Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences
Journal canadien des sciences halieutiques et aquatiques

Walleye recruitment success is less resilient to warming water temperatures in lakes with abundant largemouth bass populations

Journal:	<i>Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences</i>
Manuscript ID	cjfas-2016-0249.R2
Manuscript Type:	Article
Date Submitted by the Author:	28-Mar-2017
Complete List of Authors:	Hansen, Gretchen; Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources, Science Services; Minnesota Department of Natural Resources, Fisheries and Wildlife Midway, Stephen; Louisiana State University, Oceanography and Coastal Sciences Wagner, Tyler; The Pennsylvania State University, Pennsylvania Cooperative Fish and Wildlife Research Unit
Please Select from this Special Issues list if applicable:	N/A
Keyword:	LAKES < Environment/Habitat, CLIMATE CHANGE < General, FRESHWATER FISHES < General, COMMUNITIES < General, HABITAT < General

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Walleye recruitment success is less resilient to warming water temperatures in lakes with abundant largemouth bass populations

Gretchen J.A. Hansen^{1,2}, Stephen R. Midway³, Tyler Wagner⁴

¹Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources, Science Services, 2801 Progress Road, Madison WI 53716 USA

²Corresponding author. Current address: Minnesota Department of Natural Resources, 500 Lafayette Road, St. Paul, MN, 55155 USA. Gretchen.hansen@state.mn.us. 651-259-5245

³Department of Oceanography and Coastal Sciences, 2257 Energy, Coast, and Environment Building, Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge, LA 70803. smidway@lsu.edu

⁴ U.S. Geological Survey, Pennsylvania Cooperative Fish and Wildlife Research Unit, The Pennsylvania State University, 402 Forest Resources Building, University Park, PA 16802. txw@psu.edu

ABSTRACT

Lakes respond heterogeneously to climate, with implications for fisheries management. We analyzed walleye (*Sander vitreus*) recruitment to age-0 in 359 lakes in Wisconsin, USA, to (1) quantify the relationship between annual water temperature degree days (DD) and walleye recruitment success; and (2) identify the influence of lake characteristics (area, conductivity, largemouth bass (*Micropterus salmoides*) catch rates, and mean DD) on this relationship. The relationship between walleye recruitment and annual DD varied among lakes and was not distinguishable from zero overall (posterior mean = -0.11, 90% CI=-0.34-0.15). DD effects on recruitment were negative in 198 lakes (55%) and positive in 161 (45%). The effect of annual DD was most negative in lakes with high largemouth bass densities, and on average the probability of recruitment was highest in large lakes with low largemouth bass densities. Conductivity and mean DD did not influence recruitment or the effect of annual DD. Walleye recruitment was most resilient to warming in lakes with few largemouth bass, suggesting that the effects of climate change depend on lake-specific food web and habitat contexts.

33 INTRODUCTION

34 Understanding how lakes respond to environmental change—both natural and
35 anthropogenic—is critical for managing the ecologically and economically important goods and
36 services lakes provide (Woodward et al. 2010; Carpenter et al. 2011). Both lakes and fish are
37 integrators of environmental conditions across multiple spatial and temporal scales (e.g., Adrian
38 et al. 2009; Schindler 2009; Williamson et al. 2009), and fish in particular can serve as indicators
39 of ecological stressors on aquatic systems (Fausch et al. 1990; Minns et al. 1994; Drake and
40 Pereira 2002). Recently, long-term temporal trends have been documented in the relative
41 abundance of lake fishes throughout the upper Midwest (Bethke and Staples 2015; Hansen et al.
42 2015b). These studies have demonstrated large-scale regional declines in several economically
43 and ecologically important species, while also identifying variability in trends even among lakes
44 within close proximity to each other and subject to similar environmental conditions. Although
45 hypotheses abound, the drivers of temporal trends in fish abundance in these lakes have not been
46 identified.

47 Temperature is a critical environmental driver for poikilotherms such as fish, and is
48 correlated with the presence of numerous fish species at broad spatial scales (e.g., Tonn 1990;
49 Wehrly et al. 2012). Projected warming air temperatures associated with climate change are
50 predicted to negatively influence cool- and coldwater fish species and positively affect
51 warmwater species (e.g., Chu et al. 2005; Sharma et al. 2007; Hein et al. 2012; Van Zuiden et al.
52 2016). However, documented effects of contemporary climate change on inland fish populations
53 are relatively rare (Lynch et al. 2016). Furthermore, lake temperatures respond heterogeneously
54 to climate depending on lake size, depth, clarity, and sheltering from wind (Read et al. 2014;
55 O'Reilly et al. 2015; Rose et al. 2016). Thus, certain lakes may be resilient to increased air

temperatures associated with climate change, and may provide refugia for cool- and coldwater species even as regional air temperatures increase.

Walleye (*Sander vitreus*) is a coolwater species of economic and ecologic importance throughout North America. Walleye abundance has declined in inland lakes across Wisconsin, USA (Hansen et al. 2015b). Population declines have been linked to widespread failures in walleye recruitment, as measured by the relative abundance of walleye in the fall of their first year (Hansen et al. 2015b). In response to walleye declines, the state of Wisconsin invested over \$12M USD in 2013 to expand the production capacity of extended-growth walleye fingerlings in state hatcheries and to increase walleye stocking in hundreds of Wisconsin lakes (Wisconsin State Legislature 2013).

Climate change may play a role in declining walleye recruitment in Wisconsin lakes, although previous studies have shown contrasting effects of temperature on lacustrine walleye populations. The likelihood of walleye recruitment success in Wisconsin lakes is lower in warm lakes than in cool lakes (as indexed by water temperature degree days; Hansen et al. 2015a; Hansen et al. 2016). Further, high variability in spring water temperatures is associated with walleye recruitment failure in Escanaba Lake, Wisconsin (Serns 1982b; Serns 1982a; Hansen et al. 1998) and other places (Kallemeyn 1987). However, lake-averaged variability in spring water temperatures was not an important predictor of walleye recruitment success in hundreds of other Wisconsin lakes at a broader spatial scale (Hansen et al. 2015a). In other studies, walleye populations were positively correlated with temperature. For example, walleye year class strength in Minnesota's nine largest walleye lakes was highest in years with warm June air temperatures from 1979–1997 (Shupp 2002), and recruitment in 162 Wisconsin lakes varied

78 synchronously, suggesting that warmer years led to higher year class strength (Beard Jr et al.
79 2003).

80 Contrasting effects of temperature on walleye suggest that lake-specific factors may
81 influence walleye populations and how they response to warming. For instance, lake size is
82 strongly related to walleye recruitment success (Nate et al. 2000) and the negative effect of water
83 temperature degree days on walleye recruitment success in Wisconsin does not appear to operate
84 in large lakes (Hansen et al. 2015a). Lake productivity also plays a role in suitable walleye
85 habitat (Ryder 1977; Lester et al. 2004) and could influence the effects of temperature.
86 Temperature may also affect walleye indirectly through biotic interactions. For example,
87 largemouth bass (*Micropterus salmoides*) densities have increased concurrently with walleye
88 recruitment declines (Hansen et al. 2015c), leading some to hypothesize that largemouth bass
89 predation is directly impeding walleye recruitment. However, empirical diet studies have
90 provided mixed support for this hypothesis. In a recent diet study, only 1 walleye was observed
91 in nearly 1,000 largemouth bass diets from 4 lakes over 2 years (Kelling et al. 2016), while other
92 studies have found low but potentially biologically important predation of largemouth bass on
93 walleye (Fayram et al. 2005; Freedman et al. 2012). Context dependent effects such as those of
94 temperature on walleye are indicative of cross-scale interactions, where the effects of an
95 environmental driver operating on one spatial or temporal scale depend upon other drivers
96 operating at different scales (Soranno et al. 2014). Such interactions can be understood using
97 hierarchical models (Wagner et al. 2016).

98 Here, we evaluate the influence of water temperature on annual walleye recruitment
99 success in Wisconsin lakes. Our objectives were to: (1) quantify lake-specific effects of annual
100 water temperature on walleye recruitment success; (2) identify how lake characteristics—

specifically largemouth bass relative abundance, lake area, conductivity, and average water temperature—influence the relationship between water temperature and recruitment; (3) quantify the expected change in lake-specific probability of recruitment given increases in water temperature from the early 1980s to the 2010s.

METHODS

Walleye data

Fish data were collected by the Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources (WDNR) and the Great Lakes Indian Fish and Wildlife Commission as a part of their standardized monitoring protocols (Serns 1982a; Hansen et al. 2004). Age-0 walleyes were collected annually each fall when water temperatures were between 10 and 21 °C using nighttime boat electrofishing (230 V AC). Recruitment was indexed as the number of naturally reproduced (i.e., not stocked) age-0 walleye collected per kilometer of shoreline sampled. Age-0 walleye were identified either by length-frequency analysis or verified from scale annuli following WDNR protocols (Serns 1982a; Hansen et al. 2004). We used surveys conducted between 1980 and 2014, but excluded surveys from lake-years where age-0 walleye were stocked prior to the survey in the same year. To ensure that effort was sufficient to index whole-lake relative abundances of age-0 walleye, we restricted our analysis to surveys where at least 70% or 16.1 km of shoreline was sampled per WDNR sampling protocols. We excluded surveys in which water temperatures were < 10 °C or > 21 °C (following WDNR protocols) and those in which survey reliability was low due to adverse conditions identified by the survey operator. Our final analysis was based on 2,061 records of walleye recruitment from 359 lakes (Figure 1).

We converted age-0 walleye catch rates into a qualitative measure representing successful or failed recruitment for that lake-year. Based on Hansen et al. (2015a), walleye recruitment was classified as successful if age-0 walleye catch rates in fall electrofishing surveys were greater than $6.2 \text{ fish} \cdot \text{km}^{-1}$ ($10 \cdot \text{mi}^{-1}$). This threshold is used by WDNR managers to separate successful from failed walleye year classes. Recruitment was modeled as a binary response variable using hierarchical logistic regression as described below.

Predictor data

We quantified the response of annual walleye recruitment success to two annually varying water temperature variables previously found to correlate with walleye recruitment success in Wisconsin lakes: degree days (Hansen et al. 2015a; Hansen et al. 2016) and variability of spring temperatures (Serns 1982b; Serns 1982a; Kallemeyn 1987; Hansen et al. 1998). Daily water temperature profiles for calculating both temperature metrics were obtained from a thermodynamic simulation model of ~5,200 Wisconsin lakes (Read et al. 2014; Winslow et al. in press). This model uses daily, dynamically downscaled historical weather data and lake characteristics including riparian tree height, average water clarity, and maximum lake depth to simulate daily water temperature profiles from 1980–2015. Water temperature degree days were quantified using surface water temperature degree days with a 5°C base (Chezik et al. 2013). Degree days are a measure of cumulative heat for the entire growing season and have been used to explain variability in growth and life history for a variety of fishes, including walleye (e.g., Venturelli et al. 2010; Chezik et al. 2013; Lester et al. 2014). We used degree days to index water temperature because a recent analysis identified degree days as the best thermal predictor of walleye recruitment out of 15 possible temperature metrics (Hansen et al. 2015a). Annual, lake-specific estimates of water temperature degree days were calculated from modeled surface

water temperatures, and these year-specific degree days estimates were related to annual measures of walleye recruitment success as described below. Annual variability in spring water temperatures was calculated as the coefficient of variation in modeled surface water temperatures from 30–60 days post-ice off for each lake year. We used variability tied to ice-off date rather than a set calendar period, because walleye spawning is triggered by ice-off (Becker 1983; Schneider et al. 2010) and variable temperatures are thought to influence the survival of post-hatch larval walleye rather than eggs (Hansen et al. 1998).

We evaluated the influence of four lake-level covariates on the relationship between annual water temperature and walleye recruitment success. Mean water temperature degree days for each lake from 1980–2014 were used as a measure of average lake temperature. That is, degree days entered the model at two levels (Table 1): annual degree days (calculated for each lake-year and used to model lake-specific effects on annual recruitment success), and mean degree days (calculated for each lake and used to model variability in lake-specific slopes and intercepts as described below).

Largemouth bass relative abundance was indexed from 1995–2014 using catch per km of largemouth bass over 20.3 cm (8 inches) collected in fall surveys using a 230 V AC electrofishing boat. In some historical surveys, time instead of distance shocked was recorded as the measure of survey effort. In these cases, hours were converted to km based on the empirical relationship observed in historical data ($\text{Effort}_{\text{km}} = 3.274 \cdot \text{Effort}_{\text{hours}} + 0.071$, $R^2 = 0.84$, $p < 0.0001$, $N = 9,043$; J.F. Hansen, Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources, personal communication). We excluded surveys in which water temperatures were $< 10^\circ\text{C}$ or $> 21^\circ\text{C}$ (following WDNR protocols) and those in which survey reliability was low because of adverse conditions identified by the survey operator. Lake-specific mean largemouth bass catch per effort was used because

annual estimates of largemouth bass catch per effort were not available for most lakes (median years sampled for largemouth bass=2, range=1–14).

Lake area (ha) and conductivity ($\mu\text{S}\cdot\text{cm}^{-1}$) influence walleye recruitment success (Hansen et al. 2015a) and were included as lake-level predictors to evaluate whether they influenced temperature effects on walleye recruitment. Multiple studies have documented the positive correlation between lake area and walleye production or recruitment, although the mechanism of this effect is unknown (Ryder 1965; Nate et al. 2000; Hansen et al. 2015a). Conductivity served as a surrogate for water quality (US EPA 2003) or lake productivity, also known to influence walleye populations (with intermediate productivity values associated with highest levels of walleye production; Ryder 1965; Lester et al. 2004). Conductivity data were more widely available than other surrogate metrics of lake productivity. Mean conductivity for each lake was calculated using data from Wisconsin DNR water quality surveys conducted between 1970 and 2014 (archived in the surface water integrated monitoring system, or SWIMS; <http://dnr.wi.gov/topic/surfacewater/swims/>). Information on distributions of predictor variables can be found in Table 1. All covariates were $\log_e$ -transformed and standardized (mean = 0, SD = 1) prior to analysis.

Hierarchical logistic regression

We used a Bayesian hierarchical logistic regression model to evaluate the effects of annually varying water temperature degree days and variability in spring water temperatures on the probability of successful recruitment. As part of the model building process, we first fitted Bayesian hierarchical logistic regression models (using methods outlined below) with just annual degree days or annual variability in spring water temperatures as a predictor of walleye recruitment success, with no lake-level covariates included. We then selected the annually

varying water temperature metric(s) that were important in predicting annual walleye recruitment success for use in building more complex models; important predictors were defined as those for which 90% credible intervals did not overlap zero. Once the annually varying water temperature metric(s) was selected, we evaluated the effects of other lake-level covariates (lake area, conductance, largemouth bass relative abundance, and lake-average degree days) on (1) the mean probability of recruitment success for each lake (i.e., the lake-specific modeled intercept); and (2) the lake-specific effect of annual water temperatures on annual recruitment success (i.e., the lake-specific modeled slope).

The full varying intercept, varying slope model was as follows (the notation $j[i]$ indexes observation i for lake j):

Level 1 of the hierarchical model:

$$\Pr(y_i = 1) = \text{logit}^{-1}(\alpha_{j[i]} + \beta_{j[i]} \times \text{temperature}_i), \text{ for } i = 1 \dots n,$$

Level 2 of the hierarchical model:

$$\begin{pmatrix} \alpha_j \\ \beta_j \end{pmatrix} \sim \text{MVN} \left(\begin{pmatrix} \gamma_0^\alpha + \gamma_1^\alpha \times \text{area}_j + \gamma_2^\alpha \times \text{cond}_j + \gamma_3^\alpha \times \text{bass}_j + \gamma_4^\alpha \times \overline{\text{degree days}_j} \\ \gamma_0^\beta + \gamma_1^\beta \times \text{area}_j + \gamma_2^\beta \times \text{cond}_j + \gamma_3^\beta \times \text{bass}_j + \gamma_4^\beta \times \overline{\text{degree days}_j} \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_\alpha^2 & \rho\sigma_\alpha\sigma_\beta \\ \rho\sigma_\alpha\sigma_\beta & \sigma_\beta^2 \end{pmatrix} \right),$$

$$\text{for } j = 1 \dots J$$

Where $y_i = 1$ if recruitment was successful, 0 otherwise, α_j is the intercept for lake j , β_j is the slope for the j^{th} lake of the effect of annually varying water temperature (degree days or spring variability) on recruitment success. Mean probability of recruitment success for each lake (on the logit scale; α_j) and the lake-specific effect of annual water temperature on recruitment

success (β_j) were assumed to come from a multivariate normal (MVN) distribution. The parameters γ_0^x and γ_z^x describe the effects of lake-specific covariates on α_j and β_j ($z = 1-4$ for each covariate: area = lake area, cond = conductivity, bass = largemouth bass catch per km, and *degree days* = lake-specific mean degree days). The variances σ_α^2 and σ_β^2 are the conditional variances of the intercepts and slopes, respectively, and $\rho\sigma_\alpha\sigma_\beta$ describes the covariance between α_j and β_j , with ρ describing the correlation between α_j and β_j . Diffuse normal priors were used for γ_0^x and γ_z^x , and we modeled the variance-covariance matrix using the scaled inverse-Wishart distribution (Gelman and Hill 2007).

We ran three parallel Markov chains beginning each chain with different values. Each chain was run for 60,000 samples, from which the first 30,000 samples were discarded. The remaining 30,000 samples were thinned to every other sample, resulting in 15,000 samples per chain and 45,000 total samples used to characterize the posterior distributions (Gelman et al. 2004). We assessed convergence for all parameters both visually (trace plots and plots of posterior distributions), as well as with the Brooks-Gelman-Rubin statistic, $\hat{R}$, with values < 1.1 indicating convergence. Analyses were run using JAGS in the R2jags package (Su and Yajima 2015), run from within R version 3.2.4 (R Development Core Team 2015). We examined 90% credible intervals for all parameter estimates to determine the importance of predictor variables (i.e., examined if 90% credible intervals overlapped zero). In addition to examining 90% credible intervals, to more fully represent the uncertainty in the posterior distributions of parameter estimates we calculated the probability that the direction of the relationship (i.e., positive or negative) between predictors and response variables was in the direction of the estimated posterior mean (Filstrup et al. 2014). Model fit was assessed by the conditional R^2 (Nakagawa and Schielzeth 2013) calculated using the MuMIn package (Barton 2015). The R^2 value was

based on refitting the model described above using the glmer function in the lme4 package (Bates et al. 2015).

Lakes were sampled for walleye recruitment from 1 – 22 times between 1980 and 2014 (mean = 6, median = 3). Inferences from our analysis were not sensitive to which lakes were included, largely due to the partial-pooling of the hierarchical model. For example, when restricted to include only lakes sampled a minimum of 5 times from 1980 to 2014, the same predictor variables were deemed important (based on whether 90% credible intervals overlapped zero) and the effect sizes were similar. However, by including all lakes we were able to use all available data to characterize the effect of water temperature on walleye recruitment success.

To visualize how lake-specific probabilities of successful walleye recruitment have changed over time, we estimated the predicted probabilities in each lake for each year from 1980 to 2014. We used lake-specific estimated annual water temperature degree days as level 1 model inputs, and all other predictor variables (i.e., predictors at level-2 of the model) were held constant at their lake-specific values. Lake-specific posterior distributions of the parameter estimates were used to simulate lake-specific probabilities of recruitment for each observed degree day value, and mean predicted probabilities across all parameter estimates were calculated for each lake-year.

RESULTS

Initial models quantifying the influence of annual degree days and annual variability in spring water temperatures on the annual probability of successful recruitment suggested that annual degree days were an important predictor of recruitment success (posterior mean of the effect of degree days = -0.32 [90% CI = -0.50, -0.14]). Spring variability in water temperature

had little effect on walleye recruitment success in our dataset (posterior mean for the effect of variability in spring water temperature = 0.01 [-0.17, 0.18]). Therefore, all subsequent modeling included annual degree days as the only level-1 predictor of the probability of successful walleye recruitment.

The hierarchical logistic regression model explained a substantial proportion of variation in walleye recruitment success (conditional $R^2=0.64$). Across all lakes (i.e., the population-average effect), the effect of annual water temperature degree days was not important based on the population-average slope γ_0^β 90% CI including zero (Table 2). However, the population-average effect of annual water temperature degree days on the probability of successful walleye recruitment was most likely negative (probability of a negative effect=74%; Table 2). The direction, magnitude, and uncertainty of the relationship between annual degree days and walleye recruitment success varied substantially among lakes (Figure 1 Figures S1–S4). Of the 359 lakes included in this analysis, the most likely relationship between annual water temperature degree days and probability of successful walleye recruitment was negative for 198 lakes (55%) and positive for 161 lakes (45%; Figures S1–S4). When restricted to include only lakes for which the probability was at least 90% that the estimated effect of annual water temperature degree days was in the direction (i.e., negative or positive) of the estimated posterior mean, the relationship was negative for 40 lakes (11%) and positive for 15 lakes (4%; Figures S1–S4). The cutoff probability of 90% used here is arbitrary and used for illustrative purposes; similar summaries based on any biologically or socially relevant criteria are possible. Lakes also differed in their average probability of successful walleye recruitment (as measured by the lake-specific intercept; Figures S1–S4).

Lake characteristics influenced both the lake-specific average probability of successful walleye recruitment and the lake-specific effect of annual degree days on annual walleye recruitment success (Table 2). The average probability of successful walleye recruitment (i.e., lake-specific intercept) increased with increasing lake surface area and with decreasing largemouth bass relative abundance (Figure 2A and C). Average recruitment success also increased somewhat with increasing conductivity (probability of a positive effect of conductivity on average recruitment success = 0.81) and decreasing mean water temperature (probability of a negative effect of mean degree days on average recruitment success = 0.93; Figure 2B and D), but these effects were not distinguishable from zero based on 90% CIs overlapping zero (Table 2).

The effect of annual degree days on walleye recruitment success (i.e., lake-specific slopes) was also influenced by lake characteristics. Largemouth bass catch rates negatively influenced lake-specific slopes, with the strongest negative effects of annual water temperature degree days in lakes with the highest largemouth bass abundance (Figure 3C). The influence of water temperature degree days on walleye recruitment was also most likely to be negative in smaller lakes, lakes with high conductivity, and lakes with higher mean degree days, with probabilities of negative effects of 0.68, 0.94, and 0.82, respectively (Figure 3A,B,D), although these effects were not distinguishable from zero based on 90% CIs overlapping zero (Table 2).

Temporal trajectories of water temperature degree days from the 1980s to the 2010s affected recruitment success differently among lakes. In some lakes, the probability of walleye recruitment was predicted to have increased, while in others it was predicted to have decreased as lakes warmed (Figure 4). Effects of increasing annual water temperature degree days on

297 walleye recruitment were quite variable for cooler lakes with fewer mean degree days, but were
298 generally negative in lakes where mean degree days were 2,800 or greater (Figure 4).

299 **DISCUSSION**

300 Documentation of the complex responses of fish populations to contemporary climate
301 change is imperative for successful resource management (Lynch et al. 2016). The capacity of
302 fish to naturally reproduce and for the young to survive their first summer (i.e., recruitment) is a
303 particularly relevant metric for fish populations, as recruitment variation typically underlies
304 variation in population abundance as a whole (Hilborn and Walters 1992). Here, we quantified
305 the relationship between water temperature (in the form of annual degree days) and the
306 probability of successful walleye recruitment in Wisconsin lakes, and observed varying effects of
307 temperature among diverse lakes. We found that the effect of water temperature on the
308 probability of successful walleye recruitment varied among lakes and that lake-specific effects
309 were not distinguishable from zero for the majority of lakes. In lakes where the effect of degree
310 days on recruitment success was important, the effect was negative in most cases – that is,
311 walleye recruitment was less likely to be successful in warmer years than cooler years. However,
312 walleye in other lakes were more resilient, and in some cases, walleye recruitment success was
313 predicted to increase with increasing degree days. Heterogeneous responses of walleye
314 recruitment to water temperature suggest that the effects of climate change on walleye are likely
315 to depend on the fish community and other lake characteristics. Most notably, walleye in lakes
316 with abundant largemouth bass appeared to respond most negatively to increasing water
317 temperature. Average recruitment success was higher in large lakes and in lakes with few
318 largemouth bass. Lake area, conductivity, and mean degree days did not influence the effect of
319 annual degree days on annual walleye recruitment success.

Most heterogeneity among lakes in the response of walleye recruitment to annual water temperatures was observed in lakes with average water temperatures at or below statewide mean values (i.e., 0 on the standardized scale; Figure 3). The probability of successful walleye recruitment was generally low in lakes with high average water temperatures, and was for the most part negatively influenced by increasing annual water temperature degree days. Low probabilities of walleye recruitment at high degree day values are consistent with the previously identified threshold response of walleye recruitment to degree days (Hansen et al. 2015a; Hansen et al. 2016). Our results suggest that parsing out differences between lakes with different responses to annual water temperatures, but similar average temperatures, could be a fruitful area of future research.

The mechanisms through which lake water temperature degree days could affect walleye recruitment success are unknown, but likely complex. Our finding that increasing annual degree days are likely to negatively affect walleye recruitment success in lakes containing abundant largemouth bass populations suggests that temperature may influence walleye recruitment via food web dynamics or some other indirect pathway. For example, for walleye to survive or benefit from increased water temperatures, they must increase consumption to meet increased metabolic demands associated with warmer conditions (Kitchell et al. 1974; Kitchell et al. 1977). If prey resources are limited due to high competition with other piscivores, or if walleye experience greater predation risk because of increased time spent foraging to obtain these resources (i.e., Walters and Juanes 1993), warmer temperatures may indirectly negatively influence walleye survival (Wuellner et al. 2010). However, direct predation of walleye by largemouth bass appears to be low to non-existent even in lakes experiencing walleye declines (Kelling et al. 2016). Still, water temperature is unlikely to directly impact age-0 walleye

survival, because water temperatures in Wisconsin lakes do not exceed lethal limits in most lake-years. In fact, warming water temperatures are predicted to increase optimal walleye habitat in north temperate lakes (e.g., Fang et al. 2004; Chu et al. 2005). Indeed, the probability of successful walleye recruitment was predicted to increase with increasing water temperature in lakes containing relatively few largemouth bass. In these systems, increases in water temperature appeared to benefit walleye, perhaps by promoting growth (Venturelli et al. 2010), reproduction (Hokanson 1977), and/or survival (Koonce et al. 1977), leading to increased probability of successful recruitment. Interpretation of these results are further complicated by the fact that largemouth bass themselves are positively influenced by degree days (Hansen et al. 2016), although largemouth bass abundance was treated as constant over the entire time period in this analysis due to data limitations. Future experimental work focused on disentangling the direct effects of temperature on walleye from the indirect food web effects could provide further insight into the mechanisms underlying the observed relationships. Regardless of the driver behind variable responses of walleye recruitment success to water temperature, the observed heterogeneity across lakes supports the idea that the effects of increasing temperature operate indirectly through ecological relationships.

Even in the absence of a mechanistic understanding, the relationships observed in this analysis can be used in a management context (*sensu* Hilborn 2016). Small lakes and lakes with abundant largemouth bass are least likely to support successful, natural walleye recruitment. If maintaining walleye populations in these lakes is an important management goal, stocking may be the most plausible management option. Additionally, lakes with abundant largemouth bass are most vulnerable to walleye recruitment failure as water temperatures increase. Climate change is projected to increase temperatures throughout Wisconsin over the next several decades

(Wisconsin Initiative on Climate Change Impacts 2009; Winslow et al. in press). Knowing that lakes with few largemouth bass are most resilient to warming, managers may choose to devote resources to protecting walleye populations in these lakes from other stressors such as overexploitation or habitat degradation. Conversely, walleye populations in lakes with abundant largemouth bass that are most vulnerable to the effects of warming might warrant close monitoring. Because we cannot address mechanistic relationships in this study, we do not know if walleye recruitment success is influenced directly by abundant largemouth bass or if largemouth bass simply benefit from the same environmental conditions that reduce the resilience of walleye recruitment. Therefore, we do not know if intentionally changing largemouth bass densities would affect the probability of successful walleye recruitment in these lakes, although an adaptive management test of this idea is currently underway (Hansen et al. 2015b).

Inland lakes supporting recreational fisheries are interesting case studies for examining local resilience to climate change. Climate change will not affect all lakes within a region equally (Winslow et al. 2015; Hansen et al. 2016). Identifying locations that are most resilient to changes in climate can facilitate adaptation to changing conditions by focusing protection efforts on locations most likely to maintain critical habitat (Ashcroft et al. 2009; Keppel and Wardell-Johnson 2012; Keppel et al. 2015). In lake-rich landscapes, multiple stocks are managed for recreational harvest, often using a common set of regulations (Lester et al. 2003; Fayram et al. 2009). As lakes respond differently to similar climate conditions (Read et al. 2014; O'Reilly et al. 2015), angler movement and effort may adjust in response to changing fish populations (Carpenter and Brock 2004). Lake-specific relationships between temperature and walleye recruitment success can provide a framework for allocating limited resources across a landscape

of many lakes to places likely to be most resilient (Midway et al. 2016). Resilient lakes may also provide sites in to test hypotheses of mechanism and more completely describe the complexity of freshwater lakes and their responses to large-scale change.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We gratefully acknowledge the work of current and former employees of the Wisconsin DNR and the Great Lakes Indian Fish and Wildlife Commission for collecting and maintaining walleye recruitment and largemouth bass abundance data. We are grateful to the bass-walleye research team for initiating this project and keeping the questions coming: Steve Carpenter, Daisuke Goto, Joe Hennessey, Dan Isermann, Craig Kelling, John Lyons, Eric Pedersen, Andrew Rypel, Greg Sass, Kaitlin Schnell, Tyler Tunney, and Jake Vander Zanden. Thanks also to Jordan Read and Luke Winslow for their leadership in creating the lake temperature model and ensuring that its outputs are available to a variety of users. Thanks to Jennifer Filbert, Alex Latzka, and Mona Papeş for collating lake data and to Tom Cichosz, Steve Hewett, and Joe Hennessey for sharing their extensive knowledge of the walleye dataset. We are grateful to John Lyons and to two anonymous reviewers for their constructive reviews of earlier versions of this manuscript. This study was funded by the Department of the Interior Northeast Climate Science Center under the proposal "An integrated assessment of lake and stream thermal habitat under climate change", the United States Geological Survey National Climate Change and Wildlife Science Center grant 10909172 to the University of Wisconsin–Madison, and the WDNR Federal Aid in Sport Fish Restoration (Project F-95-P, study SSBW). Any use of trade, firm, or product names is for descriptive purposes only and does not imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

Literature Cited

- Adrian, R., Reilly, C.M.O., Zagarese, H., Baines, S.B., Hessen, D.O., Keller, W., Livingstone, D.M., Sommaruga, R., Straile, D., and Van Donk, E. 2009. Lakes as sentinels of climate change. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **54**: 2283-2297.
- Ashcroft, M.B., Chisholm, L.A., and French, K.O. 2009. Climate change at the landscape scale: predicting fine-grained spatial heterogeneity in warming and potential refugia for vegetation. *Glob. Change. Biol.* **15**: 656-667.
- Barton, K. 2015. MuMIn: Multi-model inference. R package version 1.15.6: <https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/MuMIn/MuMIn.pdf>.
- Bates, D.M., Maechler, M., Bolker, B.M., and Walker, S. 2015. lme4: Linear mixed-effects models using Eigen and S4.
- Beard Jr, T.D., Hansen, M.J., and Carpenter, S.R. 2003. Development of a regional stock–recruitment model for understanding factors affecting walleye recruitment in northern Wisconsin lakes. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **132**: 382-391.
- Becker, G.C. 1983. *Fishes of Wisconsin*. University of Wisconsin Press, Madison, WI.
- Bethke, B.J., and Staples, D.F. 2015. Changes in relative abundance of several Minnesota fishes from 1970 to 2013. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **144**: 68-80.
- Brownrigg, R. 2016. Original S code by R. A. Becker, A. R. Wilks. Enhancements by T. P. Minka and A. Deckmyn. Draw Geographical Maps. R package version 3.1.0. <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=maps>
- Carpenter, S.R., and Brock, W.A. 2004. Spatial complexity, resilience, and policy diversity: fishing on lake-rich landscapes. *Ecol. Soc.* **9**: <http://hdl.handle.net/10535/12581>.

- 433 Carpenter, S.R., Stanley, E.H., and Vander Zanden, M.J. 2011. State of the world's freshwater
434 ecosystems: physical, chemical, and biological changes. *Annu. Rev. Environ. Resour.* **36**:
435 75-99.
- 436 Chezik, K.A., Lester, N.P., and Venturelli, P.A. 2013. Fish growth and degree-days I: Selecting a
437 base temperature for a single population study. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **71**: 47-55.
- 438 Chu, C., Mandrak, N.E., and Minns, C.K. 2005. Potential impacts of climate change on the
439 distributions of several common and rare freshwater fishes in Canada. *Diversity Distrib.*
440 **11**: 299-310.
- 441 Drake, M.T., and Pereira, D.L. 2002. Development of a fish-based index of biotic integrity for
442 small inland lakes in central Minnesota. *North Am. J. Fish Manage.* **22**: 1105-1123.
- 443 Fang, X., Stefan, H.G., Eaton, J.G., McCormick, J.H., and Alam, S.R. 2004. Simulation of
444 thermal/dissolved oxygen habitat for fishes in lakes under different climate scenarios:
445 Part 1. Cool-water fish in the contiguous US. *Ecol. Model.* **172**: 13-37.
- 446 Fausch, K.D., Lyons, J., Karr, J.R., and Angermeier, P.L. 1990. Fish communities as indicators
447 of environmental degradation. *American Fisheries Society Symposium* **8**: 123-144.
- 448 Fayram, A.H., Hansen, M.J., and Ehlinger, T.J. 2005. Interactions between walleyes and four
449 fish species with implications for walleye stocking. *North Am. J. Fish Manage.* **25**: 1321-
450 1330.
- 451 Fayram, A.H., Schenborn, D.A., Hennessy, J.M., Nate, N.A., and Schmalz, P.J. 2009. Exploring
452 the conflict between broad scale and local inland fisheries management: the risks to
453 agency credibility. *Fisheries* **34**: 232-236.

- 454 Filstrup, C.T., Wagner, T., Soranno, P.A., Stanley, E.H., Stow, C.A., Webster, K.E., and
455 Downing, J.A. 2014. Regional variability among nonlinear chlorophyll-phosphorus
456 relationships in lakes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **59**: 1691-1703.
- 457 Freedman, J.A., Hoxmeier, R.J.H., Einfalt, L.M., Brooks, R.C., and Wahl, D.H. 2012.
458 Largemouth bass predation effect on stocked walleye survival in Illinois impoundments.
459 *North Am. J. Fish Manage.* **32**: 1039-1045.
- 460 Gelman, A., Carlin, J.B., Stern, H.S., and Rubin, D.B. 2004. Bayesian data analysis. Chapman
461 and Hall/CRC, New York, NY.
- 462 Gelman, A., and Hill, J. 2007. Data analysis using regression and multilevel/hierarchical models.
463 Cambridge University Press, New York, NY.
- 464 Hansen, G.J.A., Carpenter, S.R., Gaeta, J.W., Hennessy, J.M., and Vander Zanden, M.J. 2015a.
465 Predicting walleye recruitment as a tool for prioritizing management actions. *Can. J. Fish.*
466 *Aquat. Sci.* **72**: 661-672.
- 467 Hansen, G.J.A., Gaeta, J.W., Hansen, J.F., and Carpenter, S.R. 2015b. Learning to manage and
468 managing to learn: sustaining freshwater recreational fisheries in a changing
469 environment. *Fisheries* **40**: 56-64.
- 470 Hansen, G.J.A., Read, J.S., Hansen, J.F., and Winslow, L.A. 2016. Projected shifts in fish
471 species dominance in Wisconsin lakes under climate change. *Glob. Change. Biol.*: doi:
472 10.1111/gcb.13462.
- 473 Hansen, J.F., Sass, G.G., Gaeta, J.W., Hansen, G.J.A., Isermann, D.A., Lyons, J., and Vander
474 Zanden, M.J. 2015c. Largemouth bass management in Wisconsin: Intra- and Inter-
475 specific implications of abundance increases. *In Black Bass Diversity. Edited by M.*
476 *Allen. American Fisheries Society, Bethesda, MD. pp. 193-206.*

- 477 Hansen, M.J., Bozek, M.A., Newby, J.R., Newman, S.P., and Staggs, M.D. 1998. Factors
478 affecting recruitment of walleyes in Escanaba Lake, Wisconsin, 1958–1996. North Am. J.
479 Fish Manage. **18**: 764-774.
- 480 Hansen, M.J., Newman, S.P., and Edwards, C.J. 2004. A reexamination of the relationship
481 between electrofishing catch rate and age-0 walleye density in northern Wisconsin lakes.
482 North Am. J. Fish Manage. **24**: 429-439.
- 483 Hein, C.L., Öhlund, G., and Englund, G. 2012. Future distribution of Arctic char *Salvelinus*
484 *alpinus* in Sweden under climate change: effects of temperature, lake size and species
485 interactions. AMBIO **41**: 303-312.
- 486 Hilborn, R. 2016. Correlation and causation in fisheries and watershed management. Fisheries
487 **41**: 18-25.
- 488 Hilborn, R., and Walters, C.J. 1992. Quantitative fisheries stock assessment: choice, dynamics,
489 and uncertainty. . Kluwer Academic Publishers, Norwell, MA.
- 490 Hokanson, K.E.F. 1977. Temperature requirements of some percids and adaptations to the
491 seasonal temperature cycle. J. Fish. Res. Bd. Can. **34**: 1524-1550.
- 492 Kallemeyn, L.W. 1987. Correlations of regulated lake levels and climatic factors with abundance
493 of young-of-the-year walleye and yellow perch in four lakes in Voyageurs National Park.
494 North Am. J. Fish Manage. **7**: 513-521.
- 495 Kelling, C.J., Isermann, D.A., Sloss, B.L., and Turnquist, K.N. 2016. Diet overlap and predation
496 between largemouth bass and walleye in Wisconsin lakes using DNA barcoding to
497 improve taxonomic resolution. North Am. J. Fish Manage. **36**: 621-629.

- 498 Keppel, G., Mokany, K., Wardell-Johnson, G.W., Phillips, B.L., Welbergen, J.A., and Reside,
499 A.E. 2015. The capacity of refugia for conservation planning under climate change.
500 Front. Ecol. Environ. **13**: 106-112.
- 501 Keppel, G., and Wardell-Johnson, G.W. 2012. Refugia: keys to climate change management.
502 Glob. Change. Biol. **18**: 2389-2391.
- 503 Kitchell, J., Koonce, J., O'Neill, R., Shugart, H., Jr., Magnuson, J., and Booth, R. 1974. Model of
504 fish biomass dynamics. Trans. Am. Fish. Soc. **103**: 786-798.
- 505 Kitchell, J.F., Stewart, D.J., and Weininger, D. 1977. Applications of a bioenergetics model to
506 yellow perch (*Perca flavescens*) and walleye (*Stizostedion vitreum vitreum*). J. Fish. Res.
507 Bd. Can. **34**: 1922-1935.
- 508 Koonce, J.F., Bagenal, T.B., Carline, R.F., Hokanson, K.E.F., and Nagieć, M. 1977. Factors
509 influencing year-class strength of percids: a summary and a model of temperature effects.
510 J. Fish. Res. Bd. Can. **34**: 1890-1899.
- 511 Lester, N.P., Dextrase, A.J., Kushneriuk, R.S., Rawson, M.R., and Ryan, P.A. 2004. Light and
512 temperature: key factors affecting walleye abundance and production. Trans. Am. Fish.
513 Soc. **133**: 588-605.
- 514 Lester, N.P., Marshall, T.R., Armstrong, K., Dunlop, W.I., and Ritchie, B. 2003. A broad-scale
515 approach to management of Ontario's recreational fisheries. North Am. J. Fish Manage.
516 **23**: 1312-1328.
- 517 Lester, N.P., Shuter, B.J., Venturelli, P., and Nadeau, D. 2014. Life-history plasticity and
518 sustainable exploitation: a theory of growth compensation applied to walleye
519 management. Ecol Appl **24**: 38-54.

- 520 Lynch, A.J., Myers, B.J., Chu, C., Eby, L.A., Falke, J.A., Kovach, R.P., Krabbenhoft, T.J.,
521 Kwak, T.J., Lyons, J., Paukert, C.P., and Whitney, J. 2016. Climate change effects on
522 North American inland fish populations, assemblages, and aquatic communities.
523 *Fisheries* **41**: 346-361.
- 524 Midway, S.R., Wagner, T., Zydiewski, J.D., Irwin, B.J., and Paukert, C.P. 2016. Transboundary
525 fisheries science: Meeting the challenges of inland fisheries management in the 21st
526 Century. *Fisheries* **41**: 536-546.
- 527 Minns, C.K., Cairns, V.W., Randall, R.G., and Moore, J.E. 1994. An index of biotic integrity
528 (IBI) for fish assemblages in the littoral zone of Great Lakes' areas of concern. *Can. J.*
529 *Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **51**: 1804-1822.
- 530 Nakagawa, S., and Schielzeth, H. 2013. A general and simple method for obtaining R^2 from
531 generalized linear mixed-effects models. *Methods Ecol. Evol.* **4**: 133-142.
- 532 Nate, N.A., Bozek, M.A., Hansen, M.J., and Hewett, S.W. 2000. Variation in walleye abundance
533 with lake size and recruitment source. *North Am. J. Fish Manage.* **20**: 119-126.
- 534 O'Reilly, C.M., Sharma, S., Gray, D.K., Hampton, S.E., Read, J.S., Rowley, R.J., Schneider, P.,
535 Lenters, J.D., McIntyre, P.B., Kraemer, B.M., and et al. 2015. Rapid and highly variable
536 warming of lake surface waters around the globe. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **42**: 10773-10781.
- 537 R Development Core Team. 2015. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R
538 Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- 539 Read, J.S., Winslow, L.A., Hansen, G.J.A., Van Den Hoek, J., Hanson, P.C., Bruce, L.C., and
540 Markfort, C.D. 2014. Simulating 2,368 temperate lakes reveals weak coherence in
541 stratification phenology. *Ecol. Model.* **291C**: 142-150.

- 542 Rose, K.C., Winslow, L.A., Read, J.S., and Hansen, G.J.A. 2016. Climate-induced warming of
543 lakes can be either amplified or suppressed by trends in water clarity. *Limnology and*
544 *Oceanography Letters* **1**:44-53. doi:10.1002/lol1002.10027.
- 545 Ryder, R.A. 1965. A method for estimating the potential fish production of north-temperate
546 lakes. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **94**: 214-218.
- 547 Ryder, R.A. 1977. Effects of ambient light variations on behavior of yearling, subadult, and adult
548 walleyes (*Stizostedion vitreum vitreum*). *J. Fish. Res. Bd. Can.* **34**: 1481-1491.
- 549 Schindler, D.W. 2009. Lakes as sentinels and integrators for the effects of climate change on
550 watersheds, airsheds, and landscapes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **54**: 2349-2358.
- 551 Schneider, K.N., Newman, R.M., Card, V., Weisberg, S., and Pereira, D.L. 2010. Timing of
552 walleye spawning as an indicator of climate change. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **139**: 1198-
553 1210.
- 554 Serns, S.L. 1982a. Influence of various factors on density and growth of age-0 walleyes in
555 Escanaba Lake, Wisconsin, 1958–1980. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **111**: 299-306.
- 556 Serns, S.L. 1982b. Relation of temperature and population density to first-year recruitment and
557 growth of smallmouth bass in a Wisconsin lake. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **111**: 570.
- 558 Sharma, S., Jackson, D.A., Minns, C.K., and Shuter, B.J. 2007. Will northern fish populations be
559 in hot water because of climate change? *Glob. Change. Biol.* **13**: 2052-2064.
- 560 Shupp, D.H. 2002. What does Mt. Pinatubo have to do with walleyes? *North Am. J. Fish*
561 *Manage.* **22**: 1014-1020.
- 562 Soranno, P.A., Cheruvilil, K.S., Bissell, E.G., Bremigan, M.T., Downing, J.A., Fergus, C.E.,
563 Filstrup, C.T., Henry, E.N., Lottig, N.R., Stanley, E.H., Stow, C.A., Tan, P.-N., Wagner,

- 564 T., and Webster, K.E. 2014. Cross-scale interactions: quantifying multi-scaled cause–
565 effect relationships in macrosystems. *Front. Ecol. Environ.* **12**: 65-73.
- 566 Su, Y.-S., and Yajima, M. 2015. R2jags: Using R to Run 'JAGS'. R package version 0.5-7:
567 <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=R2jags>.
- 568 Tonn, W.M. 1990. Climate change and fish communities: a conceptual framework. *Trans. Am.*
569 *Fish. Soc.* **119**: 337-352.
- 570 USEPA (United States Environmental Protection Agency). 2003. Elements of a state water
571 monitoring and assessment program. EPA 841-B-03-003. Assessment and Watershed
572 Protection Division, Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watershed. US EPA, Washington,
573 D.C.
- 574 Van Zuiden, T.M., Chen, M.M., Stefanoff, S., Lopez, L., and Sharma, S. 2016. Projected impacts
575 of climate change on three freshwater fishes and potential novel competitive interactions.
576 *Diversity Distrib.* **22**: 603-614. doi:10.1111/ddi.12422.
- 577 Venturelli, P.A., Lester, N.P., Marshall, T.R., and Shuter, B.J. 2010. Consistent patterns of
578 maturity and density-dependent growth among populations of walleye (*Sander vitreus*):
579 application of the growing degree-day metric. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **67**: 1057-1067.
- 580 Wagner, T., Fergus, C.E., Stow, C., Cheruvilil, K.S., and Soranno, P.A. 2016. The statistical
581 power to detect cross-scale interactions at macroscales. *Ecosphere* **7**: e01417.
- 582 Walters, C.J., and Juanes, F. 1993. Recruitment limitation as a consequence of natural selection
583 for use of restricted feeding habitats and predation risk taking by juvenile fishes. *Can. J.*
584 *Fish. Aquat. Sci.* **50**: 2058-2070.

- 585 Wehrly, K.E., Breck, J.E., Wang, L., and Szabo-Kraft, L. 2012. A landscape-based classification
586 of fish assemblages in sampled and unsampled Lakes. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **141**: 414-
587 425.
- 588 Williamson, C.E., Saros, J.E., Vincent, W.F., and Smol, J.P. 2009. Lakes and reservoirs as
589 sentinels, integrators, and regulators of climate change. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **54**: 2273-
590 2282.
- 591 Winslow, L.A., Hansen, G.J.A., Read, J.S., and Notaro, M. *in press*. A large-scale database of
592 modeled contemporary and future projected water temperature data for 10,774 Michigan,
593 Minnesota and Wisconsin lakes. *Scientific Data*.
- 594 Winslow, L.A., Read, J.S., Hansen, G.J.A., and Hanson, P.C. 2015. Small lakes show muted
595 climate change signal in deepwater temperatures. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **42**: 355-361.
- 596 Wisconsin Initiative on Climate Change Impacts. 2009. Maps of recent and projected climate
597 change in Wisconsin. Available from <http://www.wicci.wisc.edu/climate-change.php>
598 [accessed 07 May 2011 2011].
- 599 Wisconsin State Legislature. 2013. 2013 Wisconsin Act 20.
600 <http://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2013/related/acts/2020.pdf>.
- 601 Woodward, G., Perkins, D.M., and Brown, L.E. 2010. Climate change and freshwater
602 ecosystems: impacts across multiple levels of organization. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B* **365**:
603 2093-2106.
- 604 Wuellner, M.R., Chipps, S.R., Willis, D.W., and Adams, W.E. 2010. Interactions between
605 walleyes and smallmouth bass in a missouri river reservoir with consideration of the
606 influence of temperature and prey. *North Am. J. Fish Manage.* **30**: 445-463.

607

Table 1. Predictor variables used in Bayesian hierarchical logistic regression model of walleye recruitment success. Predictor variables enter the model either at level 1 (lake-years, N=2,061) or at level 2 (lake, N=359)

Variable	Level	Mean	Median	Range
Annual degree days (°C·days ⁻¹)	1 (lake-year)	2,400	2,391	1,817–3,462
Annual CV 30-60 days post-ice-off	1 (lake-year)	0.17	0.15	0.04–0.39
Surface area (ha)	2 (lake)	282	108	12–5,377
Conductivity (µS·cm ⁻¹)	2 (lake)	11	81	13–679
Largemouth bass catch (fish·km ⁻¹)	2 (lake)	4	2	0–55
Mean degree days (°C·days ⁻¹)	2 (lake)	2,449	2,393	2,085–3,175

Table 2. Parameter estimates from the Bayesian hierarchical logistic model evaluating the effects of annually varying water temperature degree days on the probability of walleye recruitment success, and the effects of lake-level covariates on the lake-specific mean probability of recruitment success (intercepts) and effect of annual degree days on recruitment success (slopes). Posterior means are provided followed by 90% credible intervals (CIs) in parentheses (90% CIs that do not overlap zero are shown in bold), and the probability that the effect is the direction of the estimated posterior mean (positive or negative).

Description	Symbol	Estimate (90% CI)	Pr (direction of posterior mean)
Population-average intercept	γ_0^α	-1.56 (-1.90, -1.23)	1.0
Effect of lake area on intercept	γ_1^α	0.77 (0.53, 1.02)	1.0
Effect of conductivity on intercept	γ_2^α	0.17 (-0.14, 0.49)	0.81
Effect of largemouth bass relative abundance on intercept	γ_3^α	-1.31 (-1.64, -1.01)	1.0
Effect of mean DD on intercept	γ_4^α	-0.39 (-0.81, 0.03)	0.93
Population-average slope	γ_0^β	-0.11 (-0.34, 0.15)	0.74
Effect of lake area on slope	γ_1^β	-0.05 (-0.21, 0.12)	0.68
Effect of conductivity on slope	γ_2^β	-0.20 (-0.40, 0.06)	0.94

Effect of largemouth bass relative abundance on slope	γ_3^β	-0.22 (-0.43, -0.02)	0.97
Effect of mean DD on slope	γ_4^β	-0.15 (-0.41, 0.11)	0.82

620

621

Draft

FIGURE CAPTIONS

Figure 1. Map of Wisconsin, USA showing the locations of the 359 lakes with walleye recruitment data for which we developed a hierarchical logistic regression model to predict the probability of successful walleye recruitment as a function of annual water temperature degree days (DD). Points are colored by the probability that the effect of DD on walleye recruitment is negative. The three panels show example lakes exemplifying positive (A), uncertain (B) and negative (C) observed relationships between of walleye recruitment success and DD. The 90% credible region for the relationship between DD and the probability of successful recruitment are also shown for each panel. Wisconsin map was created using the ‘maps’ package in R (Brownrigg 2016).

Figure 2. Relationship between lake-specific logit-scaled mean probability of recruitment success (intercepts) and lake area (A), conductivity (B), largemouth bass index of relative abundance (CPE = catch per unit effort) (C) and mean degree days (DD; D). Points are estimated posterior means and vertical lines are 90% credible intervals. Solid line is estimated hierarchical regression line, and shaded regions are 90% credible regions.

Figure 3. Relationship between lake-specific slope parameters describing the relationship between annual water temperature degree days (DD) and the probability of walleye recruitment success and lake area (A), conductivity (B), largemouth bass index of relative abundance (CPE = catch per unit effort) (C) and mean degree days (D). Points are estimated posterior means and vertical lines are 90% credible intervals. Solid line is estimated hierarchical regression line, and shaded region are 90% credible regions. Points are colored by the probability that the effect of DD on walleye recruitment is negative.

644 Figure 4. Predicted probability (posterior means) of walleye recruitment success in Wisconsin
645 lakes based on water temperature degree days in the 1980s (average from 1980–1989; beginning
646 of arrows) to the 2010s (average from 2005–2014; end of arrows). Probability of walleye
647 recruitment success was estimated based on lake-specific degree days and predicted by a
648 hierarchical logistic regression model quantifying lake-specific relationships between annual
649 degree days and walleye recruitment success. Water temperature degree days can affect
650 probability of successful walleye recruitment negatively in some lakes (blue arrows) and
651 positively in others (red arrows).

652

Draft

Map of Wisconsin, USA showing the locations of the 359 lakes with walleye recruitment data for which we developed a hierarchical logistic regression model to predict the probability of successful walleye recruitment as a function of annual water temperature degree days (DD). Points are colored by the probability that the effect of DD on walleye recruitment is negative. The three panels show example lakes exemplifying positive (A), uncertain (B) and negative (C) observed relationships between of walleye recruitment success and DD. The 90% credible region for the relationship between DD and the probability of successful recruitment are also shown for each panel.

176x176mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Relationship between lake-specific logit-scaled mean probability of recruitment success (intercepts) and lake area (A), conductivity (B), largemouth bass index of relative abundance (CPE = catch per unit effort) (C) and mean degree days (DD; D). Points are estimated posterior means and vertical lines are 90% credible intervals. Solid line is estimated hierarchical regression line, and shaded regions are 90% credible regions.

176x176mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Relationship between lake-specific slope parameters describing the relationship between annual water temperature degree days (DD) and the probability of walleye recruitment success and lake area (A), conductivity (B), largemouth bass index of relative abundance (CPE = catch per unit effort) (C) and mean degree days (D). Points are estimated posterior means and vertical lines are 90% credible intervals. Solid line is estimated hierarchical regression line, and shaded region are 90% credible regions. Points are colored by the probability that the effect of DD on walleye recruitment is negative.

176x176mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Predicted probability (posterior means) of walleye recruitment success in Wisconsin lakes based on water temperature degree days in the 1980s (average from 1980–1989; beginning of arrows) to the 2010s (average from 2005–2014; end of arrows). Probability of walleye recruitment success was estimated based on lake-specific degree days and predicted by a hierarchical logistic regression model quantifying lake-specific relationships between annual degree days and walleye recruitment success. Water temperature degree days can affect probability of successful walleye recruitment negatively in some lakes (blue arrows) and positively in others (red arrows).