THE CRITICAL ATTRIBUTES AND DESIGN OF A MUSIC PARTNERSHIP STUDY GUIDE

by

Alison Kenny-Gardhouse

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts
Graduate Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
University of Toronto

© Copyright by Alison Kenny-Gardhouse (2016)
Abstract

Community Arts Organizations such as symphonies and opera companies play an important role as partners in school education through the provision of concerts, artist residencies and mentorship programs. The curriculum that accompanies any partnership endeavor can dramatically impact the quality of the student’s experience and subsequent learning.

This thesis identifies that a successful music partnership study guide is relevant, prepares students for the concert experience, makes the music come alive, and builds teacher confidence. These attributes were determined through an analysis of artifacts from the study guide writing team, and a survey to a sample group of teachers whose students attended the performance associated with the study guide. The study examines how knowledge of these critical attributes affects the design process. For this part of the research I examine my own practice as a curriculum writer and use my working notes, emails, drafts, and final products as my data.
Acknowledgements

To the many who have helped and encouraged on this journey, thank you.

To my thesis supervisor, Dr. Linda Cameron, you have my deep gratitude and appreciation. Thank you for your ongoing support, patience, and endless wisdom.

To my committee member, Dr. Lee Bartel, thank you for keeping me on track with your feedback, questions, and redirects.

To Jo Ann Isken, thank you for back of the napkin inspiration and reading of many drafts.

To Dr. Leslie Stewart Rose, thank you for reading, commenting, and prodding.

To Catherine West, with whom I have happily authored many study guides, thank you for your joyful approach to the work.

Finally, to my family – Mark, Gillian, and Jamie – thank you for your humour and encouragement, every step of the way.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... ii

Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................................. iii

Chapter One The Music Partnership Study Guide ......................................................................... 1

   Introduction to the Study ........................................................................................................... 1
   Who *Are* These People? ......................................................................................................... 1
   Purpose of the Study .............................................................................................................. 2
   Researcher Construction ....................................................................................................... 3

   Research Questions ................................................................................................................. 5

   Definition of Terms .............................................................................................................. 6

   Stakeholder Needs and the Partnership Landscape .................................................................. 7

       Educational Institutions .................................................................................................. 9

       Research Benefit ............................................................................................................. 10

Chapter Two Literature Review .................................................................................................... 11

   Mapping the Inquiry ........................................................................................................... 11

       Part One: The World of Arts Partnerships ...................................................................... 11

       Arts Learning ................................................................................................................. 11

       Effects of Arts Learning ................................................................................................. 13

       Increased Student Engagement ...................................................................................... 15

       Strategy: Arts Integration ............................................................................................... 15

       Strategy: Interacting With Works of Art ......................................................................... 17

       Strategy: Direct Work With Teaching Artists ................................................................. 18

       Context: The Field Trip and Place-Based Learning ......................................................... 20

       Part Two: Curriculum Design .......................................................................................... 22

       Background on Curriculum Theory and Approaches ....................................................... 22

       Curriculum Practices That Are Relevant to Music Partnership Study Guides .................. 24

       The Six Facets of Understanding ..................................................................................... 25

       Inspiring the Teacher ........................................................................................................ 27
List of Tables

Table 1 Analysis of the Six Lessons From The Magic Flute Study Guide ........................................57
Table 2 Blending of Information From Teacher Survey and Writing Team Artifacts .......................61
List of Figures

*Figure 1.* Teacher responses: How confident were you in your ability to engage your students with the opera, before reading the study guide? After reading the study guide? .................................................................................................................. 41

*Figure 2.* Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the Mozart section of the guide............................................................................................................................................. 44

*Figure 3.* Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the All About Opera section of the guide............................................................................................................................................. 45

*Figure 4.* Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the CD Listening Guide for *The Magic Flute* ............................................................................................................................................. 46

*Figure 5.* Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the following study guide Lessons. ............................................................................................................................................. 47

*Figure 6.* Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the Black Line Masters Section of the guide............................................................................................................................................. 48

*Figure 7.* Distribution of types of understanding throughout *The Magic Flute Study Guide*. ............................................................................................................................................. 65
List of Appendices

Appendix A *The Magic Flute Study Guide* ..................................................... 91
CHAPTER ONE
THE MUSIC PARTNERSHIP STUDY GUIDE

Introduction to the Study

The opera crowd looks a little different today. The usual pre-curtain quiet is replaced with a loud buzz punctuated with laughter and shouts. Two patrons jump over the seats when they realize they are in the wrong row. The ticket holders around them aren’t bothered in the least and carry on with their animated conversations. Heads nod in time to inaudible music…puzzling until I notice the tell-tale white iPod ear buds. The house lights dim and instead of a hush, the crowd erupts with a roar of approval as the curtain comes up on The Magic Flute.

Who Are These People?

This audience is comprised of middle and high school students from local and surrounding schools situated in the mid-sized and ethnically diverse Canadian city. They are attending a student matinee of one of Mozart’s most loved operas. For most it is a first time experience with live opera. For all, they are having an “encounter with a work of art” (Zakaras & Lowell, 2008, p. 20).

They are receptive at this point, but I know this age group can turn on a dime. How will they respond when the orchestra starts or when the curtains open on Prince Tamino being pursued by a larger than life serpent? Will there be snickers, snorts of derision? Will they go back to their conversations and ignore what is happening on the stage? This time, throughout the 2-plus hours of the opera the teens listen intently, roar with laughter at all the right moments and keep their eyes glued to the stage. Soon the opera is over and 2,000 students are standing on their feet clapping and cheering throughout prolonged curtain calls. They erupt when Papageno comes out for his bows. They clearly love the Queen of the Night and Pamina, and the evil Monostatos, whose performance has been utterly riveting, is acknowledged with almost rock star status. An older man nearby watches the students, turns to me, the opera company’s education consultant, and says in amazement, “There’s the future.” I, too, am struck by how much like seasoned opera-goers these students appear. They (mostly) demonstrated concert etiquette, were attentive
throughout, clearly able to follow the plot, laughing, hushing and applauding at all the appropriate moments. And they were passionate in their responses – so much so that they would fit right in with the audiences at La Scala!

How was it that they arrived at the theatre that day with this capacity to enjoy and respond so easily? After all, isn’t opera considered to be hard to understand and part of the rarified cultural canon only accessed by older and more affluent audiences? Many factors such as previous musical studies (Skoe & Kraus, 2012), exposure to other art forms (Hill, 2008), family experiences and listening background could have informed their experience today. This study aims in part, to examine the role of the study guide used by teachers to prepare the students for this performance, how it was used by the teachers, and how teachers perceived the usefulness of the guide.

**Purpose of the Study**

Community arts organizations such as symphonies, jazz centers, and opera companies play an important role in music education through the provision of concerts, artist residencies and mentorship programs. They reach large numbers of students and teachers. In 2015, American orchestras offered more than 10,000 education concerts (League of American Orchestras, 2015). The curriculum that accompanies any partnership endeavor can dramatically impact the quality of the student’s experience and subsequent learning.

There are two primary aims of this thesis:

1. to identify the critical attributes of a music partnership curriculum, specifically, the study guide resource used to prepare students for a live performance; and

2. to suggest a process for the design of music partnership curriculum products such as study guides.

The first aim will be determined through an analysis of a survey to a sample group of teachers who used *The Magic Flute Study Guide* in preparation for attending the opera with their students, a qualitative analysis of three open-ended questions from the teacher survey, and a qualitative analysis of the artifacts from the email conversations of the study guide writing team.
For the second aim I examine my own practice as a curriculum writer and use my working notes, emails, drafts, final products, and assessments from several study guides as my data.

**Researcher Construction**

In analyzing the sources of data for this study I drew heavily on my own experience as a music partnership curriculum developer. The following section provides some biographical information to establish my credibility and ability to act as an expert in the field of music partnership curriculum design. It describes the education and early work experiences that shaped my beliefs and honed my skills, and provides an accounting of the breadth and depth of my professional work as a designer of music partnership curricula.

Over the past 17 years I have worked as an arts-in-education consultant designing education programs and products for community arts organizations. Prior to this, and concurrently with the consultant work, I have always taught and continue to teach, ranging from music specialist in public schools, K-8, professor of voice in musical theatre at the college level to sessional instructor in education at the university level. My musical background is as a singer with work in opera and musical theatre. Early in my teaching career, I taught with two school districts in programs that were structured to provide music instruction to students and their teachers; in other words, everything I taught to the students had to be understood and carried forward by their teachers, frequently someone with limited music training and who was understandably nervous about their ability to teach music. These early experiences sharpened my skills in working with generalist teachers and convinced me of the importance of being able to effectively convey to them the ways that music can live and breathe across the curriculum. Training as an Orff specialist (an approach to music education) further deepened that belief and also developed in me a valuing of the importance of children being given circumstances that set up opportunities to create music. From my training in Dalcroze Eurythmics I gained an appreciation of the body as a kinesthetic means of learning and knowing. And from my education as a credentialed teacher in the province of Ontario, I had the benefit of being required to be proficient in the teaching of all subject areas in the Junior-Intermediate grades, including Language Arts, Mathematics, Social Studies, Science, Physical Education, and Visual Arts. This gave me a deeper understanding of learning across the entire curriculum.
My body of work as an arts-in-education consultant includes the development of 50 study guides for music partnerships – representing music community arts organizations from across North America (including symphonies, opera companies, choral arts groups, and theatre groups) and school districts. A portion of these have been study guides written for the specific purpose of preparing teachers and students for attending a concert, while some have been developed to facilitate long and short-term artist residencies. I have developed guides and units of study for provincial online curriculum teacher resources, and have authored an online arts-infusion course for teacher accreditation with a continuing education organization that is partnered with teacher education faculties throughout the United States. Finally, a significant amount of my output has been as lead developer for an arts-based school improvement model that is used in schools across America. In this capacity, I wrote the methodology manuals and designed the professional development modules for teacher training, led the training of trainers, and supported the implementation of the model in over 30 schools. This has allowed me to work with hundreds of grade-level teams of teachers on the design, implementation and assessment of their arts-based units of study, and to see the impact of the model on students and school cultures.

Work as an arts-in-education consultant often involves bringing together two different worlds: the community arts organizations (symphonies, operas, theatres, dance companies) and educational institutions (school districts, schools, teachers, and students). While these two sets of stakeholders come from different vantage points and have different expectations and aspirations, they have a shared goal of making life better and more rewarding for the people they serve (Weiss, 1972). I have witnessed powerful collaborations that have benefitted the performing arts organizations and the education institutions equally. I have also seen time and money wasted when teachers are not adequately supported, either through lack of professional development or relevant resources.

The performing arts offer significant life experiences for students and their teachers (Burton, Horowitz, & Abeles, 1999). Experiencing arts performances first hand and in person is exciting, thought provoking and offers a way of seeing and understanding the world that is different from classroom learning. Many of these art forms are surprisingly relevant to the lives of students. Consider the plots of most operas – they deal with love, abuse of power, social injustice, human weakness, obsession, death – the stuff of real life – issues that humans have
grappled with from the dawn of time. Interacting with works of art, as one does when attending a performance or exhibit, can be humanizing and transformative.

I believe that what happens in the classroom prior to attending a concert can hugely impact the formation of lifelong attitudes about and interest in an art form. A class that arrives at the performance already engaged with the idea of what they are about to see or hear has a vastly different experience than the class that does not. A music partnership curriculum is potentially a powerful way to scaffold a student’s understanding of what they are seeing or hearing. By identifying the critical attributes of such a curriculum we can positively impact the quality of these products. If successful, this research will lead to community arts providers being better informed on how to approach the design of music partnership curriculum products.

Research Questions

How does knowledge of the critical attributes of a music partnership curriculum influence its design?

Research sub-questions:

- What are the characteristics of an arts (music) partnership?
  - What pedagogical strategies and settings are common to arts (music) partnerships?
  - How are students affected by arts (music) partnerships?

- What are the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide?
  - How did teachers use the study guide?
  - Did use of the study guide help teachers?
  - What did teachers perceive as the most helpful features of a concert study guide?
  - How did teachers feel their students were affected by their use of the study guide?
  - How does a concert study guide scaffold a student’s learning?
  - What are the actions associated with co-authorship that a music partnership curriculum might embrace?
Definition of Terms

For the purposes of this study, community arts organization is the term used to describe the various arts organizations that bring visual and performing arts to the public. They include (but are not limited to) symphonies, opera companies, theatres, art galleries, and dance companies.

Arts partnerships happen when one or more groups partner on a specific arts-related event, project, or goal. Partnerships are often formed between a community arts organization and a school, or school district. For example, a symphony may have a set of schools they partner with to bring musicians into classrooms, or a dance company may partner with a school district to bring students to performances in the studio. Large-scale arts partnerships such as the Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE) bring multiple groups together city-wide. CAPE’s full implementation brought together 37 schools, 53 professional arts organizations and 27 communities (Catterall & Waldorf, 1999, p. 48). At its height between 2003 and 2008, Learning Through the Arts (LTTA) in Toronto, Canada, was an example of a national arts partnership. It involved over 100,000 students in 400 elementary and secondary schools and had associations with 350 artists across Canada (A. Elster, personal communication, April 10, 2016).

A music partnership is simply a type of arts partnership, with music as its core focus. It involves one or more music organizations in collaboration with an education institution or other community organization. This might range from a classroom, school, a family of schools, an entire school district, or a provincial or federal group. The partnership may be formal in the sense that it is structured with funding and assessment attached, or it may be informal, such as a grassroots outreach on the part of a few musicians.

A music partnership curriculum refers to a resource guide or course of study that supports the music partnership endeavor (e.g., an in-school concert, an out-of-school performance, an artist residency). For in-school concerts these are most often study guides sent ahead to the school containing information about the performers and a description of what the students will see or hear. Some include student worksheets (often related to instrument identification and several musical terms) and a few related classroom activities for the teacher to use. Out-of-school performance materials are similar and will also include information about the
performance venue and behavior expectations. Increasingly, music partnership materials are found online, making connections to provincial curriculum expectations or state content standards more accessible.

When asking, “What are the critical attributes of a music partnership curricula?” the words *critical attributes* are defined as being the qualities of a curricula that lead to successful outcomes. In the case of a study guide, the primary outcome or indicator of success is that students have a positive and pleasurable experience at the performance, and have an increased capacity to understand, enjoy, and interact with the art form. Within this overarching success outcome are other indicators that reflect the needs of the two main stakeholder groups of a music partnership; the community arts organizations (administrators and artists), and the educational institutions (administrators, teachers and students), described in the following section.

**Stakeholder Needs and the Partnership Landscape**

As funding for school arts declines (People for Education, 2013; Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011) community arts organizations have increasingly stepped in to fill the gap. The majority of symphony, opera, dance, theatre companies, and art galleries have education departments and have become deliberate in their planning and commitment to providing education outreach in schools and the broader community. Furthermore, most non-profits must meet the requirements of the corporate sponsors who have very specific community-based goals for how their sponsorship dollars are used. Interestingly, since 2008 the amount of government funding for the arts in Canada has risen by 15%, while corporate support for the arts has risen 49% in the same period.¹

To varying degrees, community arts organization artists and administrators view active participation in schools and education as a social responsibility, evidenced by a willingness to commit money and resources to reaching underserved communities. Some have an impassioned belief in the transformative power of the arts and want to share knowledge of their specific art

---

¹ This information came from a presentation by N. Anderson on March 25, 2015, at a CNAL (The Canadian Network for Arts & Learning) conference panel I attended. Anderson’s analysis was based on data from CADAC (Canadian Arts Database/Données sur les arts au Canada) as compiled by the Research and Evaluation Section of the Canada Council for the Arts (1,500 arts orgs in 2008; 1,600 in 2014).
form, like Bramwell Tovey, conductor of the Vancouver Symphony Orchestra, speaking to the Trustees of the Vancouver School Board (Tovey, 2010):

I do not bring these remarks to you from a lofty aesthetic perch. I grew up in England in the East End of London – my father died when I was a boy. Without the band and orchestra experience that I benefitted from in the state school education that I received, I would never have been able to compete and succeed in the music profession. As a single parent my mother could not have afforded the cost of these activities. I have a personal motive for standing here tonight – I don’t want a kid like me to fall through the cracks because of this proposal.

After a recent VSO educational concert of Beethoven’s music at the Orpheum in Vancouver, a teacher wrote to us with a comment penned by a young student who had spent his brief life in foster care due to a litany of misfortune that made Beethoven’s disability seem negligible by comparison. He wrote: “It was the most beautiful building I have ever seen. It was the most wonderful music I’ve ever heard. It was the greatest day of my life.” That is the power of music – to heal, to inspire, to communicate, to transform and so much else besides.

Community arts organizations also understand that supporting arts education is a proactive business strategy. In noting that demand for the arts is not keeping up with supply, Zakaras and Lowell (2008) identify that an individual’s ability to respond critically to the arts (being able to see or listen, then discuss and reflect to deepen understanding) is a key component in building demand. There is also recognition of the evidence that adults who have had arts educations in childhood become higher consumers of arts (Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011). Given that audience development is crucial to the health of community arts organizations, a commitment to supporting arts education makes sense. Arts partnerships make it possible for community arts organizations to support arts education in way that is tangible, and have the added benefit of enhancing the organization’s public profile.

An outcome that community arts organizations look for in a partnership is that their art form is highlighted in student learning and is represented with integrity. In a study of symphony partnerships, Meyers (1996) identified that high priority goals in their education programs were
exposure to classical music, enhanced music learning and audience development. A study guide plays a key role in this.

For reporting purposes (to funders) community arts organizations may want a partnership to show that significant numbers of students are involved, or smaller numbers with greater depth (depending on the intent of the partnership), and sometimes, that underserved populations are reached (depending on the intent of the partnership).

**Educational Institutions**

When queried about their motivation for involvement in an arts partnership, educators’ remarks reflect a commonly shared belief in the benefits of arts learning. For some time now, I have opened professional development sessions with the question “Is an arts education important? Why or why not?” The response seldom varies. Teachers and administrators all believe it is important and are able to describe in some detail why it is and how their students benefit. This is an interesting response especially when one considers that I frequently work in schools where the arts programs have been cut or significantly reduced.

Administrators, teachers, and students will each have slightly different expectations of an arts partnership and different criteria for success. Administrators will first look to see how the arts partnership aligns with the curriculum. Any use of dedicated school time for an arts partnership must serve the mandated educational goals of the district and the individual school improvement plan. Partnerships that require significant commitments of time and money for staff training and resources (as is the case where arts partnerships figure in school reform models or school improvement initiatives) will need to be reflected in the School Improvement Plan (SIP) and tracked accordingly.

For the generalist teacher, an arts partnership is often communicated as seeing value for their students in participating in a cultural event that enriches their lives. Teachers also identify a high level of engagement when the students learn through the arts and note that the benefits extend to the development of community and collaborative skills. Arts specialist educators value an arts partnership for its ability to bring students into contact with a high level of artistic expertise and a vision of what the students are studying can lead to. In the case of artist
residencies it offers the specialist the opportunity to collaborate with another artist-educator which is often a highly validating experience (Booth, 2009).

**Research Benefit**

Much has been written about the benefits of arts education in general and music education specifically. A body of research exists and is ongoing that explores arts education in the context of such areas of cognitive effects, transfer of learning from the arts to other disciplines, impact on creativity, and student engagement. In the past two decades researchers have studied several different models of arts integration, tracking the effects on student achievement, arts learning and teacher and school climate (Rabkin & Redmond, 2004). However, very little has been written about the curriculum that supports a music partnership and even less has been written about the process of its design. Clearly this study meets a need.

Through this study, a group of educators have had the opportunity to express how they feel about the effectiveness of a study guide used for a music partnership experience. They have made suggestions for improvement and given feedback on what aspects of the curriculum were most useful for their teaching situations. The information provided by the participants potentially informs the design process, leading to improved curriculum products in future teacher guides. This provides valuable feedback not only for the arts provider, but for the larger arts community as well.
CHAPTER TWO
LITERATURE REVIEW

Mapping the Inquiry

The purpose of this study was to determine the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide and suggest a process for the design of similar music partnership products. In light of this, two major areas of literature were critically reviewed: (a) arts partnerships and (b) curriculum design. A review of the literature on arts partnerships provides an understanding of the types of arts learning associated with arts partnerships, the effects on learning, and the contexts and strategies used in arts partnerships. A review of the literature on curriculum design provides a background on theories and approaches to curriculum and then identifies current practices relevant to the design of music partnership study guides.

Part One: The World of Arts Partnerships

The following pages examine the literature on arts partnerships and identify current trends and practices that may help to inform the design process of music partnership study guides. I begin by examining how arts learning is defined and described and then focus on trends emerging from arts partnerships; the educational settings, contexts, and strategies common to arts partnerships in general and music partnerships in particular.

Arts Learning

When partnerships are formed between schools and community arts organizations, students learn in different ways. The learning is often more kinesthetic, requires deep listening and observation, and collaboration and creativity are highlighted. Grumet (2004) identifies the complexity of thought that the arts invite – originality and idiosyncrasy, authorship that reflects what the student thinks about the world, and public evidence of this thinking. The skills and habits students develop through arts learning help them reach higher levels of thinking and being. Eisner (2002) suggests that the arts be considered as a model for teaching the so-called academic subjects and identifies the key actions that the arts teach us; comfort with diversity and
variability, attention to relationships, and imagination that invites students to see things other than the way they are. Eisner (2002) uses the term “flexibly purposive” (p. 206), suggesting that the means by which an outcome is reached can change according to the opportunities presented by the learning. Most types of artistic creation are by their nature “flexibly purposive”, with artists, choreographers, composers, poets, etc. being able to adapt, refine and redirect as they create. Eisner (2002) states that “artistic activity is opportunistic” (p. 206). This type of flexibility requires a higher level of cognitive work than simply following steps to complete an assignment or goal. Artistic process values this and is present in many types of arts learning. Community arts partnerships that bring students into contact with teaching artists are ripe with opportunity for this type of activity.

Arts partnerships typically embrace aspects of discreet arts (or skills-based) learning and/or arts integration pedagogies. Skill-based teaching focuses on developing the specific skills and knowledge related to the art form, while arts integration focuses on ways of learning other things through the arts (Snyder, 1996).

Zakaras and Lowell (2008) suggest a four-pronged or comprehensive approach to teaching the knowledge and skills that enable people to enjoy and understand works of art.

1. the capacity for aesthetic perception, or the ability to see, hear, and feel what works of art have to offer
2. the ability to create artistically in an art form
3. historical and cultural knowledge that enriches the understanding of works of art
4. the ability to interpret works of art, discern what is valuable in them, and draw meaning from them through reflection and discussion with others.

Their definition of “arts learning” envelops teaching and learning within the K-12 public school system, instruction and exposure provided by arts organizations, and out-of-school learning with private instruction. While Zakaras and Lowell (2008) are speaking specifically to the subject of building a demand for the arts, their four-pronged approach is relevant to this study because building demand is a by-product of arts partnerships and certainly is one intent in the development and use of a music partnership study guide.
Effects of Arts Learning

Increasingly, research is identifying the positive effects of arts learning, in and out of school. In Champions of Change: The Impact of Arts on Learning (Fiske, 1999), seven major studies sought to measure the impact of arts experiences on young people. The studies showed that schools with high arts participation had a greater effect on students from low-income backgrounds than students from high-income backgrounds; that the arts effectively reach disengaged and at-risk students; and that programs with an arts integration focus saw academic gains. It should be noted that the arts experiences measured in these studies involved arts learning at significant levels, including full-fledged traditional arts programs, which is different than the range of experiences afforded through community arts partnerships, hence my intent here is not to claim these benefits for arts partnerships but to draw attention to the benefits of arts learning in a general way. A more direct connection to arts learning resulting from community arts partnerships in Champions of Change: The Impact of Arts on Learning, is Catterall and Waldorf’s (1999) study of the Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE) which found positive changes in school climate, including principal leadership, focus on instruction, collegiality and shared leadership. Community arts partnerships are a significant aspect of CAPE’s structure.

A subsequent publication, Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development (Deasy, 2002) presents 62 summaries of studies exploring current practices in arts education in American schools (including both traditional arts programs and some community arts partnerships) and the effect on student achievement and personal growth. It further identified beneficial effects of the arts for children at risk – significant impact on basic reading skills, language development, and writing skills; focus and concentration, skills in expression, persistence, imagination and creativity; and development of a wide range of skills and behaviours such as collaboration with others, tolerance, and attention to moral development.

James Catterall (2002), one of the contributing authors to both Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development and Champions of Change: The Impact of Arts on Learning suggests that one of the most compelling findings of the combined studies is that of the relationship between arts and children at risk:
Critical Links shows two clear streams of outcomes for economically disadvantaged children. One is a set of effects related to reading skills – basic reading comprehension for children who have in fact been left behind. An added set of effects for the children is increased achievement motivation. While motivation to achieve in school comes in various forms in the literature and across the compendium’s studies, probably the most central is a tendency for the arts to promote both certain competencies for children who struggle across the curriculum as well as genuinely grounded feelings of competence and engagement. Feelings of competence and engagement can impact outlook and approach to schoolwork more generally – and research on the arts finds impacts showing both increased attendance and fewer discipline referrals. And the limited number of studies we found addressing special needs populations show that arts activities associate with particularly important outcomes: writing and reading skills, oral language skills, and (of great importance to struggling learners) sustained attention and focus. (¶5)

The Deasy analysis (2002) explored questions about transfer of learning, or the application of arts learning into other areas of study. Many of the studies in Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development produced results that suggested transfer of learning, although the claims were specific to each study and general conclusions were not drawn. Ingram (2003) in a review of Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development notes that this concern of demonstrating transfer of learning in the arts is treated differently in non-arts areas of study:

While the field of mathematics challenges itself to help students apply mathematical concepts to real world problems, advocates for the arts often focus on transfer of learning across contexts that are much more dissimilar – for example, dance teachers who seek to justify their program’s existence by emphasizing how it develops positive risk-tasking, or music educators who hope to use research evidence to show that keyboarding skills can enhance students’ language abilities. (p. 55)

Colwell (2011) states that many of the nonmusical or unintended outcomes of a rigorous music program – dependability, responsibility, diligence, and self-esteem – are “habits that are taught for and are not a result of some unthinking, automatic transfer” (p. 113). So while a growing body of research suggests positive effects from arts learning, there is still not agreement about the nature of the transfer of learning as it applies to arts learning.
Increased Student Engagement

A frequently mentioned phenomenon of arts partnerships is the reported high level of student engagement, meaning heightened attentiveness and awareness and deep concentration. Csikszentmihaly (1990) describes this as flow experience, a transformative state or optimal experience where you are totally absorbed in what you are doing, “a situation in which attention can be freely invested to achieve a person’s goals, because there is no disorder to straighten out, no threat for the self to defend against” (p. 40). The teachers of students in the schools of the Chicago Arts Partnership in Education (CAPE) know it as “The Look” – the body language of intense looking and listening, “on the edges of their seats, coiled with excitement” (Rabkin & Redmond, 2004, p. 127). Engagement was identified as a possible explanation to the statistically significant changes in Grade 6 math computation and estimation scores in an early assessment study of Learning Through the Arts, a Canadian community arts partnership. In their study, Smithrim and Upitis (2005) indicated that students at LTTA schools were highly engaged at school, which led the authors to speculate that,

The differences in computation scores were due to the students’ being more engaged, generally, in the LTTA schools that in the comparison schools. Given this, it is not altogether surprising that there would only be a change in the achievement score dealing with computation. Computation is the kind of task that can be improved by paying closer attention to the material at hand – by being more fully awake and engaged in the task. (p. 122)

Higher student engagement seems to be a natural outcome of arts learning, possibly because much of arts learning is sensory and emotion-based. The amygdala, the brain’s center for emotional response is activated, positively or negatively, when we sing, move, play an instrument, listen to music, or place color on a canvas. The essence of arts learning is interactive, whether one is interacting with others to create or whether one is responding individually to a painting, play, opera, film, or heavy metal concert.

Strategy: Arts Integration

There are several ways of defining arts integration in the literature and a wide range of practices associated with it. Arts integration places the arts in an interdisciplinary role with other subjects (Rabkin & Redmond, 2004) and is a deliberate strategy used to combine arts learning
across the curriculum. As the word integration suggests, the arts combine or blend with something else. Its use can range from individual teachers or teaching partners creating arts integrated lessons or units of study, to a full school-wide implementation of arts integrated learning and association with a community arts organization. Delivery of arts integrated programs varies in degrees of sophistication and intensity according to commitment, access to arts expertise and available funding.

Arts integration implies:

- Making connections between specific art forms and specific subjects in the way topics, themes or concepts are understood (Silverstein & Layne, 2010)
- A collaborative process, often requiring planning time between subject experts (Grumet, 2004)
- Teaching artists working with students and teachers (Booth, 2009)
- Using extensive arts-based instructional strategies (Snyder, 1996)
- Learning is inquiry-based and rooted in artistic or creative process, (Booth, 2009; Rabkin & Redmond, 2006)

In *Putting the Arts in the Picture: Reframing Education in the 21st century* (Rabkin & Redmond, 2004) six rigorous multi-year, multi-school arts education projects were examined for levels of arts integration and impact on student achievement, arts learning and teacher and school climate. The levels of arts integration in the six projects ranged from relatively low (one project) to moderate (two projects) and relatively higher (three projects). The student achievement outcomes varied, with the two of the relatively higher arts integration projects showing gains on standardized reading and math tests, and faster gains than comparable district schools. One project also identified that low-income students made the greatest test gains, supporting Catterall’s (2002) earlier findings. All six of the projects reviewed sited improvement in teaching and in the development of better school climates, with an emphasis on collaboration and improved communication.

A 4-year study in the Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE) tracked student achievement in six schools with an integrated arts focus (Scripp, 2011). The Partnership in Arts
Integration (PAIR) partnered teaching artists with Grades 4, 5, and 6 teachers in an attempt to effect student academic performance. The treatment schools were compared with six comparable control schools that did not have an arts integrated focus nor access to the CAPE-led professional development. Two significant findings emerged (Scripp, 2011). First, the low performing students in PAIR increased in academic achievement with more consistency than in control schools and second, the achievement gap between low and high achieving students was reduced by 22%. By comparison, the control schools in the study made gains of 14%. Furthermore, by the fourth year of the study, 85% of sixth grade students from the arts integrated schools met or exceeded standard reading scores in comparison to the district average of 59%. This presents a compelling argument for the use of arts integrated learning as means to effectively address the achievement gap.

It should be noted that arts partnerships will frequently mention arts integration as a goal or starting point. It is used for a number of different reasons. For the community arts organization, arts integration may be an entry point or calling card with a school or classroom, if they are able to demonstrate how their particular art form relates to what students are studying. It is a means to connect. For school administrators, arts integration may be an opportunity for school reform, an intentional way to improve and change the culture of the school. In consideration of the work that a concert study guide does within a music partnership, arts integration may be an effective approach.

**Strategy: Interacting With Works of Art**

An aesthetic or comprehensive arts education includes “developing the capacity to interpret works of art, discern what is valuable in them, and draw meaning from them through reflection and discussion with others” (Zakaras & Lowell, 2008, p. 98). Arts partnerships bring students in close contact with works of art through live performances (in or out of school), studio visits, and residencies with teaching artists. This exposure presents opportunities for students to co-author, to interact with works of art, and begin to form their thoughts and opinions.

In *In and Out of the Dark: A Theory about Audience Behaviour from Sophocles to Spoken Word*, Conner (2007) describes the evolution of this role from high audience participation in the creation and shaping of a work of art in the days of Sophocles when theatre
was out of doors and a whole day community event, to gradually lessening participation when theatre moved indoors, into the dark, supported by lighting and sound amplification. Conner (2007) notes “This adjustment transformed the playhouse or concert hall from a site of assembly – ripe for public discussion and collective action – to one of quiet reception” (p. 86). Arts performances shifted to highbrow/lowbrow in the 19th century, with a widening gap between artist’s authority and that of the audience. The 20th century saw a rise in publicly funded arts performances and venues and an increase in the availability of high quality arts at the regional and local level, with however, essentially no change in the power dynamic between the artists and audience.

Conner presents a strong argument for the re-democratization of the arts with a move back to audience co-authorship, where the audience moves from a passive encounter with an art form to an active one. The audience experience is interpretive and there is reciprocity between the audience and the artists, implying involvement with the art form before, during and after a performance. She points out that in order to “realize the full potential of experiencing an arts event, the audience member must possess two qualities; the authority to participate in the process of co-authoring meaning; and the tools to do so effectively” (Conner, 2007, p. 90).

This audience authority can be built through the provision of interactive pre-performance videos, attendance at rehearsals, encouraging email dialogue with directors and performers, the use of hand-held devices for interpretive purposes during a performance. Conner (2007) suggests that community arts organizations need to avoid the conventional “one-way transfers of information” (p. 93) and move to formats of information-sharing that encourage two-way thinking and dialogue. Potentially, a music partnership study guide can be a source for building audience authority. If the guide provokes discussion and understanding around the overarching themes – dramatic, philosophical, musical, and otherwise – and if the guide allows for actual interaction with the music, text, characters, set design, then it is conceivable that a study guide does in fact, move the future audience members to two-way thinking and dialogue.

**Strategy: Direct Work With Teaching Artists**

Many successful arts and music partnerships feature significant and meaningful interaction between students and teaching artists. The term *teaching artist* is a relatively new one
and its newness reflects that the field is changing. In the past when performers have been involved in education they have been called guest or visiting artists, or resource professionals. The use of teaching artist emphasizes their presence in a teaching capacity. Teaching artists are highly skilled professionals who have active performing careers, and teach beyond the traditional definition of studio teaching. Booth (2009) describes a teaching artist as “an artist who chooses to include artfully educating others, beyond teaching the technique of the art form, as an active part of a career” (p. 3). The scope of the role of a teaching artist is evolving from a loosely defined and unorganized movement to a recognized course of study for music performance majors and other arts disciplines. The network of teaching artists worldwide now has a professional journal and organization to communicate through, and the profession is growing rapidly.

Teaching artists have can have profound effects on student learning. Booth (2009) describes arts learning in six strands and the purpose of each as:

- Arts Appreciation (teach about art)
- Skill Building within an Art Form (teach you how)
- Aesthetic Development (invite you in)
- Arts Integration (catalyze learning)
- Community Arts (Enrich community life)
- Extensions (use the power)

Teaching Artists reach all of these types of arts learning, and often, the strands will overlap. Of these six strands Booth (2009) sees teaching artists as having the greatest impact in Aesthetic Development, and Arts Integration, with a great potential yet to be explored in Extensions. He describes the strand of Aesthetic Development, or inviting in, as the strand that develops audience skills and makes meaningful connections. Teaching artists bring the magic of what they do into the classroom and are skilled at being able to set up circumstances that allow students to step into the art form without needing skills or formal knowledge. In other words, teaching artist make it possible for students to have meaningful and often highly sophisticated arts experiences, starting from where they are.
In the Arts Integration strand, the teaching artist plays a key role in each of the three phases of the curriculum – the curriculum planned, curriculum enacted, and curriculum experienced. Booth (2009) describes this three-stage involvement as “artistic engagement of the learning on the front end of the project, and then guiding that creative energy, that investment and curiosity, into serious play in the subject area” (p. 23).

As described earlier, arts integration places the arts in an interdisciplinary role with other subjects. The teaching artist is a vital part of the curriculum designing team, and works with teachers to review the required content to be taught and finds the ways and places that the art form lives within and teaches to the concepts and overarching questions within the curriculum. A teaching artist teaches both the student and the classroom teacher.

Students value teaching artists, particularly adolescent learners. A key finding of a study by Montgomery, Rogouin, and Persoud (2013) to determine the success principles for afterschool arts programs for teens and tweens identified that,

Professional, practicing artists hold the key to youth engagement in out of school time (OST) arts programs. Young people are drawn to the artists’ knowledge of technique, their real world experience in the arts, and their energy and creativity. Professional artists have deep understanding of the creative process. Therefore, they are able to guide youth through the planning-producing-presenting-reflecting cycle, with its inevitable twists and turns, with insight and credibility. (p. 56)

This finding reflected the opinions of the tweens and teens engaged in the study as well as the opinions of the key opinion leaders (arts experts) consulted.

**Context: The Field Trip and Place-Based Learning**

A frequent context for arts partnerships is the field trip, where students participate in an arts-centered event outside of school. Typically students travel to the theatre, symphony hall, opera house, dance studio, museum or art gallery where they see a performance or exhibit, or participate in a studio event.

For an understanding of this we turn to the body of research around field studies (outdoor education), described by Knapp (1996, as cited in Willis, 1997) as learning that occurs in a context of reality rather than mediated by books or videos. More recently, the term *place-based*
is being used to describe curriculum that is designed to take place out in the community – nearby parks, wetlands, community gardens, civic buildings, zoos, arenas, or legislature buildings – where “the design of local investigations invites a wide span of practice and is associated with a more self-directed, inquiry-based, experiential pedagogy” (Demarest, 2015, p. 2).

Place-based programs such as Open Minds Classrooms in Calgary, Canada; Inquiring Minds, Edmonton, Canada; or School in the Park in San Diego, United States, are examples of place-based programs of longer duration – week-long exposures in the case of Open Minds and Inquiring Minds, and multi-week exposures in the case of San Diego’s School in the Park. Multiple Open Mind classrooms sites are located around the city of Calgary and include museums, civic buildings, the zoo, and a science center. Similarly, Inquiring Minds in Edmonton, Canada, features sites in performing arts centers, the zoo, the arena, a farm, and an historic fort. San Diego’s School in the Park is a partnership between San Diego State Unified, San Diego Unified School District, the San Diego Education Association, Price Charities and 800 students at the Rosa Parks School. These students spend 20–25% of their instructional time out of the school. During this time their classes take place in the San Diego Zoo, the San Diego Museum of Photographic Art, the San Diego Historical Society, and the San Diego Junior Theatre (Pumpian, Fisher, & Wachowiak, 2006).

Within the Inquiring Minds sites, Sound School at the Winspear Centre in Edmonton, Canada is an example of a place-based music partnership. Students spend a week at the Winspear Centre, home of the Edmonton Symphony, deeply immersed in the workday activity of the site. The curriculum for the week is developed collaboratively between the on-site experts and the classroom teacher in advance of the week, with the classroom teacher taking the lead on what will be taught. The week of learning is interdisciplinary and subjects such as science, math, language arts, social science, and career studies are interwoven around encounters with the hall, the orchestra, individual musicians, and the staff. Students observe, sketch, journal, listen, create, and discuss. Learning is frequently music-focused with singing, instrument exploration, and movement used to teach music concepts and make cultural connections.

Music partnerships that feature field trips or extended on-site exposure have in common with outdoor education, museum educators and place-based initiatives, the desired type of
learning that is problem-based, hands-on, interactive, and allows for authentic assessment. Students see real-life examples and applications of what is being studied. Artists working in their studios, halls, and galleries add a dimension of authenticity and professionalism and enable students to see artists working in their own settings (Heath, 2001). The Ontario Arts Curriculum (2010) states that arts partnerships provide rich environments for field trips and exploration, and provide models of how the knowledge and skills acquired through the study of the curriculum related to life beyond school. Mayger (2007) suggests that field trips bring a balance to the curriculum,

Field trips, however, offer a critical advantage. They can bring balance to the curriculum. The most popular destinations – museums, zoos, outdoor venues, and performances – have a natural fit with science, history, and the arts, subjects that have been marginalized by our current focus on basic skills. (p. 1)

In the previous pages I have described arts learning and its potential benefits, and discussed current strategies and contexts associated with community arts partnerships. This background is helpful in understanding what may contribute to a successful music partnership study guide.

Part Two: Curriculum Design

This section defines curriculum for those not familiar with education literature and provides a brief background on a few key curriculum theories and approaches. It explains how curriculum theories differ and how they relate to student learning and understanding. The section describes how the current practices of differentiated instruction and designing for understanding are relevant to the goals of a music partnership study guide. An analytical framework known as The Six Facets of Understanding (Wiggins & McTighe, 1998) is described and related to the concept of audience co-authorship (Conner, 2007) and the practice of uncoverage (Wiggins & McTighe, 1998).

Background on Curriculum Theory and Approaches

Curriculum theory deals with alternative structures for organizing knowledge, and asks the question, what knowledge is of most worth. Marsh and Willis (2007) define curriculum as
“an interrelated set of plans and experiences that a student undertakes under the guidance of the school” (p. 15). They qualify this definition by stating that the plans and experiences are typically created in advance, and that unplanned experiences inevitably also occur when the curriculum is enacted, and the experiences of the students can be anticipated in some ways but not in others. For Marsh and Willis (2007), the phases of the curriculum are considered as being three-pronged – the planned curriculum, the enacted curriculum, and the experienced curriculum.

Approaches to the design of curriculum are many, and the major ones can be categorized under three broad categories of theory: prescriptive, descriptive, and critical-exploratory (Marsh & Willis, 2007). The design of a music partnership curriculum, in my experience, largely uses a critical-exploratory approach, along with a descriptive approach when collaborative work is involved (as is the case with much of arts integration work, identified in the previous section as a frequent strategy used in community arts partnerships).

Ralph Tyler (as discussed in Marsh & Willis, 2007), a curriculum writer who influenced education in America in the 1930s used a rational-linear approach with four specific questions to consider – what are the objectives, what will the learning experiences be, how will the learning experiences be organized, and what will the evaluation be – always in that order. Tyler is considered to be among the prescriptive theorizers, a group whose focus attempts to create frameworks for curriculum design that will improve school practice. Marsh and Willis (2007) caution that “using the Tyler rationale may lead to a precisely planned curriculum, but it will not account for the existential complexity that seems at the heart of the enacted curriculum and the experienced curriculum – that is, the day-to-day classroom” (p. 88). Given that arts-based teaching and learning encourages complexity of thought and multiple perspectives, prescriptive theory would not typically be used in the development of a music partnership curriculum.

Walker’s (as cited in Marsh & Willis, 2007, p. 89) deliberative approach “values the openness of deliberations that permit every interested party to have a voice in developing curriculum.” “He assumes that better curricula will result when those engaged in it understand the complexity of the process” (Marsh & Willis, 2007, p. 79). Walker does not use specific guidelines or criteria, and there are few current examples based upon his approach, but, deliberation would likely be used when interdisciplinary teams of teachers are involved in
writing curricula. In Walker’s approach, design takes place only after groups have discussed and reached consensus around conceptions (beliefs), theories, aims, and beliefs about images and procedures, followed by deliberation. The specifics of the actual curriculum design emerge from this process. Walker would be amongst the descriptive theorizers, a group whose focus attempts to identify how curriculum development actually takes place, especially in school settings. Aspects of Walker’s deliberative approach would be appropriate for community arts partnerships that are school-based, long-term and focused on school improvement and/or change of school culture (such as the schools involved in CAPE, described earlier in this paper).

Eisner’s (as discussed in March & Willis, 2007, p. 99) artistic approach is grounded in artistic, or creative process; “his values are those of the creative artist and the appreciative audience.” It offers great flexibility in choices in the planned, and is responsive to the “lived qualities of the enacted and experienced curriculum” (Marsh & Willis, 2007, p. 99). Hence, there is an emphasis on the interaction between the enacted curriculum and the experienced curriculum. Eisner (as discussed in Marsh & Willis, 2007, p. 99) is considered to be amongst the critical-exploratory theorizers, a group that considers “curriculum in terms of its diversities and continuities, emphasizing what curriculum has been, is, and might be.” The school of critical-exploratory theory resonates strongly with much of the work that is carried out in community arts partnership, particularly those with a vigorous teaching artist component.

**Curriculum Practices That Are Relevant to Music Partnership Study Guides**

Curriculum and assessment experts suggest that student learning is successful when students understand the big ideas, core processes, or overarching concepts within which specific facts or topics are contained (Erikson, 1998; Reeves, 2002, Wiggins & McTighe, 2005). It is also recommended that student learning be inquiry-based (Erikson, 1998; Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006), and led by “essential questions” (Wiggins & McTighe, 2005).

As teachers plan units of instruction, Wiggins and McTighe (2005) suggest backwards planning, or beginning with the end in mind, by considering what is worthy and requiring of understanding. Something is considered worth understanding if it has enduring value (Does it represent a big idea that goes beyond the classroom?), resides at the heart of the discipline (Does it involve “doing” the subject?), requires “uncoverage” as opposed to simply covering the
material (Does it have abstract or often misunderstood ideas?), and offers potential for engaging students (pp. 22–23). Wiggins and McTighe (1998) offer an analytic framework that identifies the ways in which we understand.

The Six Facets of Understanding (Wiggins & McTighe, 1998) provides a six-sided view of the concept of understanding. Described in the next section, the six facets are indicators of how understanding is revealed. Each facet is different yet related, and together should not be viewed in a hierarchical manner. The framework is a helpful tool for teachers in planning units of study, “generating ideas for: ‘hooking’ students around a topic, engaging them in higher-order thinking, causing them to consider other points of view, and prompting self-assessment and reflection” (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006, p. 116). The breadth and depth of understanding that a music partnership study guide develops or contributes to is an important consideration in its design, since one of the main purposes of a study guide is to prepare students for a performance. The ability to understand the performance on more than just a superficial level is what moves a concert experience from arts exposure to arts learning. The Six Facets of Understanding framework is used later in this study to analyze what aspects of The Magic Flute Study Guide contributed to understanding.

The Six Facets of Understanding

When we truly understand, we

- Can explain via generalizations or principles: provide justified and systematic accounts of phenomena, facts and data; make insightful connections and provide illuminating examples or illustrations.
- Can interpret: tell meaningful stories; offer apt translations; provide a revealing historical or personal dimension to ideas and events; make it personal or accessible through images, anecdotes, analogies, and models.
- Can apply: effectively use and adapt what we know in diverse and real contexts – we can “do” the subject.
- Have perspective: see and hear points of view through critical eyes and ears; see the big picture.
- Display empathy: find value in what others might find odd, alien or implausible; perceive sensitively on the basis of prior direct experience.
- Have self-knowledge: show metacognitive awareness; perceive the personal style, prejudices, projections, and habits of mind that both shape and impede our own
understanding; be aware of what we do not understand; reflect on the meaning of learning and experience. (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006, p. 67)

Curriculum design must also take into consideration that students respond and learn differently, depending on their varied levels of readiness, interest, and learning profiles. “In differentiated classrooms, teachers begin (teaching) where students are, not at the front of a curriculum guide” (Tomlinson, 2000, p. 10). While a study guide that is prepared by an outside organization and is distributed to multiple grade levels in multiple schools obviously cannot know the individual needs of each student as a classroom teacher might, the guide should provide multiple ways for students to access information, and multiple ways to apply it. Instruction can be differentiated through content (what students learn and the materials and mechanisms used), through process (the activities that are designed to ensure students use key skills to make sense out of essential ideas and information), and through products (vehicles through which students demonstrate and extend what they have learned) (Tomlinson, 2000).

It is important for a music partnership study guide to provide a range of ways that the content can be accessed. This might include listening excerpts, digital presentations, illustrations, graphic organizers, Q/A format information sections, black line masters using simplified and/or advanced text, providing essential vocabulary and reference materials of different readability levels. Process in a music partnership study guide can be differentiated by the use of multi-arts teaching strategies and building different types of student groupings into lesson plans. Product can be differentiated by offering a range of ways the music partnership study guide offers students to show what they have learned – oral explanations, written defenses or descriptions, and visual or theatrical representations.

A music partnership study guide must cover a considerable amount of content, some of it hard to access with unfamiliar vocabulary, convoluted plots (as is usually the case in opera) or long musical excerpts. The content is both text-based and music-based, and requires deep listening, in addition to the more standard skills of reading, discussing and writing. Using a music partnership study guide may also be time-challenged in that teachers are often delivering it in relatively short blocks of time or in addition to their regular curriculum. Having to cover a lot of content in a short period of time is not an uncommon in today’s test-driven educational
climate. In fact, one the reasons for the rise of curriculum design approaches like Understanding by Design (UbD) is in response to thoughtfully handling the overwhelming number of content standards or curriculum expectations that North American teachers are expected to cover. By designing curriculum with deliberate attention to student understanding, using of overarching concepts and questions that require critical thinking skills, teachers have an alternative to teaching to the test, and can avoid the type of teaching that typifies checking off what has been covered but perhaps not understood.

**Inspiring the Teacher**

A well-designed music partnership study guide is responsive to the teacher – the principle user. The teacher is the first audience for a curriculum and the success of student learning depends in some degree on how well the teacher understands the content of a guide, and embraces the outlined steps and actions for learning. Hence, a study guide must both engage and educate the teacher. Schwartz (2006) identifies two target groups for the curriculum writer: *users* (the teachers) and *receivers* (the students). He suggests that curriculum writers erroneously write for the students when in fact they should be writing for the teachers. Schwartz argues for the creation of curriculum that seeks first to engage the teacher, basing his thinking upon Eisner’s (1990) suggestion that curriculum needs to “both emancipate and educate teachers” (as cited in Schwartz, 2006, p. 452).

Schwartz (2006) calls his format a “rehearsal curriculum” (p. 454), a three-phase approach that takes on an inspirational and transformative role. The rehearsal curriculum format sets out to captivate and inspire the teacher, first by creating a “disjuncture” – something that causes a disconnect or separation between what is already known and the new information – followed by teacher-led research, which leads to innovation or new understanding. Working through a disjuncture, where what the teacher already knows is challenged enables the teacher to teach from a new perspective. Having experienced this cycle of “disjuncture, research, and innovation” (Schwartz, 2006, p. 454), the teacher then uses the curriculum as a guide to set up a similar process for her students. Thus, he or she is emancipated from the curriculum and the curriculum guide is a resource and not a prescription. “Curricula, and the professional support
provided to teachers, should be aimed at educating teachers, both in terms of content and presentation” (Schwartz, 2006, p. 456).

If one applies this line of thinking to the use of a study guide to prepare students for attending an opera, then the writer needs to captivate the teacher first, and present information that causes them to question and discover. Schwartz’s (2006) study gives an example of different quotes of religious texts that are presented in a way that at first seems unquestioned. He then creates a disjuncture by layering the quotes one at time to contradict each other, and poses provocative questions. Something obvious and seemingly straightforward is teased into another level causing discussion and debate. In a music partnership curriculum, a similar kind of experience could be fostered by presenting opposite points of view, or connecting to the personal (making the composer a real person, knowing the circumstances of the times).

In the previous pages I have provided a background on curriculum theory and noted that curriculum associated with community arts partnerships lives comfortably with aspects of the deliberative approach and much of critical-exploratory theory. I have identified big ideas, backwards planning, and differentiated instruction as relevant practices for the design of music partnership study guides. The practice of co-authoring as described by Conner (2007) and the use of a rehearsal curriculum (Schwartz, 2006) are put forward as additional valid considerations.

**Summary**

This chapter has brought to light the positive benefits of arts learning, and describes the opportunities presented to music partnerships through arts-integration, placed-based learning, and access to teaching artists. The section on curriculum design provides a foundation for consideration of the design process to be used in the development of a music partnership study guide.
CHAPTER THREE

METHODOLOGY

This chapter is an outline of the methods used and provides a background on the theory of mixed methodology and an explanation of why it is appropriate for this study. It includes information on my data sources, how the data was collected, and the analysis process. The data for this study includes a study guide I co-authored, my field notes, writing team artifacts, and a teacher survey. The chapter is divided into four parts: methodology background, study design, analysis, and interpretation.

Methodology Background

Mixed Methodology

Mixed method design refers to research that combines quantitative and qualitative data. “Its central premise is that the use of qualitative and quantitative data, in combination, provides a better understanding of research problems than either approach alone” (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2007, p. 5). Johnson, Onwuegbuzie, and Turner (2007) suggest that mixed method research “combines elements of qualitative and quantitative approaches (e.g., use of qualitative and quantitative viewpoints, data collection, analysis, inference techniques) for the purposes of breadth and depth of understanding and corroboration” (p. 123). Mixed method research also addresses the imbalance of using one type of data alone. Quantitative data cannot speak to the subtleties of human dynamics, while qualitative data often uses small numbers of participants which cannot be generalized to the larger population. Both types of data are affected by researcher bias. Mixed methods research argues that the combination of the two, balances out the inherent weakness of each (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2011, p. 12).

The development of mixed methods as a valid form of research has been evolving since the 1950s and has been formalized into six major categories; convergent design, explanatory design, exploratory design, embedded design, transformative design, and multiphase design. Each of these types of mixed methods designs respond to a different set of research needs, and some may be more suited to a specific discipline (i.e., educational research, public health...
education, social and behavioral research, or nursing) than others. All of these research designs combine qualitative and quantitative data, but differ in that the use of the data may be fixed or emergent (use of the data is determined before the start of the study, or the use of the data is decided upon as issues arise out of the research); the level of interaction between the quantitative data or qualitative strands may be independent or interactive (strands are kept separate from each other until drawing conclusions at the end of the study, or mixing the two strands before the final interpretation); the weighting of the importance of the qualitative and quantitative strands may have equal priority, quantitative priority, or qualitative priority (both strands are equally important in considering the research problem, or either quantitative or qualitative data plays a primary role over the other); the timing or pacing of the order of the data collection and use may be concurrent, sequential, or multiphase combination (both strands are collected and used during a single phase, in two distinct phases, or a combination of phases), and mixing of the qualitative strands may be during interpretation (final step), during data analysis (merging the two sets of results in a matrix or transforming one type to another), during data collection (obtaining results connect and lead to a subsequent collection) or during the design stage (mixing within a theoretical framework or a program-objective framework) (Creswell & Plano Cark, 2011).

A researcher may choose a mixed methods design if the research problem is multidimensional and one data source provides insufficient information to tell the whole story. Or, initial results from a study raise new questions that require further explanation. For example, the generalized information that can be attained from quantitative data can be better understood when followed up by a qualitative study. Or the reverse of this, a study begins with qualitative data that needs to be further generalized. Mixed method research is also appropriate for a study that takes place over an extended time period and is multiphase.

Convergent parallel design occurs when a researcher begins the study with concurrent timing of the qualitative and quantitative data strands. The two data types are weighted equally (both strands are equally important in considering the research problem) and are analyzed separately before mixing in the overall interpretation. This mixed method approach combines and triangulates findings in order that they may be mutually corroborated and to provide a more comprehensive account of the area of inquiry (Bryman, 2006). Triangulation, or convergent parallel design, requires that the different methods assess the same conceptual phenomenon. The
rationale for this approach is to attain a more complete understanding of the phenomenon (Creswell & Clark, 2011).

Convergent parallel design was chosen for this study because more than one data source was needed to provide a balanced picture of the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide. A primary data source was the study guide itself, *The Magic Flute Study Guide*. The overall study guide was analyzed for its evidence of facets of understanding (using an analytical framework described on p. 25). The study guide lesson plans were reviewed for possible connections to the critical attributes themes emerging from the mixing of findings from the teacher survey and artifacts of the writing team. Two of the sources of information – the teacher group using the study guide and then attending the concert with their students, and the writers of the study guide – were different in number and accessibility. From the larger group (the teachers) using a quantitative approach was easier to administer and offered the possibility of generalized information. The smaller writing team of two, and easy access to the writing archives was conducive to collecting qualitative data. The third source, an analytical framework for examining understanding in the study guide, provided additional qualitative data using a research-based model that is well respected within the educator community.

For this study, more than one type of data is used in an attempt to identify the critical aspects of a music partnership curriculum. The survey to study teacher perceptions of the guide, the analysis of the writing team artifacts as will be described, and the analysis of the study guide using the Six Facets of Understanding analytical framework (Wiggins & McTighe, 1998) were carried out independent of each other, and interfaced later in the comparison and interpretation stages.

**Study Design**

**Sources of Data**

*The study guide*

A chief source of data for this study is *The Magic Flute Study Guide*, a music partnership curriculum I co-authored for a mid-sized professional opera company, in support of a yearly student matinee performance offered to junior and senior high school students. *The Magic Flute*
Study Guide was the fourth in a series of guides developed over a 6-year period. For the purposes of this study, the guide was analyzed for its content and for the process used in its design.

The first guide written 3 years prior to The Magic Flute Study Guide was the most challenging. With my co-author, Catherine West, we created a structure for the guide from the ground up. This involved reviewing the opera company’s existing study guide materials, studying teacher feedback from old surveys, identifying what we liked and disliked in other opera study guides from around the world, discussing needs and wants for the guide with the opera company’s Education Manager and developing our own aesthetic of how the guide should look and what information was crucial to include. We looked at what we considered to be shortcomings in other study guides and grappled with how we might do things differently and overcome the challenges presented by an art form that is usually sung in a foreign language with a complicated cast of characters and music that is larger than life (all part of what makes opera wonderful, too!). We made decisions about music selections and the format students would use for listening. We hired an illustrator and led him through a discovery of all things opera, and created an opera fan in the process. The graphic designer from some of our other projects handled the overall design.

By the time we were contracted to develop the study guide for The Magic Flute, we had a track record of success. Teachers appreciated the study guides and had shared their enthusiasm about them with the opera company staff. Students were increasingly observed as being excellent audience members and the opera staff attributed this growth in behaviors to the use of our study guides. We now had a structure for the study guide that evolved over 3 years, a writing team with shared pedagogical beliefs in place, an understanding of the values of the opera company we were representing, and 3 years of feedback from teachers who had used the previous guides. It appeared that the first three study guides we had created were meeting the needs of the teachers and students on several levels and I was curious to understand more deeply what key attributes had contributed to this success. If these key attributes could be identified, I theorized that this would suggest a design process that would be helpful to other curriculum designers and arts administrators.
Teacher surveys were collected from the email database of teachers purchasing tickets from the opera company to attend the performance with their classes. This information was made available through and with permission of the opera company. Every teacher who had made a booking was sent a link to the survey. A survey request was emailed from the opera and began with a letter of introduction assuring anonymity and a request for permission for use of comments and data, followed by a link to the survey, set up in Survey Monkey (see Appendix A).

Writing team artifacts were retrieved from my own digital archives. As the lead writer on The Magic Flute Study Guide, I had access to the email conversations with my co-author (referred to as Author #2) and a retired academic with an interest in Mozart (referred to as Dr. S). Permission to use the email correspondence was sought and granted by Author #2, and by the spouse of the Dr. S, who had passed away since the time of the guide’s development. The emails were already in electronic form and were printed for ease of manual coding. My handwritten journal notes were photocopied and printed for ease of viewing. Other artifacts used in this study included wall charts from initial brainstorming sessions, rough drafts, concert programmes with our handwritten notes from attending past performances of The Magic Flute, research notes, listening notes, viewing notes from watching digital performances, marked up librettos and music scores, and journal notes from attending the live performance of the student matinee. The data for the study guide analysis of understanding was gathered from the finished study guide in electronic form and was printed for ease of manual coding.

Developing the teacher survey

A survey format was chosen to probe teacher perceptions about the study guide used prior to attending a school matinee performance of The Magic Flute, the opera described in the opening paragraphs of this study. Given that the teachers in attendance were from a large geographic region, a survey allowed for equal access, and as Dillman, Smythe, and Christian (2009) note, surveys now regularly replace what used to be face-to-face contact.

The survey was designed to discover who used the guide, how it was used, and what aspects of the guide were perceived as helpful. Development of the survey began by first reviewing samples of follow-up surveys to teacher groups from different arts organizations
(including two symphonies and a national arts outreach program). Most focused on teacher opinions on how their students responded to the performance or presentation, and solicited input for improvement. The next step was a review of the opera company follow-up survey from the previous year’s student matinee. Questions included whether the study guide had been received far enough in advance, if the guide had been used, what lessons were helpful, whether or not students had learned opera terminology, use of the audio CD, and whether student opinions about opera had changed from before attending the performance. The information yielded from this was used to create a first draft survey that was similar in style but with questions designed to tease out teachers’ perceptions of the guide’s helpfulness and give more specific information on how the guide was used. The survey was divided into the following five sections:

*Using The Magic Flute Study Guide:* This section asked for the teachers’ permission to use their comments.

*Descriptive Data:* Teachers were asked to indicate grade level taught, type of school, and to self-identify as a specialist or generalist and the subjects taught. Arts specialists were further asked to identify as visual arts, drama, dance, general music, vocal music or instrumental music. Teachers also indicated their years of teaching experience, attendance at previous student matinees at the opera company, and other types of arts performances they had taken their students to in the past year.

*Using The Magic Flute Study Guide:* Respondents were asked to indicate how much instructional time they used in preparing students for the opera and to rate their level of confidence in the ability to engage their students with the opera, before reading the guide, and after. They were then asked to rate the helpfulness of the various sections of the guide including Performance Information, the Mozart section, All About Opera, the Student CDs, the Lesson Plans, and the Black Line Masters.

*Using the Audio CDs:* Teachers indicated the level of student enthusiasm about using the CDs and whether or not any listening homework was assigned.

*Insights:* Teachers rated the quality of the guide by visual appearance, information provided, relevance to their curriculum and ease of use. Open-ended questions included
asking what they personally found the most interesting to read and why, what they hoped their students would gain from attending *The Magic Flute*, and whether they had any suggestions for making future study guides more helpful. A rating scale was provided to indicate whether or not they felt their students were better prepared for the opera, and they were queried about what additional resources could support their use of the guide.

This draft was reviewed by an expert in the field of music research and significant changes to the rating scales and wording were made. A second draft was then shown to two colleagues who gave further input. Further revisions were made and the next draft was tested online by a colleague. A few final changes were made before the link was made live and the survey was sent out.

The teachers were already linked into an email communication system with the opera company for making and sending reservations, electronic delivery of the study guide, and for making and confirming arrangements for delivery of the study guide and student CDs. With this electronic relationship in place, a web survey seemed appropriate. One of the cited disadvantages of a web survey is that it leaves a certain part of the population out (those without access to computers), but the teaching population of Ontario is clearly not in that group. Educators have high access to computers in the workplace and at home and computer literacy is the norm.

The survey population was 34 teachers, the total number of teachers who brought groups of students to the opera. An email was sent to each of these teachers inviting them to participate in a short survey. The email explained the purpose of the research and pointed out that by responding their input could impact future study guides, both with the local opera company and farther afield. Dillman et al. (2009) suggests application of the concept of social exchange, the method used to motivate people to respond to surveys. In this instance, part of the social exchange offered is the chance for teacher input to impact future study guides.

Following the recommendations of Dillman et al.’s (2009) tailored design method, emails were sent to each teacher, personally addressed, and the mailing was strategically timed to coincide with arriving in the teachers’ mailboxes the first week back to school in January (a time that typically is less hectic for middle and high school teachers).
Analysis

The two data strands of quantitative (teacher survey) and qualitative (writing team artifact analysis), were analyzed independent of each other, and were compared and blended after. From the quantitative data of the teacher survey, I hoped to gain a better understanding of how the teachers used the guide and what aspects or features they found to be helpful. I reasoned that features identified as being helpful or contributing to overall teacher confidence could be possible indicators of the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide. In the qualitative data from the artifact analysis of the study guide writing team I looked for authorial intent. What types of information, formats and teaching strategies were valued by the writers? How would it compare with information yielded from the quantitative strand (teacher survey) teachers using the guide identified as helpful? In blending the two data strands, I looked for possible alignment between features found helpful by the teachers, and features deemed important by the writing team. If both were in alignment, a credible argument could be made for having identified the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide.

There was an overlap of qualitative and quantitative data within the teacher survey, with the inclusion of three open-ended questions. These questions were analyzed independent of the quantitative portion of the survey and then compared and blended at the same time as the qualitative data from the writing team artifacts. The responses to “Please rate the helpfulness of the following study guide Lessons” prompted me to analyze the content of each lesson to further identify possible critical attributes of a music partnership study guide.

Analysis of the Survey Data

Data collected by Survey Monkey was transferred into an Excel document which was then used to present the information in bar graphs. I had a consultation with the department’s data analysis and research design resource person, who reviewed the information with me, identified some points of interest in the results, and made suggestions on how to report the findings. I engaged the services of a graduate student to do a linear regression on the data from the question relating to teacher confidence (How confident were you in your ability to engage your students with the opera, before reading the study guide? After reading the study guide?).
Analysis of the Discussions of the Writing Team

Email discussions from a 3-month span between the study guide writing team (two writers, a music academic with a special interest in Mozart, and the guide’s illustrator) were analyzed by doing an initial pass through, highlighting key words, and making notes in the margins of the photocopies. I looked specifically for significance in intent: What did the authors consider to be of utmost importance for the guide to contain? How did this influence their design process? I also sorted the threads by writer (in case there were any wide variances in what the individual team members considered important) and then by theme threads.

Analysis of the Study Guide Lessons

Here I looked to see what specifically set the three highest rated or most helpful lessons apart. I identified the primary and secondary focus of each of the six individual lessons in the guide and I noted the range of teaching actions or strategies used. From here, I began to identify helpfulness themes.

Merging of the Quantitative and Qualitative Strands

Following the independent collection and analysis of the teacher survey and the collection and analysis of the artifacts, I compared the data using a chart highlighting key themes.
Chapter Four
Data Results and Analysis

In the previous chapter I outlined the rationale and methodology used for the study. In the following pages I present the findings of the study in two parts. The first part focuses on identifying the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide, and the second part focuses on steps of curriculum design implied in a study of my own design process.

Part One: Finding the Critical Attributes

The following section contains the survey results, writing team artifacts results, and the results from merging these two strands of data. The quantitative data yielded from the teacher survey is discussed first, followed by the qualitative data of the open-ended survey questions and the analysis of the writing team artifacts. The quantitative and qualitative data strands are then merged, and the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide are identified.

Survey Data Results

The teacher survey yielded two types of results: quantitative from the ranked questions, and qualitative from the three open-ended questions. Each was considered separately from the other, and the results were blended only when the additional qualitative strand, the analysis from the writing team artifacts, was available.

Teacher Survey: Quantitative Data

A total of 35 surveys (representing 100% of teachers who brought classes to the opera) were sent. A total of 13 responses from the survey were received. The response rate of slightly more than 30% may indicate a bias toward the more positive and well educated (Gall, Gall, & Borg, 2003), which is also supported by the survey’s descriptive data which identifies the respondents as high arts users (based on other performing arts events attended in the previous year). A degree of caution would be appropriate in relying on solely on the quantitative survey results with this low response rate. The mixing of the quantitative and qualitative strands helps to address this shortcoming.
The descriptive data revealed that:

- A majority of schools attending are publicly funded. Two of the 13 respondents were home-school teachers.
- The majority of the audience is high school students with a healthy percentage of middle school attendees. The home-school teachers and the private school teacher have brought younger students.
- Classes attending are general academic with 16.7% being French Immersion.
- More teachers identify themselves as specialists (61.5%) than generalists (38.5%).
- Of the arts specialists, 78% teach music and 22% teach drama. Representation from drama reflects opera’s place in theatre as well as music (multi-art genre).
- The majority have taught 10–15 years, and there were no first year teachers represented.
- All of the respondents came to last year’s performance.
- The sample group as a whole would be described as high arts users. In addition to attending the opera, 70% went to the symphony, 70% went to the theatre, and 50% went to the art gallery. Two of the high school music teachers also reported attending performance types such as jazz, avant garde, contemporary acoustic, concert band, and singer/songwriter guitar.

Using The Magic Flute Study Guide

The next section asked informants to report the amount of instructional time used to prepare their students for attending the opera. The average amount of time spent was 1–2 hours (33.3%) and a full 25% reported using more than 4 hours of instructional time. This represents a significant amount of time considering that it all occurred within the first 2 weeks of school, and in classes where specialist teachers have limited time periods with students (some as infrequent as once a week). It might suggest that the guide encourages instruction time because the information and how to use it are all in one place.
Teachers were asked to rate their *confidence in their ability to engage their students, before and after reading the study guide*. Of the 11 participants who rated their confidence *after* reading the study guide, 54.5% were quite confident in their ability to engage their students with the opera, and 45.5% were very confident. This is a positive indication of the guide’s effectiveness for its intended audience, the teacher.

When asked to rate their confidence in their ability to engage their students with the opera before *and* after reading the study guide, there was a significant positive shift by 7 respondents (not all respondents replied to the two parts of the question, before and after). On average after reading the guide, these teachers experienced a 35.5% increase in confidence, as indicated in Figure 1.
Figure 1. Teacher responses: How confident were you in your ability to engage your students with the opera, before reading the study guide? After reading the study guide?

This strong shift in the confidence levels before and after reading the guide prompted further investigation. I posed the question, “What factors affect teacher confidence?” The variables used to evaluate this question included teaching level (middle school or high school), school focus (general academic or other specialty), type of teacher (generalist or specialist), years of experience, number of previous operas attended, number of other types of arts performances the teacher has taken his/her students to, and the amount of instructional time (ranges of hours). A stepwise linear regression using the backward elimination technique was performed using Excel’s Data ToolPak using a 95% confidence interval. After the first regression using all the aforementioned values, the output p-values were reviewed. The factor with the highest p-value (greater than $1 - 0.95 = 0.05$) was removed and the regression was run again. School focus, other arts performances, number of previous operas attended, and amount of instructional time were removed successively after running four regressions. The resulting
regression thus suggests that teacher confidence levels are affected by three variables: (a) what school level they teach, (b) whether they are a generalist or a specialist, and (c) how much teaching experience they have. The Significance F value resulting from the regression indicates that these factors as a whole have an effect on teacher confidence levels. The relationship between these variables and teacher confidence is described according to the following equation:

\[
\text{confidence level following use of the guide} = 7:
\]

1 (middle school teacher) – 2 (high school teacher) – 1 (generalist)

1 (5 to 10 years of experience) – 1 (10 to 15 years of experience)

The R^2 value associated with the regression is 1, which indicates that the model is a perfect fit to the data. The more likely reason for this high R^2 value is the small sample size. All of the standard residuals fall within +/-2 standard deviations, indicating that the error term is normally distributed.

The linear regression model shows that confidence levels start at 7 and are subsequently reduced depending on which variables are applicable to the teacher (1 if true, 0 if false). For example, according to the model, a specialist high school teacher with 10 to 15 years’ experience is likely to score his/her confidence as a 4 or 'quite confident' \((7 - 1(0) \ 2(1) \ 1(0) \ 1(0) \ 1(1) = 4)\). The linear regression model suggests that teacher confidence is reduced by:

- One point if the teacher is a middle school teacher
- Two points if the teacher is a high school teacher
- One point if the teacher is a generalist
- One point if the teacher has 5 to 10 years of experience
- One point if the teacher has 10 to 15 years of experience

The following conclusions can be drawn from the linear regression:

- High school teachers are half as confident as middle school teachers.
- Specialists are more confident than generalists, but being a specialist neither increases nor decreases teacher confidence.
The effect of experience on confidence levels is the same for teachers with anywhere from 5 to 15 years of experience.

These findings may suggest that greater support is needed for high school teachers – it is possible that the guide needs teaching strategies that are more specific to high school Ministry expectations, or it might reflect that the majority of high school programs are instrumental and that opera is a less familiar subject. This may also speak to the challenge that study guide type resources often face, which is that of writing for multiple grades and needing to find a suitable mix of strategies and tasks that are challenging for a sometimes wide range of ages and stages. The finding that the confidence levels of experienced and less-experienced teachers and specialist or non-specialist teaching type do not affect the confidence levels differently, suggests that The Magic Flute Study Guide is an effective teaching resource for a wide range of educator needs.

In probing teacher perceptions of the guide’s helpfulness, different sections of the guide were surveyed. The Performance Information section has practical details for the teacher about stop and start times, lunch suggestions and use of the washrooms; architectural and acoustical features of the hall, and background on the opera company, and traditions around the chorus, principals and the understudies who will be in the principal roles on the day of the student matinee. The Performance Information section helps the day run smoothly, encourages students to be aware of their surroundings, and gives them a sense of who the community arts organization is. Teachers found all of this information helpful, and the “what to expect at the opera” information, in particular (83% of teachers rated this very or extremely helpful).

Figure 2 identifies that the section containing information about Mozart was helpful for all respondents, and that the information about Mozart’s life was the most helpful. This would indicate a valuing of the historical context of the music as well as a direct connection to the music curriculum.
Figure 2. Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the Mozart section of the guide.

The *All About Opera* section contains general information and opera terms on the *Everything You Wanted to Know About Opera* page, and then very specific information about *The Magic Flute* in the form of a three-page illustrated synopsis, and a two-page illustrated plot digest titled *The Magic Flute* At-A-Glance. Figure 3 illustrates the helpfulness rankings of these three sections. Note that illustrated synopsis is considered the most helpful.
**Figure 3. Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the All About Opera section of the guide.**

The section related to the *CD Listening Guide* is a matrix with 11 excerpts from the opera listed that have been chosen by the writers because they are important to the plot development and/or have musical significance. Figure 4 illustrates that the CD Listening Guide is considered very or extremely helpful by a majority of the teachers. Of interest is that the highest rating goes to the most interactive type of information, that of the listening strategies and activities.
In the CD Listening Guide there are three columns of information provided for each excerpt – storyline information, musical details, and listening strategies and activities. The intent of the matrix is to provide easy access points for the teacher on all of the excerpts, thereby increasing the chances that their students will hear the excerpts frequently and have several ways of responding and interacting available to them. CDs of the excerpts are provided by the opera company for each student. The matrix is information-rich, yet concise. A considerable amount of music information and terminology is shared in the musical detail column. The high rating of the listening strategies and activities, which provide both listening prompts that encourage student discovery of information (rather than being told) and multi-arts ways for students to interact with the music, suggest that teachers value inquiry and arts-based teaching strategies.

The main teaching materials contained in the guide are in the Lesson section of the guide. Each of six lessons has a specific teaching objective, materials list, lesson map of steps to follow and a sidebar listing all of the Ontario Ministry of Education Arts Curriculum expectations that are addressed in the lesson for Grades 7–12. The lessons are considered in greater detail later in
the study, as part of the qualitative analysis of artifacts. Figure 5 indicates that all of the lessons were considered helpful, with the three most helpful being “The Who’s Who of The Magic Flute”, “Everybody Loves Papageno”, and “A Plot for All Purposes.”

**Figure 5. Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the following study guide Lessons.**

A section of Black Line Masters (BLMs) is included at the end of the guide. These BLMs are resources to support the delivery of instruction. They include things like graphic organizers, libretto from scenes in the opera, an aria, text for role plays, and character cards and clues for games (see Figure 6). Not surprisingly, the BLMs ranked most helpful were for use with the most highly ranked lesson (“The Who’s Who of The Magic Flute”). The least helpful item in this section was the list of web resources. The BLMs section is intended to provide the teachers with everything they need to successfully carry out the lessons. I would consider it an important *ease of use* feature.
Figure 6. Teacher responses: Please rate the helpfulness of the Black Line Masters Section of the guide.

Teacher survey: Qualitative data

Three open-ended questions were included in the survey:

- What section of the guide did you find personally most interesting and enjoyable to read? Why?

- What did you hope your students would gain from attending *The Magic Flute*?

- Do you have any suggestions for making future study guides more helpful?

In analyzing the responses to the open-ended questions, I started with a general read through, looking for words or phrases that occurred frequently and areas where there seemed to be general consensus. In identifying what teachers found most enjoyable to read, frequent mention was made of the type of information helpful for their students in increasing understanding and familiarity. In responding to why they personally found it most interesting and enjoyable to read, comments included the relevance of the information, the readability of the story (plot synopsis) and many mentions related to the multiple ways of accessing the plot.
categorize this as the overarching feature of Student Preparation, or building familiarity prior to the performance to maximize learning. Teachers identified it in the specific following ways:

- The *plot is important*. Teachers mention the usefulness of the synopsis provided the plot summary and the At-A-Glance chart (also about the plot).
- The number and *variety of teaching strategies* offered are appreciated.
- Teachers see the *interdisciplinary connections* made in the guide and in the experience of attending the opera.

When asked “What did you hope your students would gain from attending *The Magic Flute*?”, the word “appreciation” was used frequently. Teachers identified that they hoped their students would gain an appreciation for opera, Mozart’s music, the drama of the characters, traditional story, or something they did not know much about but would learn to appreciate. The aspect of their students being able to attend a live performance was mentioned numerous times, specifically “live opera”, “live orchestra”, “live performance”, and “experience the performance live.” One teacher identified that it gave his/her students a “better understanding of the difficulties of performance, opera singing.” I categorize this information as the overarching feature of Power of the Art Form, or, a deepened understanding of opera.

- Students gain an *appreciation* for the many aspects of opera.
- The *live performance is special*. It is described as a “valuable opportunity”, “a great discovery” and teachers note the positive effect that the live performance has on their students.

**Conclusions and Discussion From the Survey Results**

The teacher survey identified that using *The Magic Flute Study Guide* increased teacher confidence in being able to engage students in opera. Teachers identified that the most helpful parts of the guide are those that build familiarity with the music, plot and characters, and prepare the students for attending the performance. The quality of the guide was rated highly in terms of its visual appearance and information provided first, followed closely by ease of use and then relevance to the teachers’ curriculum.
Some flaws noted in the survey are: the oversight of not sending the survey out in both of Canada’s official languages may have resulted in more results from French immersion schools and; the wording in the descriptive data section where it appears that most of those teachers who identified themselves as generalists in question 4 also identified themselves as Non-Arts Specialists in Question 6.

Some helpful information arising for the opera company is the lack of first year teachers attending. This is understandable since the matinee was held within the third week back to school in September and a beginning teacher would not likely be networked into the system of field trips. (It may also indicate that there are fewer new teachers getting jobs.) This presents an opportunity for the opera company, who might want to consider how to reach these potential teachers by visiting the local faculty of education in the spring of the year.

A design consideration that speaks to the relatively high years of teaching experience reported in the study is to be sure that future guides include new information and innovative teaching strategies that would appeal to veteran teachers.

**Writing Team Artifacts Analysis Results**

Emails from *The Magic Flute Study Guide* writing team were reviewed for their significance in intent: What did the authors consider to be of utmost importance for the guide to contain? Later in the mixed methods approach, I used this information to see if what the authors deemed important aligned or overlapped with what the teachers in the survey identified as helpful, but initially, I analyzed the emails only for authorial intent. Emails from a 3-month span were sorted by writer first, and then coded. Five broad themes emerged. (I am Author #1, my co-writer is Author #2, Dr. S is a Mozart specialist, and other emails are from an Opera Administrator and a Percussion Teacher.)

**Theme: “The Plot Matters!”**

A frequent and early topic in the email exchanges between myself and Author #2 was the creation of the synopsis and the At-a-Glance chart. This was based on prior knowledge from previous study guides we had created for the opera company – teachers had specifically given feedback to the opera company that the synopsis and (plot) At-A-Glance pages were popular
with their students and helped them understand what the opera was about. Knowing that opera plots are convoluted with multiple characters who are often in disguise, we made the synopsis as clear as possible, in as few words as possible. Determining the key plot points was the starting point (and required synthesizing a lot of information), followed by working with the illustrator to get the images that best support the story line. We further strengthened the use of the Synopsis by embedding it into a lesson plan.

I changed the synopsis a tiny bit to make it work better with this lesson, and I dropped in the music references. I don't think the picture references need to be there because they will be on the page right beside the text. (Author 2)

The embedding of the Synopsis into a lesson is a deliberate design choice and characteristic of all our study guides, resulting from our original research into study guides where we noted that too often guides provided by community arts organizations organized information in sections (e.g., All About the Instruments, Composer Information) and then overlooked the information in the lessons or activities provided. It was an area of disconnect that we knew we could improve on.

**Theme: “Make the Music Come Alive”**

Our emails debated at length on the selection of the 11 excerpts that would eventually form the CD Listening Guide Matrix. When one considers that a performance of *The Magic Flute* is approximately 3 hours long and includes an overture, many arias (songs), interspersed with a running dialogue that provides dramatic and musical continuity, and frequent passages where only the orchestra is playing, while onstage significant dramatic action may be taking place, it is easy to see why narrowing the choice of excerpts down is difficult. A chart started at an initial face-to-face meeting with the possible excerpts listed under the headings “Selection” and then “Character [who is singing]” “Themes and Big Ideas” and “Notes” went back and forth between us several times, accumulating new thinking, until we felt confident that we had the musically most interesting excerpts for the students. Getting the right music chosen for the student listening is crucial – it serves a practical need in supporting their understanding of the plot and an aesthetic goal of having the power to move and inspire the listener.
Mozart specialist Dr. S. helped bring Mozart alive for us. He was able to describe the breadth and depth of Mozart’s body of work. He knew the origins of so much of Mozart’s music and could see the connections to things beyond the music.

In Salzburg he wrote instrumental sonatas for organ and strings to be played for the Mass. Unfortunately he got into trouble with the Archbishop because he (the Archbishop) wanted speedy masses and Mozart's music was sometimes too long. So Mozart wrote tiny little ensemble pieces that lasted 2 or 3 minutes, and these little sonatas are gems. (Dr. S.)

**Theme: “The Guide Should Be Easy for the Teacher to Use”**

It is apparent from our email discussion that we gave consideration to how teachers think and function. We strove for clarity and added examples that we knew would help the teachers. We supported them through alignment to Ministry Arts curriculum expectations, which were changing that year.

The role-on-the-wall in this lesson doesn't feel quite right – in terms of what goes inside and outside the outlines. I had a more elaborate process for the visual art component, but cut it down because I think it was unrealistically elaborate – I am hoping that what is here is more practical. The elements of music align with the new curriculum if you're wondering why they are a little different than our usual. (Author 2)

Hi! Sorry this is taking so long! We weren't satisfied with the flow of the lessons for supporting the new Arts expectations from the Ministry (they will be brand new to teachers this September so we wanted to be sure they are clear and accessible) so we are revamping things somewhat. (Author 1 to opera administrator)

I have tidied things up a very tiny bit. Do you think you could add examples [for teacher edification] in the chart as we had discussed a while back? [“A Plot for All Purposes” lesson]. Here is the latest version. (Author 1)
Theme: “Make the Lessons Appealing to the Age Group of the Students”

There were frequent references to student interest and presenting ideas in ways that were engaging. We considered both the relevancy of the content and how it might be delivered to the students.

We are at the hard point now where we have to synthesize all we have learned about the opera, the characters, the music, and put it into a few lessons that will appeal to the middle school and high school audience. This is always a challenge! (Author 1 to Dr. S.)

There are some nice ideas here though no trajectory as yet! – I like the idea of looking for symbols in our own environment. We could go back to our metaphor lesson to have students create symbols as part of this. The Atelier stuff will give us the background info needed to do a teacher sheet – the best visual for the students would be Atelier's gorgeous poster as every single symbol is in it. Maybe we could have one more stab at seeing if that can be made available to put into the guide? It would make this lesson. (Author 2)

Hi. I want to redo the Atelier poster part so that they fill in the first column instead of the second – they look at the second column and try to find something on the poster that symbolizes it – much easier and more fun. Will send in the morning along with the rest of the curriculum connections. (Author 2)

Could you notate Papageno's bird catcher song with the three English verses for a black line master? I think it should stay in the bass clef. (Author 2)

I still have to finish the character cards with quotes but could you have a look through the lesson and see if it reads well? (Author 1)

The alternative would be to scan the two pages from the version you use. Is there a really clear copy of it anywhere? The advantage to that would be having both the German and English plus being able to see all of the interesting things in the accompaniment. (Author 1)
Theme: “Utilize the Unique”

The symbolism in *The Magic Flute* got our attention. We explored it in depth and brought in some help from our Mozart specialist, “Dr. S.” The fact that the Masonic symbolism is unusual in one sense, yet so universal in another, was appealing to us. We saw ways to connect to larger concepts.

Hi. A couple of interesting insights about MF. That theory about Maria Theresa and Emperor Joseph II was from the 1860s, and seems still to be very well regarded. The Masonic interpretation was published as early as 1793 or so. Two interpreters I have read say that Mozart went to some trouble to reverse the misogynist interpretation by making both heroes cowards (the first thing Tamino does is faint in the face of danger, Pamina leads Tamino through the trials and goes first) and by making the female characters so strong. An interesting thing perhaps for students to examine – and the direction will influence too. (Author 2)

I am sure you have explored the many Masonic references throughout the "Magic Flute." One would need to be a Mason to catch all of the Masonic musical references (bell, etc.). Mozart's "Requiem" has a Roman Catholic text but it was also strongly influenced by free Freemasonry! (Dr. S.)

Another note on Masonry: Both Mozart and Haydn were Masons. I didn't mention that in my note. During the 18th century Classical period of Mozart and Haydn the Masonic Order included many prominent Roman Catholics. Unfortunately in the U.S. sectarianism developed, so Roman Catholics did not become Masons. The Knights of Columbus and other orders were Roman Catholic in makeup. I was very aware of this division as I grew up in Buffalo, a heavily Roman Catholic city in the 1940s and 1950s. Today I understand there are not the large numbers in Masonry that there were earlier. (Dr. S.)

In addition to looking for the unique features in the plot and historical background, our ears were attracted to what was musically unusual. We noticed the sweet sound of the magic bells that Papageno plays and wondered if there was anything interesting for students to learn about them. Author 2 consulted a school district percussion teacher to track down a description of the instrument used.
Hi. I think the instrument in question is a celeste – read on…. (Author 2)

The glockenspiel may be used to support a melody or for bell-like effects. It appeared relatively early in comparison with other percussion instruments, and has taken various forms, including a version for a marching band in which the metal plates are arranged vertically, and a version played by a keyboard (used by Mozart in *The Magic Flute*, 1791, and more recently by Messiaen in the *Turangalîla Symphony*, 1948).

Above is what I cut and pasted for verification….It is a glock, but because of the difficulty of the passage to play it with one stick while carrying the instrument in the other hand on stage…it is probably performed by a celeste by the pit orchestra on the recording you have…which also has a lovely bell tone…while the person on stage is “faking” it with an actual glockenspiel. That is my guess. I can’t believe you are asking such difficult questions in June!!! Ha ha ha! (school district percussion teacher)

**Theme: “A Picture Is Worth A Thousand Words”**

We were aware of the importance of providing lots of visual connections with the text. For example, the Synopsis and the shorter form At-A-Glance were illustrated and it took a number of tries with our illustrator to get it right. Fortunately for us he was intrigued by the opera and like us, wanted to make it as accurate and accessible for the students as possible. We shared our resources with him as we found them: books, DVDs, costume research, and set designs.

Hi. Here’s what we are thinking for the illustrations: 1. Dead serpent, 3 ladies holding flute, chimes, portrait of Pamina, Tamino looking at portrait of Pamina, Papageno reaching for the chimes 2.Tamino and Pamina embracing with Sarastro looking on at the Temple of the sun, end of Act 1 – same picture can be re-used for end of Act II 3. Queen of the Night giving a dagger to Pamina 4. Tamino and Pamina go through the trial by fire, T. plays the flute 5. Papageno with bells, meets Papagena, 3 spirits in the clouds 6. Repeat picture number 2 (Author 1 to the Illustrator)
Subject: Hockney photos. Hi. Here's a Power Point with the photos. Enjoy!  
(Author 1 to Illustrator)

Anyhow I think the look of this is a bit confusing. Sarastro can look Egyptian but the others not so much I think? The look here is also alarmingly unisex – the ladies look like the boys – they should be very very female. Part of the contrast in the opera is between the female world of the Queen and the male world of the temple. Papageno must have a birdcage on his back – that is essential. (Author 2)

I agree about the look. Was that picked that up from the Julie Taymour DVD maybe. I really would like the illustrations to look more like the Hockney costumes they will be seeing. Am I on the wrong track there? (Author 1)

Hi. Can you put a slain serpent in the sketch? It should be chopped into three pieces. Thanks! (Author 1 to illustrator)

Questions arising from the results of the teacher survey were, What were the key features of the top three rated lessons? What made those lessons more helpful to teachers than the remaining three? To look more deeply at this I analyzed all six of the lessons and identified the primary and secondary focus of each lesson and looked for the actions of learning implied in each lesson (see Table 1). I paid particular attention to how the lessons differentiated instruction through content, process and products, as understood from the body of research on differentiated instruction (Tomlinson, 2000). What stands out is the variety of teaching strategies offered, and that many are arts-based and the ways in which student investigate and learn are often kinesthetically and visually centered or reinforced.
### Table 1

**Analysis of the Six Lessons From The Magic Flute Study Guide**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Primary Focus</th>
<th>Secondary Focus</th>
<th>Teaching Actions</th>
<th>Helpfulness Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“A Plot for All Purposes”</td>
<td>Understanding of plot and subplot.</td>
<td>Predicting the artistic decisions behind the performance that will help distinguish the plot from the sub-plot.</td>
<td>Embeds the use of the Synopsis. Uses kinesthetic learning (students dramatize in-role as synopsis is read). Reinforces visually. Small group work requires ability to synthesize. Provides post performance learning activity (reflection). No music listening.</td>
<td>Builds student understanding. Relevant to curriculum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson Title</td>
<td>Primary Focus</td>
<td>Secondary Focus</td>
<td>Teaching Actions</td>
<td>Helpfulness Themes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Secrets and Symbols”</td>
<td>Understanding of symbolism: auditory recognition of Mozart’s musical symbols in the Overture, visual recognition in David Hockney’s set designs</td>
<td>Conducting with attention to steady beat, dynamics and auditory recognition of instruments, familiarity with the <em>Overture</em>.</td>
<td>Use of web-based resources.</td>
<td>Cross curricular connections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Examining symbols in the opera requires deeper thinking and a more sophisticated understanding of the plot. Reinforces familiarity with the plot while requiring students to think metaphorically. Familiarizes students with the music. Reflective work using personal application of the MF symbols.</td>
<td>Builds student understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asks students to listen and describe.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Furthers plot understanding by identifying direct character quotes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Focused listening – identifying voice type.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson Title</td>
<td>Primary Focus</td>
<td>Secondary Focus</td>
<td>Teaching Actions</td>
<td>Helpfulness Themes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Everybody Loves Papageno”</td>
<td>Understanding the comedic role of Papageno.</td>
<td>Singing and rhythmic awareness.</td>
<td>Strong on music skills (reading from notation, isolating rhythmic patterns). Sidebar related to theatre describing the first actor to play Papageno and how he built a theatre with previously unheard of lighting and special effects.</td>
<td>Builds student understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Prince of Light: Queen of Darkness”</td>
<td>Exploring how Mozart musically contrasts two main characters (Sarastro and the Queen of the Night).</td>
<td>Interviewing-in-role as either reporter or The First Lady. Writing an article.</td>
<td>Reinforces plot and character recognition. Deeper discussion around composer’s intent – final journal prompt is reflective in nature.</td>
<td>Builds student understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pair-share, listening, Writing-to-describe. Small group discussion. In-role work, interviewing-in-role, writing about a character.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson Title</td>
<td>Primary Focus</td>
<td>Secondary Focus</td>
<td>Teaching Actions</td>
<td>Helpfulness Themes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The highest rated lesson – “The Who’s Who of The Magic Flute” – and the third highest rated lesson – “A Plot for All Purposes”, were strongly oriented to preparing students for understanding the opera. One was based on the plot, the other on the characters. This aligns with one of the key themes emerging from the analysis of the writing team artifacts, *the plot matters*, as described earlier. This focus on demystifying the plot is noted also in the artifacts from the design and writing process of the earlier study guides. This would support the helpfulness themes of *builds student understanding*. The second highest rated lesson was “Everybody Loves Papageno” which is centered in developing music skills and uses a quite well known tune from the opera (Papageno’s Song). This suggests a valuing of the music skills aligned with the arts curriculum, most likely coming from the music specialist teachers.

**Identifying the Critical Attributes: Merging the Data Strands**

In identifying the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide, I compared the findings from the quantitative section of the teacher survey with the findings of the qualitative section of the teacher survey and the themes emerging from the qualitative analysis of the writing team artifacts. When the quantitative strand and the qualitative strands were merged a more comprehensive picture can be seen (see Table 2).
Table 2

*Blending of Information From Teacher Survey and Writing Team Artifacts*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEMES from Teacher Survey</th>
<th>QUAN examples from Teacher Survey</th>
<th>QUAL examples from Teacher Survey</th>
<th>THEMES from Writing Team Artifacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Building teacher confidence in engaging students with the opera</td>
<td>35% overall increase in confidence after reading the guide.</td>
<td>“…and eased my teaching considerably.” “The story itself. It was easy to read and understand for the students.”</td>
<td>The guide should be easy for the teacher to use.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Significant confidence jumps from before reading the guide, to after.</td>
<td>“…mainly because it helps me to fill in the students.”</td>
<td>A picture is worth a thousand words.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students are better prepared for the performance.</td>
<td>25% somewhat better prepared, 33% quite a lot better prepared, 41% extremely better prepared.</td>
<td>“The more information students have before the performance, the better able they are to embrace and participate intellectually and emotionally”</td>
<td>The plot matters!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High helpfulness ratings in the All About Opera section, particularly the Synopsis of <em>The Magic Flute</em>.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A picture is worth a thousand words.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical content is valued.</td>
<td>High helpfulness ratings on Mozart information – his life especially, and his music and the times.</td>
<td>“I really enjoyed the information about the historical context of the opera.”</td>
<td>Make the music come alive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Utilize the unique.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical content is valued.</td>
<td>High ratings of the helpfulness of the CD Listening Guide, particularly the listening strategies and activities.</td>
<td>Appreciation for inclusion of score samples, request for a full orchestral score.</td>
<td>Make the music come alive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“We love this and the opera program has made fans of us.”</td>
<td>Utilize the unique.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Make the lessons appealing to the age group of the students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THemes from Teacher Survey</td>
<td>QUAN examples from Teacher Survey</td>
<td>Qual examples from Teacher Survey</td>
<td>THEMES from Writing Team Artifacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the plot and characters</td>
<td>The two highest rated lessons were specifically directed at understanding the plot and learning about the characters.</td>
<td>Most interesting and enjoyable sections of the guide sited plot summaries, the synopsis, and things that help fill in the information about the opera, biography of the singer. “The story itself. It was easy to read and understand for the students and made them feel they were learning something special.”</td>
<td>The plot matters!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The guide is relevant</td>
<td>High rating of the listening and teaching strategies in CD listening guide.</td>
<td>“We are still making connections, even in Geography.” “The lessons and the resources fit the curriculum beautifully.” “How it fits into the times and how it fits into all times.”</td>
<td>Make the lessons appealing to the age group of the students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To students</td>
<td>High rating of Mozart’s life and times.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Make the music come alive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To music curriculum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Utilize the unique.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Across the curriculum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is easy to see that themes from the writing team representing what the authors considered important to have in the guide, align and overlap with what the teachers found to be helpful. This alignment suggests the following critical attributes for a music partnership study guide:

1. It is relevant. It relates to the lives of the students, to the music curriculum, and to other subjects across the curriculum.

2. It prepares students for the concert experience by building familiarity with and understanding of the plot, the characters and the music.

3. It makes the music come alive.
4. It builds teacher confidence.

Part Two: Examining the Design Process

In the previous section I presented four critical attributes of a music partnership study guide, arising from the blending of findings from the teacher survey and the artifacts of the writing team. In the next section, I apply this information to the overarching research question of this study: “How does knowledge of the critical attributes of a music partnership curriculum influence its design?” I begin this work by using the study guide as the primary data source, and analyze it for presence of different types of understandings, and features of the writing style and content. This yields information about the decisions and choices I have made as a music partnership curriculum designer. I follow this work with a description of my process as identified from the writing artifacts and reflections accumulated over the 4-year period starting from the development of three previous opera study guides to the development of The Magic Flute Study Guide. I synthesize my process into a 10-step framework.

Study Guide: The Six Facets of Understanding

Wiggins and McTighe (1998) propose an analytic framework in unit design to identify the Six Facets of Understanding. The framework represents a significant aspect of the larger body of work, Understanding by Design (UbD) developed by Grant Wiggins and Jay McTighe. I chose the Six Facets Of Understanding analytical framework for this study because the design process suggested in Understanding by Design (UbD) resonated with my own identified process as a developer of music-partnership curricula, and because the depth of the descriptions of the understandings seemed to surpass other taxonomies and frameworks that I had found helpful for checking my work against, such as Bloom’s Taxonomy (a taxonomy developed by Benjamin Bloom in 1956 to describe three types of learning – cognitive, affective, and psychomotor – most often in education it is referenced for its cognitive process dimension; as discussed in Anderson & Krathwohl, 2001) or Norman Webb’s Depth of Knowledge model (DOK) – a system for categorizing the progression of levels of cognitive demand (as cited in Hess, Jones, Carlock, & Walkup, 2009). As a curriculum designer, I value the rich descriptions of cognitive challenges that the Six Facets of Understanding framework offers.
The Six Facets of Understanding are indicators of how understanding is revealed and are ways of knowing what students have learned and understand. Awareness of the Six Facets of Understanding guides the design process for planning appropriate kinds of assessments (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006). The authors also state that although the Six Facets of Understanding were originally conceived as indicators of understanding, they have also been found to be useful in unit design for generating ideas for: “‘hooking’ students around a topic, engaging them in higher-order thinking, causing them to consider other points of view, and prompting self-assessment and reflection” (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006, p. 116).

The Six Facets of Understanding, which were described earlier in greater detail, were used as a framework for analyzing what aspects of the study guide contributed to understanding, and how. I approached this by reading through The Magic Flute Study Guide with the descriptions of the Six Facets in hand (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006; Wiggins & McTighe, 1998), along with lists of performance task verbs based on the Six Facets (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006), and a matrix of performance task ideas based on the Six Facets of Understanding (Wiggins & McTighe, 2011). The combined resources provided me with several ways of identifying the types of understanding implied in The Magic Flute Study Guide, and I coded accordingly throughout all 45 pages. On the initial pass through, I identified the different Facets of Understanding implied on each page and kept a running tally of what types of understandings appeared where. This identified the frequencies of the understandings overall and also served to highlight which types of understandings appeared in each section of the guide. A total of 117 understandings were identified in the study guide, and as Figure 7 indicates, the two most frequently used types of understanding were Explanation (27%) and Empathy (21%). The Lesson section of the guide contained the highest number of understandings.
The higher presence of Explanation understandings is understandable in a study guide with a purpose of explaining the contextual, musical and dramatic details of an opera. The finding of the high presence of Empathy understandings is interesting and is worth a closer look.

The CD Listening Guide, the six lessons, and the Blackline Masters were the sections in the guide that had the most of evidence of the six facets of understanding. Several examples of the Facets of Understanding present in the guide from the guide follow:

Facet 1 – **Explanation** type understandings were the most common type of understandings in the guide (27%) and were most often present in the Lessons, the CD Listening Guide and the Blackline Masters (BLMs) sections, in that order. Explanation refers to understanding that comes from puzzling something out, or developing a well thought out and supported theory. A simple strategy for this is to focus on the five Ws of journalism – who, what, where, when, and why.

Aspects of the CD Listening Guide frequently provide prompts for teachers to lead discussions that help students identify and understand the five Ws. For example, when listening to Tamino’s aria when he first sees a picture of Pamina and falls in love with her, students...
initially listen to the first minute of the aria without being given any information about the dramatic context. They are asked to guess who is singing, what he might be singing about, and what underlying emotion is being expressed. After the dramatic context (when and where) is provided they check how close their guesses were and then listen again, focusing this time on Tamino’s first two notes, and are asked to describe the effect of the interval he sings. They notice how the major sixth takes the singer’s voice into the higher, more emotionally intense end of the tenor range. They are then asked to be specific about what emotion the vocal line portrays. By the end of these listening steps, students should be able to confidently explain the context and meaning of the aria.

Facet 2 – Interpretation is the ability to describe the meaning or significance of something, such as an event, concept, theory, work of art, data, etc. It is often demonstrated through narrative and storytelling. In teaching for this type of understanding, the challenge is bringing text to life, making connections that are relevant to self, and helping students to consider multiple viewpoints and varied sources of information. Wiggins and McTighe (1998) suggest that we must “teach them [students] to build stories and interpretations, not just passively take in official ones” (p. 51). In The Magic Flute Study Guide, Interpretation accounted for 20% of the types of understandings used.

A strategy that Wiggins and McTighe (1998) suggest for building the ability to interpret is to “invite students to fashion an oral history out of disparate interviews” (p. 51). An example of this is found in the lesson Will the Real Pamina Please Stand Up? We position author Maurice Sendak’s interpretation of the character Pamina as the true heroine against the more frequent interpretation of Pamina as totally lacking in any independence or personality. Students explore Pamina’s personality in a variety of ways (through the musical inferences, linking plot developments with understanding of the meaning of Pamina’s arias, hot-seating Pamina, holding a debate in role as Maurice Sendak or Mozart specialist R. B. Moberly, starting off with scripts paraphrased from their writings.

Facet 3 – Application is using understanding of a concept, principle or skill to inform or solve a new problem. It is context-dependent and uses situations that are new to the student. Wiggins and McTighe (1998) suggest using real world problems for developing application
understanding, or by specifically setting up problem-solving circumstances that would be encountered by professionals in their work. Application is best assessed through authentic tasks. In *The Magic Flute Study Guide*, Application accounted for 18% of the types of understandings used.

An example of application in *The Magic Flute Study Guide* is in the lesson “A Plot for All Purposes.” Here students are challenged to apply their understanding of the opera’s plot and sub-plot by finding a book, movie, or TV show that has the same all-purpose plot as *The Magic Flute*. Application of musical skills are noted throughout the study guide and include conducting the Overture, singing Papageno’s aria, using rhythmic knowledge to accompany Papageno’s aria, and applying knowledge of the elements of music to two contrasting arias.

Similar to a task that a professional set designer would encounter and hence, an authentic task in *Secrets and Symbols* students apply their understanding of symbols in sketching two different sets for the opera. The lesson concludes by asking students to “adopt one of the musical or visual symbols from *The Magic Flute* as a personal symbol. Write for 5 minutes about how this symbol is meaningful for you, and then share it with a small group.” In this instance, the task requires that students understand the meaning of the symbols in the opera and find a way to connect to and explain its personal significance.

Facet 4 – **Perspective** is the ability to have critical and insightful points of view, and being able to see things from a dispassionate or disinterested perspective. This type of understanding requires the discipline to step back and question how something might look from a different point of view. Perspective can be encouraged by providing opportunities to confront alternative theories and diverse points of view. In *The Magic Flute Study Guide*, Perspective accounted for 11% of the understandings.

The lesson *Prince of Light: Queen of Darkness* familiarizes students with the arias of two characters – Sarastro and the Queen of the Night – through listening and discussion of the composer’s intent. Students are asked to think of several questions they would like to ask of Sarastro or the Queen of the Night, if both were to walk into the classroom. They write these questions down and then team up with a partner to act in-role as a reporter from the local paper or one of the two characters, Sarastro or Queen of the Night. Students interview and then reverse
Facet 5 – **Empathy** is the ability to “get inside another person’s feelings and worldview” (Wiggins & McTighe, p. 55), or the commonly used phrase *walk a mile in someone else’s shoes*. Empathy requires the ability to get beyond what seems odd or unfamiliar, and to have respect for those who are different from us. Wiggins and McTighe (1998) suggest that it is a form of insight, and that being able to empathize may lead to a change of heart. Greiner (2012) traces the translation into English from German of the word empathy back to 1909, and notes that it was used at that time to describe the unique combination of cognitive effort and bodily feeling thought to characterize aesthetic experience. It sprang from the word sympathy. In *The Magic Flute Study Guide*, Empathy is the second most frequently occurring understanding at 21%.

Much of the work of *The Magic Flute Study Guide* centers around building understanding of the characters and how they fit into the plot. All of this work essentially results in deeper understanding of and empathy for the characters. In the lesson, “A Plot for all Purposes,” students each take a character card and as the synopsis is read aloud, they create an impromptu performance of the story, in-role. In a following lesson, students are each given a quote that is a lyric sung by a character in the opera. They have to figure out who the character is and then listen to the aria that the quote came from. They determine what voice type their character has, and then share and defend their decision with the class. This musical experience of the character adds another dimension of understanding.

The opportunity to sing an aria of a character is hugely helpful for being able to get inside another person’s feelings. In the lesson “Everybody Loves Papageno” students sing Papageno’s using an English translation. Mozart expertly creates a joyful, humorous and trusting Papageno’s character through his music. To sing the aria, is to experience the world of Papageno, through his eyes. It’s the *musical* version of walking a mile in his shoes.

Music, and opera in particular with its musical focus on character development, has the capacity to play a key role in the development of empathic understanding. Neuroscience studies identify that highly emotional music engages a reward system deep inside the brain. The physical
response sometimes felt (a chill) listening to music “causes the release of the neurotransmitter dopamine, an essential signaling molecule in the brain” (Zatorre & Salimpoor, 2013, ¶ 5).

Facet 6 – **Self-Knowledge** is described by Wiggins and McTighe (1998) as “the wisdom to know one’s ignorance and how one’s patterns of thought and action inform as well as prejudice understanding” (p. 57). By knowing what we know and don’t know, we have a chance to notice and challenge our blind spots, and further new thinking. Use of self-knowledge was only identified once (less than 1%) in the 117 understandings found in *The Magic Flute Study Guide*.

Evidence of self-knowledge in a music partnership curriculum might include; students noticing how they respond to music; reflecting on what they have seen or heard; being able to analyze what it is about the music that elicits a specific response; awareness of their biases or prejudices towards certain types of music; and noticing what musical skills are most enjoyable or challenging (singing, movement, rhythmic or melodic reading, conducting).

Three of the six lessons in the study guide conclude with a reflection. Two of the reflections ask students to revisit earlier predictions and describe additional insights, and the third reflection is more of an application type of knowledge (adopting and writing about symbols from *The Magic Flute*). In analyzing the third reflections, they have not been worded to optimize self-knowledge. A simple rewording of the tasks could easily change this and further deepen the learning.

**Study Guide: Features of Writing Style and Content**

The first phase in analyzing the writing style and content of the study guide began with several readings of the guide. Butler-Kisber (2010) describes this as the coarse-grained phase where a researcher builds familiarity with her field texts (the data) through close readings and rereadings…dialoguing with herself about what is being revealed, writing reflective and analytic memos and/or keeping a journal or log, and playing with some broad categories in which different portions of the field texts can be placed, at least temporarily. (pp. 30–31)
I began by making notes in the margins of the text over the course of many rereadings. The margin notes identified writing style choices, sometimes with words describing authorial intent or effect. These margin notes were eventually moved into a list format in a Word document which made it easier to see reoccurring key words and how they were used similarly or differently. I grouped the list into categories and colour-coded for several potential themes.

Butler-Kisber (2010) describes the next phase of analysis as “fine-grained” (p. 30) where one further breaks down the categories until they appear saturated and cannot be broken down further, at which point they are reassembled into more general themes “based on the relational dimensions among the categories that emerge” (p. 31). While this process is focused more often on qualitative research arising from interview and observations with human subjects, it was still helpful to apply to my qualitative analysis of data arising from the text of *The Magic Flute Study Guide*.

As I moved through this process in analyzing the writing style and content of the study guide and saw some of the larger themes emerge, I realized that what I was looking at were actually my *guiding principles of design*. These are beliefs shaped by the experiences of my teaching career and deepened in my work as a designer of music partnership curricula. Everything about my writing style and the content of the guide appears to boil down to three writing/design actions:

- Demystify
- Write *for* the teacher
- Design *rich* lessons

*Demystify* refers to the actions that unlock the entire concert experience, from arriving at the building, knowing how to act, understanding the story, recognizing the music and being in possession of a bit of “insider knowledge.” For instance, the guide includes a sidebar describing a unique architectural feature of the building where the opera hall is. It is not a generally known fact but once you are made aware, it is a feature that is seen all over the building in many different forms. The sidebar provides a starting suggestion as to where they might see this insider knowledge feature, thereby setting up an immediate connection with
the building. Behaviour tips function in much the same way so that students arrive knowing what some of the conventions of opera audiences are: “Please feel free to clap at the end of the arias or choruses. If you particularly like what you have heard, you can call out “Bravo!” (or “Brava” if it is a female singer).”

Much of the demystifying work is done within three actions of writing style that were noted frequently and early on in the analysis process: the use of humour, relevance, and contextualizing. I use these three writing actions to peel away assumptions and encourage connections with an underlying mission of making the art form accessible to the reader.

The use of humour in the guide is twofold. It disarms and draws in the reader, and it conveys information. It is often associated with sharing musical terminology, or language relating to the art form that is unfamiliar. For example, a side bar asks, “What in the world is a sitzprobe???” Pronounced ‘zits-probe’ this German word is not what you may think!” and goes on to describe the type of rehearsal that is held the first day of moving to the main stage. Another sidebar title describing the exploits of the young soprano featured in the Spotlight section uses a play on words “Sing or Swim.” Here humour is used to draw attention to the unusual and to build a connection to the young artist who will be performing at the concert. Humour is also used to deal with the larger than life aspect of opera – love at first sight between Pamina and Tamino, hard to believe plot lines, huge voices doing unnatural things – much of this information is approached with a deprecating type of humour that pokes fun at the art form but in a welcoming way.

The intent to build relevance is woven throughout the guide by making real life connections to the performers, pertinent observations about the life of the composer, and contemporary tie-ins with the history of times. A contemporary reference such as the sidebar “And Guess Who Was Voted Off the Island?” uses a line from a television series popular at the time of publication to describe the historical story of the improvisation contest between Mozart and Clementi, a rival. The purpose is to help the reader see Mozart as a real flesh and blood person ending up in situations not unlike current day celebrities. A similar tactic is used in the Spotlight interview with a member of the Silver Cast. The Silver Cast is the cast used for the high school matinee performance and features the understudies of the main-stage production.
They are typically young professionals at the start of their careers. The matinee affords them with the chance to sing a major role with full orchestra in an excellent hall. They are often close in age to the high school students in the audience and I use an informal interview style with lots of direct quotes to tease out aspects of their lives that will resonate with the students. While these young performers are not teaching artists within the context of the matinee performance, we know from the studies sited earlier in this paper that teens and tweens find the professionalism and real life experiences of artists very compelling (Montgomery et al., 2013).

The third and final writing action associated with demystifying is that of contextualization. Contextualization works as a demystifying strategy because it helps the reader make sense of what they are reading by making connections apparent. This works particularly well with historical information such as the writing in the Mozart’s Times section. Here background is provided describing the class structure of Mozart’s day and connections are made to the upheaval across the world at that time, manifested in the American Revolution and the French Revolution. Understanding the times helps students understand what shaped The Magic Flute. For this reason, we show a graphic timeline of Mozart’s life that is overlaid with information on what was happening in the rest of the world at that time, especially Canada. One respondent to the teacher survey described the value of this contextualizing as “I really enjoyed the information about the historical context of the opera; that is, what was happening in Canada at the time the opera was written. It tied in well with some of the history work we’ve been doing.”

Write for the teacher speaks to my writing actions that focus on engaging, challenging, and supporting the teacher. A study guide needs to pique the interest of the teacher, be easy to use, and have the end result of making teachers feel confident about sharing the subject matter with their students. Of these three needs, the one most evident in The Magic Flute Study Guide is that of ease of use. Resources are identified, suggestions are made for helping the order or flow of the lesson, and all support documents or templates are provided for easy copying and distribution. Examples of this type of support include provision of character clue cards with quotes culled from the opera’s libretto; character information cards with specific information categories; arias from the score with English lyrics embedded into lessons; libretto excerpts in English embedded into lessons; dialogues for reading aloud that are embedded into
lessons; templates for sketching and writing; and scripts for role play debating authorial intent. All of these are time consuming to track down or create. It is highly unlikely that a single teacher will have the time to do this.

Ideally the study guide sets up a process for the teacher much like Schwartz’s (2006) “rehearsal curriculum” of “disjuncture – research – innovation” (p. 454). Here the intent is for the teacher to move through an inspirational learning process that brings new learning and excitement for the subject and enables him or her to create a similar “disjuncture – research – innovation” opportunity for students. I believe that this approach is echoed in the way the guide is designed. There are ample opportunities for disjuncture for the teachers in the questions that are posed both the CD Listening Guides section, and in each of the lessons. Several of the lessons are deliberately provocative and challenge the status quo; for example, a lesson exploring the use of symbolism in the opera, and a lesson challenging the understanding of the character Pamina. The research step happens with the use of the numerous information sections provided which lead to innovation, or as Schwartz (2006) describes “the curriculum offers information or analyses that can serve as a basis for new and innovative understanding” (p. 454). At this point the use of the study guide diverges from Schwartz’ approach in that it does not suggest that this then leads to the teacher developing his or her own lesson plan. In the case of The Magic Flute Study Guide, it is assumed that teacher uses those lessons provided in the guide.

The desired end result of increasing a teacher’s confidence in engaging their students with the subject matter flows from the careful balance of providing helpful, easy to use materials in the guide, juxtaposed with materials and teaching directions that challenge and stimulate the teacher. This is an important consideration and potential pitfall if care is not taken in the development stages. A study guide for a music partnership performance runs the risk of presenting itself as finished thinking, complete with all the facts, dates, historical and musical details. Wiggins and McTighe (1998) identify the same kind of risk in textbook coverage, noting that blanket statements in textbooks hide controversies and difficulties, and present information as forgone conclusions without the students have the benefit of the struggle and messiness of inquiry. In much the same way, a study guide needs to encourage a teacher towards inquiry and uncoverage.
Design rich lessons refers to the actions of teaching used in the guide that excite both teacher and student and create a learning environment conducive to creative exploration and expression. I believe that rich lessons have multiple ways to access content and provide a variety of ways to demonstrate learning. Rich lessons also result in high levels of engagement, hopefully with many of the lasting effects described as,

People who experience high levels of engagement with works of art move imaginatively and emotionally into different worlds; broaden their field of reference beyond the confines of their own lives; exercise their capacity for empathy; develop faculties of perception, interpretation, and judgment; and form bonds with others who find in some works of art the expression of what whole communities of people have experienced. (McCarthy et al., 2004, as cited in Zakaras & Lowell, 2008, p. 4)

Some of the actions of teaching noted in the writing styles analysis are; providing details that help a teacher to guide discussion but with deliberately phrased questions that solicit student thinking first; centering lessons with a strong visual component (such as the use of Hockney set design images in the lesson exploring Mozart’s use of symbolism, or images of the Queen of the Night and Sarastro in the lesson comparing their characteristics), using a mix of kinesthetic and visual teaching strategies to land musical concepts; encouraging experimentation with musical skills (such as trying to match the highest pitches of the Queen of the Night, or the lowest of Sarastro); use of teaching prompts that begin with “ask students” far more frequently than with “tell students,” thereby encouraging students to ponder and discuss rather than the teacher continually taking the role of holder of knowledge; and, providing more than one form of content (for instance, the synopsis is provided in two forms – one is in paragraph form with descriptive detail, the other is in an “At-A-Glance” format with just key plot points included).

Another component to designing rich lessons is the use of arts-based teaching strategies, strategies drawn from the arts disciplines of music, dance, visual arts and theatre. The analysis reveals that the majority of the teaching strategies used in Magic Flute Study Guide are arts-based, and furthermore, are multi-arts based (more than one type of arts-based strategy used in each lesson or activity). The study guide draws heavily upon theatre (interviewing-in-role, hot seating, reading-in-role), somewhat on visual arts (sketching characters or contrasting set designs, drawing portrait miniatures), little from dance, and understandably, a good amount from
music (conducting, listening, adding body percussion accompaniments, singing, etc.). Arts-based strategies by their nature are a highly visual, auditory and kinesthetic means to receiving and processing information. They are strong contributors to ways of differentiating learning and a meaningful way to engage students. I believe that the frequency of Understandings identified in the study guide using the analytical framework of The Six Facets Of Understanding further supports my belief that arts-based strategies are key to creating “rich lessons.”

A final observation yielded from the analysis of the guide’s writing features and content relates to extending the learning experience. The guide is written with material for at least several weeks of learning prior to the concert experience, and learning extending beyond the concert is suggested and reinforced in several ways. Lessons include questions that ask students to make predictions on how a specific approach to the music, staging or set design will be handled at the performance, which is later revisited to compare their predictions with what actually happened. For example, in the lesson “A Plot for all Purposes” students study the plot and sub-plot of The Magic Flute. They synthesize their thinking into a statement about each of the five plots elements (protagonists, story problem, complications, crisis, and resolution) and make a prediction about either of two questions: “How will these plots be different from each other?” or “How will the opera keep our interest if the two plots are almost identical?” After the opera students revisit their predictions, discuss how accurate they were and look for any additional insights.

**My Design Steps**

The previous section identified how The Magic Flute Study Guide builds understanding, and gave examples from the guide of each of the Six Facets of Understanding as described by Wiggins and McTighe (1998, 2011). This was followed by an analysis of the writing style and content of the study guide and description of my guiding principles of design – demystify, write for the teacher, and design rich lessons. In the next section I will further present a list of design steps, summarized from a review of my design process in the production of four opera study guides, including The Magic Flute Study Guide, and to some extent, general principles of design that I follow for other types of music partnership curricula. I start with a more informal description of the process, taken from my journal notes.
Reflections on Developing the Study Guide

Grounding in the curriculum
Before we even get to the music, there is an initial foray into provincial expectations or state standards of the grade levels we will be writing for. We look at the visual and performing arts standards first, with a keener eye cast on the music strands. This generally doesn’t take long because the expectations or standards are very familiar to us. Then we move on to the so-called academic curriculum, and look for the larger units of study. Social studies and science often yield interesting connections.

Working with the music
The process starts with an initial brainstorm around the story line. We grapple with the question of what’s important, search for the “big ideas” – the overarching universal concepts like power, change, love, oppression, etc. We look at the different characters of the opera and chart what’s interesting, puzzling, or amusing about them. We look for subplots, the stories within the stories. (And in opera, there are many!)

Deep dive
Once we have an inkling of some potential areas of study we do a huge resource collection. We do online searches, put in library orders for related texts, CDs and DVDs. We have a favorite opera author and are always delighted when we find that he’s written a whole book on the opera we are writing the guide for.

We talk out loud and chart our ideas – mind mapping with lots of different colours on chart paper. The office walls are eventually covered. We have learned never to throw the chart paper away until the very end, when the guide has gone to press. Having the ideas and thinking visible helps us to make connections. It is surprising the number of connections that come up over the course of the work. They aren’t always obvious in the beginning.

Throughout this time we are listening, listening, listening. Our iPods go everywhere with us and we immerse ourselves in the music. Saturate ourselves. As we listen and keep listening, we become conscious of the various subtleties of the music. We are always running it through the lens of “what might be interesting about this to a Grade ____ student”? 
Synthesize
Early on, we are forced by necessity (time!) to synthesize and determine what the key plot points are. This is because we need to allow sufficient time for our illustrator to become familiar with the plot of the opera (we share resources with him and he quite enjoys all the books that have been written about *The Magic Flute* that we offer). Another important feature of the guide that forces us to synthesize is the tying down of the 10 or so excerpts that are provided on CD to the teachers and students. The opera company needs time to find the best (and most affordable) recording available, and we need the time to make these excerpts so much a part of our vocabulary that the lessons that flow from them will write themselves☺.

We come back together to talk through our ideas. Each person weighs in on what they think matters and defends their choices. During the discussion, new thinking emerges. Things get exciting as we start making connections through seemingly disparate things.

Generating lessons
While we are in this phase of development, the whole world takes on a different perspective. I see the antagonist everywhere, or the historical significance of a work suddenly seems to be about this morning’s headlines in the news. When we were working on Don Giovanni I found myself looking at men in a different light. It feels like I’m in the opera in my day-to-day life. Things get massive in scope. It feels like there are so many paths of thinking to pursue. So many.

Working with the illustrator
Working with the illustrator forces us to synthesize and determine what is most important, since he is creating 5 illustrations that have to capture the plot of a 3-hour opera! The illustrations are used in *The Magic Flute* At-A-Glance, intended to simplify the plot and provide a sense of the characters.

Refining
Lessons are written and refined many times over. Often the primary focus remains unchanged but we fiddle until it feels just right, right for the students and right for the teacher. Adding in the curriculum expectations to the lessons comes at the end. We can do it this way because the Ontario curriculum expectations are pretty
much memorized in our brains. Remember that we took a refresher look through these at the beginning of the process and already know what lends itself to what. We spend a lot of time checking out discrepancies. Accuracy is important!

Is it done yet? There’s a feeling of relief and accomplishment the minute the guide moves into the hands of the opera company for printing, but it doesn’t feel truly done until months later I’m able to attend the matinee and watch the students soaking up the performance. That’s when I can say “mission accomplished!”

The preceding description gives an almost physical sense to the work, and I bold many of the action words to emphasize this. The design of a music partnership study guide is for me is an exciting venture and one of discovery. Looking back at this reflection, what stands out is how much this echoes Schwartz’s (2006) rehearsal curriculum of “disjuncture – research – innovation” (p. 454). Just as he suggests that a teacher go through these phases in order to create lessons that inspire the same level of interest in the students, so have I gone through the process, for my students – the teachers who will be using the guide.

The following is a more formalized set of steps that reflects the process used for developing a music partnership study guide.

**Steps in Designing Music Partnership Study Guides**

1. Conduct a needs assessment
   a. Who is the client, what are their needs, how do you reflect their artistic vision, maintain the integrity of the organization?
   b. Who is the audience?
   c. What is the projected use of the curriculum, how will it be enacted (one time use, yearly revision planned?)
   d. What is the budget? How much time?

2. Form your team
   a. Collaboration is the best way to bring different points of views and multiple strengths to the work. Look for writers who have complementary skills and areas
of expertise to yours. Ideally at least one person on the team has classroom teaching experience.

b. Book your illustrator and set a timeline for the work.

c. Book your designer and set a timeline, or, if the design is handled by the client, establish the delivery date.

3. Situate the curriculum

a. Curriculum mapping – identify where will it be happening on the school calendar, what other concepts and themes are being covered at that time, look for possible connections to reinforce the music learning. Consider all the interdisciplinary possibilities.

4. Consider the content

a. What are the teaching goals? At the end of this lesson/unit we want the student to know____.

b. If a concert event is involved, what does the student need to know in order to understand and enjoy the performance?

c. Is there a created project or culminating event? What is needed to build a foundation for this (specific music skills, other arts skills, interdisciplinarycontent)?

5. Brainstorm

a. What are the key concepts that need to be taught?

b. Mind map of all the possible connections. Write down everything and anything, no limits. Ideas that seem far-fetched at the time may become relevant down the road. Look for the possibilities and interconnectedness of ideas at this point.

c. Consider what’s interesting about this for this age of student – look for real life connections.

d. Frame some possible ideas for lessons. List any arts-based strategies that lend themselves to the focus of the lesson.
6. Go deep into the content
   
a. Familiarize yourself with the music that students will be experiencing. Live in the music so that its qualities become embedded in your ears. Listen frequently to allow yourself many opportunities to notice what is unique or unusual, and how what the composer does affects you, the listener.

b. Research the background of the composer – read reviews, critiques of the composer’s works and that of his/her contemporaries. Search out stories that build understanding of the composer as a person. Learn about the politics and social movements of the times.

c. Explore any art forms that are related to the music to be studied. This may include dance, staging, or set design.

7. Write
   
a. Set up a lesson template/framework

b. Build on the lesson you framed in step 5. By now you should be getting clearer on the objectives of each lesson.

c. Think about writing features that immediately engage the reader (the teacher) that promote a can-do response. Consider how lessons can be sensitive to time required in preparation and carry out (be thoughtful of what you are asking of the teacher).

8. Field test
   
a. Test your lessons in the classroom. Teach the lesson yourself or have another teacher teach it.

b. In the classroom: notice how the lesson unfolds, observe how the students respond.

d. Revise your lesson. Teach the revised lesson in a different classroom if possible. Field testing catches the flaws and weaknesses, and testing with a different set of students will give you further information on what works. Build in the corrections/modifications or scrap what doesn’t work.

9. Visual design
   a. Work with a graphic designer (plan for this in the budget – always worth the investment. It helps make the information in the guide attractive and accessible).
   b. Find a format that highlights what is important to the teacher and makes key information accessible (e.g., use of sidebars, teacher tips, resource lists). This contributes to the ease of use feature.
   c. Illustrations are worth a thousand words, and are particularly useful in opera when you are dealing with a convoluted plot. If hiring an illustrator is not possible, approach large community arts organizations for permission to use their artwork.
   d. Compile useful images. Find clip art or other images of composers, instruments, music icons, etc. Do a search for images related to any of the themes or concepts you are exploring. Providing your graphic designer with images you have sourced gives him/her an idea of what you have in mind, and saves time.

10. Implementing
   a. Provide professional development whenever possible. A workshop allows for an overview of the materials and the opportunity to model the lessons. If teachers experience the lesson they will be more confident in delivering it (this is particularly true of generalists working with a music-based curriculum).

11. Assessing
   a. How do you know what landed and how well?
      i. Teacher surveys
      ii. Student pre and post tests
iii. Observation of the audience – levels of engagement, indications of comprehension

iv. Response from the community arts organization
   1. artist feedback
   2. administrative feedback

12. Next steps
   a. What have we learned for next time? Record your observations.

The data from this study offers the opportunity to look at this list of design steps and ask “How does the data inform the process I used before?” One area is in Step 4, “Consider the content.” This step relates to backwards planning and the Six Facets of Understanding analysis. That analysis demonstrated that the least evident type of understanding found in *The Magic Flute Guide* was Self-Knowledge. This would be something to consider in the early stages of the guide development and with an indentified intent in place, would be simple enough to change through the rewording of the reflective parts of lessons. This actually points to a larger lack in the guide, which is that very few assessment suggestions are offered. While it is not practical to provide different assessments for every grade level using the guide, it should be possible to create an assessment that speaks to the focus of a lesson and offers suggestions for adapting to the different grade levels. Likewise, in Step 5, “Brainstorm” I would include “How can we assess for understanding?” with “What are the key concepts to be taught?”
CHAPTER FIVE
CONCLUSION

The purpose of this study was to identify the critical attributes of a music partnership curriculum, specifically the study guide resource used to prepare students for a performance, and to suggest a process for the design of music partnership curriculum products such as study guides. The study addressed the area of arts learning and the strategies and contexts frequently found within community arts organization partnerships. From blending the results of a teacher survey and an analysis of the artifacts of the writing team, it identified four critical attributes of a music partnership study guide:

1. It is relevant. It relates to the lives of the students, to the music curriculum, and to other subjects across the curriculum.
2. It prepares students for the concert experience by building familiarity with and understanding of the plot, the characters and the music.
3. It makes the music come alive.
4. It builds teacher confidence.

The study of the process of designing a music partnership curriculum was carried out by analyzing data from the study guide using an analytical framework delving into the different types of understanding indicated in the guide. This analysis noted high frequencies of the use of Explanation and Empathy understandings, and an infrequent use of the type of understanding that arises from Self-Knowledge. Also evident was the presence of more than one type of understanding within each of the lesson plans.

An analysis of the features of the writing styles and content in the study guide led to the identification of my three main guiding principles of design; demystify, write for the teacher and design rich lessons. These guiding principles further breakdown how the critical attributes of a music partnership study guide are achieved in the design process. The actions of demystifying are strongly related to the critical attribute of relevance, and I describe how I use humour,
relevant information, contextualizing and insider knowledge to build relevance throughout the guide. Writing for the teacher speaks to the attribute of building teacher confidence. I outline the many ways that I actively seek to invite the teacher in, by writing in a style that is engaging, and by providing a balance of teaching strategies that give them the confidence to guide their students without taking away the students’ chance to discover and inquire. Design rich lessons aligns with the second critical attribute of preparing students for the concert by building familiarity, and the third attribute of making the music come alive. Here I draw attention to the elements that create rich lessons – the value of using arts-based teaching strategies, multi-arts strategies within one lesson, encouraging active experimentation, and using visual and kinesthetic opportunities to explore content.

All of this information contributes to an understanding of how a well-designed music partnership study guide can effectively develop audience co-authorship, the active participation in and finding of meaning in an encounter with a work of art. The findings of this study are specifically related to a music partnership study guide connected to a performance event. While the critical attributes and design process defined in this study are relevant to other types of music partnership curriculum products, further research would benefit the field by deeper study of related areas such as the collaboratively developed curricula resulting from teaching artist residencies.

Recommendations

For Community Arts Organizations’ Administrators

1. Consider the performance study guide as an opportunity to cultivate demand for your art form and worth the investment of time and money. You have a chance to influence a young person’s attitudes towards your art form, which translates into a lifetime of identification (or not) with your organization.

2. Hire writers who have classroom experience and have worked with a wide age range of students. If you use an in-house employee for study guide design, be sure that they have education training and if possible, pair them with a teacher(s) from your school district.
For Designers of Music Partnership Study Guides

1. Take the necessary time to deeply familiarize yourself with the music associated with your study guide. It is central driving force and inspiration for your work.

2. Build a working repertoire of teaching strategies that contribute to the design of rich lessons. Most important are arts-based strategies from all four of the arts disciplines – music, dance, drama, and visual arts. These are effective for differentiating instruction and are creative catalysts. Other important strategies include use of effective questioning, guiding discussion, and debating.

I have a lasting impression of the students in the lobby following *The Magic Flute* performance. There was a crush around the boards displaying the headshots of the performers. Students were pushing in to find out what the *real* person playing the evil Monostatos looked like, or how the Queen of the Night did her hair in real life. I heard “Oh my god! He looks so normal!” and “Wow. She’s not at all like what she seemed on stage.” I listened as students recalled the various singers and the highlights of their performances that day. They made plenty of astute observations, worthy of a music critic even. As a gaggle of students moved towards the exit doors, I heard the strains of the Queen of the Night’s aria being imitated (not badly!) followed by laughter that suggested for all intents and purposes, these students had wholeheartedly embraced the performance. I smiled. My journey with *The Magic Flute Study Guide* had reached full circle.
REFERENCES


Tovey, B. (2010). Bramwell Tovey: At the VSO we believe an education without a significant musical component is no education at all. Retrieved from http://creativitycounts.wordpress.com/2010/04/28/bramwell-tovey-at-the-vso-we-believe-an-education-without-a-significant-musical-component-is-no-education-at-all/


Appendix A

The Magic Flute Study Guide

What Makes A Study Guide WORK for You and Your Students? Research

1. Using The Magic Flute Study Guide

Happy New Years Teachers! Welcome to my survey and thank you so much for participating.

Please provides a study guide to help you and your students familiarize yourselves with the opera so that when you arrive at the , you have some idea of what to expect.

As you are a teacher who received this guide, I am interested in discovering what parts of the guide you made most use of and how you used it with your students. This is part of research I am undertaking as a graduate student at OISE. I hope to determine what the critical attributes of music partnership curricula are and how knowledge of these attributes might affect the design process.

Your feedback will help to inform future study guides and potentially will have a beneficial impact on curriculum products produced for similar arts organizations.

Please note that your responses are anonymous. I am gathering no email address or internet footprints. I would like your permission to use the data you supply in publications and public presentations and to quote from any comments you make in this survey. If you are agreeable to this, please answer “yes” to the question at the end of this page.

The survey should take about 10 minutes to complete. It would be ideal if you could complete it with your hard copy of The Magic Flute Study Guide close at hand.

Thank you! Let’s begin!

* 1. Do you give your permission for use of your comments and data?

   ☐ Yes
   ☐ No

2. Descriptive Data about You and Your Students

* 1. In what type of school do you teach?

   ☐ Public
   ☐ Separate
   ☐ Private
   ☐ Other (please specify)

   [ ]

91
2. What is your main teaching level?

☐ Middle School 6-8
☐ High School 9-12

Other (please specify)

3. What is the focus of your school?

☐ General Academic
☐ Arts School
☐ French Immersion
☐ Religious

Other (please specify)

4. Are you a generalist (classroom) teacher or a specialist teacher?

☐ Generalist classroom
☐ Specialist

5. If you are an arts specialist, which subject(s) do you teach?

☐ Visual Arts
☐ Drama
☐ Dance
☐ General Music
☐ Vocal Music
☐ Instrumental Music

Other (please specify)

6. If you are a non-arts specialist, please specify the subject(s) you teach.
7. How many years of teaching experience do you have?

☐ This is my first year
☐ 2-4 years
☐ 5-10 years
☐ 10-15 years
☐ 20-25 years
☐ More than 25 years

8. Have you brought classes to previous performances? (Check all that apply.)

☐ Marriage of Figaro (2008)
☐ Don Giovanni (2007)
☐ The Barber of Seville (2006)

9. In the past school year what other types of arts performances have you taken your students to? (Check all that apply.)

☐ Symphony
☐ Theatre
☐ Art Gallery

Other (please specify)


1. How much instructional time did you use to prepare your students for attending the opera?

☐ Less than an hour
☐ 1-2 hours
☐ 2-3 hours
☐ 3-4 hours
☐ More than 4 hours
2. How confident were you in your ability to engage your students with the opera?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Before reading the study guide</th>
<th>Not at all confident</th>
<th>A little bit confident</th>
<th>Somewhat confident</th>
<th>Quite confident</th>
<th>Very confident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>After reading the study guide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Please rate the helpfulness of the Performance Information section of the guide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What to Expect at the Opera</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Please rate the helpfulness of the Mozart section of the guide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mozart’s Life</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mozart’s Music</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mozart’s Times</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Please rate the helpfulness of the All About Opera section of the guide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Everything You Wanted to Know About Opera</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Synopsis of The Magic Flute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Magic Flute At-A-Glance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Storyline Descriptions</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Musical Details</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening Strategies and Activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Please rate the helpfulness of the following study guide Lessons.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Plot for All Purposes</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Secrets and Symbols (Freemasons)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Who’s Who of The Magic Flute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everybody Loves Papageno</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prince of Light: Queen of Darkness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Would the Real Pamina Please Stand Up</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What Makes A Study Guide WORK for You and Your Students? Research

8. Please rate the helpfulness of the Black Line Masters section of the guide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Not helpful</th>
<th>Somewhat helpful</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Extremely helpful</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Web Resource</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Character Clue Cards</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Who’s Who of the Magic Flute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papageno’s Aria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arias from The Magic Flute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papageno Meets Pamina</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Real Pamina</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Paminas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Using the Audio CDs

1. Student audio CDs were provided. On average, how enthusiastic were your students about the CDs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student response to audio CDs</th>
<th>not enthusiastic</th>
<th>somewhat enthusiastic</th>
<th>quite enthusiastic</th>
<th>very enthusiastic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Did you assign any listening homework using the audio CDs?

- [ ] Yes
- [ ] No

5. Insights

1. Please rate the quality of the guide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Very Good</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visual Appearance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information provided</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance to your curriculum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of Use</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. What section of the guide did you find personally most interesting and enjoyable to read? Why?

3. What did you hope your students would gain from attending The Magic Flute?
4. Do you feel your students were better prepared for the opera experience as a result of you having used the guide?

- [ ] Not at all
- [ ] Somewhat
- [ ] Quite a lot
- [ ] Extremely

5. What additional resources do you think would support your use of the guide?

- [ ] In-service of the guide
- [ ] Website support
- [ ] Visiting docents
- [ ] Other (please specify)

6. Do you have any suggestions for making future study guides more helpful?

6. Thank You!
What Makes A Study Guide WORK for You and Your Students? Research

Papageno thanks you!