Musical Assemblies: How Early Christian music functioned as a Rhetorical Topos, a Mechanism of Recruitment, and a Fundamental Marker of an Emerging Christian Identity

by

Jade Brooklyn Weimer

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department for the Study of Religion

University of Toronto

© Copyright by Jade Brooklyn Weimer 2016
Musical Assemblies: How Early Christian music functioned as a Rhetorical Topos, a Mechanism of Recruitment, and a Fundamental Marker of an Emerging Christian Identity

Jade Brooklyn Weimer

Doctor of Philosophy

Centre for the Study of Religion
University of Toronto

2016

Abstract

This dissertation examines the various ways in which early Christ-followers incorporated music into their religious discourse and ritual practice. Scholars have primarily focused on two particular areas of inquiry: the cultural and religious 'origins' of early Christian music and the history of music within the context of church liturgy. Music, however, played a much greater role within Christian assemblies than simply existing as part of religious liturgy. I contend that music helped shape an emerging Christian identity within early Christ-following assemblies and collective singing became a vital component in defining in-group and out-group boundaries. Early Christian writings also demonstrate that hymn compositions were used as pedagogical tools, rhetorical devices, and mechanisms of recruitment to attract new members.

I begin by examining Greco-Roman and Jewish primary source materials that reference or describe the nature of musical practice in antiquity in order to contextualize my study of musical references in early Christian texts. The next section utilizes recent developments in cognitive science to illustrate the importance of collective singing in establishing a group identity, creating cohesive social bonds, and evoking particular emotional responses. I apply this methodological approach, along with a socio-historical
lens, to a variety of early Christian texts in order to argue that collective singing functioned as a critical medium in which early Christian authorities formulated their identity and defined the boundaries of 'correct' and 'incorrect' religious thought and practice. The melodies and lyrics used by some assemblies functioned as a rhetorical medium to denounce out-group theologies and practices while simultaneously operating as an instrument of recruitment. This study concludes that collective singing played a previously unidentified role in the success of early Christianity as a social movement through mechanisms of identity formation, social bonding, and recruitment of new members.
Acknowledgements

There are many people that have helped me throughout my academic journey as a doctoral student. I would like to thank my advisor John Kloppenborg who always provided insightful and timely feedback. His suggestions and advice have been invaluable and I am grateful to have had the opportunity to work with such an accomplished and renowned scholar. His vast wealth of knowledge on all things pertaining to religions of Mediterranean antiquity has been an incredibly valuable resource throughout my graduate studies at the University of Toronto.

I also wish to thank my two committee members Colleen Shantz and Judith Newman for their comments and recommendations throughout the editing process. I am indebted to both of them and sincerely appreciate their willingness to engage with my work. I would also like to express my gratitude to my internal reader Simon Coleman for his participation on the committee and to Risto Uro, the external reader. These scholars have given me much to think about for future study from both cognitive and anthropological perspectives and I am enthusiastic about pursuing these avenues of inquiry.

I would also like to thank the fantastic administrative team at the Department for the Study of Religion at the University of Toronto. Their expertise in navigating administrative matters and their willingness to help students at every stage of the program is much appreciated and has made life as a graduate student immeasurably easier. Thanks to Irene, Marilyn, and Fereshteh for all their help along the way.

I am also incredibly grateful to my colleagues at the University of Manitoba in the Department of Religion who have been so supportive through the writing process. My
department head, Ian Whicher, and my colleague at St. John’s College, Brenda Cantelo, have always had kind and encouraging words for me, especially during the more difficult times that writing a dissertation often brings.

I could not have finished this dissertation without the unfailing support of my family and friends. My good friend and fellow grad student, Michelle Christian, cheered me on along the way and showed enthusiasm for my work and for this I will always be grateful. My soccer mate and friend for life, Charmaine Straker, has always been willing to meet for coffee to chat about the dissertation or about soccer when I needed a distraction. My wonderful parents, Rosella and Bruce Weimer, have been the greatest cheerleaders in my life. They have proudly celebrated my academic achievements and always helped me over the bumps along the way. This is just as much their accomplishment as it is mine. Lastly, my husband, Alex Bainov, is the best partner in life I could have ever found. He has always supported my decision to pursue a doctorate, even when it meant living apart for over two years. His computer expertise have saved me many times during the writing process and I have reached the finish line because of his love and encouragement.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................................. ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................................. iv

TABLE OF CONTENTS ............................................................................................................. vi

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................... 1

INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 2

THE SIGNIFICANCE OF MUSIC IN EARLY CHRISTIAN RITUAL .................................................. 8

METHODOLOGIES .................................................................................................................... 12

ANTHROPOLOGY OF MUSIC & RITUAL THEORY .................................................................. 17

SUMMARY .................................................................................................................................. 25

CHAPTER 2: THE MUSICAL NATURE OF MEDITERRANEAN ANTIQUITY ................................. 27

INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 27

MUSIC IN THE GRECO-ROMAN WORLD .................................................................................. 28

Greek Philosophical Discourse on Music .................................................................................. 30

Music and Greco-Roman Cultic Worship & Sacrifice .............................................................. 35

Ancient Greek Weddings & Funerals ....................................................................................... 38

Music in Greco-Roman Mystery Cults ...................................................................................... 41

The Greek Symposium ............................................................................................................... 44

Greek Music and the Discourse of Magic and Healing ............................................................. 45

MUSIC & ANCIENT JUDAISM .................................................................................................... 47

Music in Jewish Sectarian Communities .................................................................................. 49

Music at Qumran ....................................................................................................................... 50

Musical Practices of the Therapeutae ....................................................................................... 55

Musical Practice in the Temple ................................................................................................. 58

Music in the Synagogue ............................................................................................................ 62

Music at non-Cultic Jewish Ceremonies ................................................................................... 65

CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................ 66

CHAPTER 3: UNDERSTANDING THE SIGNIFICANCE OF MUSICAL RITUAL THROUGH COGNITIVE SCIENCE ........................................................................................................ 68

INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 68

FOUNDATIONAL CHALLENGES OF ACCESSING EXPERIENCE .......................................... 73

VERTICAL INTEGRATION AS A RESPONSE TO THE PROBLEM OF REDUCTIONISM ........ 77

MUSIC & COGNITION ................................................................................................................. 79

Musical Processing ................................................................................................................... 81

Neurological Rewards of Musical Participation ....................................................................... 84

Emotional Responses to Music ................................................................................................. 92

MUSIC AS AN EFFECTIVE/AFFECTIVE RITUAL PRACTICE .................................................... 96

EMBODIMENT, SIGNALLING, AND SYNCHRONY: APPLICABLE COGNITIVE FRAMEWORKS ................................................................................................................................. 100

Embodyment ............................................................................................................................. 100

Signalling, Cooperation & Synchrony ....................................................................................... 102

RETURNING TO MUSICAL ROOTS: THE APPLICABILITY OF NEUROSCIENCE TO A STUDY ON EARLY CHRISTIAN MUSIC ................................................................................................. 108

CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................ 112

CHAPTER 4: MUSIC IN EARLY CHRISTIANITY: RITUAL PRACTICE AS IDENTITY MARKER ...... 114

INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 114

MUSIC & IDENTITY ................................................................................................................... 118

MUSIC IN EARLY CHRISTIANITY ............................................................................................. 124
CHAPTER 5: MUSICAL MARKERS OF ‘ORTHODOXY’ AND ‘HERESY’ ............................................. 167

INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 167
THEORIES OF HERESY AND ORTHODOXY: A BRIEF OVERVIEW ........................................ 172
MUSICAL CONTROVERSIES AMONG EARLY CHRISTIANS ...................................................... 178
1. The Problem of Melody and Emotion ............................................................................... 178
2. Lyrical Authority & the Condemnation of the Heretic ...................................................... 185
   Arius: A Case Study ............................................................................................................. 189
FEMALE SINGERS IN THE FIRST TWO CENTURIES: A NON-ISSUE? ...................................... 194
EXCLUSIONARY DEVELOPMENTS: LITURGICAL PARTICIPATION OF WOMEN FROM THE THIRD CENTURY ONWARD ........................................................................................................ 196
WOMEN SINGING IN THE CHURCH: A MARKER OF HERESY? ................................................ 206
RECRUITMENT, RHETORIC, AND MUSIC .............................................................................. 208
CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................. 215

CHAPTER 6: EARLY CHRISTIAN MUSIC: FINAL ANALYSIS AND BEYOND .............................. 219

SUMMARY ................................................................................................................................. 219
CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE STUDY OF EARLY CHRISTIANITY ................................................ 224
NEXT STEPS ............................................................................................................................... 227
CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................. 232

APPENDIX 1 .................................................................................................................................. 234

BIBLIOGRAPHY ....................................................................................................................... 240
Chapter 1: Introduction

Ephraem the Syrian was one of the most prolific hymn writers in the Patristic period and he was viewed by later church historians as a defender of Orthodoxy. Ephraem declared others, namely Bardesanes and his son Harmonius, to be “heretics” because they composed new non-Biblical hymns and allowed women to sing in the chorus during worship. As a counter-measure, the astute Ephraem employed these same tactics in an attempt to negate the influence of Bardesanes' attractive melodies and lead their followers to his brand of orthodoxy through song. He too allowed women to sing in the worship service and he appropriated (or stole, depending on one’s interpretation) melodies from Bardesanes, to achieve his aim. Using these "borrowed" melodies, he changed the lyrics to reflect his own theological interpretations and this proved to be a very effective tool for recruitment, rhetorical engagement, and congregational stability.¹

This short narrative exemplifies how music was used as a form of rhetoric in early Christianity that served to reinforce one mode of practice and belief while at the same time undermining another competing form. The efficacy of music to function in the aforementioned ways, however, goes beyond rhetorical engagement. The power of social and embedded cognition make musical ritual a particular efficacious practice in a variety of ways including generating emotional responses, facilitating knowledge transmission through embodied practice, and creating a sense of unity and togetherness through synchronous performance. The Ephraem narrative also highlights the three areas in which music and musical practice helped formulate a "Christian" identity - on a personal level (Ephraem's understanding of his own Christian identity as expressed through song), at a collective level (the assembly's conception of their collective

¹ This subject is dealt with at length in chapter five in relation to the issue of member recruitment and retention as well as various classifications of the relationship between orthodoxy and heresy.
Christian identity as expressed through communal ritual singing), and finally in the creation of in-group/out-group boundary markers (Ephraem and his group's articulation of their Christian identity in relation to Other Christians defined through the use of melody, female choruses, and specific lyrical content in hymn compositions).

Introduction

The social world of early Christianity has been well documented by a variety of scholars in an attempt to account for the successful formation of Christianity as a social movement within its historical context. This type of scholarship has used comparative methodology in order to argue that the formation of early Christian social groups was both similar and varied in relation to other social groups in Greco-Roman antiquity including voluntary associations, philosophical schools, mystery cults, and synagogues. Early Christian groups share several key features with these aforementioned social assemblies in terms of their formation, methods of recruitment, organizational structure, and social benefits of membership. This comparative endeavour is significant because it provides a clearer picture of the social world out of which Christianity emerged. Sociologist Rodney Stark has made important contributions to this field in his attempt to explain why Christianity developed into a successful and widespread social movement. There are several key components to Stark’s framework but one point of particular significance is his claim that the success of the movement lies (at least in part) within a delicate balance between

---

the novel and the familiar. Stark sums this up succinctly when he argues that "any religion requires an adherent to master a lot of culture." Hence, he claims that religious conversion and recruitment is partially predicated on the level of cultural continuity between the "old" tradition and the "new" tradition. This argument is based on the idea that "a new religion is more likely to grow to the degree that it sustains continuity with the religious culture of those being missionized." In other words, certain aspects of the movement can be understood as new or unique, while others were parallel or analogous to social practices or identity frameworks with which Jews and Greco-Romans were already familiar. Stark goes on to note that Christianity preserved a high level of cultural and religious capital in Greco-Roman antiquity and this framework is a very useful one for an analysis of early Christian music and the role it played in creating and maintaining socio-religious boundary markers. Stark, along with William Bainbridge also convincingly argue for the necessity of interpersonal bonds and social networks in the process of religious recruitment. This study seeks to build on that premise by demonstrating religious recruitment was carried out through the use of music and communal singing by early Christians. Collective singing, as I will argue, facilitates social bonding and identity formation in a particularly effective way that make it a useful tool for religious recruitment.

Scholars such as Judith Lieu and Phil Harland have recently addressed questions

---

pertaining to the notion of identity in antiquity\(^7\) and these studies tend to focus on the following questions: How did those who self-identified as a χριστιανός understand this title? How did outsiders view this label? How did this sense of "being a Christian" emerge in the first place?\(^8\) Lieu’s work examines various elements of identity formation including the relationship between text, history, and memory as well as the significance of place, space, and social boundaries. Harland, moving in a slightly different direction, draws on epigraphic evidence in a discussion centering on the concept of early Christian identity within the context of group associations and a focus on specific components including familial dimensions of identity and the importance of group interactions and religious rivalries in terms of their relation to identity formation. Both works make valuable contributions toward developing a historical understanding of a Christian identity and have recognized the importance of ritual actions (such as communal meals and table-fellowship practices) in creating and sustaining this type of identity, which is certainly a fluid and dynamic entity, particularly in the context of religious competition and rivalry in Greco-Roman antiquity.

There are several key theories of recruitment put forth by scholars that attempt to explain how and why Christianity was successful as an expanding social movement in first three centuries of the Common Era. Scholars have asked the following questions: Why did people join Christ-following communities? Were the reasons intellectual or conceptual in nature? Were there economic, political or other social benefits to membership in this group? What mechanisms of recruitment were most successful in obtaining new members? How do these mechanisms compare to other associations in the Greco-Roman world? Leif Vaage’s edited volume Religious


\(^8\) Lieu, *Christian Identity*, 1.
Rivalries in the Early Roman Empire and the Rise of Christianity examines many of these questions and explores various aspects of competing religious affiliations in the ancient Mediterranean as well as how different socio-religious groups went about obtaining new members or perhaps even “missionizing.”9 Phil Harland and Dennis Duling both argue that one of the methods of recruitment used by early Christian communities was to disparage other groups (both Jewish and Greco-Roman cultic and later other Christian groups deemed “heretical”) in order to make their cause more appealing to non-Christians.10 I contend that music was a way for group leaders to accomplish this task. The Greeks also used song and melody as a rhetorical tool in order to persuade people on political and religious matters and this practice was infused in the Mediterranean cultures of antiquity.

I further the direction of scholars like Harland and Lieu by exploring the significance of singing or instrumental performance and their influence on the formation of group identity and social cohesion. The ubiquity of song and musical performance in antiquity illustrates the necessity for such an inquiry because ritual practice is certainly one of the key markers in identity formation and understanding; musical expression is of particular consequence because it is a communicative mechanism that transmits meaning while at the same time it evokes a powerful emotional response from listeners and participants alike. The permeation of an open auditory environment means that this communicative power is in some sense unrestricted, which

---

9 Leif E. Vaage, ed., Religious Rivalries in the Early Roman Empire and the Rise of Christianity (Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2006). There are several chapters of particular significance including Stephen G. Wilson’s chapter ‘Rivalry and Defection’, Leif Vaage’s chapter ‘Ancient Religious Rivalries and the Struggle for Success: Christians, Jews, and Others in the Early Roman Empire’, and the entire third section, which examines the “rise of Christianity” and includes several responses to the work of Rodney Stark.

also makes it a formidable tool of rhetoric and recruitment.

Laurence Broadhurst, in the Festschrift for Stephen G. Wilson entitled *Identity & Interaction in the Ancient Mediterranean: Jews, Christians and Others*, provides a commentary on an earlier article written by Wilson himself that reveals the scholarly lacunae that exists in the study of early Christian music. In his analysis of Wilson’s work, Broadhurst calls for a wider survey of ancient sources in any study of early Christian music but it is the questions that he poses at the end of the chapter that push scholarly inquiry in a more exhaustive and fruitful direction. He asks, “Did singing assist in advertising this new group, attracting converts? Did it assist in solidifying this group, keeping converts around and engaged?” These are precisely the types of questions that this dissertation attempts to answer in making the claim that musical expression did in fact play a key role in recruitment and group identity maintenance. Therefore, I argue that musical ritual is not only a significant socio-religious identity marker but it is also an important factor in attracting new members.

How do recruitment and musical practice connect in this context? This is a complex question and there are two different methodological approaches that ought to be employed in order to propose even a provisional answer. First, song was a form of rhetorical engagement and expression in antiquity and there are several examples, which are discussed in chapter two in the section outlining the various venues, events, and occasions where music was performed in the Greco-Roman world. There are also examples where song is employed by early Christians as a

---

form of rhetoric and these may be found in chapter five in the discussion on perceived boundaries between “orthodoxy” and “heresy”. In other words, there was a long-standing Greco-Roman cultural tradition of utilizing song to impart information, promote ideology, celebrate supernatural entities, and deliver condemnations directed toward political opposition and this tradition is adopted to a certain extent by early Christians. Second, music (vocal or instrumental) has the ability to evoke a strong emotional response from listeners and participants. Therefore, I argue that musical performance, among other things that early Christians were doing, has the power to attract potential members.

In trying to formulate a sustained argument for this claim, there are several things to consider. One must look at the source material in order to see what early Christians have to say about music and its application in a real-world context. This is a difficult undertaking, simply because many Christian authors use allegorical language and musical metaphors in their writing and some scholars have made the claim that these references (Ignatius of Antioch for example) do not shed any light on the historical nature of practices musical expression. However, there are several examples, which are undeniably made in reference to actual practice. Most famously, Clement of Alexandria discusses appropriate and inappropriate uses of musical expression at dinner parties, which can be read as a form of rhetorical engagement meant for Christian readers but it also directly critiques Greco-Roman practice and behaviour. All other things being equal, groups that appeal to natural cognitive mechanisms will be more successful in recruitment than those that do not. As stated above, there are numerous reasons as to why scholars posit

---

14 One example comes from Ignatius’ letter to the Ephesians (See McKinnon, Music in Early Christian Literature, 19) where he employs musical imagery to explain how the congregation is like an instrument in the sense that it ought to be attuned to the bishop like strings to the cithara. In addition, Ignatius refers to harmony and unity and whether this is a window into actual practice or simply a metaphorical usage in reference to the structure of the community remains a point of contention among scholars.

15 See Clement of Alexandria, Paedagogus II, iv. For analysis of several key references in the works of Clement, see McKinnon, Music in Early Christian Literature, 28-36.
Christianity was an attractive social group for non-members. They range from financial to political and social to ideological. However, many scholars of early Christianity that have asked this question have not considered the role of cognition in this process. The combination of lyric and melody make singing a powerful mechanism for attracting and engaging new members to a social group.

The Significance of Music in Early Christian Ritual

No scholarly study on the social formation of early Christian groups has examined the role that musical expression and performance have played in facilitating the creation of a group identity through a shared artistic medium. This sensory and affective medium is vital in the formation and propagation of early Christian theology and ritual practice for a variety of reasons. First, collective singing is a ritual practice that the earliest Christ-followers incorporated into their gatherings. Second, hymns and psalms were used to express shared doctrinal tenets through shared affectivity but they also functioned as a pedagogical tool that could be used to teach current members and recruit new ones. Third, singing was key element to shaping emerging identities within Christ-following assemblies on all three levels: personal, communal, and in relation to the Other (including both non-Christian and "heretical" groups alike).

Musical practice in antiquity was almost ubiquitous and all cultural groups employed musical expression in a variety of social contexts. Virtually all groups of the ancient Mediterranean viewed music as a communicative or expressive form that was derived from a divine source that validated both its significance and usage. In addition, musical expression was an important element in many facets of everyday life for both Jews and pagans including
communal meals, cultic rituals, funerary rites, and other social gatherings. Musicologists and scholars of liturgical history have discussed music in antiquity at length but curiously this line of inquiry has never intersected with socio-historical discussions pertaining to the role that music and musical expression play in a variety of other significant areas including identity formation, modes of recruitment, and rhetorical engagement. In fact, scholarly discourse on early Christian music has been confined to a debate pertaining to origins – is it Jewish or pagan? I have previously argued that the origins of Christian music are rooted in both the Jewish and pagan practices of antiquity. This may seem like an obvious conclusion but owing to disciplinary boundaries within academia, many early inquiries into this relationship concluded that early Christian musical practices were derived from either Jewish or Greco-Roman sources. Specifically, classicists tend to focus on the Greco-Roman roots of early Christian music while scholars of Christianity and Judaism often attempt to trace a lineage of ritual continuity between Temple or synagogue worship and early Christian music ritual. One must keep in mind, however, that Jews/Judeans certainly participated in Greco-Roman culture, along with many other ethnic groups. The boundaries of one’s social, religious, and political identity in antiquity were fluid and subject to contestation – particularly with regard to the use of music, in both literal practice and metaphorical usage.


18 For an excellent discussion of the complexities of social identity in the Greco-Roman world see Philip Esler, Conflict and Identity in Romans (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2003). Chapter two is particularly useful as Esler defines various aspects of social identity as argues that any identity (whether at an individual or group level) can be and is often contested by other individuals or groups.
The study of early Christian music has been limited for two main reasons. First, this is a broad area of inquiry and one must gain specialized knowledge in several disciplines. Musicologists, for example, are interested in mapping theoretical and technical aspects of music including scale modes, rhythmic patterns, and the relationship between melodic lines and lyrical content. Historians, on the other hand, are more focused on developing a historical trajectory of practice and establishing a point of origin and a connection between the emergence of ritual practices within a specific group and the ritual practices of other contemporary religious groups. This type of study, however, requires a combination of these engagements in order to understand the technical components\(^\text{19}\) of such a study on music but to make meaningful conclusions of the socio-historical significance of music in early Christianity. Moreover, a study of early Christian music requires knowledge of musical practices employed by Jews and Greco-Romans, which go beyond a basic technical analysis. Second, the narrow range of source materials has proved to be an obstacle for such an inquiry. James McKinnon, a pioneering scholar in the field of early Christian music, published an invaluable volume in 1987 entitled *Music in Early Christian Literature*, which documents a lengthy list of musical references in early Christian sources, ranging from the New Testament to later Patristic sources.\(^\text{20}\) However, this volume is not an exhaustive collection of early Christian references to music and McKinnon's aim is simply to compile a compendium of references with short descriptive explanations. Therefore, we are left with many questions about music in early Christ-following groups, which relate not only the technical elements of musical performance and practice but perhaps more significantly, the role

\(^{19}\) For example, the famous early Christian hymn POxy 1786, which was discovered in 1922, is the earliest extant document containing a Christian hymn with musical notation. This work has been the subject of much discussion pertaining to origins; while it clearly utilizes Greek musical notation, the melismatic nature of the melody demonstrates a connection to Jewish psalmody. Several scholars have published analyses of this document but one of the most concise but technically oriented is A.W.J. Holleman, “The Oxyrhynchus Papyrus 1786 and the Relationship Between the Ancient Greek and Early Christian Music,” *Vigiliae Christianae* 26 (1972): 1-17.

that music played in other social elements of early Christian life. We can gain a better understanding of early Christian practice as well as early Christian conceptions of identity through an analysis of music that employs a variety of methodological approaches including cognitive theories of music, social identity theory, and theories of recruitment. This serves to highlight the significance of music from several angles including the emotional aspects of musical participation and the potential exploitative power of music.

There is a variety of related questions that this study on early Christian music will address. How did early Christians incorporate music and musical practice into early forms of worship? Why did various forms of musical expression become a point of debate within the theological discourse of the early church fathers? Why were instruments prohibited in worship by many church authorities? How did early Christ-followers adapt Jewish and Greco-Roman forms of musical practice and incorporate them into liturgy? These are the questions that the first section of this dissertation will address in order to lay out a foundation that will set the parameters of further inquiry. The latter section of the dissertation demonstrates that the significance of musical practice goes far beyond any ritual study of early Christianity. Music was employed as a rhetorical topos; song was used as a tool of recruitment; and music functioned as an identity marker used to denote in-group and out-group boundaries. This examination and analysis of music as a subject of religious discourse and an embodied practice in the context of early Christianity can further our understanding regarding the formation of and interaction between Christ-following groups in antiquity. Group formation and the retention of group members can be attributed in part to collective music-making and early Christians successfully deployed this particular ritual practice to further their recruitment and retention goals.
Methodologies

The relationship between music, emotion, and cognition is a key point of intersection in order to provide a theoretical foundation for the argument that early Christians music could function effectively as a tool of recruitment and contribute to formulating key markers of social identity. Cognitive science has revealed a great deal about music's effects on the brain and the nature of social interaction. Cognitive science has also added an important scholarly dimension to religious studies more generally over the past two decades and this dissertation seeks to incorporate some of those theoretical components to argue why music was a key component in formulating group identity and facilitating religious recruitment. According to Justin L. Barrett, this field of inquiry seeks to "detail the basic cognitive structure of thought and action that might be deemed religious and invites historians, anthropologists, sociologists, psychologists, and other religion scholars to fill in the hows and whys of particular religious phenomena." Cognitive science is not interested in defining religion but rather exploring the nature of cross-cultural behavioural patterns and explaining why those patterns exist. For example, one of the questions that cognitive science of religion looks at is how and why people hold the belief in supernatural entities despite the fact that these beliefs may be counterintuitive but it also looks to address questions pertaining to religious ritual such as how participants perceive ritual action and why they engage in these types of behaviours. There are several important cognitive theories of ritual action that will be further addressed in chapter three but it is significant to note nearly all types of religious ritual include music.

The reason that cognitive science contributes as a central theoretical framework to this project is that it offers an empirically testable explanation for why and how religious thoughts

---

and actions develop and spread in the way that they do. Human beings have naturally occurring "cognitive biases and predilections" that are at least partly independent of cultural particulars. Barrett refers to the inherent mental tools that human beings possess, which suggests that some elements of cognition are part of our genetic inheritance. Barrett also argues that these mental tools "inform and constrain religious thought, experience, and expression." He notes that religious behaviours and ways of thinking tend to encourage prosocial behaviours and he asks which elements of religion promote prosociality. My argument is that collective music-making in a religious context is exactly the type of ritual behaviour that enables and encourages positive social interaction that results in the creation of bonds and a shared identity.

Two cognitive models that can be applied in this case are that of embodied cognition and signalling theory of religious cooperation. These theoretical approaches are well suited to the examination of the phenomenon of music and communal music-making. Glenberg and his colleagues argue that thinking is not something that is divorced from the body. Traditional Cartesian mind/body dualisms have been progressively complexified by scholars such as Maurice Merleau-Ponty who argued in his pioneering work *Phenomenology of Perception* that the body is a condition of experience. He examines the relationship between perception, experience, and knowledge and contends that these elements of human existence inform one another and cannot be understood through dualistic categories. Glenberg and his co-authors contend that cognition "exists to guide action" and "we perceive in order to act (and what we perceive depends on how we intend to act); we have emotions to guide action; and understanding

even the most abstract cognitive processes is benefitted by considering how they are grounded in action". Therefore, our thoughts, feelings, and emotions are inherently linked to our behaviours. In addition, how we understand language is dependent upon "simulations using neural and bodily systems of action, perception, and emotion", all of which continually contribute to an ever-changing individual and collective identity. Laurence Barsalou and his colleagues argue "knowledge depends inherently on the brains, bodies, and environmental situations in which it resides, rather than existing independently of them." This conclusion further implies that when people participate in religious rituals that reference a deity (i.e. reading of texts or singing religious songs), that action can actually simulate the experience of perceiving a deity.

If embodiment is a central feature of religious experience, as Barsalou and collaborators claim, does it also encourage social behaviours? One answer may be found in signalling theory. Religious behaviours, which are inherently linked to embodied religious knowledge, promote prosocial behaviours and mutual cooperation between participants. Signalling theory "considers how communication, perception, and control systems co-evolve as elements of intricate, robust designs to manage cooperation's problems." In other words, signalling theory attempts to explain cooperation among individuals when such cooperation may not be beneficial to that individual. Bulbulia and Sosis argue that honest signals are hard to fake. For example, emotions are difficult to display or convey when a person is not really feeling those emotions. They explain in their article on signalling theory that religious rituals are often associated with evidence 25Arthur M. Glenberg, Jessica K. Witt, and Janet Metcalf. "From the Revolution to Embodiment: 25 Years of Cognitive Psychology," Perspectives on Psychological Science 8 (2013): 573. 26Glenberg et al, "From Revolution", 580. 27Lawrence W. Barsalou, Aron K. Barbey, W. Kyle Simmonds, and Ava Santos. "Embodiment in Religious Knowledge," Journal of Cognition and Culture 5 (2005): 24. 28Joseph Bulbulia and Richard Sosis. "Signalling Theory and the evolution of religious cooperation," Religion 41 (2011): 364.
dispositions that are important for in-group cooperation and the detection of agents that they classify as defectors. The benefits of this in-group cooperation preserve the biological and cultural (or social) elements that "express honest religious displays" that serve to root out free-riders who are taking advantage of social benefits of group membership without contributing to the group.  

Inevitably, group membership and interaction require the negotiation of multiple layers. They also acknowledge the significance of synchronous ritual practice. When members of a collective group synchronize their actions or behaviours with each other the result is a higher level of group solidarity and cooperation as compared to those who do not move in a synchronous fashion. Synchrony is an integral component of group singing and early Christian practice was no exception. In fact, early Christian writers stressed the significance of singing together or singing with one voice. This embodied ritual practice can only be accomplished through the movement of the body. One must regulate their breathing, open their mouth, and project sound (or language) at a specific pitch and rhythm. Singing in unison further encourages synchrony and cooperation because of this collective motion and the need to hear fellow singers in order to remain in unison. The performance of religious behaviours and in this case, collective singing signal commitment and loyalty to other members of the group by an individual. In addition, the emotional nature of religious ritual plays a key role in "promoting and maintaining long-term group cooperation and commitment." Specific stimuli such as music and singing can elicit emotional responses that provide what Sosis and Alcorta refer to as an "emotionally-

---

29 Bulbulia and Sosis, "Signalling Theory", 367.
anchored social solidarity”. These emotional responses help facilitate the experience or feeling of a shared identity that is rooted in that synchronous ritual practice.

The significance of signalling during social interaction is well documented in Chris Frith's work, which contends that our perception and interpretation of environmental stimuli is influenced through social interaction with others. Social signals (such as singing and other ritualized actions) convey information through facial expression and body language that reveals emotional states that can result in the alignment of joint action (or synchrony as noted above). Action can be coordinated (even unconsciously) through mechanisms of social mimicry and mirroring and it allows participants to learn from each other and cooperate with one another. Communal singing is an excellent example of an embodied practice that communicates signals to participants resulting in social bonding and shared emotional states.

Human emotions are a key component in terms of understanding how music and cognition are related. Neuroscientists have mapped out the areas of the brain affected by specific activities. Various forms of imaging are used to illustrate the levels of electrical conductivity in the brain in order to develop a better understanding of neuroanatomy to behaviour and thought. More specifically, recent studies have shown that music and emotion are inherently linked in human systems of cognition and this conclusion has many important ramifications in the study of religion. These scientific advancements have shown that there are universal modes of cognition and that the brain reacts to musical stimuli in ways that can help explain religious recruitment and social bonding.

31 Sosis and Alcorta, "Signaling", 268.
Anthropology of Music & Ritual Theory

The power of music, as a tool of recruitment, depends on the individual appeal or effect of collective music made within a social setting. As recent neurophysiological studies have demonstrated, collective singing is an important factor in group identity formation but these studies have gone further by understanding the physiological mechanisms of neurochemical transmission involved in this process, which contribute to elements such as social cohesion, the emotive state of an individual, memory reinforcement during ritual practice, and the efficacy of music as a form of pedagogy. All of these elements play a distinctive role in formulating and sustaining a group identity and cognitive science makes an important contribution to this type of inquiry. In other words, music and melody work at other levels of influence. However, anthropological investigations of music are necessary to show that group success is fed by certain emotions that are evoked through communal singing and the social attachments that are formed through physical action and not just ideology. Any explanation of human behaviour cannot simply be attributed to the hardwiring of the brain; cultural factors play an equally important role in understanding why we act the way we do.

Singing plays a vital part in creating identity boundaries on various levels including the creation of a collective group identity; more specifically, I argue that the various references to music and musical ritual in early Christian writings reflect an attempt by writers to articulate a Christian identity. For example, Clement of Alexandria, who is perhaps the most prolific early

36 This assertion draws on the scholarship of Maurice Bloch, who stresses the significance of the nature of a communication medium in relation to understanding symbolic meaning in ritual practice. See Maurice E.F. Bloch,
Christian writer on the subject of music and musical expression, employs musical discourse using several different mechanisms, which reveal his Greco-Roman education and philosophical understanding of music. He uses musical analogies to explain theological tenets but he also comments on specific uses of music, which provide interesting insights into the musical practices of 3rd century Christians in Alexandria. This combination of metaphor and literal analysis pertaining to musical practice is particularly useful in a theoretical discussion of how music contributed to group formation and/or maintenance because it provides an example of musical reference as rhetoric, which serves to simultaneously promote in-group practice while condemning the musical practices of the Other. Various examples, including some provided by Clement, illustrate the aforementioned foundational argument of Stark, which suggests that Christianity was successful as a social movement because of certain elements of cultural continuity. Clement articulates the so-called proper methods of musical engagement (a ubiquitous socio-religious practice) which has some similarities with the Other (such as place, musical mode, rhythmic patterns) but delineates how this is different from the musical practices of the Other (such as lyrical content and intention). Therefore, I explore the ways in which the earliest Christians tended to think about music and to discuss some of the specific examples where early Christian writers use music to offer positive and persuasive images for their assemblies while at the same time denouncing other uses of music in order to reinforce group identity through a negative portrayal of other social and religious groups. The purpose here is to provide an etic explanation of the emic features reported in texts such as those written by

“Symbols, Song, Dance and Features of Articulation Is Religion an Extreme Form of Traditional Authority?” European Journal of Sociology 15 (1974): 54–81. I argue that singing is an essential communicative medium through which identity is articulated and conveyed in addition to other forms of symbolic representation.

Clement.

I further explore the argument that music played an important role in Christian identity formation insofar as Christian writers used musical practice to demarcate the lines of orthodoxy and heresy in order to create boundaries of an “in” group and an “out” group. This represents the final level of significance at which music functions to create or establish an identity at the intergroup level. This is a meaningful layer of negotiation for early Christians because there was much at stake in terms of articulating their religious identity, which was often displayed or conveyed through ritual practice. Music, and communal singing in particular, acts as a distinguishing boundary marker of social and religious identity because it is a participatory and embodied practice that requires the physical presence of the group, which promotes synchrony among individuals and fosters a sense of in-group *communitas*, while segregating those who do not participate.³⁸ In addition, specialization in practice cannot be faked. In other words, knowledge of melodies and lyrics is expressed through participation and those without that knowledge cannot participate. There are several illuminating examples of early Christian authorities discussing music as a function of denoting orthodoxy and heresy. Johannes Quasten outlines several cases in his monograph *Music & Worship in Pagan & Christian Antiquity*. Quasten provides several examples of early Christian heretics that were deemed heretical by proto-orthodoxy groups, at least in part because of their musical practices. Paul of Samosata, Marcion, and Bardesanes are some of the figures that are examined in this chapter in order to illustrate how music was used as a defining marker of group boundaries; more specifically, as markers of heresy.

³⁸ See Paja Faudree, *Singing for the Dead: The Politics of Indigenous Revival in Mexico* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2013) for an interesting contemporary case study that demonstrates how political, linguistic and religious identities are articulated through artistic media such as singing.
Vocal and instrumental performances were so deeply embedded in the social fabric of antiquity that Christian authorities had to address this in their writings, as new converts still engaged in social events (such as the aforementioned communal meal or Greek banquet) that included musical performance, which authorities deemed to be inappropriate and hedonistic. However, music, and communal singing in particular, was viewed as a form of divine communication. The body was viewed as the ultimate musical instrument with which one could express praise and thankfulness to God. Therefore, Christian writers were clearly conflicted with the use of music in Christian gatherings and eventually articulated appropriate forms of musical expression. Yet, melody and rhythm are useful as tools of meaning because they already have a level of influence on people even before they develop specific ideological associations and theological assertions.

Building on the claim that music was a key identifying feature of in-group/out-group boundaries, I advance the aforementioned Stark and Bainbridge model of social networking and religious recruitment by exploring the connection between communal singing and the use of song as rhetoric in the process of early Christian missionizing. Early Christians used song both overtly and indirectly to promote their religious identity as superior to others and as a result I argue that communal singing is a key ritualized component to facilitating the interpersonal bonds that Stark and Bainbridge argue are necessary for religious recruitment and conversion. Melody and human emotion are linked in an important way and this chapter will employ a cognitive science framework in order to strengthen the argument that musical participation draws on human emotion in a way that makes it an effective recruitment tool.

This study aims to provide another lens through which scholars can analyze the success of Christianity as a social movement. The recruitment and anthropological dimensions of music
have significance that goes beyond early Christianity. Music is still a key component in identity formation and group cohesion in many social groups, including religious traditions. For example, Géraldine Mossière's study (which I discuss in chapter 5) examines the role of music in religious recruitment of new members in an African Evangelical congregation in Montreal. She argues that the significance of music as an embodied ritual practice lies in the emotional and psychological effects of participation that connect the identity of the individual to the identity of the group. Her study demonstrates that singing reflects the reality of the participants and evokes shared emotions that solidify the group bond. These conclusions can be applied to many other social contexts – particularly in other periods of change and evolution within the historical trajectory of Christianity more generally.

Yet as Edward Foley notes in his introduction to *Foundations of Early Christian Music*, any investigation into early Christian worship music must be understood cross-culturally and this “compels us to think differently about music and its relationship to ritual”. Foley warns against the implicit use of anachronistic categories or distinctions such as music and speech, which may be applicable to our own auditory environment but cannot be used as a framework to analyze music in the ancient world. Although scholars have made numerous attempts to re-create the intonation and inflection of ancient languages, it is almost impossible to confirm the exact style in which people spoke. The sonic distinctions between song, poetry, and regular speech are not known and from a methodological viewpoint, this can make an investigation into ancient music difficult and problematic. Foley does not claim to propose a definitive solution to this problem.

---

but rather he acknowledges that one must be aware of the issue in order to avoid making an implicit assumption that "music" was understood the same way in antiquity as it is understood in a modern Western definition. However, musicologists generally work under this very premise; that music is certainly a cross-cultural phenomenon but that the auditory environment varies by time and place, as is the definition of music.\footnote{For a well-articulated discussion on methodology in the study of ancient music, see the introductory chapter in Curt Sachs, \textit{The Rise of Music in the Ancient World. East and West} (New York: W.W. Norton, 1943).} There is enough overlap, however, in the concept of singing between the ancient world and our current understanding of that term that we may proceed with this type of study and make some firm conclusions about singing in Greco-Roman antiquity.

Ritual theory, for example, has made several important contributions to the study of early Christianity. In fact, a recent volume entitled \textit{Foundations in Ritual Studies}, edited by noted liturgical scholar Paul Bradshaw, demonstrates how ritual studies and the history of Christian liturgy intersect.\footnote{See Paul Bradshaw and John Melloh, eds., \textit{Foundations in Ritual Studies: A Reader for students of Christian Worship} (London: Baker Academic, 2007).} This volume includes chapters from Mary Douglas and Catherine Bell that offer anthropological approaches to ritual theory and discuss the importance of ritual practice. In addition, Richard DeMaris' work \textit{The New Testament in its Ritual World} offers an interesting application of ritual theory when he argues that the relationship between text and rite is complex in that it may describe, prescribe, or interpret a rite.\footnote{Richard E. DeMaris, \textit{The New Testament in its Ritual World} (New York: Routledge, 2008), 6.} Chapter five of this dissertation will illustrate that Clement of Alexandria writes about music and singing in a prescriptive and descriptive manner when he references the various ways in which Christians participate in musical ritual and how they should participate in musical ritual or perhaps more accurately he outlines the type of ritualized practices and contexts that Christians should avoid.
The aim of ritual studies has become increasingly directed toward action. What do people do in worship practices and what is the significance of these actions? As Ron Grimes argues, ritual studies begins "with the act of describing the performance of the events themselves".  

Ritual theorists have undertaken the task of contemporary liturgical analysis but their goal is certainly applicable to the study of earlier liturgical practices as well. This study seeks to take the analysis a step further insofar as to explore the results or effect of musical ritual in early Christianity in relation to the aforementioned issues of recruitment and success of a socio-religious movement. Ritual studies provides a framework for this analysis, particularly in chapters four and five where I survey primary source references to musical practice in early Christian texts and explain what these references tell us about where/why/how music was employed as a ritualized communal practice among these assemblies.

The works published by Grimes, DeMaris and other scholars of ritual have contributed much to the field of ritual studies but the incorporation of music shows great potential, especially when coupled with insights from cognitive science, to explain exactly how singing rituals act as communicative, recruitment, and agents of social bonding. For example, Frederick B. Bird argues that ritual is a unique communicative medium that incorporates five forms of communication associated with ritual including constitutive, self-representative, expressive, regulative, and invocative. While Bird only references music in passing, this model is particularly helpful for understanding the significance of communal singing within a ritualized setting. Singing is constitutive in the sense that it facilitates (for a period of time) the

---

establishment and re-establishment, as Bird argues, of identifiable groups that possess specific qualities. This is precisely the way in which music functions to create a sense of collective or group identity within individual members. It connects them to one another through an embodied action that gains significance and meaning from the communal context of the performance. Singing is also a form of self-representation insofar as the lyrical component of music expresses a commitment to certain doctrinal or dogmatic features of a religious tradition. An individual conveys their personal identity as one that is in line with the group and communal singing serves to reinforce this collective expression of individual members. Bird also claims that ritual provides a channel for participants to express intense and intimate feelings\(^\text{47}\) and as I outline in chapter three, singing is very emotive ritual practice. It provides group members with the opportunity to express emotion while simultaneously evoking intense emotional responses from participants. The regulatory nature of ritualized singing is also an important theoretical element as I demonstrate in chapter five where I argue that music functioned in early Christian assemblies as an identifying marker of orthodoxy and heresy. Some compositions and musical practices were deemed legitimate while others were denounced as heresy. Ritualized singing plays a key role in the regulation of religious practice and belief. Lastly, music in antiquity was viewed as a gift from the divine realm and as such it was seen as a valid form of communication with the divine. Therefore, communal singing in a ritualized context also functioned as a medium of communication with the divine in which participants could express religious devotion and piety or perhaps petition God through prayer and thanksgiving. It should be noted, however, that despite the usefulness of this model, our understanding and analysis of ritual goes beyond the argument of ritual as communication. Certainly this is one lens through which to understand

\(^{47}\) Bird, "Ritual as Communicative Action", 33.
ritual but it is by no means the only one.

Scholars must contextualize ritual actions within their historical setting in order to understand the multiple layers of meaning within the context of ritual practice. Ritual theorists have successfully argued that there is no single or exact meaning to any ritual practice.\textsuperscript{48} There are many reasons one might participate in a ritual practice, including social, aesthetic, emotional, and other types of motivations. This dissertation makes an important contribution to ritual studies in that it provides a specific case study that illustrates the various motivations or explanations for participation in ritual practice. If we can explain how music is connected to these different facets of action, feeling, and thought, it will contextualize the other components of this project including the role of music in recruitment and early conceptions of a “Christian” identity on the three aforementioned levels: personal, collective, and intergroup.

Summary

The connection between human cognition, music and the resulting emotional response is one that ought to be examined within the context of the social world of early Christians. The meaning and significance of musical expression and participation goes far beyond the study of liturgical history or comparative musicology. Scholarship has only begun to scratch the surface in analyzing the relationship between religion and music more generally and this study provides a focused investigation, which explains how music functions within the context of early Christianity. However, it must be noted that Christianity as such was by no means a monolithic entity. Geographic, ethnic, and linguistic variations existed throughout the first three centuries

\textsuperscript{48} For example, see Ronald L. Grimes, \textit{Ritual Criticism: Case Studies in its Practice, Essays on its Theory} (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 1990) and \textit{Beginnings in Ritual Studies}, 3\textsuperscript{rd} Edition (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2010).
(which of course carry on throughout the historical development of the Christian tradition and into the modern era) and this is certainly evidenced by differences in musical practices. In fact, these variances become points of contention and debate among early Christian authorities for a number of reasons, which will be explored in chapters four and five.

The pervasive nature of music within the environment of Greco-Roman antiquity has far-reaching implications for the success and development of Christianity as a religious tradition. Cognitive science allows for the introduction of empirical evidence that supports the various connections I have drawn in this introductory chapter between music, cognition, ritual practice, and conceptions of identity. Cognitive science is also a helpful theoretical approach in terms of understanding the nature of religious recruitment and the ways that religious groups employ rhetorical discourse (and in this case musically) in order to appeal to members of rival religious traditions. Thus, the overall aim of this study is to use cognitive and social theory to argue that the social success of the early Christ-following movement is in part due to the incorporation of musical ritual in a particular way, which aided in creating a Christian identity, attracting new members to the group, and defining in-group/out-group boundaries.
Chapter 2: The Musical Nature of Mediterranean Antiquity

Introduction

Music in Mediterranean antiquity is a complex and pervasive phenomenon. The nature of music encompasses a variety of technical elements including melody, rhythm, and tempo but music in the ancient world, as it does now, goes beyond those basic and limiting classifications. Song and melody, and to a lesser extent instrumental accompaniment, can be located in nearly every area of daily life. Ancient Greeks and Romans sung songs while they worked on ships or in fields. Ancient Israelites celebrated military victories over their enemies with joyous songs and trumpet blasts. Music was performed at social gatherings and communal meals but perhaps the most significant domain of musical expression was the religious festival. Vocal and instrumental performance accompanied nearly all religious celebrations and life rite ceremonies in pagan and Jewish traditions. Additionally, the origins of melody were inextricably linked to the divine realm. Both Jews and pagans ascribed to the belief that melody was a celestial gift and this explains (at least in part) the great significance that musical practice had in the everyday lives of people in Mediterranean antiquity.

Therefore, the aim of this chapter is to present various contexts in which Greeks, Romans, and ancient Israelites used, performed, and lived through musical expression and participation. The following illustration of music in Mediterranean antiquity is by no means exhaustive, as comprehensive studies have already been published on the history of Greek, Roman, and Judean music. Rather, my intention is to present a variety of contexts and range of ritual practices where music is present in order to demonstrate the ubiquitous nature of melody,

49 It should also be noted that there are numerous other ancient civilizations that contributed to the musical fabric of Greco-Roman antiquity during the emergence of early Christianity including the Canaanites, Hittites, Assyrians, and the Egyptians. However, the historical complexities of this relationship go beyond the scope of this chapter and will not be explicitly addressed.
song, and instrumental performance. Therefore, this survey provides the historical groundwork upon which my later analysis of music in early Christianity can be contextualized.

**Music in the Greco-Roman World**

Music permeated nearly all facets of ancient Greek life including philosophical discourse, communal meals and banquets, religious rituals, theatrical performances, athletic competitions, daily manual labour, weddings, and funerary processions. These events often incorporated singing processions, choreographed dances accompanied by song, and ritual hymn performances. Musical ritual was also a part of other social contexts such as ancient healing and the recitation of spells and incantations. M.L. West, in his seminal work *Ancient Greek Music*, claims, “no other people in history has made more frequent reference to music and musical activity in its literature and art”. 50 Our knowledge of ancient Greek musical activity comes from a variety of sources such as archeological evidence, artistic representations, inscriptions, papyri and ancient poetic and philosophical writings. As early as the fourth century BCE, 51 the Greeks used a written system of musical notation, which provides scholars with examples of ancient musical scores, albeit often somewhat fragmentary. The majority of that musical notation, however, is dated to the Hellenistic and early Roman period and thus has much to tell us about Greco-Roman music in that era. Prior to written forms of musical notation, melody was disseminated through repetition – hearing the melody, memorizing it, and performing it with accompanying lyrics.

Despite the purported maintenance of melodic continuity, there was room for improvisation and

---

51 Giovanni Comotti, *Music in Greek and Roman Culture* (Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins University Press, 1991), 3. Some scholars have argued for earlier uses of musical notation but Comotti contends that the evidence does not support this hypothesis. For example, he argues that vase depictions of musicians playing in front of papyrus scrolls from earlier periods do not confirm the presence of musical notation. Also, he refutes the argument that musical signs correspond to earlier alphabetic forms that pre-date Attic script (see pages 8-10).
variation. The reason this type of variation was permitted is because the rhythm and tempo could be adjusted depending on the occasion of the song. According to ancient Greek understandings of music, the rhythm, melody, and tempo would determine the nature of the song. For example, West cites several ancient philosophers that comment on the “manliness” of certain melodies and rhythmic patterns, while others are deemed undignified, aggressive, or feminine.  

Greek philosophical discourse on the ethos of music will be examined in further detail below but it is significant to note at this point that Greek philosophers viewed aesthetic and technical components of music as inextricably linked despite varying interpretations on the importance of one or the other.

There were also significant political changes in ancient Greece that occurred toward the end of Mycenaean period that had a profound impact on the nature of Greek music. The development of the polis altered the previously existing relationship between “town and country”, and as Giovanni Comotti argues, this pattern of territorial organization gave citizens “increasing opportunities for participating in different forms of community life: religious festivals, ceremonies of the thiasoi, and banquets of the hetairai.” Thus, public festivals grew in size and included the performance of various choral compositions, all of which are mentioned in Homer. Comotti notes that in addition to the paian honoring Apollo, the linos (a dirge or lamentation), the hymenaios (a wedding song), and the threnos (a funeral song), there were other choral compositions added during the classical period that carried over into the Hellenistic period and these additions include the hymnos (a song in honour of gods or heroes), the prosodion (processional), the partheneion (the maiden’s song), and the dithyrambos (generally dedicated to

52 West, Ancient Greek Music, 247.
53 Comotti, Music in Greek and Roman Culture, 15.
Dionysus and fast/frenzied in character). During the Hellenistic period, the compositions of individuals diminished in significance but the status of individual virtuoso instrumentalists increased. Thus, there was also an increased emphasis on musical education. Therefore, the Hellenistic and early Roman era saw significant change in both philosophical discourses on music and ritual practice.

**Greek Philosophical Discourse on Music**

Several famous Greek philosophers have written extensive treatises specifically on the subject of music. From Plato and Aristotle to Pythagoras and Aristoxenus, music was a subject that occupied the minds of Greek philosophers. Comotti examines the Greek philosophical history on music in his monograph entitled *Music in Greek and Roman Culture*. He states “The Greek terms from which our word *music* derived – *mousike (techne)*, “the art of the Muses” – used to designate, as late as the 5th century BCE, not only the art of making sounds but also poetry and dance”. Comotti argues that classical Greek philosophy approached music in two ways. First, philosophers such as Pythagoras were interested in the mathematical and acoustic properties of pitch and sound. They conducted relatively accurate scientific experiments involving water vases and discs to measure sound and pitch based on distance between intervals. Second, philosophers such as Damon and Aristotle developed an ethos associated with music and examined the purported effects of music on the human soul. Damon, in particular, explored the idea of assigning an ethos specific to each harmony (or scale modes), which emotionally affect the

---

54 Comotti, *Music in Greek and Roman Culture*, 15. See pages 16-40 for a complete overview on the growth and development of different “musical schools” ranging from the Spartan school (8th-7th centuries BCE) to Lasus and Pythagoras (and the development of the term *harmoniai*), and finally to Damon and the reforms of Timotheus in the 4th century BCE.

human soul in a positive or negative way.\textsuperscript{56} During the 5\textsuperscript{th} century BCE, Greek music underwent a renaissance of sorts. Instrumentalists added strings to the lyre, which required a more virtuosi performance and composers created new forms of melodic arrangement. All philosophical schools did not welcome some of these changes and this dissonance created great debate within philosophical circles about the role and purpose of music and its relation to the human psyche.

In Plato’s \textit{Republic}, he writes “\textit{μὴ πολλάκις τὸν ποιητὴν τις οἴηται λέγειν οὐκ ἰσιματα νέα ὄλλα τρόπον φόδης νέον, καὶ τοῦτο ἐπαινῆ. δεὶ δ’ οὔτ’ ἐπαινεῖν τὸ τοιοῦτον οὕτε ὑπολαμβάνειν. εἴδος γὰρ καὶνόν μουσικῆς μεταβάλλειν εὐλαβητέον ὡς ἐν ὅλῳ κινδυνεύοντα: οὕδαμον γὰρ κινοῦνται μουσικῆς τρόποι ἀνευ πολιτικῶν νόμων τῶν μεγίστων, ὡς φησί τε Δάμων καὶ ἐγὼ πείθομαι.}”\textsuperscript{57} This “new music”, according to Plato, has the potential hazard of disturbing “the most fundamental political and social conventions”.\textsuperscript{58} In other words, Plato argues that melody possesses an inherent power to influence and shape human disposition, which can be dangerous. This change in musical performance and song writing, which can be attributed to various cultural transformations (such government policies that allowed all citizens to participate in religious festivals, cultic member associations and banquets), led to a philosophical critique within Greek academic circles that centered on the connection between melody and human behaviour.

Philosophical investigations into the relation between music and human emotion are, at

\textsuperscript{56} Comotti, \textit{Music in Greek and Roman Culture}, 32. Damon's musical theories on scale modes and rhythm are recounted in Plato's works. For example, see Plato, \textit{Philebus} 17d where he references 'men of former times' that have handed down the harmonies (or scale modes). He describes the nature of 'good' and 'bad' harmonies and rhythms articulated by Damon in \textit{Republic} 3.398-340. See chapter 3 on Aristotle and chapter 12 on Aristides Quintilianus in Andrew Barker, \textit{Greek Musical Writings} Vol. 2 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004 paperback edition) for more on Damon's musical theory.

\textsuperscript{57} Plato, \textit{Republic} 4.424c. “Not often let it be understood that the poet who recounts songs that are not new but a new manner of song, and is approving this. But we must not approve this type of thing nor accept it. For, to change to this new/strange form of music is something to be cautious of as it is wholly dangerous. For the forms of music are in no way changed without unsettling the greatest political laws, just as Damon says, and I too am convinced.”

least in part, responsible for this negative response by some to new compositions and playing
styles. In fact, some of the discussions on the philosophy of music that date to the early
Hellenistic period are quite technical in nature. Aristoxenus, for example, in his treatise On
Harmony explores the existential nature of music itself as well as appropriate forms of melodic
movement that fit within the natural ordering of the universe. In other words, he understood
melody as an extension of natural law, not simply a random compilation of varying pitches.
Interestingly, Aristoxenus, unlike his mentor Aristotle, did not view the study of music in
Pythagorean terms. Andrew Barker argues that Aristoxenus’ understanding of music goes
beyond mathematics and delves into the realm of human perception. Barker contends that this
type of musical analysis depends on “principles inherent to our experience of sound as
musical…on what we perceive as melodious, concordant, and the like”.

This emphasis on experience and perception carried over into other areas of inquiry
within Greek musical philosophy such as music and ethos. Platonic discourse on the connection
between music and emotional/behavioural disposition influenced a variety of other philosophers.
In his Republic, Plato argues that a lack of grace, “evil” rhythm, and disharmony in a musical
composition are associated with a variety of negative behaviours such as anger. Scholar
Yuhwen Wang, in a remarkable comparative analysis between ancient Greek and Chinese

59 Pythagoras famously argued that there existed a “Harmony of the Spheres” wherein pitch intervals were based on
mathematical ratios that were parallel to other mathematical relationships within the cosmos. Additionally, he
argued that musical pitch is proportional to the length of the string that produced that pitch. See Christoph Riedweg,
Pythagoras: His Life, Teachings, and Influence (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2005), 27-29 and also
Thomas Christensen, ed., The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory (Cambridge: Cambridge University
Press, 2002), 143.
61 Plato, Republic 3.401a. “For in all these there is grace or gracelessness. And gracelessness and evil rhythm and
disharmony are akin to evil speaking and the evil temper but the opposites are the symbols and the kin of the
opposites, the sober and good disposition.” “Entirely so,” he said”. This translation is from Paul Shorey, Plato in
Twelve Volumes, vol. 5 & 6, 400. “καὶ ἡ μὲν ἄσχημοσύνη καὶ ἀρρυθμία καὶ ἀναρμοστία κακολογίας καὶ
κακοπρθείας ἰδιλλίωτα, τὰ δ’ ἐναντία τοῦ ἐναντίου, σωφρονὸς τε καὶ ἀγαθὸν ἥθους, ἰδιλλίωτα τε καὶ μιμήματα. παντελῶς
μὲν οὖν, ἔρη.”
conceptions of music as ethos, outlines how Plato contrasts proper and improper forms of music, which have varying effects on the human disposition. She argues that Plato does this in order to validate certain types of melody and rhythm. Proper forms of melodic organization promote strength, valour, obedience and religious piety while improper forms result in lawlessness, weakness and contempt for religious values. In addition, Wang also draws on Plato’s emphasis on music and the development of both an appreciation for aesthetics and an ideal personality. In other words, music has the ability to cultivate an individual’s appreciation for that which is “good” and “beautiful”. According to West, most Greeks would have considered music, song, and dance to be markers of a civilized community.

Plato also had specific ideas as to the type of scale modes in the Greek system constituted appropriate and inappropriate forms of expression. He dismissed the Lydian and Ionian modes, which he classified as “soft and convivial harmonia” but advocated the use of the Dorian and Phrygian modes, which “would fittingly imitate the utterances and the accents of a brave man who is engaged in warfare or any other enforced business”. Aristotle argued that the Lydian mode was best suited for educational purposes because it could instill moderation in young men and the Dorian mode was more sedate and manly. Thus, there was some level of agreement among philosophers regarding the nature of musical modes but there was also some debate and disagreement (Aristotle and Plato differed in their understanding/acceptance of the Lydian mode,

---

64 West, Ancient Greek Music, 13.
65 Plato, Republic 3.398e-3.399a. “τίνες οὖν μαλακαί τε καὶ συμποτικαί τῶν ἁρμονιῶν; ιαστί, ή δ’ ὕς, καὶ λυθιστί αὖ τίνες χαλαρά καλοῦνται... οὕκ οἶδα, ἐφην ἐγώ, τὰς ἁρμονίας, ἀλλὰ κατάλειπε ἐκείνην τὴν ἁρμονίαν, ἤ ἐν τε πολεμικῇ πράξει ὄντος ἀνδρείου καὶ ἐν πάσῃ βιαίῳ ἐργασίᾳ πρεπόντως ἄν μιμήσαι τοῖς φθόγγοις τε καὶ προσῳδίαις, καὶ ἀποτυχόντος ἢ ἐν τραύματι ἢ ἐν”.
for example). Yet, Plato’s remarks on music theory do not reveal much about the nature of actual practice. Warren Anderson notes that like other Greek aristocrats from this period, Plato’s discourse on the philosophy of music is not particularly useful in leaning anything about musicianship and the nature of vocal and instrumental performance. Anderson argues that Plato “thought expert musicianship to be aneleutheron, not befitting the free-born man (eleutheros)”.

The role of music in education was also a topic of discussion within Greek philosophic discourse. Despite Plato’s apprehension toward the “new music”, he argued that musical education was imperative for children of both genders. He contends that those who are properly trained in music have the potential to recognize beauty and goodness because knowledge of music can enter the soul and influence it positively. In other words, a proper musical education is essential for the correct behavioural upbringing of a child. Aristotle also considers the necessity of music in a child’s education in Politics, when he asks whether music serves an educational purpose or is simply a form of pleasure. He concludes that musical participation is certainly pleasurable and good for relaxation but that it also functions to create and instill virtuous qualities in people. Therefore, it is a necessary component of Greek education, according to Aristotle. Now that we have laid out a brief philosophical foundation for ancient Greek understandings of music, it is necessary to turn now to other sources that reveal something about ritual practices and Greek discourse on the nature of musicianship and performance.

---

68 Plato, Republic 3.401d-e. ἄρ᾽ οὖν, ἢν δ’ ἐγὼ, ὁ Γλαύκων, τούτων ἕνεκα κυριωτάτη ἔν μουσικῇ τροφῇ, ὅτι μᾶλλον καταδυόταται εἰς τὸ ἐντὸς τῆς ψυχῆς ὃ τε ρυθμός καὶ ἀρμονία, καὶ ἐρρομπόνεστα ἀποτελεῖ αὐτῆς φέροντα τὴν εὔσχημοσύνην, καὶ ποιεῖ εὐσχήμονα, ἐὰν τις ὀρθῶς τραφῇ, εἰ δὲ μὴ, τούναντιν; καὶ ὅτι αὐ τῶν παραλεπομένων καὶ μὴ καλῶς δημιουργηθέντων ἢ μὴ καλῶς φύστων ὀξύτατ᾽ ἂν αἰσθάνοιτο ὃ ἐκεί τραφεὶς ὡς ἔδει.
Musical performance and public religious worship were inextricably linked in the Greco-Roman world of Mediterranean antiquity. Music was viewed as a gift from the gods but it was also understood that the gods took pleasure from hearing music. This was the impetus for the use of music at public cultic ceremonies. Johannes Quasten argues that this was the case in both Greek and Roman ceremonial contexts and this understanding of music can be extended insofar as music was thought to have some type of magical power. This so-called power of music is apparent in the notion that musical performance had the two-fold purpose of bringing “joy to the gods that were already well-disposed and to appease the angered deity”.

Musical rituals were employed at various stages during cultic celebrations including sacrifices, processions, incense offering, and libations. Various scenes of this sort are depicted on vases that date to the 7th century BCE and West cites numerous literary references to processions that include dancing, singing, and instrumental accompaniment.

Sacrificial ceremonies commonly employed musical ritual and the earliest evidence within an ancient Greek context dates to approximately 1300 BCE. Archeological excavations between 1900 and 1908 at the Minoan settlement on the island of Crete revealed a limestone sarcophagus that depicted two ritual practices – funerary rites and the sacrifice of a bull. The sarcophagus shows a man playing a seven-stringed kithara beside a woman who is offering a libation and a flute-player standing behind the bull. In addition, Quasten cites a passage from

---


71 West, *Ancient Greek Music*, 14-15. For example, West argues that processions accompanied with a pipe player(s) was common at various festivals including the Panathenaea, Oschophoria, the City Dionysia at Athens, and the Daphnephoria at Thebes, all of which are depicted on vases from the Archaic period. In addition, Greek poets such as Pindar and Bacchylides made important lyrical contributions to the prosodion, or processional song.
Plutarch’s *De Musica*\textsuperscript{72} as a literary example that describes the sacrificial cult of Apollo. Participants in this group played the flute and danced during sacrifices at Delphi and Delos and this cult was of particular significance within Greek cultic institutions.\textsuperscript{73} Thus, singing, dancing, and instrumental accompaniment were important elements of the Greek sacrificial ritual performance. West points out that there are numerous other examples (including the cult of Apollo) where choruses of men, women, and children performed. The most common song type at these sacrificial rituals was the paean, which was often a short formulaic song sung in unison and accompanied by the lyre or pipes, depending on the circumstances.\textsuperscript{74} Sacrifices were also performed during the Great Panathenaea in Athens, which was an athletic and musical competition held every fourth year. Male and female choruses sang paeans, groups of young men performed ring-dances, and after the ritual animal sacrifice on the morning of the opening day of the festival musicians played in an orchestra comprised of kitharas and auletes while the audience sang. Additionally, there were contests for professional musicians throughout the four-day festival, which included instrumental performances and lyrical recitations of epic poetry.\textsuperscript{75}

The connection between music and sacrificial ritual is also present in a Roman context. Quasten contends that the flute and the lute were the two most important instruments in Roman sacrificial rituals. For example, Ovid writes in his poem *Fasti*, the flutists were highly regarded and that flute music was played at shrines, athletic games, and at funerals.\textsuperscript{76} Moreover, the trumpet was also used at sacrificial rituals, with a particularly strong presence at the Roman festival *Tubilustrium*. Günther Wille argues that the original purpose of this festival is unknown

\textsuperscript{72} Plutarch, *De Musica* 14. “καὶ τὰ ἐξ Ἡπερβορέων δή ἱερὰ μετ’ αὐλῶν καὶ συρίγγων καὶ κιθάρας εἰς τὴν Δῆλον φασὶ τὸ παλαιὸν στέλλεσθαι.” Greek text from Quasten n.14, 21.

\textsuperscript{73} Quasten, *Music and Worship*, 3.

\textsuperscript{74} West, *Ancient Greek Music*, 16.

\textsuperscript{75} West, *Ancient Greek Music*, 20.

but he claims it was either for the preparation of soldiers for war as scholars or a ritual cleansing of the trumpets, which were used at sacrifices. Quasten agrees with the latter explanation and maintains that this is the “clearest expression” of the special connection of cult and music in Roman ritual. The Roman flutists even formed an association called the Collegium Tibicinum Romanorum. These musicians were paid a commission to play at various religious festivals in Rome. Eventually, this group joined up with the official college of lute players and this joint association had special privileges from the start, which included free food at the Temple of Jupiter on the Capitoline, a feast dedicated specifically to them, and other unique honours.

There are other descriptions of Roman sacrificial rites that included singing and clapping. For example, in the History of Rome, Livy describes a sacrificial rite performed in Rome where two animals were led through the city as virgins sang hymns. They sang specific hymns prepared for the ritual sacrifice to the goddess Juno Regina and they carried images of the goddess as they sang. Livy also writes that they beat the time or rhythm of the hymn with their feet, which seemed to correspond to the pace of the procession and the tempo of the melody.

Scholars have examined the significance of musical ritual at Greco-Roman sacrifices and there are several conclusions that may be drawn. Plutarch explains the use of music at sacrifice

---

77 See Günther Wille, Musica Romana (Amsterdam: P. Schippers, 1967), 31. He states “Es gab ein Fest für die kultische Reinigung der Trompeten. Ob es sich dabei um die Lustration von Opfertrompeten oder um die der Kriegstrompeten ausziehender krieger handelt, ist nicht sicher zu entscheiden”.

78 Quasten, Music and Worship, 6.


80 Quasten, Music and Worship, 8-9.


37
as a mechanism to overpower audible disturbances that might come from the sacrificial animal. Quasten interprets this to mean that the musicians must not be interrupted during the sacrificial ritual in order to maintain an unbroken stream of melodic accompaniment. However, the importance of the performance goes beyond simply creating a distraction. Any deviation from the prescribed order of the ritual practice was considered to be an affront to the gods who may react angrily to such a mistake. Quasten, however, takes this idea a step further insofar as he notes the apotropaic effect that music was thought to have. In other words, there are many examples where musical instruments such as bells and cymbals were used “in order to drive away demons and evil spirits so that they would not negate the ceremony”.

*Ancient Greek Weddings & Funerals*

Music rituals were present at private ceremonial functions in addition to state-sponsored religious festivals, both in the Classical and Hellenistic periods. Although West classifies weddings and funerals as “private ceremonies” he notes that they did in some sense spill out into the public domain insofar as they often included other inhabitants of the immediate surrounding area. Homer’s *Iliad* depicts the ceremonial processional from the bride’s family dwelling to her new home along with the groom. This processional included dancing, choral accompaniment, and instrumental performances. He mentions the hymenaeal, or wedding song, a group of young male dancers, and the sounds of the auloi and lyres. Comotti notes that one wedding song in

---

82 Plutarch, *De Superstitione* 13, 171. “παρειστήκει δ’ ἡ μήτηρ ἔτεκτος καὶ ἀστένακτος. εἰ δὲ στενάξειεν ἢ δακρύσειεν, ἔδει τῆς τιμῆς στέρεσθαι, τὸ δὲ παιδίον οὐδὲν ἤττον ἠθέτει, κρότου τε κατεπιπλατο λάμβανον καὶ συμπαντέον ἐνεκα τοῦ μὴ γίγνεσθαι τὴν βοήν τῶν θρήνων ἐξάκουστον.”


85 See West, *Ancient Greek Music*, 21 where he cites Homer’s *Iliad* 18, 492-496 “νῦμφας δ’ ἐκ θαλάμων δαίδον ὅπο λαμπρομενάνοι γένειον ἄνα ἁπεταίροι, πολὺς δ’ ὑμένας όρθος τοῖσιν οὐν ὑμέναις ὑμνήσεσθε ἐδίκεῖσθε, ἐν δ’ ἄρα τοῖσιν αὐλοὶ φόρμιγες τε βοήν ἔχον: αἱ δὲ γυναῖκες ἱστάμεναι θαῦμαζον ἐπὶ προθύροισιν ἐκάστη.”
particular, the *aulema gamelion*, was played by two auloi, which were representative of the bride and the groom insofar as one played at a lower pitch while the other played at a higher pitch.\textsuperscript{86} After the procession concluded and the bride and groom retired for the evening, West contends that the singing continued on into the night. In addition to the processional, Rebecca Hague argues that other elements of the wedding ceremony were accompanied by musical performance. For example, prior to the processional, there was a communal meal celebration at the home of the bride’s parents and the morning after the processional there was an informal gathering of friends and family that included the exchange of gifts. Hague claims that there were songs for each stage of the marriage ceremony and that despite their similarity in melody, the tone for each song is varied. At the communal meal celebration, she notes that the guests sang a song directed toward the couple that was a parody of sorts, imitating the type of song sung at a comedic theatrical performance. Additionally, some of the wedding songs included descriptions of the bridal chamber and these descriptions were meant to parallel the bridal chambers of the gods and their sacred union.\textsuperscript{87}

The funeral was another important ritual practice in the ancient Greco-Roman world that, like the aforementioned wedding ceremony, included numerous members of the community. During the early Archaic period, funerals were public spectacles that afforded wealthy families the opportunity to “convey their dead to the pyre in ostentatious style, which the largest possible number of mourners following the bier, wailing and tearing their hair and garments”.\textsuperscript{88} It is difficult to distinguish “singing” and “wailing” in this context but West notes that several

\textsuperscript{86} Comotti, *Music in Greek and Roman Culture*, 71.


\textsuperscript{88} West, *Ancient Greek Music*, 23.
sources\textsuperscript{89} mention the instrumental accompaniment as well as the practice of hiring foreign singers. The lyre and kithara were commonly used within the Athenian context but that the flute was also a popular instrument among Athenians and others such as the Assyrians and Babylonians\textsuperscript{90} and Comotti notes that the high-pitched aulos accompanied the funeral song, or \textit{threnos}, which was characterized by a slow tempo, even rhythm, and solemn melodic temperament.\textsuperscript{91} Additionally, there were specific funeral dirges that were performed at the time of burial or at later times to commemorate the dead.\textsuperscript{92} However, during the late Archaic and early Classical periods, there were prohibitions against lamentations for the dead in order to limit the ostentatious nature of some funeral rituals. Yet, there are numerous examples that describe the performance of funeral dirges and lamentations.\textsuperscript{93}

Similarly, the Romans employed the practice of flute playing at funerary rituals. A tombstone, currently housed in the Museo Baracco in Rome, depicts a wake. The image shows a group in mourning gathered around the corpse and at the foot of the corpse there is a flutist playing the double-flute. The top section of the fragment illustrates a group of people dancing and in the corner of the relief there is a lyre-player providing accompaniment for the dancers. Quasten refers to these dancers as “grave-dancers” and suggests that this type of performance was quite common at Roman interment ceremonies.\textsuperscript{94}

There is also remarkable level of similarity between Athenian and Roman funerary

\textsuperscript{89} For example, see Plato, \textit{Laws} 7 800e; Aeschylus, \textit{The Persians} 935-940; Homer, \textit{Iliad} 24 719-776; Homer, \textit{Odyssey} 24 46-64.
\textsuperscript{90} Quasten, \textit{Music and Worship}, 150.
\textsuperscript{91} Comotti, \textit{Music in Greek and Roman Culture}, 71.
\textsuperscript{92} West, \textit{Ancient Greek Music}, 23.
\textsuperscript{93} See West, \textit{Ancient Greek Music}, 23-24. Quasten also notes in \textit{Music and Worship}, 151, that the Athenian Statesman and poet Solon spoke out against grand displays of lamentation but that it was not necessarily the musical component to which Solon objected. Rather it was the luxurious display of wealth that he opposed and Quasten, and West alike, both point out the continued presence of funeral dirges at these ritual ceremonies.
\textsuperscript{94} Quasten, \textit{Music and Worship}, 151.
practices. For example, at the beginning of the procession, a trumpeter would signal commencement and lead the crowd during the procession. Once the procession arrived at the gravesite, a communal meal would take (on occasion) and guests would consume a special meal, drink wine, and sing and dance, while listening to a musician playing the lyre. Quasten points out that this was done for the pleasure of the guests and notes that some ancient writers found this to be both odd and amusing.\textsuperscript{95} Thus, musical performance and participation was an integral part of the funeral procession, meal, and interment in both Greek and Roman cultural contexts.

\textit{Music in Greco-Roman Mystery Cults}

The Greco-Roman mystery cults of antiquity required those that wished to join to undergo esoteric initiation rites and only these initiates were permitted to observe and participate in the ritual practices of the cult. Initiation rites tended to focus on purification and music played a significant role in these ritual practices because of the ancient belief that music had the power to drive away evil spirits and demons.\textsuperscript{96} While scholars have relatively limited information on the initiation rites of mystery cults, one commonality that seems to exist among many of them is the inclusion of percussion instruments, which may be connected to some form of dancing. Lucian states, “I will say nothing about the fact that one cannot find a single ancient initiation in which dancing does not take place … But everyone has ears, and this is why it is commonly said of those who divulge the mysteries that they dance them out”.\textsuperscript{97} There are several frescos that depict

\textsuperscript{95} Quasten, \textit{Music and Worship}, 154. Quasten cites a passage from Lucian’s \textit{De mercèdè conductis} 28, 687 (I 425, OCD) that discusses the ridiculous nature of these funeral meals insofar as the purpose of the ritual is to honour the dead but the actual event only serves to make the environment pleasurable for those that are living.

\textsuperscript{96} Quasten, \textit{Music and Worship}, 33.

\textsuperscript{97} Lucian’s \textit{De saltatione} 15. “ἐῶ λέγειν, ὅτι τελετὴν οὐδεμίαν ἄρχαιαν ἔστιν εὑρεῖν ἄνευ ὀρχήσεως. Ὀρφέως δὴ καὶ Μουσαίου καὶ τῶν τότε ἄριστων ὀρχηστῶν καταστησαμένων αὐτάς, ὡς τί κάλλιστον καὶ τόσο νομοθετησάντων, σὺν ῥυθμῷ καὶ ὀρχήσει μιψάθαι. ὅτι δ’ οὕτως ἔχει, τὰ μὲν ὀργία σιωπᾶν άξιον τῶν ἁμάλτων
initiation rites into the Bacchic mysteries, which provide some insight into the nature of the ceremony. For example, there is a Roman fresco in the Museo delle Terme in Rome that illustrates such a ritual. This fresco shows the initiate standing awaiting induction into the mystery cult and a woman stands beside the initiate playing a tambourine. Other frescos that depict this type of initiation ritual contain similar images including cymbal-players, lyre-players, and brass instrumentalists. Euripides also describes the “Bacchic revels” where adherents participate in frenzied dancing with rhythmic accompaniment.

The lack of percussive instruments in other contexts is something that set the Greeks apart from other ancient cultures like the Egyptians, for example. Comotti notes that these instruments were only utilized in the mystery cults of deities such as Dionysus and Cybele. The reason for this limitation, according to Comotti, is that percussive instruments were perceived as exotic and not associated with the oldest Greek musical traditions. Percussive instruments that fall under this category include the tympana, cymbals, and the tambourine. West contends that the drum, in particular, was associated with women and therefore a man was considered effeminate if he should play the drum. Another potential reason for the use of percussive instruments in mystery cults and not elsewhere pertains to the goal or aim of the mystery cult. These orgiastic cults attempted to induce a heightened state of consciousness in order to have an ecstatic experience that would unite the initiate with the deity. Quasten argues, “Music was the most important element used to induce this condition” and “Preference in musical tonality was

\[\text{ἐνεκα, ἐκεῖνο δὲ πάντες ἄκουσαν, ὅτι τοὺς ἐξαγορεύοντας τὰ μυστήρια ἐξορχεῖσθαι λέγουσιν οἱ πολλοὶ.}\]

This translation is from Quasten, *Music and Worship*, 33.

98 Quasten, *Music and Worship*, 34. See pages 34-35 for all of the archeological evidence that Quasten cites.
100 Comotti, *Music in Greek and Roman Culture*, 74-75.
given to the Phrygian mode". The Cult of Cybele employed the Phrygian flute, cymbals and the tambourine. These instruments accompanied vocal performance, usually a dithyramb, which was a fast-paced song. Physical movement was also an essential component to these initiation rites and the musical element was usually accompanied by a frenzied dance. Quasten claims that the tambourine was of particular importance because it was thought to expel evil spirits and “its rhythmic character was highly suited to induce psychic stimulation”.

The last point to note on the topic of music and Greco-Roman mystery cults is the nature of the relationship between music and divination. It was noted above that musical ritual was viewed as a mechanism of ecstatic induction by certain mystery cults and the resulting altered state of consciousness was thought to be an avenue to prophecy and divine communication. Quasten cites a particularly pertinent example from Pliny the Elder, who writes about the cult of Apis. In Naturalia Historia, Pliny describes how a group of young boys sing songs dedicated to the god Apis, who walks among them and appears to understand the boys. Thus, musical participation in this cultic context was used to prepare for divine communication and Quasten astutely relates this to the ancient Greek idea of eliminating tensions within the human disposition that could act as an obstacle to this kind of experience. Both Quasten and J. A. Smith note that a parallel case existed within the ancient Jewish context. For example, the author of 2 Kings describes how the prophet Elijah calls for a harpist/musician (depending on translation)

102 Quasten, Music and Worship, 36.
103 This flute differed from other types of flutes insofar as it was constructed with a unique backward bell-shaped curve and had pipes of differing lengths. See Comotti, Music in Greek and Roman Culture, 72 and Quasten, Music and Worship, 37.
104 Quasten, Music and Worship, 37.
105 Pliny, Naturalis Historia, II, 101, ed. C. Mayhoff (Lipisiae: Teubner, 1875). "Bos in Aegypto etiam numinus vie colitur. Apin vocant...cetero secretus, cum se proripuit in coetus, incedit submotu lictorum, gregesque puerorum comitantur carmen honori eius canentium. intellegere videtur et adorari velle. hi greges repente lymphati futura praecinunt."
and once the musician plays, Elijah is able to communicate with God. Thus, the effect of music in the aforementioned examples is two-fold: it prepares the individual by quieting the inner disposition and opening the mind to divine communication and it also blocks out other distractions in the immediate environment.

**The Greek Symposium**

The symposium was an integral part of Greek culture. It was a setting where men could eat, drink, relax, be entertained, and exchange ideas with their peers. Musical performance was certainly a vital component to this pervasive social institution. Participants would sing whatever types of songs they wished including hymns honouring a deity, a political commentary or exhortation, reflections on the joys of wine or the pain of heartbreak, moral advice, and satirical commentary directed toward other guests in jest. Music permeated the entire event, as there were songs sung at the beginning, during, and at the end of the meal. The most common instruments that accompanied the singing were the flute, the pipe, the lyre, and sometimes the harp. The lyre was perhaps the most commonly used instrument because the lyre provided accompaniment for the *skolion*, a traditional song sung at the symposium. Those that did not have the training in lyre-playing were thought to be uneducated. Comotti argues that the lyre was considered an “aristocratic instrument”. In addition, there were often courtesans hired to dance, play instruments, sing, and perhaps perform other services. Despite the dominant practice of hosting a male-only symposium, the women of the household would often gather in their own

---

quarters and singing was also a part of their domestic assembly. There are several examples of this practice depicted on vases and often instruments were also played in the women’s quarters.\textsuperscript{110}

Male attendants would also sing sections of the elegiac and lyric poetry from the Archaic and early Classical periods such as Pindar and Alcaeus. Despite the emphasis on merriment and drinking, Comotti argues that political debate was an important element of the symposium and he states, “Music and song not only contributed to making this communal experience more pleasurable but often became the instruments of political and cultural propaganda, as can be seen from the poems of Alcaeus and many archaic elegies”.\textsuperscript{111} Therefore, song functioned as a pedagogical and rhetorical device within the context of the symposium. Ideas and arguments were disseminated through melody and lyrics at these gatherings.\textsuperscript{112}

\textit{Greek Music and the Discourse of Magic and Healing}

The so-called “charms” of music are well-documented in ancient Greek literary sources, many of which comment on Orpheus’ ability to charm the animals with his musicianship and virtuosi performance abilities. Thus, the powers of melody and song go beyond pleasure and ethos in ancient Greece and music was viewed as a component of healing and magic in some contexts.\textsuperscript{113} West argues that “mainstream physicians” in ancient Greece relied on other mechanisms for

\textsuperscript{110} West, \textit{Ancient Greek Music}, 26-27.
\textsuperscript{111} Comotti, \textit{Music in Greek and Roman Culture}, 15.
\textsuperscript{112} While this is my own assertion, see Dean Hammer, “Ideology, the Symposium, and Archaic Politics,” \textit{The American Journal of Philology} 125 (2004): 479-512 for an interesting analysis of the political functionality of the ancient Greek symposium.
\textsuperscript{113} Certainly there are methodological issues surrounding the use of the term “magic” insofar as scholars have problematized certain distinctions between “magic” and religion”. However, it is beyond the scope of this section to address these problems in further detail. Thus, for our purposes at this point it is sufficient simply acknowledge that this serious methodological issue in the academic study of religion. In addition, it must be noted that it is not my aim to conflate “healing” and “magic” in any way. These terms are only grouped together for the sake of continuity.
diagnosis and healing such as “exercise, baths, diet, drugs, or surgery”.\textsuperscript{114} In other social milieus, however, music was thought to be a means of combatting physical and spiritual ailments. West classifies those who used such medicinal/magical intervention within the realm of “quacks, old women, religious healers and purveyors of esoteric lore”.\textsuperscript{115} He distinguishes between three manifestations of magical/healing music. First, incantations were common features of the “religious healers” that West mentions. However, in this case the melody is less significant than the actual words, which determine the efficacy of the incantation. According to Pindar, Asclepius is even purported to have used incantations as an effective form of healing.\textsuperscript{116} West lists a variety of other examples of ancient literary works that mention the use of incantations as a mechanism of healing. For example, midwives used them to induce labour, and healers used them to treat diseases such as epilepsy.\textsuperscript{117} Second, the paean was particular form of choral arrangement that was thought to have purifying effects. It was supposed to have a calming effect on the listener, which translated to a healing or curative power. In this case, the melody, rhythm, and scale mode was extremely important and the efficacy of the paean was dependent upon those very elements. Third, there were certain melodic forms that were purely instrumental that were considered effective treatments against many different physical ailments. For example, the lyre and the pipe were thought to be particularly efficacious against illnesses such as “fainting, epilepsy, sciatica, and even snake-bites”.\textsuperscript{118}

In addition to other instrumental sounds, bells were used to ward off sickness because they were thought to scare away demons, which were considered the root cause of illness in

\textsuperscript{114} West, Ancient Greek Music, 32.
\textsuperscript{115} West, Ancient Greek Music, 32.
\textsuperscript{117} West, Ancient Greek Music, 32. See footnotes 94-99.
\textsuperscript{118} West, Ancient Greek Music, 33.
among many people. This apotropaic understanding of music is rooted in the role that music played at cultic sacrifice. It was mentioned above that one of the functions of music at a sacrifice to ward off demons while the ritual was in progress. Interestingly, the use of bells as an apotropaic device was so embedded in the ancient culture of antiquity that it carried over into early Christian communities. In fact, John Chrysostom states that true protection comes from the cross, not bells or ribbons.\(^{119}\) Therefore, music (and various manifestations including singing, playing instruments, etc.) was an important part of folkloric healing, preventative medicine practices, and rituals categorized as magical in the ancient Greco-Roman world. It is interesting to note, however, that by the 13th century, Christian churches in England used a “sacring bell” to alert worshippers when the Eucharist was about to take place. The church bells would also be rung to alert those passing by that this ritual practice was taking place.\(^{120}\)

### Music & Ancient Judaism

The music of the ancient Israelites evolved over many centuries, but according to musicologist Curt Sachs, it was always an important component in the Israelite identity.\(^{121}\) During the earliest recorded histories in the Hebrew Bible, there are numerous references to music and song. Singing was a common form of worship and instrumental performances was also a popular component to cultic ritual, especially during the First and Second Temple periods. The lyre and the trumpet were two specific instruments that were used in a variety of cultic rituals. For example, upon the return of Saul and David’s from the battle with the Philistines in 1 Samuel

---

\(^{119}\) See John Chrysostom, *Homilia* 12 in Epistle I to the Corinthians 7, 7; PG LXI, 105-106. “τι ἂν τις εἴποι τὰ περὶ ἁπατα καὶ τοὺς κόδωνας, τοὺς τῆς χειρὸς ἐξητημένους, καὶ τὸν κόκκινον στήμαν καὶ τὰ ἄλλα τὰ πολλὰς ἀνοιας γέμοντα, δέον μηδέν ἔτερον τῷ παιδί περιπετεύναι, ἀλλ ἡ τὴν ἀπὸ τοῦ σταυροῦ φυλακήν.”

\(^{120}\) For more on the use of bells and the Eucharist, see Paul F. Bradshaw, *The Eucharistic Liturgies: Their Evolution and Interpretation* (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2012).

18:6, they are greeted by a contingent of women who are singing, playing, and dancing in celebration of their victory.

According to Abraham Idelsohn, however, any reflection on the nature of Israelite/Judean music must “consider the music of Israel’s ancient neighbours”.\textsuperscript{122} Thus, Jewish music was influenced by the continual change in the political and social environment of Israel/Palestine. For example, in the Egyptian tradition, music was viewed as a sacred entity given as a gift from the gods and was strongly associated with cultic ritual practices. The Egyptians also thought that music had its own divine power or ethos, an idea that took root in the Greek context as well. The Egyptians also used instruments in their musical performances, including the kithara, a stringed instrument similar to a lyre, which would later make its way to ancient Palestine.\textsuperscript{123} Music in Babylonia and Assyria was similar insofar as they too incorporated instruments such the lyre and harp but there was more of an emphasis on percussion and rhythm. Idelsohn argues that the Assyrian and Egyptian influences were the most prominent in the development of Jewish music.\textsuperscript{124}

There are several notable areas in which musical ritual played a prominent role throughout the historical development of the Jewish tradition. Music was a vital part of the Temple cult in Jerusalem. The role of song and instrument in the formation of the early synagogue, however, is much more ambiguous and unclear. This point is of particular importance with regard to this project because many scholars have attempted to trace the origins of Christian liturgy to the Jewish synagogue, which is highly problematic considering the lack of data on liturgical practices in the early synagogue. We have, however, much more concrete

---

\textsuperscript{123} Idelsohn, \textit{Jewish Music}, 4.
\textsuperscript{124} Idelsohn, \textit{Jewish Music}, 5.
evidence of musical ritual in the sectarian Jewish communities in the literary works that describe the group at Qumran as well as Philo’s Therapeutae. Therefore, this shall be our starting point given the detailed descriptions of the musical practices in these communities, which underscore the significance of musical ritual more generally in ancient Judaism.

**Music in Jewish Sectarian Communities**

There are two sectarian Jewish groups that existed in the first century CE, which can tell us something about musical practice within Judaism during the late second Temple period. The Community(-ies) at Qumran and the Therapeutae (likely based somewhere outside Alexandria) are Jewish groups that practiced voluntary separation from the rest of society (although perhaps less so with the assembly(ies) at Qumran), shared all material possessions and financial holdings, renounced bodily pleasures, and gathered together for corporate worship. These communities also developed unique liturgical forms and musical expression played a major role in communal worship practices. Yet, it is important to note that they are not representative of Jewish musical practices more generally nor do they directly reveal anything

---

125 The nature of the community(ies) at Qumran has been debated among scholars. Traditional conceptions of the Qumran community as a single entity that produced the entire corpus of the Dead Sea Scrolls have been challenged. In their introduction to the *Oxford Handbook of the Dead Sea Scrolls*, John J. Collins and Timothy H. Lim note some of these divergent opinions and contend that it is unlikely the entire corpus was composed and used at Qumran. For example, the Biblical texts generally pre-date the Sectarian rules such as the Damascus Document. Also, different editions of these rule books indicate that these texts were not read together with one another but rather they were preserved in different sectarian communities. For more on these theories, see John J. Collins and Timothy H. Lim, eds. *Oxford Handbook of the Dead Sea Scrolls* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), 1-20. Additionally, it should be noted that earlier scholarship that equated the Yahad with the Essenes (as described by Josephus) has been questioned. For example, Hillel Newman argues that the Qumran community should not be identified with any other first century Jewish sect including the Essenes even though they may share similarities such as their degree of isolation, their attitude toward normative society, and their access to power centres. See *Proximity to Power and Jewish Sectarian Groups of the Ancient Period: A Review of Lifestyles, Values, and Halakhah in the Pharisees, Sadducees, Essenes, and Qurman*. ed. by Ruth Ludlam (Leiden: Brill, 2006), 99. For more on Qumran and Jewish sectarianism, see Sacha Stern, ed., *Sects and Sectarianism in Jewish History* (Leiden: Brill, 2011), 39-86.

about early Christian music. They are extremely helpful, however, insofar as both communities illustrate two important elements pertaining to the role of music in small sectarian groups. First, according to various source materials, which will be examined below, each community made novel contributions to Jewish liturgical song forms, including melodic compositions and distinctive lyrical content. Second, each community is uniquely defined (at least in part) by their musical ritual practices. Therefore, both case studies provide a socio-religious parallel to early Christ-following assemblies (regardless of whether or not there is a direct historical link), which help inform a scholarly understanding of how music functions in this type of setting.

**Music at Qumran**

The community at Qumran broke away from the Jewish epicenter in Jerusalem and scholars contend that this happened some time around the middle of the second century BCE. This group viewed themselves as representing the “true Israel”, which in their view was “in direct opposition to the prevalent religious and national regime which they considered unlawful”. Membership was entirely voluntary, which likely indicates that this assembly has some similarities in terms of social structure with the Greco-Roman voluntary associations (communal meal practices, for example). They devoted their daily lives to ritual practice and Torah-study with a strong focus on purity, community regulations, and corporate worship. Interestingly, they also followed a solar calendar as opposed to a lunar calendar, which meant that their festival schedule was incongruent with the rest of Palestinian Judaism. This group also produced at least

---

some texts that are part of the corpus known as the Dead Sea Scrolls which provide a wealth of information about the community including initiation requirements, rules for daily living, legal interpretations, theological understandings, and liturgical practices. However, the Dead Sea Scrolls include a broad collection of texts that were discovered in and around Qumran and they must be understood and contextualized as a more far-reaching representation of early Judaism than simply a corpus of texts used by one community in particular. This issue will be addressed further in the textual analysis of several documents found at Qumran pertaining to music and liturgy.

Moreover, the liturgical texts contain information about singing and instrumental performance at Qumran and this appears to have been an integral part of community participation. According to Angela Kim Harkins, there are seven major categories of poetic and liturgical texts including: liturgies for fixed prayer times, ceremonial liturgies, eschatological prayers, magical incantations, Psalmsic collections, Hodayot hymns, and prayers embodied in narratives. These distinctive categories illuminate the various contexts in which song or cantillation of texts was employed, which is important because as Carol Newsom argues, life at Qumran was embodied in liturgical texts and that song itself can be considered a dialect of sorts that helps shape identity and demarcates social boundaries. Several of these scrolls make

---

129 It should once again be noted that the connection between the Dead Sea Scrolls and the liturgical history of the group(s) at Qumran is not necessarily straight-forward. The nature of the relationship between text and community(ies) is explored more thoroughly in the aforementioned Oxford Handbook of the Dead Sea Scrolls. See Collins and Lim, eds. Oxford Handbook of the Dead Sea Scrolls. Also, see Devorah Dimant, ed., The Dead Sea Scrolls in Scholarly Perspective: A History of Research (Leiden: Brill, 2012), which summarizes the state of scholarship on these texts from a variety of different perspectives. For a more generalized discussion on the Dead Sea Scrolls, see Craig Evans, Holman Quicksource Guide to the Dead Sea Scrolls, (Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2010), which includes information on the scrolls and how they came into the hands of scholars as well as photographs of the texts, Qumran, and the surrounding caves.


reference to musical practice.  

The Community Rule Scroll (1QS, X 9), which is generally defined as a sectarian document due to the linguistic usage and theological content, contains a specific reference to singing and musical instruments. The closing psalm at the end states, “I will sing with knowledge, and for the glory of God all my music shall be, the playing of my harp for his holy order, and the whistle of my lips I shall tune to its correct measure.” These phrases indicate that singing was in fact a religious duty in which community members must participate. Smith contends that musical expression is integral to theological understanding because he claims, “the author’s main idea could have been expressed perfectly clearly without introducing a specifically musical element”. In fact, there are several references to instrumental usage (in the War Scroll, for example) but most scholars conclude that they are mainly symbolic in nature. Werner contends that only the references to trumpets are likely references to actual practice because of the detail in which their usage is described. He also notes that the community at Qumran may have associated instrumental usage with cultic sacrificial practices in Jerusalem and they wanted to distance themselves from such rituals.

The Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice is another important document that identifies key features of musical liturgy at Qumran. However, this analysis must be prefaced with an important disclaimer. Unlike the Community Rule, we cannot conclusively identify the Songs of worship and its relationship to identity, emotion, and symbolic space. This claim will be examined further in chapter four. 

For a complete listing of musical references in the Dead Sea Scrolls see Eric Werner, “Musical Aspects of the Dead Sea Scrolls,” The Musical Quarterly 43 (Jan 1957): 21-37. Werner also includes a discussion on markings found in the margins of two specific scrolls (Isaiah and the Habakkuk commentary), which may be ephphonic notation that possibly has a musical function insofar as it may denote pitch and interestingly have a connection (perhaps coincidental) to Byzantine neumes found in hymn manuscripts dating to the 5-7th centuries.


Smith, Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity, 128.

the Sabbath Sacrifice as a document that originated within the Yahad. Carol Newsom discusses this problem in her entry on the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice in the *Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls*. She outlines some of the evidence for both a Qumran and pre-Qumran origin and although she asserts that no definitive conclusion can be made, the evidence for a pre-Qumran origin seems much stronger based on three factors including “the distribution of copies of the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice, internal evidence, and the relationship between the songs and other clearly sectarian literature from Qumran”. There were nine copies recovered from caves in and around Qumran (eight from cave 4 and one from cave 11). However, there was also a copy recovered during excavations at Masada, which indicate a potentially wider usage of this text than one confined to the community at Qumran. Although Newsom also points out that a member of the Yahad escaped Qumran during its destruction by the Romans and left a copy at Masada. Second, despite the use of a solar calendar in the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice, which does coincide with the festival schedule at Qumran, is also “presupposed in other works preserved but not composed by the Qumran community, such as *Jubilees* and *1 Enoch*”. Third, Newsom argues that there is no distinctly sectarian language in the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice or any “peculiarly sectarian forms of organization”. Additionally, we find the term “maskil” in this text but this word is also used in non-sectarian literature found at Qumran (such as *1 Enoch*) and thus cannot conclusively demonstrate a sectarian origin. Newsom also contends that the frequent use of the term “Elohim” is inconsistent with other sectarian literature. Interestingly, the classification of hymns previously deemed to be sectarian, such as the Hodayot, have also been called into question by scholars such as Harkins, which demonstrates that the

---

137 Newsom, “Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice”, 887.
designations “sectarian” and “non-sectarian” are both inherently problematic when applied broadly to any of the hymns found at Qumran. Even “sectarian” hymns such as the Hodayot contain a “variety of language and style”, some of which “does not show strong alignment” with the Yahad.  

With this discussion in mind, let us turn to the musical references found in the Songs of the Sabbath sacrifice in order to describe the nature of musical liturgy at Qumran. Russell C.D. Arnold argues that these thirteen hymns were likely used in weekly liturgies and essentially described praise and worship. They include depictions of angelic priesthoods and the heavenly realm as well as symbolic portrayals of the Temple. Arnold points out that these songs are not petitionary in nature but rather they function as representations of calendric and political rites (which establish priestly authority), and they express communion. As noted above, previous scholars (such as Geza Vermes and Carol Newsom) have argued that the Qumran community did not actually author these songs. However, Arnold argues that provenance is not particularly significant in a discussion pertaining to liturgical history. He claims that the large number of copies found in the caves around Qumran and the content of the songs themselves (which he claims do possess a high affinity with other Qumran ideology) illustrates that this was a significant text regardless of a likely pre-Qumranic origin. Similarly to Carol Newsom, Arnold concludes that these hymns served to reinforce key elements of community identity.

---

141 Arnold, *Social Role of Liturgy*, 141. Other scholars argue that the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice did originate in Qumran based the relationship between that text and other “sectarian” texts. For more on this, see Henry W. Morisada Rietz, “Identifying Compositions and Traditions of the Qumran Community: The Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice as a Test Case,” in *Qumran Studies: New Approaches, New Questions*, ed. Michael Thomas Davis and Brent A. Srawan (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdman's Publishing Co., 2007), 29-52.  
including their connection with the Teacher of Righteousness and the separation between God and humanity.\textsuperscript{143}

The connection that Arnold draws between text and practice, however, is not universally accepted among scholars. Philip Alexander's work on Jewish mysticism examines the relationship between religious traditions/texts and religious experience within the context of the community at Qumran. He notes the dialectical nature of this relationship and problematizes the assumption that liturgical practice is accurately reflected in the literature. In fact, he argues that there are only two conclusions that scholars can make: we know that the songs were to be recited in a certain order and we know that they were to be recited by an assembly led by the Maskil.\textsuperscript{144}

Therefore, there are numerous unanswered questions relating to the role that these songs actually played in the liturgy. Did the congregation join in the singing? Did these songs represent only a small component of the liturgical practices at Qumran? How did other liturgical hymns fit into the worship meetings? These are all questions that remain unclear according to Alexander\textsuperscript{145} and similar issues are raised in chapter four on the nature of early Christian hymns. Finally, it is important to point out that the findings from Qumran are still being integrated into our understanding of early Judaism and the relationship between the Yahad and other first century Jewish groups is not entirely understood among scholars.

**Musical Practices of the Therapeutae**

The sectarian Jewish community, known as the Therapeutae, is only mentioned in Philo’s *On the...*
Contemplative Life and subsequent references to Philo in Eusebius. There are no other extant historical documents that describe this assembly but Philo’s summary provides a detailed synopsis of their purported activities, including liturgical rituals. Based on Philo’s account, the Therapeutae community practiced celibacy, prohibited the consumption of wine and meat, and lived in rural areas away from major urban centres in Upper Egypt. It is also evident that both men and women were members of this group and in some sense their lifestyle can be considered semi-monastic insofar as they spent most of their time praying and studying scripture in secluded locations.

Philo writes about the musical performances of the Therapeutae within the context of a celebratory communal meal where there is singing both before and after the food is consumed. Though this passage from Philo is lengthy, it will be quoted in full so as to present all the relevant details in their original context.

And after the supper they hold the sacred vigil which is conducted in the following way. They rise up all together and standing in the middle of the refectory form themselves first into two choirs, one of men and one of women, the leader and precentor chosen for each being the most honoured amongst them and also the most musical. Then they sing hymns to God composed of many measures and set to many melodies, sometimes chanting together, sometimes taking up harmony antiphonally, hands and feet keeping time in accompaniment, and rapt with enthusiasm reproduce sometimes the lyrics of the procession, sometimes the halt and of the wheeling and counter-wheeling of a choral dance. Then when each choir has separately done its own part in the feast, having drunk as in the Bacchic rites of the strong wine of God's love they mix and both together become a single choir, a copy of the choir set up of old beside the Red Sea in honour of the wonders there wrought. For at the command of God the sea became a source of salvation to one party and of perdition to the other. As it broke in twain and withdrew under the violence of the forces which swept it back there rose on either side, opposite to each other, a semblance of solid walls, while the space thus opened between them and broadened into a highway smooth and dry throughout on which the people marched under guidance right on until they reached the higher ground on the opposite mainland. But when the sea came rushing in with the returning tide, and from either side passed over the ground where dry land had appeared the pursuing enemy was submerged and perished. This wonderful sight and experience, an act transcending word and thought and hope, so filled with ecstasy both men and women that forming a single choir they sang hymns of thanksgiving to God their Saviour, the men led by the prophet Moses and the women by the prophetess Miriam. It is on this model above all that the choir of the Therapeutae of either sex,
note in response to note and voice to voice, the treble of the women blending with the bass of the men, create a harmonious concert, music in the truest sense.\textsuperscript{146}

There are several notable features of the text. First, this is a unique example of Jewish choral song combined with dance. There are no other known examples of such a phenomenon at the Jerusalem Temple or even in other Jewish contexts. Second, there are no references to instrumental performance in Philo’s account, which suggests that the Therapeutae did not use instrumental accompaniment and relied solely on vocal musical expression in their liturgy and worship. Third, both men and women participate equally in the refrain section of each hymn.\textsuperscript{147} Joan E. Taylor and Philip R. Davies note the significance of this female chorus insofar as the musical aptitude of the participants and their equal level of contribution and involvement with their male counterparts indicate a higher level of education for Jewish women that would be considered normative at that period of time.\textsuperscript{148} Thus, musical education was certainly emphasized by the Therapeutae community and this education was not gender-specific.

Additional passages of Philo’s description of the Therapeutae denote several types of singing, which Smith systematically outlines in his analysis. There appears to have been a pre-meal responsorial performance, which may parallel the singing of the Hallel in the synagogue or even the domestic Passover meal. Then after the meal, Philo describes two choirs that sang together, separately, and antiphonally. One particularly interesting aspect of Philo’s description


\textsuperscript{147} Smith, \textit{Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity}, 125. Smith notes that Philo mentions soloists in his account but is not clear on whether both men and women take part in solo performance or if just male vocalists have that honour. He also points out that the joining of men and women in vocal performance was likely an anomaly within Judaism because mixed singing was denounced in devout Jewish circles. Additionally, Philo’s tone (according to Smith) is somewhat defensive when referencing the mixed-gender singing and he uses Biblical precedents to justify this practice.

can be seen where he comments on how the choral leader is chosen. This selection is based on honour as well as musical talent. In other words, the quality of performance was important to the Therapeutae community and Philo himself is apparently impressed by the musical aptitude of the community as a whole. Philo also seems to connect technical perfection and aesthetic appeal with devotion and piety. This demonstrates both Philo’s own personal emphasis on musical performance as well as the uniqueness of the Therapeutae liturgy as compared to the Temple cult or even worship in the synagogue. For Philo, there is something aesthetically and spiritually pleasing about the musical rituals of the Therapeutae. His description provides a clear example of how music can function in a sectarian group and the positive nature of his comments illustrates the favourable effect that musical performance and practice can have on an individual and on a collective group of people.

The last point to note on Philo’s excerpt is the connection that he draws between the ritualized performance of the Therapeutae and the celebratory event of the exodus where according to the Hebrew Bible (Exodus 14:10-15:21), Moses and the Israelites sing a hymn to God followed by Miriam’s hymn, which is sung by other women and accompanied with dance. Philo suggests that this is perhaps the basis for the ritual practices of the Therapeutae but as Smith indicates, “Philo’s implied view reflects a prevalent popular tradition stemming perhaps from mixed singing in non-sacrificial cultic festivities”.  

Musical Practice in the Temple

The roots of musical ritual within ancient Judaism may be found in Hebrew Bible references that describe various uses of instrumental and vocal performance in the Temple. The construction of

---

the Temple in Jerusalem (by Solomon according to Biblical accounts) was a significant turning point in the historical development of Judaism and the Temple became the epicenter of the ancient Israelite tradition. It was the economic, political, and religious nucleus of ancient Israel and all major festivals were celebrated at the Temple. Additionally, it was the site of priestly sacrifice and weekly worship. These ritualistic elements all included musical performance of some sort. In fact, vocal and instrumental components were integral to most ritual performances within the Temple. Prior to its construction, however, there is no mention of professional musicians and this implementation happened during the time of David and Solomon around 1000 BCE, once a permanent structure for worship was established and Jerusalem became the central geographic location for Jewish life.151

The Jewish aristocracy began to assign professional musicians to their court during this period and they also developed subsequent musical organizations within the Temple hierarchy such as the Levites who were in charge of musical performances.152 There are numerous Hebrew Bible references to music in the Temple but as J.A. Smith points out, not all of these works are particularly helpful in terms of describing musical activities with any historical accuracy.153 The books of Ezra and Nehemiah describe David ordering the appointment of musicians from the Levites and the number of musicians greatly increased when David began constructing plans for the Temple in Jerusalem before his death.154 When Solomon later consecrated the Temple, there was a joyous celebration, which involved singing, playing, and praising the Lord. There are

152 For example, see Nehemiah 12:27-30; 1 Chronicles 1:15-16; 2 Chronicles 7:6, 23:18, 34:12.
153 Smith, *Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*, 38-50. Smith contends that other sources, such as the Book of Chronicles, are not relevant sources for documenting musical practices at the First Temple for two main reasons. The likely date of authorship places it in the postexilic period, which puts a span of 250 years or so between the existence of the First Temple and the compilation of the text. Second, Smith claims that the depiction of musical activity in Chronicles is so comprehensive that it is likely the result of retrojection from the time period in which Chronicles itself was written.
154 See Ezra 2:41 and 2:70.
several instruments mentioned in First Chronicles that were used, such as trumpets, cymbals, and stringed instruments.\textsuperscript{155} Again, the historical accuracy of these descriptions remains undetermined for the reasons that Smith points out.

According to First Chronicles, there were two hundred and eighty-eight musicians appointed to serve in the Temple.\textsuperscript{156} The Levites were organized into different divisions and they would rotate through each division after a certain period of time. During “active duty” in Temple service, they lived at the Temple and were provided with food and drink. When they were rotated out of duty, they lived in towns and villages not far from Jerusalem. 1 Chronicles 23:5 describes how the Levites were supposed to praise God with instruments that David had chosen. Rabbinic texts state that there were always a minimum of twelve Levites singing and playing during a religious ceremony at the Temple and that others would join in with vocal accompaniment only as instrumental performance was reserved for the Levitical musicians.\textsuperscript{157}

According to certain references in the Mishnah, some of the Psalms were sung on specific days in the Temple, not that all of them were sung in the Temple at all times.\textsuperscript{158} Since there is very little evidence for specific songs sung in the Temple, Foley argues that there are in fact certain lyrical structures embedded in the existing texts.\textsuperscript{159} One example he provides comes from Psalm 44, which suggests that individual singers, a choir, or even a larger assembly may have joined in the singing. Also, strophic forms existed, such as suggested by Psalm 119. This Psalm is symmetrical song and is grouped into twenty-two stanzas, each containing eight

\textsuperscript{155} Sachs, \textit{The Rise of Music in the Ancient World}, 60.
\textsuperscript{156} According to 1 Chronicles 25:6-7, there were 288 who “were instructed in singing unto the Lord”.
\textsuperscript{157} See m. Arakhin 2.6 in Herbert Danby, \textit{The Mishnah} (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1964), 545.
\textsuperscript{158} See m. Tamid 7.4 in Danby, \textit{The Mishnah}, 589.
\textsuperscript{159} Foley, \textit{Foundations of Christian Music}, 38.
Smith presents a complex organizational structure of the psalms in order to argue that some psalms were likely sung in the Temple while others were not. He places them all in different groupings based on literary references, thematic similarities, vocabulary, and grammatical links.

One specific collection of psalms, however, deserves special mention. Psalms 120-134 are known as the Psalms of Ascents and Alastair Hunter argues these hymns can be described using the term *ma'alot*, which specifically refers to some type of pilgrimage (likely worshippers travelling to Jerusalem for festivals). Hunter describes the various motifs that may be found in this collection of psalms but he also raises the aforementioned question of the relationship between the psalms and praxis. For example, does Psalm 132 capture the liturgy of a historical procession? It is difficult to make that claim with any level of certainty but Hunter does note that there are some parallels in other psalms as well as in Chronicles that "might lend the hypothesis plausibility".

Instruments were also an important part of musical ritual at the Temple. All of the instruments that are mentioned in the Hebrew Bible can be broken down into three groups: strings, percussion, and wind. Smith provides a lengthy description of these instruments based on literary sources and archeological evidence and notes the contexts in which they were likely utilized. For example, instrumental accompaniment was common at sacrificial ceremonies, other religious festivals, and prophetic experiences. Sacrifice at the Temple was of particular importance and instrumental performance occurred several times throughout the service. There are numerous literary references that outline sacrificial rites. For example, 2 Chronicles has

---

several key references to music at sacrificial rites. Smith details the example from 2 Chrs 29:26-30, which includes seven steps: offering of the sacrifice, the performance of a Levitical cultic song, the blowing of the trumpets carried out by the priests, general prostration, the repetition of all four stages until the completion of the burnt offering, Levitical singing of the psalms, and finally general prostration. Therefore, it is evident from a variety of sources that both singing and instrumental performance were integral components to sacrifice, particularly in the Second Temple. Other references, in the Mishnah for example, detail similar rites but include slight variations such as alternative instruments, the addition of libations, or differences in the order of events.

Music in the Synagogue

The title of this subsection “Music in the Synagogue” is actually somewhat of a misnomer because early synagogue liturgy is difficult to talk about with any degree of certainty and scholars generally concur that it is difficult (if not impossible) to pinpoint what type of music (if any) was performed in that context. The origins of the synagogue are still strongly contested among scholars but there is both written evidence and archeological remnants to confirm that the synagogue was an established religious institution by the first century CE throughout Israel/Palestine and in the Jewish Diaspora. Prior to the first century CE, however, it is unlikely that there was any type of fixed liturgy. In fact, Lee I. Levine argues that the synagogue

---

164 See 2 Chronicles 5:12-13, 7:3-6, and 29:26-30.
166 See m. Tamid 7:3 and m. Pesahim 5:5-7. Other examples can be found in Smith, *Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*, 72-75.
only became what he classifies as a “house of worship” after the 2nd and 3rd centuries CE.\(^{168}\) This claim stands for synagogues in Israel as well as in the Jewish Diaspora. Therefore, prior to this time period, there were no fixed scriptural passages that were read in the synagogue as part of a liturgy.\(^{169}\) The Torah was certainly read during worship and the writings of the Prophets were also likely read but prior to the destruction of the Temple, there was no known formalized liturgical structure in the synagogue. Idelsohn contends that the ancient synagogue employed praise and prayer just like the Temple; however, one of the main differences between worship in the synagogue and Temple was the lack of sacrificial rites.\(^{170}\) This is a significant point of distinction that merits further discussion because of the strong link between sacrifice and musical ritual. Since there was no sacrificial cult in the synagogue, Smith argues that this phenomenon explains why there are no references to “song” or instruments connected with the synagogue in Jewish literature from antiquity. One exception worthy of mention is the Hallel (Psalms 113-118), which was not exclusively connected to the Temple cult but rather with a general expression of praise and thanksgiving on Jewish holidays.

Since the liturgy in the Temple was much more clearly defined than in the synagogue, it becomes difficult to make any positive assertions about music in the synagogue prior to the third century CE based on what we know about music in the Temple. Yet, word-centered worship in the synagogue was an important component to communal gatherings. Verbal recitation was always oscillating back and forth between the spoken word and song or cantillation. Despite the absence of an appointed high priest, like those who were present in the Temple, there were synagogue leaders called sheliach tsibbur, or the emissary of the people, who shared the

\(^{168}\) Levine, The Ancient Synagogue, 4.
\(^{169}\) Smith, Music in Ancient and Early Judaism, 131.
responsibilities of leading the worship. Consequently, there are no references to designated musicians in the early synagogue as there were in the Temple but that does not mean that musical forms were not present through other means such as cantillation of prayer and recitation of various Jewish texts.

Singing in the synagogue is point of contestation among scholars and this becomes important in any discussion on the relationship between Jewish and early Christian liturgy. It has often been suggested that the psalms played a central role in worship that took place in the early synagogue and this is perhaps the origin of psalm singing within early Christian modes of worship. Yet, both Smith and Foley note that the sources from that period do not indicate such a presence. For example, there are virtually no references in the Mishnah and the Talmud regarding scriptural reading and Psalmodic responses. Thus, the presence of psalmody in the synagogue is not proven in any respect, except perhaps, as “parts of the Holy Scripture, of the authorized and inspired canon, for reading, just like the other biblical books, which were read in the synagogues as holy words of God”. Thus, the textual evidence from the first century CE is not particularly helpful in making any determination about whether or not psalms were sung in the synagogue. Interestingly, Smith provides several references from this time period found in Philo and Josephus, which mention the synagogue and none of these examples references psalm singing. This is of particular significance in Philo because it is possible to conclude that

---

172 For example, see Egon Wellesz, “Early Christian Music,” *The New Oxford History of Music II* (London, Oxford University Press, 1954), 1. Smith quotes a specific passage in his article “The Ancient Synagogue, the Early Church and Singing” from Wellesz’s entry that suggests “It was from the synagogue that early Christians took over the cantillation of lessons, the chanting of psalms and the singing of hymns…”. Smith contends that the nature of this conclusion was proto-typical in older scholarship on the origins of Christian liturgy and he problematizes these conclusions for a variety of reasons.
174 For a complete list of references found in Philo and Josephus, see Smith, “The Ancient Synagogue, the Early Church and Singing”, 3-5.
his comments on musical ritual in the Therapeutae community (discussed below) are quite lengthy in comparison, which may suggest that psalm singing was not worthy of mention because perhaps this performative act was not part of synagogue worship. Despite the lack of evidence, Smith makes a strong case against the use of psalmody in the synagogue prior to the destruction of the Temple. He argues that there is no evidence to suggest that psalmody was a distinct entity apart from scripture reading and that first-century Jewish sources indicate that synagogue services were composed strictly of prayer, scripture-reading, and homily.\textsuperscript{175} Additionally, there are no references to the use of instruments in rabbinic literature; therefore no definitive conclusions can be drawn on the subject of musical instruments in the early synagogue.

\textit{Music at non-Cultic Jewish Ceremonies}

There is little mention in Jewish literary sources of musical ritual that was associated with weddings. Several passages in Jeremiah\textsuperscript{176} make reference to singing by the bride and groom at their wedding but beyond that there are relatively few examples that provide any information about music and the Jewish wedding. Funerals, on the other hand, fall under the category of lamentation and Smith contends that the ancient Israelites expressed their sorrow and grief through a variety of mechanism. The ones that pertain directly to a discussion on music, however, include uttering dirges, wailing, and making lamentations.\textsuperscript{177} The Mishnah contains the most comprehensive description of Jewish death and mourning rituals. After the death of a family member, it is the responsibility of the closest adult male relative to take on the funeral

\textsuperscript{175} Smith, “The Ancient Synagogue, the Early Church and Singing”, 7. In fact, according to Smith, there is no evidence for psalmody in the synagogue until the late second century.  
\textsuperscript{176} See Jeremiah 7:34, 16:9, 25:10.  
\textsuperscript{177} Smith, \textit{Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity}, 125.
planning and financial obligation. Once the family was made aware of the death, they had to
prepare the body for burial, which included ritual washing, the anointing of the body with oil,
and wrapping the body in linen. During this process, other mourners in the family would express
their sorrow through weeping and tearing their clothes. In addition, the family hired professional
musicians (generally pipers) and female mourners and these groups were responsible for playing
dirges on their instruments and wailing. After the body was prepared, the family would carry the
bier in a processional toward the place of burial and during the procession, the professional
mourners would follow along while wailing and clapping. The musicians accompanied the
procession, playing their pipes as they walked. Once the burial process was complete, the
family would gather at their home for a meal but no lamentations or instrumental accompaniment
would take place in the home. Though this clearly differs from the Greco-Roman funeral
described above, there are some similarities between the two and music is an essential element in
both cases.

Conclusion

The socio-religious traditions of the Greco-Roms and the ancient Israelites are certainly quite
different but there are some notable commonalities that can be seen pertaining to musical
practice. The socio-religious groups of Mediterranean antiquity lived in fluid and dynamic
cultural systems and musical practice (both in abstract philosophical understandings and actual
practices) were absorbed, adopted, and adapted by each group. This overview of music in

178 See Smith, *Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*, 137 for a complete synopsis. The following
sections of the Mishnah provide literary evidence of Jewish mourning ritual: m. Pesahim 8:6, m. Ta’anith 4:7, m.
179 See m. Mo’ed Qatan 3:9, which states that after a corpse has been buried, mourners may not sing lamentations or
clap their hands. See Danby, *The Mishnah*, 211.
antiquity also demonstrates the ubiquitous nature of song, melody, and instrumental performance. Therefore, it is not surprising to see permeation and cultural exchange with respect to musical practice. This is the musical environment out of which early Christianity emerged and the musical practices initiated and adopted by those assemblies were influenced and affected by music in Jewish and Greco-Roman contexts and must be understood within this historical framework. Music was a pervasive ritualized practice in the Greco-Roman world and while this chapter is mainly descriptive in nature, it sets the foundational layer upon which chapters four and five build in terms of describing, explaining, and analyzing musical practice and its significance within the context of early Christianity. Prior to this analysis, however, I turn now to an exploration of music and cognition in order to demonstrate that the significance of music as a religious ritual goes far beyond a ubiquitous historical phenomenon.
Chapter 3: Understanding the Significance of Musical Ritual Through Cognitive Science

Introduction

In the past two decades there has been a paradigm shift in the way that scholars in social sciences and the humanities have approached their various disciplines. Advancements in our understanding of human cognition and brain function have added an entirely new analytical dimension to many areas of inquiry and broadened our understanding of human thought and behaviour. This study seeks to incorporate some key findings in the field of cognitive science in order to provide empirical evidence that supports my main assertion that music in early Christian communities was a vital component in creating and sustaining a group identity and that musical ritual was integral to the recruitment efforts of early Christians.

Many convincing arguments about the value of cognitive science for the humanities and social sciences have been offered. Ron Sun, for example, contends that there are both theoretical and practical rationales for the use of cognitive science in these disciplines. He argues, “Any social process occurs through the actions and therefore the minds of the individuals involved”. He likens the use of cognitive science in the humanities to the necessary grounding that physics provides for chemistry. Social, political, and religious forces “act both upon individual minds and through individual minds” and this perception and cognitive processing is “the basis of social processes and phenomena”. In other words, socio-cultural experience and cognitive processing cannot be divorced from one another. This assertion further implies that social forces and human cognition are mutually dependent and influential. Our cognitive processing is

---


181 Sun, “Prolegomena to Cognitive Social Sciences”, 5.
dependent on our perception of our environment and this in turn influences how we respond to and behave in that environment. Therefore, cognitive science and its relation to social and cultural process can provide a better understanding of human thought and behaviour.

To put it another way, the benefit of cognitive science may be found in Edward Slingerland's work which calls for a more integrated approach to science and the humanities. The separation of mind and body in any cultural study is no longer tenable and Slingerland’s model maintains that the humanities must go beyond this dualism and employ an integrated and embodied approach. In fact, he argues that this type of integration is happening within a variety of disciplines including the philosophy of consciousness, neuroscience, linguistics, and psychology, which are all concerned with “the empirical investigation of the human mind”¹⁸² He outlines two extreme interpretations that prevail among scholars: first, those that study the physical sciences often take the position that the body is simply a passive actor and the brain a machine for “abstract symbol manipulation”. Second, scholars in the humanities often view the body as “an inert tabula rasa to be “inscribed” by culture or a passive victim of power structures created by disembodied discourses”.¹⁸³ As Slingerland points out, neither argument is particularly convincing in light of recent studies on behavioural neuroscience, perception, psychology, and cognition.¹⁸⁴ We will return to Slingerland’s model of vertical integration shortly but his work provides a cogent rationale for the use of scientific and empirical evidence in the humanities.

More significantly, cognitive science is relevant to this study on music because recent research has indicated there is a strong link between musical participation and specific

¹⁸³ Slingerland, What Science Offers, 11-12.
¹⁸⁴ Slingerland, What Science Offers, 12.
neurochemical reactions in the brain, which influence particular cognitive domains. This expands our understanding of the universal appeal of music by demonstrating how music is grounded in the materiality of our embedded experience. The significant cognitive domains include areas of the brain that process rewards/motivation, pleasure, emotion/arousal, and perceptions of group identity. These are all integral elements that pertain to the significance of music as an identity marker and this idea will be expanded in order to illustrate a more well-rounded understanding of identity within the context of early Christianity. I also argue that in addition to these components, music (and perhaps more specifically singing) played a vital role in the recruitment practices of early Christians (and possibly other social groups) in antiquity. This chapter will investigate the neurological and cognitive effects of musical participation and explain how this evidence supports the claim that music was an important component to the success of Christianity as a social movement and that it provided a medium through which congregations and church authorities attempted to recruit new members.

In order to further support the use of cognitive science as I have described above, I will provide a brief overview of the cognitive science of religion, which demonstrates how cognitive science has advanced the study of religion more generally. This field of inquiry "draws upon the cognitive sciences to explain how pan-cultural features of human minds, interacting with their natural and social environments, inform and constrain religious thought and action".\textsuperscript{185} Justin Barrett argues that the cognitive science of religion (CSR) offers three attractive features for any scholar that wishes to account for religious phenomena. First, CSR scholars describe certain behavioural patterns and belief systems without asserting a conclusive definition or explanation for religion as a whole. As Barrett argues, the focus is on “identifying human thoughts and

practices that are generally considered religious and then trying to explain why those are cross-culturally recurrent.\textsuperscript{186} Second, cognitive science provides a unique lens through which to address and explain religious behaviours; specifically, the cognitive aspect of a religious behaviour. This type of approach delivers a key point of access to human experience that compliments other approaches including sociological and anthropological. Third, this approach employs a pluralistic methodology that crosses various disciplinary boundaries by incorporating data and evidence from interviews, archeological remains, computer modeling, and historical records, among others.\textsuperscript{187}

Pascal Boyer has been another influential scholar in the field of CSR. He has laid the foundational work for other scholars that have focused on evolutionary psychology using neurobiological evidence to argue for the origins and propagation of religious traditions.\textsuperscript{188} Boyer systematically dismantles some of the most commonly accepted explanations for religion using cognitive theory. For example, it has previously been argued that religion was created as an explanation for things like the origin of the universe, the nature of evil, and the reason for human suffering. Boyer points out that anthropologists have demonstrated that explaining these types of things is not of equal importance in all cultural contexts and that the explanations provided by religious traditions are not like other ordinary explanations that human beings use to rationalize other phenomena.\textsuperscript{189} Additionally, Boyer has argued that the mind is not simply a machine that seeks to explain everything; instead, it is comprised of many “specialized

\textsuperscript{188} For example, see Justin L. Barrett, Why Would Anyone Believe in God? (Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press, 2004). Barrett offers that religious belief is a biological consequence of the human mind. He argues that cognitive processes in human consciousness result in certain assumptions such as the belief in an omnipotent and all-knowing deity. Also, see Scott Atran, In Gods We Trust: The Evolutionary Landscape of Religion (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
explanatory devices, more properly called inference systems, each of which is adapted to
particular kinds of events and automatically suggests explanations for these events”. 190 He also
provides cogent arguments against purely emotive or social explanations for religion. Boyer
claims that there is in fact no “magic bullet” for identifying a single point of origin for religion.
His work develops the idea that religion is part of social transmission and evolutionary
adaptations.191 He rejects traditional approaches that have attempted to explain why religion
exists and reframes the entire question in cognitive terms and he emphasizes the complex nature
of our cognitive systems. Boyer also contends that religious concepts depend on certain natural
cognitive capacities even though these concepts develop culturally in many different ways.

Some scholars have argued that religion is a universal feature of human existence and this
is a core tenet of CSR. In addition, one of the major questions associated with religion as a
universal relates to the debate on whether or not religion can be viewed as an evolutionary
adaptation. Those who ascribe to this theory of “adaptionism” generally explain religion as an
evolutionary feature that is derived from “the cooperative effects of religious commitments”. 192
In his study on the evolutionary nature of religion, Joseph Bulbulia argues that there is a
significant correlation between the level of religious commitment and the level of cooperative
solidarity within a social group. He contends that religious characteristics act as both motivators
and signals of cooperative functionality. Bulbulia frames religion as something that comprises
various beliefs and behaviours, which serve to create and maintain group boundaries and this is
the basis for his case on the evolutionary nature of religion more generally. Unlike other
cognitive scientists, such as Barrett for example, Bulbulia's framing presents religion as some

190 Boyer, Religion Explained, 17.
191 Boyer, Religion Explained, 50.
type of whole that is the sum of many parts. Barrett tends to avoid that type of characterization because it does not fit with his assessment of cognitive science as a piecemeal theoretical approach to religion and this is just one of the ways in which cognitive scientists tend to understand religion in different terms. Both are valid approaches to the cognitive science of religion but they differ in terms of their understanding and categorization of what constitutes religion and how we can use cognitive science to help further that understanding.¹⁹³

Foundational Challenges of Accessing Experience

Before I address the cognitive effects of musical participation, it is necessary to consider several potential issues pertaining to the use of cognitive theories more generally. First, it is often claimed that experience, feeling, and emotion are not distinctly measurable or critically accessible categories. In other words, some scholars are quite skeptical of any approach that claims to explain experience through the use of empirical data. However, it is important to note that empirical evidence such as brain wave activity and neurochemical transmissions, which are measured by various technologies including functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) and positron emission tomography (PET), is not a mechanism for measuring experience as such. Colleen Shantz, who has written on the subject of early Christianity and altered states of consciousness, argues that neuroscience provides an alternative lens, which brings certain elements - including religious practice and embodied cognition - into our realm of understanding that are otherwise unavailable. She contends, “Medical science is of manifest relevance to

¹⁹³ For an excellent overview on various theoretical frameworks pertaining to the evolutionary nature of religion, see chapter 3 on Evolution in Wesley J. Wildman, Science and Religious Anthropology: A Spiritually Evocative Naturalist Interpretation of Human Life (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009). Wildman defines many key terms in this chapter and outlines various theories (religion as an adaptation, spandrel, exaptation, or functional by-product) and limitations with those theories. He concludes that understanding religion in evolutionary terms is most effective or plausible if we consider religion (in light of the complex relationship between genetics, cognition, and environment) as a "combination of side-effects of both adapted and non-adapted features" (56).
understanding human bodily experience and neuroscience is the only direct means to describe
brain functioning during normal and altered states”. Moreover, neurochemical data allow
scholars to access human experience in a unique way insofar as this type of data does not rely on
subjective reports alone. This approach helps to further our understanding of human cognition
and behavioural processes by expanding our knowledge regarding the general effects of singing
(and these effects on early Christian communities in particular) without having to access the each
individual's perception or comprehension of a specific hymn. This is precisely the type of
integration for which Slingerland argues. His vertical integration schema calls for an embodied
approach to the study of human culture. Structures of meaning need to be grounded in what he
defines as lower levels of meaning, such as biology, so that we not only interpret the products of
culture but we also explain how evolved human capacities favour some constructs over others.
This approach is not equivalent to scientific or empirical reductionism; rather it offers an
integrative, multilevel explanation of human behaviour. Slingerland contends that the human
mind must be understood as part of the human body.

If we accept Slingerland’s position as a step forward in the study of religion, how do we
translate this framework into the experimental realm? In other words, how do empirical forms of
testing such as neuroimaging, contribute to an understanding of religion or religious experience?
Imaging technologies detect the physiological process of energy consumption by the brain when
it is functioning and various forms of neuroimaging work in different ways to translate that
information into readable data. Scan technologies detect changes in blood flow, oxygenation, and
the movement of radioactive tracers in order to highlight specific brain structures that are

---

functioning at specific times. For example, neuroscientist Nina Azari has conducted several interesting experiments in order to understand the role of cognition in religious experience as well as the connection between religious experience and emotion. Participants underwent brain scans while they read three different texts – a religious or sacred text, a text that evoke a happy feeling, and a neutral text. These categories were determined by using a standardized questionnaire called the Positive Affect Negative Affect scale where participants answered questions indicating the type of emotional feeling elicited by reading and reciting each text. The religious text used was the first verse of Psalm 23; The happy text was a children's nursery rhyme; and the neutral text consisted of instructions on how to use a phone card. Azari found that a certain section of the dorso-lateral prefrontal cortex was activated during the reading of the religious text but not during the other two. From this result, she concluded that emotion and religious feeling, while they certainly share many neural pathways, are differentiated by one specific neural pathway, thought to be involved in reasoning, judgment and belief, which are all involved in processing emotional responses.

There are certain methodological considerations to highlight with this type of study, which Azari fully anticipates and systematically describes. First, “religious experience” is characterized by a short event, which is perhaps not reflective of a lifetime of religious experience. Second, these types of studies assume that if the participant claims to have had a religious experience, then that is in fact the case. In other words, the researchers accept that the patient is accurately or truthfully reporting their experience as they understand it. Third, Azari notes that this study assumes that a religious experience is a reportable phenomenon, which is available to the participant at a particular time in a particular place, perhaps outside of a normative ritual context. These limitations are a concern for all neuroimaging studies that
attempt to document and record religious experience. But Azari makes an extremely important
distinction in terms of potential conclusions. She argues that her study documents correlation,
not causation. She does not claim that a so-called neurological “God spot” exists in the brain;
rather Azari is interested in explaining human behaviour, not debating the existence of a deity.\textsuperscript{196}
For example, a claim of religious experience neither confirms nor refutes a specific theological
worldview. Instead, a claim of religious experience during a scan correlates certain brain activity
with that experience, which tells the researcher something about how the brain functions. Azari's
study and her acknowledgment of certain limitations provide an important starting point for my
own discussion on music, religion, and cognition. Like Azari, I focus on the correlative nature of
the relationship between music, cognition, identity, and religious recruitment. This complex
relationship includes other important components such as the role of emotion and cooperation.
The neuroscientific data allows access to experience in a way that is not possible with other
methodologies and it provides a complimentary framework to the other anthropological and
sociological models that I employ.

Second, how does this approach apply to historical studies? How do current neurological
data help us understand the actions and behaviours of people that lived over two thousand years
ago? Quite simply, evolutionary changes and adaptations take hundreds of thousands of years to
manifest themselves in any species. This suggests that the human brain is probably very nearly
identical to a human brain from two thousand years ago.\textsuperscript{197} Two millennia is a relatively short
time span on the evolutionary continuum and this makes contemporary studies of neurological
function relevant in my examination of early Christians and their religious and musical practices.

\textsuperscript{196} Nina Azari, “Neuroimaging Studies of Religious Experience,” in \textit{Where God and Science Meet Volume 2}, ed. by
\textsuperscript{197} Shantz, \textit{Paul in Ecstasy}, 74-79.
Vertical Integration as a Response to the Problem of Reductionism

One of the most common critiques to the incorporation of the physical sciences into the humanities is that it can be reductionist. Richard Dawkins, for example, has argued that cultural transmission is analogous to genetic inheritance; he claims that cultural memes are much like genetic material. Boyer counters that this framework is a clear oversimplification that does not account for the internal recombination, mutation, and selection that happens within the body as genetic material reproduces itself. In other words, there is significant distortion in cultural transmission, which cannot necessarily be explained by Dawkins’ meme theory.

As I noted earlier, the model of vertical integration outlined by Edward Slingerland provides a cogent counter-argument to the charge of reductionism. Slingerland argues that "any truly interesting explanation of a given phenomenon is interesting precisely because it involves reduction of some sort - tracing causation from higher to lower levels or uncovering hidden correlations". In other words, reductionism is an inherent aspect of any higher level explanation for a phenomenon, which is not an inherently negative approach to the study or explanation of any phenomenon. Any attempt to address the "why" requires a certain kind of reductionism, which according to Slingerland is reductive in a "good way when we seek to understand how these lower-level processes allow the higher-level processes to take place".

Similarly, Ilkka Pyysiäinen notes that the term reduction often implies elimination insofar as

---

201 Slingerland, "Who's Afraid of Reductionism?" 384.
202 Slingerland, "Who's Afraid of Reductionism?" 387.
religion is understood as a distinct entity and sociological and psychological explanations eliminate it as such. However, he claims that this is not the case. Using empirical evidence to understand thought and behaviour is an example of "searching for lower-level mechanisms to account for upper-level patterns"\textsuperscript{203}, which Pyysiäinen argues is an appropriate endeavour as long as we distinguish between those levels of meaning and outline how we understand their relationship. He further argues that "Lower-level mechanisms are part of the constitution of religious experiences, although there is no direct causal relationship between them and sociocultural phenomena".\textsuperscript{204} Such lower-level processes include the molecular structures and neurochemical processing involved in memory. These processes do not cause experience but rather these processes are constitutive of it.

Additionally, Armin Geertz surveys the various ways in which neuroscience depends on empirical evidence and argues that these types of tests have been designed in a way that they can be effectively applied in a cross-cultural context. Geertz argues strongly for the integration of cognitive sciences in religion (and other disciplines) for two main reasons: "Even hardcore neuroscientists are realizing that cognition is a somatic and social phenomenon as well as a neural one, however most scholars of religion currently using cognitive approaches either deny or underplay the importance of culture in cognition, and, subsequently, in the cognitive study of religion".\textsuperscript{205} Geertz supports the notion that cognition is both a biological and social phenomenon and frames his position in such a way that it effectively mitigates the charge of reductionism.

Theories of cognitive science and religion have expanded our understanding of cultural


\textsuperscript{204} Pyysiäinen, "Religion: From Mind to Society and Back", 241.

transmission and human behaviour and provided a different perspective on such matters. Therefore, cognitive science certainly has something to offer traditional approaches to the study of religion for reasons that Slingerland describes. I argue that this usefulness extends to a more specific domain: religion and musical participation. Thus, the utility of neuroimaging also applies to the realm of music and cognition and cognitive science provides an entirely novel way of understanding the relationship between music and religion, a relationship that has not been sufficiently studied or analyzed among scholars of religion in the academy. In fact, studies that document music and cognition provide more reliable empirical data because researchers can objectively state that a subject is involved in the production or consumption of music.

With these clarifications in mind, this chapter will investigate the cognitive connections between the socio-cultural phenomena of music, emotional response, and ritual behaviour in order to further the argument that singing played a key role in constructing a religious identity while at the same time functioning in a rhetorical mode, which aided in the recruitment of new members to early Christian assemblies.

**Music & Cognition**

Before we turn to specific cognitive models to explain how music functions as an identity marker and a mode of recruitment, it is necessary to briefly examine how the brain processes music and why this is important for understanding the sociocultural responses to this sensory stimulus. The significance of music in group formation lies, at least in part, in its ability to evoke an emotional response in an individual. Popular music producer and neuroscientist Daniel Levitin published a book called *This Is Your Brain on Music: The Science of a Human Obsession*, which attempted to describe in simple terms the neurological effects of musical participation to a general
audience. The book garnered attention from many different sources and it made a significant contribution to the field of music and neuroscience. Levitin presents both anecdotal narratives and scientific data to explain how/why we have musical preferences, how musical expertise is achieved, and how our brains process, classify, and memorize music. The study of music and cognition has continued to grow and neurological experimentation into the relationship between music and brain function has uncovered a variety of important conclusions.

Neurological responses to music are complex in nature and affect many different regions of the brain. These mechanisms are related to other functions including emotional response, motivation/reward systems, memory, motor-skills, auditory and visual pathways, and linguistic processing centers. Some of these anatomical regions and processing centers are more recent evolutionary adaptations (for example, in the prefrontal cortex), while some are much older (such as the brain stem). David Huron, a neuroscientist who examines evolutionary features of the brain, argues that there are several potential domains where music could be viewed as an evolutionary asset. These domains include: mate selection, social cohesion, group effort, perceptual and motor skill development and trans-generational communication. He claims that music plays a significant role in developing common identity with other people and reinforces a common purpose or goal with those people. Based on experiments involving brain scan technology, Huron found that when his test subjects listened to music, oxytocin was released, which is an important neurotransmitter associated with a sense of social bonding and feelings of a shared identity. Huron also observed a distinct correlation between music and emotion insofar as music has the ability to increase arousal mechanisms, heighten an emotional response or act in
a completely opposing way that reduces tension and pacifies the individual.\textsuperscript{206} Thus, music has the ability to change, shape, and evoke emotional responses, a topic to which we will return.

\textit{Musical Processing}

The human brain is perhaps the most complex physical structure in the body as it interfaces with nearly all bodily functions through an intricate transmission system consisting of billions of nerve cells that communicate with various parts of the body through the transfer of chemicals called neurotransmitters. However, despite the complexity of the communication system throughout the body, much of the neurological messaging takes place within the brain itself. The inner ear, or cochlea receives incoming auditory stimuli, translating it to electro-chemical form. This sends a signal down the nervous system to the auditory cortex in the brain.\textsuperscript{207} There are various “sonic properties” that are processed in the brain that formulate our so-called auditory experience and these include pitch, loudness, duration, and timbre.\textsuperscript{208} All of these auditory elements are integral in eliciting an emotional response from the listener or participant, particularly pitch and loudness.

Other elements also play an important role in our perception and neural processing of music, especially rhythm, tempo, and contour. Tempo is simply the speed at which a melody is played or sung and as we will see tempo can also have a great impact on our emotional response to a piece of music. Rhythm is the way in which pitches are grouped together and much like tempo, the rhythm of a melody affects our feelings about that melody. The contour of a melody


describes the “overall shape of a melody, taking into account only the pattern of up and down”.\textsuperscript{209} Melody is the main theme in a piece of music that combines pitch, timbre, and contour. The melody or tune is the most important element in establishing long-term memory of a song because the lyrics and melody are inherently linked in our system of neurological processing.

Returning to the physiological pathways of auditory processing, sound moves through the inner ear and neurons pass signals along the pathway from the ear to the auditory cortex in the brain. The neural pathways are different from visual processing insofar as there are both ipsilateral (same side) and bilateral (opposite side) connections from the cochlea to the brain.\textsuperscript{210} In other words, visual stimuli that trigger a neural response in the right eye are processed by the left side of the brain and vice versa; whereas in the case of auditory processing, both brain hemispheres have neural connections to both ears. Traditionally, scientists have thought that the right hemisphere is dominant in musical processing. For example, Mark Jude Tramo notes the crucial role that the right auditory cortex plays in "perceiving pitch and some aspects of melody, harmony, timbre, and rhythm".\textsuperscript{211}

There are several other key areas of the brain that are active during musical processing besides the auditory cortex, which is located on the upper area of each side of the temporal lobes. The frontal lobes are associated with motor skills and spatial awareness, which is employed when an individual dances, claps, or taps their feet in response to auditory stimuli. The temporal

\textsuperscript{209} Daniel Levitin, \textit{This is Your Brain on Music}, 16.
\textsuperscript{210} Tan, et al. \textit{Psychology of Music}, 49.
\textsuperscript{211} Mark Jude Tramo, "Music of the Hemispheres," \textit{Science} 291 (2001): 55. See Tramo and Jamshed Bharucha, "Musical Priming in the Right Hemisphere Post-Callosotomy," \textit{Neurophysiologia} 29 (1991): 313-325 for experimental data supporting this conclusion. Additionally, Kentaro Ono and his colleagues have conducted experiments that support Tramo and Bharucha's conclusions but also demonstrate that there is less hemispheric lateralization in professional musicians, who show a more equal distribution in the activation of the right and left components of the auditory cortex while listening to music. See Kentaro Ono, \textit{et al.} "The effect of musical experience on hemispheric lateralization in musical feature processing," \textit{Neuroscience Letters} 496 (2011): 141-145.
lobe, besides housing the auditory cortex, is also involved in memory formation and long-term storage, which is significant in melodic recognition. Various structures housed in the temporal lobe, including the amygdala and the cerebellum, are involved in emotional processing, which is connected to the auditory processing of melody.\textsuperscript{212} The cerebellum is part of the brain stem and likely an older evolutionary feature of the brain. It is also important in processing rhythm and coordinating movement. It should also be noted that the language areas of the brain, including Broca’s area and Wernicke’s area, are also integral in singing. Therefore, musical perception employs nearly all areas of neural circuitry in the brain and requires a very complex processing system.

Isabelle Peretz has done extensive work with patients who have suffered some type of damage to their brain through stroke or injury. She has examined patients with amusia (the loss of musical ability), which has provided information as to how the brain processes musical elements such as melody recognition. One of her patients, who had previously enjoyed various genres of music and attended concerts regularly, had suffered two aneurysms a year apart. One aneurysm occurred on the right side of the brain while the following event occurred on the left side. After the trauma suffered by the left side, he was diagnosed with Wernicke’s aphasia (loss of language comprehension) and amusia. However, he eventually regained his speech abilities but the amusia persisted and the patient was completely unable to recognize melodic excerpts from songs with which he was quite familiar (such as the national anthem).\textsuperscript{213} The patient also had trouble identifying whether or not a melody that had been altered by one tone was different or the same. He also claimed that he did not enjoy music anymore and Peretz concluded that the patient had lost his ability to access tonal knowledge, which is a fundamental element in “making

\textsuperscript{212} Levitin, \textit{This is Your Brain}, 84-86 and Tan, et al. \textit{Psychology of Music}, 57-58.
sense” of melody.\textsuperscript{214} Other studies have shown that even infants can distinguish between two melodies that differ only by one tone if it changes the melodic contour or shape.\textsuperscript{215} Robert Jourdain notes that melodic contour is closely related to the prosody of spoken language, which is one of the neurological features connecting music and language.\textsuperscript{216} Melodic contour is also closely related to our next point of inquiry, which is the relationship between music, pleasure, motivation, and reward.

\textit{Neurological Rewards of Musical Participation}

It has been well documented that musical participation, whether actively performing or passively listening, has the ability to generate positive or negative emotional responses. The connection between music and emotion will be discussed in the following section but before we look at the role of emotion, it is necessary to examine certain elements of the autonomic nervous system in order to understand why music makes us feel a certain way and how that contributes to our engagement in musical participation. In other words, what other neurological processing mechanisms are activated in the brain when we participate in musical activities? Daniel Levitin and Mona Lisa Chandra assert that there are psychological and physiological benefits to musical participation and they evaluate the claim that music can improve health and well-being through “the engagement of neurochemical systems for (i) reward, motivation, and pleasure; (ii) stress and arousal; (iii) immunity: and (iv) social affiliation”.\textsuperscript{217} I will return to the matter of social affiliation in a subsequent section but the "reward, motivation, and pleasure" that is derived from

\textsuperscript{214} Tan, et al. \textit{Psychology of Music}, 73.
\textsuperscript{216} Jourdain, \textit{Music, the Brain, and Ecstasy}, 256.
music is where we shall now direct our attention.

Evolutionary theory holds that all living organisms engage in behaviours that are associated with survival and reward. Levitin and Chandra argue that neurological processing involves a complex combination of anatomical structures that are responsible for “motivational states, prediction, goal-directed behaviour, reinforcement learning, and hedonic states”\(^\text{218}\). There are different emotional responses before and after a reward is obtained. Two important neurotransmitters are involved in motivation-oriented behaviours. First, the neurotransmitter dopamine is released during behaviours that are classified as reward-seeking. Second, opioids are released once the reward has been obtained. Both of these neurochemicals are associated with pleasure and studies have demonstrated that pleasurable musical participation elicits such a neurological response. Music can induce intense feelings of euphoria or “chills” and they argue, “Musical pleasure is closely related to the intensity of emotional arousal”\(^\text{219}\). Empirical evidence shows that music affects the same neurochemical systems in the brain that other reward stimuli do and studies have demonstrated that while participants listen to pleasurable music, the brain releases dopamine, which is measured using Positron Emission Tomography (PET). Scientists found that there was a significant increase in neural activity in the structures that comprise the mesocortical limbic system when listening to music deemed to be pleasurable. Robert Zatorre and Anne Blood conducted several experiments that had similar results. When subjects in their experiment listened to rousing music, results indicated that music is linked with “biologically relevant, survival-related stimuli via their common recruitment of brain circuitry involved in

pleasure and reward”\textsuperscript{220}, which suggests that musical stimuli utilize a variety of mechanisms that evolved for other purposes. For music that elicits a positive and euphoric response in subjects “the activation of the reward system by music may maximize pleasure, not only by activating the reward system but also simultaneously decreasing activity in brain structures associated with negative emotions”\textsuperscript{221}. Subjects were required to listen to “control” music that did not result in such a response in order to measure the differences in blood flow to various regions of the brain.\textsuperscript{222}

Other studies, which used fMRI technology to analyze musical pleasure, found that areas of the brain associated with autonomic function and emotion were activated when participants listened to pleasurable music. For example, Levitin and Chandra conclude, “Musical reward is dependent on dopaminergic neurotransmission within a similar neural network as other reinforcing stimuli”\textsuperscript{223}. This was confirmed by repeating the experiment with musical stimuli that was dissonant and not considered to be pleasurable by participants. Also, this chill-inducing feeling would generally be classified under the rubric of "positive" emotion but it important to note that "negative" emotions or responses to music can have a similar effect.\textsuperscript{224} Thus, these

\textsuperscript{221} Zatorre and Blood, “Intensely Pleasurable Responses”, 11823.
\textsuperscript{222} All music for this experiment was self-selected by participants because Zatorre and Blood argue that because musical preference is subjective and differs from one person to the next they allowed each participant to select their own emotion-inducing musical passage (from the genre of classical music). Examples included Rachmaninoff’s Piano Concerto in D minor and Barber’s Adagio for Strings and subjects claimed that the emotional response to their selection was based on the music itself and not any particular memory associated with that composition. Each participant chose a different piece of music as their emotion-inducing composition and "each subject's selected music was used as another subject's emotionally "neutral" control" and after listening to the control music each participant had to rate the emotional intensity of their response. In order to qualify as a neutral piece, the rating had to be equal to or lesser than 3 on a scale of 1-10 where 10 was the most intense response. For a complete description of the methodology, see Zatorre and Blood, "Intensely Pleasurable Responses", 11819.
\textsuperscript{223} Levitin and Chandra, “The Neurochemistry of Music”, 181.
\textsuperscript{224} Interestingly, music that induces negative emotions can also be rewarding or pleasurable. Musical participation can result in feelings of despair, anger, grief, or melancholy. While this may appear to be a matter of personal taste
findings are also relevant in terms of describing a relationship between music and feelings of ecstasy.

The terms reward, motivation, and pleasure have been used as descriptive features of neurological events that occur within the human brain during musical participation. Indeed, the subject of pleasure is one that concerned early church authorities to a great extent. Many of them associated Greco-Roman religious rituals, meals, and musical engagements with hedonism and excess, which was viewed as a directly oppositional force to the ordered and solemn disposition of an ideal Christ-follower. Of course there are many references to joy, rejoicing, and enjoyment in worship but this is articulated in a very different way than “pleasure”. This was an important distinction because worshippers were not supposed to take any personal pleasure or enjoyment in their singing – at least in the same way they constructed or understood Greek pleasure, which was associated with drinking, sex, and certain types of musical engagement. While it may be a purely polemic distinction, this concept of pleasure was also associated with other behaviours beyond singing, as I outlined in chapter two, but several early Christian authorities felt that the relationship between song and personal pleasure warranted discussion.

There are two brief examples that are worthy of mention on the topic of singing and pleasure, which provide differing viewpoints on the matter. The first comes from Athanasius, the 4th century bishop of Alexandria, who commented on the nature of melody and pleasure in his letter to Marcellinus. He writes, “Why are words of this type sung with melody and song? It is necessary that we not disregard this either. Some of the pure ones among us, indeed believing or aesthetic appeal, Jerrold Levinson argues that negative feelings in response to music can be considered empathetic in nature. This is significant because he claims that sadness one feels while listening or performing a piece of music, for example, is not directed at the music or at a real-life situation but rather toward a featureless object contained within one’s imagination. He argues that this type of feeling can actually result in catharsis, which is rewarding and pleasurable. See Jerrold Levinson, “Music and Negative Emotion,” *Music and Meaning*, ed. Jenefer Robinson (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997), 215-241.
that which is said to be inspired by God, still think that the psalms are sung melodiously because of good sound and enjoyment. This is not the case”.

Athanasius placed a certain primacy on the words contained within the psalms as opposed to the melodic accompaniment. This injunction not to take pleasure from the melodious sounds of the psalms seeks to further dissociate any Greco-Roman or Jewish connection to Christian musical practices. The musical element of psalmody is essentially justified through metaphor. Athanasius, like Ignatius, clearly has a metaphysical agenda when he uses music as an abstract allegorical tool to talk about harmony among Christians. However, this has socio-cultural implications for elements of social unity and societal cohesion.

The second example comes from Niceta, the 4th century bishop of Remesiana. Contrary to Athanasius’ position on pleasure and singing, Niceta argues,

For since human nature rejects and avoids what is difficult, even if beneficial, and accepts virtually nothing unless it seems to offer pleasure, through David the Lord prepares for men this potion which is sweet by reason of its melody (cantionem) and effective in the cure of disease by reason of its strength. For a psalm is sweet to the ear when sung, it penetrates the soul when it gives pleasure, it is easily remembered when sung often, and what the harshness of the Law cannot force from the minds of man it excludes by the suavity of the song. For whatever the Law, the Prophets and even the Gospels teach is contained as a remedy in the sweetness of these songs.

The justification for melody here is that human nature is inherently hedonistic to a certain extent

---

225 Athanasius, Epistula ad Marcellinum de interpretation psalmorum 27, PG XXVII, 37-38. “Διὰ τι δὲ μετὰ μέλους καὶ ἡδός ψάλλεται οἱ τουθεὶς λόγοι, ἀνεγκαίον μὴ δὲ τοῦτο παρελβεῖν. Τι νές μὲν γὰρ τὸν παρ’ ἢμῖν ἀκεραίον καίτοι πιστεύοντο εἶναι θεόπνευστοι τὰ ρήματα, δόμος νομίζοντα διὰ τὸ εὐφωνον καὶ τέρψεος ἐνεκεν τῆς ἄχοης μελοδεσθεῖσθαι τούς ψαλμοὺς. Οὐκ ἔστι δὲ αὕτως.”

and singing psalms is an appropriate activity for human beings to enjoy because its origin comes from David. It appears, however, that this is a different type of pleasure – a pleasure that is congruent with spiritual experience. Worshippers ought to feel pleasure when they sing because of the doctrinal content of the psalms. In other words, Niceta views melody and lyric as inherently linked, which makes the enjoyment of singing psalms a positive and moral practice. The main point here, however, is that many church fathers recognized that human beings derived pleasure from certain melodies, and some viewed this as a dangerous by-product of communal worship while others considered it a positive and desirable response that was theologically rooted in the Hebrew Bible. Both sets recognize it as powerful. Neuroscience has demonstrated a neurochemical response to melody in the brain, which is associated with pleasure and intriguingly, Christian and Greco-Roman philosophic and religious discourse had already articulated this connection from another perspective. The empirical data presented above provides a different explanatory lens, which further substantiates the ancient connection between melody and pleasure.

The significance of neurological reward and feelings of pleasure are also a key component in my assertion that communal singing is an effective mode of religious recruitment. Positive neurological response to music (even "sad" music), particularly in a group performance, can serve to reinforce a positive feeling within an individual. Much work has been done in the preceding two decades on the nature of what scientists have termed "emotional contagion". Elaine Hatfield and her colleagues define emotional contagion as something that is "best conceptualized as a multiply determined family of psychophysiological, behavioural, and social phenomena ... where the precipitating stimuli arise from one or more other individuals, and yield
corresponding or complimentary emotions in these individuals.²²⁷ These cues can be read from vocal, facial, or postural expressions and they can be perceived and mirrored through a variety of mechanisms including conscious cognitive processes, conditioned or unconditioned emotional responses, and mimicry. There have been numerous studies on this phenomenon, often with a particular focus such as gender differences in emotional response or emotional contagion in the workplace.²²⁸ However, several studies have also focused on historical and cross-cultural examples of emotional contagion. For example, Hatfield cites several historical cases of emotional contagion with specific reference to certain types of emotion including hysteria (i.e. the Bubonic plague in the Middle Ages), fear (the French Revolution), and anger that resulted in mass violence (New York riots of 1863).²²⁹ Despite the fact that historical examples are not empirically testable in a lab, Hatfield argues that the variety of different types of evidence (including animal research, clinical evidence, social psychology, etc.) all serve to make a strong case that emotional contagion is a ubiquitous phenomenon and that people "may indeed catch the emotions of others in all times, in all societies, and, perhaps, on very large scales".²³⁰

Why is emotional contagion relevant in a discussion of early Christian music? First, emotional contagion has a significant effect on the nature of group interaction. Sigal Barsade concludes from his study on emotional contagion that "the positive emotional contagion group

²³⁰ Hatfield, et al, Emotional Contagion, 127. It should also be noted that there are certain limitations on this type of framework. For example, Dezecashe et al. argue that emotional propagation is not always replicative. In other words, the perception of emotional cues does not "automatically elicit a similar feeling" in another individual. There are many other factors to consider such as the identities of the individuals/groups involved in the situation, the nature of the interaction, and whether the people involved are part of the same or competing social groups. See Guillaume Dezecashe, Pierre Jacob, and Julie Grèzes, "Emotional Contagion: Its Scope and Limits," Trends in Cognitive Sciences 19 (2015): 297-299.
members experienced improved cooperation, decreased conflict, and increased perceived task performance." Barsade outlines various hypotheses in his article but there are two in particular that are most useful here. He asserts that mood is contagious and that positive emotional contagion will lead to greater cooperation on an individual and group level. This serves to underscore the significance of positive emotion in a group setting and is inherently linked to two points that I raise further on including the importance of synchronous ritual practice in facilitating cooperation among group members and the efficacy of music as a mechanism of recruitment.

Second, emotional contagion is an important aspect in understanding the emotional response people have to musical stimuli. The relationship between music and emotion is further explored in the section below but at this point it should be noted that emotional contagion plays a key role in conveying and perceiving emotional elements of a musical experience. Fritz and Koelsch argue that emotional contagion in humans "occurs in both the visual and auditory modality when seeing facial expressions, or hearing vocal expression." They contend that music acts as a mediator of emotional contagion and that there is an evolutionary basis for this argument, which they outline in an overview of how other mammalian species use complex vocalizations to communicate emotion that may result in desired mate selection. In humans, emotional contagion can be facilitated through instrumental and vocal performance and Fritz and Koelsch provide cross-cultural evidence to support this claim. In Western music, major keys are

---


generally indicative of a positive emotional conveyance and minor keys denote negative emotions such as sadness or anger (which is generally dependent on the tempo and rhythmic qualities of the piece). However, the nature of musical expression in the Mafa of Cameroon does not function in this same way. The authors contend that this music is not performed with emotion that can be categorized as either happy or sad. However, the participants do become emotional during ritual practice and the emotional contagion that is happening here is of a different kind; Fritz and Koelsch claim that "here the emotional involvement in an integral component of music as an authentication device that approves the genuineness of the act".234 They argue that this type of ritualistic integration of emotional contagion and musical expression is common in both Western and non-Western cultural contexts. Although this study is not clear on the nature of the Mafa music (i.e. why/how does is not convey happiness or sadness? What type of musical mode is being used here if any? Is there any general parallel to positive/negative emotions?), they do emphasize both the universal and particular aspects of emotional response to music, a topic to which we will later return.

Emotional Responses to Music

Music has the ability to evoke a particular emotional response in a person and the relationship between emotion and cognition is key to understanding the mechanisms behind our emotional responses to musical stimuli. The relationship between emotion and cognition has been widely examined in the past fifteen years and there are a variety of other factors that influence our understanding of emotion more generally. Richard Lazarus argues that emotions always present as a response to meaning and emotions cannot exist without cognitive capacity and a

motivational element. This means that goal-oriented thoughts and actions play a distinct role in human emotion. However, according to Lazarus, this does not mean that emotion cannot precede thought. In fact, he maintains that emotions that occur prior to thought are perhaps the result of memory and expectation.  

Cognitive scientists have shown that emotion and memory are directly linked through a variety of cognitive processes. However, when people experience a certain emotion, they tend to retain information that is consonant with that emotional state. For example, if a person perceives some type of sensory input (auditory, visual, etc.) while they are in a happy mood, it is likely that they will recall that event more often when they are in a happy mood. Therefore, emotion plays an important part in memory formation and memory recall.  

This becomes significant when examining the relationship between emotion and ritual practice, a topic to which we will return in a subsequent discussion on music and religion.

Based on various scientific understandings of emotion, it is clear that emotion is related to human cognition. However, it is also apparent that the social or cultural significance of emotion should not be lost in neurological studies of cognition and emotion. Kay Milton contends that emotions bind individuals to their environment and shape human interaction with their surroundings. She also points out that some cognitive theorists tend to rely heavily on empirical data and assume that the expression of emotion is innate or universal, which makes emotion immune to cultural or social variations. Therefore, according to Milton, emotion seems

---


236 There is a biological basis for this connection, which Levitin notes in This is your Brain on Music. He states, “In general, we tend to remember things that have an emotional component because our amygdala and neurotransmitters act in concert to “tag” memories as something important”, 231.
to be defined through both physical feeling (a physiological process) and cultural meaning.\textsuperscript{237} This is a more well-rounded approach in the sense that it reflects precisely what Edward Slingerland argues: empirical data ought to be read alongside an integrated or embodied approach rooted in the social sciences in order to provide a more accurate understanding of the human mind/body and its cultural environment. Emotions are such an important characteristic of the human experience and Milton argues that they need not be particularly intense or long lasting to be significant. However, she claims that, “Whether they erupt in vivid public action or remain the hidden property of those that feel them, emotions define the quality of our lives”\textsuperscript{238} Thus, she argues emotion is a vital component in both cognitive and cultural studies of human thought and behaviour.

Musical participation and emotional response are inherently linked but this relationship is complex in nature. Scholarly discourse on the topic reflects similar points of contention that were discussed in the preceding section. For example, are there certain emotional responses to music that are innate and universal? Or is emotional reaction to music culturally constructed and thus dependent on a variety of social factors and influences? Previously, philosophers who were interested in formulating a theory of aesthetics\textsuperscript{239} investigated these types of questions but this is a domain where cognitive science has added an entirely new dimension to the conversation. And the answer, if we can even use that term with any degree of confidence, likely encompasses both cognitive and social elements of human experience – much like emotion in general. However, music is a particularly interesting human practice to investigate because the emotional responses

\textsuperscript{238} Milton, “Afterward”, 215.
to music are widely varied but at the same time similar in various cultural contexts.

As we have already seen, auditory stimuli arouse a neurochemical response in the brain and these neurochemical transmissions have a variety of effects within different regions of the brain. In terms of an emotional response, Peter Kivy argues that there are two basic categories that connect music and emotion: contour and convention. Contour refers to what Kivy calls the "natural connection" between music and emotion. For example, a slow tempo seems to naturally convey a feeling of solemnity or sadness because it reflects the natural rhythm of that type of emotion. In other words, if a person is feeling sad or melancholy, they tend to move or walk at a slower pace. Conventions, on the other hand, seem to have to obvious or apparent natural link. For some contemporary Christians, a plagal cadence (moving from a IV chord to a I chord) signals the conclusion of a Western religious hymn or by extension a religious ritual more generally. William Forde Thompson problematizes this dichotomy to a certain extent when he notes that there are examples that do not neatly fit into Kivy’s categories. A minor scale expresses sadness by convention and a falling semitone naturally resembles a sigh. However, Thompson points out that one could just as easily argue that a minor mode is naturally sad because of the degree of dissonance while a sigh could be related to other falling intervals and does not seem to be exclusively attached to a semitone. As Thompson illustrates, Kivy’s concepts of contour and convention are less useful as dichotomous entities but are perhaps more helpful as “two endpoints of a continuum”. 

Recent experiments carried out by psychologist Petri Laukka and his team have demonstrated that emotional responses to music are both universal and cultural-specific. They

---

contend that "affect and emotion occupy a special place among music's expressive qualities, as evidenced by philosophical theories maintaining that an important value of music lies in its capacity to express emotions".\textsuperscript{242} The team recruited musicians from different cultural backgrounds and levels of training and played cultural-specific music for each participant. The musicians were then required to connect each melody with a specific emotion. The results of the study demonstrate that individual emotional response to music is based on both universal and culture-specific mechanisms.\textsuperscript{243} In other words, people experience universal emotional responses to certain forms of melody (such as happiness or sadness) but at the same time more specific responses can be generated at a cultural level (such as humour or longing) when the participant is already familiar with the melodic forms.\textsuperscript{244}

**Music as an Effective/Affective Ritual Practice**

The efficacy of ritual is a contentious question in religious studies and it is not my intention to offer a definitive answer as to how we can measure or define this phenomenon. However, we have correlational indications between communal musical ritual and shared emotional response and a sense of group identity. These correlations have been examined in other related contexts including the use of musical liturgy within first century Judaism. For example, Carol Newsom has integrated a discussion on Jewish cantillated prayer and hymn singing in relation to identity


\textsuperscript{244} Laukka, "Universal and Culture-Specific Factors", 443.
formation at Qumran.\textsuperscript{245} Even though much of her analysis focuses on the words or text as opposed to the significance of melody and rhythm, the importance of Newsom’s work in this area comes from the connection she draws between the aesthetic and emotional aspects of hymn performance. In her critical edition on the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice, she claims that the sequence of songs is linked to a steady building of anticipation and expectation. This format results in a particular type of religious experience and Newsom refers to this as a “sophisticated manipulation of religious emotion”.\textsuperscript{246} Interestingly, she also connects this to an increase in the frequency of ecstatic experience. While it is not clear how much (if anything) the community at Qumran or Philo’s Therapeutae had in common with early Christians in the Greco-Roman world, some of general conclusions that Newsom and others draw are quite useful in terms of understanding group identity.

In addition, Russell Arnold argues that liturgical ritual at Qumran had both social and psychological effects including social cohesion and identity formation. Regarding hymn singing at Qumran, Arnold contends that the hymns (such as the one found in 1QH 10:3-10) and the practice of collective hymn singing both illustrate that this community emphasized the practice of shared experience.\textsuperscript{247} Perhaps scholars have taken note of collective music making in this context in relation to questions of identity and social relations because of the relative isolation from other Jewish groups. However, there are two things to consider with regard to this trend in scholarly focus. First, the Jewish community at Qumran and the Therapeutae were not entirely closed off from other Jewish groups. Second, music making does not necessarily function in this way only in a semi-separate sectarian group. In other words, collective musical participation

\textsuperscript{245} See Carol Newsom, \textit{The Self as Symbolic Space: Constructing Identity and Community at Qumran} (Leiden: Brill, 2004). Newsom discusses the Hodayot in relation to identity, rhetoric, and group cohesion.  
\textsuperscript{247} Russell Arnold, \textit{The Social Role of Liturgy in Qumran} (Leiden: Brill, 2008), 210-218.
plays a role in facilitating shared experience and social cohesion in a more diverse and perhaps larger urban centre as well, despite the fact that scholars may not know exactly how certain musical pieces were performed.

The works of Arnold and Newsom demonstrate that musical ritual plays an integral part in establishing a shared identity among members of a particular community. They both acknowledge the importance of emotional response in that process. Ritual practices generally follow a clear structure or pattern and are repetitive, which contributes to an individual's sense of expectation and emotional response when performing that ritual. Despite small variations from one performance to another, there is usually a high degree of continuity and regularity. Levitin argues that ritual behaviours are “hardwired” into human cognition. Rituals form “externalized, social memory, and when marked by music, they become even more firmly instantiated in both our personal and collective memory…The music acts as a powerful retrieval cue for these memories precisely because it is associated with these and only these times and places”248 and this retrieval mechanism also brings that emotional response to the surface. Additionally, rituals help synchronize a variety of neurological functions at the same time, including affect, perceptual cognition, and motor processes.249 Bulbulia also argues, "synchronous body movements affect naturally occurring rituals, and that sacred values may combine with synchrony to modulate particularly powerful prosocial behaviours".250 This conclusion illustrates an important connection between religious beliefs and embodied ritual practice that occurs in a group setting.

Since music is an inherently embodied practice (either through singing or playing an

249 Andrew Newberg, Principles of Neurotheology (Surrey, UK: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2010), 159.
250 Bulbulia, "Spreading Order", 18.
instrument), all of these functions are initiated during musical participation. Yet, this raises the question: How is music different from other religious ritual? Levitin provides one possible explanation:

Music performs a critical, synthetic, and catalytic function. Music synthesizes disparate parts of the motor activities under a single melodic/temporal scheme. It catalyzes the actions by its alternation of tension and release: When rituals are synchronized with music specially designed for the undertaking of ritual, the music reaches an emotional peak when the activity does, and reaches a resolution and release of harmonic tension as the activity draws to a close. Music guides participants to a proper, rigid, and accurate performance of the ritual because the motor action sequences can be learned in synchrony to the music…Research has confirmed that music is a powerful way of encoding motor action sequences – specific movements that must be done in a particular way.\textsuperscript{251}

There are a number of important conclusions that Levitin makes in the preceding passage. Music has the potential to evoke a highly emotional response from participants for reasons that I have already covered. The brain’s response to music employs language centers\textsuperscript{252}, structures associated with reward/motivation, and also emotion. Therefore, the affective potential that exists within musical practice makes music a particularly successful vehicle for ritual propagation. Similarly, Levitin argues that because of the neurological response that results from musical participation, music can be classified as a highly effective information transmission system.\textsuperscript{253}

One may argue that any group activity or communal ritual can foster feelings of social bonding and group cohesion but musical ritual is a particularly effective mechanism for social bonding for two reasons. First, there is an emotional consequence whereby people experience similar emotions such as joy, simply by being in tune with other members of their social

\textsuperscript{251} Levitin, \textit{The World in Six Songs}, 207-208.
\textsuperscript{252} Levitin actually argues that music is a more effective conveyer of emotion that language because it facilitates communication in a nonspecific and nonreferential way. See Levitin, \textit{This is Your Brain}, 191.
\textsuperscript{253} Levitin, \textit{The World in Six Songs}, 225.
network. This also relates to synchrony, which is an important factor in fostering feelings of interconnectedness with others. Second, music is a ritual practice that allows individuals to confirm their identity in relation to other members of the group. Music can be a marker of both personal and group identity and this is a way of externalizing social bonds. Music as a ritual practice within a group setting functions to create an idealized state of consciousness where emotional response is heightened and a person feels a sense of unity with fellow participants. This sense of unity comes from a physical (and perhaps metaphysical) feeling of social integration with other people that share religious and cultural similarities with an individual. Andrew Newberg takes a similar approach in understanding ritual more generally – he argues, “Oneness of all participants is a theme that runs through the elements of most human rituals”. Levitin and Chandra also point to the feelings of mutual trust that develop in such a ritual setting. For example, oxytocin is an important neurotransmitter that regulates social behaviour and the role of this chemical in musical participation has been examined quite extensively and studies have shown that high amounts of this neurochemical are released when subjects are participating in collective music making rituals.

**Embodiment, Signalling, and Synchrony: Applicable Cognitive Frameworks**

*Embodiment*

Thinking is not something that is separate from the body; rather it is influenced by the body and our interaction with the environment around us. We perceive in order to act and our emotions

---

255 Levitin, *This is Your Brain*, 232.
257 Levitin and Chandra, “The Neurochemistry of Music”, 188.
guide that action. Additionally, a human being perceives their own personhood through their bodily experiences and while the boundaries that define our individual identity are continually in flux, Gibbs argues that we perceive our personhood as "an emergent property of interactions of the brain, body, and world. Glenberg et al. agree with this assessment and contend that our sense of self is grounded in activity. Musical ritual provides an excellent starting point to investigate the relationship between knowledge and practice and how that relationship contributes to the way we perceive our own identity.

The embodied nature of musical ritual is a claim that has already been made in this chapter and cognitive science also has much to contribute on this topic. As Armin Geertz argues, "Cognition is embrained, embodied, enculturated, extended, and distributed", meaning that everything we do, think, and experience is related to our cognitive processes. Geertz notes that physical manipulation of the body can direct our emotional response and mental state in a specific way and that ritual is the most effective way to accomplish this, particularly ritual that involves singing, dancing or jumping. The reason that music is such an appealing mechanism stems from the fact that melody and rhythm are connected to other elements such as repetition, elaboration, and exaggeration, which are integral components of religious ritual more generally according to Geertz. He claims that religious rituals that include a musical elements have the ability to "tug deeply at the psychological and somatic foundations of each and every individual and have the ability to arouse, shape, and form emotions and mental states, thus allowing the

260 Glenberg et al. "From Revolution to Embodiment", 582.
transfer and sharing of norms and ideals.\textsuperscript{263}

The norms and ideals that Geertz is referring to include religious knowledge. Lawrence W. Barsalou and his colleagues argue that religious knowledge is embodied and situated in our perception, action, and mental states. They argue, "Basic motor actions enhance memory, and religions incorporate them extensively into religious practice. Besides helping convey the associated spiritual idea, these actions also help entrench those ideas in memory".\textsuperscript{264} Singing is a part of many religious rituals and it involves a variety of neural pathways including those responsible for motor function, the linguistic centres of the brain, rhythmic processing, and various areas of the brain that are responsible for emotional response mechanisms. Religious knowledge and bodily motion are both embedded in ritual singing and this serves to solidify ritual action in our memory and connect the ritual to our sense of identity - both individual and group identities. Andrew Greeves and John Sutton argue, "Embodiment, in the sense of the ongoing engagement of the affective-tactile-kinesthetic body, might not be seen as a single and separable interactive component of our musical, perceptual, and cognitive capacities, but as an entirely integrated and pervasive dimension of them."\textsuperscript{265}

\textit{Signalling, Cooperation & Synchrony}

Cognitive science has provided evidence to suggest that religious ritual as an embodied practice contributes to a sense of shared or collective identity and group cohesion. How does musical ritual function in this way? There are several convincing arguments that will be adjudicated in

\textsuperscript{263} Geertz, "Brain, Body, and Culture", 307.
this section. Richard Sosis and Joseph Bulbulia, among others, argue that religious rituals are embodied acts that have several important results. First, religious ritual promotes cooperation and this is an evolutionary function of religion more generally. Second, religious behaviours contribute to social cohesion through displays of honest-signalling marked by emotional response. Third, religious ritual has the ability to create and synchronize motivational states in participants.

Signalling theory, according to Sosis and Bulbulia, "considers how communication, perception, and control systems co-evolve as elements of intricate, robust designs to manage cooperation's problems". This theoretical framework addresses the problem of cooperation among groups where cooperation might not be the best course of action for an individual. This is particularly relevant in cases where a religious ritual or identity is costly to an individual (such as circumcision rituals). They focus on religious ritual in particular because they argue that this form of ritual practice promotes an especially powerful form of cooperative solidarity among participants, who may even be strangers at first. Why is religious ritual "especially powerful" in creating group solidarity? Sosis and Alcorta argue that the primary function of religion is to promote solidarity among members. They do recognize, however, that social bonds are not an end in themselves; rather, by increasing group solidarity among members, "religion facilitates intragroup cooperation". Religions generally require what they define as costly patterns of behaviour and these behaviours (such as ritual practices) are meant to signal loyalty and commitment to the group, which in turn generates social cohesion and feelings of a shared

identity. Ritual performance "reinforces the cognitive and emotional substrates of individual commitment to group ideals and values". Religious ritual in particular imbues symbolic significance and emotionally-anchored meaning for an individual, which generates social solidarity. Rituals tend to promote trust between adherents, which Sosis and Alcorta argue provides a foundation for cooperative group enterprises and is critical to the success of long-term solidarity.

The other effect described by signalling theory addresses the maintenance of in-group boundaries insofar as "honest displays of signalling allow for the evolution of cooperative strategies by facilitating the sort of cooperative prediction required for reliable cooperative assorting among partners for whom defection is still not a live option". Honest displays refer to ritual participation more generally but encompass an emotional component, which according to Sosis and Bulbulia are difficult to fake. The necessary investment of time and resources for group membership make the individual commitment meaningful in the sense that even when religious ritual may be dangerous or wasteful, the benefits outweigh the costs. This establishes an environment where participants exchange honest signals with each other that communicate cooperation and root out free-riders that do not share the same loyalty to the group. Religious behaviours are "costly-to-fake signals that advertise an individual's level of commitment to a religious group".

Signalling theory provides a key theoretical framework in understanding how religious ritual facilitates social cohesion and group solidarity but how is music different than any other religious ritual practice? First, Alcorta and Sosis categorize music as a "rhythmic driver" that

---

"impacts autonomic functions and synchronizes internal biophysiological oscillators to external auditory rhythms". This serves to enhance the "coupling effect", which refers to the coordination of multiple neurophysiological processes that take place during a musical experience. This may also have the secondary effect of synchronizing the emotional and motivational states of participants during communal musical ritual. Second, the various attributes of a musical composition (consonance, dissonance, contour, etc.) create a level of expectation among participants and this shapes the nature of our cognitive responses and experienced emotional state. Since singing is an embodied practice, body language and facial expressions show the "musically induced psychological changes" that take place during ritual participation. Emotional response plays an integral part in facilitating this type of signalling among members of a group and since emotions can be difficult to fake, this also helps to solve the problem of free-riders. In ritual settings, emotions are strongly connected to our environment and generally correlate with social or religious motivations behind ritual participation and these motivations are often shared with other members of the group. As I noted above, spontaneous emotional responses are hard to fake and as a result these "honest signals" display the commitment and loyalty that one has to the group.

Ritual is an efficacious method of facilitating these shared emotional responses in participants because rituals are often carried out in a synchronous fashion. Synchrony is a key component to many rituals including communal verbal responses from the participants, processional marching, or musical performances. This is a particularly important framework to

---

273 Sosis and Alcorta "Ritual, Emotion, and Sacred Symbols", 336. Sosis and Alcorta note the ubiquitous presence of music in religious ritual and argue that music is "uniquely adapted to instantiate the structure of ritual precisely because it incorporates the formality, sequencing, patterning, and repetition that define ritual", 345.
apply in this study because early Christian writers emphasized the significance of singing in unison. Ignatius of Antioch, among others, was a strong advocate of this practice and this ritual prescription was often used as a metaphor for Christian unity. I will return to this issue in more depth in chapter five and it is sufficient at this point to note that synchronous unison singing was an important ritualistic element of early Christian musical practice.

How does synchronous ritual support preceding discussion on embodiment and signalling? Reddish et al. argue that "synchrony has been found to affect social cognition by increasing liking among interacting partners, augmenting social memories, improving subsequent interpersonal coordination, and facilitating social bonding". Synchronous ritual behaviours result in increased prosociality and this conclusion is supported by several studies. Wiltermuth and Heath argue that synchrony fosters social cooperation among participants, especially during synchronous chanting or singing which is a common feature of many religious rituals. They conducted several experiments where people engaged in synchronous action (marching, listening to music, etc.) and they found that people were more likely to cooperate with one another even in situations where personal sacrifice was necessary for the good of collective group. Their results showed that cultural practices involving synchronous action also helped root out free-riders and coordinate costly behaviours in a way that facilitated social bonding and cooperation.

Rituals involving synchronous behaviours may also be adaptive because they promote prosociality. As I have already demonstrated, group cooperation has many benefits even when personal costs may be high. Chanting, dancing, or singing in unison creates a shared sense of

---

identity and emotional bonds\textsuperscript{277} that diminish the perceived separation of self and group. Ivana Konvalinka and her colleagues make some important conclusions about the nature of synchronous ritual. They note the ubiquitous presence of synchronous ritual in all cultural contexts and claim that while collective rituals enhance social cohesion the effects are not limited to active participants. Synchronous ritual becomes a vehicle for "social organization and transformation by contributing to the formation of strong emotional bonds between group members".\textsuperscript{278} These researchers carried out a study on the nature of emotional arousal between participants and observers during a fire-walking ritual. They measured emotional arousal through heart rate dynamics and found that over the duration of the ritual there was an increase in synchronous physiological response between various groups.\textsuperscript{279} The strongest synchronous level was found between fellow firewalkers, which suggests that communal ritual participation may be related to "empathetic mechanisms, the natures of which remain obscure".\textsuperscript{280} However, as Kovalinka and her colleagues note, physiological responses associated with empathy are likely dependent on context and emotional intensity.\textsuperscript{281} This study also found that there was also a degree of synchronous heart rhythm between the firewalkers and spectators who were actively watching the ritual practice and had a familiarity with the practice or the firewalkers themselves. They argue that feelings of empathy or group solidarity can be fostered without actual participation in the ritual. However, this conclusion must be considered in light of the team's other finding: namely, that other observers with no association or familiarity to the participants

\textsuperscript{277} See William H. McNeill, \textit{Keeping Together in Time: Dance and Drill in Human History} (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), 67-68. McNeill argues that dance and singing are the most effective ways to generate inspiration and emotional response among people. Like Alcorta and Sosis, he also claims that these ritualistic practices cement the feeling of social solidarity among group members.


\textsuperscript{280} Bulbulia, "Spreading Order", 18.

\textsuperscript{281} Kovalinka et al. "Synchronized Arousal", 8515.
did not share the same cardiac arousal patterns and therefore were not in the same state of synchronous rhythm as other observers that did have familiarity with the ritual or active participants. They conclude that their results suggest "collective ritual experience is mediated by familiarity, because synchronized arousal is restricted to ritual participants (i.e. fire-walkers) and their friends and relatives". The nature of synchronous response then is important to consider in light of my assertion that communal singing was an effective mechanism of recruitment. However, according to the results of Kovalinka and her collaborators, this synchronous response is most effective when observers have some type of social connection to the ritual practice itself (singing) or the active participants (the singers). This conclusion provides a cognitive explanation for Stark's model of success, where he argues that successful social/religious movements are spread through social networks (although in this case I would argue that the evidence points specifically to participation in synchronous ritual practice). It also supports my claim that communal ritual (or singing in particular) is a particularly effective mode of recruitment because it has the potential to induce a synchronous physiological response among active participants but also observers that may be familiar with the ritual (or in the case of early Christianity, a person may be familiar with a specific melody) or the participants (such as friends, family, or co-workers) and create that shared sense of identity and social bonding.

Returning to Musical Roots: The Applicability of Neuroscience to a Study on Early Christian Music

A fair amount of this chapter has been dedicated to investigating the neurological and cultural motivations and responses to collective musical participation. I briefly discussed the neurological

---

significance of reward/pleasure with respect to musical performance and how some early Christian thinkers articulated their own understanding of this relationship. However, the applicability of cognition and music to understanding early Christian ritual and perhaps even the success and development of early Christian communities goes beyond the social and neurological rewarding aspects of music. The preceding section has illustrated the role that music plays in social bonding and group formation. The case studies of Qumran and the Therapeutae demonstrate a very similar situation; however, these communities lived in semi-rural environment whereas the spread of Christianity in the Greco-Roman world was mainly an urban phenomenon.\footnote{See Wayne Meeks, \textit{The First Urban Christians: The Social World of the Apostle Paul} 2nd Edition (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2003).}

Musical participation, as I have already argued, is universal despite cultural variations. So, how does music function differently in the Christianities of the first four centuries from other religious or social contexts of the same period? How did music reinforce what Christians were preaching and practicing? I argue that there were several features of collective music making within early Christian communities that made this type of ritual practice a particularly effective catalyst for information dissemination, identity formation, and recruitment of new members.

First, the musical liturgy of early Christians employed musical practice in a way that was both familiar and unique to participants, which according to Rodney Stark, is an effective mechanism for the propagation of a social movement. He contends that a successful social movement retains a certain level of continuity with potential recruits.\footnote{Stark, \textit{The Rise of Christianity}, 49-72. Stark uses this argument within the context of Jewish conversion but its applicability exceeds this particular focus.} The pseudo-Pauline epistles indicate that music-making, and singing in particular, were prominent features of congregational meetings. As I argue in the next chapter, the use of song was somewhat fluid
during this period. Ephesians 5:19 and Colossians 3:16 refer to psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs. While the exact meaning of these terms is generally considered to be unresolved and we lack empirical data such as musical notation from this period, the use of three different words suggests that there was variation in the type and melody of musical engagement. The use of Biblical psalms, which is highly probable, suggests a strong continuity stemming from the singing of psalms in the Temple.\textsuperscript{285} Of course, any connection between Christian practice and synagogue liturgy dating to the first century is extremely tenuous due to the lack of literary evidence pertaining to synagogue practice. This connection is not integral, however, because singing was a staple element of associative life more generally in both Jewish and Greco-Roman contexts. As the second chapter demonstrated, music was part of many aspects of social interaction in antiquity and music was employed in similar settings (i.e. ritual meals, worship gatherings, and other ritual practices), which had elements of similarity with other cultural groups but the religious message contained within vocal performances or at worship gatherings was distinct from both Greco-Roman and Jewish religious traditions.

However, in the Pauline community of Corinth, Paul tells the assembly that when they meet for worship each person has a hymn.\textsuperscript{286} This statement suggests that Paul welcomed individual musical expression in the form of hymns or psalms, which would be sung at assembly meetings or perhaps that individuals in the community were welcome to create their own compositions. While the exact meaning of Paul's comment cannot be determined, there is a strong emphasis on a communal form of worship where members can make meaningful

\textsuperscript{285} The second century text, the Acts of Paul, refers to singing the "psalms of David" and as Smith notes, the Apostolic Tradition mentions the psalms 'in which the Alleluia is written'. Smith contends that this "leaves no doubt that biblical psalms are meant, perhaps the Hallel." See Smith, Music, 183.

\textsuperscript{286} 1 Corinthians 14: 26 "Τί οὖν ἐστιν, ἀδελφοί; ὅταν συνέρχησθε, ἐκαστὸς ψαλμὸν ἔχει, διδαχὴν ἔχει, ἀποκάλυψιν ἔχει, γλῶσσαν ἔχει, ἐρμηνείαν ἔχει· πάντα πρὸς οἴκοδομὴν γινέσθω."
individual contributions. This idea connects to our understanding of the self in relation to a group identity, which relies on both a "stable set of evaluative standards and a fluid, ever-changing description in the moment".  

Second, the early focus on unity (both literally and metaphorically) served to reinforce group identity and social cohesion. Ignatius was one of the first church authorities to emphasize this concept of unity, using instrumental references as metaphor in order to show his audience an idealized depiction of a Christian community united in belief and practice. However, as this chapter has demonstrated, this concept of unity is more significant than simply an allegory or metaphor. Musical participation acts as a neurological catalyst during the release of neurotransmitters that are associated with feelings of a shared identity and social bonding. Collective music making was a part communal worship and this activity was particularly effective at fostering the emotional component of ritual practice and reinforcing participant’s memory of the physical action involved in ritual as well as the doctrinal content of the songs themselves. The emphasis on singing in a joyful manner illustrates the desired emotional outcome of the ritual. Early Christian authorities recognized the significance of music in worship insofar as it provided a direct action through which unity could be expressed and neurological data has confirmed that the physiological result of communal singing is the release of neurochemicals such as oxytocin, which play an important role in creating feelings of belonging and emotional bonding.

Third, song was established as a medium through which identity was continually defined and re-defined in relation to other socio-religious groups in Greco-Roman antiquity. The construction of identity is a complex and dynamic process; however, this continual shaping of a

---

Christian identity can be described at least in part through musical ritual practice. Discourse on music and singing from the first two centuries illustrates a continual need to justify and explain the use of song within the developing Christian liturgy but perhaps more importantly, descriptions of Christian singing often define the community in relation to non-members. This attempt at creating and defining socio-religious boundaries demonstrates that the use of music and discourse on music can be considered a direct form of rhetorical engagement through the process of self-definition. Direct or indirect rhetorical engagement is also a tool for recruiting new members and singing was an important component in the acquisition of new members. Communal singing is a unifying feature in most contexts but it was also used not only as a mechanism of unification but also to implicitly define in-group and out-group boundaries, which contained an inherent value judgment in later Christian texts that classified certain Christian groups as heretical.

Conclusion
The role of music in human cognition is complex in nature but this area of inquiry has much to offer the study of religion and music. The neurological mechanisms involved in processing and producing music are inextricably linked to elements of human behaviour and emotion that help us understand why human beings engage in ritual practices and what makes certain practices more efficacious or desirable than others. Melody, rhythm, and tempo are all important factors that determine our response to a song. This chapter has demonstrated that the auditory processing of music has significant physiological and sociological results, which are inherently tied to emotion and memory. The social manifestations of the neurochemical response to music are important for group formation, identity development, and social bonding. These are all key
factors in the creation and expansion of a successful social movement and I contend that music, including both the ritual practice of singing and discourse on musical practice, played an integral role in creating a group identity and attracting new members. Music and musical practice of the early Christians employed three unique features: a balance of the novel and the familiar, a strong focus on group unity and social cohesion through collective singing and discursive metaphor, and the simultaneous promotion of in-group musical practices with the disparagement of out-group musical ritual as a form of rhetorical engagement. Cognitive neuroscience provides an alternative lens through which to investigate and understand human responses to melody and rhythm. This form of scientific inquiry allows scholars to use empirical data to further analyze human behaviour and emotion in order to gain, perhaps, one more level of access to human experience. This is not meant to be a reduction of human experience to neurological activity but rather an attempt to employ Slingerland’s theory of vertical integration to the study of early Christian music. This chapter has focused on neuroscience and the brain, the individual. I have demonstrated that musical processing in the brain is connected to emotion, perception, and understanding the world around us. This discussion focused on the individual person and how the physiological processes that go on in the body facilitate and are influenced by the world around us and our understanding of self and our identity in relation to others. The next step in the development of the overall argument is to establish the role that music plays in formulating the collective identity of a particular group. How does any group create, articulate, and re-negotiate their collective identity? I argue that musical ritual provides an answer to this question in the context of early Christianity and it is to this assertion that we now proceed.
Chapter 4: Music in Early Christianity: Ritual Practice as Identity Marker

Introduction

The flourishing musical environment of Mediterranean antiquity permeated almost every facet of daily life at every socio-economic level. Music was the subject of philosophical discourse as well as a staple element at religious sacrifices, communal meals, and festivals. Melody was considered a communicative medium of divine origin, which allowed people to demonstrate their devotion to the gods and celebrate or acknowledge various life rites and ceremonial events. This was the philosophical and practical understanding of music that influenced and shaped early Christian ideas about music and musical ritual. Both Jewish and Greco-Roman musical practices and ideas about music affected the way in which Christ-following groups incorporated music into their liturgy. Yet, music was also a topic of discourse in early Christian writings and church authorities from the 2nd century onward attempted to outline acceptable forms of musical engagement in order to structure a specific musical identity that was distinct from their Jewish and Greco-Roman neighbours.

From the earliest gatherings of Christ-followers, singing was an integral component in both public and domestic worship. There are very few references in New Testament texts that describe the use of instruments but the gospels, the Pauline Epistles, and the Pastorals all mention psalms, hymns, or singing in the context of prayer, divine communication, prophetic experiences, and communal praise. These references will be discussed in depth in the following sections. Moreover, the Book of Revelation also references the “New Song”, which is likely a more allegorical usage of musical imagery but nonetheless there are various examples of musical references in New Testament texts. These references depict a certain level of fluidity pertaining
to the musical elements of communal gatherings. For this reason, scholars of early Christian music have found it very difficult make any conclusive statements about liturgical practices in the first century. In addition, the scarcity of textual references to actual practice in the New Testament challenges our ability to provide a definitive picture of what this unstructured musical practice may have actually looked like. Therefore, one must examine these references within the cultural context of Mediterranean antiquity in the first century. Chapter two outlined the nature and various functions of musical practice in both Jewish and Greco-Roman daily life and this historical context sheds some light on the New Testament references insofar as one may posit some primary conclusions based on what scholars know about musical practices in other first century cultural groups. Thus, despite a relatively small number of musical references in the first century source materials, we can still make some general and important observations about music in the lives of the earliest Christ-followers.

The literary sources from the second to the fifth centuries provide much more information on the development of musical practice in early Christianity. Moreover, there emerges a distinct philosophical trajectory on the topic of music as the formalized structure of the church hierarchy becomes standardized. Many patristic sources contain references to musical thought and practice and the place of song and instrument in both worship and daily life. “Music” as such, however, is rarely an isolated subject insofar as musical practice is often connected with a variety of other topics that occupy early Christian discourse including idolatry, sexual immorality, violence, and gender issues. In fact, a dualism develops within Christian discourse on the so-called positive and negative elements of music. Most patristic sources288 associate positive forms of musical expression with joyful praise within a worship or even

288 These Patristic sources include both Latin and Greek authors such as Tertullian and Clement of Alexandria, respectively, and their references to musical practice will be examined in detail further on in this chapter.
domestic setting and this includes hymns and songs that are deemed to be theologically correct. Calvin Stapert argues, “Music was not something Christians thought about in isolation. It was involved in their thinking on everything, from the cosmos to the details of daily living”. Conversely, negative forms of musical expression (particularly instrumental performance) are associated with the other topics mentioned above – paganism, idol worship, promiscuity, uncontrolled emotion, magic, and other behaviours and practices deemed to be improper. Therefore, discourse on music becomes a literary domain of conflict between various church authorities and eventually specific forms of musical practice become an identity marker for Christ-following congregations.

The following chapter will provide an analysis of pertinent early Christian source materials in order to illustrate the aforementioned development and trajectory of musical practice and philosophy within early Christian discourse. The fluidity of musical expression present in the New Testament references, specifically in the Pauline literature, is eventually lost as more rigid expectations develop toward the end of the second and early third centuries. As this transition takes place within a variety of cultural contexts, controversies emerge with respect to musical participation, which is clearly reflected in the patristic discourse of this period. These discussions touch upon every facet of daily life in antiquity – from marriage and funerals to communal meals and liturgical gatherings. Communal singing was viewed as a potentially unifying activity, which was meant to instill order and reverence in adherents. Musical forms that deviated from this aim were viewed in an extremely negative light and this dichotomous approach to musical ritual in the early church eventually comes to define, at least in part, the move toward proto-Orthodoxy.

While there are relatively few sources that document the actual musical practices of early

---

Christians, there are quite a few literary works that talk about music in more general terms. Also, literary sources, while the most numerous, are not the only type of ancient evidence that tell us something about music. Archeological evidence\textsuperscript{290} and musical papyri also provide certain insights into the study of early Christian music. There are very few musical papyri and the extant documents generally originate after the fourth century. However, the famous Papyrus Oxyrhynchus 1786,\textsuperscript{291} is one such example that opens a small window into early Christian music and many scholars have dissected and analyzed this hymn in order to make some generalizations about musical practice in the early church but it is sufficient to note at this point that one piece of evidence cannot be used to validate any far-reaching conclusions about early Christian music or the history of liturgical hymnody.

J.A. Smith notes two particular methodological issues surrounding the scholarly use of literary sources to piece together a history of musical practices within the early church. First, the dating of literary sources can be a serious obstacle in terms of mapping out liturgical development. If the dating of a text remains a contentious issue, it is difficult to use the information in the text in an accurate and effective manner. Second, Smith points out the potential for misinterpretation or misuse of music-related terms in the source material. He contends that certain terms may have very specific or nuanced meanings, which have been

\textsuperscript{290} See J.A. Smith, \textit{Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity} (Surrey, UK: Ashgate), 27-28 for a discussion on archeological evidence. It should be noted, however, that most of the material evidence includes actual instruments or fragments of instruments from Near Eastern civilizations, which are not particularly useful for a study on early Christian music since this was entirely vocal, according to Smith.

obscured over the preceding two millennia. The problem of translation can be equally perplexing. For example, English translations of ancient musical instruments can be misleading. Smith contends that instruments translated from the Hebrew Bible (and other ancient texts), such as the tambourine or trumpet, are not necessarily equivalent to our modern understanding or depiction of these instruments. In other cases, Smith argues that some sources occasionally name instruments that “are no longer identifiable”, presenting an even greater potential for misrepresentation. Therefore, one must keep these methodological pitfalls in mind during any engagement with all musical literary sources from antiquity.

Music & Identity

Before undertaking an examination of early Christian literary works, it is necessary to provide a provisional foundation explaining how music and musical practice can be understood as an identity marker within the context of early Christianity. The literary sources that will be reviewed throughout this chapter will illustrate how music was conceptualized theologically and employed in ritual practice during the first four centuries. There is no clear over-arching uniformity in the discourse but there are important trends and themes that loosely construct a Christian philosophy on music and these trends can tell us about Christianity and Christian identity/identities.

Judith Lieu provides a rudimentary definition of identity in her work, *Christian Identity in the Jewish and Graeco-Roman World*. She argues that identity, “involves ideas of boundaries of sameness and difference, of continuity, perhaps a degree of homogeneity and of recognition

---

293 Smith, *Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*, 31. For Smith’s complete discussion on issues surrounding translation and interpretation, specifically on Hebrew Bible terms, see pages 29-31.
by self and others”.\footnote{Judith M Lieu, \textit{Christian Identity in the Jewish and Graeco-Roman World} (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 12.} It has already been noted earlier in this study that scholarly employment of the term Christianity (and by extension Judaism) is methodologically problematic insofar as these terms create a false perception that Christianity and Judaism were monolithic and uniform entities, which of course was certainly not the case.\footnote{For a brief summary on the difficulty of terminology, see Lieu, \textit{Christian Identity}, 21-23.} We continue to use these terms, however, out of necessity with the understanding that they are more complex and diverse than scholars have previously recognized.

Lieu touches upon several important themes in her work on Christian identities that help explain how a variety of elements contribute to the creation and negotiation of any group identity. It should be noted that Lieu does not reference music at all in her work but her discussion on the importance of text, gender, embodiment, and environment all connected to many of the conceptual elements presented in this chapter on early Christian music. Before this connection is further developed, it is necessary to comment briefly on conceptions of identity in the Greco-Roman world of antiquity. First, identity is expressed through dynamic and ever-changing social, religious, and political boundaries. As Lieu points out, boundaries are subject to constant change because they are the result of human interaction and negotiation.\footnote{Lieu, \textit{Christian Identity}, 99.} Identity cannot be viewed as a stand-alone static entity because it is relational. Identity is always provisionally defined in relation to other identities. This construction, however, is not a simple dualism or dichotomy. The formulation of identity can be viewed as matrix insofar as some elements that contribute to this construct may be mutually exclusive while others may be perfectly compatible with one another.

The first nexus at which Lieu locates identity is in text. She argues that texts construct
identity such that there exists a “dynamic and dialectical relationship between texts, the variety of levels on which they function, and the distinctive identity of these groups”. For example, cultural attitudes toward gender and embodiment are textually inscribed. However, Lieu notes several difficulties associated with this assertion. Texts in antiquity were written and copied by an elite tier of society and literacy rates were quite low, which limited accessibility to a certain extent. In addition, Lieu explains that texts are a complex feature of identity because there is often a struggle for authority, power, and legitimacy that is often carried out in a written medium. How do texts become authoritative? How do changing identities evolve and adapt in relation to changing environment and power shifts? Lieu argues that textual canonicity is a complicated matter insofar as identity formation relies on historical continuity while at the same time attempting to carve out new defining features. She contends that this process involves remembering and re-remembering and that this process “creates a history that provides a coherent continuity out of the discontinuities of human experience”.

How can Lieu’s conclusions be applied to a discourse specifically on music? How does her discussion on text, gender, practice, and space contribute to this topical analysis? Music provides a locus of identity construction through discourse, ritual practice, melody, and lyrical content. Much of Lieu’s work on text is relevant to early Christian music in this way. First, her assertion that continuity is essential to identity formation is manifested in the Christian appropriation of Jewish psalms. These cantillated and melismatic verses were already well

---

297 Lieu, *Christian Identity*, 34.
298 Lieu’s assertion is made based on the formulation of the Christian canon, which incorporated Jewish texts (ie. Hebrew Bible) and of course created new ones, not all of which were included in the final corpus.
established in Jewish history and part of sacred text\textsuperscript{300}, yet their usage had to be reconciled with the fact that Rabbinical Judaism still performed psalms at their own worship services and the theological tenets of Rabbinical Judaism were incongruent with those of Christianity. Lieu notes that groups who appropriate this past continuity tend to try and “find more original or authentic interpretations”,\textsuperscript{301} which is precisely what some of the church fathers attempted to do with the psalms. Basil of Caesarea contends, “The psalm was not written for the Jews of that time, but for us who are to be transformed, who exchange polytheism for piety, and the mistake of idolatry for the knowledge of him who made us and choose temperance under the law instead of pleasure, and who take psalms, fasting and prayer, instead of the auloi, dancing, and drunkenness”.\textsuperscript{302} Not only does Basil re-constitute, or as Lieu argues, try to find a more "authentic" interpretation, his critique has the dual aim of subverting Jewish tradition and stereotypical Greco-Roman characteristics. Phil Harland argues that internal self-definition often happens through stereotyping the Other\textsuperscript{303} and this is quite pervasive with respect to Greco-Roman music and practice in early Christian discourse. Rhetoric, while integral in the process of self-definition, also becomes an important feature of recruitment, which will be examined further in chapter five. As Benjamin Beit-Hallahmi argues, "High in-group identification and positive attitudes towards one's in-group are often connected to negative attitudes toward other groups."\textsuperscript{304} This connection between conceptions of a self-definition and the creation of an "us vs. them" mentality becomes

\textsuperscript{300} See the \textit{Didascalia Apostolorum} VI, 3-5 (McKinnon, 41 – translated from the complete Syriac edition), which states that the Christians have the Psalms of David. Also, see Niceta of Remesiana, \textit{De utilitate} 3-4; PL LXVIII, 371-271, which states that psalmody is legitimated through the Jewish genealogical line from Moses to David.

\textsuperscript{301} Lieu, \textit{Christian Identity}, 84.

\textsuperscript{302} Basil, \textit{Homilia in psalmmum LIX}, 2; PG XXIX, 464. “Οὐ τοῖνυν τοῖς τότε Ἰουδαίοις ὁ ψαλμὸς γέγραπται, ἀλλ’ ἡμῖν τοῖς ἄλλοις ἁμαρτομένοις, τοῖς τὴν πολυθείαν εἰς εὐσεβείαν διαμείβουσιν, τὴν περὶ τὰ ἐἰδώλα πλάνην εἰς τὴν τοῦ ποιῆσαι θεᾶς ἐπίγνωσιν τοῖς ἀντὶ ἴδους παρανόμου σωφροσύνην ἐννομοὶ αἱρουμένοις, ἀντὶ αὐλῶν, καὶ χορῶν, καὶ μέθης, ψαλμῶν, καὶ νηστείας, καὶ προσευχῆς μεταλλάξωνοις.”

\textsuperscript{303} Phil Harland, \textit{Dynamics of Identity in the world of Early Christians} (New York: T&T Clark, 2009), 184-185.

\textsuperscript{304} Benjamin Beit-Hallahmi, \textit{Psychological Perspectives on Religion and Religiosity} (East Sussex: Routledge, 2015), 51.
very important within the context of early Christian recruitment and the articulation of orthodoxy and heresy. Beit-Hallahmi also contends that these religious group identities have a dual function insofar as they result in strong in-group cooperation (as we already noted in the section on ritual, cooperation, and synchrony in chapter three) but may also lead to intra-group conflict and competition.\(^{305}\)

Psalms, however, are not the only musical features of early Christian worship. We will see how individual compositions and non-scriptural hymns were a point of contention in liturgical development. Lieu argues that when new texts are written, some survive and some do not, providing a medium where the struggle for power and authority takes place in terms of identity construction.\(^{306}\) Individual compositions are an analogous medium insofar as they eventually constitute a musical canon of sorts, although are more loosely fashioned than a canon such as the New Testament. Some of these compositions were certainly used to de-legitimate the Other, particularly within sectarian rhetoric. Again, this will be examined further in chapter five when we investigate how music and musical practice was used as a rhetorical device to create in-out/out-group boundaries within the discourse on heresy but it must be noted that the incorporation of hymns follows the same trajectory that Lieu constructs with relation to new texts.

Hymns and psalms were often referenced in defining Christianity against its pagan neighbours. There are many examples of this practice, particularly in relation to earlier discussions in chapter two on music at weddings, meals, and funerals. Christian discourse on

\(^{305}\) Beit-Hallahmi, *Psychological Perspectives*, 54.  
\(^{306}\) Lieu, *Christian Identity*, 49.
music most often references these events as cesspools of moral corruption.\textsuperscript{307} Christian polemicists connect Greco-Roman songs with extravagance, licentiousness, gluttony, drunkenness, and idolatry. In addition, Christian writers critique the use of musical instruments on similar grounds. Thus, it is not simply the song lyrics that later Christians opposed but the melodies and rhythms themselves, which they thought had the power to ignite passions and emotions not suitable for the ideal Christian adherent.\textsuperscript{308} Therefore, song and instrument were inherently linked to behaviour and action, which was a defining feature of Christian identity for authors such as Clement of Alexandria.

Music functions on other levels that Lieu articulates in her work as well. There is a shared symbolic dimension, which is manifested through the communal experience of singing. This is an embodied practice that creates social unity and group coherence. Moreover, the ritual of singing also served to create in-group boundaries pertaining to gender roles. The eventual exclusion of female participation (although not universal) defined the role of women in the congregation, which had many other consequences in areas such as leadership and authority within the church hierarchy. To recapitulate, music functioned in a variety of ways to shape and re-shape a continually changing Christian identity. The significance of song and melody can be placed in all of the identity markers analyzed in Lieu’s work including, textual discourse, ritual practice, gender roles, and the re-invention of tradition. Musical discourse and the description of practice is used by early Christian writers to reinforce a Christian identity through the definition of musical boundaries that mark the line between Christian and non-Christian. This enterprise is

\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{307} See the famous section in Clement of Alexandria, \textit{Paedagogus} II, iv where he criticizes the musical practices at Greco-Roman symposia because of the licentious behaviours induced alongside such practices. This tractate will be subsequently analyzed in further detail later in this chapter.}

\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{308} I discussed this issue in chapter three in the section on emotion that explained how melody and rhythm contribute to formulating the contour of a piece that make it emotionally arousing.}
very complex in nature because of the shared locus between music and numerous other cultural facets that construct an entire worldview.

**Music in Early Christianity**

The origins of musical practice in early Christianity are not entirely clear although the majority of musicologists and liturgical scholars have concluded that the origins of musical ritual in this context are likely derived from both Jewish and Greco-Roman practices and philosophic discourse. However, there exists a continuum of sorts and scholars differ on the level of permeation that can be attributed to either cultural group and is likely contingent upon specific local influences. Eric Werner, for example, argues that earliest forms of Christian liturgy and singing come from the Jewish tradition. He states, “No matter how much they differed theologically, chronologically, nationally, and geographically, certain elements were common to all of their rites. Without exception, these basic [musical] concepts stemmed from Judaism”.

He concludes that Jewish synagogue liturgy likely influenced Christian worship but a clear musical relationship is very difficult to substantiate. Werner certainly overstates his case in this regard. His argument is based on an outdated view that the synagogue is the best social model in terms of understanding early Christian communities. Richard Ascough outlines some of the problems with this analogy in his work *What are they Saying about the Formation of Pauline Churches?* For example, in the first half of the first century, it is unclear exactly how the synagogue functioned in Jewish religious life. In addition, communal Jewish worship often took place in domestic space instead of a separate building specifically designated as a synagogue and

---

309 Several scholars that ascribe to this approach include James McKinnon, J.A. Smith, Margot Fassler, Peter Jeffrey, and Calvin Stapert.

the liturgical elements of domestic worship remain unclear.\textsuperscript{311} There is little literary evidence to suggest that a uniform liturgy existed in such a place during the first century. Moreover, the literary references to Paul preaching in the synagogues are found in the Book of Acts, which cannot be taken as historically accurate because as Ascough notes, “Acts is a secondary source for Paul’s life”.\textsuperscript{312} and parts of the detailed account in Acts conflicts with information found in Paul's undisputed epistles. Ascough also points out that Paul never uses the term synagogue in his letters and instead he refers to the community of believers as an ekklesia.\textsuperscript{313}

Paul’s references to singing hymns and psalms only serve to complicate matters insofar as Paul references ecstatic experience and improvisational hymns in several of his letters, which seem to have very little connection with the word-centered worship in the synagogue, according to Smith.\textsuperscript{314} However, even this claim is hard to establish due to the lack of evidence on any aspects of worship in the synagogue prior to the 2\textsuperscript{nd} century. Lee I. Levine argues that there was likely some “dimension of religious activity from the outset” but that there is little evidence to suggest any distinct continuity from synagogue worship to liturgical practices in early Christian gatherings because we simply do not know how Jews worshipped in the synagogue before the 2\textsuperscript{nd} century.\textsuperscript{315} Although, Levine does acknowledge “scriptural readings the core of Jewish

\begin{footnote}{\textsuperscript{311}}Richard Ascough, \textit{What are they saying about the formation of Pauline churches}? (New York: Paulist Press, 1998), 12-14.\end{footnote}

\begin{footnote}{\textsuperscript{312}}Ascough, \textit{What are they saying?}, 12.\end{footnote}

\begin{footnote}{\textsuperscript{313}}Ascough, \textit{What are they saying?}, 27.\end{footnote}

\begin{footnote}{\textsuperscript{314}}Smith also points out that there are other scholarly assumptions regarding the relationship between Jewish and early Christian liturgy that are simply not as clear-cut as they are made out to be. For example, he argues that the ‘parting of the ways’ is a complex phenomenon and scholars cannot assume that after the 2\textsuperscript{nd} century Christians ceased to adopt and incorporate Jewish chant into their worship practices. He contends that this practice may have carried on into the Middle Ages. See Smith, \textit{Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity}, 224.\end{footnote}

\begin{footnote}{\textsuperscript{315}}Lee I. Levine, \textit{The Ancient Synagogue: The First Thousand years} (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2000), 7. See the Introductory chapter, 1-18.\end{footnote}
synagogue worship” in the first century, one cannot use this conclusion to draw clear lines of continuity between synagogue worship and early Christian liturgy.

Other scholars such as R.P. Winnington-Ingram argue that early Christian hymns were likely adopted from Greco-Roman cultic music. This position is also difficult to substantiate insofar as this interpretation relies on a single piece of evidence, namely the Oxyrhynchus Papyri 1796. This Trinitarian hymn has caused much controversy in terms of what the document can actually tell us about early Christian music. The technical aspects of P.Oxy 1796 need not concern us here but the text employs Greek musical notation, which has led some scholars to conclude that this work may be representative of Christian hymnody during the late third century and that its origins lie in the domain of Greek music. Both approaches to the origins of Christian music make important contributions but the evidence illustrates that the so-called origins are clearly more complex in nature and cannot be attributed to one specific source. In fact, broad generalizations about influence and origin do not accurately account for the local influence and cultural permeation that occurred in each Christ-following community. Christians used music in their liturgy but where that music originated is not something that we can determine based on the current textual and material evidence that is available. In Rome, for example, there were temples, synagogues, public songs and other forms of musical engagements that contributed to the formation and development of musical liturgy in Roman Christ-following assemblies and the notion of a single point of origin for that musical tradition is not even a viable assertion.

This raises another set of questions pertaining to the development of Christian musical

317 For a listing of scholarly sources and differing interpretations on the nature of this hymn, see Quasten, Music & Worship, 105 n.59b.
practice. If we cannot ascribe the origin solely to a Greek or Jewish context, then what sort of ritualistic elements from each tradition actually played a role in this development? Josef Lössl argues, “Jesus is shown [in the gospels] as continuing the Jewish tradition of praying, or singing the Psalms. The communal singing, or reciting, both of hymns and psalms, became a key characteristic of early Christian prayer”. This assertion is certainly corroborated in some of the gospel accounts but one interesting point that Paul Bradshaw notes is the potentiality that “Christians” actually may have worshipped separately from Jews. Bradshaw relies mainly on the Book of Acts to support this claim but he also cites Matthew 6:5-6, which contains a command to pray secretly in one’s room as opposed to the “hypocrites” who pray in the synagogue and on the street corner in order to be seen and receive honour and praise for their piety. Thus, Bradshaw suggests separate worship practices may have already developed by the time the Gospel of Matthew was composed. This claim appears presumptuous since making such an assertion based on one specific passage from a single text is highly problematic and it also reflects a naïve usage or understanding of New Testament texts. Bradshaw fails to account for the apologetic tendencies of the authors insofar as Matthew may be trying to create a distinction between his community and other synagogues in order to distinguish a separate identity. In addition, it should also be noted that Judaism in the first century was hardly a monolithic entity and such claims seem to indirectly suggest that this was the case. Therefore, the evidence does not support Bradshaw’s claim. If such a break could be substantiated, then the influence of Jewish synagogue worship practices (or even Temple liturgy for that matter) may be much less

---

than scholars like Werner argue. Bradshaw does, however, contend that liturgical similarities exist between early Christians and “breakaway” Jewish communities, such as the Therapeutae and the Jewish assembly at Qumran. He claims that these purported commonalities include fixed times for prayer, similarities in eschatological understandings, and an emphasis on thanksgiving. Prayer and song are inextricably linked in early Christian worship and Bradshaw’s connection between early Christians and the Therapeutae, for example, requires further analysis in order to make any conclusions on the musical similarities that may or may not have existed.

Jerome Neyrey argues that nine types of prayer can be extracted from New Testament texts and four of his categories are explicitly musical in nature. These four musical classifications include: the "new song" from Revelation 5:8, psalms (from the Pauline epistles), hymns or songs of praise (Eph 5:19, Matt 26:20), and the paean (Rom 11:36 16:25-26, Eph 3:20-21, Phil 4:20). Neyrey does not suggest that these categories are “absolute” but he claims that they do illustrate the variances in prayer forms, some of which are inherently musical.

What can the New Testament tell us about the musical practices of early Christians? If scholars disagree on the historical accuracy of texts or perhaps the degree to which certain references reflect actual practice, then are these texts useful in determining the musical rituals of early Christians? Despite the vague and ambiguous nature of musical references, there are several conclusions that scholars can draw from the New Testament. First, there is no evidence

---

320 Some scholars do argue, however, that the use of canticles in Christian liturgy is rooted in Jewish practice. For example, Matthew E. Gordley argues the Magnificat in the Gospel of Luke 1:41-45 is modeled after Hannah's song in 1 Samuel 2:1-10 as well as in the tradition of other Jewish birth narratives. For more on this connection, see Matthew E. Gordley, Teaching through song in Antiquity: Didactic Hymnody Among the Greeks, Romans, Jews, and Christians (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2011), 307-311.
321 Bradshaw, Daily Prayer, 38.
to suggest that musical instruments were a definitive part of worship. The few passages that
mention instruments are mainly metaphorical and this makes it nearly impossible to confirm the
incorporation of instrumental accompaniment/performance during communal gatherings.
Second, the references to singing in Paul’s letters and the interwoven hymn passages in the
gospel accounts indicate that song was an important feature of Christian worship. We cannot,
however, determine exactly what early Christ-following communities were singing (for reasons
that will be discussed below). Finally, the lack of references to synagogue worship in the New
Testament (and the scant information regarding worship in the Jewish synagogue from the first
century from Jewish sources) make it problematic to draw any substantive conclusions about
continuity between the two groups. Therefore, let us return for a moment to the question of
origins.

Perhaps the most convincing argument for the potential origins of early Christian musical
practice comes from Margot Fassler and Peter Jeffery. They too acknowledge the various
cultural influences of antiquity that likely contributed to the formation of early Christian worship
but they place a strong emphasis on the Greco-Roman and Jewish customs of singing at
communal meals. They argue that too little is known about singing in the synagogue (specifically
psalmody) at this time and that Temple music was centered on sacrificial rites and carried out by
the Levitical musicians, neither of which existed in Christ-following congregations of the first
century. Therefore, the connection to Jewish worship practices stems from “ritualized Jewish
banquets celebrated by groups of disciples gathered around an authoritative Rabbi, or teacher, or
at a family-centered meal that still survive today in Jewish homes”. 323 The family-centered meals

323 Margot Fassler and Peter Jeffrey, “Christian Liturgical Music from the Bible to the Renaissance,” Sacred Sound
and Social Change: Liturgical Music in Jewish and Christian Experience, ed. by Lawrence A. Hoffman and Janet
in question may include the weekly Sabbath meal or perhaps the Passover Seder. During these gatherings, people would get together and pray, sing (psalms and perhaps hymns), read scripture, and receive religious instruction. Heather MacKay argues that the locus of Jewish piety during the Second Temple Period may be found in domestic space rather than in the synagogue and she presents a variety of Jewish and non-Jewish sources that refer to domestic Sabbath practices.\footnote{Heather MacKay, 
\textit{Sabbath and Synagogue: The Question of Sabbath Worship in Ancient Judaism}. Religions in the Graeco-Roman World, vol. 122. (Leiden, New York, and Köln: E.J. Brill, 1994), specifically 84 and 104 where MacKay provides pertinent literary examples that describe domestic Sabbath rituals. See Josephus, \textit{Apion} 2.282 where he refers to lighting the lamps on the Sabbath and Persius, \textit{Satires} 5.132-60 where he discusses Jewish Sabbath practices that take place in the home including the lighting of the lamps, meal preparation, and scriptural recitation.}

Furthermore, Fassler and Jeffery assert, “Among the pagans too, common banquets had long provided important occasions for philosophical and religious discussion as well as for religious and secular song”.\footnote{Fassler and Jeffery, “Christian Liturgical Music”, 85.} The subject of communal meals in early Christianity has acquired significant attention over the past several decades and a variety of academic publications investigate the role that communal meals played in social formation and the dissemination of rhetoric.\footnote{For example, see Willi Braun, \textit{Feasting and Social Rhetoric in Luke 14} (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995).} However, a sustained discussion on the role of music in this domain is lacking. Therefore, it is an intriguing proposition that Fassler and Jeffery put forth; the origins of early Christian music may lie somewhere in the realm of communal meal practices of both Jewish and Greco-Roman households. Another proposal, which is directly connected to communal meal practices, comes from Stephen G. Wilson, who offers another interesting analysis; he tries to dissociate early Christian music almost entirely from the synagogue and instead roots Christian musical practice in Greco-Roman voluntary associations, which may also include private Jewish associations such as the Therapeutae, depending on the definitional breadth of voluntary
association.\textsuperscript{327} Therefore, scholars must acknowledge the importance link between Wilson’s argument and that expounded by Fassler and Jeffery since the communal meal was a ritualistic element present in the vast majority of voluntary associations in antiquity.

There are several ways in which one might approach the presentation and examination of the various source materials dealing with the subject of early Christian music. The two most logical methods are a thematic organization or a chronological arrangement. The few scholars that have undertaken this task have opted for both methods but in order to reinforce the argument of a traceable historical trajectory, a chronological approach is best suited to this project. Of course, one must keep in mind the aforementioned methodological issue of text dating. Thus, the following analysis of early Christian literary sources will follow a chronological course that details certain thematic elements and issues along the way. The New Testament contains the earliest literary references to music (generally referring to hymns and psalms) and the latest references that will be examined come from texts that date to the late fourth or early fifth century. This source review will not be exhaustive nor will it document every musical reference in early Christian texts. That project exceeds the scope of this chapter. Rather, the purpose is to illustrate general trends in musical practice, imagery, and philosophy by using a selection of examples that present changes and developments in these categories. Lastly, all translations of Greek texts are my own, unless otherwise noted and the Latin translations are from McKinnon and the Loeb Classical Library series.

Musical References in Christian Literary Source Materials From the 1st century to the 4th

New Testament References

Chronologically, the earliest references to music in the New Testament are found in the Pauline Epistles. Most of Paul’s references to music are contained within his first letter to the Corinthians. There are five key passages from 1 Corinthians, which include references to singing, instruments, and psalms. 1 Cor. 13:1 states that if a person has no love, they are a sounding brass or clanging symbol. This seems to be the only negative reference Paul makes toward instrumental and it also appears to be comparative/metaphorical in nature. Paul references instruments in 1 Cor. 14:7-8 and 1 Cor. 15:51-52 and in these passages, Paul notes the significance of intelligible sounds produced by various instruments as well as the importance of the trumpet as an eschatological signal. In 1 Cor. 14:15 and 14:26-27, Paul mentions singing with the spirit and the mind and perhaps most significantly he describes the gatherings of Christ-followers, where each person joins the congregation and has a psalm. It is impossible to determine exactly what Paul means here by psalm (Biblical psalms? Non-Biblical compositions?). The ambiguity in terms, however, is certainly not limited to Paul’s letter to the Corinthians. Does Paul represent Jewish practice in his usage of terms or can scholars consider this to be a nascent Christian practice? Specific interpretations of meaning in Paul's usage of terms requires further analysis of Pauline scripture that goes beyond the scope of this chapter.

Two of the disputed Pauline Epistles present a similar problem. The most oft quoted passages come from Ephesians 5:18-20 and Colossians 3:16-17. The author of the first

328 Eph. 5:18-20 states, “καὶ μὴ μεθύσκεσθε ὁίνῳ, ἐν ὧν ἐστιν ἁσωτία, ἀλλὰ πληροῦσθε ἐν πνεύματι, λαλοῦντες ἐκαύτοις γαλικές καὶ ἀμειλές καὶ φθοᾷς πνευματικαῖς, ἀδόντες καὶ ψάλλοντες τῇ καρδίᾳ ὑμῶν τῷ κυρίῳ, εὐχαριστοῦντες πάντοτε ὑπὲρ πάντων ἐν ὑμοίῳ τοῦ κυρίου ἕμων Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ τῷ θεῷ καὶ πατρί.”
passage warns participants “not to become drunk with wine, for that is debauchery, but be filled with the spirit, speaking to one another in psalms and hymns and spiritual songs, singing and psalming in your hearts to the Lord”. McKinnon argues that the verb ψάλλειν originally referred to the plucking of a string but by the first century its meaning was slightly altered insofar as it came to mean "to sing" – with or without an instrument.  The three terms – psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs – are vague in the sense that distinctions are difficult to make. Lionel Adey claims that psalms may in fact refer to Biblical Psalms but that it is just as likely that this term refers to individual compositions. Egon Wellesz argues that these three terms referred to different types of ecstatic song, which were likely accompanied by instruments and associated with prophecy. Fassler and Jeffery maintain that these terms are “loose synonyms” that were used almost interchangeably; however, they do distinguish between three types of texts that were sung in this early period: psalms (specifically the 151-155 Biblical Psalms), canticles or odes (such as those found in Exodus 15 or Habakkuk 3), and hymns (non-scriptural compositions). Even if we could determine exactly what Paul meant by these three terms, it is equally challenging to translate the performative component of any musical composition. Wilson suggests that the terms hymn or psalm could encompass both group performance and solo singing at a worship gathering. The evidence does not confirm either claim. Although Paul does say that each member has a hymn, which may indicate that solo performance was a normative component of corporate worship. Although, the responsorial psalmody present in later formal liturgy does not

329 Col. 3:16-17 states, “ὁ λόγος τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἐνοικεῖτο ἐν ὑμῖν πλούσιος ἐν πάσῃ σοφίᾳ· διδάσκοντες καὶ νουθετοῦντες ἑαυτοὺς ὑμᾶς, ὄνειρα πνευματικὰς ἐν χάριτι, ἄνθρωπος ἐν τοῖς καρδίαις ὑμῶν τῷ θεῷ· καὶ πᾶν τι ἐὰν ποιῆτε ἐν λόγῳ ἢ ἐν ἔργῳ, πάντα ἐν ὑμῶν χωρίω Χριστοῦ, εὐχαριστοῦντες τῷ θεῷ πατρὶ δι’ αὐτοῦ.”
appear until the third or fourth century. Lastly, Col. 3:16-17 uses the same phraseology but there is one additional piece of information that is contained within this passage. The author exhorts the Colossians to “teach and advise each other with psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs”. There is a pedagogical function in music, which is clearly defined in this section. Matthew Godley explores the didactic nature of these references in an his work on the instructional nature of song in antiquity. He argues that the songs to which the author of this letter is referring are highly educational in nature and were used as an important tool in knowledge transmission within early Christian assemblies. The importance of the psalms and hymns (whatever the terms refer to) goes beyond petitionary prayer to the divine or an ecstatic experience. They are used as teaching tools directed toward others in the group in order to impart knowledge and express self-understanding. This becomes an important aspect in the relationship between music and identity.

There are two other New Testament texts that require brief mention – the Letter of James and the Book of Revelation. James 5:13 contains a short musical reference but one that is noteworthy for several reasons. The author of the epistle writes, “Is anyone among you suffering? Let him pray. Is anyone cheerful? Let him sing”. First, this passage clearly marks a connection between praying and singing, much like Bradshaw suggests in his work. Second, singing is associated with a joyful disposition. The passage seems to suggest that one ought to funnel their feelings of joy into singing praises to God instead of alternative activities that could be construed as morally corrupt. Of course the text does not explicitly make that connection but

335 Colossians 3:16-17 "ὁ λόγος τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἐνοικείτω ἐν ὑμῖν πλουσίως ἐν πάσῃ σοφίᾳ· διδάσκοντες καὶ νουθετοῦντες ἑαυτοὺς ψαλμοῖς, ὑµνοῖς, ὀδαίς πνευματικαῖς ἐν χάριτι, ἄκουσµεν ἐν ταῖς καρδιαῖς ὑµῶν τῷ θεῷ καὶ πάν ὃ τι ἔαν ποιήτε ἐν λόγῳ ή ἐν ἔργῳ, πάντα ἐν ὀνόµατι κυρίου Ἰησοῦ, εὐχαριστοῦντες τῷ θεῷ πατρὶ δι᾽ αὐτοῦ."
336 Matthew E. Godley, Teaching through song in Antiquity, 271.
337 James 5:13 “Κακοπαθεῖ τις ἐν ὑµῖν; προσευχήσθω· εὐθυµεῖ τις; ψαλλέτω.”
the phrase appears in a section that explains how adherents should respond in certain situations. For example, the author advises his readers to pray if they are sick or pray of they have sinned. Thus, singing is understood as a mechanism to circumvent or avoid those situations in the first place. The passages in Revelation make use of heavenly imagery and likely have less to do with actual worship practices. In fact, McKinnon argues that the musical references in Revelation “owe more to Jewish Temple liturgy or the contemporary imperial court than the simple domestic Christian liturgy of the time”338. Revelation 4:8 contains a short passage that falls under the category of hymn and it describes the four creatures who singing the hymn without rest.339 Interestingly, this concept of continual praise/singing/prayer is taken up by patristic authors such as Clement of Alexandria in an effort to illustrate the ideal Christian adherent.

Lastly, Rev. 5:8-9 340 mentions the creatures and the elders who all possess a cithara and the sing a “new song”. The philosophical conception of the “new song” is Greek in origin and philosophers such as Plato complained that this new song deviated from traditional forms of musical expression. In this case, the author of the Book of Revelation appropriated the idea but the “new song” is viewed as a positive element, which would usher in the coming apocalyptic age. This is a concept that is later appropriated by Clement of Alexandria, who defined his own understanding of the "new song". Thus, the musical references, while metaphysical in nature, have strong connections to Jewish musical imagery, just as McKinnon contends. The instrumental references and the ‘new song’ both act as signaling mechanisms, which are

338 McKinnon, Music in Early Christian Literature, 16-17.
339 Rev. 4:8. “καὶ τὰ τέσσαρα ζώα, ἐν καθ’ ἐν αὐτῶν ἔχον ἀνὰ πτέρυγας ἔξ, κυκλόθεν καὶ ἔσωθεν γέμουσιν ὀφθαλμῶν· καὶ ἀνάπαυσιν οὐκ ἔχουσιν ἡμέρας καὶ νυκτὸς λέγοντες· Ἅγιος ἄγιος ἄγιος κύριος, ὁ θεός, ὁ παντοκράτωρ, ὁ ἦν καὶ ὁ ὢν καὶ ὁ ἐρχόμενος.”
340 Rev. 5:8-9. “καὶ ὅτε ἔλαβεν τὸ βιβλίον, τὰ τέσσαρα ζώα καὶ οἱ εἰκόσι τέσσαρες πρεσβύτεροι ἔπεσαν ἐνώπιον τοῦ ἁρνίου, ἔχοντες έκαστος κιθάραν καὶ φιάλας χρυσᾶς γεμίσσας θυμαμάτων, αἱ εἰσιν αἱ προσευχαὶ τῶν ἄγιων· καὶ ἄφθονος ᾗς καὶ κρίνος λέγοντες· Ἀξίως εἰ λαβεῖν τὸ βιβλίον καὶ ἀνοίξαι τὰς σφραγῖδας αὐτοῦ, ὅτι ἐσφάγης καὶ ἠγόρασας τῷ θεῷ ἐν τῷ αἰματί σου ἓκ πάσης φυλῆς καὶ γλώσσης καὶ λαοῦ καὶ ἔθνους.”
reminiscent of numerous Hebrew Bible passages that employ musical references in the same way.

Christian Literature from the 1st and 2nd Centuries

Ignatius, Bishop of Antioch, wrote seven letters to various Christ-following congregations as he travelled to Rome to face execution. There are several references that provide a glimpse into the way Ignatius conceptualized musical imagery and perhaps how this translated into actual practice; however, there is one passage in particular that is quite informative. In the Letter to the Ephesians, Ignatius writes,

Therefore it is fitting that you should live in obedience to the bishop, as indeed you do. For your most renowned presbytery, worthy of God, is attuned to the bishop as strings to a cithara. Therefore, it is though your concord and harmonious love (διὰ τούτο ἐν τῇ ὁμονοίᾳ ὑμῶν καὶ συμφώνῳ ἀγάπῃ) that Jesus Christ is sung. Now each man become a member of this choir, so that being in concordance (or agreement) of sound and having taken up God’s pitch (σύμφωνοι δόντες ἐν ὁμονοίᾳ χρῶμα θεοῦ λαβόντες), you might sing in one voice through Jesus Christ to the Father, that he might hear you and recognize you through your good deed as members of his son. It is beneficial, then, for you to be in blameless unity so that you might always partake of God.  

This section represents the beginning of what Johannes Quasten refers to as *una voce dicentes*. Ignatius stresses the importance of unity – singing with one voice. This becomes a popular theme in later patristic writings and singing with one voice becomes a metaphor for the desired unity of the entire Christ-following assembly. This also signals the start of a move toward a structured

---

341 Ignatius, *Ephesians* 4, 1-2 Loeb Classical Library, The Apostolic Fathers Vol. 1, Ed. Bart Ehrman (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, reprint 2004). This is my own translation except for the phrase χρῶμα θεοῦ λαβόντες, which Bart Ehrman translates as ‘taking up God’s pitch’. Additionally, it should be noted that the term ‘harmonia’ has a different meaning in antiquity than it does in modern Western classical music, where harmony refers to the simultaneous blending of supporting parts to the melodic line. Flora Levine argues, “For Plato, the intrinsic meaning of music lay, therefore, in the concept of harmonia, the attunement, or proper “fitting together” of opposites” (See Plato’s *Timaeus* 35b-36b). Flora Levine, *Greek Reflections on the Nature of Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 15. M.L. West argues, “The word harmonia literally means ‘tunings, attunements’. It is often translated as mode, a term which implies above all a distinct series of intervals in the scale, though it usually has other connotations”. M.L. West, *Ancient Greek Music*, 177.
liturgy insofar as Ignatius does not invite everyone to "bring a hymn" as Paul does. Rather, Ignatius reinforces the authority of the bishop through an instrumental metaphor – the lyre.\textsuperscript{342} Unfortunately, this does not confirm Ignatius’ personal feelings toward the use of instruments one way or the other. In fact, Smith suggests this passage fails to verify the incorporation of the lyre at worship gatherings; instead he argues that Ignatius used images that were familiar to his readers\textsuperscript{343} and most significantly, these were images that they were familiar with from the “pagan rites of Greco-Roman religious culture”.\textsuperscript{344} However, in the very next sentence Smith states Ignatius’ reference to the lyre may possibly be indicative of its use. The meaning of Ignatius’ statement remains ambiguous but since he strongly emphasizes the necessity of one voice, it seems unlikely that instruments were used in worship. There is no mention of lyre-players in any of his writings and the only other reference to this instrument (or any instrument) in Ignatius comes from the Letter to the Philadelphians where it appears also as a musical metaphor.\textsuperscript{345} Of course it is problematic to make conclusions based on an argument from silence but if instruments were an important component of corporate worship, one can make strong case that Ignatius would have addressed this in his writing.

Justin Martyr, the second century Greek apologist, mentions hymning in several of his works but the references are all quite generic. However, like the aforementioned passage from

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
  \item[342] M.L West provides a history of the lyre in various cultural contexts in \textit{Ancient Greek Music}, 49-70. In addition, see the \textit{Homer Hymn to Hermes} IV 414-435 that describes Apollo's first encounter with lyre and reinforces the notion that this instrument is of divine origin.
  \item[343] There are many literary references in Greco-Roman texts to the lyre but the creation of this instrument, according to Greek mythology originated with Hermes. He made a lyre from a tortoise shell in order to calm Apollo after having stolen his cattle and Apollo was placated after the instrument brought him such delight. See Homer, \textit{Homer Hymns: Hymn 4 to Hermes}, edited and translated by Hugh G. Evelyn-White (London, William Heinemann Ltd. 1914). There are references to the lyre in Greek poetry (Pindar, \textit{Isthmean} 1.2), philosophy (Plato, \textit{Phaedo} 73d), and theatre (Sophocles, \textit{Trachiniae} 640). Therefore, it is likely that the assembly in Antioch would have been familiar with images of the lyre through a variety of different ways.
  \item[344] Smith, \textit{Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity}, 171.
  \item[345] Ignatius, \textit{Letter to the Philadelphians} 1.2, where he writes, “συνεισφύτημεν γάρ ταῖς ἑντολαίς ὡς χορδαῖς κιθάρα” or “For he is in attunement with the commandments, just as the harp is with its strings”.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
the Letter of James, Justin’s *Apology* also talks about hymns and prayer in the same sentence.\textsuperscript{346}

Thus, both forms of worship serve to underscore the element of thanksgiving present in the earliest forms of liturgy. Interestingly, in a later passage, Justin describes the Sunday Eucharist and there is no mention of psalms.\textsuperscript{347} He explains how participants offer “prayer and thanksgiving” and this is precisely the type of ambiguity that Bradshaw sees in the relationship between music and prayer. These overlapping categories are not always clearly defined nor separated from one another.

Tatian, the purported pupil of Justin Martyr, engages in a much more vigorous rhetorical attack against pagan music than his predecessor. In his *Discourse to the Greeks*, Tatian addresses a variety of musical issues. He condemns the Greek singers who move in “unnatural” ways.\textsuperscript{348} He also links certain melodic variations with “licentious” Greek women (specifically Sappho) and claims that Christian women do not fall victim to the same fate when they sing together. These pure maidens “sing of godly things”.\textsuperscript{349} These condemnations bring several issues to the surface. By the middle of the second century, Christian authorities are already using musical practices as an identity marker to define the boundaries between Christian and pagan (in the case of Tatian). The origins of melody and instrument, according to Tatian, are rooted in a variety of geographic and cultural sources. This is an interesting point to consider since music was thought to originate from the divine realm – a conception that was present not only in Greco-Roman discourse but in Jewish cosmological understandings as well. Additionally, this passage also

\textsuperscript{346} Justin Martyr, *Apology* I, 13; PG VI, 345. “ἐκείνω δὲ εὐχαρίστως ὄντας διὰ λόγου ποιμάς καὶ ὑμινος”, which renders “With gratitude, we give thanks to him through prayer and hymns”.

\textsuperscript{347} Justin Martyr, *Apology* I, 67; PG VI, 429.

\textsuperscript{348} Tatian, *Discourse to the Greeks*, 22; PG VI, 857. “Κεχηνέναι πολλῶν ἀδόντων θέλω, καὶ τῷ νεύοντι καὶ κινοµένῳ παρὰ φύσιν οὐ βούλομαι συνδιατίθεσθαι”.

\textsuperscript{349} Tatian, *Discourse to the Greeks*, 33; PG VI, 873. “Καὶ ἡ µὲν Σαπφὼ γύναιοι πορνικόν ἐπωτοµανές, καὶ τὴν ἑαυτῆς ἀσέλγειαν ὄσει πάσαι δὲ αἱ παρ’ ἡµῖν σωφρονοῦσι, καὶ περὶ τὰς ἡλικίας αἱ παρθένοι τὰ κατὰ Θεὸν λαλοῦσιν ἐχθρονήματα τῆς παρ’ ὑµῖν παιδὸς σπουδαιοτέρον.”

138
marks the earliest condemnation of dance, which was a common feature of most cultic rituals in antiquity. These remarks also suggest that the freedom of ecstatic worship in the Pauline churches, which seemingly employed a musical component, was now becoming problematic for various church authorities. This has a clear conceptual relationship with Tatian’s last criticism – music and sexuality. The contrasting presentation of “the Greek lovesick female” and “our chaste women” illustrates a growing concern regarding the relationship between music and female sexuality. Again, this serves to underscore the idealized identity of the Christian woman – chaste, earnest, and godly. He uses the terms “your” and “our” in order to create these social boundaries and stipulate exactly how each group is different. This is a very similar technique that is taken up by the proto-Orthodoxy in the third and fourth centuries in an effort to identify, describe, and root out heretical sects.

The last set of texts that contain significant musical references from this time period include the Sibylline Oracles and the Acts of John. The Sibylline Oracles include a variety of musical references. This collection, which was likely composed by (at least in part) by Jewish authors and then reworked and edited by later Christian authors, includes a hymn to Jesus and an “apocalyptic description of pagan Rome’s destruction”. There were a variety of settings where Romans employed the use of instruments, such as sacrificial ceremonies, wars, and drunken dinner parties. Smith astutely identifies the significance of these passages when he refers to the “medium as a rhetorical device, which says how the Christians did not behave, and lists the instruments that they did not play”. However, does this poetic collection actually reflect the social reality of the period? Did such avoidance of instrumental usage actually exist or was this simply a rhetorical mechanism used to demarcate religious boundaries? McKinnon argues that

351 Smith, Music in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity, 172.
these passages suggest that certain features of Roman religious life, including the use of instruments at sacrificial cultic practices, disappeared and were replaced by a spiritual sacrifice, which "includes sacred song".\textsuperscript{352}

The Acts of John is perhaps the most unique text in this examination of 1\textsuperscript{st} and 2\textsuperscript{nd} century texts. It should be noted that McKinnon dates the text to this period but Smith, contrary to McKinnon, argues that it may have a later date of origin, possibly around the early third century. Provenance and authorship are also disputed among scholars but the text contains a hymn and rare reference to dance. Thus, the pertinent section of the text is worth quoting here.

Before his arrest by the lawless Jews, who had their law from the lawless serpent, he gathered us all together and said: ‘Before I am given over to them, let us sing a hymn to the Father, and go forward to meet what lies ahead’. So he bade us form a circle (or ring), as it were, holding each other’s hands, and standing in the middle he said: Say amen to me. He then began to hymn and to say:

‘Glory to you, Father.’
And we, making a circle, answered him ‘Amen’.
‘Glory be to you, Word, Glory be to you, Grace.’ ‘Amen.’
‘Glory be to you, Spirit, Glory be to you Holy One, Glory be to your Glory.’ ‘Amen.’
‘We praise you Father, we give thanks to you, light in which darkness does not live.’ ‘Amen’.\textsuperscript{353}

This section includes references to aulos-playing and expressive mourning rituals, both of which are later denounced by proto-Orthodox authorities. There is also a reference to dancing later in the hymn, which is a rarity in early Christian literature. W.C. Van Unnik argues that the general

\textsuperscript{352} McKinnon, Music in Early Christian Literature, 25-26.
\textsuperscript{353} Acts of John, Vol 2.1 94-95. For the Greek text, see, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, ed. Max Bonnet (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1990, reprint), 197-198. ‘πρὶν δὲ συλληφθῆναι αὐτὸν ὑπὸ τῶν ἁπάντων καὶ ὑπὸ ἁπάντων ὄρεως νομοθετομένων Ἰουδαίων συνεχαγόν πάντας ἡμᾶς ἔφη. Πρὶν μὲ ἑκείνους παραδοθῆναι ἐμνῆσωμεν τὸν πατέρα καὶ οὔτος ἐξελθομεν ἐπὶ τὸ προκείμενον. Κελευσάς οὖν ἡμίν δῆσεν γύρον ποιῆσαι, ἀποκρατοῦντος τὰς ἀλλήλων χέιρας, ἐν μέσῳ δὲ αὐτὸς γενόμενος, ἔλεγεν. Τὸ ἁμὴν ἐπακούετε μοι. Ἡρῴτο τὸν ὑπὸν ἑμνησώμεν καὶ λέγειν. Δόξα σοι πάτερ. Καὶ ἡμῖν κυκλεύσοντες ἐπηκοούμεν αὐτῷ τὸ ἁμὴν. Δόξα σοι λόγε, δόξα σοι χάρις. Ἁμὴ. Δόξα σοι τὸ πνεῦμα, δόξα σοι ἄγιο, δόξα σοι τῇ δόξῃ. Ἁμὴν. Αἰνοῦμεν σε πάτερ εὐχαριστοῦμεν σοι φῶς ἐν ὑ ὁ σκότος οὐκ οἰκεῖ. Ἁμὴν.’ This translation is my own.
“phraseology is so peculiar and has such a Gnostic ring.” The classification of the text as Gnostic is problematic for a variety of reasons but Van Unnik questions the potential cultural genealogy of the dance element and both he and Smith conclude that responsorial hymns accompanied dance during various Jewish ritual practices. The text of the hymn itself shares no similarity with Hebrew Bible psalms, apart from the amen acclamations, however, there are other examples of Jewish practice that reference dancing. The quoted section in chapter 2 from Philo’s commentary on the Therapeutae mentions dancing as part of the all-night vigil that community inhabitants took part in, along with the choral singing. The Roman presbyter Novatian, who lived in the third century, also references dancing in connection with the Jewish tradition in his treatise De spectaculis but argues this is not a valid basis for Christians to participate in other practices such as dancing in the theatre. He argues, “That David led dancing in the sight of God is no excuse for the Christian faithful to sit in the theatre, for he did not distort his limbs in obscene gestures while dancing to a tale of Grecian lust”.

Van Unnik cites two other sources that support a claim of Jewish origin with respect to ring-dances in early Christian ritual, including a Midrashic passage on the Song of Songs that mentions an eschatological dance and a reference found in a homily by Melito of Sardis that refers to a dance performed during the Passion. It is difficult to determine the frequency of such dances, however, Smith contends that “ring-dances are ancient traditional elements in Near-Eastern culture, and while this episode is merely a legendary event in an apocryphal book, there

356 Novatian, De spectaculis, III, 2-3; PL IV, 782 (McKinnon’s translation, 47). “Et quod Davd in conspectu Dei choros egit nihil adjuvat in theatro sedentes Christianos fideles: nulla enim obscenis motibus membra distorquens desaltavit greacae libidinis fabulam.”
is no reason to doubt that its basic elements – a ring-dance with responsive song (and perhaps pipe-playing) – are drawn from real life”. Therefore, it is not outside the realm of possibility that Jesus and his disciples may have performed a dance of this nature. In addition, later references to dancing, which were mainly negative due to a connection between dance and overt sexuality, may have influenced redaction and editorial omissions in later copies of texts. There is, of course, no clear evidence to support this claim but again, the possibility exists that in the earliest gatherings of the Christ-following assemblies, ring-dances may have been performed and texts editors and copyists may have omitted such references in later reproductions.

Musical References in Christian Literature from the 3rd Century

This section discusses the works and ideas of several patristic authorities in the early church. There are some important recurrent themes that emerge during the third century that are foreshadowed to a certain extent in previous literature. By this time, however, church authorities become more particular in the way they define a Christian identity and music plays a key role in that type of articulation. While there are numerous references to singing and instrumental usage in literary sources, the main focus of this section will concentrate on two particular individuals. Clement of Alexandria and Tertullian are both important patristic figures that wrote extensively on Christian practice. While Clement’s musical references are perhaps more numerous than Tertullian, both sources provide a glimpse into the developing Christian ideology.
on music and liturgy. Clement is clearly more sympathetic toward the Greek heritage of musical thought but both men articulate their conception of correct and incorrect musical practices, which often involves a dichotomous depiction of "pagan versus Christian". This oppositional approach is the result of an extensive education in rhetoric but it also serves to portray Christianity as the good and Greco-Romans as bad. This rhetorical form of argumentation can be a very effective tool in recruitment practices and this idea will be taken up in chapter four. The last point to note is that Clement and Tertullian are, of course, not the only third century patristic sources that write about music and musical practices. Thus, it is necessary to provide a rationale for limiting a discussion on early Christian music in the third century to these two sources. First, these authors are the most prolific writers on the subject of music; therefore, they provide the most literary data available to scholars. Second, despite differences in perspective and interpretation, Clement and Tertullian provide a fairly standard representation of Christian thought on music from this period. Other patristic sources such as Origen, Novatian, and Cyprian all share an increasingly standardized negativity toward instruments and a strong oppositional stance on Greco-Roman musical practices.

**Case Study #1: Clement of Alexandria**

The most important source of information on music from the third century is Clement of Alexandria. Despite the fact that Clement never formulated an explicit treatise on music theory or the philosophy of music, he incorporated musical allegory into many of his theological assertions and his behavioural exhortations include musical directives. Musical imagery permeates much of Clement’s thought and this can be attributed in part to his thoroughly Greek education. Clement was certainly familiar with the works of Pythagoras, who wrote substantial
volumes on harmony, the mathematical nature of intervals and melody, pitch, and the aesthetic qualities of certain musical intervals. Clement propagated a "New Song" that replaced or superseded the traditional Greek musical mythology. In other words, Clement placed a high value on Greek concepts of harmony and unity, which naturally extended to musical practice and ritual, both allegorically and in actual practice. His interpretation, however, was quite different from the Greeks insofar as he used notions of harmony and unity to refer to the ideal Christian community in God.

Clement is an interesting figure to examine in the early Christian church with regard to music for several reasons. First, Clement is one of the only early church authorities that wrote at length about music and “Christianity” in the early third centuries. Music is a theme that pervades his theological doctrine and his articulation of proper Christian etiquette and social conduct. He supported musical practice in what he deemed to be a ritualized and sacred environment. Second, Clement made a clear distinction between the appropriate type of music one could practice or participate in and other forms of musical expression that was not appropriate. He focused this critique mainly on elements of musical theory, ritual setting and behaviours that he associated with those elements. For example, Clement only approved of certain melodies or rhythms, which did not provoke acts that he connected to Greek cultic or other pagan practices. Third, Clement favoured the use of musical allegories to articulate and explain his theological interpretations. He described the body as an instrument of worship; specifically a superior instrument as compared to other musical instruments such as the flute or lyre. Therefore, he viewed musical practice as an integral component of his Christian identity but of course there were limitations to the use and practice of music because other groups, specifically Greco-Romans, used certain musical forms

362 Stapert, A New Song, 50-53.
that did not parallel Clement’s own conceptions of appropriate musical expression.

According to Clement, traditional Greek musical mythology is classified as a tool of deception and trickery used to fool and corrupt human life and destroy the world. Such implements “possess a type of artful sorcery”, which is used in “celebrating orgies, deifying misfortune, leading men by idols” and “through their songs and incantations to bind to the worst servitude the noble freedom of those who lived as free citizens under heaven”. Clement also speaks about the importance of harmony and unity over dissonance and he uses allegorical references to music. Humans themselves are instruments of this highest order that ought to scorn other earthly instruments such as the cithara and the lyre. Humankind is “a cithara because of harmony (or concordance), the aulos because of Spirit, and a temple because of the Word, so that the first might sound, the second might breathe and the third might contain the lord”. He talks about the descendants of David, who was also a citharist, as having access to this music. In fact, he states that David used music to have an opposing effect from the Greeks insofar as David’s music “encouraged people to truth and dissuaded them from idolatry; indeed, he was so far from singing hymns to demons that they were truly driven out (banished) by his music. Therefore, when Saul was plagued, he healed him only through singing”. Clement states that God fashioned man as a beautiful and harmonious instrument after his own image. This is what he refers to as the New Song and this image is encompassed in the Word. This passage is certainly allegorical but it also seems to have practical or functional implications insofar as music was

---

363 Clement, *Protrepticus*. 1, 2, 1-4; PG VIII, 56-57. “ἀπατηλοὶ γεγονέναι, προσχήματε μουσικῆς λυμνάμενοι τὸν βίον, ἐντέχνῳ τυί γοητεία δαιμονώντες εἰς διαφθοράς, ὃδεις ὁργαίζοντες, πενθὴ ἐκθειάζοντες, τοὺς ανθρώπους ἐπὶ τὰ εἰδώλα χειραγωγῆσαι πρῶτοι... τὴν καλὴν ὀντως ἐλευθερίαν τῶν ὑπ’ οὐρανὸν πεπολιτευμένων ὤδας καὶ ἔπωδας ἐσχάτῃ δουλείᾳ καταζεύξαντες.”

364 Clement, *Protrepticus*. 1, 5, 3-5; PG VIII, 60. “Σὺ γὰρ ἐὰν κιθάρα καὶ αὐλός καὶ ναὸς ἐμὸς κιθάρα διὰ τὴν ἀρμονιαν αὐλὸς διὰ τὸ Πνεῦμα, ναὸς διὰ τὸν Λόγον, ἵνα μὲν χρῆς τὸ ὅ δὲ εἰμπνέη, ὅ δὲ χρόης τὸν Κύριον.

365 Clement, *Protrepticus*. 1, 5, 6-7; PG VIII, 60. “Καὶ μὴν ὁ Δαβὶδ, ὁ βασιλεὺς, ὁ κιθαριστὴς οὐ μικρὰ πρόσθεν ἐμνήσθημεν, ὃς προάπτετο τὸν κυρίων ἀπέτρεπε δὲ εἰδώλων πολλῶν γε ἐδει ψυχῆν αὐτῶν τοὺς δαίμονας, ἀληθείᾳ πρὸς αὐτοῦ διοικομένους μουσικῆ, ἢ τῷ Σαοῦλ ἐνεργουμένω ἐκείνος ἄδικον μόνον, αὐτὸν ἱάσατο”.
seen by Clement to be a form of divine communication and could therefore be used toward good or evil ends. Clement also condemns the use of cymbals and tympanis because he viewed them as symbols of initiation into the rites of Demeter, which of course constituted idolatry.\(^{366}\)

Percussive instruments are not the only musical elements deemed intolerable. Clement also considered certain melodic modes and formulations to be outside the acceptable boundaries of musical practice. He argued, in what is perhaps one of the most well-known musical quotations in early Christianity, “chromatic harmonies are therefore to be abandoned to immodest revels, and to florid and meretricious music”.\(^{367}\) Quasten argues that Clement, like many other early church fathers, understood unity and harmony to stand in direct opposition to duality and disharmony. This conceptualization of unity was meant to emphasize the sense of community on earth but also the unity one finds in salvation with God. Quasten illustrates how Clement used this concept of the συμφωνία to articulate the ideal Christian community.\(^{368}\) Christians were supposed to sing with one voice to unite them all as one community in God but also to increase the power and strength of their worship. One voice served to solidify their faith and to create strong social bonds and a unified identity. This relates directly to Clement’s dislike of dissonant melodies and chromatic passages. Quasten argues that Clement disapproved of “all chromatic music with its colourful harmonies”.\(^{369}\) Dissonant chords, for Clement, represented the evil in the good/evil duality and he clearly thought that these types of melodies possessed the power to attract or draw Christians toward pagan practices and away from the unified and singular voice of Christianity. Chromatic intervals also seemed to have the power to effect

\(^{366}\) See Clement, *Protrepticus* II, 15, 3; PG VIII, 76. “Ἐκ τυμπάνου ἔφαγον, ἐκ κυμβάλου ἔπιον…ταῦτα οὐχ ὅρις τὰ σύμβολα;”. “I have eaten from the tympanum, I have drunk form the cymbals...Are these symbols not an insult?”

\(^{367}\) Clement, *Paedegogus* II, 4; PG VIII, 445. “Καταλειπτέον οὖν τὰς χρωματικὰς ἁρμονίας τὰς ἁχρώμοις παροινίαις καὶ τῇ ἀνθρωφορίᾳ καὶ ἐταιρούσῃ μουσικῇ”.


people in a way that could be deemed emotional and persuasive.

Clement uses allegory frequently in his writings and John Ferguson argues that Clement does not necessarily use allegorical meaning to undermine the literal meaning. He provides an example from the beginning of *The Exhortation*, where the idea of symphony and harmony is a recurring theme. These concepts of harmony and proportion refer to order and organization, which Clement thought were the result of God’s work. McKinnon cites two passages on instrumental use that clearly illustrate a conflict within Clement’s thought. In *Paedagogus*, Clement quotes Psalm 150 but replaces all the instrumental references with allegorical ones. For example, Clement quotes the line ‘praise him on the cithara’ but suggests a different interpretation. He states that the cithara should in fact be understood as one’s mouth whereby the Holy Spirit actively plays through it. Clement is using this type of allegorical transposition in order to take concepts and textual references that are familiar to early Christians, who know the Hebrew Bible, and re-cast them in his particular Christian interpretation. One could also argue that this reinterpretation is not a transposition at all but rather a supersession of Judaic musical usage. In other words, the destruction of the Temple has left a space for liturgical and textual reinterpretation because those practices are no longer required to praise God and demonstrate devotion. These musical implements have become associated with dead practices of Jewish Temple and the idolatrous rituals of the pagans. Charles Cosgrove argues that Clement’s understanding of music and use of musical metaphors ought to be limited to what he classifies as Clement’s actual understanding of music. But he also remarks, “as we shall see, actual music includes both music in the ordinary sense (physical musical sounds) and heavenly music, a non-

---

371 See Clement, *Paedagogus* II, 4; PG VIII, 441. For example, “Αἰνεῖτε αὐτῶν ἐν κοιμήλαξις ἀλαλημοῦ κοιμήλαξ τοῦ στομάτος τῆς γλώττας λέγει, ἢ τοῖς κρουμένοις ἐπηχεῖ χέλεσσ” or “Praise him on the banging cymbals, as he calls the tongue the cymbal of the mouth, which makes a sound as the lips move”. 

147
literal but apparently real kind of music for Clement”.372

Clement also discusses the ritual settings where music may or may not be appropriate. One of the most famous passages about music in Clement’s writings can be found in the *Paedagogus* II, 4, where Clement outlines acceptable behaviour for a Christian attending banquets and dinner parties. “The irregular movements of the auloi, psalteries, choruses, dances, Egyptian clappers and other such playthings become altogether indecent and uncouth, especially when joined by beating cymbals and tympana and accompanied by the noisy instruments of deception”.373 Clement argues that these instruments ought to be banished from the symposium because they encourage drunkenness, promiscuity and other behaviours, which are deemed to be wicked. The banquet hall is an important venue for Clement because as Cosgrove argues, table manners and proper etiquette are inextricably tied to Clement’s conception of morals and ethics. Music is related to appropriate table behaviour in two ways. First, Cosgrove notes that music had a pedagogical function because Clement compared proper table etiquette to the proper attunement to music.374 The other conceptual link that music has to the banquet is found in the relationship between rational and irrational behaviours. In other words, there is proper music for the rational human being and a person ought not to take part in musical practice that opposes this ideal rationality. For Clement, music is a divine medium, which one can either utilize in a way that adheres to his tenets of Christianity or to the pagan practices of the Greek cults. Music is in no way a form of entertainment. In fact, it is construed almost as a duty; but it is a duty that Christians should consider themselves fortunate to have. Solemn and slow musical compositions

---

372 Cosgrove, “Clement of Alexandria” 256.
373 Clement, *Paedagogus* II, 4: PG VIII, 440 (McKinnon’s translation, 32). “Εἰ δὲ ἐν αὐλοῖς καὶ ψαλτηρίοις, καὶ χοροῖς, καὶ ὀρχήμασι, καὶ κρότοις Αἰγυπτίων, καὶ τουταίτας ραθμιάς ἀλλοι ἄτακτοις, καὶ ἀπερεπτές καὶ ἀπαίδευτοι χοιμιδὴ γίγνοντο ἄν, χυμβάλοις καὶ τυμπάνοις ἔχοισομεν, καὶ τοῖς τῆς ἀπάτης ὀργάνοις περιψοφόμενοι”.
374 Cosgrove, “Clement of Alexandria”, 259.
or recitations are controlled and serious expressions of faith and forms of praise, which are easily corruptible if practiced in a way that steps outside of the boundaries that Clement creates.

In the *Stromata*, Clement writes about the role of the sacred song in Christian life. He states, “So then, all (our) life, we celebrate a feast persuaded that God is everywhere and in everything; we plough the fields while praising [God], we sail while singing, and at every other public event we busy ourselves skillfully”. This passage is indicative of the all-pervasiveness of musical practice in antiquity and more specifically in Clement’s Alexandria. Praise through song was ideally present in all aspects of daily, whether at the dinner table or working the land. This is evident from Clement’s own background; he certainly gave credence to Greek musical philosophy but supplanted their content with his own.

Clement recognized the benefit of maintaining some connection with other contemporary practices within the Greek cultic milieu. Rodney Stark has argued that the success of Christianity was in part due to a balance between novel and traditional cultural elements. Christianity in the second and third centuries was slowly gaining in numbers and expanding across the Roman Empire and this was the period where liturgical practices and doctrinal precedents were being set before the political institutionalization of Christianity as the state religion. Thus during this period, new religious and social practices were being absorbed into liturgical ritual but Stark argues that early Christianity was able to find equilibrium between new or unfamiliar practices and old or familiar ones. For example, the Greeks often played instruments and sung songs at banquets and at the symposia. Clement did not approve of certain components of this practice but

---

375 Clement, *Stromata* VII, vii, 35; PG IX, 452. “Πάντα τοίνυν τὸν βίον ἐωρτήν ἐγγονές, πάντη πάντοθεν παρεῖναι τὸν Θείν πεπεισμένοι, γεωργοῦμεν ἁίνοντες, πλέομεν ὑμνοῦντες, κατὰ τὴν ἄλλην πολιτείαν ἐντέχνος ἀναστεφόμεθα.”

in the *Stromata* he wrote that God's “sacrifices are straightaway both prayers and praise, (as opposed to) the Scriptures before the banquet, psalms and hymns at the banquet and before going to bed, but also prayers again during the night”.\(^{377}\) This passage illustrates precisely what Stark argues. The common practice of singing at banquets is still accepted by Clement; in fact, it is encouraged. Yet, the context shifts insofar as the content of the songs and the purpose of singing is quite different. Interestingly, Clement does not mention the use of melody in the passage, which he is usually apt to do. He does not outline the types of melodic forms that are suitable here and it is possible that a more lively harmonic line might be tolerable as long as the enthusiasm of the singer is directed toward the goal of praise and not for personal enjoyment or pleasure. This was an important distinction among early Christian authorities and was often construed as one of the major differences between Christian and Greco-Roman song (for example, praise versus pleasure).

**Case Study #2: Tertullian**

Tertullian, the early Christian apologist from Carthage, was a prolific writer and much of his work is characterized by a strong polemical tone, which is directed toward those that do not practice his idealized form of Christianity. His works contain several references to hymns and psalms and Tertullian was one of the earliest church authorities to articulate a strong polemic against the use of music instruments. McKinnon claims that it is not surprising that Tertullian did not write an entire treatise on music, however, owing to his opinion on Greek education.\(^{378}\) The remarks he does make, however, are quite useful in terms of understanding how musical practice

\(^{377}\) Clement, *Stromata* VII, xvi, 102; PG IX, 469. “Αὐτίκα θυσίαι μὲν αὕτῳ, εὐχαὶ τε καὶ αἶνοι, καὶ αἰ πρὸ τῆς ἐστίασεως ἐνευξίσας τὸν Πραφὼν ψαλοῖ δὲ καὶ ὶμνοι παρὰ τὴν ἐστίασιν, πρὸ τε τῆς κοινῆς, ἀλλὰ καὶ νύχτωρ εὐχαὶ πάλιν.”

plays a role in the formulation of Tertullian’s Christian identity. There are three general thematic categories in which he talks about music and musical practice: first, he denounces the musical rituals of the Greeks and he links their instruments to the theatre, promiscuity, effeminacy, and idolatry. Second, he outlines the ways in which hymns and psalms ought to be performed, both in corporate and domestic worship. Third, he also condemns the musical renderings of the so-called heretics Marcion and Valentinus. This last category will be taken up in chapter five in a discussion on music and heresy; however, the passages that fall under the first two categories will be examined in the following section.

Tertullian makes several disparaging remarks about the Greeks and their practices in several of his works but the two texts that contain musical references include *Ad nationes* and *De Spectaulis*. In *Ad nationes*, Tertullian states, “Even in your amusements, after all, you do not award the crown as prize to the tibia or cithara, but rather to the performer who wields the tibia or cithara with beguiling skill”. However, there is more depth to this statement than McKinnon acknowledges. He translates the word *suauitatis* as beguiling, but the term possesses a variety of other connotations that likely apply in this situation including charming, deceiving, and misleading. Thus, if this is what Tertullian had in mind, he understood these instruments and their players to be engaging in something akin to magic, which parallels Clement’s claims about the intent of Greco-Roman instrumental performance. Clement describes Orpheus as a "deceiver" who was "possessed by a

---


kind of artful sorcery." Tertullian’s statement, in a similar way, implies that the player of the instrument is deceitful in some way and that the music he or she plays has some sort of charming and harmful power over the audience.

The musical references in De spectaculis, however, are slightly different in content. There are two passages that tie Greco-Roman music to theatre, which all reference musical instruments. The first example connects the theatre and the athletic games and Tertullian argues, “The path to the theatre is from temples and the altars, from that miserable mess of incense and blood, to the tune of flutes and trumpets; and the masters of ceremonies are those two all-polluted adjuncts of funeral and sacrifice, the undertaker and the soothsayer.” Thus, the theatre is synonymous with idolatry and instrumental usage in these contexts serves to highlight such elements. In addition, Quasten contends that Tertullian did not approve of excessive displays of sorrow at pagan funerals and the subsequent instrumental accompaniment that went with it. A second passage from De spectaculis refers to the immodesty of the theatre, which Tertullian attributes to dance and sexual immorality. Stapert claims that Tertullian’s denunciation of the theatre and theatre music is directly associated with it’s "seductive power of pleasure". Pleasure is a powerful emotion, according to Stapert’s interpretation, because it can cloud human judgment and therefore Tertullian viewed music for pleasure as a negative and hedonistic act.

---

381 Clement of Alexandria, Protrepticus I, 2, 4-1; PG VIII, 56-57. See n. 307 for Greek text.
383 Quasten, Music & Worship, 165. Quasten also points to the passage in De corona (xi, 3-4) where Tertullian declares that it is unfitting for a dead Christian to be disturbed by a trumpeter when the expectation is a divine trumpeter from the angelic realm. Quasten argues that the pagans wished to placate the spirits and interestingly, Tertullian does not deny this potentiality but instead renders the trumpet harmful to the dead because it is simply a disturbance.
384 See Tertullian De spectaculis, X, 8-9; PL I, 643.
385 Stapert, A New Song, 67-70.
The second category of musical references in Tertullian’s works articulate the type of musical engagements that are appropriate for a member of the Christian assembly. The one that is perhaps most often quoted comes from the *Apologeticum* and in this text Tertullian describes the agape meal that takes place within the community. He outlines the proper etiquette at such gatherings, which includes prayer, a communal meal, washing one’s hands, lighting lamps, and singing. However, Tertullian’s description of the singing at this meal is perhaps most informative. He states, “After water for the hands come the lights; and then each, from what he knows of the Holy Scriptures, or from his own heart (*proprio ingenio*), is called before the rest to sing to God; so that is a test of how much he has drunk.”

Smith argues that the "sacred scriptures" likely refers to psalms form the Book of Psalms or perhaps other Hebrew Bible texts such as the Song of the Sea. He also contends that this phrase may have encompassed some New Testament lyrical texts such as the Lucan canticles. There is no textual evidence to support this last claim, however, so it remains unclear how Smith arrives at this conclusion. Bradshaw notes the similarities in Tertullian’s description of lamp lighting and singing to the pre-festal meals of the Therapeutae. The main point to note, however, is that Tertullian’s account includes a reference to individual compositions. This is significant because non-scriptural compositions become a contentious issue by the middle of the third century but we can conclude based on this passage that during Tertullian’s lifetime (at least in Carthage), this practice was still accepted. This marks a transitional period from fluid musical practice at communal gatherings described in the Pauline epistles toward a more quasi- or loosely-structured liturgical formula. In other words,

---


certain elements have now become standardized practice (i.e. not reclining at the table during the meal) but there is still some freedom of expression for certain types of individualized worship within the context of musical performance.

There are several other (and perhaps more generic) references to singing hymns and psalms but there are two final passages that are worthy of note. The first comes from Tertullian’s treatise *Ad uxorem* and in this commentary on marriage, he declares, “Psalms and hymns sound between the two of them and they challenge each other to see who sings better to the Lord”. Singing hymns and psalms within the household serves to reinforce the marital bond and unify the couple in their religious commitment. In other words, domestic worship and specifically singing in the home, has the dualistic purpose of unifying the couple and pleasing God. Tertullian’s remark about ‘challenging one another’ is also interesting because in some sense this negates the unifying factor of communal worship in the home. Tertullian has already denounced the virtuoso performer (who plays Greco-Roman athletic competitions) so it is an odd phrase to employ within this context. The last passage that contains an important musical reference does not pertain to domestic worship but rather to music within a communal Sunday worship service. Tertullian describes a “favoured sister” who possesses special spiritual gifts. She is able to communicate directly with the divine realm through an ecstatic experience and Tertullian states, “The material for her visions is supplied as the scriptures are read, psalms are sung, the homily delivered and prayers are offered”. At first glance, the musical significance of this passage may be easily missed and McKinnon’s brief commentary does not address this

389 See *De oratione* XXVII; PL I, 1194 and XXVII, 4; PL I, 1194-95, which also make a connection between psalms and prayer.

390 Tertullian, *Ad uxorem* II, VIII, 8-9; PL I, 1304 (McKinnon’s translation, 44). “Sonant inter duos coniuges psalmi et hymni et mutuo provocant, quis melius deo suo cantet”.

391 Tertullian, *De anima* IX, 4; PL II, 660 (McKinnon’s translation, 45). "Jam vero, prout Scripturae leguntur, aut Psalmi canuntur, aut adlocutiones proferuntur, aut petitiones delegantur, ita inde materiae visionibus subministrantur."
issue. The connection between music and prophecy is an important one to consider but in the meantime it is significant to note the causal link that Tertullian draws between the psalms and ecstatic experience. Singing plays a key role in connecting with the divine in this context and both words and melody contribute to the induction of such a state.

**Christian Music in the 4th & 5th Centuries: Specificity in Formulation**

The preceding discussion of source material in early Christian thought on music and musical practice from the first three centuries demonstrates a certain progression from informal and fluid ideas on musical ritual toward a more restricted approach to musical incorporation. The discourse becomes increasingly explicit on permitted and forbidden forms of musical expression. These changes are the result of a growing need for self-definition by church authorities, in an effort to reinforce developing power structures and church hierarchies but also to create a socio-religious gap between themselves and others, specifically Jews and Greco-Romans. Music functions in a variety of different ways that emphasize the significance of proper Christian character and several literary sources articulate this character through musical images and commentary on ritual. In other words, musical expression that encourages overt sexuality, drunkenness, dancing, and eventually female participation, is denounced with such negativity, that one must question why any musical elements were incorporated into worship practices at all. However, chapter two has already demonstrated the ubiquitous nature of melody and song in the Greco-Roman world and this chapter has described the significant way in which music was incorporated into early Christian gatherings. Additionally, Foley’s commentary on the nature of the auditory environment presented in chapter one demonstrates that the question of complete musical prohibition is likely an anachronism because music as such was understood in very
different terms.

The following discussion on literary sources will provide a sampling of musical references by numerous authors from this period that touch upon the growing list of theological and moral issues that preoccupied Christian authorities from the fourth and early fifth centuries. A focus on sexual restraint and modesty, for example, has already been alluded to in earlier works. Yet, the topic still permeates fourth century Christian discourse. In some sense, a renewed focus on this subject may be connected to the development of Christian monasticism and a growing concern with the role of women in the church. Thus, the connection between music and women/sexuality is where this analysis of literary sources shall begin.

The first source from the fourth century that warrants examination is from Arnobius, also a church official from North Africa. In his treatise, *Adversus nationes*, he engages in a “vitriolic attack” against musical practices of the pagans. Arnobius links singing, dancing, and instrumental performance with sexual immorality when he writes,

> Was it for this that he sent souls, that as members of a holy and dignified race they practice here the arts of music and piping, that in blowing on the tibia they puff out their cheeks, that they lead obscene songs, that they raise a great din with the clapping of scabella; under the influence of which a multitude of other lascivious souls abandon themselves to bizarre movement of the body, dancing and singing, forming rings of dancers, and ultimately raising their buttocks, and hips to sway with the rippling motion of their loins? Was it for this that he sent souls, that in men they become male prostitutes, and in women harlots, sambucists and harpists?

The ritualistic elements and behaviours he describes are akin to licentiousness and Arnobius’ condemnation of these practices is far from subtle. It is quite extraordinary, however, that he

---

associates this unacceptable overt sexuality with both men and women since patristic sources often portrayed female adherents as sexual and immoral gossip-mongers whose participation in communal worship only served to distract the male members of the assembly. These so-called obscene songs are likely Greco-Roman secular songs although Arnobius is not entirely clear.394

There are many passages from the literary sources of this period that denounce the participation of women in liturgical singing and Quasten argues that this is somewhat divergent from normative Greco-Roman and religious practices of antiquity. He points out that there are numerous examples of female choruses in the Greco-Roman world and also within first and second Temple Judaism. The evidence for the former is quite substantial, however, support for the latter is less convincing.395 Yet, this negative attitude toward female singers is only a later development in early Christianity that starts to appear at this time. Source materials from the first two centuries do not reveal much about female singers; although, according to the Pauline references examined earlier, each member of the congregation brought a hymn, psalm, or spiritual song. Therefore, it does not appear as though women were purposefully excluded from singing at communal worship gatherings. In addition, the exclusion of women would “have stood in sharp contrast to the idea of the communion of souls which Ignatius of Antioch had

---

394 Cyprian, the third century bishop of Carthage, a similar argument in De habitu virginum XI; PL IV, 449-450. "Nam et vocem Deus homini dedit, et tamen non sunt ideireo amatoria cantanda nec turpia" or “God gave man a voice, yet amorous and indecent songs ought not to be sung” (McKinnon's translation, 49). Cyprian provides no examples of what may constitute an “amorous or indecent song” but it presumably refers to Greco-Roman melodies and perhaps the poetic writings of Sappho and other Greek poets that the early church fathers condemned. This may also be a reference to theatre music, which as we have already seen, was linked to licentiousness in many patristic writings.

395 Quasten, Music & Worship, 75-77. The only literary support for the prominence of female participation in communal singing in ancient Judaism comes from Exodus where Miriam leads the choir after their escape from slavery. Quasten also cites the Therapeutae as an example but there is a lengthy chronological gap between these two cases. In addition, two citations do not provide a convincing argument that female choruses were common. In fact, Eric Werner argues precisely the opposite in The Sacred Bridge (50), claiming that Paul’s so-called injunction against women speaking in the church (1 Cor. 14:33b-35) actually stemmed from Jewish tradition. Most modern scholars would argue that this Pauline reference is a later interpolation but regardless, Werner counters Quasten’s earlier claim.
emphasized so strongly". In fact, Isidore of Pelusium, a priest from Alexandria who wrote in the late fourth and early fifth centuries, corroborates the earlier acceptance of female singing in the church. He argues that the apostles originally allowed women to singing psalms in the church in order to combat idle chatter but women abused this privilege. He contends that they employed these melodies to arouse passion and sing for their own enjoyment instead of singing in a solemn and restrained manner. Isidore even states that female psalm singing is no better than theatre music. Therefore, he asserts that women and song possess some inherent sexual link that is both distracting to male adherents but also displeasing to God. However, it should be noted that these comments do not reflect historical memories as such; rather, they can be understood as post-hoc rationalizations that explain why women no longer sing in the church. This discourse echoes typical misogynist views of the later church. Similarly, Cyril of Jerusalem, a fourth century bishop, professes an analogous prohibition on female singing. In his description of the placement of participants in the church, he remarks that both virgins and married women should sing psalms very quietly, but only through slight movement of the lips. He states their voices should not be heard.

Not all church fathers, however, took the pseudo-Pauline injunction against the female voice in worship. One counter-example comes from the fourth-century bishop of Milan, Ambrose, who argued, “The apostle admonishes women to be silent in the church, yet they do

---

396 Quasten, Music & Worship, 77.
397 Isidore of Pelusium, Epistle I, 90; PG LXXVIII, 244. "Τὰς ἐν ἐκκλησίας φλυαρίας καταπαῦσαι βουλόμενοι οἱ τοῦ Κυρίου ἀπόστολοι, καὶ τῆς ἡμῶν παιδευταὶ καταστάσεως, ψάλλειν ἐν αὐτάς τὰς γυναικῶν συνετῶς συνεχόρθησαν. Ἀλλὰ πάντα εἰς του ναταντίον ἐπράχῃ τὰ θεοφόρα διδάγαμα καὶ τοῦτο εἰς ἔκλεισιν καὶ ἀμαρτίας υπόθεσιν τοῖς πλείσις γέγονε. Καὶ κατάνυξιν μὲν ἐκ τοῦ θείου ἡμῶν οὐχ ὑπομένουσι, τῇ δὲ τοῦ μέλους ἡδύτητι ἐκ ἐρεθισμὸν παθητικῶν χρώμενοι, οὐδὲν αὐτὴν ἔχειν πλέον τῶν ἑπί σκηνῆς ἁμαρτίας λογίζονται. Χρή τοίνυν, εἰ μέλλομεν τὸ τῷ θεῷ ἁρέσκον ἔχειν, καὶ τὸ κοινῇ συμφέρον ποιεῖν, παύειν ταύτας καὶ τῆς ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ ὁδής." 398 Cyril of Jerusalem, Procatechesis XIV; PG XXXIII, 356. "Καὶ ὁ σύλλογος πάλιν ὁ παρθενικὸς οὐτοὶ συνειλέχθω ἢ ψάλλων ἢ ἀναγινώσκων ἡμισε, ὥστε λαλεῖν μὲν τὰ χείλη, μὴ ἀκούειν δὲ τὰ ἄλλα τρία ὅτα. γυναικὶ γὰρ λαλῶν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ οὐκ ἐπιτρέπει. Καὶ ή ἐγγαμως δὲ ὁμοίως μιμεῖσθο, καὶ προσευχῆσθο καὶ τὰ χείλη κυνεῖσθο, φονὴ δὲ μὴ ἀκουέσθω."
well to join in a psalm; this is gratifying for all ages and fitting for both sexes...even women sing psalms with wifely decency, and girls sing a hymn to God with sweet and supple voice while maintaining decorum and suffering no lapse of modesty.” Therefore, despite a pervasive negative stance on female singing during worship, not all church authorities held this viewpoint. Moreover, prohibitions on female singing also became tied up with a proto-Orthodox attack on gnostic assemblies, many of whom did not have rules against female participation in communal worship. The role of women and song with respect to classifications of heresy will be elaborated upon in chapter five.

The remaining recurrent issues pertaining to music that appear in Christian writings of this period include the use of music at banquets, funerals, and weddings. Despite the fact that earlier Christian authors, such as Clement of Alexandria, already addressed some of these scenarios, Christian adherents were still participating in pagan ceremonies and subsequent patristic figures thought it was important to discuss them over a century later. John Chrysostom was perhaps the most prolific writer from this time period on the subject of music and there are several references in his corpus of writings that deal with all of the aforementioned social settings. Psalms and hymns were often sung at communal meals, as Clement of Alexandria wrote, and Quasten argues that these were meant to “displace the pagan songs”. Yet, Chrysostom’s attack on pagan meal practices and the musical accompaniment demonstrates that this complete displacement had still not taken place by the fourth century. In a passage from his Homilies on the Psalms, Chrysostom writes, “Since the devil often lies in wait at banquets,

---

399 Ambrose, *Explanatio psalmi* I, 9; PL XIV, 924-925 (McKinnon’s translation, 126). “Mulieres Apostolus in Ecclesis tacere jubet: psalmum etiam bene clamant: hic omni dulcis aetati, hic utrique aptus est sexui...jeuveneuteae ipsae sine dispendio matronalis psallunt pudoris, puellular sine prolapsione verecundiae cum sobrietate gravitates hymnum Deo, inflexae vocis suavitate modulantur”.

having his alliances drunkenness and gluttony, and disorderly laughter, and a spirit without restraint, and at that time it is necessary most of all, both before and after the meal, to build a secure fortification against him from the psalms, and rise up together with the wife and children from the symposium, to sing sacred hymns to God”.  

Further on in the same section of the homily, he condemns banquet practices that include plays, dancing, and prostitution. His remarks underscore the link between Greco-Roman banquets and sexual immorality and the structure of his critique closely parallels that of Clement and a similar sentiment is expressed in Chrysostom’s homily on the Colossians. He contends "Indeed, there are auloi, citharas, and syrinxes, but there is no discordant/noisy melody. What then? Hymns and psalms". He argues that these are the only appropriate forms to praise God after mealtime.

A critique of pagan wedding rituals is also seen in Chrysostom’s writing. There are three texts in particular, which are representative of his general attitude toward wedding practices and the inclusion of pagan wedding songs and other ritualistic traditions. Quasten argues that the Greek wedding song, the *hymenaios*, was extremely popular, even in the fourth century. The song was accompanied by the cithara or flute and was “well-like in Christian circles, so Chrysostom had to take strong measures against it". Chrysostom charges the pagans with dancing, playing instruments, singing shameful songs, and becoming intoxicated at weddings,

---

401 John Chrysostom, *In psalmum XLI*, 2; PG LV, 157 "Ἐπειδὴ γὰρ ὡς τὰ πολλὰ ἐν συμποσίῳ ὁ διάβολος ἐφεδρεύει μὲθναι καὶ ἀδηφαγίαν ἔχον αὐτῷ συμμαχόσαν, καὶ γέλωτα ἀτακτον, καὶ ψυχὴν ἀνειμένην, μᾶλιστα τότε δεὶ καὶ πρὸ τραπέζης, καὶ μετὰ τραπέζης, ἐπιτείχειν αὐτῷ τὴν ἀπὸ τῶν ψαλμῶν ἀσφάλειαν, καὶ κοινῇ μετὰ τῆς γυναικός καὶ τῶν παιδῶν ἀναστάντας ἀπὸ τοῦ συμποσίου, τοὺς ἰεποὺς ἄλλοις ἐνδέχεται τῷ Θεῷ." 

402 Interestingly, Chrysostom references the dance of the prophets in a positive context. Therefore, dance is not wholly condemned, even though Chrysostom’s writings contain many negative references to dance but the context and intent seem to be the significant factors in permitting such behaviours.


which he classifies as “rubbish of the devil”. Chrysostom's polemic, however, can be understood as an attempt to slander non-Christians or perhaps perpetuate a critique of pagan gatherings that parallels one written by Clement of Alexandria almost two centuries earlier. Chrysostom contends that these elements make a marriage ceremony dishonourable and any extravagance brings shame and “spoils the modesty/chastity of the maiden and makes the groom behave impudently”. Thus, Chrysostom views pagan wedding music as the impetus for negative behaviours including, as he says in his homily on the Acts of the Apostles, “fornication and adultery”. In fact, prohibitions on such inclusions at weddings were even formulated in an official capacity at the Council of Laodicea. This council, which took place in the latter half of the fourth century, specified “Those Christians going away to weddings should not leap and dance, but rather take the meal, as is fitting of Christians”. Religious officials had a higher standard of behavioural expectations, which is articulated in Canon 54: "priests or clerics must not view the spectacles at weddings, or at banquets, but they must rise up and depart from there before the festivities enter/begin". Gregory of Nazianzus, the bishop of Constantinople, had a similar viewpoint, arguing that the correct elements (such as the presence of bishops, prayer, and psalms) should never be mixed with the incorrect elements (such as jesters, dancing, and aulos-playing). This articulation is very effective as a rhetorical mechanism to create a dichotomous

405 Chrysostom, In 1 Corinthios, Hom. XII, 5; PG LXI, 103. "καὶ πολὺς ὁ τοῦ διαβόλου τότε ἐπεισάγεται φορυτός."
408 Council of Laodicea, Canon 54; Hefele, Histoire, vol I, 2, 1023. "Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἱερατικοὺς ἢ κληρικοὺς θεωρεῖν εἰς γάμους, ἢ διέπετον, ἀλλὰ πρὸ τοῦ εἰσέρχεσθαι τοὺς θυμελικοὺς, ἐγείσθαι αὐτοὺς καὶ ἀναχωρεῖν ἐκείθεν."  Gregory of Nazianzus, Epistle CCXXXII; PG XXXVII, 376. "Ἐν δὲ τῶν καλῶν παρεῖναι Χριστὸν τοῖς γάμοις (οὐ δὲ ὁ Χριστός εὐκοσμία), καὶ τὸ γενέσθαι οἶνον τὸ ὅδωρ, τὸ δὲ ἔστι, πάντα μεταποιεῖσθαι εἰς τὸ βέλτιον, οὕτως,
"Us versus Them". It is also interesting to note that none of these literary examples mention idolatry; the entire critique is centered on behavioural elements that depart from a controlled, pious, and solemn disposition.

Excessive displays of emotion at funerals were also cause for concern for Christian writers in this period. This critique of musical extravagance, however, did not originate in Christian discourse. Quasten notes that some Greek philosophers argued that moderate displays of lamentation were ideal but that this type of conception rarely manifested itself in actual funerary practices of the Greco-Romans. He contends that pagan funeral rituals were excluded from Christian practices for two main reasons: fear of idolatry and Christian ideas surrounding death and the afterlife.\textsuperscript{411} The first reason is fairly self-explanatory but the second requires clarification. Death was viewed as a blessing since there was a promise of spiritual deliverance; hence excessive mourning was not congruent with this theological understanding. Thus, death was viewed paradoxically – both with sorrow and with joy. Therefore, “Christians replaced lamentations and dirges sung in alternation with antiphonal singing of the psalms”.\textsuperscript{412} Chrysostom classifies excessive grief as an “intoxication”.\textsuperscript{413} Yet, one cannot conclude based on Chrysostom's discourse that Christians did not engage in outward displays of emotion at funerals. This can be understood as a highly philosophical idealization of death, which does not necessarily reflect the historical practices of early Christians at funerals. Chrysostom continues along the same line when he contrasts the funerary practices of Jews and Christians. He states, “Hence in the beginning there was wailing and lamentation over the dead, but now there are

---

\textsuperscript{411} Quasten, \textit{Music & Worship}, 160-161.
\textsuperscript{412} Quasten, \textit{Music & Worship}, 161.
\textsuperscript{413} Chrysostom, \textit{In Hebraeos}, Hom. IV, 5; PG LXIII, 43. "\textit{ἀλλὰ μεθύεις ὑπὸ τοῦ πένθους}".
psalms and hymnody. They [The Jews]...grieved because death at that time was death indeed. But now this is not so; instead there is hymnody, and prayer, and psalms, making clear that there is an thing of pleasure in it”.414

**Music as a Necessary Ritual Practice**

Many of the references in the preceding discussion on music in early Christianity have been quite negative. After the late second century, the attacks on Greco-Roman and Jewish musical practices became very common and it might appear as though these negative conceptions of music define the entire discourse. However, the singing of psalms and hymns never disappeared; rather, this practice became an integral liturgical element in both corporate and domestic worship. Therefore, it is important to understand that despite an overwhelming collection of pejorative musical references, church authorities recognized that singing, in particular, also had many beneficial aspects. Some of these positive allusions have already been identified. For example, Ignatius used musical metaphors to emphasize unity and *communitas*. Tertullian approved of domestic singing in order to foster the bonds of marriage and a deeper faith commitment.

There are, however, other references that require some discussion in order to fully explain this positivity, which may at times seem at odds with many of the preceding texts.Athanasius, the fourth century bishop of Alexandria, argues that the outward projection of melody was a sign of inner harmony. He writes, “Just as we make known and signify the thoughts of the soul through the words we offer, so too the Lord wished the melody of the words

414 Chrysostom, *De sanctis Bernice et Prosdoce* 3; PG L, 634. "Διὰ τούτο παρὰ μὲν τὴν ἄρχῃν ἐπὶ τοῖς νεκροῖς κοπετοὶ τινὲς ἐγίγνοντο καὶ θρήνοι, νῦν δὲ ψαλμοὶ χαί ὑμνοίδιαν... Ἐκόψαντο επειδή θάνατος τούτε ὁ θάνατος ἦν, νῦν δὲ οὐχ οὕτως, ἀλλὰ ὑμνοίδια καὶ εὐχαι καὶ ψαλμοί, δηλούντων ἀπάντων, ὅτι ἡδονὴ ἔχει τὸ πράγμα."

163
to be a sign of spiritual harmony of the soul, and commanded that the songs be sung with tune, and the psalms read with song”. This expresses the necessity of singing as a form of praise, which is mandated through the divine. In some sense, this demonstrates a conceptual link with Greek philosophy on the cosmic nature of harmony and melody but the passage reflects a justification for actual practice.

Melody was also viewed as an effective pedagogical mechanism. Some of the textual references we have already examined contain a similar idea but Basil of Caesarea, who argues that melody that originates in the divine realm is a useful tool for teaching human beings, emphasizes this point. According to Basil, “He mixed the pleasantness of the melody with doctrine so that inadvertently we would absorb the benefit of the words through gentleness and ease of hearing… Thus he contrived for us these harmonious psalm tunes, so that those who are children in actual age as well as those who are young in behaviour, while appearing only to sing would in reality be training their souls”. Therefore, psalm singing is understood as an effective way to impart theology, which may not be accessible to some through complex philosophical discourse. In addition, he claims that psalmody fosters charity and unity among members of the assembly. This statement takes the earlier metaphor of Ignatius and frames it in a way that reflects ideal liturgical practice. It also parallels Clement’s understanding of music as a necessary component in properly developing an individual’s behavioural and emotional disposition. This connects to the relationship between music and emotion and this correlation is also the basis for


416 Basil the Great, *Homilia in psalmum i*; PG XXIX, 212. “Τὸ ἐκ τῆς μελωδίας τερπνὸν τοῖς δόγμασιν ἐκκατόμιζεν, ἵνα τῷ πρὸσηνεί καὶ λείῳ τῆς ἀκοῆς τὸ ἐκ τῶν λόγων ὑφέλμον λανθανόντος ὑποδεξόμεθα, κατὰ τοὺς σοφοὺς τῶν ἱερῶν, οἱ τῶν φαρμάκων τὰ αὐστήρατα πίνειν ἔδοντος τοῖς κακοσίτοις, μέλλει πολλάκις τὴν κύλικα περιχρίουσι. Διὰ τοῦτο τὰ ἐναρμονία ταῦτα μέλη τῶν ψαλμῶν ἡμῖν ἐπιπεννόητα, ἵνα οἱ παιδεῖς τὴν ἡλικιάν, ἢ καὶ ὅλως οἱ νεαροὶ τὸ Ἡθος, τὸ μὲν δοκεῖν μελωδόσι, τῇ δὲ ἀληθεία τὰς ψυχὰς ἐκπαιδεύονται.”
many of the positive comments on musical.

Conclusion

The literary sources from the first four centuries demonstrate significant change in Christian musical thought. This discourse must be examined in concert with the Jewish and Greco-Roman literary sources from chapter two in order to explain the roots of Christian musical thought and practice. Not only is this important from liturgical history perspective but it is also necessary in order to explain how early Christians defined themselves and others in their socio-historical context. Nearly all scholarly studies of early Christian music focus on liturgical development but a conversation on music and identity formation has not permeated the academic discourse. The discussion on music and identity in this chapter must be considered a precursor to chapter five where we will examine the role that music and song play in internal disputes and conflict. To a certain extent, the Christian polemic against instruments (both in Jewish and Greco-Roman contexts) characterizes certain definitional boundaries that authorities create; however, the problem becomes much more focused on lyrical content and context in literary sources, which discuss heresy. Yet, it is apparent that the early critique of Jewish and Greco-Roman musical thought and practice do not disappear from the discourse and in fact, this remains a source of contention well into the fifth century. Thus, music philosophy and practice were controversial issues from the end of the first century and as Lieu argues, “it is the very forcefulness of the rhetoric of ‘the other’ that at the same time invites us to explore how groups interact with others”.417 This chapter argues that the collective identity of early Christians was in part established through discourse on music and musical practice. "Christians" identified themselves

417 Lieu, Christian Identity, 15.
in relation to Greco-Romans and Jews through a variety of mechanisms but musical ritual was a key component to this fluid and dynamic process. This framework is further developed in the next chapter where I argue that musical ritual is used to demarcate intergroup boundaries between those that self-identity as Christians. Music becomes a key discursive topic that early Christian writers use to articulate definitions of orthodoxy and accusations of heresy. Thus, we reach the culmination of the developmental trajectory: music as an intergroup identity marker.
Chapter 5: Musical Markers of ‘Orthodoxy’ and ‘Heresy’

Introduction

Toward the end of the second century, several Christian writers sought to define the beliefs and practices of their respective congregations in relation to other Christ-following groups in an attempt to demarcate clear boundaries between right belief and incorrect belief. For example, Irenaeus, the 2nd century bishop of Lyon, was particularly interested in defining these boundaries in his work *Adversus Haeresis*, in which he engages in a rhetorical attack directed toward numerous competing Christian authorities. Unfortunately, the works of many of these so-called heretics have been lost and the majority of our information about them comes from Irenaeus and other proto-Orthodox writers and church historians and therefore they must be understood within this context. Traditional interpretations of the terms orthodoxy and heresy have often centered on the notion that orthodoxy was an original or pure form of the Christian message taught by Jesus and heresy was any deviation from that point of origin. Additionally, orthodoxy and heresy have also been understood to mean majority and minority, suggesting that orthodoxy can be classified as the eventual winners of Christianity, which becomes a more recognizable category after the Nicene Creed is formulated in 325 CE. Both interpretations, however, have proved problematic within the academic study of early Christianity.

More recently, scholars have tried to move away from traditional conceptions of these terms, which have often been predicated on some type of value judgment or particular theological understanding. Instead of adopting a theological or moralistic framework, scholars are employing other mechanisms of analysis including anthropological and sociological
approaches. The diversity of belief and practice among early Christ-following communities must be understood in relation to cultural, political, linguistic, and geographical differences within these groups. Therefore, any attempt to define what becomes normative and what is classified as deviant within early Christianity becomes a difficult task. There are many points of debate that one finds in the patristic literature from the second century onward and these contentious issues highlight the diversity of early Christian belief and practice. The previous chapter illustrated the various attempts by early church authorities to define elements of Christian practice, specifically musical practices, in relation to non-Christians through rhetorical engagement. These attempts at definition were an integral part in creating a Christian identity vis-à-vis other socio-religious groups of Greco-Roman antiquity.

Singing is not generally a topic that scholars of early Christianity include in academic discourse on heresy but musical practice is in fact at the forefront of several well-known debates among early authorities within the Jesus movement. The legitimacy of song in liturgy is never questioned. There is no known literary source that wholly discourages the use of music. There are, however, several famous disputes among early Christian authorities pertaining to the various elements of musical liturgy but I will argue that these debates reflect three major issues. First, the type of melody that is used in individual compositions is called into question by various patristic writers. Melody was a potential problem because religious authorities thought that

---


419 For example, Ephraem takes issue with the musical practices of various Christ-following assemblies and their leaders including Bardesanes, his son Harmonios, and Paul of Samosata. A brief account of this dispute may be found in Theodoret of Cyrus, *Ecclesiastical History* IV 29, 1-3; PG LXXXII, 1189. Additionally, the debate between Jerome and Pelagius is characterized in part by a disagreement on whether or not women should be permitted to sing in the church. See the aforementioned Jerome, *Dialogus contra pelagianos* I, 25; PG XXIII, 519.
melody had the power to evoke certain emotions within an individual or group that were considered to be dangerous or undesirable. Emotion and behaviour are inextricably linked and melodies in the ancient world were often associated with specific occasions and subsequent behaviours (such as the wild and rapid melodies often sung during drinking parties in the Greco-Roman world). It is interesting to note that several of the primary source references to heresy and melody are framed in the same way that denunciations of pagan melody are framed. In other words, the melodies used by the so-called heretics possess the same "beguiling power" that pagan melodies possess.

Second, the lyrical content of certain compositions, used by some congregations, is questioned by other authority figures that disagree with that theological content. The lyrical content of individual compositions deemed to be heretical were challenged on the basis of their theological content but the critique extends far beyond religious disagreement. The acceptance of new compositions was dependent on several factors including the authority of the composer. This became a point of contention for early Christian writers because the popularity of hymns among congregations was often connected to melodic and rhythmic elements and therefore, the nature of the lyrical content was influential in terms of a hymn’s rhetorical and emotive power.

Third, and perhaps the most contentious point of all, is the role of women in musical liturgy. Participation in the earliest Christ-following communities does not appear to be restricted but Paul’s supposed claim that women ought to remain silent in the church becomes a serious issue among later church authorities. Some argue that Paul’s command extends to all elements

420 The infamous statement made in 1 Cor 14:34-37 is generally considered to be an interpolation added to Paul’s letter after it was written; however, later patristic authorities take up varying positions on this injunction. Some authors agree with this statement while others argue singing is an appropriate expressive medium for women in the church. For a positive view on female singing and a counter-argument directed toward Paul, see Hilary of Poitiers, *Explanatio psalmi* i, 9. For negative views on female singing and agreement 1 Cor 14:34-37, see Cyril of Jerusalem,
of liturgical participation, while others contend that the singing of psalms exists outside of that imperative. Additionally, the connection that early Christian writers drew between female musical performance and overt sexuality in a Greco-Roman context can be found in the subtext of the discourse on women and singing in the church. The issue of musical practice is at the centre of various charges of heresy by one group toward another and a close investigation of these literary references can help frame the discussion of heresy, or more accurately the internal conflict that arose between different Christ-following assemblies, of the late second century and onward. Patristic authorities argued over the issue of female participation in the singing of hymns and psalms in the church. The debate between Jerome and Pelagius in the early fifth century, for example, was clearly connected to a developing intolerance for women in the church hierarchy. Earlier references, from Paul’s letters for example, do not indicate that female participation in the liturgy or other aspects of congregational organization was restricted or limited in any way. In fact, the opposite appears to have been the case.

Women played a key role in recruitment and theological dissemination and several references in Paul’s letters indicate that a select few female adherents provides important financial support to the Christ-following community in their respective cities. However, toward the end of the second and beginning of the early third century, a proto-Orthodox church hierarchy predominantly consisting of male leadership started to restrict female participation in

\[\text{Procatechesis xiv, Jerome, Dialogus contra pelagianos I, 25, and Isidore of Pelusium, Epistle I, 90. For an overview on 1 Cor. 14:34-37 as an interpolation, see William O. Walker Jr., Interpolations in the Pauline Letters (London: Sheffield Academic Press, 2001). 421 For example, the reference to ‘Chloe’s people’ in 1 Cor 1:11 likely refers to a female householder in Corinth who “might have offered [her] house for meetings and sponsored important travel”. See Margaret Y. MacDonald, “Reading Real Women Through the Undisputed Letters of Paul,” Women & Christian Origins, ed. Ross Shepard Kraemer and Mary Rose D’Angelo (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 200-201. Additionally, MacDonald mentions the reference to Phoebe the ‘benefactor’ in Rom 16:1-3 and suggests that she too was likely a financial supporter of Paul.}\]
formalized components of worship and leadership positions within the church.\textsuperscript{422} Music was a particularly sensitive issue precisely because of the aforementioned association between Greco-Roman female singers/instrumentalists and sexual depravity.\textsuperscript{423} Patristic authorities were extremely concerned with articulating an ideal Christian female identity insofar as Christian women should be chaste, modest, and submissive to their male counterparts. Female singing was viewed as distracting, insincere, sexualized, and even contrary to Biblical tradition for some writers. However, not all church authorities agreed on whether or not women ought to be permitted to join in liturgical singing and this became an important issue in the battles against heresy during early formulations of proto-Orthodoxy. Interestingly, it should be noted that even within the proto-Orthodox congregations, there was disagreement on this issue. However, all three elements present in these discursive formulations including melody, lyric, and female participation all revolve around attempts to establish ecclesiastical authority and legitimate one specific interpretation or tradition over another. Therefore, right forms of musical engagement become a marker of orthodoxy insofar as it functions to authorize one group and de-legitimize the Other. Before we can undertake an examination of texts, however, it is necessary to provide some context to this discussion and present a brief introduction to scholarly understandings of heresy within the study of early Christianity.

\textsuperscript{422} For example, the third century work \textit{Apostolic Tradition}, written by Hippolytus, states neither widows nor virgins can be ordained (or any married women). See, \textit{Apostolic Tradition}, xi, 4-5. Francine Cardman compares this approach with Hippolytus’ contemporary, Tertullian. Cardman claims that Tertullian “was adamant that women were not permitted to speak in church, to teach, to baptize, the make the offering, or to claim for themselves any function of men, especially priestly office”. See Francine Cardman, “Women, Ministry, and Church Order in Early Christianity,” \textit{Women & Christian Origins}, ed. Ross Shepard Kraemer and Mary Rose D’Angelo (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 305-307. Cardman specifically references Tertullian, \textit{On the Veiling of Virgins}, 9.

\textsuperscript{423} For references to this connection within Greco-Roman discourse, see Lucian, \textit{Dialogi meretricii} 12, 1, 311 and Sallust, \textit{De coniuratione catilinae}, 25. For references to this association within Christian discourse, see Arnobius, \textit{Adversus nationes}, II 42; PL V, 881-882.
Theories of Heresy and Orthodoxy: A Brief Overview

Jacques Berlinerblau offers a provisional definition of the terms orthodoxy and heresy in his article, "Toward a Sociology of Heresy, Orthodoxy, and Doxa". According to Berlinerblau, orthodoxy is “Any organization of human beings who can advance a binding conception of ‘the natural’ and enforce adherence to this conception”. The distinction between orthodoxy and any other group is rooted in the orthodoxy’s ability to manage those that deviate from the group. Therefore, orthodoxy’s vulnerability lies in the potential for internal dissent and dis-unification. Heterodoxy/Heretic is “A designation conferred upon a person, who in the eyes of the orthodoxy, has swerved from its ‘natural’ conception of this world. This individual’s deviation is rendered more alarming by the fact that he or she is perceived to be a member of the group”. An element of danger is always associated with a heretic insofar as his or her actions may assist other groups rendered as a threat by the orthodoxy. Elaine Pagels argues that a greater degree of similarity between orthodoxy and heresy actually results in stronger condemnation by one party toward another. This type of heresy is “more dangerous”, according to Pagels, because similarity can lead to difficulty differentiating between the two by followers or potential converts, which can result in a stronger degree of religious rivalry.

There is also an inherent element of politicization in Berlinerblau's definition and this is one specific area in which Berlinerblau’s work goes beyond some of the previous scholarship on the topic. His assertion that orthodoxy advances a binding conception of the natural, however, needs to be elaborated. How does this "conception of the natural" become normative? Where

---

426 Berlinerblau, “Toward a Sociology of Heresy, Orthodoxy, and Doxa”, 351.
does the authority come from to change/modify/add to this conception? If a person or groups already has a conception of "the natural", how do we account for religious recruitment and conversion? Berlinerblau's explanation does not account for such socio-religious phenomena. In fact, he explicitly uses the term doxa in the title of his article, which may implicitly subsume ritualistic elements of a religious tradition but he fails to address this explicitly in his discussion. Ritual practice must be considered as a integral component to the formulation of such categories because they transmit embodied knowledge through action and participation. As I will argue further on in this chapter, singing is a fundamental element of group identification, which plays a significant part in the transmission of religious ideas and practices that (for political reasons) come to be defined by insiders as orthodoxy or heresy.

Various questions remain, however, including: if orthodoxy and heresy are relational and scholars reject the idea that these terms can be framed through theological or numerical means, then how can they be applied to the diversity of early Christianity? Where does the locus of power lie within this continuum? What makes one group orthodox and others heretical? Are the terms “orthodoxy” and “heresy” appropriate, or even useful? Any exhaustive engagement of these questions would go beyond the scope of this chapter but Berlinerblau’s work touches upon several of these questions and it is helpful to outline his assertions here. First, he argues that in order for heresy to exist, an authoritative political apparatus must be in place and recognize heresy as “deviant” behaviour or thought but also effectively manage this group. Secondly, like Pagels, Berlinerblau contends that both groups use similar language but that their discourse has a different end point or purpose. Therefore, the power of the heretic is rooted in the fact that he or she is “one of us”. Third, he lists several potential reasons for claiming that a heretic is often categorized as an insider. This includes a potential deviation from orthodoxy, a similar
institutional basis, and a common discursive universe. Berlinerblau’s framework is quite convincing, although he suggests that the dominating political power has the authority to recognize heresy as such, which is not necessarily always the case.

Thus, it is rather problematic then that much of the scholarly discourse on heresy and orthodoxy focuses on doctrine and fails to address the role of ritual practice in the formulation of any provisional definition. Theological issues that continually emerge in such discourse include the nature of Christ, the nature of the material world, and the role of Jewish law and the Hebrew Bible. But how does ritual practice fit in? How does the transmission of embodied knowledge reinforce normative belief systems or perhaps promote those of marginalized groups? What role does singing play in this transmission of religious ideas?

There is already debate between various Christ-following factions in the first century; for example, Paul writes about "false teachers" and "Judaizers" in his letters, warning the members of his assembly against these supposed dangers. Yet, as Walter Bauer’s work clearly demonstrates, there is no discernible point of origin from which the so-called genuine teachings of Jesus were "corrupted" by others, at least not one that can be argued from an academic approach.428 In fact, the conflict over belief and practice can be traced to the earliest Christ-following assemblies. For example, Paul is concerned with both doxa (ie. articulations of salvation, justification through faith, etc.) and praxis (ie. circumcision, food regulations, and the Sabbath) in the letter to the Galatians. Paul criticizes the Galatians for following the teachings of other missionary figures but he never uses the term heresy.

Einar Thomasson takes an interesting approach in his analysis of heresy and orthodoxy in second century Rome. There are two important points that deserve mention. First, he argues that

heretics (ie. Marcion and Valentinus) were not expelled by the church since there was no widely-recognized church to take such action. Rather, this is a retrospective idea that others such as Tertullian use as a basis for the justification of their own theological beliefs and ritual practices. The Christ-following assemblies in Rome lacked any type of formal political or religious structure that would be necessary to make an accusation of heresy. Second, Thomasson contends that the relationships between the various Christian assemblies in Rome during this time can be characterized by tension between centralizing and decentralizing forces. Decentralizing forces include scattered infrastructure (ie. private homes used for meetings), expanding Christ-following communities and the relative diversity of new recruits, variance in educational levels and social rank, and autonomous organization and leadership. Centralizing forces included ideology and a focus on group unification. What is unique about Thomasson’s formulation is his emphasis on unity within the context of this discussion on centralizing and decentralizing factors.

Though Thomasson claims that unity or a desire for unification acts as a centralizing feature for early Christian assemblies in Rome, he also contends that this focal point actually resulted in a greater push for exclusivity between co-existing groups, which provided an impetus for conflict and competition. Thomasson briefly mentions the significance of ritual practice in his discussion on Valentinus where he states, “The entire purpose of the church was to recognize this unity. It is brought about through rituals of initiation, where the idea of the “bridal chamber” highlights unification as a central concern, as well as through the communal singing of hymns”. Thomasson presents a convincing argument pertaining to Valentinus and Marcion

---

regarding their respective emphasis on unity and attempt to establish a restrictive orthodoxy. This goes against traditional understandings of orthodoxy insofar as these are groups are generally labeled as heretical; yet, Thomasson contends that it was Marcion and Valentinus who can be considered centralizing figures. \(^{431}\) This is very different from traditional understandings of unity in this early church, which suggests that the proto-Orthodox were the agents of unity and heretics the agents of disunity, at least in mid-second century Rome, those who retrospectively were charged as heretics in fact sought greater unity and exclusivity.

Thomasson, like Berlinerblau, moves away from framing the debate solely in theological terms, but again the significance of ritual practice is distinctly absent in his argument. Social and religious unification is not only manifested through ideology and belief but through practice and ritual performance. As I demonstrated in chapter four, singing was a ubiquitous practice in early Christ-following assemblies and there is a clear emphasis on unity in other Christian writings that date to the second century. Justin Martyr for example, argues in his *Apology*, “while being thankful to him [we] offer solemn words and hymns”. \(^{432}\) Therefore, it is not clear in Thomasson’s work how hymn singing functioned in a different way within the Valentinian community in comparison to any other Christian (Roman or otherwise) assembly. In fact, hymn singing functioned in both a centralizing and decentralizing way, to borrow Thomasson’s terminology. Communal singing acted as a centralizing force precisely because it was a group-oriented activity that served to reinforce identity and strengthen social bonds.

However, singing was also a decentralizing force for two reasons. First, hymn singing was a common activity and as we already noted in Paul’s Letter to the Corinthians, adherents were told to “have a hymn” when they come together, which suggests the practice of singing

\(^{431}\) Thomasson, “Orthodoxy and Heresy”, 255-256.

\(^{432}\) Justin Martyr, *Apology* I, 13; PG VI, 345. See n. 292 for Greek text.
non-Biblical compositions stem chronologically from time of Paul (or perhaps earlier). However, this eventually becomes problematic because individual compositions did not necessarily have a predetermined scale mode, melody line or lyrical content, which could potentially arouse a strong emotional response and lead to unacceptable behaviours or contrasting/unacceptable theological interpretations. As I noted in chapter three, music has the ability to evoke certain emotional responses based on the rhythm, tempo, and mode and this was key issue in terms of articulating correct musical practice as I discussed in chapter four when I presented a survey of Clement of Alexandria's writings. Musical "correctness" was inherently linked to theological "correctness", an issue to which we will later return. Second, hymn singing often took place at domestic meetings, which as Thomasson states can be considered a decentralizing location because of capacity limitations. Domestic space is important insofar as information disseminated in the private sphere or ritual practice among members is more difficult to control or monitor by authority figures. This relates to the issue of member participation, which could not necessarily be supervised in the private sphere.

Harry O. Maier makes a similar observation in his work on religious dissent in competing Christ-following groups during the 4th and 5th centuries. Maier argues that the household played an important role in spreading marginalized religious ideology and that it provided a place for subjugated groups to meet in private without fear of immediate persecution. In fact, he contends that domestic space allowed these groups to flourish and recruit new members. For example, Theodoret writes in *Ecclesiastical History* that Arius not only taught false doctrines but he also spoke during general meetings (the nature of which is unclear) and he went from house to house.

---

Maier suggests that the household was a dividing barrier between orthodox and heretical topographies in the 4th and 5th centuries and that this was a strategic way to disseminate ideas and recruit new members because religious gatherings in this setting were not subject to external persecution yet they still afforded access to certain social networks. Maier also claims that the household meeting place was significant insofar as it provided a means for expressing “Protest, self-definition, and reinforced social identity”. He does not specifically mention hymn singing as a mode of rhetorical dissemination or pedagogy but if we accept Maier’s argument that private dwellings functioned in this way for certain Christ-following groups, it is not only plausible but in fact highly probable that communal singing contributed to this phenomenon. Thus, music/song becomes a marker of both orthodoxy and heresy precisely because of its potential to disseminate theological ideology and its ability to change an individual’s emotional disposition and influence behavioural responses. However, the mechanisms by which music identifies a group as heretical is more complex than this and requires further examination of primary source materials.

Musical Controversies Among Early Christians

1. The Problem of Melody and Emotion

Melody and emotion are intimately connected and philosophers and religious specialists alike in antiquity were clearly aware of potential emotional responses to specific melodic forms; however, melody and emotion are not identified as problems before Clement of Alexandria. Thus, debates over melodic composition will serve as our point of departure in order to outline

---

434 Theodoret of Cyrus, *Ecclesiastical History* 1.1; PG LXXXII, 885. "Καὶ τὰς οἰκίας περινοστῶν, ἐξηνδραπόδιξαν ὅσους ἴσχυεν."

435 Maier, “Religious Dissent”, 54.
the various disputes that existed within the discourse of competing groups of Christ-followers.

Interestingly, the accusations of heresy based on the supposed “beguiling” or “corrupting” nature of certain melodies are actually quite similar to critique leveled against certain Greco-Roman melodies. Clement of Alexandria and Eusebius both discuss the charming nature of Greco-Roman melodies as well as the potential threat of corruption and exploitation that are contained within them.\(^{436}\) The way they speak about melody suggests they thought that melody contained an inherent form of power that could influence a person through manipulating their senses and disrupting their rational thought processes.

Melody can be used as a persuasive tool to evoke specific emotional states in the participants. This is a more subtle form of rhetorical engagement because melody in itself contains what Calvin Stapert refers to as a “power of attraction”. He contends that music is a form of rhetoric and its power is related to the conception of eloquence. He notes the “eloquence of melody” attracted people to certain religious groups (specifically Bardesanes and his “heresy” and Ambrose and his “orthodoxy”).\(^{437}\) Stapert’s observations regarding the significance of melody in this context are quite astute. Despite the inherent value judgments in his statement, which is theologically oriented, his discussion on the potential dangers of melody (as articulated by various patristic sources) illustrates the problem of aesthetics and pleasure. Augustine details this conflict between the sacred nature of melody and the potential dangers that exist. He clearly values the practice of singing hymns and psalms in a worship setting but in Confessions, he argues that singing can also be an occasion for sin. In Book X, he writes,

---


\(^{437}\) Stapert, *A New Song*, 188.
I feel that when the sacred words are chanted well, our souls are moved and are more religiously and with a warmer devotion rekindled to piety than if they are not so sung. All the diverse emotions of our spirit have their various modes in voice and chant appropriate in each case, and are stirred by a mysterious inner kinship. But my physical delight, which has to be checked from enervating the mind, often deceives me when the perception of the senses is unaccompanied by reason, and is not patiently content to be in a subordinate place. Augustine formulates a concern that appears to stem from personal experience. He attributes a greater degree of piety attached to a melodic performance of sacred text than without melody, yet he notes the danger that exists in terms of losing one’s capability for rational thought. The pleasure that one derives from the so-called charming nature of melody can override or negate the “true” purpose of the musical engagement, which for Augustine is to show devotion and experience a higher level of spirituality. As he writes, emotions (both “good” and “bad”) are awakened by melody and through this process a person can strengthen their spiritual connection with God and with their fellow Christ-followers. Augustine’s comments are important because they demonstrate that melody (even within Christian congregations) can be used appropriately and inappropriately. While Augustine does not specifically challenge the melodic practices of other Christian communities, he does make it clear that there are parameters that ought to be followed in order to fit a Christian ideal.

A more obvious example comes from the 4th century Syrian bishop Ephraem. Renowned for his hymn compositions, Ephraem not only denounced the melodic compositions of other Christian groups, he actually employed those same melodies in an effort to counter the so-called

Augustine, *Confessions*, X, xxxiii, 49-50; PL XXXII, 799-800. This English translation is from Stapert, 207-208. “Aliquando enim plus mihi videor honoris eis tribuere quam decent, dum ipsis sanctus dictus religiosius et ardentius sentio moveri animos nostros in flammam pietatis, cum ita cantantur, quam si non ita cantarentur; et omnes affectus spiritus nostri pro sui diversitate habere proprios modos in voce atque canlu, quorum nescio qua occulta familiaritate excitentur. Sed defectatio carnis meae, cui mentem enervandam non oportet dari, saepe me fallit, dum rationem sensus non ita comitatur ut patienter sit posterior.”
heresies of these groups. The most emphatic attack was directed toward the followers of the 2nd century Syrian Bardesanes and his son Harmonius. Eusebius recounts that Bardesanes was originally a member of the Valentinian school but he eventually broke away from that group. Eusebius writes, “He indeed was at first a follower of Valentinus but afterward, having rejected his teaching and having refuted most of his myths, he believed that he had come over to the more correct opinion. Nevertheless he did not entirely wash off the filth of the old heresy”.439 Bardesanes wrote a large collection of hymns but some scholars argue that it was his son Harmonius that adapted these compositions to known metrical forms and melodic arrangements.440

There are three main sources of information that describe Ephraem’s hymn and his use of music as a form of rhetorical engagement. Ephraem’s hymns themselves tell us a great deal about his theological orientation as well as his views on competing Christian groups. In addition to his own writings, there are two compilations of Ecclesiastical Histories that mention Ephraem’s melodic condemnation of heresies. The 5th century historians, Theodoret of Cyrus and Sozomen, both describe Ephraem’s efforts to root out and condemn heretical viewpoints through the use of melody, specifically against the followers of Bardesanes and his son. Ephraem is particularly interesting case study because of the multi-faceted ways in which he employs music as a rhetorical device. In fact, his work can be slotted into all three of our musical controversies – melody, lyrics, and female musical performance. It is not my intention, however, to argue that Ephraem’s approach was normative among early Christian authorities. Not all


authorities used melody as a medium for debate and denunciation but Ephraem found this to be a very useful tool for articulating his pedagogy and communicating correct doctrine to his congregation. He also wrote hymns against others, including the Emperor Julian. There is a collection of four hymns directed toward Julian, in which Ephraem condemns the beliefs of Julian. However, the hymns that we now direct our attention toward contain a focused critique of other Christian assemblies. The evidence indicates that competing Christian groups used hymns as rhetorical devices in order to demarcate the lines or boundaries between orthodoxy and heresy.

Returning to Ephraem and his use of melody, we must first examine the reference found in Theodoret of Cyrus’ *Ecclesiastical History*. He writes,

> And Ephraem, using the Syrian tongue, shed beams of spiritual grace. Although lacking experience in Hellenic learning, he exposed the multifarious schemes of the Greeks, and lay bare the weakness of every heretical artifice. And since Harmonius, the son of Bardesanes, had composed some songs long ago, and by mixing the sweetness of melody with his impiety had beguiled his audience and led them to their destruction, Ephraem took the music for his song, mixed with his own piety, and thus presented his listeners with a remedy both exceedingly sweet and beneficial. Even now these songs render the festivals of the victorious martyrs more splendid.442

Theodoret argues that Harmonius’ compositions utilize the "sweetness of melody" in order to trick or beguile the audience. This is actually a similar critique to earlier Christian discourse

---


accusing Greco-Romans of a similar crime.\textsuperscript{443} Once again the power of melody is described as a medium through which listeners can be fooled into believing false doctrine. Melody has the ability to draw its audience into a certain state of consciousness and Theodoret suggests that the musical compositions of Harmonius have this power. This state of consciousness places listeners in a state where they are more easily influenced or manipulated. According to Theodoret’s account, the pairing of a pleasing melody and heretical theology is a very dangerous tool. The auditory medium becomes a battleground and melodic lines are the implements of war. However, Theodoret illustrates the great lengths to which Ephraem goes to counter his enemy. He appropriates the melodies of Bardesanes and Harmonius and replaces the lyrics with his own in an attempt to utilize that same power, the "sweetness of melody". Music, therefore, is understood in rhetorical terms (ie. a mode of persuasion), which can be used in both positive and negative ways, depending on one’s theological understanding. The other point of interest here is that Theodoret explicitly states that these songs (perhaps over a century later) are still in use at various festivals celebrating martyrs, which confirms that Ephraem’s hymns were in fact used in liturgical settings. In addition, Theodoret’s comments lend further evidence to the argument that hymns were in fact a mechanism for disseminating condemnation towards one’s opponents within competing Christian assemblies and not simply the discourse of the literate. The ramifications are such that members of that association would hear, perform, and repeat these hymns and as I illustrated in chapter four, the addition of melody to specific lyrical content is an efficacious way to memorize and repeat information. Thus, the appropriation of known melodies with a change in lyrical content is an extremely effective mechanism. Not only do these hymns condemn Ephraem’s so-called enemies from within, they also portray his own theological

\textsuperscript{443} For example, at the beginning of the Pedagogus, Clement of Alexandria talks about the beguiling power of Orpheus and his melodic performances and his ability to trick/influence/manipulate others through this method.
framework in a superior fashion. This foreshadows the upcoming section on recruitment mechanisms, where I discuss the simultaneous censuring of the Other and the promotion of in-group ideology. This becomes a strong argument for a potential switch in religious affiliation.

The second source that details Ephraem’s fight against the heresy of Bardesanes and his son is the fifth century historian Sozomen. He devotes an entire section of his historical account to Ephraem the Syrian who was “revered most solemnly by the Catholic assembly”, according to Sozomen. He provides a few biographical details from Ephraem’s life before outlining the clash within Syrian Christian congregations. The following passage comes from Sozomen’s historical account of the church and is worth quoting in at length.

I am not ignorant of the fact that there were some very famous men who used to be in Osroëne, such as, Bardesanes, who contrived a heresy called by his name, and Harmonius, his son. It is said that the latter was educated in Greek learning, and was the first to overcome his primary language to meters and musical laws; he gave these to the choirs, and even now the Syrians often sing, not that which was written down by Harmonius, but the same melodies. Since he was not entirely free from the mistakes of his father, and had certain thoughts about the soul, the generation and destruction of the body, and the regeneration, which are taught by the Greek philosophers, he organized some of these ideas into the lyrical songs, which he composed. When Ephraem thought that the Syrians were charmed with the beauty of the words and the rhythm of the melody, he became concerned that they would hold the same opinions/beliefs; and even he was ignorant of Greek teachings, he grasped the metres of Harmonius, and wrote down similar ones in accordance with the doctrines of the ecclesia, and he worked hard on the sacred hymns and in the praises of men without passion. From then on, the Syrians sang the songs of Ephraim according to the law of Harmonius.

---

444 Sozomen, Ecclesiastical History, III, XVI; PG LXVII, 1085. “Ἐφοκεῖ δὲ πάντας παρευδοκιμεῖν, καὶ ἐς τὰ μάλιστα τὴν καθόλου Ἐκκλησίαν σεμνῖνειν, Ἐφραῖμ ὁ Σύρος”.

445 Sozomen, Ecclesiastical History, III, XVI; PG LXVII, 1089. “Ὅδε ἄγνοοδὲ δὲ, ὦς καὶ πᾶλαι ἐλλογομοτάτοι τοῦτο τὸν τρόπον παρὰ Ὀσροηνοῖς ἐγένοντο, Βαρδησάνης τὸν πατρῶν τρόπον, ὑπὸ τὴν παρὰ αὐτὸ καλουμένην αὕτην συνεστήματο καὶ Ἀρμονίος ὁ Βαρδησάνου παῖς, ὃν φασὶ διὰ τῶν παρ᾽ Ἐλλησί πάντοτε, πρὸς τὸν μέτρον καὶ νόμον μυστικὸν τὴν πάτριον φονὴν ὑπαγαγεῖν, καὶ χοροῦς παραδὸντα, καθάπερ καὶ τῶν πολλάκις ὁ Σύροι γὰλλουσιν, ὥς τοις Ἀρμονίου συγγράμμασιν, ἀλλὰ τοῖς μέλεσιν χρώμενοι. Ἐπεὶ γὰρ ὦν παντάπασιν ἐκτὸς ἣν τῆς πατρίδος αὐρέσεως, καὶ ὡς τὰς ψυχὰς γενέσεως τε καὶ φθορὰς σώματος, καὶ παλαγγελίας, οἱ παρ᾽ Ἐλλησί φιλοσοφοῦντες δοξάζουσιν, οὐ γὰρ ύπὸ λύσαν ἀ συνεγράφατο συνθέσεις, τοστασίας τὰς δόξας τοῖς ὁικείοις προσεέμε ὑγράμμασιν. Ἐκὼ τοῦ Ἐφραίμ χιλιομένου τοῖς Σύροις τὸ ἱλλεῖ τῶν ὀνόματοι, καὶ τὸ ῥυθμῶ τῆς μελῳδίας, καὶ κατὰ τὸν ἐπεσεζωμένους ὁμοίῳ αὐτὸ δοξάζουσιν, καὶ Ἐλληνικῆς παίδειας ἄμιορον, ἐπίστη τῇ καταλήγῃ τῶν Ἀρμονίου μέτρων, καὶ πρὸς τὰ μέλη τῶν ἀκείνου γραμμάτων, εὐτέρας γραφῆς συνεισόντως τοῖς ἐκκλησιαστικοῖς δόγμασι συνέθηκεν. ὅπως
This passage tells us that Harmonius was trained in the traditions of Greek musical theory and was familiar with the rules of melody and rhythm. Sozomen slots both father and son into the category of heretic but Harmonius seems to be the lesser of the two evils. In this account, Sozomen describes Ephraem as fearful that people should "imbibe the same opinions". In this case it is the elegance of the lyrics and the rhythm of the melody that are dangerous. However, this parallels Theodoret’s articulation of Ephraem’s concern: the nature of the melody is a potential threat insofar as the melody itself becomes an active disseminator of heretical theology. Based on the narrative, Sozomen would have his readers believe that Ephraem’s tactics were a complete success, which suggests that Ephraem’s modus operandi was accepted despite the fact that his response to heretical sects was not necessarily normative among Christian authorities. The melodies utilized in liturgical settings stemmed from Harmonius’ compositions but Ephraem appropriated them in order to combat the theological framework that was rooted in the teachings of Bardesanates. Therefore, melody in itself is a key factor in determining the legitimacy of liturgical content during the fourth and fifth centuries.

2. Lyrical Authority & the Condemnation of the Heretic

I have recurrently argued throughout this dissertation that singing is a communicative and rhetorical medium, which allows composers and writers to articulate a specific doctrine or ideology in their lyrical content and this in turn become an effective pedagogical tool. In the section on music and cognitive science in chapter three, I also provided scientific and empirical evidence that explains how the efficacy of memorization is improved when melody accompanies αὐτῷ πεπόνητο ἐν θείοις ὡμοίως καὶ ἐγκώμιοις ἀπαθῶν ἀνδρῶν. Ἐξ ἐκεῖνου τε Σύροι κατὰ τὸν νόμον τῆς Ἀρμονίου ὕδης τὰ τοῦ Ἐφραίμ ψάλλουσιν."
words or lyrics. Therefore, singing was an integral part of teaching and communicating doctrine.

Anthropologist Jeff Titon argues in his study on Appalachian Baptist Churches that "Religious language activates the relationship between the divine and the worshipper ... hymnody marks the beginning of that relationship".\footnote{Titon, \textit{Powerhouse for God: Speech, Chant, and Song in an Appalachian Baptist Church} (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1988), 213.} His discussion centers on the role that music plays in structuring the church community as well as transmitting knowledge to members. Titon interviewed some of these members about the significance of singing in their church and one participant noted that he found great comfort in hearing children sing because he knew that "the traditions are being inculcated in the young".\footnote{Titon, \textit{Powerhouse for God}, 217.} Therefore, singing is understood to create a cohesive social and family environment and the lyrics play an important pedagogical role in transmitting religious knowledge to new members and younger generations. Music as performed language is a particularly effective at accomplishing this because songs link the past and the present through the frequency of performance. Other church members claimed that the lyrics were the most important part of the hymn because meaning "registers in the mind, resonates in the memory, and 'lifts up' the indwelling spirit".\footnote{Titon, \textit{Powerhouse for God}, 236.} Therefore, the combination of lyric and melody are a potent conduit for communicating beliefs and practices within this community and this type of framework can be applied to early Christ-following assemblies as well.

Paul’s letters indicate that hymns were an important part of worship and individual compositions were likely included in the gatherings of early Christ-followers. However, toward the end of the 3\textsuperscript{rd} century, the restrictions and limitations on individual compositions become more evident. The authority of lyrical compositions becomes an important question. Who has the authority to introduce new hymns into liturgical services? What role (if any) does the aesthetic
nature of the hymn play in terms of its use and acceptance? Was hymnody a medium through which subversive or competing theologies were effectively disseminated? Does the legitimation of new compositions parallel authorization of religious texts and/or assembly leadership? This section will address these questions using specific examples from early Christian texts and illustrate how the authority of lyrical content was dependent on both theological positioning and the aesthetic superiority of the composition.

As Angela Kim notes in her article on authorizing poetic compositions, the so-called heretics such as Marcion, Arius, Mani, and Bardesanes were “famous for the beauty of their poetry and the great popularity of their hymns”. She also notes the pedagogical function of their works insofar as their hymns played a key role in disseminating their teachings, thereby increasing their popularity and level of authority within their respective congregations. In other words, hymns functioned in a way that served to reinforce the power and authority of the composer but at the same time validate their particular theological framework. Poetic compositions were an effective literary medium, even for those who were illiterate because they were set to melody, which was easily learned and memorized by members of the assembly. Thus, it was a viewed as a particularly dangerous and powerful form of doctrinal expression. Although it should be noted that authorities, such as Ephraem, did not necessarily view the problem through this specific lens; rather, this is my own assertion, which is based on the empirical evidence presented in chapter three on cognitive science and music.

Lyrics were not only a source of legitimating authority within an assembly but they also functioned as a way of constructing identity. Ampofo and Asiedu, in their study on Ghanian popular music, argue that music and singing are "conduits for the transmission of society's

---

cultural values, beliefs, and norms"⁴⁵⁰ while Faudree makes a similar claim when he argues that song can "promote cultural values and traditions".⁴⁵¹ Therefore, hymns both define and reinforce a continually changing group identity through embodied knowledge transmission. Since hymns are generally short and repeated often⁴⁵², they are an ideal vehicle for constructing identity and transmitting belief. Another interesting study by Gertrud Tönsing, examines the way in which a theological and social identity is formed through song. Her study focuses on the historical development of her own German Lutheran community in South Africa and she notes that the many post-Reformation Protestant authorities restricted the use of free compositions because of they were considered dangerous and "opened the door to a wide variety of heresies".⁴⁵³ She argues that Calvin, for example, understood that music was an important vehicle "to propel words into the hearts of people - both good words and bad".⁴⁵⁴ This statement acknowledges the potential for good and bad action (which of course is naturally subjective) through musical participation. Within the context of Lutheran history, she emphasizes the dialectical relationship that theological interpretation and hymn content have with each other insofar as they both shape and influence one another and in turn, shape and define group identity. In terms of hymn popularity and longevity, she contends that this is a complex issue but that songs with "critical content" often dropped out of use. This is not a particularly useful conclusion because what

⁴⁵² Titon argues in Powerhouse for God that despite a relatively large hymnal, the congregation sings about 25% of those hymns on a regular basis (224), which serves to increase the frequency of performance for those specific compositions. Therefore, a smaller pool of songs may lead us to two different conclusions: either those hymns are 'crowd favourites' (due to emotional arousal or other aesthetic reasons) or those hymns are the most significant in terms of representing group identity.
⁴⁵⁴ Tönsing, "Forming Identity Through Song", 2.
constitutes "critical content" is subjective and unclear. However, Tönsing's conclusions about the relationship between hymn lyrics and group identity are quite useful. In fact, her discussion on hymns as markers of identity fit nicely with Lieu's work on identity that I outlined in chapter four. Lyrical content functions in a parallel fashion to religious text in the sense that it provides a medium for establishing authority, which occurs through the process of identity construction.

ARIUS: A CASE STUDY

There are several heretical groups that are condemned by proto-Orthodox authorities for their musical compositions and performance of hymns. The first example comes from Arius, who according to a variety of sources wrote many beautiful hymns, which were very popular. Kim argues that Arius “was known to have composed many religious songs to popular meter”.455 The literary evidence she uses to support this claim may be found in the work of Ambrose of Milan. In an effort to counter the popular Arian hymns, Ambrose argues in his sermon against the Arian bishop Auxentius, “[His hymns are] a mighty charm, more powerful than any other. For what avails more than the confession of the Trinity, which is proclaimed daily in the mouth of all the people?”456 Craig Satterlee interprets Ambrose’s hymns as inherently anti-Arian in nature, which he claims Ambrose composed in order to “relieve the fears [of the congregation] and maintain their faith”.457 The remarkable part of Ambrose’s homily, however, may be found in the preceding statement to the above quotation where he writes, “They also say that the people are

led astray by the charms of my hymns (*hymnorum carminibus*). Certainly, I do not deny it”.458

This comment suggests that the Arians accused Ambrose of trickery through music. Therefore, this accusation was leveled at the proto-Orthodoxy by competing early Christian authorities. In other words, this was not simply the language of the proto-Orthodoxy but the so-called heretical groups employed the same rhetorical tactics against their opposition.

The Arians, in particular, were attacked by a variety of church authorities on the premise that the content of their hymns were inappropriate. Athenasius accuses Arius of fabricating hymns to put forth his heretical theology and it is significant to note that Athenasius mentions a specific hymn title in his critique – Thalia.459 While the content of this hymn is unknown to scholars, it must have been a well-known composition, since it is mentioned by name in several extant sources. In addition, Socrates describes a scene where the Arians were “seized by jealousy” because “the homousian hymns proved that they were more splendid/brilliant for singing at night”.460 Because of this jealousy, Socrates claims that they threw stones at a eunuch of the emperor, and as a result the emperor forbade the Arians to sing their hymns in public. In this case, Socrates is orchestrating a narrative that not only denounces the theology contained within the Arian hymns but he also suggests that the proto-Orthodox compositions were more splendid. In other words, his claim implies that the aesthetic quality of the hymn was inextricably linked to the lyrical content. Sozomen also recounts certain musical practices of the Arians in his work, which pick from where Socrates left off in his account. He writes, “Since those who

---

458 Ambrose of Milan, *Sermo contra Auxentium Sermo contra Auxentium de basilicis tradendis* xxxiv; PL xvi, 1017. See n. 397 above for Latin text.


460 Socrates, *Ecclesiastical History*, VI, 8; PG LXVII, 689. “καὶ ζηλοτυπίᾳ ληφθέντες…” Ως γὰρ λαμπρότεροι οἱ τοῦ ὁμοουσίου ὤμοι ἐν ταῖς νυκτεριναῖς ψυχολογίαις ἐδείκνυσαν.
follow the Arian heresy had been deprived/robbed of their assemblies in Constantinople during the reign of Theodosius, they held their assemblies outside the city wall. First they got together at night in the public spaces, and dividing themselves into separate units, they sang according to the manner of antiphons, composing the ends of verses that agreed with their doctrine”.

Ephraem, as I demonstrated in the preceding section, was another patristic authority that employed lyrical warfare against his opponents. Christine Shepardson contends that Ephraem used his musical/poetic compositions to “fear the ‘Arian’ heretics, who should be clearly distinct from ‘true’ Christians”. Lastly, Hilary of Poitiers also composed hymns using popular melodies in order to combat the so-called Arian heresy. Thus, the theological battle fought between the Arians and their opposition was carried out, at least in part, within a musical medium.

The Arians were not the only group attacked on the basis of their hymnody. There are several other examples that require brief mention. Tertullian distinguishes between “our psalms” and “the psalms of that apostate, heretic, and Platonist – Valentinus”. He argues that “our psalms” are derived from the prophet David, which legitimizes them because they originated

---

461 Sozomen, *Ecclesiastical History* VIII, VII; PG LXVII, 1536. “Επει γὰρ οἱ ἀπὸ τῆς Ἀρείου αἱρέσεως, ἀφαιρεθέντες τὸν ἐν τῇ Κωνσταντινουπόλει ἐκκλησίαν ἐπὶ τῆς Θεοδοσίου βασιλείας, πρὸ τῶν τειχῶν ἐκκλησίαζον, νόκτωρ πρότερον ἐν ταῖς ὁμοσίαις στοαῖς συνελέγοντα, καὶ εἰς συστήματα μαριζόμενοι, κατὰ τὸν τῶν ἀντιφώνων τρόπον ἔψαλλον, ἀκροτελεύτατα συντιθέντες, πρὸς τὴν αὐτὸν δόξαν πεποιημένα.”

462 Christine Shepardson, *Anti-Judaism and Christian Orthodoxy: Ephraem’s Hymns in Fourth Century Syria* (Washington, DC: Catholic University Press of America, 2008), 2. It is interesting to note that Shepardson illustrates clear parallels in Ephraem’s use of hymns as a rhetorical device against both supposed Christian heretics but also against Jewish opponents. In fact, she argues that Ephraem’s rhetorical hymns suggest that the boundaries of Syrian Orthodoxy were not clearly defined and that the strength of Ephraem’s discourse indicates that members of his assembly were perhaps sympathetic toward Arian theology or the Jewish practice of eating unleavened bread. Therefore, Ephraem saw a need for strong condemnation against these theological interpretations and practices.


464 Tertullian, *De carne Christi*, xx, 3 (McKinnon, 45). “Nobis quoque ad bane speciem Psalmi patrocinabantur, non quidem apostate, et haeretici, et platonici Valentinii, sed santiissimi et receptissimi prophetae David.”
through divine provenance. Kim offers a similar explanation in the case of Ephraem insofar as some of his compositions make a similar claim of divine provenance, which “secures the authority of these hymns for their public use and for countering the interpretive claims made by popular heretical poets like Arius, Bardesanes, and others”. Unfortunately, Tertullian does not elaborate on the content of these Valentinian psalms to which he refers. Regardless of the actual content, the musical arrangements and lyrical compositions of the group are scrutinized and denounced by Tertullian. His uses "us versus them" language while discussing the psalmody of the Valentinians in order to clearly demonstrate the use of musical composition as an identity marker, which is this case is used to show right and wrong theological orientation and mode of worship. Singing was an important part of the Valentinian liturgy, according to Einar Thomassen, because this served to unite the congregation through communal singing, much like we read about in the letters of Ignatius. Tertullian’s contemporary Hippolytus follows suit with this type of critique when he takes issue with the musical practices of the Naassene Gnostics. He writes, “This psalm was tossed off by them, in which they appear to hymn all the mysteries of their error in this manner”. Hippolytus actually provides some of the lyrical content, which is anti-Trinitarian in nature. The psalm composed by this group is a vehicle for the dissemination of their theological position and Hippolytus, like Tertullian, uses divisive language to argue that "they" are in the wrong. The psalm is the communicative medium through which this supposed heresy is propagated. The psalm is an identifying feature of the group, which results in a strong

---

465 Kim, “Orthodoxy and Heresy”, 42.
466 Thomassen, “Orthodoxy and Heresy”, 253.
467 This comparison is not suggesting that Valentinus should or should not be slotted into the category of ‘Gnostic’; rather, the nature of the critique found in Tertullian is somewhat repeated in Hippolytus and this is not necessarily contingent upon the group to which the critique is directed.
468 Hippolytus, The Refutation of all Heresies, V, X; PG XVI, 3159. “Ψαλμός αὐτοίς ἐσχεδίασται οὕτως. δὴ οὗ πάντα αὐτοῖς τὰ πλάνας μυστήρια δοκοῦσιν ὑμνοθεὶν οὕτος.” The first two lines of the hymn are: The generative law of all the Primal Mind, While the second was the diffused chaos of the First Born. “Νόμος ἦν γενικός τοῦ παντός ὁ πρῶτος Νόσος. Ο δὲ δεύτερος ἦν τοῦ πρωτοτόκου τὸ χωθὲν Χάος.”

---
condemnation by Hippolytus in order to denounce one set of teachings and reinforce the
authority of another set.

3. Participation: Women & Singing in the Early Church

The third major issue pertaining to divisive musical practices in the early church centres on the
role of women in liturgical performance and the perceived relationship between music, women,
and sexuality. There is a high degree of complexity surrounding this issue, mainly because there
is no consensus among early Christian assemblies, even within the domain of the proto-
Orthodoxy, at least in part, due to conflicting references in New Testament canon. There are
widely varied interpretations found within the fourth and fifth century discourse of patristic
sources and there are many justifications provided by advocates on both sides of the argument.
There are two important contextual factors to acknowledge before examining of the extant
references on the subject. First, chapter two illustrated some of the common social venues within
the Greco-Roman world where women performed musical instruments or sang songs. There
were both solemn occasions, such as certain religious festivals, but there were also enthusiastic
and lively occasions, where participants also drank alcohol and allegedly engaged in various
sexual activities. Early Christian authorities generally denounced these occasions and in certain
instances, female musicians were associated with courtesans and prostitutes because these roles
overlapped in the Greco-Roman world. Therefore, the image of a female musician was often
conflated with a sexualized women and this depiction ran counter to early Christian emphases on
modesty and sexual restraint. Female virginity was an important characteristic of the ideal
Christian women and as Virginia Burrus points out, the virginal figure was “closely linked with
the construction of Orthodoxy, and is frequently contrasted with the figure of the heretical harlot,
in language that seeks to delineate the boundaries of acceptable theological reflection while also creating a sharp distinction between ‘insiders’ and ‘outsiders’”. The second aspect to consider is related to Jewish conceptions of the female musician. Johannes Quasten argues that in the Jewish tradition, female musicians, and singers in particular, were very active in the liturgy. However, he provides only three textual examples to support this claim – the Therapeutae, Judges 21:21, and Exodus 15:20-21. While the references to the Therapeutae community provide the most detailed account of female singers, it seems unreasonable to conclude based on Philo that women were always active in Jewish liturgy. Did female singers really feature that prominently in Jewish liturgy? We know virtually nothing about early synagogue prayer and liturgy, which makes any assertion about the role of women in this context impossible to support. In addition, the two references that Quasten points to in the Hebrew Bible do not make a convincing case either. It is likely, however, that Jewish women sang in the home during domestic meals and festival celebrations. Oddly, Quasten does not mention this at all. Regardless, this short recapitulation of the female musician in the socio-historical context of Greco-Roman antiquity provides a general depiction, which allows us to better negotiate the early Christian discourse on women and singing.

Female Singers in the first two centuries: A Non-issue?

The gospel accounts tell us very little about female singing in the early church, which can be interpreted in several ways. Perhaps female participation in psalm singing was either not an issue at worship gatherings or women did not sing. The first explanation is certainly more plausible.

---

470 Quasten, Music & Worship, 77.
since several passages in the gospels and in the Book of Acts describe the crowds “praising” or “crying out” to God.\textsuperscript{471} There is no distinction between genders and from the gospel narratives that describe the crowds to which Jesus speaks, there are often women present. Paul’s letters contain more references to singing, which actually confuses the situation to a certain extent. In the letter to the Romans, Paul tells the community that they ought to live in accordance with Christ and together with one mouth they should glorify God.\textsuperscript{472} This excerpt focuses on unity among members and any type of exclusion against female participation would run counter to Paul’s exhortation. To recapitulate, 1 Corinthians 14:26-27 addresses the entire community. Paul tells each participant to have a hymn at communal worship. Only a few verses later, however, 1 Corinthians 14:33b-25 commands women to be silent in the church.\textsuperscript{473} Scholars generally explain this conflicting statement by noting that this verse is likely an interpolation added later.\textsuperscript{474} Since, among other things, it conflicts so obviously with 1 Cor 11:1-16, where women are not only speaking but prophesying in the assembly. In fact, it parallels 1 Timothy 2:12, which makes a similar admonition toward female members of the congregation. Yet, later patristic writers often quote Paul’s supposed remark in Corinthians in order to substantiate their exclusionary position on female involvement in the liturgy and church hierarchy.

Ignatius is also somewhat ambiguous on the topic of female singing in the congregation

\textsuperscript{471} See Matthew 2:19, where Jesus enters Jerusalem and the crowds shouts "Hosanna", which is considered to be a short acclamation often employed in the cantillation of Jewish psalms and other scriptural readings. In Matthew 26.30 and Mark 14.26, the descriptions of the last supper include reference to hymn singing at the end of the meal, which does not specifically mention women but this gives further credence to the argument that domestic worship was a place where hymns and psalms were sung within the Jewish tradition and that women likely participated in this practice in other contexts. Lastly, in Acts 2:46-47, the author mentions a group breaking bread together and "praising" God in their home. McKinnon argues that this can be interpreted as “hymning” or “psalm-singing”, which again included women. See McKinnon, Music in Early Christianity, 13.

\textsuperscript{472} See Romans 15:5-6, “ο δὲ θεὸς τῆς ὑποµονῆς καὶ τῆς παρακλήσεως δόη υµῖν τὸ αὐτὸ φρονεῖν ἐν ὀλλήλοις κατὰ Χριστὸν Ιησοῦν, ἰνα ὁµοθυµµαθὼν ἐν ἑνὶ στόµατι δοξάζητε τὸν θεόν καὶ πατέρα τοῦ κυρίου ἡµῶν Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ.”

\textsuperscript{473} 1 Corinthians 14:34. “Ἄι γυναίκες ἐν ταῖς ἐκκλησίαις σταῦτοςαν, οὐ γὰρ ἐπιτρέπεται αὐταῖς λαλεῖν· ἄλλα ὑποτασσέσθωσαν, καθὼς καὶ ὁ νόµος λέγει.”

but a similar argument can be made insofar as Ignatius’ emphasis on unity cannot be reconciled with the exclusion of female members.\textsuperscript{475} In the Letter to the Ephesians, he explicitly states that members should “sing in one voice through Jesus Christ to the Father”.\textsuperscript{476} Though it is difficult to make an argument from silence, it is quite reasonable to suggest that Ignatius’ stress on the unification of the community and his subsequent silence on the participation of women in this context indicates that there was no injunction in the Antioch assembly against women singing in the church. The few sources from the second century are similar in nature; for example, Justin Martyr discusses the necessity of offering prayers and hymns instead of sacrifices.\textsuperscript{477} Again, there is a focus on the unity of the congregation and no mention of excluding women from the ritual practice of worshipping through a shared musical medium. The whole assembly is invited and encouraged to participate in the act of singing hymns in order to demonstrate piety, faith, and commitment.

**Exclusionary Developments: Liturgical Participation of Women from the Third Century Onward**

By the end of the second century, the issue of female singing begins to enter discourse on appropriate means of worship. While there is no indication of any specific injunction, the earliest hint of conflict can be found in Clement of Alexandria. In the *Protrepticus*, Clement uses comparative imagery of the Dionysian maenads with the "daughters of God", in order to construct or perhaps reinforce the idealized image of the Christian woman. In this reference, Clement refers to the maenads as "unholy" while the "daughters of God are fair lambs" and

\textsuperscript{475} Johannes Quasten makes a strong case for this argument in chapter 4 of *Music & Worship*. See page 77.  
\textsuperscript{476} Ignatius, *Letter to the Ephesians* IV, 1-2; PG V, 736. “ᾳδητε ἐν φωνῇ μὴ διὰ Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ τῷ πατρί”.  
Interestingly, Clement notes that they partake in a "modest choral dance". These maidens are deemed to be righteous and they sing their praises to God in a most exemplary fashion. The need for such a comparison perhaps stems from questionable behaviours within the Alexandrian assembly. If the pervasive model of the ideal Christian woman was a modest and chaste individual, it is plausible that Clement employed this comparative technique in order to strengthen this ideal and weed out any non-conformists. Clement’s appraisal seeks to completely divorce the image of female singers in the church community from stereotypical associations with female sexuality or prostitution, which was often the case in Greco-Roman antiquity. In fact, Hippolytus mentions singing virgins in his description of the agape meal. He states, “And let them arise therefore after supper and pray; let the boys sing psalms, and the virgins also”. Thus, Hippolytus is attempting to re-orient female singers toward the image of the virgin. He does not mention the participation of other women (married or widowed). This omission could be interpreted to mean one of two things: virgins were the only female participants allowed to sing hymns at the agape meal or Hippolytus does not provide an exhaustive account and perhaps widows or married women were allowed to join in this component of the ritual practice. If

478 Clement of Alexandria, Protrepticus XII, 119, 1-2; PG VIII, 240. “βακχεύουσι δὲ ἐν αὐτῷ οὐχ οἱ Σεμέλης τῆς κεραυνίας ἀδελφαὶ ἡ Μαινάδες, ἡ δύσαγνον κρεανάμιαν μουόμειαν, ἄλλ’ ἡ τοῦ Θεοῦ θυγατέρες, ἡ ἀμανᾶς ἡ καλαί, τὰ σεμνὰ τοῦ Λόγου θεσπίζουσαι ἁγία, χορόν ἐγείρονσαι σώφρονα.”

479 Hippolytus, Apostolic Tradition, 25 (McKinnons translation, 47). McKinnon's translation is based on Botte's Latin reconstruction of the Ethiopic manuscript. See Hippolyte De Rome: La Tradition Apostolique, ed. by Bernard Botte (Paris: Latour-Maubourg, 1968). "Et surgent ergo post cenam orantes, pueri dicent psalmos et virgines. Et postea diaconus, mixtum calicem oblationis cum accipiet, dicet psalmum de illis in quibus scriptum est alleluia. Et postea presbyter si praecepit, etiam ex isdem psalmis. Et postea (quam) episcopus obtulit calicem, (eorum) qui conveniunt calici psalmum dicet, omnem cum alleluia, dum dicet omnes. Cum recitabant psalmos, dicent omnes alleluia, quod dictur: laudamus qui est deus; gloria et laus ei qui creavit omne saeculum per verbum tantum. Et perfecto psalmo, benedicet calicem et do fragmentis dibit omnibus fidelibus." It should also be noted that some scholars contest the authorship of this source, originally called Egyptian Church Order. For example Paul Bradshaw argues that this document may be a composite of various fragments by different authors at different times and he is quite cautious in his assessment. He contends that this recollection may not accurately reflect Roman practice in the early third century. See Bradshaw, Early Christian Worship: A Basic Introduction to Ideas and Practice (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1996), 15-16.
have simply omitted any reference to other female singers in order to effectively portray the idealized female congregant in action.

Neither Clement nor Hippolytus, however, engages in a sustained rhetorical condemnation directed at other Christ-following groups. Instead, Hippolytus describes ideal ritual musical performance, in which virgins are the exemplary models and Clement outlines the correct and appropriate behaviours in ritual practice, with much of his critique directed toward Greco-Roman female musicians. Yet, the presence of competing Christ-following assemblies is the impetus for later attacks on the musical practices ‘heretical’ groups. There are several potential reasons for the eventual exclusion of women from singing in some Christian groups. Quasten argues the most significant reason for this prohibition was “the fact that among heretics women had prominent rank as prophetesses, lectresses, deaconesses, and singers. The gnostics began with such an arrangement and we know that among the Marcionites women filled the same offices”.480 It would seem logical to make a similar claim about the Montanists but little is known about their singing practices, aside from Irenaeus’ comment regarding a [Montanist] "favoured sister" who finds her inspiration for ecstatic experiences in psalms and hymns.481 What do the extant sources say about this? Do the source materials support Quasten’s theory or is there another reason for the exclusion of female participation in musical worship? What can the debate over female participation in musical liturgy that emerges in the third century contribute to scholarly understandings of the terms orthodoxy and heresy?

At first glance, it may appear the conflict surrounding female singers may in fact be characterized within the context of the proto-orthodox/heresy debates of the third, fourth, and

480 Quasten, Music & Worship, 82.
481 Irenaeus, De anima, IX, 4: PL II, 669. “Est hodie soror apud nos revelationum charistmata sortita, quas in ecclesia inter dominica solemnia per ecstasin in spiritu partitur.”

198
fifth centuries. Quasten argues that this so-called struggle either for or against the participation of women in the liturgical singing became a prominent issue from the time of Paul of Samosata.\textsuperscript{482} During the third century, several groups that are eventually labeled heretical by later proto-Orthodox authorities became known for establishing all-female choirs. This was problematic because female choruses were popular features at Greco-Roman religious festivals as well as at the theatre. Therefore, female choirs were associated with paganism and idolatry in addition to sexual immorality and promiscuity. Separate female choirs also played a prominent role in the Therapeutae community but it seems highly unlikely that this example from within a Jewish context would have resulted in any sustained critique with regard to female singing, as this group does not figure prominently into Patristic discourse.\textsuperscript{483}

According to Quasten, proto-Orthodox authorities challenged these so-called heretics on the grounds that they organized female choirs to sing during the liturgy. He contends that Paul of Samosata was attacked by his opponents for two specific reasons: first, he was accused of composing his own hymns and replacing “the usual hymns concerning Christ”. Second, he was challenged on the grounds that he allowed women to sing these compositions during the Easter celebrations.\textsuperscript{484} Eusebius describes some of these ritual practices in his corpus on the history of the church. Concerning the practices of Paul of Samosata, he writes, “He ceased singing those psalms addressed to our Lord Jesus Christ, because they were new or authored by new writers, and instead he prepared women to sing psalms to him in the middle of the assembly on the great

\textsuperscript{482} Quasten, \textit{Music & Worship}, 85.
\textsuperscript{483} Eusebius briefly mentions the Therapeutae in his recapitulation of Philo’s \textit{The Contemplative Life} and he makes the claim that this group may have been early Christians. He does recount Philo’s summation of their musical practices (including hymn and psalm singing) but interestingly he never explicitly mentions the female choruses that Philo describes. See Eusebius, \textit{The History of the Church}, II xvii, 1-23; PG XX, 181-184.
\textsuperscript{484} Quasten, \textit{Music & Worship}, 82.
day of Pascha, but anyone hearing them would bristle”. Remarkably, Eusebius describes a very similar practice instituted by Ephraem the Syrian. According to some accounts, Ephraem instituted the same policy in Edessa. Shepardson argues that Ephraem conducted choirs of women who sang his hymns or midrashe within a liturgical context. Quasten interprets this to mean that Ephraem was once again utilizing mimicry in order to denounce heretical practice while at the same time appealing to those who were attracted to this type of practice. This is quite similar to Ephraem’s appropriation of popular melody (or those melodies used by opponents such as Harmonius) in order to re-associate the melody with different lyrics. In this case, he formed choirs of women to achieve a similar aim – to implement the ritual practices of his opponents but to re-formulate the theology message within the context of that practice.

Quasten includes an excerpt from Assemani’s anthology, which includes an interesting description.

When the holy Ephraem saw how all were being torn away by the singing [of the heretics], and since he wanted to keep his own people away from dishonourable and worldly plays and concerts, he himself founded choirs of consecrated virgins, taught them the hymns and responses whose wonderful contents celebrated the birth of Christ, his baptism, fasting, suffering, resurrection and ascension, as well as the martyrs and the dead. He had these virgins come to the church on the feasts of the Lord and on those of the martyrs, as they did on Sundays. He himself was in their midst as their father and the citharist of the Holy Spirit, and he taught them music and the laws of song.

---

485 Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History*, VII, xxx, 10; PG XX, 713. “ἀλλὰ σοφιστής καὶ γόης ψαλμοῦς δὲ τοὺς μὲν εἰς τὸν Κύριον ἣν ὤν ἶςοιν Χριστὸν παύσας, ὡς δὴ νεωτέρους καὶ νεωτέρων ἀνδρῶν συγγράμματα, εἰς ἑαυτὸν δὲ ἐν μέση τῇ Ἐκκλησίᾳ, τῇ μεγάλῃ τοῦ Πάσχα ἡμέρᾳ ψαλμοδοῦν γυναῖκας παρεκκληζών, ὃν καὶ ἀκούσας ἄν τις φρίξειν.”


488 Assemani, *Bibliotheca Orientalis* I (Rome, 1720), 47-48 (as cited in Quasten on 110 n. 99). This translation is from Quasten, 79. “Videns beatus Ephraem quantum omnes cantu caperentur, illosque a profanis et inhonestis lusibus choreisque evocare cupiens, choros virginum Deo sacrarum instituit docuitque hymnos et scalas et responsoria, sublimibus et spiritualibus sententis referta de Christi nativitate, baptismo, iuunio, actibus, passione, resurrectione, et ascensione, de martyribus, de paentientia, de defunctis; efficet ut virgines Deo sacrae ad ecclesiam conveniarent cunctis solemnibus Domini festis et martyrum solemnitatibus atque diebus modos musicos et modulandi carminis leges.”
This description is interesting for several reasons. First, the author specifically attributes Ephraem’s use of female choirs to combatting heresy. This is significant because it appears to give Ephraem a free pass to employ heretical practices in order to fight these opponents on their own level. Second, the practice of singing is a recognized mode of rhetoric or polemical engagement. All of the ritualistic components of musical performance play a key role in determining the legitimacy of the practice in this context. The above passage suggests that Ephraem taught these women what he deemed to be proper songs that contained specific theological discourse pertaining to baptism, the resurrection, etc. It should also be noted that Ephraem did not train all women to sing in his choral ensemble; rather, he taught only virgins.\footnote{Ephraem mentions singing virgins in the Hymns of Eastertide. In one stanza he writes, “Again, my Lord, the recesses of our ears are filled with the musical strains of virgins”. See \textit{Hymns of Eastertide} II, 8; Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalis CCXLVIII (Paris, 1903), 84. This translation is from McKinnon, 93.} Thus, he implemented the musical practices of Paul and Harmonius only to a certain extent. Quasten fails to note this distinction in his analysis and claims that Ephraem sought to “imitate them for tactical reasons and likewise use such choirs of women in order to deprive their opponents of this weapon of attack”.\footnote{Quasten, \textit{Music & Worship}, 85.} Yet, it is significant that only virgins were included in this chorus. It is clear that this tactical appropriation only went so far and other issues such as female sexuality and promiscuity can still be seen in the subtext of such discourse.

As I have already pointed out, Ephraem’s response to the so-called heretical practices of his opponents was not typical by any means. In fact, there are numerous statements made by early church fathers that condemn the practice of female singing altogether. The first example may be found in the works of the 4\textsuperscript{th} century bishop, Cyril of Jerusalem. In his \textit{Catechetical Lectures}, Cyril writes, “The group of virgins should sing songs or read quietly as a group. On
one hand, they should speak with their lips, but on the other hand, nothing should be heard, for 'I do not allow women to speak in the assembly'. Married women, and those like them, should imitate this: when they pray they should move their lips, but in way that they may be heard'. Cyril explicitly mentions virgins in his work, which once again demonstrates a preoccupation and clear correlation between women, singing, and sexuality. This treatise takes Paul’s supposed injunction in 1 Corinthians to its literal conclusion and Cyril argues that there is no room for interpretation on the matter. Even the linguistic similarity between Cyril and (Ps-) Paul here is clear. 1 Corinthians 14:34 states, “αἱ γυναῖκες ἐν ταῖς ἐκκλησίαις σιγάτωσαν, οὐ γὰρ ἐπιτρέπεται αὐταῖς λαλεῖν: ἄλλα ὑποτασσέσθωσαν, καθὼς καὶ ὁ νόμος λέγει” and Cyril writes, “γυναικὸς γὰρ λαλεῖν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ οὐκ ἐπιτρέπο”. Women are not permitted to raise their voices during liturgy in the church and singing is no exception. However, this viewpoint espoused by Cyril seems to contradict the earlier emphasis on unity within the congregation and Ignatius’ focus on una voce dicente. Yet, the next example clearly outlines a potential explanation for such a shift.

The fifth century Alexandrian ascetic, Isidore of Pelusium, justifies the earlier participation of female singing in one of his many letters. He writes, “The apostles of the Lord, the ones wishing to stop the foolish talk in the assembly, and who set down the teachings for us, intelligently allowed women to sing there. But as all of the inspired/divine teachings have been turned into the opposite, this too, has become a sin. They do not feel compunction in hearing the godly hymns but instead they misuse the sweet melody to excite the passion, inferring that it is

491 Cyril of Jerusalem, *Procatechesis* 14; PG LXXXVIII, 356. “Καὶ ὁ σύλλογος πάλιν ὁ παρθενικὸς οὕτω συναιλέθθη ἢ πάλιν ἢ ἀναγεννώσκοις ξυνηγή, ὃστε λαλεῖν μὲν τὰ χείλη, μὴ ἄκουειν δὲ τὰ ἄλλατρα ὅτα, γυναῖκι γὰρ λαλεῖν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ οὐκ ἐπιτρέπῳ. Καὶ ἢ ἐγγαμος δὲ ὁμοίως μιμεῖσθω. Καὶ προσευχήσθη καὶ τὰ χείλη κινεῖσθω, φοινὴ δὲ μὴ ἄκουεσθω.”
This statement presupposes that women were granted permission to participate in hymn singing in order to prevent gossip in the church. This type of reasoning sounds very similar to Theodoret of Cyrus’ justification for the use of instruments by the Jews. He claims that God allowed them to use instruments because “they were fond of play and laughter” and God wished to “free them from the error of idols…so he allowed them to do this, thereby avoiding the greater evil by allowing the lesser”. Isidore claims that the apostles allowed women to sing in order to avoid their gossip (avoiding a greater evil by allowing the lesser) but according to Isidore, it was necessary to revoke this permission because women were misusing this divine gift in a way that paralleled the pagan use of music. The reference to “theatre singing” could potentially refer to a variety of elements including idolatry, sexualized behaviours, or other immoral acts such as the overconsumption of alcohol. One other reference that prohibits female singing in the church is quite similar to Cyril’s injunction listed above. The Didascalia of the Three Hundred Eighteen Fathers dictates, “Women are ordered not to speak in the church, not even softly, nor may the y sing along or take part in the responses, but they should only be silent and pray to God”. Thus, by the end of the fourth or perhaps the beginning of the fifth century (depending on the accepted dating of this text), official injunctions existed against female participation in musical liturgy.

492 Isidore of Pelusium, Epistle I, 90; PG LXXVIII, 244. “Τὰς ἐν ἐκκλησίαις φλυαρίας καταπαύσαι βουλόμενοι οἱ τοῦ Κυρίου ἀπόστολοι, καὶ τῆς ἡμῶν παιδευταί καταστάσεως, ψάλλειν ἐν αὐταῖς τὰς γυναῖκας συνετῶν συνεχώπησαν. Αὐτοὶ δὲ τοὺς τοῦτοι θεοφόρα διδάγατον καὶ τοῦτο εἰς ἔκλυσιν καὶ ἁμαρτίας ὑπόθεσεν τὸς πλεῖον γέγονε. Καὶ κατάνυξιν μὲν ἐκ τὸν θείον ἤμων οὐχ ὑπομένουσα, τῇ δὲ τοῦ μέλους ἤδυτητι εἰς ἐρεθισμὸν παθητῶν καὶ λογίζονται. 493 Theodoret of Cyrus, Interpretatio in psalmos 150; PG LXXX, 1996. “Τὰ τοῖν πάντα ἔνθεσθαι συνεχώρησε, τῆς οἱ εἰς ἓπολῶν αὐτοὺς πλάνης ἀπαλλάξαι θελήσας. Ἐπείδη γὰρ φιλοσεισμονές τινες ἦσαν, καὶ φιλογέλωτες, ταῦτα δὲ ἅπαντα ἐν τοῖς εἰς ἓπολῶν ἐπετελέστω νοοῦ, συνεχώρησε ταῦτα, διὰ τῶν αὐτοὺς ἐπελεχόμενος, καὶ τῇ ἐλάττων θαλάπη κυλοῦν τὴν μάζαν.” 494 Didascalia of the Three Hundred and Eighteen Fathers, patrum 8. This translation may be found in Quasten, Music & Worship, 81. “γυναῖξ ἐς παραγγέλεσθαι ἐν ἐκκλησίαις μὴ λαλείν, μὴ δὲ ἐν φιλοσεισμῷ, μὴ τε συμφάλλειν, μὴ συνυπακούειν, εἰ μὴ μόνον αὐγάν, καὶ εὐχεσθαι θεῷ δὲ ἐντεύξεις καὶ σεμνῆς πολιτείας.” For further commentary on this text and potential dating, see Pierre Batifol, Studia Patristica: études d'ancienne littérature chrétienne (Paris: Leroux, 1889).
Despite the existence of several strongly worded prohibitions against women singing in the church, this was not a uniform feature of Christian liturgy. In fact, there are several literary examples that either describe female participation in the liturgy in neutral terms or explicitly promote this practice. Ambrose, the fourth century bishop of Milan, formulates quite a different interpretation of (Ps-) Paul’s statement from 1 Corinthians than Jerome. Ambrose composed a collection of hymns and he was seemingly well disposed toward the use of new compositions in the liturgy. In his homiletic commentary on the psalms, Ambrose promotes psalm singing in worship and explicitly addresses previous justifications for the exclusion of women during this ritual practice. After a lengthy paragraph outlining the emotional benefits to singing (such as the release of anxiety, a shield in a time of fear, or the alleviation of sorrow), Ambrose states “The Apostle admonishes women to be silent in the church, yet they do well to join in a psalm; this is gratifying for all ages and fitting for both genders … even young women sing psalms with no loss of wifely decency, and girls sing a hymn to God with sweet and supple voice while maintaining decorum and suffering no lapse in modesty”.495 Ambrose argues that singing is exempt from Paul’s admonition because there are specific benefits to singing psalms as a unified congregation. In the same passage, he claims, “A psalm joins those with differences, unites those at odds and reconciles those who have been offended … It is after all a great bond of unity for the full number of people to join in one chorus”. This is reminiscent of Ignatius and his emphasis on the unifying potential of communal singing. For Ambrose, this goal of unification supersedes other precedents that attempt to exclude female members of the assembly from participating in communal singing.

495 Ambrose, Explanatio psalmi I, 9; PG XIV, 925. This translation is from McKinnon, Music in Early Christian Literature, 126-127. “Mulieres Apostolus in Ecclesis tacere jubet: psalmum etiam bene clamant: hic omni dulcis aetati, hic utrique aptus est sexui…jeuvenetue ipsae sine dispedio matronalis psallunt pudoris, puellular sine prolapsione vercundiae cum sobrietate gravitates hymnnum Deo, inflexae vocis suavitate modulantur.”
There are several other references to singing in unison from other church authorities that illustrate a similar understanding to musical practice in the church. Eusebius, for example, writes in his commentary on the psalms, “In every way, the symphony (singing together) would be more pleasing to God than any musical instrument, according to the whole assembly of God, with like-minded spirit and single disposition, to be of one mind and to be of the same faith and piety, we raise melody in unison in our psalmody”.

He does not explicitly refer to female participants but his description of unified singing within the congregation is certainly not exclusionary in any way. Eusebius writes about the heretical practices of certain groups and if widespread prohibition on female singing existed, it seems highly probable that Eusebius would mention that in his work on the history of the church or in his exegesis on the psalms. If we move ahead almost a century later, John Chrysostom laments the "former unity" that existed among Christ-following congregations. In his homily on the 1 Corinthians, Chrysostom depicts a golden era when the church was supposedly unified by the practice of psalm singing. He writes, “In older times, everyone used to come together and sang psalms in common. We also do this now, but at that time there was but one heart and soul among everyone, while now one could not see this kind of unity in a single spirit, but much disagreement everywhere…. And there should always be but one voice in the assembly, just as there is one body.” Of course, his portrayal of the early church is idealistic in nature. However, his admonition pertaining to one voice and one body suggests that Chrysostom’s understanding of ritual singing is much like Ambrose’s insofar

496 Eusebius, *In psalmum XCI*, 4; PG XXIII, 1172-1173. “Παντὸς δ’ οὖν ὄργανον μουσικὸν γένοιτ ἂν τῷ θεῷ προσηνέστερά ἢ τῶν Χριστοῦ λαῶν συμφωνία, καθ’ ἣν ἐν πάσαις ταῖς τοῦ θεοῦ ἐκκλησίαις, ὁμογνώμων ψυχῆ καὶ μιᾷ διαθέσει, ὁμοφροσύνη τῆς καὶ ὁμοδοξία πίστεως καὶ εὐσέβειας, ὁμόφωνον μέλος ἐν ταῖς ψαλμολογίαις ἄναπέμπομεν.”

497 John Chrysostom, *In 1 Corinthios*, Homily XXXVI, 5-6; PG LXI, 313-315. “Συνήσασαν τὸ παλαιὸν ἄπαντες, καὶ ύπεγάλλον κοινῆ. Τοῦτο ποιοῦμεν καὶ νῦν; ἀλλὰ τότε μὲν ἐν ἅπασιν ψυχῆ ἦν καὶ καρδία μιᾷ, νῦν δὲ οὐδὲ ἐν μιᾷ ψυχῇ τὴν ὁμόναν ἐκείνην ἴδοι τις ἃν, ἀλλὰ πολὺς ὁ πόλεμος πανταχοῦ... Καὶ γὰρ μίαν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ δεῖ φωνὴν εἶναι ἃει, καθάπερ ἕνος ὄντος σώματος.”
as the unification of the congregation takes precedence over any proposed exclusion of female singers in the church. There are several passages where he critiques certain ostentatious practices at weddings and funerals (such as the use of instruments and excessive displays of wailing) but fails to condemn women in particular. 498 This is a notable feature of Chrysostom’s homily because often women played instruments at these occasions and engaged in emotional displays at funerals (particularly in a Greco-Roman context) and it is significant that he does not make any critical or disparaging comments about female participation at such events.

Women Singing in the Church: A Marker of Heresy?

The preceding examination of primary source material has shown that the role of women in early Christian liturgy, specifically in the musical domain, was a complex issue. It was a serious point of contention among various church authorities and female participation in liturgical singing was contingent upon a variety of factors. Quasten’s framework, which suggests that some church fathers disparaged the practice of female singing because of heretical sects featuring female musicians in the liturgy seems to explain this phenomenon only in part. If psalm singing was supposed to be a male-only activity within the proto-Orthodox church, then why was this prohibition against women not unanimous?

The conflict surrounding female musicianship reveals the multi-faceted nature of the problem. We can frame the discussion, at least in part, as a struggle between a rejection of overt female sexuality, a strong condemnation of Greco-Roman ritual practices, a growing establishment of competing patriarchal authorities, and the quest for unity among members of the Christ-following assemblies. In addition, musical practice (and specifically psalm singing) was

498 On inappropriate uses of music at weddings, see In Acta Apostolorum, Homily XLII, 3; PG LX, 301 and on overly emotional displays at funerals, see In Hebraeos, Homily IV, 5; PG LXIII, 43.
viewed as a gift from the divine realm, further complicating the issue. Thus, musical practice is inextricably linked to these other socio-religious domains and plays a key role in establishing a Christian identity alongside these other elements. The early church fathers understood female participation in the liturgy within the context of these terms, which explains why there were such variant points of view on the subject. Some proto-orthodox authorities leveled accusations of heresy against rival factions based on their incorporation of female choirs but there is an important distinction to make here. None of the proto-orthodox authors we have examined in this chapter advocate the establishment of female choruses (aside from Ephraem who claims to do this as a form of mimicry in order to disparage rivals and recruit those so-called heretics to his own congregation).

For Ambrose and Chrysostom, the exclusion of female singers contradicts an early emphasis on unity and the subsequent strength and power of worship that comes from this unification of members. I am not arguing that these church fathers would have organized choirs consisting solely of within the their assembly; in fact, that too would run contrary to an emphasis on unity. Rather, their comments illustrate the difficulty in excluding any participants from certain elements of worship. Female participation in liturgical singing is a thorny issue in relation to the orthodox/heresy discussion because it is inherently tied up with other social and theological frameworks and there is no general consensus, even within proto-Orthodox circles. It is, however, used as a polemical tool by various sources in order to demarcate the boundaries between us and them. Musical performance is a unique mechanism in this sense because it is both the subject of discursive narratives and a ritual practice that is employed by all early Christ-following assemblies, albeit in different ways.
Recruitment, Rhetoric, and Music

The nature of religious identities within early Christ-following communities is a complex phenomenon as evidenced by the discussion above. Early Christian writings on musical practice demonstrate that this was a key ritual component of Christian identity that was used as a distinguishing marker of orthodoxy and heresy. This discussion serves to further our understanding of religious recruitment and the use of music as a rhetorical device in an attempt to attract new members. Various models of religious recruitment have been put forth by scholars and I briefly mentioned Stark and Bainbridge's theory on success in the introductory chapter, which emphasized the importance of social networks and cultural continuity in the success of religious movements. This model also provides a starting point for this section, which argues that music was used as an effective tool of religious recruitment by early Christ-followers.

Scholars have examined potential reasons for "conversion" but more recently the use of this term has come into question. Conversion as religious experience is a difficult classification and some scholars argue that the language of recruitment is preferable because it "avoids the complex psychological questions" associated with conversion. Stark and Bainbridge examine the nature of missionizing movements in their work on various religious cults and sects and their work provides a useful sociological foundation that has been used by scholars as a platform from which to formulate other arguments pertaining to religious recruitment. In their article Networks of Faith: Interpersonal Bonds and Recruitment to Cults and Sects, Stark and Bainbridge argue that religious membership spreads through social networks. They demonstrate the significance of interpersonal bonds in the process of religious recruitment and use a variety of case studies (such

as methods of recruitment used by the Mormons) to support their conclusion, which states "Rather than being drawn to the group because of the appeal of its ideology, people were drawn to the ideology because of their ties to the group".\footnote{Rodney Stark and William Bainbridge, "Networks of Faith: Interpersonal Bonds and Recruitment to Cults and Sects," \textit{American Journal of Sociology} 85 (1980): 1378-1379.} I will return to this concept below in a discussion of communal singing as a ritual practice that is highly effective at facilitating the type of social bonds which Stark and Bainbridge describe in their work.

Stark's other model of success that I referenced in the introductory chapter pertains to the maintenance of cultural continuity in new religious groups. His theory states that there must be a balance between the degree of difference and the level of familiarity between the new and extant religious groups.\footnote{Rodney Stark, \textit{Cities of God: The Real Story of How Christianity Became an Urban Movement and Conquered Rome} (San Francisco: HarperCollins Publishers, 2006), 126-127.} Merrill Singer builds on this premise in his article on the use of folklore in religious conversion. He contends that effective recruitment relies on the ability of the missionizing group to attract new members and this attraction is predicated on emotional bonds that generally precede any type of conversion. The creation of these emotional bonds is facilitated through folklore, according to Singer, which he defines as "a set of cognitively and emotionally charged symbols employed in a creative fashion to transmit messages between a performer and his audience".\footnote{Merrill Singer, The Use of Folklore in Religious Conversion: The Chassidic Case," \textit{Review of Religious Research} 22 (1980): 172-173.} Singer's understanding of folklore then includes a variety of artistic media including story-telling, song, and dance. He refers to various examples including the use of song and chant by the Hare Krishnas and the use of traditional African dance by Catholic missionaries in South Africa. It is not my intent here to engage Singer's understanding of folklore (and any inherent problems with his definition); rather, his focus on recruitment through the use of an artistic medium, and music in particular, provides further data that supports
my argument regarding the efficacy of communal singing in the recruitment practices of early Christ-followers. Singer also notes the pedagogical function of this method insofar as storytelling and singing can be used to teach potential converts about a particular worldview and this is concurrent with my argument about early Christian authorities using hymns and psalms in precisely this fashion.

Dennis Duling also builds on the sociological elements of Stark and Bainbridge's theory and outlines several different models of the recruitment process in Greco-Roman antiquity. It is his discussion of "motivational factors" that is useful here. He argues that there are two sets of factors involved in recruitment: predisposing factors and situational factors. Predisposing factors include experience, psychological tension, and religious seeking, while situational factors include social encounters, bond formation, and intensive interaction.\(^{503}\) Collective singing plays an important role in the cognitive processes that result in bond formation and emotional intensity. Additionally, singing is an activity that permeates the immediate surrounding auditory space and given the high frequency of vocal performance in antiquity (ie. religious festivals, dinner parties, work, etc.), the likelihood of a social encounter that involved singing, particularly within the Christ-following community, was quite high. The predisposing factors that Duling mentions are all defined through cognitive processes and as I described in chapter three, music plays an important part in tagging memories of past experience as well as creating and relieving psychological tension. Therefore, music affects these cognitive processes and has the ability to strengthen the intensity of the situational factors listed above.

Religious recruitment is clearly predicated on the emotional or social needs of an individual as illustrated by Stark, Bainbridge, Duling, and others. Géraldine Mossière's study on

\(^{503}\) Duling, “Recruitment to the Jesus Movement”, 138.
the emotional elements of the 'conversion' process examines the role of music and religious recruitment in an African Evangelical congregation in Montreal. Mossière's article makes several important claims that are relevant to my own connections between music and religious recruitment in antiquity. She notes that music in this particular church functions in a way that involves "bodily dimensions of the self in religious ritual ... The music could be said to touch the inner self of the convert who makes it her own before expressing it through her body". In other words, the embodied knowledge that is gained through musical ritual performance has an emotional and psychological effect on a participant that serves to connect the identity of the individual with the rest of the group. Singing creates an emotional situation that draws the attention and focus of the participants or potential members. It fosters a feeling of unity and belonging because the songs and hymns that Mossière describes in her case study represent or reflect the social reality of the people singing them. She argues that "Conversion narratives are built upon selected lived events that are interpreted in terms of the adopted religious ideology". Hymn singing reflects those lived events in a way that strengthens the social bonds between the newcomer and the group. According to Mossière, the intensity of a ritual is organized and controlled through hymn-singing during a church service and this evokes certain feelings and emotions in a participant that relates their own life to other members of the religious community as well as to religious doctrine. In fact, melody and rhythm can be used deliberately to manipulate the level of emotional intensity and engagement of the participants. Early Christian authorities were well aware of the emotional responses that musical ritual could evoke from participants. Therefore, using music as a medium of self-definition in relation to the Other, early

505 Mossière, "Emotional Dimensions of Conversion", 120.
Christian authorities were able to employ this form of ritual practice as a way to attract recruits by creating an emotionally charged environment and strengthening social bonds between insider and outsider.

Lewis R. Rambo also emphasizes the affective component necessary for religious conversion and recruitment. He argues that many religious groups employ the use of music, art, and theatre as recruitment strategies.\(^5\) These activities create and strengthen the social bonds between an individual and the group, which only increases the attractiveness of a particular religious group. The cognitive basis of this relationship between music and emotion was established in chapter three and the neuroscience models I discussed in that chapter provide empirical evidence that helps to explain this connection. Additionally, Kelly Bulkeley follows Rambo's integrated approach to understanding conversion and recruitment in cognitive terms, focusing on the various dimensions of this process including "mind/brain functioning, personal circumstance, cultural context, and theological history".\(^6\) Bulkeley applies several key theoretical concepts from the field of cognitive science in his discussion such as brain physiology, neuroplasticity, and brain disfunction. These necessary aspects of cognitive science further our understanding of religious conversion and Bulkeley's most significant contribution here is his discussion of cognition and religious ritual. He focuses primarily on visual stimuli and meditative practices but his conclusions are equally applicable to musical ritual and cognition.

The main premise in Bulkeley's overview is that cognitive neuroscience can "illuminate the effectiveness of religious practices that stimulate the visual processing system or try to shut it

---


In other words, ritualized practices that are most effective at attracting new members to the group are those that function in this way and I argue that auditory processing can be categorized in similar terms. Due to the strong connection between music and emotion, melody is particularly effective at eliciting a specific emotional response that may result in a desire by the individual to join the group through participation in that ritualized practice. Lawrence W. Barsalou and his colleagues also emphasize the role of emotion in religious recruitment. They argue "that by creating powerful emotional responses in people, such rituals increase the chances that people will abandon their current way of interpreting the world and adopt a new one". Since musical participation can evoke a strong emotional response, it is perhaps one of the best examples of effective ritual for the purpose of recruitment.

As many of the literary examples from chapter four demonstrate, early Christian writers often described musical ritual in relation to the practices of the Other as a way of positively categorizing and distinguishing their own music. The aforementioned work by Tatian, Discourse on the Greeks, provides such an example. This type of comparative discourse is very important because it creates group boundaries through the articulation of idealized typologies. In other words, these remarks indicate that members of the in-group act in a certain way while non-members act in a different, and by extension undesirable, manner. Richard Ascough’s discussion of the "Rhetoric of Recruitment" examines the rhetorical forms that early Christian writers used in order to reinforce the in-group identity. Ascough contends that this mode of identity formation was very similar to a variety of Greco-Roman associations. He refers to the rhetoric of praise, in which an author will provide positive reinforcement of a community, individual, a deity, or even

---

508 Bulkeley, "Religious Conversion", 249.
an object or practice in order to foster positive advertising. This presents an inherent desirability of a specific group, which simultaneously raises the status of the in-group while disparaging the out-group. Not only does this type of rhetoric demarcate an identity boundary between social groups, it also indirectly creates an opportunity for advocacy. In other words, disparaging the out-group group aims to attract members to the in-group by solidifying these social boundaries in order to promote adherence.

How does early Christian music function in this way? Ascough argues that praise or epideictic rhetoric serves to promote one group over another within the context of social or religious rivalry. This is accomplished through the illustration of differences and similarities between two groups. The above quote from Justin Martyr demonstrates precisely this type of strategy: the out-group communicates with God through unnecessary sacrifice but the Christ-followers communicate with God through prayers and hymns. A later example comes from John Chrysostom, where song itself is the similarity between the in-group and out-group. He writes that the psalms are “established by God” in order to demarcate the line between in-group and out-group forms of musical expression. Ascough also refers to the “rhetoric of superiority”, which he argues results in an “Othering” of those who are not part of the in-group. Basil the Great employs precisely this type of tactic in his Exhortation to Youths when he writes, “The passions that descended from illiberality and low-mindedness are naturally generated by this kind of music. But we should pursue closely the other kind, which is better and leads to the better, and which, as they say, was used by David, the composer of the sacred songs, to restore

---

511 Ascough, “Defining Community-Ethos”, 63-64.
513 Ascough, Defining Community-Ethos”, 74.
the king from his madness”. He specifically states that the psalms are "better", which reinforces Christian musical practices as superior over pagan musical rituals. These examples demonstrate the use of musical practice as both a rhetorical device and an identity marker.

Singing is a particularly effective activity for fostering feelings of group identity and music is used in two specific ways. First, the actual practice of singing provides a time and place in which to experience feelings of social cohesion. Second, the ritualistic elements of communal singing are also the subject of doctrinal writings whereby the utility of song as an expression of faith and mode of unification is discussed in more concrete terms. The examples present above have mainly centered on Christ-following groups and their process of self-definition in opposition to their Jewish or Greco-Roman counterparts. Yet, similar rhetorical forms can be found in Christian discourse that seeks to define a particular community in relation to another Christ-following group/authority. In other words, discourse on musical practice becomes a medium for definitions of orthodoxy and heresy in the third and fourth centuries.

Conclusion

Musical performance was an integral component of early Christian worship and as this chapter has illustrated, the nature of music was a contentious issue during the growth and development of early Christ-following communities. This conflict was rooted in the several different issues pertaining to music in daily life but these disagreements generally centered on the theological, emotional, and social implications of musical participation. On one hand, there is an inherent

---

514 Basil the Great, Exhortation to Youths as to How They Shall Best Profit by the Writings of Pagan Authors vii; PG XXXI, 581. “Ἀνελευθερίας γὰρ δὴ καὶ ταπεινότητος ἐκάθεν πάθη ἕκα ποιήθη τοῦτοις τε μουσικῆς εἴδους ἐγγίνεσθαι πέφυκεν. Ἀλλὰ τὴν ἂντεραν μεταδιωκτέον ἡμῖν, τὴν ἀμείνωται καὶ εἰς ἀμείνων φέρουσαν, ἢ καὶ Δαβίδ χρώμενος, ὁ ποιητὴς τῶν ἱερῶν ἀσμάτων, ἕκα τῆς μανίας ὡς φασί, τὸν βασιλέα καθίστη.”
danger in musical participation because of the potential emotional response and resulting actions but on the other, an existence without song is not a conceptually possibility in Mediterranean antiquity. And therein lies the ultimate power of music as a mode of religious expression: it is a difficult communicative mechanism to control and authorize, which is the reason that musical practice was such a controversial issue among early Christian writers. The auditory landscape is such a vast domain that complete jurisdiction is impossible. Certainly, attacks against pagan musical practices continued well into the fourth and fifth centuries but the focus of these polemic engagements shifts from an external preoccupation (mainly directed at Greeks and Romans) toward internal conflict by the beginning of the third century.

The three aspects of musical liturgy presented in this chapter (melodic legitimation, lyrical authority, and female participation) are all identifying markers that shaped the self-understanding of early Christian communities. The variance in musical liturgy among these congregations demonstrates the fluidity of the terms orthodoxy and heresy, when utilized in the context of competing Christian assemblies. These issues remain a point of debate well into the early medieval period and interestingly music becomes of forum for dissent against the papacy and a medium of anti-Catholic rhetoric during the Protestant Reformation. The examples provided in this chapter demonstrate the perceived deviation of some groups by others with relation to their musical practices. Since song in general, and the psalms in particular, was viewed as a divine gift, it was extremely important for early Christian authorities to define their "binding concept of the natural" (as Berlinerblau puts it) with respect to acceptable forms of musical expression. Some patristic sources attempted to divorce music (and song) from its normative Greco-Roman context by condemning immodest and sexualized musical performances, specifically by women but in some cases there are explicit references to
inappropriate male behaviours as well. In addition, the authorization of liturgical song was (and perhaps still is) an arduous and lengthy process, which continually meets new challenges and obstacles from a variety of sources.

Thus, liturgical music played an important role in the development of a Christian identity within the context of early discourse on heretical practice among patristic sources as well as the self-proclamation of the orthodox label by some. As previously stated, music is not generally a category of analysis within scholarly discourse on orthodoxy and heresy but its significance as an identity marker within the discursive realm of early Christian sources should not be overlooked. Music, by definition, is a performative and communicative act that contains the potential to teach, persuade, polemicize, and entertain. Each of these elements can be employed in a way that is harmful or useful, depending on one’s perception and worldview. Therefore, it is not surprising that early Christian authorities espoused different views on the appropriate uses of music and song within the context of everyday life. Song was viewed as a medium through which one could communicate with the divine and demonstrate piety and commitment to the faith, which explains why this issue was a central feature of many conflicts among rival Christian groups. Thus, musical practice can be understood as a defining feature of right and wrong, both in belief and practice. Liturgical song and ritual singing practices were identity markers through which Christian assemblies demarcated the boundaries between orthodox and heresy.

This powerful and significant ritual practice also functioned as a pedagogical and rhetorical device that early Christian authorities used to recruit out-group members to their brand of Orthodoxy. Lyrical content set to familiar and pleasing melodies were employed as a teaching tool to impart religious knowledge and define that knowledge as correct. Singing played a key role in the recruitment practices of certain Christ-following assemblies because of its multi-
dimensional functionality. This embodied ritual practice served to define those collective identity boundaries and reinforce in-group/out-group belief and practice and the emotional response associated with musical participation made singing an attractive feature of those early Christian assemblies. Cognitive neuroscience provides an additional framework to sociological models of religious recruitment and conversion. Together these models present a more convincing and well-rounded explanation for understanding recruitment and conversion and future scholarship would benefit from continued investigations into specific areas of cognition such as neuroplasticity, which could explain other cognitive dimensions of religious conversion.
Chapter 6: Early Christian Music: Final Analysis and Beyond

Summary

Melody has the ability to transform, shape, and alter our emotional disposition, while the communicative element of song conveys feeling, information, and a sense of social unity when performed with others. Musical practice is a ubiquitous form of human expression and the primary aim of this project has been to illustrate the significant ways in which musical ritual shaped the identity and self-understanding of early Christian assemblies and aided in the recruitment of new members. Scholars have attempted to explain the success of Christianity as a social movement through a variety of mechanisms. Rodney Stark proposed a general model of success for new religious movements, which include the retention of cultural continuity, a medium level of deviance from other extant social groups, and the maintenance of a dense internal social network, among other aspects. While Stark himself admits to certain shortcomings within this model, it does provide a set of provisional criteria that outlines the conditions which a new religious movement ought to meet in order to have widespread success and long-term survival and I argue that music as both a ritual practice and category of discourse fits into this scheme within the cultural context of early Christianity.

Referring to the Christ-following assemblies as a new religious movement is certainly a contentious claim in itself but putting aside the debate of categorical classifications, Stark’s model does have something to offer a discussion on the success of this tradition, particularly in relation to my assertion that music and music performance plays a key role in recruiting, identifying, and sustaining membership. The musical rituals of the earliest Christ-following

---

groups demonstrate a high level of cultural continuity with other socio-religious groups of antiquity. Chapters two and four have explained how music was written about in philosophical and religious discourse but also how musical practice was incorporated into the daily lives of Greco-Romans, Jews, and early Christ-followers. As I illustrated, there are some differences but also numerous contextual, technical, and conceptual similarities between these groups and their use of music. For example, early Christ-followers employed musical ritual during meals, marriage ceremonies, funerals, and other religious celebrations. Singing, in particular, was such an integral activity within the social fabric of Greco-Roman antiquity that is not surprising early Christians employed musical practices in a similar manner to other social groups. Stark contends that new traditions do not present themselves as new or alternative but rather as a fulfillment of other extant religious groups. He points out a variety of narrative elements found in the New Testament that would have been familiar in nature to pagans and Jews,\(^\text{516}\) which are valid examples but I would argue that ritual continuity is perhaps more even powerful that the conceptual continuity found in the texts that Stark mentions because of the embodied and participatory nature of musical performance. If Jews and Greco-Romans regularly sang certain songs at communal meals, then singing a psalm or hymn at the agape meal would seem like a natural and normal occurrence, despite differences in context, symbolic/theological meaning, or actual content of the song. Thus, musical ritual serves as a more effective form of cultural continuity than other examples that Stark provides but his conceptual framework is still quite helpful.

The level of deviance is also an interesting framework to consider within Stark’s model. This plays an important part in later discussions on orthodoxy and heresy but it also in earlier

---

condemnations of Jewish and Greco-Roman doctrine and practice. Music is a key element within discussions of deviance, both in terms of actual practice as well as discourse on the subject of music. It is also employed as an identity marker to define normative boundaries within a socio-religious group. There were varying degrees of acceptability with relation to musical practice and sometimes these expectations were more clearly defined than other times. For example, Ignatius, the second century bishop of Antioch, used music as a metaphor for the Christ-following congregation. He emphasized unity and this was an allegorical representation for the entire community but also it likely references actual practice. In other words, singing in unison was of paramount importance as this communal practice created a sense of togetherness and unification, which was both symbolic in nature but also carried out in actual practice.

This notion of deviance is also inherently linked to issues of morality and ethics, which as I have illustrated, was often conceptualized in accordance with various types of music in the ancient world. Greek philosophical ideas about music and ethos (and the subsequent relationship to action and behaviour) certainly manifested itself within Christian discourse on music but took on a much more strict interpretive understanding. Musical ritual was such an important marker of deviance within Christian discourse because of the link between music, emotion and action. As I outlined in chapter four, Clement of Alexandria was particularly focused on condemning Greco-Roman musical practices because of their ability to arouse strong negative emotions in people that were thought to be inextricably linked to immoral actions such as intoxication or promiscuity. Thus, he concluded that Greco-Roman songs were not only idolatrous but they deviated from the acceptable ritualistic elements present in his accepted form of Christian liturgy. Music, for Clement, had the potential to express this deviance, which demarcated the boundaries between Christian and pagan. Yet, he advocated the common practice of singing at
communal meal times and others such as Tertullian supported the normative ritual of singing songs within a domestic setting. Stark asserts that there must be a medium level of tension or deviancy in order for a religious movement to recruit and retain new members.\footnote{Stark, “How New Religions Succeed”, 16.} In other words, there must be a balance between conformity and deviance and Christ-followers employed musical practice in precisely this way.

The third element of Stark’s model that is relevant to my work is his assertion that a new religious movement must maintain a dense internal social network. Communal singing has the ability to create and maintain such a network. In chapter three, I explained the social manifestations of cognitive or neurological responses to collective music making. The results of inquiry in this area and the subsequent empirical data that has been collected demonstrates that communal singing creates feelings of social cohesion and a collective group identity. In other words, music has the potential to unify a group of people through a ritualistic communicative act that serves to reinforce the social bonds felt by members of that group. This relates to another category in Stark’s model – mobilization. The performative act of collective singing has the ability to arouse a strong emotional response and this connects to my earlier discussion on music as a tool of recruitment in chapter five. Not only can this ritual act create strong social bonds among members that have already joined the group, music can possess an attractive aesthetic or emotive quality that individuals outside the group may find appealing or consuming. Therefore, the initiation of a communal mobilization through song works as an effective method of recruitment from other socio-religious groups when it maintains the necessary conformity/deviance balance. Stark speaks in generalities with regard to his categories but music, as a ritual practice and a discursive topic, may be used as a tangible example or manifestation of
his theoretical model.

Music is an integral link to all of the elements described above. The unique properties associated with musical expression have the ability to influence, shape, and attract members to a particular social group. Song plays an important role in the oral transmission of doctrine, ritual practice, and other elements associated with a communicative medium. The effective use of music as pedagogy allows a person or group to disseminate a specific teaching to a wide audience within that auditory environment. The musical medium does not require literacy and it is participatory in a communal setting, which serves to reinforce memory function in the brain as well as feelings of social cohesion and group identity. This makes music (and song in particular) a valuable rhetorical form insofar as it can be used as a tool of persuasion that both teaches and reinforces doctrinal tenets. At the same time song can be used as a combative engagement, which serves to promote the in-group identity and simultaneously denounce or condemn rival religious groups. Some early proto-Orthodox employed this very mechanism to slander competing authorities and charge them with heresy. Music functioned as both a participatory activity that was integral to the development of Christian liturgy but it was also a mechanism of identification in terms of how other groups employed this expressive medium. Music was employed in a variety of unique ways within early Christianity and significantly affected the growth and development of the Christ-following movement. There are a numerous factors that can help explain the success of this tradition in terms of its popularity but music is one element that scholars have underestimated and overlooked in this regard. The emotive power of song coupled with the pedagogical and rhetorical function of music provided an effective tool of dissemination and recruitment within the Greco-Roman world and contributed to the active recruitment and retention of new members. Music was employed in a similar fashion in later Christian
communities, particularly during the Protestant Reformation but it is evident that song was used in this manner much earlier.

**Contributions to the Study of Early Christianity**

It is my hope that this work will make a significant contribution in a variety of ways to the study of early Christianity. Sustained examinations of early Christian music have been limited to historical descriptions and the investigation of origins. This is certainly a useful exercise in terms of documenting and understanding the development of liturgy at early Christian gatherings. However, it is necessary to expand this avenue of inquiry. A study of early Christian music that combines the cognitive processes and social implications of musical ritual can broaden our understanding of early Christianity more generally and contextualize early Christian references to singing and music. Collective singing functioned in a complex way within Christ-following assemblies and my work has attempted to bring some of these complexities to light and demonstrate the significance of musical practice from various methodological perspectives.

The incorporation of hymns and psalms into liturgy is a process that is analogous in some ways to the canonization of text (which itself is not a well-defined process) insofar as the lyrical content must fit within the acceptable theological parameters of the assembly. Moreover, it involves power struggles within the church hierarchy and disputes among competing authorities. Like the canonization of texts, the inclusion of sacred songs within a religious tradition takes into account a variety of factors including authorship, content, theological doctrine, provenance, etc. However, in addition to these elements, sacred song is judged on the aesthetic quality of the melody, the emotive response the song/melody elicit from the participants, and the subsequent behaviours that follow or are associated with such a performative act. These musical and emotive
qualities of song are highly subjective, which makes consensus among authority figures difficult to achieve in terms of a "musical canon". Therefore, the songs and hymns that were sung by individual congregations act as an identity marker of sorts that may be unique to that specific group. This is particularly evident in the first century since the scant references to music that do exist suggests that individualized compositions were likely normative at congregational worship. Once we see a stronger push toward musical conformity among different groups, music becomes a marker used to distinguish right and wrong forms of liturgical expression. Some Christ-following assemblies are charged with heresy on the basis that they sing and compose unacceptable songs and melodies within their liturgy. These so-called deviant groups are accused of straying from supposed orthodox forms of musical expression and song becomes a defining boundary to mark the identity of both in-group and out-group assemblies. Therefore, my study of early Christian music offers a new lens through which one may contextualize patristic discourse on orthodoxy and heresy, a lens that has previously been unidentified. Music is not simply a point of contention or disagreement among church authorities; rather, it is viewed as a sacred communicative medium through which a person or group expresses piety, devotion, and morality. These are the inherent characteristics articulated through communal worship and collective music making embodies the ideal unity of adherents.

The power of unification through song that early church fathers advocated has another component that is equally significant in terms of attracting and incorporating new members to the assembly. In chapter five, I discussed the use of music as a mechanism of recruitment, which provides an additional dimension of importance to music within this socio-religious context. Previous investigations into modes of recruitment have focused on other ways of recruiting new members, which were mainly focused on discursive forms of engagement. Song is also a form of
oral transmission used to teach, spread doctrine, and perhaps denounce rival groups but song is more efficacious because it adds another non-verbal layer of meaning that taps into the human emotional response system. I outlined several examples, where early Christ-followers used specific musically-oriented tactics for the purpose of recruitment and the attraction of members from competing Christian assemblies. Ephraem is perhaps the best example, and although his practices cannot be considered normative or representative of fourth century Christian assemblies, his actions demonstrate a clear rhetorical and polemical use of collective singing. His appropriation of the so-called heretical practices (including the use of specific melodies and the employment of female choirs) are justified as combative tactics, which are necessary to attract members from an out-group deemed to be heretical and convince them to join Ephraem’s congregation. Ephraem considered music and melody to be strong persuasive elements that could be used to destroy his opponents while simultaneously saving the souls of former members through recruitment. The notion of music as an identity marker can be seen quite clearly in this case study and according to patristic narratives of church history, Ephraem’s musical rhetoric was extremely successful in attracting new members to the group.

The connection between recruitment, identity, and collective singing as an embodied practice lies in human emotion. Edward Slingerland’s notion of vertical integration that I discussed in chapter four defines a necessary approach to science and the humanities, which combines theory and empiricism and this dissertation is an attempt to utilize this method of study. Certainly there are shortcomings in this methodology (i.e. can we really access experience through scientific investigation and understand human emotion through empirical test results?) but what Slingerland’s model does provide is an approach that acknowledges the multiple levels of meaning in our reality or perception. In other words, vertical integration reflects both the
biological and social influences that shape our ways of thinking and acting and this can be seen on three levels of identity - personal, collective, and inter-group. Cognitive and social aspects of human existence are all part of the same system and they formulate our perception of the self and the self in relation to others.

Emotion plays such an integral role in our brain’s decision-making process and music is a particularly influential locus of this process because melody has the potential to change our emotional disposition and elicit a certain emotive response. Therefore, I have presented empirical data from the field of cognitive science in order to broaden our understanding of how music functions within a specific socio-religious context. Emotional responses can yield empirical measurements through neurochemical responses in the brain. The neuroscience data that I outlined in chapter four demonstrates an important physiological link between music and emotion and this link helps explain why song is such an effective mode of communication why melody plays a significant role in emotional response, group identity, and social cohesion.

Next Steps

The significance of music as a communicative medium in early Christianity has garnered more attention in recent scholarly work. For example, Holly E. Hearon argues that music plays an integral role in the oral transmission of the Jesus tradition and it does so in a way that is different from basic linguistic communication. She claims that the meaning of music “is primarily affective” and “it stands in contrast to the propositional nature of language”.518 This form of communication also serves to incorporate ritual practice. This is one way in which music

functions differently from language.\textsuperscript{519} It works on a different level of influence insofar as it reflects “a distinct capacity as a medium to organize sociality, particularly in situations of social uncertainty”.\textsuperscript{520} Therefore, song is clearly different from the spoken word and this becomes a significant factor in the study of the oral transmission practices found within the early Jesus communities. It would be interesting, however, to examine the relationship between music/song and other forms of embodied ritual practice. Often music is part of other rituals, which perhaps contributes to their efficacy but from a theoretical viewpoint, there are differences in terms of how specific rituals function within a social group. Music gets very little attention in the works of ritual/practice specialists such as Catherine Bell and Pierre Bourdieu. I argue that music functions in a unique way within ritual settings but how does it differ from other non-linguistic forms of ritual practice? This is a question fit for future study. A comparative analysis detailing how specific rituals function to reinforce memorization, allow us to learn information (or doctrine), and create a sense of shared identity, specifically within early Christianity, would be a fruitful endeavor in order to further understand how and why certain ritual practices become integral to the developing liturgy.

It is my hope that the preceding chapters have laid the foundational basis for further research in several distinct areas. First, there are still numerous questions about notions of identity within early Christ-following assemblies. Identity and the collective memory of any social group are important elements in the transmission of tradition and Hearon’s article takes an important step in this direction insofar as she explains how communal music making has the ability to create social networks that develop a collective memory, which is essentially a

\textsuperscript{519} Language as such certainly has a rhythmic and melodic component but it is not organized in the same fashion. Hearon claims that the difference can be found in the way melody and meaning are deployed; song relies more on rhythm to give it an overall shape and this yields a more visceral effect.

\textsuperscript{520} Hearon, “Music as a Medium”, 188.
foundation for a collective identity. However, this is an area where the incorporation of cognitive science would be an asset. Further investigation into the neurological responses of the human brain to collective music making could potentially clarify the physiological role of our brain chemistry in social networking and group identity formation. There is certainly some data, which I have outlined in chapter three; however, there is much more to be done in terms of understanding how the brain functions during communal music making as well as the social manifestations of these neurological responses. Further research that combines the empirical data of neuroscience experimentation and socio-historical analyses will provide a clearer picture of how and why collective music making is such an effective way to create social bonds and shared emotional connections in religious ritual more generally.

The second question for future study is the relationship between music, power, and the role of church authority in the eventually canonization of hymns. Singing is an embodied form of ritual practice that have the ability to disrupt forms of institutional power because they possess an inherent potentiality that lies outside the purview of normative power relations. Political structures cannot dictate how an individual or group will respond emotionally in a certain setting, nor can they determine what an individual or group finds aesthetically pleasing or displeasing. In his work *The Ethical Soundscape*, Charles Hirschkind examines the role of cassette sermons in the contemporary Egyptian Islamic revival movement. While Hirschkind’s work addresses a different social, chronological, and religious context, several of his conclusions about the religious auditory environment are both salient and applicable to the early Christian context in terms of explaining why auditory forms of ritual are so important in shaping what Hirschkind terms the moral and political landscape. Musical practice has the ability to cross certain social boundaries that are erected to reinforce normative social relations and support the
existent power structures. Hirschkind argues that the sermon tapes have a ubiquitous nature, which of course can be more broadly applied to musical practice generally speaking, in the sense that they can be entertaining, politically informative, educational and ethically nourishing. He contends that “Tapes have the ability to produce a cathartic and purifying operation on the soul, a strengthening of the will, and the ability to resist temptations that are called the devil’s whispers in some traditions of Islam” and the tapes also provide a “sonorous environment where the nourishing, transformative power of ethical speech works to improve the conditions of one’s heart, incline to right action”.\textsuperscript{521} These are the results that the early Christian church also would have desired from their adherents. It is this ethical transformative power that Clement of Alexandria hoped to inspire from his readers in their ritual musical performance. It is for this reason that the church did not completely abolish musical ritual from their developing liturgical practices; communal singing could be used to instill Christian moral traits in adherents. Hirschkind claims that this musicality present in the sermon tapes is “not an aesthetic gloss applied to a discursive content but a necessary condition for sermonic speech for ethical action more generally”.\textsuperscript{522} This conclusion is also applicable to Christian hymns and psalms that were sung during the liturgy in the earliest Christ-following assemblies.

I also discussed various Greco-Roman and early Christian understandings of the relationship between music and ethics and this is a question that future explorations ought to connect with conceptions of power and authority within the early church. How are various ethical and moral imperatives reinforced through musical participation? Can those in power use music as disciplinary or controlling mechanism? Can those in positions of authority use song as a tool of suppression? Who legitimates the authority of new compositions or the use of older ones?

Can song function as a subversive mode but those marginalized by the proto-Orthodox? These are questions that my work has alluded to but further investigation is required. Hirschkind argues, “The agency of music to either corrupt or edify, to distract from moral duty, or incline the soul toward its performance lies not in the sound but in the moral disposition of the heart of the listener”.523 Participants play an active role in interpreting the sound and meaning behind the sound, which gives agency or a voice to those that might not have one. Early Christian discourse on the topic of music provides a particularly useful case study insofar as the obvious contention highlights these issues and explains, at least in part, why church authorities maintained strong positions on the proper uses of music within the daily lives of Christian adherents.

The third issue that requires further examination is more general in nature. Recent interest in music, emotion, and cognition has provided the impetus for future studies on the relationship between these aspects of human existence and religious traditions more broadly. A comparative analysis of how music functions within the context of religious ritual would make an important contribution to ritual studies as well as cognitive theories of music and religion. Daniel Levitan argues that religion and music (all definitional problems aside) have many shared similarities from a scientific perspective in that they both have adaptive features, which generally relate to emotional responses. Religion and music, according to Levitan, both reduce the level of ambiguity felt by individuals. He contends that music contains the power to encode details of religious ritual and reinforce feelings of community among participants. This encoding involves the memorization of movement, speech, etc. and dictates that the ritual must be done in a certain form (proper or correct form). Music acts as a catalyst or galvanizing force, which “synthesizes

523 Hirschkind, *The Ethical Soundscape*, 35.
disparate parts” of brain function under one conceptual scheme. Cognitive science has a lot to offer this subject in terms of understanding similarities and differences in brain activity during “religious” activity, musical activity, and “religious musical” activity. Emotional response to musical participation and religious experience is an area of intersection where analysis of one category can inform the other and vice versa. Therefore, my investigation into music and the relationship to emotion within the early Christian church can be considered a case study that seeks to make some preliminary conclusions about religion, emotion, and music. However, the connections I draw between these domains merely scratches the surface of a topic that has great potential in the field of ritual studies, cognitive science, and the academic study of religion more generally.

**Conclusion**

The overall aim of this work has been to present an interdisciplinary investigation that brings together a variety of methodological and theoretical lenses in order to further understand the social, religious, and liturgical history of the Christian tradition through an examination of musical ritual. Collective singing was a fundamental part of daily life in Greco-Roman antiquity and music was an essential social element of group interaction. While the origins of melody were debated among the philosophical and religious groups of antiquity, ancient discourse on music reveals a fascination with melody on several levels. The physics of sound, the link between emotion and music, and the technical elements of musical performance all dominated writings on the subject of music. Yet, recent scholarly interest into ritual studies has prompted further analysis that goes beyond documenting the historical trajectory and development of musical

---

thought.

Scholars such as Russell Arnold and Carol Newsom have started to explore the social role of liturgy within a Jewish context, particularly within the community at Qumran. Many of their conclusions are both helpful and relevant in understanding the significance of liturgical participation within an early Christian context. Their work also addresses questions of identity, social cohesion, and legitimation of ideology through word and worship and it is my hope that this work contributes to that discussion. By examining different social and religious contexts within Greco-Roman antiquity, scholars can understand how liturgy, and more specifically musical ritual, functions in terms of creating distinctive social boundaries but also unifying those within a certain group identity through collective musical expression. In addition, I have proposed that music plays a more active role in these situations insofar as it is also used as recruitment mechanism, which appeals to members of rival or competing socio-religious groups. Therefore, music functions in a variety of ways, which if used concurrently, provides a strong communicative medium that appeals to human beings on both an emotional and intellectual level.
Appendix 1

Ancient Sources & Abbreviations

New Testament:

Acts 2:46-47
Colossians 3:16-17
1 Corinthians 1:11, 14:26, 14:34-35
1 Corinthians 14:34-35
Ephesians 5:18-20
James 5:13
Luke 1:41-45
Mark 14.26
Matthew 2:19, 26:30
Revelation 4:8, 5:8-9
Romans 15:5-6, 16:1-3

Other Christian Sources:

Acts of John 2.1 94-95

Ambrose of Milan
Explanatio psalmi I, 9
Sermo contra Auxentium de basilicis tradendis xxxiv

Assemani Anthology, Bibliotheca Orientalis I, 47-48

Arnobius
Adversus nationes II, 42

Athanasius
Epistula ad Marcellinum de interpretation psalmorum 27
Epistula ad Marcellinum de interpretation psalmorum 28
Epistuli de decretis Nicaenae synodi 16

Augustine
Confessions, X, xxxiii, 49-50

Basil the Great
Homilia in psalmum lix, 2
Homilia in psalmum i
Exhortation to Youths as to How They Shall Best Profit by the Writings of Pagan Authors, vii

Clement of Alexandria
Pedagogus II, 4.
Protrepticus I, 2, 4-1
Protrepticus, I, 2-27
Protrepticus. I, 5, 3-5
Protrepticus. I, 5, 6-7
Protrepticus II, 15, 3
Protrepticus XII, 119, 1-2
Stromata VII, vii, 35
Stromata VII, xvi, 102

Council of Laodicea, Canon 53
Council of Laodicea, Canon 54

Cyprian
De habitu virginum XI

Cyril of Jerusalem
Procatechesis XIV

Didascalia Apostolorum VI, 3-5

Didascalia of the Three Hundred and Eighteen Fathers, patrum 8

Eusebius
History of the Church, II, xvii
History of the Church IV, 30
History of the Church VII, 30
In psalmum XCI, 4
Tricennial Oration XIV, 5

Ephraem
Hymns of Eastertide II, 8

Gregory of Nazianzus
Epistle CCXXXII

Hilary of Poitiers
Explanatio psalmi I, 9

Hippolytus
Apostolic Tradition, 25
Apostolic Tradition 11, 4-5
The Refutation of all Heresies, V, X

Ignatius
Letter to the Ephesians 4, 1-2
Letter to the Philadelphians 1, 2

Irenaeus
De anima, IX, 4

Isidore of Pelusium
Epistle I, 90

Jerome
Dialogus contra pelagianos I, 25

John Chrysostom
De sanctis Bernice et Prosdoce 3
Homilia 12 in Epistle I to the Corinthians 7, 7
In Acta Apostolorum, Hom. XLII, 3
In caput XXIX Genesim, Hom. LVI, 1
In Colossenses, Hom. I, 5
In 1 Corinthios, Hom. XII, 5
In 1 Corinthios, Homily XXXVI, 5-6
In Hebraeos, Homily IV, 5
In psalmum XLI, 2

Justin Martyr
Apology I, 13
Apology I, 67

Melito of Sardis
On the Pascha

Niceta of Remesiana
De utilitate hymnorum 3-4
De utilitate hymnorum 5

Novatian
De spectaculis, III, 2-3

Socrates
Ecclesiastical History I, 11
Ecclesiastical History, VI, 8

Sozomen
Ecclesiastical History, III, XVI
Ecclesiastical History VIII, VII
Tatian
*Discourse to the Greeks*, 22
*Discourse to the Greeks*, 33

Tertullian,
*Ad nationes* II, V, 9
*Ad uxorem* II, VIII, 8-9
*Apologeticus* xxxix, 16-18
*De anima* IX, 4
*De carne Christi*, XX, 3
*De corona* XI, 3-4
*De spectaculis*, X, 2
*De spectaculis*, X, 8-9
*De oratione* XXVII
*De oratione* XXVII, 4
*On the Veiling of Virgins*, 9

Theodoret of Cyrus
*Ecclesiastical History* I 1
*Ecclesiastical History* IV 29, 1-3
*Interpretatio in psalmos* 150

**Greek & Roman Sources:**

Aeschylus
*The Persians* 935-940

Aristotle
*Politics* 8.1339b-8.1340a
*Politics* 8.1342b

Damon
*Republic* 3.398-340

Euripides
*Bacchae* 73-80

Homer
*Iliad* 18, 492-496
*Iliad* 24 719-776
*Odyssey* 24 46-64
*Homeric Hymn to Hermes* IV 414-435
Livy
*The History of Rome* XXVII, 37

Lucian
*De mercede conductis* 28, 687
*De saltatione* 15
*Dialogi meretricii* 12, 1, 311

Ovid
*Fasti* VI, 657-660

Pindar
*Isthmean* 1.2
*Pythian* 3, 51

Plato
*Laws* 7 800e
*Phaedo* 73d
*Philebus* 17d
*Republic* 3.398e-3.399a
*Republic* 3.401a
*Republic* 3.401d-e
*Republic* 4.424c
*Timaeus* 35b-36b

Pliny
*Naturalis Historia*, II, 101

Plutarch
*De Musica* 14
*De Superstitione* 13, 171

Sallust
*De coniuratione catilinae*, 25

Sophocles
*Trachiniae* 640

**Jewish Sources:**

Hebrew Bible:

1 Chronicles 1:15-16, 25:6-7
2 Chronicles 5:12-13, 7:3-6, 23:18, 29:26-30, 34:12
Ezra 2:41, 2:70
Jeremiah 7:34, 16:9, 25:10
Nehemiah 12:27-30
1 Samuel 2:1-10

Mishna:

m. Arakhin 2.6
m. Hagigah 2:4
m. Ketuboth 2:10, 4:4
m. Megillah 3:3, 4:3
m. Mo’ed Qatan. 1:5-6, 3:5, 3:7-9
m. Pesahim 5:5-7, 8:6
m. Ta’anith 4:7
m. Tamid 7:3-4

Other Jewish Writings:

Josephus
*Apion* 2.282
*Satires* 5.132-60

Philo
*De Vita Contemplativa* XI 83-88, XII 75-87

**Abbreviations:**
PG - Patrologia Graeca
PL - Patrologia Latina
CCSCO - Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalis
Bibliography


_____.


_____.

Barnard, L.W. “The Origins and Emergence of the Church in Edessa during the first two centuries AD.” *Vigiliae Christianae* 22 (1968): 161-175.


_____.


