Teachers Choose the Songs: Culturally Relevant Pedagogy in the Music Classroom
By: Gabriela Farias

A research paper submitted in conformity with the requirements
For the degree of Master of Teaching
Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

Copyright by Gabriela Farias, April 2016
Abstract

This paper explores the integration of culturally relevant pedagogy in the music classroom by answering the question *In what ways does a formal classical music education affect the diversity of classroom repertoire selection?* With subquestions; *In what ways do music educators promote diversity and inclusivity in the classroom? In what ways does the cultural diversity of the student body inform repertoire selection?* A literature review and the analysis of four interviews compose this qualitative research study. The themes which emerged from the responses of the participants in the study include; western influences on repertoire selection, global music as risk taking and teachers as cultural workers. The study concludes with the implications of the research for the educational community as well as my own identity and practice and provides recommendations and areas of further research as they pertain to music education through the lens of culturally relevant pedagogy.
Acknowledgements

To my peer editor and dear friend, Sevan who has supported me through this academic journey since our very first class at OISE. Thank you so much for your never waiving encouragement, kindness and laughter these past two years. Our future as teachers is just around the riverbend!

To my sister, thank you for enduring my endless practicing throughout my musical journey and for attending every performance of the songs you have practically memorized from hearing so often! Your support, thoughtful critiques, and cheers from the audience throughout my life have been so appreciated. Hermanas para siempre.

To my mother, I hope I can aspire to be the exemplary, dedicated, and passionate teacher that you are for your students. You are my role model in so many ways and it is an honour and a privilege to share my vocation with you. Thank you for your unconditional support, love, and guidance in my academic career and throughout my life. Te quiero mucho.

To my late father, ‘I carry your heart, I carry it in my heart’. The memory of your unconditional love and belief in me continues to carry me throughout my life. Te quiero mucho, Papi.

To my partner and editor in chief, thank you for the vibrant discussions throughout this academic journey. You have challenged me to reflect on my ideas and philosophies from a variety of perspectives and it has made me a better researcher, teacher and person in the process. Te adoro, Anton.

Dedication

For my nephew, whose journey in music is only beginning. May your life be filled with the sounds of many global musics. ‘I’ll love you forever, I’ll like you for always, as long as I’m living my baby you’ll be.’
# Table of Contents

Abstract  
Page 2  

Acknowledgements  
Page 3  

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Research Study  
Page 6  

1.0 Introduction  
Page 6  

1.1 Researchers  
Page 7  

1.2 Research Question  
Page 8  

1.3 Background of the Researcher  
Page 9  

Chapter 2: Literature Review  
Page 14  

2.1 Culturally Responsive Pedagogy  
Page 14  

2.2 Music Education Pedagogies  
Page 18  

2.3 Repertoire Selection  
Page 20  

2.4 Multicultural Education  
Page 21  

2.5 Music as Culture Studies  
Page 24  

2.6 Resource Review  
Page 29  

Chapter 3: Methodology  
Page 37  

3.0 Introduction  
Page 37  

3.1 Research Approach and Procedures  
Page 38  

3.2 Instruments of Data Collection  
Page 38  

3.3 Participants  
Page 39  

3.3.1 Criteria  
Page 40  

3.3.2 Sampling procedures  
Page 41  

3.3.4 Data Analysis  
Page 41  

3.5 Ethical Review Procedures  
Page 41  

3.6 Methodological Limitations and Strengths  
Page 42  

3.7 Conclusion: Brief Overview  
Page 43
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION TO THE RESEARCH STUDY

1.0 Introduction and Purpose

Music educators are responsible for choosing the musical content which their students will learn; therefore the repertoire becomes the music curriculum (Reynolds, 2000). By assuming this important task, every music teacher accepts responsibility for shaping the perceptions, preferences, and assumptions that students form about musics in the classroom and music as a cultural practice. Although the Ontario arts curriculum does not specify the exact musical pieces teachers should select, it does make explicit the expectation that students should “further their understanding of the music of various cultures by studying a wide range of music and musicians from different time periods and cultures, including Aboriginal, local, national, and global societies” (The Standards, 2009, p.17). Therefore music educators must use their professional judgement in order to make informed decisions on the repertoire which will frame their lessons. How do they accomplish this with such wide and varied selection to choose from? Some educators believe strongly that music must be used as a vehicle to teach cultural understanding and thereby equity (Dunbar-hall, 2005). Our selections in music are also selections in culture, thus it is imperative to present a variety of repertoire or otherwise risk creating a hierarchy of musical cultures. If we as teachers believe that students should consider our repertoire selections valuable, then we must also be aware of the implicit messages we are sending our students about the music that is and is not selected.

"Repertoire selection has a major impact on what students will and will not learn and it should help their musical understanding and appreciation" (Reynolds, 2000, p.31). Music teachers are making repertoire selections constantly; this composes the content that all other topics of rhythm, melody, and composition stem from. As educators, it is our responsibility to sift through numerous options of musical pieces and select those compositions that create meaning in our classrooms. There are a variety of strategies by which music educators choose repertoire; some teachers may feel that repertoire should be a communal decision inclusive of students and teachers and reflective of the greater global community of music makers (Campbell and Anderson, 2011). The possible
outcomes of this method might consider students’ identities and interests which may be reflected in the repertoire. Other strategies include selecting repertoire according to musical concepts such as rhythm, melody, dynamics, timbre and articulation. This narrows the possibility of repertoire which can be selected since the music must conform to the specific focus of the predetermined concept. Finally, some music educators may bind themselves to a ‘method book’ whereby the repertoire has been entirely pre-selected. This was true of two of my placements as a teacher candidate whereby I taught music in a band setting. Both of the assistant teachers used method books almost exclusively to teach their classes. This option is the most restrictive as it does not allow input from the students or the teacher. These method books are intended for beginner players; the repertoire increases in difficulty as the students progress through the book and many teachers find them helpful for this reason. The problem with the latter method becomes then that the repertoire does not necessarily represent the variety of musical cultures necessary to meet the curriculum’s important expectation for cultural significance. The purpose of this study is to unpack the process by which teachers choose repertoire and how they implement global musics in their classroom through culturally relevant pedagogy.

1.1 Researchers

Through the framework of culturally relevant pedagogy teachers examine the effectiveness and inclusiveness of their practice through three main components:

- Students must experience academic success.
- Students must develop and/or maintain cultural competence.
- Students must develop a critical consciousness through which they challenge the status quo of the current social order (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p.160).

The pioneer of this pedagogy, Gloria Ladson-Billings places special emphasis on the reflection of student identity in the content of classroom material: “Culturally relevant teachers utilize students’ culture as a vehicle for learning.” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p. 161). This pedagogical approach attempts to validate every child’s cultural identity in an
effort to create a more inclusive learning environment by celebrating diversity. My research will examine the implementation of this pedagogy in the music classroom.

Music teacher Edmun Shupman believes that teaching multicultural music promotes understanding of the cultures from which it came from and therefore teaches a hidden curriculum which promotes social justice and equity (Volk, 1993, p.146). The researchers in this area include music educator Patricia Campbell who has written a book with a compilation of lesson plans so that teaching music from a variety of cultures becomes more widely accessible (Campbell, 2001). Her book includes Latin American genres of music and is written so that any music teacher is able to easily implement these plans in their classrooms. It places a great deal of emphasis on not only teaching the music, but also the context from which it came from. This is an integral component in teaching cultural understanding: that it is not enough to teach the music, but also the understanding of the people who created it.

Egon Kraus has created a list of strategies which music teachers can implement in order to increase their training in various musical genres. The objective is for teachers to acquire the skills and knowledge required to implement the musics of varying cultures. In a speech by Egon Kraus he addresses music educators as social activists: "the confrontation of the cultures is the destiny of our times, and the bringing about of this confrontation in a meaningful manner is the great cultural-political task of our century. We, the music educators, can contribute significantly" (Egon Kraus, 1966 as cited in Volk, 1993, p.137). This statement makes the subject of music fundamentally important in establishing equity and social justice in our school communities.

1.2 Research Question

Musical selections not only define the explicit curriculum, but also the hidden implicit curriculum, revealing the musics and cultures that are valued in the classroom. If music teachers only select music from a Eurocentric and western culture, what can we as teachers expect our students to infer about music as a whole? Music does not belong to any specific culture, but is instead a global practice that is shared and expressed by all human beings. Repertoire selection which favours western traditions of music risks
creating a hierarchy of cultures whereby western music becomes the standard from which we compare all ‘other’ musics. This ‘othering’ creates a barrier that prevents students from appreciating and valuing the complexities, styles and traditions of all musics. In reflecting upon my own experience as a classically trained musician I was forced to confront my own biases when selecting repertoire in my classrooms. My research will reveal not only the process of selecting songs, but how teachers value and implement diversity in their classrooms. It will focus on the relationship between classically trained music educators and the curriculum demand of experiencing diverse musics from a variety of cultures. My research asks; In what ways does a formal classical music education affect the diversity of classroom repertoire selection? With subquestions; In what ways do music educators promote diversity and inclusivity in the classroom? In what ways does the cultural diversity of the student body inform repertoire selection? This stems from my own experience as a classically trained musician as I navigate the world of classroom music and attempt to accomplish the huge task of selecting the repertoire which my students will consume.

1.3 Background of the Researcher

1.3.1 The Early Years

As a music educator with an undergraduate degree in classical voice, I now feel far removed from the initial inspirations which ignited my love for music. As is the case for many children, I was largely inspired by my parents’ musical taste. From a young age, I would sing along to some of Latin America's most recognized songbirds like Mercedes Sosa and Carlos Gardel. At the age of 5, my family would assemble into rows to form an audience and the fireplace ledge transformed into a stage. It was here that I began singing and where this pastime would grow into a lifelong passion.

I began formal music training at the age of 8 when my parents enrolled my sister and I in private piano lessons. We did not take well to piano; the practicing was laborious and the songs failed to intrigue us. It was around the same age that I auditioned for the school musical and was assigned a solo. Vocal lessons began in the same stream as my piano lessons with the infamous "Royal Conservatory of Music" curriculum, used by
many private music educators. This system is divided by grade levels that each contain a specific set of technical requirements alongside a list of repertoire selections from the western classical tradition. The vocal repertoire is almost entirely classical art song with recent additions from the musical theatre genre. Songs are available in Italian, French, German, and English, with a few selections in Spanish—although it is the first four that are considered to be the prominent languages of classical music. This ignores the wealth of classical repertoire in Russian, Chinese, and Polish; perhaps omitted because of the difficulty of these languages for English speakers. Students and their teachers must choose and learn selections from an approved list of songs as well as various technical requirements in order to be able to perform the exam for that grade and move forward to the next level.

In hindsight, this was extremely limiting because it gave me a very narrow framework in which to develop my musical skills and knowledge. It did not take into account my personal interests as a student and completely ignored any experience and skill I had acquired from singing in latin genres. Implicitly it taught me that those music's were of lesser value than the classical genre because the personal contributions that I could make from my previous experiences in music making were not taken into account or explored by my music mentors.

Although copious RCM examinations did not contribute to my love of classical music, listening to opera and watching and participating in recitals and concerts created a lasting love affair with this genre. A lifelong passion turned into a vocation and I greatly benefitted from the formal training that I received. However, because of the tremendous technical skill that is required to perform opera, I turned to musical theatre as an outlet for performance. I participated in several musicals with local theatre companies in my community which became some of the highlights of my life to this day. Musical theatre served as an outlet to share music with an audience instead of an adjudicator.

**1.3.2 As a Music Educator**

Unfortunately, as a private music teacher myself, I often revert back to the traditions which have been instilled in me by my classical music training. In my private
lessons I am often bound to the RCM syllabus and follow meticulously the appropriate scales, ear training requirements, and repertoire listed. This is not only an expectation which I have imposed on my students, but also from my students’ parents who want to be able to see evidence of progress as students pass their piano exams and go from one grade to the next. I allow students to select pieces outside of the RCM syllabus for recitals in order to maintain their interest in music class.

I am free from these constraints in my role as music director in a performing arts program in my local community. I choose repertoire with the students interests in mind and sometimes will re-write lyrics to reflect their personal experiences. The most fulfilling moments of my musical journey have been with the children in this program. Students who thought that they could not sing, now have the courage, knowledge, and skills to sing confidently. The environment that these students have created is one of sincere support and encouragement for one another regardless of technical ability.

These two examples demonstrate stark differences in student engagement; the private students who follow the RCM syllabus often struggle to practice and feel unmotivated whereas the students in the performing arts program who choose many of the songs they sing are highly motivated and excited during rehearsals. There is not one, singular explanation for the contrast in these musical experiences, but it does lead me to the conclusion that repertoire selection is an immense contributing factor in attaining student engagement.

1.3.3 Performing Arts High school

I auditioned for the local arts high school in my community and was admitted into the vocal music program. The program used a book called "24 Italian art songs"; it is a compilation of Italian Baroque art songs and an infamous teaching tool in the classical singing world. During my four years of secondary education I would learn almost every song from the book, with select pieces in French and English, all of which stemmed from the western classical tradition. On Fridays we were able to perform pieces of our choosing for the class. On these days, students would perform songs from various genres including; pop, gospel, r&b, country, indie, music theatre, and so on.
Most of my class consisted of singers whose expertise were in genres such as gospel, r&b, Indian classical music, and pop. Two students in the class took private vocal lessons, including me. I was already familiar with the repertoire being taught and this helped me excel in the course. The vocalists in my class were immensely talented; I still remember in grade 9 listening to one of the girls in my class perform "I will always love you" by Whitney Houston. The vocal prowess and artistry she demonstrated were beyond her years, but she did not enjoy vocal class. Often complaining the repertoire was boring, she did not go on to pursue music professionally.

It's so unfortunate that such a profound hierarchy could be created by something as seemingly simple as repertoire selection. In what ways might the choice of Italian Baroque repertoire have excluded students in this class because of their socio-economic backgrounds? The western classical genre is something that usually requires instruction from an expert, and therefore the privilege of learning the necessary technique to sing this music is left for those who can afford private lessons. As educators in what ways can we acknowledge and value the vast array of musical experiences that our students bring to the classroom? The majority of our classes and assessments were devoted to classical repertoire and this worked in my favour since I had been taking vocal lessons and singing classical art song for many years before entering the regional arts program. If I had been assessed on my ability to sing a pop ballad or gospel piece, I would have had a far more humbling and equitable music education experience.

1.3.4 Post Secondary Education

I attended university as a classical voice major in Music Education. Classical technique never came easily to me and it was a shock to come from a school where I was the only classical musician to a school full of them. My private voice lessons were something I dreaded every week; no matter how much I practised I did not make sufficient progress to satisfy the demands of my instructors. One teacher wrote in my assessment: "she works too hard to her own detriment." I felt that my effort was not valued and I took it to mean that I would never understand the technique. In terms of repertoire, I had always been drawn to Spanish classical art song. I loved the intensity of
the accompaniment and the drama of the text and melody. There was one particular lesson when my teacher and I were reviewing my repertoire for my final assessment and noticed that I had included several Spanish songs. She suggested I cut some of the pieces as she considered it "frill repertoire"; this has stayed with me. In the moment, I had not realized the impact of her use of the word “frill”, but after class when listening to my recording of the lesson I felt hurt and belittled. She had offended not only my musical preferences, but my culture and identity.

As a part of the music education division I was not required to have a recital, however, during my final year I chose to create one. When I began choosing the repertoire, I realized, nothing on my list included anything in the classical genre. I had chosen a variety of cabaret and musical theatre pieces. When I brought them to my vocal teacher I'll never forget her look of amazement when she asked: "Why aren't you able to emulate this quality of technique in your classical music?" I could not answer her. Singing music that I loved helped me not only to enjoy making music again, but also improved my technical ability as a musician. Would it have made a difference had my teachers valued the strengths I brought to the class in other genres? How many students feel as if they do not have a voice in their education or that the knowledge they bring to the classroom is not valuable? I will always be grateful that I came to know and love classical music, a love that these and past teachers have fostered. Unfortunately, those four years made me question my choice in a career in music and I think it was largely due to the fact that I had to leave a part of my musical identity behind.

1.3.5 My Inspiration

During the last year of my undergraduate degree, I was becoming distraught with my choice to become a music teacher. I could not come to terms with the importance of music as anything more than a laborious past time, but then I took a course that would change my mind. "Music and Society" enlightened the power of music as a vehicle for social justice and equity. It spoke of the way music was used during the civil rights movements in the U.S., the dictatorships in Latin America, and the concentration camps in Japan. Such a vast wealth of history and culture could be shared through something as
approachable and relatable as music. This infused a new purpose into my musical
e endeavours by demonstrating the potential for music to foster inclusivity and celebrate
diversity. I felt empowered; my once painstaking pursuits for perfect technique now
became profound and passionate goals to share music with children and explore the
potential that songs could have in creating unifying and egalitarian communities.

Overview
In Chapter 1, I provide the reasons and purpose of the study and situate myself in the research. Chapter 2 contains a review of the literature and the theoretical framework which will structure my writing. Chapter 3 provides the methodology and procedure used in this research and introduces the participants. Chapter 4 connects the participants responses to my research question and groups them into themes which include western influences on repertoire selection, global music as risk taking, and teachers as cultural workers. Chapter 5 includes an overview of the key findings and their conclusions as well as implications on the educational community, recommendations and areas for further research. References and a list of appendixes follow at the end.

Chapter 2: Literature Review
Chapter 2 will present culturally relevant pedagogy as the framework for my research and deconstruct the concepts of music education through cultural studies and multicultural pedagogy. A resource review is included at the end of the chapter.

2.0 Theoretical Framework: Culturally Relevant Pedagogy

Foundations for Culturally Relevant Pedagogy
The emphasis on student centred learning which validates and celebrates the experiences, identities, and cultures of the children in our classrooms is an integral component of any good teaching practice. Researchers Mohatt and Erickson noted greater academic success in Native American children when teachers’ use of speech patterns reflected those practiced in the student’s home life. Integrating forms of communication which the students understood and practiced became the pathway to fairly and equitably assess skills and knowledge of the academic content. Many educators, researchers, and theorists during the late 80’s and early 90’s were striving to create a more humanizing
framework for teacher practice. Bartolome explains the need for a “humanizing pedagogy that respects and uses the reality, history and perspectives of students as an integral part of educational practice” (Bartolome, p. 173, 1994). Culturally relevant pedagogy acknowledges the realities, histories, and perspectives of students and infuses these understandings and experiences in academia in a way that is meaningful and reflective of student culture.

A part of the reason for the emergence of culturally relevant pedagogy came from the necessity to find a solution to the underachievement of African American students within the school system. Explanations for these academic failures were attributed to the cultural opposition between students and the school system (Erickson, 1987, 1993; Piestrup, 1973). In scholarly research that examined African American students who were academically successful, a disturbing finding was revealed—the students’ achievement in school came at the cost of their cultural and psychosocial well-being (Fine, 1986; Fordham, 1988). Fordham and Ogbu (1986) identified this phenomenon entitled, "acting White" (p. 176) “The students believed that it was necessary for them to stand apart from other African-American students so that teachers would not attribute to them the negative characteristics that may have been attributed to African American students in general” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p.476). In order for culturally relevant pedagogy to be successful, teachers need to understand these social inequities and aid students in the difficult task of navigating through ‘dual worlds’ which are the student’s own cultures and that of the mainstream.

**Objectives of Culturally Relevant Pedagogy**

“Culturally relevant pedagogy is a pedagogy of opposition that is committed to collective empowerment, not merely the individual” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p. 160). The execution of effective and successful culturally relevant pedagogy requires three components; academic success, cultural competence, and critical consciousness. Students must experience academic success and the role of the teacher is to empower students to choose academic success. Students must understand the value, relevance and importance of the work they are doing. Therefore the content must be meaningful in that it is
reflective of the student experience and powerful for their learning. Cultural competence requires that the student experience and student culture is reflected in academic content. Ladson-Billings explains the use of rap by one of the participants in her study as a tool to learn poetry techniques. The students choose appropriate songs which they were familiar with and analyzed them as a class for examples of poetic functions such as onomatopoeia or alliteration. Through these incorporations and acknowledgments of student knowledge and experience the students “learned that what they had and where they came from was of value” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p.161).

The last component of culturally relevant pedagogy is arguably the most important because it provides students with the critical thinking and analytical skills that they will use to create meaning and understanding about the relationships between their identities and the communities they are a part of. Freire’s theory of “conscientization” explains “a process that invites learners to engage the world and others critically” (Mclaren, 1989, p. 195). Students form a critical lens through which they confront and challenge the parameters of the current social order: “Students must develop a broader sociopolitical consciousness that allows them to critique the cultural norms, values, mores, and institutions that produce and maintain social inequities” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p.162). Each of the components of academic success, cultural competence, and critical consciousness are integral in defining and executing the pedagogy that Ladson-Billings intended to construct. With any single component missing it can no longer be called culturally relevant pedagogy.

**Culturally Relevant Teachers**

When researcher Ladson-Billings first set out to explain effective teaching strategies for African American students she was not able to find connections between the practices of her varying participants through the observations of their teaching. Instead she was able to make distinctive links in the teachers’ philosophies. Ladson-Billings explains these philosophies through the conceptions of self and others, social relations, and conceptions of knowledge. Culturally relevant teachers share common beliefs which inform their teaching practice. In the category of conceptions of
TEACHERS CHOOSE THE SONGS

self and others, culturally relevant teachers believe that all students are capable of academic success. They see “themselves as members of the community and teaching as a way to give back to the community” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p.478). Culturally relevant teachers feel a responsibility towards the community in which they live and are accountable for their students’ success. They understand the significant and positive impact that their contributions as teachers can have on their students.

The social relations that culturally relevant teachers maintain with their students are one of fluid relationships. They respond to the needs of every child in an appropriate, fair, and flexible manner. They seek to develop a connectedness with all students and avoid favouring or singling out children in their classrooms. In this way they address their class as a community of learners and “encourage the students to learn collaboratively, teach each other, and be responsible for each other’s learning” (Ladson-Billings, 1995, p.163). Lastly, the conceptions of knowledge in the classroom are “shared, recycled, and constructed.” The Freirean notion of "teaching as mining" (1974, p. 76) or pulling knowledge out is the outlook that all students can make significant contributions to academic discussions because of the knowledge they have formed from their personal experiences and understandings of the world which they live. Children are not empty vessels which the teacher must fill with knowledge, but instead teachers are guides to help develop and deepen the knowledge that children already have.

**Evolving Pedagogy: Culturally Sustaining**

Pedagogy is an evolving and fluid practice and as such Ladson-Billings has acknowledged the need to continue to advance her pedagogy to new forms. Culturally sustaining pedagogy is the evolution of culturally relevant pedagogy; it focuses on the necessity to develop the students critical lens and rejects the superficial applications of diverse cultural content into the classroom. For example; it is not enough to sing a song about social injustices without delving deeper into the context from which that music was derived. She also brings to our attention the need to view students as sources of knowledge: “... learners can be sources and resources of knowledge and skills” (Ladson-Billings, 2009). Culturally sustaining pedagogy is a way to push forward her
original goals of engaging critically in the cultural landscapes of classrooms and teacher education programs and becomes an opportunity for further research in this area.

2.2 Music Education and Pedagogies

The Systemic Causes for Musical Hierarchies

Music in current North American schools is associated with Western European traditions which put an emphasis on harmonic functions, notational systems and transmissions systems (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 1). Curriculums such as the ones created by the Royal Conservatory of Music emphasize classical composers of the Baroque, Classical, Romantic and 20th century eras. The most recent editions of these curriculums include selections in musical theatre and jazz genres. This prepares students to enter post-secondary institutions which follow similar structures of music education. Canadian universities offer undergraduate degrees only within the classical or jazz genres of music, and world music is available only in the form of supplementary courses. This means that music educators in public Ontario schools most likely hold degrees in either classical or jazz music and have limited experience in world musics. With a lack of experience in world music genres, teachers must find resources to guide their teaching of global musics and use their current pedagogical knowledge to learn these musics.

Kodaly and Orff methods are two dominant pedagogies which are taught to future music educators. The Kodaly method advises that children learn the folk music of their nation (Choksy, 1999). Many music teachers would agree that it is important and enriching to learn classical Canadian folk pieces as this can also facilitate learning about the history of Canada and create a shared sense of belonging for those students new to the country. In fact, many music resources in Canada for children’s repertoire are easily accessed and provide rich opportunities for learning music theory, Canadian history, and other components necessary to fulfill the requirements of the curriculum. In Canada we have a multicultural society and thus we might consider including folk songs that reflect the diversity in our communities.

Orff is largely concerned with “how” to teach rather than “what” to teach. This means that repertoire selection is largely linked to a specific learning objective which
might be based in learning a new tonality, rhythm, dynamic or timbre, however, the emphasis is not necessarily on the culture it came from. Therefore the strategies for Orff could be applied to any genre regardless of the repertoire suggestions made in method books. This leaves the responsibility to teachers to find the context for their repertoire selections in order to create connection with the culture from which the music comes from (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 34). If educators do not add contextual understanding then there is a risk that students misconstrue ownership of that music. There is a missed opportunity whereby students cannot gain an appreciation of the culture where the music comes from. These missed opportunities can be rectified if educators make it a priority to develop an understanding of the origins of a musical piece.

Method Books and Rehearsal Strategies

The use of method books is most often attributed to band classes at the elementary school level. The instruments taught in these classes are modelled after a traditional western symphony orchestra; these include woodwinds, brass and, less often, strings may be included. It is difficult to find valuable and engaging repertoire for these instruments at a preliminary level and method books lessen the burden on teachers to select music. These method books ensure a clear strategy in attaining most of the goals in the Ontario Arts Curriculum (The Ontario Arts Curriculum, 1998); however, they may not always allow for the representation of a variety of musics from diverse cultures since western instruments were made to play western music.

Band class uses the “rehearsal strategy” model which Lee Bartel describes in his research (Bartel, 2004, pg 56). The rehearsal strategy starts with a ‘warm up’ which incorporates a series of breathing exercises and scales which should ideally relate somehow to the repertoire. Following this is practice of the repertoire—the motivation for which is usually a performance. The band/choir will play through the repertoire, the conductor will make a “diagnosis” as she/he hears mistakes, and make suggestions and/or corrections as necessary. There is little insight from the band/choral members themselves as rehearsals are directed by the conductor (or music teacher in this case). Prior to the rehearsal the conductor has interpreted the score and made artistic decisions about the
expression of the music. Usually the era and knowledge of the composer’s style will indicate the way in which the music should be played. This leaves little input from the players of this music.

A shift in genres can provide a very different musical experience. Jazz requires musicians to be collaborative and use improvisation techniques to respond accordingly to one another in order to create a unified composition. This is also true for many world musics such as Klezmer, Steel Band, and Taiko ensembles whose rehearsals are generally group directed (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, p. 4). This could be largely related to the various reasons by which these musics were developed in the first place: communal expression of religious beliefs, preparation for war, and/or other ceremonial reasons (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, p. 4). In North America we inspire our students to play music due to extrinsic motivators such as exams, recitals, and concerts (Bartel, 2004, p. 56). Our children learn to see music performance as something to be viewed and listened to whereby the audience is far removed from the performers on stage (Bartel, 2004, p. 57). They are merely necessary onlookers, as they provide the purpose of playing with no participatory element.

2.3 Repertoire Selection

“Music for every Child - Every Child for Music”

Repertoire choice is informed by the expectations required by the curriculum, music experiences of the educators themselves, and available resources. But how might educators also consider their students when selecting the songs which compose the content of their lessons? The National Association for Music Education in the United States (MENC) stated its program vision as being: “music for every child-every child for music” (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 2). This statement implies that students might have some autonomy in choosing the music which they want to create and engage with. If we consider culturally relevant pedagogy, then the repertoire selected must be relevant to the needs and interests of all students, each of whom bring with them a wealth of various musical experiences and cultural identities. Any teacher striving towards effective
pedagogy will take into account the unique understandings and perspectives that students bring to their class.

**World Music Repertoire**

The Tanglewood symposium of 1967 was the first push towards a movement to implement multicultural education in music curriculums. “World music” courses arose at the university level in the 90’s as definitions of equity, pedagogy and multiculturalism were implemented (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 4). These did not generally translate into the elementary or high school systems because the university system had specialized instructors in specific world music genres. The demands on elementary and high school music teachers to learn a variety of world musics seem far too daunting since they also have to abide by the objectives laid out in the curriculum (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 4). Teaching resources for world music instruction are limited and leave teachers to their own devices to find repertoire and create lesson plans which include these musics (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 34).

With the continual development of educational technologies, the Smithsonian Institution has attempted to fill this void. This was an earnest effort by ethnomusicologists who were responding to the needs of educators to develop meaningful learning experiences in both music and culture (Our Mission and History, n.d., par. 1). If students are to learn through the lenses of a plurality of cultures, it is imperative for educators to develop a pedagogy which integrates the many contributions made by different peoples (Ladson-Billings and Tate, 2006, pg 11). This philosophy focuses on the fact that there are many equally valid forms of cultural expressions so that students may “develop a broad perspective based on an understanding of, a tolerance for, a variety of opinions and approaches.” (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 1).

**2.4 Multicultural Education**

**The Five Dimensions**

In 2004, multicultural educator James Banks proposed Five Dimensions of Multicultural Education (Banks, 2009, pg 57). These include content integration, knowledge construction, prejudice reduction, equity pedagogy, empowering school
culture, and social structure (Banks, 2009, pg 57). Content integration requires teachers to use examples from a variety of cultures to teach key concepts. Knowledge construction advises teachers to help students understand their own cultural assumptions and biases and how those construct their knowledge. Prejudice reduction uses teaching methods and materials to focus on racial attitudes of students and how those might be modified. Equity pedagogy requires teachers to facilitate student success from racially diverse groups by modifying their teaching (this includes differentiated learning strategies.) Finally, empowering school culture and social structure is central so that students are not labeled or grouped into categories and instead students from diverse cultural, ethnic, and racial groups are empowered (Banks, 2009, pg 57). The following is a model of Banks’ ‘Five Dimensions of Multicultural Education’ as he describes it (Banks, 2009, pg 57).

![Figure 1.4 The Dimensions of Multicultural Education](source: Copyright © 2009 by James A. Banks.)
These dimensions apply to music, which is considered a global phenomenon embodying a number of sophisticated traditions (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 5). Therefore music should be explored both globally and within the diversity of the student’s country—this is the basis of a fair and equitable practice (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 5). Music teachers are working with culture bearers in order to provide “authentic” notations and recordings to accompany them (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 35). “Authenticity” is difficult to acquire if a culture bearer is not present. For example I was taught a choral arrangement of a South African praise song while reading musical notation and singing with classical technique. In South Africa, I likely would have learned this song by ear and the vocal timbre would have differed enormously. Therefore performance can never be completely authentic; however, this should not be the goal of multicultural education. A meaningful understanding of the culture and music is more valuable than the replication of a culture’s music. The Smithsonian website includes a tab called “tools for teachers” which may help educators who are not able to incorporate culture bearers in the classroom (Smithsonian Education News, n.d., par. 1). This way we can make informed decisions on how to teach music and how to be respectful of its integrity by addressing the cultural traditions from which the music was derived.

**Benefits of Multicultural Education to Music Education**

Multicultural education not only informs the student as a global citizen, but can also develop sophisticated ear training (Campbell and Anderson, 2011). By exposing students to an array of musical palettes at a young age we are able to not only broaden their musical preferences, but also their attunement to tonality, rhythm, timbre, and texture (Campbell and Anderson, 2011). Additionally students begin to understand that western classical music is only one component of the plethora of complex and elegant music that is made globally (Campbell and Anderson, 2011). Students have an opportunity to construct music in a variety of ways. When students discover the parameters of a certain type of music, they understand the logic and artistry behind it (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 3). They further understand this in relation to western music; although the principles of a music may oppose those of western compositional
practices, students are able to understand its value and sophistication by appreciating its diversity and avoiding the comparison of being ‘right’ or ‘wrong’ (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 3). For example, Western music emphasizes consonant sounds whereas Javanese gamelan uses many dissonances in the tonality of their music. Students who do not have an understanding of the musical characteristics of Javanese gamelan may believe that the musicians are playing ‘wrong’ notes. They are not aware of their own musical biases. Therefore the terminology used by western culture might be inappropriate in describing the music of another culture (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). Sensitive and appropriate descriptions must be acquired so that we do not impose negative subtexts when describing world music.

One of the most significant reasons to teach world music is so that children acquire “poly musicality” (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 3). This means that children increase their ability to listen intelligently, perform many types of music, and acquire an appreciation and enjoyment for a variety of music. They acquire many different types of instrumental, vocal, compositional, and improvisational techniques. They are also introduced to new instruments and notational systems and as a result students become immersed not only in the music, but in the manner in which the music is learned and performed. When students study the melody, rhythm, texture, timbre, and harmony, students become more aware of aspects of Western music that they once took for granted and/or reappraise their previous beliefs of this music (Campbell and Anderson, 2011). Critical thinking and inquiry skills are active in all musics which they listen to and are involved with.

2.5 Music as Cultural Studies

Making Music Relevant in Schools

Music educators have many questions about what type of music they should teach and if they should seek guidance from culture bearers, method books, and repertoire resources or simply teach the music in a traditional theory based module (Dunbar-Hall, 2005). In North America we have adopted a method of teaching music as an understanding of a period of sounds and silences. Dunbar-Hall considers the possibility
of viewing music education as an opportunity to teach cultural studies (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 34). One of the implications of teaching music in this way is the uncovering of political debate which may spark inquiry on topics of poverty, ownership, and social justice (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 35). Teachers may not feel comfortable addressing these issues and/or may even feel that they have no place in a music class.

The term multiculturalism emerged from Canada in the 1970’s. In education it involves the use of teaching resources from a variety of cultures and the understanding that learning and teaching styles differ from culture to culture (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 35). Many music educators might argue that they already integrate a variety of world musics into their classrooms, but unfortunately this music is only explored aesthetically and thus superficially. Dunbar-Hall writes; “because music lessons regularly include music from a range of cultures, some members of the music education community mistakenly assume that music education already sufficiently addresses cultural issues through multicultural music education” (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 34). As educators we must strive towards giving our students the most “authentic” experience possible with music. Unfortunately, many times music teachers westernize the sound of African folk songs by singing the pieces with the usual chamber quality that a choir might sing a Bach chorale. It is not enough to introduce the repertoire aesthetically, but we must be willing to immerse ourselves in the style and context of the music. This is the critical consciousness that Ladson-Billings referred to in culturally relevant pedagogy (1995).

Multiculturalist pedagogy emphasizes the importance of pluralism which accepts the diverse approaches to all aspects of teaching and learning: “support for a tolerance of pluralism and comprehension of culture as a factor influencing contemporary life has not been a clear expectation of the multicultural focus of music education” (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 34). We must strive towards emphasis on appreciation while avoiding the use of western music as the benchmark that all other music must strive towards, a narrative many students quickly begin to acquire.
Cultural Studies Defined

Cultural studies emphasizes the relationship between cultures and questions the power dynamics and influences between them. Cultural studies developed in the 1970’s at the same time as postcolonialism which focused on the voices and opinions of the colonized rather than the colonizers (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 35). Cultural study “...defines the study of cultural artifacts, such as music, as a dialogue between the artifact, its creators and practitioners, and those who study it. It is concerned with exposing and deconstructing the positions of each of these to show how some cultures exert power over others” (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 35).

Cultural wars are taught in this subject to emphasize the importance of striving towards a truly equitable world (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 35). Although many music educators might agree with this statement, it is often easier to focus on register, timbre and tuning than to delve into these controversial issues (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). Often world music repertoire is taught through this western lens which emphasizes the previously mentioned components of register, tuning, etc. and dismisses the methods of teaching which are used in the country of origin of that music. For example, Pygmy music is highly improvisational and taught orally, but often in North American classrooms this music will be handed out in notation, notes might be plucked on a piano, classical singing technique might be applied and the music might be unrecognizable to someone of that culture. This becomes a form of cultural imperialism. The following is an example of a music lesson which incorporates culture studies as proposed by Dunbar-Hall:

Sample Music Lesson Using a Cultural-Studies Perspective

1. Listen to a song by an indigenous rock group, noting the topic of the song. How does the topic of this song relate to issues of indigenous life? How does the song further understanding of indigenous cultures?
2. From listening to the song, perform sections of it with your own accompaniment.
3. What sounds can you hear that might typify this song as by indigenous musicians? Are there instruments associated with indigenous peoples? How are these instruments
used? After performing these parts, notate them in some way—you might use standard Western notation or invent your own. Perform sections of the song again and incorporate these instrument parts into your accompaniment.

4. What languages are used in this song? What might be the reasons for using indigenous languages in rock songs?

5. Does the structure of this song reflect that of rock songs by other musicians?

6. How does this song help us understand something about indigenous people?

7. Use what you have learned from this song in the composition of your own song. Use a topic that is relevant to your own life and incorporate what you have heard in this song in the structure, sounds, and accompaniment of your song. Perform your song to the class and record it for future listening.

This lesson provides students with both meaningful engagement in music making as well as culture studies. It invites children to inquire about indigenous issues through the musical genre of “rock” which the students might already be familiar with. They are able to engage in conversation about the issues presented in the song as well as participate in music making by creating their own accompaniments to the piece. They can compare and contrast the instruments, language and structure of the piece to western practice in order to provide an understanding of the unique characteristics which compose this new music. The final project is to create a song about something that is meaningful to their own lives while integrating what they have learned about this new style of composition. The assignment allows students to develop an appreciation for the culture by exploring the structure, sounds, and accompaniment that reflect the practices of indigenous music. Through this example we can begin to acknowledge the opportunities for music educators to integrate culture studies through their lessons and through their repertoire selections.

**Suggestions for Change**

The “concept approach” teaches all music through the lens of duration, pitch, structure and other western music theory elements (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). This
leaves little or no room to explore music in the context of culture, it is a eurocentric lense in the study of sound. This is the objective for an alternative approach which places importance on many perspectives of teaching and learning music. “Pluralism not only of music but also of ideas about music, expectations of the music curriculum, and methods of delivering teaching—thus becomes an essential outcome of and rationale for the music curriculum” (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). This requires a great deal of effort from the teacher to be sufficiently informed about many different cultural point of views. This may seem an unfair requirement for music specialists who are having to address and incorporate an arguably separate subject area as part of their already demanding curriculum expectations. For this Dunbar-Hall makes some suggestions of the ways educators can begin incorporating a multicultural pedagogy into their music classes:

*Use the music terminology of a culture as its practitioners use it.
* Read descriptions of music by its creators and performers.
* Adopt teaching methods that correspond to the music being studied.
* Become aware of and teach from the aesthetic positions of each music being studied.
* Consciously identify received teaching methods as derived from Western thinking and seek out other methods, when appropriate. (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36-37)

_The Necessity for Cultural Studies in Music Education_

Unfortunately, with the decline of arts funding across Ontario and an associated push towards music lessons outside of school, music and other arts are not viewed as an integral component in academic life. It is therefore imperative that we seek solutions to provide relevant approaches in music education. Dunbar-Hall believes a solution to this could be with the inclusion of cultural studies: “Implementing a cultural-studies perspective will not be easy, but it would help music educators address what could well be their biggest challenge in the twenty first century—relevance (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 37).” This is a concern that haunts many music teachers and must be addressed so that we
can continue to implement music in schools and share music with children in their everyday lives.

2.6 Resource Review

Overview: Meeting World Music Press Guidelines

The book ‘Songs of Latin America From the Field to the Classroom’ was written by Patricia Shehan Campbell with Ana Lucia Frega. In accordance with the World Music Press guidelines, biographical information is available before the Preface of the text and the authors share their comments in the sections “About Latin American Cultures,” “About Latin American Musics,” and “Special Features and Instructional Uses for this Book and CD”. Ana Lucia Frega was the former president of the International Society for Music Education and is from Buenos Aires, Argentina. She meets the requirements as a culture bearer to at least one of the countries represented in the book; namely, Argentina. The C.D. attached with this resource demonstrates collaborations with many other culture bearers who perform in the field recordings.

The songs are prefaced with a contextual description, followed by a notated representation of the piece, a translation into English from the Spanish or Portuguese lyrics and several teaching suggestions which often include examples of activities and occasional dance instruction. The songs chosen were primarily nursery rhymes or pieces which would be considered children’s music with the exception of the final selection from Venezuela which lends itself towards a more experienced group due to the intricacy of the song.

The organization of the text is excellent as it divides the book into 9 sections according to the nine nations represented from Latin America which include Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Cuba, Guatemala, México, Puerto Rico, and Venezuela, each listed in the contents and presented in the text in this alphabetical order. Each country is visually represented on a map accompanied by brief descriptions of land and people; economy; education; language; customs and courtesies; appearances; families; recreation; food; and holidays.

Preface Observations
There were a few discrepancies between the statements in the Preface section and the content on the attached C.D. “It is a one-of-a-kind project that offers field recordings of singers from nine nations in Latin America” (Campbell and Frega, 2011, p. 3). Although this is true for 6 of these recordings, the songs ‘Arroz con leche’, ‘De Colores’, and ‘Ma Teodora’ present an exception; they are sung by Michelle Amato who recorded in Florida, U.S.A. The bright timbre and light texture of the voice in combination with the inaccuracies in the pronunciation of the language do not accurately demonstrate this style of the music, thus making it an unreliable representation of these cultures. In a few of the songs, discussed in detail later in this essay, the singing was out of tune and the instrumentation was rhythmically unsuccessful: “The field recordings are as authentic as possible and do not always project a perfectly musical performance, but should be valued for their authenticity.” (Campbell and Frega 3). This is not a representation of the authenticity of the music found in these nations and demonstrates a lack of understanding of style.

Thoughtfulness was demonstrated in the selection of repertoire: “All were real songs, alive and well, rather than artifact-songs” (Campbell and Frega, 2011, p.3) and thus serve as current representations of musical/cultural material. In the critique of other similar books, “…songs with singing voices trained far beyond the quality of the common singer… and songs that feature adult rather than children’s voices,” (Campbell and Frega, 2011, p.3) this book and accompanying CD address some shortcomings by offering songs easily singable by children and using indigenous instrumentation in the field recordings. This Preface also mentions Argentine ‘Tango’, Chilean ‘Nueva canción’, Mexican ‘Corrido’, and Brazilian ‘Samba’ which are not taught in this resource, but are useful guides in searching for supplementary material within popular genres of these countries.

**CD**

*divided by classroom and field tracks*

*Classroom Tracks*

The recordings for the classroom are presented using a children’s choir with guitar and percussion accompaniment. The higher range of these pieces lends itself to the
light falsetto singing heard on this CD. Although this is not authentic in keeping with the chest voice quality of most of the singing usually heard in Latin American countries, it is understandable to adjust to a vocal technique more suitable for children. The rhythms are always precise and discernible amongst the songs although sometimes this precision compromises musicality.

Specific Observations

- ‘Viva Mi Patria Bolivia’: Call and response between solo lines and the choir indicates a sensibility to the style of this music.
- ‘Adelita’: the rhythm feels straight and rigid and is missing the rubato demonstrated in the field recording.
- ‘Ma Teodora’: inflection and musicality of language is missed and the rhythmic accentuations are not heard easily.
- ‘Tamborcito’: the incorporation of church bells lends context to the recording and the guitar frills are a thoughtful addition and provide a sense of the style of this music.
- ‘El Barreno’: the instruction in the text indicates to listen for the drums as an indication for the initial entry; however, this was only discernible in the field recording and not the classroom version.

Application to Classroom: The teacher should listen to these recordings as an example of the performance quality one should expect from our students. It is not necessary to share these recordings with the class because the Field recordings provide a more appropriate demonstration of the overall style of the songs.

Effective Field Recordings

Arturo Costas of Bolivia performs ‘Viva mi Patria Bolivia’; he sings beautifully over top of guitar accompaniment. The text describes the way in which Latin American people first identify themselves with their nation and secondly as Latin people. The warmth of Arturo Costas’ voice and flowing legato line perfectly encapsulate this sentiment of pride in one’s country. The spoken portions in between verses in this recording are indicative of the casual style of music making and it’s connections with the
TEACHERS CHOOSE THE SONGS

audience. This music is intended to build pride among the working class. These are the differences that should be made known from a historical perspective with our students. The music of Haydn and Mozart was commissioned and more often than not meant for an elite class. The music of Latin America is often driven to promote social and political change and to create a sense of solidarity among its working class.

Teca A. Brito of Brazil provided the recording for ‘Bambu’. The principal singer has a pleasing soprano timbre and is obviously a native speaker. The children singing in the background add a level of authenticity and give listeners a sense of the function of this music which would be primarily sung in schools as a nursery rhyme. The accordion colours the texture of the instrumentation and provides the syncopated rhythm indicative of this music.

Mireya Alegria of Santiago Chile performs ‘El Rabel’. The historical context for this piece, as found in the text, indicates that this is the location of the last hispanic bastion in South America. The simple instrumentation of voice and guitar give focus to the subtle nuances of inflection of the language and musicality applied by the singer. The guitar is very steady and rhythmic.

Ethel Batres of Guatemala performs ‘Tamborcita’ which contains only voice and percussion and no church bells (as heard in the classroom recording). Excellent demonstration of style and interpretation of text. She also performs ‘El Barreno’ which is sung beautifully and performed with xylophone (meant to replace the marimba). The marimba is considered an instrument of ‘musica pura’ or pure music in this country and is essential to the style of this music. The classroom recording could be improved through the use of this percussion line.

Camerata Folklórica Octavo En-Re-Do of Venezuela perform ‘Llego Diciembre’ This is arguable the best recording on the CD. The singers and instrumentalists (including violinists) are excellent. The call and response between soloists and small ensemble of singers is perfectly representative of the community involvement of this music. The improvisational feel of this music demands a great deal of knowledge and command of the repertoire. All of the field tracks on the CD occurred in Merida Venezuela and thus,
unsurprisingly, this is the strongest recording.

**Problematic Field Recordings**

Beatriz Sanchez of Buenos Aires, Argentina performs ‘Chacarera’. This singer is out of tune for nearly the entire duration of the piece; lack of control and musicality questions the choice of this recording. Carlos Gardel and Mercedes Sosa are renowned singers from Argentina who are extremely well known in Latin America. When listening to recordings of these iconic Argentinian vocalists it is clear that this track is not representative of the kind of music making that Argentinians are accustomed to. The contributor Ana Lucia Frega is from Argentina and must have reasons for sharing this recording although she did not share any specific comments as to her choice of the inclusion of this track. The song is a nursery rhyme and meant to be humorous, perhaps this justifies the quality of the performance. In this case it would have been preferable to hear Argentinian children perform the piece.

Michelle Amato of Florida, U.S.A performs ‘Arroz con Leche’ representing Puerto Rico. This piece is well known throughout Latin America and thus the text should specify the origin and draw specific connections to this song and Puerto Rico. The song is described as a game, however, the text might be problematic if translated to the class. It describes a widow who is selecting a new mate and also makes connections between women and the activities of cooking and sewing. When presenting this in a classroom the instructor may need to place focus towards the activities which are included with the song while de-emphasizing textual meaning. The recording performs the song with a straight rhythm and legato line and is not characteristic of the style. The singer is clearly not a native speaker and inflections of the language are lost.

Michelle Amato also performs ‘De Colores’, representing Mexico. At the top of the page there is a spelling error ‘Mexican Americian’ [sic]. The association of this song with the United States of America is prefaced in the text which states that the migrant workers brought this song to California and it is indicative of Chicano identity. Recall that California was once a part of Mexico and therefore clarification of the date of origin of this piece would be helpful in defining the song as ‘American’. The light soprano
sound is out of tune and it was disappointing to occasionally hear the voice nearly a semitone flat. This is not at all an indication of performances from Mexican mariachi artists, who are practiced, professional musicians. (In fact, Placido Domingo, a Mexican operatic tenor, grew up singing mariachi.) The instrumentation in this piece evokes a good sense of the push and pull of rhythm and change tempos dramatically from verse to chorus, which is reflective of this style. The short and detached cadence which concludes the song is also a common tool used to end a piece.

Teca A. Brito of Brazil records ‘Cajueiro Pequenino’. The accordion has a great deal of trouble finding the syncopated rhythm at the beginning of the piece which disturbs the other instruments and vocal lines, which try to continue in spite of this. It seems that the song is intended to be played at a faster tempo, however, it is dragged behind because of the poor playing of the accordion. This does not illustrate the music of this nation which includes superb musicians such as Jobim, Gil, and Nunes.

Application to Classroom: The effective field recordings should be heard in the classroom and referred to often for rhythmic accentuation, pronunciation of the language, and as a general guide for musicality. If possible, supplement problematic recordings with more effectual renditions of the music and/or choose a new song entirely. The text provides many examples of artists and genres associated with each country and the instructor should feel encouraged to explore the plethora of music that is available. Another possibility is to have the instructor perform the song using appropriate instrumentation and perhaps allocate a native speaker of the language to teach proper pronunciation and inflection.

**Summaries of History**

*Brazil*

The introduction to Brazil is superficial, describing “Carnaval, glittering girls and tanned bodies.” A description of Brazil’s economy serves to supplement the rather stereotypical introduction.

*Chile*

Salvador Allende and Pinochet are named in the description of Chile, but there is
no mention of the devastation and mass murders which took place under the rule of the
dictatorship led by Pinochet. It seems that if the intention of the history portion of this
resource is to provide context for the music then it is necessary to situate these important
political figures in Chilean history.

Cuba

Cuba had a clear and concise description although Ernesto “Che” Guevara was
not mentioned as one of the primary forces spearheading the revolution with Fidel Castro.
He is also a well known icon in North America and could potentially be the catalyst for a
class discussion.

Mexico

In the description of Mexico, important figures such as Miguel Hidalgo and
Porfirio Diaz are mentioned, but a summary cannot begin to explain the history of this
country. General statements such as “more political unrest in the 1920’s and 30’s” are
incomplete. A discussion of American and Mexican relationships during this time period
is imperative for the classroom’s understanding of the context of the music as it is heavily
rooted in political topics. The resource is careful only to mention, but not discuss any
details, of the war between the U.S. and Mexico. In the introduction of a song the text
states that this “...song traveled with Mexicans to the U.S. through migrant workers in
California and became integral to Chicano identity.” It doesn’t indicate that California
was once a part of Mexico proper.

Puerto Rico

In the description of Puerto Rico the text states that Puerto Rican citizens are:
“divided by the issue of whether or not [to] request U.S. statehood.” This requires further
investigation of the history of this country.

Application to Classroom: Research the missing components of the country’s
history prior to the lesson being taught. It is imperative to be factual and demonstrate a
well rounded understanding of the historical events. Choose music selections from genres
such as the ‘Corrido’ from Mexico and ‘Nueva canción’ from Chile and make
connections to the history and political events which these genres erupted from.
Customs

The accounts of customs were very accurate and detailed even mentioning times in which people gather. Discussion of the different accents found in Latin America (i.e. porteno, castellano) provide a better understanding of the slight variances in language which are not to be misunderstood for dialects. Greetings for each country are given and vary slightly. Pastimes often overlap such as soccer, telenovelas and dancing. The celebration of Christmas on Christmas Eve with the opening of gifts at midnight occurs throughout Latin America. Food such as ‘empanadas’ are also found in many different countries with slight variances.

Application to Classroom:

Ask the class to share their own family customs. What kinds of music accompany these customs? For example; Christmas caroling can be used as a segway to teach ‘Llego Diciembre’ which celebrates the month of December and the coming of Christmas.

Corrections

Customs

Cinco de Mayo is not celebrated in Mexico, this is only recognized in the U.S.

Translation

English translations are very accurate with the exception of “Mrs. Chinita” which is actually a Chinese woman in ‘Llego Diciembre’ and “so the doves don’t mess it up,” should actually be, “the doves will eat them” in ‘Chacarera’.

Teaching Strategies

The ‘Teaching Strategies’ portion found after each song are very helpful in guiding educators towards an effective manner in which to teach this music. Very often at the end of these segments there is a list of music artists from the country and teachers are encouraged to seek supplementary material (i.e. Tito Puente, Puerto Rico; Celia Cruz, Cuba; Violeta Para, Bolivia). Extra research is imperative for building a well rounded understanding of a culture’s music. Activities and dances are often included; however, a visual presentation could be helpful in implementing these accurately. Methods of learning such as tapping the rhythm and pulse as well as the use of solfege are often
encouraged and include pictures.

Application to Classroom: An opportunity for an individual or group assignment could include researching one or more of the artists mentioned as important music figures in that country. Students could discuss biographical information; political and social content; and the characteristics of the music. Another task might be to perform a song and dance as notated and described in the book. Have the students reflect on the experience with the following questions: What were the challenges? What did they enjoy?

**Summary Impression**

This is an effective guide for teachers with a desire to delve into Latin American repertoire for the first time. The quality of the recordings on the C.D. vary widely and should be used with the intent to teach musicality and style. Supplementary material should be used if the tracks do not meet this objective. The historical content stated in the text serves as a foundation upon which further research is required by the instructor.

There is a great deal of repetition, especially in the areas of *Customs and Courtesies*, and thus it is important to note the cultural similarities within these nations while still taking note of their distinctions. The suggestions for activities and dance instruction found in the portions of ‘Teaching Suggestions’ are excellent tools in a classroom environment and can be a platform for the development of assignments and research projects. This is a practical teaching resource for Latin American music and has the potential to generate meaningful learning alongside auxiliary music examples and information.

**CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY**

**3.0 Introduction**

In this chapter I describe the procedure and process by which I collected my data and explain the criteria for the participants in this study. I compare and analyze my data and review the ethical considerations I have made as they relate to the research. The limitations and strengths of my methodology are also outlined and I conclude with a brief summary of the key methodological decisions and the reasons for these choices as it correlates to the objective of my research.

**3.1 Research Approach and Procedure**
This research study, undertaken according to the guidelines of the Masters of Teaching Program at the Ontario Institute of Studies in Education, uses a qualitative method approach to investigate the ways in which music educators incorporate culturally responsive pedagogy through their repertoire selections. Qualitative research allows for the study of things “in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them” (Creswell, 2013, p.44). This research will analyze the ways in which music teachers select and prioritize the music they present in their classrooms. It will investigate the specific choices of repertoire and their implementation in the classroom through the lens of culturally responsive pedagogy.

The strengths of qualitative research align well with this study as it aims to provide an in-depth understanding of the process of repertoire selection. It is through this method of research that we can reveal a “set of interpretive, material practices that make the world visible” (Creswell, 2013, p. 43). The purpose of this study is to expose the content which is being selected for the music classroom and how these selections meet the Ontario curriculum expectations of presenting a variety of music from diverse cultures (The Standards, 2009).

This research utilizes the case study approach to research which: “involves the study of a case within a real-life contemporary context or setting” (Creswell, 2013, p.97). A case study utilizes multiple forms of qualitative data to create a complete picture of the case (Creswell, 2013). This study combines the literature review and interview responses from participants. The literature review in chapter 2 provides the framework for my research as culturally relevant pedagogy which informed my analysis of the interviewees responses in chapter 4. It also situates music as a global practice and relates music education to culture studies.

3.2 Instruments of Data Collection

Data collection was conducted by interviewing 4 music teachers from Ontario. The information from the literature review serves as the foundation for the development of the interview questions (Appendix B). An opportunity to discuss the participants’ “lived experience” was accomplished through semi-structured interviews (Creswell,
This type of data collection allows the interviewer to create a plan which attends to the research question while also creating allowance for elaboration on behalf of the participant, who may provide new insight on the topic. The interviews were forty-five minutes to one hour in length and audio recordings were made with the consent of each participant. Notes were taken during the interview of any unspoken signals which were perceived to be relevant to the study. The interviews were transcribed verbatim to ensure that the data accurately reflected the answers of the interviewees. I strove to “conduct the interviews with participants in a comfortable environment where the participants do not feel restricted or uncomfortable to share information” (Turner, 2010, p.757).

A list of questions were developed in advance of the interview process. The questions were deliberately open ended so that the participants could reflect honestly and provide in-depth responses. The questions were also concise so as to allow optimal time for the participants to provide detailed answers (Roulston, 2010). I spoke 20% of the time in order to dedicate the majority of the short interview period to the participants’ responses (Dilley, 2000).

### 3.3 Participants

My goal was to uncover best teacher practices for implementing global musics in the classroom and examine these practices as they relate to culturally relevant pedagogy. I needed to find teachers with relevant experience and who felt passionate about presenting music as a global practice so that the music in their classrooms should be diverse and represent a variety of cultures. I wanted my participants to have come from a variety of musical experiences such as choral, instrumental, and classroom music, so that I could find specific strategies and/or commonalities among the pedagogies for teaching global musics in a variety of settings. I interviewed experienced teachers who are currently—or have recently—taught and could therefore provide the most progressive strategies that would help new teachers. I hope to be able to adapt and utilize the strategies and knowledge I have gained from these interviews in my own future classroom.
3.3.1 Sampling Criteria

Participants in this research were selected according to a criterion sampling; all participants were required to meet specific criteria in order to participate in an interview. All candidates satisfied the following qualifications for the study:

- They are classically trained musicians and hold a post-secondary degree in Music Education.
- They teach or have taught in the Greater Toronto Area.
- They teach or have taught music from a culture other than their own.
- They are willing to share and reflect upon their current/past teaching experiences.

It was not difficult to find classically trained music teachers, but it was necessary for my research because I wanted to demonstrate the intersection between western music pedagogies and global musics. I also wanted the candidates for my research to have experience working in the GTA because of the diversity that is present in the community. I wanted to know how, or if, teachers took into account student identity and cultural backgrounds when making repertoire selections. It was necessary for the teachers to have experience teaching musics from a culture other than their own so that I could examine the applications of culturally relevant pedagogy. Lastly, it was imperative to the interview process that all participants be willing to speak honestly and in depth about their teaching experiences as it pertained to the research. Once the candidates were selected they were sent an email describing the nature of the study and requested a response to confirm their participation. An interview date, time and place was selected immediately for those educators who agreed to participate in the research. Four teachers were selected. This number provided a variety of responses for this research while maintaining a manageable amount of information.

I want the findings of this research to be helpful to those music educators who are not comfortable presenting music they are unfamiliar with. I hope it serves as a model for those teachers who wish to incorporate a variety of musical styles and allow their students to have a voice through the repertoire selection process.
3.3.2 Sampling Procedures and Participants

In order to develop my research about the incorporation of culturally relevant pedagogy in a music classroom it was imperative that I find exemplary teachers who could infuse my research with insightful findings about their personal experiences with the repertoire they selected and share the perceived response from their students. I reviewed a list of previous teachers whom I already knew through my own schooling and contacted them through email. Some of these were professors, high school teachers and assistant teachers during my practicums as a teacher candidate at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. I narrowed the list to a group of 4 candidates who I felt had the most experience engaging with global musics and would provide insights and practical strategies for including a variety of musics in the classroom.

My participants needed to have experience implementing a variety of musics from diverse cultures and be willing to speak about the pedagogies that informed their approach when teaching these musics. I knew all of my participants, and experienced first-hand knowledge of a few shared experiences cited during their interviews. All of the research participants had been my teachers at some point during my academic career. They had experience in a variety of musical settings such as band, choral and classroom environments. All of the participants are experts in their fields and provided important insights into applications for culturally relevant pedagogy in music education.

3.4 Data Analysis

After the interviews were conducted I analyzed the transcriptions for themes. I compared these themes according to “cross case analysis” (Creswell, 2013) and presented the similarities and differences between the participants’ answers. The data was coded using descriptive and vivo codes. Descriptive codes compared the descriptions of participants’ quotes while vivo codes compared direct words. Analysis of similarities and differences in themes, strategies and classroom outcomes were also recorded using a color-code system so as to organize the data in an accessible way.
3.5 Ethical Review Procedures

Approval procedures for the ethical review for this research is granted by the Master of Teaching Program at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE). Participation in this study remained exclusive to teachers (not student candidates) and avoided interference by means of classroom observations. All participants were volunteers and were informed of their right to withdraw their participation from the research at any time. This was outlined in the consent form (Appendix A) which was sent to the candidates prior to the start of the interview process. This ensured that participants were fully aware of the premise of the research and informed them of their rights as an interviewee. The participants were asked to sign two copies of this consent letter, one to keep for their personal records and the other stored for my own records.

The interviews took place at a time and location that was convenient for the participant. Each interview was recorded; however, the recordings were destroyed once the transcriptions had been completed. During the interview, participants had the right to refuse to respond to any question. All data is stored on a password protected laptop and will be destroyed after 5 years. Finally, none of the participants in this study are named and their identities are kept confidential.

3.6 Methodological Limitations and Strengths

This research encompasses a wide range of literature on the topic of music education and culturally relevant pedagogy while presenting findings from teachers’ experiences. While the review is thorough, it is impossible to address all of the research which has been written on these complex topics. This research therefore is not to be read as a generalization, but instead as a set of specific experiences which belong to a select group of teacher participants. Therefore, “the intent of qualitative research is not to generalize the information…but to elucidate in particular the specific” (Creswell, 2013, p. 157). Acknowledging the voices and opinions of the teacher participants is the primary focus of my study and serves to inform my practise as a teacher. It cannot be assumed that the responses from this small group of teacher participants will extend to
other educators. With a research study of this scope and sample size, I am only able to highlight a limited number of ways in which teachers attempted to execute culturally relevant pedagogy through their repertoire selections.

I felt limited in the participant selection process as I could not interview the students themselves, or judge to what extent they actually engaged with the repertoire their teachers selected. I did not have the opportunity to observe the teachers implementing their lesson plans nor was I able to observe the response of the students to the selected music. This is likely the largest limitation as it omits the perspective of a major stakeholder in these case studies, the students.

Though this research neglects to give a voice to students, the voices of the teachers can be used for models in which other music educators can begin integrating culturally relevant pedagogy into their practise, and make more meaningful repertoire selections in the process. Repertoire selection can move from being teacher directed to student influenced and therefore serve the student body in a more powerful way. The perceived benefits give some insight into the strengths of incorporating this kind of pedagogy into the music classroom. The interview process also gave teachers an opportunity to reflect on their practise and the students’ responses to it. Through this type of research, music educators can learn about ways to thoughtfully select repertoire in order to create meaningful connections with their students and execute culturally relevant pedagogy in the process.

### 3.7 Conclusion

My methodology stems from qualitative research practises with a case study approach. In this way I am able to evaluate the unique “lived experience” of each teacher participant and make comparisons accordingly. This process took place through face to face interviews. Lastly, all participants had the right to withdraw from the study at any time. Chapter 4 will evaluate the responses of the interviews, draw comparisons and present themes from my findings.
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS

4.0 Introduction

The data collected in the following chapter attempts to answer the research questions described in Chapter 1: in what ways does a western classical music education affect the diversity of classroom repertoire selection? Also, in what ways do music educators promote diversity and inclusivity in the classroom, and in what ways does the cultural diversity of the student body inform repertoire selection? These questions arise from my own experience as a classically trained musician as I navigate the world of classroom music and attempt to accomplish the huge task of selecting the repertoire which my students will consume. As described in Chapter 2, I have framed my findings in the context of culturally relevant pedagogy. Through this lens the research can begin to reveal the implicit messages that are understood by our students about what is—and what is not—selected and the cultures that are valued in our music classrooms.

This chapter will outline overall findings from data collected during interviews with each of the four participants, as presented in Chapter 3. The questions for the interview can be found in Appendix B. The interviews were conducted with music educators who have been classically trained and have incorporated global musics in their classrooms. Several themes emerged during the interviews and those themes have been grouped together to present the ideas in a more cohesive manner. The thematic groups are as follows:

- Western Influences on Repertoire Selection
- Global Music as Risk Taking
- Teachers as Cultural Workers

4.1 Western Influences on Repertoire Selection

4.1.1 Pedagogy of Global Musics

Music systems in current North American classrooms privilege the western theoretical concepts of music, which include harmonic functions, notational systems, and transmission systems (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 1). This “concept approach to
Music” teaches all music through the lens of duration, pitch, structure and other western music theory elements (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). This leaves little or no room to explore music in the context of culture; it is a eurocentric lens in the study of sound. The pedagogies of Kodaly and Orff are then perfectly matched to teach this “concept approach” and are the pedagogies which are taught in the country’s renowned conservatories and faculties of music. All of the interviewees had knowledge of both of these pedagogies and all applied techniques to teach music from these approaches. These pedagogies may conflict with the practices of certain musical cultures. For example, Pygmy music of South Africa values an oral transmission of music over notational systems used in most western music. I assumed that music educators were using traditional western pedagogies to teach all music, however, the following examples show accordances and divergences to the latter prediction.

One of the participants taught a South African freedom song to her high school vocal class using musical notation and piano accompaniment. The musical score was published in this manner and so it seemed intuitive to teach the music with a traditional western approach. When asked how this teacher addresses the Ontario curriculum requirement to incorporate music from a variety of cultures, the participant responds:

“I think it’s important to know about that kind of stuff. I think it’s fun to experiment with that kind of stuff and sing that. It’s probably more of like a listening activity and maybe getting to perform it, but would think that maybe just to be aware of it.”

Here the participant justifies integration of global music as a mere listening activity and ‘maybe’ performance, and is mostly concerned with awareness. It seems that she is conflicted about the importance of global music or perhaps how it should be incorporated appropriately in the music classroom. Historical context of the pieces were never addressed from a global music perspective, but were addressed as an integral part of understanding western classical music. I expected that western classically trained music teachers would use western approaches, such as the use of sheet music in this example, to teach global musics. I was surprised to observe this participant’s confusion as to how to
incorporate music that she is unfamiliar with. Other teachers shared this apprehension, but sought out further instruction from culture bearers of the music they wanted to incorporate into their classrooms.

Another participant sought to teach a Carnatic—a style of South Asian music—song exactly as her teacher taught it to her:

“I taught a primary choir a Carnatic song in the Carnatic tradition...You sit cross
legged and you have a drone...you sing the syllables, but instead of do-re-mi it’s
sa-ri-garma...So I taught it exactly the way my teacher taught it to me...and they
were completely mesmerized.”

This instructor felt strongly about teaching the song within the pedagogical framework of the Indian culture and in order to accomplish this she took lessons from a teacher who was a culture bearer. Like classical musicians who study for copious years with experts of that music, this teacher sought out instruction from an expert in this genre of music. In this way the participant places importance on having an informed and knowledgeable approach to the music in order to respect the culture from which this music came from. Whether or not this is feasible for teachers requires further investigation. Countryman and Gould describe the barriers that prevent classical musicians from acquiring expertise in a global music genre: “Pygmy music of South Africa, for example, includes elaborate and intricate polyphonic rhythms and yet most musicians will only encounter this music if they choose to explicitly take a world music course as it is not readily included in any traditional Western music theory curriculum” (Countryman and Gould, 2009, pg 15).

Perhaps this begins to provide an explanation of an approach to world music repertoire which is often taught through a western lens and dismisses methods of teaching which are used in the country of origin. If we teach global musics through a western lens then we necessarily impose western musical aesthetics and values onto this repertoire. What is produced becomes music that is so far removed from its culture that it loses all sense of authenticity.

4.1.2 Striving towards Authenticity
Western classical tradition often strives to attain authenticity in accordance to the styles and aesthetics of the music. For a Baroque singer this may mean using straight tone and embellishments in the repetitions of the piece. Authenticity is arguably even more difficult to attain when western classical musicians attempt to attend to the styles and aesthetics of various global musics with only knowledge of music from their own field. As previously mentioned, Pygmy music is highly improvisational and taught orally, but often in North American classrooms this music will be handed out in notation, notes will be played on a piano, classical singing technique might be applied, and ultimately the music might be unrecognizable to someone of that culture (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). This section will address how educators attempt to attain some form of authenticity, how it is used to measure success, and how much importance should be placed on the pursuit of authenticity.

One of the participants describes a choral performance where the choir performed a South African spiritual:

“I think with African music the harmonies are really rich, if you have a real African choir the sound is very, very full and so I feel like we got that. Something happened where you guys just turned up the dial and it was out of this world.”

The participant describes a successful performance as the achievement of a sound which she perceives to simulate the sound of the culture from which the music came from. She describes the music and sound as African; however, the song is from South Africa. This is important to address since in this situation a musical culture is being attributed to an entire continent instead of the country of origin which maintains its own unique musical characteristics.

Another participant describes a rehearsal of a song from India and the difficulty she experienced in attaining an authentic sound. The teacher explains that one of the students in the choir was from India and was able to explain how to attain a more authentic Indian vocal quality:

“As much as I had listened to that vocal production I couldn’t really replicate it very well, and so we could tell in rehearsal that it didn’t sound quite right but
none of us in rehearsal quite knew how to fix it except one little girl from India who said: ‘It’s not like you’re singing nasal, but you really have to get it up on the top of your head’ and I thought that was such a great description...”

This educator describes working with the culture bearers in her classroom and allowing students to be experts in the pursuit of authenticity. This teacher had done due diligence through listening and researching the aesthetics of this musical culture, but also understood her limitations of understanding as a western classical musician. By collaborating with the culture bearers in the class the entire choir benefitted and that little girl was validated as an expert in the genre.

The pursuit of authenticity is driven by the responsibility to participate in a musical culture in a way that is informed, meaningful, and respectful, but a completely authentic sound is impossible outside the context of the music’s cultural bearers. The importance of authenticity must be weighed against the value of understanding another culture. The latter participant elaborates on this topic:

“And, I mean, did we sound genuinely Indian? Probably not, but you know, she was able to contribute in a way that validated her without, you know, othering her. In the end she was happy with it and the parents who heard it were happy...”.

The message here is that authenticity does not override the profound lessons that the choir learned from their peer. They were able to gain an understanding and appreciation for the music and the people who created it. This would have been impossible had the choir not had an opportunity to perform this music and discuss the complexities of vocal production with a culture bearer. These profound connections and understandings of a musical culture would have never occurred had the instructor only selected repertoire according to her expertise as a western classical musician.

4.1.3 Choosing Repertoire

Music educators make decisions about what musics will and will not be represented in their classrooms, and as a result which cultures are and are not included in the music curriculum. The influences and rationale behind these decisions are significant
since the music which is presented in class will inform the student’s perception of music as a whole. Reynolds explains that "repertoire selection has a major impact on what students will and will not learn and it should help their musical understanding and appreciation" (Reynolds, 2000, p.31). The repertoire selected, along with how it is presented, will determine whether students gain an appreciation for music as a global practice and understand the connection that they have to this human experience.

One of the participants described the importance of balancing western and global music. This teacher explained that she has decided that every time her students hear a song from a western culture she would also play a song from a different musical culture. She explains the importance of presenting diverse repertoire:

“I think because it all exists. Not to be valuing or privileging because if we only play western music, I’m saying that this is the norm of music and that other music is different.”

Three out of the four educators mentioned that it was important not to value western music over other musical cultures in order to avoid the perception of a hierarchy of musics. Western classical music must not be the standard from which all other musics are compared. It is important to note that the same educator who strives to balance the western and global music repertoire in her class, admits that this does not apply to her band class since they are ‘just trying to learn the instruments’. Her band class is compiled of western classical brass and woodwind instruments and she uses a method book to teach. When teachers are constrained to western music contexts such as band, the purpose of the class (as this participant clearly stated) is merely to learn an instrument. When we restrict our music educators with western instruments, which play primarily western music, we cheat our students of the opportunity to learn within a global framework.

Repertoire selection can also be affected by access and availability of global music. While western classical music is easily distributed through use of written notation, many global musics are based in oral traditions; this makes publication of these musics increasingly difficult. The demand for global musics are not near the popularity of
western music, which presents a financial concern for publishers. One of the participants elaborates on this issue:

“I was really concerned with the issues of capitalism and the issues of publishing... I was really distressed at the lack of concern publishers (have) and for accuracy, for representation of the music and even the way it was described... now some of those descriptions I would call racist.”

The educator describes the inaccuracies in the notation of these musics, but also the racist descriptions of the music. I was surprised to learn of the appalling practices of music publishers. Navigating through these prejudices as an educator makes it even more imperative to teach and perform music in a way that is respectful and representative of the cultural traditions of that music. For these and other reasons explored below, there are significant risks of failure when teaching and performing global musics in mainstream culture.

4.2 Global Music as Risk Taking

4.2.1 Teacher as Expert

Musicians such as the participants in this research have dedicated years to developing the technique, styles, and history of western classical music. They are considered expert musicians in their field of study, but in the context of another musical tradition they once again become novices. The teacher must then perform due diligence in learning and informing themselves about the global musics they choose to present in their classroom. This requires a great deal of effort from the teacher to be sufficiently informed about many different cultural points of view. This may seem an unfair requirement for music specialists who are having to address and incorporate an arguably separate subject area as part of their already demanding curriculum expectations. The risk of failure as a novice in a new music is significant since lack of skill and/or knowledge in the music may cause students to disengage or have other negative reactions to the repertoire.

Three out of four participants mentioned the use of technology to gain information regarding language pronunciation, musical aesthetics, and historical context:
“Over the last 10 years the internet has become an amazing resource. So if you want to do a song in Hebrew, you can look up the pronunciation. There’s no excuse to not really know anymore.”

The educator reflects on the accessibility to acquire the knowledge required to teach music which she is unfamiliar with. Another teacher adds that her strategy is to provide opportunities for discussion and in this way, students and teachers learn together. Therefore neither is required to be an expert.

“This is what I’ve read. Does anyone know anything about it? And open up the conversation.”

Creating dialogue and encouraging student insights creates a classroom that Dunbar-Hall describes as pluralism: “Pluralism not only of music but also of ideas about music, expectations of the music curriculum, and methods of delivering teaching—thus becomes an essential outcome of and rationale for the music curriculum” (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). Open discussions and ‘teacher as guide’ are important instructional strategies that should be applied when teaching global musics in order to reduce the risk of failure and increase the opportunities for student engagement.

Another participant describes her reservations and precautions about the music that she chooses to incorporate into her classrooms:

“And the other problem is how much of an expert do you have to be to teach music of a different culture… So I’ve studied Carnatic music, so I taught that music in school, but I’ve done a bit of African drumming so I would be wary. I look to bring in culture bearers and I don’t look at representing the class. I look at more, what is my expertise and what do I feel comfortable teaching and I’ll teach.”

This teacher describes the importance of being an expert in the music she teaches and shares her decisions to invite culture bearers in order to assist her in teaching music she is unfamiliar with. This ensures that the music is presented in a respectful manner and within the framework of the culture’s traditions. The inclusion of a culture bearer reduces the risk of failure when presenting unfamiliar music to a class.
4.2.2 Descriptive Language

One important pedagogical decision involves the language which students and teachers use to describe the music. Reactions to unfamiliar music can involve superficial dismissal of music from students who laugh or label the music as ‘weird’. The tonalities and rhythms of musics from different cultures can oppose the values of western music. For example, western music prefers tonal music with few dissonances, but Javanese gamelan prefers many dissonances and varying tempos. Students might describe this music as having “wrong notes” or “lacking melodic themes” and use only negative descriptions rooted in comparison to western classical concepts. Therefore the terminology used by western culture might be inappropriate in describing the music of another culture (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 36). Sensitive and appropriate descriptions must be acquired so that we do not impose negative subtexts when describing world music. Educators must not allow western music to become the model from which all other musics are judged, otherwise students will fail to accept any other music as equally valuable.

All teachers described some hesitation from students to accept music that they had not heard before. One of the participants described how she modeled the appropriate vocabulary to describe all music in a respectful manner:

“So, I’ll say ‘well, we don’t say it’s weird, we say, well, I haven’t heard this before.’ Just trying to think of it that way and I guess that’s a normal human reaction to laugh... but to just kind of redirect the laugh to ‘Oh I never heard anybody sing like that before’”.

The teacher does not dismiss or scold the students reaction, but instead helps the students to accept the music through prompting. The same educator describes her rejection of the common philosophy that music is a universal language. She explains that music is complex, that each culture has its own language from which they express their music, and that those languages must be learned in order to be understood and appreciated. Tools for description of global musics along with open mindedness can allow students to navigate through them successfully and minimize the risk of failure.
4.2.3 Breaking the Mold of Western Tradition

Open mindedness must be applied when programming recitals and performances which incorporate global musics. Formal concerts stem from western music tradition and therefore the addition of global musics will often intersect with western culture during assemblies, recitals, and so on. "The confrontation of the cultures is the destiny of our times, and the bringing about of this confrontation in a meaningful manner is the great cultural-political task of our century. We, the music educators, can contribute significantly" (Egon Kraus, 1966 in Volk, 1993, p.137). This statement makes the subject of music fundamentally important in establishing equity and social justice in our school communities, but there is evidently a huge risk of failure when ‘Jingle Bells’ is not included in the annual Christmas concert.

One teacher describes the tension between staff members when creating a program for the traditional Christmas concert:

“Well, you know: ‘they should just sing only Christmas songs.’ Mostly I hear teachers, there are teachers and parents who feel strongly about Christmas.”

This teacher chose to implement a recital of global musics which she named “Winter Lights” in lieu of a traditional Christmas concert. It incorporated the common theme of ‘light’ across a variety of cultures that were represented through music and poems. She tries to explain the rationale for the apprehension towards global musics:

“Well, I mean, I guess the things that are more familiar to them is going to be easier for them to accept.”

Certainly this teacher took a huge risk in re-inventing the Christmas concert in an effort to give students a broader perspective on the diverse customs which are practiced during the winter season.

Another participant describes her experience with Carnatic music with a group of students who were unfamiliar with the culture. She asked the children to choose the repertoire they would like to sing for the concert from the songs they learned in class and they chose the Carnatic song they learned:
“And this was not a diverse classroom, there was not one student who was not Anglo, you know? So there was no diversity whatsoever and here are all these little kids singing this Carnatic song and it was so well received by the community.”

She describes her feelings of accomplishment at the success of the event:

“The Carnatic music performance...I really put myself out there. Huge risk of failure, you know because it was something that was really dear to me...”

The teacher understood her risk of failure and therefore the success became even more gratifying. As another educator put it: “…the one thing that unites all people is music…”; this was accomplished at this concert. This instructor understood that the risk of failure was outweighed by the reward of having her students appreciate a music and culture that they had not interacted with before. In this respect, this teacher is a cultural worker because she is concerned with creating an environment which promotes equity and social justice (Knoester and Yu, 2015). This topic is further explored in the final theme.

4.3 Teachers as Cultural Workers

4.3.1 Significance of the Cultural Context

Western classical music spans many languages and composers from various European, American, and Commonwealth countries. Although the repertoire within the framework of western classical music may be diverse, it does not come close to providing a complete view of music as it exists globally. One teacher interpreted global music as any music sung in a different language, but we must be careful to distinguish western classical music as something that has been inherited by North American musical institutions and is therefore part of our mainstream culture: “Because music lessons regularly include music from a range of cultures, some members of the music education community mistakenly assume that music education already sufficiently addresses cultural issues through multicultural music education” (Dunbar-Hall, 2005, pg 34). Italian art song, German lied and French chausson is not sufficient in representing diversity of culture and this is one misconception which was revealed during the interviews.
Teachers are usually left to their own devices to find the context of global music repertoire in order to create a connection with a specific culture (Dunbar-Hall, 2005). There is a risk then that if students do not understand where the music comes from, they assume ownership. This is a missed opportunity for students to gain an appreciation of the originating culture of a piece of music. This can be rectified if educators make it a priority to develop an understanding of the origins of a musical piece. One of the participants explains that it is not enough to perform the music without also understanding the culture which it came from:

“...cross cultural understanding, well you’re not going to do it from singing or playing a piece of music, but if you sing or play a piece or several pieces of music from the same culture with some intentional investigation of what the culture is like then it becomes meaningful...”.

This interviewee understands that music cannot be treated purely aesthetically. In order for meaningful learning to occur students must understand the cultural context from which it was derived. To dismiss culture would be to rob students of building personal connections and understanding of people from other parts of the world.

4.3.2 Influence of Students’ Cultural Backgrounds on Repertoire Selection

It was agreed by all of the participants that it is imperative for students to understand and appreciate music on a global scale, but it is impossible to represent every single musical culture that exists. Therefore one theory suggests that teachers select repertoire according to the diversity present in our students’ cultural backgrounds. In contrast, all of the interviewees explained that their selection of repertoire had less to do with the cultures present in their student body and more to do with their own personal connection to the music. I found this to be a very surprising finding since culturally responsive pedagogy suggests that educators teach to the cultures present in their classrooms. One educator explains her rationale:

“The genre of the piece never mattered to me as much as whether or not I actually liked the music. And the language didn’t matter as much... so putting that
together with the emotional part of the music was always a driving factor for me”.

This perspective was accompanied by the importance of selecting the ‘best of the best’ repertoire regardless of genre. All of the educators expressed the importance of students knowing what good music is, and the responsibility of the teacher to select music that everyone can “sink their teeth into”, as described by one participant.

Another interviewee had a poignant explanation for deliberately not selecting repertoire according to the cultures which were present in her classroom:

“One theory is that you are inspired by the student population and I think that’s really dangerous... who am I to teach reggae or make the assumption that the Jamaican kid likes reggae, you know?”.

This is contrary to culturally responsive pedagogy which states that students should be culturally competent in at least mainstream culture and their own culture or mainstream culture and one other culture (Ladson-Billings, 1995). For those minority students this could mean risking ‘othering’ those children regardless of the teacher’s incentives for inclusion. This ‘othering’ opposes the objective of building a global understanding and community.

4.3.3 Building a Global Community

The participants were asked to express their thoughts on the objectives of music education and they all agreed that participation in music creates a sense of unity. This sense of unity was further explained by some interviewees as the understanding that music is a global experience and something that every cultures participates in:

“Music makes us human. It’s the one thing that unites all people and all races is music because every single person is musical and every person has a musical culture...”.

The objective for music education, at least in part, is then to establish a well rounded perspective of music as it exists in the world. As a result students gain appreciation, and some understanding, for the culture and the people who create that music. Music teacher Edmum Shupman believes that teaching multicultural music promotes understanding of
the cultures from which it [the music] came from and therefore teaches a hidden
curriculum which promotes social justice and equity (Volk, 1993, p.146). To this respect,
music educators who choose to teach global musics are cultural workers who seek to
promote equality and celebrate diversity.

Another interviewee explained the importance of including global musics in her
curriculum:

“I firmly believe that music from every part of the world has value and conveys
something that any other person can gain something from, if they have some
understanding of the culture in which it arises.”

Some music educators believe strongly that music must be used as a vehicle to teach
cultural understanding and thereby equity (Dunbar-Hall, 2005). Music then becomes
more than a subject which teaches us an art form, but a platform for building a global
community.

“Music is a vehicle through which we can come to understand each other better.”
The educator demonstrates an appreciation for the larger global community and
understands the potential that music has to create global citizens. This participant reflects
on her reasons for entering the field of music education and asks, “what am I contributing
to the world?” It is clear that this teacher feels music is a powerful tool which can be used
to create positive societal change. She strives to contribute something meaningful to the
world through the cultural work instigated by global musics.

4.4 Conclusion

Music educators must adapt to the contemporary needs of a diverse and global
society. In the context of the music classroom the repertoire defines the curriculum and
thus it is imperative that the songs selected represent music from a global perspective.
Traditional western pedagogies may conflict with the skills and practices necessary to
respectfully and effectively present global musics in our classrooms. Introducing global
music then brings a risk of failure because educators must compensate for their lack of
skills and knowledge in these areas. By incorporating culture bearers and expanding upon
existing knowledge and strategies, this risk can be reduced. Educators can confidently
lead their students in the direction of a more equitable and diverse approach to music education which recognizes the art form as part of a global practice. This philosophy focuses on the fact that there are many equally valid forms of cultural expressions so that students may “develop a broad perspective based on an understanding of, a tolerance for, a variety of opinions and approaches.” (Campbell and Anderson, 2011, pg 1). Chapter 5 will provide a thoughtful summary of my key finding and research points, make recommendations for the application of this research in the music education field and how these findings have shaped my personal practice as a music teacher.

CHAPTER 5: Implications

5.0 Introduction to the Chapter

In this final chapter I will address key findings that answer my original research question: *In what ways does a western classical music education affect the diversity of classroom repertoire selection?* And sub-questions: *In what ways do music educators promote diversity and inclusivity in the classroom? In what ways does the cultural diversity of the student body inform repertoire selection?* The results of this research study have led me to make suggestions for the educational research community as well as ideas and practices that I can adopt and utilize within my own teaching practice. I will then move towards discussing the implications of my research for the larger education community and for my own practice. I will make recommendations to other members of the education community and lastly, I will suggest areas where further research is still needed.

5.1 Overview of Key findings and their Significance

In Chapter four, my findings were categorized into three headings; Western Influences on Repertoire Selection, Global Music as Risk Taking, and Teachers as Cultural Workers. I explored the significance of teaching all musics through a western lens, regardless of the cultural practices associated with the music. By teaching through western pedagogies and imposing western aesthetic values onto music we ignore the people and cultures from which that music originated. A concept teaching approach narrows the focus to western music values. It is important for educators to look beyond
the western canon of music in order to demonstrate the variety and richness of all musics present in our global community. It is also not sufficient to superficially introduce these musics into the classroom while ignoring the historical and cultural context of the repertoire. In order for our students to value and respect all musics they must understand the origins of the repertoire we present in class. Otherwise we risk the misconception of ownership of musics which do not belong to the western canon and miss an opportunity to value another culture’s music (Dunbar-Hall, 2005).

Introducing global musics, however, does not come without significant risk to teachers. Music educators will likely not be experts in a variety of global musics and must therefore depend on culture bearers and resources to educate themselves on the traditions and styles of a variety of repertoire. They should not only understand the music itself, but also the pedagogy by which the music is taught in that culture. It is not acceptable to teach a South African praise song through the western pedagogy of notation and piano accompaniment when practicing culturally responsive pedagogy. We must take into account the oral tradition of this culture and the appropriate instruments and aesthetic which represent the music. We will never achieve authenticity, but we can attempt to respect the integrity of the culture through an informed and respectful pedagogical approach.

This philosophy of valuing all musics will inevitably mean that teachers encounter barriers with western musical traditions. In my findings we revealed the lack of support when a teacher attempted to reform the traditional Christmas concert in order to be more inclusive of all traditions. When teachers interpret music as a vehicle for equity and social justice, they may be vulnerable to resistance and tension from staff and parents who are unwilling to part with customs of mainstream culture.

5.2 Implications

This research process has allowed me to connect with educators who share the philosophy that music is a vehicle from which we build communities. I have also come to understand some of the barriers and challenges that these instructors face including an educational foundation based in western tradition, a lack of resources for a variety of
musics, and a lack of support from their school communities. The interviews revealed that some teachers feel that it would be beyond their abilities—disrespectful, even—to teach music without appropriate expertise. This confines teachers to the genre of repertoire within their own expertise, which for many educators will be restricted to the western canon. The Ontario curriculum states that we must teach musics from a variety of cultures and traditions and yet it was clear from my interviews that teachers either felt that it was beyond their range of knowledge, or that they had to perform strenuous due diligence in researching and becoming experts in new musics. Finally, one interviewer displayed a lack of awareness of the western approach to global musics; this is a reflection of personal values and an upbringing in an educational system that only taught western music and pedagogies.

My intent with this research was to discover how teachers are meeting the Ontario curriculum expectation and if it is being met through a culturally responsive pedagogical approach. All teachers felt that representing a variety of musics was important, although only some understood that representation of a variety of musics meant more than just a simple listening activity. Those who understood the potential for music to be used as a vehicle to teach cultural understanding, and thereby equity, were instructors who taught and performed music in a way that maintained the cultural integrity of the repertoire (Dunbar-hall, 2005). It is important to note that while all of the teachers incorporated musics outside of the western canon, not all educators taught within the cultural framework of the music. All of the educators had backgrounds which were rooted in western classical music and some taught through this western lens while others strived to present the music as authentically as possible. The Ontario curriculum provides no guidance for those educators who seek to not only present a variety of musics from different cultures, but also to teach the repertoire as it would be presented in the context of that culture. I hope that educators can learn from the interviewees and be inspired to teach global musics in their classrooms in an effort to represent music as a global practice. It is an experience that is shared by all cultures and our students should acknowledge that their practices are only a small part of a large international community.
5.2.1 Broad: The Educational Research Community

The qualitative research that I have accumulated through my literature review and four interviews with music teachers offers insights for the educational research community. The Ontario Arts curriculum describes the importance for students to gain appreciation for: “the similarities and differences among the various forms of artistic expression of people around the world” (The Standards, 2009, pg 3). An entire section of the curriculum is devoted to anti-discriminatory education and its role in the arts. It explicitly states that teachers should: “avoid choosing only male artists’ work or only European works for study” (The Standards, 2009, pg 49). My research adds that it is not only sufficient to include a variety of works, but also address the presentation of these works. This will define how, or if, all musics are valued equally. One of the interviewees taught a Carnatic song using the appropriate solfege from that culture. If she had used the traditional western solfege she would have been dismissing the cultural practices and peoples of which that music belongs. The curriculum should then include a statement about the ways our pedagogy as teachers must adapt according to the cultural practices from which the artistic work is derived. Otherwise, as one interviewee expressed, we might feel validated in presenting global musics only for the sake of “being aware of it”, but never unpacking the richness and wealth of a musical culture and appreciating it for all its complexities and uniqueness. It is not sufficient to merely perform a listening activity, but instead to perform, compose and experience a variety of musics in authentic interactions with the repertoire. If we are to avoid creating a hierarchy of cultures then we need to ensure that teachers understand the extent of the dedication required to present all musics with the integrity to cultural context that they deserve.

Music specialists are usually required to have an undergraduate degree in music and will have expertise in primarily a western genre. As these musicians go on to teaching careers, they may carry a bias towards western music that they may be unaware of. This was the case with my first interviewee who taught all musics through a western
lens. My experience in my own undergraduate degree meant I was only required to take a half credit course in a world music of my choosing. In my entire four years as a music education major, I was only required to take one semester of a non-western music (and performance majors were not required to take any). If teachers have been educated to value the western canon above all else, then how can we begin to address the variety of musical cultures that the curriculum requires us to represent? Increasing the length of global music courses to full year courses will provide students the opportunity to address the skills required to play these musics with increasing confidence and appreciation. Furthermore, these courses should have extensions into second, third, and fourth year courses so that students can become experts in a music outside of the western canon. This is the practice of culturally responsive pedagogy and these are the expectations of the Ontario curriculum. It is therefore only logical that the institutions that are preparing music educators ensure that future teachers are competent and skilled in a vast array of musics. This will also require hiring a staff which is culturally diverse and paying them the wage that a professor teaching the western canon is paid. Preparing music education majors to teach in a global community is imperative to their success as Ontario teachers (who are required to implement anti-discriminatory education practices and represent art from a variety of cultures).

Professional development and resources as well as a supportive educational community are significant in creating a successful, culturally responsive music education model. Opportunities to work with culture bearers should be accessible to teachers and school boards through workshops. I have participated in an African drumming workshop in a Toronto school and it was exciting to watch teachers and students learn music from an expert in the genre. It helped to make the teacher more confident when she took over this unit and it exposed the children to an authentic representation of the music. Professional development such as this will guide teachers in their own pursuits of inclusion of global musics in their classrooms. Additional resources which indicate not only the repertoire, but also the cultural context of the work will be imperative to effective culturally responsive pedagogy. As mentioned in my interviews, online
resources such as the Smithsonian website or world music guides written by Patricia Campbell of the University of Toronto are excellent tools that teachers should utilize when addressing musics from a variety of cultures. I am concerned that when music is solely dedicated to band (with western instruments), or when teachers are bound to method books, students may not be exposed to a diverse range of musics. It is imperative then to provide resources both online and hard copy that assist teachers in the implementation of musics which they are unfamiliar with in all contexts of music whether band, vocal, or otherwise.

Finally, the school community must be supportive of a teacher who attempts to push the boundaries of traditional western music practices. In Chapter 4 we met a teacher who encountered resistance from her staff for wanting to create a Christmas concert which was more inclusive of many practices during the winter season. If school communities understand the value of social justice and equity then we can begin to form an atmosphere that is welcoming of these shifts towards a more inclusive environment. Administrators and parents must empower their music teachers to perform cultural work in order to successfully implement our curriculum’s mandate for anti-discriminatory education.

5.2.2 Narrow: Professional Identity and Practice

I studied classical music as a voice major during my undergraduate degree and I began to understand the hierarchies and discriminatory practices that are perpetuated in our post-secondary institutions. I had an interest in Spanish music—particularly music by composers De Falla and Granados. I loved the flamenco qualities of this music. I remembered them from my childhood and enjoyed singing in my first language. My vocal teacher at the time felt that I had too many songs in Spanish on my repertoire list and explained that this was “frill” repertoire. She was directly comparing the value of a music which I held closely to my identity as lesser than the western canon selections which she valued. In that moment, I had accepted this as truth—that in fact the musics sung in French chausson, German lied, and English art song were more important than the Spanish repertoire that I loved. I believed this to be factual information until I took a
course on music from a cultural perspective. The same institution that had taught me to value the western canon was challenging me to look at music as a global practice and understand the value of all musics.

These academic collisions made me realize that I had allowed a part of my identity to be devalued in order to be embraced in an exclusive community of western classical musicians. This revelation inspired my research to seek out ways that music education could be implemented through culturally responsive pedagogy. The teachers I interviewed made it clear that: “music is a vehicle through which we can come to understand each other better”. This instructor understood that her role as an educator meant that she had to perform cultural work, and that this required the courage to teach against traditional norms of music education (Knoester and Yu, 2015).

The teachers who I interviewed helped me understand the subtle complexities of being culturally responsive. This kind of pedagogy requires that every student be fluent in mainstream culture, their own culture or one other culture (Ladson-Billings, 1995). This implies that we must represent student culture in the repertoire that we select, but a few of the interviewees had opinions that diverged from this philosophy. One teacher pointed out that we should be cautious of implementing the musics of the cultures we find in our classes because we may in fact be ‘othering’ those students despite our good intentions to include them. This truly transformed my approach in the process of selecting repertoire.

As an educator I have to teach music in a way that showcases a variety of musics from different cultures while being sensitive to the cultural identities that are present in my class. One of the interviewees told a story about how she had chosen an Israeli peace song for the class to sing that day, but one of her students had refused to sing it because his brother had been killed by an Israeli soldier. This made me realize that we must not only attend thoughtfully and knowledgeably to the musical cultures that we choose to represent through our repertoire selection, but also to the cultural identities that exist in our classrooms. We must consider the intersection that arises from the cultural context of the repertoire and our students’ identities in order to select music thoughtfully and sensitively. In my future classroom, I will have a better understanding of the challenges
and complexities that arise from teaching music through a culturally responsive lens, but also the important and necessary outcome that this will have in creating social justice and equity in our global community.

5.3 Recommendations

I present my research as one philosophy: that music is a vehicle from which we can teach social justice and equity. If other educators agree than it is important that we begin to encounter the biases that are rooted in our own musical identities. Teaching outside of the framework of western pedagogy and repertoire may seem like a lonely and daunting task, and indeed teachers will encounter inevitable barriers and obstacles. However, with professional development, global music resources, and support from administrators and parents, music educators can begin to overcome these challenges and allow students to value all musics and make connections to cultures outside of their own. Understanding the intersection between student identity and the cultural context of the music will be imperative in effectively implementing culturally responsive pedagogy. This requires teachers to form strong bonds with their students in an effort to build an inclusive environment. Administrators need to understand the demands of an increasingly diverse global community and support their students and teachers to continue to grow, learn, and adapt to the world as global citizens. Providing teachers with a variety of instruments, workshop opportunities with culture bearers, and resources will be the foundation from which successful anti-discriminatory education can begin.

5.4 Areas for further research

My study focused on culturally responsive pedagogy in the music classroom and the decisions that educators made during the repertoire selection process. Further studies could delve into the complexities of the implementation of these musics. Currently Kodaly, Orff, and Dalcroze are the standards by which we teach music, but further research might suggest a new pedagogy by which we might be able to adapt to the needs of a variety of musical cultures. There is also the problem of method books and western-style bands which restrict our teachers to instructing solely from the canon, or only addressing global musics in a superficial manner that encourages students to
perform the music without any real knowledge of its cultural context. More research needs to reveal ways that we might include global musics into a band program and uncover the reasons why so many music educators feel bound to method books, and their narrow view of music. Finally, we might consider the ways in which teachers are implementing anti-discriminatory education in the arts as mandated by the Ontario curriculum.

5.5 Concluding Comments

Music is a practice that is shared by every culture in the world. It is a uniting force that has the potential to build communities through understanding and enjoyment of another people's musical expression. One of my interviewees eloquently stated what I have now adopted as my own teaching philosophy:

“I firmly believe that music from every part of the world has value and conveys something that any other person can gain something from, if they have some understanding of the culture in which it arises.”

By understanding musical context, we can influence understanding of people and as a result influence a sense of connectedness to a broader global community. One of the greatest music educators of our time once stated that: "The confrontation of the cultures is the destiny of our times, and the bringing about of this confrontation in a meaningful manner is the great cultural-political task of our century. We, the music educators, can contribute significantly" (Egon Kraus, 1966 as cited in Volk, 1993, p.137). Equality and acceptance of all peoples is imperative in the promotion of social justice and equality. Music educators have an incredible vehicle by which students can explore, experience, and appreciate musics and the cultures from which they are derived. The only decision left is to decide if we are ready to accept this important task.
Appendix A: Letter of Consent for Interviews

My Name is Gabriela Farias and I am a student in the Master of Teaching program at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education at the University of Toronto (OISE/UT). A component of this degree program involves conducting a small-scale qualitative research study. My research will focus on the integration of culturally responsive pedagogy in the context of Music education. I am interested in interviewing teachers who thoughtfully select and teach music repertoire from a variety of cultures. I think that your knowledge and experience will provide insights into this topic.

Your participation in this research will involve one 45-60 minute interview, which will be transcribed and audio-recorded. I would be grateful if you would allow me to interview you at a place and time convenient for you, outside of school time. The contents of this interview will be used for my research project, which will include a final paper, as well as informal presentations to my classmates and/or potentially at a research conference or publication. You will be assigned a pseudonym to maintain your anonymity and I will not use your name or any other content that might identify you in my written work, oral presentations, or publications. This information will remain confidential. This data will be stored on my password-protected computer and the only people who will have access to the research data will be my course instructor Dr. Arlo Kempf. You are free to change your mind about your participation at any time, and to withdraw even after you have consented to participate. You may also choose to decline to answer any specific question. I will destroy the audio recording after the paper has been presented and/or published, which may take up to a maximum of five years after the data has been collected. There are no known risks or benefits to participation.

Please sign this consent form, if you agree to be interviewed. The second copy is for your records. I am very grateful for your participation.

Sincerely,

Gabriela Farias
647-519-2584
gabriela.s.farias@gmail.com
Appendix A: Letter of Consent for Interviews

Course Instructor’s Name: Arlo Kempf

Contact Info: arlo.kempf@utoronto.ca

Consent Form

I acknowledge that the topic of this interview has been explained to me and that any questions that I have asked have been answered to my satisfaction. I understand that I can withdraw from this research study at any time without penalty.

I have read the letter provided to me by Gabriela Farias and agree to participate in an interview for the purposes described. I agree to have the interview audio-recorded.

Signature: __________________________________________

Name: (printed) _______________________________________

Date: __________________________________________
Appendix B: Interview Protocol

Thank you for participating in this interview for my Master’s of Teaching Research Project. The aim of this research is to learn the ways in which music educators execute culturally responsive pedagogy through their repertoire selections. The interview should take approximately 50 minutes. I will ask you a series of closed and open-ended questions focused on your personal music education, how you came to teach music, your values as an educator and significant challenges you have faced as it relates to the research topic. I want to remind you of your right to choose not to answer any question and your right to retract your responses. Do you have any questions before we begin?

Section 1: Background Information

1. Tell me about your own music education.
   1. a) Where did you study music?
   1. b) Did you perform in formal/informal environments?
   1. c) What kind of repertoire did you play?
2. Why did you choose to pursue music initially?
3. To what extent do you consciously base your own music lessons on the way you were taught?

Section 2: Teacher Practices

4. What brought you to the decision to teach music?
5. How do you begin to plan a music unit?
5. a) Where do you start? What considerations do you make?
5. b) How important is repertoire selection in your planning process?
6. The Ontario music curriculum states that we are to: “...teach music from a variety of cultures and traditions”. How do you address this expectation in your classroom?
6. a) In what ways does the racial/cultural diversity in your classroom influence your repertoire selection?
7. How do you approach teaching music from a culture other than your own? (i.e. seek help from a culture bearer)

Section 3: Beliefs/Values

8. In your opinion, what is the principal objective of music education?
9. Is it important to present a diverse range of music from a variety of cultures?
9. a) In what ways might this benefit your students?
10. Is there a connection between repertoire selection and student engagement?
11. In what ways do you promote inclusivity and diversity in your music classroom?

Section 4: Next Steps/Challenges

12. Describe a situation where you taught/student’s performed/attended a master class of a music from a different culture. What was the students’ response?
13. What are some obstacles you have encountered/negative feedback you have received when presenting music from a different culture?
14. What was your most memorable performance to date and why?
14. a) What music did you perform?
14. b) What made it memorable?
15. What is the take away message you want your student’s to leave your classroom with at the end of the school year?

Thank you so much for your time and participation in this research. Your wealth of experience and knowledge as a music educator is an invaluable asset to this study.
References


