Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences
Journal canadien des sciences halieutiques et aquatiques

Phenotypic integration of behavioural and physiological traits is related to variation in growth among stocks of Chinook salmon

Journal:	<i>Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences</i>
Manuscript ID	cjfas-2017-0367.R1
Manuscript Type:	Article
Date Submitted by the Author:	31-Jan-2018
Complete List of Authors:	Dender, Mitchel; University of Windsor, GLIER Capelle, Pauline ; University of Windsor, GLIER Love, Oliver; University of Windsor, GLIER Heath, Daniel; University of Windsor Heath, John; Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd., Semeniuk, Christina; University of Windsor, GLIER
Is the invited manuscript for consideration in a Special Issue? :	N/A
Keyword:	AQUACULTURE < General, Behaviour, Diel cortisol, GROWTH < General, Chinook salmon

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Phenotypic integration of behavioural and physiological traits is related to variation in growth among stocks of Chinook salmon

MITCHEL G.E. DENDER¹, PAULINE M. CAPELLE², OLIVER P. LOVE², DANIEL D. HEATH¹, JOHN. W. HEATH³, CHRISTINA A.D. SEMENIUK^{1,*}

¹ *Great Lakes Institute for Environmental Research, University of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario N9B 3P4, Canada*

² *Department of Biological Sciences, University of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario N9B 3P4, Canada*

³ *Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd., Heriot Bay, BC, Canada V0P 1H0*

* Corresponding author. Great Lakes Institute for Environmental Research, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Ave., Windsor, Ontario, Canada N9B 3P4. Tel.: +1 519 253 3000 ext. 3763

E-mail address: semeniuk@uwindsor.ca (C.A.D. Semeniuk)

Running headline: Phenotypic integration benefits salmon growth

Abstract

The selection for a single organismal trait like growth in breeding programs of farmed aquaculture species can counter-intuitively lead to lowered harvestable biomass. We outbred a domesticated aquaculture stock of Chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*) with 7 wild stocks from British Columbia, Canada. We then examined how functionally related traits underlying energy management - diel variation in cortisol; foraging, social, and movement behaviours - predicted stock-level variation in growth during the freshwater life history stage, a performance metric under aquaculture selection. Outbreeding generated significant variation in diel cortisol secretion and behaviours across stocks, and these traits covaried, suggesting tight integration despite hybridization. The coupling of nighttime cortisol exposure with daytime behavioural phenotype was the strongest predictor of stock-level variation in body mass. Our results suggest selecting for an integrated phenotype rather than on single mechanistic traits alone can generate the greatest effect on aquaculture fish growth under outbreeding practices. Furthermore, selecting for these traits at the stock level may increase efficiency of farming methods designed to consistently maximize fish performance on a large scale.

Key words: Aquaculture, Behaviour, Diel cortisol, Phenotypic integration, Functional traits, Growth, Chinook salmon,

36 **Introduction**

37 For the first time on record, people are consuming more farm-raised than wild-caught fish
38 (FAO 2016), and urbanization is simultaneously creating a greater demand for both improved
39 quantity and quality protein due to its recognition in healthy diets (Clapp & Cohen 2009;
40 Henchion et al. 2017). Aquaculture production has been relieving the pressure on wild fish
41 populations by attempting to provide a more sustainable and economic source of protein (FAO
42 2016). However, aquaculture faces the same challenges as other farming practices: to harvest the
43 greatest amount of product at the minimum operator cost. As with any domestication process,
44 fish stocks have the tendency to inadvertently become inbred when only selecting the largest,
45 fastest growing individuals as broodstock (Bentsen & Olesen 2002), thereby becoming
46 susceptible to disease (Arkush et al. 2002), experiencing slower growth (Kincaid 1983), or
47 having low fecundity (Su et al. 1996). (Re)introducing alleles at fertilization is the classic
48 method of lessening the effects of inbreeding depression via the outbreeding of domestic
49 broodstock with wild individuals (Lehnert et al. 2014). First generation (F1) hybrid offspring of
50 wild-caught and domesticated parents may experience benefits associated with outbreeding such
51 as increased size (i.e., hybrid vigour: Gharrett et al. 1999; Whitlock et al. 2000). However, stocks
52 may also experience outbreeding depression (Allendorf et al. 2001; Neff et al. 2011), whereby a
53 shift in mean phenotype occurs and causes a reduction in growth (Tymchuk et al. 2006) and
54 survival (Gharrett et al. 1999; Tallmon et al. 2004; Edmands 2007). These discrepancies can be
55 explained through the evolutionary concept of an integrated phenotype (Murren 2012), which
56 recognizes that optimal functioning of the organism requires multiple traits to work in unison. As
57 such, when genetic recombination disrupts the evolutionary orchestration of integrated traits,
58 individual performance and fitness can be compromised (Lancaster et al. 2010).

To enhance the performance of captive stocks, aquaculture producers should ideally be able to assess whether the genotypes selected for outcrossing will maintain the expression of maximal performance metrics such as growth through the continued integration of key phenotypic traits (e.g., traits related to energetic management) that ultimately increase harvest biomass (Tallmon et al. 2004). One of these metrics is the ability to manage energetic homeostasis, both physiologically and behaviourally, since energetic management is widely recognized as critical for maximizing growth in aquaculture (Boisclair and Sirois 1993; Silverstein et al. 1999). In particular, diel management of baseline levels of glucocorticoids is important for overall energetic balance via the optimal timing of fuel mobilization (e.g., glucose, lipids, and fatty acids; Gregory and Wood 1999). Likewise, behavioural traits related to energetics such as aggression, schooling, neophilia, and coping style all directly affect the ability of an individual to acquire, consume, and efficiently convert food to tissue (Gregory and Wood 1999; Almazán-Rueda et al. 2005; Martins et al. 2006). Collectively, physiological and behavioural traits related to energy management are expected to impact fitness (Gilmour et al. 2005), yet the linkages among these traits in novel environments remain largely unexplored.

Here we apply the framework of phenotypic integration (Ketterson et al. 2009; Lancaster et al. 2010; Murren 2012) to assess the impacts of outbreeding on performance at an important early life-history stage within an emerging model of Pacific salmonid aquaculture (Chinook salmon; *Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*). Specifically, our objectives are to determine whether: 1) outcrossing a domesticated stock with multiple wild populations generates variability in traits expected to impact juvenile growth (e.g., diel cortisol patterns, exposure to cortisol during nighttime and daytime, and behavioural phenotype); 2) physiological and behavioural traits are tightly coupled; and 3) taking an integrative, compared to a traditional, single-trait approach,

better predicts variation in growth in an aquaculture setting. We examine these questions using a domesticated stock outbred with wild genotypes from 7 regional populations in coastal British Columbia, Canada. We focused these questions on an early-life stage given the recently highlighted importance of identifying mechanisms controlling early development since these are considered significant for the determination of developmental windows that most impact growth variation and survival (Valente et al. 2013). Given the high degree of local adaptation of semelparous Pacific salmon (Taylor 1991), reflecting the environment-specific functional properties of specific loci (Carlson & Seamons 2008), our chosen system also provides the unique opportunity to examine whether physiology and behaviours associated with energy management become decoupled in a hybrid F1 generation, and whether the expression of energy-management phenotypes is optimally related to growth in a novel, captive environment. Given that adaptive covariation between physiology and behaviour should be ultimately linked to performance (McGlothlin et al. 2007), selection for suitable captive phenotypes expressing optimal cortisol-behavioural trait combinations should be critical for producing the ideal farmed fish. As such, we expected hybridized stocks expressing an optimal combination of low daytime baseline cortisol (representing low energetic demand), intermediate nighttime baseline cortisol (representing the ability to mobilize energy without entering stress-induced levels; Mommsen et al. 1999), and favorable energy management behaviours (e.g., high foraging rates, high sociality, and lower movement) to exhibit the largest mean body mass.

Methods

Animal husbandry and growth

Research was conducted at Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd. (YIAL) on Quadra Island, British Columbia (latitude: N 50° 7' 59.124"; longitude: W 125° 19' 51.834"). The YIAL Chinook salmon population originated from crosses made in 1985 from two nearby hatcheries: Robertson Creek (latitude: N 49° 18' 37.8792"; longitude: W 124° 57' 36.4392") and Big Qualicum River (latitude: N 49° 21' 56.3616"; longitude: W 124° 39' 6.2964"). The domesticated YIAL stock has been maintained in captivity for seven generations. In 2013, sires from 7 wild stocks originating from tributaries on Vancouver Island and the lower mainland of British Columbia (Figure 1) were selected for generating outbred crossed stocks with YIAL dams, with an additional YIAL x YIAL stock serving as a control (Semeniuk et al. submitted). Gamete collection and fertilization occurred during October and November of 2013, with milt of 10 males from each stock fertilizing mixed eggs from 17 YIAL dams, who were the offspring of self-fertilization in one functional hermaphrodite, to control for known maternal effects on growth (Heath et al. 1999). After incubation in vertical-stack trays, fry were transferred on March 14, 2014 to 200 L barrels (mean: 122 ± 5 fish per barrel; range: 120-136) split by stock and duplicated to account for barrel effects (n=16 barrels), with a flow through water system maintained between 10–12 °C and water turnover at 1 L/min. All barrels were cleaned approximately every 7 days and dissolved oxygen was monitored once a week and maintained above 80% saturation. Fish were fed to satiation 8 times daily between 8:00am to 5:00pm, and mortalities removed every two days (mean mortality rate (March 26-June 4, 2014): $2.52 \pm 3.9\%$ per barrel; range: 0-16 fish). For this study, barrels for each stock consisted of a mixture of all 10 families. On June 6, 2014, a random subset of 10–13 individual fish were removed from every barrel, individually weighed to the nearest 0.01g, and

fish were returned to their original barrel. Body mass at this stage was used as our performance metric to represent early growth from the fry stage, a critical freshwater life-history stage under strong selection in aquaculture (Piper et al. 1982).

Blood sampling and cortisol assays

We sampled fish for diel cortisol patterns at 8 months post fertilization, over a three-day period beginning on June 25, 2014. Specifically, six fish from each stock were sampled (alternating between barrel replicates) at 6 time periods across the entire diel cycle for a total sample size of 36 fish per stock (Figure 2A). These specific sampling times were chosen to represent both key periods over the 24-hour period where fish have been shown to be active behaviourally and physiologically (Thorpe et al. 1987; Gries et al. 1997; Pavlidis et al. 1999; Bremset 2000), to capture as much finer-scale variation with day- and night-time periods as possible. Fish were captured via dip net, immediately euthanized in a clove oil solution, and blood was collected via caudal severance using heparinized hematocrit tubes. All sampling was completed within 5 minutes of the initial disturbance to account for increases in cortisol due to capture and handling, and a given barrel was only sampled once every 24 hours to ensure that individuals had not been disturbed from a previous capture session. Packed red blood cells were then separated from plasma via centrifugation at 14,000 rpm (13,331 g) and plasma was stored at -80°C until further analyses. Baseline plasma cortisol was determined using a cortisol enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (Cayman Chemical, MI, USA) optimized in-house for use in juvenile Chinook salmon (Capelle et al. 2016). Samples were run in triplicate across fourteen assay plates at 1:20 dilution. Individual assay plates included standard curves and common control samples,

and were read at a wavelength of 412nm using a spectrophotometer (Biotek Inc). Inter- and intra-assay coefficients of variation were 11.0% and 4.6%, respectively.

Behavioural analysis

All barrels (2 barrels per stock) were each filmed once over a span of seven days (June 3–10, 2014). GoPro cameras (Woodman Labs, USA) were placed on the bottom center of the barrels at ~6:00am and behaviours were recorded for 1.5 hours. At 1 hour post camera deployment, fish in the barrels were fed ~4.2g of feed. Feed amount was calculated using Taplow Feeding charts (Chilliwack, BC, Canada), with daily amounts representing ~2% of the biomass in a barrel to match a satiated growth promotion diet. Behavioural analyses consisted of: assigning a score to the degree of group cohesion, calculating individual swimming velocity, and scoring uniformity of gregarious swimming direction fifteen minutes prior and post the addition of food, at one-minute intervals. During food presentation, position and movement of a subset of fish (~60) were noted, as well as latency (in seconds) to resume pre-feeding behaviours (see supplementary materials, Tables S1 and S2). Behavioural videos of the Capilano-River stock were highly distorted due to unforeseen technical issues and thus this population was excluded from all behavioural analysis.

Statistical analysis

All analyses were conducted using JMP version 12 (SAS Institute Inc.), except where indicated. Prior to analysis, model assumptions of normality and homogeneity of variances were tested by visual inspection of residual versus predicted plots, and normality was confirmed using the

Shapiro–Wilk test. Non-normally distributed data were $\log^{10}$ transformed where indicated. In all cases, results were evaluated for significance at $\alpha = 0.05$.

To describe diel cortisol variation across all stocks, a general linear model with stock, time of day, and their interaction included as fixed effects was used. Cortisol data were $\log^{10}$ transformed to achieve normality. Next, the area under the diel cortisol curve (AUC) was calculated for daytime (6am–6pm) and nighttime (6pm–6am) cortisol (see Figure 2A), following Pruessner et al. (2003) as an estimate of the amount of hormone fish were exposed to (aggregated at the stock level), and as a means to capture the potential different roles of cortisol across the 24-hour cycle. Daytime and nighttime cortisol exposures were pooled separately for each stock but differences were examined using a paired t-test.

Behavioural variables from video recordings were grouped *a priori* into three categories with known implications for fish growth and consisting of distinct variables: Foraging, Sociality, and Movement (Fernö et al., 1988; Fernö et al., 1995; Oppedal et al., 2011). A principal component analysis (PCA) with varimax rotation was used for initial exploration of each behavioural category independently to reduce redundancies in the data and to create more homogenous groupings. Each ‘factor’ extracted explained a minimum of 35% of the variance in behaviour based on the Kaiser criterion (eigenvalue >1) and visual inspection of variance plots (Table S1), and were retained for the second stage of PCA. In the second stage, the rotated factors resulting from each behavioural category were loaded into a PCA to produce an overall behavioural phenotype. This PCA produced only a single component with an eigenvalue score that was >1 (eigenvalue = 2.3), explained 38.3% of the overall variance, and was used in subsequent models. High positive scores were associated with fish that spent longer time feeding, retained group

cohesiveness, and collectively exhibited consistent swimming directions, suggestive of more efficient energetic management.

To investigate the effects of cortisol and behaviour on growth, analyses were conducted using daytime and nighttime cortisol exposure separately. To first confirm the coupling of cortisol during daytime and nighttime directly with behaviour, we used a linear regression with the behavioural phenotype score regressed against cortisol exposure (AUC_{night} or AUC_{day}). Next, we assessed whether each trait in isolation or in combination influenced size using linear regressions with mean body mass per population as the response variable (from the sub-sample of individuals weighed prior to the experiment and averaged across replicate barrels), and population-level behavioural phenotype with nighttime cortisol exposure (AUC_{night}) or daytime cortisol exposure (AUC_{day}) as the explanatory variables. Both linear and quadratic terms for cortisol and behaviour were used in a subset of models to account for any hormetic relationships (Schreck 2010). For model selection, we used a combination of fit, significance, and AIC modified for small sample size (AIC_c) using the package “AICcmodavg” in R (Mazerolle and Mazerolle 2017).

All analyses were aggregated to the level of the population since screening at the individual level is not necessarily a feasible practice within aquaculture (Castanheira et al. 2013; Pigliucci, 2003). Instead, determining whether integrated phenotypes exist at the population level is not only practical, but since intraspecific variability influences fundamental evolutionary processes of adaptation (Bennett et al. 2016), it also increases the potential that the desired phenotypes will remain robust under the stresses of captivity in subsequent generations.

218 **Results**

219 **Variation in diel cortisol and behaviour among stocks**

220 Stock and time of day interacted to influence baseline cortisol levels ($F_{47,279} = 14.01$, $n = 280$, $p <$
 221 0.001). While each stock showed similar diel rhythms in their baseline cortisol (Figure 2A), they
 222 differed in overall exposure to cortisol across the full 24-hour cycle (Figure 2B). In addition,
 223 daytime cortisol exposure was significantly lower than nighttime exposure (*paired t*(6) = 5.59, p
 224 < 0.001). The behavioural phenotype scores for different stocks ranged from -1.88 (Nitinat) to
 225 2.23 (Chilliwack), and were additionally composed of differences in the contributions of each
 226 independent behavioural trait (Figure 2C).

228 **Integrated effects of cortisol and behaviour on growth**

229 Daytime cortisol exposure had a negative linear relationship with behavioural phenotype ($R^2 =$
 230 0.64 , $p = 0.031$; Figure 3), while nighttime cortisol exposure showed no such relationship ($R^2 =$
 231 0.12 , $p = 0.44$). As univariate predictors of performance, nighttime cortisol exposure and
 232 behavioural phenotype each showed a non-linear, hormetic relationship with body mass (cortisol:
 233 $R^2 = 0.94$, $p = 0.003$, AICc = 6.1; quadratic regression: body mass = $(4.44 - 0.002 * (\text{AUC}_{\text{night}} -$
 234 $75.31)^2$); (behaviour: $R^2 = 0.95$, $p = 0.003$, AICc = 5.8, quadratic regression: body mass =
 235 $(4.03 - (0.12 * \text{behaviour}^2))$). AUC_{day} had no effect on body mass (linear or quadratic
 236 relationships; $R^2 < 0.4$, $p\text{-values} > 0.36$, AICc's > 11.0). However, the inclusion of both
 237 nighttime cortisol exposure and behaviour increased the model's predictive ability and its
 238 weighting to explain variation in body mass, with stocks exhibiting mid-range in nighttime
 239 cortisol exposure and high energy-management behaviours having the largest body masses ($R^2 =$
 240 0.998 , $p = 0.07$, AICc = -143.3 ; Figure 4A). There was no meaningful or significant integration

of daytime cortisol exposure with behavioural phenotype on body mass. All models tested are included in Table S3.

Discussion

Rapid human population growth and increases in anthropogenic stressors on wild ecosystems require improved efficiency in alternative food-production systems such as aquaculture to keep pace with world demand for protein (Green et al. 2005). However, aquaculture practices such as selecting for fast growing individuals can inadvertently decrease stock genetic diversity and/or co-select for undesirable traits that will ultimately impact production (Castanheira et al. 2017). We sought to determine whether outbreeding a domesticated Chinook salmon stock with multiple wild populations resulted in the optimal integration of physiological and behavioural traits at the nexus of energetic management, and if this integration lead to maximized performance at an early-life freshwater stage. Outbreeding generated significant variability in physiological and behavioural traits that are associated with energetic management and known to impact growth. As predicted by the theory of phenotypic integration (Murren 2012), growth was influenced by a coupling of nighttime cortisol exposure and behavioural phenotype, specifically with intermediate cortisol values and high energy-management behaviours combining to generate an optimized hormetic relationship to maximize body size. Our results also suggest that examining the effects of the co-variation of multiple functionally related traits on body mass is a stronger approach than examining these traits in isolation. Moreover, relationships that exist between phenotypic traits such as daytime cortisol exposure and behaviour do not imply integration (and by extension maximized performance), highlighting that only within the context of a performance measure can phenotypic integration be revealed. While phenotypic correlations

among traits have been extensively studied, fewer have been examined in light of performance- or fitness outcomes, and fewer still across multiple populations. This is the first study to show how among-population coupling of physiological and behavioural traits can influence early-life metrics such as growth rate (here measured as body mass), considered important in assessing long-term success in aquaculture (Valente et al. 2013). This work therefore suggests that researchers and producers may benefit from determining how phenotypic integration impacts early-life performance when employing methods such as outbreeding to enhance or rescue breeding programs.

Impacts of outcrossing on variability in performance-mediated traits

Optimal management of energy budgets over both short- and long-term periods within the constraints of local environmental variation is expected to maximize fitness (Fong 1975; Taylor 1991; Sanford & Kelly 2011), a critical consideration for production output in aquaculture (Akvaforsk 2005). Outbreeding in our study produced substantial variation in diel physiological and behavioural traits central to daily energetic management. We focused on diel variation in baseline cortisol because it can differentially affect growth by regulating metabolic processes and promoting homeostasis in fish (Mommsen et al. 1999). In diurnal vertebrates, an optimal diel cortisol cycle consists of high levels early in the morning to provide the energy via gluconeogenesis following night fasting (Dallman et al. 1993), to initiate foraging and other activities (Astheimer et al. 1992; Breuner et al. 1999; Breuner and Hahn 2003). Levels then tend to decline for the remainder of the day to avoid the “high cost of living” associated with maintaining high baseline circulating glucocorticoid levels (Sapolsky et al. 2000; Bernier et al. 2004). Although our data confirm that all populations showed strong diel rhythms in baseline

cortisol, populations nonetheless differed significantly in patterns of cortisol exposure during night and day. Outbreeding also generated a range in behavioural traits associated with energetic management, and when combined with differences in cortisol exposure, revealed certain stocks to be less ideally suited to captive environments as evidenced by the resultant low body size.

The differences observed among stocks are presumably driven by large sire effects that result from genetic differences among the source stocks that have arisen through local adaptation and potentially genetic drift (Fraser et al. 2011). The sire effect would have dominated possible dam effects among stocks given that we used a common inbred line of domestic dams to both minimize maternal effects and equalize any influences across all stocks (as eggs were also pooled). Within our study, not all hybrid stocks showed high performance. While there are many possible causes of this pattern of reduced performance, one may be the poor performance of the F1 generation is due to the intermediate phenotypes generated by hybridization which are unsuited to the domestic parental environments (Frankham et al. 2002; McClelland & Naish 2007). Another mechanistic cause of lowered performance in hybrid stocks may be intrinsic outbreeding depression due to the disruption of epistatic interactions in large co-adapted gene complexes (Edmands 1999); however, we do not believe this to be the case since previous studies have shown Chinook salmon F1 hybrids of genetically different parental lines demonstrate no evidence of hybrid breakdown (Lehnert et al. 2014). Instead, suboptimal performance of juvenile Chinook salmon of certain stocks most likely reflects local adaptation of performance traits within freshwater systems that are very important for the success of early life-history stages of anadromous, semelparous salmonids (Waples 1991). When different genotypes are raised in common environments, the impacts of these locally adapted phenotypes persist and are known to generate significant variation in performance outcomes (McClelland & Naish

2007), and so deliberate selection of these tightly integrated traits will be robust past the F1 generation and persist through multiple generations. However, the potential for non-additive genetic effects coupled with residual epigenetic effects may interfere with the predictable inheritance of some of the traits measured.

Effects of outcrossing on the outcome of phenotypic integration under novel captive conditions

Traditionally, researchers have focussed on single traits rather than multi-trait combinations to predict fitness or performance of wild populations (Gilmour et al. 2005; Killen et al. 2013). However, since traits that depend on common mechanisms for their expression may evolve as a unit (McGlothlin & Ketterson 2008), ignoring the potential for synergistic effects of integrated phenotypes on performance can limit our appreciation of their adaptive value (Pigliucci 2003; Ketterson et al. 2009; Laughlin & Messier 2015). In our study, examining interactions between physiology and behaviour suggested that daytime cortisol exposure predicted behavioural phenotype in a simple linear fashion, setting up the expectation that both would interact to impact growth. However, an integrated phenotypic approach revealed it was the combination of exposure to nighttime cortisol and behaviour that was the best predictor of maximized growth across the 7 stocks, with stocks having mid-range nighttime cortisol exposure and maximal energetics behaviour exhibiting the highest body mass (Figure 4A).

Chronically high cortisol levels are known to negatively impact behavioural traits such as foraging and competitive ability due to a reduction in appetite (Gregory & Wood 1999) and can inhibit aggression and locomotion in salmonids (Øverli et al. 2002). As such, prolonged exposure can lead to tertiary responses such as slow growth, reduced immune function, and compromised

survival (Pickering & Pottinger 1983; Barton 2002). In our study, stocks with individuals that expressed elevated daytime cortisol exposure may have incurred these behavioural costs that led to reduced growth. During nighttime, when fish were not fed and feeding activity was much reduced (Fraser & Metcalfe 1997), cortisol plays a more direct role in growth: elevated baseline levels maintain energetic homeostasis, allowing stored glycogen in the liver (generated from food consumed and digested during the day) to be mobilized as glucose to fuel the maintenance and growth of tissues (see Dallman et al. 1993). Behaviours that promote energy gain while reducing energetic costs of locomotion (including sociality) are generally assumed to lead to the highest growth (e.g., foraging efficiency: Eklöv, 1992; high cohesiveness: Johnsson 2003). Interestingly, as a sole (univariate) measure, these maximized behaviours seemingly had a counter-intuitive, negative effect on growth (i.e., significant hormetic relationship), and yet as an integrated unit with physiology, these same behaviours conferred the greatest performance. We therefore argue that an integrated approach situated within a performance context is needed to understand how underlying traits will ultimately impact performance in aquaculture. We also demonstrate that with this integrated relationship - visualized as a contour plot (Figure 4B), there exists the potential for further selection of integrated traits to maximize production. For instance, *actively* selecting for specific behaviours (i.e., greater locomotory-, foraging efficiency, and sociality) - should these traits remain co-varied within a physiological range, can result in even greater mass gains than those observed. This integrated selection approach at the stock level can be of value for other performance traits (such as disease resistance) and in other breeding programs, outside of salmon culture: it is not only feasible for farming methods that must routinely document production data of functional traits and performance on a large scale, but can be used to possibly increase efficiency as well.

Conclusions

While phenotypic integration can increase organismal performance by optimizing the adaptive phenotype over evolutionary time, it may decrease flexibility in a changing environment (Schlichting 1989). This apparent trade-off is an important realization for evolutionary biologists and applied producers since both robust and flexible phenotypes carry costs due to (1) the potential for a “mismatched” phenotype to a given environment (Hendry 2004; Nosil et al. 2005) and (2) the associated energetic costs of flexibility (DeWitt et al. 1998; Snell-Rood 2013), respectively. In fact, with regards to food production, abrupt changes in environment (e.g., from the wild to captivity, or fresh water to salt water) may better suit a less flexible and instead a more integrated phenotype, as the temporal lag in endocrine activity and its associated behavioural response may be too slow (and take several generations) to adaptively respond to changing conditions (Taff & Vitousek 2016). Since the management of cortisol is intimately involved in the osmoregulatory transition of fish from fresh to salt water (rev. in McCormick 2012), we would predict that (above and beyond energetic management) a tighter integration between cortisol and behaviour could also result in a less costly transition. Taken together, appreciating population-level effects associated with integrated energetic management has the ability to better inform researchers and aquaculture producers about early-life stage mechanisms that influence variation in growth and survival (Valente et al. 2013), and that can also undergo intentional selection for increased food production long-term.

377 **Acknowledgements**

378 We thank Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd, especially Dr. Ann Heath, J. Drown and the YIAL
379 staff (N. Antonioli, K. Jones, E. Haugen and D. Meester) for fish care and providing the
380 facilities for the experiments. We also thank C. Harris and K. Janisse for lab assistance, and all
381 field volunteers. This manuscript was improved by the input of three anonymous reviewers. We
382 thank the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of Canada for Strategic
383 Partnership Grant and Discovery Grant funding to DDH, OPL, and CADS, and the Canada
384 Research Chairs program for funding to OPL. All research followed the University of Windsor
385 Animal Care Committee guidelines (AUPP #13-22) for the care and use of animals and complied
386 with the Canadian Council on Animal Care guidelines.

References

- Akvaforsk Å. 2005 Selection and breeding programs in aquaculture. Gjedrem T, editor. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Allendorf FW, Leary RF, Spruell P, Wenburg JK. 2001 The problems with hybrids: setting conservation guidelines. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **16**, 613–622. (doi:10.1016/S0169-5347(01)02290-X)
- Almazán-Rueda P, Van Helmond ATM, Verreth JAJ, Schrama JW. 2005 Photoperiod affects growth, behaviour and stress variables in *Clarias gariepinus*. *J. Fish Biol.* **67**, 1029–1039. (doi:10.1111/j.0022-1112.2005.00806.x)
- Arkush KD, Giese AR, Mendonca HL, McBride AM, Marty GD, Hedrick PW. 2002 Resistance to three pathogens in the endangered winter-run chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*): effects of inbreeding and major histocompatibility complex genotypes. *Can. J. Fish Aquat. Sci.* **59**, 966–975. (doi:10.1139/f02-066)
- Astheimer LB, Buttemer WA, Wingfield JC. 1992 Interactions of corticosterone with feeding, activity and metabolism in passerine birds. *Ornis Scand.* **23**, 355–365. (doi:10.2307/3676661)
- Barton BA. 2002 Stress in fishes: a diversity of responses with particular reference to changes in circulating corticosteroids. *Integr. Comp. Biol.* **42**, 517–525. (doi:10.1093/icb/42.3.517)
- Bennett MG, Whiles MR, Whitley GW. 2016 Population-level responses of life history traits to flow regime in three common stream fish species. *Ecohydrology* **9**, 1388–1399.
- Bentsen HB, Olesen I. 2002 Designing aquaculture mass selection programs to avoid high inbreeding rates. *Aquaculture* **204**, 349–359. (doi:10.1016/S0044-8486(01)00846-8)

- 409 Bernier NJ, Bedard N, Peter RE. 2004 Effects of cortisol on food intake, growth, and forebrain
410 neuropeptide Y and corticotropin-releasing factor gene expression in goldfish. *Gen.*
411 *Comp. Endocrinol.* **135**, 230–240. (doi:10.1016/j.ygcen.2003.09.016)
- 412 Boisclair D, Sirois P. 1993 Testing assumptions of fish bioenergetics models by direct estimation
413 of growth, consumption, and activity rates. *T. Am. Fish Soc.* **122**, 784–796.
414 (doi:10.1577/1548-8659)
- 415 Bremset, G. 2000 Seasonal and diel changes in behaviour, microhabitat use and preferences by
416 young pool-dwelling Atlantic salmon, *Salmo salar*, and brown trout, *Salmo trutta*. *Env.*
417 *Biol. Fishes.* **59**, 163–179. (doi:10.1023/A:100769131)
- 418 Breuner CW, Hahn TP. 2003 Integrating stress physiology, environmental change, and behavior
419 in free-living sparrows. *Horm. Behav.* **43**, 115–123. (doi:10.1016/S0018-506X(02)00020-
420 X)
- 421 Breuner CW, Wingfield JC, Romero LM. 1999 Diel rhythms of basal and stress-induced
422 corticosterone in a wild, seasonal vertebrate, Gambel's white-crowned sparrow. *J. Exp.*
423 *Zool.* **284**, 334–342. (doi:10.1002/(SICI)1097-010X(19990801)284:3<334::AID-
424 JEZ11>3.0.CO;2-#)
- 425 Capelle PM, Semeniuk CAD, Sopinka NM, Heath JW, Love OP. 2016 Prenatal stress exposure
426 generates higher early survival and smaller size without impacting developmental rate in
427 a Pacific salmon. *J. Exp. Zool. Part A* **325**, 641–650. (doi:10.1002/jez.2058)
- 428 Carlson SM, Seamons TR. 2008 A review of quantitative genetic components of fitness in
429 salmonids: implications for adaptation to future change. *Evol. Appl.* **1**, 222–238.
430 (doi:10.1111/j.1752-4571.2008.00025.x)

- 431 Castanheira MF, Herrera M, Costas B, Conceição LE, Martins CIM. 2013 Can we predict
432 personality in fish? Searching for consistency over time and across contexts. *PLoS One*.
433 **8**, e62037. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0062037)
- 434 Castanheira MF, Conceicao LEC, Millot S, Rey S, Bégout M-L, Damsgard B, Kristiansen T,
435 Höglund E, Øverli Ø, Martins CIM 2017 Coping styles in farmed fish: consequences for
436 aquaculture." *Reviews in Aquaculture* **9**: 23-41.
- 437 Clapp J, Cohen MJ, editors. 2009 The global food crisis: Governance challenges and
438 opportunities. Wilfrid Laurier Univ. Press. **1**, 1–288.
- 439 Dallman MF, Strack AM, Akana SF, Bradbury MJ, Hanson ES, Scribner KA, Smith M. 1993
440 Feast and famine: critical role of glucocorticoids with insulin in daily energy flow. *Front.*
441 *Neuroendocrinol.* **14**, 303–347. (doi:10.1006/frne.1993.1010)
- 442 DeWitt TJ, Sih A, Wilson DS. 1998 Costs and limits of phenotypic plasticity. *Trends Ecol. Evol.*
443 **13**, 77–81. (doi:10.1016/S0169-5347(97)01274-3)
- 444 Edmands S. 1999 Heterosis and outbreeding depression in interpopulation crosses spanning a
445 wide range of divergence. *Evolution* **53**, 1757–1768. (doi:10.2307/2640438)
- 446 Edmands S. 2007 Between a rock and a hard place: evaluating the relative risks of inbreeding
447 and outbreeding for conservation and management. *Mol. Ecol.* **16**, 463–475.
448 (doi:10.1111/j.1365-294X.2006.03148)
- 449 Eklöv P. 1992 Group foraging versus solitary foraging efficiency in piscivorous predators: the
450 perch, *Perca fluviatilis*, and pike, *Esox lucius*, patterns. *Anim. Behav.* **44**, 313–326.
451 (doi:10.1016/0003-3472(92)90037-A)
- 452 FAO. 2016 The State of World Fisheries and Aquaculture. Rome. 1–204.

- 453 Fernö A, Furevik DM, Huse I, Bjordal Å. 1988 A multiple approach to behaviour studies of
454 salmon reared in marine net pens. ICES.
- 455 Fernö A, Huse I, Juell J-E, Bjordal Å. 1995 Vertical distribution of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*
456 L.) in net pens: trade-off between surface light avoidance and food attraction.
457 *Aquaculture* **132**, 285–296. (doi:10.1016/0044-8486(94)00384-Z)
- 458 Frankham R, Briscoe DA, Ballou JD. 2002 Introduction to conservation genetics. Cambridge
459 University Press.
- 460 Fraser NH, Metcalfe NB. 1997 The costs of becoming nocturnal: feeding efficiency in relation to
461 light intensity in juvenile Atlantic salmon. *Funct. Ecol.* **11**, 385–391.
462 (doi:10.1046/j.1365-2435.1997.00098.x)
- 463 Fraser DJ, Weir LK, Bernatchez L, Hansen MM, Taylor EB. 2011 Extent and scale of local
464 adaptation in salmonid fishes: review and meta-analysis. *Heredity* **106**, 404–420.
465 (doi:10.1038/hdy.2010.167)
- 466 Fong H. 1975 Animal physiology: adaptation and environment. *Yale J. Biol. Med.* **48**, 262–263.
- 467 Gharrett AJ, Smoker WW, Reisenbichler RR, Taylor SG. 1999 Outbreeding depression in
468 hybrids between odd-and even-broodyear pink salmon. *Aquaculture* **173**, 117–129.
469 (doi:10.1016/S0044-8486(98)00480-3)
- 470 Gilmour KM, Wilson RW, Sloman KA. 2005 The integration of behaviour into comparative
471 physiology. *Physiol. Biochem. Zool.* **78**, 669–678. (doi:10.1086/432144)
- 472 Green RE, Cornell SJ, Scharlemann JP, Balmford A. 2005 Farming and the fate of wild nature.
473 *Science* **307**, 550–555. (doi:10.1126/science.1106049)

- 474 Gregory TR, Wood CM. 1999 The effects of chronic plasma cortisol elevation on the feeding
475 behaviour, growth, competitive ability, and swimming performance of juvenile rainbow
476 trout. *Physiol. Biochem. Zool.* **72**, 286–295. (doi:10.1086/316673)
- 477 Gries, G, Whalen, KG, Juanes, F, Parrish, DL. 1997 Nocturnal activity of juvenile Atlantic
478 salmon (*Salmo salar*) in late summer: evidence of diel activity partitioning. *Can. J. Fish.*
479 *Aquat. Sci.* **54**, 1408–1413. (doi:[10.1139/f97-046](https://doi.org/10.1139/f97-046))
- 480 Heath DD, Fox CW, Heath JW. 1999 Maternal effects on offspring size: variation through early
481 development of chinook salmon. *Evolution* **53**, 1605–1611. (doi:10.2307/2640906)
- 482 Henchion M, Hayes M, Mullen AM, Fenelon M, Tiwari, B. 2017 Future protein supply and
483 demand: strategies and factors influencing a sustainable equilibrium. *Foods*, **6**, 53.
- 484 Hendry AP. 2004 Selection against migrants contributes to the rapid evolution of ecologically
485 dependent reproductive isolation. *Evol. Ecol. Res.* **6**, 1219–1236.
- 486 Johnsson JI. 2003 Group size influences foraging effort independent of predation risk: an
487 experimental study on rainbow trout. *J. Fish Biol.* **63**, 863–870. (doi:10.1046/j.1095-
488 8649.2003.00187.x)
- 489 Ketterson ED, Atwell JW, McGlothlin JW. 2009 Phenotypic integration and independence:
490 hormones, performance, and response to environmental change. *Integr. Comp. Biol.* **49**,
491 365–379. (doi:10.1093/icb/icp057)
- 492 Killen SS, Marras S, Metcalfe NB, McKenzie DJ, Domenici P. 2013 Environmental stressors
493 alter relationships between physiology and behaviour. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **28**, 651–658.
494 (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2013.05.005)
- 495 Kincaid HL. 1983 Inbreeding in fish populations used for aquaculture. *Aquaculture* **33**, 215–227.
496 (doi:10.1016/0044-8486(83)90402-7)

- 497 Lancaster LT, McAdam AG, Sinervo B. 2010 Maternal adjustment of egg size organizes
498 alternative escape behaviors, promoting adaptive phenotypic integration. *Evolution* **64**,
499 1607–1621. (doi:10.1111/j.1558-5646.2009.00941)
- 500 Laughlin DC, Messier J. 2015 Fitness of multidimensional phenotypes in dynamic adaptive
501 landscapes. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **30**, 487–496. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2015.06.003)
- 502 Lehnert SJ, Love OP, Pitcher TE, Higgs DM, Heath DD. 2014 Multigenerational outbreeding
503 effects in Chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*). *Genetica* **142**, 281–293.
504 (doi:10.1007/s10709-014-9774-5)
- 505 Martins CIM, Schrama JW, Verreth JAJ. 2006 The effect of group composition on the welfare of
506 African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*). *Appl. Anim. Behav. Sci.* **97**, 323–334.
507 (doi:10.1016/j.applanim.2005.07.003)
- 508 Mazerolle MJ, Mazerolle MM. 2017. Package ‘AICcmodavg’.
- 509 McClelland EK, Naish KA. 2007 What is the fitness outcome of crossing unrelated fish
510 populations? A meta-analysis and an evaluation of future research directions. *Conserv.*
511 *Genet.* **8**, 397–416. (doi:10.1007/s10592-006-9178-x)
- 512 McCormick, SD. 2012 Smolt physiology and endocrinology. *Fish Physiol.* **32**, 199-251.
513 (doi:[0.1016/B978-0-12-396951-4.00005-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-396951-4.00005-0))
- 514 McGlothlin JW, Jawor JM, Ketterson ED. 2007 Natural variation in a testosterone-mediated
515 trade-off between mating effort and parental effort. *Am. Nat.* **170**, 864–875.
516 (doi:10.1086/522838)
- 517 McGlothlin JW, Ketterson ED. 2008 Hormone-mediated suites as adaptations and evolutionary
518 constraints. *Philos. T. Roy. Soc. B* **363**, 1611–1620. (doi:10.1098/rstb.2007.0002)

- 519 Mommsen TP, Vijayan MM, Moon TW. 1999 Cortisol in teleosts: dynamics, mechanisms
520 of action, and metabolic regulation. *Rev. Fish Biol. Fisher.* **9**, 211–268.
521 (doi:10.1023/A:1008924418720)
- 522 Murren CJ. 2012 The integrated phenotype. *Integr. Comp. Biol.* **52**, 64–76.
523 (doi:10.1093/icb/ics043)
- 524 Neff BD, Garner SR, Pitcher TE. 2011 Conservation and enhancement of wild fish populations:
525 preserving genetic quality versus genetic diversity. *Can. J. Fish Aquat. Sci.* **68**, 1139–
526 1154. (doi:10.1139/F2011-029)
- 527 Nosil P, Vines TH, Funk DJ. 2005 Reproductive isolation caused by natural selection against
528 immigrants from divergent habitats. *Evolution* **59**, 705–719. (doi:10.1554/04-428)
- 529 Oppedal F, Dempster T, Stien LH. 2011 Environmental drivers of Atlantic salmon behaviour in
530 sea-cages: a review. *Aquaculture* **311**, 1–8. (doi:10.1016/j.aquaculture.2010.11.020)
- 531 Øverli Ø, Kotzian S, Winberg S. 2002 Effects of cortisol on aggression and locomotor activity in
532 rainbow trout. *Horm. Behav.* **42**, 53–61. (doi:10.1006/hbeh.2002.1796)
- 533 Pavlidis 1999. The effect of photoperiod on diel rhythms in serum melatonin, cortisol, glucose,
534 and electrolytes in the common dentex *Dentex dentex*. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.* **113**, 240–
535 250. (doi: 10.1006/gcen.1998.7190)
- 536 Pickering AD, Pottinger TG. 1983 Seasonal and diel changes in plasma cortisol levels of the
537 brown trout, *Salmo trutta* L. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.* **49**, 232–239. (doi:10.1016/0016-
538 6480(83)90139-9)
- 539 Pigliucci M. 2003 Phenotypic integration: studying the ecology and evolution of complex
540 phenotypes. *Ecol. Lett.* **6**, 265–272. (doi:10.1046/j.1461-0248.2003.00428.x)

- 541 Piper, RG, McElwain, IB, Orme, LE, McCraren, JP, Fowler, LG, Leonard, JR. 1982) Fish
542 hatchery management. United States Department of the Interior Fish and Wildlife
543 Service, Washington, D.C., USA.
- 544 Pruessner JC, Kirschbaum C, Meinlschmid G, Hellhammer DH. 2003 Two formulas for
545 computation of the area under the curve represent measures of total hormone
546 concentration versus time-dependent change. *Psychoneuroendocrino.* **28**, 916–931.
547 (doi:10.1016/S0306-4530(02)00108-7)
- 548 Sanford E, Kelly MW. 2011 Local adaptation in marine invertebrates. *Annu. Rev. Mar. Sci.* **3**,
549 509–535. (doi:10.1146/annurev-marine-120709-142756)
- 550 Sapolsky RM. 2000 Stress hormones: good and bad. *Neurobiol. Dis.* **7**, 540–542.
551 (doi:10.1006/nbdi.2000.0350)
- 552 Schlichting CD. 1989 Phenotypic integration and environmental changes. *BioScience* **39**, 460–
553 464.
- 554 Schreck CB. Stress and fish reproduction: the roles of allostasis and hormesis. 2010 *Gen. Comp.*
555 *Endocrinol.* **165**, 549–556. (doi: 10.1016/j.ygcen.2009.07.004)
- 556 Semeniuk CAD, Capelle P, Dender M, Devlin R, Dixon B, Drown J, Heath J, Hepburn R, Higgs
557 D, Janisse K, Lehnert S, Love O, Mayrand J, Mickle M, Pitcher T, Neff B, Semple S,
558 Smith J, Toews S, Wellband K, Venney C, Heath D. submitted Domestic-wild
559 hybridization to improve aquaculture performance in Chinook salmon. *Aquaculture*
- 560 Silverstein JT, Shearer KD, Dickhoff WW, Plisetskaya EM. 1999 Regulation of nutrient intake
561 and energy balance in salmon. *Aquaculture* **177**, 161–169. (doi:10.1016/S0044-
562 8486(99)00076-9)

- 563 Snell-Rood EC. 2013 An overview of the evolutionary causes and consequences of behavioural
564 plasticity. *Anim. Behav.* **85**, 1004–1011. (doi:10.1016/j.anbehav.2012.12.031)
- 565 Su G-S, Liljedahl L-E, Gall GAE. 1996 Effects of inbreeding on growth and reproductive traits
566 in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *Aquaculture* **142**, 139–148. (doi:10.1016/0044-
567 8486(96)01255-0)
- 568 Taff CC, Vitousek MN. 2016 Endocrine flexibility: optimizing phenotypes in a dynamic world?
569 *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **31**, 476–488. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2016.03.005)
- 570 Tallmon DA, Luikart G, Waples RS. 2004 The alluring simplicity and complex reality of genetic
571 rescue. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **19**, 489–496. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2004.07.003)
- 572 Taylor EB. 1991 A review of local adaptation in Salmonidac, with particular reference to Pacific
573 and Atlantic salmon. *Aquaculture* **98**, 185–207. (doi:10.1016/0044-8486(91)90383-I)
- 574 Thorpe, JE, McConway, MG, Miles, MS, Muir, JS. 1987 Diel and seasonal changes in resting
575 plasma cortisol levels in juvenile Atlantic salmon, *Salmo salar* L. *Gen. Comp.*
576 *Endocrinol.* **65**, 19–22. (doi:10.1016/0016-6480(87)90217-6)
- 577
- 578 Tymchuk WE, Biagi C, Withler R, Devlin RH. 2006 Growth and behavioral consequences of
579 introgression of a domesticated aquaculture genotype into a native strain of coho salmon.
580 *T. Am. Fish Soc.* **135**, 442–455. (doi:10.1577/T05-181.1)
- 581 Valente, LMP, Moutou, KA, Conceição, LEC, Engrola, S, Fernandes, JMA, Johnston, IA. 2013.
582 What determines growth potential and juvenile quality of farmed fish species? *Rev.*
583 *Aquacul.* **5**, S168–S193. (doi:10.1111/raq.12020)
- 584 Waples RS. 1991 Pacific salmon, *Oncorhynchus spp.*, and the definition of "species" under the
585 Endangered Species Act. *Mar. Fish. Rev.* **53**, 11–22.

586 Whitlock MC, Ingvarsson PK, Hatfield T. 2000 Local drift load and the heterosis of
587 interconnected populations. *Heredity* **84**, 452–457. (doi:10.1046/j.1365-
588 2540.2000.00693.x)
589

Draft

Figure 1. Map of British Columbia, Canada showing the source of wild Chinook salmon stocks used for outbreeding in the study. A captive, inbred stock was used as the basis for all crosses and is held at Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd. Colours: Bright green – YIAL; purple – Robertson Creek; orange – Quinsam River; pink – Puntledge River; light blue –Nitinat River; dark blue – Chilliwack River; dark green – Capilano River; red –Big Qualicum River.

Figure 2. Inter-population variation in (A) diel patterns of baseline cortisol secretion, (B) daytime and nighttime exposure to baseline cortisol, and (C) variation in behavioural traits of Chinook salmon parr.

Figure 3. Exposure to daytime cortisol predicts overall behavioural phenotype (combination of foraging, sociality, and movement behaviours) as a linear relationship across 6 outbred populations of Chinook salmon and the inbred control population.

Figure 4. Body mass outcome of optimal phenotypic integration between exposure to cortisol during the night and overall behavioural phenotype (see Methods) across 6 outbred populations of Chinook salmon and the inbred control population (YIAL), represented as both (A) a three-dimensional plot and (B) as a contour map.

A

B