals, to keep everyone feeling open. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane believes that with experience, Dalcroze students learn to become more comfortable in communicating through movement with other students. Teachers are very aware of their initial lack of confidence in this regard, and intentionally create exercise in which students can become more comfortable within their own bodies in movement, and with other students’ moving bodies. As long as the teacher does not ask them to go too far beyond their comfort level, students generally feel good about interacting with each other.

**Emotional Release and ‘Letting Go’**

Our discussion ventured into an exploration of self-imposed restrictions that students sometimes discover, and then learn to release in a Dalcroze class. Besides letting go of inhibitions, students often discover and learn to let go of self-limiting beliefs:

There is also letting go of self limiting beliefs – for example, sometimes I am deliberately keeping it very vague. I said, I want you to use the elastic and one person holds, while the other person lets themselves be pulled, and then you change leadership, just to try on your own. The students come up with all sorts of limiting beliefs – are we allowed to do this?
Are we not allowed to do that? And I said, well my instruction was simply, just that. And very often they don’t feel safe enough to go outside of what they are told, so there aren’t many instructions in Dalcroze, sometimes we do that on purpose, so they don’t feel very safe, to make discoveries. I’m looking to see what you will find out, so it’s not my goal to see a cookie-cutter kind of … performance … execution. There is no right or wrong. But very often, when students are new to Dalcroze, they are looking for that very clearer direction. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Students are often so concerned with ‘getting it right’ that they do not learn to tap into their own creativity. Zane’s directions to his students are intentionally vague, forcing them to create their own movement solutions, thereby facilitating an emerging awareness and confidence in their own creativity – without any self-limiting beliefs.

Skillful applications of Dalcroze pedagogy enable students to discover and to develop their own unique way of moving expressively to music. Dalcroze pedagogy is about discovering ways in which the body moves naturally to the music, and then noticing how that movement feels, and what the space, time, and energy of that movement teaches us about the space, time, and energy of music. The student is encouraged to move in a way that uniquely expresses the music that she hears. Zane believes that the discovery approach is of utmost importance in Dalcroze pedagogy. However, he spoke about the difficulties that students who expect clearer direction might have with this approach – that it could cause frustration, even tears:

They want the teacher to tell them what to do. Sometimes as a teacher I have to balance that, and knowing that the boiling point is coming, I give them something very clear. So I might say, “All you need to do now is sit down, and snap your fingers if you hear a tri-chord.” And they are happy – “I can do this” “I can feel this” and “I feel very good”. And then we go on from there, and that exercise doesn’t need to be there really, but it’s a very essential link for their … emotional and psychological readiness – to open up. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane disclosed that he has often witnessed people crying in Dalcroze classes, and not always out of frustration. For many students, the sensation of freely moving to music without inhibition or self-imposed restrictions is so liberating that the sense of freedom and release brings
tears. Sometimes their embodied musical expression is so personal and beautiful, that they become emotional. Zane shared some of his experiences with crying:

The different reasons that people shed tears – out of joy, out of release, out of the past emotional traumas, out of our certain awareness, or certain recognition and acceptance that something is not working for them – they are incapable, or, joy because they realize “I can do this”, and people cry after they pass exams, or they are able to improvise something beautifully, and they’re just like: “Ahh, I can not believe I played that!” (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Zane and I discussed the ways that harmony can elicit certain emotions. For example, major tonalities are often associated with lighthearted and joyful feelings, while minor tonalities often elicit darker, deeper, sometimes mysterious moods or images. These are cultural and contextual associations that are made very early, often through children’s songs and popular music, which are often in a major key. Harmonic progressions such as a sudden modulation can provide surprise, perhaps humorously, as a “wrong” chord may sound if it were played at the end of a well-known song. At other times, harmony can elicit more intense feelings. Zane described emotional reactions that sometimes occur in a common Dalcroze exercise, in which students must sing and maintain a pitch – the same pitch, while the teacher plays shifting harmonies to accompany that pitch:

You know the famous doh exercise – all the students have to sing “doh, doh, doh” and the teacher just improvises with different harmonies, and they are hearing the different tendency of the doh’s, and in numerous occasions, people cry with this, they already can do the simple task that’s just doh, doh, but just singing that, with everybody, and then that group singing that, with the resonance – with how the doh has so many differ- ent shapes and emotions – emotion is very hard to articulate, with harmony … you can influence that. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

In Dalcroze classes, students are sometimes asked to express or embody harmonic qualities and changes that they hear in music. For example, a teacher may ask the class to embody the difference between a major and a diminished chord. The major chord has a stable quality, while the diminished chord is inherently unstable. Their shapes will invariably be more solid for the
major chord, and more unbalanced for the diminished chord. Dalcroze teachers generally include rich harmonic progressions and modulations in their improvisations, which are designed to inspire and to elicit a reaction to the changing harmonies. Yet harmonies are closely connected with emotions in music, and can be very easily felt by the students. We discussed the connection between emotion and harmony:

So, there’s also the power struggles within the tonal sense that they are experiencing, and they almost – consciously or subconsciously – in their mind, they are creating these connections, and associations that triggers everything and … it’s very mystical to articulate that, and so, I realize that there is another “a–ha” moment as a teacher. And I would say, O my Gosh! – and I think – These are people’s emotions that we are playing with! (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

Music’s ability to evoke images, to elicit associations, and to provoke feelings is dependent upon many factors, including melody, rhythm, harmony, volume, timbre, texture, and expressive performance techniques, such as accents, staccato, and legato playing. Identified as the elements of music, these factors work together to comprise the whole composition. Harmony is only one factor, but when used skillfully, it is an effective device for deliberately and instantly affecting our mood and sense of meaning.

Zane referred to one of his former teachers who had a great influence on him, and who would often remind her students: “I am not your therapist, I’m just your Dalcroze teacher!” With this remark, Zane’s former teacher acknowledges that Dalcroze pedagogy often causes students to have emotional reactions. Zane explained:

For her to say that means that she is very aware of the therapeutic effect of Dalcroze, but, she doesn’t want to get into it. That’s her boundary. But, she’s fully aware of the therapeutic … you know, people break down crying with the ‘doh to doh’ scales. (personal correspondence, Aug. 29, 2013)

The ‘doh to doh’ scales Zane referred to exercises in modulating key and pitch relationships. The eight pitches of the scale are sung from doh to doh starting on ‘C’. Then they are sung again,
starting on ‘C’, but using ‘C’ now as the second scale degree, (Bb tonality), and then again using ‘C’ as the third scale degree. The tonic orientation of the scale changes each time. It is a difficult exercise to master, but one that very effectively demonstrates the tendencies and inter-relationships of each pitch within the tonal system. Zane believes that if a student cries while practising this exercise, it is because she has just realized and felt those tendencies, perhaps after many years of playing, and the sudden profound discovery of those pitch tendencies has moved her to tears.
Chapter Six

Monique

When I met Monique, she was completing a 5-year concurrent Education and Music Education degree. She had come to Toronto to take part in the summer Dalcroze training program, which was taking place at the National Ballet School on Jarvis Street in Toronto. This was her second encounter with Dalcroze pedagogy. We met during her lunch break on the last day of classes, in a vacant dance studio. As she talked, it became apparent to me that Monique has a deep passion for global education, particularly for issues of racialization. She was to be an invited speaker at an upcoming conference on Critical Mixed Race Studies later that year. As an aspiring teacher, she was looking forward to instilling values of respect, equity, and collaboration in her students through her music program. She returned to Toronto a year later to continue her Dalcroze training, and we met again over lunch, exactly one year later, in the cafeteria.

Monique was excited to have discovered that many of the summer Dalcroze activities supported her philosophical viewpoints. She believes the application of Dalcroze principles and the adaptation of Dalcroze exercises in a multicultural classroom may help to create an inclusive and respectful learning environment. She claims the movement activities are particularly well suited to encouraging participation and expression from all students, to the best of their abilities.

The critical pedagogy has also been a focus of mine. I really believe that the approach of Dalcroze, even though it’s very Eurocentric with the music, the approach is universal, and that’s what I really enjoy about the Dalcroze approach. Because it comes down to, that we’re all human, you know, and our space and migration and colonization has changed the way that we interact with each other. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique considers Dalcroze pedagogy to be equitable because it encourages active participation. It also enables students of various abilities and backgrounds to explore musicianship to the best of their ability, and to interact with each other in a sociably supportive environment.
Background

Monique’s first instrument is the voice. Making music was a natural and frequent occurrence in her family; she recalls hearing her father often sing at home during her childhood:

Just hearing my father sing in the morning, he would sing Spanish songs, songs that he knew growing up. It was one of the things that, in the morning, I would listen to. I guess it was the same experience for my brother and my sister, but for myself I know that it was one of the first introductions to singing. And ever since, I thought, it didn’t seem like something I was afraid to do. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique’s understanding of music is associated with a natural passion and a relaxed confidence for singing. Her father was not a professional singer; he just loved to sing. Her mother played the piano when she was younger, but neither of her parents presently play or sing. Monique’s parents live with her now. Their health has deteriorated so much that family music-making is no longer possible for them. She lamented, “I wish they would still do it, but now they say, “O, we’re too old” … and that breaks my heart, because I don’t think you are too old for music. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

As long as she can remember, Monique always enjoyed singing. Although she eventually studied voice professionally, she attributes her love of singing and her natural confidence in her voice to those early years of listening to her father singing. As a child, Monique recalls singing in choirs with her brother and her sister:

I think I was maybe 9 years old or so, I was singing in a choir, and me, my brother and my sister, we kind of stood out, to the point where by the age of 17 or so, they asked if I could do some choral conducting as well. I was conducting pieces for them, and I was like, “Oh, I’m not comfortable”. But they did ask me in high school, and I never actually saw a future in it because it wasn’t taken seriously with my family. They were like, “you’re good at it, but don’t go into it” because you can’t make money off of music. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)
After she finished secondary school, Monique entered a CEGEP\textsuperscript{27} program in animal health studies, and intended to continue with veterinary science at university. CEGEP offers students the opportunity to study specific fields of interests, as preparation for university, or to obtain a diploma. While she was attending CEGEP, Monique continued to nurture her love of singing by performing with a friend on her own time:

I was 19 at the time and I was performing on guitar with a friend, and then we broke up. There was a band, 2 guitarists, a bassist, and a drummer, they were looking for a singer, and they heard me, and they’re like, “Would you like to sing for our band?” So I was like, “Ok!” I thought it would be a fun experience. I love to do things that are just … fun. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique described their music as ‘progressive metal’; the band was based on the musical styles of Rush\textsuperscript{28} and Black Sabbath\textsuperscript{29}. She enjoyed the expressive freedom that she experienced when performing rock music. The intensely embodied and cultural aspects of rock music appealed to her. She also commented on the inherent political qualities of rock music in general:

It expresses a person’s or people’s or society’s conflicts. There is a lot of personal pain that’s expressed in rock music, I find. Not just pain, also the desire to express a wilder side that is kind of rebellious – that IS rebellious, not “kind of”! – that IS rebellious and looking for acceptance. So I really feel that music, rock music, or, music … is a tool to express someone’s personal culture and social culture as well. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

As a young adult, Monique experienced wide exposure and acclaim as a singer. People often encouraged her to obtain further training in voice:

So, I was 19, 20, and, when I would perform, the feedback was always like, people would say, “O you sound like a back up singer”. My background was in choral singing as well, And then they said, “You know Monique, maybe you should be taking voice lessons”. At this time I had never taken private voice lessons, so, this was new to me. And I’m like, “What’s the cheapest way I could take voice lessons?” Because it can get very, very ex-

\textsuperscript{27} Collège d'enseignement général et professionnel. In Québec, the elementary panel includes grades K – 6, the secondary panel includes grades 7 – 11 (there is no grade 12). CEGEP follows the secondary panel.

\textsuperscript{28} Rush is a Toronto-based rock band formed in 1968. Website: http://www.rush.com/

\textsuperscript{29} Black Sabbath is a British heavy metal rock band formed in 1968. Website: http://www.blacksabbath.com/
pensive! It just so happened that they had a very recognized, well at the time, a recog- nized music program there [at her CEGEP college]. That’s why I thought to myself, “Ok, maybe I could go into a double deck at the CEGEP level where I can do science, where I can focus on going towards veterinary medicine, and music, so I can get those voice les- sons!” (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique took advantage of the music program that was available to her through the CEGEP program. She was very fortunate to have studied with a vocal teacher who was also a very per- ceptive and compassionate mentor. She recalled the ways that her vocal teacher helped her to grow through personal barriers and difficulties:

Monique – And my voice teacher at the time, she saw me through so many struggles with singing because it came to a point where … you know, singing is a very embodied expe- rience. If I am going through something, it will show up in my voice. So there was al- ways a restriction, a restriction, a restriction. And she helped me talk through it, and ex- press that in my lesson! Which I am forever grateful for to her, because I started to really come out, you know, that this is something that I truly loved, so … Why am I not pursu- ing it as a career?

Sharon – What a great teacher! You were so lucky you had her!

Monique – I’m crying … thinking about her! (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

As Monique’s passion and abilities for singing and music-making grew stronger, her in- terest in animal sciences as a career began to wane. When her CEGEP program was close to be- ing complete, she considered enrolling in a Music degree program at the University level:

So this is the point where I decided I wasn’t going to go into science any more, I kind of dropped the Science because I already had another degree in animal sciences, so it’s like, “What direction was I going towards?” So I said, “I may as well do music.” You know, I’m pretty good at it, and I enjoy singing. So what I’ve actually completed was pre- university music in vocal … classical vocal as my instrument. So, when I completed that, that’s when I got into the music education program, well, a little bit later, I was 24. (per- sonal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique continued her musical studies by enrolling in a concurrent Education/Music Education degree program. She had decided, during her CEGEP program, that her passion for music out-
shone her interest in science. At first, she was considering a career as a professional singer, but later, she decided to become a music teacher:

When I did explore my barriers, and getting through them, one of the defining moments in my life was, I need to make a decision, this decision is to be going into music and pursuing it. And she [her vocal teacher] recognized this, because also I had a very strong ear as well, for ear training. And, I would tutor, like peer-tutor other students at the CEGEP level. Yeah, she recognized that, and this is something that a lot of my teachers as well were saying, Monique you … – I told them that maybe I would pursue performance, but they said, “Monique, you’re a teacher.” (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique explained that part of her decision to enroll in an education program rather than performance was based on a personal and sincere desire to share her love of music with others. She remarked, “But when it actually came down to education, I just thought, there’s no reason for me to hold on to my talent. I need to share it”. She also believed that a career in teaching would suit her personality more than a career in performance, with its competitive edge and demanding pressures:

Well, that was another thing too, because I thought, maybe I could pursue a performance career because I was in this band, and I was like, maybe this can go somewhere. But then, afterwards, I realized, you know what – it was not really useful for me to go into it professionally. Also, I realized there was a lot of competition, and I’m not a very competitive person by character. There was also a lot of … diva characters in the vocal program, and I just stayed away from them. So I was like, I had no interest in going forward in it. I just had no interest in … you know, like, I love performing. And like, honestly, the fact that it sparks other people’s interest the way that it sparked my interest, that was the direction I was going. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique chose a career path that would enable her to share her passion for music and also to nurture her love for singing ‘for fun’ without the pressures of singing professionally.

**Music Education as Equity Education**

As a vocal major, Monique studied performance, but her music education degree program also included courses in music history, theory and pedagogy. Her teacher training offered techniques for building a positive classroom learning environment, and an educational philosophy
that was grounded in global education. Monique’s personal teaching philosophy is based on peace education, with its emphasis on equity, inclusivity, social justice, anti-oppression, and environmental protection, responsibility, and balance. Siddiqui (2013) describes peace education:

Peace education is in essence good education. It is based on positive and rewarding human relationship, the foundation for these is not only laid in early childhood but also during early and later adulthood. The goal of peace studies (Peace education) is the development of active citizens dedicated to democratic values and public good. The end of education is not more acquisition of knowledge. Rather, the end must be critically informed judgement and wise action. (pg. 508)

Monique is particularly interested in equity in education, and has concerns for students whose learning differences or circumstances present challenges for successfully meeting curriculum expectations.

Children’s reading abilities are often the first indicators of concern for students who may require school support to meet curriculum standards. Students who are below average learners in language arts may be identified as having learning difficulties in their reading or oral and written communication skills and abilities. This is because the development of language arts skills is the primary focus of Canadian elementary schools. But music – indeed any of the arts subjects – is not dependent upon students’ abilities to read or to process language. The arts are forms of communication that depend on imagination, creativity, and expression, and which pose no extra challenges for many students who find reading, linguistics, and/or mathematics difficult and demanding. Music therefore, offers all students an opportunity to excel, including students whose language arts skills are below average. Monique believes that music can offer a forum in which learning differences can be minimized or eliminated; she appreciates the inclusivity that a music program can provide for all students:

And to me, I feel so blessed, to be in a subject area where students can express themselves, you know, and that’s another thing too … When I did my field experience in an inner city school where there … it’s a full inclusion, so you got students from the interna-
tional program, like the IB – the International Baccalaureate organization – then you got regular students, you got enriched students, you got students with special needs. This is my fourth field experience, when I noticed that there were a lot of students who were having these difficulties, but in music they excelled. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

She believes that a musical program of study that features movement as a learning vehicle may ‘level the playing field’ for all students, for it would not privilege students who are good readers. Indeed, students who find it challenging to have to remain still during their language arts classes may excel in a music program that is taught through a kinaesthetic approach.

The arts are considered an embodied form of communication because they elicit a felt experience between the artist and the recipient. In her field placements, Monique discovered that quite often the learning differences that are evident in reading or other cognitive processes are not apparent in the music classroom. She commented:

They [teachers] focused also on how to be inclusive in the classroom, for the students with special needs, because this is general education. But then, there were no [guidelines for] music – specifically – how to include students with special needs in the music classroom. But the thing is, and my field experience in the secondary school is that … I had spoken to some of the heads of the resource centres, where they keep a file on students with special needs. Those students were coded, and he always told me … “Those who are in music, you don’t really see their conditions.” (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

There are many ways to teach music, and many approaches are introduced and practised in public education classrooms. Monique was particularly interested in observing the ways that music can meet the learning styles and strengths of a variety of students. Music teachers tend to teach from their strengths and to include these in their programs. While one teacher may choose to offer a vocal program based on folk music, another may excel in drumming circles, while another might include more drama and improvisation in their lessons.

At one end of the teaching spectrum is a cognitive approach to music education, which may include lessons in music research and theory. In this approach, students sit at desks and
learn about various forms of music, music notation, and formal structure through reading and studying; assessment would take the form of written and oral presentations or tests. It is a transmissive approach to music education (non-experiential); no actual music making is required. Students with strong reading skills would have a learning advantage, while students with strong kinaesthetic skills would be disadvantaged. At the other end of the spectrum is an experiential approach. This approach requires students to participate in creating their own music. This may take the form of playing instruments, singing in a choir, participating in a musical dramatic performance, creating movement sequences, experimenting with music technology, and/or on ‘found’ instruments. Assessment could be based on observed individual development and expression. It is a transformational approach because the students are discovering, listening, creating, and expressing their own music, and are thereby experiencing and developing their own artistic potential. They are also learning to take risks and to accept each other’s differences, while becoming more in touch with their inner, creative, and spiritual selves.

Monique’s love for embodied musical experiences, such as her previous rock music performances, enables her to relate more closely with experiential music education. She described the personal expressive potential that she found in the Dalcroze classes, and its similarity to the cultural and political experiences that she encountered in rock music:

Dalcroze is a very ‘in the present’ experience. When we talk about something political, it, music, documents moments that are happening at the time. So, when I think about Dalcroze, I think about experiencing the body and the body awareness at the present time. You don’t think about the … well, we DO think about the future because we are in preparation for the next movement, but movement in time within space and with the people that you are with. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

A classroom teacher who wishes to meet the needs of all students may implement a program of study that offers a variety of learning opportunities and experiences for her students, in order to satisfy the wide variety of learning strengths and abilities that is typically found in Canadian
classrooms. Her program would include activities from both ends of the spectrum, as well as from points in between.

**Practicum**

Monique’s teacher training program included field studies where she received practical teaching experience in a school, under the supervision of a host teacher. As a student teacher, she was required to complete four practice teaching sessions – two sessions in each of the elementary and secondary panels. One of Monique’s field teaching assignments allowed her to observe students taught in a traditional, performance based approach. At the high school level, music classes are commonly conducted as band classes, where students learn to play an instrument and to participate in ensemble performances. Monique described a class from her field experiences in which she unfortunately found the students and their teacher to be virtually disconnected. She felt that the teacher’s teaching style and cultural perspectives were out-of-date, and that he did not seem to care to stay ‘in step’ with his students and their culture. He used a very directed teaching style, rather than one that was more student-centred. Although the students were engaged in playing their instruments, they were not involved in any discussions or decisions regarding their performance. Their teacher told them what to learn and how to play, and they more or less played when and how he wanted them to. Monique believed that his teacher-directed learning style contributed to the pedagogical alienation between him and his students, and that they consequently often misunderstood each other.

Another thing too is the way that my cooperating teacher was teaching. Even though he was a jazz major, very much into performance, I don’t think he really embraced music education, because he’d say, “Play this” on this instrument. “You’re not sounding it right, you have to do it like this.” You know, very performance oriented and I had huge problems with that because it wasn’t really adapting to the student. His focus was on jazz performance, and having a jazz band, the school had instruments for them to use, but the teaching method was very different from what I myself would have contributed to the classroom. And also he was in his later years so I think he was getting tired. I think he felt
a very big difference between his education with the students and his own education, or perception of music. You know, students with technology now, with their devices, they’re so disconnected, and he just didn’t know how to adapt to that, because he grew up in a post-World War II kind of scenario. So his perception of the students and technology was “They’re all misbehaving”, you know, like, “I don’t know how to deal with that.” It was very difficult for me as a new teacher to see how closed-minded he was being. So I need to find a way to incorporate other students in a way that we can all relate. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique observed the teacher making all of the important musical decisions, with the goal that the students achieve a high standard of excellence in jazz performance. This is a very traditional approach to music education, where the students learn to perform very well, but within a limited stylistic musical exposure, specifically in this case, the jazz band. She also noticed that this particular teacher inadvertently emphasized the difference between his cultural background and that of his students. She thought that a more engaging pedagogical style may have established a better teacher-student relationship. The students might then have felt more included in the music learning, resulting in greater satisfaction all round. Monique also noted that the jazz band students came from a vastly different cultural and social upbringing than their teacher. The teacher’s disconnection from his students, and the students’ disengagement with their teacher and with the music class discouraged her.

Monique understands that today’s students are more engaged with their devices (texting, e-mailing, tweeting, etc.) than their predecessors, and noted that there is a cost – they have become more isolated from each other, from their families, their schools, their friends, and from society in general and more absorbed in the digital world. This ‘attitude’ may also affect their inclination to learn in group learning environments such as band class, particularly when the teacher is not structuring his music lessons to accommodate their cultural interests and backgrounds. In addition, whereas high school students in the past would gather and talk during their break times, contemporary students still sit together, but they are often singularly absorbed in their cell
phones and text conversations. The jazz band teacher may not have understood the extent to which students have become socially dependent on their communication devices, and consequently, he may have felt unnecessarily alienated and disrespected.

Monique explained that because they were in the secondary panel, the jazz music students were in that particular class by choice, for music is not a compulsory subject at that level. Many students may enjoy music, but they might not choose it as a subject, for they do not relate to or believe that they would be successful in a jazz band program. She described a situation at the same school where students who were considered to be ‘at risk’ of failing chose to create their own style of music during their breaks instead of participating in the music class, and were excelling at it:

There were also some local students who excelled only when they were not in the classroom, and when they were playing during breaks. There was a group of ‘at risk’ students. They were playing guitar, drums, a lot of those students liked to go on the drums. They were playing metal music. Because it was, once again these are kids who are at risk, who come from low-income homes, and one of them actually was, I found out later, was a father! – in secondary 3, so that’s grade 9! So home life was not that great. So they related to metal music, and they I guess, a person that they brought in, actually, I had played with his band before. Back when I was, in my younger years. So he knew what these kids were going through, because that’s what his experiences in his youth, and my youth I could say, as well, and he was also taking a role as a mentor. So, he was teaching these kids how to listen to music, what does the music mean. And how can you put that experience into your playing. But it was very instrumental. It wasn’t so much … it was movement based, but, it was their experience, yeah, and that’s how they were able to relate to the music. That’s where they excelled – doing their own music. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

The students were engaged in this alternative music experience because they were learning music they could relate to, and that had some cultural meaning for them. Music is a critical agent in the culturalization, identity construction, and socialization of youth. North and Hargreaves (1999) suggest, “Overall, musical style did influence participants' responses to the 12 statements such that adolescents believe that a given musical preference does have social conse-
quences” (p.82). Due to music’s importance as a strong socialization agent, most adolescents and young adult students will align themselves with the culture of their favourite music icons. It might be possible therefore, to draw more students into a secondary music program if the program featured music from their musical culture. An astute music teacher, wishing to attract more students to her class, may consider finding ways to incorporate rock music – perhaps through movement – into her program.

‘Uneducation’

In Monique’s opinion, the current education system does not encourage enough development of students’ inherent imagination and expressive potential, and therefore does not provide a quality education. Graduates are very disconnected from each other and from themselves. She referred to a ‘Ted-talk’ by Ken Robinson30 as she explained:

So there is this one talk from Ken Robinson – it was about the paradigms of education, or, uneducating the students. So basically the idea is that … children have so much imagination, but then, they learn not to use it as they go through the school system. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique is very interested in cultivating expressivity in her future classes, and believes that by cultivating mindfulness in her students, they may develop their expressivity as musicians and artists. She noted that children are very expressive, and that they have a natural confidence in themselves as musicians and artists. As teenagers however, they often become inhibited by feelings of inadequacy and therefore tend not to indulge their natural ease of artistic expression. Amorino (2009) confirms her concern: “A long-standing concern in the field of art education has been the seeming atrophication of artistic expression that usually accompanies the onset of late childhood and early adolescence” (p. 214). Children’s natural sense of wonder and artistic ex-

30 http://www.ted.com/talks/ken_robinson_says_schools_kill_creativity
pression gradually becomes exchanged for the more urgent concerns of adolescence. Kessler (2000) observes, “Students and teachers alike lament the shift in priorities that occurs after elementary school – a shift that diminishes the opportunity for creative expression” (p. 92).

Young adults are also becoming increasingly disconnected with the world around them as they become more connected with technology and more focused on social media. They have no time and little use for artistic expression; by then they have ‘forgotten’ how to sing and dance. That joy has been replaced with more socially popular modes of expression. Monique believes the school system could do much more to nurture and encourage children to retain and develop their appetite for artistic expression. She concurs with Ken Robinson, that schools are ‘uneducating’ students by stifling their creativity, their spontaneity, and their imaginations.

After observing a children’s Dalcroze demonstration class during the summer training session, Monique speculated that adult participants may not feel as confident or possess the same freedom of expression that she observed in the children. She suggested that adults may be much more self-conscious, and would be thinking: “What do I do? Am I doing it right?” She commented:

When I see people walk down the street, and they’re really self-conscious, I keep thinking, “These people have gone through the school system. What have they got out of it?” How they interact with people, you know, everybody’s very into what they’re doing and not aware of what’s going on. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique would prefer to be part of an education system that prioritizes and fosters artistic expression and confidence throughout a student’s academic career. The arts provide a creative outlet and a source of pride of accomplishment that is otherwise lacking in the busy, working adult culture of contemporary society. The arts nourish our soulful selves, thereby creating the opportunity to experience balance and personal connection in an adult’s busy life.
Discovering Dalcroze Pedagogy as Equity Education

Monique was introduced to the Orff, Dalcroze, and Kodály methodologies as part of her music education program. She was particularly intrigued with the movement aspect of the Dalcroze approach, and pursued her interest by taking a Dalcroze workshop that was being offered in her home town. Following this, she attended a summer teacher-training program through Dalcroze Canada in Toronto. During this intensive week of Dalcroze pedagogy and demonstrations, Monique discovered that the classes triggered many personal connections, not only musical, but also personal, social, cultural, and philosophical connections. Movement and reflection were the keys that inspired her to discover and understand her own personal interactions with space and time. She also noticed that the movement exercises, combined with the social aspect of the classes, inspired her to reflect on her interactions with society in general. When everyone in a class is moving, and has a certain task or focus, then there are no perceived barriers imposed by language, culture, age, education, or economic status. She wished to share that discovery with her future students:

Yes, so I mean, the other approaches also have movement, but it’s more like, in place, and I feel like it’s more specifically for a classroom that’s restricted in space. But the movement part is what really, really inspired me, because I really felt that, especially now with students – even myself, in my experiences of how I place myself in space and time, and within society, I feel like movement, and connection, one to one, is something that’s quite lacking with students. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique believes that the social interactions in Dalcroze classes and the development of a sense of self in society may benefit her future students, particularly those with special needs. She believes Dalcroze pedagogy may also provide a way for all students to feel more equalized in their classrooms, regardless of ability or learning differences. This resonates with her educational ideals of global education:
So that’s where the Dalcroze approach really enticed me. Because I said to myself, “You know what, this is something very social where I’m giving my attention to somebody, or … not.” Or you know, having to teach … how we work together, having a unified sound instead of everybody being so individual. And then people are having different cultural heritages, it’s also very, very different – different class backgrounds, different gender, like, how do girls and boys interact? In some cultures, a lot of women like to stay together, and a lot of men like to stay together, so, there’s a certain dynamic, and I said to myself, “We have to come back down to the core of it. What is it to be a human being? What is it to relate to ourselves in our physical space, within the classroom, then within the school, then within our families, and then within society outside of the school?” So, everything that I’ve always wanted to learn about has been … I’ve found in Dalcroze. And this week, has just … ‘pop’ … opened it up! (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

For Monique, the Dalcroze classes served as a metaphor for experiencing all relationships. She was experiencing many levels of socialization and community awareness, particularly through the movement classes. She hopes to use the activities in her future classes, to develop her students’ awareness of their various communities and their potential roles in those communities.

Monique also believes that many of the Dalcroze activities she encountered would provide relief to students who feel pressured in traditional music classes, by having to play the right notes, or perform correctly, or having to achieve any of the standard curriculum expectations and learning outcomes. The movement exercises may provide them with an opportunity to experience the curriculum expectations along with an expressive musical experience that does not require any prerequisite reading ability or performance skills. She is hoping that by incorporating Dalcroze activities into her future music classes, she will offer her students a diversion from traditional, transmissive, teacher-directed learning experiences. In its place, she will provide them with a discovery-based, joyful, and transformational learning experience.

Learning music through movement affords students the opportunity to become personally familiar with the embodied nature of art. Siegesmund (2004) claims: “the arts are forms of human inquiry that are rooted in non-linguistic skills of qualitative reasoning and somatic knowledge” (p. 94). Monique’s own music training had been taught to her through a traditional
approach. When she studied voice with a private teacher at the university level, she learned progressively more demanding repertoire, learning sequentially to read musical notation, and about theory and harmonic construction. Her craft is embodied in the sense that she developed vocal technique and learned to apply various vocal colours and nuance to the pieces that she was learning, but the essence and meaning of the art form, of classical vocal music, was very conceptual.

When I was in university I was very much like, in the brain, and I had to find other ways to internalize the rhythms and the melodies that I had to sing for various classes. And then Emma\textsuperscript{31} said this very well, “Our brains perceive what our body experiences”. So, through the movement, through doing, we are able to really understand more of the concepts. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) iterates the same idea: “Every thought is the interpretation of an action” (pg. 8).

Monique described one of the classes that took place at the Dalcroze summer school that involved a menagerie of props. There were various objects – umbrellas, a flashlight, tools, a shirt – scattered throughout the room. The instructor asked the students to choose and stand beside an object. Monique described her impression of the class:

One of the teachers did a workshop yesterday, and I said, “How do you use objects in the Dalcroze class?” I thought, you know, we’re going to learn instruments, but when she scattered the room with like … like, socks, (laughter) … chairs, hats, drums … then … How do we draw it? How do we draw it somewhere else? How do we envision it – Faster! Slower! What can we do with this object? And then totally imagining different ways of manipulating it, and imagining it in a way that, you know, we’re always told, Ok, this is a piece of paper (waves paper) – with words on it. Take it and read it … and then, that’s when the creativity comes in – imagination – and I’m not sure if it was one of the other teachers, I can’t remember, but they said, “It’s really to the limitation of your imagination” and what you bring into the classroom. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

This lesson opened Monique’s mind and heart to the application of imagination to music, and also to life – to being open to thinking of things through different perspectives. This was not a

\textsuperscript{31} Emma (pseudonym) was one of the summer Dalcroze teachers in Monique’s course. She is a master Dalcroze teacher, holding the diplôme supérieur.
traditional music class; this class was about perception and imagination, about assigning alternative meanings to objects, and about the infinite number of meanings we can assign to artistic events. The activities challenged her to think about music’s interpretive capacities, which are as limitless as our imaginations will allow. Like Monique, many traditionally trained musicians learn to experience music education through reading and performing. When they experience music education as hearing, feeling, and moving, their musical beliefs expand from what feels like one-dimensional knowledge into three-dimensional understanding. For Monique, this ‘objects’ exercise resonated with her on deeper levels than the musical application. She extended the lesson into a life-lesson about believing in one’s self, and about being unbounded by the limits of our imaginations. On the surface, the purpose of the object lesson was to awaken imagination, creativity, and expression. Monique also conjectured however, that rather than complimenting and facilitating creativity, the objects could represent barriers to inventiveness. The barriers could be anything – physical or economic impediments, time and commitment barriers, or even self-limiting and negative beliefs:

Talk about objects – it could be a barrier. Or, it could compliment our environment, not just objects, but people, a person can be a barrier, I mean, psychologically, that could be a barrier. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

The idea that we are limited only by our imaginations applies to all aspects of our lives, and not just the arts. This concept is what she wishes to address with her future students. It is an idea that is more deeply felt and understood through personal discovery – through embodied learning – as she experienced in the objects lesson, rather than through cognitive processing (reading). She commented, “So this week has really opened my eyes, like just to the possibilities of where I can bring music education”.

The summer school that Monique attended included demonstration lessons. She noted that the children who were part of the demonstration class were fully and singularly engaged in what they were doing. A Dalcroze lesson is always guided by a musical concept as a focal point, such as time values, pitch, or other musical elements. Applying movement to the pedagogy allows the student to experience the element in a personal way. Students begin to respond to the expression or the sense of the music as they bring their bodies into alignment with the elements. Monique observed the children in the Dalcroze class moving rhythmically and expressively. She commented:

Four to six year olds, yes, I was so moved at the way that, even though they’re still in their developmental stages, they were so expressive. They just interact with each other and they were comfortable with whatever movement they were doing. It was a beautiful thing to see. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique believes that all students are capable of expressive movement, regardless of learning styles, although some may have already developed restrictive, self-imposed barriers. She also believes that all students can learn about and experience the joy of musical expression through movement, and that Dalcroze Eurhythmics, being an embodied approach, may also help students to become more expressive in general.

Global Education

Monique believes that the kinds of activities that students perform in Dalcroze classes may impact their overall capacity for community awareness in a positive way. She commented, “It’s the ability to remain focused, very focused within your body, and within time, and within your space.” She envisions a connection between heightened awareness and global education. She explained further, “It’s being aware of ourselves, and also of the people around us.” Monique believes that by developing her students’ capacities for awareness, they may become
more intuitive, more concerned about and connected with their past and future, and more empathetic to their world, their culture, and all that occurs therein.

Monique considers music to be a social activity, one in which people generally and willingly enjoy participating. She recalled from her field observations that students were often not engaged in their music classes. She often noticed them on the periphery of the class, not wishing to participate. She felt some concern that many of the older students were not experiencing the benefit of socializing with their classmates in a musical context.

Older students … there’s all these different things that happen in the classroom with the students interacting in the classroom. But what I’ve noticed in many music classrooms that I’ve done my field experience in, over the past five years, is that students aren’t always playing music together. And music is such a social and dynamic activity. They’re off and doing something else, or disrupting, you know. They’re not engaged. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique was witnessing the withdrawal that often happens with students in their adolescent years, as they choose to refrain from engaging in classroom group activities and retreat into their own personal space and time. As noted above, adolescents generally love their music, not necessarily school music, and their music is not the kind of music that usually occurs in a classroom. An important goal for Monique in her career as a global music educator is to plan music activities that will be appealing for adolescent students, and that will draw them into more active participation. She believes that this will be of great benefit for them, not only with regard to their understanding and enjoyment of music, but also for their social development and wellbeing.

… and then you start to realize that there’s so many wonderful things happening in the classroom, that, it’s so much more to have fun with people, you know, or interact with people than it is by yourself. And I find in society, we become very, very individual or just within our own space and time, our own schedule. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)
Monique believes an alternative approach to music education might encourage more inclusivity. She found one of the Dalcroze activities that she encountered in the summer school particularly inspiring in this regard:

And what I see, and this is looking at it pedagogically, is .... the [Dalcroze] teacher always starts off like, we do everything together, and we do the lesson together or the song together, or we clap together, or we move together and then eventually, we start to incorporate how can we change the interaction with each other. For example, today in Emma’s class we were, she played a piece of music and said, “Move spontaneously to it.” Then she said “Ok, now get into partners”, and then how do you move with that? And then breaking apart, joining people and then breaking apart, and still within the group. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique believes that adolescent students, such as those who were becoming disinterested in the music class, may choose to become more engaged if group inclusivity is encouraged. She thought they may enjoy this activity because the social aspects would appeal to them, and they could have fun with it. As an educator with concerns for inclusivity, she also noted, “Another thing that’s really motivated me with this approach is, I can take this approach and put it to different music.” An activity such as the one that she described above may be implemented with any style of music, and may be particularly motivating if the music is of a type that the students enjoy or relate to. The music activity may also become a way of encouraging inclusivity, a concept that is in line with Monique’s strong beliefs in global education.

Monique lamented the loss of cultural diversity that is occurring as immigrant families assimilate western traditions.

You know, for me, and for young children who do not really have opportunities, or their parents don’t see the benefit of holding on to their traditions, and just, you know, “I’ll just let western culture be my dominant … way to interact with society”. I’ve always told myself that I really have to make sure that I respect the culture, and the music, and really respect the context which they come from. So my approach to holistic education also takes into consideration race relations. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

She noticed a loss of cultural identity happening within families, as well as in the schools:
… and especially with a multi-ethnic classroom, a lot of children don’t really identify – even their parents don’t really identify – with their culture anymore. It’s like, as they’ve gotten older, they realize that it’s actually a loss. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Monique believes that music can be a catalyst for global acceptance and cultural celebration. As an educator with a global perspective, she intends to encourage students to celebrate their own cultural heritage while accepting and celebrating the diversity of heritages within their classroom.

Monique mentioned that she experiences racism almost every day because of her skin colour. As she becomes more aware of the demoralizing effects of racial prejudice in her daily living, she also becomes more resolved to impart strong equity values in her students, and to dispel any prejudicial or other self-limiting tendencies through a teaching philosophy that is grounded in global education. She recalled another Dalcroze exercise that she thought would make a strong educational statement for peace education:

Monique – you had to talk in a foreign language.

Sharon – You were making it up?

Monique – Yes, yes, yes, and I was thinking, where is she going with that? But it was interesting because we were all back-to-back. We were watching two people interact with each other with a foreign language, back-to-back. It had to sound like something that was an actual language, using, strong consonants, but, it didn’t have to make sense.

Sharon – So it’s gibberish really?

Monique – Yes, it was gibberish, but our inflections in the words, and the way the... [demonstrating inflection] Du du du du... du du du du du – things like that, there was an interaction happening. And it makes me think about, what about immigrants who are coming from different countries, who are trying to speak English, and they’re not being able to be understood. How does a person be sensitive to that? How can they, you know ... ’cause a lot of people are very like, “Oh, I don’t understand them.”

Sharon – Yeah, like don’t bother.

Monique – Exactly, but ... if you take the time to understand the context, to understand the person, you know, there’s something about the Dalcroze approach that allows that
kind of respect. So to me that’s … (laughs) that’s just an eye-opener. They don’t really teach that in the schools. Often, there’s predominantly white teachers in the classroom, that are teaching, or who are actually directing the education system, so it’s just another reason why, as a person of colour, I feel like … I’m being a different representation for the students, you know. It’s not just white teachers out there, there’s also you know,

Sharon – So it goes beyond cultural barriers.

Monique – Yeah, Yeah! (personal communication Aug. 9, 2013)

Musically, the gibberish activity was an exercise in expressive communication, in improvising, and in responding. Yet Monique experienced it as an exercise in peace education, in which students were required to listen through a language barrier, to understand each other’s intent and expression – to hear the person behind the words. With so much prejudice inherent in Canadian societies, multiculturalism and equity in the classroom are issues that need constant attention. Most students understand that in the classroom, prejudicial behavior or language is not permitted, but they may still be hearing and experiencing it at home. And, although officially multicultural, our Canadian culture continues to demonstrate prejudice at many levels. It is sometimes overt, and sometimes subtle, and is often embedded in mass media – in movies or advertisements. The Dalcroze gibberish activity may possibly be an effective exercise to teach empathy, tolerance, and acceptance in any classroom – math, science, language arts, physical education, etc. Although students understand the rules around expressing prejudice, by experiencing the gibberish activity, they would have embodied the experience, which for many, might be the first time they have demonstrated empathy in this context. The experience may in turn, enable them to understand equity more insightfully.

**Monique’s Experiences as a First-Year Teacher.**

I met with Monique for a second interview exactly one year after our first interview. I was interested in finding out if she had implemented any of her ideas for teaching global educa-
tion during her first year as a music teacher, and in particular, if she had used any Dalcroze exercises to achieve that goal. She was fortunate to have acquired a full-time position teaching only music as soon as she became qualified. She described her campus:

Well, let me first explain the conditions in which I was able … to survive teaching in. So, it was one school, 2 campuses. So that means that in each campus, there was a junior and a senior campus, and they’re about a block apart. I could walk between the two schools. So, the junior campus has one principal, and the junior campus has a different principal as well. Junior campus, K to Grade 2, and then the senior campus was Grades 3 to 6. In the junior, I had 10 classes, so, that came up to about 200 or so kids, then in the senior classes, there were 13 classes total, but they had some smaller numbers in them as well, so that came up to about 260. And I saw everybody once a week. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

She was responsible for teaching music to 460 students, and was offered the position in mid-August, with only a few days to prepare:

I finished the Dalcroze, the week I came back, I had no idea – I had 3 days really, to get my things together. And I also had to prepare 2 different classrooms. So, now I have … worked through that. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

She would already have been familiar with Québec Education Program, but as a professional teacher, she would have had to prepare yearly outlines for each grade, and to choose activities for each grade that support those goals and expectations. She would also have been expected to direct or implement extra-curricular activities; in this case, there were concerts and a talent show to manage. Monique was successful in incorporating some Dalcroze pedagogy into the junior classes:

The junior students were more welcoming, because they were much younger too, to the movement exercises, and I was able to really focus on Dalcroze and Kodály, but different. I was able to do a lot of movement with them using props as well, like … scarves and hackey sacks, to really feel the weight of the beat. Sometimes I would play the drum, or we would sing songs, and sometimes I would go on the piano, and play very simple melodies. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

She explained that the junior students were more accepting of her than the senior students. There were many dynamics at work in her classroom:
The senior classes, they are much older, and they had the music teacher that was there before for, basically their whole education career in elementary. So to see me introduced into the picture was for them, a very ... they weren’t ... at first they weren’t very welcoming. They LOVED their other teacher; he was like a light in their lives. Another teacher explained that I was like the ‘step-parent.’ (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique was politely understating their attitude towards her. When I asked her if she had implemented any prop activities such as ball bouncing with the senior students, she described a discouraging situation:

They weren’t used to it before – like I had a lot of them laugh at me. They’re like, “This is not music!” And I’m like, “This is part of the experience.” And they would throw the ball at each other, they would laugh ... it was just, ... (laughs). (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique’s negative encounters with the senior students were unavoidable and not directed towards her personally. They were so used to their previous teacher’s methods, that they rejected her new ideas of teaching through movement. They may also have been feeling some anger because she had replaced their former, well-loved music teacher. Monique also experienced some issues with bullying, from Grade 2 through to Grade 6:

Well in my first year of teaching, at the very, very beginning, I explained to the students, music is about working together, it’s about ... So I implemented the ideas of collaboration and collectivity, and the students understood but, once again, when they were coming into the classroom, they weren’t always aware because of ... having that kind of collaboration within the class, because there were already dynamics of cliques and bullying, older students, and younger students too. Maybe not so much in Kindergarten and Grade 1, but by grade 2, because also it’s a junior campus, so they’re like, the OLDER ones! So there’s a certain ... I mean, it’s good for students to have confidence, but, they have it in their minds that they can do whatever ... (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Like many new teachers, Monique was encountering some challenges, particularly in the higher grades. It will take some time, perhaps another year or two before her students become comfortable with her and her program; she will be returning to the same position for a second year.
During our second interview, I asked Monique if she had been successful in implementing any activities that supported her beliefs in global education. She described an activity that she used in February, when many schools in Canada observe ‘Black History Month.’

For Black history Month, the focus was on Nelson Mandela because he had passed away in December, so, they wanted … the committee wanted us to focus on Black History Month, the subject being about Nelson Mandela and South African Apartheid. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

She chose a freedom song to teach the senior students, Sing Your Own Song, by UB40. The lyrics uphold and promote the values of freedom. She discovered that some of her students did not understand the concept of racism, and did not comprehend the politics behind Apartheid. She created an embodied activity to implement with the senior students that utilized music notation to illustrate the idea of racial discrimination:

By this time, I had already taught them a quarter note is sound, and the ‘rest’ is silence. So there was one activity I did that was an anti-discrimination activity, where I basically handed them out tickets, and had 2 different sides of the room. This side has the quarter note symbol, this side has the quarter rest symbol. By this time, I knew the students understood the material, but now it was about who I was going to be choosing, and how I was going to be reacting to them, and it was basically to educate them on the apartheid in South Africa. So, sound, silence. I was working with the group, mostly who had the quarter note sound, while, with the other group I was like, “Excuse me, it was not your turn to answer”, so, I was giving the quarter note group more attention, and telling the other group, “sorry, it’s not your time, I haven’t addressed you yet”, and being kind of, just a little bit mean about it.

It was very brief, maybe 5 minutes. But within that 5 minutes, we discussed it afterwards and they were like, “I didn’t like how I was being treated” or, “I liked how I was being treated, because I felt special. You were asking us questions, and we knew the answer”. And then, those who I was silencing, they were like, “I felt invisible. I felt like I didn’t matter”. And I told them, “Imagine if you were in this situation where they were segregating people because of the colour of their skin!” And then all of a sudden, and because these groups were also mixed, like there were white students, black students, Asian students … and then I also saw those that were in the sound group were saying, “I feel sorry”. They were also demonstrating feelings of empathy. So I thought that was very interesting. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

32 Black History Month was implemented in Canada in 1995 to observe the history of people of African-American descent during February.
Monique had elicited a felt experience from both groups. The silenced group felt insignificant and angry because they had no ‘voice’. The quarter note group felt privileged because they alone had a ‘voice,’ but then they felt empathy for the unjustly silenced ‘other’ group. The students briefly experienced the same feelings, although not to the same extent, as the people who experienced Apartheid. Therefore, their understanding of Apartheid may be more deeply understood than if they had merely read about it or been told about it. Monique had provided the students with a transformational experience. Her students learned what Apartheid was about, but more importantly, they may remember how it might have felt, as they experienced discrimination first-hand.

Monique’s activity continued with student reflections. They verbalized their reactions and responses to the activity while she wrote them on a whiteboard. She then photographed the collection of responses and showed the students’ responses to other classes who had done the same activity.

Monique – I said, this is what the other class said, and they did the same thing as you. Nobody wants to feel ignored. Everybody wants to have a say.

Sharon – Is that the response that you wanted?

Monique – Yeah. I wanted them to be able to see that there was a similarity. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

By sharing the students’ responses, they may also understand that other students feel the same way as they do, that everyone has a right to voice their opinions. This concept would help her students relate to all the less privileged children in the world who experience racism or any other form of oppression. Monique closed her discrimination activity by showing a Michael Jackson video, You are Not Alone.
Monique was fortunate to teach music in her own music room, yet the space was too small to teach the movement activities that she had hoped to introduce to her students. The students bumped into each other. I asked her about her plans for next year:

Monique – And, so, what I’ve learned from this year, like being able to apply in my future classes … You see, when I think about it now, and the students I was working with this past year, these techniques are based on a child being able to sit down and listen. And a lot of students don’t listen. And of course, that’s something they have to be trained in. So I think I would have approached it very, very differently. I mean I’ll have less things to worry about. Now I’ll have had the experience of … what to expect. And also the students understand now that I’m the music teacher. So that relationship will be played out very differently in the way that I approach teaching them. But, definitely, I’m definitely going to do more prop work with the students, because it seems like they really enjoy doing that. Singing, they were able to do. When I started to do the Kodály – the Curwen hand signs, like … to them it was a challenge. They were like, “do, re, mi”. I started just focusing on the sol–mi, with the Kindergarten, well I didn’t want to do too much of that with the Kindergartens and grade 1’s, but by Grade 2 they were able to really focus on that. Well, definitely with the junior campus, K to 2, I do more movement with them than I do with the Grades 3 to 6. Their interest actually was instrument playing. So, I started doing a recorder program for the Grade 3s and 4s. I didn’t have enough for the Grade 5s and 6s. I had something different for them. They were more into like … Hip Hop, so I was able to kind of implement some of that, using this, like beat boxing. There’s a computer program they really enjoy, the Grade 6’s, called 'Incredibox'.33 It’s an online program. Like, there’s this one guy, you dress him up in different costumes, and each costume has a different sound, and it’s like “pff, tss, pff, tss…”

Sharon – so were they composing?

Monique – Ya, they were creating their own compositions using this program. They really enjoyed it. (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014)

Monique wishes that all of her students be engaged in music, with no one standing idle in the corners. She believes Dalcroze activities will stimulate group participation and her choice of music will facilitate student engagement. She also understands that teachers must be reflective in their teaching approaches and willing to embrace new methodologies that will stimulate their

---

33 *Incredibox* is a computer program in which students can create their own music by combining rhythms, effects and melodies.
students’ interests. The computer program, Incredibox, enables her students to meet curriculum expectations (composition), while creating and playing music in a style that they love.
Chapter Seven

Hania

Hania has retired from classroom teaching, but is still active in Orff teacher training programs. I have participated in some of her workshops, particularly during my own training in Orff pedagogy in the mid 1980s. I also occasionally saw her at Dalcroze workshop classes. I approached her at one of the summer pedagogy classes in Toronto to ask if she would be interested in participating in my study. We met twice to hold interviews over lunch, two weeks apart, on a very quaint main street of a small Ontario town. Hania also provided written correspondence to elaborate on some of our discussion topics.

Background

Hania enjoyed a very successful career as an itinerant elementary school music teacher in an urban centre. She has a strong association with Carl Orff Canada, and has presented many Orff workshops. She considers Orff to be a very holistic, comprehensive, and child-centred approach to music education, with its inclusion of drama, movement, dance, language and speech rhythms, improvisation, socialization, and introduction to percussion instruments. In an Orff class, children study music in a social setting, learning on instruments that are designed especially for children. Orff instruments are effective percussion instruments for young children; they are easier to master as compared to instruments designed for adults. Students have the opportunity to experiment with pitch and melody, and to play in ensembles, in small groups, or in solo performances.

34 Carl Orff and Gunild Keetman together developed a comprehensive approach to music education in Germany in the early twentieth century that includes singing, movement, drama, language, stories, and percussion performance and improvising. It is known as Das Schulwerk in Germany, and as Orff in North America, and has been widely implemented in public schools. See www.orffcanada.ca/
Within the Orff context, Hania specializes in movement and drama and strongly believes that movement should be included in every music lesson. However, the memories that she herself has of her own early music lessons do not include movement at all. She described her piano lessons and singing classes as ‘traditional’:

Traditional music – the way I was taught piano – is … theory was told to the head, and then I learned to play the piano from the wrist down! And, I had a little bit of singing in school; we sat in our chairs, and only used the vocal chords of our throat. And then we looked at staff lines. So it was very much teaching transmissive knowledge to the brain – to the concepts – and then the brain telling either the voice to vibrate or the hands and the fingers, and the rest of the body was not involved. That’s all I had. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania believes that music taught in the traditional manner is limiting because it only utilizes a cognitive approach to education, and does not engage the student in kinaesthetic or social forms of learning. Traditional, private piano lessons emphasize performance skills, and generally utilize a mentor/student relationship; the teacher models proper technique, draws attention to errors, and encourages students to play to the best of their ability. It is not common practice to employ movement, drama, or story telling as teaching tools in a private lesson.

Hania came from an Eastern European family that celebrated traditions through the arts – music, drama, and folk-dance. As a child, she participated in artistically enriched community celebrations; she also has very fond memories of ethnic summer camp activities. These summer camp experiences provided opportunities for her to experience meaningful and personal connections with several of the performing arts, including music and dance, but particularly drama. She recalled the passion that she felt for the summer camp performing arts experiences:

Growing up as a child, I loved doing drama, and took part in Polish summer camps in the ‘60s, where we did a lot of folk dancing and singing songs around the camp fire, and marching, singing songs down the road, hiking and singing, and the close friendships, and just re-enacting Polish traditions. It’s very powerful, very community-building, dramatizing little stories and Polish history and all that. It had a very powerful influence on me, and gave me that love of drama and music. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)
Hania’s music education learning experiences exposed her to two very contrasting methodologies of music education. On the one hand, she experienced formal, private piano lessons, which were very cognitive and transmissive in their approach. In contrast, Hania had the opportunity to participate in multi-sensory summer camp experiences, learning about and experiencing music within a joyful and cultural context. In this positive environment, she made friends and connections through the performing arts, and had the opportunity to celebrate her Polish historical and cultural roots through music, dance, and drama. Away from the transmission style of formal music education, she was free to experience, to feel, and to fall in love with the joy of performing through the arts. She later discovered and embraced an approach to music education that included elements of movement, drama, story, and improvisation – Orff pedagogy.

**Introduction to Orff and Dalcroze Pedagogy**

After high school, Hania completed a Bachelor of Arts degree. She continued to study piano, and to nurture her passion for drama by participating in the drama club at university. Upon completing the bachelor’s degree, she attended Teacher’s College where she was introduced to Orff pedagogy. Hania’s first encounter with Orff also inadvertently included Dalcroze Eurhythmics exercises. Although it wasn’t labeled as Dalcroze Eurhythmics, Hania later recognized the style of music and movement that was introduced in her first Orff classes as being derived from Dalcroze pedagogy. She described her first encounter:

It was my first connection with Orff in the early 70s in Teacher’s College where we did what I would call Dalcroze exercises, it’s just that I didn’t know the name. We were at Teacher’s College in ’73 – ’74. That was the first year you had to have a Bachelor of Arts degree to become an elementary school teacher. The classes were very small and I took the Ministry Part 1 Music courses. I remember the teacher had us walking in a line to the beat, stopping, stop and go, making shapes, working with body percussion patterns, the basic things, but it was the first time in my life as an adult, in my mid-twenties, to be exposed to a musical experience that was not traditional. It was when I did the Dalcroze exercises, which were in the context of Orff, but they both do have that in common, that
movement base, that I went, … “WOW! This is It!” (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

As a teacher-in-training, Hania experienced the pedagogical connection between music and movement for the first time in an Orff class. As Hania enjoyed the wholistic childhood performance experiences in the music camp, it is not surprising that she felt a strong connection with Das Schulwerk\(^{35}\) and its child-centred, wholistic inclusion of music, drama, story-telling, and movement. Based on these pedagogical connections and her passion for movement and drama in particular, she decided to pursue further training in Orff pedagogy. She completed Orff teacher training at the Royal Conservatory of Music\(^{36}\) in Levels I, II, and III in the early 1980s. Thus began her life-long association with Orff pedagogy.

Recalling the differentiation of *wholistic vs. holistic* from Chapter 2, (p. 25), Orff pedagogy is a wholistic (multidisciplined) approach because it includes a variety of experiences – dance, singing, improvisation, drama, speech, and playing on percussion instruments. It is also a holistic approach to music education because it engages the child in several capacities – intellectually, corporally, and spiritually. Orff classes are designed to present a child-centred musical perspective, enabling young children to discover rhythm through language and to discover creativity and ensemble playing through improvisation using instruments that are specially designed for children. Hania considers Orff classes to be *authentic* music education experiences because the child participates as much as possible in an integrated musical and dramatic experience – one that the child has helped to create, and that is designed to provide an environment wherein she can explore, nurture, and express her full artistic potential.

---

\(^{35}\) The German term for Orff pedagogy

\(^{36}\) The Royal Conservatory of Music in Toronto (RCM) was and still is the defining institution for musical training in Toronto.
Drama can easily provide a holistic element in any subject area because it offers students a direct experience with the subject (outer reality) and their imaginative and expressive (inner) selves. J. Miller (2000) notes, “Many of my students have argued that drama is one of the most holistic subjects since it can combine several subjects (e.g., English, history, art, and music) as well as engaging the whole person (e.g., the intellectual, emotional, physical, and spiritual)” (p. 81).

Very shortly after completing the Level III Orff teacher training course, Hania heard that a Dalcroze workshop was being offered in Toronto. At that time there were relatively few occasions to study Dalcroze pedagogy in Toronto37. In her first Dalcroze classes, Hania discovered yet another approach to music education, based entirely on embodied ways of knowing. She recounts her early introduction to Dalcroze pedagogy on its own, apart from Das Schulwerk:

At that point I hadn’t heard the word ‘Dalcroze’ at all. But then, in the mid-to-late ’80s, there was a Dalcroze workshop I attended in Toronto, and, I went “Wow – this is great!” And then maybe I did another one in the early 90’s. And I invited a Dalcroze teacher to present a workshop at the Council of Drama and Education’s (CODE) annual conference, because I was very intrigued by the Dalcroze [approach]. I had this feeling that it added more depth than the Orff even, though they overlap so much, but this real focus on the kinaesthetic sense in such depth and breadth really intrigued me. And, I attended that workshop at the CODE conference. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania continued to attend Dalcroze workshops and classes when they became available. She believes that brain development is stimulated when people listen to music and attentively respond in their bodies, particularly when participating in exercises such as Dalcroze eurhythmics. Barnhill (2008) claims, “The rhythms and features of music, through the gateway of movement, impact psychological processes which in turn can impact the structure or at least cer-

---

37 Dalcroze pedagogy is still under-represented in North America, compared to the Kodály and Orff methods, both of which were widely implemented in elementary schools in Canada and in the USA on a large scale during the mid-to-late twentieth century.
tain aspects of the functioning of the brain” (5’ 35”). Hania further believes the increased time that today’s children are spending at computers, and the decreased amount of time they spend moving and playing with each other, negatively impacts their ability to concentrate. She explained:

So, every time I have a quality Dalcroze workshop, it really confirms in me that this is what we should be doing in basic mainstream education, the education of the body that really supports or develops those brain connections for all learning. Like, this is more important than just music education, doing eurhythmics. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania suggested that Dalcroze Eurhythmics classes enhance neurological development, and would therefore be of benefit to students in their other learning endeavours, as well as in music education.

**Rituals**

Hania spent two years (1969 – 1971) in West French Africa with Canadian University Service Overseas (CUSO) as an English high school teacher. She lived in La Haute Volta (now known as Burkina Faso) in ‘the bush.’ She taught in two boys’ high schools and was the only white and female teacher in one of them. She spoke only French while she was there, as this was a former French colony and French was the official language in the education system. She described some of her experiences and impressions from those years:

I attended some amazing rituals of the local tribes where photography was not permitted. I saw and participated in very sacred drumming, mask and dance celebrations commemorating the death of past tribal leaders. These two years exposed me to looking at life quite differently in terms of how to think about time, use of space, personal possessions and concept of family which extended far more widely. Here the paradigm was so unlike that of the white Western man. (e-mail correspondence, June 10, 2014)

---

Hania encountered a very different culture in Africa to the one that she had known previously. She commented that the musical traditions were very different from those she had been exposed to. The rituals she encountered in La Haute Volta and the surrounding region combined music, dance, and drama, and had a strong influence on the deep affinity she would later feel for Orff pedagogy, with its inclusion of music, dance, and drama. Hania greatly appreciated and marveled at the artistry and spiritual expressivity of the rituals. Her first-hand encounter with the Haute Volta rituals never left her:

What a person chooses to believe in to explain existence does not matter to me, but that there be a sense of the sacred for the spirituality of all life. The 'arts' are a reflection on life about a given set of values and time in a society. To live with an awareness of beyond the here and now was a goal of mine to have children exposed to through the arts. (e-mail correspondence, June 10, 2014)

Later on in her career, when Hania worked as an itinerant music teacher, she often developed lessons that incorporated spirituality and ritual using the Orff methodology. It is important to her that children have the opportunity to experience a sense of spirituality, or as she described it, “a sense of the sacred”, similar to the feelings she encountered in the rituals, and which she believes can be felt through the arts and through ritualistic practices:

I still felt it was important for children to be exposed to ritual. I did have units on 'Ritual' I did with junior grade classes over the years also. Grasping what a 'ritual' is (be it sacred or secular) is a complex concept for children to understand and think about. What the role of ritual is in our lives and the elements that make up ritual. The children would then prepare their own rituals in groups. (e-mail correspondence, June 10, 2014)

We discussed the positive aspects of celebrating through rituals, and the ways that rituals link to community:

Hania – You see, rituals … celebration is basic to human kind.

Sharon – Yes.

Hania – And the components of ritual is props, music, movement,
Sharon – Community

Hania – Community, and celebrating some event. I even do this unit now with children in Grade 5, because the school system, deals with ritual, or old cultures … so I asked the children just to brainstorm a list of all the holidays we have in our world today, so they’ll put things down like birthdays, Christmas, Easter, Valentines, endless. Canada Day, Labour Day, whatever. And then I say, Now, divide the list in to secular and sacred. So then, they’ll notice some have to do with … like Thanksgiving, that’s almost kind of in between the two. It has to do with being grateful for food, because food is so basic to live, to exist, and yet at the same time, there’s the spiritual component because we’re so dependent on life forces to give us food, and, if you look at the Indian culture, or Inuit, or Aboriginal …

Sharon – Gratitude is there.

Hania – Yes, – of the beauty and the safety of the environment, and the balance. But anyways, it gets the children to focus on, “Why do we have these celebrations?” And then, it’s sort of like, you know, trying to explain existence, and we hold on to it, and we revere it, and we’re thankful, and we want it to stay safe for us, ’cause otherwise we won’t live, so it’s getting the children to understand what culture and celebration and sacredness means, ’cause that’s an abstract concept, so by having them just think about their own holidays, and how they make them feel … and then I say, “What do all these celebrations have in common?” Well the birthday, you’ve got food, the cake, you’ve got hats, the props, you’ve got singing, you’ve got games,

Sharon – Presents, gifts?

Hania – … and then you look at all of them, whether they’re sacred or not, and they all have the same five components, so then I say, in groups, you can create your own rituals. You can choose the reason for it, and, how will you show me how you’ve incorporated four or five of those elements. So, that to me shows that powerful relationship between movement and expression, giving it depth of meaning. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania wrote a unit related to native rituals, which has been published in Canada Is: Grades 3–4.

The unit includes a well-developed set of lessons for the teacher, as well as suggestions for implementing the integration of the Arts. She commented on this unit:

The pictures show how physically connected my students were while dramatizing through song, dance, chant and mask (from e-mail correspondence, June 10, 2014).

By performing or creating their own rituals, Hania’s students are able to combine the arts – music, dance, visual arts, and drama – into one integrated, wholistic arts experience. Because
they are involved in the creation of the performance, her students are able to engage with their peers in the creative process and to realize their own ideas intellectually, emotionally, socially, physically, and spiritually.

**Orff Pedagogy**

The organization Carl Orff Canada, Music for Children identifies as its first objective:

- to encourage the development throughout Canada of a holistic music education program for children based on the pedagogical philosophy and approach of Carl Orff39

They also describe their pedagogical philosophy:

The Orff approach to Music Education is holistic, experiential and process oriented. It is for all children … and encompasses aural, visual and kinesthetic learners. Children learn through doing, exploring and improvising. The Orff philosophy combines the elements of speech, rhythm, movement, dance, and song. And at the heart of all this is improvisation – the instinct children have to create their own melodies, to explore their imaginations.40

Providing her students with a holistic educational experience is very important to Hania. She believes that holistic experiences allow her students to become more inwardly balanced, more sensitive to their own perceptions, and more aware of all of the relationships that surround them, all of which foster deeply sensitive and artistic expressions. Her classes regularly combine movement, drama, and music, starting with movement. She notes that while Dalcroze classes are designed to enable students to awaken and develop their capacity for sensing, they are primarily about movement, and are intended to develop musicianship. She believes that Orff is more integrated than Dalcroze, but that Dalcroze has more depth. She compared the two approaches:

I actually think that Carl Orff was more wholistic, but Carl Orff needed to use Dalcroze pedagogy as part of the whole Orff experience. I find Orff looked at story, and folk, and community, and he thought much more wholistically, to my way of thinking, Dalcroze was trying to elevate sound through body. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

---

Miller differentiates wholistic (multi-faceted) education from holistic education, which facilitates inner, soulful connections for the student. Wholistic education can also be holistic education, as long as it provides opportunities for the student to engage in soulful learning. Hania identifies closely with Orff pedagogy, because of its emphasis on multi-sensory, wholistic education:

Orff works with community making music together with movement (creative and rhythm-mic), voice (spoken and sung), percussion (body, non melodic and melodic), recorder and finally leading to improvisation once some skills are there. The goal of Orff is to develop well-balanced human beings through music that is movement based. I think the two [Dalcroze and Orff pedagogies] can be a perfect marriage, each having a richness in its perspective. (e-mail correspondence June 10, 2014)

Hania is most concerned with awakening and developing her students’ capacities for sensitivity, perception, and awareness and does not limit her pedagogy to music. She teaches drama, dance, and music, and believes that by offering lessons in which students can explore and develop their capacities for sensitivity and awareness, they will become more sensitive artists and ultimately more compassionate human beings. Orff pedagogy emphasizes and offers these kinds of experiences. Dalcroze offers them as well, but its focus is primarily on developing kinaesthetic awareness of music and musical concepts. Dalcroze students often find that they become more sensitive and perceptive artists and human beings in general as a result of their participation in Dalcroze classes. Indeed, arts education has the potential to develop sensitivity, awareness, and perception in all students.

**Multi-sensory Stimulation and Development in Arts Education**

Hania includes extensive movement and drama in her music classes on a regular basis, ultimately involving every student and often creating very moving and dramatic school performances. She uses her vocation as a music teacher not only to teach music, but also to develop all of her students’ senses, to the best of her ability. She believes that by becoming more sensitive

---

41 see Chapter 2, Literature Review, (p. 25).
human beings, students and educators alike will become more perceptive and more expressive in their encounters with the arts, and in their lives in general.

I always start with movement, and I use the senses to stimulate the movement, so it could be sound, it could be looking. I develop an aesthetic sense, not only like music focuses on sound. We’ll isolate looking, and the body response; we’ll isolate the sense of touch and body response; the kinaesthetic sense responds to all the sensory input. Now music would focus on involving that depth of the sound input, but I will bring in other sensory inputs too. We’ll do exercises to develop that kinaesthetic sense that Dalcroze talked about. I had extended it to deepen the other senses, to add the nuances, that connection with the whole nervous system. So when you touch hot, cold, rough, smooth, – that gives a body response. When you smell, if you were to smell smoke, there would be tension – FIRE! FIRE! So tension-release – that’s the same kinaesthetic sense as sound – so, it’s not only just sound input. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

The aesthetic sense that Hania described is a form of heightened awareness – a multi-sensory awareness that engages all of the senses – touch (hot, smooth), sight (colour, light, form, perspective), sound, smell, and the proprioception\(^42\) sense of direction, balance, and movement. Her exercises include movement and often incorporate a dramatic response such as delight, disgust, or surprise. She contends that her drama pedagogy training is responsible for showing her the importance of sensory awareness activities, and claims that drama incorporates all of the senses with body connections. Thus, she is training her students to use all of their senses to be as perceptive as possible. She believes that all teachers should have some background in drama education because it broadens and deepens one’s perspectives. She believes that drama and story are basic to all the other arts. She explained:

It was the drama courses I took for ministry credit, parts 1, 2 and 3 that helped me create a clearer framework for teaching music in a holistic manner: the senses to activate the body to arouse emotions to then stimulate the intellect and mostly in the context of meaningful story. I see Drama, Story as the grand umbrella for all the other arts. (e-mail correspondence, June 10, 2014)

---

As her students acquire more experience in sensibility and perception, they become more expressive in their performances, and better able to perceive expression in the arts as audience members and receptors of the arts in general. Hania believes that by incorporating multi-sensory integration into a lesson, the teacher ensures that her students are being offered a potentially holistic experience. Hania believes that arts education offers a unique opportunity for students to explore and to express their developing perceptions and life experiences, but only if the experiences are provided as authentic arts experiences. Hania describes an authentic arts experience as being personally meaningful and holistically engaging. Yet most students are more familiar with the ‘rote’ style of music education, and do not necessarily have the opportunity to be exposed to a holistic approach. Hania also noted that the multi-sensory approach is neither expected nor widely understood:

Working on the expressive arts, teaching expressive communication through all the senses and the full body, that’s what I do. There’s a sense when people ask, what I do, and if I say I’m a music teacher, then, they say, “what instrument do you play?” (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania has observed that as adults, we tend to become artistically desensitized. She believes that newborns have a naturally higher sensitivity to external stimuli, and that this sensitivity becomes less discriminating as children mature through their various stages of development:

That sense, that Dalcroze spoke about in terms of building a tension, babies have it when they’re born, it’s very heightened, so they can respond with joy, with fear, with sadness very quickly; all their senses are very activated. But then we get numbed. By the time, ... 3 and 4 year olds are very responsive, but by the time people are 10, 11, 13, and then as adults, they stop noticing things. So to become an artist that is truly connecting to sound, and truly connecting to colour and line, or to shape, or whatever, you have to do those Dalcrozeian-type exercises to heighten that body-nervous system connection. So, I broaden it to even more than just working with the sound, and even the opening Dalcroze exercises actually look at children – looking and developing their relationship to the world around them, so that’s working with the visual – and the body. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)
Many of the Dalcroze exercises develop students’ capacity for attention to detail and musical nuance. The games can be easily adapted to develop student’s awareness of dramatic or visual arts elements. Hania applied perception and attention games to her drama classes to heighten her students’ awareness and attentiveness to visual and/or dramatic details.

**Holistic Education**

I asked Hania to share her thoughts about holistic education in regard to relationships and connections.

Hania – Well, holistic education … When I’m teaching the Orff courses, my first session is always setting a framework about what’s the difference between holistic education and traditional? And I follow the Miller transmission, transaction, and transformative model. They have to read that first article and respond to it with a reflection, “Where do they think they fall?” But I always say, traditional education was transmitting facts to the intellect. You would then respond, either in writing, or by giving an oral response, but mainly you were teaching concepts to the intellect, and that doing that in the arts particularly really ended up being quite limited.

Sharon – It reminds me of the Cartesian duality.

Hania – Yes, exactly, and I make reference in my thesis about Descartes splitting the mind and the body, whereas in holistic education, I have the children always start with movement, because that stimulates joy in 99% of children, and when there’s joy it means that they’re connecting emotionally. So then it becomes an aesthetic joy, a community building activity. So, I develop the physical domain, which activates the emotional and the soul, and then that stimulates curiosity and intellect. And that’s how, and I explain that, that’s just how my process goes, body, to mind-emotion, to intellect, which is the opposite of traditional teaching, which goes first to the mind, and it will often just stay in the mind, and that’s not holistic if you’re not working with the three domains. So that’s the holistic framework I work in all the time, and that’s Dalcroze and Orff both. That’s why I love Orff’s little quote: “Experience precedes cognition”. And that’s Dalcroze too. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania clarified the concept of holistic education by differentiating between process in cognitive education and process in holistic education:

I often give an example by Brian Way; he’s a drama educator. This is one of his drama exercises, where he says, “What is a blind person?” He says, “Cognitively, I can answer that by saying someone who cannot see, and who has to rely on the other senses, but, if I were to do it holistically, I would ask them to close their eyes, to move, to try moving, functioning in the room without your eyes, and to then reflect on what’s happening.” And he says, “and that’s where the ‘experience’ becomes transcendental.” And you truly understand it in a holistic way, involving the emotions, and all these ways, not just as an intellectual idea. The three terms – transmission, transaction, and transformation is holistic, because you are transformed from the inside out. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

J. Miller (2007) claims “holistic education also involves exploring and making connections as it attempts to move from fragmentation to connectedness” (p. 13). The cognitive explanation that Hania described is a fragmented or one-dimensional way of understanding blindness. A holistic approach would connect intellectual understanding to the physical or kinaesthetic and also to the spiritual dimensions of understanding. By suggesting that his students try moving and then reflecting on their ‘blind’ experience, Way is incorporating all three realms of understanding – intellectual, physical, and spiritual. Embodied understanding is experiential. Furthermore, his example uses the kinaesthetic sense to instruct the intellectual sense – the body learns and then the student reflects upon what it means and feels like to be blind. Confucius is credited with the quote: “Tell me and I will forget; show me and I may remember; involve me and I will understand.” Montessori (1949), Dewey (1938/1998) and Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) concur that education is rooted in experience. Students have an experiential understanding of blindness, assimilate their knowledge with their previous perceptions, and benefit spiritually from the empathetic understanding that experiencing blindness provides.

44 This lesson example can be found in Development Through Drama by Brian Way, published by Longmans in 1967
Holistic Principles in Dalcroze Pedagogy

Hania believes a rich repertoire of sensory experiences stimulates heightened awareness, alertness, and cognitive activity. She devised exercises that utilize the kinaesthetic sense, and she provided her students with opportunities for multi-sensory perception:

I think all art needs Dalcroze Eurhythmics. I think all artists need it because even an exercise like when you walk forward or back to a beat and feel the phrase, that’s the same like a character in a play. Your character – are they moving forward directly or indirectly? What energy are they going to work with, when they are creating character in a play? You have to have the same body awareness, and it’s … you’re not working with pitch as directly, but you are working with the nuance of rhythm. Every character has rhythm. I think it’s wonderful for drama work. It’s the same with visual artists – the line you’re working with, you know – is it direct? Is it smooth? Is it jagged? Dalcroze work frees that up. I think that if you could have children having twenty minutes of eurhythmics every day in the school system, we could transform the society… (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

Hania commented on music education in the schools. She believes that drama teachers and visual arts teachers instruct with an emphasis on expression, whereas music educators may not. She explained:

Hania – Now it’s interesting that we’re talking about all the arts. I’ve always felt that if you were going to compare a visual arts teacher to drama teachers, to dance teachers, to music teachers in the school system – I generally find that the music teachers are the least aesthetic, and the least authentic, and the most cut-off. And they have no … they desperately need Eurhythmics!

Sharon – Why is that?

Hania – Well music is very mathematical – and they can make it very ‘rote’. And I think the majority of music education in North America is very rote. It’s awful. I find visual arts teachers are more expressive, and drama teachers are very expressive generally. And I find that very sad about music education, and kids are bored in class. They’re not engaged, they’re not connected. It’s quite ‘rote’, and I don’t think it’s changing. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

Hania also noted that there is a significant difference between movement abilities and expressive gestures between boys and girls in the elementary school classroom. She has noticed
that boys move more freely in general than girls, and believes that this is due to differences in the ways that boys and girls are socialized. She observed:

When I teach music with the Dalcroze movement as a basic part of the program, even the boys in Grades 1, 2, and 3 are far more expressive than the girls. The girls are very healthy and polite; the boys are more imaginative, more authentic, more real – more connected. They move with such … they’re just in sync. There’s a stiffness to the girls. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

Of course, this is a general observation; some girls at that age are very physically coordinated, while some boys are not. Hania continued:

Now this morning, I worked with a group of 8 children at the community centre here, where there actually was a girl who was very expressive, and it was lovely to watch little Gracie – she was very free. They stand out, when these girls are expressive, but generally the boys just outshine them. So whenever at workshops, teachers, say, I can’t get the boys to dance, I say, “Don’t call it a dance, actually boys love to Move”. And they are far stronger movers than the girls – far stronger. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

Hania described an activity that she participated in during the Orff teacher training summer course in her role as the drama/movement specialist teacher. She believes that this activity exemplified holistic education in music education:

I love doing dance/dramas, and it’s very Dalcrozi, and yet, it’s also more than just analysis of music components. It’s kind of a fusion of working with the elements of music, but in a dramatic way, and our theme for the closing was ‘risk’. That life has risks, and so, I took a new book that was published by Sally Carmichael – with wonderful, creative movement pieces. She works with many different musical sources, and she had one that was Rita McNeil’s song, ‘Workin’ Man’ … and it’s the risk of the miners … and her words are fabulous. And she had this wonderful outline which she ‘tweaked’ but I had twenty-three of the participants, adult teachers – music teachers. We worked on the movement together. So we dramatized clusters coming in, the elevators going down, and the swing hammer going every two beats to the song, you have the sound of the clap coming from the xylophone bars, and the other level sang it live, so it was, and it built up with harmony, and the movement, the participants felt phrasing, they felt tempo, they felt dynamics, they had lifting – the hard work of the lifting and the putting down – passing, pushing the carts. And we added elements of the rhythmic sound of the carts going along the dark cave, and then the explosion happens. And freeze and silence, and there was such a … like everybody was so moved, like suddenly everybody felt real empathy first for Rita McNeil, who just died, (Hania’s voice is breaking up) a lot of the people were from the east coast, and could identify with the story (Hania starts to cry) of the tragedy, you know, and then they ended just walking off and a solo voice singing. It … there was,
like ... the people all said to me, “You made me cry, you made me cry”. So, that to me is ... *(with difficulty speaking)* that’s a ‘eureka moment’ – the power of movement and sound together, within a cultural context of meaning – because this is the heritage and the culture of our Eastern Canada, and the beautiful words of a Canadian singing icon. So, that’s just one example of many over the years, where, to be able to use movement, and that kind of full-body movement ... and that was the other thing – in those 23 participants, half of them were dancers and very comfortable and very expressive, but there were 3 or 4 – there were 2 men in particular – very self-conscious – couldn’t get into role. The last day they were in role, and they got it ... and I just went up to them and I said – *(Hania is teary eyed)* ”You gave me your soul. Thank-you” I said, “You really felt it. Thank-you.” *(personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)*

This integrated arts experience included music, movement, and drama, and also developed personally meaningful cultural and historical connections for the performers. Hania believed that the *Workin’ Man* performance provided an example of authentic learning, as opposed to rote learning. The re-enactment of the Nova Scotia coal miners tragedy provided authentic artistic meaning for the students because they contributed to its creation by offering and incorporating their own ideas as the performance developed. Hania describes the Rita MacNeil performance as a “eureka moment” because there were so many deep connections being made; “the power of movement and sound together, within a cultural context of meaning, and the beautiful words of a Canadian singing icon.”

Amorino (2009) claims authentic art education must “guide students towards a realization of artistic expression as a meaningful and life-changing facet of education” *(p. 216)*. Hania continued:

When you are creating beauty and sound – not in a rote way, but an authentic way – and that’s what Dalcroze goes for – the authentic expression. That’s an important concept – that we’re not rote responders – we’re authentically giving back with full body involvement. *(personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)*

In music education, rote learning can occur when students learn to reproduce music, either by reading it, or by copying a teacher. Students may be playing an instrumental composition in an ensemble setting or singing in a choral setting, performing with correct tempo, phrasing,
melodic line, harmony, and rhythm. Yet their performance may lack authenticity because they are merely copying or deciphering. They are following the score as written and under the conductor’s direction, without incorporating any meaningful expression or creativity into the performance. The rote performance does not always ‘ring true’; it may be lacking in playfulness or it may not connect with the audience emotionally. Music that is taught and learned by rote will not necessarily move an audience, because the student has not personally connected with the music on a soulful or artistic level. Amorino (2009) finds a similar problem in teaching the visual arts: “many educators preoccupy themselves with a linear, formulaic teaching of studio techniques, skills, history, and formalism … instead of re-creating the natural flow of events that comprise the ‘authentic’ artistic process” (p. 215). On the other hand, the authentic learning that Hania refers to includes holistically experiencing and understanding the music, and knowing the music in a spiritual and artistic sense as well as intellectually. Authentic learning enables students to be soulfully creative and artistically expressive regardless of ability or medium. One of the appealing qualities of an Orff program is that children can make music on their own terms, using instruments specifically designed for children, incorporating expressive movement, singing, and often including some degree of improvisation or compositional input from the children.

Hania continued:

Hania – But that’s the goal of arts education – to not be rote, but to bring out authentic experience. That sense of community, and that, “my contribution is …”. The two Grade 2s I worked with, we worked on a little sharing presentation at the end, and for 7-year olds, in the end, they were so authentically honest and focused, and that was so exciting (laughs).

Sharon – What do you think it meant for them? Do you think they were expressing something that they’ve never done before?

Hania – That’s right. That’s right. I could see that they loved it, and they wanted to keep doing it more and more. More and more – they never tired of it! And they wanted to make it more and more beautiful and they wanted to improve their skills. And it was al-
ways because we started with the movement and the Dalrozan concept. If it was not for Dalroze and Orff, I would not have remained a music teacher. But now, because of Dalroze and Orff, I never get bored teaching music. Never! After 30 years, I find it more and more exciting continually! And that’s why, even though I’m retired, I go in to work with a few classes for a half day every week, because I have to maintain that contact with children.

Sharon – Would you say it’s a spiritual connection as well, that’s being nourished?

Hania – Exactly. That’s what it is. That’s what it is. And I could feel the spiritual bond from the children at the end, I really could. Ya, And there was such a … they had matured so much in their focus and … it’s amazing. They were transformed in the end. They really were. That’s what’s so fabulous about being an educator! (chuckles)

Sharon – And that’s really what I’m trying to express in this thesis… by getting different stories and perspectives on that … on these experiences – what does it do for us as people?

Hania – That’s right. That’s right. I think it does transform the child for life. For life – absolutely. I run into old students who say, “That’s all I remember are these – arts things you did with us – that was the highlight.” Yeah!

Sharon - I want to try to uncover how that happens, and that it does happen, or that it can happen.

Hania – I think it’s because you see, each person is made to feel they have contributed something of their own individuality, authentically, and so they’re not just being a rote puppet conducted by a eurhythmics teacher! It’s such a wonderful gift and they … trust and feel safe and confident in their skills. And that’s developing their … life skills. They don’t have to become musicians as adults, but it’s giving them confidence to communicate independently as their own human beings … Yeah. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania noted that not only do students benefit immediately from these multi-sensory aesthetic experiences in their current social, artistic, intellectual, and spiritual development, they also recall them at a later date as being meaningful and valuable educational experiences in general. The experience gives them confidence, which transfers to other areas or situations in their lives. She tried to explain how the performers and the audience felt during this performance:

So the teachers, or the grade 2s, they got so unselfconscious and comfortable in their bodies, that they could truly enjoy the music, and openly want to just give to the world freely, and so that flow was so open and honest. There was pure joy for all of us, and the class-
room teacher watching too, pure joy. Yeah. And people who were watching said, it gave me goose-bumps because they could feel the genuineness, that they were just so… So, it wasn’t that they were being controlled, they were being themselves! (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

I asked Hania to specify what it was about the Dalcroze approach that was authentic for her. She explained that it was through the arts that people find value in themselves, and can discover an artistic way to share that expression of self. She remarked that her music classes have enabled certain students who were feeling depressed to start feeling good about themselves again. She described a time when the arts provided a safe vehicle for a student who otherwise felt predominantly unloved:

I think that movement education, and in this particular instance, using the Dalcroze approach, is the way one can bring safety and confidence in one’s own body, so you can find your place in the world, and that that is what’s going to heal society. We can create a society of people who feel good about themselves in their bodies. I did not have a happy childhood and it was the arts that saved me – gave me a sense of value, and I can see children who come into the room, and sometimes you know, they’re coming from homes, where there’s anger, there’s hurt; they can be affirmed through music class. I know I had a few boys like that this year, who felt hurt, and then I found, boy, they really had a sense of the rhythm, and they could play. I remember one of them could play the drums with a real connection, and often 7-year olds don’t have that, and I just said, “Oh, I love the way you do that because you’re using your full body, you can feel that, and you’re gonna be my drummer, you’re gonna keep us altogether”. And I know that that boy then suddenly started liking to come to music because they felt good in here, and valued, and that was the beginning of the fact of saying, I can like myself, I do have value. So, it is an avenue for hurt people to transform themselves. So that’s one of the things that we can do, because I know that’s what happened to me. (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013)

Hania’s student was beginning to realize his own value and to gain an appreciation for his own unique purpose and place in the world.

**Dalcroze Eurhythmics Classes**

I asked Hania to describe her personal impressions of experiencing music through movement:

I just love doing expressive movement to music that is not boxed in with prescribed choreography, that is free movement, but it works with the dynamics and the musical form of
the music. When you’re responding with improvisation, but your mind is also feeling, oh, that’s the rhythm – oh, the tempo has changed – oh, that’s gone from A to B music, so you may be improvising, but you’re responding to the elements of the composition – so, it’s not just kind of beat or texture, which is interesting in my class at the Dalcroze course. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

She was curious about whether other students’ movement responses were generated intellectually, by noticing and analyzing the elements of music (melody, form, dynamic, metre, etc.) or if they became aware of visual images evoked by the music, and responded to those. She asked some of the other students, and remarked that she received a mixed response:

The pure musicians tended to not be as comfortable with movement. They approached it in more in the intellectual domain. They were going with … okay, did the tempo change, what is the mode now, they didn’t see any pictures at all, didn’t see any imagery, so they were just thinking high, low, fast, slow, major, minor, that’s what they were responding to. To them it was analyzing the music concepts, and not so much how is this making me feel … their domain was more … just one, not as wholistic. They were representing [the music] – oh yeah, that’s high, minors are more closed … I found their movements were very appropriate, but the source of inspiration of thinking was such a different starting point from the others. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

When I asked her where her inspiration for the movement came from, she responded:

For me, I find I do both. But first, it’s the imagery and the mood. I see music education as part of expressive communication, and we are responding to life situations abstractly through movement, through sounds, through pictures, through language, on a symbolic level. When I’m listening to a piece of music, I’m thinking, “What am I seeing, what am I feeling?” But then, when I start moving, I do start to think about the intellectual concepts too. Do I want to focus on, or do I want to move with the beat? Or do I want to move contra the beat – like contra-rhythmically, (against it)? Or maybe I’m going to move just on the accent beat, and change shape, so maybe I’m going to be flowing … so I do think conceptually, but the first thing is the emotion that I want to communicate on the symbolic level. And then I’ll use the intellectual constant as a tool to help me structure it – so, it’s not just random, or ‘minor movement’. I find I do tend to think on all three levels – intellectually, physically, emotionally when I approach music. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

We discussed the concept of ‘thinking physically.’ It is a concept that requires a philosophical approach. Hania offered an explanation that concluded with an example:

Hania – We’re always moving – even when we’re not moving. Dalcroze says there is no movement without life. If there’s no movement it means you’re dead. He’s right – non-
movement – stillness is moving – but it’s being conscious of that – I’m consciously responding to a sound stimulus. And that’s a conscious movement. So, it involves intellect, the body responds to the intellect, and it arouses emotion, I mean it’s always happening. In Dalcroze you make movement with conscious decision – I mean that’s part of Dalcroze’s exercises, to bring self-awareness to what you are doing. That’s the whole point. … Some people do move intuitively.

Sharon – Maybe that’s the goal, is to get that into the subconscious – to respond to everything you’re hearing – moving sub-consciously, you know, moving in small movements because it’s quieter.

Hania – Flowing versus jerking – Yeah, but certainly, when you find … There was one movement exercise we did to *The Rite of Spring*[^45] … that was just so phenomenal – that was a spiritual experience. This was a concept Natasha[^46] created, having us feel the metre. It was predominantly a metre of 4 that would change to 5 or 3 from time to time. And we were in partners, and then in two rows. And we would feel … we would push, and pull, there would be an ebb and flow, so we would take steps 1, 2, 3, 4, back 2, and there was contact, now it’s 3, 4, back 2, 3, 4 in sync with the music. And Natasha would help by calling out the upcoming metre, and it was like … feeling a breath (*hhaaa*), and like, we were in one with the music. *The Rite of Spring* is quite a complex piece of music, and I’ve always loved it because it is so … the images and everything – but, she gave us a simple movement concept to work with – and, it just felt … spiritual. You know, and that was the same with the miner song that the teachers did in the summer – the same thing.

So that was a conscious choreographed musical concept that we worked with, to have the music go into our nervous system, but it was very aesthetic, so it was more than just a rote exercise. So, when it becomes an expressive, aesthetic experience, that your whole nervous system is totally taken over with the sound, in sync …

Sharon – I was just wondering what made it so spiritual for you. Were you just so immersed in it that you became in flow with it? Or was it the connection with everybody else?

Hania – It was that we all felt the same metre, and the simplicity of the movement, really got into the … feeling the breath of the music. That’s why I love working with Natasha – because she does that with every piece – she winds up an idea to work with one of the concepts in a way that just really gets you to feel and explore the concept – this was the changing metre. I mean there are so many more textures in that music, but that’s what she focused on. And that was … eureka! Phenomenal! (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

[^45]: *The Rite of Spring* – ballet music written by Igor Stravinsky, 1913
[^46]: Fictitious name
Although the above example related to the concept of thinking from a ‘physical standpoint’, for Hania, the experience is also associated with a spiritual experience. She compared it to *Workin’ Man*, which she described earlier, and used as an example of holistic education. When people express what they are feeling through their bodies, they become aware, perhaps for the first time, of the potential and ability that resides in their own bodies for self-expression. That is why many musicians experience an ‘a-ha moment’ in their first Dalcroze classes. This awareness brings them in touch with their spiritual awareness, and more in tune with themselves, their feelings, their expression, their aesthetic potential, and their spirituality.

**Multi-sensory Artistic Experience**

During Hania’s teaching career, she often provided multi-sensory artistic experiences for her students. The exercises involved many senses; they were intended to sharpen her students’ perceptive abilities, and to awaken and develop their artistic potential. I asked her to recall those times that she engaged in multi-sensory artistic experiences as a participant or a performer, rather than as a teacher. I also requested that she describe the sensations she felt within herself as she experienced and expressed this connection, for example, using movement and music. Hania described a recent performance and the sensory experiences that she felt as a participant. Every sensory element was relevant to the artistic experience, including the temperature and time of day:

This last weekend, I had a ‘eureka moment’: *(chuckles)*
We were doing a demonstration of NIA\(^{47}\) on pavement at the corner of Highway 4 and Highway 6 in Fleshterton because they were having a fair day there. We were in the middle of this … It was the juxtaposition of it that I found so fantastic, because there was the sun, with all of its glory, shining in our faces, we’re all on this hard pavement, with traffic going around us, and we had on this new age, relaxation music – this contrast, and we were, the four of us, were demonstrating for people what NIA is. So we did this very

---

\(^{47}\) NIA (Neuromuscular Integrated Action) is a type of movement classes developed in California in the late twentieth century. See [http://www.nianow.com/practice](http://www.nianow.com/practice)
simple movement pattern in our group of 4 – just walking slowly towards each other –
having one hand go up – a very simple pattern, and then the other, breathing slowly, mak-
ing the breath bigger and bigger with our hands and our breath. Then we sat down togeth-
er. We moved ‘as one’, and it was very flowing, very still, very gentle, and it was in the
setting of pavement – heat – traffic – but it was kind of surreal, and I found a eureka! I
loved it. It made me think of the modern dance choreographer Pina\textsuperscript{48} – it was like watch-
ing a Pina dance. I absolutely loved it. (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

While it seems like an unlikely setting for a genuinely artistic event, Hania explained that
it was the unique combination of contrasting sensory stimulation in the setting – the pavement,
the sun, and the traffic – that made the event so interesting for her. All of those elements, the mu-
ic, the corresponding movement, the setting, and the background sounds came together to create
an artistic moment:

It was the juxtaposition and the context. We were doing this beauty in this jarring pave-
ment, and this actually made it more beautiful – than … in the forest funnily enough.
That made it powerful. The contrast of the textures …
It was like … the hardness of life with the pavement and the blazing sun and the jarring
traffic … that had a beauty. That had a beauty because that’s life – we’re alive, and it’s all
part of reality, – and that was the part about Pina – that joining the unexpected together,
so I found doing this legato\textsuperscript{49} in this harsh context was very interesting. That was part of
the composition. I loved it. Yeah. So yes, it’s lovely to move when you can feel you get
in touch with the … life force somehow … you’re responding to the whole energy of life,
through sound and nervous system and … (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

Hania felt that the \textit{gestalt} or wholeness of this experience put her in touch with the life
force, as if the movement, the setting, and the music all blended together to create a sensory win-
dow through which she could enter into the elemental presence of pure creativity. She continued
to explain her point of view:

Hania – It’s my religion. I don’t go to church, this is what I do.

Sharon – It’s very sensory … a ‘wonder?’

Hania – Yes, exactly. It’s connecting with the universe.

\textsuperscript{48} Pina Bausch (1940 – 2009) was a modern dance performer, choreographer, dance teacher, and director
\textsuperscript{49} \textit{legato} – a term denoting smooth, lyrical musical expression
Sharon – It’s almost like super- awareness.

Hania – It’s kind of just celebrating the mystery of life! (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

Spiritual Connections through Sensory Experiences

To close our interview, I asked Hania to summarize what it was about teaching through movement that resonated with her. She responded:

It affirms my connection to others; it builds community. When I’ve done dance dramas in a group, it brings one close to each other, and you feel the eureka! Like last weekend, doing that thing on the pavement, that was very powerful spiritually for me. I continually have experiences like that – it’s sort of hard to pick just one (laughs). (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)

She related one more incident to me, not of movement or drama, but of a sacred place in South Carolina:

Hania – even sitting in a special place – we go down to Hilton Head every year, which is just this natural nature reserve island in South Carolina, and there’s a forest where there’s a sacred ring, that was built by early man I think 16,000 years ago. And the shells are still there, in the middle of this forest clearing, in this huge circle in the low lands. And there’s this ring of shells that are starting to decay but you can still see it. And when you go there, you can feel the sacredness of the place, you’re in touch with the early, early man, and that’s powerful. It’s amazing.

Sharon – 16,000 would be the native people …

Hania – So they would be the native original people on North America – it’s just quite amazing – and this is like, I guess 3 kilometres from the ocean, so the water has receded that much over the years. ’Cause this used to be by the ocean, that’s why there are these shells – well, it’s not 3 kilometres, what would it be – probably a kilometre in the middle of the forest now but before that was by the sea, way back. And these original shells, and they say, “Please don’t lift a shell that was placed by early man”, and that’s sacred, that kind of … and you can sit and wonder, Now what were they … Why the circle? What were they celebrating? When would they gather? How would they gather? (personal communication, Aug. 27, 2013)
Chapter Eight

Grace

I had the pleasure of studying Dalcroze pedagogy with Grace during a summer training program a few years ago. I asked her to participate in the study because she has extensive knowledge and experience with Dalcroze pedagogy and could provide a teacher’s perspective. Having a variety of interpretations provides depth to the research design. We met in a restaurant, and conducted the interview over dinner.

Background

Grace has always felt a close connection between music and dance. She attributes this to her experiences as a young child, having parents who were both classical musicians. They were professional duo pianists, and while her mother practised at home, Grace would dance. Her earliest memories are of joyfully dancing to her mother’s music. She was experiencing music in a way that is natural for children, by becoming so absorbed in it that she gave in to her natural inclination to move along with it.

They were pianists, and my dad was teaching at Baker Oak College\textsuperscript{50}, and they concertized together, so mom would practise at home, while my dad would practise at the studio. So she would be there for hours, and I would just … as a preschooler, play under the piano, and come out and dance, and then go play under the piano, and then go out and dance, every day. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Although most of her early exposure to music was through her mother’s practicing, Grace also remembers the excitement of hearing her parents playing both parts together at concerts:

Sometimes she’d be practising Chopin etudes, and sometimes she would be practising the two parts, and then when I went to the concert, I heard my dad’s part along with her part, and “O Wow!” – it was just so cool. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

\textsuperscript{50} fictitious name
While other children spent hours playing with toys or playing with their friends, Grace spent a considerable amount of time dancing to music; it was one of the ways she played. She believes that her early dance-play developed artistry, creativity, and kinaesthetic awareness and expression. It also enabled her to deeply connect with her mother’s music, experiencing it in her own unique and personal way, and on her own terms. Nevertheless, through dance-play, she was connected with her parents in a state of artistic flow: Grace was dancing while they were playing, but they were all in flow together. She believes that dancing through her formative years gave her a deeply felt, personal connection between music and dance – a connection that stayed with her for the rest of her life.

Her parents nurtured her developing passion for dance, enrolling her at an early age in summer dance classes. While movement continued to be a source of natural joy for her, she also began to understand dance as an expressive and respected art form:

The National Dance Festival\(^{51}\) was coming to Baker Oak College, where my dad taught, and where I grew up, and, during the summers, when this took place, these amazing, creative movement teachers – modern dance teachers – came and they taught children’s classes, so I was in those as well. People like Bonnie Bird\(^{52}\), who has become really well known, and other teachers came. So from the time I was little on through, I had these great, unusual … – never any “Miss Susie Ballet”, (which I imagined myself some day being), but it was, you got the sense that it was serious, and it was very conceptual. We studied Laban\(^{53}\), we did Laban dictation after a while. We had to take it home and learn it and come back and do it the next day. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Grace was also taking piano lessons at that time, and developing musical performance abilities and perceptions of music, but in her case, those perceptions were strongly associated

---

\(^{51}\) fictitious name

\(^{52}\) Bonnie Bird (1914 – 1995) danced with Martha Graham’s Dance Company, and became a dance teacher who was notable for educating her students not only in dance but also in their personal development in general. See http://www.bonniebird.org/bonniebird.html

\(^{53}\) Rudolf Laban (1879 – 1958) developed a movement notation and analysis system in the 1920s, that considers time, space, weight, and flow in movement. See http://www.sesame-institute.org/movement-rudolf-laban
with movement. She explained that her dance experience enabled her to feel the music she was playing on the piano as if she was dancing to it:

We usually had a live pianist, a real musician right there, and so dancing and moving to piano music was … normal to me. I was taking piano lessons too, so I was a pianist also, so I feel the movement as I play, I just never separated them. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

I asked Grace to tell me more about her experiences with this connection between music and dance, particularly if there were any times or performances when she felt the connection more vividly:

Grace – It’s always been there. I used to dance in the living room also when my mother wasn’t practising. When I got older, I could see a reflection in the window that was sort of a mirror. We did not work with the mirror in the dance classes that I had, and I would just play music and dance and dance and dance and dance and dance, and I’d stop as soon as anybody came down the stairs – my sister, my parents. As long as other people were out of the house – it was like, “Yes! The living room!” I would just go and dance and dance and dance and dance. I don’t know what I was doing because I didn’t have any real technique classes where we learned steps, but I just LOVED moving to music.

Sharon – What were your experiences like when you were training as a dancer?

Grace – I was little, I was into the ballerina thing, and I know that now there’s a lot of sociological issues about, studies about how that’s really not good for little girls, in the sense that they start to think that they’re a princess ballerina, everything pink and fluffy and pretty, and it kind of warps their sense of themselves, so, I had a little of that – I wanted to be the ballerina in the music class, you know. Then in high school, I got really into old 1940s music, and old 1930s and ‘40’s musicals on TV that they would show on Saturday, so I wanted to learn to tap dance. And my older sister who had no knowledge of dance, so I don’t know why she even got to say this, but she said, “You should learn ballet before you learn tap dance”. So I went to the little ballet class at the ‘Y’ that was taught in Pellerston, taught by a dance company’s dancers in Pellerston. And they said – and I was 15 – I mean that’s pretty old to be starting ballet, but my body could do this stuff, and I was coordinated, and they were amazed that I had perfect turn-out, and I could do this, and I could do that. They wrote my mother a letter and said, “We urge you to let Grace come and live in Pellerston and train as an apprentice with this ballet company”. And my mother said, “She is just not ready for that, but if you

---

54 ‘Y’ is a short form for YMCA (Young Men’s Christian Association)
55 fictitious name
could tell me how to get her to clean her room, that would be a good start!” (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

The connection between music and movement that Grace had nurtured as a child grew into a natural love and ability for dance, which continued to develop throughout her adolescent years. Eventually she made her way into the National School of the Arts:

It was easy for me. And then my dad had a piano student whose mother had been with the original Ballets Russes, and they came for oh, probably he would play recitals at our house, and she said, “What are you learning? Have you learned this? Have you learned that”? And I didn’t have any vocabulary – it was just based on this theory of rotors and motors, and it was interesting. So she said, “Come to my house and I’ll teach you”. So, I learned in her basement. I was about 16 and then at 17, I went to the National School of the Arts, and it was just easy for me, so, I really enjoyed that. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Grace continued to immerse herself in her love of dance while attending this arts-based secondary school; she studied music and dance along with a comprehensive general curriculum.

It wasn’t until college, I think, when I felt the pressure of choosing a major, and seeing the two different departments in 2 different buildings on 2 opposite sides of the campus, that it was really weird. I felt always that I was doing one thing when I was doing either one. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Conceptually, Grace considers music and dance to be inseparable. Dance is a way to express the artistic intent of music, and music is a way to express the artistic intent of dance, both generated from the same expressive stimulus or idea. So strong is the fusion for her, that later, when she began post-secondary education, she balked at the idea of having to choose between studying dance or music. She at first rejected the notion that music and dance were separate entities:

When I went to Baker Oak as a student then, I had to pick a major and I could not split music and dance, and I was realizing that, all these dancers don’t understand anything about music, and even the teachers don’t! And all these musicians, if their music is not natural to the physical body, then it’s not going to resonate with the physical bodies of the

---

56 fictitious name
57 The Ballets Russes was a very successful ballet company based in Paris in the early twentieth century.
people in the audience, and that’s what it’s about I think. That’s where it comes from, it comes from the body, and the voice, it’s not … nothing fell from the sky … that just … you know – like, here’s a trombone, or here’s a piano and here’s what it is you know … it’s all from the body, and so, I try to connect those two. And I was getting really frustrated and we were, at the time, keeping technique journals. And my journal was getting filled with, “I can’t believe these people don’t understand anything about music!” (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Grace continues to embody the artistry of music through movement, and of movement through music. She understands music from its physical characteristics – the movement of a phrase, the energy of metre and rhythm, the shape of a melody, the emotional responses to changing harmonies – these are her ‘musical elements’, all fused together to create one embodied artistic expression, which could be music or movement. In the 1980’s however, the predominant music education philosophy was based on an analytic approach, in which the separate elements of music (harmony, rhythm, melody, texture, form, and timbre), were taught and studied (Reimer, 1989). For Grace however there is no separation; the elements are all together. She fundamentally did not agree with separating music and movement, much less breaking music up into its component parts. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) agrees; “the study of sound and movement should be collated and harmonised, and no one branch of music should be separable from the other” (p. 7).

**Conflicting Points of View**

While at college, Grace learned music through a cognitive approach, not an embodied one. She felt frustrated by this methodology, because for her, the real meaning of music is connected with its capacity for generating expressive movement. In a cognitive-based approach to music education, students may learn music theory and composition through the study of harmony and form without ever listening to or experiencing the music as an expressive art form. Grace’s experiences with music however, are consistently felt in her body and conversely, her involve-
ment with artistic movement are always associated with music. When she remarked, “these people don’t understand anything about music”, she was commenting on her teachers’ failure to understand the connection that music has with the body, which for her is both obvious and fundamental. Of movement and music, Grace said: “They’re part of the same thing – one thing. So I think the split is artificial in the first place.”

While Grace was playing music for the dance classes, she realized that the dance teachers were not asking her to provide musical or inspirational music for their lessons. She did not believe that they were in tune with her artistry. Her recollection reveals that at least one dance teacher did not even want her to play musically, in fact, asked her to play quite unmusically – which demonstrated to her that he did not really understand the connection between artistic playing and artistic movement:

At the same time, I was accompanying dance classes, so, I would literally – in my leotards – go and be at the piano to play for one class, and then jump out and take another class, then go and play one class, and I was seeing it from that side too, that teachers did not know what they were asking me to play. So, I was playing music that I felt very personally. One time I played something in ‘3’ – I played one of the Ravel Waltzes Nobles, which did not hit the ‘1’ [beat 1] really hard – and the teacher said, “I don’t hear the one” so I tried to give it more of a ‘1’, and he said, “No. No.” So I played something really – I don’t know what I played, but I banged the bass, and he said “Yes! That’s what it is!” So it was really hard for me, and then he would say, “Now let’s do that one twice as fast” [and I thought] “No, I’m not going to play this piece twice as fast – I’m going to play another one”. So I was getting really annoyed to find that the world was split like this. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Whereas for Grace, music and dance were mutually inspirational art forms, for the dance teachers at her college, the music was functional – more like a metronome for the dancers.

In order to obtain a Bachelor’s degree at Baker Oak, Grace was expected to enter either a Music or a Dance program. She decided to major in Music:

I still feel they are connected, and the rest of the world splits them apart, and I don’t know why. There’s, I guess, a Greek idea, that they’re all connected, so, it’s that I wish I
could play the piano and dance at the same time! That’s the one thing! (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

While she was studying at Baker Oak, one of the dance teachers told Grace about Dalcroze Eurhythmics:

When I was going through all this writing and the technique journal as I mentioned, one of the dance teachers said: “Why don’t you go and look up Dalcroze in the library – it combines music and dance”. And I said, nope. Nobody does that. I can’t do that, it has to be one or the other. You have to specialize – which kind of dance, and which kind of music and ya da ya da – and I looked it up and I wept as I read the book – I was so amazed that this wheel had already been invented! I knew I had to go and do that. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Grace was deeply moved because she believed that she had discovered a pedagogy that resonated with the way that she understood music and dance – that they were deeply interconnected art forms. Music and dance had always held very close and personal meanings for her, and in Dalcroze, she believed that she had found a way to study music and dance as she understood them – as mutually interdependent art forms.

**First Experiences with Dalcroze**

Grace’s first experiences with Dalcroze pedagogy were not as inspiring as she had hoped. Eventually however, she found a teacher who she felt a connection with. Her artistic experiences in Dalcroze were different from what she had experienced as a musician or dancer:

One thing about eurhythmics that’s different from just dancing to music and playing music from the feeling of physicality, is the way the exercises are so playful! They are so fun! I mean, that is the most fun I have ever had! In Dave’s classes, when I was first there – it was just the best kind of play I’d ever had. It was really fun. I think there was maybe a cognitive aspect that wasn’t quite the cognitive aspect – it was different from being worried about your dance technique, or playing the right keys or something. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

58 Dave (not his real name) is a master Dalcroze teacher, holding the highest possible accreditation in Dalcroze pedagogy, the diplôme supérieur.
Play is one of the pedagogical techniques that Dalcroze teachers often incorporate into their classes. Rieber (1996) claims, “Research from education, psychology, and anthropology suggests that play is a powerful mediator for learning throughout a person’s life” (p. 43). Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) claims,

The child delights in all manner of games in which his body may participate. Gratify this instinct, and apply it to our scheme for the education of the future. There is nothing to be ashamed of in it. Let us be children with children; it will be time enough to replace our spectacles when we come to discuss music with adult amateurs. (p. 54)

Dalcroze pedagogy is not a methodology, but rather a set of pedagogical principles. Every Dalcroze teacher will apply the same principles, but perhaps in a different way. One of the foundational pedagogical principles is experience precedes cognition, but it is up to the teacher to determine exactly how that experience will occur. Some teachers may use jazz music while others use classical music. Some may develop movement exercises that incorporate responding to music with simple hand-held instruments, while others may prefer to use props such as elastic bands or gracefully moving scarves. Grace recalled her experiences with her first Dalcroze teacher, who also held the qualification of diplôme supérieur:

Grace – Actually I went to a different Dalcroze group first, and it did not click with me and I thought – this is just not what I read about. “O well, I guess I don’t want this after all” I didn’t know there were any others, and then I found Dave’s, and that one clicked. So, the different ways of working, I think, resonate with different people for different reasons.
I thought that was the only school there was. And it just happened that my dad got a brochure in his college mailbox about Pemberton, and I went there, and I went “Ahhhh - oooo” just right away.

Sharon – How was that different, could you just elaborate on that a little bit?

Grace – I remember doing anapest. I felt like it was going somewhere, that you were progressing through the exercises fairly quickly and I understood that we were walking the beat, and now we had this rhythm over the beat, now we change between the hands

---

59 Fictitious name
60 Anapest refers to the rhythmic pattern, short short long, the rhythm of the word, anapest
and the feet. It felt challenging, and interesting and related to music but related to dance, and it just made sense. I think the other experience that I’d had, I did not see the connection either to music or to movement as I understood it, it just kind of felt like … I was not on a path to be an educator, or, I did not think of myself at this time as a teacher; I was a pianist and a dancer, and I was just exploring the middle ground, you know – the one-ness of that. I think maybe that teacher was teaching us to teach children, so she was teaching us as though we were children much of the time, and I didn’t get it. So, it really felt totally different when I went to Dave’s class. It was really different. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

In Dalcroze classes, students experience all musical concepts through movement, including music notation. For example, to study rhythmic notation, the students may listen to a phrase or a segment of music, and would then respond through movement. After the student has experienced the music through movement, then they may be asked to repeat the exercise, and to notice the rhythm. Only after the embodied rhythmic experience would they be asked to notate the rhythm, and then usually by writing short and long dashes to represent short and long sounds. This is a different approach than what is experienced in private or traditional piano lessons. In a traditional setting, the student first learns to read and decode rhythmic notation for simple rhythms, usually starting with quarter notes and rests, with extensive practice in clapping various rhythms before attempting to perform them in their musical context. Gradually, as the student’s decoding skills increase, more complicated rhythms are introduced. As a partial requirement for conservatory performance examinations, students are required to clap a rhythm from rhythmic notation at sight, increasing in complexity with each grade level. The approach of learning and experiencing rhythm in Dalcroze pedagogy is totally different. I asked Grace to comment on the ways in which Dalcroze pedagogy affects her understanding of foundational musical concepts, such as music notation:

Grace – Yes, well, about notation, like you, I was trained classically as a pianist, I could sight-read anything, but, until I was studying with Dave, the idea of the space between the notes, actually making sense in dictation, never occurred to me, so that was really cool – notation has its own space. It’s a musical thing of its own. And I think that’s where
Dalcroze came from too. In studying theory, we – theory was never my strong point either – we were writing these chords and it felt like math to me. And they said, “Don’t go to the piano, you know, don’t anybody go to the piano”. So, I could not, and I was not trained to hear what I was writing. The writing was different from the hearing even though I could play it. So, it was a not musical experience. And the whole Dalcroze idea of listening first, and connecting the hearing with the notation with the … everything, just brought all of that full circle. That was the revelatory thing for me.

Sharon – and the harmony too.

Grace – and I’m still learning harmony! (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

The harmony that Grace referred to is the practice of writing for four simultaneous voices – soprano, alto, tenor, and bass. As Grace described, it is traditionally taught away from the piano, by learning and applying the rules of harmony. Conservatory students are often forbidden to use a piano to aid them in constructing their harmonic progressions, to better prepare them for their harmony exams, which are written at a desk, without benefit of a piano. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) believes that music students should be able to hear internally what they are reading and writing:

To my mind, musical education should be entirely based on hearing, or, at any rate, on the perception of musical phenomena: the ear gradually accustoming itself to grasp the relations between notes, keys, and chords, and the whole body, by means of special exercises, initiating itself into the appreciation of rhythmic, dynamic, and agogic nuances of music. (p. 109)

In order to develop his students’ sense of inner hearing, he devised solfège lessons that were designed to improve their inner hearing of musical structures such as harmonies, melodies, and intervals. Even though she was an advanced musician, Grace believes Dalcroze pedagogy helped her understand music theory:

That’s probably one of the things I learned the most with Dave, even though I already had a bachelor’s [degree] in Music, there was a lot of theory missing. When I went into Pemberton College, I took the theory entrance exam, and the recommendation was “you need to take theory classes while you are pursuing your degree.” There was no room in the Dalcroze program. There was one credit of electives. Everything else was filled up with piano and Dalcroze, but through the Dalcroze training, I could pass the exit exams if I
imagined I was playing it, and I could hear it, and I could do the theory. So, I’ve learned
that, – sound to notation and notation to sound, and that helped a lot. (personal communi-
cation Mar. 14, 2014)

Jaques-Dalcroze believes rules are not enough for students to learn how to write harmo-
ny; they should be able to audiate, to internally hear or imagine musical sounds such as tonality
or intervallic relationships. It is possible to learn major and minor tonalities by understanding
and memorizing patterns of tones and semi-tones, but Jaques-Dalcroze insists that musicians
need to also understand how those structures sound and feel. Considering the stepwise ascending
third for example, known as a tri-chord to Dalcroze teachers, students who have sung and em-
-bodied the character of those steps will then recall an embodied understanding of the intervallic
steps, rather than simply knowing abstractly that it is made up of a tone plus a semi-tone. Grace
found that experiencing musical concepts in her body helped her to understand theory because
there would then be an embodied and felt connection between notation and sound, rather than an
understanding that is based on cognitive reasoning and decoding or memorizing.

Dance and Spirituality

Grace and I discussed the notion that music is similar to meditation – that music can be-
come a venue for shared meditation, creating a connection between the performer and the audi-
ence. She commented:

Yes, I believe that. I understand that there are now terms for … ‘flow’ … it’s much like
meditation. My 16th birthday present was a mantra for transcendental meditation, with my
sister, and my parents – you had to have your own mantra. It was transcendental medita-
tion – TM – and it was a big movement, and my parents and my sister were doing it, and
you had to send away to California to get your special mantra. If you used the wrong
mantra, you’d get head-aches. And then they teach you how to meditate, so, there was a
lot about this meditation, but there was nothing like, playing the piano, or dancing – there
was some other state, and I don’t know what that is. I could try to sit still and meditate for
20 minutes … or I could spend 20 minutes playing Mozart! (personal communication
Mar. 14, 2014)
Meditation was not nearly as liberating for Grace as playing Mozart or dancing. However, she noted that she could attain another state of consciousness through dancing or playing the piano. She referred to the experience as being in ‘flow.’ Csikszentmihalyi (1996) describes ‘flow’ in depth, as discussed in Chapter 1, (p. 13). It is similar to meditation in that a performer becomes so involved in the music or the dance, that she loses herself in the performance, becoming temporarily oblivious to outside stimuli. Also, in both meditation and musical performance, a person may become more closely in touch with her inner self, whether through silence or through artistic expression. Grace loves to move, and would rather connect with herself through a Mozart sonata than a mantra! For her, music and dance are the preferred avenues for becoming uplifted in a spiritual sense. She also pointed out that meditation and performance are very different regarding brain activity. When a musician or dancer performs, she is multitasking to a very high degree, integrating many experiences, beliefs, and perceptions into her performance. Unlike meditation, which aims to calm the mind, the brain is very active when performing music. The performer is striving to align herself as closely with the music or dance as possible, in order to fully feel and express the artistic intent or meaning. Musicians can be in flow with the music and intently focused on the music, simultaneously thinking about what the music is doing, what has just occurred, and what is coming next. Grace described some of the intensity that occurs in a performance experience:

It’s an integrated experience because you’re using your eyes and your ears, and some part goes away, but your motor instincts, it’s very … you’re really very active in all that you’re doing in your brain. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

**Thoughts on Musical Evolution**

Our exploration of music and spirituality led to some speculation about music’s purpose.
Sharon – *(reads from notes)* Yob (2010) says, “Music is a manifestation of human spirituality.”\(^6\) No one is really sure why we as humans have evolved with music.

Grace – I think we evolved with music and movement, rhythmic movement as a glue that binds people together, to make work rhythms become less fatiguing …

Sharon – What about binding people together?

Grace – You can look at children’s games – how they have to cooperate. Everybody has to be in on the game or not, and learning the same tease or jump hoop games, where they’re singing, and doing the rhythm, and they bond together that way. And if a child is not ready for it, they wait, and they learn to wait their turn, and I think that child culture has been lost, I’m getting back to children again, I think the children in all of us are wired to engage together in rhythmic movement and music, I really do. I think it probably does something individual – and I’m theorizing – in terms of their physical coordination. They’re learning to endure fatigue, they’re learning to deal with frustration, they’re learning to – all the things that we worry about kids doing now – their ability to be better than this person but not as good as that person, their identity within a group – their ability to go into a group and learn a new thing – all of those things are lost and now we only see movement, it seems like, as a way to get kids better at sitting still! (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Grace believes that children in schools are not benefitting from movement; it is not being taught for its own merit. Rather, she suggests music is used as a diversion, to provide them with some necessary physical relief so that they can sit at their desks for a while longer.

There are many theories as to why humans need music. Grace noted that as tribal beings, we were much more dependent on interaction and social community skills. She believes that there should be a greater focus on children’s physical development in school through physical exercise, particularly through music and movement. Children are not given the opportunity to participate in movement activities that develop their understanding of their own bodies. She believes they are capable of much more kinaesthetic development than what schools are providing:

But as tribal beings, we need it *[rhythmic movement and music activities]* to connect with each other and work with each other, and accept the differences in life to survive. And that’s why the industrial age changed everything. If you think of child labourers – awful

---

\(^6\) Yob claims, “both music and religion are manifestations of spirituality” (p. 148)
as that was, I’m not saying we should go back to child labour, but when factories first came out, children were working in these factories. They were going hours away from where they lived, working for 11 hours, and then going back, getting like, 2 hours of sleep – can you imagine kids today doing that? There’s something about that kind of perseverance and endurance that we’ve lost – again not that I’m saying that children should do that – but there’s something extraordinary that we’re taking away from children, in not letting them move, and in sitting them in chairs – why are we sitting them in chairs anyway? … because that’s their jobs as clogs in the wheel of our industry now. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

Grace was also pointing out that our culture has become increasingly more dependent on our minds for our survival than on our bodies. She believes that children in industrial societies are missing out on important social and psychological development due to their motionless lifestyles. She is concerned that current education systems have not addressed children’s need to be mobile, and have not accommodated their natural and necessary proclivity to physically interact with their environments and to embody all of their innate curiosity. She suggested that the education system is preparing them for service in a self-perpetuating industrial society instead of meeting their innate developmental needs.

I moved the discussion toward the topic of the full day Kindergarten program, which has recently been implemented in Ontario. It is a ‘play-based curriculum’ where children are free to interact with their environment on their own terms. She responded:

So how would that work in an environment where they were a tribe? I always think of that – what are we wired to do really? I often go back to, “What’s the natural thing?” It seems like we are wired to learn at that age by interacting with our environment, and if there were a way that they could just interact with their environment, where there are multiple adults doing their roles at the same time … It’s just gone because of the way that we work now, as industry and employees in offices and industrial spaces. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)

As a teacher, Grace intuitively considers what is most natural and beneficial for children, not only for their health and well-being, but also to complement their learning preferences. She believes children learn most naturally by interacting with each other and with their environment.
Children love music, dancing, and the interactions and connections that occur between them when they play music games. They are quite at ease as expressive, artistic beings, unfettered by notions of inhibition, or by the demands of sustaining an industrial life-style. As Grace noted:

I keep thinking of children, because it seems like they are already ‘there’, so when I’m teaching 3-year olds, I am so fascinated because I know that that is at the core of all of us because we were all 3, and it’s the child in us that really understands all that. (personal communication Mar. 14, 2014)
PART III
THE FINDINGS

Chapter Nine
Discussion

This dissertation explores the experiences of five teachers and students who practise Dalcroze pedagogy in their music classrooms, and/or also in their personal development as musicians. They have recounted experiences they believe elicit connections with musical artistry, with their intuitive selves, with their pasts, and with their personal values.

J. Miller (2007) clarifies the characteristics of holistic education as: “an education of balance (for example, right relationship), inclusion, and connection” (p. 14). He offers the following examples of balance, “individual/group, content/process, knowledge/imagination, rational/intuitive, qualitative/quantitative assessment, technique/vision, assessment/learning, and technology/program” (pp. 7 – 9). J. Miller also provides several examples of connections or relationships that may be developed in holistic education: “the relationship between linear thinking and intuition, the relationship between mind and body, the relationships among various domains of knowledge, the relationship between the individual and community, the relationship to the earth, and our relationship to our souls” (p. 13).

The participants’ stories were co-created into narratives, comprising Chapters 4 through 8, with the intent to convey the essence of their experiences with Dalcroze pedagogy regarding holistic education. During the research process – the interviews, the transcribing process, and the co-creation of the participants’ chapters, I analyzed the transcriptions, seeking examples of holis-
tic education experiences. I then looked for similarities among the participants’ lived experiences, and for recurring references to any particular Dalcroze pedagogical principles, and created themes. Themes emerged from the participants’ experiences that referred to relationships, connections, balance, and soulful connections as outlined by J. Miller (2007). I then merged all of the relevant data into a master document, which was organized into related emergent themes such as community and global education. The ensuing collection of organized field texts became the foundation from which this discussion chapter evolved.

Before commencing with the interviews, I provided each participant with J. Miller’s (2007) definition of holistic education as being concerned with relationships as described above, and asked them to provide examples of and to comment on experiences that they felt were holistic. Each participant shared different perspectives, revealing unique conceptual understandings of holism, diverse background experiences, and varied comfort levels regarding their disclosures. For example, while one participant disclosed personally validating connections between music and movement, another envisioned potential for using Dalcroze pedagogy to teach global or peace education in her future teaching praxis. Most of the participants reported experiencing a sharper sense of awareness and sensitivity from engaging in the warm-up exercises. This chapter therefore summarizes the holistic experiences of the participants, in particular, the experiences that were believed to affect their spiritual awareness and development. The emergent themes have been retained as section headings.

**Community Building**

Holistic education considers the student “in relation to community” (J. Miller 2007, p. 13). The community can be “the classroom, the school community, the community of one’s town and nation, and the global community” (pp. 13-14). Zane spoke of the necessity for students to
bond with each other in his classes. His first goal is to have students move “as one unit” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). In a Dalcroze class, there is very little verbal direction; students are typically asked to attend to a particular aspect of the music and to express something about that aspect through their bodies. For example, they may be asked to arrive in a position facing a new partner at the end of a phrase. Ideally, the class therefore works together as a cohesive group; the music acts as the bonding agent. But for new students, this is often an unfamiliar method of learning. Zane commented, “When I teach, I have to bring a group together. It’s almost more effort on my part versus, say, when a group has been together for 2 to 3 years, and we come together right away” (personal communication August 29, 2013). He noted that children and experienced Dalcroze students “get there faster”.

As new students become more comfortable with their own movements, they also become more accepting of themselves and of each other, and of reacting kinaesthetically to each other’s movements. Zane can tell by their embodied interactions if they are sensitized to each other. Yet, J. Miller (2007) notes that contemporary education generally emphasizes individual learning, as opposed to community based learning (p. 7), even though societies need to operate in balance with each other and with nature in order to nurture a healthy, caring, and sustainable life-style.

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) acknowledges the intrinsic value for his students of an education that strives to establish and nurture a sense of connection: “The aim of rhythmic gymnastics is to develop mind and feeling in everything connected with art and life. Its study is all the more indispensable to the musician since music without rhythm is lifeless” (p. 103). Kessler (2000) describes the beneficial qualities of deep connections in interpersonal relationships:

Whether it is a relationship to one’s own self, to others, or to the world, the experience of deep connection arises when there is a profound respect, a deep caring, and a quality of “being with” that honors the truth of each participant in the relationship.” (p. 18)
Community based learning, such as in Dalcroze classes, general music classes, or music ensembles, provides a way to bring balance to a predominantly individual-based educational environment. Music ensembles such as choirs or drumming circles provide a means through which students come together with the same purposes, to participate in creating something deeply and artistically meaningful, and to experience a joyful sense of community. Kessler (2000) claims, “All children, including those with emotional disabilities, can get lost together as they let go of words and concentrate on the simple, yet riveting, rhythms of syncopation and alternation” (p. 86).

Grace noted that her very young students experienced a sense of community in her Dalcroze classes, and she considered this bonding experience to be essential to their healthy social and psychological development. She believes that children bond through playing music games, and that they recognize and understand myriad social standards and learn appropriate behaviours through the playing of cooperative rhythmic games. Adults who sing in choirs or play in music ensembles often experience a similar sense of community and camaraderie. Hurst (2014) claims, “Singing has been known to positively impact social, emotional, and cognitive processes” (p. 19). Although there is more research to support this finding in instrumental music than in choirs, she cites a recent study by Balsnes (2012) which, “illustrated ways in which singing in a choir can aid in the development of competency and empowerment, promote healthy living, and promote the development of healthy relationships, as well as providing a method for which one can find meaning and develop a balanced life” (as cited in Hurst 2014, pp. 19-20). Besides these benefits, Grace believes when children play games together, they gain valuable experience relating to each other and within a community. She said, “They’re learning to deal with frustration …
their identity within a group – their ability to go into a group and learn a new thing” (personal communication March 14, 2014).

Ann also recognized the value of community development that occurs in a Dalcroze classroom. She shared Zane’s opinion that Dalcroze students must feel comfortable with moving together first, in order to gain maximum benefit from the class. By making these initial connections, students begin to gain confidence and to dispel any feelings of self-consciousness and fear. J. Miller (2007) claims, “When students experience community in their classrooms, they form connections with the other students, the teacher, and the learning process” (p. 160). He describes an ideal school community as one where “students feel they belong” (p. 151). Ann remarked, “Some of the very first exercises that we did were about making connections with the people in the classroom first, before you did anything else, making that eye contact” (personal communication, August 26, 2013). She noted that it takes more time for some students to feel comfortable moving creatively among other students, and that this is quite difficult for some students, particularly for her more emotionally sensitive students. Ann works with students who have special needs; some of them have deep emotional wounds that left them feeling fearful of any social interactions. Learning to feel safe within their own community of peers was contrary to their learned mistrust and consequent emotional withdrawal. She was sensitive to their vulnerability – even a small amount of risk-taking would go a long way to dispel deeply imbedded negative beliefs.

Monique believes that society in general is becoming more disconnected. She had recently finished her teacher training, and had spent time observing classrooms where she noticed students did not appear to be engaged with each other or with their teachers. She believes that Dalcroze classes, because of their ability to heighten awareness within a social setting, provide an
accessible way for students to connect with each other. She commented, “I feel like movement and connection, one to one, is something that’s quite lacking with students” (personal communication, August 9, 2013). Monique’s intuition is substantiated by Moore (1992) who claims, “There are many signs in our society that we lack a sufficiently deep experience of community” (p. 92). Paradoxically, although people are in contact with other people most of the time, they often feel intense loneliness, and yearn to build a stronger personal connection to community (Moore 1992). Kessler (2000) claims a caring community enables students to be authentic in their relationships, to develop confidence in themselves, and to experience a sense of belonging (p. 22). Students feel accepted and tend to develop real friendships when they feel like they are a valued part of a community. When they discover something they have in common, they learn to feel more confident and secure, even if only among themselves, and less concerned with their shortcomings. Consequently, their lives have more meaning. Moore (1992) reminds us, “The roots of community are immeasurably deep, and the process of belonging, dealing actively with loneliness, begins in the depth of the soul” (p. 95).

**Global Education.**

As an aspiring professional music teacher, Monique looks forward to using movement activities in the social and inter-relational setting of Dalcroze classes to provide a sense of connection for her students. She is sensitive to student differences and envisions the potential of using Dalcroze pedagogy to foster equity in a classroom of students with diverse abilities and cultural backgrounds. J. Miller (2007) claims “Global education shares the same principles as holistic education, particularly with regard to the concept of interdependence” (pp. 159-160). Monique expressed her hopes: “we work together, having a unified sound instead of everybody being so individual. And then people are having different cultural heritages … different class back-
grounds” (personal communication, August 9, 2013). She believes Dalcroze activities may provide students with a way to overcome their cultural differences, and to create a sense of community within her classroom. Being a person of visible minority, it is precisely the embodied nature of the pedagogy that resonates with her as an equalizing factor. When the mode of communication is movement, there is no consideration of colour, culture, language, cognitive ability, economic status, or heritage. She recognized the value for students of discovering and utilizing their own space, and then of applying that awareness to ever expanding levels of community – i.e., the immediate and extended families, the neighbourhood, one’s professional community, and the global community.

Monique wishes to apply the principles of Dalcroze pedagogy to all of her students, even though those principles were originally developed within a Eurocentric setting, with classical music. Dalcroze (1921/1972) suggests that his rhythmic training be adapted to suit the music of various cultures: “rhythmic training should vary in its methods according to the special needs of the country in which it is given” (p. xiii). Moving to music, attending to musical nuance, and developing rhythmic literacy and fluency in the body can be experienced with any form of music, not only classical. Monique observed,

> I really believe that the approach of Dalcroze … is universal, and that’s what I really enjoy about the Dalcroze approach. Because it comes down to, that we’re all human, you know, and our space and migration and colonization has changed the way that we interact with each other. (personal communication, August 9, 2013)

Monique believes her background in progressive rock music afforded her a unique opportunity to connect with student culture. She saw the potential for using an embodied approach to teach and understand rhythm and music of all genres, particularly progressive rock music. Engaging students in embodied and social activities in the music classroom became her ideal metaphor for teaching about global community relationships in general. She mused, “What is it to be
a human being? What is it to relate to ourselves in our physical space, within the classroom, then within the school, then within our families, and then within society outside of the school?” (personal communication, August 9, 2013) Monique looked forward to using embodied experiences of connecting through music to infuse her teaching with a philosophical foundation of global education.

**Acceptance.** In order to achieve an authentic sense of community, Dalcroze students endeavour to be supportive and non-judgmental toward each other and with themselves. Acceptance and authentic expression can blossom in an environment where there is no fear of negative judgment. Zane noticed that his students attained a comfortable degree of acceptance within their class: “they just really appreciated each other, they had that acceptance” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). When a group of students are accepting of each other, they also experience how it feels to be accepted by the group as a whole, and consequently they may become more accepting of themselves by releasing some of their personal barriers. Zane considered this to be “a gift” – that “students start to feel that acceptance of themselves” and of their differences. Recalling Mathieu’s (2013) comment, “For Dalcroze, the principal aim of education is to help the child to know himself and to develop his personality” (p. 2), acceptance of self and others may be one of the developments of character that Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) was referring to as *education through rhythm* (p. 9).

Grace also mentioned the connection between community and acceptance: “But as tribal beings, we need it [*rhythmic movement and music activities*] to connect with each other and work with each other, and accept the differences in life to survive” (personal communication, March 14, 2014). Grace’s comments about community resonate with J. Miller’s (2000) and Kessler’s (2000) writings on soulful education and community. Grace believes that when children play
movement games with each other, they establish a foundation for understanding their roles and interactions within a community. Their experiences allow them to bond, to find their own niche and to know their own abilities and limitations within their communities. For all of these reasons, she believes children should be playing movement games and exercises for their developmental merit, and not as energizing activities to sustain their long sitting days.

**Learning (and Allowing Ourselves) to Trust.** Alongside self-acceptance is a sense of trust that develops between the students and between the teacher and the students. J. Miller refers to Secretin’s (1996) description of the ideal school environment as a sanctuary of “respect, caring, and even reverence” (as cited in J. Miller, 2007, p. 151). Freire (1972) encourages the creation of six conditions for dialogue and problem-solving, and which, according to J. Miller (2007), “are also fundamental to creating a caring school community” (p. 157). These conditions are: love, humility, faith, trust, hope, and critical thinking (as cited in J. Miller, 2007, pp. 156-157).

Several of the participants in this study noted the necessity of allowing a sense of trust to develop between students in a Dalcroze class, and between the students and the teacher, in order to feel confident in their movements and safe with each other. Zane observed, “When the class acquires a sense of trust, they also become more encouraging toward each other, so that no one feels embarrassed or feels badly if they make a mistake” (personal communication, August 9, 2013). Zane observed that adults often have to transition into a state of trust, whereas children already have it. Children are generally more carefree than adults. In class, he notices when the energy of adults shifts into a state of what he calls, “galactic trust.” The class becomes more relaxed; there is nothing to be concerned about.
Grace also noted that when she teaches, her students “have to trust themselves and the rest of the group and the teacher all at the same time” (personal communication, March 14, 2013). She explained that students need to “give themselves permission” to let go of the self-consciousness and inhibitions that hold them back. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) observes,

Rhythmic movement is a very focus of energy and joy, and all who study it are upheld by the consciousness that they are aiming at the same goal and are linked to one another by bonds of solid affection which give them renewed strength, security and courage. (p. 13)

Hania shared this observation, that participating in the movement exercises provides a sense of “safety and confidence” (personal communication, August 14, 2013) particularly for students who are emotionally fragile. Hania believes that students not only benefit from experiencing embodied forms of learning, but in some cases the movement activities enable them to affirm their sense of self as unique and valuable individuals. Through movement education, she contends, “We can create a society of people who feel good about themselves in their bodies” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). Contemporary classrooms do not emphasize the importance of encouraging students to learn to trust or even to use their bodies, although for many students, embodied expression is satisfying and soul affirming. As classrooms focus more on cognitive development, students become increasingly less focused on their embodied connection to their planetary home. Conversely, if students became more sensitized to their embodied “interconnectedness with the rest of the earth” (Olsen 2002, p. 8), they may become more aware of their unique value and position within the cosmos. Olsen claims,

The radical alternative in body attitude would be that the body has intrinsic value in itself. It has interiority, subjectivity. It has much to teach us if we learn to listen. We can consider that we are part of a vast interconnected system, rather than separate from the world around us. We are nature too. (p. 8)

J. Miller (2006) states, “Wholeness refers to recognizing the interconnected nature of experience and the multidimensionality of human beings” (p. 156). He refers to ancient religions
and philosophies: “Each element in our body is interconnected and our bodies are connected to all that surrounds us” (p. 156). By becoming more aware of sensory and corporal learning, students can become more centred in their physical essence and can also become more aware of their connections and their relationships with their surroundings.

Through multi-sensory stimulation, Hania’s students are awakened to their inner artistic potential, and form connections with their artistic, soulful selves. Hania commented, “They’re [her students are] coming from homes where there’s anger, there’s hurt; they can be affirmed through music class” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). For emotionally wounded students, making and expressing artistic connections can be an avenue for healing. Clements-Cortès (2014) cites improvisation with drums as being particularly helpful in adolescent music therapy practices for “relieving anxiety, increasing self-expression or self-awareness, and forming group cohesion” (p. 32). Through teaching the arts, Hania discovered a teaching praxis that enables emotionally wounded students to feel good about themselves and to begin a healing process. One of her students discovered a sense of personal worth through playing drums and through Hania’s encouragement and belief in him. She commented, “That boy then suddenly started liking to come to music because they felt good in here, and valued, and that was the beginning of the fact of saying, I can like myself, I do have value” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). Hania considers the arts to be a safe mode for personal development and expression for all students and alludes to a similar personal experience, claiming, “It was the arts that saved me” (personal communication, August 14, 2013).

For many people, achieving a sense of deep fulfillment is never fully realized until they are able to express or create something that has great personal value. The expression does not have to be artistic; it can take on many forms such as community service, working at a fulfilling
vocation, writing one’s memoirs, or spending time nurturing relationships with one’s most cherished family members, companions and friends. Self-expression in this sense is analogous to self-actualization, or realizing and living a personally satisfying life that also serves the greater good. Hania’s student found, perhaps for the first time, a way to safely and authentically express his inner self through playing the drums, and for him, this was an awakening into personal joy and fulfillment.

As a Dalcroze teacher, Zane believes that his students need to build trust in him. When they feel comfortable in his class, he can facilitate their creative development. Embodied expression is very personal, and students enjoy experiences that they find both stimulating and rewarding. Zane believes that students develop their own creativity by taking risks. Sometimes his directions are purposely vague, so that they have to use their own ideas to create musical patterns or expressions. Only in this way can they truly discover and develop their own potential for creative expression. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) claims, “The best method of teaching is that which, from the start, offers the pupil a problem which neither his memory nor his instinct for imitation can help him to solve” (p. 45). Zane noted that there are students who are uncomfortable with vague direction; if the task is too difficult or the direction too vague, the students may become frustrated. While he pushes his students to develop their creative potential, he also recognizes when, as he said, “the boiling point is coming” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). At that point, he balances the dilemma with an exercise that he claimed, “doesn’t need to be there really, but it’s a very essential link for their … emotional and psychological readiness – to open up.” When students have regained their confidence and sense of trust in the teacher, he can proceed with the music lesson.
As noted above, Ann believes that her emotionally wounded students experience a challenging, yet safe enough environment in her classes to experiment with their bodies as vehicles for communication. Kessler (2000) recommends “creating a safe environment if we want to encourage authentic expression in the classroom” (p. 108). Ann believes that the warm-up activities help her students to become more centred and more in tune with their inner ‘sense of self’ as well as with each other. The exercises sharpened their ability to pay attention and to stay focused, while engaging them in a social bonding experience. She clarified, “It takes a long time before they are able – before they have inner strength to be able to trust anything about themselves ... taking risks. They think they’ll be laughed at” (personal communication, August 26, 2013). Ann believes that the Dalcroze exercises help her students to dispel some of their emotional fears, to become more trusting, and to gain some confidence in themselves as risk-takers within their class community. She said, “They take it as this foundation upon which they can then be more trusting and creative” (personal communication, August 26, 2013).

**Mindfulness**

J. Miller (2000) writes, “When we live mindfully, we are in the here-and-now; we are present and awake” (p. 132). Dalcroze classes typically begin with a centring exercise; students release their previous thoughts and concerns and focus their attention on their bodies, perhaps attending to the contact their feet make with the floor or the temperature of the room or the feel of their clothes on their skin. They consequently become more engaged in the moment, more aware of their bodies, of their surroundings, and of the space they occupy within the room. They (hopefully) sustain that heightened state of awareness when they begin to move, becoming aware of other moving bodies, of the music, and of their own movements. Jaques-Dalcroze strove to develop his students’ listening skills, and also their ability to be fully attentive. The warm-up ex-
ercises serve to develop seamless connections between body, mind, heart, and soul, and to sensitize students to their own bodies and embodied presence within the class. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) believes exercises should be devised so as “first to awaken spontaneity of mind and body, and diminish the interval of time between the conception of an act and its realization; second, to bring order into the child’s spontaneous bodily manifestations” (p. 104).

Ann was able to make personal connections through the warm-up exercises. She claimed “the warm-ups were a way to take the class to another level of understanding” (personal communication, August 26, 2013). She was also connecting her previous musical knowledge and training with the current embodied Dalcroze exercises and experiences. By allowing “the cares and concerns of the outside world to be put aside” she was able to become more open to deep learning at the soul level (e-mail correspondence, Oct. 30, 2013). The experience is similar to meditation with respect to the practice of focusing on the present, instead of on our ongoing thoughts and concerns. When participating in meditation, J. Miller (2000) claims, “we let go of the calculating mind and open ourselves to the listening mind that tends to be characterized by a relaxed alertness” (p. 124). Concurring with J. Miller, Kessler (2000) also uses the same term, relaxed alertness to describe a learning atmosphere that would maximize creative potential (p. 108). The warm-up exercises are necessary to relax the class, particularly if there are new students. Ann noted that when students are new to Dalcroze pedagogy, they may need time to achieve that state of embodied attentiveness: “The students or participants usually never know each other, so the time for warming up takes longer, because people are reluctant to make eye contact initially. Everyone is self conscious” (personal correspondence, September 14, 2014). The warm-up exercises should encourage, rather than assume a sense of trust and security, and at the same time, develop embodied attentiveness and personal awareness.
Hania likes to incorporate elements of movement, language and drama into her music classes. She uses multi-sensory stimulation to facilitate her students’ sensitivity, but also includes other stimuli besides music. She develops her students’ awareness of their entire surroundings, their entire sensory environment – visual, tactile, and social. She explained,

I broaden it to even more than just working with the sound, and even the opening Dalcroze exercises actually look at children – looking and developing their relationship to the world around them, so that’s working with the visual – and the body. (personal communication, August 14, 2013)

Hania’s students thereby experience a sense of heightened awareness that enables them to become more cognizant of both their immediate and extended environments. She also applies Dalcroze pedagogical principles to her performance arts lessons. She envisions arts education in general as a means for enabling authentic self-expression and for developing increased sensitivity and holistic wellbeing.

Hania understands the first principle of Dalcroze pedagogy as; the outer world of sensory input has a direct and interdependent relationship with the inner world of perception and cognition, and the second principle as; the development of the kinaesthetic sense that is pedagogically foundational to all other learning (Krajewski, 1992, p. 17). She believes in providing a rich vocabulary of multi-sensory experiences in order to develop awareness and to stimulate creativity in her students. As an arts teacher, she strove to restore some of the heightened sensory awareness to her students that they naturally experienced as babies. “So to become an artist that is truly connecting to sound, and truly connecting to colour and line, or to shape, or whatever, you have to do those Dalcrozian-type exercises to heighten that body-nervous system connection” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). By developing her students’ abilities to notice the details that surround them – whether they pertain to sound, image, texture or any other sensory
stimulus – she was developing their abilities to attend and to be fully in the moment, a skill she believed to be fundamentally requisite for any arts production.

Ann believes that musicians are often thinking too much; their bodies are “not always in line” with their music (personal communication, August 26, 2013), and consequently, their music is not as expressive or moving as it could be. Palmer (2004) claims, “we live in closer conformity to our own souls” when we “learn to trust bodily knowledge as part of our inner guidance” (p. 106). That is to say, highly demanding performances, such as music, require that we not consider the myriad details of performing music artistically, but trust our embodied knowledge to perform the music from our souls. (Palmer 2004). The concept is similar in some respects to Csikszentmihalyi’s (1996) notion of flow, insofar as “we are aware only of what is relevant here and now” (p. 112). Csikszentmihalyi claims a person can cultivate creativity through practising mindfulness, although he uses different terminology. He writes, “the first step toward a more creative life is the cultivation of curiosity and interest, that is, the allocation of attention to things for their own sake” (p. 346). He recommends cultivating a childlike sense of awe and wonder, and marveling at “the majesty and variety of the world” (p. 346).

Music has long been considered an avenue through which people experience soulful connections. J. Miller (2000) claims, “Music can immediately shift our consciousness from ego to where we feel our souls connected to something larger than ourselves” (p. 134). Grace recollected being in a different state of awareness when she was dancing and playing the piano. As a young adult, she became familiar with the practice of meditation, but preferred to let herself become absorbed in music. She said, “There was some other state, and I don’t know what that is. I could try to sit still and meditate for 20 minutes … or I could spend 20 minutes playing Mozart!” (personal communication, March 14, 2013).
Ball (2010) describes music as “ubiquitous”. He claims, “We know of societies without writing, and even without visual art – but none, it seems, lack some form of music” (p. 2). Although there is a mystery about music and its purpose in society, there is not a human community on earth that has not included music in its rituals and social gatherings. Music, by its nature, can be thought of as a mindful practice. The arts in general, for that matter, “have always been among the ways that human beings have nurtured soul.” (J. Miller 2000, p. 75).

Hania’s description of her experience with the NIA demonstration exhibits a shift in her personal level of awareness from the ordinary to one of heightened sensory awareness and stimulation. The movements were simple; the dancers focused on their breath, moved slowly, and raised their arms together. She said, “We moved as one” (personal communication, August 27, 2013). By focusing on the music and movement, they were able to just be together, in spite of the loud traffic and the searing hot pavement. Focusing on the NIA movements, amidst all of the sensory distractions, facilitated a spiritual experience for Hania, as time momentarily stood still, as she became ‘one with the movement.’

**Transformational Learning**

Transformational learning involves the whole person, and enables a student to make connections, which are personally and socially meaningful (J. Miller, 2007, p. 12). Students experience transformational learning when they participate in activities that lead to developing relationships and connections with their true, inner selves, their communities, and with the earth. These connections often result in increased perception, sensitivity, and compassion. Kessler (2000) notes, “I have seen the power of drumming and free form dance encourage even serious

---

62 As noted in Chapter 7, (Hania), p. 152, NIA (Neuromuscular Integrated Action) is a type of movement class developed in California in the late twentieth century. See http://www.nianow.com/practice
students to let go into deep nonverbal connection with their inner self and each other” (p. 86). Hania’s student experienced transformational learning when playing the drums because he was able to connect with his inner, authentic self, the self that is an integrated and whole human being, with a meaningful place in society and in the universe.

Hania, Grace, Monique, and Zane spoke of having experienced traditional music education prior to their encounters with Dalcroze classes. Their experiences with Dalcroze pedagogy opened up new perspectives and possibilities for them, and also enabled them to see that their previous educational experiences were incomplete in some respects. Hania’s first experiences with music education were at a piano – an instrument designed for adults. She described her foundational musical training as, “Theory was told to the head, and then I learned to play the piano from the wrist down” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). Although her first music lessons were formal, her cultural and community experiences with music were wholistic, and included drama, dance and music in a culturally rich setting. During her first encounter with Dalcroze, Hania discovered a personal connection between music and movement that she had not experienced before. Her exclamation, “WOW! This is It!” reveals the impact that this discovery had on her.

Grace experienced frustration in the disconnected and segmented approach to the performing arts that she experienced while at college, particularly between music and movement. She relates an experience in which a dance teacher was either oblivious to the music’s quality, or was willing to sacrifice the quality of the music in order to provide metric support for a dance exercise. For Grace, beautiful music and beautiful dance are interdependent; to play music un-artistically would mean that the movement is also un-artistic. But with expressive music, both the musician and the dancer could be artistic, the dancer’s movements being perfectly supported by
the music. She reported experiencing deep frustration at discovering that in college, music and movement were thought of as two separate disciplines. However, her discovery of Dalcroze pedagogy contradicted that fragmentation, and dispelled some of the frustrations that she had encountered. She reported being moved to tears at finding a pedagogical philosophy that resonated with her deep beliefs in the synthesis of music and dance. Although her first Dalcroze class did not live up to her expectations, she eventually found one that exceeded them. Her comment, “I went ‘Ahhhh – oooo’ – and just right away, right away the connections were made” (personal communication, March 14, 2014) indicates her profound joy at finally finding a method of study that combined the elements of both dance and music. Jaques-Dalcroze based his entire method on using the body to develop good rhythm; his méthode uses the elements of movement – time, space, and energy – to teach rhythm.

Grace also referred to the disconnection that our present day education system imposes upon children by having them sit in chairs. She notes that many teachers do not teach movement for its own intrinsic benefits, but instead, they offer children movement intermittently to break up their study blocks, as an energizing activity so that they can keep sitting in their chairs for most of the day. Grace laments the losses that today’s children experience during their school years, noting that their ‘education’ requires that they sit more than they move. It is not only the child’s physical wellbeing that is being compromised by schools. Standardized testing has shifted the focus of educational policies away from holism and creative development and toward a state of competition, fragmentation, and intellectual development. Carlsson-Paige (2001) claims, “the current standards-driven educational climate has edged out multiple ways of seeing and being and has driven an even bigger wedge between curriculum expectations and children’s views of the world” (p. 24). Teaching music or any other subject through movement, or through any art
form, provides a way for students to discover and maintain personal connections with their inner and outer selves, with their environments, and with other people.

Monique recounted her experience of being inspired by objects that had been scattered around a Dalcroze classroom; the students were asked to use their imaginations when moving with the object – an umbrella might become a frying pan, or a hat might be used as a mirror. She recalled hearing the phrase, “It’s really to the limit of your imagination” (personal communication August 9, 2013). The musical lesson behind the activity was for the students to experience a heightened application of their imaginative energies. But for Monique, the object lesson was about self-imposed limitations and psychological barriers. In life, events, memories, and beliefs can be used to help or to hinder our sense of well-being, depending on one’s point of view. The idea of culturing a limitless imagination not uncommon; its value is appreciated. But through the embodied application of the object-imagination lesson, the lesson became transformational for Monique – one that resonated with her own life experiences, and that she appreciated for its personal and global implications. Monique felt the idea that we are limited only by our imaginations to be true and personal, and therefore it became more intimately understood. She reflected, “Talk about objects – it could be a barrier. Or, it could compliment our environment, not just objects, but people, a person can be a barrier, I mean, psychologically, that could be a barrier” (personal communication, August 9, 2013). Using her own movements and her own imagination to animate the objects allowed her to experience the lesson on a soul level.

Zane has observed his own students’ self-imposed limitations in Dalcroze classes, particularly when they thought that they needed more direction. He said, “very often they don’t feel safe enough to go outside of … what they are told” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). When he makes his instructions deliberately vague, he is giving his students permission to devise
their own movements, to have more freedom in creating ways to embody what they notice in music. But sometimes, instead of exploring and exploiting that freedom, he observed, “They come up with all sorts of limiting beliefs – Are we allowed to do this? Are we not allowed to do that?” (personal communication August 29, 2013) We hold ourselves back by our own fears. 

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) comments on personal barriers: “To be master of one’s body in all its relations with the intellect and with the senses, is to break down the oppositions which paralyze the free development of one’s powers of imagination and of creation” (p. 36).

Zane was on a clear career path as a piano teacher when he had his first encounter with Dalcroze pedagogy. He recalls having good experiences in music education until then, but his previous tuition did not include using movement to facilitate an embodied understanding of music and rhythm. As an advanced musician pursuing Master’s work in piano performance, he had a very comprehensive knowledge and background in music and piano performance. But he had not yet encountered any classes that focused entirely on the rhythmic movement of the body. His first experience with embodied learning was a revelation for him. Zane described his experience:

To be able to move through space, and jump, and leap with the music – to make this connection with the music, to articulate music and feel the music in my body, without being tied up with an instrument, for the very first time, it was so liberating. (personal communication, August 29, 2013)

Zane was especially intrigued by the experience of improvising on a very simple scale, not having had any previous training or guided experience in improvisation. The experiences deeply affected him as a person and as a musician. He recognized the value of the experience: “There are those experiences that propel us forward a bit, and they are the experiences that make you look at something from a different angle, it’s just like an a-ha moment” (personal communication, August 29, 2013).
All of these experiences are examples of J. Miller’s (2006) description of *timeless learning*. They attest to a powerful internal dialogue between ego and soul, a merging or blurred distinction between subject and object, and the presence of awe and mystery in our everyday lives, if only we would stop to notice.

**Creativity**

Moore (1992) describes creativity as, “being in the world soulfully, for the only thing we truly make, whether in the arts, in culture, or at home, is soul” (p. 199). He claims that creativity is not exclusively awarded to great artists, but is present in everyone, and is available to us by “making something for the soul out of every experience” (p. 198). Kessler (2000) concurs, stating, “creativity is a way of thinking, learning, and expressing oneself that goes beyond the arts into the entire way we understand and relate to the world” (p. 93). She further claims, “creativity in the classroom is vital to both the survival of soul and the success of learning” (p. 114).

Kessler (2000) notes that creativity is not a priority in schools: “Messages and methods of our current pedagogy suppress rather than stimulate creative solutions” (p. 94). She claims that creativity is fostered by silence and play (p. 104). Yet, silence is rare in public schools, and children are gradually given less and less play time as they advance through the elementary grades from Kindergarten through to Grade 8. Kessler (2000) describes the value of nurturing creativity in students:

> We connect deeply to ourselves and others, imbue life with freshness and meaning, and experience the delight that comes with transcending old or limited ways of thinking and doing. Mind, body, heart, and spirit come together to spark the passion that fuels the motivation to learn to contribute, and to savor our infinite capacity for growth. (p. 114)

Kessler (2000) advocates for learning environments to facilitate creativity, and uses the term *relaxed alertness* to describe an ideal condition of “low threat, high challenge” (p. 109) to maximize conditions conducive to nurturing creativity. She describes an experience in drumming and
free dance in which, “it is not only the rhythm and dance but the spontaneity itself – a wild inventiveness – that stirs their souls and unleashes a current of joy” (p. 86). She recommends that teachers practise “a willingness to be open to surprise and accidents, to the experience of mystery and not knowing where the process is going” (p. 99). Keeping the lesson improvisational and capturing teaching moments that allow inspiration and creativity to occur spontaneously are essential components of developing the creative process in the classroom. Many teachers however, under pressure to complete curriculum requirements within a restricted time frame, do their best just to implement their planned activities and do not create or operate in learning environments that foster creativity. While the arts are recognized as providing opportunities for creative learning in education, they are not considered essential to a child’s educational preparation for success in a capitalist society such as ours. J. Miller (2000) writes,

We are told constantly that the purpose of schooling is to prepare our children to compete in a global economy. There is rarely any mention of a broader vision of education that includes a focus on the whole person. The emphasis is primarily economic. (p. 4)

Home room teachers in the primary grades are often asked to teach music, in addition to teaching the core subjects of language arts and mathematics. Yet they do not generally have adequate experience or training in this field. For these reasons, Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) insists, “it is of the first importance that the musical education in primary schools – as well as in the higher schools – should be in the hands of musicians” (p. 33). He further recommends, “The music teacher should make it his first business to create a feeling for beauty in the souls of his pupils” (p. 35).

Monique believes that the current education system does not provide adequate opportunities to develop creativity in education. She referred to uneducation, a term which she adopted from one of Ken Robinson’s videos featured on the Ted Talk series entitled How Schools Kill
Creativity. In her opinion, “Children have so much imagination, but then, they learn not to use it as they go through the school system” (personal communication, August 9, 2013). She described her impression of a Dalcroze demonstration lesson in which four-to-six-year-old children responded freely and expressively to music: “I was so moved at the way that they’re … even though they’re still in their developmental stages, they were so expressive” (personal communication, August 9, 2013). She did not see the same kind of freedom with adults, and concluded that the education system had failed them in this respect: “These people have gone through the school system, and what have they got out of it?” (personal communication, August 9, 2013)

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) advocates for the development of creativity and artistry in education: “The object of education is to enable pupils to say at the end of their studies, not ‘I know,’ but ‘I experience,’ and then to create the desire of self-expression” (p. 58).

Being in touch with and utilizing our imaginations is one of the connections that holistic education seeks to develop. Zane claimed that he often deliberately does not tell his students how to do an exercise, forcing them to figure it out for themselves, thereby learning to develop and trust their own embodied musical responses. He commented, “I’m looking to see what you will find out, so it’s not my goal to see a cookie-cutter kind of performance … there is no right or wrong” (personal communication, August 29, 2013).

Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) sought to endow his music student with the ability to “regard this very technique as a means of asserting himself, of carrying out his personal determination and feelings, instead of allowing it to become a means of slavishly imitating the thoughts and feelings of others” (p. 50).

Jaques-Dalcroze was a composer and believed very strongly that music students should develop improvisation skills. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) claims, “All children feel a craving to

---

63 The video can be seen at http://www.ted.com/talks/ken_robinson_says_schools_kill_creativity?language=en
create, and the teacher should lose no opportunity of turning this disposition to account” (p. 56). In Dalcroze pedagogy, students are taught to improvise with their bodies, on their instruments, and also on the piano. Bolden (2014) claims that music education does not necessarily teach children to be creative, especially when they are being taught to “replicate something that someone else created” (p. 2). He suggests instead that music teachers structure their lessons so as to provide all students with opportunities for creating and improvising:

When composing and improvising, students have the chance to meaningfully engage in the full gamut of creative work: They imagine and generate musical ideas; seek and forge connections between them; synthesize and represent their own musical experiences and understandings; identify and solve musical problems; experiment and explore with sounds and structures; take musical risks; have the chance to be subversive with the musical materials they employ and choices they make; make use of time away to incubate musical ideas; and analyze the context in which the music will be presented in order to inform the editing and refining of their new musical products. (p. 2)

Hania believes that schools fail students by not teaching them to be in touch with themselves and with their surroundings. She believes that arts education can provide multi-sensory stimulation and thereby foster opportunities for increased self-awareness and creativity. Babies, she claimed, are born with heightened sensitivity, but then: “We get numbed … 3 and 4 year olds are very responsive, but by the time people are 10, 11, 13, and then as adults, they stop noticing things” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). Hanna (2015) agrees: “Sensory-rich integration helps learners find sense and meaning in new learning, increasing the odds for retention” (p. 63).

However, Hania notes that the arts – especially music – are not always taught in such a way as to develop students’ creativity. She observed classroom music teachers, more so than other classroom arts teachers, to be “the least aesthetic – the least authentic – the most cut-off” (personal communication, August 27, 2013). She further observed that students were, “not engaged, they’re not connected. It’s quite ‘rote’, and I don’t think it’s changing.” In rote teaching,
students learn by copying or *drilling* – sometimes committing to memory an entire song, line by line, without necessarily considering any application of meaning, artistry, or sensitivity. Monique found a similar situation occurring in her practice teaching, observing students who were not engaged in the music lesson. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) was very critical of this method: “We are too apt to appeal to the child’s instinct for imitation, to the detriment of his sense of analysis and his inventive faculties” (p. 55). Alternatively, a balanced program of study could include some rote learning for skill building, as well as opportunities for improvisation, composition, analysis, and expressive responses to music.

As far as the arts in education are concerned, Kessler (2000) finds that there is, “an ethos in which the arts curriculum is devoid of an invitation to genuine creative expression” (p. 92). She illustrates her point by describing two arts lessons, one in which the students carefully follow directions to cut out and assemble a penguin, and another in which they are given the materials, and are challenged to create a penguin as they see fit (p. 93). Amorino (2009) advocates for a blend of personal freedom with craftsmanship, and supports “an ‘authentic’ artistic process (in which personal experiences are represented through individually constructed technique and clarified through an idiosyncratic integration of formalism)” (p. 215). He suggests, “student-centered, materials-based teaching … requires a complex, sequential structure in which developmentally appropriate themes, motivational dialogues, sensory processes, and a gradually expanding repertoire of materials are all factors which play co-informing roles in artistic learning” (p. 216).

A balanced program would include opportunities for creative work as well as skill development with the teacher serving as an inspirational role model. Bolden (2014) admits to the enrichment he enjoys from singing in choirs, and to a multitude of benefits in community music

64 see discussion on page 112.
making, such as, “building community, for connecting people to each other and to the aesthetic realm, and for enabling individuals to be part of something bigger than themselves” (p. 2). It is possible however, that music teachers choose to provide as much class time as possible for students to practise and develop their singing, listening, and playing skills, so that they might derive more satisfaction from their ensemble performance experiences. Nevertheless, Hania’s observations are consistent with Monique’s observations during her teacher training. Monique saw students who were disengaged from the lesson and from the teacher: “they’re not engaged and music is so interesting. And it’s up to the teacher to find that in their students, and to motivate them” (personal communication August 9, 2013). Both Monique and Hania believe the incorporation of Dalcroze pedagogy into their music lessons could motivate students to become engaged, and to develop their inherent creativity.

**Personal Connections**

Ann described a deeply spiritual episode that she experienced when watching her class perform a plastique animée exercise. As she watched the students move, she suddenly imagined their bodies to be planets, moving with the same time, space, and energy relationships as planets moving in relation to each other. She said, “All of a sudden, I could understand, I could see the relation of time, space, and energy in a very meaningful and almost … tangible way” (personal correspondence, August 26, 2013). It was a revelation that simultaneously excited her mind, body, and spirit. Acquiring an embodied understanding of the relationships between time, space, and energy is the foundational basis of Dalcroze pedagogy. Jaques-Dalcroze was primarily concerned with the study of rhythmic movement, and applying this kinaesthetic understanding to

---

65 see pages 70 - 72
music. As a teacher, he attempted to develop in his students the qualities that he believed were essential for their development as musicians. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) explains,

These qualities are delicacy of aural perception, nervous sensibility, rhythmic feeling, \textit{i.e.} the true sense of the relations between movements in time and those in space – and lastly, the faculty of spontaneously externalising sensations of movement and transforming them into feelings and emotions – \textit{i.e.} the imaginative and creative sense. (p. 49)

Ann described her observations of the plastique animée performance and commented, “the music, the movement, the timing. It was the essence of Dalcroze pedagogy” (written correspondence January 3, 2015). By this she was referring to the continuously unfolding and interactive relationship of these three elements and to the consequent realization of the creative imagination. For Ann, the process and practice of plastique animée represents personal expression and growth. She conjectured that the continuous transformation of music into movement can be thought of as the continuous transformations that we experience along our life journeys as human beings. She said, “You are in fact, each person is a plastique animée” (personal communication, August 26, 2013).

Zane experienced a deeply personal connection between movement and music when he began his Dalcroze studies. His first Dalcroze experience changed the way he understood his relationship with music. Until that point, he was intent on studying piano performance and pedagogy. He had not experienced embodied musical understanding before and explained, “I think through moving, you sense something, you feel something, you perceive something and therefore you facilitate certain discoveries, that it is either musical or not musical” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). He discovered the natural connection between music and movement, and through that connection, he was able to connect with himself as an artist in a new way, enabling an increased capacity for musically artistic communication. His movements revealed to him whether or not he was authentically connected to the music, as evidenced in his comment,
“The more musically I stepped, … the more musical I became” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). Zane recalled his teachers telling him to “step musically” and realized, “How I am musical has everything to do with how I move my body” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). This realization clarified he intimate connection between movement and music, and changed the way that he thought about music.

Sometimes music students are so preoccupied with getting the notes correct, that they fail to fully connect to their soulful, expressive selves. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) noticed this in his students; many of them played accurately, but a-rhythmically and without fluency or artistry:

I saw the lack of musical rhythm to be the result of a general “a-rhythm,” whose cure appeared to depend on a special training designed to regulate nervous reactions and effect a co-ordination of muscles and nerves; in short, to harmonise mind and body. (p. vii)

Rather than accepting the prevailing opinion that some students simply have ‘musical talent’ and others do not, he set out to develop musicianship through rhythmic movement, through the deep connection between music and movement. He explains the development of his teaching method: “It was by endeavouring to determine the individual cause of each musical defect and to find a remedy for it that I gradually built up my method of rhythmic gymnastics” (Jaques-Dalcroze, 1930/1985, p. 53).

The moment when Zane encountered the deep connection between body, artistry, and music was transformational for him. However, he described the direction from the teacher as being vague – the students were told to “just express what they hear”. Had the directive been more precise, he may not have had the same epiphanic experience:

and I suddenly realize an epiphany … my … the footsteps or … the body that I was trying to move – the nuances I’m trying to move to, at that instance I felt … I was the music, and … AND, … the more musically I stepped … the more musical I became. (personal communication, August 29, 2013)
Zane felt the connection through moving to music – through “stepping musically” – in a way that he would never have understood it otherwise. There was no longer a separation; he was music.

While Hania recognizes the value of experiencing embodied rhythmic education for its own merit, she also believes “The education of the body … really supports or develops those brain connections for all learning. This is more important than just music education, doing eurhythms” (personal communication, August 14, 2013). Barnhill (2007) applies Dalcroze Eurythmics techniques and pedagogy in a remedial educational program *Cognitive Eurhythmics*, which, “combines Dalcroze & Feldenkrais to address learning and behavioral difficulties in special needs children”, 66 (not necessarily musical learning). Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) claims:

> It seems to me, however, that if nerve specialists would be good enough to study my experiments carefully, they would speedily recognise the therapeutic value of exercises that control muscular contraction and relaxation, in every shade of time, energy and space, for instruction thus given must inevitably stimulate intuition and endow the pupils with bodies perfectly organised, both mentally and physically” (p. 105)

Hania believes that Dalcroze training should be included in mainstream education because it provides a valuable artistic and kinaesthetic learning foundation that students would not otherwise experience. She further believes the relationships that are encountered in Dalcroze classes – the nuance, the relationships between space, time, and energy – are valuable education experiences for anyone. The experiences facilitate a sense of awareness and attention to details not otherwise noticed, and brings the whole person (body, mind, soul) together. She mused, “I think that if you could have children having twenty minutes of eurhythms every day in the school system, we could transform the society” (personal communication, August 27, 2013). Hall (1920) claims,

---

This tendency of eurhythmics to enhance art expression in drawing and painting has been so noticeable in all the grades that further experimentation has been planned by the art teachers to prove that this kind of rhythmic experience should be a fundamental part of art education. (p. 148)

Monique believes that Dalcroze exercises can facilitate valuable personal connections. The embodied experience of the objects lesson, (as discussed on page 187), enabled her to become more aware of the effects of psychological barriers. The students were asked to assign different meanings to the objects, and to manipulate them as if they had other qualities. Having experienced first-hand the crippling effects of self-imposed limitations, she connected the re-assignment of meaning of the objects with a reassignment of self-perception. “It’s really to the limit of your imagination” (personal communication August 9, 2013). It was through the exercise of embodying the application of meaning in this case, that she was able to make that deep metaphorical connection.

Paul is an established music teacher at the university level. He had recently discovered Dalcroze pedagogy as I was making preliminary pilot investigations into this study. When I asked him if he had encountered any personal connections in Dalcroze classes, he described the following experience:

… just discovering the things that are there in a lovely free way, and that’s actually learning as well, so it’s another kind of vulnerability. Nobody is asking us to do anything, we’re just expected to walk, however we want, and run somewhere in the corner, and not be ‘right’, not be ‘correct’, not be judged in any way, just do it. And that’s a kind of freedom, that you get to just play and find out, in the play time, find out, “Oh, I think I could play with this now, and another place, later on.” So, Dalcroze loosens … gives you … the work gives that permission, in a way, which is really cool for adults, because we don’t have permission to play very often. (personal communication, August 14, 2012)

The exercises stimulated Paul’s playful spirit – he responded to the opportunity to become musically playful through movement, and he enjoyed experiencing music in an embodied way.
Kessler (2000) describes play as a place where “our wildness and our humanity can safely meet” (p. 87). For adults, it is a place where our creative spirits are unbounded by the daily fetters of responsibility and rationality or by any self-imposed fears and restrictions. It is a place where we can connect and express our inner selves, without being hampered by judgments or concerns about what is right or wrong. It is just play.

Hania described an experience with NIA that heightened her senses and enabled a deep connection for her. The day and the pavement were hot and there was traffic and noise. The four participants moved gracefully, and “as one, and it was very flowing, very still, very gentle, and it was in the setting of pavement – heat – traffic – but it was kind of surreal, and I found a eureka! I loved it” (personal communication August 27, 2013). There was communication and deep connection between the participants through music and movement. The hot sun and hard pavement added to Hania’s sense of “Eureka!” The harshness framed their gentle movements, making their demonstration all the more ethereal. It was a celebration for her, of all of the sensory elements working in an unlikely harmony. All of the parts – heat, movement, sun, – came together to create an event that was very much in the present moment. It was wholistic in the sense of bringing many sensory stimuli together, and holistic because the experience allowed her to make a personal, soulful connection.67

Grace’s experiences with music and dance reveal a personal connection that was apparent as long as she can remember: “It’s always been there” (personal communication, March 14, 2014). Because both of her parents were professional musicians, she had abundant exposure to music, and as a child, her natural inclination to move was nurtured and inspired through their

67 I adopt J. Miller's (2007) suggestion that wholistic education refers to multidisciplinary interconnections, and holistic education as being more concerned with inner, soulful connections (p. 6). See Chapter 2 (Literature Review) p. 25 for more clarification.
music. It was anomalous for her to think of music and dance as separate entities. She said, “I still feel that they are connected, and the rest of the world splits them apart, and I don’t know why.” When Grace experienced the separation of music and dance in college, she experienced intense frustration. In her journals, she wrote, “I can’t believe these people don’t understand anything about music!” Her strong beliefs in the fusion of music and dance were finally verified when she discovered Dalcroze pedagogy: “I looked it up and I wept as I read the book – I was so amazed that this wheel had already been invented. I knew I had to go and do that” (personal communication, March 14, 2014).

When Ann became reacquainted with Dalcroze pedagogy as an adult, she was overcome with joy. She described this encounter as an epiphanic moment; the exercises brought her back to her childhood memories of doing music and movement in nursery school at Branksome Hall. She explained, “O my God – I know all this, and I don’t just know it, I – I have it in me! That was a huge connection for me. That was … primal” (personal communication, August 26, 2013). As an adult, she was very comfortable with doing the exercises, noting “This is far too easy. This is what I did as a child!”

**Emotional Involvement**

The experience of authentically moving to music can be intensely emotional for students, not only because of the synchronization of their bodies to the music, but also because of the emotional experience of releasing inhibitions and self-limiting beliefs. Zane described many other circumstances in which he has observed people crying:

> The different reasons people shed tears – out of joy, out of release, out of the past emotional traumas, out of our certain awareness, or certain recognition and acceptance that something is not working for them – they are incapable, or, joy because they realize “I can do this”, and people cry after they pass exams, or they are able to improvise something beautifully, and they’re just like: “Ahh, I can not believe I played that”. (personal communication, August 29, 2013)
Zane reported observing students cry during a Dalcroze exercise involving harmony. The exercise requires students to sing a note on the same pitch, “doh, doh, doh” while the teacher plays various different harmonies on the piano at the same time. Musically, the exercise trains the ear to accept various harmonies while vocalizing a single pitch, but Zane claimed that the exercise also sometimes released emotions in students. He explained, “They are hearing the different tendency of the ‘doh’s’ and in numerous occasions, people cry with this” (personal communication, August 29, 2013). He thought this was due to the various harmonies that are integral to the exercise, because harmonies can invoke emotions. The exercise can be humorous, especially if the teacher plays a very remote and bright sounding chord, trying deliberately to nudge the students off their note, or if the teacher plays a familiar tune in a remote key, creating ‘dissociation’ in the students.68 The teacher may also play a very rich harmonic progression during this exercise. Being involved in the artistic creation of different and beautiful harmonies, combined with the resonance of the group can trigger an emotional, tearful response of joy. Zane explained, “There’s also the power struggles within the tonal sense that they are experiencing, and they are creating these connections, and associations that triggers everything and … I realize, ‘These are people’s emotions that we are playing with’” (personal communication, August 29, 2013).

If students who are new to Dalcroze pedagogy are receptive enough to embrace the idea of having embodied connections with music, their first experience can be very liberating – sometimes ecstatic. But sometimes, classically trained musicians may encounter distress during their first encounters with embodied musical expression. Their previous training can prohibit the experience of embodied connection between music and movement. The traditional and still the

---

68 Dalcroze pedagogy often includes dissociation to heighten attention and rhythmic coordination skills. An example would be to have students perform a rhythm or melody simultaneously in contrast to what the teacher is performing.
most typical method of training is through a reading approach; conservatory students may spend thousands of hours practising their instruments in order to play the correct notes at the right time clearly and with appropriate expression. Their private lessons do not generally include whole-body movement or improvisation experience. Consequently, because of previous associations and learning constructs, their advanced training often impedes and inhibits the kinaesthetic learning that is available to them in Dalcroze classes, often leading to frustration. Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) discovered when teaching harmony, “while with older students acoustic sensations were hindered by futile intellectual preconceptions, children appreciated them quite spontaneously” (p. v).

Recognizing our emotions is one way of connecting with our inner selves. Carlsson-Paige (2001) claims that today’s child is disconnected from her social, emotional, and spiritual self (p. 26). She recommends active listening as one way to encourage children to express their feelings, and presents recommendations for teachers to foster emotional literacy in their students (p. 31). The arts provide an avenue through which people can express their emotions, when often they cannot find the words. Through self-expression and experiences of acceptance, children can nurture confidence in themselves and develop positive ways to communicate their feelings. Music has been considered as having a high potential for expressive communication. In a discussion on the evolutionary development of art, Damasio (2010) claims,

Art became a privileged means to transact factual and emotional information deemed to be important for individuals and society. […] Art also became a means to induce nourishing emotions and feelings, something at which music has excelled through the ages. (p. 314)

Tears can be a sign of deep emotional learning in a positive way. People cry when they are deeply moved, as Monique did when she remembered her vocal teacher, and the personally
developmental learning that she experienced with her. That teacher was able to help Monique to realize some of her own personal restrictions, and helped her to grow as a person:

There was always a restriction, a restriction, a restriction. And she helped me talk through it, and express that in my lesson! Which I am forever grateful for to her, because I started to really come out, that this is something that I truly loved. (personal communication, August 9, 2014)

At other times, students have been known to cry out of joyful release, as Grace described her emotional reaction to discovering an approach to education that combined music and dance. She had encountered considerable frustration and discord between her perceptions of music and dance and those of the academic faculty she was attending. Hania was moved to tears as she recalled and conveyed the performance of Rita McNeil’s song, Workin’ Man. The audience and the participants in that event were moved by the recent death of Rita McNeil, by the disaster that the song depicted, and by the children’s beautiful and authentically artistic adaptation of that song. Hania described the poignant and dramatic moment at the end of the performance: “And then they ended just walking off and a solo voice singing. It … there was, like, … the people all said to me, ‘You made me cry, you made me cry’” (personal communication August 14, 2013). For Hania, authentic arts experiences are those which move the artist and the audience in a soulful way.

When Ann reconnected with Dalcroze classes as an adult, the experience almost caused her to laugh out loud. She remarked, “I was just so immediately happy” (personal communication, August 26, 2013), and commented that the joy she experienced was “a real impetus to take a closer look at it.” When we learn in a community of cooperation, acceptance and joy, we are experiencing soul learning. J. Miller (2007) explains that our egos function separately and often competitively with others, while the soul “senses a deep connection to others and all life” (p. 14).
The deep soulful connection with others and with life is so joyful and satisfying that we are often moved to tears.
Chapter Ten

Conclusion

The central research question in this study is: In what ways does a Dalcroze approach to music education exemplify holistic education? The experiences of five Dalcroze teachers and students were presented as individual narratives, comprising Chapters 4 through 8 of the dissertation. Participants provided recollections of experiences in Dalcroze classes that they believed exemplified holistic education. All of these occurrences involved movement with artistic intent or as part of an artistic event. Dalcroze pedagogy is unique among music education methods and approaches; it alone is based exclusively on embodied learning: all of the exercises in Dalcroze pedagogy involve listening and responding to music and rhythm through the body. The approach is founded upon the following premise: by experiencing rhythm and music in the body before pursuing formal music studies, students will be more prepared to engage in future music studies. Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) claims the study of rhythmic movement prepares the student for future musical study, and should precede the study of music:

Before adapting his nature to the movement and sound of an instrument, the pupil should be capable of experiencing in his own body – and then of analysing – both motor and aural sensations; special exercises will first develop his sense of muscular rhythm and his nervous sensibility, then they will render his ear attentive to all gradations of intensity, duration and time, phrasing and shading, so that his limbs may faithfully reproduce the rhythms perceive by the ear. Hence the pupil will find himself in a better condition for motor receptivity, as well as better prepared to take up studies that aim at converting impression into expression. (p. 108)

Using movement to enhance music education is not a new idea; music and dance are very closely related in their expression and practices; their pedagogical connection builds upon naturally occurring neurological and spiritual connections. Applying embodied learning to music education expands students’ understanding of music, provides a way to approach music education holistically, and enables transformational learning to occur. Incorporating movement into any
subject opens pathways for more comprehensive knowledge and understanding in different forms and on several levels. Creative and expressive movement engages the emotions, eliciting feelings of balance, wonder, and joy. Engaging the body in learning creates an immediate connection between declarative knowledge (knowing about) and procedural knowledge (knowing how to) (Hanna 1992, p. 38).

Furthermore, movement can be effectively applied in learning subjects other than music to facilitate deeper and more comprehensive understanding. Hania provided one of Brian Way’s drama exercises in which students experience their surroundings with their eyes closed in order to understand the meaning of blindness as an example of holistic learning. She remarked, “And you truly understand it in a holistic way, involving the emotions, and all these ways, not just as an intellectual idea” (personal communication, Aug. 14, 2013). Monique employed an exercise in her classroom in which half the class was given a ‘voice’, while the others did not, in order to provide her students with the experience of oppression. The experience was much more meaningful for the students because they were given the opportunity to not only know what oppression is, but to experience how it feels. “I also saw those that were in the sound group were saying, “I feel sorry”. They were also demonstrating feelings of empathy” (personal communication Aug. 9, 2014). Because of this embodied and interactive exercise, Monique’s students will remember the feeling associated with racial discrimination. Their learning experience will therefore be more meaningful for them than if they had learned about racism through a transmissive approach, by reading or listening.

Any of the arts can be easily incorporated into any subject lesson, thus engaging students immediately in meaningful and personal artistic expressions, and providing a holistic learn-
ing experience. Conte (2001) claims, “The gift of arts experiences is that they build the mental qualities or life skills of creative thinking, problem solving, self-reflection, perspective taking, empathy, resilience, effective communication, teamwork, and healthy risk-taking” (p. 83). Yet, most educational practices continue to exclusively emphasize rational thinking over embodied thinking and understanding. Slingerland (2014) reminds us, “disembodied rationality […] completely fails to reflect how we actually experience our lives” (p. 212). He suggests, “Education should be analog, holistic, and oriented toward action” (p. 213).

Aside from creating an educationally holistic environment, incorporating the arts into a lesson can aid the brain in the learning process by providing an additional and complimentary stimulus. Hanna (2015) claims, “When teaching any subject, adding the visual to the verbal increases likelihood of retention” (p. 63). Including gestures when learning a second language for example, aids in the retention of the new vocabulary. A recent online article published by the Max Planck Institute notes,

> It is easier to learn vocabulary if the brain can link a given word with different sensory perceptions. The motor system in the brain appears to be especially important: When someone not only hears vocabulary in a foreign language, but expresses it using gestures, they will be more likely to remember it. (Learning with all the Senses, para. 1)\(^69\)

Furthermore, using multi-sensory stimulation as teaching aids is not restricted to the arts. The same article continues, “Taste and smell also have a role in learning, and feelings play an important part too” (Learning with all the Senses, para. 7). It may be that associated movements, sounds, images, and other multi-sensory stimuli create mnemonic triggers. Or, it may be that the addition of associated embodied stimuli to transmissive styles of learning deepens our comprehension and conceptual understanding of the subject.

\(^{69}\) [http://www.mpg.de/8934791/learning-senses-vocabulary](http://www.mpg.de/8934791/learning-senses-vocabulary)
The kinds of movement that are being considered in Dalcroze classes however, are not being provided as associated stimuli to facilitate the learning of a separate subject; rather, the movements are the subject: Dalcroze Eurhythmics is the study of rhythmic movement. Dalcroze (1930) claims “the most potent element in music, and the nearest related to life, is rhythmic movement” (p. 115). Students in Dalcroze classes are encouraged to embody the sounds that they hear, and to do this in a way that is sensitive to the artistic intent. When students respond with their bodies to music, they are connecting the music, or what they hear ‘out there’, with what they feel and know intuitively, or what is ‘in here’. If artistic expression is soulful expression, then developing our awareness and sense of connection to what is ‘in here’ is fundamental to artistic expression. As Zane said, “The more musically I stepped, the more musical I became” (personal communication August 29, 2013).

Soulful learning is understood to be learning that connects the student with her inner, insightful, and intuitive self. While this was not his primary intention, Dalcroze (1930/1985) comments on the soulful learning and consequent spiritual development that his students experience in his classes:

I have said that rhythmic gymnastics – whatever method of teaching may be adopted – is more than an educational method. Indeed, it is a force analogous to electricity and the great natural forces of chemistry and physics; it is an energy, a radio-active agent whose influence restores us to ourselves, in making us aware, not only of our own powers, but also of those of others, those of humanity. It compels us to meditate upon the unfathomable depths of our enigmatic and changing nature. It enables us to glimpse the secrets of the eternal mystery which governs the lives of men throughout the ages, it gives our thoughts that original character of intense religious feeling which links together the past, the present, and the future, to create closer relations between body and mind, to unify the moral and physical forces of the individual, and to give a firmer foundation to the relations between men. (Dalcroze 1930/1985, pp. 57 – 58)

In particular, his reference to “glimpse the secrets of the eternal mystery which governs the lives of men throughout the ages” is reminiscent of one of Moore’s (1992) referrals to the
mysterious qualities of soul: “Care of the soul is not solving the puzzle of life; quite the opposite, it is an appreciation of the paradoxical mysteries that blend light and darkness into the grandeur of what human life and culture can be” (p. xix). Jaques-Dalcroze (1930/1985) recognizes the close interdependency between intellect, emotion, soul, and body, and espouses that his method incorporates holism as its philosophical approach:

It must likewise be possible for the individual’s motor powers – when their collaboration is necessary – to be placed in immediate contact with the cerebral and the emotional faculties, for soul and body to be in mutual and intimate communion, the soul idealising and purifying the body, while the body endows the soul with the strengthening realities of its own energy. ... Along such lines may research profitably take place under the aegis of Eurythmics. (p. vii)

Thus, I have elected to explore some of the ways that the manifestation of holistic education occurs in Dalcroze classes, as evidenced by these five teachers and students.

The participants in this study shared many personally and deeply meaningful moments with me. Many of the experiences that were presented in Chapters 4 through 8 exemplified the lived experiences that were holistic in their nature by developing connections between the body, intellect, and spirit. In the 9th chapter ‘Discussion’, these were summarized and presented according to themes based on holistic educational principles. The themes that emerged were; Community Building, Learning (and allowing ourselves) to Trust, Mindfulness, Transformational Learning, Creativity, Personal Connections, and Emotional Involvement. Each of these learning outcomes can be considered as pathways towards a student’s spiritual development.

Grace, Zane, Ann, Hania, and Monique all referred to the necessity and challenges of student-to-student bonding and community building in their classes. Grace referred to the socially and developmentally necessary phenomenon of community building in her young students. Zane noted that peer bonding was necessary in order for his classes to benefit from the exercises and described the difference between children and adults in this respect. Ann referred to the
unique challenges that her emotionally wounded students faced as they cautiously learned to trust each other in her Dalcroze classes. Monique lamented the cultural trend towards a lack of social bonding that was generally occurring with students of the technological communications gadget culture. Hania’s students experienced a deeply spiritual sense of community in the ‘rituals’ she prepared for them, and in her Orff classes. She commented, “That’s the goal of arts education, to not be rote, but to bring out authentic experience ... that sense of community” (personal communication, August 14, 2013).

The importance of having trust was especially apparent to Ann in her work with emotionally traumatized children. She noted that it was more difficult for them to engage in a class community because their previous experiences left them feeling fearful of relating to other people. Zane related that the moment when his adult classes let down their guard enough to trust him and each other was palpable. Hania spent considerable time in her classes on warm-ups that would (among other things) strengthen her students’ abilities to trust each other. Grace, like Monique, noted that students also have to trust themselves with their interactions and movement responses, and not hold back.

Hania utilized the warm-up exercises to develop a sense of heightened awareness or mindfulness in her students. Ann experienced this herself on numerous occasions, particularly during the plastique animée classes, allowing herself to become ‘as one’ with the music and the participants. Grace claimed that dancing or playing music brought her more in touch with her inner self than did meditation.

There were several remarkable accounts of transformative learning. All of these experiences involved embodied, non-cognitive realizations. Ann tried to explain the moment when she understood the interrelationships of time, space and energy as revealed to her by the participants
in the plastique animée class, although words do not suffice. Zane shared his excitement during a Dalcroze class when he realized “the more musically I stepped, the more musical I became” (personal communication August 14, 2013). Hania described the sensation of experiencing the juxtaposition of multi-sensory stimuli – noise, temperature, texture, music, movement, and silence – during a NIA\textsuperscript{70} demonstration that she participated in. Monique shared her embodied, metaphorical interpretation of the props lesson, as the props became representations of her own personal barriers, and the implications that this symbolic lesson could have on her future teaching praxis. Grace was moved to tears when she discovered a pedagogy that combined movement and music. Transformational learning connects us directly to our souls; we only need to be receptive.

Contemporary education tends to emphasize intellectual learning and development in a busy and competitive environment in order to prepare students for economic success; the classroom is not generally considered as an appropriate place for soulful development. As a result of this type of ‘education’, students absorb values that support capitalist views of self, community, and global economics, and tend to view the world as fragmented and competitive. Western cultures value educational training for economic success over the development of students’ spiritual relationships and meaningful connections with their true, compassionate and artistic selves, their community, or their planetary home. Palmer (1999) states, “Education is about healing and wholeness. It is about empowerment, liberation, transcendence, about renewing the vitality of life. It is about finding and claiming ourselves and our place in the world” (p. 19).

\textsuperscript{70} As noted in Chapter 7, (Hania), p. 152, NIA (Neuromuscular Integrated Action) is a type of movement classes developed in California in the late twentieth century. See http://www.nianow.com/practice
Making soulful connections is a central principal in holistic education and can be encouraged and developed through activities as simple as drawing a picture, spending time with nature, or in silence. Students in secondary schools in particular are in a stage of development that is receptive to and searching for truth, meaning, and spiritual awakenings, but the completion of the Ontario secondary diploma provides few opportunities for anything but intellectual achievement, requiring only one arts credit to be completed during the four years.

The participants in this study were made aware that I was conducting research to explore the holistic aspects of Dalcroze pedagogy, and that those aspects are understood to develop connections between body, intellect, and spirit. There are a variety of ways teachers and students experience connections in Dalcroze classes; the participants provided unique and personal holistic experiences. While Monique experienced the ‘props lesson’ as exemplifying a personal encounter with self-restricting barriers, the same lesson would likely elicit a different interpretation from another student. Although I had some control over the direction of the interviews, the participants’ prior understandings about holistic education would heavily influence their choice of responses to the interview prompts.

J. Miller (2007) provides a suggestion for holistic education as being concerned with inner, personal, and soulful connections, and for wholistic education as referring to multidisciplinary interconnections and experiences (p. 6). Using this distinction, holistic education does not necessarily have to incorporate several disciplines, as long as it provides the student with the opportunity to be personally engaged in a way that inspires soulful learning. Hania’s approach to arts education is wholistic and multi-sensory, including music, drama, language, tactile sensations, kinaesthetic learning, and visual and aural awareness. Her students also encountered soulful experiences; one could say she taught holistically through a wholistic approach. That is, her
students and their parents felt the reality of Rita McNeil’s *Workin’ Man* in a personal and transformative way through the incorporation of drama, dance, story, creativity, music, visual effects, and movement. Upitis (2011) advocates for a multi-sensory learning approach, so that children can engage in the arts in various ways, recognizing that all children learn differently. She quotes Rettig and Rettig, (1999): “Creative and meaningful learning in, about, and through the arts is more likely to happen when teachers make learning active, enable learning through social interaction, provide multi-sensory experiences, and promote practices that help students develop skills in self-regulation” (as cited in Upitis, 2011, p. 50).

Hania’s attraction to the Orff approach also reflects her affinity with wholistic education. Recalling that her discovery of authentic arts education was through those early camp experiences with drama, dance, and music, it is very rewarding and deeply meaningful for her as an arts teacher to recreate her memories in the performance arts through a similar multi-sensory approach such as *Orff Schulwerk*. Hania’s pedagogical philosophy is based closely on her intimate relationship with and understanding of Orff pedagogy, which is a *wholistic* pedagogy.

The Dalcroze experiences of my participants were often serendipitous and affected them in profoundly meaningful and personally transformative ways. This finding is evidenced by Zane’s term, “stepping musically”, by Monique’s realization that objects could represent self-imposed barriers, and by Ann’s experience of watching moving bodies but seeing the time, space, and energy relationship between moving planets. Their revelations were relevant to and likely inspired by the life experiences that held meaning for them at the time. Zane had been studying very advanced musical performance skills, and his embodied revelation affected his praxis and his identity as a musician. In his teaching practice, Zane ensures that embodied awareness and learning are given priority in his Dalcroze classes by continuously engaging in
somatic empathy and by requiring his students to experiment with expressive and creative movement instead of providing them with clear, unambiguous (intransigent) instruction.

Monique made revelatory connections through movement with her personal philosophical beliefs and dedication to equity and global education. As a person concerned with self-limiting thoughts and self-imposed psychological barriers, her embodied experience with the objects lesson resonated and connected with her strong personal beliefs in those areas. Ann experienced a transcendental connection with the universe through the deep connections with and harmonious movements of the members of the plastique animée classes. During the time that she visualized the planetary balance between space, time, and energy, she was working through self-discovery, personal wellness, and spiritual healing, and was also making spiritually based connections through Qi Gong exercises. Grace found a pedagogical approach that resonated with her strong beliefs in the fusion of music and dance. In her practice as a Dalcroze teacher, she strives to give her students the same experiences that she had as a child – moving to music in a way that connects their hearts, their artistry, their imaginations, their love of play, their sense of community, and their innate sense of awe and wonder. Hania provides a variety of artistic and personally meaningful experiences for her students through drama, movement, and Orff classes, recreating her own artistic discoveries and experiences.

All of these participants were working on their own personal developments; the connections that they made through embodied learning clarified the answers to personal questions they were already exploring at that time. Their insightful revelations would not have occurred if the teaching style were declarative or transmissive in nature, because they would not have the opportunity for experiencing deeply moving and personal embodied experiences. These particular learning outcomes were not what they were expecting. However, they were open enough to al-
low these personally transformational experiences to occur, and now, to share them with me. They also recognized the personal connections that were made possible as a result of their experiences, and applied their new knowledge and insights to their present understanding of music, musical artistry, embodied awareness, and global education.

There is a large amount of evidence throughout the participants’ interview transcripts and supporting academic literature that validates the holistic potential of music education. One of the goals of a holistic music education program is to enable students to discover their own personal connections through music and with music. Yet music elicits different meanings for people; their personalities, social paradigms, and personal associations cause them to derive and construct their own unique and personal responses to the music. It is the nature of art to inspire its audience to construct personal and unique meanings and associations – to construct a personal interpretation, and to experience a personal connection. As long as there is a personal connection, then it can be considered a holistic experience.

When the music or the music making has personal meaning for the student, or engages the student in a meaningful experience, then it can be considered an authentic experience in the arts. To provide an authentic arts experience for her students, the music teacher needs to de-emphasize intellectual understanding, and include well-chosen activities that will provide her students with opportunities for making meaningful and personal connections to music. These activities can be singing songs they love, playing instruments to make simple music together, creating their own music, moving to music, or listening to music. When students are given opportunities to connect with their inner selves or with the world through performing, creating, listening, or moving to music, then music education can be considered holistic. Music as an art form needs
to connect us with the inner and infinite potential for human expression that comes not from the intellect, but from the soul. Maleuvre (2005) explains,

Art is less concerned with delivering information about the world than teaching us about how to stand in relation to it, how to find our place in it, and live with it: through art we do not seek to master the world so much as become its denizens. It is a teaching of love. (pp. 77-78).

Quite often however, music classes are spent on skills development and are taught in a rote style of teaching. The intended expectation for the class might be to develop their ability to read music notation, but if there is no participation in, moving with, creating, or listening to music, then there are no opportunities for soulful connections, there are no expressive revelations, there is no joy – there is no music. Music in the schools is governed by a set of curriculum expectations – many of which are intended to develop higher order thinking, literacy, and problem-solving skills. For music education to be holistic, the teacher would approach her class from a holistic perspective, with the intent to involve body, mind, heart, and soul. Upitis (2011) claims,

In order to provide rich daily arts experiences for their students, teachers must directly experience the joy and the value of artistic work for themselves – whether by involvement in the arts in their non-teaching time or by enhanced professional development in the arts. (p. iii)

Suggestions for Further Research

Increasing evidence supports the belief that cognition and rational thought are enhanced through embodied experiences. Further studies are needed to investigate whether or not and in what ways the application of embodied learning practices can enhance and provide aspects of holistic learning to academic disciplines – language arts, social studies, math, and science.

Research supports the integration of arts education into core subjects to introduce an element of holistic education (Miller 2000, Conte 2001). Through the arts, students can engage their imaginations, develop their creativity, develop their relationships within communities, and ex-
press personal thoughts, feelings, and ideas (Conte 2001). Integrating arts education into core subjects would increase student’s experiences with the arts while providing more depth and personal meaning to their core subject curriculum. Miller (2000) claims that in Waldorf Schools, “art is not just a subject but integral to almost everything in the curriculum” (p. 75). He continues, “Clearly, art, here, is not just self-expression, but something that engages the whole student. The intellectual, emotional, and physical faculties are called upon and developed” (p. 81). Further studies are needed to study the incorporation of various forms of the arts into core subjects, and the effects that such enrichment might have on students, teachers, administration, and school communities.

Current curriculum requirements for Ontario public schools emphasize core subjects almost exclusively over arts subjects. And while classroom teachers may be aware of the benefits of integrating arts into core curriculum, they are generally not sufficiently trained to implement authentic arts experiences into their programs. Neither, for the most part, do they incorporate whole body movement into their core subject lesson plans. However, current trends in education continue to focus almost exclusively on the intellect, de-emphasizing the importance of physical activity and the role that the body plays in learning. Holistic education upholds the inclusion of all aspects of learning, including not only the intellect, but also the student’s physical, emotional, and spiritual development. An embodied approach to learning ‘core subjects’ might re-engage students who have become lethargic and apathetic towards school and to their own health. Current studies are needed to explore ways of incorporating a balanced approach to education into classrooms for all subjects and grade levels.

The current emphasis on language arts and math testing has relegated arts education to a ranking of educational frill. Ontario schools are providing less and less scheduled class time for
students to spend in arts education. Yet, the arts are considered necessary to a child’s comprehensive education and are included in the school curriculum so that all students, regardless of financial, demographic, or social privilege, can benefit from partaking in quality arts programs. Shand and Bartel (1993) claim, “One of the strongest indicators of school board policy supporting music instruction is the hiring of teachers specifically to teach music” (p. 38). Their 1993 research study revealed 58.6% of Ontario school boards hired music specialists to teach at elementary schools (lowest of 10 provinces), and 68.2% of Ontario school boards hired music specialists at high schools (second lowest), far below the national average of 81.2% for elementary schools and 78.4% of high schools (p. 37). However, in P.E.I. and Newfoundland at that time, 100% of school boards hired music specialists to teach music for both the elementary and secondary panels. Clearly there is a difference in perceived priority. Shand and Bartel (1993) found “a serious lack of administrative support in many boards” based on “hiring practices, locally prepared program guidelines and resources, and financial support” (p. 41). A more current investigation would bring these numbers up to date. Shand and Bartel (1993) also recommend further research into what actually happens in music classrooms, as well as what administrators report.

A more recent study created by Beynon et al. (2005) recommends, “arts education must be available to all citizens regardless of financial means” (p. 2). They cite several recommendations for research studies, among them, research that “provides arguments for a holistic approach to education which includes the arts” (p. 2).

Jaques-Dalcroze (1921/1972) advocates for music to be included in all schools, “I repeat that a genuine musical education – like the teaching of science and morals – should be provided at school” (p. 14). He further believes music should be taught by musicians: “It is of the first importance that the musical education in primary schools – as well as in the higher schools – should
be in the hands of musicians” (p. 33). He contends, “those who have gone through life with an untrained ear cannot be expected to appreciate the necessity of furnishing others with an ear attuned to fine perceptions by the diligent practice of special exercises” (p. 24). Ball (2015) repeats the dictum, “Beginning in their first year of school, all children should have a right to quality music instruction taught by teachers with a background and training in music” (p. 41). He further contends, “If the money spent on testing were diverted to funding music and the other arts in schools, not only would overall student achievement levels rise, but students would also become better problem solvers, creative thinkers, and team players. They would develop into more expressive, empathetic, self-aware individuals” (p. 41). Yet, the arts, including music, continue to be taught in many Ontario classrooms by homeroom teachers who often resort to activities that can be easily evaluated, such as making instruments or studying classical composers. To teach music artistically, one must have enough musical expertise to be attentive to the individual musical growth and needs of each student, and then to be able to develop a student’s musical abilities through carefully chosen activities, rather than implementing a ‘one-size-fits-all’ curriculum. Further research is needed to demonstrate the impact that authentic arts education has on the holistic development of students, and the effects that such education has on students’ overall wellness.

Schools also need to provide funding for implementing and maintaining quality arts education. Too often music teachers are pushing carts full of their supplies from classroom to classroom while the home-room teacher takes her break time. If students are sitting at their desks in a music class, the teacher is severely restricted in her attempt to provide them with authentic musical experiences. A study by Beatty (2001) found 64% of music teachers in Ontario schools “reported of the inadequacy of music equipment and resources” (p. 5). As well, “50% perceived that
music education took an unimportant role in their school board” (p. 4). Further studies are in order to investigate current conditions for teaching music, and for making recommendations for adequate facilities and equipment.

A research study that explores Jaques-Dalcroze’s pedagogical intentions with regard to soulful learning would be of particular interest to Dalcroze teachers and to teachers interested in holistic education. An in-depth study of the educational practices at that time would place Dalcroze pedagogy, particularly those principles that resonate with holistic education, into historical context, and would provide an interesting view of holistic educational reforms at the turn of the last century.
References:


Music Education Research. 8(2), 153–173. doi: 10.1080/14613800600779592


