Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences
Journal canadien des sciences halieutiques et aquatiques

Internal iron loading and warm temperatures are pre-conditions for cyanobacterial dominance in embayments along Georgian Bay, Great Lakes

Journal:	<i>Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences</i>
Manuscript ID	cjfas-2016-0377.R2
Manuscript Type:	Article
Date Submitted by the Author:	27-Dec-2016
Complete List of Authors:	Verschoor, Mark; York University, Biology Powe, Christopher; York University, Biology McQuay, Eric; University of Waterloo, Earth and Environmental Sciences Schiff, Sherry; University of Waterloo Venkiteswaran, Jason J.; Wilfrid Laurier University, Department of Geography and Environmental Studies Li, Jiahua; York University, Biology Molot, Lewis; York University, Faculty of Environmental Studies
Keyword:	EUTROPHICATION < General, cyanobacteria, iron, NUTRIENTS < General, TEMPERATURE < General

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Internal iron loading and warm temperatures are pre-conditions for cyanobacterial dominance in embayments along Georgian Bay, Great Lakes

Mark J. Verschoor, Chistopher R. Powe, Eric McQuay, Sherry L. Schiff, Jason J. Venkiteswaran, Jiahua Li and Lewis A. Molot

M.J. Verschoor, C.R. Powe and J. Li. Department of Biology, York University, Toronto, ON M3J 1P3, Canada

S.L. Schiff and E. McQuay. Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, ON N2L 3G1, Canada

J.J. Venkiteswaran. Department of Geography and Environmental Studies, Wilfrid Laurier University, Waterloo, ON N2L 3C5, Canada

L.A. Molot. Faculty of Environmental Studies, York University, Toronto, ON M3J 1P3, Canada

Corresponding author: Lewis Molot (email: lmolot@yorku.ca)

Abstract: Previous work suggests that a high rate of internal ferrous iron (Fe^{2+}) loading from anoxic sediments into overlying waters favours cyanobacteria dominance (> 50% of the phytoplankton biomass) over eukaryotic algae. This Cyanobacteria-Ferrous conceptual model was assessed along the Georgian Bay coastline of Lake Huron, Ontario in one meso-eutrophic and three oligotrophic embayments which experience natural hypolimnetic anoxia. Cyanobacteria dominated all embayments in the relatively warmer summer of 2012 but not in much cooler 2014 although hypolimnetic anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading were observed in both summers in all embayments. A cyanobacteria bloom large enough to turn the lake visibly green was observed only in warmer 2012 in the meso-eutrophic embayment. Results show that warm summer temperatures and internal Fe^{2+} loading are necessary pre-conditions for cyanobacteria dominance while high nutrient levels are needed to form large blooms. There were no consistent patterns between dominance and total and dissolved phosphorus (P), total nitrogen, ammonium and nitrate. Internal P loading was not a necessary pre-condition for dominance. While P removal programs will decrease phytoplankton biomass in eutrophic waters, oxidized surficial sediments must be maintained throughout an aquatic system to prevent cyanobacteria dominance.

Introduction

Some of the primary goals of eutrophication management include lowering the risk of algal and cyanobacteria bloom formation and maintaining deep water oxygen levels above critical levels for fish communities. These goals are typically accomplished at the watershed scale by lowering productivity through nutrient loading controls. The link between excessive phosphorus (P) loading and higher productivity has been known since the 1960s (Sakamoto 1966) with conclusive experimental confirmation published over 40 years ago (Schindler and Fee 1974; Schindler et al. 2012), providing the basis for widespread and often successful management actions to lower productivity by decreasing total P (TP) loading (Dolan 1993; Schindler et al. 2016). Regardless of whether eutrophic systems are nitrogen (N), P or light-limited, point-source P controls are viewed as one of the primary means to induce nutrient limitation thereby lowering productivity and, hence, phytoplankton biomass. New nutrient reduction targets for Lake Erie are focused on P loading only (International Joint Commission 2013). Some researchers advocate removing both N and P as a means of mitigating freshwater cyanobacteria blooms (Paerl et al. 2011; Gobler et al. 2016), an idea that has been vigorously disputed (Schindler 2012; Schindler et al. 2012, 2016). In spite of these criticisms, support exists for dual nutrient controls, e.g. US EPA (2015).

One of the hallmark characteristics of eutrophic systems is the high risk of developing potentially harmful cyanobacteria blooms. Here, we use the term ‘dominant’ to describe cyanobacteria populations comprising > 50% of the total phytoplankton biomass. Further, the phrase ‘cyanobacteria bloom’ is used in this paper to describe cyanobacteria populations with visible surface accumulations or in which the surface waters are clearly green regardless of whether cyanobacteria are dominant. Empirical among-lakes data show that the risk of

cyanobacteria dominance increases with increasing average summer epilimnetic TP and total N (TN) concentrations (i.e., with increasing productivity) and decreasing TN/TP ratios; nevertheless dominance can occur at most TP concentrations, TN concentrations and TN/TP ratios (Downing et al. 2001) including systems that are not eutrophic (Chen et al. 2007, 2009; Carey et al. 2008; Vareli et al. 2009). Clearly, TN and TP are important risk factors for cyanobacteria dominance but other factors must be investigated to consistently explain cyanobacteria dominance over their eukaryotic algal competitors along a trophic gradient.

Molot et al. (2014) hypothesized that much of the unexplained variance and the increased risk of cyanobacteria dominance with nutrient concentrations in Downing et al.'s (2001) meta-analysis might be accounted for by variation in internal ferrous iron (Fe^{2+}) loading, a process dependent on development of sediment anoxia. Anoxia is generally correlated with productivity, i.e., with high nutrient levels as demonstrated by the relationship between TP and anoxic factor (Nürnberg 1995). Molot et al. (2014) presented a conceptual model (referred to here as the Cyanobacteria-Ferrous or Cyano-Fe model) describing cyanobacteria bloom formation as a function of sediment anoxia, P, N, Fe^{2+} and sulphate (SO_4^{2-}). The central thesis of this conceptual model is that the magnitude of summer phytoplankton biomass is typically controlled by macronutrient concentrations (usually P or N but sometimes light in hypereutrophic systems) but dominance by eukaryotic algae or cyanobacteria is influenced by the availability of Fe^{2+} , regardless of what limits total phytoplankton biomass.

The unknown link between TP and TN and risk of cyanobacteria dominance across a macronutrient concentration gradient (Downing et al. 2001) may be explained to some extent by an increasing risk of surface sediment anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading with nutrient enrichment (Molot et al. 2014). Cyanobacteria have high Fe requirements relative to eukaryotic

photoautotrophs and can only transport Fe^{2+} directly across the inner membrane (e.g. Kranzler et al. 2013; see review in Molot et al. 2014; C. Powe and L. Molot, unpublished data). In contrast, eukaryotic algae have lower Fe requirements and can transport Fe^{3+} directly across their inner membranes (C. Powe and L. Molot, unpublished data). Cyanobacteria demand for Fe is to some extent mitigated by ferric Fe (Fe^{3+}) scavenging mechanisms such as siderophores and extracellular capsular polysaccharides (Wilhelm 1995; Rose et al 2005; Li et al 2016; Sorichetti et al. 2016), but they are unable to transport Fe^{3+} across their cell membranes without prior reduction. While Fe^{2+} can be generated by biological and photo-reduction of Fe^{3+} , Molot et al. (2014) hypothesized that rapid re-oxidation to Fe^{3+} before transport across the inner membrane lowers cell supply rates. Thus, Molot et al. (2014) hypothesized that large cyanobacteria populations that turn surface waters green (i.e., large blooms) must be supported by high external supply rates of Fe^{2+} and the most likely source of this would be internal Fe^{2+} loading from anoxic sediments. Buoyancy-controlling cyanobacteria can migrate to at least 10-12 m below the surface to acquire nutrients (Camacho et al. 1996, 2000; Head et al. 1999; Gervais et al. 2003) suggesting that in eutrophic systems they may migrate into or adjacent to anoxic bottom waters to acquire Fe^{2+} . Thus, diffusion of Fe^{2+} from anoxic sediments into overlying waters may play a role in the success of these taxa. If, on the other hand, the external supply rate is low, then the Cyano-Fe model predicts that a system with a low supply rate of Fe^{2+} will be dominated by eukaryotic species.

The Cyano-Fe model suggests that the timing of a cyanobacteria bloom may in part be related to the seasonal onset of internal Fe^{2+} loading, which in turn is controlled by anoxia, reducible Fe content of surface sediments and SO_4^{2-} reduction rate (Molot et al. 2014) in waters with suitable temperatures and light. Evidence to date from eutrophic systems supports the

Cyano-Fe model in thermally stratified lakes (Molot et al. 2010, 2014) with more limited evidence from polymictic systems (Smith et al. 2011).

What constitutes a suitable temperature for cyanobacterial bloom formation during the summer is not clear. Cyanobacteria exceeded 20% of the phytoplankton biovolume in eutrophic Lake St. George, Ontario only when the temperature at 1 m exceeded 21°C (McQueen and Lean 1987). Several studies have examined the effects of temperature on photosynthesis and growth rate in laboratory cultures of cyanobacteria. The results are difficult to compare because of different growing conditions (e.g., culture media, irradiance, photoperiods, mixing conditions), but in general they describe maximum growth rates between 20°C and 30°C with much lower growth rates below 15°C (Konopka and Brock 1978; Robarts and Zohary 1987; Butterwick et al. 2005). Paerl and Huisman (2009) suggested that maximum growth rates for eukaryotic algae are lower than those for cyanobacteria in warm waters and that cyanobacteria dominance is favoured in eutrophic waters above 25°C. However, others have reported that some, but not all, eukaryotic species grow as rapidly as cyanobacteria at 25°C to 30°C in culture (Cole and Christian 2000; Butterwick et al. 2005). Tropical eukaryotic species are inherently adapted to high water temperatures and transplanted species may not survive cold winters. Confounding our understanding of the impact of temperature on cyanobacterial bloom formation is the impact of climate warming on sediment anoxia via higher respiration rates and longer ice-free seasons (Stainsby et al. 2011; North et al. 2014) which promote internal Fe^{2+} loading, thereby favouring cyanobacteria (Molot et al. 2014). Therefore, the temperature-mediated effects on cyanobacterial growth must be separated from those on sediment anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading.

In this study, the objective was to examine relationships between water level, temperature, sediment anoxia, nutrient levels and internal Fe^{2+} and P loading on cyanobacteria

dominance and bloom formation in one meso-eutrophic and three oligotrophic embayments along Georgian Bay (northeast Lake Huron in Ontario, Figure 1). These embayments offer an excellent opportunity to test the validity of the Cyano-Fe model, since they span a range of nutrient regimes and some experience natural hypolimnetic anoxia during the ice-free season that is not linked with anthropogenic nutrient loading (total P concentrations are very low, $< 10 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$). Incomplete mixing during early spring means that deep waters begin the stratification season with a dissolved oxygen deficit which can lead to anoxia even in oligotrophic systems (Molot et al. 1992). Naturally occurring anoxia is not uncommon in small, oligotrophic forested lakes in central Ontario in lakes with a maximum fetch $< 1.4 \text{ km}$ (Molot et al. 1992).

In addition, one meso-eutrophic embayment in particular (Sturgeon Bay) has experienced frequent blooms of *Anabaena* since 1990 (Schiefer 2003). Water level was included in this study because there is a public perception that declining water levels in the Great Lakes in recent years (Georgian Bay Association 2016) has somehow been responsible for the increasing incidence of cyanobacteria blooms.

We hypothesized that warm temperatures, high nutrient levels and internal Fe^{2+} loading are necessary pre-conditions for a bloom to form while warm temperatures and internal Fe^{2+} loading are required for dominance across a trophic range. The study was conducted in a relatively warm (2012) and a much cooler (2014) summer allowing us to distinguish between the potential impact of temperature and Fe^{2+} availability on cyanobacteria dominance. Seasonal time series data were collected to assess whether anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading preceded cyanobacterial dominance, as required by the Cyano-Fe model. If dominance occurs in the absence of either anoxia or internal Fe^{2+} loading, then the Cyano-Fe model must be either modified or rejected.

Materials and methods

Study sites

Four embayments along the Georgian Bay coast (Lake Huron, Ontario) were the focus of this study: the north basin of Sturgeon Bay (N 45° 36' 51.1236", W 80° 26' 1.7052"), Deep Bay (N 45° 23' 41.3982", W 80° 13' 25.7916") and Twelve Mile Bay (N 45° 5' 0.927", W 79° 56' 44.088") (Figure 1). In 2014, North Bay (the north bay of Honey Harbour; N 44° 53' 7.1", W 79° 48' 39.8") was sampled instead of Twelve Mile Bay. These embayments are located between Honey Harbour in the south and Sturgeon Bay Provincial Park near Pointe au Baril in the north, a distance of about 100 km. Physical characteristics of the study sites are listed in Table 1. The embayments are described in more detail in Schiefer (2003; Sturgeon Bay), Schiefer and Schiefer (2010; Twelve Mile Bay and North Bay) and Schiefer (2005; Deep Bay). The study area is located on the Precambrian Shield with largely undeveloped forest catchments and wetlands. Many of the embayments along the Georgian Bay coast, including those studied here, have cottage development with numbers, size and usage increasing over the past few decades from small summer occupancy units to multi-use year-round establishments (Schiefer et al 2007; Schiefer and Schiefer 2010).

Deep Bay, Twelve Mile Bay and North Bay are oligotrophic while the north basin of Sturgeon Bay is meso-eutrophic. Late summer blooms of filamentous cyanobacteria have been reported intermittently for many years in the north basin of Sturgeon Bay (Schiefer 2003). Reports of Sturgeon Bay blooms have increased from relatively infrequent occurrences prior to 1990 to annual events over the past few years. While Sturgeon Bay's relatively high TP concentration and blooms are unusual for the region where most embayments are oligotrophic,

there is concern among community members that blooms may spread to other embayments currently unaffected.

Water sample collection

Sampling was biweekly. Sturgeon Bay and Deep Bay were sampled between mid-June and early September in 2012 and between mid-June and early October in 2014. Twelve Mile Bay was sampled between mid-June and early September in 2012 and North Bay was sampled between mid-June and early October in 2014. Embayments were sampled at their deepest points (Table 1). Profiles of conductivity, temperature and dissolved oxygen were taken using a YSI 6600v2 Sonde connected to a YSI 650 display and data logging system (YSI Incorporated, Ohio). Prior to recording these measurements, the sonde was allowed time to stabilize between each 0.5 m vertical sampling interval.

Water samples were collected using a horizontal sampler without metal parts at 2 m intervals to a depth of 0.5 m above the sediment. Equal sample volumes from discrete depths were pooled to create integrated epilimnetic and metalimnetic samples with the depths of the layer boundaries identified each time from temperature profiles: boundaries between the epilimnion, metalimnion, and hypolimnion were defined by the intersection of straight lines drawn through the temperature-depth profile of adjacent layers. To minimize the risk of contamination from previously collected samples, samples were collected from top to bottom of the water column since surface samples generally have lower nutrient concentrations than deeper waters. Epilimnetic and metalimnetic samples were filtered through 400 μm acid washed mesh to remove large zooplankters and debris, and stored in 4 L acid washed carboys before pooling. To minimize oxygen contamination after collection, hypolimnetic samples were transferred

directly to an acid-washed syringe from the horizontal sampler through a customized T-fitting which allowed samples to be carefully drawn into and flushed out of the syringe repeatedly until air bubbles were no longer visible in the apparatus. Five mL of sample was then used to flush the filter of possible contaminants. The syringe was then filled and filtered into acid-washed 50 mL snap cap vials through 0.2 μm syringe-tip filters (Sartorius cellulose acetate with glass fibre pre-filter).

Integrated epilimnetic, metalimnetic and discrete hypolimnetic samples were subsampled for ammonium (NH_4^+ measured as $\text{NH}_3 + \text{NH}_4^+$), nitrate (NO_3^- measured as $\text{NO}_2^- + \text{NO}_3^-$), SO_4^{2-} , total dissolved Fe and total dissolved P (DP) and filtered through 0.2 μm syringe-tip filters into acid-washed vials. Dissolved inorganic N (DIN) is defined here as $\text{NO}_3^- + \text{NH}_4^+$. Subsamples were also collected for TN and TP and stored unfiltered in acid-washed vials.

Fe^{2+} was not measured directly because of the difficulty of quantifying this form accurately in remote locations and the likelihood of autoredox of Fe^{3+} to Fe^{2+} by reagents in the presence of dissolved humic matter (Verschoor and Molot 2013). Instead, we assumed that where water column profiles showed large, increasing concentrations of dissolved Fe with increasing depth in anoxic waters relative to metalimnetic and epilimnetic concentrations, such large increases indicated release of Fe^{2+} from anoxic sediments similar to internal loading of P from anoxic sediments (Nürnberg and Dillon 1993; Molot and Dillon 2003). While some dissolved Fe may include other forms such as Fe sulphide, settling ferric hydroxides and organic Fe compounds (e.g., Cook 1984; Rickard and Morse 2005), for the purposes of this study it was not necessary to quantify Fe^{2+} accurately, only to confirm that an internal loading profile in anoxic waters was present. We also assumed that increasing DP profiles with depth in anoxic waters was generated by internal P loading (Nürnberg 1984; Nürnberg et al. 1986). Internal P

and Fe loading was assumed present in anoxic water if concentrations at the top of the anoxic profile were at least 50% higher than the highest of the metalimnetic or epilimnetic value. Groundwater influxes to these Precambrian Shield systems were assumed confined to the nearshore epilimnetic sediments and thus negligible contributions to the hypolimnetic zone.

Subsamples for phytoplankton identification and enumeration were collected from the integrated epilimnetic and metalimnetic samples and preserved with Lugols iodine (4 mL per 96 mL of sample) in screw-cap centrifuge tubes (Jasprica 2002). Samples were gently mixed and stored in the dark until analysis.

Water chemistry methods

In 2012 TN, NO_3^- , NH_4^+ and SO_4^{2-} were analyzed at the University of Alberta Biogeochemical Analytical Service Laboratory in Edmonton. NH_4^+ (in 2012 and 2104) was analyzed using the Berthelot reaction method (Method 4500- NH_4 F, American Water Works Association 1999) with a detection limit of $2 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. NO_3^- was measured colourimetrically after reduction to nitrite (Method 4500- NO_3 I, American Water Works Association 1999) with a detection limit of $1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. TN was determined by combustion-oxidation to nitrite with chemiluminescence detection (conformed to method D5176, American Society Testing Materials 2008) with a detection limit of $10 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. SO_4^{2-} was measured using ion chromatography with a detection limit of 0.04 mg L^{-1} .

In 2012 total and DP were analyzed at the Trent University laboratory in Dorset, Ontario using ascorbic acid-molybdate colourimetry after autoclave digestion in sulphuric acid (Method 4500-P F, American Water Works Association 1999) with a detection limit of $1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. Total dissolved Fe was measured at the Water Quality Centre at Trent University in Peterborough,

Ontario with inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry (ICP-MS; Thermo XSeries-2) with a detection limit of $1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$.

In 2014, NO_3^- and SO_4^{2-} were analyzed at the University of Waterloo with ion chromatography on a Dionex ICS-2100, total DP and total dissolved Fe were measured at the Trent University Water Quality Centre with ICP-MS (Agilent 8800 Triple Quadrupole) and TN and NH_4^+ were analyzed at the University of Alberta Biogeochemical Analytical Service Laboratory

Phytoplankton analyses

Phytoplankton samples were identified at the genus level where possible and counted using the Utermöhl method (Lund et al. 1958) and an inverted microscope (Nikon DIAPHOT-TMD, Mississauga, Ontario) with phase-contrast optics. One mL of a well-mixed sample was pipetted into a 10 mm diameter, 1 cm deep Utermöhl slide and settled for a minimum of 8 hours. Large individual and colonial eukaryotic phytoplankton and colonies and filaments of cyanobacteria were enumerated by counting the contents of the entire chamber at 100x magnification. Very small ($< \sim 10 \mu\text{m}$ greatest axial linear dimension) individual eukaryotes and cyanobacteria were enumerated in 20-50 uniformly distributed fields with a minimum of 200 total individuals counted. All phytoplankton were classified by shape and size (Prescott 1970; Wehr and Sheath 2003). Measurements from 10-20 individual cells or colonies for each phytoplankton size/shape classification were taken at the highest magnification practical (up to 1600x) and averaged. Data were organized into as many as 50 distinct size/shape classifications, and the cyanobacterial and eukaryotic phytoplankton biovolumes were calculated by multiplying cell count values by their respective geometric cell volumes (Hillebrand et al. 1999; Olenina et

al. 2006; Vadrucci et al. 2007). Biovolume was converted to biomass by assuming an approximate cell density of 1 g mL^{-1} . Population growth rate was calculated as the slope of $\ln(\text{biomass})$ versus time.

Water level and meteorological data

Monthly water level data for Lake Michigan-Lake Huron were available on-line from the Canadian Department of Fisheries and Oceans website at http://www.tides.gc.ca/C&A/network_means-eng.html. Mean monthly water levels were derived from observations at six monitoring stations: Thessalon and Tobermory in Ontario, and Milwaukee (Wisconsin), Ludington, Mackinaw City and Harbor Beach (Michigan) in the US. Levels are referenced to the International Great Lakes Datum 1985. Mean daily air temperatures at Muskoka A station ($44^{\circ}58'00.000'' \text{ N}$, $79^{\circ}18'00.000'' \text{ W}$) between 1939 and 2004 were available on-line at http://climate.weather.gc.ca/historical_data/search_historic_data_e.html.

Statistical analyses

Redundancy analysis (RDA) was used to determine statistically significant relationships between phytoplankton community composition and environmental factors (epilimnetic and metalimnetic temperature, dissolved Fe at 10 m, redox potential at 10 m, DP at 10 m, epilimnetic TP, epilimnetic NH_4^+ and epilimnetic NO_3^-). Transformations were applied to environmental variables (z-score standardization) and phytoplankton composition data (Hellinger transformation). Phytoplankton were excluded when their abundance was less than 10% of the total biomass to avoid a cluttered and unreadable diagram and because the focus of the study was on taxa that were dominant. Only data from Sturgeon in 2012 were used because this was the

only lake-year to experience a bloom and cyanobacteria dominance. RDA modeling based on forward selection was performed in R using “rda” in the “vegan” package and “forward.sel” functions in the “packfor” package (R Core Team 2015; <http://www.R-project.org>). Pearson correlation coefficients were calculated using Microsoft Excel.

Results

Runoff to the embayments is softwater (generally with conductivity $< 0.08 \text{ mS cm}^{-1}$), but there are occasional intrusions of harder water through narrow channels connecting the embayments to the open waters of Georgian Bay where the conductivity is typically $> 0.18 \text{ mS cm}^{-1}$ (Schiefer and Schiefer 2007, 2010). During the summer of 2012 surface conductivity ranged from $0.14 - 0.18 \text{ mS cm}^{-1}$ in Twelve Mile Bay, $0.09 - 0.11 \text{ mS cm}^{-1}$ in Deep Bay and $0.08 - 0.10 \text{ mS cm}^{-1}$ in the north basin of Sturgeon Bay, suggesting varying mixtures of Georgian Bay water and Precambrian Shield runoff. Surface conductivity in 2014 ranged from $0.12 - 0.13 \text{ mS cm}^{-1}$ in North Bay. These measurements indicate that Sturgeon Bay and Deep Bay are less susceptible to water exchange with Georgian Bay than Twelve Mile Bay and North Bay.

SO_4^{2-} concentrations in the embayments reflect a mixture of softwater Precambrian Shield inputs and Georgian Bay water. Concentrations in nearby Lake Huron are 15.9 mg L^{-1} (Chapra et al. 2012) while in 2012 epilimnetic SO_4^{2-} ranged from 6.8 to 8.6 mg L^{-1} in Sturgeon Bay, 7.5 to 8.9 mg L^{-1} in Deep Bay and 10.9 to 12.9 mg L^{-1} in Twelve Mile. The higher SO_4^{2-} concentrations in Twelve Mile correspond to higher conductivity in this embayment than in the others, reflecting a greater water exchange rate with Georgian Bay. In June 2012, hypolimnetic SO_4^{2-} concentrations near the sediments were similar to epilimnetic concentrations in all

embayments, but hypolimnetic concentrations began to decline in July probably because of SO_4^{2-} reduction, with differences of more than 1.5 mg L^{-1} from top to bottom in mid-July in Sturgeon and Twelve Mile and in late July in Deep Bay. SO_4^{2-} reduction rates were not high enough to prevent internal Fe^{2+} loading (latter is discussed below).

Mean summer (June-August) water levels in Lake Michigan-Lake Huron between 1918 and 2014 ranged from a low of 175.76 m in June 1964 to a high of 177.39 m in July and August 1986, a difference of 1.63 m (Figure 2). The mean summer water level for the 25 year periods between 1964 and 1989 and 1990-2014 were 176.8 and 176.4 m, respectively, a difference of only 0.4 m. Therefore, lake levels in the period after 1990, which were associated anecdotally with a high incidence of blooms, were on average only slightly lower than the preceding period. However, water levels after 1999 were consistently low, averaging 176.2 m.

Mean summer air temperatures between 1939 and 2004 at Muskoka A station near Bracebridge, Ontario (the nearest weather station with a continuous record but ending in 2004) ranged from 15.1°C in 1992 (about one year after Mount Pinatubo erupted in the Philippines) to 19.5°C in 1955 with a mean of 17.4°C . The anecdotal period of blooms (1990-2004) was slightly warmer than the 15 year pre-bloom period preceding it (1975-1989): means were 17.6°C and 17.3°C and medians were 17.8°C and 17.0°C , respectively. An alternative way of looking at temperatures is to consider the frequency of a warm years: 41% of the summers were warmer than 17.5°C during 1939-1989 compared to 67% during 1990-2004 (Figure 2). The mean summer air temperature was 1.7°C cooler in 2014 compared to 2012 at nearby Parry Sound CCG meteorological station (the Parry Sound station lacks a long term record).

The temporal sequences of chemical and biological changes are an important aspect of the Cyano-Fe model and are examined next.

Sturgeon Bay (2012 and 2014)

The difference in summer air temperatures in 2012 and 2014 had a major effect on surface water temperatures in Sturgeon Bay. The number of days when the top three metres of the water column were above 20°C was twice as high in the latter half of June and three times higher in July in 2012 compared to 2014 (Figure 3a and 3b). In both years, the north basin was thermally stratified when sampling began in mid-June and remained stratified until sampling ended in early September, although the hypolimnion disappeared by mid-July in 2012 and mid-September in 2014 having been entrained into the metalimnion.

Although anoxia is in principle defined to be 0 mg L⁻¹ dissolved oxygen (DO), internal loading of Fe²⁺ and P was observed above 0 mg L⁻¹. Indeed, the lowest value recorded in Sturgeon Bay with the YSI was 0.045 mg L⁻¹ perhaps because of YSI calibration issues. Since the redox potential declined sharply below 0.5 mg L⁻¹ (Figure 3c), we used the redox-DO relationship to operationally define the top boundary of the anoxic zone as 0.5 mg DO L⁻¹. The top of the anoxic zone moved upwards from the bottom (10 - 12 m depending on where the anchor was dropped) to a depth of 7 m towards the end of July in both years (Figure 3d).

Dissolved Fe concentrations at 10 m (2 m above the bottom) ranged more than 20-fold from 45 to 2290 µg L⁻¹ in 2012 and 147 to 3053 µg L⁻¹ (Table 2). Dissolved Fe concentrations increased between 9 and 12 m after these strata became anoxic. Concentrations reached 1,000 µg L⁻¹ at 10 m by the end of July in both years compared to epilimnetic concentrations < 60 µg L⁻¹ in 2012 and < 150 µg L⁻¹ in 2014 (Figures 4a and b). When the 9 m stratum became oxic in August, dissolved Fe concentrations declined from 535 µg L⁻¹ to much lower levels similar to those found in the epilimnion due to dilution with low Fe water and oxidation of dissolved Fe²⁺

to Fe^{3+} and precipitation. DP also increased in the hypolimnion by late July in both years when anoxia developed but the increases were not as large as the increases in dissolved Fe (Table 2, Figures 4c and d). Epilimnetic DP levels ranged from 6 to 10 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in 2012 and 6 to 12 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in 2014. Hypolimnetic DP reached 55 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ at 10 m in 2012 and 44 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in 2014, exceeding 180 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ at 12 m near the sediments in both years.

In 2012 cyanobacteria dominated from first half of July through the summer, reaching over 80% of the phytoplankton biomass in the epilimnion by late July. In contrast they did not become dominant in 2014, although they had reached 33% of the biomass by mid-September (Figure 5a and 5c). Growth of cyanobacteria began after sediment anoxia developed in early summer in both years, reaching ‘bloom’ proportions in 2012 (i.e., the lake was visibly green) but not in 2014 (Figure 5b and 5d). The epilimnetic biomass peaked at 9,300 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in early September 2012 when it was predominantly *Dolichospermum*, a filamentous N_2 -fixer. The most common cyanobacteria in 2014 were *Woronichinia* and *Dolichospermum*. The net summer growth rates for the epilimnetic populations were 0.054 day^{-1} in 2012 and 0.016 day^{-1} in 2014 when it was cooler (Figure 5e).

Mean epilimnetic and metalimnetic nutrient concentrations ranged from 9 to 17 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ TP (Table 2) and 372 to 432 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ TN. TN/TP ratios by weight in the metalimnion and epilimnion ranged from 18 to 73 in 2012 (means 37 and 38, respectively) and 20 to 56 in 2014 (means 29 and 36, respectively), which are generally indicative of P deficiency (Healey and Hendzel, 1979). However, while TN/TP ratios were high, epilimnetic and metalimnetic NH_4^+ and NO_3^- concentrations were occasionally undetectable, especially immediately before cyanobacteria growth began, indicating that the bulk of the N was present in dissolved organic or particulate form which may have favoured diazotrophs such as *Dolichospermum*.

Twelve taxa exceeding 10% of the phytoplankton biomass on at least one occasion (excluding pico-phytoplankton) were used in the RDA of Sturgeon Bay data in 2012: *Dolichospermum*, *Coelomoron*, *Microcystis*, *Planktothrix*, *Woronichinia*, *Peridinium*, *Ceratium*, *Asterionella*, *Fragilaria*, unknown coccoids, unknown diatom ‘centrics’ and unknown algal ‘medium rounds’. *Dolichospermum*, the most abundant of the cyanobacteria, was closely associated with high dissolved Fe at 10 m and to a lesser degree high epilimnetic NH_4^+ during late summer as well as low redox at 10 m and low epilimnetic NO_3^- (Figure 6). Variance inflation factors (VIF) for epilimnetic TP, epilimnetic NO_3^- and redox potential at 10 m depth were high (45.8 - 84.9) indicating a high degree of multicollinearity while VIF for dissolved Fe and DP at 10 m and epilimnetic NH_4^+ were relatively low (2.0 - 7.2). The proportion of variance explained by RDA axis 1 was 49.3% and the proportion explained by axis 2 was 27.5%. Epilimnetic NH_4^+ was removed without loss of adjusted R^2 which was 70%. Global tests of the RDA were significant ($p < 0.001$) and the first two canonical axes were significant ($p < 0.01$) with and without epilimnetic NH_4^+ included.

Deep Bay (2012 and 2014)

The anoxic zone in Deep Bay extended from the sediments upwards to a depth of 7.2 m in early August 2012, while in 2014 it had only extended upwards to 14.5 m by late August (Figure 7). Dissolved Fe responded to development of anoxia in both years (Table 2) but increased over time at a slower rate than in Sturgeon. In comparison, DP did not increase as bottom waters became anoxic in 2012 but increased by about $7 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in 2014 (Table 2, Figure 7).

Cyanobacteria populations were small in this oligotrophic embayment, $< 400 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in both years (Figure 8). Cyanobacteria growth began after the appearance of anoxic sediments. Cyanobacteria dominated the epilimnion at the end of the summer in 2012 but did not dominate the metalimnion in 2012 or either layer in 2014 (Figure 8). In 2012 the metalimnetic population consisted primarily of the non- N_2 -fixing colonial cyanobacteria, *Microcystis*. The epilimnetic population consisted primarily of *Dolichospermum* which also was the most important cyanobacterium in both layers in 2014.

Mean epilimnetic and metalimnetic TP and TN concentrations ranged from 4 to $20 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ TP (Table 2) and 270 to $480 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ TN. TN/TP ratios by weight in the metalimnia and epilimnia ranged from 19 to 74 in 2012 (means 38 and 45 , respectively) and 19 to 49 in 2014 (means 32 and 42 , respectively).

Twelve Mile Bay (2012)

Anoxia was first detected in bottom waters (10.5 m) in late June 2012 in Twelve Mile Bay (Figure 9a). As the summer progressed, the top of the anoxic zone gradually extended upwards to 9 m by early August but was never more than 2 m from the sediments, in contrast to the anoxic zones in Sturgeon Bay (Figure 5) and Deep Bay (Figure 7) which were thicker. Internal Fe^{2+} loading was clearly detectable at 10 m in early August (Figure 9a), having increased to $141 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ from $48 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ two weeks earlier but the increase at 9 m was much smaller (Table 2). The maximum difference in DP between the bottom and the top of the hypolimnion on any given day was quite small, $< 2.3 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ (Table 2). This small concentration gradient indicates that internal P loading and contributions from mineralization of settling particulate P in the hypolimnion were minimal after anoxia developed. Epilimnetic TP ranged

from 5 to 11 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ (Table 2), epilimnetic TN ranged from 208 to 267 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, and epilimnetic TN/TP ratios ranged from 19 to 44.

Clear differences in epi- and metalimnetic cyanobacteria biomass emerged by late August after anoxia and internal Fe loading developed (Figure 9b). The non- N_2 -fixer *Planktothrix* was the dominant taxon in metalimnetic samples collected in late August, reaching 1,600 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in early September (89% of phytoplankton biomass, Figure 9c). The cyanobacteria biomass was less than 60 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in the epilimnion during the summer, never exceeding 8% of phytoplankton biomass (Figure 9c).

North Bay (2014)

DO exceeded 0.5 mg L^{-1} throughout the water column to the bottom at 16 m until the end of July (Figure 10a). The top of the anoxic zone reached its shallowest depth of 8 m at the end of August and then began to move downwards. There was a small increase in dissolved Fe of 9 and 20 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ at 14 and 15 m between late July and late August (Figure 10a), then much larger increases occurred at these depths (463 and 739 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, respectively) by mid-September (Table 2). There was no evidence of internal P loading after anoxia was detected with hypolimnetic concentrations less than 10 $\mu\text{g P L}^{-1}$ throughout the sampling period except very close to the sediments late in the season in September and October (Table 2). Epilimnetic TP ranged from 6 to 15 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ (Table 2), epilimnetic TN ranged from 316 to 450 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, and epilimnetic TN/TP ratios ranged from 29 to 73. Epilimnetic NH_4^+ was below the detection limit throughout the study period while epilimnetic NO_3^- was low in mid-June (7 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$), increasing to higher levels in July and August (184 - 202 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$).

Cyanobacteria growth began between late July and late August coincident with development of anoxia and small increases in internal Fe^{2+} loading (Figure 10b). Cyanobacteria biomass was low and never dominated the phytoplankton community in the epilimnion and the metalimnion (Figure 10c). Maximum biomass and proportions were reached in the epilimnion in mid-September ($244 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, 23% of total phytoplankton biomass) and in the metalimnion in early October ($309 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, 41% of total phytoplankton biomass). Cyanobacteria consisted primarily of *Dolichospermum* and *Aphanizomenon*.

TN and TP correlations with biomass

Mean epilimnetic and metalimnetic cyanobacteria biomass was highly correlated with mean epilimnetic and metalimnetic TN ($r = 0.91$) and mean TP ($r = 0.94$) ($n = 5$, (3 epilimnia and 2 metalimnia)) in 2012 but not in 2014 ($r = -0.02$ for TP and -0.26 for TN, $n = 6$, (3 epilimnia and 3 metalimnia)).

Dissolved inorganic nitrogen

In 2012, epilimnetic NO_3^- and NH_4^+ concentrations were depleted (i.e., below the detection limit) by the end of June in Sturgeon and Deep Bay (Figure 11, Table 2) and subsequently, the dominant cyanobacteria in both lakes was N_2 -fixing *Dolichospermum*. In Twelve Mile Bay, metalimnetic NH_4^+ was depleted by early July while NO_3^- was available until the end of July. The metalimnion was dominated by non- N_2 -fixing *Planktothrix*. NH_4^+ peaked briefly in Sturgeon and Twelve Mile as N_2 -fixing cyanobacteria became dominant and peaked one month before dominance in Deep Bay. NO_3^- and NH_4^+ concentrations were higher in Sturgeon and Deep Bay in 2014 than in 2012 (Figure 11). The positive relationship between

Dolichospermum and epilimnetic NH_4^+ illustrated in the RDA diagram (Figure 6) was influenced in large part by the buildup in mid-season of NH_4^+ from leakage or senescence associated with the large population of *Dolichospermum* (Figure 11).

Discussion

Do the observations support the Cyano-Fe model?

An important feature of this study is that it interprets ecological and biogeochemical observations from several naturally anoxic, unproductive embayments as well as a meso-eutrophic embayment within a novel framework (the Cyano-Fe model) to explain cyanobacteria dominance and blooms across the productivity gradient. The framework tells us that the factors that control dominance operate in both oligotrophic and eutrophic lakes and that cyanobacteria dominance in oligotrophic lakes differs from blooms in more productive lakes only by the size of the populations. We cannot ignore N and P but the framework forces us to look beyond them.

Two pre-conditions, warm temperatures and sediment anoxia with internal Fe^{2+} loading, were necessary for cyanobacteria dominance in all embayments regardless of TP, DIN and TN concentrations. Cyanobacteria did not dominate in 2014 when temperatures were cooler although anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading occurred (but reached 30% of phytoplankton biomass in Sturgeon Bay). Three pre-conditions were needed to generate both cyanobacteria dominance and a large, visibly blooming population: high P levels, internal Fe^{2+} loading and warm temperatures. These three pre-conditions were present only in Sturgeon Bay in 2012. These results support the Cyano-Fe conceptual model described by Molot et al. (2014) but modified to include the impact of water temperature on cyanobacteria growth rate.

Mean epilimnetic and metalimnetic cyanobacteria biomass was highly correlated with mean epilimnetic and metalimnetic TN and mean TP in 2012 but not in 2014. These correlations are consistent with the fact that higher nutrient levels support more biomass when temperatures are warm but cannot be used to infer that either N or P concentrations were responsible for cyanobacteria dominance in light of cyanobacteria dominance of the oligotrophic embayments in 2012.

There was no consistent pattern between cyanobacteria dominance and DIN in the embayments. Negative correlations between low NO_3^- and cyanobacteria biomass have been reported before (McQueen and Lean 1987; Nürnberg 2007) and have been interpreted by some as a causal relationship in which cyanobacteria purportedly have a competitive advantage at low NO_3^- and higher NH_4^+ (Hyenstrand et al. 1998). However, in 2012 both NH_4^+ and NO_3^- were depleted in the weeks preceding cyanobacteria population growth (conditions during this critical period determine the outcome of cyanobacteria versus eukaryotic algae competition) in Sturgeon Bay and Twelve Mile Bay and in Deep Bay, NO_3^- was higher than NH_4^+ so it seems unlikely that a low NO_3^- / high NH_4^+ ratio regulated the outcome of competition between cyanobacteria and eukaryotic algae.

High TN/TP ratios suggest that the embayments were P-limited but they could have been N-limited for short periods of time when DIN was undetectable in the euphotic zone, especially in Sturgeon Bay and Deep Bay which were dominated by N_2 -fixing *Dolichospermum*. DIN depletion may have contributed to growth of N_2 fixers in 2012. The NH_4^+ spike during the cyanobacteria growth periods may have been leakage from N_2 fixation or senescence. N_2 fixation is an Fe-rich process (see review of Fe requirements in Molot et al. 2014) so it is not surprising that growth of N_2 fixers occurred during periods of anoxia accompanied by internal Fe^{2+} loading.

Among the embayments and years, there were no consistent patterns in P concentration before initiation of cyanobacteria population growth and during the periods of cyanobacteria growth. For example, internal P loading occurred in Sturgeon but not in Twelve Mile Bay or Deep Bay in 2012 although all three embayments were dominated by cyanobacteria and had anoxic hypolimnia. In Sturgeon Bay, cyanobacteria did not exceed 50% of the phytoplankton biomass in 2014 even in the presence of internal P loading.

The time series monitoring used in this study reinforces the conclusions of other studies, e.g., the experimental removal of Fe^{2+} in Lake 227 (Molot et al. 2010) and observations in Lake 227 and Hamilton Harbour (Molot et al. 2014), that show an important role for internal Fe^{2+} loading in the competitive outcome between eukaryotic algae and cyanobacteria.

Episodic anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading may promote cyanobacteria bloom formation in shallow polymictic lakes. The sediment-water interface in eutrophic Missisquoi Bay, Lake Champlain, was hypoxic ($\sim 1 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$) at the beginning of a cyanobacteria bloom on July 27 and 28, 2008 (Smith et al. 2011). Fe^{2+} was detected 2-3 mm below the sediment surface although the very high detection limit of the voltammetric method ($\sim 1100 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ for Fe^{2+} compared to $1.0 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ for total Fe using ICP-MS) does not exclude the possibility that biologically relevant concentrations occurred much closer to or even above the sediment surface. In late August, the full bloom in Missisquoi Bay was coincident with anoxic conditions and relatively high concentrations of Fe^{2+} ($1100\text{-}2200 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$) at the sediment water interface suggesting that winds were light and water column mixing was not turbulent which would allow an anoxic boundary layer to form at the sediment/water interface. In eutrophic, polymictic Clear Lake in California, where an *Aphanizomenon* bloom occurred each spring, the sediment surface was frequently anoxic but often of short duration (Wurtsbaugh and Horne 1983).

The Baltic Sea is a eutrophic, brackish water system with a long history of cyanobacteria blooms (Kahru et al. 2007; Funkey et al. 2014). In a paleolimnological study in the Baltic Sea, hypoxia and cyanobacteria abundance were correlated during an 8,000 year period (Funkey et al. 2014). The increased abundance may have been caused by higher P concentrations from internal P loading. Phosphate release is typically coupled to reduction of ferric hydroxides which release Fe^{2+} when sediments become anoxic (Jensen and Andersen 1992), so if internal P loading occurred during episodes of water column hypoxia, it is possible that internal Fe^{2+} loading also occurred.

Favourable conditions for cyanobacterial dominance may exist in other naturally anoxic oligotrophic embayments along the Georgian Bay coast although TP concentrations in these embayments are not high enough to cause large surface blooms. Favourable growth conditions for cyanobacteria in these embayments include a combination of natural anoxia caused by incomplete spring turnover (Molot et al. 1992), an adequate source of easily reducible Fe in sediments and SO_4^{2-} concentrations low enough not to completely inhibit internal Fe^{2+} loading via formation of Fe sulphides (Loh et al. 2013).

Water level, warmer waters and incidence of cyanobacteria blooms

The publically perceived increase in cyanobacteria blooms in Sturgeon Bay after 1990 (Schiefer 2003; Georgian Bay Association 2016) may be related to a warming trend rather than to changes in land use or water level in Georgian Bay (Figure 2). Water levels were consistently at the low end of the historical range between 1999 and 2014 but were at the higher end between 1990 and 1998 (Figure 2) (Gronewald and Stowe 2014), hence, it appears unlikely that changes in water levels alone explain all of the blooms reported after 1990. Diatom-inferred TP concentrations in Sturgeon Bay have been stable and relatively high (20-24 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$)

since about 1800, suggesting that the TP enriched state is natural (Cumming et al. 2006) and thus not a result of cottage development in recent decades.

Cumming et al. (2006) also reported increases in pigment concentrations of total diatoms and colonial cyanobacteria in Sturgeon Bay occurred after approximately 1950, which are consistent with public reports of increased incidence of cyanobacteria blooms. It was speculated that shifts in diatom species composition in recent decades to those that prefer more stable thermal stratification can be attributed to climate change and warmer surface waters. The Muskoka A weather records show a warming trend between 1950 and 2004 but the record does not go back far enough to compare pre- and post-1950 periods. An analysis of Canadian weather records by Zhang et al. (2000) between 1900 and 1998 revealed a summer warming trend in the Georgian Bay area of about 1°C per 99 years in daily maximum air temperature and over 2°C per 99 years in daily minimum air temperature, most of which seem to have occurred after 1950. While the effect of warmer maximum daily air temperatures during the summer on lake warming is well understood, the increase in daily minimum air temperatures is no less important if it decreases overnight cooling (Lehman 2002).

While the extent of anoxia, nutrients and implied availability of Fe^{2+} (from dissolved Fe profiles) were similar in 2012 and 2014 in Sturgeon Bay, temperatures were not and we conclude that cyanobacteria growth was probably influenced by temperature. The net cyanobacteria growth rate in cooler 2014 was about 30% of the net growth rate in 2012. The warming regional climate is consistent with the public perception of increased incidence of cyanobacteria blooms in Sturgeon Bay and in Ontario in general (Winter et al. 2011).

While cyanobacteria may respond to warmer summers with higher growth rates, other climate-related mechanisms might also favour their dominance such as longer ice-free seasons

and thermal stratification periods (Stainsby et al. 2011). These longer periods will lengthen the extent of the hypolimnetic oxygen depletion season which, in turn, could lead to an increase in the spatial and temporal extent of anoxia (Foley et al. 2012; North et al. 2014) and internal Fe^{2+} loading, especially in lakes that are susceptible to development of anoxia. Analysis of long-term oxygen and temperature records from Lake Simcoe in central Ontario shows that the lengthening of the ice-free season since 1980 by 30 days was accompanied by a lengthening of the oxygen depletion period in the hypolimnion (Li 2016).

Implications of the Cyano-Fe model for management

To prevent cyanobacteria blooms, the amount of substances contributing to exhaustion of dissolved oxygen must be lowered to levels that maintain surface sediments in an oxidized state. If a P removal program in a eutrophic system does little to improve sediment redox, then blooms will continue although productivity might be lower under the new loading regime.

The Cyano-Fe model can contribute to improved eutrophication management by leading us to design TP concentration and loading targets that prevent low redox levels in surficial sediments. For example, the current guideline for maximum acceptable TP concentration in Ontario is $20 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ (Ontario Ministry of Environment and Energy, 1994) which is assumed to prevent cyanobacteria blooms based on historical data. However, increasing incidences of blooms in Lake Erie (Conroy et al. 2005; Michalak et al. 2013) and in inland oligotrophic and mesotrophic lakes in recent years (Carey et al. 2008; Winter et al. 2011) suggest that this target is not universally applicable and more stringent targets may now be required for some lakes. The relationship between sediment redox and bloom formation suggests that nutrients (and perhaps organic matter loading, especially to polymictic systems) should be managed with explicit

objectives to decrease productivity and DO consumption to nutrient levels that will maintain DO concentrations above a critical level at the sediment/water interface.

If external TP loading criteria were based on a mechanistic understanding of the relationship between external P loading, anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading for a given lake and climate regime, lake-specific loading targets could be developed to decrease the spatial and temporal extent of anoxia. Similarly, *in situ* aeration might be more effective at preventing cyanobacteria blooms if systems were designed to deliver oxygen at a rate that leaves surficial sediments with a sufficiently high redox over a larger lake area, including shallow bays, than is currently considered necessary.

Schindler and his colleagues argued that N removal would have little impact on bloom formation in eutrophic lakes because N_2 fixation compensates for N losses sufficiently to allow cyanobacteria to dominate (Schindler 2012; Schindler et al. 2012, 2016). The amount of N_2 fixed will depend on the N debt but we hypothesize that it is also dependent on the supply rate of Fe^{2+} . Schindler's argument is based in part on continued dominance by N_2 fixing cyanobacteria in Lake 227 for more than 20 years after experimental N additions ceased in 1990 while experimental P additions continued (Paterson et al. 2011; Schindler 2012; Schindler et al. 2012, 2016). The Lake 227 experiment clearly showed that N_2 fixation, even if operating only for a short but critical time, has been sufficient for cyanobacteria to continue dominating the lake with no significant decline in their biomass (Paterson et al. 2011). The Cyano-Fe model explains the post 1990 blooms in Lake 227 after N additions ceased and the lake became N-limited. Continued anoxia in the hypolimnion allowed high rates of internal Fe^{2+} loading (Molot et al. 2010) to support N_2 fixation, a process that has high Fe demands (see review in Molot et al. 2014) and is energetically costly (Stam et al. 1987). Scott and McCarthy (2010) argued that N_2

fixation rates are, in general, too low to alleviate N deficiency, however, N₂ fixation was clearly important in Clear Lake, California, providing over 40% of the annual N budget (Horne and Goldman 1972) even though N₂ fixation was at times Fe-limited (Wurtsbaugh and Horne 1983). The evidence to date and the Cyano-Fe model suggest that if managers want to shut off N₂ fixation, they will have to shut off internal Fe²⁺ loading.

Laboratory studies indicate that N removal will have a negligible impact on cyanobacteria growth in natural systems as long as sufficient micronutrients including Fe²⁺ are available. Growth rates and maximum biomass yields of heterocystous N₂ fixers in nutrient-replete, single-species laboratory cultures using only N₂ as a source of N were only slightly different (approximately 10%) than when grown with NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ (Allen and Arnon 1955; Bagchi et al. 1985; Schlangstedt et al. 1987; Vargas et al. 1988). A lower growth rate caused by partial or whole dependence on N₂ implies that it will take longer for an N₂-fixing cyanobacteria population to reach its maximum yield. It is also possible that the lag phase of the growth curve might be longer *in situ* which could affect the timing of bloom onset and maximum biomass. Nevertheless, all of the NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ had to be removed from these cultures to achieve a modest difference in maximum population size.

There is, however, one exception regarding the effectiveness of N removal. The Cyano-Fe model predicts that cyanobacteria dominance will cease with nutrient removal only if sediment redox is maintained at a level that suppresses reduction of Fe³⁺ to Fe²⁺. In aquatic systems where P controls have not been able to sufficiently diminish internal Fe²⁺ loading rates, i.e., systems in which sediment redox remains low, and additional P controls are not feasible, nitrification of NH₄⁺ without N removal in wastewater treatment plants (WWTP) (i.e., no denitrification step) might be beneficial in cases where external N loading to watersheds is

dominated by WWTP point sources because *in situ* nitrification by nitrifying bacteria can be a major oxygen sink in eutrophic lakes (Müller et al. 2012; Clevinger et al. 2014). WWTP nitrification will lower *in situ* oxygen demand and could raise the sediment redox level sufficiently in watersheds where point source N loads are relatively large. In addition, subsequent *in situ* NO_3^- -based respiration can raise sediment redox, thicken the oxidized layer in surficial sediments, and suppress internal P and Fe^{2+} loading (Jensen and Andersen 1992; Kleeberg and Kozerski 1997; Hemond and Lin 2010). Hence, WWTP nitrification before effluent discharge might be a beneficial course of action in some situations as long as aquatic health standards for NO_3^- are not exceeded. The emphasis here is on the impact that WWTP nitrification has on sediment redox, not on phytoplankton macronutrient supply since the total external N supply will not be affected (although internal loading of N and P might be lowered by a higher sediment redox). Nutrient export from diffuse urban and agricultural sources is acknowledged as very important in many watersheds but discussion of management of diffuse sources is beyond the scope of this paper.

If N removal fails to suppress a bloom because of a failure to improve sediment redox, it will shift cyanobacteria species composition to N_2 fixers if it shifts a lake from P to N deficiency. It may also affect cyanobacteria toxin production although the impact on toxin production is unclear (Pick 2016). Low N appears to mitigate toxin production in non- N_2 -fixing *Microcystis* (Harke et al. 2015; Gobler et al. 2016), however, N_2 fixing *Aphanizomenon* produces more toxin under moderate N stress (Gagnon and Pick 2012). These studies suggest that toxin production varies unevenly along an N gradient from strongly excessive N relative to P to severe N depletion.

A final management consideration is that WWTP N removal (both nitrification and denitrification) might be needed in some locations to help mitigate marine coastal eutrophication (i.e., reduce coastal productivity), especially in riverine systems with large point source loads and low N retention rates.

This study represents the first test of the Cyano-Fe conceptual model in natural systems. This and other studies (Molot et al. 2010, 2014) support the model modified to include the impact of water temperature on cyanobacteria growth rate. The collective evidence from contrasting oligotrophic and meso-eutrophic freshwater systems suggests that warm temperatures, anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading are critical pre-conditions for cyanobacteria dominance and these pre-conditions along with high P are needed for relatively large, visible blooms to form.

The Cyano-Fe model could be useful for improved management of cyanobacteria blooms but more work is needed to test validity of this conceptual model that couples the oxidation state of surficial sediments and geochemical cycles to cyanobacteria bloom formation under a range of real conditions, especially in polymictic and brackish waters. Paying close attention to the period prior to bloom onset will be critical to improving our mechanistic understanding of how blooms form.

A warming climate will increase the risk of sediment anoxia and internal Fe^{2+} loading as well as increase water temperatures into a more optimal range for cyanobacteria growth in temperate regions. A warming climate, therefore, has implications for greater incidence of cyanobacteria dominance along a trophic gradient and bloom formation in P rich waters.

Acknowledgements

This study was funded by grants from Georgian Bay Forever, Environment Canada's Lake Simcoe/Southeastern Georgian Bay Clean-up Fund and Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada. We are grateful to David Sweetnam (GBF) and participating cottagers for their assistance, to Dr. Sue Watson for her advice and to several reviewers for their constructive comments.

References

- American Society for Testing Materials. 2008. Standard test method for total chemically bound nitrogen in water by pyrolysis and chemiluminescence detection, ASTM-D5176-2008. Available from <https://www.document-center.com/standards/show/ASTM-D5176/history/2008%20R15%20EDITION>.
- Allen, M.B. and Arnon, D.I. 1955. Studies on nitrogen-fixing blue-green algae. I. Growth and nitrogen fixation by *Anabaena cylindrica* lemm. Plant Physiol. **30**: 366-372.
- American Water Works Association. 1999. Standard methods for the examination of water and wastewater, 20th Ed. Volume 11.02 Water (II).
- Bagchi, S.N., Sharma, R. and Singh, H.N. 1985. Inorganic nitrogen control of growth, chlorophyll, and protein level in cyanobacterium *Nostoc muscorum*. J. Plant Physiol. **121**: 73-81.
- Butterwick, C., Heaney, S.I. and Talling, J.F. 2005. Diversity in the influence of temperature on the growth rates of freshwater algae, and its ecological relevance. Freshwat. Biol. **50**: 291-300.

- 719 Camacho, A., Garcia-Piche, I. F., Vicente, E. and Castenholz, R. W. 1996. Adaptation to sulfide
720 and to the underwater light field in three cyanobacterial isolates from Lake Arcas (Spain).
721 FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. **21**: 293–301.
- 722 Camacho, A., Vicente, E. and Miracle, M. 2000. Ecology of a deep-living *Oscillatoria*
723 (=Planktothrix) population in the sulphide-rich waters of a Spanish karstic lake. Archiv für
724 Hydrobiologie, **148**: 333–355.
- 725 Carey, C. C., Weathers, K. C. and Cottingham, K. L. 2008. *Gloeotrichia echinulata* blooms in an
726 oligotrophic lake: helpful insights from eutrophic lakes. J. Plank. Res. **30**: 893–904.
- 727 Chapra, S. C., Dove, A. and Warren, G. J. 2012. Long-term trends of Great Lakes major ion
728 chemistry. J Great Lakes Res. **38**: 550–560.
- 729 Chen, H., Burke, J. M., Dinsmore, W. P., Prepas, E. E. and Fedorak, P. M. 2007. First assessment
730 of cyanobacterial blooms and microcystin-LR in the Canadian portion of Lake of the
731 Woods. Lake Reservoir Manage. **23**: 169–178.
- 732 Chen, H., Burke, J. M., Mosind, T., Fedorak, P. M. and Prepas, E. E. 2009. Cyanobacteria and
733 microcystin-LR in a complex system representing a range in trophic status: Lake of the
734 Woods, Ontario, Canada. J. Plankton Res. **31**: 993–1008.
- 735 Clevinger, C. C., Heath, R. T. and Bade, D. L. 2014. Oxygen use by nitrification in the
736 hypolimnion and sediments of Lake Erie. J. Great Lakes Res. **40**: 202–207.
- 737 Cole, J. F. and Christian, R. C. 2000. Effect of temperature on photosynthesis-light response and
738 growth of four phytoplankton species isolated from a tidal freshwater river. J. Phycol. **36**:
739 7–16.

- 740 Conroy, J.D, Kane, D. Dolan, D.M., Edwards, W.J., Charlton, M.N. and Culver, D.A. 2005.
741 Temporal trends in Lake Erie plankton biomass: Roles of external phosphorus loading and
742 dreissenid mussels. *J. Great Lakes Res.* **31**: 89–110.
- 743 Cook, R.B. 1984. Distributions of ferrous iron and sulfide in an anoxic hypolimnion. *Can. J.*
744 *Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **41**: 286-93.
- 745 Cumming, B., Laird, K. and Enache, M. 2006. Assessment of changes in total phosphorus in
746 Sturgeon Bay, Ontario: A paleolimnological assessment. Report for EcoMetrix
747 Incorporated, Mississauga, ON (www.ecometrix.ca).
- 748 Dolan, D.M. 1993. Point source loadings of phosphorus to Lake Erie: 1986-1990. *J. Great Lakes*
749 *Res.* **19**: 212-223.
- 750 Downing, J.A., Watson, S.B. and McCauley, E. 2001. Predicting Cyanobacteria dominance in
751 lakes. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **58**: 1905-1908.
- 752 Foley, B., Jones, I.D., Maberly, S.C. and Rippey, B. 2012. Long-term changes in oxygen
753 depletion in a small temperate lake: effects of climate change and eutrophication. *Freshwat.*
754 *Biol.* **57**: 278-289.
- 755 Funkey, C.P. Conley, D.J., Reuss, N.S., Humborg, C., Jilbert, T. and Slomp, C.P. 2014. Hypoxia
756 sustains cyanobacteria blooms in the Baltic Sea. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **48**: 2598-2602.
- 757 Gagnon, A. and Pick, F.R. 2012. Effect of nitrogen on cellular production and release of the
758 neurotoxin anatoxin-a in a nitrogen-fixing cyanobacterium. *Front. Microbiol.* June 12.
759 <http://dx.doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2012.00211>.
- 760 Georgian Bay Association. Water (Water Quality and Water levels). Available from
761 <http://www.georgianbayassociation.com/water-quality> [accessed 2 May 2016].

- 762 Gervais, F., Siedel, U., Heilmann, B., Weithoff, G., Heisig-Gunkel, G. and Nicklisch A. 2003.
763 Small-scale vertical distribution of phytoplankton, nutrients and sulphide below the
764 oxycline of a mesotrophic lake. *J. Plank. Res.* **25**: 273–278.
- 765 Gobler, C.J., Burkholder, J.M., Davis, T.W., Harke, M.J., Johengen, T., Stow, C.A. and Van de
766 Waal, D.B. 2016. The dual role of nitrogen supply in controlling the growth and toxicity of
767 cyanobacterial blooms. *Harmful Algae*. **54**: 87-97
- 768 Gronewald, N.D. and Stow, C.A. 2014. Water loss from the Great Lakes. *Science*. **343**: 1084-
769 1085.
- 770 Harke, M.J., Davis, T.W., Watson, S.B. and Gobler, C.J. 2015. Nutrient-controlled niche
771 differentiation of western Lake Erie cyanobacterial populations revealed via
772 metatranscriptomic surveys. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **15**: 604-614.
- 773 Head, R.M., Jones, R.I. and Bailey-Watts, A.E. 1999. Vertical movements by planktonic
774 cyanobacteria and the translocation of phosphorus: implications for lake restoration.
775 *Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems*. **9**: 111–120.
- 776 Healey, F.P. and Hendzel, L.L. 1979. Indicators of phosphorus and nitrogen deficiency in five
777 algae in culture. *J. Fish. Res. Bd. Can.* **36**: 1364-1369.
- 778 Hemond, H.F. and Lin, K. 2010. Nitrate suppresses internal phosphorus loading in an eutrophic
779 lake. *Wat. Res.* **44**: 3645-3650.
- 780 Hillebrand, H., Durselen, C.-D., Kirschtel, D., Pollinger, U. and Zohary, T. 1999. Biovolume
781 calculation for pelagic and benthic microalgae. *J. Phycol.* **35**: 403–424.
- 782 Hyenstrand, P., Blomqvist, P. and Pettersson, A. 1998. Factors determining cyanobacterial
783 success in aquatic systems: a literature review. *Archiv fur Hydrobiologie, Special Issues in*
784 *Advanced Limnology*. **51**: 41–62.

- 785 International Joint Commission. 2013. Assessment of progress made towards restoring and
786 maintaining Great Lakes water quality since 1987. Sixteenth biennial report on Great Lakes
787 water quality. Available from
788 <http://www.ijc.org/files/publications/16th%20BR%20long%2020130514.pdf> [accessed
789 July 22, 2016]
- 790 Jasprica, N. 2002. Cell volume and carbon measurements in marine phytoplankton. In D.V.
791 Subba Rao (ed.), *Pelagic ecology methodology*. A.A. Balkema Publishers, Exton.
- 792 Jensen, H.K. and Andersen, F.Ø. 1992. Importance of temperature, nitrate, and pH for phosphate
793 release from aerobic sediments of four shallow, eutrophic lakes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **37**:
794 577-589.
- 795 Kahru, M., Savchuk, O.P. and Elmgren, R. 2007. Satellite measurements of cyanobacterial
796 bloom frequency in the Baltic Sea: interannual and spatial variability. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*
797 **343**: 15-23.
- 798 Kleeberg, A. and Kozerski, H.-P. 1997. Phosphorus release in Lake Großer Müggelsee and its
799 implications for lake restoration. *Hydrobiologia.* **342/343**: 9-26.
- 800 Konopka, A. and Brock, T.D. 1978. Effect of temperature on blue-green algae (Cyanobacteria)
801 in Lake Mendota. *Applied Environ. Microbiol.* **36**: 572-576.
- 802 Kranzler, C., Rudolf, M., Keren, N., and Schleif, E. 2013. Iron in Cyanobacteria. *In* *Advances in*
803 *Botanical Research*. Elsevier. pp. 57-94.
- 804 Lehman, J.T. 2002. Mixing patterns and plankton biomass of the St. Lawrence Great Lakes
805 under climate change scenarios. *J. Great Lakes Res.* **28**: 583–596.

- 806 Li, J. 2016. Long-term changes in hypolimnetic dissolved oxygen and phytoplankton community
807 composition in Lake Simcoe, Ontario and revisiting dissolved oxygen profile models for
808 small inland lakes in central Ontario. Masters thesis, York University, Toronto, Canada.
- 809 Li, Z.-K., Dai, G.-Z., Juneau, P., and Qiu, B.-S. 2016. Capsular polysaccharides facilitate
810 enhanced iron acquisition by the colonial cyanobacterium *Microcystis* sp. isolated from a
811 freshwater lake. *J. Phycol.* **52**: 105-115.
- 812 Loh, P.S., Molot, L.A., Nürnberg, G.K., Watson, S.B. and Ginn, B. 2013. P and Fe release rates
813 from anoxic sediments in Lake Simcoe, Lake Winnipeg and Hamilton Harbor and their
814 relationship to sediment fractions. Can release be predicted by sediment fraction
815 chemistry? *Inland Waters.* **3**: 105-118.
- 816 Lund, J.W., Kipling, G.C. and Le Cren, E.D. 1958. The inverted microscope method of
817 estimating algal numbers and the statistical basis of estimations by counting. *Hydrobiologia*
818 **11**: 143-170.
- 819 McQueen, D.J. and Lean, D.R.S. 1987. Influence of water temperature and nitrogen to
820 phosphorus ratios on the dominance of blue-green algae in Lake St. George, Ontario. *Can.*
821 *J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **44**: 598-604.
- 822 Michalak, A.M., Anderson, E.J., Beletsky, D., Boland, S., Bosche, N.S., Bridgeman, T.B.,
823 Chaffin, J.D., Cho, K., Confesor, R., Daloglu, I., DePinto, J.V., Evans, M.A., Fahnenstiel,
824 G.L., He, L., Ho, J.C., Jenkins, L., Johengen, T.H., Kuo, K.C., LaPorte, E., Liu, X.,
825 McWilliams, M.R., Moore, M.R., Posselt, D.J., Richards, R.P., Scavia, D., Steiner, A.L.,
826 Verhamme, E., Wright, D.M. and Zagorski, M.A. 2013. Record-setting algal bloom in Lake
827 Erie caused by agricultural and meteorological trends consistent with expected future
828 conditions. *PNAS* **110**: 6448-6452.

- 829 Molot, L.A., P.J. Dillon, B. Clark and B. Neary. 1992. Predicting end-of-summer oxygen profiles
830 in stratified lakes. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **49**: 2363 -2372.
- 831 Molot, L.A. and Dillon, P.J. 2003. Variation in iron, aluminum and dissolved organic carbon
832 mass transfer coefficients in lakes. *Wat. Res.* **37**: 1759–1768.
- 833 Molot, L.A., Li G., Findlay, D.L. and Watson, S.B. 2010. Iron-mediated suppression of bloom-
834 forming cyanobacteria by oxine in a eutrophic lake. *Fresh. Biol.* **55**: 1102–1117.
- 835 Molot, L.A., Watson, S.B., Creed, I.F., Trick, C.G., McCabe, S.K., Verschoor, M.J., Sorichetti,
836 R.J., Powe, C., Venkiteswaran, J.J. and Schiff, S. L. 2014. A novel model for cyanobacteria
837 bloom formation: the critical role of anoxia and ferrous iron. *Fresh. Biol.* **59**: 1323-1340.
- 838 Müller. B., Bryant, L.D., Matzinger, A. and Wüest, A. 2012. Hypolimnetic oxygen depletion in
839 eutrophic lakes. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **46**: 9964-9971.
- 840 North, R.P., North, R.L., Livingstone, D.M., Köster, O. and Kipfer, R. 2014. Long-term changes
841 in hypoxia and soluble reactive phosphorus in the hypolimnion of a large temperate lake:
842 consequences of a climate regime shift. *Global Change Biology.* **20**: 811-823.
- 843 Nürnberg, G.K. 1984. The prediction of internal phosphorus load in lakes with anoxic
844 hypolimnia. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **29**: 111-124.
- 845 Nürnberg, G.K., Shaw, M., Dillon, P.J. and McQueen, D.J. 1986. Internal phosphorus load in an
846 oligotrophic Precambrian Shield lake with an anoxic hypolimnion. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.*
847 **43**: 574-580.
- 848 Nürnberg, G.K. and Dillon, P.J. 1993. Iron budgets in temperate lakes. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.*
849 **45**: 1728–37.
- 850 Nürnberg, G.K. 1995. Quantifying anoxia in lakes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **40**: 1100-1111.

- 851 Nürnberg, G.K. 2007. Low-Nitrate-Days (LND), a potential indicator of cyanobacteria blooms in
852 a eutrophic hardwater reservoir. *Wat. Qual. Res. J. Can.* **42**: 269-283.
- 853 Olenina, I., Hajdu, S., Edler, L., Andersson, A., Wasmund, N., Busch, S., Göbel, J., Gromisz, S.,
854 Huseby, S., Huttunen, M., Jaanus, A., Kokkonen, P., Ledaine, I. and Niemkiewicz, E.
855 2006. Biovolumes and size-classes of phytoplankton in the Baltic Sea. HELCOM Balt. Sea
856 Environ. Proc. No. 106, 144pp.
- 857 Ontario Ministry of Environment and Energy. 1994. Water Management Policies Guidelines and
858 Provincial Water Quality Objectives. Toronto, Ontario, Canada.
- 859 Paerl, H.W. and Husiman, J. 2009. Climate change: a catalyst for global expansion of harmful
860 cyanobacterial blooms. *Environmental Microbiol. Reports.* **1**: 27-37.
- 861 Paerl, H.W., Xu, H., McCarthy, M.J., Zhu, G., Qin, B., Li, Y. and Gardner, W.S. 2011.
862 Controlling harmful cyanobacterial blooms in a hyper-eutrophic lake (Lake Taihu, China):
863 The need for a dual nutrient (N & P) management strategy. *Wat. Res.* **45**: 1973-1983.
- 864 Paterson, M.J., Schindler, D.W., Hecky, R.E., Findlay, D.L. and Rondeau, K.J. 2011. Comment:
865 Lake 227 shows clearly that controlling inputs of nitrogen will not reduce or prevent
866 eutrophication of lakes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **56**: 1545-1547.
- 867 Pick, F.R. 2016. Blooming algae: a Canadian perspective on the rise of toxic cyanobacteria. *Can.*
868 *J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **73**: 1149-1158.
- 869 Prescott, G. 1970. How to know the freshwater algae. Pictured Key Series. Dubuque (Iowa): Wm
870 C Brown Co.
- 871 Rickard, R.D. and Morse, J.W. 2005. Acid volatile sulfide (AVS). *Mar. Chem.* **97**, 141–197.

- 872 Robarts, R.D. and Zohary, T. 1987. Temperature effects on photosynthetic capacity, respiration,
873 and growth rates of bloom-forming cyanobacteria. New Zealand J. Mar. Freshwat. Res. **21**:
874 391-399.
- 875 Rose, A.L., Salmon, T., Lukondeh, T., Neilan, B.A. and Waite, T.D. 2005. Use of superoxide as
876 an electron shuttle for iron acquisition by the marine cyanobacterium *Lyngbya majuscula*
877 Environ. Sci. Technol. **39**: 3708-3715.
- 878 Sakamoto, M. 1966. Primary production by phytoplankton community in some Japanese lakes
879 and its dependence on lake depth. Arch. Hydrobiol. **62**: 1-28.
- 880 Schiefer K. 2003. Water quality study of Sturgeon Bay. A report prepared for the Township of
881 the Archipelago, Ontario.
- 882 Schiefer, K. 2005. Water quality survey of Deep Bay, 2005. A report prepared for Carling
883 Township, Ontario.
- 884 Schiefer, K., Schiefer, K. and Wianko, 2007. Water quality monitoring 2007, Township of
885 Georgian Bay. Report prepared for Georgian Bay Forever, Ontario.
- 886 Schiefer, K. and Schiefer, K. 2010. Water quality monitoring, Township of Georgian Bay.
887 Summary report 2001-2009. Report prepared for Georgian Bay Forever, Ontario.
- 888 Schindler, D.W. 2012. The dilemma of controlling cultural eutrophication. Proc. Royal Soc. B.
889 **279**: 4322-4333.
- 890 Schindler, D.W. and Fee, E.J. 1974. Experimental Lakes Area: Whole-lake experiments in
891 eutrophication. J. Fish. Res. Bd Can. **31**: 937-953.
- 892 Schindler, D.W., Hecky, R.E., Findlay, D.L., Stainton, M.P., Parker, B.R., Paterson, M.J., Beaty,
893 K.G., Lyng, M. and Kasian, S.E.M. 2012. Eutrophication of lakes cannot be controlled by

- 894 reducing nitrogen input: Results of a 37-year whole-ecosystem experiment. Proc. National
895 Acad. Sci. **105**: 11254-11258.
- 896 Schindler, D.W., S.R. Carpenter, S.R., Chapra, S.C., Hecky, R.E. and Orihel, D.M. 2016.
897 Reducing phosphorus to curb lake eutrophication is a success. Environ. Sci. Technol. DOI:
898 10.1021/acs.est.6b02204.
- 899 Schlangstedt, M., Bisen, P.S., Dudel, G. and Kohl, J.-G. 1987. Interaction of combined nitrogen
900 availability and light in the regulation of growth, heterocyst differentiation and dinitrogen
901 fixation of the planktic blue-green alga *Anabaena solitaria* Kleb. Arch. Protistenkd. **134**:
902 389-396.
- 903 Scott, J.T. and McCarthy, M.J. 2010. Nitrogen fixation may not balance the nitrogen pool in
904 lakes over timescales relevant to eutrophication management. Limnol. Oceanogr. **55**: 1265-
905 1270.
- 906 Smith, L., Watzin, M.C. and Druschel, G. 2011. Relating sediment phosphorus mobility to
907 seasonal and diel redox fluctuations at the sediment-water interface in a eutrophic
908 freshwater lake. Limnol. Oceanogr. **56**: 2251-2264.
- 909 Sorichetti, R.J., Creed, I.F., and Trick, C.G. 2016. Iron and iron-binding ligands as cofactors that
910 limit cyanobacterial biomass across a lake trophic gradient. Freshwat. Biol. **61**: 146-157.
- 911 Stainsby, E.A., Winter, J.G., Jarjanzi, H., Paterson, A.M, Evans, D.O. and Young, J.D. 2011.
912 Changes in the thermal stability of Lake Simcoe from 1980 to 2008. J. Great Lakes Res.
913 **37**: 55-62.
- 914 Stam, H., Stouthamer, A.H. and van Verseveld, H.W. 1987. Hydrogen metabolism and energy
915 costs of nitrogen fixation. FEMS Microbiology Letters. **46**: 73-92.

- 916 United States Environmental Protection Agency. 2015. Preventing Eutrophication: Scientific
917 Support for Dual Nutrient Criteria. EPA-820-S-15001. Available from
918 <https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/documents/nandpfactsheet.pdf> [accessed
919 September 29, 2016].
- 920 Vadrucci, M.R., Cabrini, M. and Basset, A. 2007. Biovolume determination of phytoplankton
921 guilds in transitional water ecosystems of Mediterranean ecoregion. *Transitional Waters*
922 *Bull.* **2**: 83-102.
- 923 Vareli, K., Briasoulis, E., Pilidis, G. and Sainis, I. 2009. Molecular confirmation of *Planktothrix*
924 *rubescens* as the cause of intense, microcystin—Synthesizing cyanobacterial bloom in Lake
925 Ziros, Greece. *Harmful Algae*. **8**: 447-453.
- 926 Vargas, M.A., Rodriguez, H., Morena, J., Olivares, H., Del Campo, J.A., Rivas, J. and Guerro,
927 M.G. 1998. Biochemical composition and fatty acid content of filamentous nitrogen-fixing
928 cyanobacteria. *J. Phycol.* **34**: 812-817.
- 929 Verschoor, M.J. and Molot, L.A. 2013. A comparison of three colorimetric methods of ferrous
930 and total reactive iron measurement in freshwaters. *Limnol. Oceanogr. Methods*. **11**: 113-
931 125.
- 932 Wehr, J.D. and Sheath, R.G. (editors). 2003. *Freshwater algae of North America: ecology and*
933 *classification*. San Diego (CA): Academic Press.
- 934 Wilhem, S.W. 1995. Ecology of iron-limited cyanobacteria: a review of physiological responses
935 and implications for aquatic systems. *Aquat. Microbial Ecol.* **9**: 295-303.
- 936 Winter, J.G., DeSellas, A.M., Fletcher, R., Heintsch, L., Morley, A., Nakamoto, L. and Utsumi,
937 K. 2011. Algal blooms in Ontario, Canada: increases in reports since 1994. *Lake Reserv.*
938 *Manage.* **27**: 105-112.

939 Zhang, X., Vincent, L.A., Hogg, W.D. and Niitsoo A. 2000. Temperature and precipitation
940 trends in Canada during the 20th Century. *Atmos.-Ocean*, **38**: 395-429.

941 Wurtsbaugh, W.A. and Horne, A.J. 1983. Iron in eutrophic Clear Lake, California: Its
942 importance for algal nitrogen fixation and growth. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **40**: 1419-1429.

943

Draft

Table 1. Physical characteristics of the study embayments along the Georgian Bay, Lake Huron coast.

	Mean	Max	Surface	Watershed
	depth	depth	area	area
	(m)	(m)	(km ²)	(km ²)
Sturgeon Bay (north basin)	6	14	2.95	21.9
Deep Bay	10	21	2.85	26.8
Twelve Mile Bay	12	24	2.98	27.2
North Bay	-	22	2.20	11.2

948 **Table 2.** Mean nutrient concentrations $\pm$ 1 standard deviation in the epilimnion (TP, NH_4^+ and NO_3^-) and 2 m off the bottom (DP,
949 dissolved Fe) in the embayments June-September. Range is in brackets. Units are $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. Depths 2 m off the bottom are: Sturgeon
950 Bay 10 m, Deep Bay 16 m in 2012 and 15 m in 2014, Twelve Mile Bay 9 m, North Bay 14 m. Values for NO_3^- were set at $0.5 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$
951 when below detection limit of $1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, values for NH_4^+ were set at $1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ when below detection limit of $2 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$.

	Sturgeon		Deep		Twelve Mile	North
	2012	2014	2012	2014	2012	2014
TP	13.1 ± 2.9 (9.2 - 16.9)	12.8 ± 3.0 (9.6 - 17.1)	7.5 ± 2.0 (3.5 - 9.6)	15.4 ± 4.5 (10.9 - 20.3)	9.0 ± 2.4 (5.2 - 11.2)	10.9 ± 3.3 (6.2 - 14.8)
NH_4^+	18 ± 18 (1 - 49)	19 ± 12 (1 - 31)	33 ± 68 (1 - 186)	29 ± 12 (13 - 41)	20 ± 26 (1 - 70)	21 ± 28 (1 - 63)
NO_3^-	4 ± 5 (0.5 - 15)	87 ± 71 (0.5 - 197)	7 ± 5 (0.5 - 15)	92 ± 45 (30 - 145)	10 ± 12 (1 - 35)	132 ± 50 (7 - 202)
DP	18.7 ± 17.6 (6.5 - 54.7)	19.4 ± 16.6 (6.7 - 43.8)	5.2 ± 0.6 (4.5 - 6.0)	12.9 ± 7.3 (5.0 - 23.8)	4.2 ± 0.6 (3.6 - 5.2)	6.8 ± 2.4 (4.2 - 9.7)
Dissolved Fe	701 ± 838 (45 - 2290)	1249 ± 1321 (147 - 3053)	1065 ± 1736 (88 - 4803)	792 ± 237 (162 - 669)	37 ± 8 (27 - 52)	163 ± 209 (49 - 537)

Figure 1. Location of study sites along Georgian Bay, Lake Huron. Inset shows Great Lakes region. Sturgeon Bay is meso-eutrophic while the other embayments are oligotrophic.

Figure 2. A) Mean June-August water level in Lake Michigan-Lake Huron between 1918 and 2014 and B) frequency distribution of mean summer air temperatures for 1939-1989 and 1990-2014 at Muskoka A weather station. Water level unit has been added.

Figure 3. Degree-days above 20°C in the top 3 metres in A) 2012 and B) 2014, C) dissolved oxygen vs redox (dashed line is 0.5 mg L⁻¹) in 2012, and D) the depth at 0.5 mg L⁻¹ dissolved oxygen occurred in Sturgeon Bay in 2012 (solid line) and 2014 (dashed line).

Figure 4. Dissolved Fe (panels A and B) and DP (panels C and D) in Sturgeon Bay epilimnion and several hypolimnetic depths and the depth at which 0.5 mg L⁻¹ dissolved oxygen occurred in 2012 and 2014.

Figure 5. Cyanobacteria percent (panels A and B), biomass (panels C and D) and net summer growth rates (panel E) in Sturgeon Bay in 2012 and 2014. Dashed line is the 50% criterion for defining cyanobacteria dominance.

Figure 6. RDA triplot of Sturgeon Bay 2012 phytoplankton response variables, environmental predictor variables and sampling dates (objects).

974 **Figure 7.** Dissolved Fe (panels A and B) and DP (panels C and D) in the epilimnion and several
975 hypolimnetic depths and the depth at which 0.5 mg L⁻¹ dissolved oxygen occurred in Deep Bay
976 in 2012 and 2014.

977
978 **Figure 8.** Cyanobacteria percent (panels A and B) and biomass (panels C and D) in Deep Bay in
979 2012 and 2014. Dashed line is the 50% criterion for defining cyanobacteria dominance.

980
981 **Figure 9.** Dissolved Fe concentration and the depth at which 0.5 mg L⁻¹ dissolved oxygen
982 occurred (A), cyanobacteria biomass (B) and cyanobacteria percent (C) in Twelve Mile Bay in
983 2012.

984
985 **Figure 10.** Dissolved Fe concentration and the depth at which 0.5 mg L⁻¹ dissolved oxygen
986 occurred (A), cyanobacteria biomass (B) and cyanobacteria percent (C) in North Bay in 2014.

987
988 **Figure 11.** NH₄⁺, NO₃⁻ and cyanobacteria biomass (µg L⁻¹) in 2012 in (A) Sturgeon Bay
989 (epilimnion), (B) Deep Bay (epilimnion) and (C) Twelve Mile Bay (metalimnion). Circles
990 denote when cyanobacteria biomass first exceeded 50% of total phytoplankton biomass. Note
991 different nitrogen scales.

Figure 1

Made with Natural Earth

<http://www.naturalearthdata.com/>

Figure 2

Figure 3

Figure 4

Figure 5

Figure 6

Figure 7

Figure 8

Figure 9

Figure 10

Figure 11