# Rational Design of Efficient Palladium Catalysts for Electroreduction of Carbon Dioxide to Formate

Anna Klinkova, Phil De Luna, Cao-Thang Dinh, Oleksandr Voznyy, Egor M. Larin, Eugenia Kumacheva, and Edward H. Sargent

## Version
Post-Print/Accepted Manuscript

## Citation (published version)

## Publisher’s Statement
This document is the Accepted Manuscript version of a Published Work that appeared in final form in ACS Catalysis, copyright ©2016 American Chemical Society after peer review and technical editing by the publisher. To access the final edited and published work see https://dx.doi.org/10.1021/acscatal.6b01719.

---

### How to cite TSpace items

Always cite the published version, so the author(s) will receive recognition through services that track citation counts, e.g. Scopus. If you need to cite the page number of the TSpace version (original manuscript or accepted manuscript) because you cannot access the published version, then cite the TSpace version in addition to the published version using the permanent URI (handle) found on the record page.
Rational Design of Efficient Palladium Catalysts for Electroreduction of Carbon Dioxide to Formate

Anna Klinkova1‡, Phil De Luna2‡, Cao-Thang Dinh3, Oleksandr Voznyy3, Egor M. Larin1, Eugenia Kumacheva1,*, Edward H. Sargent3,*

1Department of Chemistry, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario M5S 3H6, Canada

2Department of Materials Science & Engineering, 184 College St., Toronto, Ontario M5S 3E4, Canada.

3The Edward S. Rogers Sr. Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, 10 King’s College Rd, Toronto, Ontario M5S 3G4, Canada.

ABSTRACT: The electrochemical reduction of CO₂ into renewable chemical products such as formic acid is an important and challenging goal. Traditional Pd catalysts suffer from CO poisoning which leads to current density decay and short operating lifetimes. Here we explored the ability to control Pd nanoparticle surface morphology to amplify catalytic activity and increase stability in the electroreduction of CO₂ to formate. Through computational studies we have elucidated trends in intermediate binding which govern the selectivity and catalytic activity. We
then rationally synthesized Pd nanoparticles having an abundance of high-index surfaces to maximize electrocatalytic performance. This catalyst displays a record current density of 22 mA/cm² at a low overpotential of -0.2 V with Faradaic efficiency of 97%, outperforming all previous Pd catalysts in formate electrosynthesis. The findings presented in this work provide rational design principles which highlights morphological control of high index surfaces for the effective and stable catalytic electroreduction of CO₂ to liquid fuels.

KEYWORDS: Carbon dioxide, palladium, nanoparticle, shape, facet, electrochemical CO₂ reduction.

INTRODUCTION: The electrochemical conversion of carbon dioxide (CO₂) into synthetic fuels and value-added chemicals is a key enabler of carbon-neutral energy sources, since it provides a means to store renewable electricity in a high-density (energy-per-volume) liquid form.¹ Unfortunately, CO₂ electoreduction suffers from a high overpotential, poor product selectivity, and insufficient electrocatalyst stability.¹² The field seeks stable electrode materials that efficiently and selectively reduce CO₂ to useful products at low overpotentials.

Electroreduction of CO₂ into formic acid is of particular interest, as formic acid can be used as a fuel in direct formic acid fuel cells,³ and is used today in the synthesis of fine chemicals such as pharmaceuticals⁴,⁵ and as a preservative and antibacterial agent.⁶ Formate and formic acid are the main products of CO₂ electoreduction on post-transition metals, such as Pb, Hg, Tl, In, Sn, Cd and Bi; however, previously-reported electoreduction studies using these materials have required very negative potentials relative to the equilibrium potential to achieve good product selectivity.⁷,⁸ Among inorganic strategies, only through the use of Pd electoreduction of CO₂ to formate have
potentials close to the equilibrium potential been obtained; indeed these results come impressively close to the performance of formate dehydrogenase enzymes.\textsuperscript{9}

Currently, Pd nanoparticles (NPs) used in the selectively reduce CO\textsubscript{2} to formate have been limited to low current densities: specifically, only-sub-mA/cm\textsuperscript{2} geometric current densities have been reported at near-equilibrium potential.\textsuperscript{10,11} Recently, Pd NP-based electrocatalysts with near quantitative Faradaic efficiency, impressive geometric current densities (10 mA/cm\textsuperscript{2} at -0.2 V in 2.8 M KHCO\textsubscript{3}) and high mass activity have been reported for CO\textsubscript{2} reduction to formate.

In these otherwise very promising studies, one key challenge remains: over the course of the reaction, performance was lost.\textsuperscript{12} Thus, although the application of Pd NPs shows great promise for energy-efficient electroreduction of CO\textsubscript{2},\textsuperscript{12} further understanding has to be developed for the factors that affect their stability and high selectivity.

It has been proposed that the reduction of stability of Pd nanocatalysts in formate synthesis originates from CO poisoning.\textsuperscript{12} While at high overpotentials CO\textsubscript{2} steadily reduces to CO, at low overpotential, CO is only forming in trace amounts and yet, this is sufficient for catalyst surface poisoning.\textsuperscript{13} Two proposed multistep mechanisms of electrochemical reduction of CO\textsubscript{2} to formic acid include:

Mechanism 1:

\[
\text{CO}_2 + H^+ + e^- + * \rightarrow \text{COOH}^* \hspace{1cm} (1)
\]

\[
\text{COOH}^* + H^+ + e^- \rightarrow \text{HCOOH} \hspace{1cm} (2)
\]

Mechanism 2:

\[
\text{CO}_2 + H^+ + e^- + * \rightarrow \text{HCOO}^* \hspace{1cm} (3)
\]

\[
\text{HCOO}^* + H^+ + e^- \rightarrow \text{HCOOH} \hspace{1cm} (4)
\]

Additionally, the competing electrochemical reduction of CO\textsubscript{2} to CO proceeds as follows:
COOH*/HCOO* + H^+(aq) + e^- → CO* + H_2O  \tag{5}

CO* → CO + * \tag{6},

where * represents either a vacant surface catalytic active site, or intermediate species adsorbed on the active site. The production of formic acid is proposed to proceed either through a proton/electron pair transfer to form a carboxyl (COOH*) (reaction 1), or a formate (HCOO*) intermediate (reaction 3). Next, the COOH* (reaction 2) or HCOO* (reaction 4) can be reduced to HCOOH with a subsequent proton/electron pair transfer. Importantly, reaction 5 leads to the formation of CO species bound to the active site: this in turn poisons the surface of the catalyst.\textsuperscript{9,12} Furthermore, it has previously been shown that the more favored intermediate for CO evolution is COOH*.\textsuperscript{17}

The surface of the electrode can be reactivated by short oxidative treatment.\textsuperscript{12} More desirably, though, CO poisoning would be reduced, and the selectivity towards formic acid synthesis, by designing a catalyst that would stabilize the formation of intermediates that reduce to HCOOH (steps 1-4) and inhibit the formation of intermediate bound CO (steps 5-6).

Here we focus on designing the surface of the metal surface to weaken the CO binding affinity. We contemplate either varying the size of NPs, or honing the arrangement of atoms on their facets. The difference in surface atomic arrangements results in different stabilization energies of reaction intermediate,\textsuperscript{14} the effect that is specific for a particular metal material. The effect of metal surface morphology on CO\textsubscript{2} electroreduction pathways and efficiencies has been reported for gold and copper NPs.\textsuperscript{14,15} It has been established that low-coordinated sites on gold NPs favor the formation of carbon monoxide,\textsuperscript{15} while copper NPs exhibit increased catalytic activity and selectivity with decreasing NPs size.\textsuperscript{16} Recently, it has been shown that Pd NP size influences Faradaic efficiencies of CO\textsubscript{2} to CO electroreduction in the potential range from 0.6 to -1.2 V (vs RHE), which was also
attributed to the higher efficiency of edge sites, compared to terrace sites.\textsuperscript{17} To the best of our knowledge, no comprehensive studies have been conducted to explore the effect of Pd NP morphology on CO\textsubscript{2} electroreduction to formate catalyzed by Pd NPs.

We begin by elucidating the underlying principles in the morphology-governed catalytic performance of Pd NPs. We seek to do this by carrying out density functional theory (DFT) studies of Pd(111), Pd(110), Pd(100), Pd(211) NP surfaces and a Pd\textsubscript{19} cluster, revealing the relation between the surface atomic coordination and the catalytic behavior of NPs in CO\textsubscript{2} electroreduction. Following the theoretical predictions, we designed and synthesized a family of Pd NPs with various shapes and enclosing surface planes, for which we explored electrocatalytic performance in the CO\textsubscript{2} reduction reaction. Our work shows favorably high intrinsic catalytic CO\textsubscript{2} electroreduction activity and stability on branched Pd NPs, enclosed by high index facets and surface kinks, in comparison with other types of Pd NPs. The best catalysts achieve impressive Faradaic efficiencies (FE>90\%) and exceptionally high current density (\textasciitilde 15 mA/cm\textsuperscript{2}), both realized at low overpotentials (-0.2V vs RHE). In summary, we have leveraged morphology-driven principles to maximize electrocatalytic efficiency and stability by rationally designing Pd NPs with sharp geometric features.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Recent DFT screening of metal surfaces and facets for formic acid synthesis showed that there is a high probability the reaction takes place with the HCOO* intermediate.\textsuperscript{18} Furthermore, these studies showed that Pd had the lowest limiting potential closely matching the equilibrium potential for the synthesis of formic acid. Being inspired by these findings, we performed a series of DFT calculations on Pd surfaces to explore the relationship between a specific surface facet and catalytic
electroreduction of CO₂ to formic acid. In these studies, we elucidated the thermodynamic reaction energy barriers and free energies of formation for the reaction intermediates (HCOO*, CO*, COOH*) on different facets. The catalyst surfaces were modeled with the Vienna Ab-initio Simulation Package (VASP)\textsuperscript{19} with periodic boundary conditions using the Atomic Simulation Environment (ASE)\textsuperscript{20} (see Supporting Information).

To identify the most favored reaction intermediate during the first proton coupled electron transfer step we calculated the electronic binding energies of HCOO* vs. COOH* intermediates on Pd(111), Pd(100), Pd(110), and Pd(211) planes, as well as on Pd\textsubscript{19} cluster (Table S3). We found that the binding energy of COOH* was more negative on low index facets Pd(111), and Pd(100) whereas the binding energy of HCOO* was more negative on high index facets Pd(110), Pd(211). For example, the binding energy of COOH* and HCOO* on the stepped Pd(211) surface was -0.35 eV and -0.42 eV, respectively. The more negative binding energy of the HCOO* intermediate suggested that the reaction proceeds via a formate, rather than a carboxyl intermediate, in agreement with recently published results.\textsuperscript{18} Conversely, Pd(111) and Pd(100) surfaces favored the COOH* intermediate which is more likely to lead to CO poisoning.

Next, the electronic energies of HCOO* on Pd(111), Pd(110), Pd(100), Pd(211), and Pd\textsubscript{19} surfaces were converted into the free energies (ΔG) of the bound intermediates at 298 K, 1 atm, pH = 0 at 0V vs. Reverse hydrogen electrode (RHE) (Table S4). Figure 1 shows the free energy diagram of CO₂ calculated using the computational hydrogen electrode model.\textsuperscript{21} The ΔG\textsubscript{max} for CO and HCOOH production via COOH* and HCOO* was also calculated for pH = 0 and pH = 7.2 (Table S4).
**Figure 1.** Free energy diagrams for the electrochemical reduction of CO$_2$ to formic acid on Pd(111) (red), Pd(100) (blue), Pd(110) (purple), Pd(211) (green), and Pd$_{19}$ cluster (yellow). The reaction energy barrier is significantly decreased as the index increases.  
(Right) Free energies of CHOO* and CO* intermediates on Pd(111), Pd(100), Pd(110), Pd(211), and Pd$_{19}$. As the surface index increases the CO* intermediate is destabilized while the COOH* intermediate is stabilized. This suggests that sharper features are less susceptible to CO poisoning while simultaneously promoting formic acid production. The reaction energy barriers for CO and HCOOH production via the COOH* and HCOO* intermediates are summarized in table S5.

When the Pd surface contained higher-index facets with more steps and under-coordinated atoms, the energy barrier associated with the catalytic reaction ($\Delta G$) decreased. Thus based on Figure 1, the structures with more steps, edges and grain boundaries are expected to exhibit a greater catalytic activity. The Pd$_{19}$ cluster was included in the study as an approximation for adatoms, surface defects, or under-coordinated sites that may be present.
Additionally, the \{211\} plane has found to have the lowest energy barrier and is thus thermodynamically the most favorable surface termination for the reaction to proceed. As a result, this plane usually exhibits the highest catalytic activity, e.g., as has been shown for \( \text{CO}_2 \) electroreduction on gold.\(^{14}\)

![Figure 2.](image)

**Figure 2.** Free energies of formation for HCOO* and CO* intermediates on Pd(111), Pd(100), Pd(110), Pd(211), and Pd\(_{19}\). The formation energy of the CO* intermediate is reduced while the formation energy of the HCOO* intermediate increases on higher index surfaces. This suggests that sharper features promote the formation of the HCOO* intermediate which in turn promotes the production of HCOOH. The trend also shows that sharper features leads to a lower propensity for CO* production.

In order to explore the effect of surface morphology of Pd on CO poisoning, we compared the free energies of formation, \( \Delta G_{\text{formation}} \), of HCOO* and CO* intermediate to the surface. That is, the free energy of reactions (3) \( \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}^+ (\text{aq}) + e^- \rightarrow \text{HCOO}^* \) and (5) \( \text{COOH}^*/\text{HCOO}^* + \text{H}^+ (\text{aq}) + e^- \rightarrow \text{CO}^* + \text{H}_2\text{O} \) as listed above. Figure 2 shows the variation in the value of \( \Delta G_{\text{formation}} \) of CO*
and HCOO* to different surface facets. We found that for CO*, the value of $\Delta G_{\text{formation}}$ increases from -0.83 (Pd(111)) to -0.65 eV (Pd(211)), whereas for HCOO*, the value of $\Delta G_{\text{formation}}$ decreases from 0.28 (Pd(111)) to -0.09 eV(Pd(211)) These results suggest that the formation of CO* on Pd surfaces is less favoured with increasing index, thus decreasing CO binding, while the formation of HCOO* becomes more favoured.

Next, charge density and d-orbital analysis of Pd were performed to probe how the change in surface facet affects the binding of intermediates to the Pd surface. To this end, we have calculated Bader partial atomic charges$^{22}$ (Table S6) and projected density of states (PDOS) for the binding site Pd d-orbitals as shown in Figure 3. The Bader charges show that as the surface index increases, the charge density on the Pd atom bound to CO decreases while the Pd atom bound to HCOO increases. This change in charge density implies that the bond between Pd-HCOO* is strengthened whereas the Pd-CO* bond is weakened. Furthermore, the PDOS for the Pd d-orbital shows an increase in the peak around -0.3 eV on Pd(211) whereas there is no change in the highest energy peak for Pd(111). This suggests that on the Pd(211) surface, when HCOO* is bound, there are a greater number of states closer to the fermi level which are available for binding. Additional PDOS plots for Pd(110), Pd(100), and Pd$_{19}$ are shown in Figure S1. The far-reaching implication of these results is that Pd NPs with sharper features may be less susceptible to CO poisoning, and also simultaneously favor HCOOH production.
Figure 3: (Left) Bader partial atomic charges for the Pd atom bound to the intermediates HCOO* and CO* as a function of surface facet. (Right) the projected density of states (PDOS) Pd d-orbitals. The Pd(111) bound to CO* (solid red) and HCOO* (dashed red) is shown on the top and the Pd(211) bound to CO* (solid green) and HCOO* (dashed green) are shown on the bottom.

Following the predictions of DFT calculations we developed high index-faceted Pd catalysts for formate synthesis. We used large-scale synthesis of Pd NPs with specific shapes enclosed by various types of facets stabilized with cetyltrimethylammonium bromide. More specifically, we synthesized \{100\} plane-enclosed nanocubes (NCs), \{110\} plane-enclosed rhombic dodecahedra (RDs), NPs with mixed low-index facets, and branched NPs enclosed by high-index facets (BNPs).
Figure 4. SEM images of Pd NPs used for electrode fabrication: NCs (a), RDs (b), BNPs (c), NPs with mixed low-index facets (d), and Pd black (e). Scale bar 100 nm.

Figure 4a-d shows scanning electron microscopy (SEM) images of the NPs. The side length of the NCs was 42±4 nm. For the RD and BNP NPs, the dimensions were defined as the diameters of circles that can fit these NPs, as were 71±6 and 108±11 nm, respectively. For these three NP types the shape purity was ≥95%, determined from the SEM image analysis. The NPs with mixed low-index facets were represented by the faceted spheres with a diameter 74±12 nm and the nanorods with dimensions 108±19 nm × 28±4 nm. Commercial Pd black (99.95% purity, purchased from Sigma-Aldrich) with the smeared morphology and the size of small features below 20 nm was used as a control material. Since the {111} facet is the most thermodynamically stable we assume that the control material has a high proportion of this facet exposed. The NPs were deposited from the NP slurry in the methanol-water mixture on the carbon paper using Nafion
(Supporting Information). The NPs densely covered the 0.6 cm × 0.6 cm are of the carbon paper, without carbon fiber exposed to the solution (Supporting Information).

Figure 5a shows the total geometric current densities for the catalysts prepared from different types of Pd NPs. At the beginning of electrolyses, the geometric current densities were increased from 15 to 22 mA/cm² (at -0.2 V overpotential). In the course of the reaction, the geometric current densities reduced for all NPs studied. The decline of the current density was associated with CO poisoning of the nanocatalyst surface and thus the rate of decline characterized NP stability in electroreduction of CO₂. The rate of current density reduction increased in the raw BNPs, RDs, NCs, NPs with mixed low index facets, and commercial Pd black. The trend in reduced NP stability was in agreement with the theoretically predicted relationship between the facets, enclosing the NPs and their binding energies for reaction intermediates. In particular, in DFT calculations we found that higher index facets had a lower binding energy of CO and higher binding energy of formate intermediate, which suggested that higher index facets were less susceptible to CO poisoning. Experimentally, we find the lowest rate of current density decay for BNPs, which were enclosed by high index facets, in agreement with our computational predictions.
Figure 5. Left: CO$_2$ electroreduction activity of different Pd NPs in 0.5M KHCO$_3$ at -0.2V: (a) geometric current densities, (b) CO stripping voltammograms on different Pd NPs. Red – BNP, green – RDs, blue – NCs, magenta – NPs with mixed low index facets, black – Pd black. (c) ECSA normalized current densities.

Next, we quantified the FE of formate formation by determining formate concentration in the solution after 1 h reaction. Formate was esterified to ethylformate$^{29}$ which allowed the measurement of its concentration using gas chromatography (GC). The values of FE in electrocatalytic formate synthesis were 97%, 95%, and 90% for BNPs and RDs, 95% for NCs, and
90% for NPs with mixed low index facets and Pd black; the remainder of FE (<10%) was responsible for hydrogen evolution reaction, while no CO presence was detected by GC.

Electrochemically active surface area (ECSA) of the electrodes was determined using a CO stripping method described elsewhere.\textsuperscript{30} Figure 5b shows the CO stripping voltammograms recorded in 0.5M H\textsubscript{2}SO\textsubscript{4} solution. The broadening of the anodic CO oxidation peak for the BNP electrode was attributed to a variety of active sites in BNPs, caused by their complex high-index facet surface morphology. More narrow anodic CO oxidation peaks for all other electrodes were consistent with the more defined surface sites for the NPs forming these electrodes. The relative positions of the anodic current peaks for the electrodes comprised of NCs and RDs (enclosed by \{100\} and \{110\} facets, respectively) were in agreement with the relative current peak positions reported for the corresponding single-crystal Pd electrodes.\textsuperscript{31} The ECSAs of the electrodes were calculated from the stripping voltammograms (Figure 5b) using the charge of 420 \(\mu\)C/cm\textsuperscript{2} required for the removal of a monolayer of CO from Pd (Supporting Information).\textsuperscript{32} Figure 5b shows the ECSA-normalized current densities for all types of the electrodes. The initial current density of the BNP electrode was significantly higher than that of electrodes comprised of other types of NPs with low-index facets, in agreement with the theoretically predicted trends (Figure 2).

To explore further the long-term performance of BNP electrodes, we examined their recovery by oxidative treatment\textsuperscript{12} and compared it with the recovery of NC electrode. We performed one-hour electrolysis followed by 10 min-long oxidative treatment of the electrode by exposing it to the air, after which the next electrolysis round was carried out. Although the initial performance of the BNP and NC electrodes was comparable, a significantly higher current decay rate was observed for the NC electrode (Figure 6). The oxidative treatment resulted in almost complete
recovery of both BNP and NC electrodes, with a significantly (three-fold) higher average current density over five cycles for the BNP electrode.

**Figure 6.** Stability of BNPs (red) and NCs (blue) in 0.5M KHCO$_3$ at -0.2V: the electrodes were exposed to air for 10 min between one hour-long CO$_2$ electroreduction runs. Dashed lines are shown for eye guidance for the median geometric current densities across five electroreduction runs.

**CONCLUSION**

In conclusion, we found herein that NPs with high-index facets suppress CO poisoning while simultaneously promoting formic acid synthesis. Computational simulations were utilized to study the intermediate bindings energies of competing mechanisms with respect to changing morphology to promote the evolution of preferred product while suppressing catalytic poisoning. We leveraged new understanding of the role of NP surface morphology to maximize their electrocatalytic performance. This has resulted in a catalyst with record performance of 22 mA/cm$^2$ geometric current density at a low overpotential of -0.2 V and near unity Faradaic efficiency. Fundamentally, our findings provide important insights into the rational design of catalysts for the selective and stable production of fuels from CO$_2$. In particular, our results underline the importance of high-
index surfaces and morphological design of Pd NPs for their enhanced catalytic performance. These findings contribute to the goal of developing efficient catalysts for CO₂ reduction for the generation of renewable fuels and feedstocks.

AUTHOR INFORMATION

Corresponding Authors

* E-mail: ted.sargent@utoronto.ca, ekumache@chem.utoronto.ca

Author Contributions

† AK and PDL contributed equally to this work.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Computational details, experimental details, additional SEM images. This material is available free of charge via the Internet at http://pubs.acs.org.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

AK, EK, and EHS thank Connaught Global Challenges Fund of the University of Toronto, Ontario Research Fund – Research Excellence Program, NSERC, and the CIFAR Bio-Inspired Solar Energy Program for financial support of this work. PDL thanks the Atsumi Ohno Scholarship and NSERC CGS-D for funding. DFT computations were performed using the IBM BlueGene/Q supercomputer at the SciNet HPC Consortium provided through the Southern Ontario Smart Computing Innovation Platform (SOSCIP).
REFERENCES


TOC graphics: