Fostering a Sense of Appreciation for All Music:
Teacher Experiences of Incorporating Cultural Diversity in Ontario Music Education

By

Mavis Kao

A research paper submitted in conformity with the requirements
For the degree of Master of Teaching
Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

Copyright by Mavis Kao, April 2017
Abstract

The purpose of the study was to explore how Ontario school music teachers are integrating culturally diverse music into their teaching. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with two music educators who shared their experiences of introducing culturally diverse music to their students. Findings were as follows: 1) these teachers’ integration of culturally diverse music in their teaching stemmed from their belief in the importance of students gaining a more complete understanding of different musical styles, 2) they believe that culturally diverse music could be used as an engagement tool, and 3) student participation in different performance contexts reportedly helps develop a greater sense of musicianship. Overall, the success of multicultural music teaching may rely on teacher belief and personal connection with the culture in question. Music teachers who are open-minded about diverse music and willing to try new ideas may be more likely to incorporate multicultural music in their classes.

Key Words: cultural diversity, music education, music appreciation, student engagement
Acknowledgments

I would like to take this opportunity to thank my professor, Dr. Lee Airton for providing me professional guidance in this research experience. I would also like to thank my teaching assistant, Heba Elsherief, for her hard work and feedback on my research.

I would like to acknowledge the two music educators who participated in my research study and shared their valuable music teaching experiences with the purpose of developing a better music learning environment and a sense of appreciation for culturally diverse music among students. I would also like to thank Amely Zhou, an erhu (Chinese violin) workshop instructor for sharing her musical experiences with me. I am thankful to my university ethnomusicology professor, Dr. Annette Sanger, for her inspiration of world music, especially gamelan (Indonesian metallophone) music, and on-going support.

At the end, I would like to thank my parents for their moral support; also Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE) and the Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning (CTL) for providing me this learning opportunity.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................. ii

Table of Contents ................................................................................................................... iii-v

Chapter 1: Introduction ........................................................................................................ 1-7
1.0 Research Context .......................................................................................................... 1-4
1.1 Research Problem ......................................................................................................... 4
1.2 Research Purpose .......................................................................................................... 4-5
1.3 Research Questions ....................................................................................................... 5
1.4 Reflexive Positioning Statement .................................................................................... 5-7
1.5 Overview ....................................................................................................................... 7

Chapter 2: Literature Review .............................................................................................. 8-25
2.0 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 8
2.1 Student Learning Outcomes in Exposure to Multicultural Music ................................. 8
    2.1.1 Development of respect through appreciation of multicultural music ................. 9-11
    2.1.2 Construction of self-identity and others ................................................................. 11-13
2.2 Teacher Attitude and Teaching Strategies of Incorporating Multicultural Music ............. 13
    2.2.1 Teacher attitude ...................................................................................................... 14-16
    2.2.2 Teaching strategies ................................................................................................. 16-19
2.3 Challenges and Resources in Multicultural Music Teaching ............................................. 20
    2.3.1 Teacher biases in music repertoire selection ......................................................... 20-21
    2.3.2 Teacher expertise ................................................................................................... 21-22
    2.3.3 Resources .............................................................................................................. 23
2.4 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 24-25
Chapter 3: Research Methodology ................................................................. 26-37
3.0 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 26
3.1 Research Approach and Procedures ............................................................. 26-27
3.2 Instruments of Data Collection ..................................................................... 28-29
3.3 Participants ........................................................................................................ 29
   3.3.1 Sampling criteria ....................................................................................... 29-30
   3.3.2 Sampling procedures ................................................................................ 30-31
   3.3.3 Participant bios ......................................................................................... 32
3.4 Data Analysis ...................................................................................................... 32-33
3.5 Ethical Review Procedures ............................................................................. 33
3.6 Methodological Limitations and Strengths .................................................... 34
   3.6.1 Limitations ............................................................................................... 34-35
   3.6.2 Strengths .................................................................................................. 36
3.7 Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 37

Chapter 4: Research Findings ............................................................................... 38-56
4.0 Introduction to the Chapter ........................................................................... 38
4.1 Teachers’ Holistic Approach to Music Promotes Student Exposure to Diverse Music .... 39
   4.1.1 Generate a more thorough music understanding ................................... 40-42
   4.1.2 Exposing students to as many musical styles and sounds as possible ....... 43-46
4.2 Diverse Music serves as an Engagement Strategy for Students in Music and Culture Learning ................................................................. 46
   4.2.1 Student engagement in diverse music learning ..................................... 46-47
   4.2.2 Learning music from the cultures of students: Cultural connection to the music .... 47-50
4.3 Participation in Different Performance Contexts Develops a Greater Sense of Musicianship ........................................................................................................ 50
   4.3.1 Different modes of music learning .......................................................... 51-52
   4.3.2 Sense of accomplishment in performances ......................................... 53-54
4.4 Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 55-56
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.0 Research Context

Canada is a multicultural country that promotes values of respect for diversity and cultural inclusiveness. Ontario has the most diverse population in Canada as approximately 2.7 million Ontarians self-identified themselves as members of the visible minority population on the 2006 Census (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009). However, discrimination including racism, religious intolerance, and cultural prejudice still takes place in school communities (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009). On-going efforts to teach students about the importance of diversity, respect, and inclusiveness are necessary.

In 2008, the Ontario Ministry of Education or OME (2009) introduced the Equity and Inclusive Education Strategy for Ontario schools so as to promote inclusive education. Inclusive education is defined as “education that is based on the principles of acceptance and inclusion of all students. Students see themselves reflected in their curriculum, their physical surroundings, and the broader environment, in which diversity is honoured and all individuals are respected” (p. 4).

In the school climate survey for grade 7-12 students in the Toronto District School Board (TDSB), the highest proportion of South Asian students (>70%) reported that they felt positive about their overall school experience. On the contrary, Black (56-63%) and Latin (59-66%) students population had the least proportion reporting they felt positive about their overall school (Yau et al., 2014). For class participation, Middle Eastern (65%), White (62%), and South Asian (61%) students felt the most comfortable, followed by East Asian (47%), Southeast Asian (48%), and Aboriginal (49%) students (Yau et al., 2014).
The arts are an ideal medium in which to learn about expression, cultural values, social issues, and self-reflection in relation to others. In particular, music transcends the barrier of language and can be served as an effective tool to engage students in learning different cultures and social issues. Through the exploration of art, students are exposed to diverse cultures and values, which can help reduce misunderstanding and tension among different cultural groups.

In the 2010 *The Ontario curriculum grades 9 and 10: The arts* for secondary school (OME, 2010), music learning from different cultures in its historical and cultural context is incorporated as one of the expectations for students. The curriculum aims to connect students from different cultural identities with the curriculum and help them develop a global perspective on music. In the expectations of the strand of Reflecting, Responding, and Analyzing, the use of critical analysis and reflection of different music “enables students to develop a deeper understanding of themselves and the communities in which they live” and analysis involves listening to performances from different cultures allow students “to understand the language of music, its historical and cultural context, and how effectively its composers and performers communicate to their audience” (OME, 2010, p. 99).

Despite the addition of global perspective on music to the Ontario secondary music curriculum, the Eurocentric framework still dominates in the music classrooms at present. Ensembles from the traditional Western convention, such as choir and band, are the only types of music students come across at some schools. In a study (Walden, 2014) of Canadian music education, the opinions of Canadian music educators in response to the issue of Eurocentric dominated pedagogy in music classroom were mixed, some felt more music from non-Western cultures should be added in the lessons while other felt satisfactory about the expectations of
cultural diversity in the music curriculum. The emphasis on Western European traditional art music, teacher-centered approach (Shepherd & Vulliamy, 1983; Stubley, 2000), and Western musical notation literacy (Walden, 2014) in music classrooms may be the reasons for lower student engagement. The music ensembles, including instrumental band, choir, and jazz band, require students to have high Western musical notation literacy (Walden, 2014). In some non-Western cultures, music communication is based on aural transmission instead of written notation. Emphasis on Western musical notation may result in exclusion of some musically capable students with different music learning styles from music practice at school (Walden, 2014). Students may lose interest in taking music courses when they do not see their cultural identities being represented in music classroom (Stubley, 2000).

When entering secondary school (grade nine) from elementary school in Canada, music changes from a compulsory to elective subject. High school students require only one credit in the art stream to graduate. The choice of continuing music education at secondary school can be affected by personal beliefs and culture values (McPherson & O’Neill, 2010). Moreover, many students do not find their cultural representations in the Eurocentric music curricula and repertoire and in some cases many not feel connected with the music they access outside of school (Green, 2002). This may be responsible for the overall decreased engagement in music from grade five to grade eleven in Canada (Price, 2013).

Based on the Equity and Inclusive Education Strategy (OME, 2009) for Ontario schools, modification of the traditional Eurocentric teaching framework in music education should be done by developing pedagogy that incorporates student’s living experiences and cultural background in order to make music learning more accessible and culturally inclusive. Cultural diversity should be expanded to teaching strategies in music education by considering the
different learning styles of music and different cultural attitudes in students. Culturally diverse content that incorporates students’ lived experiences and considers different cultural background is important. “When students see themselves reflected in their studies, they are more likely to stay engaged and find school relevant” (OME, 2009, p. 15).

1.1 Research Problem

Despite the current secondary music curriculum including music and the artistic perspectives of other cultures, engaging students with culturally diverse music can be challenging for music educators due to issues of appropriation, misrepresentation, and inauthentic engagement (Palmer, 1992). Integrating diverse musical forms in music education aims to help students feel more connected to school music learning environments. However, there is little research on K-12 music teachers’ integration of culturally diverse music, including in the diverse Ontario context. It is important to hear directly from music teachers who are adopting culturally diverse pedagogy about its impacts on student engagement in music learning and best practices so that effective ways of incorporating cultural diversity in music classroom can be learned and shared across Ontario and beyond.

1.2 Research Purpose

The purpose of the study was to explore how Ontario music teachers are integrating culturally diverse music. For the purpose of this study, I will explore culturally diverse music integration in Ontario school-based music education by interviewing a sample of these teachers about their perspectives on the current Ontario music curriculum and its potential to support culturally diverse music teaching; their music repertoire selection and lesson planning practices; their reported teaching strategies and perceived outcomes; and barriers and supports for integrating culturally diverse music.
My study aims to provide a starting point for music teachers who want to integrate culturally diverse music in their classrooms to develop their own teaching strategies to introduce multicultural music to their students. I hope music teachers can foster a sense of appreciation and respect for all music and build a stronger relationship with their students who come from different cultural backgrounds.

1.3 Research Questions

The central question guiding this study was: how are Ontario school music teachers currently integrating culturally diverse music?

Sub-questions to further study the research were:

- How do teacher beliefs, defined by what teachers want their students to learn from their classes, affect their integration of cultural diverse music in their music classrooms?
- What teaching strategies do teachers use when designing lesson plans for music classes featuring culturally diverse music?
- What specific culturally diverse teaching strategies do teacher think are effective for making music class more engaging for students?

1.4 Reflexive Positioning Statement

As an individual who is passionate about music and aware of its long-term benefits in enriching life experience, I am concerned about making music more engaging and accessible for students from different cultural backgrounds. In addition, reflecting upon my Canadian educational experience as a Chinese immigrant, I found Ontario secondary music to be Eurocentric because my cultural identity and a global perspective on music were not represented. It was not until university that I was exposed to ethnomusicology and became interested in the
different approaches to music. From this insight, I hope that I can expose students to different perspectives on music from various cultures at an earlier age.

Being raised in Hong Kong (China), which was a British colony from 1897-1997, I can relate myself to the issue of Eurocentrism and decolonization fairly easily. In Hong Kong, the general public view of European culture as a sign of cultivation had a prominent impact on my life. Emphasis on the European values in the society was evident in the generally held perceptions that attending Catholic schools was a better choice than secular/ Buddhist schools for education, learning English as a second language was more useful than Mandarin (Chinese language), and taking Western music lessons was more important than Chinese music lessons. This Eurocentric attitude may be responsible for why I used to have the misconception that “to be knowledgeable is to be westernized”.

When I was in Hong Kong, I received formal music training in piano. I would say that the selection for piano music repertoire was limited and I was not exposed to a wide variety of music in my piano playing. I never got formal training in Chinese music, but I was taught Chinese folk songs and dances at schools. In addition, I was exposed to old Chinese music due to the musical preferences of my grandparents and parents at home. I was able to remember tunes, recite the lyrics, and make connections between the music and drama plots.

At the age of ten, I went to Canada for further education and I continued to study music and piano. As Canada is a multicultural country, I had the opportunity to learn about different cultures and meet people from all over the world. I was fascinated by the cultural diversity and interacting with different people first hand because I never had this chance in Hong Kong. The cultures and people that I read about in books and saw in media in Hong Kong were alive in front of my eyes in Canada. As I studied more in Western music, I became interested in
musicology and I wanted to know the background information of the music piece beyond just the musical elements.

In my undergraduate, I continued to take courses in the Music & Culture Program and I was exposed to music from many different cultures. At first, I found ethnomusicology challenging in comparison to the Western musicology course. I was taught many Indigenous terms for the instruments, music elements, genres, which was very challenging for me to recognize and remember them. However, after a period of time, I became familiar with the terms and I was able to understand their meanings. In addition, I realized that through music learning, I was able to learn more about the values with the cultures and expand my knowledge of different musical traditions.

1.5 Overview

In response to the research questions, I will be conducting a qualitative research study using purposeful sampling to interview three Ontario music teachers about their integration of culturally diverse music. In Chapter 2, I review the literature on student learning outcomes in culturally diverse music integration, teaching strategies for incorporating cultural diversity in music, and challenges faced by music teachers in doing this integration. In Chapter 3, I discuss the research design. In Chapter 4, I report my research findings and discuss their significance in relation to the reviewed literature. In Chapter 5, I discuss the application of the research findings to my teaching practice and the educational community more broadly. In addition, I suggest areas of improvement and future directions for my research topic.
Chapter 2: The Literature Review

2.0 Introduction

In this chapter, I review relevant literature on the integration of culturally diverse music and student learning outcomes in multicultural music, as well as teacher attitudes and teaching strategies of incorporating multicultural music, and challenges and resources in multicultural music teaching. More specifically, I review research on the significance of culturally diverse music integration, and components of this integration in terms of conception of self and others, social relations, and conceptions of knowledge. Next, I review research on teacher attitude and teaching strategies in incorporating multicultural music in a music classroom. After, I review research on challenges and resources in incorporating multicultural music, including teacher biases, teacher expertise, and resources.

2.1 Student Learning Outcomes in Exposure to Multicultural Music

Music serves as an effective medium to learn about different cultures. There are many positive student learning outcomes in exposure to multicultural music, such as the development of respect through appreciation and construction of self-identity and others. Culturally diverse music integration can take the form of discussions of different music, visiting artist workshops, music performance, and arts-based learning at schools. From these multicultural learning experiences, students can build a more personal connection to cultures they were unfamiliar with previously, developed a better relationship with others and constructed meaningful knowledge about other cultures.
2.1.1 Development of respect through appreciation of multicultural music

It has been found that learning culturally diverse music can allow students to develop a sense of respect and appreciation for different cultures. The exposure to different music through discussions, performances, workshops, and involvement in the community can result in a personal connection with various cultures that can help students to gain a better understanding of different musical elements and values from these cultures.

Multicultural music learning resulted in students developing respect and appreciation for different cultures (Hoffman, 2012; Nethsinghe, 2010). In a study conducted by Nethsinghe (2010), ten adolescents of Sri Lankan background participated in a semi-structure interview that focused on their music learning experiences in the multi-cultural extra-curricular program in Victoria, Australia. In the extra-curricular program, students learned about multicultural, Western, and Sri Lankan music. From the interviews, Nethsinghe found that the participants developed a sense of respect and appreciation for multicultural music. One participant said that the extra-curricular experience was interesting because it made him become more open-minded. Another participant expressed that the learning of multicultural music may help people change initial opinion about other cultures through appreciation of diversity. The participants also gained a multi-musical understanding of how music from one culture can influence another one.

Hoffman (2012) found similar student learning outcomes as Nethsinghe for an arts-integrated curriculum project in a middle school (grade 6-8) in America. The project included presentations of world cultures and U.S. immigrant cultures, community celebration involving arts-based activities, and visiting artist workshops. It aimed to engage students and school staffs in learning about different cultures through arts, musical performances, sociocultural inquiry, and historical studies. The experiences provided a richer context, complex relationship, and deeper
meanings for how cultures are represented in the curriculum. Through conversations and interactions with visiting artists, the students built a more personal connection with cultures they were unfamiliar with previously, developed a better relationship with others, constructed meaningful knowledge about others as individuals, and redefined the world around them (Hoffman, 2012). The respect for multicultural music would help students living in harmony with members from different cultural backgrounds in the society (Nethsinghe, 2010).

Shin (2011) also reported similar finding on student learning outcomes when students studied the artistic or cultural expression of other ethnic groups. Student had dialogues with members from other ethnic groups and observed their cultural artistic expressions in the community. From the interaction, students learned about the values and issues of the ethnic groups and became concerned about the well-being of others. This helped students develop respect and empathy for other ethnic groups and critical thinking about stereotypes and social injustice.

Pascale (2013) shared the stories of teachers in U.S. when using the teaching resource she developed from the Afghan Children’s Songbook Project and her experience in attending the school music event at the end of the project. With the help of Afghan musicians and poets, she compiled a collection of sixteen traditional Afghan children’s song. The grades 3-5 teachers in Colchester, Connecticut, wanted to teach their students about Afghan music in order to promote understanding of Afghan culture. One teacher expressed that at the start of the launching this project, some students showed resistance about learning Afghan cultures. They asked, “Why are we learning these Afghan songs anyway?” and “Don’t we hate the Afghans? Aren’t they our enemies?” (p. 133). Some students had family members who served in the military in
Afghanistan. This showed the tension between the American and Afghan cultures and how the perspectives of children were affected by the war images in media.

As the lessons progressed, students learned about Afghan songs and dance, poetry, homemade kites. At the school music event, students had discussions about the concerns and misconceptions of Afghan culture. Pascale (2013) argued that the music project had a great impact on the students and the school community. By the end of the project, few students expressed, “I was wrong about Afghans” and “I learned that Afghan kids are just like us in many ways” (p. 133). The exposure to the Afghan music reportedly allowed students to develop a sense of respect for others and alleviated the tension between cultures.

2.1.2 Construction of self-identity and others

Learning culturally diverse music helps to reinforce one’s self-cultural identity and develop a better understanding of the relationship between self and others. The exploration of culturally diverse music could be used as a bridge between people from different cultures to foster a sense of respect for cultural diversity. Music has the power to elicit strong emotions related to cultural identities and build a trusting relationship among members in a community. Deep emotions and cultural connectedness can be formed when people interact with music from their own cultures.

The adolescents in Nethsinghe’s (2010) study expressed that the cultural background of their parents played a factor in determining the types of music they listened to at home. In addition to listening to Sri Lankan music at home, the adolescents also listened to a wide variety of musical styles and genres, including hip-hop, R&B, rap, and pop. Adolescents from the current generation have multiple musical identities and are associated with different musical styles. One participant said, “awareness of differences develops the formation of your own
identity” (p. 389). This suggested that through the understanding of one’s own musical background, it is possible to develop and extend the sense of musical and cultural self-identity. Another participant talked about how through music could be a bridge between people from different cultures. Students participating in this study explained that the practice of exploring multicultural music developed respect for their own traditional music and their recognition of its place in their cultural heritage and identity.

Music is connected to one’s self-cultural identity. Pascale (2013) recalled the scene that took place during the release party for her Afghan song book, *Qu Qu Qu Barg-e-Chinaar: Children’s Songs from Afghanistan*, which was part of the *Afghan Children’s Songbook Project*. When showing a video of Afghan children singing Afghan folk songs, a woman shouted out, “We all know this song. We should all be singing” (p. 130). In response to this comment, people from the crowd began singing. Pascale (2013) was stunned to see the emotions of the people at the event when many shed tears upon hearing songs from their culture, “In that poignant moment, I realized the potential music has to define culture, to strengthen connections, and to reach the human spirit and bring people together” (p. 130).

*Mariachi* is an important music ensemble at school for youth in cities such as Los Angeles and Seattle due to its musical brilliance and its role as a “badge of identity” for Mexican American students (Sheehy, 2006). In East Los Angeles, there is a large community of Mexicans and Mexican Americans. In Seattle, student population in public school consists of mostly students from communities of Mexican Americans who are learning mariachi music. The commitment to musical and cultural diversity has inspired two teachers to learn mariachi as a new and unfamiliar music to them as a way to understand the knowledge and skills of their students.
One of the teachers discovered local musicians with a strong sense of cross-mariachi performance techniques on the various instruments and a full knowledge of repertoire that would work for beginners. The teacher and these musicians worked together to build musicianship and instrumental techniques in her students, and she played along with her students in order to better understand mariachi techniques. The group performed at school events and as their repertoire increased, they branched out to community gatherings and local mariachi festivals. The music teacher worked to develop her students’ musicianship and at the same time, used music to develop a stronger bond with the school and families in the community.

In general, multicultural music learning has been found to promote positive learning outcomes. Most participants who were exposed to diverse cultural music expressed enjoyment in their learning and felt it helped them gain a better understanding of self and others. The development of respect and appreciation of different cultures were evident when participants developed personal connection with multicultural music.

2.2 Teacher Attitudes and Teaching Strategies of Incorporating Multicultural Music

Findings show that many music teachers have a positive attitude towards multicultural music teaching. They believe that multicultural teaching should be practiced mainly to expose students to other musical thinking. Support from the school community and school board are main factors in affecting teachers’ cultural relevant attitude. Experienced teachers are less likely to incorporate culturally relevant teaching in their lessons in comparison to relatively novice teachers. Different teaching strategies are used by teachers to introduce multicultural music, such as listening to music, singing music, discussions, arts based project (art and craft, rap, poetry), watching videos, playing the instruments, etc. I explore each of these areas in turn below.
2.2.1 Teacher attitudes

In Legette’s (2003) study, 394 music teachers at public schools in the southeastern U.S. from elementary (39%), middle (29%), and high school (18%) participated in a survey about their attitude and teaching practices in multicultural music. Ninety-nine percent of the music teachers expressed that music from other cultures should be included in their music classes. Eighty-one percent of the participants felt that all music educators should incorporate multicultural music in their teaching. From the data, a majority of the music teachers value multiculturalism and show respect for music from different cultures.

For the open-ended question, which asked participants about why music from other cultures should be/ not be included in music classes, 40% answered the exposure to other cultures, 28% for understanding of other cultures, and 20% for reducing prejudice. Exposure to different kinds of cultures was the main reason why music teachers felt culturally diverse music was important in a music classroom. Understanding the reasons behind teachers’ approaches are significant because they were usually closely related to the types of teaching strategies used in their classrooms.

For the question of how often participants incorporated multicultural music in their concerts, 21% answered in all of their concerts, 38% for most concerts, 7% for half of the concerts, and 29% for some concerts. In response to how often participants incorporated multicultural music in their class, 29% answered all of their classes, 20% for most classes, 11% for half of the classes, and 19% for some classes. Comparing the responses from teacher attitude towards multicultural music in their teaching and incorporation of multicultural music in their teaching practices, there was a discrepancy between their theories and practices. There were
relatively less incorporation of multicultural music in their teaching practices despite their strong beliefs on the importance of multicultural music teaching.

Doyle (2014) studied the different factors that affect music teachers in the U.S. in adopting culturally relevant teaching in their practices. The Culturally Relevant Teaching Questionnaire was administered to K-12 public school music educators (N = 584) from 20 large cities in the U.S. It was found that school/community support was the strongest predictor for both expectations and implicitly prejudiced attitudes. This finding indicated that school/community support had a meaningful influence on teacher perceptions about their students. Preparation was found to moderately affect both attitudes and expectations. Higher levels of perceived teacher preparation indicated lower levels of implicitly prejudiced attitudes, more positive attitudes towards culturally relevant teaching in music, and higher expectations. While the effects of the demographic variables were all small to moderate, results suggested that when school teachers shared similar demographic backgrounds with their students, teacher attitudes were more positive and their expectations were higher. It is generally not possible to match teachers with students who have similar demographic profiles; however, awareness of these phenomena could help preservice teachers examine and reflect on possible individual biases.

Results indicated small but meaningful negative effects of teacher quality indicators (TQI). Teachers with higher TQIs had lower scores for both culturally relevant attitudes about Teaching and culturally relevant attitudes about music. Educational research literature defines TQIs as combined measures of a teacher’s years of experience, level of education, undergraduate major and teaching assignment in the area of expertise. This could be partly attributable to the fact that CRT is a relatively new area of pedagogy so teachers who had more years of teaching
and who have thus been away from their undergraduate studies longer may not have been exposed to formal education regarding cultural relevance. Additionally, teachers who have been practising longer may have traditional viewpoint of pedagogy and may less likely feel the need to modify instruction for students with different backgrounds and interests. This findings suggested that targeted preparation for urban areas could help mediate some of the effects of TQI on culturally relevant attitudes of urban music teachers.

2.2.2 Teaching strategies

Different teaching strategies are used to integrate culturally diverse music, such as listening to music, playing instruments, discussion, visuals, visiting artist performances, and teaching the sociocultural contexts of the music. Among the teaching strategies, playing the real instruments from non-Western music is the least-documented teaching strategy used by music teachers to promote cultural diversity in music. Having learning opportunities that created a personal connection and meaningful interaction with the cultural music are critical in developing a thorough understanding of the values and significances of culturally diverse music.

In Legette’s (2003) study, when music teachers were asked about whether they selected music that reflects ethnic background of students in class, 35% said they selected music that reflected the ethnic background of their students and 63% did not do so. In response to what resources they used for multicultural teaching, 42% expressed they used textbooks as their primary source, 50% used supplementary materials (music scores, the Internet, recordings, and colleagues) (Legette, 2003). The most commonly used multicultural activities used by music teachers were mostly listening to songs (79%) and singing songs (74%) from other cultures, followed by discussion on multicultural music (65%), watching movie or slides (52%), and playing instruments from other cultures (37%).
In Hoffman’s (2012) study, some of the students reportedly expressed excitement about learning to perform dances, songs, or instrumental music from cultures that they were not familiar with. They showed interest in authenticity issues and had questions about how different cultures were represented in the school curriculum. Similar to results in Legette’s (2003) study, Hoffman (2012) engaged students in having discussions of cultural transmission and emigration patterns between Africa, Latin America, and North America. When facilitating these discussions, Hoffman would show the students a world map with arrows to relate the music they studied with the regions. “These connections enhanced student learning in other content areas and, perhaps, made their understandings more meaningful through exploration and discovery” (p. 65).

In Pascale’s (2013) study, as above, grade 3-5 music teachers in the U.S. reported using picture books and videos of Afghan schoolchildren singing when teaching Afghan music. In Cain’s (2011) study of interviewing with music teachers in Singapore, two of the participants discussed teaching multicultural music in a sociocultural context. In addition to teaching the musical elements of the music, they also emphasized the sociocultural aspects by relating the rhythm, costumes, atmosphere, and ceremonial event to the music, such as the kompong rhythm in Malay wedding music.

Hanley and Noblit (2009) found a significant relationship between arts-based culturally responsive pedagogy, positive racial/ethnic identity, and academic success. The teachers in their study incorporated arts projects, such as hip-hop, rap music, popular theatre, and digital storytelling to introduce students personal and community issues. The students were able to lean in a creative and culturally responsive manner. These arts-based projects were also used in other subjects, such as social studies, history, and geography, and students who were classified as “at-risk” demonstrated improved academic writing, reading skills. Meanwhile, these arts projects
were integrated into subject-area learning (e.g., social studies, history, and geography) and enabled students to improve academic skills in reading, writing, and content knowledge. Similarly, in a study conducted by Au and Jordan (1981), when teachers considered the cultural backgrounds of students by incorporating talk-story, a learning style distinct to Native Hawaiian students, students have higher academic performance in standardized reading test results (Au & Jordan, 1981). These examples showed that when the cultural identities, such as hip-hop, rap music, street performances, and talk-story, were brought into their learning at school, they were able to do well academically.

Based on the survey results from Legette’s (2003) study, teaching students about multicultural music through instrument playing was the teaching practice least conducted at schools in the U.S. There are many benefits in learning about other cultural music through the interaction of music making. The exposure to diverse music promotes multiple ways of learning and knowledge transmission in different music practices. Dunbar-Hall (2006) studied the music learning experiences of four adults, who had Western music background, but minimal prior knowledge of non-Western music, in a Balinese gamelan ensemble in Australia. Unlike Western music, Balinese gamelan music does not have written music notation, which requires players to listen more proactively. The participants found learning Balinese gamelan music very different from their previous training in Western music, which challenges their original norm of knowing. They experienced difficulties identifying rhythm and memorizing the music repertoire. These findings suggested that music practice is cultural rather than universal (Dunbar-Hall, 2006).

The four participants were aware of the challenges they experienced in Balinese music learning. In response to the challenges, they developed learning strategies and invented music notations based on their prior music background to make sense of Balinese music. They all
agreed that Balinese music playing relies heavily on proactive listening, which was not as significant in Western music. They were unfamiliar with the verbal transmission in Balinese music practice and could not memorize the music. As a result, they invented their own music notations for score reading. The participants demonstrated a metacognitive approach in their Balinese music learning process of identifying challenges and developing strategies to overcome them. Through the journey of learning Balinese music, the participants explored and learned more about their cultural identities in relationship to others. They understood the strengths and limitations of different music learning approaches.

In Cain’s (2011) study, music teachers from Singapore were interviewed about their multicultural teaching. One of the participants shared her teaching experience in the gamelan ensemble. She found that playing non-Western music reportedly helped open up the musical worlds of her students. The students reportedly enjoyed the gamelan concert and eventually, joined the ensemble because it is new and different from their own cultures. She felt that her students were open-minded about learning different cultural music.

The challenges teachers have faced suggest the multiple ways of music teaching/learning and music as a cultural practice. Thus, music educators should rethink about the common assumption of music as a universal language. Teaching music in limited approach may not result in effective and inclusive music learning experiences for some students. Therefore, the consideration of culture as a vector of music education is needed, while keeping in mind that not all students will be able to develop strategies to overcome the challenges arise in music learning like the participants in Dunbar-Hall’s (2006) study. Therefore, various teaching approaches need to be adopted by music educators in order to make music learning more accessible and meaningful for students of different cultural backgrounds.
2.3 Challenges and Resources in Multicultural Music Teaching

Music teachers report challenges when incorporating multicultural music in their classrooms, which included teacher biases for music repertoire selection and lack of teacher expertise. Teachers have been found to have mixed attitudes towards teaching approach of whether to teach cultural music that is closely related to their students’ cultural backgrounds or to teach global music. Teachers have found that pre-service multicultural music courses and visiting artist workshops are useful in helping them to incorporate multicultural music in their teaching practices. These opportunities can allow teachers to gain a better understanding of music from other cultures and help familiarize them with the content of multicultural music.

2.3.1 Teacher biases in music repertoire selection

Music teachers in Singapore expressed concerns about teacher bias when selecting music repertoire in their classrooms (Cain, 2015). One participant talked about how he prioritized teaching local culture, East Asian music over African or Latin or Arabic music to his students because East Asian being the major ethnic makeup in Singapore (Cain, 2015). Another reason for prioritizing East Asian culture was that Singapore is more closely related to East Asia in trading and economic sectors. In that sense, the teacher felt that he had a responsibility to familiarize his students to the cultures and traditions they are more closely related.

On the other hand, another participant also expressed her bias towards teaching local cultures due to Singapore’s ethnic makeup (Cain, 2015). But, at the same time, she felt the need to teach global music to her students for the purpose of exposing students to a more complete music representation. School may be the only opportunity for some students to learn about the world and if teachers choose not to teach certain topics, students would never been exposed to the cultural diversity. These examples showed how teachers could determine the level of music
exposure among students and the complicated nature of selecting which cultural music to be included in a music classroom.

Some teachers expressed their understanding of introducing global music to students, however, they felt they did not have enough expertise and resources to teach about beyond wester and East Asian cultures. Cain (2015) stated that the teachers felt there was less need to teach students about global music most of the student population in Singapore is Asian and travelling to other continents outside of Asia would be unlikely for most Singaporeans.

2.3.2 Teacher expertise

Teacher expertise in music from non-Western cultures could play a factor in determining how comfortable they feel about having culturally diverse music in their classrooms. Prior associations with different cultural music, such as attending visiting artist workshops, multicultural music teaching in pre-service teaching program, professional development in culturally responsiveness, and personal interest in culturally diverse music, helped teachers to feel more prepared in incorporating culturally diverse music. The interactions with different music allowed teachers to be more open-minded about different cultural music and aware of other music practices.

In Legette’s (2003) study, the majority of music teachers in the U.S. felt comfortable (96%) and prepared (90%) in incorporating multicultural music in their classes. Most of the participants (86%) felt they had the knowledge about where to find resources for multicultural music (Legette, 2003). When asked about their most commonly used multicultural activities used by music teachers were mostly listening to songs (79%) and singing songs (74%) from other cultures, followed by discussion on multicultural music (65%), watching movie or slides (52%), and playing instruments from other cultures (37%). Despite the teachers felt comfortable
teaching multicultural music, the teaching activities were limited at a superficial level of demonstrating music techniques and understanding musical elements.

The music teachers were also asked about their undergraduate studies in multicultural music. Sixty-four percent of the teachers stated they did not receive any multicultural music training during undergraduate and 35% said they received this kind of training. In addition, 62% of the participants expressed they have attended multicultural workshops in their teaching career while 36% indicated no.

Cain (2011) interviewed seven music teachers from five Singapore public primary schools about their teaching practice. The study showed the success of having multicultural music courses in pre-service teaching in developing culturally responsive attitude among music teachers. Due to the governmental philosophies in advocating for cultural diversity in Singapore, many music teachers received lesson on world music from their music education in pre-service teaching program. All the participants appreciated the inclusion of multicultural music in their teaching programs. They understood the importance of having cultural diversity in music and aimed to incorporate multicultural music in their future teaching practices.

One participant reflected on how she came from a Western music training background and the music education courses allowed her to learn about other music aside from Western music. Another participant also showed appreciation for the education program for including multicultural teaching. She saw the values in learning about non-Western music and commented that the learning experience made her more open-minded. She wanted people not to associate music with only the Western model, but also other cultures.
2.3.3 Resources

Music teachers find attending visiting artist workshops to be an effective way to develop better knowledge of and personal connection with the non-Western music.

In Howard’s et al. (2014) study, teachers found visiting artist workshops at a university music program offered a great opportunities to learn about the music distant from their personal experiences. The workshops included folk music from Bulgaria, Mexico, north India, Puerto Rico, South Korean, Tanzania, Trinidad, Turkey, and Botswana. The workshops provided context for pre-service teachers to have a better understanding of the functions and meaning of different non-Western music, which challenged their musical assumption and exposed to different way of thinking. They also learned about practical skills, such as vocal techniques and instrumental fingerings. They were able to build a sense of familiarity and appreciation through attending the workshops. In addition, teachers were asked to develop “music culture curricular units” that incorporated cultures in their teaching.

Participants from Cain’s (2011) study also found that exposure to multicultural music helped them become aware of the different non-Western music. By having direct experiences of how it felt like to learn music from different cultures, teachers could relate to student experience when they first learned music, thus allowing them to develop teaching strategies that meet student needs.

Teacher biases for music repertoire selection and lack of teacher expertise were some of the reported challenges in incorporating multicultural music teaching. Multicultural training at pre-service teaching program and artist workshops were useful in helping music teachers to understand the contexts and meanings of different cultural music. From the literature, teachers were open minded about learning non-Western music and felt it opened up their perspectives.
2.4 Conclusion

From the literature, positive learning outcomes, including development of respect and understanding for other cultures, a sense of community and open-mindedness, were reported for the incorporation of multicultural music and arts based projects. Some of the reviewed teaching strategies used to incorporate multicultural music (from most commonly used to least commonly used) included listening to music, singing to music, discussions, watching slides, and playing the instruments. Some teachers taught the music in a sociocultural context and engaged students in having discussions about how different cultural music were represented in the curriculum. Others used arts based project, such as poetry, hip-hop, rap, to engage students in learning, which resulted in improved academic performance.

Music teachers reported the challenges of incorporating multicultural music in their classroom, which are teacher biases in music repertoire selection and lack of expertise. In Singapore, the teaching of Asian music was prioritized over other cultures due to the majority of student population being Asian. Some felt that it was more important for students to learn about cultures that are closely related to their cultural background than to learn about cultures beyond the Asian cultures. But, another teacher felt that exposing students to culturally diverse could help them expand their knowledge and perspectives. Music teachers found multicultural training at pre-service teaching program and visiting artist workshops useful in preparing them to teach multicultural music in their teaching practices.

The literature provided many case studies and examples about how teachers incorporated multicultural music in their teaching. Many teaching strategies, including arts-based projects, use of Afghan songbook, discussions, were adopted by these teachers in introducing students to multicultural music. In many of the reviewed studies, student learning end goals aligned with the
teacher’s intention of developing respect and better understanding of other cultures. In addition, students from Australia also found that learning music from their own cultures helped them construct self-identity and learn about others.

The limitations of the literature review was the lack of research in multicultural music teaching in the context of Ontario or in Canada. Most of the researches on multicultural music took place in the U.S., Singapore, and Australia. It will be helpful to understand how students in Ontario perceive the current music education and what they would like to learn in music classes. Moreover, most of the teaching strategies in the researches for multicultural music teaching were singing music and inviting visiting artists for performance. There was only one study that focused on the learning experience of instrument playing, which was the participation in gamelan ensemble (Dunbar-Hall, 2006). Although the gamelan ensemble learning experiences provided great insights about learning music from another culture, the participants in the study were adults in Australia and they may have a different mindset and attitude toward learning different cultures in comparison to children and adolescents who are the focus in my study.

For my study, I would like to study the factors that affect teachers in incorporating multicultural teaching and what student learning outcomes they wanted to achieve through such teaching. I am particularly interested in how music teachers make meanings from the multicultural music they teach about. I want to explore how teachers created an inclusive music learning environment for their students. I hope teachers would explore music more than analyzing musical elements with their students and discuss the sociocultural context of the music when teaching multicultural teaching.
Chapter 3: Research Methodology

3.0 Introduction

In this chapter, I describe the research methodology. I begin by reviewing the qualitative research approach, procedures, and data collection instruments. I then move on to participant sampling, recruitment, and biographies. Next, I explain data analysis procedures and review the ethical considerations pertinent to my study. After, I identify a range of methodological limitations and strengths. Finally, I conclude the chapter with a brief summary of key methodological decisions and my rationale for these decisions given the research purpose and questions.

3.1 Research Approach & Procedures

The research study was conducted using a qualitative research approach involving a literature review and semi-structured, face-to-face interviews with two music educators. The procedures involved in my study included 1) identification of the phenomenon, 2) data collection (see 3.2), 3) identification of the participants (see 3.3), 4) data analysis (see 3.4), and 5) interpretations and conclusions. In this study, I attempted to describe the values and perceptions of participants in relation to their culturally diverse music teaching experiences.

Patton (2008) identifies the major characteristics of qualitative research as: 1) naturalistic inquiry (lack of predetermined constraints on outcomes); 2) inductive analysis (use of open questions instead of hypotheses); 3) holistic perspective (understanding of a phenomenon as complex interdependencies); 4) qualitative data (description, in-depth inquiry); 5) personal contact and insight (direct contact with participant and use of researcher’s personal experience in inquiry); 6) dynamic systems (emphasis on process as well as product); 7) unique case orientation (capture of details in individual cases); 8) context sensitivity (consideration of data in
socio-historical context); 9) empathic neutrality (neutral nonjudgmental approach to understanding a phenomenon); and 10) design flexibility (adapting inquiry that considers responsiveness). Most qualitative research collects data in the form of words (Fraenkel et al., 2012). It does not reduce data into numerical values; instead it tries to make insights from data by considering the context in which participants live and the process of the interview (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007). It assumes that participants construct realities in the form of multiple mental constructions (Fraenkel et al., 2012). As it is impossible for researchers to separate participants’ lived experiences from studied participants, researchers pay attention to 1) how participants make sense of their lives, 2) the gestures, comments, and manners of participants when answering questions, 3) the meanings of certain terms and actions to participants, and 4) participant attitudes in relation to actions (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007).

Qualitative research was a suitable approach for my research purpose of gaining a better understanding of how Ontario music teachers are integrating culturally diverse music in their classrooms because there are many different ways of (repertoire, instruction, activity) and factors in (students population, teacher expertise, resources available) integrating culturally diverse music. Without the assumption of highly generalizable way to integrate culturally diverse music, I considered each teacher as having a unique teaching experience and meanings attributed to this integration: what they did and how they thought. By doing so, I captured a more detailed understanding of culturally diverse music integration practices from the perspectives of participants, highlighted the intertwining complexity of their values and actions (Fraenkel et al., 2012), and provided a more complete picture of multiple practices for integrating culturally diverse music in music classrooms.
3.2 Instruments of Data Collection

There are different types of interviews used in qualitative research, including structured, semi-structured, and unstructured interview. Structured interview follows an interview protocol, which contains a set of standardized questions or scripts (Bernard, 1988). The researcher uses the scripts of questions to ask the same questions in the same order to all the participant in each interview (Savenye & Robinson, 2005). Structured interview is sometimes considered a survey or questionnaire (Goetz, & LeCompte, 1984). In a semi-structured interview, the questions are phrased in an open-ended manner that allowed flexibility and variation in participant responses (Lichtman, 2010). Each interview was audiotaped for data analysis. In addition to verbal responses, observations of gesture, tone, and avoidance of certain topic were also noted for analysis (Shastri, 2008). Unstructured interview usually takes form in a conversation with the participants. Participants should lead the conversation and probing questions can be used to focus the interviews (Bernard, 1988). In comparison to structured interview, discussions in semi-structured interview are carried in a less organized and probing manner. Other formats common to unstructured interviews include oral histories, creative, and postmodern interviewing through the use of visual media and polyphonic interviewing.

The primary instrument of data collection used this research study was the semi-structured interview protocol. The exact wording of questions and their order were prepared beforehand and the same questions were asked in each interview (see Appendix B). The interview questions were divided into four sections, including 1) perception, 2) understanding, 3) practice, and 4) future inquiry.

The semi-structured interview was used in my research because the open-ended questions allow researchers to gather data on their research questions, but also allowed participants to share
their lived experiences freely in a non-restrictive manner (Creswell, 2012). This allowed for emergence and exploration of new ideas that are not anticipated by researcher. By answering the same questions in the same order, it minimized deviation from the original topic and increased comparability of data among participants (Patton, 2008). Pre-determined questions also allowed more effective evaluation of instrumentation and better organization of data collection (Patton, 2008). The weakness of standardized questions included the lack of spontaneity in interview by setting a direction-oriented atmosphere (Patton, 2008).

3.3 Participants

In this section, I will review the 1) sampling criteria, 2) sampling procedures, and 3) participant biographies, for my research study. The sampling criteria described the set of requirements all teacher participants shared, including their teaching experiences in music education, experiences integrating culturally diverse music, and locations they have taught. The sampling procedures used in this research study were purposive and convenience sampling.

3.3.1 Sampling criteria

The following criteria were applied to music educator participants:

1. Music educators were working in Ontario.
2. Music educators had prior experiences of teaching music in public school.
3. Music educators had integrated culturally diverse music.

Music educators had to teach in Ontario because Ontario is the most culturally diverse province in Canada; by understanding teaching approach and practice in Ontario, it served as a significant indicator of Canadian attitude in addressing cultural diversity in education. Teachers should have prior experience in teaching music courses that are grade 9 or lower because it is these music courses that have the most student enrolment in comparison to other upper year
music courses. This is because one art credit is required for high school graduation, which is usually obtained from enrolling in grade 9 music, visual art, or drama course.

As my study was interested in whether teachers who integrate culturally diverse music help engage students in music learning or pursue music study in the long run, the music learning experiences of students in grade 9 or lower were important in determining their future engagement in music, which may be in the form of enrollment of upper year music courses, participation in music ensemble, or other engagements in music activities. As my study aimed to understand the different ways of integrating culturally diverse music in a school music classroom and evaluate their effectiveness, teachers must have done this.

3.3.2 Sampling procedures

Purposive sampling is a non-random sampling method that ensures participants of certain criteria are recruited in the research study (Robinson, 2014). Before a research, researchers have certain assumptions that the opinions and perspectives of a particular group of participants are important in contributing to the phenomenon (Mason, 2002; Trost, 1986). Purposive sampling ensures that these targeted participants to be represented in the final sample (Robinson, 2014). Establishing sampling criteria helps researcher to narrow participants who fit the research question and gain effective insights about the research topic (Fraenkel et al. 2012).

In convenience sampling, researchers choose a nearby source (organization, club, school) that is close to potential participants for recruitment (Robinson, 2014). Convenience sampling is best used when researchers want to study topics/issues at the local level for a specific demographic and geographic community (Robinson, 2014). By recruiting participants that who have some kinds of connections with the local community, more specific data that are targeted to a particular aspect in the area can be obtained. As
convenience sampling is not random sampling, generalization of data cannot be made, meaning collected data may not apply in a broader public context (Robinson, 2014).

Snowball sampling is also known as chain-referral sampling. Recruited research participants are asked to refer other people they know who also meet the criteria to participate in the research study (Cohen et al., 2011). This method is useful when the sampling population is difficult to contact due to stigmatizing and illegal nature of the phenomenon (Heckathorn, 2002) or when participants may be suspicious of researchers (Cohen et al., 2011). Through the referral of recruited participants, a sense of rapport and trust can be developed more easily between the potential participants and researchers (Cohen et al., 2011). However, this sampling method can also result in biases of participant recruitment (Heckathorn, 2002) in that most participants may share similar backgrounds due to the reliance of the initial participants (Cohen et al., 2011).

In my study, purposive and convenience samplings were used to recruit participants. Purposive sampling was conducted by establishing the sampling criteria, meaning all participants must have the requirements in order to be interviewed. Convenience sampling was used when sending e-mails to different professors at Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE), music teachers at University of Toronto Schools (UTS), and high school music teachers at public schools.
3.3.3 Participant bios

**Ben** is the music department head at a public high school in Ontario. He has been working as a teacher in Ontario for twenty years. He finished his undergraduate degree in music and education in Ontario. As the department head, he is responsible for ensuring that the music content taught at school aligns with the curriculum expectations and organizing music ensembles, concerts, field trips. Throughout his career, he taught the high school instrumental and vocal courses at all grade level. He also had experiences supervising high school bands.

**Alice** is a music teacher at a public elementary school in Ontario. She has been working as a teacher in Ontario for thirty years. She finished both her undergraduate degree in music and graduate degree in education in Canada. She currently teaches students from kindergarten to grade 6. She is responsible for teaching music, supervising choir (extracurricular activity), and organizing music concerts, festivals, and field trips.

3.4 Data Analysis

Data analysis in qualitative research frequently involves coding transcripts of interviews. Coding is defined as “the analytic process through which data are fractured, conceptualized, and integrated to form theory” (Strauss & Corbin, 1994). Codes are descriptive or interpretive ideas that emerge from responses. In this research study, open coding will be used (inductive emergence). Codes are then analyzed using categorization, thematic analysis, and theory to gain understanding of collected data (Strauss & Corbin, 1994).

Although there are different ways to incorporate culturally diverse music in Ontario music classrooms, this study was inspired by the phenomenological approach, which assumes there are some underlying commonalities between participant experiences that can be identified and understood. By categorizing the commonalities shared by multiple perspectives on the
phenomenon in different themes, researcher can understand the fundamental characteristics of the phenomenon (Fraenkel et al., 2012).

3.5 Ethical Review Procedures

The potential ethical risks that may occur in my research included emotional discomfort in sensitive topic discussion and possible identification of participants from the use of direct quotes in the interview (Seidman, 2013). The in-depth semi-structured interviews may create possible emotional discomfort for the participant. The sensitivity of the research topic could also elicit uneasy feelings that researchers need to pay attention to (Seidman, 2013). Discussions on cultural diversity could be a sensitive topic for participants who may experience discrimination from their personal lives or may witness people around them facing oppression. Direct quotes from the interviews were used in my research findings to create a sense of authenticity, which may be possible that the participants could be identified (Seidman, 2013). There may be some personal opinions that the participants did not want others or the school board to know.

In this research study, identities of participants were not be disclosed and instead pseudonyms were used. Participants were informed about the research topic and purpose. Participants were given the opportunity to withdraw from interviews in any circumstances. Interviews only proceeded after permission given by participants. The data collected in interviews were kept in a confidential manner that others, aside from researcher and supervisor, had no access to information. Data remained on a private, password protected, external hard-drive and would be erased after five years. Data appearing outside of interview recording was not be recorded and used in data analysis for the research.
3.6 Methodological Limitations and Strengths

A qualitative research approach involving a literature review and semi-structured interviews was used in my study. This approach was suitable for my research purpose to gain a better understanding of the culturally diverse music integration practices from the perspectives Ontario music teachers in a non-restrictive manner. Despite the strengths of the qualitative research approach, there are many limitations in my study on the integration of culturally diversity in music classroom. In this section, I will discuss the limitations, strengths of my research, and provide suggestions to improve future study.

3.6.1 Limitations

A major limitation of qualitative research is researcher bias, in that the personal experience and values of a researcher could affect interpretation and meaning ascribed to data (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007). My social position in relation to cultural diversity could affect the attitude I had towards integrating culturally diverse music in a music classroom. My past experiences at schools and my multiple self-cultural identities with different music may result in greater level of advocating for cultural diversity. My Chinese identities could also result in my limited network with the East Asian school communities and my tendency to promote East Asian cultures. To reduce research bias, data interpretation was shown to participants for verification (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007). Participants could check if my coding and theme analysis match their positions on their teaching approaches towards integrating culturally diverse music.

Another limitation of my study was the small size of my sampling population. Only two participants were interviewed, meaning that their teaching experiences were only applicable to a specific demographic area and could not be generalized to a larger community. The schools where the two participants taught at had a majority of Asian student population and the non-
Western music selected in the music repertoire were mostly from East Asian cultures. Therefore, the findings from my study may not be useful in school communities where student populations were outside of Asian or East Asian.

The schools of the two music teachers showed great support for music learning by providing funding for gamelan and *erhu* ensembles, which may not be the case for other schools in Ontario. Music teachers without funding and access to real non-Western instruments may not find the student learning experiences in the non-Western ensembles relevant to their teaching practices and would need to be more creative in their music teaching approaches.

Due to the scope and time constraint of my study, only music teachers were interviewed. The findings only showed the reported students learning outcomes from the teachers’ perspectives, which could be different from or similar to students’ perceptions of the music learning experiences. Some of the learning contexts and meanings behind teaching strategies could be lost when describing music teaching experiences in words in an one-time interview, more information about classroom atmosphere, student engagement, learning outcomes could be obtained through ethnography, observations, and multiple discussions with the teachers in an ongoing manner.

In order to have a broader context for my study, a higher number of music teachers and music teachers from different school communities in terms of wider cultural backgrounds of student populations and socioeconomic status should be interviewed. In addition, having interviews with school administrators, school board representatives, students, parents, pre-service teachers, and visiting artists could enrich the research context and gain a better understanding of the current state and effectiveness of integrating culturally diverse music in music classrooms and future actions that are needed to improve multicultural music teaching.
3.6.2 Strengths

Qualitative study was useful in research studying the process of how participants experience the phenomenon (Fraenkel et al., 2012). It avoided the generalization of phenomenon by assuming each experience as a unique lived experience (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007). It was suitable for my research purpose of gaining a better understanding of how Ontario music teachers are integrating culturally diverse music in music classroom because there are many different ways of (repertoire, instruction, activity) and factors in (students population, teacher expertise, resources available) integrating culturally diverse music. Without the assumption of highly generalizable way to approach cultural music integration, I considered each teacher as having a unique teaching experience and meanings attributed to cultural music integration.

The open-ended questions in the semi-structured interview allowed participants to share their lived experiences freely in a non-restrictive manner (Creswell, 2012) within a framework. This allowed for emergence and exploration of new ideas that are not anticipated by researcher. By answering the same questions in the same order, it minimized deviation from the original topic and increased comparability of data among participants (Patton, 2008). Pre-determined questions also allowed more effective evaluation of instrumentation and better organization of data collection (Patton, 2008). Using semi-structured interview, I was able to gain a more detailed understanding of culturally diverse music integration practices from the perspectives of participants, highlighted the intertwining complexity of their values and actions (Fraenkel et al., 2012), and provided a more complete picture of integrating culturally diverse music in music classrooms.
3.7 Conclusion

In this chapter, I explained the research methodology. I started by identifying the characteristics and explaining the significances of qualitative research approach and procedures. I then identified the semi-structured interview as the primary instrument of data collection. I listed the benefits and limitations of semi-structured interviews. Next, I moved on to the participants of the study by describing the sampling criteria and sampling procedures (purposive and convenience sampling). I proceeded to describe how I will analyze the data using coding, categorization, theme analysis. Ethical issues such as participant identity protection, consent, right to withdraw, confidentiality, data storage were considered. Finally, I discussed the methodological limitations and strengths of the study. In the next chapter, I report on the findings of the research.
Chapter 4: Research Findings

4.0 Introduction to the Chapter

This chapter presents the findings that emerged in the analysis of data from interviews with two music educators: Ben and Alice (pseudonyms). Throughout this chapter, discussions and examples about how Ontario music educators integrate culturally diverse music are provided.

After presenting the data, a comparison of my research findings in reference to the Chapter Two literature review is made. Findings are organized into three main themes:

1) Teachers’ holistic approach to music promotes student exposure to diverse music,

2) Diverse music serves as an engagement strategy for students in music and culture learning,

3) Participation in different performance context develops a greater sense of musicianship.

These themes also have sub-sections that further highlight how culturally diverse music is being integrated in Ontario music classrooms. For each theme, I will first describe it, present my data, explain themes in the context of my data, and compare my findings to the literature.

As a conclusion, my research findings suggested that 1) the integration of culturally diverse music in a music classroom mainly stemmed from the music educators’ teaching philosophies of wanting students to gain a more complete understanding of different musical styles, 2) culturally diverse music could be used as an engagement tool for students in music learning, and 3) student participation in different performance contexts could help develop a greater sense of musicianship.
4.1 Teachers’ Holistic Approach to Music Promotes Student Exposure to Diverse Music

For the music teachers interviewed, both Ben and Alice adopted the holistic approach by exposing students to diverse music, and were not limited to Western music. I am defining a holistic approach as having a more complete understanding of music in terms of different musical styles, music practices, and/or sociocultural contexts. For both of these music teachers, while the Western music framework serves as the basis for student music learning experience at school, they are, each well aware of the diverse cultural backgrounds of the students and want to show a more complete representation of music that includes non-Western cultures. Ben and Alice’s teaching approach reportedly involves teaching students foundational knowledge about Western music notation first before teaching them about music from other cultures.

These teachers’ holistic approach to music reportedly promotes student exposure to diverse music. Under this theme, there are two sub-themes that explore these teachers’ reported reasons why the holistic approach is adopted, which are: 1) generating a more thorough music understanding and 2) fostering a sense of inspiration and appreciation. In each section, teaching strategies that were used by the music teachers to promote the values behind the holistic approach and inclusive music learning environment will be discussed.
4.1.1 Generating a more thorough music understanding

Foundational knowledge of Western music is introduced at the beginning of the school year and serves as the basis for learning other musical styles. Both music teachers aimed to create an inclusive music learning environment for students by exploring the significances of Western music in the overall history and elements of non-Western music in reference to the Western music framework.

Ben shared his teaching strategy to get students reflect on why the class emphasizes the Western music instead of music from other cultures:

I explain that the reason why we are doing Western music specifically, is because of … the development of music literacy… I do take the time to explain to the students… [the significances of learning Western musical notation], because I don’t want them to think that this is the only history of music. Here, Ben shared his process for starting his first lesson of music for the high school students. He explained his position of choosing to emphasize Western music in his classroom, but at the same tried to make students feel their lived experiences are respected in the classroom as most of the students at his schools are Asian. He first asked students why they think they study Western music instead of other music. He would then state his positions in emphasizing the Western music framework, providing reasons for such choice, and acknowledging the existences of music from other cultures. He expressed to his students that the development of music literacy (reading and playing music) was his primary concern. This can be achieved relatively more effectively through the study of Western musical notation due to its relatively more developed system in music communication and standardization. This type of questioning helped foster critical
thinking among students about the transmittance/practice of music knowledge in different cultures.

Another reason why Ben exposed students to diverse music is to develop better listening skills among students. He believes that music from other cultures is a good resource to highlight and understand the differences among musical styles. Ben said that

Musically, if we are doing exercises where we are doing responses to any kinds of listening activity, we will listen to a piece of music, um I will often include different cultures and I’ll use, you know focus, maybe on students’ cultures that are in our class. This is no specifically designed for any other reasons, the music is very interesting, something different and it reinforces with what we are learning anyway. The goal is not just to… maybe we should do some culturally diverse things, that’s a bonus, and it works really well. But, the more, you know, the focus is really on… developing the listening skill, if we can do that [listening skill] and do that [cultural diversity] as well, I see a double win there. So that’s how we do it that way.

Ben felt that listening to music from a wide variety of genres, getting a snapshot of what the musical styles are from other cultures, is more important than studying few musical styles in depth. He tended to pick folk tunes or cultural music because those music are relatively well-known and have a lasting effects on the students. Folk music serves a great resource to expose students to different music. For example, when teaching Asian music, he would introduce its frequent use of pentatonic scale, which is different from the conventional Western scale. When listening to music, Ben wanted students not to judge the music as bad or good, but approach the music by identifying different musical elements and techniques that the composers used to achieve the effects.
Alice reported that, in her music teaching, she would constantly engage students to describe the musical elements in reference to the Western music terminology, such as tempo, rhythm, texture, etc:

If we do music from all over the world, …I will want to… no matter what, what genre we’re doing, what world music, we’re always in the education, we are always practicing the elements of music and talk about how the beats are in all music. We’ll talk about the rhythm, the texture, the timbre. We’ll talk about tempo. I mean we’ll talk about all those elements and that’s how I evaluate as well. Always, always talking about, no matter what we’re doing.

Alice focused on having students pay attention to different musical elements and identify them in reference to the Western terminology they learned previously. She believes that this constant comparison of musical styles helps students to be familiar with the use of music terminology and reportedly gain a more thorough understanding of musical styles, as well as make a connection between different music.

By engaging students in class discussions about the significances of Western music in the curriculum, why Western music is emphasized in the classroom, and the exploration of non-Western music elements in reference to the pre-established Western music terminology, these teachers are reportedly helping students to develop a more thorough music learning experience and make connections among different musical styles.
4.1.2 Exposing students to as many musical styles and sounds as possible

When the music teachers were asked about what they want their students to achieve in their classes, they all had similar responses: they wanted to expose students to as many different musical styles and timbre (sounds) as possible. They wanted students to expand on their music knowledge and try new listening and playing experiences with different musical styles. Their main goal is to provide a comfortable and accessible learning environment where the students are encouraged to try new things in music.

When Alice was asked about what she wanted her students to achieve in her music class, she said that

I really like to expose the children to the world of music in so many genres. …I like to have them comfortable singing and playing and drumming, all different things. I like them to enjoy it and like to inspire them, and I like them to have experiences with trying every instrument in the classroom.

The teaching strategies Alice used was directly related to her teaching philosophy. She created a comfortable learning environment for students to show their musical expressions and interact with different instruments as ways to expose them to different music. She wanted students not to be afraid of making mistakes and try as many different music as possible. In Alice’s music classroom, there is a wide variety of musical instruments available for the students to play, including ukuleles, drums, the Orff instruments (xylophones, metallophones, etc.), gamelan (Indonesian metallophones), and the piano. Alice believes that the music classroom is the students’ room so they are always welcome to come in, practice, and play during recesses and after school wherever she is available. Alice also added that “I think sense of appreciation and awareness of the music around you is really important. And to give [students] experience so they
learn about [music] and are able to accomplish things… what it’s like to perform in front of people and see performances as well.” By having a reportedly friendly environment for students to play the different instruments, Alice says that her students interact with music in a meaningful way that, in her view, could increase their appreciation for music.

In response to what he wanted his students to achieve from the music lessons, Ben answered,

The most important [learning goals] that I want to get across to students would be a love of music, which is very, very difficult to assess. If students come in a way that they love all different types of music, not just specific one, but they understand music and love it, because they understand it. I think that’s a sign of great accomplishment. That’s the goal that we have.

Here, Ben shares his desire for students to develop an interest in and understanding about all kinds of music. The attitude of accepting and trying new music was evident in the diverse music repertoire in his music and band class. The music repertoire ranges from high art, movie music, jazz, folk tunes, to popular musical styles and many more. When selecting music, Ben considered the quality of the composition, teaching ability, musical values, diversity, and preferences of the students and audiences so most students are interested in the music. As much as Ben wanted to engage his students, he also believed that students need to be challenged in their music learning experience by having exposure to meaningful art music, which may not be easy for students to show interest in at first; however, he felt that the musical values of the high art could have a positive effect on students in the long run.

The open-mindedness of these music educators is reportedly resulting in a more diverse music repertoire and greater exploration of musical styles for students. These educators believe
that exposing to different musical styles helps their students develop a sense of appreciation for music.

In the schools of both Ben and Alice, the majority of the student population is Asian, specifically Chinese. It is important for students to explore their cultural identities in relation to the content within the curriculum. Among the music repertoire in the class of Ben and Alice, it is not difficult to find music from the Chinese culture or other non-Western cultures. All participants value exposing students to different musical styles and create learning opportunities for students to feel more connected in their music learning.

In this study, the two music educators interviewed all showed a great sense of appreciation for diverse music and aimed to expose their students to a diversity of music, reportedly to foster this appreciation in them as well. This finding is similar to Cain’s (2015): that teacher candidates who showed appreciation for diverse music and understood the significance of exposure to diverse music tended to incorporate a greater diversity of music in their classes. Howard et al.’s (2014) finding about having in-depth musical encounters with a culture as one of the most important factor in teachers developing meaningful learning experiences of multicultural music for students also converged with my own findings. In my interviews, the three educators reportedly felt comfortable integrating culturally diverse music, including Chinese and Korean music, in their classrooms because they were interested in different types of music, had personal connections with the students and parents in their school communities, and attended workshops relating to non-Western music. Although Doyle’s (2014) findings suggest that experienced music teachers are less likely to adopt culturally responsive pedagogy, the two music teachers, Ben and Alice, who had worked in music education for more than ten years, were both concerned about creating inclusive, accessible learning environment for
students and providing a more complete narrative regarding music learning by introducing culturally diverse music in their music classrooms.

4.2 Diverse Music serves as an Engagement Strategy for Students in Music and Culture Learning

Based on the perceptions of the participants, students showed great interest in learning about different music and instruments, such as ukulele, gamelan, drums, and *erhu*. For this theme, I will talk about 1) student reported engagement in diverse music learning and 2) music learning from the cultures of students – cultural connection to the music.

4.2.1 Student engagement in diverse music learning

Alice and Ben both expressed how their students showed great interest in learning about different instruments, such as gamelan, *erhu*, and ukulele. Alice recalled that

They never want to leave often [when playing the gamelan]. (laugh) They often… is really hard for them to lose [interest]. You just say at certain point, ‘thanks. Bye bye… bye bye.’ …They love ukulele. They have with them when they are lining up. Sometimes the kids would just pick up ukulele and play for each other. And I will let them have it if there isn’t another class playing it.

Ben also shared a teaching moment when his students learned about Chinese music in the extracurricular *erhu* ensemble:

I think that’s [having visiting artist to teach non-Western music] really one of the best possible ways you can implement this [cultural diverse music]. If you have a large Chinese population, you have an [*erhu*] ensemble… that is, you know, authentically taught by a master. Um… and using real instruments, real traditional instruments, I’m not sure if you
can do much better than that. So that was very helpful. … And it was very well-received. It was... a very well-received ensemble.

The experiences shared by Alice and Mandy suggest that students had great interest in learning about different forms of music other than Western ones. Alice reported past students who visited her remembered having a fun time playing different instruments. The instruments in the examples, such as gamelan and erhu, are not conventional Western instruments.

Students showed great interest in learning about different music and instruments, such as ukulele, gamelan, African drums, and erhu. These reported student experiences suggest that students enjoyed learning about diverse music and playing different music instruments. The interactions with different music instruments could serve as a starting point to engage students in long term music learning.

4.2.2 Learning music from the cultures of students: Cultural connection to the music

These teachers perceive that selecting teaching materials from the cultures of their students can make students feel their cultures are valued at school and connect to the learning when they see themselves being represented.

When Ben was asked about what his thoughts were on culturally diverse music integration, he said,

I was just saying, as I was thinking about cultural pedagogy, it tends to be… again, how are we, include world cultures… You’re going to look at the students that are in your class and you’re going to tailor experiences to them. I think this is a very, you know, even if you weren’t not doing it specifically to be culturally responsive… I think any good teacher would always look at their students and will, you know, try to figure out something about them and… utilize that as an engagement tool to make the experience in
your class more… engaging or effective… I think there is a good reason to do that, but I also think that you can do this automatically if you just follow good teaching and say responsive to the students in your class and how… how we use that to engage them specifically based on their background of cultures.

Ben was aware of the cultural backgrounds of his students and wanted to use cultural music as an engagement tool to make students feel more connected to music learning in the classroom. He would include Korean and Chinese folk songs in his band class to make his instructions relevant to his Korean and Chinese students’ cultures and at the same time expose other students in learning about music from diverse cultures. He remembered that in the concert, some parents were emotionally attached to the music from their cultures and they cried upon hearing it played by the students. He felt that selecting music from the cultural background of students reportedly helped build a stronger relationship with parents and among members in the school community. It also celebrated the respect for cultural diversity at school. In class, he would also make references to Korean and Chinese popular music and say ‘hello’ in the language of his students to make students.

Another account about basing instruction on students’ cultures was provided by Alice when she talked about singing the same song in choir in multiple languages representative of the students’ cultures:

I have a little boy who is fluent in German. And we did this song, we learned as many languages as we can. … But I remember we did it first in French, and then this boy taught everyone in German. And then we have another family, they knew Italian. We have four versions of the song that was sung in kindergarten.
Having students sang the song in their own languages could make students felt that the cultures they identified with at homes were welcomed and accepted by people in the school community. From these learning experiences, students were reportedly able to learn more about others’ cultures through music and languages. It also allowed people and parents in the community to learn about the cultures of others because Alice had students perform different cultural music in school concerts. She reportedly said that a stronger connection can be built through the musical expression of singing different languages. She also reportedly felt that students may not understand the cultures of others entirely from the singing experiences, but they could at least better understand the meanings of words in different languages through the lyrics translation in the song.

The teaching strategies used by the music teachers, such as having students taught the class about singing in different languages and playing culturally diverse music in class, are some efforts to make students feel they also have expertise and their cultures are valued at school. Students were a step closer to understanding their peers’ cultures. It is important for school to establish a positive, encouraging learning environment where all different cultures are respected and valued so students do not feel they need to dissociate with their cultural values at school.

In addition to the teaching of music from the cultures of the students, such as Chinese and Korean music, the music teachers, Ben and Alice, also introduced students to a wide variety of music outside of the cultures they identified with. The two teachers reportedly tried to make students see their cultures being represented in the classroom, but at the same time, want students to be open-minded by exposing them to music from cultures outside of their own. This finding diverges from that of Cain (2015), where music teachers in Singapore introduced students to Western and Asian cultures, but not cultures outside of Asia.
Based on this study, the students of the parents who showed deep emotional connection when listening to music from their cultures performed at the music concerts in Ben’s account also had cultural connection with music from their cultures at home. This is similar to the finding in Nethsinghe’s study about students listening to a high level of diverse music form different cultures, musical styles, and genres (Nethsinghe, 2012). The study also suggested that students’ listening experiences at home were greatly influenced by parents, meaning they listened to similar music as their parents (Nethsinghe, 2012). By incorporating music representative of students’ cultures, all participants developed a stronger relationships with the students and community, which was consistent with Sheehy’s study that teacher’s participation in the music of the student’s cultural identity helped build greater connection with families of the students (Sheehy, 2006).

4.3 Participation in Different Performance Contexts Develops a Greater Sense of Musicianship

Students are encouraged to participate in the music ensembles at the school of Ben and Alice. There is a wide variety of ensembles for students to choose. At Ben’s high school, there are band, choir, and jazz ensembles, from grade 9 to 12. At Alice’s elementary school, there are bands, choir, string ensembles, drumming, and ukulele groups. Participation in different performance contexts helps students develop a greater sense of musicianship (the knowledge of performing music). In addition to the music ensembles mentioned above, students from Ben’s school performed in the erhu (Chinese violin) ensemble while students from Alice’s school played in the gamelan ensemble. In this section, I will focus on these two learning experiences of non-Western music by discussing: 1) different modes of music learning and 2) sense of accomplishment in performances.
4.3.1 Different modes of music learning

The music teachers created different music learning opportunities, such as gamelan and *erhu* ensemble, to expose their students to non-Western way of music transmission and traditions. The learning experiences of non-Western music can be very different from those of Western music. The gamelan relies on verbal transmission and *erhu* playing uses a written music notation, known as *jian pu* (simplified numerical notation) that is different from the Western convention. The exposure of different music performance contexts reportedly allow student to learn the different modes of music learning.

When Alice was asked about the student learning experience in the gamelan ensemble, she expressed that

In gamelan music, it’s more listening, working with… each other in an ensemble, listening towards the gong comes and all the cycle of the song. And um, hearing a different scale and there are dances that go to certain ones. And I have had the dance teacher from the Indonesian concert going to teach us dances, so the children are not only… um hearing the form in the instrumental. They are singing the form at a dance so they are seeing the visual. Beautiful costumes.

After the gamelan ensemble, Alice reports that her students understood the verbal transmission of music in gamelan music. They realized it is based on a cycle of melody (the main melody is played repetitively between alternative sections) and each musician is required to memorize the melody line. For the gamelan ensemble, students learned about things they did not give much thoughts to before, such as the proactive listening to others’ playing in order to ensure balance.

Another participant, Ben, described his students’ experiences of learning the erhu,
They [students] learned the original Chinese notation [jian pu]. She [the erhu instructor] taught them how to read the… the Chinese notation. …Most of them [students] had no prior experiences playing the *erhu*.

In the *erhu* ensemble, students learned another convention of written musical notation, called *jian pu*, a simplified numerical music notation that was quite different from the Western notation. The students reportedly had much difficulties getting used to the *jian pu* notation, which slowed down their learning progress in playing *erhu*. By exposing students to a different musical notation, students would be more aware of the different mode of learning in music.

The learning experience of interacting with culturally diverse music allowed students to expand their knowledge about different music practices and knowledge transmission. It also opened up the students’ perspectives that there are different modes of learning and communicating music. In the learning contexts of the students, the commonly held belief that music is a universal language was challenged. Students reportedly had difficulties playing the gamelan and *erhu* due to their deviated music practices from the Western convention. Through such interactions, students could understand the idea of music as a cultural practice by relating to their personal learning experiences.
4.3.2 Sense of accomplishment in performances

When students were given the opportunities to perform in front of the public, they were motivated to practice hard and give their best. The process and the final product of performance help build a sense of accomplishment for students. The performance contexts gave students a medium to showcase and recognize their abilities.

Alice talked about her students’ performance experiences in the gamelan ensemble:

When we performed, it was really wonderful. We were in total costumes from the Indonesian Concert. We really worked with dancers. We go down to Indonesian Concert and played the beautiful, beautiful gong and string.

Ben shared the experience of his students performing *erhu* performance at the school music concert,

I think that’s [the *erhu* ensemble] very authentic. I can’t believe I forgot that, but that was very authentic, very responsive to our culture at our school. …So they [students] played the, there was a given instructor, proficient, good teacher came in. She brought in instruments, we had an ensemble, they played *erhu* and they played the *dizi* [Chinese flute], which is like a flute. *Di-zi* (articulating), right. They brought in some other instruments to play along with them and we had them perform with us at the last concert.

So it was a good, you know, a good experience.

The performance opportunities reportedly allow students to apply what they learned in music class in a real life context. Many of the students had no prior knowledge of learning non-Western; Alice and Ben believe that these experiences developed student interest, adaptive learning, and motivation, which helped students reach their performing potentials.
In sum, the music educators reported that students who participated in the gamelan and *erhu* ensembles were able to experience the other cultures and learn about different music practices, such as verbal transmission and simplified musical notation, respectively. Both Alice and Ben mentioned different modes of music learning in the cross-cultural ensemble, reinforcing the idea that music learning is socially and culturally rooted rather than universal. Proactive listening was emphasized in gamelan playing while *jian pu* music notation was used in *erhu* ensemble.

The students’ music learning experiences showed that music is a cultural practice. They needed to modify their original way of knowing in order to understand and master the music content from the non-Western cultures. This adaptive learning styles were also found in the study on the learning experiences of adult students, with prior musical experience with Western music, playing the gamelan ensemble, which they encountered multiple challenges in understanding the rhythm and cycle (Dunbar-Hall, 2006). Through the experience of learning different music, students reportedly learned about the cultures of others and at the same time, developed a better understanding of themselves in relation to others in terms of different modes of learning in music. In a similar fashion, Hoffman (2012) reported participants, including school teachers, staffs, and students, who took part in a music project that promoted cultural diversity found that personal connection to the cultures of others helped gain competence about self and others.
4.4 Conclusion

The interviews with two music educators in Ontario have provided insights about the current state and benefits of cultural diverse music integration in Ontario classrooms. In conclusion, these teachers’ approaches to integrating diverse music involves having students to identify the musical elements in different music genres, understand the sociocultural contexts of the eras, and demonstrate playing techniques in the non-Western instruments. This is mainly due to the teachers’ teaching philosophy of wanting students to gain a more complete understanding of different musical styles. A sense of appreciation for diverse music was valued by all the participants.

All of the participants in the study believe diverse music could be used as an engagement tool for students in music learning. Students reportedly showed great interest in trying different instruments, including ukulele, gamelan, and erhu. These teachers perceive that selecting music from the cultures of the students can result in greater connection to the content in the classroom and make students feel their identities were valued.

These teachers also perceive that participation in different performance contexts develops a greater sense of musicianship. The process of preparing for the performance and the final product of performing in front of the public can reportedly provide students with opportunities to showcase and recognize their abilities. Lastly, these teachers believe that the learning experience in non-Western ensembles allow their students to understand the different modes of music transmission and practices.

Relating back to my central research question of how Ontario music teacher integrate culturally diverse music, my study suggested that the exposure to different cultural music and participation in playing non-Western musical instruments (gamelan, erhu) resulted in the
development of a sense of respect for other cultures and a better understanding of different ways of knowing in music. When learning about different non-Western music, the participants would always have discussions about the musical elements to achieve different effects in the compositions. The participants felt that having personal connections with the music, such as selecting music from the cultural backgrounds of students, playing musical instruments, and performing in front of an audience, were reportedly effective teaching strategies to help students to feel engaged in music learning.

Next in Chapter 5, I will discuss the implication for my research findings, provide recommendation, and give recommendation for future research.
Chapter 5: Conclusion

5.0 Chapter Introduction

In this final chapter, I will discuss the research findings and their significances. I will then offer implications and recommendation for administrators and music teachers on further supporting cultural diversity music teaching to enrich student music learning experience.

5.1 Overview of Key Findings and their Significances

In the first chapter, I introduced the need to introduce students to music from different cultures. The purpose of the study is guided by the central question: how are Ontario school music teachers currently integrating culturally diverse music? The sub-questions include: How do teacher beliefs, defined by what teachers want their students to learn from their classes, affect their integration of cultural diverse music in their music classrooms? What teaching strategies do teachers use when designing lesson plans for music classes featuring culturally diverse music? What specific culturally diverse teaching strategies do teacher think are effective for making music class more engaging for students?

In Chapter Two, I conducted a literature review on the current knowledge and teaching practices of integrating culturally diverse music. In Chapter Three, I provided the methodology of the study, which include qualitative interviews with three music educators in Ontario and inductive analysis of data. In Chapter Four, I present the themes from my research findings and relate them to the finding in the literature review.

From my study, three main themes regarding multicultural music teaching emerged: 1) Teachers’ holistic approach to music promotes student exposure to diverse music, 2) Diverse music serves as an engagement strategy for students in music and culture learning, and 3) Participation in different performance contexts develops a greater sense of musicianship.
In this study, holistic approach is defined as having a more complete understanding of music in terms of different musical styles, music practices, and/or social contexts. All three music educators engaged their students in diverse music because they want their students to develop a sense of appreciation and respect for all kinds of music. These teachers perceived that music from different cultures served as an effective entry point to engage students in music learning. They felt that folk music is a good choice to introduce cultures. Students and parents reportedly often feel emotionally connected to the cultural music they are associated with. Music educators who organized the gamelan and *erhu* ensembles reported their students enjoy the learning experiences. Despite the different music practices, the students enjoyed playing in the ensembles and tried very hard to prepare for the performance.

The research findings suggest that the exposure to diverse music helps students develop a sense of appreciation and respect for different music. Students reportedly enjoyed music learning in the gamelan and *erhu* ensemble. The practical music experiences reportedly allowed students to feel more engaged and make personal connection in music learning. Music educators can adopt different teaching strategies, such as teaching music in a sociocultural context, inviting visiting artists to teach, encouraging students to play different instrument, and having students to participate in music ensemble, to enrich the student music experience. It is evident from this study that music serves as a great medium for students to learn about different cultural values and practices.
5.2 Implications

The music educators from my study provided insights about the current teaching practice of multicultural music teaching. The research findings provided implications in the contexts of the broad educational community and my professional identity and practice. Teacher belief and person interest in diverse music determined the extent of cultural diversity in a music classroom. From the interaction with music educators, I reflected on the type of music teacher I want to be and the teaching strategies I want to adopt in my future classroom.

5.2.1 Broad: The educational community

My study suggested that many factors, including personal interest in diverse music, multiculturalism in Toronto, interaction with student population from non-Western cultures, and school equity policy all affected teacher attitude in making music learning more inclusive and accessible for students. The success of multicultural music teaching may rely on teacher belief and personal connection with the different cultures. Music teachers who are open-minded about diverse music and willing to try new ideas may be more likely to incorporate multicultural music in their classes.

Teacher beliefs, defined as what teachers want students to learn from their music classroom, were one of the crucial factors in determining cultural diversity in a music classroom. Fostering a sense of appreciation and respect for all music for students served as the driving force for music educators to teach multicultural music. Teachers’ personal interest about different musical styles and cultures may result in opportunities for students to try different instruments, learn music in a sociocultural context, and perform music in front of an audience.

Music teachers expressed concerns about their expertise when they first taught multicultural music. In order to provide authentic music experience for students, they often
needed to invest time and efforts to find resources for multicultural music teaching. These resources include: attending music workshops, interacting with visiting artists, getting the instruments, using technology, and reaching out for people in the school community. Having the real instruments and visiting artists may be the most effective teaching strategies to develop personal connection with the culture and to create authentic music learning experience for students.

Despite the support available in the school board, music teachers often need to rely on personal connection with different artists and music community to gain resources for multicultural music teaching. It may be more challenging for music teachers to teach students about multicultural music if they do not have the real life experiences with music from different cultures.

5.2.2 Narrow: My professional identity and practice

Reflecting on my professional identity, I was trained in Western music and never received formal music training in Chinese music. However, as a descendent from Chinese immigrants, I am still connected to the Asian identity and shared multiple musical identities. As a music teacher, I want to create an inclusive and accessible school learning where all students feel comfortable being who they are. In my teaching practice, I will try to develop a personal connection with all students in my class and want students to feel proud of their cultural identities. When designing my lesson, I would choose music that my students identify with and enjoy. I believe that having students see their cultures being represented in the classroom and their musical preferences respected are important for them to feel more connected to school learning. I am concerned about students constructing their self-identities and showing respect for other cultures at school. I want my future students to share the same reported student learn
experiences from my study; students who participated in the gamelan and erhu ensemble reportedly developed a greater sense of appreciation, excitement, and way of knowing.

I also share similar teaching philosophy as the three music educators interviewed in my study, which is to promote a sense of appreciation and respect for all kinds of music for the students. They provided me insights about the different teaching strategies in introducing students to diverse music. I would like my students to have the opportunities to play the indigenous instruments and interact with artists from different cultures. I believe teachers have the responsibility to provide students a more complete narrative and global perspective about music, not limited to Western music.

5.3 Recommendations

For these teachers, multicultural music teaching often relied on their personal connection with the music and network with the visiting artists. For some music teachers, especially those who work at a community with less cultural diverse student population, developing a personal connection with music from different cultures can be more difficult. Therefore, school board should develop more initiative in supporting music teachers in introducing music diversity in a music classroom. As my study suggested, music teachers felt that visiting artists provided the most authentic music learning experience for students. More funding needs to be allocated to inviting visiting artists to school to share about their music performance experiences.

The school board should make multicultural music teaching accessible for music teachers by providing more learning opportunities and teaching resources for music teachers. Lack of teacher expertise in multicultural music is a challenge that discourages teachers from teaching music from other cultures. School and community supports that prepare teachers become familiar with the content and sociocultural context of music from different cultures are needed.
The participation in artist workshops is effective in helping teachers develop understanding of different music practices and personal connection with the music. For example, having musicians and clinicians from specific cultures, such as African drumming, Indonesian gamelan, Chinese erhu, folk dances, and Orff instruments allow teachers to have hands-on experiences with the music and develop personal connection with the cultures.

Discussion of multicultural music teaching during professional development and sharing of teaching resources are also needed to support music teachers in teaching multicultural music. For some teachers, even after attending the artist workshops, they may still have concerns about cultural appropriation and music inauthenticity due to personal comfort level and cultural differences. Instead of having teachers to develop the teaching resources on their own, the school board can provide resources, such as ready-to-use worksheets, interactive apps, videos featuring artists, for teachers to feel more guided when planning multicultural music lessons.

Overall, more supports are needed from school board, school, and the community to support music teachers develop understanding and personal connection with multicultural music.

5.4 Areas for Further Research

In my literature review, it was difficult to find multicultural or diverse music teaching in the Canadian education context. Most of the research articles regarding multicultural music were done in Australia and Singapore. Multicultural music activities take place in Canada, but are not studied in the education context. Therefore, more research is needed in Ontario to study about the current state of multicultural music teaching, the multiple musical identities students may bring to school, and teaching strategies to help students and the school community to gain understanding of the music practices from different cultures.
Most research articles discussed the theory of teaching multicultural music and teachers’
reported response of student learning results when exposed to diverse music. More researches
need to be done to study teaching practice of multicultural music. There is also a lack of
researches that focus on the benefits or disadvantages of multicultural music learning based on
student and parent responses. In order to develop effective teaching strategies that help students
to enjoy music learning experience, the opinions of students need to be taken into consideration.
The interest of students and parents in terms of what they want to achieve in life and school
music learning can affect their attitude towards music and pursuit of music in secondary school
or higher education. More studies need to be done to study different factors that affect people
perception of music learning and effective ways to promote music as a lifelong learning in order
to engage the young generation to take part in the music learning community.

5.5 Concluding Comments

The purpose of my study was to gain a better understanding about teaching strategies to
implement culturally diverse pedagogy in a music classroom. The two participants were selected
for my study because of their teaching approaches of integrating culturally diverse music and
non-Western music ensembles in their classrooms.

The interviews with two music educators in Ontario have provided insights about the
current state and challenges of integrating culturally diverse music in music education. As a
conclusion, my research findings suggested that 1) the integration of culturally diverse music in a
music classroom may mainly stemmed from the music educators’ teaching philosophies of
wanting students to gain a more complete understanding of different musical styles, 2) culturally
diverse music could be used as an engagement tool for students in music learning, and 3) student
participation in different performance contexts could help develop a greater sense of musicianship.

These teachers’ approaches to integrating diverse music involves having students to identify the musical elements in different music genres and demonstrate playing techniques in the non-Western instruments. I believe that this is mainly due to the teachers’ teaching philosophy of wanting students to gain a more complete understanding of different musical styles. A sense of appreciation for diverse music was valued by all the participants.

All of the participants in the study believe diverse music could be used as an engagement tool for students in music learning. Students reportedly showed great interest in trying different instruments, including ukulele, gamelan, and *erhu*. These teachers perceive that selecting music from the cultures of the students can result in greater connection to the content in the classroom and make students feel their identities were valued.

These teachers also perceive that participation in different performance contexts develops a greater sense of musicianship. The process of preparing for the performance and the final product of performing in front of the public can reportedly provide students with opportunities to showcase and recognize their abilities. These teachers believe that the learning experience in non-Western ensembles allow their students to understand the different modes of music transmission and practices.

Teaching music in a sociocultural context, inviting visiting artists to teach, encouraging students to play different instruments, and participating in music ensembles, are effective teaching strategies to expose students to cultural diversity in music. It is evident from this study that music serves as a great medium for students to learn about different cultural values and practices.
References


Appendices

Appendix A: Letter of Consent for Interview

Date: 
To whom it may concern: 

I am a Master teacher candidate at Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE), University of Toronto, and am currently studying Master of Teaching (MT). My research project is about culturally diverse pedagogy in elementary/secondary school music education. I hope to learn about ways to incorporate culturally diverse teaching in music class to make student music learning experience more engaging and meaningful. Findings obtained from this research study can be informative for current and future practice of pre-service teachers. I believe that your experience will provide insight into this topic.

Your participation in this research will involve one roughly 60 minutes interview, which will be audio-recorded and transcribed. I would be grateful if you would allow me to interview you at a place and time convenient for you, outside of school time. The contents of this interview will be used for my research project, which will include a final paper and informal presentations to my classmates. I may also present my research findings via conference presentation and/or through publication. You will be assigned a pseudonym to maintain your anonymity and I will not use your name or any other content that might identify you in my written work, oral presentations, or publications. This information will remain confidential. Any information that identifies your school or students will also be excluded.

The interview data will be stored on my password-protected computer and the only person who will have access to the research will be my course instructor. You are free to change your mind about your participation at any time, and to withdraw even after you have consented to participate. You may also choose to decline to answer any specific question during the interview. I will destroy the audio recording after the paper has been presented and/or published, which may take up to a maximum of five years after the data has been collected. There are no known risks to participation.

If you have further questions and inquiry about the research, feel free to contact me or the MT Program Research Coordinator, Dr. Angela Mac-Donald-Vemic.

Sincerely,

Mavis Kao

MT Program Contact: 
Dr. Angela Macdonald-Vemic 
Assistant Professor – Teaching Stream 
Phone number: (416) 821-6496 
E-mail: angela.macdonald@utoronto.ca
Consent Form

I acknowledged that the topic of this interview has been explained to me and that any questions that I have asked have been answered to my satisfaction. I understand that I can withdraw at any time without penalty.

I have read the letter provided to me by Mavis Kao and agree to participate in an interview for the purposes described. I agree to have the interview audio-recorded.

Signature: __________________________________________

Name (printed): _____________________________________

Date: _______________________________________________
Appendix B: Interview Protocol

Start of Meeting (10 minutes)
1. Introduce self.
2. Present and discuss consent form (have 2 copies – one for the researcher and one for the participant to keep).
3. Answer any questions about the project.

“The thank you for participating in my research study. The aim of this research is to learn how music teachers incorporate good teaching practice in a music classroom. This interview should take approximately 60 minutes, and is comprised of approximately 22 questions. The interview protocol has been divided into six sections, beginning with your A) career background information, followed by questions about your B) school context, C) thoughts on teaching world music, D) reported practice, E) barriers and supports, and F) future inquiry. I want to remind you that you can choose not to answer any question, and can remove yourself from participation at any time.”

Do you have any questions before we begin?

4. Test audio recorder (remember to prepare extra batteries).
5. Begin recording.

“To begin can you state your name for the recording?”

6. State date and time of the interview.

Interview (~60 minutes)

Section A – Career Background Information

1. Can you start by describing your current job title and responsibilities in your current position? (Official title and responsibilities)

2. Can you tell me about your qualifications: what and where you studied during your undergraduate degree?
   a) When and where did you finish your pre-service teacher training?

3. How many years have you been working as a teacher in Ontario?

4. What grades, subjects, and streams do you currently teach?
   a) Which grades and subjects have you previously taught?
5. Aside from your role as a teacher, do you have any other roles in the school (e.g., coordinator, advisor, etc.)?

6. How would you describe your teaching philosophy, as a music teacher?

7. What is the most important thing you want students learn in your music classes? (e.g., musicality, music technique, sense of appreciation, exposure to different music, enjoy the process of music making)

Section B – School Context

8. How long have you taught in this school?

9. Can you describe the community in which your school is situated (e.g., demographics, socioeconomic status, academic focus, etc.)?

10. Can you describe the resources and facilities available for music at your school?
    a) Possible prompts: What about…
       i) the number of teachers,
       ii) instruments, equipment (projector, audio recorder), practice room,
       iii) ensemble, music club,
       iv) concerts, music trips, music festivals, music camp,
       v) teaching materials (music scores, music tracks, videos, learning resources, websites).

You were asked to participate in this study because you have self-identified as having specific knowledge and experiences related to the values of good teaching practice of world music. The next series of questions will ask you to reflect on those experiences.

Section C – Thoughts on Teaching World Music

11. Can you tell me your own definition of good practice of world music in a music classroom?

12. How does good teaching practice of world music look like, in practice, in the music classroom?
    a) Possible Prompt:
       i) music repertoire,
       ii) teaching approach (explanation of context, comparison of different music),
       iii) learning attitude (reflection),
       iv) expectation.

13. What was your first impression of teaching world music? What were some of your concerns teaching world music?

14. Would you say that CRP is common at your school? How about among other music teachers (if applicable)?
15. How do you think cultural values affect students’ attitude towards music learning? Can you list some examples among your own students?

Section D – Reported Practices of World Music

16. Can you give me an example of a time that you explicitly incorporated world music in the classroom?
   a) Possible prompt:
      i) Which cultures of music did you include in the repertoire? Why?
      ii) (if non-Western) How did you create an inclusive learning environment when exposing students to non-Western music?
      iii) (if non-Western) How did you evaluate students’ understanding of non-Western music? (e.g., reflection, social context, comparison with Western music)
      iv) Can you describe how you design your lesson? (e.g., activities/ hooks used, learning goals, assessment, resources, set-up)

17. What were some students’ responses to the lesson? In your view, was it an effective lesson?

18. What impacts did the lesson have on students’ learning?
   a) Possible prompt:
      i) student engagement (interest in course material, increased connection, attention span),
      ii) student motivation (willingness to practice and stay focus on task),
      iii) open-mindedness, sense of appreciation,
      iv) performance (technique).

Section E – Barriers and Supports

19. What were some challenges when implementing world music in a music classroom?
   a) Possible prompt
      i) teacher expertise
      ii) colleague/ student resistance,
      iii) preparation time, resources, funding,
      iv) time constraint,
      v) authenticity issue.

20. What were some resources that you found helpful in teaching world music?
   a) Possible prompt
      i) workshop from the school board/ training from professional development,
      ii) information exchange with colleagues,
      iii) websites/ journals/ books,
      iv) students/ parents,
      v) others.
Section F – Future Inquiry

21. What advice would you give to another colleague who is planning to teach world music in a music classroom?

22. Any final thoughts or opinions on expanding or improving teaching world music in music education?
   a) Possible Prompt:
      i) teacher resources,
      ii) on-going workshops,
      iii) funding for indigenous performance/ speaker series,
      iv) training in pre-service institution.

End of Interview (10 minutes)
1. Turn off recorder.
2. Explain “member check” – will send you a transcript for your review.
3. Review consent.
4. Thank participant.