Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences
Journal canadien des sciences halieutiques et aquatiques

The response of North Atlantic diadromous fish to multiple stressors including land use change: a multidecadal study

Journal:	<i>Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences</i>
Manuscript ID	cjfas-2015-0450.R3
Manuscript Type:	Article
Date Submitted by the Author:	19-Apr-2016
Complete List of Authors:	de Eyto, Elvira; Marine Institute, Fisheries Ecosystems Advisory Services Dalton, Catherine; Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick Dillane, Mary; Salmon Management Service Division Jennings, Eleanor; Dundalk Institute of technology McGinnity, Philip; University College, Cork, O'Dwyer, Barry; University College, Cork, Environmental Research Institute Poole, Russell; Marine Institute Rogan, Ger; Salmon Management Service Division Taylor, David; University of Singapore
Keyword:	CONSERVATION < General, FRESHWATER ENVIRONMENT < General, LAND USE < General, DIADROMOUS SPECIES < Organisms, CLIMATE CHANGE < General

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

1 **The response of North Atlantic diadromous fish to multiple stressors including land use**
2 **change: a multidecadal study**

3

- 4 • Elvira de Eyto, Marine Institute, Newport, Co. Mayo, Ireland.
5 elvira.deeyto@marine.ie
- 6 • Catherine Dalton, Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick, Ireland.
7 Catherine.Dalton@mic.ul.ie
- 8 • Mary Dillane, Marine Institute, Newport, Co. Mayo, Ireland. mary.dillane@marine.ie
- 9 • Eleanor Jennings, Centre for Freshwater and Environmental Studies, Dundalk
10 Institute of Technology, Ireland. eleanor.jennings@dkit.ie
- 11 • Philip McGinnity, School of Biological, Earth & Environmental Science, University
12 College Cork, Ireland. p.mcginfinity@ucc.ie
- 13 • Barry O'Dwyer, Environmental Research Institute, University College Cork, Ireland.
14 B.ODwyer@ucc.ie
- 15 • Russell Poole, Marine Institute, Newport, Co. Mayo, Ireland. russell.poole@marine.ie
- 16 • Ger Rogan, Marine Institute, Newport, Co. Mayo, Ireland. ger.rogan@marine.ie
- 17 • David Taylor, National University of Singapore, Singapore. david.taylor@nus.edu.sg

18

19

20 **Corresponding author**

21 Elvira de Eyto, Marine Institute, Newport, Co. Mayo, Ireland.

22 **Phone:** 003539842300, **Fax:** 003539842340, **Email:** elvira.deeyto@marine.ie

23

24

25 **Abstract**

26 Reduction of freshwater habitat quality due to land use change can have significant impacts

27 on diadromous fish. Partitioning this impact from other potential drivers, such as changing

28 marine conditions and climate, is hampered by a lack of long term datasets. Here, four

29 decades of data were used to assess the impact of land use change on *Salmo salar* L. and30 anadromous *Salmo trutta* L. in the Burrishoole catchment, Ireland, one of the few index sites

31 for diadromous fish in the North Atlantic. Land use change was found to have no significant

32 impact on the freshwater survival of either salmon or trout. However, climate impacted

33 significantly on the survival of salmon and trout in freshwater, with poor survival in years

34 with wetter warmer winters, coinciding with positive North Atlantic Oscillation values.

35 Additionally, cold springs were associated with higher survival in trout. The addition of

36 hatchery fish into the salmon spawning cohort coincided with low freshwater survival. Our

37 results highlight the necessity for a broad ecosystem approach in any conservation effort of

38 these species.

39

40

41 Introduction

42 The migratory nature of diadromous fish means that they are threatened by a unique set of
43 multiple stressors, including habitat destruction, barriers, overexploitation and climate change
44 (Wilcove and Wikelski 2008, Piou and Prévost 2013). As a result, declines have been
45 catalogued around the globe (Musick et al. 2000, Limburg and Waldman 2009). Effective
46 conservation of migratory fish requires an assessment of the relative importance of potential
47 pressures, enabling managers to prioritise cost efficient programmes of measures aimed at
48 priority impacts. It also requires an understanding and quantification of fundamental density
49 dependant processes (Rose et al. 2001) and long term directional changes in stock recruitment
50 relationships (non-stationarity) (Chaput et al. 2005, Walters et al. 2008).

51 In the north Atlantic region, declines in stocks of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar* L.)
52 and anadromous brown trout (sea trout) (*Salmo trutta* L.) have been noted in recent years
53 (Gargan et al. 2006, ICES 2014). A downward trend in salmon stock recruitment (returns of
54 adults back to freshwater) has been evident from the mid-1980s across their Atlantic range
55 (Crozier et al. 2003, Jonsson and Jonsson 2009). Sea trout populations along the west coast of
56 Ireland declined in the late 1980s and early 1990s, a phenomenon that was linked to intensive
57 salmon aquaculture in enclosed bays, resulting in high levels of sea lice *Lepeophtheirus*
58 *salmonis* (Krøyer, 1837) and infestation of returning sea trout (Tully and Whelan 1993,
59 Gargan et al. 2006, Poole et al. 2006). While some sea trout populations have recovered,
60 many other populations remain at historically low levels (Gargan et al. 2006, Marine Institute
61 2013). Marine mortality has been pinpointed as being the most significant driver of these
62 species declines (Piou and Prévost 2013), however, impacts originating on land, including
63 freshwater habitat loss, are regarded as easier to address (Bacon et al. 2015).

64 Declines in diadromous fish populations in their freshwater phases have been
65 attributed to land use and management policies associated with afforestation, agriculture and

66 rural development (Elliott et al. 1998, Hendry et al. 2003). Habitat degradation has been
67 identified as one of the biggest threats to freshwater vertebrates, particularly those aquatic
68 species inhabiting flowing waters (Dudgeon et al. 2006, Stendera et al. 2012, Collen et al.
69 2014). While a cause-effect relationship between land use change and fish stock decline is
70 plausible and highly likely, questions remain about the relative contribution of this driver,
71 and few accurate quantitative links have been established. Long-term datasets quantifying
72 environmental change and the response of diadromous fish populations in the same
73 catchment are extremely rare. Accurate quantification of diadromous fish migration into and
74 out of catchments is difficult, and restricted to only a small number of index sites where full
75 trapping facilities are available. For example, there are only 13 index stations collecting long
76 term data on the stock and recruitment of Atlantic salmon in the NE Atlantic region (Prévost
77 et al. 2003).

78 Atlantic salmon and anadromous brown trout are native to the Burrishoole catchment
79 in the west of Ireland. At these latitudes, Atlantic salmon and anadromous trout spawn in
80 winter and spend 1-4 years in freshwater before entering the sea as smolts (Metcalf and
81 Thorpe 1990). They return to their natal rivers to spawn after one or more years. A long-term
82 monitoring programme of migrating salmon and trout has enabled quantification of key
83 trends in the Burrishoole diadromous fish populations from the 1960s to the present. In
84 addition to the long-term fish population records, a detailed reconstruction of aquatic
85 ecosystem responses to land use change in the Burrishoole in the 20th century is available
86 (Dalton et al. 2014). This palaeolimnological reconstruction was described from a sediment
87 core taken from the deepest point of Lough Feeagh, the most downstream lake in the
88 Burrishoole catchment. Slices of this core were dated and analysed for commonly used
89 palaeolimnological proxies, which enabled the key land use changes in the catchment to be
90 quantified and dated. Low nutrient levels prevailed in the lakes in the catchment lakes until

the 1950s. Commercial coniferous afforestation in the mid-20th century and extensive sheep overgrazing in the 1980s and 1990s (Gillmor and Walsh 1993) were associated with increased rates of erosion, leading to elevated sedimentation, organic matter and nutrients in downstream lakes, and a shift to mesotrophic conditions (Dalton et al. 2014). This reconstruction provided valuable information that captured the degradation of the lake and its water catchment along a trajectory spanning the last century that is representative of many upland peat catchments on the Atlantic coast of Ireland (Huang and O'Connell 2000, Bullock et al. 2012) and beyond (Evans et al. 2014). In these catchments, afforestation and overgrazing have been a focus of fisheries and aquatic ecosystems conservation efforts (Fitzsimons and Igoe 2004, Drinan et al. 2013, Harrison et al. 2014).

These land use changes in the Burrishoole catchment could conceivably have impacted native diadromous fish populations. Higher levels of sediment in rivers may suffocate spawning beds, reducing egg survival of salmon and trout (Cowx et al. 1998, Soulsby et al. 2001, Suttle et al. 2004), while increases in trophic state can effect juvenile salmonid survival (Hendry et al. 2003). Recent work in Ireland has shown the deleterious effects of coniferous plantations on salmon populations, with upland streams in forested catchments having fewer salmon than those draining non-forested catchments (Harrison et al. 2014). Trout were unaffected in that study, implying that there may be inter-specific differences in sensitivity to the changes in habitat quality associated with commercial conifer production.

Although focussed on the Burrishoole catchment, the co-availability of both fish census and environmental change data provides a unique opportunity to explore the role of changes in land use and freshwater habitat on important stocks of diadromous taxa, contributing to an issue that is of general concern: the long term conservation of fish stocks in a rapidly changing world.

116

117 **Materials and Methods**118 *Site description*

119 Burrishoole is a small (100 km²) upland catchment (53° 56' N, 9° 35' W) draining into the
120 North-east Atlantic through Clew Bay (Fig. 1). Climatically influenced by the Atlantic Ocean
121 (Jennings et al. 2000, Allott et al. 2005, Blenckner et al. 2007), the catchment experiences a
122 temperate, oceanic climate with mild winters and relatively cool summers. Maximum
123 summer air temperatures rarely exceed 20°C, while minimum winter temperatures are usually
124 between 2°C and 4°C. The base geology on the western side of the catchment is
125 predominantly quartzite and schist, leading to acidic runoff, with poor buffering capacity. By
126 comparison, the geology on the eastern side is more complex as quartzite and schist are
127 interspersed with veins of volcanic rock, dolomite and wacke, leading to higher buffering
128 capacity and aquatic production. Soils in the catchment comprise poorly drained gleys, peaty
129 podsoles and blanket peats. Feeagh and Bunaveela, the two largest freshwater lakes in the
130 catchment, are both relatively deep (mean depth >12 m), oligotrophic (TP <10 µg l⁻¹),
131 coloured (c. 80 mg l⁻¹ PtCo) due to high levels of dissolved organic carbon (DOC), have low
132 alkalinity (<20 mg l⁻¹ CaCO₃) and are slightly acidic (pH = c. 6.7).

133 Partial upstream and downstream fish trapping facilities have been in operation in
134 Burrishoole since 1958, and full trapping facilities were put in place in 1970. The traps
135 enable a complete census of migrating fish in (adult salmon and sea trout) and out (salmon
136 and trout smolts) of the catchment. A variable number of individuals from a captive bred
137 population of salmon ('Burrishoole hatchery fish') were released upstream of the traps during
138 the study period, and spawned along with the wild population. Census details are recorded in
139 the annual reports of the research station (e.g. Marine Institute 2013). A rod fishery for
140 salmon and trout operated during the time period of interest, between June and September of

each year. The salmon and sea trout catches have changed considerably since the 1970s. For example, the average number of salmon and sea trout caught in the period 1970-74 (including wild and hatchery fish) was 237 and 967 respectively. In 1996, the salmon catch was 295 but the sea trout catch had dropped to 125. Since 1995, all wild salmon fishing has been on a catch and release basis, with restrictions on fishing on Feeagh imposed for conservation reasons. Data from these fisheries are included in the census data where relevant (e.g. fish which were caught and released are including in the spawning escapement, while fish killed are not).

Data collation

Data were collated to provide two fish response variables along with a suite of explanatory variables characterising land use change, climatic influences and other significant impacts (Fig. 2). The cut off year for data collation (2007) was chosen as it represents the most recent year of the catchment change reconstruction provided by the palaeolimnological record extracted from Lough Feeagh (Dalton et al. 2014). The fish response variables were salmon and trout freshwater survival (Fig. 2). The number of returning adult salmon and trout were counted as they moved upstream through the Burrishoole traps between 1970 and 2006. Egg number (the potential egg deposition of each cohort) was estimated using known sex ratios and fecundities. Sex ratios are estimated from external characteristics as they move upstream through the traps and are catalogued in the annual reports of the research station (e.g. Marine Institute 2013). As salmon fecundity (egg number per fish) can be predicted from fish size (de Eyto et al. 2015), fecundities are estimated from length: egg number relationships parameterised for Burrishoole fish, using egg numbers and fish size (length or weight) collected from brood stock (Marine Institute, unpublished data). In Burrishoole, the majority of salmon smolts migrate as two year old fish (2+), while trout generally smolt as 2+ and 3+

fish. Out-migrating smolts were counted as they moved down through the traps from 1973. Egg numbers were matched with the relevant smolt year for both salmon and trout, enabling the modelling of stock recruitment curves for each species (Fig. 3). In the case of trout, the smolt output was portioned between the potential proportion of 2+ and 3 + smolts (Poole et al. 2006). The residuals from these stock recruitment (SR) curves were used as the survival index for each species (Peterman et al. 1998, Mueter et al. 2002), with negative residuals indicating cohorts with lower than expected survival, and positive residuals indicting good survival. This survival index represents the survival of salmon and trout in the freshwater phase of their life cycle. If land use change is affecting the freshwater stages of salmonids at a catchment scale, then this is where the impacts are most likely to be seen. The number of hatchery salmon released upstream to spawn was included in the egg deposition estimate. The contribution of resident brown trout to the egg numbers was not quantified, and so the number of trout smolts migrating out is based on the assumption that they are the progeny of migrating trout. This is unlikely to be completely the case, and it is probable that a small, variable proportion of trout smolts derive from resident brown trout.

Land use change explanatory variables (n=14) were extracted from the analysis described in Dalton et al. (2014). As many of these explanatory variables were highly collinear, initial data exploration was used to extract a land use change proxy which adequately reflected the timing and direction of impacts on the downstream aquatic ecosystem (Lough Feeagh) (Fig. 2). Percentage loss on ignition (*LOI*) was measured at 1cm intervals from the Lough Feeagh core (Dalton et al. 2014). *LOI* quantifies changes in the proportion of organic material in sediment accumulating in the lake (Heiri et al. 2001). In an oligotrophic lake in a catchment that is largely blanketed in peat, major changes in the proportion of organic material in sediments are likely to represent variations in external loadings to the lake, as a result of peat erosion and inwash. *LOI* can therefore be used as a

proxy of catchment instability. The proportion of organic matter increased from baseline conditions of ~ 27% before 1960, and rose to 46% by the mid-1990s. It then decreased to ~40% after 2000. Twenty-six samples from the Lough Feeagh core were analysed for *LOI* in the time period for which salmonid data were available (1971-2007) and were matched to the relevant hatch year using a Constant Rate of Supply (CRS) model for determining accumulation rates (Appleby 2002). CRS estimates were validated with reference to ¹³⁷Cs fallout chronostratigraphic markers (1986 Chernobyl and 1963 weapons testing).

While the aim of this paper was to estimate the role that land use change has played in the population dynamics of fish in Burrishoole, previous research has highlighted several climatic and other factors (Fig. 2) accounting for some of the observed variation in Burrishoole salmon and trout trends (McGinnity et al. 2009). Water temperature was measured adjacent to the fish trap on the eastern outflow from Lough Feeagh (Fig. 1) using a paper chart recorder. Data were extracted at midnight for each day, and averaged to produce seasonal values (winter – Dec, Jan, Feb; spring – Mar, Apr, May; summer – Jun, Jul, Aug; autumn – Sep, Oct, Nov) (Fig. 2). Similarly, precipitation measured at the Burrishoole manual weather station (Fig. 1) was expressed as seasonal accumulations of daily rainfall (Fig. 2). Both Dalton et al. (2014) and Jennings et al. (2000) highlighted the correlation between the NAO index and catchment responses in the Burrishoole, and so this index was included as a potential climatic explanatory variable (average values for the months of December, January, February, and March: Hurrells winter Index (Hurrell 1995) (Fig. 2). Previous analysis of the freshwater survival of salmon in Burrishoole has shown that the proportion of hatchery fish in the spawning cohort (which varied between 1 and 60% over the time series), accounted for a large proportion of the annual variability in egg to smolt survival (McGinnity et al. 2009), so this was added to the analysis (Fig. 2). Although not included in the analysis, the sea trout population of Burrishoole was profoundly impacted by a sharp

decline in marine survival in the late 1980's, and these data are presented in Fig. 2 for information.

Statistical analysis

Analyses were conducted in R, version 3.0.2 (R Core Team 2013). The SR curves for salmon and trout were modelled using linear (equation 1) or Beverton Holt models (equation 2) (Beverton and Holt 1957), with best fit being ascertained by minimising the sum of the squared residuals, where R signifies recruits (smolts), S signifies the number of eggs and m , a and b are coefficients. .

Linear model: $R = mS$ (Equation 1.)

Beverton Holt model: $R = \frac{aS}{1 + bS}$ (Equation 2.)

The residuals (observed – predicted values for each year) were extracted from the SR curves and used as the indicators of survival for each cohort of salmon and trout (Fig. 2). Salmon and trout survival were analysed with the suite of explanatory variables in order to assess possible relationships between fish stocks and environmental change. Generalized additive models (GAM) were used to assess trends in the fish data and model relationships with explanatory variables using the mgcv package (Wood 2006). As correlation amongst fish recruitment and environmental data is common (Pyper and Peterman 1998), VIFs (variance inflation factors) less than 3 were used to exclude closely related variables (Montgomery and Peck 1992, Zuur et al. 2009). All models were tested for violations of the assumptions of homogeneity, independence and normality, and amended as appropriate. Models were also examined for the effects of autocorrelation in residuals by plotting the autocorrelation function (acf) (Venables

and Ripley 2002) from the R Stats package (R Core Team 2013). The significance of explanatory variables were assessed using changes in the AIC (Akaike Information Criteria), explained deviance and significant F-tests comparing models with and without the variable of interest. As the temporal resolution of the land use change proxy (*LOI*) was lower than that of all other variables, models were initially fitted to the full fish datasets using all explanatory variables apart from *LOI* (salmon n=37, trout n=35) to determine the most important drivers over the time period. Subsequently *LOI* was included in the model, but using a reduced dataset (n=26 for salmon and n=11 for trout) to determine whether land use change explained some of the variation in salmonid freshwater survival.

Results

Salmon

The SR curve for salmon was best described by a linear relationship, with no obvious curve at higher spawner levels (Fig. 3). This indicates that the existing level of the monitored salmon stock in Burrishoole populates the lower end of the stock recruitment model – well away from the descending (e.g. Ricker) or flat topped (e.g. Beverton Holt) limb of a SR curve (Solomon 1985). Apart from some high values in the early 1970s, spawning in the catchment constituted between 500,000 and 2,000,000 eggs, with a corresponding smolt output of 5000 and 10000 fish. This equates to an egg to smolt survival of between 0.2 and 1.2 %. The lowest survival (0.2%) was for the 1989 cohort, when an egg deposition of 1.86 million eggs led to a smolt output of only 3794 smolts.

The best model describing salmon freshwater survival over the study time period included the proportion of hatchery fish in the spawning cohort (*hatcheryprop*) and the NAO index (*nao*) (Table 1). This model explained 68% of the deviance in the response variable (n=37). The same model fitted to a reduced dataset (excluding *LOI*) had an explained

deviance of 80% and an AIC of 464. The addition of the land use change explanatory variable *LOI* to the model increased the explained deviance from 80% to 84%, but the AIC only decreased from 464 to 462, and dropping the *LOI* variable from the model was not significant when analysed using an F-test ($p=0.12$) (Table 2). Taken together, these results provide sufficient evidence to conclude land use change had no significant impact on salmon survival. Higher freshwater survival was evident when the proportion of hatchery fish in the cohort was low and when the hatch year (i.e. eggs in the gravel) of the cohort coincided with a negative NAO index (cold dry winters) (Fig. 4).

Trout

The stock recruitment curve for anadromous trout was best described by a Beverton-Holt curve (Fig. 3). There is a clear change in the stock recruitment relationship of trout after 1989/1990, with all the pre 1990 cohorts populating the upper right hand side of the curve. From 1990 on, all the cohorts are tightly grouped on the upward ascending limb in the bottom left of the curve. Average egg to smolt survival was 0.53% for the hatch years 1972 to 1989, and 1.43% for the hatch years 1990 to 2006. Before 1990, egg deposition rates ranged between *circa* 350,000 and 1,600,000 eggs, corresponding to a smolt output of 2,000 to 6,000 fish. From 1990 onwards, the egg deposition of anadromous trout averaged only 70,000, and the smolt output dropped to less than 1,000 fish. The variability in the residuals from the Beverton-Holt SR curve (i.e. the trout survival index) was much higher in the earlier part of the time series, and stabilised from 1990 onwards (Fig. 2). This change in the dynamics of the trout population was fundamentally linked with decreasing marine survival, with returns of sea trout averaging 40% until 1989, but only 11% thereafter (Fig. 2).

A model including the water temperature in spring of the hatch year (*sprwt*) and the NAO index (*nao*) explained 79% of the deviance in the trout survival over the whole series

(1972-2006) (Table 3). The relationship between spring water temperature and survival was not linear, with survival decreasing as spring water temperatures increased from 6°C to 8°C but then increasing slightly as temperatures rose to 10°C (Fig. 5). The relationship between survival and the NAO index was also non-linear, with survival decreasing as the NAO index moved from a strongly negative phase towards a value of 1, but then rising again as the NAO shifted to positive values of 3. On further analysis, the non-linear nature of the relationships between trout survival, *sprwt* and *nao* appear to be an artefact of combining the two distinct phases in the Burrishoole trout population in the analysis, before and after the sea trout collapse in 1989/1990. When data from after 1989 are excluded from the analysis, the relationships between trout survival, *sprwt* and *nao* are much clearer (Fig. 6). Survival decreased as *sprwt* increased from 6 to 9 °C, and also decreased as *nao* moved from negative to positive phases. The GAM of this smaller data set had an explained deviance of 88% (n=18), and the smoothers for *sprwt* and *nao* are significant at $p<0.05$. The addition of the catchment change proxy *LOI* did not increase the explained deviance of this reduced model (Table 4), although it should be noted that the sample size was very small at this stage, owing to the lower temporal resolution of the *LOI* data (n=11). However, the residuals from the full model (Table 3) also show no relationship with *LOI* over the time period 1972-2006, strengthening the conclusion that land use change had little or no impact on trout survival. Any attempt to model freshwater trout survival in the years after 1990 proved unsuccessful, a reflection of the very small amount of variation in freshwater survival during this period.

Discussion

Land use changes have had a significant impact on the ecological quality of downstream lakes in Burrishoole (Dalton et al. 2014). Remains of diatoms preserved in sediments indicate

313 increased productivity in catchment lakes, Feeagh and Bunaveela, between 1970 and 2007.
314 The rate of sediment accumulation in the lake, linked largely to peat erosion and organic
315 matter deposition, also increased substantially over the same period. Excessive sedimentation
316 of headwater streams and spawning gravels is known to have adverse effects on salmonids
317 (Soulsby et al. 2001, Suttle et al. 2004) but this does not seem to have been the case in
318 Burrishoole. There are two possible reasons for this. First, the topography of the catchment
319 may promote rapid wash out of eroded sediment from upland spawning streams. Rivers in the
320 catchment are characterised by high frequency spates, with floods rising within an hour of
321 rainfall events, and frequent high water levels throughout the year. This was accentuated
322 when ground preparation for afforestation, including extensive land drainage networks, was
323 carried out in the mid-20th century (Müller 2000). Thus the main sediment deposition could
324 have occurred in the standing waters of Bunaveela and Feeagh, rather than in the headwater
325 streams where salmonid spawning takes place. Second, increased productivity in the
326 catchment may have benefited the salmon population: even slight increases in nutrients
327 (carbon, nitrogen or phosphorus) in catchment lakes may have resulted in greater food
328 availability to salmon. Graham et al. (2014) noted that trout found in Irish lakes situated in
329 afforested catchments were larger than those found in un-afforested catchments. This
330 observation was attributed to eutrophication of small lakes by commercial forestry actions
331 including fertilisation of recently planted conifer crops, accelerated peat decomposition,
332 mineralisation of disturbed peatlands, and increased availability of organic matter from
333 felling residues (Drinan et al. 2013). Similarly, organic matter from forested catchments was
334 found to enhance bacterial biomass, and hence supply extra energy through the food web of
335 Canadian lakes, boosting the biomass of planktivorous fish (Tanentzap et al. 2014). Additions
336 of leaf litter and terrestrial invertebrates from forestry can also positively impact on
337 productivity (Wipfli 1997, Wallace et al. 1997, Dineen et al. 2007), by increasing the

allocthonous energy supply to fish and hence the enriching riverine salmon populations (Johansen et al. 2005). The results of this study indicate that there was no impact of the land use changes in Burrishoole on salmonid survival, either positive or negative.

There were no data available describing salmon survival before 1970, nor were there data to show whether the number of returning adults described here was particularly high or low relative to previous decades. There is, thus, no way of ascertaining whether the period described in this paper is representative of the historical number of salmon spawning in the catchment, or historical freshwater survival. Our time series represents a general period of decline in the number of Atlantic salmon in the North Atlantic (Limburg and Waldman 2009) following a productive period between 1950 and 1970, with high commercial catches (Parrish et al. 1998, Boylan and Adams 2006). Local evidence suggest that salmon numbers were much higher in Burrishoole during that time period, with reported draft net catches in Lough Furnace (a coastal lagoon downstream of Lough Feeagh and the fish traps) of 500 grilse and 120 MSW (multi-sea winter) salmon in the early 1950s (Nixon 1999). For comparison, the total returns through the Burrishoole traps for the period 1970-2006 averaged 518 grilse and 19 MSW fish. The linear nature of the SR curve for salmon indicates that the current stock (i.e. the last five decades) does not exhibit a compensatory relationship, and it seems likely that the catchment could support a much larger population of salmon, without affecting density dependant survival, should stocks improve in the future. It is possible that the period 1971-1995 represented a low level of salmon survival coinciding with land use change and a deleterious hatchery influence, with 1995-2007 representing a recovery of sorts. Whatever the mechanism behind the observed increase in freshwater survival in salmon, no significant *negative* impact of land use changes on salmon stocks in freshwater is evident. However, caution must be applied to any conclusions based on this result. Although the Burrishoole catchment has become more trophically enriched over the period discussed here, it remains

oligotrophic. Openwater phosphorus levels in Lough Feeagh rarely exceed $10\mu\text{gL}^{-1}$ and chlorophyll *a* values are generally less than $2\mu\text{gL}^{-1}$ (Marine Institute, unpublished data), putting the lake into the oligotrophic category (after Carlson 1977). The humic nature of the waters in Lough Feeagh may limit autotrophic primary production, even with increased nutrients (P and N) (Karlsson et al. 2009, Sparber et al. 2015). In addition, long term monitoring of some of the rivers in the catchment by the Irish Environmental Protection Agency indicates that water quality is still good (McGarrigle et al. 2011), with Q-indices of 4, 4-5 and 5. The Q index is an Irish rating system used to classify river water quality against a trophic gradient, with Q5 sites showing no signs of eutrophication, while Q1 sites are severely affected (Toner et al. 2005). Work by Kelly et al. (2007) indicates that salmonid populations begin to be impacted once river sites fall below Q4.

The salmon model presented in this paper is an extension of work described in McGinnity et al. (2009), which found that 76% of the interannual variability in egg-to-smolt survival was related to a set of climatic and management related (% hatchery fish) drivers. At the time of that analysis, land use change proxies were not available for inclusion, but were acknowledged to be a likely source of variation. In addition, the survival index used in McGinnity et al. (2009) (egg to smolt survival) did not take account of the density dependant nature of the relationship between survival and spawning stock size. Nevertheless, the results presented here support the conclusions of this previous analysis, and confirm that, together with climatic variables, the influence of hatchery fish in the spawning cohort accounts for a large proportion of the variability in salmon survival in Burrishoole. The addition of a land use change proxy (*LOI*) did not explain any additional variation in the dataset, but underlines the importance of considering multiple drivers in any assessment of long term directional changes in stock recruitment relationships.

The dynamics of the anadromous trout population in Burrishoole was profoundly

affected by changing conditions at sea in the late 1980s, leading to poorer returns of potential spawners to the catchment. This meant that any impact of environmental disturbance in freshwater was going to be difficult to detect. Trout could be expected to respond to increased productivity in the catchment in a similar fashion to that described for salmon but there is little evidence for this in Burrishoole. The trout population after 1989 bore little resemblance to that of the 1970s and 1980s, with the number of migratory trout falling by an order of magnitude from an average of 2,624 between 1975-1979, to an average of 115 between 2000 and 2003 (Poole et al. 2006). While smolt output decreased substantially after 1989, egg to smolt survival actually increased. Relaxation of density dependence on juvenile trout may be responsible for this increase in freshwater survival. It is, however, also possible that it is due to an increased relative contribution of resident trout to smolt output, although this is thought to be low (Poole et al. 2006). The stock–recruitment relationship for Burrishoole migratory trout suggests that the production of smolts, or juvenile recruits, is closely related to the level of ova deposited by migratory trout, supporting the hypothesis that the propensity for marine migration is under strong genetic control, and the increase in egg-smolt survival post 1989 is a real phenomenon of the anadromous portion of the trout population (Poole et al. 2006).

The relationship between the NAO index and egg-smolt survival of both trout and salmon is interesting, but not unexpected. Negative NAO index values are accompanied by cold, dry and calm winters in northwest Europe, whereas positive values are correlated with milder winters, strong westerly winds and higher rainfall (Hurrell 1995). Such variation in precipitation and temperature, at a time when salmonids are spawning and emerging as vulnerable swim-up fry, is expected to bring about significant variation in survival. Previous studies have highlighted the impact of NAO on aquatic ecosystems in western Europe (Weyhenmeyer et al. 1999, Bradley and Ormerod 2001, Straile et al. 2003), including the Burrishoole (Jennings et al. 2000, Blenckner et al. 2007), and also on the fish populations

native to these catchments (Elliott et al. 2000, Kallio-nyberg et al. 2004, Alonso et al. 2011). Results presented in this paper show that even in combination with many other pressures, the NAO influence on survival of salmon and trout in freshwater is significant. Salmonid survival is highest when the NAO index is negative, i.e. when winters are cold, dry and calm. As this NAO link is apparent for the hatch year, we interpret these results as the impact of winter weather on cohorts hatching from the stream gravels and emerging as fry. Possible reasons for this relationship include wash out of eggs and fry from gravels in wet winters (Jensen and Johnsen 1999), or a mismatch in developmental schedules in warm winters between the hatching eggs and emerging fry and their prey, resulting in insufficient energy reserves for survival (McGinnity et al. 2009, Jonsson and Jonsson 2011). Future climate projections for the Atlantic coast of Europe (Beniston et al. 2007) and specifically for Burrishoole (Fealy et al. 2014) include an increase in winter rainfall, and warmer winter temperatures. Results from this study indicate that the occurrence of such changes could be detrimental to freshwater survival of salmon and trout. A step change in air temperature which occurred in Ireland and across Europe in 1987–1988 has been attributed to the start of an extended positive phase of the NAO and has been associated with ecological changes (Beaugrand 2004, Fealy and Sweeney 2005, Donnelly et al. 2009), including an increase in the incidence of disease in brown trout *Salmo trutta* in Switzerland (Hari et al. 2006).

The impact of spring water temperatures on trout survival appears to be stronger than the influence of winter climate as indicated by NAO. Spring water temperatures will invariably be higher after winters with positive NAO indices, especially if water temperatures are measured in lakes that may take several months to warm or cool. Thus, the two variables are interlinked. Nevertheless, spring water temperature and NAO were not strongly correlated in this study, indicating that warm spring weather puts an additional stress on trout in freshwater that is not apparent for salmon. More detailed analysis using juvenile trout

densities may help to elucidate the mechanism between spring water temperature and survival. The causes are likely to be similar to those outlined above with reference to winter temperatures.

In conclusion, the data reported here underline the importance of maintaining long term datasets against which to test long held hypotheses, and to generate knowledge of ecosystem processes sufficient to understand the likely consequences of human actions (Pikitch et al. 2004). Diadromous fish are particularly at risk from multiple impacts in marine, transitional and freshwater environments as well as the overarching impact of climate change. Understanding the relative importance of these impacts allows managers to make informed decisions on the measures required to conserve these stocks. In Burrishoole, the most important determinant of freshwater survival of salmon was the deleterious effect of hatchery fish in the spawning cohort for salmon. While stocking is seen by many as a possible management action to conserve and bolster stocks, evidence continues to mount that where a wild population is present, and habitat is available, stocking is misguided (McGinnity et al. 2009, Bacon et al. 2015). The impact of reduced marine survival as a result of sea lice parasitism (Poole et al. 1990, Gargan et al. 2006, Thorstad et al. 2015) on the Burrishoole migratory trout was very significant, and transformed the dynamics of the population. Any relationship with land use change was likely to pale into insignificance in comparison, and we found this to be the case. In the case of salmonids, direct anthropogenic impacts, which in hindsight could have been avoided or minimised, have posed the greatest risk to the conservation of stocks in Burrishoole, notwithstanding the significant influence of climatic factors. The lesson to be learned here must surely be to minimise those impacts that we now know are likely to affect stocks of diadromous fish, with the knowledge that there are many unpredictable and less easily controlled confounding effects on the horizon. Finally, the role that an ecosystem approach using long term ecological monitoring must play in

providing the evidence needed to manage diadromous fish stocks cannot be underestimated.

Acknowledgements

The authors sincerely thank the many staff of the Marine Institute research station in Burrishoole who have maintained the migratory fish census over five decades. The Environmental Protection Agency in Ireland funded the project which supplied some of the data for this work (ILLUMINATE # 2005-W-MS-40). P. McGinnity was supported by the Beaufort Marine Research Award in Fish Population Genetics funded by the Irish Government under the Sea Change Programme. Marzena Olas, Kim Olaya-Bosch and Karin Sparber helped with the collection of the core data.

References

- Allott, N., McGinnity, P., and O’Hea, B. 2005. Factors influencing the downstream transport of sediment in the Lough Feeagh catchment, Burrishoole, Co. Mayo, Ireland. *Freshw. Forum* **23**: 126–138.
- Alonso, C., García de Jalón, D., Álvarez, J., and Gortázar, J. 2011. A large-scale approach can help detect general processes driving the dynamics of brown trout populations in extensive areas. *Ecol. Freshw. Fish* **20**(3): 449–460. doi:10.1111/j.1600-0633.2011.00484.x.
- Appleby, P.G. 2002. Chronostratigraphic Techniques in Recent Sediments. *In* Tracking Environmental Change Using Lake Sediments. *Edited by* W.M. Last and J.P. Smol. Springer Netherlands. pp. 171–203.
- Bacon, P.J., Malcolm, I.A., Fryer, R.J., Glover, R.S., Millar, C.P., and Youngson, A.F. 2015. Can Conservation Stocking Enhance Juvenile Emigrant Production in Wild Atlantic

- 487 Salmon? *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **144**(3): 642–654.
488 doi:10.1080/00028487.2015.1017655.
- 489 Beaugrand, G. 2004. The North Sea regime shift: Evidence, causes, mechanisms and
490 consequences. *Prog. Oceanogr.* **60**(2–4): 245–262. doi:10.1016/j.pocean.2004.02.018.
- 491 Beniston, M., Stephenson, D.B., Christensen, O.B., Ferro, C.A.T., Frei, C., Goyette, S.,
492 Halsnaes, K., Holt, T., Jylhä, K., Koffi, B., Palutikof, J., Schöll, R., Semmler, T., and
493 Woth, K. 2007. Future extreme events in European climate: an exploration of regional
494 climate model projections. *Clim. Change* **81**(1): 71–95. doi:10.1007/s10584-006-
495 9226-z.
- 496 Beverton, R.J.H., and Holt, S.J. 1957. On the dynamics of exploited fish populations.
497 Fisheries Investigation Series 2, volume 19, UK Ministry of Agriculture. Fish. Food
498 Lond. UK.
- 499 Blenckner, T., Adrian, R., Livingstone, D.M., Jennings, E., Weyhenmeyer, G.A., George,
500 D.G., Jankowski, T., Jarvinen, M., Nic Aonghusa, C., Noges, T., Straile, D., and
501 Teubner, K. 2007. Large-scale climatic signatures in lakes across Europe: a meta-
502 analysis. *Glob. Change Biol.* **13**(7): 1314–1326. doi:10.1111/j.1365-
503 2486.2007.01364.x.
- 504 Boylan, P., and Adams, C. 2006. The influence of broad scale climatic phenomena on long
505 term trends in Atlantic salmon population size: an example from the River Foyle,
506 Ireland. *J. Fish Biol.* **68**(1): 276–283. doi:10.1111/j.0022-1112.2006.00893.x.
- 507 Bradley, D.C., and Ormerod, S.J. 2001. Community persistence among stream invertebrates
508 tracks the North Atlantic Oscillation. *J. Anim. Ecol.* **70**(6): 987–996.
509 doi:10.1046/j.0021-8790.2001.00551.x.

- 510 Bullock, C.H., Collier, M.J., and Convery, F. 2012. Peatlands, their economic value and
511 priorities for their future management – The example of Ireland. *Land Use Policy*
512 **29**(4): 921–928. doi:10.1016/j.landusepol.2012.01.010.
- 513 Carlson, R.E. 1977. A trophic state index for lakes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **22**(2): 361–369.
514 doi:10.4319/lo.1977.22.2.0361.
- 515 Chaput, G., Legault, C.M., Reddin, D.G., Caron, F., and Amiro, P.G. 2005. Provision of
516 catch advice taking account of non-stationarity in productivity of Atlantic salmon
517 (*Salmo salar* L.) in the Northwest Atlantic. *ICES J. Mar. Sci. J. Cons.* **62**(1): 131–
518 143. doi:10.1016/j.icesjms.2004.10.006.
- 519 Collen, B., Whitton, F., Dyer, E.E., Baillie, J.E.M., Cumberlidge, N., Darwall, W.R.T.,
520 Pollock, C., Richman, N.I., Soulsby, A.-M., and Böhm, M. 2014. Global patterns of
521 freshwater species diversity, threat and endemism: Global freshwater species
522 congruence. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* **23**(1): 40–51. doi:10.1111/geb.12096.
- 523 Cowx, I.G., O’Grady, K.T., O’connor, W.C.K., and Andrew, T.E. 1998. The effects of
524 siltation on Atlantic salmon, *Salmo salar* L., embryos in the River Bush. *Fish. Manag.*
525 *Ecol.* **5**(5): 393–401. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2400.1998.550393.x.
- 526 Crozier, W.W., Potter, E.C.E., Prevost, E., Schon, P.-J., and Ó’Maoiléidigh, N. 2003. A
527 coordinated approach towards the development of a scientific basis for management
528 of wild Atlantic salmon in the North-East Atlantic. (SALMODEL - Scientific Report
529 Contract QLK5-1999-01546 to EU Concerted Action Quality of Life and
530 management of Living resources). Belfast.
- 531 Dalton, C., O’Dwyer, B., Taylor, D., de Eyto, E., Jennings, E., Chen, G., Poole, R., Dillane,
532 M., and McGinnity, P. 2014. Anthropocene environmental change in an
533 internationally important oligotrophic catchment on the Atlantic seaboard of western
534 Europe. *Anthropocene* **5**: 9–21. doi:10.1016/j.ancene.2014.06.003.

- 535 de Eyto, E., White, J., Boylan, P., Clarke, B., Cotter, D., Doherty, D., Gargan, P., Kennedy,
536 R., McGinnity, P., and O'Maoileidigh, N. 2015. The fecundity of wild Irish Atlantic
537 salmon *Salmo salar* L. and its application for stock assessment purposes. Fish. Res.
538 **164**: 159–169. doi: 10.1016/j.fishres.2014.11.017
- 539 Dineen, G., Harrison, S.S.C., and Giller, P.S. 2007. Growth, production and bioenergetics of
540 brown trout in upland streams with contrasting riparian vegetation. Freshw. Biol.
541 **52**(5): 771–783. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2427.2007.01698.x.
- 542 Donnelly, A., Cooney, T., Jennings, E., Buscardo, E., and Jones, M. 2009. Response of birds
543 to climatic variability; evidence from the western fringe of Europe. Int. J.
544 Biometeorol. **53**(3): 211–220. doi:10.1007/s00484-009-0206-7.
- 545 Drinan, T.J., Graham, C.T., O'Halloran, J., and Harrison, S.S.C. 2013. The impact of
546 catchment conifer plantation forestry on the hydrochemistry of peatland lakes. Sci.
547 Total Environ. **443**: 608–620. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.10.112.
- 548 Dudgeon, D., Arthington, A.H., Gessner, M.O., Kawabata, Z.-I., Knowler, D.J., Lévêque, C.,
549 Naiman, R.J., Prieur-Richard, A.-H., Soto, D., Stiassny, M.L.J., and Sullivan, C.A.
550 2006. Freshwater biodiversity: importance, threats, status and conservation
551 challenges. Biol. Rev. **81**(2): 163–182. doi:10.1017/S1464793105006950.
- 552 Elliott, J. M., Hurley, M.A., and Maberly, S.C. 2000. The emergence period of sea trout fry in
553 a Lake District stream correlates with the North Atlantic Oscillation. J. Fish Biol.
554 **56**(1): 208–210. doi:10.1111/j.1095-8649.2000.tb02096.x.
- 555 Elliott, S.R., Coe, T.A., Helfield, J.M., and Naiman, R.J. 1998. Spatial variation in
556 environmental characteristics of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) rivers. Can. J. Fish.
557 Aquat. Sci. **55**(S1): 267–280. doi:10.1139/d98-001.
- 558 Evans, C.D., Bonn, A., Holden, J., Reed, M.S., Evans, M.G., Worrall, F., Couwenberg, J.,
559 and Parnell, M. 2014. Relationships between anthropogenic pressures and ecosystem

- 560 functions in UK blanket bogs: Linking process understanding to ecosystem service
561 valuation. *Ecosyst. Serv.* **9**: 5–19. doi:10.1016/j.ecoser.2014.06.013.
- 562 Fealy, R., Allott, N., Broderick, C., de Eyto, E., Dillane, M., Erdil, R.M., Hancox, L.,
563 Jennings, E., McCrann, K., Murphy, C., O'Toole, C., Poole, R., Rogan, G., Ryder, E.,
564 Taylor, D., Whelan, K., and White, J. 2014. RESCALE: Review and Simulate
565 Climate and Catchment Responses at Burrishoole. Galway.
- 566 Fealy, R., and Sweeney, J. 2005. Detection of a possible change point in atmospheric
567 variability in the North Atlantic and its effect on Scandinavian glacier mass balance.
568 *Int. J. Climatol.* **25**(14): 1819–1833. doi:10.1002/joc.1231.
- 569 Fitzsimons, M., and Igoe, F. 2004. Freshwater Fish Conservation in the Irish Republic: A
570 Review of Pressures and Legislation Impacting on Conservation Efforts. *Biol.*
571 *Environ. Proc. R. Ir. Acad.* **104B**(3): 17–32.
- 572 Gargan, P., Poole, W.R., and Forde, G. 2006. A review of the status of Irish Sea trout stocks.
573 *In* *Sea Trout: Biology, Conservation and Management. Edited by* N.M. Graeme
574 Harris. Blackwell, Oxford. pp. 25–44.
- 575 Gillmor, D., and Walsh, J. 1993. County level variations in agricultural adjustment in Ireland
576 in the 1980s. *Geogr. Viewp.* **21**: 25–44.
- 577 Graham, C.T., Drinan, T.J., Harrison, S.S.C., and O'Halloran, J. 2014. Relationship between
578 plantation forest and brown trout growth, energetics and population structure in
579 peatland lakes in western Ireland. *For. Ecol. Manag.* **321**: 71–80.
580 doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2013.06.057.
- 581 Hari, R.E., Livingstone, D.M., Siber, R., Burkhardt-Holm, P., and Güttinger, H. 2006.
582 Consequences of climatic change for water temperature and brown trout populations
583 in Alpine rivers and streams. *Glob. Change Biol.* **12**(1): 10–26. doi:10.1111/j.1365-
584 2486.2005.001051.x.

- 585 Harrison, S.S.C., Hutton, S., Baars, J.-R., Cruikshanks, R., Johnson, J., Juhel, G.,
586 Kirakowski, T., Matson, R., O’Haloran, J., Phelan, P., and Kelly-Quinn, M. 2014.
587 Contrasting impacts of conifer forests on Brown Trout and Atlantic Salmon in
588 headwater streams in Ireland. *Biol. Environ. Proc. R. Ir. Acad.* **114B**: 219–231.
589 doi:10.3318/bioe.2014.20.
- 590 Heiri, O., Lotter, A.F., and Lemcke, G. 2001. Loss on ignition as a method for estimating
591 organic and carbonate content in sediments: reproducibility and comparability of
592 results. *J. Paleolimnol.* **25**(1): 101–110. doi:10.1023/A:1008119611481.
- 593 Hendry, K., Cragg-Hine, D., O’Grady, M., Sambrook, H., and Stephen, A. 2003.
594 Management of habitat for rehabilitation and enhancement of salmonid stocks. *Fish.*
595 *Res.* **62**(2): 171–192. doi:10.1016/S0165-7836(02)00161-3.
- 596 Huang, C.C., and O’Connell, M. 2000. Recent land-use and soil-erosion history within a
597 small catchment in Connemara, western Ireland: evidence from lake sediments and
598 documentary sources. *CATENA* **41**(4): 293–335. doi:10.1016/S0341-8162(00)00095-
599 3.
- 600 Hurrell, J.W. 1995. Decadal Trends in the North Atlantic Oscillation: Regional Temperatures
601 and Precipitation. *Science* **269**(5224): 676–679. doi:10.1126/science.269.5224.676.
- 602 ICES. 2014. Report of the Working Group on North Atlantic Salmon (WGNAS) , 9-18
603 March 2014. Copenhagen, Denmark.
- 604 Jennings, E., Allott, N., McGinnity, P., Poole, R., Quirke, W., Twomey, H., and George, G.
605 2000. The North Atlantic Oscillation: Effects on Freshwater Systems in Ireland. *Biol.*
606 *Environ. Proc. R. Ir. Acad.* **100B**(3): 149–157.
- 607 Jensen, A.J., and Johnsen, B.O. 1999. The functional relationship between peak spring floods
608 and survival and growth of juvenile Atlantic Salmon (*Salmo salar*) and Brown Trout
609 (*Salmo trutta*). *Funct. Ecol.* **13**(6): 778–785. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2435.1999.00358.x.

- 610 Johansen, M., Elliott, J.M., and Klemetsen, A. 2005. Relationships between juvenile salmon,
611 *Salmo salar* L., and invertebrate densities in the River Tana, Norway. Ecol. Freshw.
612 Fish **14**(4): 331–343. doi:10.1111/j.1600-0633.2005.00107.x.
- 613 Jonsson, B., and Jonsson, N. 2009. A review of the likely effects of climate change on
614 anadromous Atlantic salmon *Salmo salar* and brown trout *Salmo trutta*, with
615 particular reference to water temperature and flow. J. Fish Biol. **75**(10): 2381–2447.
616 doi:10.1111/j.1095-8649.2009.02380.x.
- 617 Jonsson, B., and Jonsson, N. 2011. Ecology of Atlantic Salmon and Brown Trout: Habitat as
618 a Template for Life Histories. Springer Science, Netherlands.
- 619 Kallio-nyberg, I., Jutila, E., Saloniemi, I., and Jokikokko, E. 2004. Association between
620 environmental factors, smolt size and the survival of wild and reared Atlantic salmon
621 from the Simojoki River in the Baltic Sea. J. Fish Biol. **65**(1): 122–134.
622 doi:10.1111/j.0022-1112.2004.00435.x.
- 623 Karlsson, J., Byström, P., Ask, J., Ask, P., Persson, L., and Jansson, M. 2009. Light limitation
624 of nutrient-poor lake ecosystems. Nature **460**(7254): 506–509.
625 doi:10.1038/nature08179.
- 626 Kelly, F., Champ, T., McDonnell, N., Kelly-Quinn, M., Harrison, S., Arbuthnott, A., Giller,
627 P., Joy, M., McCarthy, K., Cullen, P., Harrod, C., Jordan, P., Griffiths, D., and Rosell,
628 R. 2007. Investigation of the Relationship between Fish Stocks, Ecological Quality
629 Ratings (Q-Values), Environmental Factors and Degree of Eutrophication. Wexford.
- 630 Limburg, K.E., and Waldman, J.R. 2009. Dramatic Declines in North Atlantic Diadromous
631 Fishes. BioScience **59**(11): 955–965. doi:10.1525/bio.2009.59.11.7.
- 632 Marine Institute. 2013. Newport Research Facility, Annual Report, No. 57, 2012. Newport,
633 Co. Mayo.

- 634 McGarrigle, M., Lucey, J., and Ó Cinnéide, M. 2011. Water Quality in Ireland 2007-2009.
635 Wexford.
- 636 McGinnity, P., Jennings, E., de Eyto, E., Allott, N., Samuelsson, P., Rogan, G., Whelan, K.,
637 and Cross, T. 2009. Impact of naturally spawning captive-bred Atlantic salmon on
638 wild populations: depressed recruitment and increased risk of climate-mediated
639 extinction. *Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci.* **276**: 3601-
640 3610. doi:10.1098/rspb.2009.0799.
- 641 Metcalfe, N.B., and Thorpe, J.E. 1990. Determinants of Geographical Variation in the Age of
642 Seaward-Migrating Salmon, *Salmo salar*. *J. Anim. Ecol.* **59**(1): 135–145.
643 doi:10.2307/5163.
- 644 Montgomery, D.C., and Peck, E.A. 1992. Introduction to linear regression analysis. Wiley,
645 New York.
- 646 Mueter, F.J., Ware, D.M., and Peterman, R.M. 2002. Spatial correlation patterns in coastal
647 environmental variables and survival rates of salmon in the north-east Pacific Ocean.
648 *Fish. Oceanogr.* **11**(4): 205–218. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2419.2002.00192.x.
- 649 Müller, M. 2000. Hydrogeographical studies in the Burrishoole catchment, Newport, Co.
650 Mayo, Ireland: effects of afforestation on the run-off regime of small mountain spate
651 river catchments. *Verh Intern. Ver. Limnol* **27**: 1146–1148.
- 652 Musick, J.A., Harbin, M.M., Berkeley, S.A., Burgess, G.H., Eklund, A.M., Findley, L.,
653 Gilmore, R.G., Golden, J.T., Ha, D.S., Huntsman, G.R., McGovern, J.C., Sedberry,
654 G.R., Parker, S.J., Poss, S.G., Sala, E., Schmidt, T.W., Weeks, H., and Wright, S.G.
655 2000. Marine, Estuarine, and Diadromous Fish Stocks at Risk of Extinction in North
656 America (Exclusive of Pacific Salmonids). *Fisheries* **25**(11): 6–30. doi:10.1577/1548-
657 8446(2000)025<0006:MEADFS>2.0.CO;2.

- 658 Nixon, S. 1999. Guarding the Silver: A life with Salmon and Sea trout. Berry Print Group,
659 Westport, Co. Mayo.
- 660 Parrish, D.L., Behnke, R.J., Gephard, S.R., McCormick, S.D., and Reeves, G.H. 1998. Why
661 aren't there more Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*)? Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. **55**(S1):
662 281–287. doi:10.1139/d98-012.
- 663 Peterman, R.M., Pyper, B.J., Lapointe, M.F., Adkison, M.D., and Walters, C.J. 1998. Patterns
664 of covariation in survival rates of British Columbian and Alaskan sockeye salmon
665 (*Oncorhynchus nerka*) stocks. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. **55**(11): 2503–2517.
666 doi:10.1139/f98-179.
- 667 Pikitch, E.K., Santora, C., Babcock, E.A., Bakun, A., Bonfil, R., Conover, D.O., Dayton, P.,
668 Doukakis, P., Fluharty, D., Heneman, B., Houde, E.D., Link, J., Livingston, P.A.,
669 Mangel, M., McAllister, M.K., Pope, J.A., and Sainsbury, K.J. 2004. Ecosystem-
670 based fishery management. Science **305**(Weekly): 346–347.
671 doi:10.1126/science.1098222.
- 672 Piou, C., and Prévost, E. 2013. Contrasting effects of climate change in continental vs.
673 oceanic environments on population persistence and microevolution of Atlantic
674 salmon. Glob. Change Biol. **19**(3): 711–723. doi:10.1111/gcb.12085.
- 675 Poole, W.R., Dillane, M., de Eyto, E., Rogan, G., McGinnity, P., and Whelan, K. 2006.
676 Characteristics of the Burrishoole Sea Trout Population: Census, Marine Survival,
677 Enhancement and Stock-Recruitment Relationship, 1971-2003. In Sea Trout: Biology,
678 Conservation and Management. Edited by G. Harris and N. Milner. Blackwell,
679 Oxford. pp. 279–306.
- 680 Prévost, E., Parent, E., Crozier, W., Davidson, I., Dumas, J., Gudbergsson, G., Hindar, K.,
681 McGinnity, P., MacLean, J., and Sættem, L.M. 2003. Setting biological reference
682 points for Atlantic salmon stocks: transfer of information from data-rich to sparse-

- 683 data situations by Bayesian hierarchical modelling. *ICES J. Mar. Sci. J. Cons.* **60**(6):
684 1177–1193. doi:10.1016/j.icesjms.2003.08.001.
- 685 Pyper, B.J., and Peterman, R.M. 1998. Comparison of methods to account for autocorrelation
686 in correlation analyses of fish data. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **55**(9): 2127–2140.
687 doi:10.1139/f98-104.
- 688 R Core Team. 2013. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation
689 for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. <http://www.R-project.org/>.
- 690 Rose, K.A., Cowan, J.H., Winemiller, K.O., Myers, R.A., and Hilborn, R. 2001.
691 Compensatory density dependence in fish populations: importance, controversy,
692 understanding and prognosis. *Fish Fish.* **2**(4): 293–327. doi:10.1046/j.1467-
693 2960.2001.00056.x.
- 694 Solomon, D.J. 1985. Salmon stock and recruitment, and stock enhancement. *J. Fish Biol.* **27**:
695 45–57. doi:10.1111/j.1095-8649.1985.tb03231.x.
- 696 Soulsby, C., Youngson, A.F., Moir, H.J., and Malcolm, I.A. 2001. Fine sediment influence
697 on salmonid spawning habitat in a lowland agricultural stream: a preliminary
698 assessment. *Sci. Total Environ.* **265**(1–3): 295–307. doi:10.1016/S0048-
699 9697(00)00672-0.
- 700 Sparber, K., Dalton, C., de Eyto, E., Jennings, E., Lenihan, D., and Cassina, F. 2015.
701 Contrasting pelagic plankton in temperate Irish lakes: the relative contribution of
702 heterotrophic, mixotrophic, and autotrophic components, and the effects of extreme
703 rainfall events. *Inland Waters* **5**(3): 295–310.
- 704 Stendera, S., Adrian, R., Bonada, N., Cañedo-Argüelles, M., Hugueny, B., Januschke, K.,
705 Pletterbauer, F., and Hering, D. 2012. Drivers and stressors of freshwater biodiversity
706 patterns across different ecosystems and scales: a review. *Hydrobiologia* **696**(1): 1–
707 28. doi:10.1007/s10750-012-1183-0.

- 708 Straile, D., Livingstone, D.M., Weyhenmeyer, G.A., and George, D.G. 2003. The response of
709 freshwater ecosystems to climate variability associated with the North Atlantic
710 Oscillation. *In* The North Atlantic Oscillation; Climatic Significance and
711 Environmental Impact. *Edited by* J.W. Hurrell, Y. Kushnir, G. Ottersen, and M.
712 Visbeck. American Geophysical Union, Washington DC. pp. 263–279.
- 713 Suttle, K.B., Power, M.E., Levine, J.M., and McNeely, C. 2004. How fine sediment in
714 riverbeds impairs growth and survival of juvenile salmonids. *Ecol. Appl.* **14**(4): 969–
715 974. doi:10.1890/03-5190.
- 716 Tanentzap, A.J., Szkokan-Emilson, E.J., Kielstra, B.W., Arts, M.T., Yan, N.D., and Gunn,
717 J.M. 2014. Forests fuel fish growth in freshwater deltas. *Nat. Commun.* **5**: 4077.
718 doi:10.1038/ncomms5077.
- 719 Thorstad, E., Todd, C., Uglem, I., Bjørn, P., Gargan, P., Vollset, K., Halttunen, E., Kålås, S.,
720 Berg, M., and Finstad, B. 2015. Effects of salmon lice *Lepeophtheirus salmonis* on
721 wild sea trout *Salmo trutta*—a literature review. *Aquac. Environ. Interact.* **7**(2): 91–
722 113. doi:10.3354/aei00142.
- 723 Toner, P., Bowman, J., Clabby, K., Lucey, J., McGarrigle, M., Concannon, C., Clenaghan,
724 C., Cunningham, P., Delaney, J., O’Boyle, S., MacCarthaigh, M., Craig, M., and
725 Quinn, R. 2005. Water Quality in Ireland 2001 - 2003. Wexford, Ireland.
- 726 Tully, O., and Whelan, K.F. 1993. Production of nauplii of *Lepeophtheirus salmonis* (Krøyer)
727 (Copepoda: Caligidae) from farmed and wild salmon and its relation to the infestation
728 of wild sea trout (*Salmo trutta* L.) off the west coast of Ireland in 1991. *Fish. Res.*
729 **17**(1–2): 187–200. doi:10.1016/0165-7836(93)90018-3.
- 730 Venables, W.N., and Ripley, B.D. 2002. Modern Applied Statistics with S. *In* Fourth Edition.
731 Springer, New York.

- 732 Wallace, J.B., Eggert, S.L., Meyer, J.L., and Webster, J.R. 1997. Multiple Trophic Levels of
733 a Forest Stream Linked to Terrestrial Litter Inputs. *Science* **277**(5322): 102–104.
734 doi:10.1126/science.277.5322.102.
- 735 Walters, C.J., Hilborn, R., and Christensen, V. 2008. Surplus production dynamics in
736 declining and recovering fish populations. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **65**(11): 2536–
737 2551. doi:10.1139/F08-170.
- 738 Weyhenmeyer, G.A., Blenckner, T., and Pettersson, K. 1999. Changes of the plankton spring
739 outburst related to the North Atlantic Oscillation. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **44**(7): 1788–
740 1792. doi:10.4319/lo.1999.44.7.1788.
- 741 Wilcove, D.S., and Wikelski, M. 2008. Going, Going, Gone: Is Animal Migration
742 Disappearing. *PLoS Biol* **6**(7): e188. doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.0060188.
- 743 Wipfli, M.S. 1997. Terrestrial invertebrates as salmonid prey and nitrogen sources in streams:
744 contrasting old-growth and young-growth riparian forests in southeastern Alaska,
745 U.S.A. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **54**(6): 1259–1269. doi:10.1139/f97-034.
- 746 Wood, S.N. 2006. *Generalized Additive Models: An Introduction with R*. Chapman and
747 Hall/CRC., London.
- 748 Zuur, A., Ieno, E.N., Walker, N., Saveliev, A.A., and Smith, G.M. 2009. *Mixed Effects*
749 *Models and Extensions in Ecology with R*. Springer.
- 750

751 **Table 1.** Generalized additive model of salmon freshwater survival in the Burrishoole
 752 catchment. Variables included were *nao*: NAO - Hurrells winter index and *hatcheryprop*:
 753 proportion of hatchery fish in the spawning escapement. Deviance explained = 68%, R-
 754 sq.(adj) = 0.58, GCV score < 0.001, Scale est. < 0.001 and n = 37

Parametric coefficients	Estimate	Std. Error	t-value	<i>p</i>
Intercept	680.4	274.8	2.5	0.02
Approximate significance of smooth terms	edf	Ref.df	F	<i>p</i>
<i>s(nao)</i>	5.4	6.5	2.6	0.03
<i>s(hatcheryprop)</i>	2.9	3.5	4.2	0.01

755

756

Table 2. Generalized additive models of salmon freshwater survival in the Burrishoole catchment. Variables included were *nao*: NAO - Hurrells winter index; *LOI* : loss on ignition of sediment from L. Feeagh; *hatcheryprop*: proportion of hatchery fish in the spawning escapement. The value of $\text{Pr}(> F)$ gives the significance of dropping one term from model 1, by comparing the difference in deviances of the nested models using an F-test. $n = 26$ for all models.

Model	AIC	Explained deviance	$\text{Pr}(> F)$
1. $\text{Survival} \sim s(\text{hatcheryprop}) + s(\text{nao}) + \text{LOI}$	462	84%	
2. $\text{Survival} \sim s(\text{hatcheryprop}) + s(\text{nao})$	464	80%	0.12
3. $\text{Survival} \sim s(\text{hatcheryprop}) + \text{LOI}$	474	61%	0.01
4. $\text{Survival} \sim \text{LOI} + s(\text{nao})$	476	61%	0.006

767 **Table 3.** Generalized additive model of trout freshwater survival in the Burrishoole
 768 catchment. Variables included were *sprwt*: average water temperature for spring (Mar, Apr,
 769 May) of hatch year, and *nao*: NAO - Hurrells winter index. Deviance explained = 79%, R-
 770 sq.(adj) = 0.67, GCV score < 0.001, Scale est. =78166 and n = 35

Parametric coefficients	Estimate	Std. Error	t-value	<i>p</i>
Intercept	-7.36	47.26	-0.16	0.87
Approximate significance of smooth terms	edf	Ref.df	F	<i>p</i>
<i>s(sprwt)</i>	7.61	8.42	6.36	<0.0001
<i>s(nao)</i>	5.34	6.41	2.64	0.04

771

772

773
774
775
776
777
778
779

780

Table 4. Generalized additive models of trout freshwater survival in the Burrishoole catchment for years between 1972 and 1989. Variables included were *sprwt*: average water temperature for spring (Mar, Apr, May) of hatch year; *nao*: NAO - Hurrells winter index and *LOI* : loss on ignition of sediment from L. Feeagh. The value of Pr(>F) gives the significance of dropping one term from model 1, by comparing the difference in deviances of the nested models using an F-test. n= 11 for all models.

Model	AIC	Explained deviance	Pr(>F)
<i>Survival ~ s(sprwt) + nao + LOI</i>	169	61%	
<i>Survival ~ s(sprwt) + nao</i>	166	61%	0.96
<i>Survival ~ s(sprwt) + LOI</i>	167	59%	0.61
<i>Survival ~ nao +LOI</i>	174	17%	0.02

Figure legends

Fig. 1. Map of the Burrishoole catchment, showing its location in Ireland. © Ordnance Survey Ireland Discovery Series. EPA and MI data provided under Creative Commons CC-BY 4.0 licence.

Fig. 2. Fish response variables (salmon and trout survival), the land use change proxy (*LOI*), climatic (teleconnections, temperature, precipitation) and other explanatory variables (influence of hatchery stocks and marine survival) considered in the analysis. Additional seasonal climatic variables were included (winter, summer and autumn values of water temperature and precipitation), but are not plotted.

Fig. 3. Stock recruitment curves for salmon (left) and trout (right) from the Burrishoole catchment. Dotted lines indicate the best fit SR curve. For salmon: $R^2 = 89\%$, $m = 6352$ (eq. 1). For trout: $R^2 = 80\%$, $a = 18087$, $b = 3.312$ (eq. 2). See main text for equation details.

Fig. 4. Conditional plots of partial residuals for each explanatory variable in a GAM describing salmon freshwater survival in the Burrishoole catchment (details in Table 1.). The lines indicate mean model fit $\pm 95\%$ c.i.'s in shaded polygons. These plots show the value of the explanatory variable of interest (x-axis), and the change in the response variable (y-axis), holding all other variables constant.

Fig. 5. Conditional plots of partial residuals for each explanatory variable in a GAM describing trout egg-smolt freshwater survival in the Burrishoole catchment (see table 3) between 1972 and 2006. The lines indicate mean model fit $\pm 95\%$ c.i.'s in shaded polygons.

Fig. 6. Conditional plots of partial residuals for each explanatory variable in a GAM

804 describing trout egg-smolt freshwater survival in the Burrishoole catchment between
805 1972 and 1989. The lines indicate mean model fit $\pm$ 95% c.i.'s in shaded polygons.

806

Draft

Proportion of hatchery fish in spawning cohort